

**“[T]he subtle but powerful cement of a patriotic literature”:
English-Canadian Literary Anthologies, National Identity, and the Canon**

Bonnie Kathleen Hughes

Thesis submitted to the
Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies
In partial fulfilment of the requirements
For the PhD degree in English Literature

Department of English
Faculty of Arts
University of Ottawa

© Bonnie Kathleen Hughes, Ottawa, Canada, 2012

Table of Contents

Title Page	i
Table of Contents	ii
Abstract	iv
Acknowledgements	v
Anthologies Consulted	vii
Introduction	1
Anthologies and Canons	5
The Canon Debate	8
Canon Formation	13
Anthology Development and the Canadian Canon	15
Outline of the Dissertation	16
Chapter One: The Development of Canadian Literary Anthologies	18
The Literary Historical Phase	18
The Literary Nationalistic Phase	27
The Thematic Phase	32
The Pluralistic Phase	41
Chapter Two: Frances Brooke	51
Brooke's Biography and Literary Works	53
The Literary Historical Phase	56
The Literary Nationalistic Phase	58
The Thematic Phase	63
The Pluralistic Phase	67
Conclusion	74
Chapter Three: John Richardson and William Kirby	76
Richardson's Biography and Literary Works	81
The Literary Historical Phase	83
The Literary Nationalistic Phase	88

The Thematic Phase	93
The Pluralistic Phase	96
Kirby's Biography and Literary Works	100
The Literary Historical Phase	105
The Literary Nationalistic Phase	109
The Thematic Phase	110
The Pluralistic Phase	112
Conclusion	114
Chapter Four: Susanna Moodie	116
Moodie's Biography and Literary Works	120
The Literary Historical Phase	122
The Literary Nationalistic Phase	129
The Thematic Phase	136
The Pluralistic Phase	149
Conclusion	158
Chapter Five: Pauline Johnson	160
Johnson's Biography and Literary Works	162
The Literary Historical Phase	164
The Literary Nationalistic Phase	170
The Thematic Phase	172
The Pluralistic Phase	177
Conclusion	188
Conclusion	190
Works Cited	195

Abstract

The dissertation investigates the correlations among the development of general anthologies of Canadian literature, the Canadian canon, and visions of national identity. While literature anthologies are widely used in university classrooms, the influential role of the anthology in the critical study of literature has been largely overlooked, particularly in Canada. The dissertation begins with an analysis of the stages of development of general anthologies of Canadian literature, demonstrating that there are important links between dominant critical trends and the guiding interests of the various phases of anthology development and that anthologies both reflect and participate in moulding views of the nation and its literature. Focusing then upon five eighteenth- and nineteenth-century Canadian authors, the dissertation traces their treatment in anthologies and analyzes in detail the impact of stages of anthology development upon authors' inclusion and presentation. The reception of Frances Brooke, John Richardson, William Kirby, Susanna Moodie, and Emily Pauline Johnson over a span of nearly 90 years is examined, and points of inclusion and exclusion are scrutinized to determine links with prevailing critical interests as well as canonical status. These case studies reveal the functions of anthologies, which include recovering overlooked authors, amending past oversights, reflecting new areas of critical inquiry, and preserving the national literary tradition. Their treatment also reveals the effect of larger critical concerns, such as alignment with dominant visions of the nation, considerations of genre, and reassessments of past views. The dissertation shows that the anthology is a carefully constructed, culturally valuable work that plays an important role in literary criticism and canon formation and is a genre worthy of careful scrutiny.

Acknowledgements

Fittingly, since the topic of my dissertation is one that is often collaborative and involves input from numerous people, I have many to thank. I would like to thank the University of Ottawa and the Department of English for financial support during my studies. I am grateful to my external examiner, Dr. Cecily Devereux, for taking the time to review my project, offer helpful remarks, and travel to my defense. Many thanks to my internal examiners, Dr. Jennifer Blair, Dr. Gerald Lynch, and Dr. David Staines for their insightful comments and feedback regarding my project.

My supervisor, Janice Fiamengo, has been unfailingly supportive and guided me towards a stronger project at every stage. I admire her writing and research very much, and she has been a wonderful mentor and friend. My Master's supervisor, Francis Zichy, helped me throughout my MA degree and to continue my studies; his guidance and encouragement have been invaluable.

I am grateful for the support and assistance I received from my friends. Amie Shirkie has been a good friend for many years and is always ready with supportive words, an optimistic viewpoint, and endless giggles. Thanks to Lindsay, Monique, and Finn Tallon, Dave and Amanda Hutton, and Siobhan Dunbar for their friendship, positivity, and encouragement. Poonam Bajwa, whom I met on the first day of the program, has been a wonderful friend ever since, and her wit, humour, insight, and suggestions have helped me in so many ways. Thanks to thesis club, Poonam, Sue Bowness, Carmela Coccimiglio, and Marissa McHugh, for providing the opportunity to mull over and work through thesis problems, as well as much needed breaks from work. Thanks to many others who offered

friendship, inspiration, and guidance during my studies. Many thanks to everyone who attended my defense and celebrated with me afterwards.

My entire family has supported me in so many ways throughout my time as a graduate student. My sisters, Nicole, Rosalie, and Heather, have cheered me on the entire time, and their encouragement has been very important to me. My mother, Audrey Hughes, nurtured a deep love of reading and learning in me from an early age, and my father, Larry Hughes, demonstrated the value of hard work, dedication, and a sense of humour. For this and everything else they have done for me, I am so grateful. I could not have pursued this project without my parents' support, and I dedicate this dissertation to them.

Last, but so very far from least, I must thank my husband, Garry Drake, for his endless love, support, patience, positivity, and encouragement. Thank you so much for everything.

Anthologies Consulted

- Bennett, Donna, and Russell Brown, eds. *An Anthology of Canadian Literature in English*. 3rd ed. Toronto: Oxford UP, 2010. Print.
- , eds. *A New Anthology of Canadian Literature in English*. Don Mills, ON: Oxford UP, 2002. Print.
- Broadus, Edmund Kemper, and Eleanor Hammond Broadus, eds. *A Book of Canadian Prose and Verse*. Toronto: MacMillan, 1923. Print.
- , eds. *A Book of Canadian Prose and Verse*. Rev. ed. Toronto: MacMillan, 1934. Print.
- Brown, Russell, and Donna Bennett, eds. *An Anthology of Canadian Literature in English*. 2 vols. Toronto: Oxford UP, 1982-83. Print.
- Brown, Russell, Donna Bennett, and Nathalie Cooke, eds. *An Anthology of Canadian Literature in English*. Rev. and abr. ed. Toronto: Oxford UP, 1990. Print.
- Daymond, Douglas, and Leslie Monkman, eds. *Literature in Canada*. 2 vols. Toronto: Gage, 1978. Print.
- Denham, Paul, ed. *The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English: 1945-1970*. Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1973. Print.
- Edwards, Mary Jane, ed. *The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English: Beginnings to 1867*. Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1973. Print.
- Edwards, Mary Jane, Paul Denham, and George L. Parker, eds. *The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English: 1867-1914*. Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1973. Print.
- Klinck, Carl F., and Reginald E. Watters, eds. *Canadian Anthology*. Toronto: Gage, 1955. Print.

- , eds. *Canadian Anthology*. Rev. ed. Toronto: Gage, 1966. Print.
- , eds. *Canadian Anthology*. 3rd ed. Toronto: Gage, 1974. Print.
- Lecker, Robert, ed. *Open Country: Canadian Literature in English*. Toronto: Nelson, 2008. Print.
- Moss, Laura, and Cynthia Sugars, eds. *Canadian Literature in English: Texts and Contexts*. Vol. 2. 2 vols. Toronto: Pearson, 2009. Print.
- Parker, George L., ed. *The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English: 1916-1945*. Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1973. Print.
- Robins, John D., ed. *A Pocketful of Canada*. Toronto: Collins, 1946. Print.
- Smith, A.J.M., ed. *The Book of Canadian Poetry: A Critical and Historical Anthology*. Toronto: Gage, 1943. Print.
- , ed. *The Book of Canadian Poetry: A Critical and Historical Anthology*. Rev. ed. Toronto: Gage, 1948. Print.
- , ed. *The Book of Canadian Poetry: A Critical and Historical Anthology*. 3rd ed. Toronto: Gage, 1957. Print.
- , ed. *The Book of Canadian Prose: The Canadian Century: English-Canadian Writing Since Confederation*. Toronto: Gage, 1973. Print.
- , ed. *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings to Confederation*. Toronto: Gage, 1965. Print.
- , ed. *The Canadian Experience: A Brief Survey of English-Canadian Prose*. Toronto: Gage, 1974. Print.
- Sugars, Cynthia, and Laura Moss, eds. *Canadian Literature in English: Texts and Contexts*. Vol. 1. 2 vols. Toronto: Pearson, 2009. Print.
- Watson, Albert Durrant, and Lorne Albert Pierce, eds. *Our Canadian Literature:*

Representative Prose and Verse. Toronto: Ryerson, 1922. Print.

Weaver, Robert, and William Toye, eds. *The Oxford Anthology of Canadian Literature*.

Toronto: Oxford UP, 1973. Print.

---, eds. *The Oxford Anthology of Canadian Literature*. 2nd ed. Toronto: Oxford UP, 1981.

Print.

INTRODUCTION

In his introduction to *Selections from Canadian Poets; With Occasional Critical and Biographical Notes, and an Introductory Essay on Canadian Poetry* (1864), Edward Hartley Dewart asserts that

A national literature is an essential element in the formation of national character. It is not merely the record of a country's mental progress: it is the expression of its intellectual life, the bond of national unity, and the guide of national energy. It may be fairly questioned, whether the whole range of history presents the spectacle of a people firmly united politically, without the subtle but powerful cement of a patriotic literature. (xxii)

In Dewart's view, a unified, independent, and intelligent nation could not exist without a distinct national literature. *Selections from Canadian Poets*, recognized as the first major Canadian poetry anthology,¹ asserted that Canada had a national literature and that this body of writing was worthy of collection and examination. Dewart's remarks connect cultural nationalism, the literary tradition, and the anthology format, creating associations that have remained an essential part of anthologies. His claims and approach influenced later anthologies, as his introduction has been frequently quoted, and the emphasis he placed upon national traits and patriotism has continued to preoccupy anthologists. In the pages that follow, I analyze the development of Canadian literature anthologies to examine how they both reflect and participate in shaping an understanding of the nation and its literature. Using the theory of canon formation, I emphasize the role of historical

¹ Robert Lecker in "Nineteenth-Century English-Canadian Anthologies and the Making of a National Literature" notes that "Dewart is usually seen as Canada's first true literary anthologist" (97).

context and critical trends in influencing anthologists' choices, and I note how ideas of Canada and Canadian literary culture have changed over time.

Since the publication of *Selections from Canadian Poets*, many anthologies have been compiled,² focusing upon a range of genres, themes, groups, regions, and periods; this variety suggests the many functions of the anthology. The anthology preserves valued works, outlines a tradition, and introduces a subject through its contents and textual apparatus, which include introductions, headnotes, bibliographies, and suggestions for further reading. The pedagogical role of the anthology is one of its key purposes; several anthologists have remarked that their anthologies were created to meet the demands of the classroom.³ While anthologies most often collect previously published works, they are sometimes the impetus for the creation of a work, demonstrating what Jeffrey R. Di Leo terms the “generative power of anthologies” (“Analyzing” 16). Anthologies are also tools of recovery. As J.R. Struthers points out, “Anthologies [. . .] can be ways of demonstrating the range and strength of areas of interest that conventional pedagogy or literary history has marginalized or ignored. Such works come into existence because of a perceived need, an editor and publisher having imagined alternatives to whatever options currently exist” (31). Anthologies can thus address perceived oversights through the inclusion of material that was removed or never included in collections. Anthologies, then, both establish and revise traditions.

In order to create anthologies that fulfill diverse roles, many decisions and evaluations must be made. A multitude of factors affect anthology compilation, including

² In his introduction to *Open Country: Canadian Literature in English*, Lecker states that more than 3000 anthologies have been published since Dewart's (xxii).

³ Carl Klinck and Reginald Watters and Donna Bennett and Russell Brown all note that their anthologies were compiled for the university classroom.

economic and material considerations such as permissions fees, budget, page count, paper type, and technological issues, to name only a few. Previously published anthologies, personal preference, and dominant critical trends also determine the shape of an anthology. Critics have noted that anthologies are inevitably influenced by a range of factors and are not solely based on literary value. Paul Lauter, a prominent anthologist and editor of the *Heath Anthology of American Literature*, notes that the anthology is “a problematic cultural construction shaped by a variety of motives and demands” (38). Lauter values the anthology genre but cautions against uncritical acceptance. Struthers takes a similar approach in determining the value of the anthology, pointing out that while the anthology format is not without complications, it ultimately has much to offer: “Despite all the intrinsic limits of the anthology form – among them the inevitable bias of selectivity and the perennial indeterminacy of the idea of balance – its invitation to read the word and the world against a multiplicity of contexts is its potential strength” (35). While there are many difficulties associated with anthology compilation, the anthology is an important element of literary studies.

The goals of this project are, broadly, two-fold: to demonstrate that the anthology is a valuable, interesting genre and to discuss and study the links between general anthologies of English-Canadian literature and the Canadian canon. My project examines general anthologies of Canadian literature, defined as anthologies that contain both poetry and prose and claim to be representative of the nation (rather than a particular region or group), published between 1922, the date of the first general anthology, and the present. My main goal is to query the relationship between anthologies, literary criticism, and the historical development of the English-Canadian literary canon. Many Canadian literary critics, including Robert Lecker, Carole Gerson, W.J. Keith and Donna Bennett, have

examined various aspects of the Canadian canon, raising questions of literary value, cultural validation, and institutional agendas; my thesis engages with these and other critics by examining the canon debate generally and the question of the Canadian canon specifically. Choosing fiction as my main focus because of its pedagogical and public prominence in the twentieth century, I examine the profiles of five authors included in general university-level anthologies, looking at how these authors are positioned and represented in the context of Canadian literature. The body of my thesis provides detailed analyses of the treatment of these authors throughout the stages of anthology development. Critical studies of Canadian literature have argued that the canon is fluid, imaginary, or even non-existent; my project demonstrates that Canadian literature anthologies present a clear image of a fairly stable canon whose influences, contours, and variations can be mapped with precision. While the vital role of anthologies in the development of Canadian literature has been recognized by a handful of critics, it has not been fully examined. Such analysis will allow me to trace the trends that determine the form of anthologies and their contents.

To investigate anthology development and links with the Canadian canon, I have studied university level general anthologies,⁴ focusing specifically on the treatment of five authors. I examine the careers and reception of five eighteenth- and nineteenth-century authors: Frances Brooke, John Richardson, William Kirby, Susanna Moodie, and Emily Pauline Johnson. Canada's literary culture emerged from these early and post-Confederation authors, making them central to a study of the development of the nation's

⁴ My focus is general anthologies intended for an adult audience. I have not included anthologies such as the two editions of *The Voice of Canada: A Selection of Prose and Verse*, edited by A.M. Stephen (1927) and J.F. Swayze (1946), which are targeted towards students in grades seven to ten. William F. Kendrick's *Canadian Stories in Verse and Prose* (1932, 1936) was also compiled for school children; each poem in the collection is followed by a number of questions to help the student gain a more complete understanding of the work, and each of the prose selections is supplemented with suggestions for further study.

literary canon. Since these authors predate the first anthology included in my study, Albert Durrant Watson and Lorne Albert Pierce's *Our Canadian Literature: Representative Prose and Verse* (1922), examining their treatment in anthologies over a period of nearly 90 years allows for a detailed account of the development of Canadian literature and creates a concrete portrait of how various critical approaches and phases of anthology development have impacted these authors' literary reputations. I trace the evolution of these authors' treatments in anthologies, placing them against the backdrop of the development of the anthology.

Anthologies and Canons

While anthologies are most often regarded as collections of literature designed to make teaching or studying more convenient, they also influence and even determine the status and standing of various authors and works. Critic John Guillory sees a close link between the literature taught in the classroom and the literature that is canonized, stating that the "problem of the canon is a problem of syllabus and curriculum, the institutional forms by which works are preserved as *great* works" ("Canons" 240). While Guillory does not specifically mention anthologies as tools that sanction certain works, he regards classroom activity as bestowing authority on certain texts. In *Loose Canons: Notes on the Culture Wars*, Henry Louis Gates, Jr. takes an even stronger position regarding the relationship between the classroom and the canon, stating that a "well-marked anthology functions in the academy to *create* a tradition, as well as to define and preserve it" (31).

In line with Gates's view, Alan Golding, in his study of American poetry anthologies, regards anthologies as playing a prominent role in the process of canon formation. He views anthologies as a means for understanding the process of selection

and argues that an analysis of anthologies can reveal the ways that the canon has developed and the various standards that have influenced its form. More recently, Joseph Csicsila, in his examination of American literature anthologies *Canons by Consensus: Critical Trends and American Literature Anthologies*, identifies the works taught in the classroom as central to the status of various authors and titles. Anthologies have significantly influenced the shape and development of American literature, since “the standing of American authors and works has always been related to inclusion in and exclusion from literary anthologies. After all, these editorial decisions essentially dictate who is taught in college classrooms across the country and how” (Introduction xv-xvi). Csicsila argues that the central role of anthologies in the development of American literature has been largely overlooked and calls for greater consideration of the anthology as a critical tool. A recent edition of the journal *symplokē* was devoted entirely to anthologies, and in it, general editor Di Leo discusses the many connections between anthologies and the canon: “anthologies also have a key role in canon-formation, and are always already implicated with various political and cultural agendas [. . .] They are not, as many once believed, simply *reflective* of literary canons, rather they are constitutive of them” (Editor’s Note 6).

Few critics have studied Canadian anthologies in detail and no one has fully scrutinized the connections between anthologies and the development of Canadian literary history. Most sustained discussions of Canadian general anthologies and the process of compilation are found in the anthologies themselves, in prefaces and introductions, as well as in literary histories and reference books, suggesting that there is much room for further critical analysis. Robert Lecker’s chapter in *Making it Real: The Canonization of English-Canadian Literature*, his recent article “Nineteenth-Century English-Canadian

Anthologies and the Making of a National Literature,”⁵ and Peggy Kelly’s “Anthologies and the Canonization Process: A Case Study of the English-Canadian Literary Field, 1920-1950” are the most detailed studies of Canadian anthologies to date, but none claims to offer a comprehensive overview.

Anthologists have frequently commented upon the impact of their collections on the nation’s literary tradition, suggesting that there is a widely recognized link between anthologies and the canon in the Canadian tradition. In the preface to *Canadian Anthology* (1955), Carl F. Klinck and Reginald E. Watters state their reasons for compiling the anthology, noting that “No canon of major works has been established – as it has for the literature of Britain or the United States – by the browsing, researches, and evaluations of generations of readers, scholars and critics” (xv). The reference to other national canons reveals the editors’ awareness of the need to distinguish a distinct Canadian literary tradition in order to elevate the country’s cultural status. In his memoir, Klinck writes that through the compilation of their anthology, he and Watters “helped establish a canon” (*Giving Canada* 88), showing that the two editors were consciously engaged with the process of canon formation.

Editors in later decades also reference their role in canonizing. In the general introduction to *A New Anthology of Canadian Literature in English* (2002), Donna Bennett and Russell Brown note that they are acutely aware that their collection is part of a process of defining the Canadian canon. They believe that the anthology offers an outline of the entire body of literature, revealed in their comment that “readers can use

⁵ Lecker’s forthcoming *Keepers of the Code: English-Canadian Literary Anthologies and the Representation of Nation*, a history of English-Canadian literary anthologies, will be another substantial contribution to the field.

this anthology to discover the overall shape of the English-Canadian literary tradition” (Introduction xvii). In their most recent edition, they take an even stronger view of the connections between anthologies and the canon. Noting the increased attention to national literature in the second half of the twentieth century, they remark that

No entirely fixed canon held sway—canons are always in flux, particularly when societies are rapidly growing and changing. Still, the fact that fifty-five writers who were in the first edition of this anthology reappear in this one and forty-nine authors have been in all four versions does suggest that the Canadian canon, while changing and expanding over the last twenty-five years, now has a stable core. (Preface xiv)

Given the various intersections between the Canadian canon and the development of anthologies, a study of anthologies provides a concrete, verifiable approach to the canon and the range of factors that determine it. My project thus builds upon the preliminary work that has been done in this area, contributing to current understandings of the institutional and critical factors that have formed the national canon.

The Canon Debate

Many critics have analyzed the canon and the range of factors influencing it. W.H. New provides a useful overview of the canon debate. He defines canon and canonicity as terms that imply authenticity, stating that they can be used “both positively, to assert a selection of the ‘best’ or ‘most representative’ works in a particular field, and pejoratively, to categorize a body of work and a set of attitudes that at any given time have come to be accepted uncritically as the ‘best’ or ‘most representative’” (“Canon” 176). Discussions of the canon generally align with one of these positions. New writes that when canons are

stable, they are widely accepted and influence teaching, publishing, literary criticism, and literary history. On the other hand, when canons are challenged, “the ostensible norms of literary evaluation come into dispute. At such times, not only is a set of texts challenged; so too are the systems of value that underlie the cultural and/or academic approval of such a set of texts” (176). Further, he argues that “this process of selection and rejection is ongoing, so that over time a canon can be extended, expanded, modified, replaced, or reaffirmed” (176).

As New indicates, there are two main critical positions on the canon and discussions of the shape, nature, and future of canons either advocate a canon based on literary worth or challenge the standards upon which the canon is based. Harold Bloom, a staunch defender of aesthetic quality, argues in *The Western Canon: The Books and Schools of the Ages* that artistic merit is and must be the sole determining factor of a work’s position within a literary tradition. Works are preserved due to their inherent aesthetic worth, which the discerning reader recognizes and cherishes; the canon is therefore the “relation of an individual reader and writer to what has been preserved out of what has been written” (17). In “Shooting Niagara? Some Pessimistic Thoughts about the Future of English-Canadian Literary Studies” Canadian critic W.J. Keith also regards literary value as a central aspect of the canon, arguing that “canons presuppose quality” (390). For Keith, the existence of a canon is completely dependent upon literary and aesthetic quality;⁶ any Canadian canon “will be determined in large measures by the

⁶ Keith feels that “Evaluations in terms of language and style [. . .] are inescapable” and thus are the basis for inclusion in the canon (390). He acknowledges that literary value is, to a certain extent, an intangible concept, but he contends that literature can be evaluated for its aesthetic worth if one possesses the proper knowledge: the assessment of literary value requires “comprehensive knowledge of established classics,” a “sense of literary quality,” and an “awareness of the variety of acceptable critical approaches and procedures” (395).

artistic skills of the writers represented” (390). For Bloom and Keith, then, a text’s canonical status is determined by its inherent value.

This view, however, is not widespread and has been vigorously challenged. Guillory and Terry Eagleton in particular find the notion of literary value problematic. In *Cultural Capital: The Problem of Literary Canon Formation*, Guillory acknowledges the existence of aesthetic value, but he maintains that other factors determine a text’s literary status: “evaluative judgements are the necessary but not sufficient conditions for the process of canon formation” (Preface vii). Eagleton argues more forcefully against the importance of aesthetic worth, noting that “value-judgements are notoriously variable” (11). Opposing Bloom’s and Keith’s contention that a fixed canon will emerge, Eagleton dismisses the possibility of a permanent canon: “‘*Value*’ is a transitive term: it means whatever is valued by certain people in specific situations, according to particular criteria and in the light of given purposes” (401). Since the definition of value varies, a fixed canon can never emerge.

Diverging even further from Bloom’s championing of inherent aesthetic value, Eagleton asserts that the values of only certain people dictate a text’s perceived importance. He argues that the canon “has to be recognized as a *construct*” because there is “no such thing as a literary work or tradition which is valuable *in itself*” (401). In this view, literary texts are objects upon which value is conferred according to the needs of people who have the power to determine the work’s value. The significance of literature therefore lies in the ways in which it can be utilized for particular purposes, meaning that the canon is an ephemeral construct that reflects the specific needs of a group at certain times.

Regarding the Canadian canon, Carole Gerson aligns herself with a position similar to Eagleton's. In "The Canon Between the Wars: Field-notes of a Feminist Literary Archaeologist," she views canons as mirrors of the interests of particular people in response to specific imperatives.⁷ She argues that canons constantly fluctuate, adapting with the ever-changing values of "those in power" (46). More specifically, she argues that male academics have traditionally excluded women from the canon, arguing that women have been marginalized in the established canon of the first half of the twentieth century (56) and that the aesthetic merits of a work ultimately have little impact upon its canonicity. This position connects with Guillory's notion of institutional affirmation, and both Gerson and Guillory are critical of the links between the academy and the canon.

Similarly, Donna Bennett in "Conflicted Vision: A Consideration of Canon and Genre in English-Canadian Literature" posits that the members of the academy are responsible for moulding the canon; however, she also emphasizes the importance of aesthetic quality. An important anthologizer herself, Bennett claims that a well-defined yet flexible Canadian canon is slowly materializing: "While we may not be able to produce a stable canon that will supply Canadian readers and writers with a single tradition, we may still seek to shape one that will show us the aesthetic history of our literature and, in so doing, will show us the standards that have emerged from our conflicted literary values" (149). Additionally, she sees a clear link between the articulation of the canon and anthologies: "The most obvious acts of canon-definition are anthologies [. . .] surveys [. . .] are equally important in canon-formation. (Indeed, virtually all studies by critics are implicated in acts of canon-defining)" (221). Her view

⁷ Gerson contends that "The contours of a canon are governed not by the inherent qualities of certain texts, but by the values attributed to them by those in power according to their current agendas and the particular configuration of national, aesthetic, and sexual politics that best serves their interests" (46).

of a Canadian tradition as shaped by aesthetic excellence, responsive to changing cultural values, and carefully scrutinized by critics is a vision of the canon that includes elements of both Eagleton's and Bloom's observations.

I employ Bennett's approach to the canon, suggesting that the Canadian canon has largely been formed by those in positions of power within academic institutions and that over time, a consensus on the canon has developed. Eagleton asserts that canons are ephemeral constructs because they reflect prevailing critical and institutional interests, which invariably change. While I agree that canons are structured according to the views of those in power within the academy, my position regarding the stability of the canon diverges from Eagleton's: my study finds that a significant number of authors and texts have retained critical interest over a 90-year period, thus demonstrating some agreement regarding the core of the canon. Frances Brooke, Susanna Moodie, Thomas Chandler Haliburton, Stephen Leacock, Sinclair Ross, Margaret Laurence, and Margaret Atwood, for example, have received a consistent level of attention throughout a number of critical phases. The works of these authors have been able to support a range of approaches, demonstrating that canons are not purely temporary and that there is a core body of works and authors forming a relatively stable Canadian canon.

Furthermore, my study of anthologies has led me to conclude that while the canon is shaped by the concerns and interests of the academic institution, literary quality is also a controlling factor. The aesthetic merits of works that retain critical interest are assessed, and works that are deemed to have little literary value are slowly eliminated from the canon. Writers whose critical reputations have fallen due to aesthetic evaluation include John Richardson, Ralph Connor, Norman Duncan, Howard O'Hagan, Morley Callaghan, and Hugh MacLennan; conversely, poets such as Oliver Goldsmith, Isabella Valancy

Crawford, and Pauline Johnson have fallen in stature and begun to rise again, a phenomenon that suggests interesting potential conclusions about the relationship between conceptions of aesthetic value and ideas of Canadian identity.

Canon Formation

To clarify the process of canon formation, critics have approached the question by differentiating various types of canons. Alastair Fowler, in “Genre and the Literary Canon,” distinguished six different canons, and these discriminations have been widely accepted. He lists the potential canon, made of the entire “written corpus, together with all surviving oral literature”; the accessible canon, which is the portion of the potential canon that is widely available at a given time; the selective canon, comprised of lists of authors such as those found in syllabi and reviews; the official canon, which is a combination of the lists of the selective canon; the personal canon, which consists of what readers know and value; and finally the critical canon, which includes works that are frequently examined in critical articles and books (98-99).

Wendell Harris has also wrestled with the notion of the canon and its many forms and influences. Addressing the difficulty of definitively defining the canon, Harris adds to Fowler’s list. Among the canons he discusses are the “diachronic canon,” which is the “glacially changing core” of the canon, and the “nonce canon,” which is a “rapidly changing periphery [of which] only a miniscule part [. . .] will eventually become part of the diachronic canon” (113). Like Fowler, Harris’s categories provide exact definitions, thereby offering a means to study literary histories concretely.

Golding in *From Outlaw to Classic: Canons in American Poetry* uses Fowler's distinctions to analyze and chart the canon of American poetry. He focuses on the

potential, accessible, and selective canons. He suggests that each of these divisions is controlled by a different impulse: in the first stage of canon formation, the goals of preservation, nationalism, and historicizing narrow the potential canon to an accessible canon; once an accessible canon has emerged, the belief in transhistorical excellence controls subsequent expressions of the canon; and, in the final and ongoing stage of canon formation, revision, there is continuous conflict between revision and conservation (24), which is the guiding criterion for future versions of the selective canon (29). Although Golding does not utilize Harris's categorization of the diachronic and nonce canons, the last stage of revision can be understood as the continuing interplay between the diachronic and nonce canons. Golding's application of Fowler's divisions shows that canons develop in stages that can be delineated in order to discover the controlling forces.

In his study, Golding regards anthologies as playing a prominent role in the process of canon formation. He makes a strong argument for the connection between the canon and collections of literature: he views anthologies as a means of understanding the process of selection, for they are "one fundamental means by which the selective canon is formed and transformed" (3). Further, he contends that studying the "standards that American anthologists have brought to bear on the problem of selection" can assist in an understanding of "how an anthology can reflect, expand, or redirect a period's canon; what literary and social principles regulated the poetry canon at different points in American literary history; and how these principles have changed over the years" (3). Anthologies, then, are central to the establishment, articulation, and maintenance of a literary tradition and examining these collections reveals some aspects of the ways that the canon has developed and the various standards that have influenced its form.

My project examines anthologies of Canadian literature to reveal the various stages of Canadian canon formation and suggests that these collections are vital to an understanding of the Canadian canon and its development. I show how the canon has evolved from a potential to an initial accessible canon,⁸ with an emphasis upon historicizing, nationalizing, and preserving; then, how the initial accessible canon was narrowed to a selective canon; and finally how the selective canon has been and continues to be challenged through revision, apparent in the interactions between the diachronic and nonce canons. I analyze the guiding impulses of each phase of canon development, showing that while aesthetic worth is a criterion for entry and a continued influence on the canon, institutional forces and social values define the standards of a generation's canon and determine the shape and nature of the selective canon. As selective canons are altered, a general consensus emerges, creating an "official canon" (Fowler 98) and a fairly stable literary tradition.

Anthology Development and the Canadian Canon

Throughout my dissertation, I analyze and discuss the correlations between anthology development and the Canadian canon. Csicsila demarcates the evolution of the American literature anthology into three distinct phases: literary historiography, occurring from 1919-1946; the New Critical, ranging from 1947 to the mid-1960s; and the multicultural, taking place from 1967 to the present (Introduction xx). I argue that Canadian anthologies have followed a similar though not identical path. I distinguish four distinct stages of anthology development to date: the literary historical, from 1922 to the late 1940s; the

⁸ I use Golding's understanding of the accessible canon: "that part of the potential canon to which readers have fairly easy access in the form of scholarly reprints, affordable paperbacks, or anthologies" (3).

literary nationalistic, from the 1950s to the late 1960s; the thematic, occurring throughout the 1970s and into the early 1980s; and the pluralistic, from the early 1980s to the present. Each of these phases is marked by distinct features and corresponds with a stage of canon development. Not all anthologies fit neatly into these categories, as thematic anthologies often also emphasize a work's literary history, but these divisions illuminate the various ways anthologies have been shaped and revised, and illustrate the strong connection between dominant critical practices and the form of anthologies.

Outline of the Dissertation

In Chapter One, I detail the key features of each phase of anthology development and study how general anthologies of Canadian literature demonstrate these traits. I examine how the form of anthologies has changed to accommodate dominant social and cultural influences. I also show how phases of anthology development are linked with stages of canon formation. The following chapters focus upon individual authors, and I analyze their treatment in anthologies to determine the impact that stages of anthology development may have upon an author's inclusion and presentation. Chapter Two examines Frances Brooke, who was recovered through anthologies: she was first included in 1955 and has received a considerable amount of critical interest in recent decades. She is now recognized as an important and influential early Canadian writer, and her work has been of particular interest to feminist and postcolonial critics. The following chapter traces the inclusion of John Richardson and William Kirby; their treatment contrasts Brooke's, as they were regarded as major figures in the first half of the twentieth century but have since experienced a sharp drop in both scholarly attention and anthology inclusion. Critics have found elements of each author's subject matter, styles, and

viewpoints problematic, and the novels do not align with current articulations of national identity. Chapter Four studies Susanna Moodie, whose treatment is notable, for she has been included consistently throughout all stages of anthology development. A number of factors have contributed to her steady anthologization, including the generic variety of her work, her direct influence on other authors, the themes of her work, and her persona. The final chapter focuses upon Emily Pauline Johnson, who has held a somewhat tenuous position in anthologies. She was included with some consistency throughout all stages of the anthology but was never regarded as a major author. Recently, her writing has been re-evaluated, and details of her life, specifically her Aboriginal heritage, political activism, and career, have received increased attention, a shift reflected in anthologies. The cases of these five authors provide important insight into the process of anthologization and the correlations between anthologies, prevailing critical trends, and the national literary tradition.

CHAPTER ONE

The Development of Canadian Literary Anthologies

This chapter outlines the development of general anthologies, discussing the key traits of each phase, and details the connections between stages of anthology development and canon formation. I determine four clear stages of anthology development to date: the literary historical, from 1922 to the late 1940s; the literary nationalistic, from the 1950s to the late 1960s; the thematic, from the 1970s into the early 1980s; and the pluralistic, from the early 1980s to the present. Studying these phases reveals the ways that anthologists build upon, modify, and react to others' work as the perceived shortcomings of one stage are addressed in the next. The concerns of various stages sometimes overlap; for example, the question of literary value is frequently raised in the literary nationalistic stage but not addressed in depth until the literary historical phase, and thematic interests remain evident at the beginning of the pluralistic stage. These common traits demonstrate the influence of phases upon one another and show that changes in presentations of the nation's literature sometimes occur gradually. Furthermore, there are a number of recurring concerns throughout all phases, such as national identity, inclusion, exclusion, and literary value. Careful study of the development of anthologies suggests clear connections between phases of anthology growth and canon development.

The Literary Historical Phase

The foremost concern of the first stage of general anthology development was asserting the existence and parameters of a national literature. Editors sought to increase awareness of Canadian literature, make literature widely accessible, and preserve works that risked

otherwise being forgotten. Since they felt that Canadian literature was undervalued and frequently overlooked, editors were primarily concerned with ensuring that readers had access to as much material as possible; this emphasis on quantity meant that literary quality was often a secondary concern, a fact anthologists frequently noted. Through their anthologies, editors created images of the nation and presented overviews of the country's cultural, political, and literary landscapes. These anthologies shared a few important traits, namely broad coverage, short excerpts, very brief critical analyses, and interest in articulations of national identity.⁹ The main impulses evident throughout the stage were to preserve, historicize, and nationalize Canadian literature, and throughout the phase, an image of a nation with a rich, varied culture and past was created.

The first anthology of this stage was Albert Durrant Watson and Lorne Albert Pierce's *Our Canadian Literature: Representative Prose and Verse*, published in 1922. This was the first general anthology containing both prose and verse that focused on the nation's distinguishing characteristics, emphasizing Canadian cultural sovereignty. An anonymous 1923 review of the anthology in *The Globe and Mail* highlights the collection's importance: "The value of the anthology is increased by the great number of early Canadian books that are out of print, thus rendering the works of many writers accessible to the public only through selections of this kind" (20). The reviewer's

⁹ This phase of the anthology in Canadian literature has similarities with the development of American anthologies. Csicsila notes that wide coverage, the absence of longer works, and interest in the historical and sociological significance of writing are key traits of the historiographical phase (10).

On a similar note, Alan Golding lists several traits of American poetry anthologies published in the 1920s. He remarks that editors at this stage had a number of goals, including "furthering the cause of national literature, gaining an audience[,] [. . .] preserving texts," and "claiming historical inclusiveness" (12). As a result of the desire to document the development of a unique literature, "literary merit is not the overriding criterion," causing "work of extremely variable quality" to be included; additionally, some works were anthologized "for the sake of historical representativeness" and to reveal the spirit and temper of the time (Golding 13). Although Golding focuses upon American poetry anthologies, all of these traits are evident in Canadian anthologies in the literary historical phase. The similarities between the development of Canadian and American anthologies suggest that the process of anthology development follows distinct patterns.

acknowledgement of the need to preserve Canadian writing and make it widely available shows that the anthology was fulfilling an important role. Robert Lecker in “Watson and Pierce's *Our Canadian Literature* Anthology and the Representation of Nation” also notes that the anthology was remarkable for its inclusion of prose: “Simply by virtue of the fact that their anthology included both poetry and prose, Watson and Pierce promoted the idea—radical for their time—that poetry was not the only means of evoking national consciousness” (49). The anthology was created at an important historical moment and presented a new understanding of Canadian writing; this first general anthology therefore established many of the aims of anthologies of this stage. Awareness of the nation’s literary features was one of the editors’ primary goals, as they set out to distinguish “what is essential to the spirit of Canadian literature,” which included “love of our native heritage,” a “spirit of fraternity,” “reverence for the religious and political traditions of our race,” a “love of reality,” and “devotion to truth, beauty and goodness” (Pierce, Introduction 127). This anthology positioned itself as a record of the beginning of a distinct national literature and contains a number of traits specific to the first stage of Canadian anthology development, specifically a focus on the history and evolution of Canadian literature and a desire to affirm the existence of a unique national literature and, by extension, a unique national culture as well.

The editors’ introductions to the poetry and prose sections outline their goals for the anthology. The sense that the anthology was a tool of preservation is evident throughout: Watson, in the introduction to the poetry section, argues, “It is our duty [. . .] to see that our native art is not lost in obscurity. Some jewel of a Canadian song, not yet fully appreciated, may be saved to the immediate future, if not to all time, through the recognition bestowed upon it by the very least of us” (7). The editors believed that the

collection would help Canadians appreciate the accomplishments of the nation's authors and guide readers towards other Canadian works: "We leave to the reader the appreciation of those selected with the hope that his reading will be widened in scope in response to the inspiring influences of these numbers" (Watson, Introduction 11). Watson and Pierce also considered the question of aesthetic worth¹⁰ and positioned their anthology as a record of the achievements of Canadian authors, a foundation upon which writers would continue to build.

Concern with national identity was a primary focus throughout *Our Canadian Literature*. Pierce believed that literature could serve as a means to unify people: he was convinced "that literature had to be a force for patriotic indoctrination and cohesion" in a rapidly expanding society (Campbell 138). He voices this sentiment in the introduction: "Great literatures have grown out of the national consciousness of peoples and have developed around national ideas" (123). The connection he sees between nationhood and literary accomplishment is further clarified in his statement that "there is something distinct and unique about the Canadian national spirit" and that there "seems to be a deepening conviction that we have a considerable historical tradition, and that we have as well a not inglorious literary tradition. In a word, it means that we have achieved a sense of full nationhood" (Introduction 123-24). Pierce explicitly linked national identity with a

¹⁰ Watson discusses the literary value of Canadian poetry, stating that there are many Canadian poems of high quality, such as Isabella Valancy Crawford's "Egypt, I die!" and the longer works of C.G.D. Roberts and Bliss Carman, but he acknowledges that several poems that were selected do not equal the achievement of these authors. He identifies the nation's youth as a reason for the absence of more skilled authors, as the energies of young nation cannot be focused entirely on artistic development: "In all new lands artistic appreciation is to be valued because of its rarity. The energies of the people are absorbed in the physical effort of conquering nature, and the practice of industrial art leaves little time for engagement in its finer expression" (8). Watson later defends Canada's extant literary production, arguing that the early efforts of Canadian poets will assist the development of future poets. Works of poor quality, he suggests, are an inevitable aspect of cultural development, and "While our young nation is striving to find its soul, there is sure to be more uncouth gesturing" (12).

strong literary tradition and viewed a national literature as a means of creating bonds between Canadians. The editors' sustained focus upon national identity would continue to interest later anthologists, although definitions of the Canadian character would vary.

In the following year, Edmund Kemper Broadus and Eleanor Hammond Broadus edited *A Book of Canadian Prose and Verse* (1923), an anthology that presented Canadian literature in a manner similar to Watson and Pierce's. In the introduction, they state their goals for the anthology: "The editors of this book have two objects in view – to bring together in a single volume of usable size a representative selection of Canadian poetry and prose; and [. . .] to create [. . .] a picture of Canadian life, past and present" (Preface vii). Like Pierce and Watson, Broadus and Broadus compiled an anthology that combined both poetry and prose in hopes of making literature more accessible and assisting readers in gaining a fuller understanding of the nation. Interest in the Canadian scene was also prominent, and the editors "sought to make a representative selection of Canadian poems which reflect the love of country or of empire; which relates to Canadian history; or which depict or are inspired by the Canadian landscape" (Preface vii). Broadus and Broadus speak specifically about the various types of writing and what they must represent, stating that poetry that "lacks flavor of locality" and prose that "transports the reader to other scenes than Canadian" have been excluded (Preface vii).

Broadus and Broadus admitted that aesthetic quality was not a primary criterion for selection, pointing to instances where concerns other than literary value informed inclusion. In reference to the many patriotic poems selected, they remark that "in much of it there is to be found more patriotism than poetry" (Preface vii). Other poems were included because the editors viewed them as important to illustrating the development of Canadian literature (Preface viii). Like Watson and Pierce, they argued that writers in the

future would find inspiration in Canadian life and history and create great works; the focus at this point, however, was representation and access instead of literary value.

In 1934, the second edition of *A Book of Canadian Prose and Verse* edited by Broadus and Broadus was published, and the editors made some significant revisions that speak to the dominant concerns of the phase, specifically broad coverage and concern with national traits. In the preface, they comment that some sections were shortened in order to “make room for more recent – and more valuable – material” (Preface vii). This focus on literary quality continues in their note that in the first edition, numerous poems “were resuscitated for the sake of their historical interest rather than for the sake of their poetical merit” (Preface vii); since the poems were “available to the general reader in library copies of the first edition,” the editors no longer felt obligated to include poems solely for their historical value, and they have “profited by that emancipation” (Preface vii). Broadus and Broadus’s remarks show that the first edition emphasized historical significance, preservation, and accessibility, while the changes to the second edition reflect an increasing concern with literary value.

Interest in outlining Canadian literature is evident in A.J.M Smith’s *The Book of Canadian Poetry: A Critical and Historical Anthology* (1943).¹¹ Like other anthologists of the time, Smith sought to provide an overview of the tradition. The broad scope and coverage of the anthology reveal his attention to the history of Canadian poetry and to

¹¹ Smith edited three editions of *The Book of Canadian Poetry: A Critical and Historical Anthology* (1943, 1948, 1957), as well as *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings to Confederation* (1965), *The Canadian Century: English-Canadian Writing Since Confederation* (1973), and *The Canadian Experience: A Brief Survey of English-Canadian Prose* (1974), which combined the 1965 and 1973 prose anthologies. Although the poetry and prose anthologies were published separately, they were intended as complementary collections. Smith writes in the preface to the 1965 edition of *The Book of Canadian Prose* that the anthology “forms a companion to the poetry in the earliest sections of *The Book of Canadian Poetry*. The two books together will provide the reader with a broad picture of the literature of our colonial period” (Preface xi). Smith’s anthologies therefore have been included in this study and are considered collectively as editions of general anthologies.

making it widely accessible. The anthology includes excerpts from a variety of authors and upon a number of themes, and it focuses both on the poets Smith admired¹² and those he found to be of greater historical than literary importance.¹³ A notable feature is his analysis of other anthologies; he notes, “I have tried to present a more balanced view of the development of Canadian poetry as a whole than can be obtained from other anthologies and to this end I have placed rather less emphasis upon the poets of the school of Carman and Roberts than has been customary in Canada” (Preface iii). His anthology, then, is in part a response to the choices of other anthologists. Smith’s headnotes are longer and more detailed than other editors’ notes, showing that his engagement with earlier poetry anthologists led him to build upon and modify their approaches. This conversation among anthologists would become a central component of general anthologies in later stages, revealing the process of evaluation and re-evaluation among editors. While the anthology differs in some ways from others of this phase, his concern with detailing the traits of the tradition, ensuring broad coverage, and increasing readers’ familiarity with the poetry clearly situate the anthology within the stage.

In 1946, *A Pocketful of Canada*, edited by John D. Robins, was published, displaying several characteristics of the stage. The anthology was sponsored by the Canadian Council of Education for Citizenship, a group devoted to adult education and community growth;¹⁴ increasing knowledge about the nation was one of the main goals of

¹² Among the poets he discusses at length in the introduction and characterizes as highly skilled are Joseph Howe, Charles Sangster, Charles Heavyside, the Confederation poets, Marjorie Pickthall, Francis Sherman, Tom MacInnes, Robert Service, E.J. Pratt, L.A. Mackay, F.R. Scott, Leo Kennedy, and Abraham Klein.

¹³ These poets include Oliver Goldsmith and Alexander McLachlan.

¹⁴ Carole Gerson quotes the finding aid to the Canadian Citizenship Council fonds (CAIN No. I81992, LAC): “The Canadian Council of Education for Citizenship was established in 1941 and consisted of representatives from eight provincial departments of education, the Canadian Education Association, the Canadian Association for Adult Education and the Canadian Teachers' Federation. The association acted as

the anthology. Robins lists his intentions for the anthology in his introduction: “This book aims to present some aspects of Canadian life, by means of selections from prose and poetry, articles on the arts and crafts of this country, excerpts from speeches and from significant documents relating directly to the status of Canada, and a small amount of statistical information” (xiii). Broad coverage is clearly a feature of the anthology; the work contains visual, literary, cultural, political, and statistical material with the intent of providing “a sharp, panoramic impression of our land and people” (Introduction v). Short excerpts and interest in sociocultural writing are evident, as well as in national characteristics: Robins chose material “because it is thought to be characteristically Canadian, in mood or content, or both” (Introduction xiii). He writes that his anthology “makes no claim to be a repository of the best Canadian writing” (Introduction xiii) and that he is “acutely aware that much material, admirable for the purpose of the book, is absent from it” (Introduction xiii); he, like other compilers of this phase, finds that preservation and accessibility are more important than literary value.

While Robins’s anthology is the most eclectic of the group and claimed to be “not intended as an anthology” (Introduction xiii), critics have determined that it was both valuable and influential. Carole Gerson argues that “the book bravely proclaimed that Canada possessed a substantial textual culture” (“Design and Identity” 78). Northrop

a link between the federal government and the provincial departments of education. It distributed information of the Wartime Information Board, published pamphlets and books and distributed material on education, community organization and democratic methods to schools, groups and communities.

The Council helped organize the Citizens' Forum Radio and the Joint Planning Committee, both of which were later taken over by the Canadian Association for Adult Education. After the war, the name was changed to the Canadian Citizenship Council and membership widened to include national and provincial organizations and interested government bodies. It became the main resource centre for educational agencies concerned with language teaching for immigrants, and it conducted research in immigration problems and continued its wartime programme of developing responsible and participating citizens” (qtd. in Gerson, “Design and Identity” 66).

Frye, who wrote that Robins was “a central figure in the cultural history of Canada,” comments, “His anthology, *A Pocketful of Canada*, for all its unpretentiousness, is actually a powerful analysis of the cultural development of the country: he saw, perhaps more clearly than anyone else [had] seen, the shaping and growth of Canadian writing and painting out of the conditions of Canadian life” (“John D. Robins” 218). These assessments of Robins’s anthology speak to the importance of the format and reveal the impact an anthology can have upon views of a nation’s literature and understandings of cultural development.

Smith’s revised edition of *The Book of Canadian Poetry* (1948) shows a shift in focus similar to the changes between Broadus and Broadus’s first and second editions, as he became more concerned with the question of literary value. He substantially revised the second edition of his poetry anthology by adding new poems and increasing coverage of major poets.¹⁵ He addresses the addition of new poets, stating that the five years since the publication of the first edition

have been unusually rich in the production of modern Canadian verse by a talented group of writers, who seem to have escaped from the limitations of provincialism into a cosmopolitanism that does not reject native sources of strength but draws nourishment from them, and who therefore have an interest for the reader outside of Canada that few Canadian poets have had.

(Preface vii)

He affirms the value of Canadian writing, restating the claim he made in the preface to the first edition: “The compiler believes that here is an increasingly significant body of verse, at its best cogent, intense, and finely shaped, and that it may be presented as a not

¹⁵ He defines these as Archibald Lampman, E.J. Pratt, Patrick Anderson, and Abraham Klein.

unworthy expression of the growth of Canada's self-awareness" (Introduction 4).

Although he questions the quality of some Canadian writing,¹⁶ he maintains his claim that there is a strong, valuable tradition of Canadian writing worthy of preservation.

Editors at this time emphasized Canadian history and national traits, and as the nation was defined through its literature, a canon was also articulated. The potential canon, the "entire written corpus" (Fowler 98), was refined to create an initial accessible canon. The focus during this phase upon preservation, nationalism, and accessibility is evident in the initial accessible canon that was defined. Anthologists included works that they viewed as historically significant, descriptive of the nation, and in danger of being forgotten. Through these early general anthologies, a significant amount of Canadian literature was made widely available. The process of refining the potential canon is apparent through prefaces, introductions, and selections, and editors detailed the traits they hoped their anthologies presented. As the initial accessible canon was established, the broad outlines of a distinct national literature were drawn, connecting nationhood, the canon, and anthologies.

The Literary Nationalistic Phase

In the following stage, the questions of national identity and the aesthetic worth of Canadian literature that had emerged in the previous phase became central areas of interest. Anthologists asserted the value of the nation's writing and applied more strident critical guidelines in their evaluations than they had in the past. They promoted Canadian writing as worthy of academic study, a view reflected in the format of the anthology:

¹⁶ He writes, "No apology is offered for neglecting the academic or the archaic among contemporary versifiers or for leaving the maple-leaf school of vaudeville poets without its present-day representatives" (Preface viii).

introductions included critical evaluations of writers and editors wrote more detailed headnotes. Authors were granted more pages and excerpts were longer. The process of anthologization became more scholarly, particularly as editors became interested in the study of Canadian literature at the university level. Anthologists moved away from the broad inclusiveness of the previous phase and selected a smaller number of authors, increasing the number of works by individual authors. The earlier emphasis upon political and sociological writing was discarded, and poetry and prose became the primary focus. These changes to the anthology were spurred by the desire to assert the value of Canadian writing; the broad contours of a national literature had been established in the previous phase, and anthologists turned to determining its unique features and aesthetic quality.

A central trait of this period was interest in cultural distinctiveness. Such a concern emerged following World War II, when issues of national identity, self-representation, anti-Americanism, and anti-colonialism became prevalent parts of Canadian cultural discourse. In 1951, the Massey Report of the Royal Commission on National Development in the Arts, Letters, and Sciences issued a warning about the dangers of dependence upon American culture, proposing a strategy for state-sponsored Canadian cultural development (Litt 3), which was the catalyst for sustained attention to the shape and nature of Canadian literature and the canon. The earlier literary historical phase of the anthology began with the desire to document Canadian literature and slowly grew into an expression of cultural sovereignty and validation.

The first general anthology of the nationalistic phase was Carl F. Klinck and Reginald E. Watters's *Canadian Anthology* (1955), and the editors' interest in promoting the study of Canadian literature is evident in the preface, as well as throughout the anthology. They emphasized the aesthetic qualities of Canadian literature, a notable shift

from earlier anthologies: they outlined their criteria for selection, which included offering “substantial samplings of work in both prose and poetry by a limited number of major authors” and ensuring that their selections were “determined primarily by intrinsic literary excellence or historical significance” (Preface xv). Rather than claiming existence as grounds for inclusion, the editors asserted that there were high quality works deserving further consideration and study. The format of their anthology differed from earlier collections: they provided extensive headnotes, critical commentary, and a detailed bibliography and suggestions for further reading. Their anthology was intended for use in postsecondary classrooms, and the focus upon the academic study of Canadian literature is evident through the textual apparatus.

Smith’s changes to his third revised edition of *The Book of Canadian Poetry* (1957) reveal an emphasis similar to Klinck and Watters’s, namely a more sustained focus upon literary value and critical examination. In the preface, he writes, “It is gratifying to know that a third edition of this anthology is required for use in Canadian universities” (vii), revealing the shift from the emphasis upon accessibility of the previous phase to scholarly examination. Furthermore, he stresses the literary worth of Canadian literature in his discussion of the changes to the anthology: “a number of isolated minor poems—in themselves good—were omitted in the second edition as distracting and room was thus found for more and longer poems by the influential masters” (Preface viii). He notes that in the third edition, “a number of poems have been replaced by new and usually better ones by the same author. This makes the work at once more representative and more up to date” (Preface viii). The emphasis upon literary worth is further emphasized in the introduction, when he claims quality to be his highest consideration:

The main purpose of this collection is to illustrate in the light of a contemporary and cosmopolitan literary consciousness the broad development of English-Canadian poetry from its beginnings at the end of the eighteenth century to its renewal of power in the revolutionary world of today. The emphasis, however, is not upon literary history or social background but on the poetry itself. (1)

His focus upon “the poetry itself” situates the anthology in a different light than the first edition, which sought to make the reader cognizant of the nation’s poetic tradition. While the third edition has similarities with the first and second editions, the emphasis upon university study and aesthetic value firmly places this anthology in the later phase of anthology development.

In 1965, Smith’s *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings to Confederation* was published. While Smith does not offer enthusiastic praise for the aesthetic merits of early Canadian prose, finding that the poetry is generally of higher quality, he is concerned with perceptions of the nation’s writing: “Canadian literature, when it has not been neglected entirely, has either been contemptuously dismissed or extravagantly praised” (Preface xiii). He deems early prose writing most valuable for its documentary focus, but his promotion of the university study of Canadian literature demonstrates a belief that the prose can stand up to serious critical attention. He included selections from fifteen authors, a fairly small number, as well as critical evaluations of each. He also included a list of selected criticism at the end. His anthology stands apart from those published previously, even his own, through its more scholarly and focused approach.

The second edition of Klinck and Watters's *Canadian Anthology* (1966) shows an even stronger focus upon the scholarly study of Canadian literature than the first edition.

In the preface, they write,

The ten years that have passed since *Canadian Anthology* was first published have witnessed a remarkable growth in the scholarly and critical attention accorded to our national literature. New and comprehensive bibliographies have been published, a very valuable paperback series has made available reprints of dozens of worthwhile titles at reasonable cost, a quarterly journal wholly devoted to Canadian literature has been established, and a literary history of Canada which provides a firm foundation for future interpretations and appraisals has recently appeared.

(xv)

The references to scholarly activity show that the editors consider the field of Canadian literature as an established discipline, moving beyond the concerns of preservation and accessibility in the first phase. In addition, their discussion of the New Canadian Library and *Literary History of Canada* in the preface situates the anthology itself as part of the scholarly examination of Canadian literature. The sense that the anthology is a serious tool of academic study is clear in the introduction and headnotes, which include critical analysis and historical overviews, as well as in the bibliographies and suggestions for further reading.

Throughout the literary nationalistic phase, then, editors were concerned with the question of literary value. As evaluations regarding aesthetic quality were made, the initial accessible canon established in the previous phase was narrowed to a selective canon.

Editors chose authors whose works they believed were of high quality and promoted them

as worthy of study, particularly in the university. Building upon the selections of earlier anthologists, editors focused upon a smaller number of authors and included longer works. The format of the anthology reflected a more serious and scholarly view of the nation's literature: critical assessment replaced broad representation. Anthologists worked to refine the canon that had been established, and their choices were strongly determined by assessments of literary value.

The Thematic Phase

Interest in the notable features of the nation's literature escalated in the thematic stage, which was characterized by the dominance of a single, thematic approach to texts—a determination to find certain ideas and attitudes in the literature—and a drive towards more detailed examinations. Much thematic criticism was influenced by Northrop Frye's concept of the "garrison mentality,"¹⁷ in which early settlers wished to maintain the traditions and mores of the Old World while secluding themselves from their physical surroundings; in this view, the Canadian literary imagination developed in an environment of ambivalence and uncertainty towards nature and indigenous culture, a markedly different view from that of anthologists in the previous phase. Frye wrote that Canadian literature was "more significantly studied as a part of Canadian life than as a part of an autonomous world of literature" (Conclusion 834); he argued that critics should not evaluate the aesthetic worth of Canadian literature, since much of it had little merit and instead suggested that its shaping patterns be studied. Margaret Atwood, in *Survival: A*

¹⁷ Frye writes, "Small and isolated communities surrounded with a physical or psychological 'frontier,' separated from one another and from their American and British cultural sources: communities that provide all that their members have in the way of distinctively human values, and that are compelled to feel a great respect for the law and order that holds them together, yet confronted with a huge, unthinking, menacing, and formidable physical setting – such communities are bound to develop what we may provisionally call a garrison mentality" (Conclusion 842).

Thematic Guide to Canadian Literature (1972), built upon Frye's notion of the garrison mentality and argued that the central preoccupations in the nation's literature are the themes of survival and the victim (34-35). She discussed a number of other themes, such as isolation, alienation, and failure and studied the appearance of these and other motifs throughout a number of Canadian works.

During this phase, anthologists identified the struggle to survive as a distinctly Canadian preoccupation and emphasized the new understandings of the nation's literature and people that emerged as a result. This specific focus caused elements of the Canadian identity to be regarded in new ways. Traits that were once celebrated, such as a close, rewarding connection with nature, were complicated by thematic criticism, and assessments of the land, climate, and northern geography centred instead upon the destructive effects of the physical environment. Foreign influence, specifically American culture, was considered a threat to the evolution of the Canadian identity. The Aboriginal presence, which was aligned with nature in the literary historical phase, was seen in one of two ways: as a threatening "instrument of Nature the Monster" or as a "variant[] of the victim motif" (Atwood, *Survival* 102). Further, there was an increased emphasis upon the individual, and anthologists selected works stressing the individual's relationship with his or her family, community, and physical environment, as well as the conflicts among them. Due to the focus upon negative themes and discord, Canadian identity was most frequently portrayed as governed by the garrison mentality and characterized by tension, fear, uncertainty, and hopelessness. The thematic assessments of this phase demonstrate, despite the often negative characterization of the Canadian psyche, a growing confidence in the value of the nation's literature as a record of Canadian identity and the movement towards a clear and unified vision of the Canadian literary tradition.

Several distinct traits emerged in anthologies at this point. Editors focused more extensively upon a smaller number of works than was common in the previous phase. Excerpts were longer, a greater number of works by a single author were included, and introductions and headnotes were more detailed. An overview of the nation remained an overriding interest, but the particular elements of the writing, namely unifying themes, were emphasized, creating new areas of interest. The process of anthologizing itself began to receive a greater amount of attention, as editors referenced their processes of selection, omissions, personal preferences, and the activities of earlier anthologists. Editors articulated their thoughts on the process more consistently and clearly than earlier anthologists had; perhaps as confidence grew in the status of Canadian literature, anthologists felt more comfortable with considering their own interests and re-evaluating the decisions earlier editors had made.

The impact of *Survival* upon anthologies was immediately apparent. One year after the publication of Atwood's critical work, Robert Weaver and William Toye, in the preface to *The Oxford Anthology of Canadian Literature* (1973), note that the

themes we have assigned to the material [. . .] reveal some characteristics of our literature, in both English and French, that have often been noticed. Alienation. The victim. Endurance. A hostile natural environment. These are some of the themes explored by Margaret Atwood in her arresting study of Canadian literature, appropriately called *Survival*. They are not, of course, uniquely Canadian preoccupations. Indeed, alienation is world-wide; the victim can be discovered everywhere. But it seems that in Canadian writing, while there is love and humour, and nature is sometimes benign and celebrated for its benevolence, and there are small triumphs

from time to time, the mood is most often sombre—not unlike other literatures in the twentieth century. (xiii-xiv)

These comments reveal the editors' thematic interests and their focus upon literature as an index of the national psyche. Other elements of the anthology show a preoccupation with recurring motifs. While the editors arranged the anthology alphabetically, they also included an index of "Themes and Subjects," which includes "Alienation," "Nature" (with subdivisions of gentle and hostile), and "Victims." The introduction and index highlight the connections between the Canadian literary tradition and thematic interests, firmly situating the anthology in the phase.

Published in the same year as Weaver and Toyé's anthology, the four volumes of *The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English*¹⁸ show a similar interest in uncovering the common themes of the nation's literature. In the first of the four volumes, *The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English: Beginnings to 1867*, editor Mary Jane Edwards writes that pre-Confederation authors "helped develop and preserve patterns of life and literature that others could and did follow" (Introduction 14) and that the "experiences of the post-Confederation Canadian writers [. . .] resulted in the creation of poetry and fiction which explored many themes" (Introduction 10). The anthology also included detailed analyses of poetry and prose, styles, influences, details of publishing, and overviews of authors' political views and involvement. The thorough examination of the details of authors' lives and writing provided important context for the study of recurring motifs.

¹⁸ The four volumes are *The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English: Beginnings to 1867*, edited by Mary Jane Edwards (1973); *The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English: 1867-1914*, edited by Mary Jane Edwards, Paul Denham, and George Parker (1973); *The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English: 1916-1945* edited by George L. Parker (1973); and *The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English: 1945- 1970* edited by Paul Denham (1973).

The second volume, *The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English: 1867-1914* (1973) edited by Edwards, Paul Denham, and George Parker, also had a thematic bent evident through an interest in uncovering common patterns. Another interesting feature of this edition is the discussion of the details of compiling an anthology:

the task of choosing both the best and the most representative selections from the works of these authors for an anthology of limited length has not been easy. By following our editorial policies of representing only the work of authors who were either born in, or who became permanent residents of, Canada and using only complete selections, we were able to select more, and occasionally longer, works of some authors who played crucial roles in the development of Canadian literature but we had to omit other authors and works that might perhaps have been included. The selections, therefore, do not fulfil all our dreams about what an anthology of Canadian literature between 1867 and 1914 should be. They do represent, however, many important characteristics of Canadian life and writing during this period. (Preface v)

Quality, representation, residency, genre, and impact were factors in assembling the anthology, linking their approach with other editors of the stage. The features of the Canadian experience highlighted in the anthology were chosen to trace lines of influence, suggesting a thematic approach. Like the first volume, the second centred upon contextual details and offered detailed examination of authors' lives and writing.

The third edition of *Canadian Anthology*, edited by Klinck and Watters, was published in 1974. Of the anthologies in the phase, this anthology is the least clearly influenced by the thematic school; this seems due to the fact that the anthology was the

third edition and was in many ways a continuation of the interests and focus of the previous editions. Despite this, the anthology does have some traits of the phase, specifically confidence in the status of Canadian writing and an interest in evaluating editorial activity. The editors comment upon the changes between the first and third editions, pointing out that the anthology was first published

when courses in our national literature were few and far between. The editors, however, were themselves teaching university courses in the subject, and urgently needed a volume of reading in prose and verse to put in their students' hands. No such anthology was then available. There were no Canadian paperback series, and no journals exclusively devoted to Canadian literary studies. Today, Canada's literary scene has been completely transformed. Several anthologies have recently appeared, several paperback series are flourishing, and books and periodical articles on Canadian literature stream forth incessantly. (Preface xiii)

Their comments display the confidence in Canadian writing that other editors discussed and situate the literature as worthy of serious critical study.

In Smith's *The Canadian Experience: A Brief Survey of English-Canadian Prose* (1974), thematic interests are once again clear. Smith was still concerned with accessibility, as he was in the first edition of *Canadian Poetry*, but he also concentrates upon the recurring themes:

The purpose of this book then is to make available to as large an audience as possible a selection of texts which illustrate the special character that geography, climate, and politics have imposed upon the sensibility and thought of the Canadian people. Canadian literature may be defined,

perhaps, as the inevitable, often unconscious artistic expression of that character. (Introduction xiv)

He views early Canadian prose as an “instrument or a tool to be used in the main task of subduing the wilderness, achieving an emotional adjustment to the new environment, and securing a safe and stable social and political organization” (Introduction x). The sense of a wild, untamed natural world against which the individual must struggle is a key aspect of thematic criticism and his analysis of literature as a means to counter the power of nature suggests such a reading. He then posits that there is “a unity, a harmony, a set of common characteristics, rising out of a common confrontation with a common experience” evident throughout the prose selections (Introduction xix). He points to these traits as an essential element, though not the sole one, of his process of selection: “The editor’s opinion finds expression [of national identity] in the pieces of literature he has chosen to include, though his criterion has been in every case literary, not social, political, or historical [. . .] [;] it is from art in all its forms that the true essence, *soul*, if you will, of a country can be best discerned” (Introduction xix). Unlike some editors in the thematic phase, Smith upholds literary quality as the main criterion for anthology inclusion, but he also emphasizes the distinct themes that can be seen to unify the nation’s writing and, by extension, define the Canadian character.

Douglas Daymond and Leslie Monkman presented their anthology, *Literature in Canada* (1978), as outlining the tradition as well as reflecting contemporary critical interests. Their preface to the first volume of *Literature in Canada* details their view of the growth of anthologies of Canadian literature. The focus upon unifying motifs is suggested in their comment that “Authors whose creative imaginations have been a predominant force in shaping a Canadian literary tradition are extensively represented”

(Preface ix). Furthermore, much of the material they chose supports a thematic reading. Like other editors of the phase, they remark upon previously published anthologies and emphasize the connection between the desire for cultural validation and anthologies: “The predilection of Canadians for what Northrop Frye has called ‘relentless cultural stock-taking and self-inventories’ is nowhere more evident than in the many anthologies that serve as points of reference throughout the literary history of Canada” (Preface ix). They then list several anthologies they consider influential; their overview of the history of Canadian literature anthologies indicates that, like Klinck and Watters, they believe the anthology is an essential element of documenting and defining the nation’s literature.

The second edition of Weaver and Toye’s *The Oxford Anthology of Canadian Literature* (1981) was the final anthology of this phase, and while the anthology is clearly associated with the thematic phase, the editors’ notes and interests hint towards the concerns of the next, pluralistic stage. The editors show a clear confidence in the status of Canadian writing and remark upon the process of compiling an anthology. The preface is similar to that of the first edition in its focus upon recurring motifs: “The themes we have assigned to the material reveal some obsessions in our literature, both English and French, that have often been noticed: alienation; the victim; endurance; a hostile natural environment—all of which have been explored in Margaret Atwood’s *Survival* and other studies of Canadian literature” (Preface xiii). The index is arranged by “Themes and Subjects,” continuing the emphasis from the first edition. But they also made significant changes, noting that they “tried to represent the continuing expansion of Canadian writing through the 1970s to the beginning of the 1980s. In doing this we have had to make, regretfully, some omissions—notably the earliest writers” (Preface xiv). Along with the

removal of some early authors, they added new authors to reflect and respond to shifts in the literature:

In the eight years since the First Edition appeared there have been two significant developments on the Canadian literary scene. Regionalism—writings centred on British Columbia, the Prairie Provinces, Ontario, Quebec, and the Atlantic provinces—has flowered in a large body of fiction, poetry, and drama. It is represented by many anthologies and had helped to make major figures of such writers as Rudy Wiebe, Jack Hodgins, and Robert Kroetsch (all of whom are in this anthology). The critic Northrop Frye has described regionalism as ‘an inevitable part of the maturing of the culture of a society like ours’; in the late 1970s it became a pervasive characteristic of contemporary Canadian writing. (Preface xiv)

The other development is “the interest shown in our literature abroad” (Preface xiv), apparent through author visits, awards, and translations. Their comments upon new areas of inquiry and interest show the beginnings of a movement away from considerations of themes alone. The shifts in interest anticipate the central concerns of the following phase of anthology development.

At this time, then, the status of Canadian literature had been established, and the existence and quality of Canadian writing were no longer questioned as they had been in the past. Critics and editors were free to turn their attention to the large patterns of the texts, which they did through the critical lens of the thematic approach. This specific focus led to further revision and narrowing of the canon. Editors frequently selected works that revealed patterns common to the Canadian experience and identity. The selective canon that had been presented in the literary historical stage was challenged

through the revisions of the thematic stage. Wendell Harris's categorizations of the "diachronic canon," the "glacially changing core" of the canon, and the "nonce canon," a "rapidly changing periphery [of which] only a miniscule part [. . .] will eventually become part of the diachronic canon" (113) become relevant at this point. The process of re-evaluating and revising the selective canon demonstrates how the interests of the thematic phase challenged and revised the selective canon. The variations between the selective canons of the literary historical and thematic phases reveal the process through which the nonce canon develops; the authors who remained in selective canons of several phases become part of the diachronic canon.

The Pluralistic Phase

Near the end of the thematic phase, anthologists, like critics, began to resist the narrow and sometimes restrictive emphasis of thematic criticism by exploring new approaches to canonical texts and considering works previously overlooked or undervalued. Such interests were in part influenced by government policy and laws, namely the recognition of multiculturalism in the Charter of Rights and Freedoms in 1982 and the Canadian Multiculturalism Act of 1988.¹⁹ Anthologies from the early 1980s on show a renewed

¹⁹ Section 3.1 of the Multiculturalism Policy of Canada states,

"It is hereby declared to be the policy of the Government of Canada to

(a) recognize and promote the understanding that multiculturalism reflects the cultural and racial diversity of Canadian society and acknowledges the freedom of all members of Canadian society to preserve, enhance and share their cultural heritage;

(b) recognize and promote the understanding that multiculturalism is a fundamental characteristic of the Canadian heritage and identity and that it provides an invaluable resource in the shaping of Canada's future;

(c) promote the full and equitable participation of individuals and communities of all origins in the continuing evolution and shaping of all aspects of Canadian society and assist them in the elimination of any barrier to that participation;

(d) recognize the existence of communities whose members share a common origin and their historic contribution to Canadian society, and enhance their development;

interest in literary and social history and a move away from notions of nation, nationality, and unity towards considerations of gender, sexuality, region, and cultural plurality. These considerations reflect the rise of multiculturalism, feminism, and postcolonial theory and an overarching concern with inclusiveness and diversity. Interest in alternative and subversive views of the nation, issues of race, and the inclusion of marginalized voices became dominant areas of critical inquiry and emphasis, marking a major departure in selection criteria. Anthologists at this time emphasized the diversity of Canada and viewed the multiplicity of voices and perspectives as an integral element of Canada's literary heritage. In his introduction to *Open Country: Canadian Literature in English*, Robert Lecker discusses the effect of contemporary critical trends:

editors wrestle with questions about how the nation is represented through its literature and about the extent to which its literary canon should be repudiated or reproduced. They are also forced to make difficult decisions about representing genre, gender, chronology, region, revision, abridgement, and the repertoire of every single author to be included in the chosen group. (xxii)

As Jeffrey R. Di Leo notes, editors are faced with “the delicate issues of how one balances the desire to represent ‘the best which has been thought and said’ with the contemporary

(e) ensure that all individuals receive equal treatment and equal protection under the law, while respecting and valuing their diversity;

(f) encourage and assist the social, cultural, economic and political institutions of Canada to be both respectful and inclusive of Canada's multicultural character;

(g) promote the understanding and creativity that arise from the interaction between individuals and communities of different origins;

(h) foster the recognition and appreciation of the diverse cultures of Canadian society and promote the reflection and the evolving expressions of those cultures;

(i) preserve and enhance the use of languages other than English and French, while strengthening the status and use of the official languages of Canada; and

(j) advance multiculturalism throughout Canada in harmony with the national commitment to the official languages of Canada.”

mandate towards equality of representation” (“Analyzing” 12). Anthologists must find a balance between innovation and preservation: new voices, materials, and elements of the tradition are included and explored while the tradition of Canadian literature is affirmed and outlined.

The format of the anthology and the focus of editorial comments also change at this time. Introductions, prefaces, and headnotes are extensive, detailed, and scholarly, offering readers historical and critical backgrounds on authors and literary trends. Editors discuss elements of their anthologies, such as selection, organization, omissions, inclusion, headnotes, and footnotes to a greater extent than in the past. They are also aware of the anthologies published previously and the constructions of the nation presented within; their own presentations of the country and its literature build upon and, crucially, react to earlier versions. Along with considering previous anthologies and textual details, editors begin to discuss the question of the canon and canonicity overtly. The careful attention to details of anthology compilation perhaps indicates a shift towards more serious consideration and evaluation of the anthology genre, as editors assess their own and others’ choices and processes in a critical and sustained manner.

The first anthology of this phase was *An Anthology of Canadian Literature in English* (1982), edited by Russell Brown and Donna Bennett. Published a year after Weaver and Toyé’s *Oxford Anthology of Canadian Literature*, the anthology is positioned at a point of transition between the thematic and pluralistic phases, and traits of both phases emerge. There are several references to thematic interests: for example, they remark that authors such as Frances Brooke, Catharine Parr Traill, Samuel Hearne, David Thompson, and Susanna Moodie “became part of the archetypal Canadian tales and have frequently been responded to by later writers” (1: Introduction xii). References to

thematic critics²⁰ also reveal the influence of thematic criticism upon the editors. However, the anthology largely centres upon other interests, namely a focus upon historical and cultural milieus and the exploration of diversity rather than an emphasis upon unity. The editors comment that the works they selected can “be read both for their intrinsic interest and for the way they collectively reveal the cultural and historical contexts that inform them” (1: Introduction xi-xii), suggesting a shift away from themes of survival and isolation. Departure from these areas of focus is even clearer in the introduction to the second volume, when the editors point out that much contemporary writing departs from the concerns of earlier authors: “this volume records the progress of Canadian writers in consolidating the modernism of their predecessors; in exploring and developing the range of possibilities that had been opened up to them; and, in some cases, in reacting against or seeking to go beyond this inheritance” (Introduction xiv). The anthology is mainly characterized by a pluralistic approach, but the influence of the thematic school is apparent, showing that there is some permeability between phases.

In 1990, Brown, Bennett, and Nathalie Cooke edited a one-volume revised and abridged edition of *An Anthology of Canadian Literature in English*; this edition is firmly part of the pluralistic phase and does not show traits of the thematic stage. The editors discuss their process of revision and show their awareness of their activities as canon-makers. This is the first time that anthologists directly linked their activities to the canon; they position themselves as engaging with the question of the canon and view earlier anthologists as undertaking the same task. They write, “As well as shortening some

²⁰ In discussing the evolution of Canadian literature, they write “there exists what Northrop Frye has called an ‘imaginative continuum’—a milieu in which ‘writers are conditioned in their attitudes by their predecessor, or by the cultural climate of their predecessors, whether there is a conscious influence or not’” (Introduction xii). Further, they suggest that “readers looking for overriding themes that unify Canadian writing will want to test their discoveries against those suggested by Frye, George Woodcock, and (in Volume II) D.G. Jones” (1: Introduction xiii).

previous selections and omitting some writers, the editors have updated selections and headnotes throughout, and several authors have been added, reflecting not only the emergence of new figures but the continuing reassessment of the canon” (Introduction xvii). Along with considerations of the canon, they point to definitions of Canadian identity as a driving force behind much Canadian writing: the “Canadian literary tradition [. . .] has been shaped by a need for chronicling the Canadian experience and developing a sense of self-identity” (Introduction xiii). The view of the national character they present is diverse, complex, and multifaceted: “Within Canadian writing a number of divergent elements remain in play that speak of the romantic, positivist, sceptical inheritances, and along with Canada’s sense of place as wilderness, rural, agrarian, and urban, continue to create the complex and still emerging Canadian identity” (Introduction xiv).

Attention to varied perspectives and experiences is even stronger in the third edition, *A New Anthology of Canadian Literature in English* (2002), edited by Bennett and Brown. They discuss the changes made to the various editions and classify the anthology as “a reconsideration of Canadian literature in English at the beginning of the twenty-first century” (Preface xiii). In their introductory remarks, they argue for the necessity of re-evaluating and broadening the tradition:

in the past generation, Canadian publishers and readers have expanded their range in a way that reflects the new diversity as well as the continuing vitality of the Canadian literary milieu. Some of the writers who appear for the first time in this edition of our anthology come out of new writing by individuals of Native descent; some are here as a result of the increased impact of Maritime and Western writers beyond their regions; some are shaped by the continued urbanization of Canada, some by the increased

presence of immigrants who trace their descent from areas other than Europe; some have found their voice because of the acknowledgement of greater sexual diversity; and some would have been visible only in minority communities. (Preface xiii)

As these comments make clear, the pluralistic phase, which moved from a reassessment of literary and historical context to the inclusion of a wide range of diverse, often marginalized, authors, has a broader scope than earlier stages and seeks to redefine the nation's literary tradition.

Brown and Bennett's introductory remarks also demonstrate the negotiation between tradition and innovation that occurs in anthologies of this phase. They note that there are clear continuities within the tradition, as "a recurrent concern among our writers has been to report accurately about experience" (Introduction xvi), as well as significant shifts: "As Canada has changed, so have writers' priorities about *which* details are important to depict, and about what kind of depiction is appropriate, what language to use, what narrative structures will best serve, and what value to assign these changing circumstances. But an aspiration to report, to document has remained strong" (Introduction xvi). As they worked to represent the variety of writing that has been part of the articulation of distinct national traits, the editors found that even genre needed to be reassessed. They note that at mid-century "it was agreed that [. . .] poetry formed the centre of the Canadian canon [. . .] but longer works of fiction and other prose have moved to the centre of attention" (Preface xiii-xiv). Along with a shift from poetry to prose, the boundaries and definition of the "literary" are not as firmly established as they once were; their first anthology included some exploration and settlement writing and "those forms have become more important since, and their presence here has increased"

(Preface xiv). The editors worked to provide accurate reflections of current interests; the consideration of continuities and disruptions over time reveals much about the process of anthologizing.

Robert Lecker's *Open Country: Canadian Literature in English* (2008) is part of the pluralistic phase. His approach is similar to others of the stage: the anthology provides detailed critical headnotes, offers an overview of the tradition, revises past presentations, and includes analysis of contemporary critical trends. One significant element of the anthology is his discussion of the process of anthologizing and the links between the canon and anthologies. As his overview of his guidelines for compiling the anthology demonstrates, he followed and revised the approaches of other anthologists:

In making choices for this anthology, I was guided by a number of editorial aims. I wanted to give the book a contemporary emphasis by including writers who have emerged in the past 10 years. At the same time, I tried to cover writers who have been historically excluded from mainstream anthologies of Canadian literature and to include a greater representation of material from the Maritimes and the West. Although many of the selections include canonical works by some of Canada's best-known writers, I have also chosen some of their lesser-known poetry and fiction in order to challenge traditional assumptions about their output. I hope the extensive explanatory material contained in footnotes throughout the volume will enrich the reading experience. (Preface xxi)

Additionally, he analyzes the process of anthologizing. Following his overview of his goals for the collection, Lecker discusses anthologies, editors, and the canon. He concludes with the suggestion that his anthology is part of an ongoing conversation:

“Literary taste is a give and take, and it is always affected by others. [. . .] Every anthologist has to be conscious of other anthologists who have faced similar editorial challenges. This anthology is in conversation with earlier anthologies of Canadian literature. I hope it will converse with others that follow it” (Introduction xxv).

Cynthia Sugars and Laura Moss’s two-volume *Canadian Literature in English: Texts and Contexts* (2009) offers a varied overview of Canadian literature and shows both preservation and innovation. They discuss the process of anthologizing, noting in the preface to the first volume that they had to address “issues of balance, representation, artistic merit, historical import, and space” and that they “had to make compromises and omit materials that [they] would very much like to have included” (xi-xii). In addition to prose and poetry, they included “visual materials and contextual pieces alongside important writings by canonical and non-canonical, literary and ‘non-literary’ Canadian authors” (Preface xi). These selections show a significant expansion of what is deemed literary and an overt return to sociological issues, especially race and postcolonial concerns. When creating their anthology, they imagined an ideal anthology that would take into account the history of the settlement of Canada, while also representing a diversity of voices, [and] it would provide a good sense of the debates surrounding the growth of Canadian literature, including a recognition of the ways this literature was inevitably linked to shifting notions of national identity. Moreover it would provide substantial cultural-historical commentary on each period and its authors [. . .] and dispel the myth of the humourless Canadian author. (Preface xi)

Many of these broad goals for the anthology, along with their specific aims,²¹ are the defining features of the phase. The editors' considerations of cultural nationalism, defining characteristics, representation, and diversity reveal current critical concerns while also maintaining the national literary tradition.

The final anthology of the stage is *An Anthology of Canadian Literature in English* (2010) edited by Bennett and Brown. The editors added new material, changing the content to reflect their interest in diversity and inclusiveness. While the editors had discussed the development of Canadian literature in earlier anthologies, this edition includes an even more detailed overview of its growth, anthologies, and the canon, and their analysis suggests clear connections between the development of the literature and anthologies. The anthology fits with others of the pluralistic phase through its emphasis on multiculturalism, postcolonialism, and diversity, as well as in its self-consciousness about the relationship between anthologies and the canon. In Bennett and Brown's view, a stable canon has emerged and anthologies have played a central role in its articulation. The editors' consideration of their own role in the process of defining the canon shows a significant shift from earlier phases, where the question of canonicity was not directly addressed. Canadian literature, anthologies, and the canon are intertwined and their developments are dependent upon each other.

²¹ They outline their goals in the preface, which are to "provide a chronological survey of English-Canadian poetry, short fiction, pamphlets, nonfiction, and essays, ranging from the sixteenth century to the present" (xiii); "include contextual materials to accompany the wide range of literary texts, including materials that might be used in classroom teaching, such as political speeches, government documents, maps, photographs, paintings, newspaper articles, cartoons, autobiographical statements, songs, popular culture texts, and essays" (xiv); "provide extensive historical introductions to each section that present an overview of the period as well as contextualizing discussion of specific authors and texts included in the anthology" (xiv); "chart the central debates surrounding the formation of Canadian national literary and cultural traditions, particularly debated about the links between literary production and national identity" (xiv); "gather works that make intertextual reference to one another" (xv); and "[t]o be representative of different regions, ethnicities, histories, and gender identities" (xvi).

As Bennett and Brown suggest, the canon continues to be reassessed at this point. The selective canon established during the thematic phase is being re-evaluated and modified. Editors are interested in authors and works who demonstrate the diversity of the nation's writing. As was shown in the previous stage, the revisions and modifications of the canon in this phase reveal the contours of both the nonce and diachronic canons and the emergence of a stable canon. Works that are able to sustain a range of critical approaches are included in the selective canons of several phases and gradually become part of the stable canon. The anthology is a central tool in determining which authors and works enter the canon. Golding remarks that once "a selective canon has been formed, every anthologist faces the choice of maintaining or trying to change the canon" (25); these choices are a concern for editors, and throughout the pluralistic stage, they are highly aware of the impact of their choices and activities.

As this chapter demonstrates, there are clear stages of development of the general anthology and these phases are associated with articulations of the canon. As anthologies develop, there are points of overlap, clear links with views of national culture, connections with critical trends, and a continuing interest in the Canadian experience and identity. These features show that anthologies both reflect and contribute to definitions of the nation and the literary tradition. The anthology is a tool of preservation, innovation, pedagogy, and recovery; these functions are apparent throughout the development of general anthologies of Canadian literature and suggest the value of the genre.

CHAPTER TWO

Frances Brooke

This chapter investigates the treatment of Frances Brooke (1723-1789) in general anthologies to demonstrate the relationship between anthology inclusion and critical interests, as well as to examine how an overlooked author may be recovered through the anthology. Brooke is currently recognized as the author of the first North American and first Canadian novel, *The History of Emily Montague* (1769), a sentimental epistolary tale of courtship in the New World, set in the recently conquered territory of Quebec, where Brooke's husband was stationed as Anglican chaplain to the British garrison. The novel was initially well-received following its publication, with six editions released in Brooke's lifetime, but it was largely ignored in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Brooke was not included in general anthologies of Canadian literature until 1955 when she was selected to pinpoint the emergence of a distinct English-Canadian literary tradition, and her work was then presented as creating a vivid and compelling image of the Canadian environment. This acknowledgement marked the beginning of Brooke's critical recovery: significant assessments of her work occurred in later phases of anthology development when the novel came to be appreciated for its documentary value, characterization, feminist message, and postcolonial relevance. Brooke's varied reception, from exclusion to recognition as a skilled feminist author and a figure central to understanding Canada's postcolonial status, illustrates the myriad ways that anthologists respond to critical and cultural forces and demonstrates the central role of anthologies in canon-making.

Brooke's treatment in anthologies in recent decades reveals the connections between the presentation of authors in anthologies and dominant critical discourse. In "Sisters Under the Mink: The Correspondent Fear in *The History of Emily Montague*," (1994), Dermot McCarthy provided a succinct overview of the various critical approaches to the novel:

Literary historians and critics have converged on Brooke's novel from four directions, seeing it as an originary object in Canadian literary history; as a discussion of European themes that employs the epistolary form and capitalizes on the exotic vehicle of a North American setting; as a sociocultural document and 'celebration' of the unique Canadian space; and finally, as a significant proto-feminist work in a revisionist-feminist literary history. (340)

These four modes of interpretation are evident within the phases of anthology development: the first two views of the novel appeared during the literary nationalistic phase, the idea of the novel as a "sociocultural document" emerged during the thematic phase, and consideration of the novel as a "proto-feminist work" materialized during the pluralistic phase. McCarthy's suggestion that assessments of Brooke have fallen into certain critical categories is upheld through examination of the links between criticism and anthologies. Interestingly, while seeing himself as rebutting critical trends to read the novel afresh, he actually embodied the newest of such trends, for he presents a postcolonial reading, the emphasis that has dominated recent critical studies of the novel. He argues that the "landscape, Natives, and French Canadians of Quebec [. . .] [create] various forms of alterity [that] embody what the colonial power, by right of its civilizing mission, must conquer and convert, and, by embodying it so vividly, they further

legitimize the colonial project by configuring the magnitude of otherness that threatens it” (356). This postcolonial perspective on the novel is found in anthologies of the pluralistic phase, demonstrating the close interconnections between prevailing critical interests and representations of Brooke’s novel in anthologies.

Indeed, Brooke’s treatment in general anthologies reveals the impact of the controlling impulses of particular stages of anthology development, and the changes in Brooke’s presentation demonstrate the effect and significance of anthology inclusion. Brooke was recovered through the anthology in the 1950s. Her epistolary novel contains a total of 228 letters, offering a range of subjects and themes; however, only a small group of letters has been anthologized consistently, specifically letters 49 and 80. These epistles were selected for the first general anthology to include Brooke, and since that time, either Letter 49 or Letter 80 has been excerpted in every anthology that includes her. While the particular emphases have varied during the decades of inclusion, the consistent selection of these two letters indicates that they are regarded as part of the Canadian canon. Consideration of the anthologies demonstrate that Brooke was saved from obscurity through inclusion in an anthology and that her work has been viewed as significant to the national tradition ever since, though in remarkably different ways.

Brooke’s Biography and Literary Works

Frances Brooke, the eldest daughter of Mary Knowles Moore and Reverend Thomas Moore, was baptized on January 24, 1724. Her father died in 1727, and her mother passed away ten years later, leaving Frances and her two sisters to live with their aunt and uncle at Tydd Saint Mary, Lincolnshire, where she lived until she was an adult. Her uncle, a curate, belonged to the rural gentry, and Brooke was educated as a member of that class:

she was taught at home by her mother and then her aunt, and learned reading, writing, arithmetic, Italian and French translation, as well as the domestic arts. Laura Moss notes in “A Literary Biography of Frances Brooke” that the literary allusions and intertextual references of Brooke’s work suggest that she “must have read extensively in a well-stocked and comprehensive library” (355). At the age of twenty-four, she moved to London to pursue a career as a writer and met this goal with success, for she “became a celebrated essayist, journalist, dramatist, novelist, and translator” (Moss 355). In London, she was part of a literary circle that included several prominent authors, such as Samuel Johnson, James Boswell, Anna Seward, Oliver Goldsmith, Samuel Richardson, and Frances Burney (Moss 355-56).

As a prolific author, Brooke was involved with a variety of projects; her first literary undertaking was the creation of a periodical, *The Old Maid* (1755 – 1756), which she wrote under the pseudonym Mary Singleton, Spinster. *The Old Maid* dealt with a range of topics, including the theatre, love, courtship, marriage, and politics (Moss 356). In the periodical’s final year, Brooke also published her first collection, entitled *Virginia, a Tragedy with Odes, Pastorals and Translations*, which included eleven poems, a translation of Italian Renaissance court poet Battista Guarini’s “La Bella Cacciatrice,” and a tragedy Brooke wrote (Moss 356). Brooke stopped writing the periodical around the time of her marriage to John Brooke, rector of Colney, Norfolk in 1756. In the following year, Brooke had a son, John Moore.

In 1757, John Brooke left England for Canada, and by 1760, he was the chaplain to the British garrison in Quebec. Although he spent a total of eleven years in Canada, his wife was not able to join him in Quebec until 1763; following the Treaty of Paris (1763) and the ceding of Canada to Britain, Canada was decreed a British colony and Brooke

believed it was safe for his family to join him in Quebec (Moss 360). During her husband's absence, Brooke had published a translation of Marie Riccoboni's *Lettres de Milday Juliette Catesby, à Milady Henriette Compley, Son Amie* (*The Letters of Lady Juliet Catesby to her Friend, Lady Henrietta Campley*) (1760), an epistolary novel of sensibility. In 1763, Brooke published her first novel, *The History of Lady Julia Mandeville*, which was well-received by both critics and readers (Moss 359).

During Brooke's time in Quebec, she is believed to have written most, or even all, of *The History of Emily Montague* (Moss 361). In 1768, the Brookes returned to England, and this, her second novel, was published in the following year. Brooke continued her literary career after her return to England, translating two French sentimental novels, *Memoirs of the Marquis de St. Forlaix* by Nicholas Framery, published in 1770 and *Elements of the History of England, From the Invasion of the Romans to the Reign of George the Second* by Abbé Millot, published in 1771 (Moss 362). Brooke then became involved with the theatre, managing The King's Theatre in the Haymarket with actress Mary Ann Yates from 1773 to 1777 (McMullen 151). Also in 1777, Brooke published her third novel, *The Excursion*, which was not as well received as her earlier novels, but a second edition of the novel was published in 1785, suggesting that it had at least a moderate readership (Moss 363).

Three of Brooke's plays were performed and published in the 1780s. *The Siege of Sinope – A Tragedy* was performed ten times at Covent Garden in 1781 and was published in the same year. In 1782, *Rosina: A Comic Opera in Two Acts* was produced and was quite successful, being performed two hundred and one times before 1800 in England, New York, and Jamaica (Moss 363). Brooke wrote a third opera, *Marian, A Comic Opera – Airs, Songs, Duets, Trios and Chorusses* [sic], which was performed in

1788. Brooke died on January 23, 1789, two days after her husband (Moss 364). *The History of Charles Mandeville*, a sequel to *Lady Julia Mandeville*, was published posthumously in 1790.

The Literary Historical Phase

Brooke was not included in any general anthologies in the literary historical stage, which is a notable exclusion, considering that *The History of Emily Montague* later came to be viewed as the first Canadian novel and significantly representative of Canadian concerns. While editors have recently posited that Brooke's novel speaks to subjects and themes that Canadian authors have been particularly interested in, editors and critics in the 1920s did not find that her work belonged within the tradition they were seeking to define. The novel did not receive much critical interest at the time, and the little attention it received was fairly dismissive.

Tracing the critical reception of *The History of Emily Montague* reveals that the novel's status had dropped sharply in the decades prior to the publication of the first general anthology. The work was well-received following its initial publication: several editions and translations were produced by the end of the eighteenth century. Brooke was commended for her skilful presentation of the characters and the Canadian scene. Lorraine McMullen notes in *An Odd Attempt in a Woman: The Literary Life of Frances Brooke* that travel journals were popular at the time *The History of Emily Montague* was published, and Brooke's "description of Canada and its people was an added impetus to sales" (113). The novel became so popular among travellers that "*Emily Montague* became required reading for early British travellers to Canada" (McMullen 115), an assertion upheld by the references several British authors and travellers made to Brooke

and her novel.²² However, despite this early success, *The History of Emily Montague* was largely ignored in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. A handful of critical reviews of the novel appeared in the 1910s and 1920s,²³ and these analyses sought to make readers aware of the novel's existence and emphasized the presentation of the Canadian scene but were not particularly laudatory. The novel was republished in 1931 as part of The Canada Series, edited by F.P. Grove, but the new edition garnered little critical and popular interest. In his article "The First Canadian Novel" (1946), Desmond Pacey outlines the novel's shortcomings, shedding light on contemporary views of it. Pacey concurred with earlier reviewers that "From its portrayal of Canadian life the book derives most of its interest and value" and that the artistic "shortcomings are obvious: the plot is thin, conventional, repetitive, and poorly integrated with the informative sections of the book; the style is generally stilted and monotonous; the characters, with one or two exceptions, are traditional in conception and deficient in life; the whole performance is heavily didactic and sentimental" ("The First" 143). Despite these limitations, Pacey asserted that "the novel remains of interest and value to us as a social, and to a lesser extent as a literary, document" ("The First" 143). Pacey's evaluation aligns with the views of early critics who, while lamenting the novel's conventionality, praised Brooke's rendition of the Canadian scene as the most significant aspect of the novel.

Considering the primary concerns of the literary historical phase, Brooke's exclusion from anthologies of this time is not entirely surprising. Anthologists were interested in asserting the existence of a distinct national literature that spoke to some essential aspect of the nation; while *The History of Emily Montague* details characteristics

²² See McMullen 116.

²³ See J.M. Lemoine's "The First Canadian Novelist, 1769" (1906), Ida Burwash's "An Old-Time Novel" (1907), and Charles S. Blue's "Canada's First Novelist" (1921).

and attitudes of early settlers and colonists, the novel focuses upon English characters, and the notable traits of the colony are secondary to the romance plot. Further, unflattering critical assessments of the work likely contributed to its exclusion from early collections. Brooke's British heritage also seems to have influenced editors' views of her work: in his introduction to the prose section of *Our Canadian Literature: Representative Prose and Verse*, Lorne Pierce writes that "although we include Frances Brooke [. . .] among our writers [she] really belong[s] to the old land" (125), showing that anthologists considered an author's birthplace to be as important as the subject of her writing. Brooke was regarded as essentially British rather than Canadian, an important distinction at a time when anthologists were concerned with establishing the existence and contours of a distinct national literature. Brooke's treatment at this time suggests that while critics viewed the novel as valuable in some ways, they did not consider it to be an influential or significant text, and that the author's nationality and the British frame of the novel disqualified it from being considered a fully Canadian work.

The Literary Nationalistic Phase

Carl F. Klinck and Reginald E. Watters's decision, then, to include Brooke in their collection, *Canadian Anthology* (1955), was a notable choice, for it demonstrated a shift in both the development of anthologies and in views of the nation's literature. *Canadian Anthology* marks the beginning of the literary nationalistic phase; Brooke's entry into general anthologies thus coincides with a shift in editorial focus from the assertion of the existence of a Canadian literature to an emphasis on how distinct aspects of national identity were apparent in certain works. Klinck and Watters present Brooke as both

influencing and reflecting images of the nation, offering readers a portrait of a specific region at an early point in the nation's history.

Brooke is the first author included in Klinck and Watters's anthology; the editors thus mark the beginnings of the nation's literary production with her. They emphasize Brooke's status as the author of the first Canadian novel, stating that her "place in Canadian literature is earned by the fact that she was unquestionably the first novelist to live and write in Canada, if not also in North America" (1). They selected two letters from *The History of Emily Montague* for their collection: Letter 49 and Letter 80. Arabella Fermor, the novel's vivacious coquette, is the author of the two epistles addressed to Lucy Rivers; in them, she describes both the trials and pleasures of winter in Canada. In Letter 49, Arabella complains about the terrible cold and states that the harsh Canadian winter deadens creative impulses. In the most frequently quoted lines from the novel, Arabella writes,

I no longer wonder the elegant arts are unknown here; the rigor of the climate suspends the very powers of the understanding; what then must become of those of the imagination? Those who expect to see

‘A new Athens rising near the pole,’

will find themselves extremely disappointed. Genius will never mount high, where the faculties of the mind are benumbed half the year.

’Tis sufficient employment for the most lively spirit here to contrive how to preserve an existence, of which there are moments that one is hardly conscious: the cold really brings on a sort of stupefaction. (2)

In the following letter, Arabella presents a more positive view of winter and suggests that the Canadian scene is in some ways more enjoyable than a British winter. She writes,

“Your dull foggy climate affords nothing that can give you the least idea of our frost pieces in Canada,” and then describes a journey in a cariole with “the serene blue sky above, the dazzling brightness of the sun” and remarks that “[e]ven an overturning has nothing alarming in it; you are laid gently down on a soft bed of snow, without the least danger of any kind” (4-5). The distinctive aspect of the Canadian climate is presented from two different viewpoints, perhaps suggesting that admiration follows recoil as the observer becomes more reconciled with the winter cold. The focus upon climate clearly locates the novel in Canada; the editorial choices suggest that the editors deliberately selected letters that emphasized the nation’s distinctive geography, ensuring that it would be viewed as a part of the national literature.

Inclusion of these particular letters also connects with a larger concern of the time, namely Canada’s rather halting cultural development. Such preoccupations emerged in the Massey Report, which addressed literary and cultural development. Critics were highly aware that the nation was perceived as having failed to produce a vibrant national literature, particularly in relation to the accomplishments of the United States. Klinck and Watters’s selection of Letter 45, which stresses the deadening effect of the cold upon creativity, speaks to prevailing debates about national culture. Arabella laments the stifling effect of winter and the “stupefaction” it causes, but she also imagines that there is opportunity for creativity to flourish: “I suppose Pygmalion’s statue was some frozen Canadian gentlewoman, and a sudden warm day thawed her. I love to expound ancient fables, and I think no exposition can be more natural than this” (4). This comment evokes a connection between the Canadian environment and myth, establishing the country as a place ready for grand stories, and while Arabella places the story of Pygmalion in the past, her retelling also suggests that the current frozen climate will thaw, allowing artistic

accomplishment to thrive. Through the selection of this letter, Klinck and Watters engaged with and responded to contemporary anxieties about the nation's literary culture.

Klinck and Watters's inclusion of Brooke marked the beginning of her recovery, and critical attention to the author grew in the following years.²⁴ Other anthologists of the literary national phase showcased Brooke and positioned her as a central figure in Canadian literature. In 1965, the first of two volumes of Canadian prose edited by A.J.M. Smith was published: *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings to Confederation*. Smith's approach to Brooke departs from Klinck and Watters's in that he devoted a significant section of his general introduction to Brooke, provided some critical commentary on the novel, and chose a total of eight letters for his collection, far more than had appeared in *Canadian Anthology*. The differences between the two anthologies illustrate how editors modify and vary approaches to authors, often within the same phase.

In the general introduction, Smith assesses Brooke's prose, finding that while her novel casts Canada in an unflattering light at some points, her writing is substantial and authentic. He concludes that the novel is "prejudiced and conventional, but it is not superficial"; further, it is "superior" and "condescending, and thus it is not in the mainstream of native Canadian letters" (Introduction xvii). Smith argues that Canadians should not accept the dismissive view of the nation and its artistic potential presented in the novel. His assessment of the novel's faults offers some insight into why certain anthologists chose to exclude Brooke from their collections: it did not promote an entirely

²⁴ In 1961, *The History of Emily Montague* was published as part of the New Canadian Library series. In the foreword, Klinck asserts that "The book has not gone unrecognized; it has long been in the canon of Canadian literature" (v). While this claim may be an overstatement, the novel was certainly beginning to be viewed as an important work.

positive view of the nation. However, he determines that the novel can be favourably compared with other notable Canadian works:

it is what might be called the literature of preconceived ideas, at the opposite pole from the solid practical inductive observation of a David Thompson or a Mrs. Moodie. It is second rate perhaps, but at least the writer was on the spot at the time, and her book is closer to reality than the romantic historical novels or even the painstakingly ‘got up’ period pieces such as *The Golden Dog* or *The Seats of the Mighty*. (Introduction xvii)

Thus Smith judges the aesthetic merits of *The History of Emily Montague*, claiming that although Brooke has not equalled Susanna Moodie’s achievements as an author, she is a more realistic and evocative author than a William Kirby or a Gilbert Parker.

Smith’s greatest interest in the novel lies with its documentary qualities. While he freely admits the novel’s shortcomings, he insists that *The History of Emily Montague* deserves recognition as a truthful, revealing portrayal of garrison life. He asserts that the novel “has a genuine social and historical interest. It shows, for instance, how closely the British governing party after 1763 identified its own interests with those of the seigneurs and land-owning aristocracy of the old regime” (Introduction xvii). He praises Brooke for having “utilized the material afforded by the society around her, English and French, military and civil, to depict the manners and foibles and the political aspirations of the new British colony of Lower Canada” (Introduction xvi). He concludes that *The History of Emily Montague* “affords us a clearer picture of the social life of Quebec immediately after the conquest than any of the sober histories” (Introduction xvii).

In asserting that Brooke’s most significant contribution in the novel was the realistic depiction of certain elements of Canadian life, Smith shows his alignment with

the literary nationalistic phase. Interest in the distinctive features of the nation was a primary concern of the stage, and the letters he chose touch upon issues that remain central to questions of Canadian identity: representations of Aboriginal people, the divide between English and French, and the influence of British culture upon Canada.²⁵

Throughout the remainder of the literary national stage, the emphasis upon Brooke's importance as the first Canadian novelist and the assertion that her novel should be valued for its documentary snapshot of Canadian concerns and conditions remained the dominant approaches to the author. In later editions of *Canadian Anthology* (published in 1966 and 1974), Brooke was treated in a manner identical to the first edition, with the same headnotes and selections. This unvarying presentation of Brooke indicates that the editors were seeking to establish a tradition and maintain continuity with earlier choices, thereby asserting the existence of a strong, unbroken line of development which could be traced from the eighteenth century to the present. Brooke mattered because she showed readers something about Canadian life and social conditions at a particularly significant point in its history.

The Thematic Phase

Following the literary national stage, some significant changes in presentations of Brooke occurred as the concerns of thematic criticism were applied to her Canadian novel. In 1974, Smith issued *The Canadian Experience: A Brief Survey of English-Canadian Prose*, a revised and abridged edition of his earlier prose collections, and some shifts in his presentation of Brooke are apparent. Smith did not stress the historical and social value of

²⁵ He arranged the eight letters into three categories: "Colonel Rivers' Impressions of Canada (Letters III, IV, V, VI, and XI)," "An English Belle in Quebec (Letters XLV and XLIX)," and "A British Tory on the Canadians, the Americans, and the Savages (Letter CXV)."

the novel as he had in his 1965 collection, suggesting that he valued the documentary aspects of the novel less than he had and that his current interest in the novel was in its significance for thematic criticism. He shortened his discussion of Brooke in the general introduction and reduced the number of the novel's letters from eight to three, retaining letters 11, 45, and 49. The two epistles written by Arabella, Letter 45 and Letter 49, support the thematic approach. In the first, she describes the sense of isolation she feels after watching the last ship of the season leave the port: "you have no notion what a melancholy sight it is: we are now left to ourselves, and shut up from all the world for winter: somehow we seem so forsaken, so cut off from the rest of humankind, I cannot bear the idea" (9). In the second letter, she writes, "It is with difficulty I breathe, my dear; the cold is so amazingly intense as almost totally to stop respiration. I have business, the business of pleasure, at Quebec; but have not courage to stir from the stove" (11). In both epistles, Arabella describes the overwhelmingly difficult nature of winter and laments the stifling effect of the weather, leaving the reader with a negative impression of the impact of the Canadian environment. Whereas earlier anthologies offered a more balanced view of the climate, this collection presents an overwhelmingly negative view of winter as an antagonist to survival, both physical and cultural.

This focus on the harshness of the Canadian environment and its inability to provide happiness and foster creativity was consistent with the current thematic emphasis of Canadian criticism. Preeminent thematic critic John Moss in *Patterns of Isolation in English Canadian Fiction* (1974) evokes Northrop Frye's discussion of the garrison mentality and asserts that *The History of Emily Montague* should be seen as "a prototypic portrait of garrison exile" in which "[d]espite the insistent and awesome presence of the landscape and the vitality of its description," the British characters hold on desperately to

their Old World behaviours and judgments (17). The letters Smith selected foreground the characters' strong sense of connection with Britain and their difficult, even desperate, struggle to adapt to the harsh new environment; in Letter 45, Arabella writes, "Your idea of Quebec, my dear, is perfectly just; it is like a third or fourth rate country town in England; much hospitality, little society" (10). In Smith's revised anthology, then, we can see how perceptions of the novel as filtered through thematic criticism affected the selection of excerpts.

Another anthology of this phase with a clear thematic focus highlighted Brooke: Douglas Daymond and Leslie Monkman's *Literature in Canada* (1978). Daymond and Monkman selected three letters, each of which had appeared in earlier collections. Although the editors were interested in departing from the concerns and areas of interest of previous volumes, their decision to select the same letters as earlier anthologists demonstrates consensus with those before them, revealing how editors may be influenced by the choices of earlier editors. Once again, letters 45 and 80 offer interpretations of the effects of winter upon the individual: in Letter 45, Arabella presents a gloomy view of Canadian winter, and in Letter 80, she describes the various pleasures she and her friends find in the season. The two epistles present different interpretations of winter, but each supports a thematic reading in which the physical environment has a profound and lasting effect upon the individual.

The final letter Monkman and Daymond selected is Letter 150, written by William Fermor, describing the local Huron and French Canadians and noting the similarities between the two groups. His view of the Huron is largely negative, although he admits that they have some admirable traits: "That the savages have virtues, candour must own; but only a love of paradox can make any man assert they have more than polished

nations” (35). Fermor’s view of the Huron falls in line with John Moss’s comments on the portrayal of Indigenous people in Brooke’s novel: “The Indians [. . .] are variously extolled for the nobility of their ways and condemned for their demented savagery. On the whole, they are admired for their capacity to endure” (26). Fermor’s judgment of the French Canadians is quite critical, particularly when citing the traits he believes they have adopted from the Huron: “the peasants [have] acquired the savage indolence in peace, their activity and ferocity in war; their fondness for field sports, their hatred of labour; their love of a wandering life, and of liberty” (33). Fermor’s letter, while largely negative, reveals dichotomies within the novel that are associated with the interests of the thematic school: Moss argues that in the novel, “the victors and the vanquished, the indigenous and the alien, are counterpoised; home and exile correlated; urbane and rustic, civilized and savage, juxtaposed” (30-31). During the thematic phase, Brooke’s novel was seen as embodying the binary oppositions that critics of this school had come to value and expected to find in Canadian literature, and these dichotomies are evident in anthology selections of the time.

While Brooke was selected for all editions of *Canadian Anthology*, there were several general anthologies that did not contain any selections from her novel: *The Oxford Anthology of Canadian Literature* (1973) edited by Robert Weaver and William Toye and *The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English: Beginnings to 1867* (1973) edited by Mary Jane Edwards. Edwards included Brooke in the bibliography of her anthology, positioning Brooke as a significant but not central author. In the general introduction, she notes that she only included authors who were either born in or became permanent residents of the British North American colonies (Preface v), which accounts for Brooke’s exclusion from the anthology. None of the editors discusses the reasons for leaving

Brooke out, but her absence demonstrates that although several editors valued her work, there was not widespread critical consensus regarding the status and worth of her Canadian novel.

The Pluralistic Phase

A marked change in views and presentations of Brooke occurred during the next phase of the anthology, as editors reacted to presentations of Brooke put forth during the thematic stage. They responded to thematic investigations of the novel by recasting nature in a more positive light and centring on the socio-cultural milieu of the novel. The first anthology of the stage to include Brooke was Russell Brown and Donna Bennett's *An Anthology of Canadian Literature in English* (1982). Their introductory remarks reveal a focus upon issues of gender, region, and cultural plurality, all key traits of the pluralistic phase. Brown and Bennett's introduction to Brooke reveals a move away from a focus on traits of the nation and towards a more detailed examination of the novel's social and cultural contexts.

Brown and Bennett clearly reply to one strand of the thematic school when they discuss earlier interpretations of the Canadian wilderness in the novel and offer an alternate view. They liken the Canadian environment to the enchanted forests of Shakespeare's plays: "Canada stands in a relationship to England that resembles the way the enchanted woods of Shakespeare's comedies stand to the everyday world. It is a place for romantic intrigues and the confusions of love, for an idyllic interlude from which all the principals will eventually emerge to return to the orderly world of their origins" (1). This analysis positions the physical environment as a retreat and escape from the quotidian, a place of the imagination and fantasy. Responding to thematic views of nature

in which the physical environment was regarded as threatening and dangerous, Brown and Bennett's interpretation suggests a more positive and less menacing view.

Brown and Bennett briefly discuss Brooke in their general introduction of the first volume, mentioning that she is an author who is not often read; their decision to include her is therefore in part an attempt to broaden awareness of her writing. Further, they argue that Brooke's Canadian novel belongs within the Canadian tradition because she showed an early concern with a "lack of an indigenous mythology and of a native stock of images, metaphors and forms" (Introduction xii), making her one of the first authors to be aware of the need for the proto-nation to express its unique identity and history. The editors suggest that Brooke contributed to defining the nation's traits, for "Early writers like Brooke [. . .] are interesting to read today [. . .] [because] they themselves have become myth-makers and even mythic figures" (Introduction xii). Thus Brown and Bennett present Brooke as an author who was an integral part of Canadian literary history, noting that

Though her novel seems to have had little direct influence on Canadian writers, Brooke is an important figure in Canada's literary tradition because she provides some of the earliest imaginative responses to the country—responses that anticipated those of later writers. For instance, the experience of the immigrant in the New World receives one of its earliest treatments in this novel, and Brooke uses that topic to comment on, and give some freshness to, the plot of her highly conventional romance. (1)

Brown and Bennett's focus on the depiction of Canada as a place for romantic intrigues and Brooke as a "myth-maker" is far removed from the earlier stress upon accuracy or on whether Brooke's writing helps the reader understand something about the state of life in

early Canada. Earlier editors were most interested in Brooke for the documentary qualities they believed she possessed, offering her novel as an eye-witness account of the conditions of life in early Canada and the attitudes of early settlers and colonists. In the thematic phase, the emphasis was quite different; the focus was on Brooke as a writer articulating recurring motifs such as survival in a harsh climate and the deep dichotomies at the heart of the Canadian experience. In the pluralistic stage, editors stressed how her work is an interesting imaginative response to the country. Thus, the changes within anthologies reveal the range of critical views of the novel and the significance editors continue to find within it.

Brown and Bennett included nine letters,²⁶ and the selections expand earlier presentations of the novel. A few of the letters discussing the physical environment that were included in previously published anthologies were selected, but several others were added: letters centring on the romance plot, the admirable characteristics of the Huron women, and Arabella's unconventional character were chosen, presenting a more diverse range of the novel's themes and concerns than earlier anthologies. Along with offering a more positive image of the country and the people than in earlier anthologies, the editors also positioned the novel as one that investigates feminist ideals. Several of the epistles show male and female characters admiring the strength, character, and intelligence of female characters. Further, the editors highlight Ed Rivers's comments on the freedoms of the Huron women, a topic discussed in detail in Letter 11, where he remarks upon the Huron system of government to critique English values and praise the enlightened culture of Aboriginal people. The inclusion of this letter offers a drastically different image of the

²⁶ They chose Letter 1, Letter 10, Letter 11, Letter 49, Letter 80, Letter 121, Letter 125, Letter 129, and Letter 167.

novel than did earlier anthologies, particularly those of the thematic phase. Through letters such as these, Brown and Bennett move discussions of Brooke away from nation and theme and towards greater consideration of gender and ideology.

Postcolonial considerations of the novel also emerge in Brown and Bennett's selections. They pay particular attention to imperialism, footnoting instances where the imperial voice is prevalent and pointing readers to other instances of the novel's strong support for British colonialism. They included two letters written by Captain William Fermor, Arabella's father, the first of which (Letter 121) clearly illustrates his imperialist mindset as he reiterates the importance of colonies to England and contemplates the value of the Canadian people. He writes, "It is not only our interest to have colonies; they are not only necessary to our commerce, and our greatest and surest source of wealth, but our very being as a powerful commercial nation depends on them; it is therefore an object of all others most worthy of our attention, that they should be as flourishing and populous as possible" (12). To this sentence, the editors added a footnote that tells us that "Fermor's colonial attitude is expressed even more emphatically in Letter 131: 'Every advantage you give the North American trade centers at last in the mother, they are the bees, who roam abroad for that honey which enriches the paternal hive'" (12). Through letters and notes such as these, the editors draw attention to the novel's imperial message, thereby foregrounding Canada's postcolonial status and casting the novel in a new light.

In 1990, Brown, Bennett, and Nathalie Cooke edited a one-volume revised and abridged edition of *An Anthology of Canadian Literature in English*. A notable change that the editors made to the general introduction was the removal of the extended discussion of Brooke. Instead, they group a number of early writers together in a general overview of the growth of the nation's literature:

In their encounters with new milieus and unfamiliar landscapes, early writers such as Brooke, Hearne, Thompson, Jameson, Moodie, and Traill sought – in their chronicles of ventures into the wilderness, of stoic endurance and personal regeneration, and of the attractions of primitivism – to reconcile old realities with new, and to deal with the contradictions of a Canadian experience at odds with their models from the past.

(Introduction xvi)

The editors retain their comment that *The History of Emily Montague* is the only novel represented in the anthology because the novel and “narratives of exploration and settlement [. . .] are from books that are not often read today in whole, but that remain important to students of Canadian literature” (Introduction xviii). This remark shows that the editors believed that readership for the novel had not increased in the last decade and that the novel was important and needed to be preserved through anthologies. The preservation of literature was one of the defining traits of the earlier literary historical phase but remained present in this later stage.

Three revised editions of Brown and Bennett’s anthology were published in 1990, 2002, and 2010; while some significant changes were made to other parts of the anthology, the section on Brooke was unaltered.²⁷ Brooke retained her position as one of the first authors in the later editions of the anthology,²⁸ showing that the editors maintained their view that a discernible Canadian literary tradition began with her.

²⁷ The same letters that were chosen for the 1982 edition were selected for all three editions. The editors changed the numbering of the letters in the later editions to correct the inconsistent numbering in the original text, which contains two letters numbered 112 and two letters numbered 113.

²⁸ In the 2002 and 2010 editions, the editors included one author before Brooke: Saukamapee, a Nahathaway man who later joined the Peigan tribe. His work, *Life Among the Peigans* was transcribed by explorer David Thompson and is an account of “North American life prior to and just after the first European contact” (1).

Further, they continued to regard her as an important early author whose responses to the environment of the colony have remained important in Canadian writing. In the general introduction of the most recent edition, they make special note of Brooke's inclusion: "We continue to reprint some of the fictional letters from Frances Brooke's first novel, *The History of Emily Montague*, because of their value as the first example of English-language fiction dramatizing subjective responses to Canada's new landscape" (xv). Throughout all four editions of their anthology, Bennett and Brown presented Brooke as an important, interesting author whose Canadian novel speaks to key traits of the nation and continues to support new avenues of critical investigation.²⁹

While Bennett and Brown chose Brooke for all editions of their anthology, other anthologists of the pluralistic phase did not include her. Robert Lecker, in *Open Country: Canadian Literature in English* (2008), selected *The Rising Village* (1825) by Oliver Goldsmith as the first entry. In the headnotes, Lecker comments that Goldsmith was the first Canadian-born poet to be published in England, emphasizing the author's place of birth. In the general introduction, Lecker discusses his decision to begin the anthology with Goldsmith:

It will always be possible to argue with the chronological bookends of a national literature anthology. Where does a national literature begin? Through what lens do we see its origins or its present? I am well aware that those origins could be located in the literature of Canada's Native peoples, or in the early travel narratives, or in the long poems of Henry Kelsey and

²⁹ Postcolonial approaches have been prevalent in recent years: see Jodi L. Wyatt's "'No place where women are of such importance': Female Friendship, Empire, and Utopia in *The History of Emily Montague*" (2003), Stephen Carl Arch's "Frances Brooke's 'Circle of Friends': The Limits of Epistolarity in *The History of Emily Montague*" (2004), and Katherine Binhammer's "The Failure of Trade's Empire in *The History of Emily Montague*" (2010).

Thomas Cary, or in Canadian slave narratives dating from the late 1700s. There is no definitive point of departure. *Open Country* begins with the celebratory vision of Oliver Goldsmith's *The Rising Village*, which has always struck me as unique in its urgent need to comprehend a Canadian landscape through religious and aesthetic perspectives that try to differentiate (unevenly) between the old world and the new. (xxiv)

Lecker's choice to begin with Goldsmith foregrounds a Canadian-born author whose work discusses both the Old and New Worlds and emphasizes the unique features of the Canadian environment. Goldsmith's status as the first native-born Canadian poet seems to have been a determining factor, showing that Lecker, like Pierce and Edwards, links the emergence of a distinct literature with place of birth (Goldsmith's identity as the grandnephew of Anglo-Irish poet Oliver Goldsmith may also have affected his inclusion). Further, Goldsmith's poem was viewed as embodying qualities distinct to the emerging nation: as Pierce writes, Goldsmith "followed Old World patterns in [his] verse, but the content, the spirit of what [he] wrote, was a definite and conscious break with the past and a salute to a new country in a new age" (Foreword ix). While Brooke's novel touches upon the themes of the Old versus the New World and discusses the challenges of life in the colony, the perspective presented in her novel is much more strongly aligned with British society and culture than that of *The Rising Village*. Goldsmith's birthplace, themes, and content seem to be key factors in his placement in the anthology and Brooke's exclusion.

Brooke is not part of Cynthia Sugars and Laura Moss's *Canadian Literature in English: Texts and Contexts* (2009); her absence from the anthology is accounted for by their statement in the general introduction that they chose not to include excerpts from

novels.³⁰ Moss, editor of a critical edition of *The History of Emily Montague*, has deemed the novel worthy of further study, and the editors would likely categorize Brooke's novel as one that would be read in addition to selections from their anthology. Brooke's exclusion from some anthologies of the pluralistic phase, then, seems to be the result of editorial decisions regarding genre and space restrictions rather than value and position within the tradition. Brooke's treatment in the pluralistic stage suggests that she is acknowledged as an important early Canadian writer. Bennett and Brown included her in all editions and situated her work as marking the beginning of the nation's literary tradition. Although some editors of the phase began their anthologies with different selections and did not include Brooke, her position as an established and canonical author has been sustained.

Conclusion

Although not all editors chose Brooke, her inclusion in over half of the general anthologies published from 1955 on has established her reputation as a canonical author. Editors have presented compelling arguments for recognizing Brooke's contributions to the nation's literature. Her novel has maintained the interest of anthologists for more than five decades and has supported a number of approaches, suggesting that she will continue to be recognized and valued as a major early Canadian author. As Jane Sellwood notes, "Brooke's novel foreshadows many preoccupations in the literature that follows it: the confrontation of Old World ideas with New World reality; ambivalent attitudes to First Nations; problematic relations between English and French; and deference, implicit or

³⁰ In the general introduction, they write, "We have chosen not to include any excerpts from novels or plays on the assumption that they will be assigned as additional texts in most Canadian literature courses. We do, however, include selections from travellers' journals and emigrant guides" (Preface xiii).

otherwise, to the assumed cultural superiority of British cultural values” (158). These areas of interest emerge in later Canadian writing and are central concerns in various phases of anthology development, cementing Brooke’s position in Canadian literature.

While in the literary historical phase Brooke’s exclusion indicated a dismissal of the value of her Canadian novel, her treatment in the pluralistic phase suggests that she is now well known. Furthermore, her reception in anthologies reveals the process through which she has been recovered. Klinck and Watters’s inclusion of Brooke in 1955 marked the beginning of her recovery; in subsequent decades, critical interest in Brooke grew and she is now regarded as one of the founding figures of the nation’s literature and valued for providing an early imaginative response to the emerging nation. Brooke’s inclusion in anthologies of Canadian literature shows the slowly changing nature of anthologies, as well as the relative uniformity of anthologists’ presentations of certain authors. The somewhat static nature of Canadian anthologies has helped to identify and solidify a canon. Consensus among anthologists is clear through the inclusion of one of letters 49 or 80 in every anthology that contains Brooke. Brooke’s varied reception and treatment in anthologies illustrate the process of an overlooked author gaining entry into anthologies and the canon.

CHAPTER THREE

John Richardson and William Kirby

This chapter examines John Richardson (1796-1852) and William Kirby (1817-1906), two authors whose contributions to the development of Canadian literature are widely recognized. The authors share a number of similarities, most obviously the themes and styles of their major novels, Richardson's *Wacousta; or, the Prophecy: A Tale of the Canadas* (1832) and Kirby's *The Chien d'Or (The Golden Dog): A Legend of Quebec* (1877). The two historical romances depict early stages of the Canadian past, and elements of the gothic appear in both. Richardson and Kirby both received popular and critical favour when their major novels were published; in the last several decades, however, their reputations and receptions have varied widely and their treatments in anthologies have been dissimilar. Richardson has been included in a greater number of anthologies than Kirby and is still regarded as a significant pre-Confederation novelist, but his work has been treated unevenly and anthologies of the last few decades do not include any excerpts from his work. Kirby has received even less attention than Richardson in recent decades and has completely vanished from anthologies, a stark contrast to his earlier popularity. This chapter seeks to uncover why two authors with shared themes and styles have been dealt with so differently and to examine the factors that have led to the exclusion of these authors from contemporary collections.

While Richardson is generally regarded as a central figure of early Canadian literature, his treatment by anthologists presents a complicated picture. He was consistently anthologized throughout the literary historical phase, and editors agreed that his most valuable work was *Wacousta*, praising the novel extensively and paying scarce

attention to his other writing. In later stages of anthology development, interest in Richardson's first Canadian novel wavered, and instead, anthologists focused upon his non-fiction works, emphasizing the authenticity of his voice and the documentary value of his writing. The notion of an involved participant later gave way to examination of the themes evident within his writing, with particular emphasis upon the garrison and isolation. The editorial focus during this phase upon Richardson's first-hand knowledge of the events he depicted suggests editors were seeking to demonstrate that the concerns preoccupying thematic critics were evident within the real-life experiences of Canadians, thereby establishing a correlation between contemporary critical interests and the realities of life in early Canada. This connection validated thematic criticism as a means to uncover and explore essential aspects of the Canadian character evident prior to Confederation and prominent since. Finally, in contrast to earlier stages of anthology development, the current pluralistic phase does not include Richardson, although *Wacousta* is still generally viewed as a significant novel because it was the first novel written by a Canadian-born author and its focus is on a range of themes and issues central to later Canadian literature; this contrast between *Wacousta*'s general stature and its omission from anthologies calls for a close analysis.

Kirby's current reputation is far less firmly established than Richardson's, as there are few critical works on him, his novel has been removed from the New Canadian Library series, and there is presently little scholarly interest evident in his life or works.³¹ *The Golden Dog* was part of collections during the literary historical phase, but in the

³¹ A new edition of *Le Chien d'or/The Golden Dog: A Legend of Quebec*, edited by Mary Jane Edwards and part of the Centre for Editing Early Canadian Texts series, is set to be released in the spring of 2012, which may lead to greater critical attention to the novel.

following stage, Kirby was entirely absent. He was then included in a few anthologies in the 1970s but has been omitted since. As with Richardson, editors selected a range of writings from his body of work, choosing first his fiction and then his non-fiction and poetry. Variations in the genres excerpted show editors working to present authors in new ways and to highlight different aspects of an author's body of writing. The fluctuations in Kirby's representation indicate that he is no longer considered a major author, perhaps because his imperialist vision of the place of French Canada within the larger nation is repugnant to many editors, fitting with neither the thematic nor the pluralistic phase.

The issue of genre is particularly important to a discussion of Richardson and Kirby, for several traits of their novels and the variations in their critical receptions are related to the form of their best-known novels. In his discussion of Canadian historical literature, Martin Kuester comments that Kirby and Richardson

subscribe to a more or less traditional realism in their evocation of earlier times and events. Settings are detailed, motivations are clear (if not always credible). The emphasis falls upon plot, and the vigorous action serves the political concerns of the present. In this, they are strongly influenced by British and American models, such as Sir Walter Scott's historical novels or the gothic romance tradition of Charles Brockden Brown. Historical romances have always been immensely popular, even though—or because—they tend to be rather formulaic, depending conventionally on a muscular hero, an immoral or savage opposition, challenging turns of fortune, and a final resolution. (496)

Both *Wacousta* and *The Golden Dog* have several characteristics of the historical novel that situate them within the tradition of the historical romance. One feature of the novels

in particular that critics have commented upon is the influence of the gothic tradition.³² Gwendolyn Davies characterizes *Wacousta* as drawing upon “sentimental, sensational, and gothic novel conventions to develop a tale of disguise, coincidence, and psychological fear (represented by the unknown in the forest), threatening sexuality, and the grotesque” (83). Similarly, Robert Stacey argues that there are many gothic traits in *The Golden Dog*, including a remote setting, betrayal, disguise, and poisonings, and, in line with Kuester’s comments about historical romances serving the “political concerns of the present,” he argues that ultimately, “[t]he gothic turn serves an obvious political purpose [. . .] in that it enables Kirby to cast the defeat of New France of its best by its worst, and not as a heroic or moral victory for the British” (101).³³ In the two novels, the conventions of historical fiction are used to entertain, as well as to comment upon contemporary issues.

More central to each novel, however, is the specific way that history is used and the novels’ roles in defining a national identity. As Carole Gerson notes in *A Purer Taste: The Writing and Reading of Fiction in English in Nineteenth Century Canada*, throughout the nineteenth century, writers and critics held a “reverence for history based on the assumption that history was objective, factual, one of the classical pursuits, and therefore unquestioningly superior to ‘mere works of fiction’” (92). Both Richardson and Kirby used events from Canadian history as the basis of their novels, and while the novels are not entirely factual, history forms the core of both. The incorporation of historical material was also regarded highly because it was a means to foster a sense of national identity: writers of the time “promote[d] the historical romance as the genre which would

³² See Margot Northey’s *The Haunted Wilderness: The Gothic and Grotesque in Canadian Fiction* (1976) and I.S. MacLaren’s “*Wacousta* and the Gothic Tradition” (1984).

³³ Stacey continues, writing that the novel “conforms to the demands of contemporary history which, in the immediately post-Confederation context of the text’s composition, required the development of narrative structures through which bilateral hostility between English and French Canada might be minimized or avoided” (101).

develop a national identity by popularizing and mythologizing Canada's neglected history" (Gerson, *A Purer Taste* 91). Further, historical fiction was popular in Europe, which "fortified Canadians' interest in indigenous material and reinforced their view that the development of a recognizable literary tradition was inseparable from the establishment of a distinctive historical identity" (Gerson, *A Purer Taste* 94). Generally, the historical novel in Canada was seen to elevate the nation's sense of identity and value of its writing: "No critic questioned the importance of history and most presumed a direct correspondence between a country's awareness of its past and the quality of its imaginative literature" (Gerson, *A Purer Taste* 94). Historical material is an essential aspect of both *Wacousta* and *The Golden Dog* and the novels were written at a time when historical fiction was regarded as a means to define the country and its literature and elevate the status of both.

Since the historical romance is tied closely with articulations of the nation, Richardson's and Kirby's novels can be studied to determine the views of the country they support. In these two cases, inclusion of their works in anthologies aligns with contemporary articulations of the nation. Scrutiny of the parallels and divergences in the treatment of Richardson and Kirby reveals the impact of prevailing ideas about Canadian identity. As each phase endorses a version of Canadian identity, and as various aspects of the nation are promoted, editors focus upon different elements of an author's writing. Richardson's personal history, use of historical information, and status as Canada's first native-born novelist are stressed at various times. Kirby's case is also significant, for it raises questions about how novels with a world view that is no longer popular are or should be incorporated into a nation's literary tradition. Kirby imagined a country that recognized and appreciated its English and French roots from a distinctly imperialist point

of view; this vision has not been embraced and Loyalist views of the country are no longer endorsed, suggesting one reason for Kirby's unbalanced inclusion.

Richardson's Biography and Literary Works

John Richardson was born in Queenston, Upper Canada on October 4, 1796. His father was a British medical officer who served at Fort Malden, located near Amherstburgh, Ontario, and Richardson spent his childhood at the fort. His mother was Madeleine Askin, daughter of John Askin, a fur trader who was likely a member of the Ottawa tribe (Duffy, "Richardson" 998). At the age of 15, Richardson enlisted with the British Army to fight in the War of 1812 against the United States. Shortly after joining the army, he was captured during the Battle of Moraviantown; his internment lasted a year, and upon his release he returned to Canada. Richardson then spent a short time in Europe during the Napoleonic wars and in 1816, he was assigned to the West Indies. Editors and critics often emphasize these details of Richardson's military career, for his personal history and interest in Canada's past are evident throughout his body of work.

Following his military service, Richardson began his literary career. While living in London, he composed a narrative poem, *Tecumseh; or, the Warrior of the West* (1828), its subject matter already showing his interest in the country's military history, in this case including its Aboriginal heroes. He then published a collection of poems, *Ecarté; or, The Salons of Paris* (1829). Michael Greene notes that Richardson's early writing did not meet with critical favour: "Reviews of his poetic style were consistently negative, and his early forays into the novel were also disappointing" (969). However, his literary reputation was markedly strengthened following the publication of *Wacousta* in 1832, which was "the only real success among readers and critics" (Greene 969). He returned to Canada in 1838

to report for the London *Times* but soon lost the position due to his unpopular political views (Greene 969); he was “a special correspondent [. . .] to cover Lord Durham’s efforts to re-establish Upper and Lower Canada’s political structures after the 1837 rebellions,” and his support of Durham caused conflict with his editors, leading to his dismissal (Duffy, “Richardson” 998). He then became a contributor to the *Literary Garland* in Montreal and later founded weekly newspapers in Brockville, Kingston, and Montreal; none of the papers was successful and all ran for only a short time. In 1840, Richardson published a sequel to *Wacousta*, *The Canadian Brothers; or, The Prophecy Fulfilled*, set during the War of 1812. The novel was critically well-received, but it was not popular with readers. His next projects included *War of 1812* (1842), consisting of documentary reprints and his own accounts, and *Eight Years in Canada* (1847), a collection of pamphlets he had published. Unhappy with his reception in his native land, Richardson “criticized Canada as a society devoid of refinement and without rewards for its writers” (Greene 969). He then moved to New York in pursuit of a larger audience but still did not find the recognition he was seeking. He remained in New York until his death in 1852.

Wacousta was Richardson’s best-known work during his lifetime and remains his most-studied novel. Set during Pontiac’s attack on Fort Detroit and Michilimackinac, it is a story of revenge which “combines Gothic romance elements with tragedy” and “continues to evoke suspense and horror” (Greene 969). Greene further asserts that the novel is an ordinary text of Canadian literature, for it is “viewed as an early, perhaps even seminal, articulation of the conflict between ‘garrison’ and ‘wilderness,’ a prominent motif in later Canadian writing and criticism” (969). It influenced writers into the twentieth century, being adapted for the stage by James Reaney as *Wacousta!* in 1978. Greene concludes, noting that “Today, ironically [because he died in obscurity],

Richardson is recognized as one of Canada's most important pre-Confederation novelists and as the first Canadian-born writer to achieve international recognition" (969). Other critics also praise the novel, claiming that it continues to support scholarly inquiry. In his preface to the Canadian Critical Edition of *Wacousta* (1998), John Moss evaluates the novel positively, remarking that "*Wacousta* invites all manner of speculation yet refuses to submit to any one analytic construct. It is a novel of such ambivalence and ambiguity that proscriptive readings simply generate the possibility of further alternatives" (ix). He also calls it "a wondrous tale of dishonour, revenge and enduring passion, of horror, terror and moral perversity, of weird sexuality and bizarre violence" (x). Both Greene's and Moss's assessments of the novel position it as an interesting, rewarding work central to Canadian literary history and criticism. His current status, then, as an author removed from general anthologies warrants consideration.

The Literary Historical Phase

At the time of publication of the first anthology of the literary historical phase, Richardson was viewed as a significant author. Albert Durrant Watson and Lorne Albert Pierce, in *Our Canadian Literature: Representative Prose and Verse* (1922), included an excerpt from *Wacousta* (chapter four of volume two), which they entitled "Pontiac at Fort Detroit." The selection details Pontiac's first formal meeting with Governor de Haldimar; the leaders of the local tribes, which include the Ottawa, Delaware, and Shawnee, travel to Fort Detroit under the guise of resolving hostilities between the two groups. The meeting is an attempt to trick the British into going to war, but Pontiac's plan is unsuccessful due to the unusual sagacity of the British governor of the fort, and all parties agree to meet again in three days to continue the negotiations. The editors included the entire chapter,

though heavily abridged and significantly shorter than the original. The passage emphasizes the exchanges between the groups, focusing upon dialogue and descriptions of the Aboriginal people. The inclusion of this particular excerpt suggests that the editors were interested in the novel's representation of Aboriginal people, as well as in their interactions with the British.

Another important aspect of the selection from *Wacousta* is the link it allowed editors to establish between war and national identity. In his introduction to the prose section of the anthology, Pierce connects the emergence of an original national literature with the end of the American War of Independence. He asserts that Canadian literature truly began after 1776, for the American Revolution resulted in a "great influx of loyalists into Canada" and that the "literary output after this change of residence" was notably improved (125). He further contends that the next pronounced change in Canadian writing occurred as a result of the War of 1812:

The process which had been operating after the war of 1776 reached a culmination in the war of 1812. English, Scotch, Irish and French were welded together against one common foe. However, once the emergencies of the war were removed the old lines of demarkation began again to assert themselves, though not as clearly or as persistently as before. There might be unity on occasion, but not union. Nevertheless the episode did show that their likes were stronger than their dislikes, and their similarities than their dissimilarities. (126)

Pierce regards the War of 1812 as a catalyst for national unity and an event that blurred cultural differences. Given his strong belief in the potential value of war as an impetus for national unification, we may infer that Richardson's inclusion in the anthology is linked to

the novel's subject matter. Although Pierce does not refer to the altercations Richardson focuses upon, *Wacousta*, which is set in 1763, takes place in the aftermath of the Seven Years' War (1754 - 1763) and during Pontiac's Rebellion (1763 - 1766), a time of great conflict and transition. Given that Pierce regarded war as influencing the development of a distinct national identity and offering rich creative possibilities, the selection is noteworthy for its representation of a period of warfare in Canadian history, its contribution to the growth of national awareness, and as an example of the potential for positive interactions between different cultural groups, especially in its vision of developing harmony between British, French, and Aboriginal people at the novel's end. While later critics would note that the imagined harmony involved the subordination of French and Aboriginal culture to British hegemony, Pierce focused on moments of conflict as crucibles of national identity.

Richardson's representation as an author with important insights into Canadian history continues in Edmund Kemper Broadus and Eleanor Hammond Broadus's *A Book of Canadian Prose and Verse* (1923, 1934). For both editions, the editors selected chapter six of the second volume in its entirety, which follows the excerpt in Watson and Pierce's anthology. The two collections focus upon the same series of events, suggesting that the editors agreed upon the parts of the novel that were most significant for representation of the country. The chapter in *A Book of Canadian Prose and Verse* details Pontiac's failed attempt to attack Fort Michilimackinac and the subsequent negotiations between the two groups.

The placement of the excerpt from *Wacousta*, "The Conspiracy of Pontiac," shows the editors' intention to create a narrative of national development through the arrangement of their collection. The passage from Richardson's novel is located in a

section called “The People,” and two excerpts precede it: one from Kirby’s *The Golden Dog* (1877) and the other from Gilbert Parker’s *The Seats of the Mighty* (1896). The excerpt from Kirby’s novel is set in New France in 1748 and details events prior to the defeat of New France (1760) and the passage from Parker’s novel describes the siege of Quebec (1759) during the Seven Years War (1756-63). Although the novels were published decades after Richardson’s, the editors arranged the materials chronologically by subject rather than by the author’s date of birth. In so doing, they locate the beginning of a distinct nation with the internal decay and ultimate collapse of the Old Regime and the subsequent triumph of the British, leading to a new and just order. The focus on British control of the French is continued in the excerpt from *Wacousta*, as the chapter describes British interactions with French-allied Aboriginal people of the area; Broadus and Broadus comment that the local tribes had supported the French and “continued their hostilities against the English” (148). The arrangement of these three selections, as well as those that follow, creates a narrative of nation-building in which British forces overwhelm and defeat the French and their Aboriginal allies through a combination of superior intelligence and moral probity, creating a space for a distinctly English-Canadian identity and creativity to emerge.

The concentration upon the construction of a national identity comes into even sharper focus when Broadus and Broadus’s judgement on the novel’s aesthetic value is considered, for they determine that the worth of the novel lies entirely in its depiction of early Canada and in Richardson’s direct knowledge of the events portrayed. The editors remark upon the contrast between *Wacousta* and James Fenimore Cooper’s *The Last of the Mohicans* (1826), admitting that *Wacousta* both “invites and suffers by comparison” (148). They argue that “Richardson’s characterization is wooden, his plot melodramatic;

and the romantically poetic atmosphere with which Cooper invests his story has become in *Wacousta*, mere artifical [sic] elaboration” (148). Clearly, the editors do not value his literary achievement or even his elaborate plot. They will admit only that

Wacousta has power; and this power lies wholly in the boding mystery of Wacousta himself—a white man (as it ultimately develops) who has turned Indian and who, as the friend and advisor of Pontiac, has only one object in life—to revenge himself upon the governor of Fort Detroit, Sir Charles de Haldimar, for an affront suffered long before, when they were boys together. (148)

Here, Broadus and Broadus reveal the mystery of Wacousta and his past, suggesting that they are not concerned about discouraging readers from reading the entire novel or perhaps that they do not expect most to read *Wacousta*. Instead, they offer extensive praise for Richardson’s personal knowledge of the novel’s events, bringing to the readers’ attention that Richardson “learned of the details of the attack upon Detroit from his grandmother, whose husband, M. Erskine, had led the detachment which relieved the beleaguered garrison” (148). Broadus and Broadus continue, emphasizing “The fact that Richardson obtained his material by direct oral transmission and the further fact that *Wacousta* (1832) is the first Canadian historical romance, gives it an adventitious importance and interest” (148). The focus upon the novel’s status as the first historical romance by a Canadian-born author with direct family knowledge of the events shows Broadus and Broadus’s interest in positioning the novel within the nation’s literary history and asserting its significance to the past.

The Literary Nationalistic Phase

Richardson's skills as a writer were reassessed during the literary historical stage, as editors began to promote more strident critical standards, thus asserting the importance of both a strong national identity and high literary standards. While earlier anthology editors were primarily concerned with outlining the contours of Canadian literature, editors of the next stage focused upon evaluation of both identity and aesthetics. This change is evident in Richardson's representation, for the works anthologized in the 1950s and 1960s are presented as being of high quality as well as informing the reader of some aspect of the nation. This stage of the anthology illustrates increased confidence, or at least patriotic promotion, in the worth of the nation's writing. At this time, writing by Richardson that was not included or mentioned in earlier collections was anthologized, demonstrating broader knowledge of Richardson's body of writing and a higher estimation of its literary merits.

The re-evaluation of Richardson's quality as a writer began in the 1950s and is evident in the first edition of Klinck and Watters's *Canadian Anthology* (1955). Like editors before them, Klinck and Watters centre upon Richardson's personal history, stressing the connections between his life and significant events in the nation's past. In the headnotes, they highlight Richardson's lifelong interest and involvement with the military and with Aboriginal people:

He spent his boyhood at Amherstberg on the Canadian border which faced the Indian lands of the West, where Pontiac had made history, and where Tecumseh, Barclay, and Brock would fight their battles in the War of 1812-1814. As a young soldier, he saw border romance unfold before his eyes, especially when he was captured by the Americans at Moraviantown,

where Tecumseh was killed. Both the tales he heard about Pontiac and his own military experience were to provide literary material for his later use.

(17)

Like anthologists of the literary historical phase, Klinck and Watters stress Richardson's involvement in and direct knowledge of certain elements of Canadian history. The introduction to Richardson refers to the War of 1812, showing that in the literary nationalistic phase, war gained perhaps even greater recognition as a defining event in Canadian history and national identity. Richardson's familiarity with the events he incorporated into his literature is emphasized, positioning him as an informed, reliable source of information regarding early Canada.

But Richardson's personal knowledge of historical events was not alone the focus of Klinck and Watters's analysis; the editors also turned to the question of aesthetic merit and determined that the sequel to *Wacousta*, *The Canadian Brothers*, offered both high literary quality and a convincing representation of Canadian history. They argue that Richardson's skill improved throughout his career, noting that "the realism of *Ecarté* and of his historical narratives had toned down the melodrama of *Wacousta*" (17). They excerpted parts of chapters two and three of *The Canadian Brothers*, which describe the beginnings of the War of 1812 and introduce the Grantham brothers, the novel's protagonists. Their criticism of the "melodrama of *Wacousta*" shows they are uninterested in plot twists and dramatic revelations; rather, they seek to present Richardson as a witness to important historical events who created authentic depictions of the time. Choosing *The Canadian Brothers* emphasized the realistic aspects of Richardson's writing, thus presenting him as a skilled author with valuable insight into the past.

Presentations of Richardson shifted slightly in the late 1960s as editors began to focus more intently upon the question of literary value and gave greater consideration to his non-fiction. In the second and third editions of their anthology, published in 1966 and 1974, Klinck and Watters included a non-fiction excerpt from Richardson's body of writing. They retained the headnotes from their earlier edition, maintaining a focus upon Richardson's personal history, but in place of an excerpt from *The Canadian Brothers*, they chose a passage from *War of 1812*, Richardson's memoir of his war experience, a "vivid, highly partisan account of individuals and events interspersed with long stretches of documentary reprints" (Duffy, "Richardson" 998). The selection is fairly short, consisting of only a few pages describing the deaths of two prisoners in Tecumseh's camp. Modifying their presentation of Richardson places greater emphasis upon the War of 1812 and on Richardson's first-hand knowledge of the events and may suggest that they had re-thought the positive assessment of *The Canadian Brothers*. The editors' increased interest in the war is also apparent in other additions made to the collection: they included two anonymous ballads of the War of 1812, "Come All You Bold Canadians" and "The Battle of Queenston Heights," before the excerpt from Richardson. By substituting a non-fiction passage from *War of 1812* for the excerpt from *The Canadian Brothers*, the editors decisively shifted their emphasis away from Richardson's status as a novelist and towards his status as a credible reporter recounting crucial events of Canadian history.

Other editors in the later part of the literary nationalistic stage also focused upon Richardson's non-fiction. A.J.M. Smith in *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings to Confederation* (1965) contrasts Richardson's fiction and non-fiction,

finding the latter superior. He discusses the qualities of *Wacousta* which prevent him from including the novel:

Some of the descriptions and many of the pictures of Indian fighting are vivid and forceful, but the characterization, particularly that of the 'females' is melodramatic or weak and the rather rambling plot is not free of sensationalism. Neither this novel nor its sequel, *The Canadian Brothers* (1840) [. . .] can compare with the works of the explorers and fur-traders in the presentation of the Indian. The literary professional romanticizes and sentimentalizes; the practical amateur puts down exactly what he sees.

(123)

Smith values the documentary aspect of early writing, arguing that Richardson's fiction is sentimental while the accounts of explorers and fur-traders are objective and accurate. Despite his misgivings concerning the novel's style, Smith admits its value to the literary tradition: "*Wacousta*, however, stands as the first of a long series of historical romances that includes Kirby's *The Golden Dog* and Sir Gilbert Parker's *The Seats of the Mighty*" (123). His emphasis upon the worth of *Wacousta* to the history and development of a particular genre suggests that the historical romance is no longer considered to be a form of great value, having significance only as it influenced other work in this tradition. Smith's critique also suggests that he is aware of the inclusion of *Wacousta* and *The Canadian Brothers* in earlier collections and that his evaluation of Richardson is a deliberate revision of earlier assessments.

Having determined that the literary value of Richardson's novels is quite low, Smith then discusses a work he admires, the non-fiction account *War of 1812*. In his

general introduction, he centres upon the War of 1812 as a pivotal event in the development of Canadian national identity and growth:

The war did more to unite the Canadas and turn the thoughts of the people toward an eventual union of all the British North American colonies than any other event before the American Civil War, when the complex relations between the Canadian colonies, the warring powers in the United States, and Great Britain, was seen by Canadians as a threat to the very existence of the colonies. (Introduction xix)

Smith links the war with national unity, positioning it as a pivotal event in the nation's history and upholding Pierce's assessment of the connections between war, national identity, and affiliation with Britain. Building upon this assertion, Smith excerpts Richardson's *War of 1812* and includes a section called "The Battle of Moraviantown and Death of Tecumseh," which details the defeat of the British at Lake Erie on September 10, 1813 and the death of Tecumseh. He writes that it is in Richardson's "historical writing of a more sombre sort that [his] true merit is to be found. His most valuable book is his fine military history, *The War of 1812* [sic], published in 1842, from which we have selected the dramatic narrative of the death of Tecumseh" (123). Here, Smith reveals his New Critical stance, as he emphasizes vividness and drama and rejects melodrama and sensationalism. His interest in historical events and veracity shows that he valued writing that realistically depicted elements of the past. This combination of modernist principles and celebration of authenticity corresponds with the literary nationalistic stage of anthology development, which promoted Canadian writing as a literature of high aesthetic worth, while also promoting Canadian distinctiveness.

The Thematic Phase

The focus upon authentic accounts continues in Mary Jane Edwards's *The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English: Beginnings to 1867* (1973). Edwards included a lengthy selection from Richardson's "A Trip to Walpole Island and Port Sarnia," an essay detailing a journey he took in 1848. She discusses *Wacousta* briefly, noting the use of history in the novel, which she believes to be "subordinated to a study of 'the thirst of vengeance inherent in human nature'" (147). This short analysis of *Wacousta* conforms to a thematic reading of the novel, but Edwards chose a different focus in her presentation of Richardson. While she was clearly aware of thematic concerns, she was most concerned with Richardson's personal history and the documentary value of his writing. Throughout Richardson's anthologization, editors have commented upon the importance of his direct knowledge of the events he wrote about, and Edwards emphasizes both his family history and his personal involvement. Her headnotes highlight Richardson's past, and she asserts that there is a clear link between his ancestry and writing, noting that "war and Indians seemed particularly to fascinate him" (147), a preoccupation she argues is evident throughout the essay she included. The essay she selected is a detailed account of a trip to Walpole Island and Fort Sarnia, with an emphasis upon the traits of Aboriginal people he encountered. The selection reveals Richardson's highly romanticized view of Aboriginal people, as he contrasts "the really native dignity and simplicity of these interesting people, with the loathsome hypocrisy of civilized life" (154). Edwards's presentation of Richardson foregrounds his direct involvement with the scenes and events he describes; her decision to focus on these aspects rather than offer a predominantly thematic analysis of Richardson's works shows the dominance of the belief in the documentary value of his writing.

A different kind of interest in the unique features of the nation and its literature came to prominence with the rise of thematic criticism, as interest shifted from history and experience towards core themes. John Moss, in *Patterns of Isolation*, discusses two recurring patterns in Canadian literature, the garrison and the frontier, which he examines in relation to *Wacousta*. He explains that “[t]he garrison is a closed community whose values, customs, manners have been transported virtually intact from some other environment and are little influenced by their new surroundings,” while “[t]he frontier, in contrast, is a context of undifferentiated perimeters, where the experience of one reality comes into direct contact with that of another, a more immediate and amorphous reality” (12-13). He analyzes the presence of these motifs in *Wacousta*, arguing that it is “the exemplary novel of frontier exile” (42). Richardson’s Canadian setting is

the landscape of a troubled dream; dark, forbidding, filled with murderous savages and murderous intent, a chaotic malevolence streaked with intimations of virtue and stained with the bloodshed of human depravity. It is the outer perimeter of reality, a morass of limitless depth, and man at its centre is in utter isolation, turned in upon himself—his actions and emotions, the self-fulfilling prophecies of his own demise. (50)

Moss’s summary of the novel’s themes suggests that the novel explores the boundaries of humanity, contrasting civilization and wilderness, community and isolation. Thematic analyses such as this turn from an interest in authentic experience towards certain haunting themes, stressing the features of a work that speak to these motifs. The focus of the analysis then becomes how a work supports certain themes viewed as central to the national identity rather than how a work represents or engages with the nation’s past.

Douglas Daymond and Leslie Monkman's selection in the first volume of *Literature in Canada* (1978) clearly illustrates the conflict between the garrison and the frontier that Moss delineates. Their anthology is the last to include Richardson, and they chose an excerpt from *Wacousta*, "Fort Michilimackinac." The selection includes a description of an armed vessel attempting to travel to the fort while under attack from the Huron:

What chiefly contributed to their disquietude, was the dreadful consciousness that, however their present efforts might secure a temporary safety, the period of their fall was only protracted. A few months more might bring with them all the severity of the winter of those climes, and then, blocked up in a sea of ice, - exposed to all the rigor of cold, - all the miseries of hunger, - what effectual resistance could they oppose to the many bands of Indians who, availing themselves of the defenceless position of their enemies, would rush from every quarter to their destruction. (140-41)

The presentation of nature and Aboriginal people as threatening and hostile is found throughout the excerpt, supporting a thematic reading. The rest of the passage is mainly descriptive, detailing the fort's location, structure, appearance, and interior, focusing finally upon the apartment where Madeline and Clara de Haldimar are hiding. The entire excerpt clearly aligns with thematic interests: a garrison, deep in the threatening Canadian wilderness, is besieged by an unknown and hostile force, and in the centre of the fort, British culture and civility are represented through the art and objects in the room. The excerpt from Daymond and Monkman's anthology shows the darker side of the garrison

and frontier Moss discusses, as it places the fort in opposition to the wilderness and focuses the fear and unease of those within the garrison.

The Pluralistic Phase

As Richardson's treatment in the thematic phase shows, assessments of the author and his works have not been uniform. Editors have selected a variety of excerpts to represent the author, and while not all editors have agreed upon the significance of *Wacousta*, there is widespread acknowledgement among critics of its prevalence and significance, showing that the novel remains well-known and is generally considered a canonical text. In the first few phases of anthology development, editors centred upon Richardson's first-hand knowledge of historical events and the notion that war and conflict have deeply impacted the national character. However, a significant change occurred in the pluralistic stage, for anthologies of this phase do not include Richardson at all and editors do not comment on his exclusion. He has disappeared from the anthologies currently in use in university classrooms, and there are a number of factors that could have led to his marginalization.

One aspect of Richardson's writing that may be related to his current treatment is his characterization of Aboriginal people, as there are some aspects of his writing that do not align with the current vision of the nation editors wish to advance. Relationships between Aboriginal people and other Canadians have undoubtedly been an area of concern for the last several decades and will probably continue to be a central element of national discourse. Even critics who value Richardson and *Wacousta* conclude that there are problems with his characterization from a contemporary perspective. Gwendolyn Davies, for example, takes a fairly positive view of Richardson's presentation of Indigenous people, noting that "while obviously sympathetic to Aboriginal history (as

evidenced in his 1828 epic poem *Tecumseh*), Richardson tends to sublimate his First Nations characters in *Wacousta* to the wider service of his tale of revenge” (83). Frank Birbalsingh, on the other hand, evaluates the novel much more harshly; he notes, until as late as 1960, “where aboriginal interest and concerns are not completely neglected in Canadian literature, they are presented as savage, trivial, or decadent. John Richardson’s novel *Wacousta* [. . .] illustrates this type of presentation” (6). The representation Birbalsingh condemns is evident in much of Richardson’s work; the selection Edwards chose frequently describes Aboriginal people as uncivilized and unrefined, and throughout his works, Aboriginal people are associated with darkness, savagery, and irrationality, descriptions that are not accepted or endorsed by anthologists of the pluralistic phase. Richardson, then, in the eyes of contemporary critics, is at fault either for largely overlooking the Aboriginal people in favour of his revenge plot or for presenting them in a problematic manner; in either case, it seems that critics of the present time feel that the issue of unflattering characterization of Aboriginal people must be acknowledged and perhaps censored. Given that accounts of Aboriginal people are available in other genres, editors have a greater range of writing to choose from to represent this feature of Canada’s past. Editors’ decisions to exclude Richardson may be an attempt to avoid the complications of selecting from his writing or it may be a deliberate rejection of his characterization of Aboriginal people.

Another issue closely linked with the present status of the novel is contemporary assessment of its style and genre. While many have noted that historical romances are often melodramatic, evaluations of the novel have increasingly focused upon the poor quality of Richardson’s writing. W.J. Keith argues that *Wacousta* is badly written, concluding that “[h]is, indeed, is the classic example of the inability of fiction to attain

literary excellence in the absence of intellectual depth and stylistic expertise” (*Canadian Literature* 71). He finds that while Richardson creates convincing scenes of suspense, the novel’s drama quickly becomes wearying: “As horror piles upon horror, the unrelieved tone of excitement soon becomes oppressive. Virtually every chapter is punctuated by shrieks, scalps are continually reeking, and in his scenes of conflict Richardson apparently works on the principle: the more blood the better” (71). He also remarks that Richardson “writes a clotted, prolix, graceless prose, and his dialogue is particularly stilted” (71). Keith finds little aesthetic value in *Wacousta* and its sequel and states that beyond Richardson’s use of “some powerful and psychologically significant themes” (71), his works are not worthy of study. This assessment of Richardson’s abilities reiterates some of the critiques of earlier editors, such as Smith, but Keith’s extremely critical analysis of the novel suggests that current assessments may be even less complimentary than earlier evaluations.

Generic concerns also impact anthology inclusion, as shifts in editorial focus affect the types of writing selected. The historical romance, once seen as a central tool in nation-building, no longer generates the critical interest it once did. While historical novels remain popular, romances have fallen out of critical favour. In the introduction to their 2010 collection, Donna Bennett and Russell Brown remark that changing views of history have affected the kinds of writing collected. They note that “Our first anthology reflected [a change in conceptions of the literary] in its inclusion of accounts of exploration and settlement; such accounts have since come to be viewed as part of a larger category called ‘life writing’ and the importance granted to such writing has increased” (xx). The shift in the perceived value of writing by fur traders and explorers occurred at the beginning of the pluralistic stage, coinciding with the time that Richardson was

removed from anthologies. The selection of excerpts from life writing indicates that the editors were interested in presenting authentic accounts, but the definition of what was considered to be a reliable account shifted from Richardson's fiction to the non-fiction writings of men such as Samuel Hearne, David Thompson, and John Franklin. Interest in the documentary aspect of prose remained but the questions of validity, truthfulness, and verifiable first-hand experiences and encounters changed, and Richardson's work has been put aside.

Shifts in contemporary criticism and the notion of authenticity have thus impacted views of Richardson's writing. Early on, he was valued for his participation in warfare and as someone whose relatives had participated in earlier conflicts, and he was also praised for his presumed knowledge of Aboriginal life on the frontier. Later, his haunting gothic accounts of the darkness of the New World were central to anthologies of the thematic phase. However, in the pluralistic stage, his accounts have come to be regarded as Eurocentric and biased, and anthologies of this phase ignore Richardson's writing and instead offer accounts of another kind, namely those of fur-traders, explorers, and Aboriginal people themselves. He has been excluded due to a preference for Aboriginal perspectives and genuine eye-witness exploration accounts. In sum, Richardson's vision of the nation is no longer considered important enough to include and other views that are acceptable to proponents of pluralism have been selected instead. The changes in Richardson's status from a central author to one who is completely marginalized in anthologies reveals the impact of changing critical values and assessments.

Kirby's Biography and Literary Works

William Kirby was born in Kingston-upon-Hull, England on October 13, 1817. His father was a currier, and the family emigrated to Cincinnati, Ohio in 1832. Kirby left the United States for Canada in 1839, as he was increasingly uncomfortable with anti-British sentiment in the United States. Upon his arrival, he settled at Niagara-on-the-Lake, where he worked as a tanner. He married Eliza Madeline Whitmore, a member of a well-known Loyalist family in the region, and “soon gained a reputation as a learned and active participant in the affairs of the region and the country” (Dyer 581), becoming the editor of the local newspaper, the *Niagara Mail*, and working as a customs collector from 1871 to 1895. In 1882, he was elected to the Royal Society of Canada. He remained in Niagara-on-the-Lake until his death on June 23, 1906.

Kirby is best-known for his historical romance *Le Chien d'Or (The Golden Dog): A Legend of Quebec* (1877), a critical and popular success. The novel, which was based upon two stories from Quebec author J.M. LeMoine's *Maple Leaves*, “Le Chien d'or” and “Château Bigot,” is set in 1748 New France and is a tale of romance, greed, deception, and murder; it tells of the downfall of the corrupt Intendant of New France, Bigot, and reveals the immorality of the governing class, suggesting that the fall of New France was inevitable under such leadership. Some of the characters in the novel, namely le Gardeur and the Bourgeois Philibert, were historical figures, and interest in the history of the region may partially account for the novel's success. Klay Dyer notes that the novel was “one of the most popular early Canadian works of historical fiction” (581), a fact supported by the publication of a French translation by Pamphile Le May in 1884. Patricia Monk comments upon Kirby's use of romantic conventions, finding that “[t]he romance characteristics [. . .] are [. . .] precisely the qualities that enabled *The Chien D'Or* to seize

the popular imagination in Kirby's own time and even today render it quite readable" (189).

Kirby's other works did not fare so well at the time of their publication and have received sparse critical attention since. As a vocal Tory Loyalist, Kirby promoted his political beliefs through his writing, and as Dennis Duffy notes, his "lesser works display the contours of an Upper Canadian Tory mentality" ("Kirby" 597). In 1849, under the pseudonym Britannicus, Kirby wrote *Counter Manifesto to the Annexationists of Montreal*; the letter was later republished as a pamphlet, and it warns readers of the dangers of close affiliation with the United States. Kirby was also a poet: his first published collection was *The U.E.: A Tale of Upper Canada* (1859), which consists of twelve cantos written in heroic couplets, a work which Duffy asserts "displays the primary assumptions of the Loyalist mythology that was influential in the culture of Victorian Ontario" and pastoralizes Upper Canada ("Kirby" 597). He published numerous poems in his newspaper dealing mainly with historical and patriotic themes and collected them in *Canadian Idylls* (1881; second edition 1884). His final published work was *Annals of Niagara* (1869), a historical narrative of the border warfare following the Battle of Queenston Heights in the War of 1812.

Kirby's political views are mentioned in nearly all critical discussions of his work, revealing the pervasiveness of his Loyalism in both his poetry and his prose. Carl Berger, in *The Sense of Power: Studies in the Ideas of Canadian Imperialism, 1867-1914*, discusses the traits of the Loyalists and comments upon Kirby's incorporation of these ideas into his writing. Canadian imperialism was "the movement for the closer union of the British Empire through economic and military cooperation and through political changes which would give the dominions influence over imperial policy" (Berger 2). One

trait of this view particularly relevant to Kirby was the high regard Loyalists had for former times, especially where the past revealed noble conduct and self-sacrifice for a worthy cause: “Canadian imperialism was dominated by appeals to the past primarily because its exponents regarded history as the repository of enduring and valuable principles” (Berger 109). The emphasis upon the past falls in line with the belief that “the inclusion of historical material increased the moral and didactic value of a novel” (Gerson, *A Purer Taste* 93). Kirby’s choice, then, to compose a romance based upon historical people and events reflected his Loyalist beliefs and allowed him to extol the virtues of the past.

One aspect of Loyalism evident in Kirby’s writing was the Loyalist view of French Canada. Many imperialists thought of French Canadians “primarily as agriculturalists” (Berger 141). For Loyalists, “the archetype of the French Canadian was the *habitant* who was conventionally noted for his frugality, courtesy, hospitality, and his attachment to the land” (Berger 142). The value Loyalists placed upon the French Canadian way of life was based upon a specific view of French Canada’s past: “An invariable accompaniment of this appreciation of the conservative social forms of Quebec and her loyal background was an idealized picture of the heroic character and grandeur of French-Canadian history” (Berger 143). Kirby’s interest in French Canadian history, specifically “the chivalric and hierarchical social order of the French society” (Berger 95), is evident throughout *The Golden Dog*, thereby positioning the novel as deeply influenced and shaped by Loyalist values.

Closely related to the Loyalist appreciation of French Canada’s past was the belief that French Canadians could assist in defining the national character. Some imperialists, “[u]rged by the desire, natural to all nationalists, to conceive of a single people sharing

common characteristics,” worked to accommodate French Canadians “into their composite image of the Canadian character” (Berger 128). The notion that the national character required the incorporation of a range of traits was evident in much Loyalist writing: “[i]mplicit in a good deal of the literature describing the position of the French in Canada was the notion that their collective qualities formed a necessary counterpoise to Saxon character and that the interaction of the two races would provide distinctiveness to the Canadian nationality” (Berger 144). Kirby’s strong Loyalist beliefs are apparent throughout his writing, especially *The Golden Dog*, and his views of the nation and of the place of French Canada within it have strongly impacted his critical reception.

While agreeing that Kirby’s most significant work was *The Golden Dog*, critics diverge in their assessments of its value. Keith remarks that although the novel has some shortcomings, it “is perhaps the most substantial narrative written in Canada in the nineteenth century” (*Canadian Literature* 72). Dyer also holds the novel in fairly high regard, arguing that it is an integral part of the national literary tradition:

the novel is both a telling sociocultural document and an important literary antecedent to the immensely popular historical romances of Gilbert Parker. Indeed, these two novelists [. . .] were instrumental in establishing in English Canadian literature a tradition of historical fiction heavily indebted to the Old World models of Sir Walter Scott [. . .]. It was through the building of such a tradition, Kirby and his contemporaries were confident, that the future of the new dominion might be well served, nurturing in the still-developing culture a deep appreciation for its heroic colonial past and for the virtues of peace, order, and good government, which such narratives inevitably modelled. (581)

Dyer positions Kirby as forging a Canadian literature rooted in Old World models. Monk also views Kirby as linking Europe and Canada but is more dubious about his aesthetic achievement, finding that his works are

naturally of considerable interest to the literary historian, for they are valuable indicators of the temper of the times at a crucial moment in Canadian history. Nevertheless, their intrinsic interest is not only historical. They are also important to the student of form, for Kirby's attempts to accommodate his Canadian experience within his European models illustrate precisely the stylistic problems of Canadian literature, which other, more skilled, writers and poets were able to solve. (190)

More recently, critics have found the novel's significance to lie in its publication history, particularly the copyright issues surrounding publication, noting that because Kirby's publishers did not register the novel in Canada, other publishers were able to print the novel without recognizing Kirby's rights or paying him royalties.³⁴ These examinations of Kirby's works and publishing history position Kirby as an author noteworthy for his incorporation of historical events into his fiction.

Aside from Kirby's role in demonstrating the transplantation of European conventions to a North American setting, critics also focus upon the political and cultural elements of the novel, namely the tensions between French and English cultures. Dyer takes a positive view of Kirby's use of a French setting, noting that

Kirby remains one of the first English-language Canadian writers to recognize the narrative possibilities in the already romanticized history of

³⁴ For a more detailed account, see Carole Gerson's *A Purer Taste* 113-28 and George Parker's *The Beginnings of the Book Trade in Canada* 190-92.

French Canada. Connecting him with such prominent 19th-century Québec writers as James MacPherson le Moine and Philippe Aubert de Gaspé, such foresight locates Kirby as an important Victorian commentator on the role of the Canadian imagination within a multicultural and bilingual nation.

(581)

Dyer's assessment places Kirby within both French and English traditions, encompassing two of the nation's founding cultures. Other critics present a less flattering assessment: Duffy suggests that the novel "exemplified a cultural strategy for enfolding Quebec's history within that of Anglophone Canada" ("Golden Dog" 472). His assertion that the text envelops and engulfs French Canadian history presents a darker view of the novel and emphasizes the English-Canadian attempt to assimilate French Canada, a perspective on the nation that recent anthology editors are not interested in promoting. Most centrally, though, his Tory imperialist vision has proven to be uncongenial to anthology editors of later phases.

The Literary Historical Phase

Watson and Pierce included two excerpts from *The Golden Dog*,³⁵ and, as with Richardson, the selections focus upon the region's history. The editors selected "Beaumanoir" (consisting of chapter six and part of chapter seven) and "The Canadian Boat Song" (from chapter 26) and heavily abridged the two excerpts. The first selection describes the Chateau of Beaumanoir, the residence of the Intendant of New France, details the history of the area, summarizes the political atmosphere, and focuses upon

³⁵ Watson and Pierce used the edition published by The Musson Book Company of Toronto. Kirby did not authorize the edition and there are several variations between the Musson edition and the edition published by The Montreal News Co. Ltd. Inc. (1897), which Kirby corrected and revised.

Bigot's corruption. Watson and Pierce's first selection ends partway through the seventh chapter, leaving the reader with a highly unflattering image of Bigot:

He was fond of wine and music, passionately addicted to gambling, and devoted to the pleasant vices that were rampant in the Court of France; finely educated, able in the conduct of affairs, and fertile in expedients to accomplish his ends. Francois Bigot might have saved New France, had he been honest as he was clever; but he was unprincipled and corrupt. No conscience checked his ambition or his love of pleasure. He ruined New France for the sake of himself and his patroness, and the crowd of courtiers and frail beauties who surrounded the King, and whose arts and influence kept him in his high office despite all the efforts of the *Honnêtes gens*, the good and true men of the colony, to remove him. (270)

In the novel, this description is embedded in the middle of the chapter; Watson and Pierce's decision to conclude their excerpt at this point shows how they emphasized Bigot's negative traits and his role in the fall of New France as well as the "*honnêtes gens*" who might have helped the colony to flourish. Rather than excerpting a chapter that describes the land, people, or history of the region, the editors chose to remind readers of the fall of New France due to internal weakness. Kirby's criticism of Bigot's corruption was central to his imperialist vision of the duty of the Mother Country to a colony, and Watson and Pierce's decision to focus on this aspect suggests they endorsed, or at least found compelling and worth preserving, an imperialist view of the nation.

The next passage has an entirely different focus: it describes a group of voyagers transporting Lady de Tilly, her family, and Pierre Philibert back to the Manor House. The excerpt presents an idyllic, pastoral image of the voyagers joyfully singing a famous

French ballad, which Watson and Pierce include in its entirety in French.³⁶ The excerpt details the characteristics of the French Canadians and presents aspects of French language and culture. The selection ends with the song, and no translation is provided, showing that the editors expected Anglophone readers to understand it. This excerpt offers a more pleasant view of New France than the previous one and relates to Kirby's vision of rural virtue. Many imperialists "frequently expressed a deep rooted preference for agrarian values and also identified industrialism with a hateful materialization of life" (Berger 142), and French Canadians were strongly identified with such rural values. This excerpt offers a clearly Loyalist view of French Canadians, presenting them as contented, loyal, and linked with nature.

The two selections in Watson and Pierce's collection seem to be in harmony with their general view of French culture and language and the status of French Canada. Pierce acknowledges the distinctiveness of French-Canadian culture but argues that regional differences are ultimately subsumed by a larger national unity: "We have two great shrines at which we speak two languages; yet we have but one passionate loyalty – Canada!" (Introduction 124). Watson and Pierce's selection from Kirby's novel supports their view of national development, whereby the divisions and conflicts of the past have been overcome by "one passionate loyalty," and the worth and distinctiveness of Quebec find their best safeguard within the nation's British heritage.

The attempt to incorporate Kirby's novel into a version of Canadian history is also evident in both editions of Broadus and Broadus's *A Book of Canadian Prose and Verse*. The anthology contains a lengthy section from *The Golden Dog*, which they title "The

³⁶ This is a significant difference between the unauthorized and corrected editions of the novel: Watson and Pierce included the complete version of the boat song as it appeared in the Musson edition, while the authorized edition only includes three lines.

Old Regime,” comprised of a number of excerpts from the novel ranging from the beginning of the first chapter to the scene of Bourgeois Philibert’s death near the conclusion. As noted previously, the editors placed selections from *The Golden Dog* before the one from *Wacousta*, offering a retelling through fiction of the nation’s development. In the headnotes, Broadus and Broadus summarize the plot, emphasizing the end of the regime of New France. They provide a succinct overview of Kirby’s life and make no mention of Kirby’s other works. They do not discuss their presentation of the text and give no indication that their selections cover the majority of the novel.

Their anthologization of the novel clearly demonstrates a prevalent trait of the first phase of anthology development: interest in preserving and historicizing Canadian writing. The presentation of *The Golden Dog* is unusual, as most anthologists selected a chapter or two and focused upon one section of the novel rather than attempting to cover the entire novel through a series of excerpts. This treatment of the novel illustrates the process of preservation, for the editors’ inclusion of the novel in a truncated form made it accessible to a large number of readers, likely far more than would have read the long novel in its entirety. In fact, the editors’ low appraisal of the novel’s literary worth indicates that they did not expect many readers to have read the novel; they deemed it worthy of inclusion primarily for its use of historical figures and occurrences: Kirby “is one of the few Canadians who have availed themselves of the wealth of material for historical fiction at their door. The plot of *The Golden Dog* is sheer melodrama, but the historical material is ingeniously used” (119). They further stress the significance of the use of history, remarking that “A vivid account of this period and of many of the characters who appear in *The Golden Dog* may be found in Parkman’s *Montcalm and Wolfe*, Chapter XVII” (119). By focusing their selection on historical figures and events

and stressing the links between Kirby's and Parkman's works, Broadus and Broadus historicize Canadian literature, highlighting both the nation's past and the incorporation of historical material into literature. Ultimately, selections from *The Golden Dog* throughout the literary historical phase assert the success of the consolidation of Canada as a just British nation.

The Literary Nationalistic Phase

Kirby was excluded entirely from the literary nationalistic phase of the anthology, which may be linked with his handling of French subjects and material. Having established the existence of a national literature, critics and anthologists were concerned with establishing the quality of a distinct literature. In an attempt to present the value of the nation's writing and unique traits of the country, anthologists focused upon fewer authors and included longer excerpts than did editors of the literary historical phase. Critics were working to make Canadian literature the focus of greater scholarly interest; Kirby's popular romance may have been viewed as meaningful for its role in the development of a tradition, but it was not considered valuable enough to include in general anthologies. Editors emphasized the literary value of the works in their collections, thereby asserting that the nation had a distinct literature of high aesthetic worth, perhaps leaving no room for the historical romance, a genre that was becoming less popular. Near the end of the previous stage, English-Canadian literature was beginning to be seen as representative of the country, and this trend continued in the literary nationalistic phase. Kirby, a writer whose subject matter and style did not conform to the vision of the nation promoted in this stage, was not included in collections of this time.

The Thematic Phase

The suggestion that Kirby was slowly removed from anthologies due to his increasingly unpopular view of the relationship between French and English Canada and his political views in general is upheld in an examination of the anthologies in which he was included in the 1970s. Edwards, in *The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English: Beginnings to 1867*, discusses Kirby's belief that Canada needed to recognize fully both French and English traditions in order to prosper. She comments that one of Kirby's concerns was Canada's "need to become a united country whose peoples appreciated fully the value of their cultural heritage from both the English and the French" (207). Kirby's personal correspondence shows that he recognized "both the problems between the 'two races' and the unique 'double treasure' which the new dominion had" (207). Edwards contends that "*The Golden Dog* is Kirby's most magnificent tribute to what he calls 'the double memory . . . which will one day make the glory of our country'" (207). This notion of a double tradition is a concern that anthologists wrestled with from the first general anthology and the question of how to incorporate or acknowledge the French-Canadian tradition was an ongoing one. However, the selections Edwards chooses offer no answers to how the "double memory" may be used to elevate the nation; like earlier anthologists, she seems to agree that the two literatures should be considered separately.

Although Edwards discusses Kirby's admiration for the French heritage, her presentation of the author emphasizes his British background and Tory principles, suggesting that Kirby's politics are the main area of interest for Edwards. She stresses his anti-Americanism, a tenet of Loyalist beliefs, connecting Kirby's views with thematic interests. She included two works by Kirby: *Counter Manifesto to the Annexationists of Montreal* and a poem, "Canadians Forever," from the second edition of *Canadian Idylls*,

an ode Kirby wrote at the time of Confederation. She also focuses upon Kirby's political affiliation as a Tory Loyalist, noting that the theme of danger from the United States recurs throughout his writing: "Kirby distrusted the political system of the Americans and disliked much about the American way of life. He feared the influence of the United States, both on Canadian politics and Canadian culture" (206). Edwards notes that these views are apparent in *Counter Manifesto to the Annexationists of Montreal*; the manifesto's focus upon the perils of a close relationship with the United States is a concern of anthologists in both the literary nationalistic and thematic phases. The manifesto was written in response to a group of Montreal merchants who supported annexation to the United States; Kirby's document aligns him with British interests, which in this instance directly oppose some French-Canadian concerns. The poem celebrates Confederation and asserts that in order for Canada to become great, it must "remain part of the British Empire" (207). Edwards's selections highlight Kirby's politics, specifically his anti-Americanism, and position him as a writer closely allied with Britain.

Like Edwards, Daymond and Monkman foreground Kirby's Loyalist background, and they also situate him as an author whose motifs are clearly aligned with the unique features of the nation. Their emphasis upon his background and presentation of his work exclude his views of the value of French culture to the nation and firmly situate him as an English-Canadian author. They included one poem by Kirby, "The Hungry Year" from *Canadian Idylls*, which celebrates the tenacity of Loyalist settlers in their struggle to prosper in a new land. The poem creates a picture of a challenging, frightening, isolating wilderness full of hardship and toil, images which align with a thematic view of the Canadian environment. Selection of this poem stresses Kirby's belief in a close relationship with Britain. Overall, Daymond and Monkman's presentation of Kirby

diverges from that of other anthologists, for they completely overlook his interests in French Canada and instead suggest that he is an English-Canadian author working to articulate the experiences and values of early Loyalist settlers.

The Pluralistic Phase

The focus of Daymond and Monkman's selection indicated the direction that future studies of Kirby would take. Despite earlier emphases upon his hope for a dual tradition, critics and anthologists began to pay closer attention to Kirby's stated interest in the future of the nation and the messages of his work. Kirby's writing was heavily influenced by his political views, and in recent decades, the links between his politics and writing have come under close scrutiny. Early anthologies frequently included Kirby, using *The Golden Dog* to create images of early Canada. While anthologists and critics never claimed that Kirby's novel was an accurate representation of early Canadian history, they seemed to value the novel's portrayal of a past time. Broadus and Broadus, for example, situated excerpts from the novel along with other works of historical fiction to create a narrative of national growth, offering an imaginative retelling of Canadian history. Anthologists also commended Kirby for a vision of the nation that included and celebrated both English and French Canadians. However, more recent assessments demonstrate that while Kirby claimed to champion a dual tradition, his view of the nation was firmly rooted in Loyalist notions. The attempt in the 1970s by anthologists to situate Kirby shows the difficulties of including in a collection meant to represent the nation an author whose work is firmly entrenched in a past world view. Edwards and Monkman and Daymond address this difficulty by positioning Kirby as a significant figure in the

nation's growth and the Loyalist tradition, but they emphasize the remoteness of his vision.

Study of Kirby's reception and anthology inclusion shows that there are clear links between changing views of Canadian nationalism, views of French Canada, and Kirby's status. J.D. Logan and Donald G. French in *Highways of Canadian Literature* (1922) view Kirby "not as a relic of colonialism but as a forerunner of nationalism" (94). Desmond Pacey in *Creative Writing in Canada* (1961) sees the novel as "a faithful reconstruction of the old regime, embodying values and a way of life 'which Kirby sought vainly to perpetuate'" (10) and as "a novel of the new nationalism" (70). In contrast to this view, Margot Northey in *William Kirby and His Works* (1990) suggests that Kirby's novel is not an accurate portrayal of the old regime but is instead "an idealized vision of the past" (11) that "suggests that all will be well if French and English form a common bond of loyalty and devotion" (19). Stacey views the novel even more critically, suggesting that Kirby locates French nationality entirely in the past, emphasizing only the English aspects of the country: "[t]he very form of *The Golden Dog* has the effect of sealing off a French national past from a *Canadian* national present – of declaring an end to it and whatever powers of self-definition and national differentiation it, in 1877, might still hold for the French Canadian" (104-05). While Kirby was initially applauded for his promotion of a nation that embraced two distinct traditions, recent considerations of his work and themes have determined that Kirby ultimately promoted an Anglo-centric view of the country heavily influenced by his Loyalism.

Further, Kirby's endorsement of a nation closely tied with Britain is now thought to exclude appreciation and inclusion of a range of groups. Northey characterizes Kirby as a "genuine conservative about social cohesiveness" (*William Kirby* 23), a stance that is

out of step with the pluralistic phase and its celebration of diversity. Contemporary considerations of the national character are suspicious of unitary definitions of the country; Kirby's insistence upon a singularly defined nation clearly does not fit with current views of Canada, and his works have consequently been excluded. Kirby's reception has altered as definitions of the nation changed; once his vision of the nation was no longer promoted and the values and notions underlying his imperialist view of Canada were scrutinized, he fell from critical favour and was removed from anthologies.

Kirby's uneven inclusion in general anthologies reveals the connections between views of the nation and representation in literature collections. While the promotion of close ties with the British Empire and an insistence upon the value of French-Canadian language and culture to the future success of the nation may now seem to have little in common, both suggest reasons for Kirby's irregular representation. In the two phases to include Kirby, editors focused upon either his integration of French history or his pro-imperialist political beliefs. As anthologies developed, neither the notion of a "double tradition" nor an imperialist vision were promoted as prominent views of Canada; instead, a primarily English and increasingly multicultural nation affiliated with but independent from Britain became the dominant image. Kirby's works, then, offer a view of the nation and its future that was ultimately rejected.

Conclusion

In both Kirby's and Richardson's cases, aesthetic evaluation and genre have influenced inclusion, but connections between the author's body of work and articulations of the nation have played a larger role. The treatment of these two authors in anthologies shows that anthologists have been interested in Canadian history and its role in the nation's

literature, asserting Canadian distinctiveness, and focusing upon English Canadian works and subject matter. One cause of the differences in Richardson's and Kirby's inclusions is the degree to which each author's body of writing supports a specific view of the nation. Kirby's exclusion from the literary nationalistic stage stemmed from a disconnect between editorial concerns and the themes of his writing; meanwhile, Richardson was selected throughout this phase because several of his works supported both the narrative of national advancement and the assertion of high aesthetic value. In the current phase, however, a different image of the nation is endorsed, as the country's multiculturalism and the recovery of previously overlooked or marginalized authors are promoted; while the pluralistic stage allows for the discovery of unjustly neglected authors, it also leads to the removal of other significant writers, such as Richardson and Kirby. Both authors have been recognized by contemporary critics as valuable writers, but their exclusion from current anthologies indicates that they will likely receive even less scholarly attention in the future.

As anthologies evolve, so too do versions of the nation and the canon. Richardson is currently acknowledged as a canonical, if problematic, writer while Kirby's position is less secure. If, however, Richardson continues to be excluded from anthologies and critical interest wanes, he may be removed from the diachronic canon as well. The shifts in the ways the two authors have been presented in anthologies illustrate negotiations between different types of canons and the ways that a literary tradition is established through assessment and reassessment. Richardson's and Kirby's representations in anthologies and the shifting emphases upon different texts and aspects of their writing offer a glimpse into the interplay between canon, anthology, and visions of national identity.

CHAPTER FOUR

Susanna Moodie

This chapter examines Susanna Moodie (1803-1885), one of the most widely recognized and studied authors of Canadian literature. Moodie, a British emigrant, was the author of numerous sketches, poems, essays, and books; her best-known work is *Roughing It in the Bush; or, Forest Life in Canada* (1852), an account of her early experiences as a settler in Upper Canada. The book encompasses a range of genres and themes and is regarded as a foundational work of Canadian literature, as demonstrated through its ubiquity in Canadian literary histories, criticism, and university syllabi. Moodie and her works have been used to investigate, define, and understand Canadian experiences, characteristics, and identity. Unsurprisingly, she has been consistently deemed a valuable writer in anthologies, recognition that sets her apart from many writers. She was included in the first general anthology and has since been included in almost every general anthology.³⁷ Her treatment in anthologies is remarkable, for she is one of only a very few authors included almost without fail throughout all anthology phases.³⁸

Moodie's treatment offers valuable insight into the process of anthologization: the consistency with which she has been included in anthologies, as well as the sustained and evolving critical interest in her work, demonstrates that some authors have been and continue to be valued consistently even as critical interests shift. The pervasiveness of

³⁷ The single exception is Weaver and Toye's second edition of *The Oxford Anthology of Canadian Literature* (1981).

³⁸ Other authors include Thomas Chandler Haliburton, D.C. Scott, Bliss Carman, Archibald Lampman, and Charles G.D. Roberts.

Moodie's work reveals that a Canadian canon exists and has been slowly taking shape for decades, determining an "official canon" (Fowler 98).

Critics have frequently noted the wide range of views and interpretations that Moodie's best-known book, *Roughing It*, has supported. Michael A. Peterman, in his introduction to the Norton critical edition of the book, discusses the work's richness:

Its record of emigration and pioneering experience, its personalized drama, its apparent contradictions of purpose and mood, and its persistently humorous responses have held readers' interest over the decades.

Numerous Canadian writers, such as Robertson Davies, Margaret Atwood, Carol Shields, Tom King, Julie Johnston, Elizabeth Hopkins and Timothy Findley, have included Susanna in their novels, plays and poems, and two recent films have celebrated her life and legacy. For many, *Roughing It in the Bush* suggests, if not defines, something of the nature of the Canadian imagination and the struggle to adapt to life in a northern environment. For others, it has given rise to a preoccupation with the author herself. Was Susanna Moodie, as Northrop Frye observed, 'a one-woman army of British occupation?' Was she a too-shrill and persistent complainer? Was she an English snob who could not and would not adjust to frontier conditions? Or was she an astute observer of backwoods manners and morals? Was she a heroic pioneer and an extraordinary woman in her own right? Was she a writer of limited talent who somehow, through the intimacies of memoir and autobiography, unlocked the best of her talent?

(xvii)

He concludes, “No single view encompasses what Susanna Moodie has to say and what she represents. Rather, she stands as a persistent and challenging enigma for readers old and new” (xvii). Peterman’s comments on the complexity of Moodie’s book demonstrate the wide reach of her influence and the questions her book continues to raise. Critical analysis has allowed Moodie to retain a central role in Canadian literature and will almost certainly ensure that her book maintains its status as a national classic for some time to come.

Moodie’s inclusion in anthologies has been consistent, yet anthologists have presented her essays, sketches, poems, and books in various ways, showing the impact of genre considerations upon an author’s presentation. Early anthologists selected both her prose and poetry but placed them in different sections, clearly distinguishing the genres. When excerpts from *Roughing It* were selected, their format, in which poems appeared at the beginning and end of sketches, was altered so that prose and poetry were separate. In later anthologies, a shift away from Moodie’s poetry was evident. Later editors primarily valued Moodie as a prose writer, and although a number of critics have analyzed her poetry, her prose has received more attention in general. Thus, Moodie’s reception is linked with assessments and views of the genres of her writing, and the various ways anthologists view and organize genre demonstrate how various elements of a single work may be foregrounded at different times.

Upon closer examination, the book’s own heterogeneous genre has impacted inclusion in anthologies significantly. One of the aspects of *Roughing It* that has allowed for its frequent selection is that its form makes it easy to excerpt and adaptable to various editorial agendas for anthologies. Editors and critics have categorized and studied it as travel writing, autobiography, emigrant guide, novel, and a collection of sketches; the

many classifications of the work speak to its diversity and wealth of material. In their discussion of nineteenth-century guidebooks, Cynthia Sugars and Laura Moss note, “The literature of the period is thus a mixture of many genres: satires, travel and adventure stories, and emigrant guides” (111); as critics have remarked, *Roughing It* is an excellent example of such generic multiplicity.³⁹ Its mixing of genres has contributed to the book’s frequent inclusion, as the variety of writing, generically and thematically, provides ample selection for editors and support for a range of approaches.

Another intriguing aspect of Moodie’s inclusion in anthologies, particularly in recent decades, is her connection with other authors. Specifically, there are links between Moodie’s inclusion and the anthologization of Catharine Parr Traill and, especially, Margaret Atwood. In an earlier chapter, I examined how the anthology may be a tool for the recovery of an overlooked author; in this chapter, I investigate how the inclusion of an author in an anthology may contribute to increased attention to other writers. Moodie’s broad coverage in anthologies has contributed to re-evaluations of Catharine Parr Traill’s writing, and her influence on Atwood is evident in the selection and treatment of Atwood’s writing in various anthologies.

³⁹ In an attempt to encompass and categorize the variety of writing found within the book, some scholars, including W.J. Keith and W.H. New, have suggested that it is most useful to term the book a miscellany. Keith writes, “*Roughing It in the Bush* is a miscellany made up of personal impressions, character sketches, passages of romantic description, anecdotes, short stories, and even poems” (*Canadian Literature* 41). New concurs with Keith’s assessment: “Formally, it is a miscellany, a gathering of essays, anecdotes, sketches of event and character, punctuated by occasional poems, some of them contributed by her husband” (*History* 93). A closer examination of *Roughing It*, however, reveals that the categorization is not quite apt, for the book is more unified than the term miscellany implies. In fact, *Roughing It* has several key features of an anthology: it is a collection including previously published works, it includes multiple genres, it may be read as a whole or in part, it collects work from several authors (Moodie, her husband, and her brother (Peterman xv-xvi)), and it was collected and published with a specific theme and purpose in mind. The authorship, publication history, and genres of the book, when considered together, demonstrate that the book is a cohesive collection, suggesting it may also be considered an anthology.

Moodie's Biography and Literary Works

Susanna Moodie (née Strickland) was born in Bungay, Suffolk, England on December 6, 1803. She was the sixth daughter of Thomas and Elizabeth Strickland, who had recently moved from rural Suffolk. Moodie and her sisters were educated at home, and their literary interests in particular were nurtured (Peterman viii). After their father passed away in 1818, Susanna and several of her sisters began to write for a living, as Carole Gerson notes in *Canadian Women in Print, 1750-1918*: “After the death of their father in 1818, Susanna and Catharine Strickland followed their eldest sister, Agnes, into London’s genteel literary circles, where, during the 1820s, they eked out a living by writing children’s books and contributing poetry and prose to literary periodicals and annuals” (38). Moodie supported herself with her writing throughout the 1820s, composing a number of children’s stories, poems, and sketches; she also transcribed *The History of Mary Prince*, the first narrative of a former slave published in Britain.

Moodie met her future husband, John Wedderburn Dunbar Moodie, in 1830; he had recently returned from South Africa, where he had farmed for over a decade. He and Susanna were married in the following year, and in 1832, the Moodies and their five-month-old daughter left for Canada. They arrived in Cobourg in September 1832 and settled 13 kilometres from the town. In February 1834, they left their first settlement and moved to the Douro Township. Her siblings Catharine Parr Traill and Samuel Strickland had emigrated to the area at an earlier time and became the Moodies’ neighbours. Gerson notes, “On the shores of Lake Katchewanooka, the Moodies and Traills took up adjoining grants of uncleared land beside the lot already occupied by Samuel Strickland, their younger brother, who had been sent out in 1825 to learn farming” (*Canadian Women* 38). The Moodies did not flourish in their new environment, struggling with poor crops,

injury, fire, sickness, debt, and the loss of livestock. This time in the bush forms the basis of *Roughing It* and has received significant critical interest. Dunbar Moodie, who had held two militia jobs in Canada, was later appointed sheriff of Hastings Country in October 1839. In January 1840, Moodie and her children joined her husband in Belleville, where Moodie remained for much of her life.

While many aspects of Moodie's life during her early years in Canada were uncertain and unfamiliar, one that remained consistent was her writing. She supplemented the family's income through writing and contributed to every issue of *The Literary Garland* (1838-51).⁴⁰ Magazines were central to Moodie's career in several ways, for they were an important source of income, and several of the sketches and poems first published in Canadian magazines were later collected and revised for *Roughing It* (Peterman xv). London publisher Richard Bentley, who had published Dunbar Moodie's book on South Africa, edited and published *Roughing It* in 1852, and the book was a best-seller in Britain and the United States and met with success when it was later published in Canada in 1871 (Peterman vii). Since its first Canadian publication, the book has received significant popular and critical interest:

the book has enjoyed a growing prominence in Canada over its 150-year history, drawing both high praise and some resentment and hostility from succeeding generations of readers who have felt its influence and power.

⁴⁰ Cynthia Sugars and Laura Moss provide an overview of the magazine's history: "*The Literary Garland*, published in Montreal from December 1838 to December 1851, is notable as an important vehicle for many literary authors from this period who were writing for a local audience and working on creating a Canadian voice. Moodie, for instance, published in all its thirteen issues. *The Literary Garland* was the first successful literary periodical in either Upper or Lower Canada. Much of that success can be attributed to its emphasis on original compositions and its appeal to readers beyond the boundaries of the Canadas. It was one of the first Canadian publications to be written for both a Canadian and international audience. This is another key point: while those writing about Canada desired a local readership, they also wanted to compete on a global scale and to be read internationally" (115).

Indeed, in the first decade of the twenty-first century, *Roughing It in the Bush* is widely recognized as one of the most important nineteenth-century books written in and about Canada. (Peterman vii)

Roughing It has continued to attract interest, and, as Peterman comments, “In the twentieth and twenty-first centuries, the book has remained a challenge for many scholars, creative writers and students” (vii).

Moodie remained involved with Canadian literary culture after her move to Belleville, as she and her husband edited the *Victoria Magazine* (1847-48). The majority of the magazine’s contents was written by the Moodies, “on topics ranging from classical Rome to current humour” (Gerson, *Canadian* 40). Moodie also published five more books: *Life in the Clearings versus the Bush* (1853); *Mark Hurdlestone; or, the Goldworshipper* (1853); *Flora Lyndsay; or Passages in an Eventful Life* (1854); *Matrimonial Speculations* (1854); and *Geoffrey Moncton* (1856), all of which contained pieces previously published in periodicals in the 1840s. Of this group, *Life in the Clearings* is the best-known; it is frequently viewed as a companion piece and sequel to *Roughing It* and focuses upon Moodie’s time in Belleville. While Moodie’s second Canadian book has been the focus of some critical attention, *Roughing It* remains her most consistently anthologized work.

The Literary Historical Phase

Most early general anthologies included selections from *Roughing It*, and the excerpts focused upon Moodie’s early reactions to and experiences in Canada. Selections from the book framed Moodie’s encounters as positive, a tendency that John Thurston discusses in *The Work of Words: The Writing of Susanna Strickland Moodie*: “Critics and teachers of

Canadian literature constituted both ‘the Canadian identity’ and a Moodie congruent with it through a grid of acculturated proclivities founded on national optimism and faith in the romance of history” (5). Thurston’s summary of the book’s critical treatment in the first half of the twentieth century also applies to anthologies of the literary historical phase. Excerpts centre upon Moodie’s pioneer experiences and her more positive assessments of her new home, therefore characterizing her persona as optimistic and hopeful, a markedly different view of the author than would become dominant in later decades.

Albert Durrant Watson and Lorne Albert Pierce, in *Our Canadian Literature: Representative Prose and Verse* (1922), included a short passage from *Roughing It* that focused upon the beauty of the natural world, creating a positive image of both the land and Moodie’s experience. They chose an excerpt from the first sketch, “A Visit to Grosse Isle,” entitled “On First Seeing Quebec.” The selection was placed in a section of the anthology detailing various elements of the Canadian environment, and, as a whole, the section presents the nation as a place of beauty and tranquility. The excerpt from Moodie’s book aligns with this largely positive presentation. Barely two paragraphs in length, it describes Moodie’s initial response to the landscape of Quebec: “Edinburgh had been the beau ideal to me of all that was beautiful in nature—a vision of the northern Highlands had haunted my dreams across the Atlantic; but all these past recollections faded before the present Quebec” (181). Moodie’s description of Quebec as surpassing the beauty of Scotland emphasizes the splendour of the Canadian landscape, and her complimentary reaction creates a strong sense of hope for her life in Canada. Although only a short passage from Moodie’s book was chosen, its inclusion indicates that the editors regarded her account as a significant early response to Canada and positioned the excerpt as a valuable, realistic description of the country.

Watson and Pierce's presentation of the book reveals their interest in creating a specific image of early immigrants' responses to a new environment. In its original context, the chosen passage in *Roughing It* is followed by a scene showcasing Moodie's violent and horrified recoil from the New World, but the negative aspects of Moodie's reaction are hidden from readers of the anthology. Through careful selection, the editors created a falsified impression of Moodie's work, for at this point in the book, she is in no way reconciled with her new home. Watson and Pierce's concern with promoting early positive reactions to the country supersedes accurate representation of the book.

The view of Moodie's work as a truthful, interesting portrayal of life in early Ontario continued in Edmund Kemper Broadus and Eleanor Hammond Broadus's *A Book of Canadian Prose and Verse* (1923), where excerpts from *Roughing It* were included to depict Ontario in the 1800s and describe the lives of settlers. As in Watson and Pierce's anthology, the presentation of the environment is largely positive, although some of the more challenging aspects of bush life are included. The editors divided Moodie's writing according to genre: they included her poetry in the first section of the anthology, "Canada and the Canadian Scene," and placed her prose in the second section, "The People," titling the entry "Pioneers in Ontario," thus indicating their documentary interest in her book. The prose pieces detail pioneer life in Ontario, and in the headnotes Broadus and Broadus praise Moodie's ability to "describe[] with vividness and spirit her pioneer experience" (169). They chose two poems, "The Maple-Tree" and "The Canadian Herd Boy," as well as three prose selections, "A Journey into the Woods," "Burning the Fallow," and "The Bear." The prose excerpts are abridged and the selections were chosen from sketches throughout the book; unlike Watson and Pierce, who focused upon the beginning of the book, Broadus and Broadus included selections from several points in Moodie's narrative.

The excerpts centre upon some of the more eventful aspects of Moodie's life as a settler and describe challenging experiences, offering a fairly full and realistic image of her time in the bush.

The poems from *Roughing It* were included to document the history of Canada, a central trait of this phase of anthology development. The editors note that Moodie "is best remembered for her prose sketches of pioneer life in Canada" and then remark that "[h]er verse is conventional, but the fact that she was one of the earliest to write of Canadian life lends it an historical interest" (18). The editors thus situate her poetry as historically significant with little aesthetic value. The two poems describe unique Canadian scenes and focus upon the physical environment. "The Maple Tree" is a patriotic poem describing the beauty of the Canadian landscape and presenting the maple tree as a symbol of Canada. "The Canadian Herd Boy" is a brief narrative poem describing a boy calling a herd of cattle from grazing to come home.

Through the three prose excerpts, the editors present Moodie as slowly growing accustomed to her new environment. Their decision to include selections from different points in the book suggests an interest in presenting a more fully realized Moodie-character than was evident in Watson and Pierce's collection. The first selection describes the family's journey from their first farm to their second settlement. The sketch as presented in the anthology ends with the sleigh turning over and Moodie's crockery and stone china being broken; her husband says that she should be grateful that the driver and horses were not injured, and she writes, "I should have felt more thankful had the crocks been spared too; for, like most of my sex, I had a tender regard for china, and I knew that no fresh supply could be obtained in this part of the world" (178). The next sketch, "Burning the Fallow," describes how a hired man set the fallow around the Moodies'

house on fire, and Moodie's fears that she and her children, trapped in the house and surrounded by fire, would perish. At the last moment, a thunderstorm burst overhead, saving the house and family: "a most terrific crash of thunder burst over our heads, and, like the breaking of a water-spout, down came the rushing torrent of rain, which had been pent up for so many weeks" (183). The sketch relays Moodie's terror regarding the fire, but the turn of fortune tempers the story, suggesting that the experience, under God's control, was ultimately manageable. These sketches are contrasted by the final selection, "The Bear," which was taken from "The Fire," a sketch describing how the Moodies' house caught fire and burnt down. Rather than focusing upon the destruction of the Moodie home, the editors instead chose the Moodies' encounters with two bears, one that was shot for meat for the family, and her likely mate, who later attacked the Moodies' cattle in the middle of the night. Moodie describes her husband in his night-shirt, shooting randomly into the dark, and the family servant Jenny brandishing a large knife, a scene Moodie found highly amusing: "I, for my part, stood at the open door, laughing until the tears ran down my cheeks, at the glaring eyes of the oxen, their ears erect, and their tails carried gracefully at a level with their backs, as they stared at me and the light in blank astonishment" (186). The final image of Moodie is markedly different in its humour from the first and second selections. The excerpts highlight the realistic, disorienting, and frightening aspects of Moodie's experiences while also demonstrating the more light-hearted and amusing details of her time in the bush as she slowly accepts and finds a degree of happiness in her new home.

In the second edition of their anthology, Broadus and Broadus greatly reduced Moodie's representation, including only a single prose selection, "Journey into the Woods." The removal of the additional prose selections and poetry substantially alters the

presentation of Moodie, as the changes in her personal responses are no longer evident and her poetry is neither included nor discussed. They may have believed that Moodie was adequately represented in their first anthology and chose to make room for new authors in their second. As the focus of the literary historical phase was making the past accessible, the editors may have decided that a single excerpt from *Roughing It* adequately demonstrated the realities of life for early settlers in Canada. The concern at the time was broad representation rather than selection of the most aesthetically significant work; the editorial decision, then, to remove the sections that provided a clear narrative and instead include a greater number of authors adheres to predominant editorial interests.

The presentation of Moodie as a perceptive observer of early settler life continues in A.J.M. Smith's *The Book of Canadian Poetry: A Critical and Historical Anthology* (1943). Smith selected Moodie for all three editions of the anthology, keeping the same headnotes and selections in each. He chose two poems from *Roughing It*, "The Canadian Herd-Boy" and "The Fisherman's Light," both describing features of life in the colony. He comments on the quality of the poems, noting that while the lyrics in the book "are not without some historical interest [. . .] the conventionality of most of the verse is in sharp contrast to the vigorous, witty, and homely prose" (60). He finds that the greatest value of Moodie's writing is found in its descriptions of settler life:

Mrs. Moodie is very much the cultured Englishwoman—superior, strong-minded, humorous, energetic, and, when necessary, courageous. Her book, because of these qualities, is the most vivid and authentic account we have of the conditions under which the English settlers opened up the frontier in Upper Canada. (60)

Smith valued Moodie's book primarily for its documentary focus, and his emphasis upon the accuracy of her writing reveals an interest in detailing national history and unique traits, key elements of the literary historical phase. Furthermore, like other editors of the phase, his descriptions of Moodie's writing, personality, and record of her experiences are fairly complimentary and suggest that settlers responded well to their new physical and cultural environments.

The final general anthology of the literary historical phase, John D. Robins's *A Pocketful of Canada* (1946), also presents the book and Moodie's experiences positively. In the section "Snake Fence Country," Robins included a selection entitled "A Settler's Wife Alone at Night," taken from the sketch "Brian, the Still-Hunter." The section describes several events that were a part of pioneer life in Ontario, including a barn-raising and sugar-making. Moodie's excerpt is at the beginning of the section and details the first night she spent alone while her husband went to a neighbour's house twenty miles away to bring home a cow. In the passage, Moodie describes the fear she felt, but she also states that she was unnecessarily frightened: "I cannot now imagine how I could have been such a fool as to give way for four-and-twenty hours to such childish fears; but so it was, and I will not disguise my weakness from my indulgent reader" (37). Moodie situates her response as one of an inexperienced and naïve settler, and she places her fears in the past, making it clear that she no longer has that reaction to the woods. But the event excerpted in the anthology is only part of the sketch: in *Roughing It*, the sketch has a much darker theme, as it relays the story of Brian the still-hunter and his tragic past and ultimate fate. The presentation of the sketch in a truncated manner creates a sense of what life was like for early settlers but also emphasizes the ultimately non-threatening nature of the environment. This largely positive presentation falls in line with the other excerpts

found in the section, all of which focus upon the more pleasant aspects of early Ontario life.

Throughout the literary historical phase, Moodie was included consistently and *Roughing It* was her only work excerpted. Her accounts of settler life were praised for their accuracy and for allowing readers to access and celebrate the past. At this early stage of anthology development, compilers were concerned with preserving and historicizing, resulting in a tendency for editors “to showcase particular works because of their qualification to convey the spirit of a bygone era” (Csicsila 10). Editors consistently praised her ability to make readers understand the struggles she faced. While the editors acknowledged that the Canadian environment posed some difficulties for Moodie, nature was largely presented as having a beneficial effect on the settlers and providing the opportunity for them to demonstrate their bravery and adventurous nature. None of the editorial comments includes a sustained analysis of the aesthetic value of Moodie’s text, suggesting that works were selected primarily for their portrayal of a past time and pioneer experiences.

The Literary Nationalistic Phase

In the next stage, editors built upon earlier views of Moodie’s work as an accurate and entertaining account of settler life and continued to praise *Roughing It*; they also began to draw attention to her other works, situating her as a skilled and prolific author with specific knowledge of Canada in the nineteenth century. While editors of the literary nationalistic phase were certainly aware of Moodie’s biography, as they frequently mentioned her time spent in the bush, they began to shift attention towards the literary value of her work. They agreed that *Roughing It* was an important work, yet their

presentations of Moodie aimed to bring greater exposure to her other works. The changes in interest in Moodie's work and life reflect the transition from the literary historical to the literary nationalistic phase and illustrate how various aspects of an author's body of work are valued at different points.

Emphasis on the literary culture of Canada became apparent in presentations of Moodie beginning in the 1950s. In the first anthology of this phase, *Canadian Anthology* (1955), Carl F. Klinck and Reginald E. Watters note that Moodie was

a leading contributor of both prose and verse to *The Literary Garland* of Montreal [. . .] *Roughing It in the Bush* (1852) is not only her masterpiece, but a work which has a secure place in Canadian literary history as a vigorous, accurate, and humorous account of frontier conditions in Upper Canada. It is currently available in a modern reprint. *Life in the Clearings* (1853) is perhaps not as remarkable, but it deserves to be better known than it now is. (49)

The reference to the reprint of *Roughing It* indicates that the editors believed that Moodie's book was widely read.⁴¹ Their interest in broadening knowledge of Moodie's other works is also evident in their selections: they chose a passage from *Life in the Clearings* and the introduction to *Mark Hurdlestone*. By including excerpts from Moodie's lesser-known books and mentioning Moodie's involvement with a prominent

⁴¹ Their selections also reflect adherence to the guidelines for inclusion Klinck and Watters outlined in the preface: "Whenever equally valuable alternatives were available, we have endeavoured to avoid using excerpts from long works such as novels, or from familiar and comparatively accessible books. Our intention throughout has been, not to substitute a part for a whole, but to supplement the known and stimulate exploration" (xv).

Canadian literary magazine, the editors sought to position her as an important contributor to the growth and development of the nation's literature.

The excerpt from *Life in the Clearings* is from the first chapter of the book and offers a more optimistic image of Canada than most of *Roughing It*. The selection describes the clothing and appearance of the Canadian lady as well as members of the "lower class" who "are not a whit behind their wealthier neighbours in outward adornments" (50). In the passage, Moodie argues that poor emigrants may obtain a level of comfort, status, and prosperity in Canada that would not have been possible in their home countries. The second part of the selection, also taken from the first chapter, describes a group of French Canadian lumbermen at work and focuses upon the dangers of spring thaw and a dramatic incident Moodie witnessed following the collapse of a bridge. The selection describes several aspects of the Moodies' lives in Belleville and the tone is pleasant; while certain environmental, social, and cultural challenges exist, the passage is quite light-hearted and offers a positive view of the area and the opportunities available to new Canadians.

The second excerpt, "Early Canadian Periodicals," was taken from the introduction to *Mark Hurdlestone* and discusses the difficulties of writing in Canada in the late 1800s and outlines the history of Canadian periodicals. Here, the editors highlight the developing literary culture of the nation and present an example of the criticism of the time, thereby asserting the existence of a literary culture. Moodie discusses the *Literary Garland*, which was published for twelve years until it could no longer compete with American periodicals, namely *Harper's Magazine* and the *International*. Moodie was a frequent contributor to the *Literary Garland* and laments the end of its publication, writing that it is "much to be regretted that a truly Canadian publication should be put to

silence by a host of foreign magazines, which were by no means superior in literary merit” (58). She then briefly recounts the publication histories of a number of other periodicals published at roughly the same time as the *Literary Garland*, including one that she and her husband edited for a year, *Victoria Magazine*. Through her summary of these periodicals, Moodie asserts that there was a valuable literature in Canada as well as an appreciative readership, affirming that Canadian literary culture existed and flourished in the early-to-mid-nineteenth century. Inclusion of such an essay is an attempt to verify the existence and worth of a literature, aligning with the literary nationalistic tendency to promote a distinct culture. The excerpt also shows an expanded understanding of Moodie as an author, adding literary criticism to the genres in which she wrote. The selection of this excerpt reveals the tendency of editors during the literary nationalistic phase to highlight the contributions of authors to a unique national literature.

Even more than the 1955 edition, the revised 1966 edition of *Canadian Anthology* forcefully promoted Moodie’s status as a central figure of the nation’s literature. In the second edition of the anthology, Klinck and Watters made some changes to their presentation of Moodie, selecting two essays and a poem, all first published in *The Literary Garland*. They also altered the headnotes, placing greater emphasis upon her personal life, noting, for instance, that her literary career was more successful once she and her family moved to Belleville and that she was a frequent contributor to Canadian literary magazines. They stressed that her best work stemmed from her Canadian experiences, remarking that “her poetry is generally undistinguished and her fiction (in which she avoids Canadian settings) is imitative of the sentimental and melodramatic popular fiction of the day in England. When she draws upon her personal experiences in Canada, however, she is at her best” (58). The editorial concern with asserting the

aesthetic worth of Moodie's writing, especially her writing about Canada as she had experienced it, a core trait of the literary nationalistic phase, demonstrates that the editors were deliberately working to position Moodie as a skilled author who should be recognized for her body of work overall, not only her first Canadian book.

Their first selection was an essay entitled "A Word for the Novel Writers." As they note, the piece was first published in *The Literary Garland* in August 1851. They chose to republish the essay "as a period piece of Canadian literary criticism and as a statement of Mrs. Moodie's theory and practice in the serialized fiction that she wrote for *The Literary Garland*" (58). Although this selection discusses British literature, not Canadian, Moodie's literary activities are significant as evidence of Canada's extant literary culture. The essay is a defense of novels against those who argue that only works of "religious, historical, or scientific subjects" (58) are worthy of study. It gives a sense of Moodie's view of literature and approach to criticism, and its significance therefore lies in what it reveals about Moodie and her authoritative position as an arbiter of culture.

The second selection, "Early Canadian Periodicals," is the same excerpt from *Mark Hurdlestone* selected for their first edition, and the presentation is unchanged. Much like the first excerpt, this selection emphasizes Moodie's literary critical activity and positions her as an engaged contributor to early Canadian writing. Unlike "A Word for Novel Writers," this selection focuses on Canadian writing and the difficulties authors face in Canada. The editorial decision to retain this essay suggests that the piece was viewed as a strong example of Moodie's criticism.

The final selection Klinck and Watters included in their first edition was a poem, "The Indian Fisherman's Light," first published in the *Literary Garland* in February 1843. The poem was later included in *Roughing It* and is found at the end of chapter fifteen,

“The Wilderness and Our Indian Friends.” As the editors remark in the headnotes, they do not hold her verse in high regard; the inclusion of the poem, then, suggests they selected it because they were most interested in showing the reader the range of Moodie’s writing and giving some sense of the style of the poems in *Roughing It*.

Smith included Moodie in *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings to Confederation* (1965), and although he excerpted *Roughing It* while Klinck and Watters did not, his collection shows similar interests in presenting Moodie as a skilled, significant author. Smith comments on Moodie’s personal life to a greater degree than earlier editors of this phase and than in his poetry anthologies. He remarks that *Roughing It* was published twenty years after her emigration, when she was settled in Belleville, “prosperous, well-established, and reconciled to her new country” (159), suggesting that the discomfort and unhappiness with Canada expressed in her book had disappeared. Although he continues to find the descriptions of early settler life to be a distinguishing feature of the book, he also highlights Moodie’s writing skills, an emphasis which sets apart his representation of Moodie from editors of the literary historical phase. He praises both *Roughing It* and *Life in the Clearings* while also finding aspects of the two works problematic:

Because of the vigor of the narrative, the vividness of the descriptions, and the often humorous characterizations, these books stand apart from the generally undistinguished poetry and fiction of Mrs. Moodie. The story they tell is a representative and significant one, and what gives them a special interest for the social historian is the quite unselfconscious sense of superiority based on class, sex, and race which they reveal on every page.

(159)

Smith's characterization of Moodie as superior and condescending reveals a more negative view of the author than other anthology editors, as well as his own earlier view, revealing the impact of changing critical interests. He begins the later trend to view Moodie as an archetypal pioneer figure whose struggles to adapt to the rugged Canadian environment symbolize the clash between Old and New World values.

Smith included two excerpts from *Roughing It*: a selection from the introduction and the sketch "Uncle Joe and His Family," abridged. The introduction is a warning to British citizens of the challenges and hardships of emigration. Smith's assertion that Moodie ultimately accepted Canada sharply contrasts the introduction; his interest in the ways that she and her views of her new home changed indicates a preoccupation with the author as a person not evident in earlier anthologies. The second excerpt is more light-hearted and supports Smith's assertion that Moodie's writing is humorous, vivid, and vigorous, as well as proving his assertions about her class snobbery and ethnocentrism. The sketch describes the Moodies' interactions with their American neighbours and reveals aspects of Moodie that position her as an irritable and supercilious pioneer whose connection to the Old World and inability to adapt to new conditions represent the worst of British colonialism. Smith is the first to stress Moodie's condescension and her upper-middle class persona in a way no one had previously done.

In sum, presentations of Moodie changed notably in the literary nationalistic phase, as editors began to insist upon the literary worth of her works. Klinck and Watters laboured to make readers aware of her lesser-known works and to show the value of her contributions to early criticism. In general, editors of this phase offered critical evaluations of her work and asserted that while her prose and literary criticism were of high quality, her poetry was not noteworthy. Greater interest in Moodie's critical activities

emerged and editors sought to bring awareness to the diversity of her writing and the variety of genres in which she wrote. Additionally, less flattering aspects of Moodie's viewpoint and responses were highlighted, offering a new perspective on *Roughing It* and challenging earlier, uniformly positive presentations. The treatment of Moodie in this phase reveals growing confidence in the value of early Canadian writing and interest in articulating the history of the nation's writing.

The Thematic Phase

In the following phase, presentations of Moodie continued to demonstrate a growing confidence in the value of the nation's literature and Moodie's place within it. While most anthologists asserted this worth through the application of a few key themes to Moodie's work, some editors maintained a focus upon her literary criticism and her contributions to the development of the nation's literature. Although these anthologies were published during the thematic phase, their presentations of Moodie did not promote thematic inquiry and instead favoured the approach of earlier anthologists who emphasized the value of Moodie's prose and criticism. The overlap between the phases reveals an interest in maintaining continuity with previous presentations and establishing a tradition within anthologies.

Perhaps because they had already discussed Moodie extensively and built upon previous views of her work, in their third edition of *Canadian Anthology* (1974), Klinck and Watters left their presentation and discussion of Moodie largely unchanged. The headnotes are identical to the 1966 edition, and they included a shortened version of "Early Canadian Periodicals," as well as "The Indian Fisherman's Light." "A Word to Novel Writers" was removed. The focus remained upon the value of Moodie's works in

addition to *Roughing It*, upholding her position as an authority on Canadian literary culture. The section on Moodie was shortened, but the emphasis upon her as a contributor to and critic of early Canadian writing was maintained.

Similarly, Mary Jane Edwards in *The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English: Beginnings to 1867* (1973) concentrated on Moodie's role as a writer of early Canadian literature rather than as an archetypal figure. Edwards included a lengthy introduction to Moodie, focusing upon her career and the success of *Roughing It*. She selected three excerpts: "Achbor: An Oriental Tale," "The Oath of the Canadian Volunteers," and "Old Woodruff and His Three Wives." In the headnotes, she emphasizes the provenance of the pieces, highlighting Moodie's involvement with Canadian literary magazines. "Achbor: An Oriental Tale," first published in the *Canadian Literary Magazine*, is an allegorical tale examining the nature of happiness and sorrow. Edwards describes the tale as a "reminder that the state of man is unhappiness and that those who search for happiness inevitably fail to find it" (166). In her discussion of "The Oath of the Canadian Volunteers" and "Old Woodruff and his Three Wives," first published in *The Literary Garland*, Edwards notes that the two pieces were later incorporated into *Roughing It*. Her interest in the publication details, Moodie's "habit of including previously published material in a new work" (165), and the value of Moodie's contributions to the evolution of Canadian literature reveals that her presentation of Moodie is more closely aligned with the concerns of the literary nationalistic phase than the thematic.

In other anthologies, however, readings and presentations of Moodie were clearly thematic. In the 1970s, *Roughing It* garnered even more critical attention than it had in the past, and Moodie's work and person came to be regarded as emblematic and

representative of the nation and the questions surrounding Canadian identity. John Thurston summarizes the connections between the interests of thematic critics and Moodie:

Interpretive studies of Canadian literature in the 1970s and 1980s used a limited number of themes to produce coherent views of Canadian literature [sic] Moodie always figuring as a literary pioneer. Essays on *Roughing It* reconstructed it as a unified novel by isolating small portions of the text. This work rewrites *Roughing It* as a heroine's confrontation with the archetypal wilderness, making it a cornerstone of a literary canon based on the putative uniqueness of the Canadian relationship with the land.

("Moodie" 754 – 55)

As Thurston points out, *Roughing It* was used to represent the core concerns of thematic critics and to establish a link between early Canadian writing and contemporary critical interests. Moodie's presentation in anthologies was clearly influenced by the themes of the victim, isolation, and failure, with a range of sketches, essays, and poems anthologized to illustrate these motifs. Further, as studies of Moodie expanded, her sister Catharine Parr Traill began to generate greater critical interest and Margaret Atwood's imaginative reworking of Moodie's most famous book led to additional scrutiny of Moodie. The thematic phase of the anthology was thus a time of increased attention that offered new readings and understandings of Moodie's writing.

The first anthology of the phase that emphasized thematic interests and included Moodie was Robert Weaver and William Toye's *The Oxford Anthology of Canadian Literature* (1973). Their anthology has a distinct thematic bent, evident in their preface, in which they mention *Survival* and its impact on critical studies of the nation's literature.

Their discussion of Moodie and the excerpt they selected demonstrate all of the themes detailed in their preface, situating Moodie as an important figure for thematic considerations. They praise the quality of Moodie's writing, specifically her engaging, vivid depictions: "Of all the many books written about pioneering in Canada [*Roughing It*] is probably the most popular. Mrs Moodie recounts her experience in the form of anecdotes and character sketches that partake a little of the qualities of fiction in their dramatic shape and effective use of dialogue" (339). The reference to anecdotes, sketches, fiction, and dialogue shows the challenges anthologists faced in trying to categorize the genre of *Roughing It*, yet, as the editors note, the variety makes the work compelling. Her skill is also evident in her descriptions of personal reactions: "in addition, the character of the outspoken author, with her divided feelings about Canada and her obsessions, comes through as vividly and interestingly as the events she writes about" (339). The focus upon Moodie's personal reactions and sense of division and dislocation in her new environment creates an image of Moodie and her work as embodying the central features of the Canadian imagination.

Weaver and Toye chose a single excerpt, a selection from the sketch "Brian, the Still-Hunter," which clearly aligns with thematic interests. The selection, abridged from the original sketch, begins with Moodie's first encounter with Brian when he enters her home and ends with Brian mourning the death of his dog Chance. The passage focuses upon Brian retelling the story of his attempted suicide, evoking the themes of alienation and isolation. Since the attempt was unsuccessful, the notion of endurance also emerges, although the tone of his tale is not particularly happy.⁴² The portrait of the melancholy

⁴² Moodie ends the sketch by mentioning that Brian did eventually succeed in killing himself.

hunter and his survival as representative of the challenges facing an individual within the Canadian wilderness resonates with thematic criticism.

Emphasis upon thematic concerns continues in the second edition of Smith's prose anthology, *The Canadian Experience: A Brief Survey of English-Canadian Prose* (1974), an interest evident in the introduction. Smith discusses Moodie in the general introduction (she was not mentioned in the introduction to any of his earlier anthologies), commending her as an example of a writer of "good solid simple prose" (x). Further, he writes that "Mrs. Moodie, wife of a forest settler in Upper Canada, though she could never forget she was an English gentlewoman, brought to her narrative of colonization the same sturdy doggedness that had enabled her and her kind to survive and conquer" (x-xi). Here the theme of endurance emerges and Smith situates Moodie as a literary pioneer striving to succeed in a difficult milieu, a focus somewhat different from his earlier stress on her unselfconscious snobbery. In the section on Moodie, Smith did not alter the headnotes, but he removed the introduction to *Roughing It* and included only the sketch "Uncle Joe and His Family." The 1974 edition is a survey of English-Canadian prose, combining pre- and post-Confederation literature, so the excerpt may have been removed in order to accommodate a greater number of authors. Despite the removal of a part of the text that strongly supports a thematic reading, the selection still sustains thematic inquiry. It shows Moodie and her family struggling with a new, alienating physical and cultural environment that challenges their Old World values. While "Uncle Joe and His Family" is a more light-hearted sketch than "Brian, the Still-Hunter," it demonstrates the core concerns of Atwood-inspired thematic criticism.

Douglas Daymond and Leslie Monkman's *Literature in Canada* (1978) contains two selections from *Roughing It*, both of which align with thematic interests. They

selected excerpts from the first two sections of the book, the introduction and the sketch “A Visit to Grosse Isle,” creating a somber image of the colony. Moodie’s famous introduction ends with a note of warning, as she writes that she will be pleased with her book if even one family is deterred from emigrating after reading her words, presenting emigration as a grim reality rather than an opportunity to be embraced, as in earlier anthologies. The inclusion of the introduction impacts the sketch that follows, since stressing the challenges of emigration and many emigrants’ lack of preparedness makes Moodie’s ambivalence about dealing with a new climate apparent. “A Visit to Grosse Isle” contains elements of the garrison mentality, specifically Moodie’s unease and discomfort with a new land and her desire to retain British mores. It illustrates the ambivalence of settlers in the physical, social, and cultural environments of Canada. The selection ends on a rather deflated note, as Moodie is tired, hungry, and surrounded by “a fresh cargo of lively savages” (163). Together, the two selections articulate a sense of unhappiness and disillusionment.

Presentations of Moodie in the thematic phase sharply contrasted the selections of editors of earlier phases, particularly the literary historical. Watson and Pierce’s selection foregrounded the beauty of Moodie’s new home, and Robins chose and framed an episode from Moodie’s early days that in retrospect is entertaining and makes light of her inexperience. Broadus and Broadus’s selections centred upon the details of settler life, presenting Moodie’s work as an authentic portrayal of life in the bush, and Smith’s presentation also emphasized the accuracy of her account. In this first phase, editors gave no indication that Moodie did not endorse emigration, focusing instead on the more descriptive aspects of her work, as well as passages that presented Canada in a positive

manner, all of which are later undermined. Thematic phase considerations of *Roughing It* created instead images of ambivalence, division, alienation, and isolation.

The few anthologies published in the 1970s that did not stress the themes of *Roughing It* focused upon other works and Moodie's role in early Canadian literature. The differences within anthologies of this phase show that *Roughing It* is the work that best supports a thematic reading and that Moodie's other writing is significant for other concerns. The variations in representation are related to editorial guidelines (Klinck and Watters and Edwards deliberately sought short and lesser-known works) and genre, as thematic interests are more easily satisfied with prose than with literary criticism, nationalistic poems, and allegorical tales.

Another interesting aspect of Moodie's inclusion in anthologies at this point is that presentations of the author both influenced and were influenced by the treatment of other authors, specifically Catharine Parr Traill and Margaret Atwood. In the thematic phase, there was a marked increase in Traill's anthologization. Like Moodie, she was first included in Watson and Pierce's anthology: a short excerpt from *Studies of Plant Life in Canada* describing the beauty of the winter scene was selected. The editors did not comment upon the relationship between the two women, as there are no headnotes on individual authors, but they placed Traill's excerpt immediately after Moodie's. Watson and Pierce's *Our Canadian Literature* was the only anthology of the literary historical phase to include her and she was not part of any collection in the literary nationalistic stage. Then, she was included in the second edition of Klinck and Watters's *Canadian Anthology*⁴³ and since, she has been included in all anthologies in which Moodie appears.

⁴³ They included two excerpts from *The Backwoods of Canada*: "A Matter-of-Fact Country" and "A Sleigh Ride."

At the same time that Traill began to be included, the headnotes on Moodie in several anthologies began to mention Traill, demonstrating an expansion of studies of Moodie and a corresponding opening up of the canon.

Presentations of Traill at this time centred upon her relationship with her sister and highlighted the differences between their respective views of Canada. Carl Ballstadt's summary of the reception of *The Backwoods of Canada* also neatly outlines Traill's reception throughout the thematic phase: "Through much of the 20th century it was valued chiefly as a vivid, historical record of Canadian pioneer life. Its characteristics as a literary work were examined by several writers in the last half of the 20th century, usually in comparison with Susanna Moodie's much different account of settlement life" (1122). As Ballstadt's comments suggest, when both authors were included in an anthology, editors emphasized the differences between the sisters' views of Canada. Contrasting Traill's reaction with Moodie's also strengthened thematic readings of Moodie, as her sense of division and personal struggles becomes apparent when compared with her sister's buoyant determination and acceptance.

Klinck and Watters included two excerpts from Traill's *The Backwoods of Canada*, a collection of her letters to her family in England, in the third edition of their anthology. In the headnotes, they noted that Traill was born into the Strickland family "which became well known in Canada because of Susanna Strickland (Mrs. Moodie)" (25), immediately establishing a link between the two authors. The first excerpt, "A Matter of Fact Country," taken from Letter X of *The Backwoods of Canada*, contains Traill's thoughts upon Canadian history and folklore: "As to ghosts or spirits they appear totally banished from Canada. This is too matter-of-fact country for such supernaturals to visit. Here there are no historical associations, no legendary tales of those that came

before us. Fancy would starve for a lack of marvellous food to keep her alive in the backwoods” (27).⁴⁴ In the conclusion of the excerpt, Traill asserts that she is able to find happiness in her environment:

For myself, though I can easily enter into the feelings of the poet and the enthusiastic lover of the wild and the wonderful of historic lore, I can yet make myself very happy and contented in this country. If its volume of history is yet a blank [. . .] from its pages I can extract a thousand sources of amusement and interest whenever I take my walks in the forest or by the borders of the lakes. (27)

The second excerpt, also from Letter X, is entitled “A Sleigh Ride” and describes the charm and beauty of the Canadian winter. In both selections, Traill’s acceptance and contentment with her new home are evident, sharply contrasting Moodie’s more difficult transition.

Similarly, Daymond and Monkman selected a letter from Traill’s collection for their anthology. They introduce Traill as “[a] sister of Susanna Moodie” (146). They describe the book as a “series of letters written to her mother giving a realistic account of settlers’ lives in Upper Canada” (146); their interest in Traill thus lies in her ability to create authentic depictions of pioneer experiences. They included a selection from Letter VIII which describes the inconveniences of settling the land, the process of obtaining provisions, a snowstorm, a hurricane, Indian summer, and the approach of winter; throughout the letter, Traill maintains a positive outlook. Daymond and Monkman presented a thematic reading of Moodie, yet they focused upon the realistic aspects of

⁴⁴ This sentiment is echoed in the final lines of Earle Birney’s poem “Can. Lit.”: “it’s only by our lack of ghosts / we’re haunted.” Birney is included in Klinck and Watters’s anthology, but “Can. Lit.” is not included and the connection between Traill and Birney is not mentioned.

Trill's writing, highlighting again the difference in nature and genre of the two sisters' writings.

Another central component of Moodie's inclusion and treatment at this time was the connection anthologists established between Moodie and Atwood. 1970 saw the publication of Atwood's poetry collection *The Journals of Susanna Moodie*, in which Atwood reimagines and reworks parts of *Roughing It*. Since Atwood used *Roughing It* as the impetus for her collection, the links between Moodie's book and Atwood's collection are obvious; anthologists and critics alike have scrutinized the various ways the works interact. Editors have valued the intertextual nature of *The Journals of Susanna Moodie*, frequently commenting on the specific points of intersection between Moodie's and Atwood's works. Following the publication of *The Journals of Susanna Moodie*, every general anthology has contained at least one poem from the collection, even when Moodie is not included.⁴⁵ The works have come to be seen as interdependent, and readings of Atwood's poetry collection have influenced interpretations of Moodie's book.

Critics have noted the thematic bent of Atwood's collection and the corresponding image of Moodie created throughout. Gwendolyn Davies remarks, "there remained enough ambiguity in Moodie's overall oeuvre to inspire Margaret Atwood's poetry sequence in *The Journals of Susanna Moodie* (1971) [sic], in which she imaginatively recreated Moodie's sense of erasure by the wilderness" (76). Thurston argues that "Frye's remarks about Moodie as an isolated figure facing an undifferentiated environment of bush and barbarism led to Margaret Atwood's transference of Moodie to a transhistorical collective unconscious. In the preface to her *Journals of Susanna Moodie*, Atwood creates

⁴⁵ Weaver and Toye's second edition is the single general anthology to do so. They selected "Dream 1: The Bush Garden," "Dream 2: Brian the Still-Hunter," and "Death of a Young Son by Drowning" from *The Journals of Susanna Moodie* but did not include Moodie.

a Moodie who mothers the ‘violent duality’ of the Canadian imagination” (“Moodie” 754). The notions of ambiguity, unease, erasure, and duality, central to thematic criticism, emerge in Atwood’s recreation of Susanna Moodie.

Every anthology of this phase included poems from *The Journals of Susanna Moodie* and most editors commented upon the connections between Atwood’s and Moodie’s works. However, a few anthologists included poems from *The Journals of Susanna Moodie* without referencing the relationship between Atwood and *Roughing It*, leaving the connections for the readers to discover. For their third edition, Klinck and Watters chose several poems from *The Journals of Susanna Moodie*: “The Immigrants,” “Dream I: The Bush Garden,” and “The Planters.” They did not mention Moodie in the introduction to Atwood, and since they did not reprint selections from *Roughing It*, there are no connections within the anthology for them to emphasize. Daymond and Monkman selected three poems from the collection for their second volume: “Further Arrivals,” “Disembarking at Quebec,” and “Departure from the Bush.” Although the first two poems correspond with the sketch they included, “A Visit to Grosse Isle,” they did not discuss the links.

Other editors, however, strongly emphasized the relationship between Atwood’s and Moodie’s works. Weaver and Tøye, for example, draw attention to the connections between the two authors in the preface to their first edition: “There are numerous cross-references in the book. We have three of Margaret Atwood’s poems from *The Journals of Susanna Moodie*” (Preface xiv). Then, in the headnotes on Atwood, they write, “Three of the following poems—‘The Bush Garden’, ‘Brian the Still-Hunter’, and ‘Death of a Young Son by Drowning’—are from *The Journals of Susanna Moodie*, a sequence of poems suggested by the experiences of a pioneer in which the themes of alienation and

assimilation are memorably treated. [. . .] Mrs. Moodie's own account of Brian the Still-Hunter begins on page 340" (6). The introduction to Atwood thus stresses the thematic concerns within her reworking of Moodie's book. Correspondingly, at the end of the headnotes on Moodie, the editors mention Atwood's work:

Margaret Atwood's *The Journals of Susanna Moodie* is a memorable sequence of poems that grew out of her reading [*Roughing It* and *Life in the Clearings*], of which Miss Atwood says in an 'Afterword': 'The prose was discursive and ornamental and the book had little shape; they were collections of anecdotes. The only thing that held them together was the personality of Mrs Moodie, and what struck me the most about this personality was the way in which it reflects many of the obsessions still with us.' Three poems from this collection appear on pages 10-12. (340)

The reference to Atwood and her Afterword frames the excerpt that follows as embodying thematic interests. The notes on each author reference the other, creating an unavoidable connection between the two in the anthology.

The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English: 1945-1970 (1973), edited by Paul Denham, also included poems from *The Journals of Susanna Moodie*. Denham discusses the connections between Atwood and Moodie in the headnotes on Atwood. While Edwards did not mention Atwood in the notes on Moodie, Denham makes clear the connections between the two and positions Moodie as a significant figure who impacted later Canadian writing. He selected "Further Arrivals," "The Two Fires," and "Thoughts from Underground"; he also included a lengthy excerpt from Atwood's Afterword⁴⁶ in his

⁴⁶ He quotes the Afterword at length: "If the national mental illness of the United States is megalomania, that of Canada is paranoid schizophrenia. Mrs. Moodie is divided down the middle: she

notes, which he argues “tells us something about Miss Atwood’s view of Mrs. Moodie and of Canada, and about the origin of these poems” (259). Denham views Atwood’s interpretation of Moodie as a key to understanding Atwood’s other writing: “It also suggests something about her poetry as a whole. The imaginative landscape of her poems is a violent, frightening, and irrational one where conventional guides and compasses are useless. The best that agents of order and civilization such as Mrs. Moodie [. . .] can do is to ‘neatly/sidestep hysteria’” (259).

Atwood’s inclusion in anthologies, which has been uninterrupted since she was first selected for a general anthology, is thus linked with Moodie. None of the editors claims that Atwood was selected because of the connections between Moodie and Atwood, and Atwood’s many other valuable works would have ensured her inclusion in anthologies, yet Atwood’s inclusion is undeniably related to her reimagining of Moodie. Editors such as Denham cite Moodie’s influence upon Atwood, and others stress the impact of Atwood’s poetry collection upon readings of Moodie. While there are variations in the specific ways editors have approached Atwood and Moodie, the connections between the two were established and emphasized during the thematic phase, offering new ways of reading *Roughing It* and of understanding Atwood’s works.

praises the landscape but accuses it of destroying her; she dislikes the people already in Canada but finds in the people her only refuge from the land itself; she preaches progress and the march of civilization while brooding elegiacally upon the destruction of the wilderness. . . Perhaps that is the way we still live. We are all immigrants to this place even if we were born here: the country is too big for anyone to inhabit completely, and in the parts unknown to us we move in fear, exiles and invaders” (259).

The Pluralistic Phase

Gradually, shifts in critical interest away from thematic concerns led to an expansion in studies of Moodie and her works, impacting her presentation in anthologies of the pluralistic phase. Thurston notes,

With the waning of thematic criticism in the mid-1980s, scholars began to attend to details in *Roughing It* that had been ignored. Critics found its enactments of class, race, and gender issues to be more important than the conflict with the bush. Researchers fleshed out Moodie's biography with archival materials, and critics began to explore the historical, social, and political contexts within which she wrote. ("Moodie" 755)

A new set of interests became prevalent in criticism, influencing Moodie's presentation while also solidifying her reputation. In the pluralistic phase, a greater number of sketches from *Roughing It* was selected than were chosen in earlier anthologies, and there was increased interest in Moodie's personal history and views, contrasting earlier anthologies focusing primarily upon her career and literary output. There was also a reduction in the number of different works anthologized, as *Roughing It* once again becomes Moodie's most frequently included work. As editors begin to agree upon the centrality and importance of *Roughing It*, a group of sketches was consistently anthologized: "A Visit to Grosse Isle," "Brian, the Still-Hunter," and "Adieu to the Woods" are included (sometimes in abridged form) in every anthology of the pluralistic phase. Editors found in these sketches examples of Moodie's historical, social, and cultural environments, as well as compelling descriptions of her personal views and reactions. Through a core set of sketches, editors discovered, presented, and discussed key traits of the pluralistic phase and Moodie's autobiography. The general consensus regarding the sketches illustrates the

articulation of what Fowler terms an “official canon” (98) and a stable literary tradition; in the pluralistic phase, Moodie was firmly established as a canonical writer.

Russell Brown and Donna Bennett included Moodie in all four editions of their anthology and emphasized her personal history and reactions to her new environment, showing an interest in the autobiographical aspects of the book. The headnotes on Moodie in their first edition praise her literary skills, stating that the book “is made up of a series of anecdotes that reveal its author as a practised storyteller. She had a remarkable ability to convey the variety of characters she met in the bush by using their colourful, idiomatic speech in lively dialogue” (77). Their greatest concern, however, lies in Moodie’s personality:

Indeed, what most engages the modern reader is that although Moodie reveals herself as melancholy, inflexible, and proud to the point of condescension, she still continues to struggle against the perpetual defeat of her hopes, all the while giving vent to a confused mixture of feelings. [. . .] she shows us her exhilaration in small victories, a degree of pleasure in enduring painful experiences, and—in her ‘Adieu to the Woods’—the tearful sadness she felt at leaving the scene of her hardships. It is in watching Moodie make her choice and achieve—even if almost despite herself—her reconciliation with the land that the greatest attraction of her story lies. (77-78)

Interest in Moodie’s struggles and reactions as an individual marks a departure from thematic concerns identifying her as an archetype and towards consideration of the book as an autobiography. The editorial comments regarding the book’s autobiographical

elements alters interpretations of the sketches, as Moodie is situated as a brave, interesting woman struggling to come to terms with her new life.

The focus upon Moodie's responses and gradual acceptance of her new home is evident through the excerpts Bennett and Brown selected: the introduction to the third edition, "A Visit to Grosse Isle," "Quebec," "Uncle Joe and His Family," "Brian, the Still-Hunter," "The Fire," "The Outbreak," and "Adieu to the Woods." The editors included selections from the beginning and the end of the book, offering a more complete representation of both the book and Moodie's own responses than is found in previous anthologies. The excerpts show a range of experiences and reactions, both negative and positive. The introductory notes situate the book as most significant for what it reveals about Moodie, her views of the social, historical, and cultural milieus of Canada, and her gradual adaptation to her new environment. The excerpts support this reading of the book as autobiography, as the sketches demonstrate Moodie's gradual acceptance of Canada as her new home. Although the book ends on a note of warning, Bennett and Brown assert that Moodie becomes adjusted to the environment; the emphasis upon acceptance and reconciliation rather than isolation, alienation, and duality is a significant change in anthologists' presentations of Moodie from the thematic phase.

Bennett and Brown made few changes to their presentation of Moodie in their subsequent editions, maintaining her position as a canonical author. In their 1990 edition, they removed the sketches "Quebec" and "The Outbreak" but left the rest of the section unchanged, including the headnotes. The 2002 and 2010 editions presented Moodie in the same way. In each of the editions, substantial changes to other aspects of the anthology were made; their decision to add, expand, and remove some authors while maintaining their presentation of Moodie suggests that they believed her position was secure and that

the sketches they included were the best representation of the book's themes, style, and content, suggesting the determination of a canon.

Robert Lecker's discussion and presentation of Moodie in *Open Country: Canadian Literature in English* (2008) also centred upon the autobiographical traits of the book. The anthology contains several sketches from *Roughing It*, all of them unabridged: "A Visit to Grosse Isle," "Our First Settlement, and the Borrowing System," "Brian, the Still-Hunter," and "Adieu to the Woods." He included sketches from various points in the book, presenting a complete image of Moodie's experiences. He terms the book an "autobiographical narrative interspersed with poetry" (27), categorizing the book as life-writing. Additionally, the sketches offer insight into the contemporary concerns of class, race, and gender. Moodie's interactions with her neighbours, for example, reveal class consciousness, and all of the sketches present the opportunity for investigations of gender, given Moodie's various roles as wife, mother, sister, neighbour, and author. The selections along with this characterization of the book indicate that, like Bennett and Brown, he is interested in the ways that the book reveals Moodie's personality and concerns.

Cynthia Sugars and Laura Moss's presentation of Moodie in *Canadian Literature in English: Texts and Contexts* (2009) has similarities with other anthologists of the pluralistic phase, as they are interested in her personal history. Sugars and Moss included several excerpts from *Roughing It* and added a selection from a work that no other anthologist chose: the introduction to *Life in the Clearings*. They selected abridged excerpts from the introduction to the third edition, "A Visit to Grosse Isle," "Our First Settlement," "Brian, the Still-Hunter," and "Adieu to the Woods." Following the excerpts from *Roughing It* is an anonymous review of the book from *Blackwoods Edinburgh*

Magazine (1852). The reviewer regards the book as an authentic account of the tribulations of life in a harsh environment and praises Moodie's perseverance: "At last a brighter day dawned, and it is from a tranquil and happy home [. . .] that the settler's brave wife has transmitted this narrative of seven years' exertion and adventure" (228-29). Finally, they selected the introduction to Moodie's second Canadian book. Their notes show interest in Moodie's personal responses: "Moodie herself decided to write *Life in the Clearings* in order to address some of the criticisms of *Roughing It*. The introduction to *Life in the Clearings* contains Moodie's response to her detractors" (211). The selections from *Roughing It* and *Life in the Clearings* demonstrate interest in Moodie's personal history, suggesting that, like other anthologists of the phase, Sugars and Moss value the autobiographical elements of the book. Their selections also allow for scrutiny of concerns central to the phase, including class, gender, and race. The inclusion of the review supplements the focus on life writing by offering a historical context.

Throughout the pluralistic phase, interest in Moodie as autobiographer impacted the ways that she was presented in terms of genre. While several editors mentioned her poetry, none reprinted the sketches as they were originally published, with poems at the end of the sketches. In fact, her poetry is not included in any of the anthologies. The focus upon *Roughing It* as life-writing established Moodie as a prose writer.

Interest in Moodie's text as autobiography is also evident in considerations of Traill, who received increased attention and coverage in the pluralistic phase. She was included in almost all anthologies of this phase,⁴⁷ and while her relationship with her

⁴⁷ Weaver and Toye did not include Traill in the second edition of their anthology. Brown and Bennett chose Letter IX and Letter X from *The Backwoods of Canada* for all four editions of their anthology, Lecker included "The Bereavement," and Sugars and Moss selected four excerpts from *The Backwoods of Canada*: the introduction, "Letter 15," "Maple Sugar," and "Candles."

sister remained an area of interest, she has also received considerable attention beyond her family ties, a shift from her presentation in the thematic phase. In the earlier stage, Traill's relationship with Moodie was a major factor in her inclusion; throughout the pluralistic phase, new critical concerns led to in-depth considerations of Traill and her contributions to early Canadian writing. All editors of the pluralistic phase discuss Traill's impact upon later authors, Margaret Laurence and her novel *The Diviners* in particular.⁴⁸ The treatment and assessments of Traill show serious consideration of the author, a move beyond her presentation throughout the thematic phase merely as a contrast to her sister.

Another key trait of presentations of Moodie at this point is the emphasis upon her position as a figure central to the Canadian literary imagination, a notion that emerged in the thematic phase. Anthologists discussed Moodie's impact upon later authors, marking Atwood's *The Journals of Susanna Moodie* as the beginning of re-imaginings of the author. Brown and Bennett argue that "Moodie has become a mythic figure for modern Canadians—so much so that Margaret Atwood responded to her Canadian chronicles with a collection of poems, *The Journals of Susanna Moodie* (1970), that in its own way has become as much of a classic as *Roughing It*" (1: 77). They also reference the Afterword to the poetry collection, noting that "Atwood sees Moodie as 'divided down the middle'—an emblem of the 'violent duality' of Canada itself" (1: 77). In the headnotes on

⁴⁸ In all editions of their anthology, Brown and Bennett comment upon Traill's impact: "In *The Diviners* (1974) Margaret Laurence has her central character enter into imaginary dialogues with Catharine Traill, even to the point of invoking her: 'Saint Catharine: Where are you now that we need you?' (1: 70). Lecker positions her as a key figure in the Canadian literary imagination, noting that throughout *The Diviners* "protagonist Morag Gunn holds conversations with an imaginary Catharine Parr Traill. She pictures 'C.P.T.' having already cooked breakfast 'for the multitude,' 'cleaning the house, baking two hundred loaves of delicious bread, preserving half a ton of plums, pears, cherries, etcetera. All before lunch'" (20). Sugars and Moss note Traill's appearance in Laurence's work: "Because of her characteristic optimism in the face of adversity, Margaret Laurence even goes so far as to call her 'Saint Catharine' in her novel *The Diviners* (1974)" (193).

Atwood, the editors summarized her thematic criticism and listed *The Journals of Susanna Moodie* as embodying thematic concerns. Along with poems from Atwood's other collections, Brown and Bennett included several poems from *The Journals of Susanna Moodie*,⁴⁹ as well as the Afterword. At the beginning of the series of poems from the collection, the editors included a footnote explaining the connection between the poems and Moodie,⁵⁰ and they also added footnotes to several of the poems providing relevant information about *Roughing It*. The link between Moodie and Atwood remained a prominent element of Bennett and Brown's later editions, solidifying both authors' iconic statuses and suggesting that such issues as otherness, migration, and the wilderness remain central to the Canadian canon. As Atwood's body of writing grew, fewer poems were included from *The Journals of Susanna Moodie*,⁵¹ but the connection with Moodie has remained a prevalent part of Atwood's presentation in anthologies.

Other anthologists of the pluralistic stage also examine Moodie's impact upon Atwood and other authors. Sugars and Moss point out that "Several Canadian writers have responded to Moodie's now iconic status in Canadian culture with contemporary re-envisioning of her stories and poems. Armand Garnet Ruffo's poem 'Creating a Country' and Atwood's *The Journals of Susanna Moodie* are two examples in Volume II of this anthology" (211), making clear the connections between Moodie and contemporary

⁴⁹ They chose "Departure from the Bush," "Disembarking at Quebec," "Dream 2: Brian the Still-Hunter," "First Neighbours," "Further Arrivals," "The Planters," "Paths and Thingscape," "The Two Fires," "The Wereman," and "Thoughts from Underground."

⁵⁰ The footnote reads, "In this book Atwood uses the historical Susanna Moodie (1803-85) as the speaker in poems inspired by her two narratives of settlement, *Roughing It in the Bush* (1852) and *Life in the Clearings* (1853). Most of the people and events alluded to in the poems reprinted here may be found in the selections from *Roughing It in the Bush* in Vol. I, pp. 77-126" (461).

⁵¹ In the 1990 edition edited by Brown, Bennett, and Cooke, they selected "Departure from the Bush," "Death of a Young Son by Drowning," "Dream 2: Brian the Still-Hunter," "Further Arrivals," "The Planters," "The Wereman," and "Thoughts from Underground." In the 2002 and 2010 editions, Bennett and Brown included "Disembarking at Quebec," "Further Arrivals," "Death of a Young Son by Drowning," "Dream 2: Brian the Still-Hunter," and "Thoughts from Underground."

authors. At the beginning of the group of poems selected from *The Journals of Susanna Moodie*⁵² in the second volume, they inserted a footnote discussing the links with Moodie's book and noting specific points of intersection: part of the footnote reads "See Volume I for excerpts from Moodie's *Roughing It*, including the chapter 'A Visit to Grosse Isle', which forms the background to 'Disembarking at Quebec' and 'Further Arrivals'" (441).

Lecker also comments upon Moodie's influence upon the Canadian literary tradition, noting that her book and personal history have impacted other authors. He references the earlier thematic reading of Moodie, noting that she "has achieved an almost mythical status in the Canadian literary imagination, embodying for some the archetypal Canadian struggle between self and wilderness" (27). More specifically, he discusses Atwood's view of Moodie as representing this conflict: "*The Journals of Susanna Moodie* also illustrates human interaction with the natural world, but in this work Atwood focuses on one woman's estrangement from the Canadian landscape. She sees Moodie as a fundamentally divided and displaced figure [. . .] For Atwood, Moodie's detachment represents the Canadian condition" (698). He also notes that Atwood used Moodie's *Life in the Clearing* in *Alias Grace*, having found the story of Grace Marks in the work, as well as for the basis of a television script entitled *The Servant Girl*. Although Lecker discussed Atwood's use of Moodie's character and books, he included only a single poem from *The Journals of Susanna Moodie*, "Departure from the Bush." His focus on historical information, Moodie's impact on Atwood, and the relation between the two

⁵² They selected "Disembarking at Quebec," "Further Arrivals," "Departure from the Bush," "Dream 2: Brian the Still-Hunter," and "Thoughts from Underground."

writers and Canadian literature more generally shows the concern with expanding and re-evaluating assessments of authors, a central trait of the phase.

While the connections between Moodie and other authors were noted in the thematic phase, anthologists in the pluralistic phase presented more detailed, expansive studies of these links. Most significantly, the correlations between Atwood and Moodie were scrutinized, and through the connection with Atwood, the interests associated with the pluralistic phase became apparent within Moodie's work. While the editors did not always emphasize class, gender, and race in their selections and treatments of Moodie, these issues were partly addressed in the headnotes, in comments upon her perseverance and the challenges she faced as a woman struggling to write in the backwoods of Canada. Presentations of Moodie largely focus on the autobiographical elements of the book, and in her accounts of her new home, the concerns of the pluralistic stage are evident. More significantly, Atwood's intertextual poems foreground these concerns, centring on a fictionalized Moodie and her response to an environment in which her beliefs about class and gender are challenged and reworked. The poems are inextricably linked with *Roughing It*, a connection anthologists repeatedly stressed, causing readings of Moodie to be influenced by Atwood. Therefore, through the associations with Atwood, the concerns of the pluralistic phase were accentuated in Moodie's work.

The pluralistic stage, then, solidified Moodie's position as a canonical writer and a consensus regarding *Roughing It* emerged, thereby defining part of the "official canon" (Fowler 98). The book's reception at this point demonstrates that it is able to support the inquiries and examinations that emerged following the thematic phase. Inclusion of the book in anthologies reveals its importance, as well as Moodie's impact upon later writers, establishing her as a central figure to the Canadian literary imagination. Interest in the

autobiographical aspects of her book led to new considerations of Moodie. The interplay between anthologies, critical evaluations, and canonical position becomes clear in the anthologies of the pluralistic phase, for links between authors, as well as authors and specific critical approaches, are detailed and made explicit.

Conclusion

As anthologies developed, so too have presentations of Moodie; her treatment provides a valuable case study of the variations in presentation of an author over several decades and during shifts in critical attention. Moodie has been consistently anthologized throughout all phases of anthology development, and she and her writing have been presented as embodying a range of traits. She has been situated as a pioneer whose accounts of settler life are valued for their authenticity, a literary critic, a skilled author contributing to an emerging national literature, an archetypal figure, and a skilled autobiographer. The variety within her presentation in anthologies illustrates the ability of her writing to support a range of approaches. Her steady inclusion is significant for a number of reasons: she is one of a few authors to be anthologized throughout all anthology phases; she influenced other authors; she affected the inclusion of other authors; her writing in several genres has been selected; and her works and person have been used to outline and define a distinct national character and literature.

The specific ways Moodie has been anthologized reveal some key traits of canonization and the relationship between canon development and general anthologies. Canonical authors must be able to attract and sustain critical interest and support investigations of some aspect of national identity. Generic diversity within an author's body of work creates the opportunity for broader inclusion and re-examination. Important

authors influence or impact other authors in some way, and their study may also lead to reconsideration of other authors; canonical authors, then, enable the opening up of the canon. A canonical work will gain consensus through critical evaluation and anthologization; it will also be able to support diverse readings and interpretations. All of these aspects of a canonical author and works are evident in Moodie's presentation in anthologies, demonstrating how the anthology contributes to articulations of the canon.

CHAPTER FIVE

Emily Pauline Johnson

This chapter discusses Emily Pauline Johnson (1861-1913), a popular poet, short fiction writer, and performer. Born to a Mohawk father and English mother, she was interested in the relationship and tensions between her two cultures, a theme often visited in her writing. During her lifetime, she was best known as a poet-performer and was both popularly and critically acclaimed. In the decades following her death, however, evaluations of her poetry became increasingly dismissive, and she came to be regarded as, at best, a minor figure. Her poetry was selected for all anthologies of the literary historical phase but excluded almost completely throughout the literary nationalistic phase. In the late 1970s, her writing received renewed critical attention, and she has been consistently selected for anthologies throughout the past few decades. Her inclusion differs from that of Brooke and Moodie, who, once selected, remained part of the majority of anthologies and had a core group of works and selections chosen. Johnson, on the other hand, received varying levels of attention at different stages, and presentations of her have emphasized different elements of her life and work. The fluctuations in her representation in anthologies suggest that editors have recognized her value and contributions to Canadian literature but have been less certain about her precise position in the nation's literary tradition. As a result, there are significant differences in early and more recent presentations of her work, as well as noteworthy omissions; these variations speak to the process of articulating and defining the contours of the nation's literature.

Johnson's dual heritage has received much attention throughout all phases of anthology development, as nearly all editors who selected Johnson mention or discuss at

length her cultural background. Views of her ancestry have affected and influenced her presentation, and there has been a shift from an early focus upon either the Aboriginal or the British elements of her life and writing towards a consideration of her life and works that emphasizes the balance between and meshing of these elements. While editors of the literary historical phase categorized Johnson as either an Aboriginal or a Canadian writer, anthologists of the pluralistic phase centred instead upon the ways that her poetry and prose embrace and work within two traditions. The shift in perceptions of the significance and impact of her ancestry is evident in both headnotes and selections in anthologies, providing a clear example of the ways that anthologies deliberately shape the presentation of an author.

Changes in views of Johnson's heritage have also impacted the types of her writing chosen for anthologies. Early editors focused only on her poems, examining the ways they related to her background, while later anthologists, interested in her views of culture, gender, and race, increased the space granted to her by including her prose as well as her poetry. Her three collections of prose were all published by 1913, so they were available to editors at the beginning of the literary historical phase; it was not until the thematic phase, however, that her prose was selected, and since then, most anthologists have selected both her poetry and her prose. In this way, more recently published anthologies present a fuller image of her writing than early anthologies containing only a handful of her more popular poems.

While inclusion of Johnson's writing in anthologies has fluctuated, her current status and reception suggest that she is now considered a canonical author. Her status reflects the recovery of an author who, as Veronica Strong-Boag and Carole Gerson argue in *Paddling Her Own Canoe: The Times and Texts of E. Pauline Johnson*, has been

“largely slighted” by “the historical and literary canon of our day” but “has persisted in slipping in and out of our consciousness, never entirely to be forgotten” (15). Increased attention to and reassessments of Johnson’s writing in recent years⁵³ have contributed to her current status as a canonical author; her treatment illustrates the case of an author whose reputation varied before becoming firmly established. She had not previously been accepted as a canonical author, yet she was never completely absent from anthologies, showing the tenuous position her work held. Her treatment presents another narrative of inclusion, as she was not ignored entirely as was Brooke, canonized and then dropped as were Richardson and Kirby, or selected consistently as was Moodie. Her position between popular and critical acceptance reveals much about literary criticism, as well as views of gender, the nation, and culture.

Johnson’s Biography and Literary Works

Emily Pauline Johnson was born on the Six Nations Reserve near Brantford, Ontario on March 10, 1861. Her parents were George Henry Martin Johnson, a Mohawk chief who was one quarter Dutch, and Emily Susanna Howells, who had emigrated from England as a child. Johnson was the youngest of four children. The Johnson family lived in a mansion called Chiefswood and enjoyed a high standard of living as well as an elevated social status in both Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal communities. Johnson was educated, primarily at home, in both British and Mohawk tradition and culture.

⁵³ See Charlotte Gray’s *Flint and Feather: The Life and Times of E. Pauline Johnson* (2002), Carole Gerson and Veronica Strong-Boag’s *Paddling Her Own Canoe: The Times and Texts of E. Pauline Johnson, Tekahionwake* (2000), their edited *E. Pauline Johnson, Tekahionwake: Collected Poems and Selected Prose* (2002), and Janice Fiamengo’s chapter in *The Woman’s Page: Journalism and Rhetoric in Early Canada* (2008).

After George Johnson's death in 1884, the remaining members of the family were forced to sell the family home, and Johnson, her mother, and her sister moved to Brantford. She began publishing poems to support herself and her family. Her poetry and prose appeared in several publications, in both Canada and the United States: the *Brantford Expositor*, *The Week*, the *Globe*, *Saturday Night* and *Gems of Poetry*. In October 1886, she was asked to compose a poem to be read aloud during a ceremony unveiling a statue of Joseph Brant, founder of Brantford. Her "Ode to Brant" was well-received, and the next day, Sara Jeannette Duncan interviewed Johnson for the *Toronto Globe's* "Woman's World" column. Johnson's poetry was also included in W.D. Lighthall's poetry anthology *Songs of the Great Dominion: Voices from the Forests and Waters, The Settlements and Cities of Canada* (1889), showing the growth of her reputation at this time.

While her publications and interview garnered Johnson some public interest, the turning point for her career occurred in 1892 when she began performing. Her first public recitation took place at an event called "Evening with Canadian Authors," organized by the Young Men's Liberal Club in Toronto. She recited "A Cry from an Indian Wife" and was extremely well-received. Building upon this successful performance, she soon began touring: from 1892 to 1909, she traveled throughout Canada, the United States, and England. One feature of her performance that set her apart was her incorporation of Aboriginal cultures into her concert performance by adopting her grandfather's name, Tekahionwake, and creating a costume of her own design that incorporated articles from several tribes and some out of her own imagination. As Strong-Boag and Gerson note, "Throughout her public life [she] played with the fundamental question of identity posed by her dual heritage"; when performing, she first appeared as "the Mohawk woman

warrior or storyteller” and then as “the supposed opposite, the refined European-Canadian lady” (4). Her change in dress partway through her performance fascinated audiences, and she was extremely popular, and this feature of her act greatly contributed to her popularity.

While touring, Johnson published two collections of poetry: *The White Wampum* (1895) and *Canadian Born* (1903). In 1912, she brought out a third collection of poetry, *Flint and Feather*. After she had retired from performing, she supported herself by writing prose and wrote articles and stories on a variety of topics. Three collections of her prose were published, two of them posthumously: *Legends of Vancouver* (1911), *The Moccasin Maker* (1913), and *The Shagganappi* (1913). While critical evaluations of her writing have been uneven, she has remained a popular poet; in the late 1980s, for example, *Flint and Feather* was “the largest selling Canadian book of poetry” (Lyon 137). Johnson’s life and writing have continued to attract popular and critical attention, and it seems that she has now been granted a secure position in the nation’s literary history.

The Literary Historical Phase

Albert Durrant Watson and Lorne Albert Pierce’s *Our Canadian Literature: Representative Prose and Verse* (1922) includes four poems by Johnson, and Watson, in his introduction to the poetry section, presents her inclusion as proof of the broad scope and inclusive nature of the anthology. He argues that the selection of her poetry proves the editors’ willingness to incorporate authors from a range of backgrounds into their vision of the nation’s literary tradition:

There should be nothing but the best good-will, either latent or manifest, between the representatives of [French Canadian] or any other sections of

our people. Our literature is fostering this kindly feeling and extending it to other nations. The friendly reception given to Drummond's dialect verse, to Pauline Johnson's Indian lyrics; the admiration we feel for Frechette [sic], and, more recently, the interest manifested in Florence Livesay's 'Songs of Ukrainia,' are all evidences of that generous spirit which enlarges our patriotism to universal dimensions, and gives to character the highest place in our esteem without reference to negligible minor distinctions.

(Introduction 9)

Watson's characterization of authors such as Johnson as belonging to "other sections of our people" suggests that he considered British-Canadian authors as comprising the core of Canadian writing, while authors of foreign ancestries were included as a measure of Anglo-Canadian generosity and patriotism. Further, the differences between British-Canadian authors and authors like Johnson are deemed "negligible minor distinctions," implying that the Anglo-Saxon culture would not be challenged or altered in any significant manner by the inclusion of other authors.

Upon examination of the poems the editors chose for the poetry section, it seems that they were most interested in how Johnson fit into the editorial vision of Canadian literature rather than in the unique features of her poetry. Despite categorizing her as an author from another "section" of the nation, they suggest that her work is representative of it. They chose "The Train Dogs," "Shadow River," "The Song My Paddle Sings," and "The Sleeping Giant." The poems are scattered throughout the poetry section, thus creating a focus upon the general themes of Canadian poetry rather than the style and subject matter of individual authors. "The Train Dogs" is the only poem with an Indigenous protagonist, and the others describe scenes of the Canadian landscape. Despite

Watson's reference to Johnson's "Indian lyrics," her Aboriginal heritage is downplayed, and most of her poems are similar to the other nature poems in the anthology. The editors seem to have regarded her (or wanted their readers to view her) as part of a national tradition in which cultural differences were ultimately "negligible."

A less nuanced view of Johnson's poetry and background is found in both editions of Edmund Kemper Broadus and Eleanor Hammond Broadus's *A Book of Canadian Prose and Verse* (1923, 1934). They focused solely upon her Indigenous ancestry, finding that her Mohawk background was the dominant characteristic of all her poetry. Their short introduction to Johnson outlines her biography and characterizes her writing: "[h]er two volumes of verse reflect the instinctive rhythms and the lyrical fervor of her Indian blood" (88). While Watson and Pierce suggested that her poetry blends the English lyric form with Aboriginal material, Broadus and Broadus presented her Aboriginal heritage as influencing all of her writing. While none of the poems selected ("The Song My Paddle Sings," "The Cattle Country," and "Prairie Greyhounds") has a narrator or character clearly identified as Aboriginal, the introduction suggests that all her poems reveal her Aboriginal ancestry. Much like Watson and Pierce's selections, Broadus and Broadus's choices are poems of nature, but Broadus and Broadus's headnotes set Johnson apart from other authors while Watson and Pierce sought to incorporate her writing into their view of the literary tradition. Considering that most of Johnson's poetry dealt with themes and issues other than Aboriginal subject matter,⁵⁴ Broadus and Broadus's assessment that all of her poetry is indicative of her Mohawk ancestry demonstrates their exclusive interest in presenting her as an Aboriginal author.

⁵⁴ George W. Lyon categorizes the subject matter of her poems as follows: "only sixteen of her poems deal with undeniably native themes; twenty-nine have European-Canadian (or simply European) themes; twenty-seven are concerned with nature; thirteen with love" (158).

The focus upon Johnson's heritage is sustained in the first two editions of A.J.M. Smith's *The Book of Canadian Poetry: A Critical and Historical Anthology* (1943, 1948), but his approach departs from that of earlier anthologists, as he challenges the authenticity of Johnson's Aboriginal-content poems. In the general introduction to the first edition, he discusses Johnson's career at length and argues that both her skill and reputation have been exaggerated:

The poetry of Miss Johnson was much admired in Canada, where the romantic fact of her Indian birth, played up by critics and journalists, was accepted as convincing proof that she spoke with the authentic voice of the red man. She had a vigorous personality and an excellent sense of the theater. Dressed in Indian costume, she read her verses with great effect to audiences in Canada, the United States, and England. Furthermore, she was enthusiastically praised by a fashionable London critic. Theodore Watts-Dunton, who had been attracted to her poems in W.D. Lighthall's *Songs of the Great Dominion* (1889), hailed Miss Johnson as the accredited spokesman 'of the great primeval race now so rapidly vanishing' and later wrote a rhapsodic introduction to her collected poems, *Flint and Feather*, which was published soon after her death in 1913. The claim that this volume contains genuine primitive poetry or that it speaks with the true voice of the North American Indian will hardly be made by responsible criticism, and, though her collected poems are still sold to tourists in Vancouver and Victoria, she is likely to be remembered chiefly for one or two graceful lyrics which make no claim to national or racial significance. In the theatrical and once popular ballads of Indian life, her rhythm is

heavy, her imagery conventional, and her language melodramatic and forced. (22-23)

He acknowledges her popularity and powerful stage presence yet finds little value in her writing and determines that she will be largely forgotten in the future. Further, he contends that her poetry speaks to neither national nor Aboriginal interests and concerns, countering the claims of Watson and Pierce and Broadus and Broadus.

Smith's dismissal of Johnson's contributions is linked with his high regard for Duncan Campbell Scott, as he argues that Scott's poetry provides a more compelling and authentic image of Indigenous people than Johnson's. Immediately before his discussion of Johnson in the general introduction, Smith discusses Scott:

Dr. Scott's lifework as an administrator in the Department of Indian Affairs at Ottawa provided him with the material for many remarkable poems of Indian life—from 'The Half-Breed Girl,' in his first volume of 1893, to the tragic masterpiece, 'At Gull Lake: August, 1810,' in the volume of later poems collected in 1936. As an interpreter of the Indian, Duncan Campbell Scott is deserving of more serious consideration than is the widely acclaimed poetess Pauline Johnson. But Miss Johnson had special advantages: she was a real Indian princess, a genuine half-breed girl. (22)

Smith views Scott's poetry as superior, in both style and content, to that of Johnson. His description of Johnson as "genuine" seems sarcastic and derisive, considering that he goes on to write that no "responsible" critic would claim that her voice was authentic.

Despite his critique of Johnson in the introduction, Smith selected her poetry for his anthology. He chose a single poem, "Shadow River," and placed it in the section "The

New Nationalism: Varieties of Romantic Sensibility,” which contained verse by Confederation poets including Charles G.D. Roberts, Archibald Lampman, and D.C. Scott. In his headnotes, he notes that “[h]er father was a full-blooded Indian, chief of the Six Nations Confederacy, and her mother was an English-woman [. . .] Her early home was not a primitive one, and she was reared in cultured surroundings. Her education was literary, and her poetry is in no way primitive or aboriginal” (211). Here, Smith continues his argument that Johnson’s poetry does not offer authentic views of Aboriginal people. However, his decision to include “Shadow River,” a nature poem, indicates that he valued at least some of Johnson’s poetry and the arrangement of the section tacitly acknowledges her association with the Confederation group of poets. Smith considered Johnson important enough to warrant discussion and inclusion in his anthology though his assessment of her writing is, at best, ambivalent.

The final anthology of this stage is John D. Robins’s *A Pocketful of Canada* (1946), featuring one poem by Johnson, “The Corn Husker.” Since the anthology does not have headnotes and Johnson is not discussed in the introduction, there is little editorial evidence for how Robins viewed Johnson. His selection of this particular poem, however, is noteworthy, for he is the sole editor of the literary historical phase to choose it; in fact, the poem was not anthologized again until 1978. Although Robins does not offer any commentary upon the poem, its inclusion can be regarded as a counterbalance to Scott’s poetry. In “Recuperating Modernism: Pauline Johnson’s Challenge to Literary History,” Gerson argues that “The canon has allowed the poetry of Duncan Campbell Scott to represent Native concerns in early Canadian literature, while ignoring Johnson’s advocacy in ‘The Corn Husker’” and suggests that the poem presents an important counter to Scott’s well-known sonnets “The Onondaga Madonna” and “Watkwenies” (180).

Robins's anthology, then, can be seen as providing an alternate viewpoint to Scott's poetry through the inclusion of "The Corn Husker." Robins selected several poems by Scott ("Night Hymns on Lake Nipigon," "The Onondaga Madonna," and "The Forsaken") and placed them in the same section that included Johnson's poem. Moreover, "The Corn Husker" is placed near "The Onondaga Madonna," perhaps to invite the contrast and comparison for which Gerson calls. While some anthologists favoured Scott over Johnson, *A Pocketful of Canada* suggests that some editors may have viewed her poetry as supplementing depictions such as Scott's and that the challenges Gerson recommends were in fact evident in this phase.

While Johnson was consistently anthologized at this time, editors were far from agreeing upon the aesthetic value of her poetry, the authenticity of her voice, and her position within the nation's literature. Considerations of her heritage led to polarized views of her work, in which her writing either always demonstrated "the fervor of her Indian blood" or revealed her lack of authentic connection with Aboriginal people. She was included consistently, but at most four poems were selected and her prose was neither included nor discussed in any part of the anthologies. Editors had difficulty categorizing and evaluating her work, although there was acknowledgement that her poetry was, in some way, a significant part of Canada's literary tradition.

The Literary Nationalistic Phase

Johnson's inclusion, which was steady but sparse in the literary historical phase, dropped sharply in the following stage. Her poetry was included in only one anthology: Smith's third and final edition of *The Book of Canadian Poetry* (1957), which presents Johnson's life and writing in exactly the same manner as in the two earlier editions. Norman Shrive

in “What Happened to Pauline?” writes that “the learned journals seemed blandly indifferent to Miss Johnson” (26); her omission from the majority of anthologies and contemporary evaluations of her work supports such an assertion. However, her inclusion in all three editions of Smith’s *The Book of Canadian Poetry* is significant, for critics have acknowledged that the anthology essentially determined the canon of the time: Gerson argues “Smith’s elevation of intellectually difficult ‘cosmopolitan’ poetry over ‘provincial’ romantic verse prevailed in his very influential anthology, *The Book of Canadian Poetry*, whose three editions (1943, 1948, 1957) established the canon of early and mid-century Canadian poetry that still obtains today” (“Recuperating” 173-74). While only one poem by Johnson was selected, she was included in every edition of an anthology that critics widely agree outlined the contours of the nation’s literature; her treatment at this time, then, shows that she was considered part of the nation’s tradition but that her position was tenuous.

Indeed, most collections excluded her, and her absence appears to be linked with the promotion of modernist writing that prevailed at the time. Gerson, in “Recuperating Modernism,” argues that this period was marked by an interest in modernism and a corresponding devaluing of the writing of many Canadian women authors: “Scorning romanticism and sentimentality, [the modernists] valorized detachment, alienated individualism, elitism, and formalism over emotion, domesticity, community, and popularity, a binarism that implicitly and explicitly barred most of Canada’s women writers from serious academic consideration” (170). Johnson’s popular, emotionally charged poetry clearly did not fit within such parameters, and although much of her poetry was nationalistic, neither her style nor her themes fit with the vision of the nation’s literature endorsed at the time. Further, her career as a performer and her popularity also

appear to have been determining factors in her exclusion. Gerson argues that the modernists had a “conflicted attitude towards material success” and that “To the elite mind, poetry presented in costumed performances aimed at the semi-washed could not possibly inhabit the same realm as poetry published in small university-based magazines, and poems written for oral performance [. . .] were quickly denigrated as ‘elocutionist-fodder’ (to return to Robertson Davies’s phrase)” (174). Smith dismissed much of her writing as melodramatic and conventional, finding little value in her more popular, dramatic poems, and other anthologists of the phase appear to have agreed with his assessment. Johnson, who was well-received by the public and wrote and performed emotionally evocative poetry, was not the type of writer valued at this time.

The Thematic Phase

In the next stage, Johnson’s position within anthologies and the canon was by no means firmly established, but her works and the details of her life garnered more interest from anthologists than in the previous decades. While she was not part of Robert Weaver and William Toye’s *The Oxford Anthology of Canadian Literature* (1973), Carl F. Klinck and Reginald E. Watters’s *Canadian Anthology* (1974), or Smith’s *The Canadian Experience: A Brief Survey of English-Canadian Prose* (1974), she was selected for *The Evolution of Canadian Literature: 1867-1914* (1973), edited by Mary Jane Edwards, Paul Denham, and George Parker, as well as *Literature in Canada* (1978), edited by Leslie Monkman and Douglas Daymond. Her presentation in these two anthologies is markedly different from earlier anthologies, signaling the beginning of significant editorial interest in Johnson and new areas of critical inquiry and consideration.

Edwards, Denham, and Parker were the first editors to discuss both Johnson's life and work at length, as well as the first to include her prose. They refer to her inclusion in Lighthall's *Songs of the Great Dominion* and cite British reviewer and critic Theodore Watts-Dunton's introduction to the second edition of *Flint and Feather* (1914). Watts-Dunton recalls his first impression of Johnson when he read *Songs of the Great Dominion*: he viewed the anthology as revealing the predominantly Anglo-Saxon atmosphere of Canada, but he also "came upon a new note—the note of the Red Man's Canada" (189). The editors also quote his recollection of seeing Johnson and her manager and co-star Walter McRaye perform at Steinway Hall in London. The inclusion of these characterizations shows that Johnson was well-received in her lifetime and that her popularity was closely linked with her public performances. They comment further upon her wide appeal:

Her fame was partly due to her ability to write and recite highly rhetorical pieces on such popular subjects as Indians and the North-West Mounted Police. Although this poetry now seems more embarrassing than serious and patriotic, a poem like 'The Riders of the Plains' undoubtedly helped shape the brave, bold image of the Royal Canadian Mounted Police, the 'true north, strong and free' picture of Canada and the Indian legend of Miss Johnson herself. (191)

Unlike earlier anthologists, the editors consider her popularity a mark of her cultural significance as an author and performer rather than simply as an unflattering element of her career.

The editors acknowledge that some of Johnson's poetry may not have substantial literary value, but they find that much of her writing is of high quality. Further, they argue that her most admirable writing is successful because it reflects her experiences:

Her best work is, nevertheless, that in which she is less rhetorical and more subjective. In such poems as her canoe songs and 'The Lullaby of the Iroquois,' for example, she sings in her own voice and combines an English lyrical form with native Canadian imagery. Similar combinations of standard English and West Coast Indian legends also produced her most appealing prose [. . .] One reason why Pauline Johnson succeeded in these combinations was that they were probably truer to her own character and personality than her more rousing renditions of the 'Red Man's Canada,' for despite her Mohawk background and the Indian costumes she wore when she recited, her life and works seem less typical today of a Canadian Indian than they do of a turn-of-the-century woman writer struggling to make a living in Canada and abroad from her personal charms and her literary talents. (191)

The assertion that Johnson wrote several works of high aesthetic value addresses her exclusion from anthologies of previous decades and suggests that she should not have been so treated. The discussion of her writing as a reflection of her life also addresses the topic of her background, an area that interested earlier anthologists. Much like Watson and Pierce, who emphasized Johnson's Aboriginal ancestry but presented her as a Canadian writer foremost, Edwards, Denham, and Parker suggest that a consideration of the diverse elements of Johnson's life and experiences leads to the most useful categorization of her writing.

Their selections seem to have been made to reveal the range of Johnson's body of work and her knowledge of distinct traditions: they included both poetry and prose, popular performance pieces, and less rhetorical works: "In the Shadows," "The Song My Paddle Sings," "Shadow River," "Lullaby of the Iroquois," "The Riders of the Plains," and "The Legend of Lillooet Falls." In the headnotes, they discuss the majority of the selections, presenting greater analysis of Johnson's works than was found in previous anthologies. "The Riders of the Plains" was selected as an example of her rousing performance pieces, while the remaining poems were included as examples of what the editors considered to be her best work, in which she incorporates Canadian scenes into established literary forms. They also praise "The Legend of Lillooet Falls" for its integration of standard English and West Coast legend. Earlier editors viewed her poetry as representing one tradition or the other; the editors demonstrate that she was knowledgeable of and comfortable with both Aboriginal and English forms and successfully integrated them in her writing. In their presentation of Johnson's writing, Edwards, Denham, and Parker acknowledge criticisms of her poetry but also suggest that the style and subject matter of her body of work deserve greater study.

The other anthology of this phase that included poems by Johnson was Daymond and Monkman's *Literature in Canada*. The editors' presentation of Johnson has some similarities with other anthologists, but they depart from these assessments by fitting her writing within a thematic framework. They outline her biography and then briefly describe her career: "[s]he published her first poem in 1885 and in 1892 began the series of concert readings of her poems and stories which made her a popular and romantic figure to audiences in both Canada and England" (356). The focus upon her celebrity differs from earlier anthologists, who either ignored or criticized her success. They chose

four poems: “Shadow River” “Marshlands,” “Silhouette,” and “The Corn Husker.” The first two poems describe scenes of nature in a positive light, aligning with presentations of Johnson as a nature writer.

The similarities with other anthologies end, however, with the selection of “Silhouette” and “The Corn Husker”; these poems clearly support thematic considerations. In *Survival*, Margaret Atwood posits that “Canada has a dual literary tradition for Indians [. . .] Victor/Victim” (91). She finds that most often, “the Indian emerges in Canadian literature as the ultimate victim of social oppression and deprivation” (97). The protagonists in the poems are presented as victims of forces they neither influence nor control, aligning with Atwood’s determination of the victim for Aboriginal figures. The two poems present the decline of a people and their way of life as an unavoidable, tragic reality. As in “The Corn Husker,” where “might’s injustice” is to blame for the eradication of a people, in “Silhouette,” the chief “With visage fixed and stern as fate’s decree / He looks towards the empty west, to see / The never-coming herd of buffalo” (14-16). In these two poems, blame for the people’s demise is assigned to “fate’s decree,” showing that the cause does not lie within the culture itself. In addition to supporting Atwood’s argument, the two poems uphold a thematic reading in other ways: both relay an overwhelming sense of isolation and solitude and present nature as a threatening, negative force. In “Silhouette,” for example, the “never-coming herd of buffalo” signals an unbalanced relationship between man and nature, in which the depleted herds of buffalo caused by settlement will have a devastating impact on the people’s traditional way of life. “Silhouette” and “The Corn Husker” differ significantly from “Shadow River” and “Marshlands,” revealing another side of Johnson’s writing in both the portrayal of nature and the theme of European threat to Aboriginal ways of life.

While Johnson's work was not widely anthologized at this time, her inclusion in Edwards, Denham, and Parker's and Daymond and Monkman's anthologies is significant. Edwards, Denham, and Parker included her prose for the first time, selected a variety of poems to reveal the range of her skill, and examined her background in new ways, beginning a move away from polarized views of her work. Daymond and Monkman's presentation shows that her poetry supports a thematic examination, thus calling attention to her exclusion from anthologies with a clear thematic focus, such as Weaver and Toye's. While much of Johnson's poetry advances a positive view of the relationship between nature and the individual, several of her poems complicate this view, as Daymond and Monkman's presentation reveals. Despite her somewhat sparse inclusion, presentations of Johnson became fuller in this stage, as editors assessed and considered her personal background extensively and selected works not previously chosen, expanding the number of works available in anthology format.

The Pluralistic Stage

Johnson's inclusion in anthologies of the pluralistic stage has been steady; except for Russell Brown and Donna Bennett's *An Anthology of Canadian Literature in English* (1982), every anthology of this phase has included her writing. Furthermore, a greater number of her works have been selected than in previous anthologies, including her prose. The increased attention and space given to Johnson and her writing support Gerson's analysis of her current status as marking "a new phase in Pauline Johnson's reception history," in which "she may finally be granted her due position in Canada's literary history" ("Recuperating" 178). Editors have become more interested in Johnson's cultural heritage and gender, recasting and broadening earlier assessments of the links between her

writing and background. In this phase, evaluations of her work have become more positive, countering some earlier critiques of her writing and recovering overlooked aspects of her career.

Aside from *An Anthology of Canadian Literature in English* (1982), all of the anthologies Bennett and Brown edited include Johnson's writing, and they provide more complete coverage of her life and writing than earlier collections. The editors increased the number of selections and wrote detailed headnotes addressing aspects of her life and career that other anthologists had struggled with or ignored entirely, namely her career as a performer, mixed-race heritage, and prose. Brown, Bennett, and Nathalie Cooke, editors of *An Anthology of Canadian Literature in English* (1990) selected "His Majesty, the West Wind," "A Cry from an Indian Wife," "The Flight of the Crows," "The Song My Paddle Sings," "Silhouette," and "'Through Time and Bitter Distance'." While they did not choose her prose, they note that she concentrated upon writing prose after 1904 and published three short fiction collections, thus guiding readers towards her other writing. Aside from Edwards, Denham, and Parker, editors up to this point had not commented upon her prose.

The editors also address her popularity in a different manner than previous anthologists through the inclusion of "His Majesty, the West Wind" and a discussion of Johnson's awareness of her self-conscious public persona. In the poem, Johnson mocks her popular work "The Song My Paddle Sings" and suggests that she was naïve to compose and perform a poem about a region she had never visited. The humorous and self-deprecating tone is markedly different from most of her poetry; the selection offers a glimpse of her poetic persona not often highlighted in anthologies. *Canadian Literature in English* marks the first time that the poem was republished in an anthology; after its initial

publication in the Toronto *Globe* in 1894, it was reprinted only once in the literary magazine *The Beaver* in 1986. The editors describe the poem as “an uncharacteristically frank criticism of ‘The Song My Paddle Sings’” (145) and then comment that “The spark of humour in this poem shows a side of Johnson that was rarely seen; but her refusal to reprint the poem reveals how well she understood her public image” (145).

The editors also reframed Johnson’s work through the connections they establish between Johnson and the Confederation poets. “‘Through Time and Bitter Distance’” was reprinted with Johnson’s footnote: “For this title the author is indebted to Mr Charles G.D. Roberts. It occurs in his sonnet, ‘Rain’” (150). The selection of the poem and reprinting the footnote highlight her connection with the Confederation poets, an aspect of her writing that other anthologists either did not discuss or alluded to only briefly. While Roberts regarded Johnson as a distinguished contemporary, naming her in a letter as “one of the acknowledged leaders of our Canadian group” (210) and numerous critics in the 1920s viewed her as part of the group,⁵⁵ later anthology editors shied away from such assertions; some, such as Smith, clearly did not regard her skill as equal to other members of the group. Although Brown, Bennett, and Cooke did not identify her as a Confederation poet, “‘Through Time and Bitter Distance’” establishes the link. While other editors had positioned her as an important Aboriginal author, they had not situated her as a member of this founding group; Brown, Bennett, and Cooke’s anthology thus

⁵⁵ Gerson notes, “The authors of the spate of nationalistic studies of Canadian literature published during the 1920s situated Johnson likewise [as a leading member of the Confederation poets]: according to the prominent journalist W.A. Deacon she was ‘in skill, sentiment and outlook, one of the powerful ‘Group,’ and wrote ‘with a mastery equal at times to the best of them, and seldom much below it.’ Professors Logan and French judged her to be ‘[i]n some respects...the most original and engaging singer in the company of the Canadian lyrists who were born in 1860, 1861, and 1862. Others described her as ‘one of the most gifted singers of Canada,’ and ‘in one sense, the most Canadian of all Canadian poets’” (“Recuperating” 171).

signals a significant shift in the presentation of Johnson's writing and her position within the nation's literature.

The editors' discussion of Johnson's cultural heritage and its relation to her work also differs from other anthologists, as they link her popularity with her ability to combine successfully the various components of her background. They argue that her skill as an author and performer is linked with her ancestry:

The tension in Johnson's work resulting from her twin heritages—Mohawk and British—is most clear in 'A Cry from an Indian Wife.' Although she makes use of her Mohawk heritage for both the content and the perspective of the poem, which conveys an Indian wife's thoughts on the North-West rebellion of 1869-70 led by Louis Riel, Johnson also draws heavily on her knowledge of the conventions of English verse. (The speaker's hesitations, for instance, are more reminiscent of a Shakespeare soliloquy than of the oral tradition of Johnson's Mohawk ancestors.) But this was the key to Johnson's charm for contemporary audiences: this 'Mohawk Princess' communicated the unfamiliar in a way wholly familiar to them. (144)

Here, the editors present her "twin heritage" as a tool Johnson used to make her audience cognizant of cultures and experiences likely outside their own. While earlier editors had emphasized Johnson's background, implying that her dual heritage created irreconcilable tensions in her work, Brown, Bennett, and Cooke suggest instead that she was able to fuse diverse subject matter and form to create accessible, informative, and entertaining poetry.

In *A New Anthology of Canadian Literature in English* (2002), Bennett and Brown presented Johnson in a manner similar to their 1990 anthology, suggesting that their assessment of her value and contributions was largely unchanged. The headnotes are

similar to those from the earlier anthology, with the addition of a more extensive discussion of her prose. The poetry selections are identical to those in the 1990 anthology, although the order of the poems was changed slightly. “His Majesty, the West Wind” was moved so that it followed “The Song My Paddle Sings”; the earlier anthology highlighted the poem’s publication, while the 2002 anthology emphasizes the connection between the two. The footnote accompanying “His Majesty, the West Wind” was also expanded,⁵⁶ offering a fuller account of the poem’s provenance and publication history than in the earlier anthology.

The most significant change was the addition of a prose piece, “The Lost Island,” from *Legends of Vancouver*. The selection reveals the editors’ interest in expanding their presentation of Johnson’s work. They analyze “The Lost Island” and argue that just as Johnson blended different subject matter and styles in her poetry, she combined various elements of her background and experience in her prose:

Perhaps the most interesting manifestation of Johnson’s complex relationship with the First Nations communities may be seen in *Legends of Vancouver*. Prior to writing this book she had spent her career generalizing about Aboriginal groups; mixing the myths and customs of a number of peoples; and expressing this *mélange* in a language alien to its subject matter. For the stories in *Legends of Vancouver*, she uses a form closer to that of oral narrative and more suited to its Native content. The tales in this

⁵⁶ The footnote reads: “Johnson wrote this ironic commentary on her immensely popular performance piece ‘The Song My Paddle Sings’ in August 1894 when a late summer tour with Smiley took her, for the first time, to the Canadian prairies; she published it in the *Toronto Globe* that December. Many of Johnson’s fans were offended by this poem’s descent from the high rhetoric to which they were accustomed to ‘slang’; this controversy prompted a debate over Johnson’s merits as a poet in the letters column of *The Week*. Johnson never republished this poem, and it was not reprinted until it appeared in *The Beaver* (Dec. 1986/Jan. 1987); its appearance in the 1990 *Anthology of Canadian Literature in English* marked its first book publication” (173).

volume are told by an elder to a Westernized listener, the pattern of Johnson's own experience. She first heard most of these narratives, which she describes as legends previously 'unknown to . . . Pale-faces', from the Squamish Chief Joe Capilano. The oral quality of Capilano's narration is retained in such stories as 'The Lost Island', a tale explaining earlier Squamish power and providing for the possibility of its return. (168)

The discussion of Johnson's generalizations about Aboriginal peoples and the disconnect between the form and content of some of her writing is a response to critical evaluations claiming that Johnson promoted rather than opposed stereotypes of Aboriginal people through her writing and performance.⁵⁷ The assessment of her prose as an appropriate blend of Western and Aboriginal form and tradition suggests that she moved well beyond stereotypes, especially when her writing was founded upon her personal experiences.

Bennett and Brown's *An Anthology of Canadian Literature in English* (2010) includes the same selections and headnotes as the previous edition. Only a small change was made to the order of the poems: "The Song My Paddle Sings" and "His Majesty, the West Wind" were placed first, followed by "A Cry from An Indian Wife," "The Flight of the Crows," "Silhouette," "Through Time and Bitter Distance," and "The Lost Island." Placing Johnson's best-known poem at the beginning both emphasizes her popularity and gently satirizes it, as "His Majesty, the West Wind" follows immediately. The same emphasis upon her links with the Confederation group, the quality of her prose, and her skilled fusion of distinct traditions remains in the most recent edition, suggesting that in

⁵⁷ See Daniel Francis's *The Imaginary Indian: The Image of the Indian in Canadian Culture* (1992) and Rick Monture's "'Beneath the British Flag': Iroquois and Canadian Nationalism in the Work of E. Pauline Johnson and Duncan Campbell Scott" (2002).

Bennett and Brown's view, Johnson's place in the tradition and her canon of representative works are stable.

Robert Lecker's *Open Country: Canadian Literature in English* (2008) includes several poems by Johnson, and he presents her as a significant author whose works have recently gained the critical favour they deserve. He comments upon her background, positioning her upbringing as encouraging and enabling her to embrace various traditions:

her parents placed great value on interracial cooperation in the political sphere as well as in the home, and from them Pauline inherited a lifelong admiration for both Native and imperial traditions. As a young adult, Pauline read Byron, Scott, Longfellow, Tennyson, and Keats, but she absorbed the stories of her grandfather, the influential Mohawk chief Sakayengwaraton (John Smoke Johnson). (142)

Like other anthologists of this stage, Lecker views her background as having allowed her to respect and combine elements of all parts of her background into her writing. He praises her skillful integration of English and Aboriginal forms and content:

Many of her verses are ballad-like, with enticing rhymes and lilting metres. Moreover, her conscious decision to write accessibly and to use the first person when addressing either the audience or an unseen 'you,' reflected her admiration for oral storytelling. By drawing on oral modes, she indicated her faith in the power of direct communication to counter assumptions about race and gender. (143)

He also links her blending of styles with her popularity and accessibility, noting that she intended her poems to have a wide appeal; this assertion responds to the claims of earlier critics and anthologists, who dismissed her due to her popularity. In fact, he directly

addresses such criticism: “Johnson’s work was enthusiastically received by her peers the Confederation poets, but her themes and her forms were too popular and political to appeal to the next generation of modernist poets, who valued intellectually difficult verse and believed that commercial success was the antithesis of aesthetic achievement” (143).

He also presents Johnson as an advocate for Aboriginal people. He mentions her article “A Strong Race Opinion: On the Indian Girl in Modern Fiction” and while he does not include the article, he summarizes her goal, in both the editorial and her poetry more generally, as “challenging the racial stereotypes about Natives—particularly Native women—fostered by the literature of the day” (142). He continues, outlining her writing and including excerpts from her letters to support his presentation: her poems

always ensure that Native women are not ‘hampered with being obliged to continually be national first and natural afterwards.’ By focusing on unique lives rather than stereotypes, Johnson was better able to assert the validity of her own divided heritage and to challenge the arrogant assumptions made by Whites who ‘write up Indian stuff’ without ever having ‘met a “real live” Redman.’ (143)

Lecker’s view of Johnson as a skilled, passionate spokesperson for Aboriginal people is evident through his choice of poems. He included “A Cry from an Indian Wife,” “The Idlers,” “The Pilot of the Plains,” “The Cattle Thief,” “Ojistoh,” and “The Corn Husker.” The poems examine a range of subjects and themes, but several of the poems criticize Europeans for appropriating Aboriginal land and imposing Christianity upon the people; blame in “The Cattle Thief,” for example, is placed entirely on the British. The majority of the poems also include empowered, active female characters who act in unexpected and non-stereotypical ways. Lecker categorizes Johnson as “radical in her descriptions of

female sexuality” (143), noting specifically that in “The Idlers,” “the natural world facilitates a sexual longing that is not fearful or uncertain, but experienced, anticipatory, and, eventually, burdened by regret” (143).

Lecker made some similar choices as other editors, but his introduction and the poems selected present Johnson’s work as relevant to issues of race and gender in a more direct manner than other anthologists. He writes, “Johnson has lately been identified as someone who challenged the limitations placed on femininity and racial identity in an imperial and patriarchal society, and there is renewed interest in her poems. Her influence on Native writers has been profound and consistent” (143). In his view, Johnson is currently receiving the interest and attention her work deserves and her writing continues to influence later writers, two factors which suggest that her canonical position is becoming established.

Cynthia Sugars and Laura Moss also included Johnson in *Canadian Literature in English: Texts and Contexts* (2009), and their anthology presents the most complete and detailed overview of her life and work in general anthologies. Their selections showcase her diversity in genre, tone, and subject matter, expanding earlier presentations of her life and work. They demonstrate that Johnson was a valued writer and that she was highly aware of the reception of and reactions to her work and was able to balance audience expectations with her interests and message. They discuss Johnson’s literary milieu, showing her connections with other prominent Canadian writers of the time, namely Ernest Thompson Seton and Roberts; quotations from both are included in the headnotes. Establishing a link between her and well-known contemporary writers shows that she was a respected and important writer of her time and also that her popularity as a performer did not prevent her peers from valuing her work. The editors also address her awareness

of the public's views of her work through the inclusion of "The Song My Paddle Sings" and "His Majesty, the West Wind": they call the latter poem "her self-critical poem [. . .] in which she looks back upon "The Song My Paddle Sings" and critiques her naive view of the prairie climate. The publication of "West Wind" caused some furor among critics, who felt that Johnson was being too flippant about her poetic status" (393).

A significant part of both Johnson's writing and performances was her support for Aboriginal people, and the editors analyze her concerns with the depiction of Aboriginal women in particular. They included several works that contain a clear political message, positioning her as an important voice for Aboriginal people at the turn of the century. The article "A Strong Race Opinion: On the Indian Girl in Modern Fiction," selected for the anthology, critiques "the conventional depictions of helpless Indian maidens and the frequent conflation of all Native peoples into one common 'tribe'" (392). The editors also selected the story "As It Was in the Beginning," in which "she provided an alternative to the Indian maiden stories that so exasperated her" (392). The type of speaking out apparent in the prose excerpts appears in other selections, and the editors draw attention to her activism: "The political courage of Johnson's message is evident not only in her early poem 'A Cry from an Indian Wife,' in which she unequivocally condemns the European theft of Native lands, but also in 'The Cattle Thief' and many of her public statements, as for example in her interview in the *London Gazette* in 1894" (394).⁵⁸ The editors also respond to criticisms that Johnson's performances perpetuated the stereotypes she sought to counter,⁵⁹ arguing that "Johnson was getting her message across in the only way

⁵⁸ Along with the selections listed here, they also included "The Corn Husker."

⁵⁹ The editors note that although Johnson intended to counter stereotypes of Aboriginal people, "many critics have accused her of promoting such stereotypes in her own performances in order to cater to popular demand" (393). In response to these claims, the editors point out several features of her performance that

possible: by catering to audience demand, she was also able to slip in her political message about Native disenfranchisement” (394).

While other editors of the phase discuss the politics of Johnson’s advocacy, only Sugars and Moss focus upon another central element of her political affiliations: her nationalism and Loyalism. Critics have noted Johnson’s commitment to imperialism (Gerson characterizes Johnson as having a “staunchly and consistently pro-Canadian, pro-British, anti-American position” (“Recuperating” 169)), yet this part of her political identity was not mentioned in earlier anthologies, as earlier editors were concerned with Johnson’s Aboriginal or British influences and interests and less interested in the overlap between the two. Sugars and Moss note that “While she was proud of her Mohawk heritage, Johnson, like her father, was also a committed Canadian nationalist and British Loyalist” (394). More specifically, they note that “Canadian Born” “reveals that she saw membership in the British Empire as the glue that could unify all Canadians, Native and non-Native alike” (394). The discussion of her imperialism and the inclusion of “Canadian Born” expand the presentations of earlier anthologists and suggest that much like her genres and styles, her political beliefs were varied and resisted neat categorization.

The variety of works chosen and the assessments of Johnson’s writing reveal the growth of scholarship about her throughout the pluralistic stage. The choices anthologists made show that while a consensus regarding her value has emerged, agreement regarding which works best represent her body of writing has not been reached. While authors such as Brooke and Moodie have been presented in a fairly similar manner over the past few

challenged her audience’s beliefs: her costume combined “various ‘Indian’ symbols, and her performance included war whoops and threatening postures (many of which shocked her bourgeois audiences) and thus evoked an image of Native savagery. Moreover, her switch into refined evening dress in the course of her performance enacted the very assimilation (and presumed disappearance) of Native peoples that she so much opposed. Likewise, her ‘Indian’ poems are written in the tradition of British poetry, including dramatic monologues written in heroic couplets” (393-94).

decades, Johnson's presentation in anthologies is not fixed, and new areas of interest in her writing continue to develop. As Gerson argues, "Pauline Johnson [. . .] is especially relevant today, as we work to unravel constructions of gender, race, ethnicity, empire, value, and national literary history" ("Recuperating" 178). The areas of interest Gerson outlines are evident, to varying degrees, in anthologies of this phase, revealing the interconnectedness between critical interests and anthologies. The links between anthologies and literary criticism are also apparent through editors' direct responses to criticism: Lecker replies to the modernists for their exclusion and devaluing of Johnson, and Bennett and Brown and Sugars and Moss directly refute claims that Johnson promoted stereotypes through her writing and performances.

Conclusion

Throughout Johnson's inclusion in anthologies, a wide variety of her writing has been selected and the works chosen have often been linked with views of her background, as anthologists have sought to show the connections between her cultural heritage and literary work. Her authenticity has been questioned, leading anthologists to suggest that other poets are better able to represent an Aboriginal perspective (Smith's argument regarding Scott, for example) or to suggest, as anthologists of the pluralistic stage do, that she was a courageous spokesperson for Aboriginal people. Her career as a performer was initially viewed as a mark of her popularity, then as evidence of the inferior quality of her writing, and recently as a means of political activism. The variations in interpretations of her background, performance, and politics reveal the continued fascination anthologists and critics have had with Johnson's identity and its impact upon her inclusion and presentation.

Johnson is presently acknowledged as an important early Canadian writer, and recent anthologies and critical assessments suggest that her writing will continue to spark debate. Responses to her writing's aesthetic qualities as well as its political and cultural impact have varied widely, revealing a range of critical evaluations not seen in responses to the other authors studied so far. The marked differences between her presentation at specific points in anthology development show the impact a particular phase may have upon an author's reputation, as well as the process and impact of reassessment and recovery. Her present status has been attained, in part, by her inclusion in anthologies, for although she was chosen infrequently at times, she was never entirely forgotten.

CONCLUSION

The importance of anthologies is made clear through the various metaphors critics and editors employ to describe them. In his introduction to a recent edition of *American Book Review*, Jeffrey R. Di Leo uses metaphors of navigation, remarking that the value of anthologies lies “in the topologies of the literary world they create” and positing that “[a]nthologies chart courses through the literary world and are one of the primary ways through which we learn to navigate it” (3). The sense that anthologies capture specific points in time emerges in Robert Weaver and William Toye’s reference to their anthology as a “capsule history of Canadian writing” (Preface 3rd ed. xiii) and in Cynthia Sugars and Laura Moss’s hope that their anthology “provides enough snapshots of times and places to achieve a sense of how many stories have been imagined within Canada” (Preface xviii). Other characterizations centre upon the ideas of preservation and worth. Paul Lauter claims that “the comprehensive anthology can be looked at [. . .] as a vast museum of various literary forms” (28) and Robert Lecker likens anthologies to “multi-faceted jewels on an unfinished necklace, the stories and poems changing with the light” (xxiii). As these descriptions suggest and this dissertation has worked to demonstrate, the anthology plays a central role in establishing and defining the nation’s literary tradition, as it contains valued material, assists in the navigation of a subject, and reflects and guides changing notions of worth.

In this dissertation, I have analyzed the development of general Canadian literature anthologies to consider their role in reflecting and shaping views of the nation’s literary tradition. In order to examine the intersections between anthologies, the national canon, and critical concerns, I have considered the treatment of five authors, finding that

prevailing critical approaches and ideas of national identity strongly determine an author's treatment in anthologies and his or her canonical status. As certain authors fall out of critical favour, others sustain critical interest, and, over time, a consensus gradually emerges, suggesting that there is a relatively stable canon. The cases of the authors studied in this dissertation highlight some of the functions of the anthology, including cultural validation, maintenance of the tradition, and recovery. Their treatment also reveals the effect of dominant critical trends upon an author's position in anthologies and the canon; alignment with prevailing views of nation, assessments of literary quality, considerations of genre, and reconsiderations of past views all impact an author's treatment. Frances Brooke's novel went from being valued for its documentary qualities to being valued for its vision of the new nation. Its usefulness to feminist and postcolonial critics played a major role in its continuing interest for scholars. John Richardson and William Kirby, on the other hand, found themselves on the wrong side of critical fashion, as their genre and ideology both, to differing degrees and in somewhat different ways, caused them to fall from favour. Susanna Moodie was never as suitable as Brooke to feminist readings, but her miscellanic genre, amenability to life writing approaches, and especially her iconic status and her articulations of dominant Canadian critical themes have guaranteed her longevity. Pauline Johnson's Aboriginal heritage as well as her status as a political activist and popular performer aided her recovery during a phase dominated by postcolonial and cultural studies approaches.

While this study is not an exhaustive account of authors' presentations in anthologies, some patterns of inclusion have emerged from it, shedding light upon the treatments of other authors and suggesting further areas of study. A number of additional authors can be seen as following roughly the same patterns of inclusion, whether current

recovery, as indicated by the inclusion of Mary Ann Shadd in Cynthia Sugars and Laura Moss's anthology; swift removal due to changing visions of nation, as seen in the treatment of William Henry Drummond;⁶⁰ consistent inclusion with emphasis upon different aspects of writing at various times, as evident in Charles G.D. Roberts's treatment; or fluctuating levels of interest and recent movement towards recovery, as shown in Robert Service's reception. These are only a few examples, but they suggest that the cases of Brooke, Kirby, Richardson, Moodie, and Johnson could inform investigations of a number of other authors. Additionally, the treatment of authors whose careers began in later stages of anthology development could be traced to determine the connections between the guiding impulses of the phase and an author's profile. Study of the receptions of E.J. Pratt, L.M. Montgomery, Margaret Atwood, and Eden Robinson, for example, would complement the study of the earlier authors examined in this dissertation.

Along with considerations of additional authors, other aspects of the anthology could be examined to consider further its form and functions. This dissertation focused upon general anthologies; study of genre-specific anthologies could be undertaken to determine whether poetry and short story anthologies follow the same trajectory of development. Special-interest anthologies, defined as anthologies that seek "to represent consciously such ideological questions as gender and sexuality, cultural plurality, race, region, First Nations experience, and women's lives and stories" (Struthers 31), are becoming increasingly popular, and analysis of their compilation, contents, structure, and organization would be valuable both for what it would reveal about the development of

⁶⁰ At the turn of the century, Drummond was an extremely popular poet and was included consistently in early general anthologies. In his introduction to *The Book of Canadian Poetry* (1948), Smith argues, "William Henry Drummond's tender and humourous evocations of olden times in French Canada are a classic instance of the preservative value of humility, humanity, and good sense" (4). In the following decades, however, Drummond's *patois* poems came to be viewed as condescending and offensive; both his reputation and inclusion in anthologies dropped sharply and there is no sign of growing interest in his work.

various special interest anthologies as well as how it could enhance evaluations of general anthologies. Anthologies created for elementary and secondary schools could also be examined to determine what views of nation and the literary tradition they promote and are influenced by and to assess how these anthologies differ from general anthologies. Additional studies could focus upon the anthology within the university setting, by scrutinizing the process and challenges of compilation and editing, the impact of instructor demand upon anthology contents, and the status of the anthology within the academy.

While there are many aspects of the anthology that could be examined in greater detail, one element of the anthology that anthologists have contemplated is the form that anthologies may take in the future. Donna Bennett and Russell Brown argue that the boundaries of what is considered “literary” are becoming less strictly defined, citing authors who challenge generic boundaries, such as George Elliott Clarke and Fred Wah, and suggest that “[p]erhaps the anthology of the future will be a multimedia work” (Introduction *An Anthology* xix). In their view, the increasingly interdisciplinary nature of contemporary writing may be best reflected and experienced in a multimedia format. While Bennett and Brown suggest that the changing nature of literature may lead to a new format, Lauter argues that advances in technology will cause substantial changes to the anthology form and re-evaluation of its role: “[t]echnological developments, like the possibility of shaping individual anthologies from on-line text bases, will force new assessments of the value and roles of such collections” (38). Online anthologies have been created,⁶¹ and as Lauter points out, a new set of benefits and challenges would emerge

⁶¹ D.M.R. Bentley’s *Early Writing in Canada: English 274E Anthology* is a current example of an online anthology. While it does not have the textual apparatus of most anthologies, such as an introduction

from a shift to online anthologies that could change the genre significantly. While the precise format that the anthology make take in the future is not known, the anthology will continue to play an important role in understanding and defining the nation and its literature.

or headnotes, and could be categorized as a collection rather than an anthology, it indicates the form anthologies may take in the future.

Works Cited

- Arch, Stephen Carl. "Frances Brooke's 'Circle of Friends': The Limits of Epistolarity in *The History of Emily Montague*." *Early American Literature* 39.3 (2004): 469-70. Print.
- Atwood, Margaret. "Afterword to *The Journals of Susanna Moodie*." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 2 471-72. Print.
- . *Alias Grace*. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1996. Print.
- . "Death of a Young Son by Drowning." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 820. Print.
- . "Death of a Young Son by Drowning." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 785-86. Print.
- . "Death of a Young Son by Drowning." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 592. Print.
- . "Death of a Young Son by Drowning." Weaver and Toye, 1973 ed. 12. Print.
- . "Death of a Young Son by Drowning." Weaver and Toye, 2nd ed. 12. Print.
- . "Departure from the Bush." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 2 467-68. Print.
- . "Departure from the Bush." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 590-91. Print.
- . "Departure from the Bush." Daymond and Monkman, Vol. 2 633-34. Print.
- . "Departures from the Bush." Lecker, *Open Country* 703-04. Print.
- . "Departure from the Bush." Moss and Sugars 443-44. Print.
- . "Disembarking at Quebec." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 818. Print.
- . "Disembarking at Quebec." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 783-84. Print.
- . "Disembarking at Quebec." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 2 461-62. Print.
- . "Disembarking at Quebec." Daymond and Monkman, Vol. 2 632. Print.
- . "Disembarking at Quebec." Moss and Sugars 441-42. Print.
- . "Dream 1: The Bush Garden." Klinck and Watters, 3rd ed. 566-67. Print.

- . "Dream 1: The Bush Garden." Weaver and Toye, 1973 ed. 10. Print.
- . "Dream 1: The Bush Garden." Weaver and Toye, 2nd ed. 10. Print.
- . "Dream 2: Brian the Still-Hunter." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 821. Print.
- . "Dream 2: Brian the Still-Hunter." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 786-87. Print.
- . "Dream 2: Brian the Still-Hunter." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 2 469. Print.
- . "Dream 2: Brian the Still-Hunter." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 593. Print.
- . "Dream 2: Brian the Still-Hunter." Moss and Sugars 444-45. Print.
- . "Dream 2: Brian the Still-Hunter." Weaver and Toye, 1973 ed. 11. Print.
- . "Dream 2: Brian the Still-Hunter." Weaver and Toye, 2nd ed. 11. Print.
- . "First Neighbours." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 2 463-64. Print.
- . "Further Arrivals." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 819. Print.
- . "Further Arrivals." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 784-85. Print.
- . "Further Arrivals." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 2 462-63. Print.
- . "Further Arrivals." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 588-89. Print.
- . "Further Arrivals." Daymond and Monkman, Vol. 2 631-32. Print.
- . "Further Arrivals." Denham 265-66. Print.
- . "Further Arrivals." Moss and Sugars 442-43. Print.
- . "The Immigrants." Klinck and Watters, 3rd ed. 565-66. Print.
- . *The Journals of Susanna Moodie*. Toronto: Oxford UP, 1970. Print.
- . "Paths and Thingscape." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 2 465-66. Print.
- . "The Planters." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 2 464. Print.
- . "The Planters." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 589-90. Print.
- . "The Planters." Klinck and Watters, 3rd ed. 567. Print.
- . *Survival: A Thematic Guide to Canadian Literature*. Toronto: Anansi, 1972. Print.

- . "Thoughts from Underground." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 822-23. Print.
- . "Thoughts from Underground." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 787-88. Print.
- . "Thoughts from Underground." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 2 470. Print.
- . "Thoughts from Underground." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 594. Print.
- . "Thoughts from Underground." Denham 268-69. Print.
- . "Thoughts from Underground." Moss and Sugars 445-46. Print.
- . "The Two Fires." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 2 466-67. Print.
- . "The Two Fires." Denham 266-67. Print.
- . "The Wereman." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 2 465. Print.
- . "The Wereman." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 590. Print.
- Ballstadt, Carl. "Traill, Catharine Parr." New, *Encyclopedia* 1120-22. Print.
- "The Battle of Queenston Heights." Klinck and Watters, rev. ed. 31. Print.
- "The Battle of Queenston Heights." Klinck and Watters, 3rd ed. 30. Print.
- Bennett, Donna. "Conflicted Vision: A Consideration of Canon and Genre in English-Canadian Literature." Lecker, *Canadian Canons* 131-49; 221-26. Print.
- Bennett, Donna, and Russell Brown, eds. *An Anthology of Canadian Literature in English*. 3rd ed. Toronto: Oxford UP, 2010. Print.
- . Introduction. Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* xvii-xx. Print.
- . Introduction. Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* xvi-xx. Print.
- , eds. *A New Anthology of Canadian Literature in English*. Don Mills, ON: Oxford UP, 2002. Print.
- . Preface. Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* xiii-xv. Print.
- . Preface. Bennett and Brown. *An Anthology* xiii-xvi. Print.
- Benson, Eugene, and William Toye, eds. *The Oxford Companion to Canadian Literature*.

- 2nd ed. Toronto: Oxford UP, 1997. Print.
- Bentley, D.M.R., ed. *Early Writing in Canada: English 274E Anthology*. Web. 15 Nov. 2011.
- Berger, Carl. *The Sense of Power: Studies in the Ideas of Canadian Imperialism, 1867-1914*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1970. Print.
- Binhammer, Katherine. "The Failure of Trade's Empire in *The History of Emily Montague*." *Eighteenth-Century Fiction* 23.2 (Winter 2010–11): 295-319. Print.
- Birblasingh, Frank. *Novels and the Nation: Essays in Canadian Literature*. Toronto: TSAR, 1995. Print.
- Birney, Earle. "Can. Lit." *Ghost in the Wheels: The Selected Poems of Earle Birney*. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1977. 49. Print.
- Bloom, Harold. *The Western Canon: The Books and Schools of the Ages*. New York: Harcourt Brace, 1994. Print.
- Blue, Charles S. "Canada's First Novelist." *Canadian Magazine* 58 (Nov. 1921): 3-12. Print.
- Broadus, Edmund Kemper, and Eleanor Hammond Broadus, eds. *A Book of Canadian Prose and Verse*. Toronto: MacMillan, 1923. Print.
- , eds. *A Book of Canadian Prose and Verse*. Rev. ed. Toronto: MacMillan, 1934. Print.
- . Preface. Broadus and Broadus, 1923 ed. vii-ix. Print.
- . Preface. Broadus and Broadus, rev. ed. vii. Print.
- Brooke, Frances. *The Excursion*. 1777. Eds. Paula R. Backscheider and Hope Cotton. Lexington: UP of Kentucky, 1997. Print.
- . *The History of Charles Mandeville*. London: Lane, 1790. Web. 18 Oct. 2010.
- . *The History of Emily Montague*. Ed. Laura Moss. Ottawa: Tecumseh, 2001. Print.

- . *The History of Emily Montague*. Ed. Lawrence J. Burpee. The Canada Series. Gen. ed. F.P. Grove. Ottawa: Graphic, 1931. Print.
- . *The History of Emily Montague*. London: Dodsley, 1769. Print.
- . *The History of Lady Julia Mandeville*. 1763. Ed. E. Phillips Poole. London: Scholartis, 1930. Print.
- . "Letter 1." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 11-12. Print.
- . "Letter 1." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 11-12. Print.
- . "Letter 1." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 2-3. Print.
- . "Letter 1." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 2-3. Print.
- . "Letter 10." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 12-14. Print.
- . "Letter 10." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 12-14. Print.
- . "Letter 10." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 3-4. Print.
- . "Letter 10." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 3-4. Print.
- . "Letter 11." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 14-18. Print.
- . "Letter 11." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 14-18. Print.
- . "Letter 11." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 5-9. Print.
- . "Letter 11." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 5-9. Print.
- . "Letter 49." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 19-20. Print.
- . "Letter 49." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 19-20. Print.
- . "Letter 49." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 9-10. Print.
- . "Letter 49." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 9-10. Print.
- . "Letter 80." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 20-21. Print.
- . "Letter 80." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 20-21. Print.
- . "Letter 80." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 11-12. Print.

- . "Letter 80." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 10-11. Print.
- . "Letter 121." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 12-14. Print.
- . "Letter 123." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 22-24. Print.
- . "Letter 123." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 22-24. Print.
- . "Letter 123." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 12-13. Print.
- . "Letter 125." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 14. Print.
- . "Letter 127." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 24. Print.
- . "Letter 127." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 24. Print.
- . "Letter 127." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 14. Print.
- . "Letter 129." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 15-16. Print.
- . "Letter 131." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 24-26. Print.
- . "Letter 131." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 24-26. Print.
- . "Letter 131." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 14-16. Print.
- . "Letter 167." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 17. Print.
- . "Letter 169." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 26-27. Print.
- . "Letter 169." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 26-27. Print.
- . "Letter 169." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 16-17. Print.
- . "Letter III." Smith, *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings* 4-5. Print.
- . "Letter IV." Smith, *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings* 5-8. Print.
- . "Letter V." Smith, *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings* 9-12. Print.
- . "Letter VI." Smith, *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings* 12-13. Print.
- . "Letter XI." Smith, *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings* 13-19. Print.
- . "Letter XI." Smith, *The Canadian Experience* 3-9. Print.
- . "Letter XLV." Daymond and Monkman, Vol. 1 29-31. Print.

- . "Letter XLV." Smith, *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings* 19-21. Print.
- . "Letter XLV." Smith, *The Canadian Experience* 9-11. Print.
- . "Letter XLIX." Klinck and Watters, 1955 ed. 2-3. Print.
- . "Letter XLIX." Klinck and Watters, rev. ed. 4-5. Print.
- . "Letter XLIX." Klinck and Watters, 3rd ed. 4-5. Print.
- . "Letter XLIX." Smith, *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings* 21-23. Print.
- . "Letter XLIX." Smith, *The Canadian Experience* 11-12. Print.
- . "Letter LXXX." Daymond and Monkman, Vol. 1 31-32. Print.
- . "Letter LXXX." Klinck and Watters, 1955 ed. 3-4. Print.
- . "Letter LXXX." Klinck and Watters, rev. ed. 6-7. Print.
- . "Letter LXXX." Klinck and Watters, 3rd ed. 6-7. Print.
- . "Letter CXV." Smith, *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings* 23-25. Print.
- . "Letter CL." Daymond and Monkman, Vol. 1 33-35. Print.
- . *Marian, A Comic Opera – Airs, Songs, Duets, Trios and Chorusses* [sic]. 3rd ed.
London: Cadell, 1789. Web. 17 Oct. 2010.
- . *The Old Maid. By Mary Singleton, Spinster*. London: Millar, 1764. Web. 18 Oct.
2010.
- . *Rosina: A Comic Opera in Two Acts*. 2nd ed. London: Cadell, 1783. Web. 18 Oct.
2010.
- . *The Siege of Sinope – A Tragedy*. Dublin: Sam Price, 1781. Web. 18 Oct. 2010.
- . *Virginia, a Tragedy with Odes, Pastorals and Translations*. London: Millar, 1756.
Web. 18 Oct. 2010.
- Brown, Russell, and Donna Bennett, eds. *An Anthology of Canadian Literature in
English*. 2 vols. Toronto: Oxford UP, 1982-83. Print.

- . Introduction. Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 xi-xiv. Print.
- . Introduction. Brown and Bennett, Vol. 2 xiii-xvi. Print.
- Brown, Russell, Donna Bennett, and Nathalie Cooke, eds. *An Anthology of Canadian Literature in English*. Rev. and abr. ed. Toronto: Oxford UP, 1990. Print.
- . Introduction. Brown, Bennett, and Cooke xv-xviii. Print.
- Burwash, Ida. "An Old-Time Novel." *Canadian Magazine* 29 (Jan. 1907): 252-56. Print.
- Campbell, Sandra. "Nationalism, Morality, and Gender: Lorne Pierce and the Canadian Literary Canon, 1920-60." *Papers of the Bibliographical Society of Canada* 32.2 (1994): 135-60. Print.
- Canada. Royal Commission on National Development in the Arts, Letters, and Sciences (Massey Commission). *Report of the Royal Commission on Development in the Arts, Letters, and Sciences in Canada*. Ottawa: Printer to the King's Most Excellent Majesty, 1951. Print.
- Canada. Department of Justice. *Canadian Multiculturalism Act*. R.S.C. 1985, c. 24 (4th Supp.). Web. 20 Sept. 2011.
- "Come All You Bold Canadians." Klinck and Watters, rev. ed. 30-31. Print.
- "Come All You Bold Canadians." Klinck and Watters, 3rd ed. 29-30. Print.
- Cooper, James Fenimore. *The Last of the Mohicans: A Narrative of 1757*. 1826. Peterborough, ON: Broadview, 2009. Print.
- Csicsila, Joseph. *Canons by Consensus: Critical Trends and American Literature Anthologies*. Tuscaloosa: U of Alabama P, 2004. Print.
- . Introduction. Csicsila xv-xx. Print.
- Davies, Gwendolyn. "English-Canadian Colonial Literature." *History of Literature in Canada: English-Canadian and French-Canadian*. Ed. Reingard M. Nischik.

- Rochester, NY: Camden House, 2008. 72-87. Print.
- Daymond, Douglas, and Leslie Monkman, eds. *Literature in Canada*. 2 vols. Toronto: Gage, 1978. Print.
- . Preface. Daymond and Monkman, Vol. 1 ix-x. Print.
- Denham, Paul, ed. *The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English: 1945-1970*. Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1973. Print.
- Dewart, Edward Hartley. Introduction. *Selections from Canadian Poets with Occasional Critical and Biographical Notes and an Introductory Essay on Canadian Poetry*. Ed. Edward Hartley Dewart. ix-xix. Montreal: Lovell, 1864. Print.
- Di Leo, Jeffrey R. "Analyzing Anthologies." *On Canons: Politics and Pedagogy*. Ed. Jeffrey R. Di Leo. Lincoln, NE: U of Nebraska P, 2004. 1-27. Print.
- . Editor's Note. *symplokē* 8.1-2 (2000): 5-6. Print.
- . "Introduction to Focus: Anthologies and Literary Landscapes." *American Book Review* 28.2 (Jan.-Feb. 2007): 3. Print.
- Duffy, Dennis. "Golden Dog, The." Benson and Toye 472-73. Print.
- . "Kirby, William." Benson and Toye 597. Print.
- . "Richardson, John," Benson and Toye 997-99. Print.
- Duncan, Sara Jeannette. "Woman's World." *Globe* 14 Oct. 1886. 6. Print.
- Dyer, Klay. "Kirby, William." New, *Encyclopedia* 581. Print.
- Eagleton, Terry. *Literary Theory: An Introduction*. 2nd ed. Minneapolis: U of Minnesota P, 1996. Print.
- Edwards, Mary Jane, ed. *The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English: Beginnings to 1867*. Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1973. Print.
- . Introduction. Edwards 1-15. Print.

- Edwards, Mary Jane, Paul Denham, and George L. Parker, eds. *The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English: 1867-1914*. Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1973. Print.
- . Preface. Edwards, Denham, and Parker v-vi. Print.
- Fiamengo, Janice. *The Woman's Page: Journalism and Rhetoric in Early Canada*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 2008. Print.
- Fowler, Alastair. "Genre and the Literary Canon." *NLH* 11 (1979): 97-119. Print.
- Framery, Nicholas. *Memoirs of the Marquis de St. Forlaix*. Trans. Frances Brooke. London: Dodsley, 1770. Web. 18 Oct. 2010.
- Francis, Daniel. *The Imaginary Indian: The Image of the Indian in Canadian Culture*. Vancouver: Arsenal, 1992. Print.
- Frye, Northrop. Conclusion. *Literary History of Canada: Canadian Literature in English*. Ed. Carl F. Klinck. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1965. 821-52.
- . "John D. Robins." *Canadian Forum* 32 (Jan. 1953): 218. Print.
- Gates, Henry Louis Jr. *Loose Canons: Notes on the Culture Wars*. New York: Oxford UP, 1992. Print.
- Gerson, Carole. *Canadian Women in Print, 1750-1918*. Waterloo, ON: Wilfrid Laurier UP, 2010. Print.
- . "The Canon Between the Wars: Field-notes of a Feminist Literary Archaeologist." Lecker, *Canadian Canons* 46-56. Print.
- . "Design and Ideology in *A Pocketful of Canada*." *Papers of the Bibliographic Society of Canada* 44.2 (Fall 2006): 65-85. Print.
- . *A Purer Taste: The Writing and Reading of Fiction in English in Nineteenth Century Canada*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1989. Print.

- . "Recuperating Modernism: Pauline Johnson's Challenge to Literary History." *Women and Literary History: "for there she was."* Eds. Katherine Binhammer and Jeanne Wood. Newark, NJ: U of Delaware P, 2003. 167-86. Print.
- Gerson, Carole, and Veronica Strong-Boag, eds. *E. Pauline Johnson, Tekahionwake: Collected Poems and Selected Prose*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 2002. Print.
- Golding, Alan. *From Outlaw to Classic: Canons in American Poetry*. Madison: U of Wisconsin P, 1995. Print.
- Goldsmith, Oliver. "The Rising Village." Lecker, *Open Country* 2-15. Print.
- Gray, Charlotte. *Flint & Feather: The Life and Times of E. Pauline Johnson, Tekahionwake*. Toronto: HarperCollins, 2002. Print.
- Greene, Michael. "Richardson, John." New, *Encyclopedia* 969. Print.
- Guillory, John. "Canons." *Critical Terms for Literary Study*. Eds. Frank Lentricchia and Thomas McLaughlin. 2nd ed. Chicago: U of Chicago P, 1995. 233-49. Print.
- . *Cultural Capital: The Problem of Literary Canon Formation*. Chicago: U of Chicago P, 1993. Print.
- . Preface. Guillory, *Cultural Capital* vii-xiv. Print.
- Harris, Wendell. "Canonicity." *PMLA* 106.1 (Jan. 1991): 110-21. Print.
- Johnson, Pauline. "As It Was in the Beginning." *Sugars and Moss* 405. Print.
- . "Canadian Born." *Sugars and Moss* 400-1. Print.
- . *Canadian Born*. Toronto: Morang, 1903. Print.
- . "The Cattle Country." Broadus and Broadus, 1923 ed. 90-91. Print.
- . "The Cattle Country." Broadus and Broadus, rev. ed. 45-46. Print.
- . "The Cattle Thief." Lecker, *Open Country* 148-49. Print.
- . "The Cattle Thief." *Sugars and Moss* 398-400. Print.

- . "The Corn Husker." Daymond and Monkman, Vol. 1 359. Print.
- . "The Corn Husker." Lecker, *Open Country* 151. Print.
- . "The Corn Husker." Robins 178. Print.
- . "The Corn Husker." Sugars and Moss 400. Print.
- . "A Cry from an Indian Wife." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 228-30. Print.
- . "A Cry from an Indian Wife." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 168-69. Print.
- . "A Cry from an Indian Wife." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 145-47. Print.
- . "A Cry From an Indian Wife." Lecker, *Open Country* 143-44. Print.
- . "A Cry From an Indian Wife." Sugars and Moss 395-96. Print.
- . "Fate of the Red Man: An English Journalist's Chat with Pauline Johnson." Sugars and Moss 403. Print.
- . "The Flight of the Crows." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 233-31. Print.
- . "The Flight of the Crows." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 170-71. Print.
- . "The Flight of the Crows." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 147-48. Print.
- . *Flint and Feather*. Toronto: Musson, 1912. Print.
- . *Flint and Feather*. Introduction by Theodore Watts-Dunton. 3rd ed. Toronto: Musson, 1914. Print.
- . "His Majesty the West Wind" [sic]. Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 228. Print.
- . "His Majesty the West Wind" [sic]. Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 172-73. Print.
- . "His Majesty the West Wind" [sic]. Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 145. Print.
- . "His Majesty, the West Wind." Sugars and Moss 398. Print.
- . "In the Shadows." Edwards, Denham, and Parker 192-93. Print.
- . "The Idlers." Lecker, *Open Country* 145-46. Print.
- . "The Legend of Lillooet Falls." Edwards, Denham, and Parker 198-201. Print.

- . *Legends of Vancouver*. Toronto: McClelland, Goodchild & Stewart, 1911. Print.
- . "The Lost Island." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 233-35. Print.
- . "The Lost Island." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 175-77. Print.
- . "Lullaby of the Iroquois." Edwards, Denham, and Parker 196. Print.
- . "Marshlands." Daymond and Monkman, Vol. 1 357-58. Print.
- . *The Moccasin Maker*. Toronto: Briggs, 1913. Print.
- . "Ojistoh." Lecker, *Open Country* 149-51. Print.
- . "Prairie Greyhound." Broadus and Broadus, 1923 ed. 91-92. Print.
- . "Prairie Greyhound." Broadus and Broadus, rev. ed. 46-47. Print.
- . "The Pilot of the Plains." Lecker, *Open Country* 146-47. Print.
- . "The Riders of the Plains." Edwards, Denham, and Parker 197-98. Print.
- . "Shadow River." Daymond and Monkman, Vol. 1 356-57. Print.
- . "Shadow River." Edwards, Denham, and Parker 195-96. Print.
- . "Shadow River." Smith, *Book of Canadian Poetry* 1943 ed. 211-12. Print.
- . "Shadow River." Smith, *Book of Canadian Poetry* rev. ed. 206-07. Print.
- . "Shadow River." Smith, *Book of Canadian Poetry* 3rd ed. 205-26. Print.
- . "Shadow River." Watson and Pierce 44-45. Print.
- . *The Shaganappi*. Toronto: Ryerson, 1913. Print.
- . "Silhouette." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 231-32. Print.
- . "Silhouette." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 173-74. Print.
- . "Silhouette." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 150. Print.
- . "Silhouette." Daymond and Monkman, Vol. 1 358-59. Print.
- . "The Sleeping Giant." Watson and Pierce 93. Print.
- . "The Song My Paddle Sings." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 226-27. Print.

- . "The Song My Paddle Sings." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 171-72. Print.
- . "The Song My Paddle Sings." Broadus and Broadus, 1923 ed. 89-90. Print.
- . "The Song My Paddle Sings." Broadus and Broadus, rev. ed. 43-45. Print.
- . "The Song My Paddle Sings." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 148-49. Print.
- . "The Song My Paddle Sings." Edwards, Denham, and Parker 193-94. Print.
- . "The Song My Paddle Sings." Sugars and Moss 396-97. Print.
- . "The Song My Paddle Sings." Watson and Pierce 62-63. Print.
- . "A Strong Race Opinion: On the Indian Girl in Modern Fiction." Sugars and Moss 401-03. Print.
- . "Through Time and Bitter Distance." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 232-33. Print.
- . "Through Time and Bitter Distance." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 174-75. Print.
- . "Through Time and Bitter Distance." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 150-51. Print.
- . "The Train Dogs." Watson and Pierce 21-22. Print.
- . *The White Wampum*. London: Lane, 1895. Print.
- Keith, W. J. *Canadian Literature in English*. London: Longman, 1985. Print.
- . "Shooting Niagara? Some Pessimistic Thoughts about the Future of English-Canadian Literary Studies." *Essays on Canadian Writing* 51-52 (Winter 1993): 382-97. Print.
- Kelly, Peggy. "Anthologies and the Canonization Process: A Case Study of the English-Canadian Literary Field, 1920-1950." *Studies in Canadian Literature* 25.1 (2000): 73-94. Print.
- Kendrick, William K.F, ed. *Canadian Stories in Verse and Prose*. Toronto: Clarke, Irwin,

1932. Print.
- . *Canadian Stories in Verse and Prose*. New ed. Toronto: Clarke, Irwin, 1936. Print.
- Kirby, William. *Annals of Niagara*. Welland, ON: Tribune, 1896. Print.
- . "Beaumanoir." Watson and Pierce 266-71. Print.
- . "The Canadian Boat Song." Watson and Pierce 272-76. Print.
- . *Canadian Idylls*. Toronto: Rose-Belford, 1882. Print.
- . "Canadians Forever. A National Song." Edwards 219-21. Print.
- . *The Chien d'Or (The Golden Dog): A Legend of Quebec*. New York: Lovell, Adam, Wesson, 1877. Print.
- . *Le Chien d'Or: Légende Canadienne*. Trans. Léon-Pamphile Le May. Montreal: n.p., 1884. Print.
- . *Counter Manifesto to the Annexationists of Montreal*. Edwards 208-19. Print.
- . *Counter Manifesto to the Annexationists of Montreal*. Niagara, ON: Davidson, 1849. Print.
- . *The Golden Dog (Le Chien d'or): A Romance of the Days of Louis Quinze in Quebec*. Montreal: Montreal News, 1897. Print.
- . *The Golden Dog (Le Chien d'or): A Romance of the Days of Louis Quinze in Quebec*. Toronto: Musson, n.d. Print
- . *Le Chien d'or/The Golden Dog: A Legend of Quebec*. Ed. Mary Jane Edwards. CEECT 12. Montreal: McGill-Queen's UP, 2012. Print.
- . "The Hungry Year. Part 1." Daymond and Monkman, Vol. 1 178-81. Print.
- . "The Old Regime." Broadus and Broadus, 1923 ed. 119-32. Print.
- . "The Old Regime." Broadus and Broadus, rev. ed. 91-106. Print.
- . *The U.E.: A Tale of Upper Canada*. Niagara: n.p., 1859. Print.

- Klinck, Carl F. Foreword. *The History of Emily Montague*. By Frances Brooke. 1769.
 Abr. ed. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1961. v-xiv. Print.
- . *Giving Canada a Literary History: A Memoir*. Ed. Sandra Djwa. Ottawa: Carleton UP,
 1991. Print.
- , ed. *Literary History of Canada: Canadian Literature in English*. Toronto: U of
 Toronto P, 1965. Print.
- Klinck, Carl F., and Reginald E. Watters, eds. *Canadian Anthology*. Toronto: Gage, 1955.
 Print.
- , eds. *Canadian Anthology*. Rev. ed. Toronto: Gage, 1966. Print.
- , eds. *Canadian Anthology*. 3rd ed. Toronto: Gage, 1974. Print.
- . Preface. Klinck and Watters, 1955 ed. xv. Print.
- . Preface. Klinck and Watters, rev. ed. xv. Print.
- . Preface. Klinck and Watters, 3rd ed. xiii. Print.
- Kuester, Martin. "Historical Literature." New, *Encyclopedia* 495-99. Print.
- Laurence, Margaret. *The Diviners*. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1974. Print.
- Lauter, Paul. "Taking Anthologies Seriously." *MELUS* 29.3-4 (Fall/Winter 2004): 19-39.
 Print.
- Lecker, Robert, ed. *Canadian Canons: Essays in Literary Value*. Toronto: U of Toronto P,
 1991. Print.
- . Introduction. Lecker, *Open Country* xxii-xxv. Print.
- . *Keepers of the Code: English-Canadian Literary Anthologies and the Representation
 of Nation*. Forthcoming 2012. Print.
- . *Making It Real: The Canonization of English-Canadian Literature*. Concord, ON:
 Anansi, 1995. Print.

- . "Nineteenth-Century English-Canadian Anthologies and the Making of a National Literature." *Journal of Canadian Studies* 44.1 (Winter 2010): 91-117. Print.
- , ed. *Open Country: Canadian Literature in English*. Toronto: Nelson, 2008. Print.
- . Preface. Lecker, *Open Country* xxi. Print.
- . "Watson and Pierce's *Our Canadian Literature* Anthology and the Representation of Nation." *Canadian Poetry* 38 (Spring/Summer 1996): 49-87. Print.
- Lemoine, J.M. "The First Canadian Novelist, 1769." *Maple Leaves* 7 (1906): 239-45. Print.
- . *Maple Leaves*. 7 vols. Quebec: Hunter, Rose, 1863-96. Print.
- Lighthall, W.D. *Songs of the Great Dominion: Voices from the Forests and Waters, the Settlements and Cities of Canada*. London: Scott, 1889. Print.
- Litt, Paul. *The Muses, the Masses, and the Massey Commission*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1992. Print.
- Logan, John Daniel, and Donald Graham French. *Highways of Canadian Literature: A Synoptic Introduction to the Literary History of Canada (English) from 1760 to 1924*. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1924. Print.
- Lyon, George W. "Pauline Johnson: A Reconsideration." *Studies in Canadian Literature* 15.2 (1990): 136-59. Print.
- MacLaren, I.S. "Wacousta and the Gothic Tradition." *Recovering Canada's First Novelist: Proceedings from the John Richardson Conference*. Ed. Catherine Sheldrick Ross. Erin, ON: Firefly Books, 1984. 49-62. Print.
- McCarthy, Dermot. "Sisters Under the Mink: The Correspondent Fear in *The History of Emily Montague*." *Essays on Canadian Writing* 51-52 (Winter/Spring 1993): 340-57. Print.

McMullen, Lorraine. *An Odd Attempt in a Woman: The Literary Life of Frances Brooke*.

Vancouver: U of British Columbia P, 1983. Print.

Millot, Abbé. *Elements of the History of England, From the Invasion of the Romans to the*

Reign of George the Second. Trans. Frances Brooke. Dublin: James Williams,

1771. Web. 17 Oct. 2010.

Monk, Patricia. "William Kirby." *Dictionary of Literary Biography: 99 Canadian Writers*

Before 1890. Ed. William H. New. Detroit: Gale, 1990. 186-190. Print.

Monture, Rick. "'Beneath the British Flag': Iroquois and Canadian Nationalism in the

Work of E. Pauline Johnson and Duncan Campbell Scott." *Essays on Canadian*

Writing 75 (Winter 2002): 118-141. Print.

Moodie, Susanna. "Achbor: An Oriental Tale." Edwards 167-72. Print.

---. "Adieu to the Woods." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 139. Print.

---. "Adieu to the Woods." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 122. Print.

---. "Adieu to the Woods." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 119-26. Print.

---. "Adieu to the Woods." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 97. Print.

---. "Adieu to the Woods." Lecker, *Open Country* 58-65. Print.

---. "Adieu to the Woods." Sugars and Moss 227. Print.

---. "The Bear." Broadus and Broadus, 1923 ed. 183-86. Print.

---. "Brian, the Still-Hunter." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 129-35. Print.

---. "Brian, the Still-Hunter." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 112-18. Print.

---. "Brian, the Still-Hunter." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 101-09. Print.

---. "Brian, the Still-Hunter." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 88-93. Print.

---. "Brian, the Still-Hunter." Lecker, *Open Country* 48-58. Print.

---. "Brian, the Still-Hunter." Sugars and Moss 221-26. Print.

- . "Brian the Still-Hunter." Weaver and Toye, 1973 ed. 340-46. Print.
- . "Burning the Fallow." Broadus and Broadus, 1923 ed. 179-83. Print.
- . "The Canadian Herd Boy." Broadus and Broadus, 1923 ed. 20. Print.
- . "The Canadian Herd-Boy." Smith, *Book of Canadian Poetry* 1943 ed. 61. Print.
- . "The Canadian Herd-Boy." Smith, *Book of Canadian Poetry* rev. ed. 74-75. Print.
- . "The Canadian Herd-Boy." Smith, *Book of Canadian Poetry* 3rd ed. 74-75. Print.
- . "Early Canadian Periodicals." Klinck and Watters, 1955 ed. 56-60. Print.
- . "Early Canadian Periodicals." Klinck and Watters, rev. ed. 63-66. Print.
- . "Early Canadian Periodicals." Klinck and Watters, 3rd ed. 57-59. Print.
- . "The Fever of Immigration (from the Introduction)." Smith, *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings* 161-63. Print.
- . "The Fire." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 135-39. Print.
- . "The Fire." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 118-22. Print.
- . "The Fire." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 110-13. Print.
- . "The Fire." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 93-97. Print.
- . "The Fisherman's Light." Smith, *Book of Canadian Poetry* 1943 ed. 61-62. Print.
- . "The Fisherman's Light." Smith, *Book of Canadian Poetry* rev. ed. 75-76. Print.
- . "The Fisherman's Light." Smith, *Book of Canadian Poetry* 3rd ed. 75-76. Print.
- . *Flora Lyndsay; or Passages in an Eventful Life*. London: Bentley, 1854. Print.
- . *Geoffrey Moncton*. New York: De Wielt and Davenport, 1856. Print.
- . "The Indian Fisherman's Light." Klinck and Watters, rev. ed. 66. Print.
- . "The Indian Fisherman's Light." Klinck and Watters, 3rd ed. 59. Print.
- . "Introduction." Daymond and Monkman, Vol. 1 152-55. Print.
- . "Introduction [to *Life in the Clearings*]." Sugars and Moss 229-30. Print.

- . "Introduction [to *Roughing it In the Bush*]." Sugars and Moss 211-14. Print.
- . "Introduction to the Third Edition." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 110-12. Print.
- . "Introduction to the Third Edition." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 94-97. Print.
- . "Introduction to the Third Edition." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 78-80. Print.
- . "Introduction to the Third Edition." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 71-73. Print.
- . "A Journey to the Woods." Broadus and Broadus, 1923 ed. 169-78. Print.
- . "A Journey to the Woods." Broadus and Broadus, rev. ed. 149-60. Print.
- . "from *Life in the Clearings versus the Bush*." Klinck and Watters, 1955 ed. 50-55.
 Print.
- . *Life in the Clearings versus the Bush*. London: Bentley, 1853. Print.
- . "The Maple-Tree." Broadus and Broadus, 1923 ed. 18-20. Print.
- . *Mark Hurdlestone; or, the Goldworshipper*. London: Bentley, 1853. Print.
- . *Matrimonial Speculations*. London: Bentley, 1854. Print.
- . "The Oath of the Canadian Volunteers, a Loyal Song for Canada." Edwards 173.
 Print.
- . "Old Woodruff and His Three Wives. A Canadian Sketch." Edwards 174-82. Print.
- . "On First Seeing Quebec." Watson and Pierce 181. Print.
- . "Our First Settlement." Sugars and Moss 218-21. Print.
- . "Our First Settlement, and the Borrowing System." Lecker, *Open Country* 35-48.
 Print.
- . "The Outbreak." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 114-19. Print.
- . "Quebec." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 88-89. Print.
- . *Roughing it in the Bush: or, Life in Canada*. London: Bentley, 1852. Print.
- . "A Settler's Wife Alone at Night." Robins 37-41. Print.

- . "Uncle Joe and His Family." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 117-29. Print.
- . "Uncle Joe and His Family." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 100-12. Print.
- . "Uncle Joe and His Family." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 90-101. Print.
- . "Uncle Joe and His Family." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 76-87. Print.
- . "Uncle Joe and His Family." Smith, *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings* 163-72. Print.
- . "Uncle Joe and His Family." Smith, *The Canadian Experience* 56-64. Print.
- . "A Visit to Grosse Isle." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 112-17. Print.
- . "A Visit to Grosse Isle." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 97-100. Print.
- . "A Visit to Grosse Isle." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 81-88. Print.
- . "A Visit to Grosse Isle." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 73-76. Print.
- . "A Visit to Grosse Isle." Daymond and Monkman, Vol. 1 155-64. Print.
- . "A Visit to Grosse Isle." Lecker, *Open Country* 28-35. Print.
- . "A Visit to Grosse Isle." Sugars and Moss 214-18. Print.
- . "A Word for the Novel Writers." Klinck and Watters, rev. ed. 58-63. Print.
- Moss, John. Introduction. *Wacousta: A Critical Edition*. By John Richardson. Ed. John Moss. Ottawa: Tecumseh, 1998. ix-xi. Print.
- . *Patterns of Isolation in English Canadian Fiction*. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1974. Print.
- Moss, Laura. "A Literary Biography of Frances Brooke." *The History of Emily Montague*. Ed. Laura Moss. Ottawa: Tecumseh, 2001. 355-64. Print.
- Moss, Laura, and Cynthia Sugars, eds. *Canadian Literature in English: Texts and Contexts*. Vol. 2. 2 vols. Toronto: Pearson, 2009. Print.
- New, W.H. "Canon, Canonicity." New, *Encyclopedia* 176. Print.

- , ed. *Encyclopedia of Literature in Canada*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 2002. Print.
- . *A History of Canadian Literature*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's UP, 2003. Print.
- Northey, Margot. *The Haunted Wilderness: The Gothic and Grotesque in Canadian Fiction*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1976. Print.
- . *William Kirby and His Works*. Toronto: ECW, 1990. Print.
- Pacey, Desmond. *Creative Writing in Canada: A Short History of English-Canadian Literature*. Westport, CT: Greenwood, 1961. Print.
- . "The First Canadian Novel," *Dalhousie Review* 26 (July 1946): 143-50. Print.
- Parker, George L. *The Beginnings of the Book Trade in Canada*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1985. Print.
- , ed. *The Evolution of Canadian Literature in English: 1916-1945*. Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1973. Print.
- Parker, Gilbert. *The Seats of the Mighty*. Toronto: Copp, Clark, 1896. Print.
- . "The Fall of Quebec." Broadus and Broadus, 1923 ed. 132-48. Print.
- . "The Fall of Quebec." Broadus and Broadus, 2nd ed. 106-25. Print.
- Peterman, Michael A. Introduction. *Roughing It in the Bush: Authoritative Text, Backgrounds, Criticism*. By Susanna Moodie. Ed. Michael A. Peterman. New York: Norton, 2007. vii-xvii. Print.
- Pierce, Lorne Albert. Foreword. *The Autobiography of Oliver Goldsmith*. Ed. Wilfrid E. Myatt. Toronto: Ryerson, 1943. vii-ix. Print.
- . Introduction to Prose Section. Watson and Pierce 123-29. Print.
- Prince, Mary. *The History of Mary Prince, a West Indian Slave*. London: Westley and Davis, 1831. Print.
- Reaney, James. *Wacousta!* Toronto: Press Porcépic, 1978. Print.

Rev. of *Our Canadian Literature: Representative Prose and Verse*. *The Globe and Mail*.

Saturday 20 Jan. 1923. 20. Print.

Rev. of *Roughing It in the Bush*. Sugars and Moss 228-29. Print.

Riccoboni, Marie Jeanne de Heurles Laboras de Mezières. *The Letters of Lady Juliet*

Catesby to her Friend, Lady Henrietta Campley. Trans. Frances Brooke. London:

Dodsley, 1760. Web. 18 Oct. 2010.

Richardson, John. "The Battle of Moraviantown and Death of Tecumseh." Smith, *The*

Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings 124-31. Print.

---. "from *The Canadian Brothers, or the Prophecy Fulfilled*." Klinck and Watters, 1955

ed. 18-24. Print.

---. *The Canadian Brothers; or, The Prophecy Fulfilled*. Montreal: Armour and Ramsay,

1840. Print.

---. "The Conspiracy of Pontiac." Broadus and Broadus, 1923 ed. 148-69. Print.

---. "The Conspiracy of Pontiac." Broadus and Broadus, rev. ed. 125-38. Print.

---. *Ecarté; or, The Salons of Paris*. London: Colburn, 1829. Print.

---. *Eight Years in Canada*. Montreal: Cunningham, 1847. Print.

---. "Fort Michilimackinac." Daymond and Monkman, Vol. 1 138-45. Print.

---. "Pontiac at Fort Detroit." Watson and Pierce 291-97. Print.

---. *Tecumseh; or, the Warrior of the West*. London: Glynn, 1828. Print.

---. "A Trip to Walpole Island and Port Sarnia." Edwards 148-62. Print.

---. *Wacousta: A Critical Edition*. Ed. John Moss. Ottawa: Tecumseh, 1998. Print.

---. *Wacousta; or, the Prophecy: A Tale of the Canadas*. London: Cadell, 1832. Print.

---. "from *War of 1812*." Klinck and Watters, rev. ed. 32-35. Print.

---. "from *War of 1812*." Klinck and Watters, 3rd ed. 31-34. Print.

- . *War of 1812*. 1842. Toronto: Historical Pub., 1902. Print.
- Roberts, Charles G.D. *The Collected Letters of Sir Charles G.D. Roberts*. Ed. Laurel Boone. Fredericton, NB: Goose Lane, 1989. Print.
- Robins, John D. Introduction. Robins xiii-xiv. Print.
- , ed. *A Pocketful of Canada*. Toronto: Collins, 1946. Print.
- Saukamapee. "Life among the Peigans." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 2-10. Print.
- . "Life among the Peigans." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 2-10. Print.
- Scott, Duncan Campbell. "The Forsaken." Robins 229-31. Print.
- . "Night Hymns on Lake Nipigon." Robins 172-73. Print.
- . "The Onondaga Madonna." Robins 181. Print.
- Sellwood, Jane. "Brooke, Frances." New, *Encyclopedia* 156-58. Print.
- Shrive, Norman. "What Happened to Pauline?" *Canadian Literature* 13 (Summer 1962): 25-38. Print.
- Smith, A.J.M., ed. *The Book of Canadian Poetry: A Critical and Historical Anthology*. Toronto: Gage, 1943. Print.
- , ed. *The Book of Canadian Poetry: A Critical and Historical Anthology*. Rev. ed. Toronto: Gage, 1948. Print.
- , ed. *The Book of Canadian Poetry: A Critical and Historical Anthology*. 3rd ed. Toronto: Gage, 1957. Print.
- , ed. *The Book of Canadian Prose: The Canadian Century: English-Canadian Writing Since Confederation*. Toronto: Gage, 1973. Print.
- , ed. *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings to Confederation*. Toronto: Gage, 1965. Print.
- , ed. *The Canadian Experience: A Brief Survey of English-Canadian Prose*. Toronto:

- Gage, 1974. Print.
- . Introduction. Smith, *The Book of Canadian Poetry* 1943 ed. 3-34. Print.
- . Introduction. Smith, *The Book of Canadian Poetry* rev. ed. 3-34. Print.
- . Introduction. Smith, *The Book of Canadian Poetry* 3rd ed. 1-36. Print.
- . Introduction. Smith, *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings to Confederation* xiii-xxii. Print.
- . Introduction. Smith, *The Canadian Experience* ix-xix. Print
- . Preface. Smith, *The Book of Canadian Poetry* 1943 ed. vii-ix. Print.
- . Preface. Smith, *The Book of Canadian Poetry* rev. ed. vii-ix. Print.
- . Preface. Smith, *The Book of Canadian Poetry* 3rd ed. vii-ix. Print.
- . Preface. Smith, *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings* xi-xii. Print.
- Stacey, Robert. "Romance, Pastoral Romance, and the Nation in History: Reading William Kirby's *The Golden Dog* and Philippe-Joseph Aubert de Gaspé's *Les anciens canadiens*." *ReCalling Early Canada: Reading the Political in Literary and Cultural Production*. Eds. Jennifer Blair et al. Edmonton: U of Alberta P, 2005. 91-117. Print.
- Stephen, A.M., ed. *The Voice of Canada: A Selection of Prose and Verse*. Toronto: Dent, 1927. Print.
- Strong-Boag, Veronica, and Carole Gerson. *Paddling Her Own Canoe: The Times and Texts of E. Pauline Johnson, Tekahionwake*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 2000. Print.
- Struthers, J.R. "Anthologies." New, *Encyclopedia* 31-35. Print.
- Sugars, Cynthia, and Laura Moss, eds. *Canadian Literature in English: Texts and Contexts*. Vol. 1. 2 vols. Toronto: Pearson, 2009. Print.
- . Preface. Sugars and Moss xi-xx. Print.

Swayze, J.F., ed. *The Voice of Canada: A Selection of Prose and Verse*. Rev. ed. Toronto: Dent, 1946. Print.

Thurston, John. "Moodie, Susanna Strickland." New, *Encyclopedia* 752-55. Print.

---. *The Work of Words: The Writing of Susanna Strickland Moodie*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's UP, 1996. Print.

Trails, Catharine Parr. *The Backwoods of Canada: Being Letters from the Wife of an Emigrant Officer, Illustrative of the Domestic Economy of British North America*. London: Knight, 1836. Print.

---. "The Bereavement." Lecker, *Open Country* 21-26. Print.

---. "Candles." Sugars and Moss 207-08. Print.

---. "Introduction." Sugars and Moss 196-99. Print.

---. "Letter 15." Sugars and Moss 199-06. Print.

---. "Letter VIII." Daymond and Monkman, Vol. 1 146-51. Print.

---. "Letter IX." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 102-07. Print.

---. "Letter IX." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 87-91. Print.

---. "Letter IX." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 71-75. Print.

---. "Letter IX." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 64-68. Print.

---. "Letter X." Bennett and Brown, *An Anthology* 107-08. Print.

---. "Letter X." Bennett and Brown, *New Anthology* 91-93. Print.

---. "Letter X." Brown and Bennett, Vol. 1 75-76. Print.

---. "Letter X." Brown, Bennett, and Cooke 68-69. Print.

---. "Maple Sugar." Sugars and Moss 206-07. Print.

---. "A Matter-of-Fact Country." Klinck and Watters, rev. ed. 27-28. Print.

---. "A Matter-of-Fact Country." Klinck and Watters, 3rd ed. 26-27. Print.

- . "Native Wild Flowers." Watson and Pierce 182-83. Print.
- . "A Sleigh Ride." Klinck and Watters, rev. ed. 28-29. Print.
- . "A Sleigh Ride." Klinck and Watters, 3rd ed. 27-28. Print.
- . *Studies of Plant Life in Canada, or Gleanings from Forest, Lake and Plain*. Ottawa: Woodburn, 1885. Print.
- Watson, Albert Durrant. Introduction to Poetry Section. Watson and Pierce 7-13. Print.
- Watson, Albert Durrant, and Lorne Albert Pierce, eds. *Our Canadian Literature: Representative Prose and Verse*. Toronto: Ryerson, 1922. Print.
- Weaver, Robert, and William Toye, eds. *The Oxford Anthology of Canadian Literature*. Toronto: Oxford UP, 1973. Print.
- , eds. *The Oxford Anthology of Canadian Literature*. 2nd ed. Toronto: Oxford UP, 1981. Print.
- . Preface. Weaver and Toye, 1973 ed. iii-xiv. Print.
- . Preface. Weaver and Toye, 2nd ed. xiii-xiv. Print.
- Wyett, Jodi L. "'No place where women are of such importance': Female Friendship, Empire, and Utopia in *The History of Emily Montague*." *Eighteenth-Century Fiction* 16.1 (2003): 33-57. Print.