

**Can a Song Save the World? The Dynamics of Protest Music,
Spirituality, and Violence in the Context of the ‘War on Terror’**

Lauren Michelle Levesque

Thesis submitted to the Faculty of Theology,
Saint Paul University, in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of Doctorate in Theology

Ottawa, Canada
December 31, 2012

© Lauren Michelle Levesque, Ottawa, Canada 2012

Abstract

Can a Song Save the World? The Dynamics of Protest Music, Spirituality, and Violence in the Context of the ‘War on Terror’

In this dissertation, I construct and apply an adequate approach to the study of contemporary protest music in the discipline of spirituality. The purpose of this construction and application is twofold. First, I emphasize the ambiguity, complexity, and multiplicity of protest music as a genre and as a performance space. Second, I seek to broaden what scholars in spirituality consider valuable and viable examples of protest music in their discipline. By valuable and viable, I mean those examples that can act as sources of insight and as methodological frameworks.

The dissertation is divided into five chapters. The first three chapters address issues of methodology. In Chapter One, I contextualize my research by discussing the history of spiritually-motivated peace activism in the United States. I focus on the capacities to imagine and to build a positive peace in the lives and works of particular activists. The examples explored provide precedents for a consideration of an ‘engaged spirituality’ in the contemporary United States. The spaces created by this spirituality, I propose, can be understood as mirroring those generated in protest music performances.

Chapter Two is an examination of the methodological steps needed to construct an adequate approach to the study of protest music. The steps include stating my hypothesis that protest music is a source of insight into the delegitimizing of violence. To substantiate this hypothesis, I discuss working definitions of music, spirituality, and violence and explore the idea of delegitimizing violence in theological, religious, and musical engagements with the ‘war on terror.’

Out of these definitions and explorations, I suggest that an adequate approach to protest music begins by creatively shifting one's methodological starting point from spirituality to music. This shift is evident in the work of select scholars in the discipline of spirituality who examine the dynamics of natural and urban spaces. By dynamics, I mean the relationships that structure these spaces. By effecting a shift from spirituality to spatial dynamics, the scholars discussed broaden their sources of insight. I argue that their scholarship exemplifies the principles of creativity, interdisciplinarity, and literacy.

In Chapter Three, I utilize the above-mentioned principles to construct an adequate approach to protest music. For the purposes of my research, however, the principle of literacy is not geared toward natural and urban spaces but toward the spaces created in musical performance. I therefore discuss the importance of music literacy in this chapter. Although creativity, interdisciplinarity, and music literacy are extant in select works on popular music in theology, religious studies, and spirituality, I query whether approaches that use spirituality as their starting point are adequate for the study of protest music written in response to the 'war on terror.' To answer this question, I 'follow the flow' of protest music performances in Chapter Four. By following the flow, I mean understanding these performances according to protest music scholarship.

Chapter Four comprises an application of the constructed approach to popular music performances, including those of protest music. I not only use musical performance as my starting point but also demonstrate literacy in protest music scholarship. The understandings provided by this scholarship suggest that performance is a space in which those participating imagine and live out alternative ways of being in the world; alternatives with the prospect of contributing to peaceful social and political

change. I discuss the performances of Neil Young's 2006 "Living With War" album as an in-depth example of these alternatives.

In Chapter Five, I weave together comments on protest music, space, and spirituality. Based on this weaving, in the Conclusion, I suggest that protest music performances can be used as methodological frameworks to re-vision engaged spirituality. One re-visioning is that scholars in the discipline of spirituality can be understood as artists who create imaginative and performative spaces with which to dream up and live out a more just and peaceful world. Through these spaces, scholars in this discipline contribute to and sustain the hope that options, other than violence and war, exist to address the threat of future terrorist attacks.

Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Introduction	
Contexts and Commitments	1
I. Setting the Stage: The American ‘War on Terrorism’	1
I.2 Outlining My Commitments	2
I.2.1 Creating a Conceptual Space to Contest Violence and War	2
I.2.2 Understanding the Dynamics of Performance Spaces	4
I.3 Originality and Structure of the Dissertation	5

PART I: METHODOLOGY

Chapter 1

The Historical Backdrop for Constructing an Adequate Approach to Contemporary Protest Music in the Discipline of Spirituality	7
1. Introduction	7
1.2 Peace: A Multifaceted Concept	8
1.2.1 Spirituality as a Resource for Peace: Insights from Religious Peacebuilding	9
1.3 Defining a Positive Peace	12
1.3.1 The Dual Capacities of Spiritually-Motivated Activists: Resisting Fear by Imagining and Building a Positive Peace	15
1.3.2 Imagining a Positive Peace: Examples	15
1.3.3 Building a Positive Peace: Examples	17
1.3.4 Two Vocabularies: Vision and Action in Spiritually-Motivated Activism	20
1.4 Vision and Action in American Spiritually-Motivated Peace Activism	22
1.4.1 Envisioning a Reconciling America	22
1.4.2 Envisioning Fortress America	25
1.4.3 Alternatives to Fortress America: Fostering Cultures of Peace	27
1.5 Nonviolence and Spiritually-Motivated Peace Activism in America	29
1.5.1 Principled American Nonviolence in the Twentieth Century	32
1.5.2 Mahatma Gandhi’s Influence	34
1.5.3 Gandhian Nonviolence: Envisioning Truth, Affirming Life	37
Theme I: Satyagraha	37

	Theme II: Ahimsa	40
1.5.4	Martin Luther King, Jr.: Envisioning Community, Manifesting Love	43
	Theme I: The Beloved Community	44
	Theme II: The Commitment to Love	47
1.5.5	Standing on the Shoulders of Giants	49
1.5.6	Examples: Engaged Spirituality in America	51
1.6	The Sacred Work of Engaged Spirituality: Key Learnings	55
1.7	The Imaginative and Performative Dynamics of Engaged Spirituality	57
1.8	Conclusion: Protest Music Performances as a Source of Insight?	59
Chapter 2		
	Methodological Steps For Constructing an Adequate Approach to Contemporary Protest Music in the Discipline of Spirituality	60
2.	Introduction	60
2.1	Hypothesis	60
2.2	Working Definitions	61
2.2.1	Working Definition of Music	61
	Theme I: Music as a Source of Insight	61
	Theme II: Musical Performance as an Act of Social Imagination	65
2.2.2	Working Definition of Spirituality	68
	Theme I: Spirituality as a Basic Human Capacity	69
	Theme II: The Postmodern Context	71
	Theme III: Spiritual Literacy and Pneumatophores	74
2.2.3	Working Definition of Violence	76
	Theme I: Violence as a Legacy	77
	Theme II: Violence as a Cultural Performance	78
	Theme III: The Cultural Construction of Legitimacy	81
	Theme IV: The Poetics of Violence – Legitimizing Violence in our Own Cultures	84
2.3	Shifting Starting Points	86
2.3.1	First Pneumatophore: Contesting Violence	87
2.3.2	Contesting the War: Religious Leaders and Scholars	88
2.3.3	Contesting Violence: Art and the Offering of Different Vantage Points	93
2.3.4	Getting Creative: Musicians Respond to the War	97
2.4	Second Pneumatophore: Shifting One’s Starting Point	100

2.4.1	Examples of Listening: Voices in City Spaces	101
2.4.2	Examples of Listening: Voices on Backcountry Trails	105
2.5	Conclusion: Providing Hope	109
Chapter 3		
Constructing an Adequate Approach for the Study of Contemporary Protest Music in the Discipline of Spirituality		111
3.	Introduction	111
3.1	A Responsible Interdisciplinarity	112
3.1.1	Addressing Terrorism through Interdisciplinarity and Arts Literacy	113
	Theme I: Using the Full Register of Human Intelligence	115
	Theme II: The Arts as a Source of Insight	117
	Theme III: The Importance of Arts Literacy	120
3.2	Said and Barenboim: Why Music Literacy Matters	123
	Theme I: Music as a Humanizing Space	123
	Theme II: Fostering Understanding through Music Literacy	126
	Theme III: The Need for Adequate Approaches to Music Literacy	127
3.3	Listening for Spirit: Understanding and Approaching Music	129
3.3.1	Music and Spirituality	130
3.3.2	Cross-Disciplinary Interest in Music and Spirituality	133
3.3.3	Selected Understandings of and Approaches to Music in Theology	134
3.3.4	Interdisciplinarity and Music Literacy in Music Theology	134
3.3.5	Music Over-Determining Theology: Creativity, Interdisciplinarity, and Music Literacy in Jeremy Begbie's Research	137
3.3.6	Imaginative Openings: Creativity, Interdisciplinarity, and Music Literacy in Heidi Epstein's Research	140
3.4	Popular Music in Theological and Religious Studies Perspectives	144
3.4.1	Anthony Pinn and Robert Beckford: Affirming the Importance of Creativity, Interdisciplinarity, and Music Literacy in Approaches to Popular Music	147
3.4.2	Anthony Pinn: Following the Flow of Rap Music	147
3.4.3	Robert Beckford: Dubbing Jesus	152
3.5	Understandings of and Approaches to Popular Music in the Discipline of Spirituality	156
3.5.1	Don Saliers: Spirituality as the Root of Protest Music	158
3.6	Conclusion	164

PART II: APPLICATION

Chapter 4

Applying a Creative, Interdisciplinary, and Musically Literate Approach to Contemporary Protest Music	166
4. Introduction	166
4.1 Methodological Preferences Explained	167
4.2 Defining Popular Music Performance	167
4.2.1 Creating Space in Popular Music Performance	168
4.2.2 Why Do Performances of Popular Music Matter?	171
Theme I: The ‘Talk’ About Popular Music	172
Theme II: The Ubiquity of Music in Everyday Life	175
Theme III: Commodification and Technology	176
4.3 The Ambiguity of Popular Music Performances	180
Theme I: Radical Ambiguity	181
Theme II: Music as Violence	182
Theme III: Popular Music and the Violent Subjugation of Human Beings	184
4.4 Literacy in Protest Music Performances	186
4.4.1 Themes from John Street’s <i>Music and Politics</i>	187
Theme I: Does Music Make a Difference?	187
Theme II: Popular Music as Imagination and Action	190
Theme III: Protest Music as a Source of Insight and Hope	193
4.4.2 Rob Rostenthal and Richard Flack’s <i>Playing for Change: Music and Musicians in the Service of Social Movements</i>	197
Theme I: Movement Musicking as Process	197
Theme II: Musical Performance as Free Space	201
4.4.3 In-Depth Example: Protest Music Performances in the Context of the ‘War on Terror’	204
4.4.4 Contextualizing Protest Music Performances	204
Theme I: Militarism and Popular Culture in the ‘War on Terror’	205
Theme II: Stories and Spaces in the Aftermath of Terror	208
Theme II Continued: Stories of Healing, Spaces of Hope	210
Theme II Continued: Stories of Danger, Spaces of War	213
Theme II Continued: Critique, Dissent, and Censorship in the Context of the ‘War on Terror’	217
4.4.5 Contesting Space: Neil Young’s “Living With War”	222
Theme I: Justifications for Choosing “Living With War”	223
Theme II: Analysis – The Importance of Dialogue, Community, and Peace as a Viable Alternative to Violence and War	225

Theme III: Protest Music Performances as Sources of Insight and Hope	230
4.5 Conclusion: Vision, Action, and Protest Music Performances	234
Chapter 5	
Weaving a Musical and Spiritual Fabric – A Commentary On Protest Music, Space, and Spiritual Literacy	236
5. Introduction	236
5.1 Spiritual Literacy and the Creation of Space	237
5.2 The Space to Understand and Contest Violence	238
5.3 The Space to Explore Different Vantage Points	242
5.3.1 The Space for Vantage Points: Implications for Methodology	242
5.3.2 The Space for Vantage Points: Implications for Content	245
5.4 The Space to Consider Scholarship as a Creative Process	248
5.5 The Space to Imagine and Build a Reconciling America: New Ideas and Fresh Energy	253
Conclusion	
A Love Song for Music, A Manifesto for Peace	254
6. Introduction	254
6.1 Protest Music Performances as a Methodological Framework	254
Re-envisioning I: Engaged Spirituality as Contesting, Humanizing Space	255
Re-envisioning II: Engaged Spirituality as Performance	256
6.2 A Love Song for Music, A Manifesto for Peace	257
BIBLIOGRAPHY	259

Acknowledgements

In pursuing this research, I was guided and supported by many people. I would like to acknowledge my Director, Dr. Heather Eaton. With patience and persistence, Dr. Eaton provided me with the space to grow as a person and as a scholar. I am deeply grateful for her guidance and friendship while completing my doctorate.

I would also like to thank my committee members, Dr. Kenneth Bush, Dr. Kenneth Melchin, and Dr. Myrtle Power. Their questions and reflections helped to shape my work in its initial stages. Your insights were, and continue to be, greatly appreciated. I must also thank Dr. Pierrette Daviau and Dr. Ramon Martínez de Pisón for opportunities in research and community organizing that contributed to my thinking on spirituality and constructive social change.

I would like to extend my thanks to the Ontario Ministry of Training, Colleges, and Universities, the Grey Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, and Saint Paul University for funding my research as a doctoral student. Thank you for affirmation of my work.

My parents' constancy and generosity were pivotal to the completion of my doctorate. Throughout my life they have been models of love, compassion, and service. They have given all their children the gift of education. We are eternally grateful.

To my partner, François – Your steadfast belief in my abilities was a motivating spark when I felt I couldn't read or write another word. I love you very much.

And, to my nieces, Eloise and Margo – You remind me that, as an aunt and as a scholar, I have a responsibility to make the world a better place. This work is dedicated to you. May you experience a present and a future where people imagine and live out a positive peace rather than violence, terror, and war.

Introduction: Contexts and Commitments

War tests our theories, no less than our received assumptions, our creativity, and our courage.

- Lawrence Rosen, *Anthropological Assumptions and the Afghan War*

I. Setting the Stage: The American ‘War on Terrorism’

The tragic events of September 11, 2001, marked the beginning of the American ‘war on terror.’¹ On that day, members of the Al Qaeda terrorist network hijacked four commercial aircrafts.² Two of the planes brought down the World Trade Center in New York City.³ Another plane targeted the Pentagon in Washington, D.C., and the final plane crashed into a field in Pennsylvania. Three thousand people were killed in the attacks. In an address to the nation on September 20, 2001, former President George W. Bush characterized the attacks as an act of war.⁴ American military action in Afghanistan was subsequently announced on October 7, 2001, in response to this act.⁵

The ‘war on terror’ has been characterized as the former Bush administration’s guiding metaphor or story.⁶ According to Ira Chernus, the administration used the war

¹ Robert P. Watson, “The Politics and History of Terror,” in *America’s War on Terror*, ed. Tom Lansford, Robert P. Watson, and Jack Covarrubias, 2nd ed. (Burlington VT: Ashgate, 2009), 1.

² For an in-depth discussion of Al Qaeda, see Mark Juergensmeyer, *Global Rebellion: Religious Challenges to the Secular State, From Christian Militias to Al Qaeda* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2008).

³ Terry H. Anderson, *Bush’s Wars* (Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2011), ix. Anderson provides a historical analysis of the origins and impacts of former President Bush’s time in the Oval Office.

⁴ George W. Bush, “Address to the Nation,” (September 20, 2001),” under “Historic Speeches – George W. Bush,” <http://www.presidentialrhetoric.com/speeches/09.20.01.print.html> (accessed September 26, 2011).

⁵ Bruce Lincoln, *Holy Terrors: Thinking about Religion after September 11*, 2nd ed. (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 2006), 19.

⁶ Erin Steuter and Deborah Wills, *At War With Metaphor: Media, Propaganda, and Racism in the War on Terror* (Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2008), 7-15. The purpose of understanding the ‘war on terror’ as a story is to enable a shift from religious and/or spiritual engagements with the war to those emerging from the arts, particular popular protest music. I discuss this shift in Chapter Two. Here, I acknowledge that this is not the only way to understand the ‘war on terror.’

to give meaning to September 11.⁷ It became an imaginative framework that shaped people's lives in the aftermath of the attacks.⁸ Stated differently, the 'war on terror' provided a conceptual space in which people could legitimize the use of military action against the 'evil ones' and/or 'evildoers' who would perpetrate terror against the United States.⁹

In this space, United States citizens could feel secure in their need to stand together in a fight against evil.¹⁰ As a result, Chernus suggests that the story of the 'war on terror' enabled Americans to believe that terrorists are monsters.¹¹ The more Americans believed that these monsters were bent on the destruction of their nation the easier it was to conceive of the war as a viable response to terrorist attacks.¹²

I.2 Outlining My Commitments

I.2.1 Creating a Conceptual Space to Contest Violence and War

In my dissertation, I am using the word *space* in two ways. First, I am creating a conceptual space with my dissertation to contest the idea that violence and war can bring about a more just and peaceful world. By creating this space, I am drawing attention to other stories that existed in the American cultural landscape while former President

⁷ Ira Chernus, *Monsters to Destroy: The Neoconservative War on Terror and Sin* (Boulder, CO: Paradigm Publishers, 2006), 1, 3.

⁸ J.W.T. Mitchell, *Cloning Terror: The War of Images, 9/11 to the Present* (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 2011), 13.

⁹ Ira Chernus, "George W. Bush's War on Terrorism and Sin," *Political Theology* 5, no. 4 (2004): 419.

¹⁰ Chernus, "George W. Bush's War on Terrorism and Sin," 417.

¹¹ I discuss American perceptions of the country's enemies in Chapters Two and Four.

¹² Several studies explore the implications of the war's discourses and rhetoric on American culture and public opinion, see Stuart Croft, *Culture, Crisis and America's War on Terror* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2006); François Debrix, *Tabloid Terror: War, Culture, and Geopolitics* (London, UK: Routledge, 2008); Richard Jackson, *Writing the War on Terrorism: Language, Politics and Counter-Terrorism* (Manchester, UK: Manchester University Press, 2005).

Bush was in office (2001-2008). These other stories involve those who called for nonviolent and peaceful alternatives during “the epoch of the ‘war on terror.’”¹³

The idea that a manuscript can act as a conceptual space arises from my readings of John Paul Lederach. Lederach often speaks of the need for a container where communities share, listen, and heal in the aftermath of violence.¹⁴ I understand my dissertation to be a container in this sense, a space where ideas about the legitimacy and viability of violence and war are critically examined and discussed.

This understanding exemplifies a commitment to carry out research that is relevant beyond the walls of the academy. Emilie Townes alludes to the importance of this commitment in her 2009 Presidential Address to the American Academy of Religion. She writes:

Part of what is involved in crafting scholarship that will contribute to the academy and the lives of people beyond the library or our studies or our offices or classrooms is that we think in more expansive ways than our disciplinary homes have often trained us to think with our intellect focused primarily on our scholarly navels. This is tricky business because in doing so, we may also be challenging the holy of holies in many disciplines and reconfiguring the standards of excellence in them.¹⁵

I believe that violence and war are issues that demand a challenging of disciplinary ‘holy of holies.’ This is because they cause “extraordinary horror” and “needless human

¹³ Mitchell, *Cloning Terror: The War of Images*, xix. It should be noted that the ‘war on terror’ was not officially declared over under President Barack Obama. Mitchell explains that the phrase was replaced by the euphemism, ‘Overseas Contingency Operations.’ See Mitchell, *Cloning Terror: The War of Images*, 23-24. Other scholars have commented that the ‘war on terror’ was relinquished in name only by the Obama administration, see Gina Heathcote, “Feminist Reflections on the ‘End’ of the War on Terror,” *Melbourne Journal of International Law* 11, no. 2 (2010): 277-307. As noted, my focus will be on aspects of the ‘war on terror’ during the years of the former Bush administration.

¹⁴ John Paul Lederach and Angela Jill Lederach, *When Blood and Bones Cry Out: Journeys through the Soundscape of Healing and Reconciliation* (St. Lucia, AU: University of Queensland Press, 2010).

¹⁵ Emilie M. Townes, “Walking on the Rim Bones of Nothingness: Scholarship and Activism,” *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 77, no.1 (March 2009): 13.

suffering.”¹⁶ As I discuss in Chapter One, the commitment to contest such horror and suffering has a long history in the lives and works of spiritually-motivated peace activists and scholars. I hope to make a modest contribution to this activism and scholarship with this dissertation.

I.2.2 Understanding the Dynamics of Performance Spaces

The academic discipline of spirituality emerged in the early 1990s with the goal of studying the complexity and multidimensionality of lived spiritual experience.¹⁷ To achieve this goal, the discipline has expanded over the years to include a plethora of subjects that were not, at least explicitly or initially, considered religious.¹⁸ Examples include popular culture, feminism, and ecology. The expansion of what constitutes lived spiritual experience has resulted in a sense that “whenever human experience found its edges, reached beyond the purely material, touched the sublime or mysterious, or crossed boundaries that were not physical it seemed to have entered the realm of spirituality.”¹⁹

In my research, I am committed to studying the complex and multifaceted spaces produced in protest music performances. This commitment builds on the idea that spirituality touches all aspects of lived human experience. Thus, the second way in which I use the word *space* in my dissertation is in relation to musical performance. By exploring the spaces created in particular performances, I construct and apply an adequate understanding of and approach to contemporary protest music in the discipline

¹⁶ David P. Barash and Charles P. Webel, *Peace and Conflict Studies*, 2nd ed. (Los Angeles, CA: Sage Publications, 2009), 16.

¹⁷ Sandra M. Schneiders, “Spirituality and the God Question,” *Spiritus* 10, no. 2 (Fall 2010): 245.

¹⁸ Schneiders, “Spirituality and the God Question,” 247.

¹⁹ Schneiders, “Spirituality and the God Question,” 247.

of spirituality. I discuss what I mean by space in relation to musical performance in subsequent chapters.

I.3 Originality and Structure of the Dissertation

The originality of this dissertation lies in two aspects. The first is the ways it has been woven together. A useful image for the reader, in this regard, is that of a song's 'musical fabric.'²⁰ This fabric is made of different, interlinking musical layers. Whether the bass beat, the melody, or the harmonic filler, each layer contributes to the overall texture of a song. My research has been similarly envisioned, with its scholarly contribution emerging from the ways the arguments, ideas, and themes presented in each chapter make up a coherent whole.

The second aspect of originality is the situation of my research within a particular methodological trajectory in the discipline of spirituality. This trajectory involves the shifting of one's starting points and is elaborated on in Chapter Two. My focus in subsequent chapters is less on evaluating the pros and cons of this trajectory and more on providing a unique example of its possibilities with protest music.

The dissertation is divided into five chapters. The first three chapters address issues of methodology. In Chapter One, I contextualize my research by discussing its historical backdrop. By historical backdrop, I mean the precedents that highlight the long history of spiritually-motivated peace activism in the United States.

In Chapter Two, I discuss the methodological steps needed for constructing an adequate approach to contemporary protest music in the discipline of spirituality. This

²⁰ Allan F. Moore, *Song Means: Analysis and Interpreting Recorded Popular Song* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2012), 19-28.

involves stating my hypothesis, introducing my working definitions, and exploring the idea of delegitimizing violence in theological, religious, and musical engagements with the ‘war on terror.’ I conclude the chapter by examining the creativity of scholars in spirituality *vis a vis* their sources of insight. Based on these discussions, I construct an approach to contemporary protest music in Chapter Three. This approach is built on the principles of creativity, interdisciplinarity, and music literacy.

Chapters Four and Five provide a twofold application of the above-mentioned approach. First, using this approach, I demonstrate literacy in protest music scholarship in Chapter Four. The literacy demonstrated highlights the ambiguity, complexity, and multiplicity of protest music performances. It is also a basis for discussing particular performances as spaces in which those participating challenged stories that legitimized the use of violence during the ‘war on terror.’

Second, I comment on some of the connections that can be made between protest music, space, and spiritual literacy in Chapter Five. Ideas gleaned through the application of a creative, interdisciplinary, and musically literate approach in Chapter Four are the centerpiece of this commentary. In the Conclusion, I reflect on the potential use of protest music performances as a methodological framework in the discipline of spirituality. This discussion represents topics for future research into the roles that spirituality can play in the pursuit of a more just and peaceful world.

Chapter One: The Historical Backdrop for Constructing an Adequate Approach to Contemporary Protest Music in the Discipline of Spirituality

A primary block to the establishment of peace is not so much the actual difficulty of achieving it but rather the **feeling** that it is impossible, the inability or refusal of many people to imagine peace as a realistic prospect. Before anything can be done, it must be imagined first.

- David Barash and Charles Webel, emphasis in original

One of the missions of Christian nonviolence is to restore a different standard of practical judgment in social conflicts. This means that the Christian humility of nonviolent action must establish itself in the minds and memories of modern man [sic] not only as **conceivable** and **possible**, but as a **desirable alternative** to what he now considers the only realistic possibility: namely political technique backed by force.

- Thomas Merton, emphasis in original

1. Introduction

The purpose of this chapter is to discuss some of the historical roots of spiritually-motivated peace activism in the United States. By discussing these roots, I am establishing that spirituality has been and continues to be conceptualized as a resource for imagining and building a positive peace. In the first section of the chapter, I define a positive peace. I then provide examples of the ways spiritually-motivated activists have promoted this peace in several different contexts.

In the second section, I narrow my discussion to the history of spiritually-motivated peace activism in the United States. I briefly discuss the influence of Mohandas K. Gandhi on Martin Luther King, Jr., leader of the American Civil Rights movement. I suggest that contemporary examples of what has been called ‘engaged spirituality’ build on the visionary and action-oriented legacies of figures such as King. By exploring the vision and action of spiritually-motivated activists, I am highlighting

the imaginative and performative dynamics inherent to engaged spirituality. I discuss the significance of these dynamics in a subsequent section of the chapter.

1.2 Peace: A Multifaceted Concept

Like any other concept, peace can be defined in multiple ways. The meaning of peace can be influenced by context, disciplinary presuppositions, and/or the political agenda out of which the concept is promoted. In relationship to spirituality, peace has been described as both a search and a mandate. For example, the search for a “peaceful heart” has been put forward as foundational to a socially and ecologically engaged spirituality.¹ Another example is the celebration of the spiritually-motivated “peace mandates” of cultures contesting the excessive use of military power as described in Sharon Welch’s study *After Empire*.²

Given these examples, it is not surprising that spirituality is often conceptualized as a resource for achieving peace. According to Donald Rothberg:

Out of such [religious and spiritual] traditions have come the principles of justice, nonviolence, interdependence, and equality; visions of peace, reconciliation, and the ‘beloved community,’ analyses of the roots of suffering and injustice; an emphasis on cultivating core virtues, such as love, compassion, courage, patience, equanimity, and wisdom; and the life stories of numerous exemplary figures.³

Recent studies exploring the spiritual resources for peace in the world’s major traditions affirm Rothberg’s ideas. These studies include the volume *Religion and Peacebuilding*, which examines the relationship between spirituality and peace in eight of the world’s

¹ Roger S. Gottlieb, *A Spirituality of Resistance: Finding a Peaceful Heart and Protecting the Earth* (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 2003), 4-5.

² Sharon D. Welch, *After Empire: the Art and Ethos of Enduring Peace* (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2004), xvii.

³ Donald Rothberg, “The Spirit of Change: Spiritual and Religious Resources for Peace and Justice Movements,” in *Peace Movements Worldwide: History and Vitality of Peace Movements*, eds. Marc Pilisuk and Michael N. Nagler, vol. 1 (Santa Barbara, CA: Praeger, 2011), 113.

major traditions.⁴ Another volume profiles thirteen spiritually-motivated activists from different cultures that have contributed to peace in their respective communities.⁵ The Tanenbaum Center for Interreligious Understanding, which produced the study, promotes the public profile and impact of these types of activists.⁶

In the next section, I examine some of the insights that emerge from these and related studies concerning the conceptualization of spirituality as a resource for peace. The purpose of the discussion is to problematize this conceptualization. By problematize, I mean weighing the benefits and challenges of understanding spirituality in this way. Weighing the benefits and challenges of this understanding provides a critical foundation from which to define peace more specifically in the context of my research project.

1.2.1 Spirituality as a Resource for Peace: Insights from Religious Peacebuilding

Religious peacebuilding can be defined in several ways. For example, it has been described as both a field of study and as a movement in religious circles in the international community.⁷ Another definition states that religious peacebuilding is “the range of activities performed by religious actors and institutions for the purpose of resolving and transforming deadly conflict, with the goal of building social relations and

⁴ Harold Coward and Gordon S. Smith, eds., *Religion and Peacebuilding* (Albany, NY: State University of New York, 2004).

⁵ David Little, ed., with the Tanenbaum Center for Interreligious Understanding, *Peacemakers in Action: Profiles of Religion in Conflict Resolution* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2007).

⁶ The Tanenbaum Center for Interreligious Understanding, “Peace: Religion and Conflict Resolution,” The Tanenbaum Center for Interreligious Understanding, under “Programs: Conflict Resolution,” <https://www.tanenbaum.org/programs/peace> (accessed December 2, 2011).

⁷ Katrien Hertog, *The Complex Reality of Religious Peacebuilding: Conceptual Contributions and Critical Analysis* (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 2010), 1.

political institutions characterized by an ethos of tolerance and nonviolence.”⁸ With its focus on the ways faith-based activists nonviolently resolve and transform conflict, literature on religious peacebuilding can provide insight into some of the benefits and challenges of conceptualizing spirituality as a resource for peace.

One of the benefits is strengthening the idea that spirituality concerns more than individual well-being.⁹ Katrien Hertog explains that spiritual leaders often make a distinction between the “spiritual core of religious traditions and the outer shell of religiosity, such as religious ritual and symbols.”¹⁰ In their understanding, spirituality is conceived as something that unifies and supports collective well-being. This is in contrast to religion, which some spiritual leaders feel creates division when too much emphasis is placed on external differences.¹¹ To navigate these differences, spiritual leaders stress the cultivation of inner peace as a vital step for sustaining larger processes of nonviolent conflict resolution and transformation.¹² Spirituality as a resource for peace should involve, therefore, both the cultivation of individual well-being and the well-being of communities.

⁸ David Little and Scott Appleby, “A Moment of Opportunity? The Promise of Religious Peacebuilding in an Era of Religious and Ethnic Conflict,” in *Religion and Peacebuilding*, ed. Harold Coward and Gordon S. Smith (Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2004), 5.

⁹ See Joseph Kundel, “The Spiritual Side of Peacemaking,” in *Spiritual and Political Dimensions of Nonviolence and Peace*, ed. David Boersema and Katy Gray Brown (Amsterdam, NL: Rodopi, 2006), 31-41; Michael N. Nagler, “On Meditation,” in *Peace Movements Worldwide: Peace Efforts that Work and Why*, ed. Marc Pilisuk and Michael N. Nagler, vol. 3 (Santa Barbara, CA: Praeger, 2011), 277-283.

¹⁰ Hertog, *The Complex Reality of Religious Peacebuilding*, 36.

¹¹ Hertog, *The Complex Reality of Religious Peacebuilding*, 36.

¹² Hertog, *The Complex Reality of Religious Peacebuilding*, 35.

One of the challenges of conceptualizing spirituality as a resource for peace is its capacity to legitimize violence.¹³ Scott Appleby refers to this capacity as “the ambivalence of the sacred.”¹⁴ This ambivalence is evident in his use of the term, “religious militant.” Religious militants, understood by Appleby as those engaged in warfare, can be both extremists and/or peacemakers.¹⁵ Extremists are those who use violence to achieve their religious goals. In contrast, peacemakers are committed to the cessation of violence.¹⁶ Appleby writes: “Both types ‘go to the extremes’ of self-sacrifice in devotion to the sacred; both claim to be ‘radical,’ or rooted in and renewing the fundamental truths of their religious traditions.”¹⁷ Other scholars have acknowledged this ambivalence in their studies on spirituality and violence.¹⁸

By acknowledging spirituality’s capacity to legitimize violence, these scholars caution against simplistic understandings of its role as a resource for peace. By simplistic, they mean not critiquing the assumption that spirituality is inherently peaceful. Mark Juergensmeyer’s studies on the rise of contemporary religiously-motivated violence address this problem.¹⁹ His studies demonstrate that spirituality can be used to legitimize violence despite the directives for peace that many spiritual

¹³ Jerald Richards, “Spirituality, Religion, Violence and Nonviolence,” in *Spiritual and Political Dimensions of Nonviolence and Peace*, ed. David Borsema and Katy Gray Brown (Amsterdam, NL: Rodopi, 2006), 9-29.

¹⁴ R. Scott Appleby, *The Ambivalence of the Sacred: Religion, Violence and Reconciliation* (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 2000).

¹⁵ Appleby, *The Ambivalence of the Sacred*, 11.

¹⁶ Appleby, *The Ambivalence of the Sacred*, 11, 13.

¹⁷ Appleby, *The Ambivalence of the Sacred*, 11.

¹⁸ Sharon Erickson Nepstad, “Religion, Violence, and Peacemaking,” *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 43, no. 3 (2004): 297-301; Richards, “Spirituality, Religion, Violence and Nonviolence,” 9-29.

¹⁹ Mark Juergensmeyer, *Terror in the Mind of God: The Global Rise of Religious Violence*, 3rd ed. (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2003); Juergensmeyer, *Global Rebellion: Religious Challenges to the Secular State*.

adherents feel to be at the heart of their traditions. In this regard, Clinton Bennett suggests that spiritual adherents need to honestly evaluate the role that their traditions have played in certain conflicts.²⁰ Such honesty underscores that no one spirituality can claim to be the most important or most effective resource for peace.

The principal insight that Bennett and others provide is that the relationship between spirituality and peace is complex. I affirm this complexity in the next section by defining a positive peace and establishing its relationship to spirituality. Here, the point is that scholars conceptualizing spirituality as a resource for peace should begin by acknowledging the ambivalence and complexity at the heart of this relationship. Robert Schreiter writes: “No discussion today of peacemaking can avoid examining, at least in some measure, what religion contributes to the promotion of violence.”²¹ In the next section, I provide a definition of peace pertinent to my research.

1.3 Defining a Positive Peace

A definition of peace pertinent to my research is that of a ‘positive peace.’ A positive peace can be said to mirror what many cultural and spiritual traditions believe to be an important social and political goal.²² This goal includes a reality far more broad than the absence of war and is encapsulated in concepts such as the Arabic *salaam* and the Hebrew *shalom*.²³ These concepts speak to conditions of “well-being, wholeness,

²⁰ Clinton Bennett, *In Search of Solutions: The Problem of Religion and Conflict* (London, UK: Equinox, 2008), 7.

²¹ Robert J. Schreiter, “Grassroots Artisans of Peace,” in *Artisans of Peace: Grassroots Peacemaking among Christian Communities*, ed. Mary Ann Cejka and Thomas Bamat (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2003), 296.

²² Barash and Webel, *Peace and Conflict Studies*, 8.

²³ For more on the significance of these terms, see M. Darrol Bryant, “Shanti, Shalom, Salaam: Reflections on the Quest for a Culture of Peace,” *Dialogue and Alliance* 22, no. 1 (Spring/Summer 2008): 75-89.

and harmony within oneself, a community, and among all nations and peoples.”²⁴ They point to a reality that has been referred to as a positive peace.

A positive peace denotes “the simultaneous presence of many desirable states of mind and society such as harmony, justice, equity, etc.”²⁵ In contrast to a ‘negative peace,’ that can be defined as a state in which there is no operative military violence, a positive peace signifies the presence of a just social order; one in which subtler forms of violence such as exploitation and discrimination are absent.²⁶ Stated differently, a positive peace is understood as a continuous and encompassing reality.

Implicit in this understanding is the idea that, in the absence of war, subtler forms of violence can inhibit individuals and communities from flourishing.²⁷ Johan Galtung explains more fully the difference between a negative and a positive peace:

If our focus is violence avoidance or prevention – and this applies not only to direct violence but also to structural violence (in which the social order directly or indirectly causes human suffering or structural violence) – then negative peace is the right term for what we seek. However, if our focus is to realize ever higher levels of violence-avoidance togetherness (beyond bleak words of mere tolerance), and if we are interested in cooperating on joint projects that carry all parties to higher levels of human existence – all the way into the spiritual and the transcendental, with no fear of treading precisely where the angels tread – then we need to seek a positive peace.²⁸

Another way of conceptualizing the focus Galtung describes is to speak of peace as indivisible.²⁹ This means that peace is not merely the absence of war but also the absence of fear and the presence of justice.³⁰ From a spiritual perspective, peace as

²⁴ Barash and Webel, *Peace and Conflict Studies*, 9.

²⁵ Barash and Webel, *Peace and Conflict Studies*, 4.

²⁶ Barash and Webel, *Peace and Conflict Studies*, 7.

²⁷ Barash and Webel, *Peace and Conflict Studies*, 9.

²⁸ Johan Galtung, foreword to *Building New Pathways to Peace*, ed. Noriko Kawamura, Yoichiro Murakami, and Shin Chiba (Seattle, WA: University of Washington Press, 2011), viii.

²⁹ Ursula Franklin, *The Ursula Franklin Reader: Pacifism as a Map* (Toronto, ON: Between the Lines, 2006), 77.

³⁰ Franklin, *The Ursula Franklin Reader*, 69-71, 106.

indivisible suggests that it is not simply a good feeling that individuals cultivate.³¹

Peace is inextricably linked to conditions of justice, harmony, and equity in society as a whole. Ursula Franklin clarifies:

Once we have accepted that peace is the realization of the biblical promise of ‘fear not,’ we can see several things in a fresh perspective. We can see that peace has never been won, and can never be won, by instilling fear. Threatening and bullying, making some nations and peoples fearful so that others might fear less, is no way to peace. If we want to work for peace and justice we must be clear that threats and the technological instruments of threat have no place in the promotion of peace. The road to peace is not lined with weapons. The scriptures have said this; we should have known it.³²

When fear permeates people’s everyday lives, they experience an artificial or illusory peace.³³ By artificial and illusory, Franklin means that people are not really living in conditions of harmony, justice, and equity. They are not experiencing peace as a continuous and encompassing reality.

Spiritually-motivated activists have been at the forefront of resisting an artificial or illusory peace for many years and in many different contexts.³⁴ Their resistance has involved the dual capacities of imagining and building alternatives to the idea that fear and instruments of threat can bring about a more just and peaceful world. Before exploring the ways in which spiritually-motivated activists have resisted fear, it is important to recognize that the acts of imagining and building can be used to promote violence and war.

In the wake of September 11, for example, people imagined and constructed images, toys, and t-shirts that gave voice to the idea that violence was an acceptable

³¹ Franklin, *The Ursula Franklin Reader*, 76-79.

³² Franklin, *The Ursula Franklin Reader*, 76-77.

³³ Franklin, *The Ursula Franklin Reader*, 106-113.

³⁴ See Christian Smith, ed., *Disruptive Religion: The Force of Faith in Social Activism* (New York, NY: Routledge, 1996); Walter Wink, ed., *Peace is the Way: Writings on Nonviolence from the Fellowship of Reconciliation* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2000).

response to the attacks.³⁵ One toy depicts Osama bin Laden as a ‘voodoo doll’ with the caption: “Stick it to Him.”³⁶ By posting these creations online, people imagined and contributed to a world they felt would be more just and peaceful. One of the main differences between these acts of imagining and building and those of the spiritually-motivated activists discussed below is the idea that violence cannot bring about a more just and peaceful world. Spiritually-motivated activists believe that this world can only be achieved by imagining and building a positive peace.

1.3.1 The Dual Capacities of Spiritually-Motivated Activists: Resisting Fear by Imagining and Building a Positive Peace

In this section, I provide examples of the ways in which spiritually-motivated activists have demonstrated the capacities to imagine and build a positive peace. By capacity, I simply mean the ways activists use their hearts, hands, and minds, to bring about a more just and peaceful world. I wish to reiterate here that with these examples, I am not suggesting that spiritually-motivated activists are the only persons who demonstrate these capacities. Individuals and communities from different contexts imagine and build to achieve different goals, including the legitimizing of violence.

1.3.2 Imagining a Positive Peace: Examples

Resisting fear begins with the capacity to imagine that another world is possible.³⁷ This capacity often involves conceiving of a conflict situation in a new

³⁵ Karen Engle, *Seeing Ghosts: 9/11 and the Visual Imagination* (Montreal, QC: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2009), 78-112.

³⁶ *Seeing Ghosts: 9/11 and*, 81.

³⁷ In 2001, thousands of activists gathered in Porto Alegre, Brazil, for the first meeting of the World Social Forum. The slogan for that meeting was “Another World Is Possible.” For more on the processes of the global and local forums that emerged in the wake of this initial meeting, see Jackie Smith et al., *Global Democracy and the World Social Forums* (Boulder, CO: Paradigm Publishers, 2008).

light.³⁸ Thinking differently about a conflict opens a space to consider solutions that may not have seemed plausible before. Thus, by using the power of their imagination, people can envision different realities.³⁹ The capacity to imagine enables a divesting of the idea that the realities experienced are inevitable and the issues faced unchangeable.⁴⁰

An example of the power of imagining a different world can be found in the context of decolonizing Indigenous communities. Andrea Smith explains:

At the 2005 World Liberation Theology Forum held in Porto Alegre, Brazil, indigenous peoples from Bolivia stated they knew another world was possible because they see that world whenever they do their ceremonies. Native ceremonies can be a place where present, past and future become copresent, thereby allowing us to engage in what Native Hawaiian scholar Manu Meyer calls a racial remembering of the future. Native communities prior to colonization were not structured on the basis of hierarchy, oppression, or patriarchy... Our understanding that it was possible to order society without structures of oppression in the past tells us that our current political and economic system is anything but natural and inevitable.⁴¹

The description of the Indigenous peoples at the World Liberation Theology Forum suggests some of the ways the act of imagining can be of profound importance to individuals and communities. By imagining a different reality in their ceremonial spaces, the Indigenous peoples were able to think differently about their current situation. Their imaginings were a catalyst for the affirmation that they were not limited by the histories of hierarchy, oppression, and patriarchy that the communities had experienced under colonization. They had viable imaginative frameworks in their

³⁸ Robert J. Schreiter, "The Catholic Social Imaginary and Peacebuilding: Ritual, Sacrament, and Spirituality," in *Peacebuilding: Catholic Theology, Ethics, and Praxis*, ed. Robert J. Schreiter, R. Scott Appleby, and Gerard F. Powers (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2010), 221.

³⁹ Daisaku Ikeda, "Our Power of Peace," in *Hope in a Dark Time: Reflections on Humanity's Future*, ed. David Krieger (Santa Barbara, CA: Capra Press, 2003), 91.

⁴⁰ Ikeda, "Our Power of Peace," 91.

⁴¹ Andrea Smith, "Roundtable Discussion: Native/First Nation Theology. Dismantling the Master's Tools with the Master's House: Native Feminist Liberation Theologies," *Journal of Feminist Studies in Religion* 22, no. 2 (2006): 97.

traditions that could act as alternative resources for cultural, socio-political, and spiritual renewal.

Another example of activists resisting fear by imagining alternatives is the grassroots, women-initiated movement, CODEPINK. The name CODEPINK is a play on the color-coded security system developed by the former Bush administration to alert the public on the severity of terrorist threats.⁴² Co-founders Medea Benjamin and Jodie Evans describe how the movement began with the dreaming and scheming of women on how they could stop the spiral of violence initiated by the September 11 attacks.⁴³

In 2005, the movement published a book that sought to share this dreaming and scheming with a larger audience.⁴⁴ The book invites readers to imagine a world without violence and war, a world that CODEPINK explicitly promotes in its protest actions and social justice campaigns. In their Afterword, Benjamin and Evans encourage readers to imagine what they can contribute to this world of peace and justice. They write:

The struggle to end war will be the culmination of a global movement that rejects violence on the part of individuals, terrorist groups, and nation-states. That's why your contribution, however big or small, makes a difference. With patience, energy, and determination, keep your eyes on the prize: a world that thrives in peace.⁴⁵

1.3.3 Building a Positive Peace: Examples

The examples provided by Smith, Benjamin, and Evans hint at the intrinsic relationship between the capacity to imagine peaceful alternatives and the capacity to build them in the concrete. The Indigenous communities enacted their imagined

⁴² Medea Benjamin and Jodie Evans, preface to *Stop the Next War Now: Effective Responses to Violence and Terrorism* (Maui, HI: Inner Ocean Publishing, Inc., 2005), xv.

⁴³ Benjamin and Evans, preface, xv.

⁴⁴ Medea Benjamin and Jodie Evans, ed., *Stop the Next War Now: Effective Responses to Violence and Terrorism* (Maui, HI: Inner Oceans Publishing Inc., 2005).

⁴⁵ Medea Benjamin and Jodie Evans, afterword to *Stop the Next War Now: Effective Responses to Violence and Terrorism* (Maui, HI: Inner Oceans Publishing Inc., 2005), 225.

alternatives in their ceremonies. CODEPINK's book not only shared an alternative way of envisioning the world but also invited its readers to take action for positive social and political change. Like these activists, some scholars understand the capacity to imagine a positive peace as intrinsically entwined with people's capacity to build it.

For example, extensive experience in situations of deep-rooted conflict has taught John Paul Lederach that building peace is more than a set of skills or techniques. Building peace is a creative act whose well-spring is what he calls the "moral imagination."⁴⁶ The moral imagination is described as "the capacity to imagine something rooted in the challenges of the real world yet capable of giving birth to that which does not yet exist."⁴⁷ He continues: "In reference to peacebuilding, this is the capacity to imagine and to generate constructive responses and initiatives that, rooted in the day-to-day challenges of violence, transcend and ultimately break the grips of those destructive patterns and cycles."⁴⁸ In situations of deep-rooted conflict, Lederach suggests that peacebuilding is both the art of imagining another world and the skills needed to build it.⁴⁹

Lederach's description of the moral imagination in the context of peacebuilding deepens a sense of the interconnection between the capacities to imagine and to build. The root of building peace in communities facing violence is the capacity to give birth to new ideas. These ideas generate initiatives that seek to break the cycles of violence. Such initiatives can include addressing an enemy with respect or risking one's life to

⁴⁶ John Paul Lederach, *The Moral Imagination: The Art and Soul of Building Peace* (Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2005), ix, 182.

⁴⁷ Lederach, *The Moral Imagination*, 29.

⁴⁸ Lederach, *The Moral Imagination*, 29.

⁴⁹ Lederach, *The Moral Imagination*, ix.

bring adversaries to the negotiation table.⁵⁰ The point is that ideas generate the constructive acts that contribute to people's capacities to build peace.

At the Greenham Peace Camp, established in Berkshire, Southern England, between 1981 and 2000, spirituality was a key factor in the ways activists sought to imagine and build a positive peace.⁵¹ The camp emerged as a protest action against the increasing fear and threat of nuclear war.⁵² The Greenham Common airbase housed American, nuclear-tipped missiles that could result in explosions up to sixteen times more powerful than Hiroshima.⁵³ Spirituality at the camp was not uniform, however.⁵⁴ Some participants drew on their Christian roots, while others drew on nature-based, or goddess traditions. Despite this lack of uniformity, these spiritualities shaped the ways participants imagined and lived out their individual and group actions. This included the reenactment of rituals, the songs that were sung, and the peace doves and spider webs that were tied to security fences as small symbols of the belief that peace was a realistic prospect.⁵⁵

Another example where spirituality is intertwined with the capacities to imagine and build peace is the Plowshares Movement. Members of this international movement perform radical acts of nonviolent, civil disobedience against weapons of mass

⁵⁰ Lederach, *The Moral Imagination*, 7-19.

⁵¹ Christina Welch, "The Spirituality of, and at, Greenham Common Peace Camp," *Feminist Theology* 18, no. 2 (2010): 230-248.

⁵² For more on the history of nonviolent resistance at Greenham, see Beth Junor and Katrina Howse, *Greenham Women's Peace Camp: A History of Non-violent Resistance, 1984-1995* (London, UK: Working Press, 1995).

⁵³ Welch, "The Spirituality of, and at, Greenham Common," 231.

⁵⁴ Welch, "The Spirituality of, and at, Greenham Common," 237.

⁵⁵ Welch, "The Spirituality of, and at, Greenham Common," 237, 238-239, 236. For more on the use of song at Greenham Common, see Anna Feigenbaum, "Now I'm a Happy Dyke!": Creating Collective Identity and Queer Community in Greenham Women's Songs," *Journal of Popular Music Studies* 22, no. 4 (2010): 367-388.

destruction.⁵⁶ Civil disobedience can be defined as opposition to the perceived unethical practices of governments.⁵⁷ Plowshares activists imagine alternatives to their governments' perceived sanctioning of violence by drawing on the biblical directive to "beat swords into plowshares" (Mica 4:3).⁵⁸ In 2003, five activists known as the 'Pitstop Plowshares,' acted on this directive by breaking into a hanger at Shannon airbase in Ireland.⁵⁹ Protesting the United States' plans to invade Iraq as part of the 'war on terror,' they damaged a United States navy transport plane by wielding hammers and a pickaxe.

1.3.4 Two Vocabularies: Vision and Action in Spiritually-Motivated Activism

In the previous sections, I explored the capacities of imagining and building a positive peace. Below, I discuss two other ways these capacities are named and described in the disciplines of theology and religious studies. In these disciplines, two vocabularies are prominent for examining the ways spiritually-motivated activists imagine and build a positive peace. By examining these vocabularies, I am reaffirming that the capacities are not new.

The first vocabulary puts emphasis on an activist's vision and action. Jim Wallis, who is himself an activist, alludes to the importance of having vision in his work, *The Soul of Politics*. He states: "We need visions and dreams; our future depends

⁵⁶ Sharon Erickson Nepstad, *Religion and War Resistance in the Plowshares Movement* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2008).

⁵⁷ Barash and Webel, *Peace and Conflict Studies*, 237.

⁵⁸ Nepstad, *Religion and War Resistance*, 59-86.

⁵⁹ Harry Brown, *Hammered by the Irish: How the Pitstop Plowshares disabled a U.S. war-plane – with Ireland's Blessing* (Petrolia, CA: CounterPunch, 2008).

upon fresh imagination.”⁶⁰ The living out of these visions is not possible without concrete strategies or action. Wallis refers to action as the capacity to reconstruct or rebuild in the wake of suffering and exile.⁶¹ He writes that this rebuilding demands taking spirituality into the streets.⁶²

The second vocabulary uses the language of mysticism.⁶³ For example, Curtiss Paul Deyoung underscores the intrinsic relationship between vision and action in his study of spiritually-motivated activists Dietrich Bonhoeffer, Malcolm X, and Aung San Suu Kyi.⁶⁴ He uses the term *mystic-activist* to describe these individuals. The term reflects the ways in which Bonhoeffer, Malcolm X, and Suu Kyi reached within themselves for the sustenance, wisdom, and perseverance to sustain their social and political activism. Deyoung states: “Their outward activism needs inward mysticism.”⁶⁵

The relationship between activism and mysticism is also explicit in Dorothee Sölle’s book, *The Silent Cry: Mysticism and Resistance*.⁶⁶ Echoing Deyoung, she writes: “For mystical consciousness, it is essential that everything internal become external. A dream wants to be told, the “inner light” wants to shine, the vision has to be shared.”⁶⁷ Sölle suggests that small acts of resistance are as important as the acts of

⁶⁰ Jim Wallis, *The Soul of Politics* (New York, NY: The New Press, 1994), 41-42.

⁶¹ Wallis, *The Soul of Politics*, 221-230.

⁶² Wallis, *The Soul of Politics*, 226.

⁶³ See Janet K. Ruffing, ed., *Mysticism and Social Transformation* (Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 2001).

⁶⁴ Curtiss Paul Deyoung, *Living Faith: How Faith Inspires Social Justice* (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2007).

⁶⁵ Deyoung, *Living Faith*, 7.

⁶⁶ Dorothee Sölle, *The Silent Cry: Mysticism and Resistance* (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2001).

⁶⁷ Sölle, *The Silent Cry: Mysticism*, 13.

influential social movement leaders in turning spiritual vision into concrete social and political action. It is worth quoting her remarks in full. She explains:

However small we judge our power to be, it is certainly greater than we surmise or are prepared to concede. Learning to believe in that something that we envisage, in the divine – however vaguely! – as the power of life, also means not to give the last word to one’s own assessment regarding success or uselessness. Submission to the idol of violence begins with the seemingly reasonable insight that we accomplish little with our own power; we are zeros incapable even of indignation and outrage. But in truth ‘that of God,’ as Quakers call it, sleeps also in us and waits to become free.⁶⁸

The vocabulary of vision and action is a succinct identifier for the capacities of imagining and building that I have discussed in the first sections of this chapter. I use this vocabulary in subsequent sections to examine spiritually-motivated peace activism in the United States.

1.4 Vision and Action in American Spiritually-Motivated Peace Activism

Offering an in-depth analysis of the global reach of spiritually-motivated peace activism is beyond the scope of this dissertation. However, I examine aspects of spiritually-motivated peace activism in the United States because it concerns the efforts to imagine and build a positive peace in this country during the years former President George W. Bush was in office (2001-2008). The movements and ideas that shaped these efforts are the most pertinent to my research. They provide historical precedence for examples of spiritually-motivated peace activism that occurred in the context of the ‘war on terror.’ Some of these examples are explored in Chapter Two.

1.4.1 Envisioning a Reconciling America

The history of peace is long, complex, and diverse. The global reach of this history is explored in the comprehensive study, *Peace: A History of Movements and*

⁶⁸ Sölle, *The Silent Cry: Mysticism*, 277.

Ideas.⁶⁹ As the title of the study suggests, one should not speak of peace as a singular reality. Peace is a composite, made up of movements and ideas that are embedded in different histories, cultures, and contexts. There are, therefore, innumerable examples of individuals, communities, and organizations that exemplify the relationship between vision and action in spiritually-motivated peace activism.⁷⁰

My focus is on the United States, which has its own legacy of peacemaking.⁷¹ This legacy has been referred to as a “Reconciling America,” understood as a country characterized by the goals of social justice, nonviolence, and the establishment of “mutually enriching relationships.”⁷² The roots of this legacy have been traced back to the nonviolent alternatives found in some Indigenous American communities.⁷³

An example of one of these traditions is the first recorded document of a peace tradition in the United States known as the “Great Law of Peace.”⁷⁴ The Law was created by the Iroquois Confederation after years of warring over land and food.⁷⁵ The concept of peace in the Law was indicative of more than the mere absence of battle. Peace was characterized as part of the personal spiritual growth of the individual, which

⁶⁹ David Cortright, *Peace: A History of Movements and Ideas* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2008).

⁷⁰ See Jenny Taylor, “Taking Spirituality Seriously: Northern Uganda and Britain’s ‘Break the Silence’ Campaign,” *The Round Table* 94, vol. 382 (October 2005): 559-574.

⁷¹ Elise Boulding, “The Other America: The Forgivers and the Peacegivers,” *Peace and Change* 28, no. 3 (July 2003): 446.

⁷² Boulding, “The Other America,” 449.

⁷³ James C. Juhnke and Cole M. Hunter, *The Missing Peace: The Search for Nonviolent Alternatives in United States History* (Kitchener-Waterloo, ON: Pandora Press, 2004), 17-36.

⁷⁴ Charles Howlett and Robbie Lieberman, ed., *For the People: A Documentary History of the Struggle for Peace and Justice in the United States* (Charlotte, NC: Information Age Publishing, 2009), 1-2, 8-9.

⁷⁵ Howlett and Lieberman, *For the People: A Documentary*, 1.

was understood as contributing to the collective welfare of the village, the nation, and the Confederation.⁷⁶

The history of a Reconciling America has also been influenced by the spiritual traditions of American colonists.⁷⁷ Religious communities such as the Quakers, the Church of the Brethren, and the Mennonites, known as the historic peace churches, advocated for both nonviolence and social justice.⁷⁸ The Quakers in particular left an indelible mark on the history of nonviolent alternatives in the United States.⁷⁹ They worked for the abolishment of war and slavery, prison reform, and the rights of Indigenous Americans and those of women.⁸⁰

Nonviolent alternatives were even present during a period characterized as one of the most sacred in American history: the Revolutionary War.⁸¹ The use of the word ‘sacred’ to describe this period suggests that the images and stories of the war have gained mythic status in the country, contributing to the perception of the nation as strong and righteous.⁸² The reality is, however, that during this most ‘sacred’ period, people spoke out against war and injustice.⁸³ In terms of war, individuals and communities also spoke out against the War of 1812, the Mexican War in 1846, and the Civil War that

⁷⁶ Howlett and Lieberman, *For the People: A Documentary*, 2.

⁷⁷ Ira Chernus, *American Nonviolence: The History of an Idea* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2004), 1-25.

⁷⁸ Sam Marullo and David S. Meyer, “Antiwar and Peace Movements,” in *The Blackwell Companion to Social Movements*, ed. David S. Snow, Sarah A. Soule, and Hanspeter Kriesi (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2007), 644.

⁷⁹ Chernus, *American Nonviolence*, 13-25.

⁸⁰ James Volo, *A History of War Resistance in America* (Santa Barbara, CA: Greenwood, 2010), 74.

⁸¹ Juhnke and Hunter, *The Missing Peace*, 37.

⁸² Juhnke and Hunter, *The Missing Peace*, 37-38.

⁸³ Robert Mann, *Wartime Dissent in America: A History and Anthology* (New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2010), 11-22; Volo, *A History of War Resistance*, 87-134.

decimated the United States between 1861 and 1865.⁸⁴ In terms of addressing injustice, movements to abolish slavery, defend the rights of women and Indigenous Americans, and secure the rights of workers can also be found throughout American history.⁸⁵

The point I wish to make, as Elise Boulding reminds her readers, is that these movements and the communities that sparked and sustained them are an essential part of American society.⁸⁶ In other words, whether as part of the Abolitionist movement, the Labor movement, or the Civil Rights movement, Americans have contributed to the imagining and building of nonviolent and peaceful alternatives in contexts throughout the United States.⁸⁷ This legacy challenges the idea that violence and war are the only viable ways that Americans have of bringing about a more just and peaceful world.

1.4.2 Envisioning Fortress America

Unfortunately, the legacies of American movements for peace and social justice are not as celebrated as those of “Fortress America.”⁸⁸ “Fortress America” consists of an image of the United States as the world’s protector, ready to get tough and use violence to right perceived wrongs, at home or abroad.⁸⁹ By at home or abroad, I mean that this image is thought to exemplify national security measures put in place to keep Americans safe. For example, scholars have commented on what they consider to be repressive antiterrorism measures instituted by the former Bush administration in the

⁸⁴ Murray Polner and Thoma E. Woods, Jr., ed., *We Who Dared to Say No to War* (New York, NY: Basic Books, 2008), 1-86.

⁸⁵ Howlett and Lieberman, *For the People: A Documentary*, xxii.

⁸⁶ Boulding, “The Other America,” 448.

⁸⁷ For more on these movements, see Staughton Lynd and Alice Lynd, ed., *Nonviolence in America: A Documentary History* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 1995).

⁸⁸ Boulding, “The Other America,” 449.

⁸⁹ Boulding, “The Other America,” 446.

wake of the September 11 attacks.⁹⁰ These measures, which include enhanced surveillance of those deemed threats to the domestic safety of the country, are judged by some to be an extension of the former administration's imperialist agenda in Afghanistan and Iraq.⁹¹

In her book *America, Amerikka: Elect Nation and Imperial Violence*, Rosemary Radford Ruether discusses contrasting perceptions of the United States. She argues that historically, the United States has perceived itself to be a good and righteous nation. This perception has obscured the reality that the country has what, she refers to as, "an evil twin."⁹² The twin emerges in the country's self-identification as God's chosen nation, or the idea that the United States is a New Israel meant to dominate and redeem the world.⁹³

According to Ruether, many Americans genuinely believe in the positive national values that they associate with their nation's role as redeemer. The problem is that they are often unaware of the ways other people have experienced these values as exploitative and oppressive.⁹⁴ When Americans become conscious of such exploitation and oppression, they are often moved to rethink and to act.⁹⁵ This consciousness has been at the root of movements for nonviolent and peaceful change throughout American

⁹⁰ See Nancy Chang, *Silencing Political Dissent: How Post-September 11 Anti-Terrorism Measures Threaten Our Civil Liberties* (New York, NY: Seven Stories Press, 2002); Frances Fox Piven, *The War at Home: The Domestic Costs of Bush's Militarism* (New York, NY: The New Press, 2004).

⁹¹ See Damien Cox, Michael Levine, and Saul Newman, *Politics Most Unusual: Violence, Sovereignty and Democracy in the 'War on Terror'* (New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2009).

⁹² Rosemary Radford Ruether, *America, Amerikka: Elect Nation and Imperial Violence* (London, UK: Equinox, 2007), 1-2.

⁹³ Ruether, *America, Amerikka: Elect Nation*, 251.

⁹⁴ Ruether, *America, Amerikka: Elect Nation*, 2.

⁹⁵ For example, see the peace activism of Cindy Sheehan. Sheehan became an advocate after the death of her son, Casey, in Iraq. Cindy Sheehan, *Dear President Bush* (San Francisco, CA: City Lights Books, 2006).

history.⁹⁶ In the next section, I discuss the importance of identifying and celebrating alternative visions and actions for fostering peace cultures in the United States.

1.4.3 Alternatives to Fortress America: Fostering Cultures of Peace

A peace culture can be defined as “a culture that promotes peaceable diversity; that gives space both for social bonding and individual autonomy and uniqueness; that includes patterns of belief, values, and behavior that promote mutual caring among humans and nature.”⁹⁷ Spiritually-motivated activists have profoundly shaped American attempts to envision and create this culture.⁹⁸ These attempts have involved criticism of an American identity based on the perception of the nation’s mission as the world’s redeemer.⁹⁹ Thus, in their particular time and place, spiritually-motivated activists have provided alternative visions of and ways of being American that challenge this perception.¹⁰⁰

Such alternative visions and actions are vital given the country’s devotion to violence, as Walter Wink explains.¹⁰¹ The myth of redemptive violence, or the notion that might makes right, undergirds American popular culture, nationalism, and foreign policy.¹⁰² The myth is so successful in these areas because it has been normalized as

⁹⁶ Ruether, *America, Amerikka: Elect Nation*, 3.

⁹⁷ Boulding, “The Other America,” 453. For a more detailed discussion of peace culture, see Elise Boulding, “Peace Culture: The Problem of Managing Human Difference,” *Crosscurrents* 48, no. 4 (Summer 1998): 445-457.

⁹⁸ For a discussion of the intrinsic relationship between spirituality and social justice in America and other countries, see David R. Hodge, “The Conceptual and Empirical Relationship between Spirituality and Social Justice: Exemplars from Diverse Faith Traditions,” *Journal of Religion & Spirituality in Social Work: Social Thought* 31 (2012): 31-50.

⁹⁹ Ruether, *America, Amerikka: Elect Nation*, 5.

¹⁰⁰ Ruether, *America, Amerikka: Elect Nation*, 211-249.

¹⁰¹ Walter Wink, *Engaging the Powers: Discernment and Resistance in a World of Domination* (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 1992), 13.

¹⁰² Wink, *Engaging the Powers: Discernment*, 13.

part of everyday life in the United States.¹⁰³ It simply appears to work and, therefore, has an aura of constancy and inevitability that even finds legitimization in religion and spirituality.

One example of this legitimization is the theological foundations for violence in American neoconservative foreign policy.¹⁰⁴ As part of the policy, American violence is justified because the country is considered at the top of the hierarchy of nations and because “its national motives are good and pure, somehow untainted by original sin.”¹⁰⁵ This worldview can be traced back to the Puritan belief that America is God’s elect nation.¹⁰⁶ A worldview Ruether also emphasizes in her previously mentioned study.

Alongside neoconservative foreign policy, Americans have found ways to religiously defend a number of injustices including racism, gender discrimination, and land grabbing, as described by John Pahl in his book, *Empire of Sacrifice*.¹⁰⁷ Pahl argues that religious violence is deeply embedded in American history. Religion was not only used to justify violence but also to convince Americans of their innocence in implementing their “blessed brutalities.”¹⁰⁸ These brutalities included persecution, slavery and, more recently, the ‘war on drugs.’ Pahl explains that the justifications for these brutalities emerged as religious discourses, practices, and communities mixed with the ideals, practices, and institutions of the state. The result was a type of hybrid civil

¹⁰³ Wink, *Engaging the Powers: Discernment*, 13.

¹⁰⁴ Ira Chernus, “The Theology of American Empire,” in *Voices of Dissent: Critical Readings in American Politics*, ed. William F. Grover and Joseph G. Peschek, 8th ed. (New York, NY: Longman, 2010), 72-77.

¹⁰⁵ Chernus, “The Theology of American Empire,” 73.

¹⁰⁶ Chernus, “The Theology of American Empire,” 74.

¹⁰⁷ John Pahl, *Empire of Sacrifice: The Religious Origins of American Violence* (New York, NY: New York University Press, 2010), 3.

¹⁰⁸ Pahl, *Empire of Sacrifice: The Religious*, 7.

religion, an “empire of sacrifice,” with characteristics of religious violence similar to those examined by scholars such as Appleby and Juergensmeyer.¹⁰⁹

These analyses of American violence are not meant to demonize the country or its people. Rather, they testify to the need to continually identify and celebrate the visions and actions of those who have spoken out against it. Without attention to these alternatives, violence and injustice appear to be inevitable and unchangeable undercurrents in American history and culture. As one scholar writes: “One of the unfortunate outcomes of a virtually uninterrupted history of successful war-making was that *Americans came to believe that war worked* – that it could be used to resolve seemingly insoluble problems, work out thorny issues, and bring lasting peace.”¹¹⁰ The fact is that, as I have briefly illustrated, there are alternative ways of envisioning America and being an American. Violence and war have never been the only options.

In the following sections, I continue to explore alternative ways of envisioning and building peace cultures in the United States. The legacy of nonviolence and its influence on spiritually-motivated peace activism is an important part of this exploration. As I discuss below, nonviolence is not just a strategy or technique. For many spiritually-motivated peace activists, it is considered a way of life.

1.5 Nonviolence and Spiritually-Motivated Peace Activism in America

Like peace, nonviolence can be defined in multiple ways. The term ‘nonresistance’ was initially used in the United States to define the work of individuals

¹⁰⁹ Pahl, *Empire of Sacrifice: The Religious*, 27-34.

¹¹⁰ Volo, *A History of War Resistance*, x. Emphasis in original text.

and groups who based their opposition to violence on religious grounds.¹¹¹ With the emergence of a nonsectarian peace movement in the nineteenth century, however, a range of terms appeared to describe the desire to “eliminate institutionalized violence using means that are themselves not violent.”¹¹² These terms included nonviolence, passive resistance, and nonviolent resistance.

When spirituality is considered to be one of its defining characteristics, nonviolence is often referred to as ‘principled nonviolence.’ Principled nonviolence can be characterized by a commitment to do no violence under any circumstance.¹¹³ Such a commitment involves both the ways people think about nonviolence and how their ideas are implemented. To underscore this point, Chernus cites Mahatma Gandhi and Martin Luther King Jr., among others, as exemplars of the principled nonviolence that has influenced its practice in the United States.

For scholars such as Gene Sharp, however, principled nonviolence is distinct from ‘nonviolent action’ or ‘nonviolent struggle.’ Sharp understands nonviolence as a technique used in people power movements throughout the twentieth century.¹¹⁴ He clarifies: “Nonviolent struggle is identified by what people do, not by what they believe.”¹¹⁵ The purpose of making this distinction is twofold. First, the distinction recognizes that nonviolence is not necessarily defined by spirituality or religious commitment. Second, nonviolence is not passive but active, meaning that it is a struggle

¹¹¹ Howlett and Lieberman, *For the People: A Documentary*, xxii.

¹¹² Howlett and Lieberman, *For the People: A Documentary*, xxii.

¹¹³ Chernus, *American Nonviolence*, 1-2.

¹¹⁴ Gene Sharp, *Waging Nonviolent Struggle: 20th Century Practice and 21st Century Potential* (Boston, MA: Extending Horizons Books, 2005), 20-21.

¹¹⁵ Sharp, *Waging Nonviolent Struggle*, 19.

for which activists may have to lay down their lives. Peter Ackerman and Jack DuVall explain:

It is often assumed that the choice of nonviolent resistance is made for moral reasons, but the historical record suggests otherwise. Most who used nonviolent action in the twentieth century did so because military or physical force was not a viable option. Some simply lacked sufficient arms to mount a violent revolt; others had recently seen a violent insurrection fail, with devastating results for life and property. But since peoples' most vital interests were at stake, and because they were determined to take down rulers or laws that withheld their rights, they were impelled to take up other, nonviolent weapons. Those who used nonviolent actions in our stories did not come to make peace. They came to fight.¹¹⁶

Sharp, Ackerman, and DuVall are correct in stating that nonviolence is not defined solely by spiritual or religious commitment. I also agree with their assessment that nonviolence is fundamentally a struggle to persuade others that alternatives to violence and war are the most powerful means of imagining and building a more just and peaceful world. Taking these points into account, I understand nonviolence, alongside Chernus, to be a commitment to do no violence under any circumstance. Spirituality can define this commitment or not, but one thing is certain: this commitment is not passive. Conceptions of nonviolence as “relentless persistence” that emerged in Latin America embody the active element of this commitment.¹¹⁷ Aldofo Pérez

Esquivel writes:

Nonviolence is not passivity or conformism...It is a spirit of prophecy, for it denounces all sundering of a community of brothers and sisters and proclaims that this community can only be rebuilt through love. And it is a method – an organized set of ruptures in the civil order so as to disturb the system responsible for the injustices we see around us.¹¹⁸

¹¹⁶ Peter Ackerman and Jack DuVall, *A Force More Powerful: A Century of Nonviolent Conflict* (New York, NY: Palgrave, 2000), 5.

¹¹⁷ Leonardo Boff, foreword to *Relentless Persistence: Nonviolent Action in Latin America*, ed. Philip McManus and Gerald Schlabach (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock Publishers, 1991), x.

¹¹⁸ Aldofo Pérez Esquivel, *Christ in a Poncho: Testimonials of the Nonviolent Struggles in Latin America* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 1983), 52, quoted in Cortright, *Peace: A History of Movements*, 223.

In the sections that follow, I explore the development of principled nonviolence in the context of twentieth century America. The twentieth century is significant because of the proliferation of principled nonviolent movements and organizations that emerged at this time.¹¹⁹ Chernus writes:

Through the end of the nineteenth century, nonviolence was not seen primarily – and in the historic peace churches not at all – as a method of social and political change, but rather as abolitionists had seen it: as a way to maintain individual spiritual purity by submitting only to God, not to any human beings, as the legitimate ruler over their lives.¹²⁰

In the twentieth century, principled nonviolence was transformed from a way of maintaining individual spiritual purity into a method and way of life dedicated to communal and systemic social and political change. I examine some of these transformations below.

1.5.1 Principled American Nonviolence in the Twentieth Century

Nonviolent theories and practices have ancient spiritual roots.¹²¹ Although they acknowledge such roots, scholars interested in these theories and practices generally agree that nonviolence reached its maturity as an instrument of social and political change in the twentieth century.¹²² They write: “In the twentieth century, nonviolence became more of a deliberate tool for social change moving from being largely an *ad hoc* strategy growing naturally out of religious or ethical principles to a reflective, and in

¹¹⁹ For example, the Catholic peace organization *Pax Christi* was founded in France in 1945 and was introduced to the United States in 1972. See Pax Christi USA, “Our History,” under “About Us,” <http://paxchristiusa.org/about/our-history> (accessed May 3, 2012).

¹²⁰ Ira Chernus, “Religion and Nonviolence in American History,” in *The Blackwell Companion to Religion and Violence*, ed. Andrew R. Murphy (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing Inc., 2011), 557.

¹²¹ Stephen Zunes, Lester R. Kurtz, and Sarah Beth Asher, introduction to *Nonviolent Social Movements: A Geographical Perspective* (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishers, 1999), 2.

¹²² Kenneth E. Boulding, “Nonviolence and Power in the Twentieth Century,” in *Nonviolent Social Movements: A Geographical Perspective*, ed. Stephen Zunes, Lester R. Kurtz, and Sarah Beth Asher (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishers, 1999), 9; Zunes, Kurtz, Asher, introduction, 1; Ackerman and Du Vall, *A Force More Powerful*, 1-9.

many ways institutionalized, method of struggle.”¹²³ This scholarly consensus has been applied to the history of nonviolence in America.

For example, some scholars note that the outbreak of the First World War was a defining moment for principled nonviolence in the United States.¹²⁴ Several key figures involved in its practice in the early to mid twentieth century were deeply influenced by their experiences of the War, both at home and abroad. Speaking of these figures, Joseph Kip Kosek writes: “These religious idealists had thought little about the war, for they were sure that such a self-destructive method of settling disputes would wither away in the modern world. The Great War transformed their lives.”¹²⁵ In other words, a new constituency of principled nonviolent activists emerged out of the war that opened and changed the twentieth century.¹²⁶

This constituency grew because many activists felt betrayed by former President Woodrow Wilson’s decision to enter the war in the hopes of saving democracy.¹²⁷ Several absolute pacifists – meaning those who rejected the legitimacy of the Great War – applied for Conscientious Objector Status and as a result were either sent to work camps or imprisoned.¹²⁸ In 1915, the faith-based, pacifist organization known as the Fellowship of Reconciliation (FOR), which had been founded in Europe a year before,

¹²³ Zunes, Kurtz, Asher, introduction, 1.

¹²⁴ Charles Chatfield, “Nonviolent Social Movements in the United States: A Historical Overview,” in *Nonviolent Social Movements: A Geographical Perspective*, ed. Stephen Zunes, Lester R. Kurtz, and Sarah Beth Asher (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishers, 1999), 284-285.

¹²⁵ Joseph Kip Kosek, *Acts of Conscience: Christian Nonviolence and Modern American Democracy* (New York, NY: Columbia University Press, 2009), 17.

¹²⁶ Chatfield, “Nonviolent Social Movements,” 285-286.

¹²⁷ Leilah C. Danielson, “In My Extremity I Turned to Gandhi”: American Pacifists, Christianity, and Gandhian Nonviolence, 1915-1941,” *Church History* 72, no. 2 (June 2003): 362.

¹²⁸ Patricia Appelbaum, *Kingdom to Commune: Protestant Pacifist Culture between World War I and the Vietnam War* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2009), 10-24.

came to the United States.¹²⁹ FOR members worked tirelessly to defend and support the legal rights of these Conscientious Objectors.

This organization and others, such as the American Friends Service Committee, became what Charles Chatfield calls “the carriers of principled nonviolence” after the War.¹³⁰ He writes: “The wartime, reform-oriented pacifists and those who joined them later become convinced that even as war is a form of injustice, so causes of peace and justice are one: what is wrong with war, they felt, is the injustice it does to all.”¹³¹ This amalgamation between war and injustice, which for these activists meant an agenda of “progressive activism with pacifist principle,” was foundational to the reception of Gandhian nonviolence in America.¹³²

1.5.2 Mahatma Gandhi’s Influence

Nonviolence developed into a concrete movement for change in different contexts with the introduction of the strategies and tactics of Mahatma Gandhi.¹³³ The reception of these strategies and tactics in the United States is important because they influenced several generations of principled nonviolent activists.¹³⁴ The early successes of Gandhi’s method and philosophy reached the United States in the late second decade of the twentieth century.¹³⁵ During the 1920s, for example, the Mahatma’s nonviolent

¹²⁹ Paul R. Dekar, *Creating Beloved Community: A Journey with the Fellowship of Reconciliation* (Telford, PA: Cascadia Publishing House, 2000), 18.

¹³⁰ Chatfield, “Nonviolent Social Movements,” 286.

¹³¹ Chatfield, “Nonviolent Social Movements,” 286.

¹³² Chatfield, “Nonviolent Social Movements,” 286.

¹³³ Walter Wink, *The Powers That Be: Theology for a New Millennium* (New York, NY: Galilee Doubleday, 1998), 116.

¹³⁴ David Cortright, “Gandhi’s Influence on the US Peace Movement,” *International Studies* 34, no. 3 (1997): 359-375.

¹³⁵ Cortright, “Gandhi’s Influence on the US Peace Movement,” 361.

campaigns were publicized in several African American journals and newspapers such as W.E.B Dubois' *The Crisis*.¹³⁶

Throughout the 1930s and 1940s, Gandhi's methods provided the American peace movement with what Marian Mollin calls "a new paradigm of political action: an example of how nonviolence could be used on a mass scale to achieve concrete social, economic and political gains."¹³⁷ The influence of this new paradigm is evident in several books published by Richard B. Gregg in the 1930s.¹³⁸ Gregg spent several years in India studying Gandhi's movement and writings.

Echoing Mollin, Patricia Applebaum writes that Gregg's books "offered a new model for the "way of life" [protestant] pacifists advocated."¹³⁹ For example, Gregg stressed the importance of pacifists training as rigorously for peace as soldiers did for war.¹⁴⁰ This echoes Gandhi's assertions on the importance of self-discipline as an intrinsic part of nonviolent social action. His autobiography, titled *The Story of My Experiments with Truth*, is replete with his struggles for self-discipline using spiritual practices such as chastity and fasting.¹⁴¹

In the 1950s and 1960s, the Mahatma's strategies and tactics influenced some of the most significant spiritually-motivated social and political activists in the United

¹³⁶ Vinay Lal, "Gandhi's West, the West's Gandhi," *New Literary History* 40 (2009): 296-297.

¹³⁷ Marian Mollin, *Radical Pacifism in Modern America: Egalitarianism and Protest* (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2006), 13.

¹³⁸ Applebaum cites two of Gregg's books from the 1930s. Richard B. Gregg, *The Power of Nonviolence* (Philadelphia, PA: Lippincott, 1934) and Richard B. Gregg, *Training for Peace: A Program for Peace Workers* (Philadelphia, PA: Lippincott, 1937), quoted in Appelbaum, *Kingdom to Commune*, 288.

¹³⁹ Appelbaum, *Kingdom to Commune*, 129.

¹⁴⁰ Appelbaum, *Kingdom to Commune*, 133.

¹⁴¹ Mohandas K. Gandhi, *The Story of My Experiments with Truth*, trans. by Mahadev Desai (New York, NY: Dover Publications Inc., 1983 [1948]), 179-181, 182-185, 295-297.

States, including civil and labor rights leaders, Cesar Chavez and Martin Luther King, Jr.¹⁴² Chavez cites Gandhi's influence in a statement on nonviolence published April 23, 1963.¹⁴³ In particular, he refers to the Indian leader's use of fasting as a nonviolent tactic and his recognition of the struggle of human beings to choose nonviolence over violence.¹⁴⁴ Several years later when asked what aspects of the Mahatma's life and message influenced him the most, Chavez responded:

His activism. He was a saint *of the world*. He did things; he accomplished things. Many of us can be so holy, you know, but we don't get very much done except satisfying our own personal needs. But Gandhi did what he did for the whole world. Not only did he talk about nonviolence, he showed how nonviolence works for justice and liberation.¹⁴⁵

Given the force of Chavez's statements, I believe it is important to explore some of Gandhi's ideas on nonviolence and how these ideas are connected to nonviolent action. This exploration provides a better picture of the influence that the Mahatma's conviction that nonviolence is a force more powerful than violence had on King.¹⁴⁶ As Wallis suggests, understanding this conviction is vital for imagining and building a positive peace.¹⁴⁷ He writes:

We must begin to believe that there is a better way. First of all nonviolent resolution of conflict has worked in a great variety of situations. Gandhi and King are but the best-

¹⁴² Cesar Chavez was founder of the United Farmers Workers Union, an organization that helped spur a Chicano/a social justice movement for civil and economic rights in the United States. For more on Chavez's role in this movement and his broader political and social significance in the United States, see Luis D. León, "Cesar Chavez in American Religious Politics: Mapping the New Global Spiritual Line," *American Quarterly* 59, no. 3 (September 2007): 857-881.

¹⁴³ Cesar Chavez, "Letter from Delano," *Christian Century* 86, no. 17 (April 23, 1963): 540.

¹⁴⁴ For more on Chavez's use of fasting and other spiritual disciplines geared toward nonviolent social struggle, see Claire E. Wolfeich, "Devotion and Struggle for Justice in the Farm Workers Movement: A Practical Theological Approach to Research and Teaching in Spirituality," *Spiritus* 5, no. 2 (Fall 2005): 158-175.

¹⁴⁵ Catherine Ingram, "Interview with Cesar Chavez, April 22, 1989, Keene, California," in *In the Footsteps of Gandhi: Conversations with Spiritual Social Activists*, rev. ed. (Berkeley, CA: Parallax Press, 2003), 114. Emphasis in original text.

¹⁴⁶ Ackerman and Du Vall, *A Force More Powerful*, 1-9.

¹⁴⁷ Wallis, *The Soul of Politics*, 190.

known practitioners of nonviolent movements that have obtained freedom, secured justice, defended others, and made peace without recourse to violence.¹⁴⁸

In the next section, I briefly discuss pertinent themes from Gandhi's principled nonviolence. Having touched on these themes, I turn to an examination of King's nonviolent vision and action in the context of the American Civil Rights movement.¹⁴⁹

1.5.3 Gandhian Nonviolence: Envisioning Truth, Affirming Life

Below, I explore two themes: Satyagraha and Ahimsa. These themes represent particular aspects of the Mahatma's principled nonviolence. I use a mixture of primary and secondary sources in this section. This mixture underscores the continued influence of Gandhi's ideas and actions on spiritually-motivated activists and scholars.¹⁵⁰ His influence extends to examples of contemporary popular music, some of which I discuss in Chapter Five.

Theme I: Satyagraha

Several scholars have pointed out that Gandhi's politics were shaped by deep spiritual beliefs.¹⁵¹ Affirming this point, the Mahatma characterized his autobiography

¹⁴⁸ Wallis, *The Soul of Politics*, 190.

¹⁴⁹ King was not the only African American intellectual and activist who was influenced by Gandhi. Several African American intellectuals and activists travelled to India to meet with Gandhi or his followers after his passing in 1948. These include Howard Thurman, dean of the Chapel at Howard University, and Bayard Rustin, who acted as King's special assistant for seven years. See Cortright, "Gandhi's Influence on the US Peace Movement," 366-369.

¹⁵⁰ Scholars and activists working to understand and address global terrorism have sought insight in the Mahatma's nonviolent vision and action. See Anna Alomes, "Search for an Exit in the Corridor of Fear: Revisiting Gandhi and King in Times of Terror[ism]," in *Nonviolence: An Alternative for Defeating Global Terror(ism)*, ed. Senthil Ram and Ralph Summy (New York, NY: Nova Science Publishers Inc., 2008), 31-46; Micheal N. Nagler, "The Mahatma and the Mujihadeen: Gandhi's Answer to Terrorism," in *Nonviolence: An Alternative for Defeating Global Terror(ism)*, ed. Senthil Ram and Ralph Summy (New York, NY: Nova Science Publishers Inc., 2008), 47-56.

¹⁵¹ Chernus, *American Nonviolence*, 93; John Hicks, "Gandhi: The Fusion of Religion and Politics," in *Religion, Politics, and Peace*, ed. Leroy S. Rouner (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1999), 148.

as a space to narrate his ‘experiments’ in what he called the ‘spiritual field.’¹⁵² These experiments sustained his engagements with politics, which included a method he called, *Satyagraha*.¹⁵³

As a method, Satyagraha was profoundly related to the Mahatma’s understandings of truth/Truth.¹⁵⁴ *Satya*, he explained, was based on the Sanskrit word for ‘being,’ or *Sat*. “Nothing is or exists in reality except Truth. That is why *Sat* or Truth is perhaps the most important name for God. In fact it is more correct to say that Truth is God, than to say God is Truth.”¹⁵⁵ The Mahatma elaborated further: “And when you find Truth as God, the only inevitable means is love, that is, nonviolence, and since I believe that ultimately the means and the ends are convertible terms, I should not hesitate to say that God is Love.”¹⁵⁶ Satyagraha was also referred to in Gandhi’s writings as ‘truth-force,’ ‘soul-force,’ and ‘love-force.’¹⁵⁷

I would like to highlight particular aspects of the Mahatma’s understanding of Satyagraha. First, in terms of its implementation, truth-force puts emphasis on the relationship between means and ends. The ways in which individuals and communities sought to bring about a more just and peaceful world, in other words, had to coincide with the ends pursued. This implied that, as a method, Satyagraha was informed by a sense of and need for action. The second half of the term, *graha*, can be translated as

¹⁵² Gandhi, *The Story of My Experiments with Truth*, viii.

¹⁵³ Gandhi, *The Story of My Experiments with Truth*, viii-ix. Also see Mohandas K. Gandhi, *Essential Writings*, ed. John Dear (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2008), 75-77.

¹⁵⁴ Mohandas K. Gandhi, *Non-Violent Resistance (Satyagraha)* (Mineola, NY: Dover Publications, 2001 [1961]), 38-40.

¹⁵⁵ Gandhi, *Non-Violent Resistance (Satyagraha)*, 38-40.

¹⁵⁶ Gandhi, *Essential Writings*, 73.

¹⁵⁷ Gandhi, *Non-Violent Resistance (Satyagraha)*, 1, 6.

holding firm or persisting.¹⁵⁸ Those who practiced Satyagraha were known as ‘seekers of truth,’ or Satyagrahi.¹⁵⁹ This label evokes an image of conscious and deliberate actors who understood that their visions of nonviolence were intrinsically related to their actions.

The second aspect of Satyagraha I would like to highlight is the Mahatma’s concern for experimentation in relationship to the partiality of human understanding. Always contingent, the best each human being can achieve is what Mark Juergensmeyer calls a “proximate vision” of truth, meaning truth with a small t.¹⁶⁰ Although human visions were proximate, meaning characterized by both contingency and partiality, Gandhi called for continuous experimentation. These visions, including the viability of replacing violence with nonviolence, had to be put into action.¹⁶¹ Juergensmeyer explains: “Just as there are laws of nature, reasoned Gandhi, there are laws of harmonious living. Our task is to seek them out, to “experiment with truth” the way a scientist might use a laboratory.”¹⁶²

Experimentation encompassed all aspects of a truth-seeker’s life. Gandhi wrote: “Non-violence to be a creed has to be all-pervasive. I cannot be non-violent about one activity of mine and violent about others. That would be a policy, not a life-force.”¹⁶³ Elsewhere, he affirmed: “Satyagraha excludes violence in any shape or form, whether in

¹⁵⁸ Terrence J. Rynne, *Gandhi and Jesus: The Saving Power of Nonviolence* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2008), 50; Sölle, *The Silent Cry: Mysticism*, 268.

¹⁵⁹ Gandhi, *Non-Violent Resistance (Satyagraha)*, 45, 314.

¹⁶⁰ Mark Juergensmeyer, *Gandhi’s Way: A Handbook of Conflict Resolution* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2005), 22.

¹⁶¹ David Cortright, *Gandhi and Beyond: Nonviolence for a New Political Age*, 2nd ed. (Boulder, CO: Paradigm Publishers, 2009), 15.

¹⁶² Juergensmeyer, *Gandhi’s Way: A Handbook*, 19.

¹⁶³ Mohandas K. Gandhi, *Non-Violence in Peace and War 1942*, vol. 1 (New York, NY: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1972), 110.

thought, speech, or deed.”¹⁶⁴ In particular, violence could only be replaced when one took up Satyagraha as both a method and a way of life. It represented a continuous and encompassing experiment with certain spiritual truths. Foremost among these was the conviction that violence could not bring about a more just and peaceful world. I would add the idea that, in the pursuit of this world, an activist’s visions and actions were deeply intertwined.

Theme II: Ahimsa

Given the discussion of Satyagraha above, it can be said that nonviolence functioned as the Mahatma’s “litmus test of truth.”¹⁶⁵ This method and way of life was understood as a measure of individual and communal pursuits for a more just and peaceful world. Gandhi explained:

In the application of Satyagraha I discovered in the earliest stages that the pursuit of truth did not admit of violence being inflicted on one’s opponent but that he must be weaned from error through patience and sympathy. For what appears to be truth to one may appear to be error to the other. So the doctrine came to mean a vindication of truth not by infliction of suffering on the opponent but on one’s self.¹⁶⁶

Violence was inhibited to those practicing Satyagraha because, as the Mahatma underscored, no human being had access to Absolute Truth.¹⁶⁷ Without this access, how could one human being dominate, exploit, or punish another?¹⁶⁸

This understanding of Satyagraha points to Gandhi’s use of the Sanskrit word, *Ahimsa*. The word is the opposite of *himsa*, meaning a desire to harm.¹⁶⁹

Juergensmeyer states that the Mahatma used *himsa* to indicate “anything that violates –

¹⁶⁴ Gandhi, *Non-Violent Resistance (Satyagraha)*, 56.

¹⁶⁵ Juergensmeyer, *Gandhi’s Way: A Handbook*, 27.

¹⁶⁶ Gandhi, *Non-Violent Resistance (Satyagraha)*, 6.

¹⁶⁷ Gandhi, *Non-Violent Resistance (Satyagraha)*, 1.

¹⁶⁸ Gandhi, *Non-Violent Resistance (Satyagraha)*, 1.

¹⁶⁹ Juergensmeyer, *Gandhi’s Way: A Handbook*, 27.

in a physical, mental, or emotional way – the integrity of something living.” As opposite to this violation, *Ahimsa* can be translated as “the absence of the desire to kill” and has been called the foundation or bedrock of Satyagraha.¹⁷⁰ The Mahatma affirmed: “A Satyagrahi will always try to overcome evil by good, anger by love, untruth by truth, *himsa* by *ahimsa*.”¹⁷¹

Gandhi is described as extending the meaning of *Ahimsa* by connecting it to his understandings of truth.¹⁷² Philip Hefner writes: “Gandhi carried *Ahimsa* further: not only must there be no harm done, there must be “respect for the truth” in the other. The essence of the other must not be violated.”¹⁷³ Other scholars concur, stating that *Ahimsa* compels activists to not only acknowledge the humanity of others but also to persist in acts of kindness and sympathy.¹⁷⁴ This acknowledgment and persistence is important for two reasons.

First, it reiterates the intrinsic relationship between means and ends, discussed in the previous section. Violence is simply not a viable means to achieve the ends of social, political, and spiritual transformation. To underscore this point, *Ahimsa* has been referred to as the “animating principle” of Gandhian nonviolence.¹⁷⁵ Second, the Mahatma understood this animating principle as an affirmation of life.¹⁷⁶ In contrast, violence was comprised of its negation.¹⁷⁷ Varun Soni states: “According to Gandhi,

¹⁷⁰ Sölle, *The Silent Cry: Mysticism*, 268; Barash and Webel, *Peace and Conflict Studies*, 460.

¹⁷¹ Gandhi, *Non-Violent Resistance (Satyagraha)*, 77.

¹⁷² Philip Hefner, “Spiritual Transformation and Nonviolent Action: Interpreting Mahatma Gandhi and Martin Luther King Jr.,” *Currents in Theology and Mission* 31, no. 4 (August 2004): 268.

¹⁷³ Hefner, “Spiritual Transformation and Nonviolent,” 268.

¹⁷⁴ Barash and Webel, *Peace and Conflict Studies*, 460.

¹⁷⁵ Rynne, *Gandhi and Jesus*, 50.

¹⁷⁶ Juergensmeyer, *Gandhi’s Way: A Handbook*, 28.

¹⁷⁷ Rynne, *Gandhi and Jesus*, 50.

violent action, regardless of the short-term outcome, is destructive and becomes the very cycle of oppression and injustice it seeks to eliminate.”¹⁷⁸ Only *Satyagraha* animated by a life-affirming principle such as *Ahimsa* could break these destructive cycles. The Mahatma remarked:

There is no half way between truth and nonviolence on the one hand and untruth and violence on the other. We may never be strong enough to be entirely nonviolent in thought, word, and deed. But we must keep nonviolence as our goal and make steady progress towards it. The attainment of freedom whether for a man, a nation or the world, must be in exact proportion to the attainment of nonviolence by each. Let those, therefore, who believe in nonviolence as the only method of achieving real freedom, keep the lamp of nonviolence burning in the midst of the present impenetrable gloom. The truth of a few will count, the untruth of millions will vanish even like chaff before a whiff of wind.¹⁷⁹

Describing the implications of a commitment to nonviolence, Krishnalal Shridharani wrote the following passage in the conclusion to his 1939 Columbia University thesis. I quote Shridharani in full because he was not only a scholar. He also participated in Gandhi’s Salt March Campaign and was arrested on March 5, 1930, for his nonviolent civil disobedience.¹⁸⁰ At the end of his thesis, he stated:

The resourcefulness of man [sic] is likely to invent many more stratagems to meet the ‘enemy’ at every step in a strictly nonviolent fashion, much in the same way as it has helped him cover reams of paper with army and navy secrets. The suggestions might sound fantastic, for we are all the creatures of our past, and our senses hesitate to take chances with new perceptions. But a considerable part of what is suggested has been successfully practiced in India in the past, perhaps the rest is not so impossible as it sounds. Here is the challenge.¹⁸¹

Sixteen years later, in Montgomery, Alabama, civil rights activist Rosa Parks was arrested. She had refused to move to the rear of the bus to provide a seat for a white

¹⁷⁸ Varun Soni, “Religion, World Order, and Peace: A Hindu Approach,” *Crosscurrents* 60, no.3 (September 2010): 312.

¹⁷⁹ Mohandas K. Gandhi, “The Acid Test,” in *Nonviolence in Theory and Practice*, ed. Robert L. Holmes and Barry L. Gan, 2nd ed. (Long Grove, IL: Waveland Press, Inc., 2005), 83-84.

¹⁸⁰ Krishnalal Shridharani, *War without Violence: A Study of Gandhi’s Method and its Accomplishments*, Garland Edition (New York, NY: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1972 [1939]), xxxiv.

¹⁸¹ Shridharani, *War without Violence*, 323.

man, thereby violating the state's segregation laws.¹⁸² Park's arrest sparked the 381-day Montgomery bus-boycott that saw a reluctant Baptist preacher and theologian, Martin Luther King, Jr., catapulted into the role of civil rights leader.¹⁸³

In the next section, I discuss aspects of Martin Luther King, Jr.'s vision and action. I note the influence of the Mahatma's ideas on one of the United States most recognized practitioners of principled nonviolence. One of these ideas was that violence could not lead to a more just and peaceful world. Again, I use a mixture of primary and secondary sources to emphasize the lasting inspiration that the Mahatma and King give to those interested in principled nonviolence today.

1.5.4 Martin Luther King, Jr.: Envisioning Community, Manifesting Love

Like Gandhi, spirituality shaped King's vision of and action for a more just and peaceful world.¹⁸⁴ At the root of this spirituality was an understanding of Christianity as deeply concerned with the perpetuation of love and social justice for all in the here and now.¹⁸⁵ In his famous "I have a dream" speech, delivered in front of the Lincoln Memorial in Washington, D.C., on August 28, 1963, King called attention to this understanding by speaking of "the fierce urgency of now."¹⁸⁶ He stated: "This is no time to engage in the luxury of cooling off or to take the tranquilizing drug of

¹⁸² Charles Marsh, *The Beloved Community: How Faith Shapes Social Justice, from the Civil Rights Movement to Today* (New York, NY: Perseus Books, 2005), 20.

¹⁸³ Coretta Scott King, foreword to *The Strength to Love* by Martin Luther King, Jr., Gift Edition (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2010 [1981/1963]), ix-x.

¹⁸⁴ Daniel Groody, "A Heart as Wide as the World:" A Christian Spirituality of Nonviolence," in *Religion, Terrorism and Globalization. Nonviolence: A New Agenda*, ed. K.K. Kuriakose (New York, NY: Nova Science Publishers, Inc., 2006), 223.

¹⁸⁵ Cortright, *Gandhi and Beyond*, 57. Chernus, *American Nonviolence*, 162. Chernus writes that the notion that Christianity was a religion of "freedom and liberation" was already present in the Black church tradition in which King was immersed as a child.

¹⁸⁶ Martin Luther King, Jr., *A Call to Conscience: The Landmark Speeches of Martin Luther King, Jr.*, ed. Clayborn Carson and Kris Shepard (New York, NY: Grand Central Publishing, 2002), 82.

gradualism. Now is the time to make real the promises of democracy.”¹⁸⁷ These promises could be made real by transforming systemic structures of injustice through the creation of the beloved community. Below, I examine King’s vision of this community.

Theme I: The Beloved Community

The beloved community was a vision of faith and solidarity. The vision was born out in King’s many nonviolent campaigns for economic, racial, and social justice in the Southern United States. Describing one of these campaigns, the civil rights leader noted the thousands of activists willing to give up their freedom and safety for its realization. He wrote:

Without violence, we totally disrupted the system, the life style of Birmingham, and then Selma, with their unjust and unconstitutional laws. Our Birmingham struggle came to its dramatic climax when some 3,500 demonstrators virtually filled every jail in that city and surrounding communities, and some 4,000 more continued to march and demonstrate nonviolently.¹⁸⁸

These activists believed in the dream of black and white citizens living together that King depicted in his speeches and books.¹⁸⁹

At the end of a Christmas Sermon in 1967, this dream was reiterated. King confessed: “Yes, I am personally the victim of deferred dreams, of blasted hope, but in spite of that I close today by saying I still have a dream, because, you know, you can’t give up on life.”¹⁹⁰ These words resonate with the Mahatma’s understanding of *Ahimsa* as the animating principle of nonviolence. In practicing nonviolence, activists have to

¹⁸⁷ King, *A Call to Conscience*, 82.

¹⁸⁸ Martin Luther King, Jr., *Conscience for Change: Massey Lectures 1967* (Toronto, ON: Canadian Broadcasting Corporation Publications, 1968), 31

¹⁸⁹ See for example, Martin Luther King, Jr., *Why We Can’t Wait* (New York: Harper & Row Publishers, 1964), 101-117.

¹⁹⁰ King, *Conscience for Change*, 45.

hold firm to their visions of a more just and peaceful world. They are the taproots of hope that promises made can be realized.

With these taproots in mind, the beloved community has been characterized as King's guiding metaphor.¹⁹¹ This community represented the biblical ideal of a society based on the values of freedom, justice, and harmony.¹⁹² For the civil rights leader, such values had to extend to every human being because human life was deeply interconnected.¹⁹³ Interconnectedness was the basic law of the universe.¹⁹⁴ King remarked: "Injustice anywhere is a threat to justice everywhere."¹⁹⁵ The implication is that, when an activist commits to a vision of a deeply interconnected universe, harming others by any means is suspect.¹⁹⁶ Echoing the Mahatma's understanding of *himsa*, the idea is that by harming others, we harm ourselves.

The "I have a dream" speech has been described as one of the most powerful statements on the beloved community.¹⁹⁷ Part of this power is attributed to the radical spirituality of inclusiveness King narrated. The spirituality is radically inclusive because it promotes the civil rights leader's desire for an integrated society in which everyone would be understood as equal in the eyes of God.¹⁹⁸ The image evoked in the speech is

¹⁹¹ Cheryl A. Kirk-Duggan, *Refiner's Fire: A Religious Engagement with Violence* (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2001), 82.

¹⁹² Chernus, *American Nonviolence*, 168.

¹⁹³ Michael Nojeim, *Gandhi and King: The Power of Nonviolent Resistance* (Westport, CT: Praeger, 2004), 195.

¹⁹⁴ Chernus, *American Nonviolence*, 164-165.

¹⁹⁵ Martin Luther King, Jr., "Letter from a Birmingham Jail," *Christian Century* 80, no. 24 (June 12, 1963): 767.

¹⁹⁶ John Dear, *Put Down Your Sword: Answering the Gospel Call to Creative Nonviolence* (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2008), 118.

¹⁹⁷ Nojeim, *Gandhi and King*, 196-197; Peter J. Paris, "Martin Luther King Jr.'s Vision of America: An Ethical Assessment," *Theology Today* 65 (April 2008): 17-25; C. Douglas Weaver, "The Spirituality of Martin Luther King Jr.," *Perspectives in Religious Studies* 31, no. 1 (Spring 2004): 55-70.

¹⁹⁸ Weaver, "The Spirituality of Martin Luther King, Jr.," 68.

of a more just and peaceful America, a country flush with the sound of freedom ringing from every mountain and hilltop.¹⁹⁹ King declared:

And when this happens, when we allow freedom to ring, when we let it ring from every village and every hamlet, from every state and every city, we will be able to speed up the day when all of God's children, black and white men, Jews and Gentiles, Protestants and Catholics, will be able to join hands and sing in the words of the old Negro spiritual: Free at last! Free at last! Thank God Almighty, we are free at last!²⁰⁰

Elsewhere, he connected this image of America with other conceptualizations of what it means to be radically spiritual and inclusive. King wrote: "The hope of a secure and livable world lies with the disciplined nonconformists, who are dedicated to justice, peace and brotherhood."²⁰¹ By nonconformists, King implied those such as Mahatma Gandhi who envisioned and lived nonviolence as both a method and a way of life. These nonconformists modeled the hope that systems of injustice and oppression in the United States were not inevitable and unchangeable. The country could be different and spirituality had a vital role to play in achieving this end.

Of the India leader, King stated: "Within his own century, the nonviolent ethic of Mahatma Gandhi and his followers muzzled the guns of the British Empire in India and freed more than three hundred and fifty million people from colonialism."²⁰² Love-force was understood in this context as a viable option because of these nonconforming Satyagrahi, several million strong. Nonviolence was their means to transform their country. The end, an India free from colonial oppression and violence, was a precedent for what King's beloved community could accomplish in the United States.

¹⁹⁹ King, *A Call to Conscience*, 86-87.

²⁰⁰ King, *A Call to Conscience*, 87.

²⁰¹ Martin Luther King, Jr., *Strength to Love*, 16.

²⁰² King, *Why We Can't Wait*, 27.

Theme II: The Commitment to Love

King resonated with Gandhi's belief that nonviolence was the only way to bring about a more just and peaceful world.²⁰³ Speaking of the Mahatma's influence, he observed: "As I delved deeper into the philosophy of Gandhi my skepticism concerning the power of love gradually diminished, and I came to see for the first time that the Christian doctrine of love operating through the Gandhian method was one of the most potent weapons available to oppressed people in their struggle for freedom."²⁰⁴ Here, the Christian doctrine of love is explicitly connected to action. The implications of this connection are clear: love is not passive. King remarked: "Not arms but love, understanding, and organized goodwill can cast out fear. Only disarmament, based on good faith, will make mutual trust a living reality."²⁰⁵ Love made manifest, meaning through nonviolence, brings about the beloved community.

King equated love with *agape*, or what Stanley Hauerwas refers to as "the refusal to distinguish between worthy and unworthy people."²⁰⁶ The civil rights leader commented: "When we rise to love on the *agape* level, we love others not because their attitudes and ways appeal to us, but because God loves them."²⁰⁷ The purpose of this love is not to defeat or humiliate the perpetrators of injustice but to win them as a

²⁰³ Nojeim, *Gandhi and King*, 195.

²⁰⁴ Martin Luther King Jr., "My Pilgrimage to Nonviolence," *Christian Century* 77, no. 15 (April 13, 1960): 440.

²⁰⁵ King, Jr., *Strength to Love*, 125.

²⁰⁶ Stanley Hauerwas, *War and the American Difference: Theological Reflections on Violence and National Identity* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2011), 90.

²⁰⁷ Martin Luther King Jr., "Facing the Challenge of a New Age," in *Peace is the Way: Writings on Nonviolence from the Fellowship of Reconciliation*, ed. Walter Wink (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 2000), 182.

friend.²⁰⁸ Winning a friend through love requires distinguishing between the perpetrator of injustice and the injustice itself.²⁰⁹ In a sense, this understanding parallels the Mahatma's stress on acknowledging people's common humanity. By acknowledging this humanity, nonviolent activists can distinguish between a person and his/her deed.²¹⁰ It is the deed that should be reviled, not the person.

In the context of the Civil Rights movement, learning to love the person while reviling the deed required courage, dignity, and strength.²¹¹ This was because of the prospect of hatred and violent retaliation on the part of Southern segregationists that many nonviolent resisters faced on a daily basis. During the Montgomery Bus Boycott, King endured police harassment, death threats, and his house was bombed.²¹² His conviction in the power of love to transform structures of injustice and oppression did not waver, however. The conviction has been attributed to King's belief that the struggle against these realities was a deeply spiritual endeavor.²¹³ In his 1964 Nobel Prize lecture, King wrote:

When I speak of love I am not speaking of some sentimental and weak response which is little more than emotional bosh. I am speaking of that force which all great religions have seen as the supreme unifying principle of life. Love is somehow the key that unlocks the door which leads to ultimate reality.²¹⁴

²⁰⁸ Hauerwas, *War and the American Difference*, 90.

²⁰⁹ Nojeim, *Gandhi and King: The Power*, 198.

²¹⁰ King, "Facing the Challenge of," 182. Emphasis in original text.

²¹¹ Weaver, "The Spirituality of Martin Luther King Jr.," 63-66.

²¹² Marsh, *The Beloved Community*, 30-38.

²¹³ Weaver, "The Spirituality of Martin Luther King Jr.," 56.

²¹⁴ Martin Luther King, Jr., "Martin Luther King – Nobel Lecture." Nobelprize.org, under "Nobel Peace Prize," http://www.nobelprize.org/nobel_prizes/peace/laureates/1964/king-lecture.html (accessed November 19, 2011).

This quotation reasserts the understanding that nonviolent love is both a method for change and a way of life.²¹⁵ When practiced, it makes the beloved community present.²¹⁶ Julius Lester, who worked as a civil rights activist in the 1960s, describes the impact of King's vision and action on the movement:

The concept of non-violence gave southern blacks a way to channel their anger, the understandable desire for revenge, and focus on changing the hearts of the adversary. What Dr. King did so brilliantly was to base his concept of non-violence on a central Biblical teaching: 'You shall love your neighbor as yourself.' The goal of the civil rights movement became, not the end of segregation, but, in the words of Jane Stembridge, a white civil rights worker, the goal was the creation of 'the beloved community.'²¹⁷

1.5.5 Standing on the Shoulders of Giants

Gandhi is said to have modeled an engaged spirituality before there was such a word.²¹⁸ The Mahatma drew on the ethical precepts of his spirituality to challenge social, political, and economic injustice and bring spiritual practices to bear on the transformation of society.²¹⁹ He was not always successful in his efforts, but Robert King writes that he inspired others to take up an engaged spirituality, including Martin Luther King, Jr.²²⁰ Each leader believed, in other words, that peace and reconciliation were the taproots of their spiritual traditions, despite the traditions' histories of oppression and violence.²²¹ Such personal convictions were made manifest in the visions and actions of these giants and those who followed their examples of principled nonviolence.

²¹⁵ King, "My Pilgrimage to Nonviolence," 71.

²¹⁶ Chernus, *American Nonviolence*, 171.

²¹⁷ Julius Lester, "God and Social Change," *Crosscurrents* 56, no.3 (August 2006): 306.

²¹⁸ Robert H. King, *Thomas Merton and Thich Nhat Hanh: Engaged Spirituality in an Age of Globalization* (New York, NY: Continuum, 2001), 157.

²¹⁹ King, *Thomas Merton and Thich Nhat*, 157.

²²⁰ King, *Thomas Merton and Thich Nhat*, 157.

²²¹ King, *Thomas Merton and Thich Nhat*, 159.

Given the devotion of activists and scholars to these giants, it is fair to say that many feel that contemporary spiritually-motivated activism stands on their shoulders. Other figures could have been chosen to reflect on this activism, however. Several names come to mind: Dorothy Day, Abraham Joshua Heschel, and the Berrigan brothers, Daniel and Philip.²²² These activists also emerged in the twentieth century to influence what has become known as engaged, liberation, non-violent, progressive, and/or resistance spiritualities.²²³

I prefer the term ‘engaged spirituality’ because of its breadth. By breadth, I mean the term can be employed across a spectrum of scholarly disciplines and spiritual traditions to denote a proactive concern for social and political transformation.²²⁴ Such breadth reflects the diversity of those who take up this concern either individually, as part of a community, or at an organizational level in the United States today. Ken Butigan remarks: “Ours is the age of a widely emerging ‘Engaged Spirituality.’”²²⁵ In the next section, I provide some examples of contemporary spiritually-motivated activists currently working in the United States. The visions and actions of these

²²² For more on these nonviolent activists, see Anne Klejment and Nancy Roberts, *American Catholic Pacifism: The Influence of Dorothy Day and the Catholic Worker Movement* (Westport, CT: Praeger, 1996); Abraham Joshua Heschel, *Abraham Joshua Heschel: Essential Writings*, ed. Susannah Heschel (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2011); Daniel Berrigan, *To Dwell in Peace: An Autobiography* (San Francisco, CA: Harper and Row, 1987); Philip Berrigan with Fred A. Wilcox, *Fighting the Lamb’s War: Skirmishes with the American Empire* (Monroe, ME: Common Courage Press, 1996).

²²³ See Jeremy Carrette and Richard King, *Selling Spirituality: The Silent Takeover of Religion* (New York, NY: Routledge, 2005); Gordon Lynch, *The New Spirituality: An Introduction to Progressive Belief in the Twentieth Century* (London, UK: I.B. Tauris, 2007).

²²⁴ See Joseph Nangle, *Engaged Spirituality: Faith Life in the Heart of Empire* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2008); Janet W. Parachin, *Engaged Spirituality: Ten Lives of Contemplation and Action* (St. Louis, MO: Chalice Press, 1999); Donald Rothberg, *The Engaged Spiritual Life: A Buddhist Approach to Transforming Ourselves and the World* (Boston, MA: Beacon Press, 2006).

²²⁵ Ken Butigan, “What is Engaged Spirituality?” *Tikkun* 23, no. 5 (September/October 2008): 66.

activists represent the many ways principled nonviolence is understood and lived out in this context.

1.5.6 Examples: Engaged Spirituality in America

Gregory Stanczak uses the term *engaged spirituality* in his sociological study of spiritually-motivated socio-political commitment in America.²²⁶ The activists Stanczak interviewed were not only rooted in a number of different spiritual traditions but also took on a variety of roles in their communities. They volunteered as soccer coaches, ran faith-based organizations, or acted as advocates on behalf of the homeless. In their work, these activists confronted a range of issues, including poverty, injustice, and violence. To capture this diversity, Stanczak defines engaged spirituality as a merging of a “spirituality of the soul with a spirituality of the streets.”²²⁷

I understand this definition as reaffirming the dual capacities of imagining and building a positive peace previously discussed in this chapter. Through these capacities, spiritually-engaged activists recognize that their visions of a more just and peaceful world always require concrete action. Thus, the spheres of social and political change are conceptualized as broader than the church hall, the mosque, the temple or the sangha. Spiritually-motivated social and political change also take place in the streets.

Stanczak identified a common theme in his interviews that speaks to the definition of engaged spirituality as a meeting of the soul and the streets. This theme

²²⁶ Gregory Stanczak, *Engaged Spirituality: Social Change and American Religion* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University, 2006).

²²⁷ Stanczak, *Engaged Spirituality*, 6.

was the belief in the ubiquitousness of spirituality in everyday experiences and actions.²²⁸ He writes:

What is clear from these stories is that spirituality is in everything: the mundane, the intimate, the iconic and the unexpected. Engaged spirituality ensures acknowledgement of this connection as not only internalized or salvation-bound but also externalized in the works of this world. It is neither exclusively private nor public, sacred nor profane. Spirituality in the minds and actions of these interviewees is in struggle and service; it is the energy of change.²²⁹

The characterization of spirituality as the ubiquitous energy of change that sustains spiritually-motivated activism would reverberate with the Network of Spiritual Progressives cofounded by Rabbi Michael Lerner, Sister Joan Chittister, and Cornell West in 2005.²³⁰ In its mission statement, the Network states that spirituality is “personal but not a private matter; it is about how we treat each other and how we live our lives.”²³¹ It welcomes members from a spectrum of philosophies and traditions, including atheism and humanism. Despite these different backgrounds, the members of the Network share a dedication to envisioning and building a world that is more just, ecologically sound, and peaceful. This dedication is evident in articles posted on the organization’s website on the role of nonviolence in settings around the world.²³²

²²⁸ Stanczak, *Engaged Spirituality*, 169.

²²⁹ Stanczak, *Engaged Spirituality*, 184.

²³⁰ The Network of Spiritual Progressives, “NPS Co-Founders,” The Network of Spiritual Progressives, under “About Us,” http://spiritualprogressives.org/newsite/?page_id=33 (accessed December 7, 2011).

²³¹ The Network of Spiritual Progressives, “Our Mission and Vision,” The Network of Spiritual Progressives, under “About Us,” http://spiritualprogressives.org/newsite/?page_id=303 (accessed December 7, 2011).

²³² Michael Nagler, “Nonviolence was Key to Changes in Egypt,” The Network of Spiritual Progressive, <http://www.spiritualprogressives.org/article.php?story=20110215154439309> (accessed May 5, 2012).

Vietnamese Buddhist monk, Thich Nhat Hanh shares the Network's vision.²³³

Nhat Hanh is one of the preeminent voices of engaged spirituality in the United States.²³⁴ He coined the term 'Engaged Buddhism' to refer to a spirituality that explicitly melds the precepts of wisdom and compassion with concrete social action.²³⁵ The term was initially meant to describe the activism of a small group of Buddhist monks, nuns, and laity who opposed the violence perpetrated by both sides in the Vietnam War.²³⁶ Now in his eighties, Nhat Hanh continues to promote nonviolent social change through his writings, retreats, and speaking engagements.²³⁷ Echoing Martin Luther King, Jr.'s sentiments that the time for nonviolence is the present moment, he writes:

To prevent war, to prevent crisis, we must begin right now. When war or a crisis has begun, it is already too late. If we and our children practice ahimsa in our daily lives, if we learn how to plant seeds of peace and reconciliation in our hearts and minds, we will begin to establish real peace and, in that way, we may be able to prevent the next war.²³⁸

In Christianity, the terms engaged, liberation, and resistance are often used to describe a spirituality dedicated to envisioning and implementing nonviolent social and

²³³ Chernus, *American Nonviolence*, 192-203; Janet W. Parachin, "Educating for an Engaged Spirituality: Dorothy Day and Thich Nhat Hanh as Spiritual Exemplars," *Religious Education* 95, no. 3 (Summer 2000): 250-268.

²³⁴ Although Nhat Hanh's principal residence is Plum Village in France, he has founded monastic communities in the United States and frequently travels to the country to give retreats and speaking tours on Buddhism and social engagement.

²³⁵ Sallie B. King, *Socially Engaged Buddhism* (Honolulu, HI: University of Hawai'i Press, 2009), 4.

²³⁶ Christopher S. Queen, "The Peace Wheel: Nonviolent Activism in the Buddhist Tradition," in *Subverting Hatred: The Challenge of Nonviolence in Religious Traditions*, ed. Daniel L. Smith-Christopher, 10th Anniversary Edition (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2007), 28. Also see Sister Chan Khong, *Learning True Love: Practicing Buddhism in a Time of War* (Berkeley, CA: Parallax Press, 2007).

²³⁷ See Thich Nhat Hanh, *Love in Action: Writings on Nonviolent Social Change* (Berkeley, CA: Parallax Press, 1993); Deer Park Monastery, "Thich Nhat Hanh – Biography of our teacher Thich Nhat Hanh," Deer Park Monastery, under "Home," <http://deerparkmonastery.org/about-us/thich-nhat-hanh> (accessed January 23, 2012).

²³⁸ Thich Nhat Hanh, "Ahimsa: The Path of Harmlessness," in *Buddhist Peacework: Creating Cultures of Peace*, ed. David W. Chappell (Boston, MA: Wisdom Publications, 1999), 159. It should be noted that ahimsa is also a precept in Buddhism. It did not originate with Gandhi.

political action. For example, Joseph Nangle has written a book entitled *Engaged Spirituality: Faith Life in the Heart of the Empire*. He states that his writings are influenced by his encounter with liberation theology after living for fifteen years in Latin America.²³⁹ Liberation theology can be understood as “a way to think about God in our contemporary world from the perspective of those left out of the benefits of the current global economy.”²⁴⁰ Although its origins lie in experiences of oppression, poverty, and resistance in Latin America, several theologies have emerged under the label of ‘liberation theology’ in the United States and around the globe.²⁴¹ These theologies include Asian, Black, Hispanic, and Feminist theologies.²⁴²

A contemporary voice in liberation spirituality is Mary Grey. In one study, she explores the ways liberation spirituality can help to re-envision reconciliation in the aftermath of violence.²⁴³ The book was sparked by a journey to Rwanda that raised troubling questions about the role of spirituality in the context of genocide.²⁴⁴ Although Gray uses the term liberation, her work identifies some of the same themes that Stanczak, the Network for Spiritual Progressives, and Nhat Hanh suggest are intrinsic to an engaged spirituality. Speaking of the link between spirit and action, she describes how peace and reconciliation begin with those willing to risk small acts of courage.²⁴⁵

²³⁹ Nangle, *Engaged Spirituality: Faith Life*, xiv.

²⁴⁰ Daniel Groody, *Globalization, Spirituality and Justice* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2010), 183.

²⁴¹ Groody, *Globalization, Spirituality and Justice*, 183, 186-189; Stacey M. Floyd-Thomas and Anthony B. Pinn, ed., *Liberation Theologies in the United States: An Introduction* (New York, NY: New York University Press, 2010).

²⁴² Groody, *Globalization, Spirituality and Justice*, 202-207.

²⁴³ Mary Grey, *To Rwanda and Back: Liberation Spirituality and Reconciliation* (London, UK: Darton, Longman and Todd, 2007).

²⁴⁴ Grey, *To Rwanda and Back: Liberation*, ix.

²⁴⁵ Grey, *To Rwanda and Back: Liberation*, 107.

These acts are witness to the role that spirituality can play in larger processes of nonviolent social and political change. For Grey, witnessing to this role is the “sacred work” to which all Christians have been entrusted.²⁴⁶

In the final sections of this chapter, I explore some of the key learnings derived from my previous discussions. With these learnings, I attempt to ‘connect the dots’ so to speak between envisioning and building a positive peace and the role of engaged spirituality in the United States. The connections I make should not be understood as definitive statements on these matters. They are connections that resonate with the ideas presented in the subsequent chapters of my dissertation.

1.6 The Sacred Work of Engaged Spirituality: Key Learnings

In the United States, the sacred work of engaged spirituality continues on a daily basis. As stated above, my intention with this chapter was not to provide a comprehensive overview of this sacred work. Such an overview would fill the pages of more than one dissertation. In my research, I am concerned with activists, spiritual and musical, who spoke out against the ‘war on terror.’ The plethora of academic works that explore spiritually-motivated activism in the United States, however, are a testament to its breadth and diversity.²⁴⁷

The examples discussed throughout this chapter set the historical backdrop for the construction of an adequate approach to contemporary protest music in the discipline of spirituality. From this backdrop, three key learnings emerge. The first is that

²⁴⁶ Grey, *To Rwanda and Back: Liberation*, 107.

²⁴⁷ See Elizabeth D. Hutchinson, “Spirituality, Religion and Progressive Social Movements: Resources and Motivation for Social Change,” *Journal of Religion and Spirituality in Social Work: Social Thought* 31 (2012): 105-127.

spirituality is a resource for cultivating a positive peace. I established this learning by discussing the dual capacities of imagining and building that is at the heart of spiritually-motivated initiatives in a variety of contexts. I turned to the role of spirituality in the visions and actions of influential principled nonviolent advocates to affirm this learning. By noting the influence of Mahatma Gandhi on civil rights and labour leaders such as Martin Luther King Jr. and Cesar Chavez, I have suggested that nonviolent, engaged spirituality runs deep in the history and culture of the United States. This history continues to be written today through the work of those practicing diverse forms of the aforementioned spirituality.

The second learning is that vision and action are major components of an engaged spirituality. The examples I have discussed testify to the importance of the power of the imagination to sustain the dreams that other worlds are possible. These dreams are the fertile soils in which a principled nonviolence can take root. Micheal Nagler writes: “We need new ideas and fresh energy to break out of the closed cycles of discourse surrounding violence, as living things on earth need energy from beyond our planet, from the sun, to organize themselves biologically and overcome entropy.”²⁴⁸ Figures such as the Mahatma and King underscore, however, that new ideas and fresh energy are only part of the equation. Action brings these ideas to life and channels this energy into ever more creative strategies for achieving constructive social and political change.

²⁴⁸ Michael N. Nagler, *The Search for a Nonviolent Future: A Promise of Peace for Ourselves, Our Families, and our World* (Maui, HI: Inner Ocean Publishing, 2004), 191.

The third learning is the need to identify and explore the visions and actions of those committed to bringing about a more just and peaceful world. The ideas and works of activists and organizations testify to the reality that nonviolent alternatives do exist and can be a legitimate means of responding to violence and to war. They embody the reality that violence and war are not inevitable and unchangeable undercurrents in either American history or culture. This stands in sharp contrast to former President Bush's often quoted statement that: "You are either with us or against us."²⁴⁹ Fortunately, at the same time that the former President was uttering this statement, spiritually- and musically-motivated activists were dreaming up other worlds and taking these worlds to the streets.

1.7 The Imaginative and Performative Dynamics of Engaged Spirituality

The key learnings in this chapter are significant underpinnings for all subsequent discussions in this dissertation. They emphasize the historical relationship between spirituality and peace in the United States. They also suggest that engaged spirituality can be understood as having imaginative (vision) and performative (action) dynamics. By dynamics, I mean the capacity to create particular spaces.

When spiritually-motivated activists imagine and build a positive peace they can be viewed as engaging in the creation of spaces similar to those generated by musicians when they protest violence and war. In this view, spiritually-motivated activists are artists embarking on a creative process. This idea is affirmed by the work of Robert

²⁴⁹ Leader, "Bush's new world order: Either you stand with us or against us," *The Guardian* (September 14, 2001), under "Special Report: Terrorism in the U.S.," <http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2001/sep/14/september11.usa6/print> (accessed February 1, 2012).

Wuthnow who argues that artists have much to teach spiritual adherents about the creation of a satisfactory spiritual life.²⁵⁰ He writes:

In the final analysis, the way of the artist is not about techniques for becoming more creative in one's efforts to get ahead. It is about spiritual practice and incorporating the artist's experimental approach into one's spiritual quest. Creating a satisfactory spiritual life involves taking responsibility for one's relationship with the sacred. It requires focusing one's attention, learning the rules, mastering the craft, and deploying the imagination. It encourages us to confront the pain that arises from broken relationships and to register the wonder that comes from thinking about love and redemption. In these matters, artists have much to teach us all.²⁵¹

Wuthnow also suggests that, by understanding the artistic process, insight is provided to revitalize what it means to be spiritual in the United States.²⁵² In the context of my research, this insight and revitalization includes querying into the ways people imagine and build a positive peace through musical performance.

The idea that the arts and music can provide insight into and revitalize spiritualities is not new.²⁵³ Other scholars have described these activities as helping people recognize and respond to their spiritual needs.²⁵⁴ Pattiann Rogers notes: "The finest of the arts reveal to us those needs in the sharpest, most distinct, most penetrating evocations and, in doing so, enlarge and brighten the world."²⁵⁵

²⁵⁰ Robert Wuthnow, *Creative Spirituality: The Way of the Artist* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2001).

²⁵¹ Wuthnow, *Creative Spirituality: The Way*, 276. See also Alison Knowles et al., "Art as Spiritual Practice," *PAJ: A Journal of Performance and Art* 24, no. 3 (September 2002): 18-34.

²⁵² Robert Wuthnow, *All in Sync: How Music and Art are Revitalizing American Religion* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2003).

²⁵³ For more on the relationship between art and spirituality, see Diane Apostolos-Cappadona, ed., *Art, Creativity, and the Sacred* (New York, NY: Continuum, 2001).

²⁵⁴ Pattiann Rogers, "Small and Insignificant, Mighty and Glorious," *Spiritus* 2, no. 2 (Fall 2002): 146.

²⁵⁵ Rogers, "Small and Insignificant," 146.

The activists discussed in this chapter would consider a positive peace to be a vital spiritual need.²⁵⁶ It is not only a spiritual need. This peace is also a social and political concern that activists from a range of backgrounds and communities have sought to engage with. Thus, I propose throughout the remainder of my dissertation that artists and musicians evoke and enlarge perspectives on and possibilities for a positive peace.²⁵⁷ By evoking and enlarging these perspectives and possibilities, the arts and music kindle the imagination. This kindling is particularly powerful, as Douglas Burton-Christie suggests, when people engage in the creative process itself.²⁵⁸

1.8 Conclusion: Protest Music Performances as a Source of Insight?

Can protest music performances be sources of insight into the delegitimizing of violence and war? What is the role of creativity in this delegitimizing? In subsequent chapters, I explore these questions. I begin the exploration in Chapter Two. Here, I introduce my hypothesis, working definitions, and some of the methodological shifts needed to support my understanding of musical performance as a source of insight that evokes and enlarges perspectives on and possibilities for a positive peace.

²⁵⁶ See for example, John W. De Gruchy, *Christianity, Art and Transformation: Theological Aesthetics in the Struggle for Justice* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2001).

²⁵⁷ Douglas Burton-Christie, "Poesis," *Spiritus* 2, no. 2 (Fall 2002): vii-ix.

²⁵⁸ Burton-Christie, "Poesis," vii.

Chapter Two: Methodological Steps for Constructing an Adequate Approach to Contemporary Protest Music in the Discipline of Spirituality

A complex reality always bursts in on attempts to seal it out.

- Edward Said, *Parallels and Paradoxes*

I am asking all of us to think carefully and clearly. For if we are all being herded into actions that will make the world even more dangerous than it is now, we will later regret that we went along silently and did not raise our voices as citizens to ask, "How can we get at the roots of this problem? Is it right to meet violence with violence?" All of us can do something, can ask questions, can speak up.

- Howard Zinn, *Artists in Times of War*

2. Introduction

In this chapter, I discuss some of the methodological steps needed to construct an adequate approach to contemporary protest music in the discipline of spirituality. In the first section, I introduce my hypothesis. The second section is an exposition of my working definitions. These definitions underscore the need for creative and original thinking on the human phenomena of music, spirituality, and violence. In the third section, I discuss the creativity of two scholars in the discipline of spirituality who have broadened their sources of insight into the issue of space. Their creativity implies that the re-envisioning of scholarly approaches is an acceptable methodological step in their discipline. By re-envisioning, I mean rethinking approaches to make them more expansive or in terms pertinent to my research as creative, interdisciplinary, and musically literate.

2.1 Hypothesis

Contemporary protest music is a source of insight into the delegitimizing of violence, including the violent legacies of the American 'war on terror.' To study this

music adequately, scholars in the discipline of spirituality require an approach that is creative, interdisciplinary and musically literate. The benefit of this approach is a methodological framework through which to re-envision the ways engaged spirituality is theorized and taught in the discipline.

2.2 Working Definitions

I begin my construction of an adequate approach to contemporary protest music by discussing my working definitions of music, spirituality, and violence. Working definitions are important because they “contain [an] area of reflection without limiting it.”¹ The ability to contain without limiting a subject cautions against assuming that there are universally accepted definitions in most scholarly discourses.² For the purposes of my research, therefore, I provide composite understandings of the human phenomena under investigation.³

2.2.1 Working Definition of Music

Below, I present my working definition of music. This definition is grouped into two themes, namely music as a source of insight and music as an act of social imagination. I employ a similar thematic format to discuss my understandings of spirituality and violence in subsequent sections.

Theme I: Music as a Source of Insight

¹ David Perrin, *Studying Christian Spirituality* (New York, NY: Routledge, 2007), 16.

² Perrin, *Studying Christian Spirituality*, 16.

³ Perrin, *Studying Christian Spirituality*, 16-35.

Christopher Small's term, *musicking*, is defined as taking part in a musical performance in any capacity.⁴ This includes rehearsing, performing, listening, and dancing. The definition is extended to activities such as the provision of materials for performance as well as the sale of tickets. Musicking covers "all participation in a musical performance, whether it takes place actively or passively, whether we like the way it happens or whether we do not, whether we consider it interesting or boring, constructive or destructive, sympathetic or antipathetic."⁵ In this understanding, even listening to a recording can be an important act of musicking that contributes meaning to a performance.

Small's term is significant for several reasons. First, as a verb, it is a reminder that musical meaning is not embedded in a score or a song's text but in its performance.⁶ Musicking, in other words, is an action.⁷ Placing the emphasis on action implies that performance is not a secondary concern for those seeking to understand this human phenomenon. Rather, performance should be considered at the center of such understandings.⁸ Simply put, music would not exist without the act of performance.⁹

⁴ Christopher Small, *Musicking: The Meanings of Performance and Listening* (Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press, 1998), 9.

⁵ Small, *Musicking*, 9.

⁶ Christopher Small, "Prologue: Misunderstanding and Reunderstanding," in *Music and Solidarity: Questions of Universality, Consciousness, and Connection*, ed. Felicity Laurence and Olivier Urbain, *Peace and Policy*, vol. 15 (New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers, 2011), ix-x.

⁷ Small, "Prologue: Misunderstanding and Reunderstanding," x.

⁸ Small, *Musicking*, 185.

⁹ Small, *Musicking*, 164.

Second, his term draws attention to the relationships that are brought into being in musical performances. These relationships are the basis of musical meaning, in Small's opinion.¹⁰ He explains:

Musical meanings, then, are concerned with relationships, the relationships of our world as we believe they are and as we believe they ought to be. And since how we relate is who we are, we can say that in musicking we are exploring, affirming, and celebrating who we are, or at least who we think we are, in relation to fellow humans, to the world and even perhaps to the supernatural world – if the supernatural is a part of our conceptual world.¹¹

Another way to understand this explanation is that musicking provides participants with the space to explore, affirm, and celebrate how they relate to the world. By providing this space, musicking becomes a source of insight into the ways people interact. Stated differently, musicking is a human encounter with the potential to shape and reshape “our landscape of human relationships,” including the ways in which people come together to dream up and live out constructive social and political change.¹²

Analyzing this human encounter in the particular is important.¹³ This is because understandings of the complex interplay of relationships in musical performances differ according to context. Small comments: “A work of art ‘means’ whatever the beholder, in whatever ‘here’ or ‘now’ they might find themselves, think it means.”¹⁴ Such contingency is not considered an obstacle but rather a means to creative and original

¹⁰ Small, “Prologue: Misunderstanding and Reunderstanding,” xi.

¹¹ Small, “Prologue: Misunderstanding and Reunderstanding,” xiii.

¹² Small, “Prologue: Misunderstanding and Reunderstanding,” xii.

¹³ Small, *Musicking*, 49. Musicking has been used as a tool in several studies to describe and analyze the dynamics and meanings produced in performance. See Nicola Wood and Sun J. Smith, “Instrumental Routes to Emotional Geographies,” *Social and Cultural Geography* 5, no. 4, (December 2004): 533-548; Avi Gilboa, Nechama Yehuda, and Dorit Amir, “Let’s Talk Music: A Musical-Communal Project for Enhancing Communication among Students of Multi-Cultural Origin,” *Nordic Journal of Music Therapy* 18, no. 1 (March 2009): 3-31; Michael Fuhr, “Performing K(yopo)-Rock: Aesthetics, Identity, and Korean Migrant Ritual in Germany,” *Inter-Asia Cultural Studies* 11, no. 1 (March 2010): 115-122.

¹⁴ Small, “Prologue: Misunderstanding and Reunderstanding,” ix.

thinking on particular acts of musicking.¹⁵ To facilitate such thinking, Small asks: “*What does it mean when this performance takes place at this time, in this place, with these participants?*”¹⁶ His question highlights at least three sets of relationships that create meaning in musical performances.

The first set concerns the relationship between the participants and the physical setting.¹⁷ Inquiring into this relationship reveals that the physical setting in which a musical performance takes place has the power to guide human behavior.¹⁸ For example, in a Western style concert hall there is often a sense of crossing a threshold into another world when participants move from the foyer to the performance hall.¹⁹ The building’s design gives the impression that social interaction takes place in the foyer and contemplative reception of the music occurs in the hall.²⁰ By adhering to or challenging these physical parameters, participants create an imaginative space in which to envision or re-envision their relationships. The point is that both the physical setting and the imaginative space created give meaning to the performance and its reception.

The second set of relationships highlighted by Small’s question is among those taking part in a performance.²¹ This idea, that meaning is created in the relationships between those present, challenges a conceptualization of performance as predictable, inevitable, and static.²² The reality is that the meaning of musicking changes as

¹⁵ Small, “Prologue: Misunderstanding and Reunderstanding,” xv.

¹⁶ Small, *Musicking*, 10. Emphasis in original text.

¹⁷ Small, *Musicking*, 193.

¹⁸ Small, *Musicking*, 20.

¹⁹ Small, *Musicking*, 24.

²⁰ Small, *Musicking*, 25-27.

²¹ Small, *Musicking*, 193.

²² Small, *Musicking*, 46.

individual and communal tastes shift.²³ Understandings of this human phenomenon cannot be reduced, therefore, to a single relationship or activity. If one is to understand the dynamics of a particular musical performance, a more expansive approach is needed that can account for the diverse relationships that exist between those present. This includes the relationships between the musicians, the musicians and the audience, and among the audience members.

Finally, the third set of relationships is between the sounds that are made by the performers.²⁴ For example, what meaning is generated through the relationships between different vocal lines or between a song's melody and rhythm? Attending to these relationships is important because, as Small suggests, they model the complexity and dynamism of life.²⁵ Sonic relationships are here understood as metaphors that enable an experience of deep interdependence.²⁶ Small writes:

When we perform, we bring into existence, for the duration of the performance, a set of relationships, between the sounds and between the participants, that model ideal relationships as we imagine them to be and allow us to learn about them by experiencing them. The modeling is reciprocal, as implied by the three words I have used persistently through this book: in exploring we learn, from the sounds and from one another, the nature of relationships; in affirming we teach one another about the relationships, and in celebrating we bring together the teaching and the learning in an act of solidarity.²⁷

Theme II: Musical Performance as an Act of Social Imagination

²³ Small, *Musicking*, 91, 133.

²⁴ Small, *Musicking*, 193.

²⁵ Small, *Musicking*, 200.

²⁶ John Paul and Angela Jill Lederach also explore this idea. They stress the importance of music as a sonic metaphor for facilitating processes of healing and reconciliation among individuals and communities who have experienced violence. Feeling connected to others as human beings is vital to the success of these processes. See Lederach and Lederach, *When Blood and Bones Cry Out*.

²⁷ Small, *Musicking*, 218.

By using the term musicking, Small hoped to provide people with a tool to explore the multiple relationships possible in musical performances.²⁸ He believed that cultivating awareness of musicking's "ever widening spiral of relationships" could give people a renewed sense of what music can do.²⁹ More specifically, he hoped that people would come to understand musicking as a space where they could live out the relationships they wanted to see in their everyday lives.³⁰

As though echoing this hope, Janet Sarbanes discusses musicking in her analysis of a Greek musical subculture known as *rebetika*.³¹ Rebetika is an amalgamation of Greek and Turkish influences and in the early twentieth century was associated with marginalized urban milieus such as hashish dens.³² In the context of this subculture, musical performance became a space for what Sarbanes calls, "social imagination."³³ The use of the term social imagination captures what is implicit in the verb, musicking. This is the idea that music is a highly collaborative act, meaning that it involves "the integration of people doing different things."³⁴ Alongside exploring, affirming, and celebrating the relationships they would like to see in their everyday lives, people also use musicking to contest these relationships.

For example, rebetika involved the construction of alternative identities and communities that resisted normative perceptions of what it meant to be Greek. This

²⁸ Small, *Musicking*, 10.

²⁹ Small, *Musicking*, 210.

³⁰ Small, *Musicking*, 46, 50.

³¹ Janet Sarbanes, "Musicking and Communitas: The Aesthetic Mode of Sociality in Rebetika Subculture," *Popular Music and Society* 29, no. 1 (February 2006): 11-35.

³² Grove Dictionary Online, "Rebeika," Oxford Music Online, under <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com.proxy.bib.uottawa.ca/subscriber/article/grove/music/51102> (accessed March 13, 2012).

³³ Sarbanes, "Musicking and Communitas," 20-21.

³⁴ Sarbanes, "Musicking and Communitas," 21.

meant dressing in Turkish costumes and participating in customs such as drinking, dancing, and smoking hashish.³⁵ Through these different activities, those who performed rebetika contested simplistic understandings of Greek identity. By musicking, they gained the insight that to be Greek could also mean the exploration, affirmation, and celebration of Turkish influences.³⁶

In another example, a 2003 Clash-tribute concert is described as a highly collaborative and contesting act of musicking.³⁷ Kevin Dunn remarks:

On stage, the bands – all many years younger than I – were using the songs to make sense of the world; to make sense of what was happening around them. It was clear to them, it was clear to the kids in the audience, and it was clear to me that we were living in extremely dangerous times. The in-between song banter reflected this – comments about President George W. Bush, remarks about American fascism, concerns about the impending war on Iraq, and pleas to register to vote. The kids in the club were using the Clash, much as I did years before, to help them understand the world they were inheriting.³⁸

At the concert, Dunn was particularly struck by the ways in which these Clash-fans used their music-making to make sense of their experiences of the world. More pointedly, in the space provided, participants used song, dance, and conversation to voice their

³⁵ Sarbanes, “Musicking and Communitas,” 19-22.

³⁶ Sarbanes, “Musicking and Communitas,” 31.

³⁷ Dorian Lynskey, *33 Revolutions per Minute: A History of Protest Songs* (London, UK: Faber and Faber Limited, 2010): 339-358; Hardeep Phull, *Story Behind the Protest Song: A Reference Guide to the 50 Songs that Changed the 20th Century* (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 2008), 139-164, 140. The Clash was a British punk band formed in 1975. The punk movement emerged in Britain and the United States at a time when each country was experiencing economic, social, and political hardships, including rising inflation, high unemployment, and racial tensions. The music spoke to a sense of having no options for a better future among youth. The Clash was one of the iconic bands of the late 1970s and early 1980s. Joe Strummer, the lead vocalist for the band, is quoted as saying, “Rock doesn’t change anything. Having said that, I still want to try and change things.” Quoted in Phull, *Story Behind the Protest Song*, 146.

³⁸ Kevin C. Dunn, “The Clash of Civilization,” in *Resounding International Relations: On Music, Culture, and Politics*, ed. M.I. Franklin (New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2005), 264. Also see Kevin Dunn, “‘Know Your Rights’: Punk Rock, Globalization, and Human Rights,” in *Popular Music and Human Rights: British and American Music*, ed. Ian Peddie, vol. 1 (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2011), 27-37.

opposition to the former Bush administration's decision to go to war in Iraq.³⁹ In a sense, the performative space of the concert became an imaginative space and, thus, a source of insight into the ways people could oppose the war.

By engaging with these spaces, those present participated in an act of social imagination. They re-conceptualized their relationships to each other and to their government. For Dunn, the act sparked a need to integrate his roles as an engaged citizen and as an international relations scholar.⁴⁰ The point I wish to underscore is that, in this concert, spaces were created for the insight that he could be both.

Dunn's description of a particular musical performance resonates with Small and Sarbanes' ideas. These include understanding musicking as a highly collaborative act that mirrors the complexity, multifacetedness, and interconnectedness of people's relationships with each other and the world. An approach in the discipline of spirituality that seeks knowledge of this act should reflect its complexity, multifacetedness, and interconnection. The approach should take account not only of the spiritual dimensions that contribute meaning to a musical performance. Where relevant, scholars should also address what makes a particular performance a source of insight, whether this is the creation of spiritual space or one of social and political contestation.

2.2.2 Working Definition of Spirituality

³⁹ John DeFrongo, *The Iraq War: Origins and Consequences* (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 2010), 1. On March 20, 2003, the United States and its allies invaded Iraq. The apparent purpose of the invasion was to find and destroy weapons of mass destruction. At this time, many Americans believed that Saddam Hussein's regime was somehow implicated in the September 11 terrorist attacks. In the intervening years, the reasons for undertaking military intervention in Iraq have been revealed as false. That is not to say that the war did not garner support. As with any war, there was a spectrum of positions on its legitimacy. These debates will be discussed in Chapter Four through the lens of popular music.

⁴⁰ Dunn, "The Clash of Civilization," 272.

In this section, I turn to my working definition of spirituality. This definition includes three themes. The themes are spirituality as a basic human capacity, the postmodern context, and the importance of spiritual literacy and pneumatophores.

Theme I: Spirituality as a Basic Human Capacity

Sandra Schneiders defines spirituality as, “the conscious involvement in the project of life integration through self-transcendence toward the ultimate value one perceives.”⁴¹ Conscious involvement suggests that spirituality is an “ongoing and coherent approach” to one’s life.⁴² The notion of integration signifies that this involvement engages all of one’s experiences. Spirituality is not a separate dimension of one’s life, but an integral, holistic pursuit. This pursuit finds meaning by transcending the self and relating to others, to the wider world and, in many cases but not all, to divinity.⁴³ The idea of self-transcendence toward the ultimate value one perceives acknowledges that for many, spirituality can be practiced without reference to religion or to a divine entity.⁴⁴

This definition can be situated within the anthropological approach in the discipline of spirituality. The root of the approach is that spirituality is a basic human capacity. The word ‘capacity’ is used to emphasize the belief that spirituality is present, in some shape or form, in every human being. Spirituality is, therefore, “existentially

⁴¹ Sandra Schneiders, “Religion vs. Spirituality: A Contemporary Conundrum,” *Spiritus* 3, no. 2 (Fall 2003): 166.

⁴² Schneiders, “Religion vs. Spirituality,” 167.

⁴³ Schneiders, “Religion vs. Spirituality,” 167.

⁴⁴ For more on this possibility, see Kieran Flanagan and Peter C. Jupp, ed., *A Sociology of Spirituality* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2007); Lynne Hume and Kathleen McPhillips, ed., *Popular Spiritualities: The Politics of Contemporary Enchantment* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006).

(though not always experientially) prior to any particular actualization of spirituality as Christian, Buddhist, ecological, and so on.”⁴⁵ In other words, to be Christian, Buddhist, or ecological can be understood by spiritual practitioners as their chosen and particular manifestation of a shared human capacity.

Following this understanding, Schneiders explains that the discipline of spirituality, which studies Christian spirituality, cannot abstract itself from the awareness that other religious traditions and non-religious movements share in the human experience of spirituality.⁴⁶ The anthropological approach, therefore, acknowledges a broad range of experiences as spiritual, whether or not they appear to be Christian.⁴⁷ This approach is considered to be at its most adequate when it is interdisciplinary, cross-cultural, and interreligious, thereby recognizing the multifaceted and diverse human quests for spirituality.⁴⁸

I work out of this understanding of and approach to spirituality because my interest is contemporary protest music. As I discuss in a subsequent chapter, this genre of music emerges out of diverse contexts. In some of these contexts, protest music intersects with particular spiritualities.⁴⁹ In others, the music intersects with and is more readily understood from a social and/or political perspective. I prefer a working

⁴⁵ Sandra Schneiders, “Approaches to the Study of Christian Spirituality,” in *The Blackwell Companion to Christian Spirituality*, ed. Arthur Holder (Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell, 2011), 26.

⁴⁶ Schneiders, “Approaches to the Study of Christian Spirituality,” 26.

⁴⁷ Perrin, *Studying Christian Spirituality*, 40.

⁴⁸ Sandra Schneiders, “Christian Spirituality: Definitions, Methods and Types,” in *The New Westminster Dictionary of Christian Spirituality*, ed. Philip Sheldrake (Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 2005), 5.

⁴⁹ See for example, Stephen A. King, “Protest Music as ‘Ego-enhancement’: Reggae Music, the Rastafarian Movement and the Re-examination of Race and Identity in Jamaica,” in *The Resisting Muse: Popular Music and Social Protest*, ed. Ian Peddie (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006), 105-118; Peter Dunbar-Hall, “‘We Have Survived’: Popular Music as a Representation of Australian Aboriginal Cultural Loss and Reclamation,” in *The Resisting Muse: Popular Music and Social Protest*, ed. Ian Peddie (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006), 119-131.

definition of spirituality that can adapt to the diversity of protest music and be applied beyond one spiritual tradition.⁵⁰

Theme II: The Postmodern Context

Alongside Sandra Schneiders, Ursula King provides an understanding of spirituality that can accommodate my definitional preferences. King's understanding is informed by a commitment to situate spirituality within the contemporary postmodern context.⁵¹ I briefly discuss this context, pinpointing relevant insights that emerge from King's commitment. These insights include the need to creatively rethink spirituality, to devise approaches that can address the complexity and multidimensionality of this basic human capacity, and the role of spiritual literacy in fostering the well-being of individuals, communities, and the planet.

The postmodern context has been characterized as a kind of wilderness, meaning a place without a sense of rootedness and where no one path is clear or absolute.⁵² This sense of rootlessness can be experienced either negatively or positively. For some, the sense provides an opportunity for experimentation, to recognize diversity and locality,

⁵⁰ Perrin, *Studying Christian Spirituality*, 26-51; Schneiders, "Spirituality and the God Question," 243-250.

⁵¹ Ursula King, *The Search for Spirituality: Our Global Quest for Meaning and Fulfillment* (Norwich, UK: Canterbury Press, 2009). This is a commitment shared by most scholars in the discipline of spirituality. An excellent study is David Ray Griffin's *Spirituality and Society: Postmodern Visions* (Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 1988). A more recent collection of essays edited by King also provides an overview of the challenges facing spirituality in the twenty-first century. See Ursula King with Tina Beattie, ed., *Spirituality and Society in the New Millennium* (Brighton, UK: Sussex Academic Press, 2001). In these works, King cites the recognition of gender analysis, interfaith encounter, and the renewed interest in spirituality in diverse contexts as some of these postmodern challenges.

⁵² Ursula King, introduction to *Spirituality and Society in the New Millennium* (Brighton, UK: Sussex Academic Press, 2001), 3-4.

and to conceive of the world as more deeply interconnected.⁵³ For others, a context where no one path is clear or absolute can lead to “a deep spiritual crisis;” a crisis King believes is prevalent for many people in Western societies.⁵⁴ This crisis is the result of an awareness that deeply held assumptions about the world are not predictable and stable but malleable.⁵⁵

Other scholars, such as Daniel Helminiak, have commented on the ‘crisis’ of the postmodern context. I quote his remarks in full because they give substance to King’s assessment of the impact of postmodernism on spirituality. He writes:

The uncertainty of postmodernism invades the sacred precincts of our very souls. Diametrically opposed to the heart of religion, postmodern uncertainty provokes a disturbing dilemma. That dilemma is this: only committed adherence to a religion allows it to do its needed work, yet with growing awareness of religious differences, it becomes harder and harder for any believer to maintain committed adherence, so no religion can function effectively any more. The important social work of religion now goes undone, and as a result, society comes undone. Religion that once served society can no longer be what it was, and to the extent it remains what it was, it no longer serves the best interests of society. What used to be the solution has become the problem. Whereas shared firm beliefs and assured values used to hold society together, today they inspire divisions. Yet, for a people not to share beliefs and values with assured confidence is also a problem. It also results in the fragmentation of society. On all fronts, human community is under fire.⁵⁶

Helminiak’s way of addressing the dilemma described is to envision a common spirituality at the heart of all religions and societies.⁵⁷ This spirituality would provide a

⁵³ Valerie Lesniak, “Contemporary Spirituality,” in *The New Westminster Dictionary of Christian Spirituality*, ed. Philip Sheldrake (Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 2005), 7-12; Perrin, *Studying Christian Spirituality*, 76-87.

⁵⁴ King, introduction to *Spirituality and Society in the New Millennium*, 1-2. Rabbi Michael Lerner also writes about a growing spiritual crisis, particularly within the United States. See Michael Lerner, *The Left Hand of God: Healing America’s Political and Spiritual Crisis* (New York, NY: HarperSanFrancisco, 2006).

⁵⁵ Ursula King, “Is There a Future for Religious Studies as We Know It? Some Postmodern, Feminist, and Spiritual Challenges,” *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 70, no. 2 (June 2002): 378-379.

⁵⁶ Daniel A. Helminiak, *Spirituality For Our Global Community: Beyond Traditional Religion to a World at Peace* (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 2008), 23.

⁵⁷ Helminiak, *Spirituality For Our Global Community*, 23.

model of beliefs and values with which to pursue the goal of a more just and peaceful world. Although he acknowledges the difficulties that some experience as part of the postmodern context, Helminiak appears to understand postmodernism less as a detriment and more as an opportunity to rethink spirituality.

The point is that, whether experienced as an opportunity or a crisis, postmodernism has the capacity to act as both a critique and creative rethinking of spirituality.⁵⁸ To engage with this capacity, a simple return to or revival of past spiritualities is not enough.⁵⁹ A return or revival is insufficient because individuals, communities, and scholars now stand at a “new threshold” which demands responding to the challenges posed by postmodernism and an increasingly global world.⁶⁰ Honest self-reflection and acknowledging that, “any position is provisional and open to further critique and revision,” are fundamental to responding to these challenges.⁶¹ Admission of provisionality has enabled scholars such as King and Helminiak to question, for example, the necessity of an *a priori* theological standpoint with which to study spirituality.⁶²

Taking this admission to heart, King defines spirituality as a journey to be “explored and ventured” and as “a process of growth and transformation.”⁶³ These metaphors for defining spirituality are not new. At least in the Christian tradition, the image of exile as a journey through which individuals and groups experience suffering,

⁵⁸ King, “Is There a Future,” 270.

⁵⁹ Ursula King, “Spirituality in a Postmodern Age: Faith and Praxis in New Contexts,” in *Faith and Praxis in a Postmodern Age*, ed. Ursula King (London, UK: Cassell, 1998), 97.

⁶⁰ King, “Is There a Future,” 384.

⁶¹ King, “Spirituality in a Postmodern Age,” 95.

⁶² King, “Spirituality in a Postmodern Age,” 96.

⁶³ King, “Spirituality in a Postmodern Age,” 108.

hope, and transformation has deep historical and spiritual roots.⁶⁴ Understanding spirituality as a journey and process of growth is important because a connection can be made to praxis, meaning a melding of thought and social action. This melding produces what King calls the ‘flourishing’ of all human beings and the planet.⁶⁵ Given the scope of this flourishing, scholars should employ approaches with the breadth to address spirituality in all its complexity and multidimensionality.⁶⁶

Theme III: Spiritual Literacy and Pneumatophores

According to King, approaches with breadth help to re-envision the world’s spiritualities as a common human inheritance. This inheritance can offer insight into values such as liberation, inner freedom, love, peace, justice, and reconciliation.⁶⁷ Exploring these values is a necessity for addressing many of the interconnected issues that contemporary societies face such as violence, poverty, and the destruction of the earth.⁶⁸

The interconnectedness of these issues is a clear indication, to King, that spiritualities need to “stir people into action and make them work for change.”⁶⁹ People can be stirred in these directions when they commit to greater awareness of the world and critical self-reflexivity.⁷⁰ Such awareness and self-reflexivity comprise what King refers to as ‘spiritual literacy.’ This literacy is important because it creates “spaces of

⁶⁴ Andrew Hamilton, “Exile,” in *The New Westminster Dictionary of Christian Spirituality*, ed. Philip Sheldrake (Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 2005), 294-295.

⁶⁵ Ursula King, “One Planet, One Spirit: Search for an Ecologically Balanced Spirituality,” *Ecotheology* 10, no. 1 (2005): 70-72.

⁶⁶ King, introduction to *Spirituality and Society in the New Millennium*, 8.

⁶⁷ King, introduction to *Spirituality and Society in the New Millennium*, 9-10.

⁶⁸ King, introduction to *Spirituality and Society in the New Millennium*, 11.

⁶⁹ Ursula King, “Earthing Spiritual Literacy: How to Link Spiritual Development and Education to a New Earth Consciousness?” *Journal of Beliefs and Values* 31, no. 3 (2010): 246.

⁷⁰ King, “Earthing Spiritual Literacy,” 246; King, *The Search for Spirituality*, 140.

genuine creativity.”⁷¹ In these spaces, people learn about wonder, peace, joy, and love. They are also encouraged to nurture identities based on responsibility, community, and belonging.⁷²

Creative spaces can be structured around what King calls “pneumatophores;” a botanist’s term describing the air roots of plants growing in swampy water.⁷³ Pneumatophores supply the plant with *pneuma*, meaning air or spirit. When used metaphorically, the term can refer to empowering ideas and/or inspirations that can lead to transformative action.⁷⁴

Dialogue and collaboration help to identify pneumatophores.⁷⁵ This includes dialogue between the world’s spiritual traditions as well as collaboration with secular organizations and social movements.⁷⁶ King also considers interdisciplinary cooperation as highly important.⁷⁷ The point is to develop the spiritual literacy needed to engage people in acts of social and political change that can lead to a more full, abundant, and meaningful life.⁷⁸ Here, spirituality becomes not only a source of insight but also a call to action, the aim of which is to “promote the welfare of all people, ensure their flourishing and that of the entire Earth community.”⁷⁹

The themes discussed above associate a working definition of spirituality with a set of verbs: growing, cultivating, flourishing, and transforming. King uses these verbs

⁷¹ King, “Earthing Spiritual Literacy,” 251.

⁷² King, “Earthing Spiritual Literacy,” 252-253.

⁷³ King, “Earthing Spiritual Literacy,” 258.

⁷⁴ King, “Earthing Spiritual Literacy,” 258.

⁷⁵ King, *The Search for Spirituality*, 168.

⁷⁶ King, “One Planet, One Spirit,” 68, 79-85.

⁷⁷ King, *The Search for Spirituality*, 170.

⁷⁸ King, *The Search for Spirituality*, 178-179.

⁷⁹ King, *The Search for Spirituality*, 190.

to re-envision spirituality as a creative, dynamic search for meaning and action.⁸⁰ In her opinion, such creative, action-oriented spiritualities should not only “fuel people’s zest for life” but also “fire their minds and hearts” in the direction of social and political change.⁸¹ As she suggests, one of the principal tasks for scholars is to help construct adequate approaches that can foster spiritual literacy and the discovery of pneumatophores. The hope is to encourage creativity and original thinking on the role of spirituality in a world “so deeply torn apart.”⁸²

2.2.3 Working Definition of Violence

In this final section, I divide my working definition of violence into four themes. The themes are violence as a legacy, violence as a cultural performance, the cultural construction of legitimacy, and the poetics of violence. Combined, these themes emphasize three ideas. First, they caution against simplistic understandings of violence as a mysterious and/or terrifying monstrosity.⁸³ By monstrosity, I mean an act characterized as random and senseless and, thus, beyond our ability to comprehend.

Second, and with regard to the first idea, violence can be conceived not only as a calculated performance but also one in which the performers hope to achieve particular ends.⁸⁴ Carleen Basler et al. observe:

In all cases, performing violence involves a quest to move the hearts and minds of people, every bit as much as, or perhaps even more than the staging of a play or the production of a film or novel. The staging of violence sometimes glamorizes,

⁸⁰ King, *The Search for Spirituality*, ix-xi.

⁸¹ King, “Is There a Future,” 285.

⁸² King, introduction to *Spirituality and Society in the New Millennium*, 1-2.

⁸³ Carleen Basler, Thomas L. Dumm, and Austin Sarat, introduction to *Performances of Violence* (Amherst, MA: University of Massachusetts Press, 2011), 7.

⁸⁴ For more on these performances, see Patrick Anderson and Jisha Menon, ed., *Violence Performed: Local Roots and Global Routes of Conflict* (New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009).

sometimes degrades, those who are its purported agents. When violence is performed we are moved.⁸⁵

Third, the themes emphasize that violence can be ‘staged,’ suggesting that its justification and legitimation are adequately understood in relation to particular contexts. I discuss the significance of these ideas below.

Theme I: Violence as a Legacy

I borrow the phrase ‘legacy of violence’ from the work of anthropologists who have conducted research in war zones. Their first-hand experiences have shaped their understandings of violence and its impact on the lives of individuals and communities. Their writings bring into sharp relief the saying, ‘violence begets violence.’ Nancy Scheper-Hughes and Philippe Bourgois write: “Violence gives birth to itself. So we can rightly speak of chains, spirals, and mirrors of violence – or, as we prefer – a continuum of violence.”⁸⁶ When understood as a continuum, violence cannot be conceived simply as a singular human phenomenon, such as the infliction of physical pain.⁸⁷ Violence emerges as highly complex with roots and impacts in the cultural, political, psychological, religious and social spheres.⁸⁸

In this understanding, violence does not end with the shattered lives of those on the frontlines of war.⁸⁹ Carolyn Nordstrom explains:

⁸⁵ Sarat, Basler, and Dumm, introduction to *Performances of Violence*, 7.

⁸⁶ Nancy Scheper-Hughes and Philippe Bourgois, introduction to *Violence in War and Peace: An Anthology* (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2004) 1.

⁸⁷ Scheper-Hughes and Bourgois, introduction to *Violence in War and Peace: An Anthology*, 1.

⁸⁸ In terms of the spiritual sphere, liberation theologians speak of a “spiral of violence” comprised of three levels: poverty, revolt, and repression. For more on this conceptualization of violence, see Thia Cooper, “Liberation Theology and the Spiral of Violence,” in *The Blackwell Companion to Religion and Violence*, ed. Andrew R. Murphy (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2011), 541-553.

⁸⁹ Carolyn Nordstrom, “The Tomorrow of Violence,” in *Violence*, ed. Neil L. Whitehead (Santa Fe, NM: School of American Research Press, 2004), 223-242; Carolyn Nordstrom, *Shadows of War*:

Violence is set in motion with physical carnage, but it doesn't stop there. Violence reconfigures its victims and the social milieu that hosts them. It isn't a passing phenomenon that momentarily challenges a stable system, leaving a scar but no lasting effects after it has passed. Violence becomes a determining fact in shaping reality as people *will* know it, in the future.⁹⁰

The point is that violence has enduring effects that can continue to transform lives even after war has ended. The experience of violence insinuates itself into the routines of everyday life. This can take the shape of economic deprivation, increased domestic abuse, and crime.⁹¹ Finding solutions to these violent legacies begins by looking into the linkages that make them possible.⁹² In an effort to better understand these linkages, I explore the idea that violence is a cultural performance in the next section.

Theme II: Violence as a Cultural Performance⁹³

Neil Whitehead defines violence as a cultural performance. This definition is helpful to conceptualize the linkages that make violence possible. One of these linkages is that violence is contingent, meaning that it cannot be separated from the contexts in which it is enacted. This link affirms Scheper-Hughes and Bourgois' argument that violence has complex cultural roots and impacts.

As a performance, violence emerges and is marked as violent according to cultural codes and discourses.⁹⁴ The ways in which these codes and discourses are used

Violence, Power, and International Profiteering in the Twenty-First Century (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2004).

⁹⁰ Nordstrom, "The Tomorrow of Violence," 226.

⁹¹ Nordstrom, "The Tomorrow of Violence," 227-238.

⁹² Nordstrom, "The Tomorrow of Violence," 239.

⁹³ Whitehead is not the only scholar to define violence as a performance. See Juergensmeyer, *Terror in the Mind of God*, 121-147.

⁹⁴ Neil L. Whitehead, introduction to *Violence* (Santa Fe, MN: School of American Research Press, 2004), 20-22; Neil L. Whitehead, "Rethinking Anthropology of Violence," *Anthropology Today* 20, no. 5 (October 2004): 1-2; Neil L. Whitehead and Nasser Abufarha, "Suicide, Violence, and Cultural Conceptions of Martyrdom in Palestine," *Social Research* 75, no. 2 (Summer 2008): 410. Whitehead's definition of violence grows out of his ethnographic research on a form of sorcery called *kainaimà* among

to amplify and/or justify violent acts constitutes what Whitehead has called ‘the poetics of violence.’⁹⁵ The concept is that those performing violence deploy cherished and/or familiar beliefs, ideals, and/or values to move people toward their desired ends. Thus, situating violence within particular cultural contexts is one avenue through which to understand its roots and impacts.

This avenue of understanding is based on the idea that violence is a basic human capacity.⁹⁶ Although counterintuitive to some, this idea helps to move conceptualization of violence beyond that of ‘monstrosity.’ Whitehead comments: “Our moral rectitude in condemnation of such [violent] acts cannot stand in for the professional commitment to understand all human behavior, no matter how challenging to our personal sensibilities.”⁹⁷ Violence, in other words, is not self-evident.⁹⁸ It is more than “the absence of meaning” or “a total negation of the very idea of cultural and social association.”⁹⁹ This basic human capacity not only functions within particular cultural orders but also shapes the experiences of those living within these orders.¹⁰⁰

For example, in the wake of the September 11 attacks, it was difficult for many to comprehend how this violence could be meaningful.¹⁰¹ What meaning could the death of three thousand people have? In the weeks, months, and years following the

the Amerindians of the highlands of Guyana, Venezuela, and Brazil. The sorcery, which involves stalking, mutilation, and consumption of the victim, carries particular cultural meaning within this context. Defining violence as a cultural performance is a way of respecting the significance that *kainaimà* holds for these Amerindian communities. See Neil L. Whitehead, *Dark Shamans: Kainaimà and the Poetics of Violent Death* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2002).

⁹⁵ Whitehead, introduction to *Violence*, 6.

⁹⁶ Whitehead and Abufarha, “Suicide, Violence, and Cultural Conceptions,” 407-408.

⁹⁷ Whitehead, introduction to *Violence*, 10.

⁹⁸ Whitehead and Abufarha, “Suicide, Violence, and Cultural Conceptions,” 397, 407.

⁹⁹ Whitehead, introduction to *Violence*,” 8.

¹⁰⁰ Whitehead and Abufarha, “Suicide, Violence, and Cultural Conceptions,” 396.

¹⁰¹ Whitehead, introduction to *Violence*,” 10.

attacks, however, politicians, public figures, and scholars called for investigations into the underlying causes of the tragic events.¹⁰² Although difficult, these calls were propelled by the recognition that violence could be meaningful.¹⁰³

Whitehead explains that violent acts generate what he calls “a shared idiom of meaning for violent death.”¹⁰⁴ He suggests that attending to these idioms can help to elucidate the perceived meanings of and/or justifications for violence. This is not to imply that violent acts are any less brutal, destructive, or difficult, only that they can and should be examined and understood.¹⁰⁵

To cite one example, Iraqi activist and artist, Haifa Zangana, discusses the use of music as cultural resistance against the United States’ occupation of her native country.¹⁰⁶ The use of the word ‘occupation’ suggests that the violence that these musicians experienced is conceptualized as unjust. They resisted both the violence performed by the ‘occupiers’ and the shared idioms used to justify these performances. Iraqi musical responses, in other words, contested the meanings that the United States’ government had given to legitimize the invasion and occupation of their country. Those meanings included the story of liberating the Iraqi people and spreading ‘democracy’ and ‘freedom.’¹⁰⁷

¹⁰² See Ahmed Akbar and Brian Frost, ed., *After Terror: Promoting Dialogue among the Civilizations* (Malden, MA: Polity, 2005).

¹⁰³ Whitehead, introduction to *Violence*, 9.

¹⁰⁴ Neil L. Whitehead, afterword to *Terror & Violence: Imagination and the Unimaginable*, ed. Andrew Strathern, Pamela J. Stewart, and Neil L. Whitehead (London: Pluto Press, 2006), 233.

¹⁰⁵ Whitehead and Abufarha, “Suicide, Violence, and Cultural Conceptions,” 407.

¹⁰⁶ Haifa Zangana, “Iraqi Resistance has its Song,” *International Journal of Contemporary Iraqi Studies* 3, no. 3 (2009): 277-286.

¹⁰⁷ Zangana, “Iraqi Resistance has its Song,” 279. Also see, Chernus, *Monsters to Destroy*, 163-182.

Challenging this story, Zangana describes the daily experiences of violence that Iraqis endured during the occupation. In the streets, people gathered the body parts of bomb-blast victims and hosed down pavement covered in blood. Body parts were collected to mitigate the stench of rotting flesh.¹⁰⁸ Summarizing these experiences, Zangana avows: “We are not celebrating. Death is covering us like fine dust.”¹⁰⁹

The point is that divergent cultural codes and discourses shape the perceived meanings of and justifications for violence, including those of different groups within a particular context.¹¹⁰ American soldiers in Iraq also turned to music to make sense of their experiences and/or performances of violence.¹¹¹ The ways they used music are as complex and multifaceted as those of the Iraqi resisters. Violence as a cultural performance is one avenue through which to examine and understand both of these examples. I return to the relationship between music and violence in Chapter Four.

Theme III: The Cultural Construction of Legitimacy

The points addressed in the previous sections underscore that the legitimacy given to particular performances of violence is itself a cultural construct.¹¹² With this assertion, I am not suggesting a simple dichotomy between ‘meaningful violence as legitimate’ and ‘meaningless violence as illegitimate.’ Rather, I am suggesting that

¹⁰⁸ Haifa Zangana, “The Right To Rule Ourselves,” in *Not One More Death*, Brian Eno et al. (London, UK: Verso, 2006), 49.

¹⁰⁹ Zangana, “The Right To Rule Ourselves,” 49.

¹¹⁰ It is important to note that musical responses to the events of September 11 and the ‘war on terror’ varied both within and outside the United States. I discuss some of the American responses to the attacks and the war in Chapter Four. For a selection of essays on musical responses from outside the United States, see the second half of *Music in the Post-9/11 World*, 177-314.

¹¹¹ George Gittoes, *Soundtrack to War: The Movie*, DVD (Beverly Hills, CA: Melee Entertainment, 2006); Jonathan Pieslak, *Sound Targets: American Soldiers and Music in the Iraq War* (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 2009).

¹¹² Whitehead, introduction to *Violence*, 10, 16; Neil L. Whitehead, “On the Poetics of Violence,” in *Violence*, ed. Neil L. Whitehead (Santa Fe, MN: School of American Research Press, 2004), 60.

perspectives on and responses to performances of violence as meaningful and/or meaningless are reflective of particular cultural imaginaries.¹¹³

An imaginary consists of the world of ideas that shape people's justification for and responses to particular events. Andrew Strathern and Pamela Stewart explain: "Our basic argument is that the power of ideas regarding terror does not rest solely on the events of terrorist actions, destructive as they may be. It rests also on the great multiplications of reactions that these acts and the fears that these acts arouse in people's imaginations."¹¹⁴ Stated differently, violence operates and is registered on several levels, including that of the imagination.¹¹⁵ Whitehead concurs with these statements.

He writes:

The legitimacy of violent acts is part of how they are constituted in the minds of observers, victims and perpetrators of such acts, and matters of legitimacy are not at all separate from the way in which given acts and behaviors are considered violent in the first place.¹¹⁶

These ideas affirm that the ways in which people are maimed and killed in particular cultures are not arbitrary.¹¹⁷ The violence perpetrated has been conceived by someone in that culture as "systematic, always rule-governed and replete with meanings

¹¹³ Whitehead, afterword to *Terror & Violence: Imagination and the Unimaginable*, 231. For more on imaginaries, political ideologies, and the 'war on terror,' see Manfred Steger, *The Rise of the Global Imaginary* (Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2008).

¹¹⁴ Andrew Strathern and Pamela J. Stewart, introduction to *Terror & Violence: Imagination and the Unimaginable* (London, UK: Pluto Press, 2006), 6, 9.

¹¹⁵ Patrick Anderson and Jisha Menon, introduction to *Violence Performed: Local Roots and Global Routes of Conflict* (New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), 5.

¹¹⁶ Whitehead, "Violence & the Cultural Order," *Daedalus* (Winter 2007): 40.

¹¹⁷ Whitehead and Abufarha, "Suicide, Violence, and Cultural Conceptions," 408.

for both victims and victimizers.”¹¹⁸ Other anthropologists encapsulate these ideas by stating: “Violence needs to be imagined in order to be carried out.”¹¹⁹

As previously alluded to in Chapter One, redemptive violence is a cultural value in the United States.¹²⁰ Its performances are often considered legitimate because of the perception that the United States only uses its might “in the name of positive values that would make life better for everyone.”¹²¹ Torture, specifically the incidents at the Abu Ghraib prison in Iraq, illustrates the contradiction inherent to this perception. American violence does not always promote ‘positive values’ yet can be conceived as systematic and rule-governed.¹²²

For example, the revelations of torture at Abu Ghraib shocked many United States citizens because it contradicted their perception of ‘legitimate’ wartime violence.¹²³ Derek Jeffreys explains:

When the Abu Graib scandal broke, many people reacted with disgust at the sight of naked prisoners standing in pyramids and sexually compromising positions. They were appalled to see military policemen treat Iraqi prisoners like playthings. Sadly, this revulsion soon gave way to excuses, rationalizations, and defense mechanisms designed to shield people from the horror.¹²⁴

¹¹⁸ Whitehead, introduction to *Violence*, 9.

¹¹⁹ Ingo W. Schröder and Bettina E. Schmidt, introduction to *Anthropology of Violence and Conflict* (New York: Routledge, 2001), 9.

¹²⁰ Whitehead, “On the Poetics of Violence,” 57. See Pahl, *Empire of Sacrifice* and Ruether, *America, Amerikka*. These scholars have made similar arguments in relationship to the religious undertones that suffused the former Bush administration’s justifications of the ‘war on terror.’

¹²¹ Chernus, *Monsters to Destroy*, 137.

¹²² Mark Danner, *Torture and Truth: America, Abu Graib, and the War on Terror* (New York, NY: New York Review Books, 2004), xiii. Photographs of prisoner abuse in Abu Ghraib were first broadcast on the CBS television network on April 28, 2004. They were published in the New York Times shortly after. For faith-based engagements with torture, including Abu Ghraib, see George Hunsinger, ed., *Torture is a Moral Issue: Christians, Jews, Muslims and People of Conscience Speak Out* (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2008).

¹²³ Whitehead, “Violence & the Cultural Order,” 47.

¹²⁴ Derek S. Jeffreys, *Spirituality and the Ethics of Torture* (New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), 13.

One of these shielding mechanisms was to equate the incidences with acts of individual pathology. Jeffreys continues: “Some people, for example, attributed Abu Graib to an ‘animal house’ mentality among soldiers at the prison. For them, the photographs shocking the world revealed the work of a few sadists rather than interrogators.”¹²⁵

Whitehead’s understanding of violence as a cultural performance suggests that it is more likely that the construction of the prisoners as ‘enemy,’ ‘evil,’ ‘terrorist,’ or ‘insurgent’ – and therefore worthy of torture – contributed to the perceived legitimacy of the abuses at Abu Ghraib.¹²⁶

Unfortunately, this construction allowed for attention to be drawn away from the ways in which American cultural values shaped the forms of violence used, including sexual humiliation.¹²⁷ These forms of violence exemplified the “cultural loop” that occurs in their production.¹²⁸ This loop occurs when people’s perceptions of the violence of others inform their understanding of their own legitimate use of force.¹²⁹

Theme IV: The Poetics of Violence – Legitimizing Violence in our Own Cultures

By citing the ways torture at Abu Ghraib was legitimized, Whitehead and Jeffreys are not trying to demonize the United States. They are underscoring the

¹²⁵ Jeffreys, *Spirituality and the Ethics of Torture*, 32.

¹²⁶ Whitehead, “Violence & the Cultural Order,” 47. See Judith Butler, *Precarious Life: The Powers of Mourning and Violence* (London, UK: Verso, 2004). Butler provides an astute discussion of the ways in which labels such as ‘prisoner’ or ‘terrorist’ can result in dehumanization and violence.

¹²⁷ See Alex Danchev, “Like a Dog!”: Humiliation and Shame in the War on Terror,” *Alternatives*, 31 (2006): 259-283; Jon McKenzie, “Abu Ghraib and the Society of the Spectacle of the Scaffold,” in *Violence Performed: Local Roots and Global Routes of Conflict*, ed. Patrick Anderson and Jisha Menon (New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), 338-356. The connection between violent and sexual motifs has been explored in these analyses of the images from Abu Ghraib.

¹²⁸ Whitehead, introduction to *Violence*, 13-14.

¹²⁹ Whitehead, introduction to *Violence*, 16-20. See Tony Perucci, “Performance Complexes: Abu Ghraib and the Culture of Neoliberalism,” in *Violence Performed: Local Roots and Global Routes of Conflict*, ed. Patrick Anderson and Jisha Menon (New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), 357-371.

importance of cultural analysis for understanding the ambiguity and complexity of violence. This ambiguity and complexity includes examining the ways in which violence is considered both legitimate and/or illegitimate in our own Western cultures. Violence as a cultural performance, which is grounded in the idea of violence as a basic human capacity, clarifies rather than obscures the many potential meanings violence can generate in different contexts.¹³⁰ Thus, by situating violent acts within larger debates on legitimacy, a space is created to examine cultural assumptions that may be taken for granted where violence is concerned. In this space, violence is understood as a meaningful and significant part of particular cultural orders and imaginaries, including our own.¹³¹

People in Western countries also live under climates of fear and terror, as Whitehead reminds his readers.¹³² Western cultures rehearse the potential for disaster using their own stories of doom and gloom. Fear is kept alive through terror alerts, news reports, and television programming.¹³³ For Whitehead, the necessity of questioning how violence is understood in our own cultures is underscored by the reality of global media technology. This technology enables violent cultural performances to be disseminated around the globe, with the prospects of contributing to further cycles of violence.¹³⁴

¹³⁰ Whitehead, "Violence & the Cultural Order," 46.

¹³¹ Whitehead, "Violence & the Cultural Order," 50.

¹³² Whitehead, afterword to *Terror & Violence: Imagination and the Unimaginable*, 234.

¹³³ Neil L. Whitehead, "Sacral Violence: Cosmologies and Imaginaries of Killing," in *Dying for Faith: Religiously Motivated Violence in the Contemporary World*, ed. Madawi Al-Rasheed and Marat Shterin (London, UK: I.B. Tauris, 2009), 172.

¹³⁴ Whitehead, "On the Poetics of Violence," 74.

For this project, Whitehead's definition helps to identify and understand some of the violent legacies of the 'war on terror.' These legacies include the ways in which popular music was used to justify and legitimize the war. Exploring these aspects of popular music is an opportunity to gain insight into the stories and performances that shaped particular cultural imaginaries in the United States between the years 2001-2008. As I discuss in Chapter Four, violence and war were not the only stories or performances available at this time. There were also stories and performances of comfort, healing, and protest.

The point I wish to make here is that without challenging how we perceive violence and our responses to it, the less able we will be to create the spaces necessary to understand its impact on ourselves and on others. Thus, in the next section, I advocate for the use of creative and original thinking in the discipline of spirituality with which to understand the interconnections between musical performance, violence, and protest in the context of the 'war on terror.' This advocacy begins with a discussion of the need to shift one's starting points.

2.3 Shifting Starting Points

The working definitions presented in the previous sections underscore that music, spirituality, and violence are complex and contested human phenomena. By contested, I mean that they are perceived and responded to in multiple ways by different people in different contexts. Given the complexity and multiplicity of understandings and responses associated with these phenomena, the question arises: what approaches are the most adequate for their study? In the sections that follow, I discuss the need to identify the principles around which an adequate approach to these phenomena can be

built. I have borrowed King's notion of pneumatophores, understood as empowering or inspiring ideas, to think through the importance of this step in relationship to the 'war on terror.'

The first pneumatophore discussed is the idea of contesting violence as a way of engaging with the war. The second is the importance of shifting one's starting points to extend the potential sources of insight into a particular issue. These ideas are invaluable for identifying the principles of creativity, interdisciplinarity, and music literacy. They are the foundations, I contend, upon which to construct an adequate approach to contemporary protest music in the discipline of spirituality. I describe and evaluate the above-mentioned principles in Chapter Three.

2.3.1 First Pneumatophore: Contesting Violence

In this section, I examine the ways in which religious leaders and scholars engaged with the 'war on terror' by contesting the use of violence. This engagement is a pneumatophore in the context of my research for two reasons. First, the idea affirms the themes discussed in the previous section on the importance of looking into the ways violence is perceived and responded to. As part of their engagement with the war, religious leaders and scholars from different traditions and contexts questioned the perception that violence is a legitimate response to terrorist acts such as September 11.

Second, by questioning the above-mentioned perception, these leaders and scholars hint at the possibility that options other than violence exist. Taking this possibility seriously is important given the reality that violence fractures human bonds

and oppression tears communities apart.¹³⁵ By contesting violence, religious leaders and scholars suggest that bold, new thinking is needed to engage with terrorism.¹³⁶ Evidence of this thinking can already be seen in various interreligious initiatives that contest violence as a pathway to peace.¹³⁷

2.3.2 Contesting the War: Religious Leaders and Scholars

In the immediate aftermath of September 11, four thousand American religious leaders published a statement in the *New York Times*.¹³⁸ They acknowledged the pain and grief suffered by the American public in the wake of the attacks but asked that people of faith not go down the path of hate and dehumanization of the other. America, they declared, had to be a safe place for all its citizens. Their statement reminded readers of the visions of community, tolerance, compassion, justice and sacredness of life that were at the heart of many of the world's religious traditions. They concluded with an appeal to resist responses that contradicted these visions:

Let us make the right choices in this crisis – to pray, act, and unite against the bitter fruits of division, hatred and violence. Let us rededicate ourselves to global peace, human dignity, and the eradication of the injustice that breeds rage and vengeance.¹³⁹

Reflecting on the appeal seven years later, Jim Wallis, one of the original signatories, stressed that the September 11 attacks were not only used as a rationale for the invasion of Iraq but had also cost over four thousand American lives and those of

¹³⁵ Ada María Isasi-Díaz, “Justice: A Post-9/11 Theory,” in *The Impact of 9/11 on Religion and Philosophy: The Day that Changed Everything?*, ed. Matthew Morgan (New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2009), 169.

¹³⁶ Isasi-Díaz, “Justice: A Post-9/11 Theory,” 170, 183.

¹³⁷ Diane D’Souza, “Creating Spaces: Interreligious Initiatives for Peace,” in *Religion and Peacebuilding*, ed. Harold Coward and Gordon S. Smith (Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2004); David R. Smock, ed., *Interfaith Dialogue and Peacebuilding* (Washington, D.C.: United States Institute of Peace Press, 2002).

¹³⁸ Jim Wallis, “Reflecting on Our Responses to 9/11,” *Huffington Post* (September 12, 2008), under <http://www.huffingtonpost.com/jim-wallis/reflecting-on-our-responses> (accessed August 14, 2010).

¹³⁹ Wallis, “Reflecting on Our Responses to 9/11.”

countless Iraqis.¹⁴⁰ By responding to terrorism with violence, the former Bush administration had not brought about a more just and peaceful world. Given this reality, Wallis urged that it was not too late to change the course of the American response to the threat of terrorism.

In a slim volume titled *Finding Peace*, Jean Vanier wrote that in response to the attacks many people, religious and secular, came together to pray and affirm a vision of the world based on mutuality, solidarity, and love.¹⁴¹ These prayer sessions made Vanier uneasy, however. He had doubts whether people prayed together out of fear or whether they truly prayed for change.¹⁴² His doubts were assuaged when people started to ask questions in these sessions challenging the reliance on violence as a legitimate response to terrorism. In doing so, the participants affirmed Vanier's conviction that the way to peace is the responsibility of each individual and not simply the purview of governments.¹⁴³ He remarked that, "As we live through the fear and conflict that resulted from September 11, we should not despair. We *can* find the road to hope and peace in our world if we open ourselves to change, enter into new relationships, and break down the walls around [our] own hearts."¹⁴⁴

Echoing Vanier, the Dalai Lama cautioned against the use of violence as a response to terrorism. He wrote that responses to terrorist attacks must be carefully

¹⁴⁰ Wallis, "Reflecting on Our Responses to 9/11."

¹⁴¹ Jean Vanier, *Finding Peace* (Toronto, ON: Anansi Press Inc., 2003), 4.

¹⁴² Vanier, *Finding Peace*, 5.

¹⁴³ Vanier, *Finding Peace*, 6.

¹⁴⁴ Vanier, *Finding Peace*, 8. Emphasis in original text.

thought out and deployed according to the principles of nonviolence.¹⁴⁵ Military action may bring short-term results, he warned, but force is not a long-term answer to ongoing terrorist threats. Informed by his Buddhist spirituality and practice, he suggested that responses to these threats should be guided by compassion and understanding. In a statement given on the eve of the 2003 invasion of Iraq, the Dalai Lama recommended that war and the belief that arms can solve complicated human problems be relegated to the dustbin of history.¹⁴⁶

In a similar vein, Thich Nhat Hanh has written: “The only way we can protect ourselves is with compassion and understanding. Only when understanding and compassion embrace you and the other person does safety become a reality.”¹⁴⁷ His point is that the cultivation of spiritual principles can lead to a sustained sense of safety among individuals and communities. Openness to change and the belief that other options exist is core to contesting the notion that violence can lead to long-term security. In his writings on terrorism, this conviction is clear:

Since the so-called War on Terror began, we have spent billions of dollars but have only created more violence, more hate, and fear. We have not succeeded in removing terrorism, neither in its expression nor, most importantly, in the minds of people. It’s time to come home to ourselves and find a better way to bring peace to ourselves and to the world.¹⁴⁸

Theologians and religious studies scholars also questioned a reliance on violence as a way of engaging with the events of September 11 and the subsequent ‘war on

¹⁴⁵ Tenzin Gyatso, 14th Dalai Lama, foreword to *Nonviolence: An Alternative for Defeating Global Terrorism*, ed. Senthil Ram and Ralph Summy (New York, NY: Nova Science Publishers, Inc., 2008), ix.

¹⁴⁶ Tenzin Gyatso, 14th Dalai Lama, “War is Anachronistic, An Outmoded Approach,” in *The Iraq War and its Consequences: Thoughts of Nobel Peace Laureates and Eminent Scholars*, ed. Irwin Abrams and Wang Gungwu (Singapore: World Scientific Publishing Co., 2003), 6.

¹⁴⁷ Thich Nhat Hanh, *Calming the Fearful Mind: A Zen Response to Terrorism* (Berkeley, CA: Parallax Press, 2005), 30.

¹⁴⁸ Hanh, *Calming the Fearful Mind*, 93.

terror.’ They gave voice to their concerns in anthologies such as *Strike Terror No More*, *Dissent from the Homeland*, and *The Impact of 9/11 on Religion and Philosophy*.¹⁴⁹

The former Archbishop of Canterbury, Rowan Williams, wrote that as soon as it was decided that the tragedy of September 11 was an act of war, clarity around the event disappeared.¹⁵⁰ He recounts that in the United Kingdom at least, public confusion arose about what exactly a ‘war on terror’ entailed. It is worth quoting his remarks in full.

They point to some of the troubling implications of using the word ‘war’ to categorize responses to terror:

Language fosters the assumption that this is a conflict with a *story* to it – hopefully, a story with a happy ending, a victory for justice. But terrorism is not a place, not even a person or a group or a group of persons; it is a form of behavior. ‘War’ against terrorism is as much a metaphor as war against drug abuse (not that the metaphor isn’t misleading there as well) or car theft. It can only mean a sustained policy of making such behavior less attractive or tolerable. As we’ve been reminded often, this is a long job; but there is a difference between saying this, which is unquestionably true, and suggesting that there is a case for an open-ended military campaign.¹⁵¹

In his comments, Williams reminds readers to be wary of labels that advocate for a long-term commitment to renewed cycles of violence.

For Stanley Hauerwas, the use of war-language as a response to terrorism is not surprising given the fact that war has become such a normalizing discourse for Americans.¹⁵² He writes that the word ‘war’ had a magic quality in the aftermath of the

¹⁴⁹ Jon L. Berquist, ed., *Strike Terror No More: Theology, Ethics, and the New War* (St. Louis, MO: Chalice Press, 2002); Stanley Hauerwas and Frank Lentricchia, ed., *Dissent from the Homeland: Essays after September 11* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2003); Matthew J. Morgan, ed., *The Impact of 9/11 on Religion and Philosophy: The Day that Changed Everything* (New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2009).

¹⁵⁰ Rowan Williams, “End of War,” in *Dissent from the Homeland: Essays after September 11*, ed. Stanley Hauerwas and Frank Lentricchia (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2003), 31.

¹⁵¹ Williams, “End of War,” 32. Emphasis in original text.

¹⁵² Stanley Hauerwas, “September 11, 2001: A Pacifist Response,” in *Dissent from the Homeland: Essays after September 11*, ed. Stanley Hauerwas and Frank Lentricchia (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2003), 182, 186.

terror attacks because it helped to reclaim everyday life from the uncertainty and fear that ensued. The word provided people with a clear moral purpose and gave their actions moral credibility. For many Americans, engaging in a ‘war on terror’ made them feel safe.¹⁵³ The irony was that for those labeled the ‘enemy,’ both within the United States and abroad, a war without limits held no prospects of peace or security.¹⁵⁴

In the introduction to the 2008 volume *Religion, Terror and Violence*, Philip Tite describes how witnessing the coverage of September 11 evoked in him a profound need to make sense of the violence.¹⁵⁵ This need was exacerbated by the announcement that the United States was at war with terrorism. Tite began to question his responsibility as a scholar *vis à vis* the war. He reflected:

When the planes and soldiers poured into Afghanistan and then Iraq, my concern was that without serious reflection on the postcolonial, ideological, and economic reasons for these various acts of violence, only an ongoing perpetuation of violence would occur; cycles of violence driven by superficial constructs of good versus evil topologies; i.e., processes of other making for the sake of insider affirmation.¹⁵⁶

This call to engage critically with the war was echoed by other contributors in the volume.

Theologians Hans Küng and Walter Wink raised doubts as to whether the ‘war on terror’ was an appropriate vision for the world’s collective future.¹⁵⁷ Wink

¹⁵³ For more on the ways in which war has become a normalizing discourse in American society, see Andrew J. Bacevich, *Washington Rules: America’s Path to Permanent War* (New York, NY: Metropolitan Books, 2010).

¹⁵⁴ Hauerwas, “September 11, 2001,” 187.

¹⁵⁵ Philip L. Tite, “Sacred Violence and the Scholar of Religion as Public Intellectual,” in *Religion, Terror and Violence: Religious Studies Perspectives*, ed. Bryan Rennie and Philip L. Tite (New York, NY: Routledge, 2008), 3.

¹⁵⁶ Tite, “Sacred violence and the scholar,” 4.

¹⁵⁷ Hans Küng, “A New Paradigm of International Relations: Reflections after September 11,” in *Religion, Terror and Violence: Religious Studies Perspectives*, ed. Bryan Rennie and Philip L. Tite (New York, NY: Routledge, 2008), 105; Walter Wink, “Can Love Save the World?,” in *Religion, Terror and*

challenged this vision by reminding readers of the extreme contradiction of pursuing peace through war. Although touted by the former Bush administration as providing a future free of violence, the government's policies only perpetuated violence.¹⁵⁸ Wink saw nonviolence as the most responsible way of addressing these policies and their consequences.¹⁵⁹

2.3.3 Contesting Violence: Art and the Offering of Different Vantage Points

One way of engaging with the concerns articulated by religious leaders, theologians, and religious studies scholars is to explore the ever-expanding literature on religion and violence.¹⁶⁰ This would be a logical starting point if the goal is to understand their concerns within a theological or religious studies framework. I have not chosen this route because I am interested foremost in how protest music can act as a source of insight for delegitimizing violence. Having said this, my interest in protest music was piqued by the inclusion of an essay on art, artists, and September 11, in the aforementioned collection *Religion, Terror and Violence*.

Interspersed among the theological and religious studies contributions was a reflection by Maureen Korp.¹⁶¹ Korp holds a doctorate in religious studies, which explains her inclusion in the collection. The question that emerged for me, in spite of Korp's disciplinary background, was why a single arts-based essay was included? Her

Violence: Religious Studies Perspectives, ed. Bryan Rennie and Philip L. Tite (New York, NY: Routledge, 2008), 120.

¹⁵⁸ Wink, "Can love save the world?," 120.

¹⁵⁹ Wink, "Can love save the world?," 117.

¹⁶⁰ See Andrew R. Murphy, ed., *The Blackwell Companion to Religion and Violence*, 1st ed. (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing Ltd, 2011).

¹⁶¹ Maureen Korp, "Seeing What is Missing: Art, Artists, and September 11," in *Religion, Terror and Violence: Religious Studies Perspectives*, ed. Bryan Rennie and Philip L. Tite (New York, NY: Routledge, 2008), 254-279.

essay remained a curiosity given the breadth of artistic engagements with the events of September 11, some of which I address in subsequent chapters of the dissertation. After some reflection, I came to the conclusion that the answer to my question was hinted at in the essay's title, *Seeing What is Missing?*

The thrust of Korp's argument is that artistic responses to terror provide a unique way of seeing. She writes that to become engaged with art is "to cross time and culture, to enter into the soul of another and see with the eyes of another."¹⁶² Because of its ability to allow people to see differently, to offer people different vantage points, Korp likens some artists to religious visionaries.¹⁶³ She suggests that these artists work with and out of truth, insight, and vision to shape terror into something other; sometimes molding it into light, other times into silence, other times into a more terrifying manifestation.¹⁶⁴

In several of his works, John Paul Lederach discusses a similar understanding of some artists providing different vantage points on violence and terror.¹⁶⁵ By providing such vantage points, these artists put flesh on the statistics about the costs of war.¹⁶⁶ They humanize the statistics. By humanizing, Lederach means they communicate the messiness, destruction, and chaos of people's experiences of violence and terror.

¹⁶² Korp, "Seeing what is missing," 267.

¹⁶³ Korp, "Seeing what is missing," 268.

¹⁶⁴ Korp, "Seeing what is missing," 265, 268, 261.

¹⁶⁵ Lederach, *The Moral Imagination*; John Paul Lederach, "The Poetic Unfolding of the Human Spirit," *Fetzer Institute: Essays Exploring a Global Dream*, Fetzer Institute, under http://www.fetzer.org/resources/resource-detail/?type=recent&resource_id=1000188 (accessed September 13, 2010): 3-8.

¹⁶⁶ Lederach, *The Poetic Unfolding of the Human Spirit*, 32. An example is the art of Iraqi-American artist, Wafaa Bilal. See Wafaa Bilal and Kari Lydersen, *Shoot an Iraqi: Art, Life and Resistance under the Gun* (San Francisco, CA: City Light Books, 2008).

Poetry, for example, reverberates “below and beyond” these experiences.¹⁶⁷ The idea of reverberation suggests that a verse of poetry can give voice to what people often feel is unspeakable. The verse creates a space for the human stories that exist between the numbers on a page. Lederach explains: “Poetry catches you in such a way that you will notice things differently.”¹⁶⁸ For him, the challenge of responding to violence and terror is not related to the quantity and/or size of conflicts with which we are confronted today. The challenge is our lack of imagination and commitment to do so without the use of weapons.¹⁶⁹

Given these ideas, Lederach and his daughter, Angela Jill, consider sound and music as a different vantage point for thinking about social healing and reconciliation in situations of deep-rooted conflict.¹⁷⁰ Different vantage points are important because the dominant metaphors in peacebuilding literature and program initiatives are often linear and sequential. In their view, these metaphors such as “conflict is linear” and “peace is sequential” do not adequately capture the lived experience of violence in local communities.¹⁷¹ They write: “In other words, healing while facing the continued threat of violence represents simultaneous aspects of a complex reality; aspects that are rarely experienced in a neat, sequential order.”¹⁷²

Using the experiences of local communities as a starting point, the Lederachs propose that a metaphor shift is needed to adequately envision what life is like under the persistent threat of violence. This shift is needed because the metaphors that emerge

¹⁶⁷ Lederach, *The Poetic Unfolding of the Human Spirit*, 32.

¹⁶⁸ Lederach, *The Poetic Unfolding of the Human Spirit*, 38.

¹⁶⁹ Lederach, *The Poetic Unfolding of the Human Spirit*, 42.

¹⁷⁰ Lederach and Lederach, *When Blood and Bones Cry Out*.

¹⁷¹ Lederach and Lederach, *When Blood and Bones Cry Out*, 44-54.

¹⁷² Lederach and Lederach, *When Blood and Bones Cry Out*, 10.

from these communities are not linear or sequential but spatial, suggesting movements that approximate a circle, a vibration, or an echo as opposed to a progression of phases and stages.¹⁷³ Explorations of sonic and musical metaphors such as a Tibetan singing bowl and the meditative songs of a particular musician are used to communicate insight into the temporally simultaneous, multidimensional, and cyclical experience of both violence and social healing in local communities.¹⁷⁴

Music in particular is described as having the capacity to create imaginative spaces in which individuals and communities recapture their sense of safety, humanity, and wonder. The Lederachs write:

The sensation of being surrounded creates spaces of feeling and potential and perhaps the reality of being accepted, the presence of unconditional love, which can be described as being held, feeling safe, experiencing a sensation of ‘at-homeness.’ We feel the ‘silence.’ Music permits us to feel more fully *human* in our very *being*.¹⁷⁵

The stories shared in their study underscore that music also creates performative spaces in which to experience feelings and sensations of being human, being loved, and being safe. One example is the use of drumming to help former child soldiers integrate back into their communities.¹⁷⁶ The performance of the drumming created what the Lederachs call a ‘container’ for these former child soldiers to experience the imaginative space of integration. Their basic point is that, through the creation of such spaces, music is a concrete and effective tool in peacebuilding initiatives.¹⁷⁷ I interpret the Lederachs’

¹⁷³ Lederach and Lederach, *When Blood and Bones Cry Out*, 72.

¹⁷⁴ Lederach and Lederach, *When Blood and Bones Cry Out*, 89-102; 117-141.

¹⁷⁵ Lederach and Lederach, *When Blood and Bones Cry Out*, 142. Emphasis in original text.

¹⁷⁶ Lederach and Lederach, *When Blood and Bones Cry Out*, 17-22. For a related example, see the journey of former child soldier, Emmanuel Jal. Jal has used music for his own healing and those of others who have experienced violence and war. Emmanuel Jal, *War Child: A Child Soldier's Journey* (New York, NY: St. Martin's Press, 2009).

¹⁷⁷ Lederach and Lederach, *When Blood and Bones Cry Out*, 181.

study as affirming my hypothesis that musicking is a source of insight into the delegitimizing of violence.

2.3.4 Getting Creative: Musicians Respond to the War

Music has also been used to contest violence in the context of the ‘war on terror.’ In this section, I only provide one example of this contestation because I discuss the relationship between music, violence, and the ‘war on terror’ in greater depth in Chapter Four. Here, I simply wish to acknowledge that, like their religious counterparts, musicians also challenged the perception that violence is a legitimate response to terrorism. In vocalizing their opposition to this idea, they affirmed that options other than violence exist.

On his 2003 album *Everybody Deserves Music*, Michael Franti sought to shape responses to terror into something different. He sang: “We can bomb the world to pieces, but we can’t bomb it into peace.”¹⁷⁸ I have often seen this sentiment printed on buttons pinned to the sweaters, bags, and hats of activists at antiwar protests. The tiny, colorful messages of “Make art, not war” or “Books not Bombs” echo Franti’s basic idea: engaging terror with more terror is not a constructive response. Other options are available.

The genesis of Franti’s verse was a meeting he attended to organize a peace concert in the wake of September 11. In an interview with John Malkin, Franti elaborates on the context out of which the song verse grew.¹⁷⁹ He explains:

¹⁷⁸ Micheal Franti, quoted in John Malkin, “Power to the Peaceful,” in *Sounds of Freedom: Musicians on Spirituality and Social Change* (Berkeley, CA: Parallax Press, 2005), 19.

¹⁷⁹ Franti, quoted in John Malkin, “Power to the Peaceful,” 17-25.

Ever since September 11, our nation has been feeling a lot of pain, a lot of hurt, a lot of anger, a lot of frustration, and a lot of fear. People are questioning the future. When you are in that much of a state of emotional chaos, it is easy to follow somebody who says, "I have a way for you to ease your pain. We are going after these people who did this horrible thing and we are going to take them out. Then you won't have to think or worry or fear it anymore." That's a very simplistic view that the Bush administration has put out not only to us, but to the rest of the world.¹⁸⁰

Rather than taking the former administration's view of the attacks at face value, Franti asks people to start looking into the reasons behind the violence. In other words, he asks people to look for different vantage points. As his music suggests, responding to September 11 with war seemed an unlikely way of building peace. "Creating more war-torn areas in Afghanistan and Iraq," Franti remarks, "has not brought us more peace and stability."¹⁸¹ He is adamant that the result of every bullet fired, bomb dropped, and leader overthrown, is another child growing up convinced that militaristic solutions are the only way to achieve peace on this planet.¹⁸² On the 2009 album *All Rebel Rockers*, Franti sings:

Don't ever doubt the power of just one mind
Or the world wide power of just one rhyme
Don't ever doubt the force of the bass line
Or a record gone round to burn the house down.¹⁸³

Again, the message is simple but clear: look at the situation differently. Violence is not the only way. There is also music.

Popular musicians produced some of the most scathing declarations against the 'war on terror.' Examples emerged from a number of genres including country music,

¹⁸⁰ Franti, quoted in John Malkin, "Power to the Peaceful," 20.

¹⁸¹ Franti, quoted in John Malkin, "Power to the Peaceful," 20.

¹⁸² Franti, quoted in John Malkin, "Power to the Peaceful," 20.

¹⁸³ Michael Franti and Spearhead, "Hey World (Remote Control Version)," *All Rebel Rockers*, Digital Release (New York, NY: Boo Boo Wax Under, 2009).

hip-hop, and folk.¹⁸⁴ The power and importance of these examples lie in what I call the ‘contesting spaces’ created through their musicking.¹⁸⁵ In these spaces, those participating sought to re-conceptualize human relationships based on solidarity and justice instead of violence and war. They imagined what a more just and peaceful world looked like and experienced this world through their participation in musical performances. By doing so, those participating offered different vantage points from which to evaluate the use of violence as a response to terrorism.

Examining the contesting spaces created through protest musicking is an opportunity for scholars in the discipline of spirituality. They are invited to extend their sources of insight into the options, other than violence, with which to respond to future terrorist attacks. By extending their sources of insight, scholars can affirm the need to seek out nonviolent alternatives such as those articulated in the spiritually-motivated contestation of the ‘war on terror’ already discussed. Furthermore, this affirmation builds on the traditions of principled nonviolence examined in the previous chapter that run “like a thread of thinking and acting, through the fabric of U.S. history.”¹⁸⁶

¹⁸⁴ See Reebee Garofalo, “Pop Goes to War, 2001-2004: U.S. Popular Music after 9/11,” in *Music in the Post-9/11 World*, ed. Jonathan Ritter and J. Martin Daughtry (New York, NY: Routledge, 2007), 3-26; Rik Palieri, “Working in the Trenches: Surviving Conflicts through Folk Music and Tales,” in *Music and Conflict Transformation: Harmonies and Dissonances in Geopolitics*, ed. Olivier Urbain (London, UK: I.B. Tauris, 2008), 187-200; Jerry Rodnitsky, “Iraq is Arabic for Vietnam: The Evolution of Protest Songs in Popular Music from Vietnam to Iraq,” in *Homer Simpson Marches on Washington: Dissent through American Popular Culture*, ed. Timothy M. Dale and Joseph J. Foy (Lexington, KY: The University Press of Kentucky, 2010), 203-217.

¹⁸⁵ Philip Bohlman uses similar terminology in an essay on the production and reception of Sufi music in the West. See Philip V. Bohlman, “World Musics and World Religions: *Whose World?*,” in *Enchanting Powers: Music in the World’s Religions*, ed. Lawrence E. Sullivan (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1997), 61-90.

¹⁸⁶ Chernus, *American Nonviolence*, x.

2.4 Second Pneumatophore: Shifting One's Starting Points

In the following sections, I discuss my second pneumatophore. As previously mentioned, this is the idea of shifting one's starting points to extend the potential sources of insight into a particular issue. In the context of my research, this shift involves starting my analysis with music as opposed to spirituality. The reasoning for this shift is simple: starting with music allows for a level of creativity, interdisciplinarity, and music literacy that can deepen understandings of protest music's contesting spaces. Deepening these understandings reveals ways of re-envisioning engaged spirituality that speak to the legacies of the 'war on terror' and the threat of future terrorist attacks.

I can advocate for this shift because of the creativity that already exists in the discipline of spirituality. By creativity, I mean the ability to be open to other possible vantage points. This ability is pronounced in the ways certain scholars explore natural and urban spaces such as a mountaintop or a city park.

Listening is a vital component of these explorations. I use the term 'listening' to refer to the ways in which the scholars discussed conceptualize natural and urban spaces as speaking with their own voices. Listening, in my understanding, is a methodological preference that signals the viability of different starting points in spirituality. The scholars explored below are examples of this methodological preference. They understand that the spaces investigated are complex and multidimensional. In order to discern the spiritual impact of a mountaintop or in a city park, one has to be open to all of the voices present.

The idea of listening allows the scholars discussed to shift their starting points from spirituality to the dynamics of the spaces they investigate. By dynamics, I mean

the relationships between the objects, people, and practices that structure the spaces in question. An example could be the dynamics that structure the relationship between the trees, benches, and people enjoying the shade in a city park or the relationship between a backpacker, an open sky, and the trail beneath his or her feet.

The purpose of shifting one's starting point is twofold. First, as noted, it enables scholars to listen to a multiplicity of voices that can, in turn, refine their understandings of space and how it enhances or diminishes the human spirit. Second, acknowledging a multiplicity of voices broadens the potential sources of insight into the relationship between space and spiritual transformation. Thus, by shifting their starting points, the scholars discussed creatively rethink approaches used to address issues such as the growth of megacities or the conservation of the natural environment. Listening is an important tool in this creative rethinking.

2.4.1 Examples of Listening: Voices in City Spaces

Philip Sheldrake writes that a Christian understanding of spirituality holds in tension the inner and outer lives of individuals and communities.¹⁸⁷ In other words, spirituality is not only about interiority or contemplation but also about exteriority, or what he calls prophetic social action.¹⁸⁸ By situating this dialectic at the heart of spirituality, Sheldrake provides a foundation for his conviction that urban spaces can be

¹⁸⁷ Philip Sheldrake, *Spaces for the Sacred: Place, Memory, and Identity* (Baltimore, MD: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2001), 147.

¹⁸⁸ Philip Sheldrake, "Christian Spirituality as a Way of Living Publicly: A Dialectic of the Mystical and Prophetic," *Spiritus* 3, no.1 (2003): 25.

sources of insight into the relationship between spirituality and social change.¹⁸⁹ Cities are particularly important sources of insight into this relationship.

Cities shape people's sensibilities and ways of seeing the world.¹⁹⁰ As humanly conceived and constructed, cities can be understood as symbolizing cherished societal values, both negative and positive. Stated differently, cities have stories to tell about the visions and practices of those who inhabit their many and multifaceted spaces. In the twenty-first century, however, the city is where an increasing majority of people live for better or for worse.¹⁹¹ This reality, coupled with the emergence of mega-cities in the developing world that contribute to the expansion of slums and shantytowns, make listening to the voices of city spaces an important spiritual issue.

Sheldrake admits that Christianity shapes how he listens to these voices. He is a Christian theologian, after all. He is careful, however, to recognize that cities are always complex realities in need of sophisticated, interdisciplinary approaches.¹⁹² To stress this point, he acknowledges that his understanding of cities has been shaped through ongoing conversations with urban theorists, architects, city planners and policy makers.¹⁹³ By engaging in these conversations, he believes scholars in the discipline of spirituality can extend their understanding of city-making beyond "classic texts and spiritual practices to

¹⁸⁹ Philip Sheldrake, "Spirituality and Social Change: Rebuilding the Human City," *Spiritus* 9, no. 2 (2009): 137-156.

¹⁹⁰ Sheldrake, *Spaces for the Sacred*, 147; Sheldrake, "Spirituality and Social Change," 140.

¹⁹¹ Philip Sheldrake, *Explorations in Spirituality: History, Spirituality and Social Practice* (New York, NY: Paulist Press, 2010), 159; Philip Sheldrake, "Placing the Sacred: Transcendence and the City," *Literature and Theology* 21, no. 3 (September 2007): 244.

¹⁹² Philip Sheldrake, "Christian Spirituality as a Way of Living Publicly," 28; Sheldrake, "Spirituality and Social Change," 137.

¹⁹³ Sheldrake, "Spirituality and Social Change," 137.

focus more deeply on the practice of everyday life and on material culture.”¹⁹⁴ In other words, scholars need to shift their starting points to the daily routines and practices of individuals and communities that not only bring these spaces to life but also structure the city itself.

This shift is important for two reasons. First, Sheldrake reminds his fellow scholars that sacred space is not static or fixed.¹⁹⁵ Understanding any space as ‘sacred’ requires inquiring into who defines what is sacred and who has access to particular spaces.¹⁹⁶ When complex urban spaces are conceived univocally, or with the voice of one community or discipline in mind, they can become spaces that exclude.¹⁹⁷ This is one of the problems that Sheldrake discusses in relationship to contemporary urban planning. A “cellular view” of city design, which divides it into different zones for work, leisure, and shopping, turns the city into a commodity.¹⁹⁸ In contrast, a multivocal approach relates architecture to community-building and design to the production of humanizing public spaces.

Second, as cities become more and more religiously plural, understandings of what makes a space sacred must extend beyond conventional religious buildings.¹⁹⁹ Sheldrake argues that buildings and spaces have the ability to shape people’s spiritual visions.²⁰⁰ For example, the spatial configuration of a cathedral ‘speaks’ of

¹⁹⁴ Sheldrake, “Spirituality and Social Change,” 140.

¹⁹⁵ Sheldrake, “Placing the Sacred,” 248.

¹⁹⁶ Sheldrake, “Placing the Sacred,” 243.

¹⁹⁷ Sheldrake, *Spaces for the Sacred*, 149-150.

¹⁹⁸ Sheldrake, “Placing the Sacred,” 245.

¹⁹⁹ Sheldrake, “Placing the Sacred,” 252.

²⁰⁰ Sheldrake, *Explorations in Spirituality*, 171.

transcendence and the need for an ordered public life.²⁰¹ This is because the stones and spaces of the cathedral hold the cumulative memory of city communities.²⁰² In a similar way, a public park can shape visions of solidarity when it is understood as a space where people encounter one another and share their stories. Listening to what these spaces have to say is important for defining them as “humane,” or as landscapes with the ability to “undermine the defensive human instinct for closed assumptions and foregone conclusions.”²⁰³

Using these spaces as a starting point, Sheldrake rethinks spirituality as “a way of living publicly.”²⁰⁴ He writes:

Living publicly implies real encounters, learning how to be truly hospitable to what is different and unfamiliar, and establishing and experiencing a common life. Living publicly excludes social or political quietism, it excludes existing passively in the midst of the world.²⁰⁵

In his understanding, how people engage with the complexity and multivocality of space is integral to cultivating a greater awareness of the spiritual potential of city landscapes.²⁰⁶ Listening to cities with this awareness in mind offers people “a language to confront evils such as dominance, violence, injustice and social exclusion.”²⁰⁷ As a result, the city becomes a repository or source of insight into how urban dwellers can disrupt and challenge these evils.

An adequate approach for understanding city spaces must reflect their complexity and multivocality. By listening to this complexity and multivocality,

²⁰¹ Sheldrake, *Explorations in Spirituality*, 164.

²⁰² Sheldrake, *Explorations in Spirituality*, 165.

²⁰³ Sheldrake, “Christian Spirituality as a Way of Living Publicly,” 30.

²⁰⁴ Sheldrake, “Christian Spirituality as a Way of Living Publicly,” 26-27.

²⁰⁵ Sheldrake, “Christian Spirituality as a Way of Living Publicly,” 26.

²⁰⁶ Sheldrake, “Christian Spirituality as a Way of Living Publicly,” 29.

²⁰⁷ Sheldrake, “Spirituality and Social Change,” 151.

Sheldrake creatively rethinks the importance of interdisciplinarity and city-literacy for deepening spiritual understandings of and approaches to urban spaces. In turn, this deepening provides an opportunity to extend the sources of insight into the contribution spirituality can make to the flourishing of individuals and communities in the heart of contemporary cities. Sheldrake is, therefore, advocating for an approach that is creative, interdisciplinary, and city-literate. In the next section, I explore these principles in the work of Belden Lane.

2.4.2 Examples of Listening: Voices on Backcountry Trails

In many ways, Lane's writings affirm Sheldrake's understanding of and approach to the relationship between space and the contribution of spirituality to human flourishing. I explore some of these affirmations below. The continuity between their ideas underscores the importance of acknowledging the complexity and multivocality of particular spaces and/or landscapes. They agree that spiritual approaches to these spaces should reflect this complexity and multivocality.

These convictions suggest that a level of creativity and spatial literacy are needed to understand spaces on their own terms. Thus, by shifting their starting points and employing an interdisciplinary and literate approach, both scholars can effect a creative rethinking of the contribution of spirituality to particular issues such as the flourishing of humane city spaces or the personal transformation of an individual in the wilderness. In either case, space is considered a source of insight into spirituality and its relationship to the complex and multifaceted realities of individual and social change.

Lane acknowledges that spaces shape human perception and experience. He writes: “We *are* what our places make of us.”²⁰⁸ Where landscape and the natural world are concerned, Lane suggests that these places are participants in the creation of meaning.²⁰⁹ This means that they speak with their own voices and carry their own stories.²¹⁰ The task of the scholar is to learn to respect and listen to these voices and stories.

Echoing Sheldrake for a second time, Lane recognizes the need for holistic, interdisciplinary approaches for the study of landscapes.²¹¹ Such an approach facilitates insight into the dynamics of a particular place. For example, Lane suggests that poets can provide as much critical insight into these dynamics as the approach of a social scientist or the clerk at a government mapping office.²¹² Through their works, poets seek to capture the languages of birdsong, wind, and water. This is one way of acknowledging, in lieu of listening to the voices of an actual natural space, that language is not the purview of human reason alone.²¹³

Bringing attention to the insights of poets is not surprising given Lane’s understanding of the discipline of spirituality. He writes that the goal of the discipline is to strike a balance between analytic rigor and imaginative reflection.²¹⁴ Lane describes

²⁰⁸ Belden C. Lane, “Merton’s Hermitage: Bachelard, Domestic Space, and Spiritual Transformation,” *Spiritus* 4, no. 2 (Fall 2004): 145. Emphasis in original text.

²⁰⁹ Belden C. Lane, “Giving Voice to Place: Three Models for Understanding American Sacred Space,” *Religion and American Culture* 11, no. 1 (2001): 55-56.

²¹⁰ Lane, “Giving Voice to Place,” 70, 71.

²¹¹ Lane, “Giving Voice to Place,” 72.

²¹² Lane, “Giving Voice to Place,” 72-73.

²¹³ Lane, “Giving Voice to Place,” 73.

²¹⁴ Belden C. Lane, “Spider as Metaphor: Attending to the Symbol-Making Process in the Academic Discipline of Spirituality,” in *Minding the Spirit: The Study of Christian Spirituality*, ed. Elizabeth A. Dreyer and Mark C. Burrows (Baltimore, MD: The John Hopkins University Press, 2005), 114.

how he sought to strike this balance in his work, *The Solace of Fierce Landscapes: Exploring Desert and Mountain Spirituality*.²¹⁵

The book wove together his experiences of loss in the wake of his mother's death, the spirituality of the Desert Fathers and Mothers, and the voices of particular desert and mountain landscapes. He describes how he moved through his experiences and this spirituality, knowing that the voices of the deserts and the mountains he explored would ultimately have the last word.²¹⁶ The landscapes had insights to teach. In order to glean them, Lane understood that he would have to take the landscapes seriously on their own terms. He writes: "I must let the land speak in all its bewildering otherness."²¹⁷ His ability to be open to this otherness allowed him to intertwine his voice with those of the Desert Fathers and Mothers to creatively rethink approaches to wilderness in contemporary spirituality.

Continuing with the theme of wilderness and by shifting his starting point to listen to particular landscapes, Lane extends his understanding of the spaces and practices that can be sources of insight into individual and societal transformation. In an essay titled "Backpacking with the Saints: The Risk Taking Character of Wilderness Reading," Lane employs a spatial analysis of reading as a spiritual practice.²¹⁸ Given the long history of saints being moved by reading in wilderness settings, he is surprised

²¹⁵ Belden C. Lane, "Writing in Spirituality as a Self-Implicating Act: Reflections on Authorial Disclosure and the Hiddenness of the Self," in *Exploring Christian Spirituality: Essays in Honor of Sandra M. Schneiders, IHM*, ed. Bruce H. Lescher and Elizabeth Liebert (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 2006), 64-67.

²¹⁶ Lane, "Writing in Spirituality as a Self-Implicating Act," 66.

²¹⁷ Belden C. Lane, *The Solace of Fierce Landscapes: Exploring Desert and Mountain Spirituality* (Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 1998), 18.

²¹⁸ Belden C. Lane, "Backpacking with the Saints: The Risk Taking Character of Wilderness Reading," *Spiritus* 8, no. 1 (Spring 2008): 23-43.

that so little attention has been paid to the role of place in religious experience and the process of reading more generally.²¹⁹ Taking up this lacuna, Lane uses his experiences of backcountry hiking and camping as a hermeneutical lens.²²⁰ He examines how spiritual insights discovered in his reading of certain saints are shaped and enriched by his experience of the Missourian Ozarks wilderness.²²¹

By shifting his starting point, a seemingly solitary practice such as backpacking becomes a site of spiritual transformation and confrontation with injustice. Backpacking through the economically and ecologically depressed counties of southeastern Missouri becomes an act of cultivating awareness of the fragility of the natural environment and of the local people.²²² Through sounds and images, the landscape impresses onto Lane a sense of the interconnectedness of people and place and the messy knot of economic and ecological injustice.

These impressions help Lane re-envision wilderness reading as a form of “engaged” spiritual practice, in which the boundaries between self and landscape dissolve.²²³ Reading in this context becomes an active, dynamic encounter with oneself and the natural world. It becomes, as Lane writes, “an explosive, uncontrolled event, as whimsical as wilderness itself.”²²⁴ His description of his feelings and perceptions – of waking up to a fresh blanket of snow or the mixture of awe when encountering a black bear on a backcountry trail – puts flesh on his potentially abstract discussion of

²¹⁹ Lane, “Backpacking with the Saints,” 24.

²²⁰ Lane, “Backpacking with the Saints,” 28, 29.

²²¹ Lane, “Backpacking with the Saints,” 31-37.

²²² Lane, “Backpacking with the Saints,” 36-37.

²²³ Lane, “Backpacking with the Saints,” 38. For more on the centrality of reading for engaged spiritual practice, see Daniel Coleman, *In Bed with the Word: Reading, Spirituality, and Cultural Politics* (Edmonton, AB: University of Alberta Press, 2009).

²²⁴ Lane, “Backpacking with the Saints,” 40.

wilderness as a source of insight. As a result, he grounds literary ideas of simplicity, attentiveness, and fearlessness in practices shaped by the ways in which he himself listens to the Ozarks.

2.5 Conclusion: Providing Hope

The working definitions presented in this chapter suggest that creative and original thinking on music, spirituality, and violence enrich our understandings of their function and impact in diverse contexts. When brought into dialogue with my pneumatophores, this suggestion becomes a call for the construction of adequate scholarly approaches to study these phenomena. In the context of my research, this means constructing an approach to contemporary protest music in the discipline of spirituality.

Such an approach needs to be creative, interdisciplinary, and musically literate. These principles build on two challenges discussed in the third and fourth sections of this chapter. The first is the challenge to perceive alternatives to the violent legacies of the ‘war on terror.’ The second is the need to broaden sources of insight into the relationship between spirituality and social transformation.

Constructing an adequate approach to contemporary protest music may seem like an exercise in futility given the reality that violence remains a legitimated policy option for most governments worldwide. Yet, the construction of this approach is not futile if it can sustain the hope that viable options exist, other than violence, with which to respond to terrorism. This hope suffused the millions who poured into the streets on February

15, 2003, to challenge the United States' war against Iraq.²²⁵ The protests have been characterized as an expression of people's resistance against the fear produced by war.²²⁶ By resisting, hope was generated and alternatives to this fear were provided. Any idea or action that contributes to this resistance is important.

The question that needs to be asked continuously as part of this resistance within the academy is: What other options are available? In the context of this dissertation, the question of options becomes one related to music. How does protest music help us understand the poetics of the 'war on terror'? What spaces does this music create to give voice to options and generate hope? How do musicians use their musicking to resist fear? Is it possible to perform a song and change the world? In the next chapter, I discuss the ways the principles of creativity, interdisciplinarity, and music literacy ground an adequate approach with which to answer these questions.

²²⁵ For more on these protests, see Stefaan Walgrave and Dieter Rucht, ed., *Demonstrations against the War on Iraq* (Minnesota, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2010).

²²⁶ Rebecca Solnit, *Hope in the Dark: Untold Histories, Wild Possibilities* (Toronto, ON: Penguin Group, 2006), 26.

Chapter Three: Constructing an Adequate Approach for the Study of Protest Music in the Discipline of Spirituality

I believe that we can change the world if we start listening to one another again. Simple, honest, human conversation. Not mediation, negotiation, problem-solving, debate or public meetings. Simple, truthful conversation where we each have a chance to speak, we each feel heard, and we each listen well.

- Margaret Wheatley, *Turning to One Another*

We know that music can aid in the recovery from trauma, so we need to encourage societies to respect this capacity in music. We know that involving children in music leads to their becoming healthier, better adjusted, more disciplined, and self-aware adults, so we should work to make music thrive again in schools, families, and communities. And of course, all of us need to bring our critical ability to the task of understanding how music is implicated in conflict, justice, intercultural understanding, and peace.

- Gage Averill, *Music in the Post-9/11 World*

3. Introduction

In this chapter, I construct an adequate approach for the study of contemporary protest music in the discipline of spirituality. My construction is based on two interlocking ideas introduced in the previous chapter. The first is the notion that creativity involves the capacity to see other perspectives on a particular issue or topic. The second is that scholars can broaden their sources of insight by using creativity to shift their starting points. The result of this shift is an approach based on the principles of interdisciplinarity and literacy. Literacy, to remind readers, comprises understanding phenomena such as spirituality and space according to their own dynamics.

In the first section of the chapter, I explore the use of interdisciplinarity and music literacy in the research of international relations scholar, Roland Bleiker. The second section is a discussion of music literacy in the book *Parallels and Paradoxes*:

Explorations in Music and Society by David Barenboim and Edward Said.¹ In the third section, I examine the creativity, interdisciplinarity, and music literacy in approaches to popular music in the disciplines of theology and religious studies. Based on this examination, in the fourth section I assess understandings of and approaches to popular music in the discipline of spirituality.

3.1 A Responsible Interdisciplinarity

It is important to acknowledge that interdisciplinarity, understood as the principle of relating to and dialoguing with another discipline, is considered to be a central precept in the discipline of spirituality.² By central precept, I mean that scholars embrace the idea that other disciplines can provide insight into the ways people understand and live out their spirituality. Sheldrake affirms, however, that interdisciplinarity requires more than “a plundering” of the vocabularies and interpretive strategies of other disciplines.³ A responsible interdisciplinarity respects these vocabularies and strategies, recognizing the value of a multipronged approach to a particular issue or topic.⁴

Roland Bleiker’s research is an example of responsible interdisciplinarity. By using Bleiker, I am not suggesting that interdisciplinary scholarship in the discipline of

¹ Daniel Barenboim and Edward Said, *Parallels and Paradoxes: Explorations in Music and Society* (New York, NY: Vintage Books, 2004). The idea of music literacy resonates with King’s notion of spiritual literacy discussed in Chapter Two. Like spiritual literacy, music literacy can deepen understanding of the transformative potential of music in relationship to spirituality and social change.

² Judith Berling, “Christian Spirituality: Intrinsically Interdisciplinary,” in *Exploring Christian Spirituality*, ed. Bruce H. Lescher and Elizabeth Liebert (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 2006), 35-52; Perrin, *Studying Christian Spirituality*, 37-39; Sandra M. Schneiders, “The Study of Christian Spirituality: Contours and Dynamics of a Discipline,” in *Minding the Spirit: The Study of Christian Spirituality*, ed. Elizabeth A. Dreyer and Mark C. Burrows (Baltimore, MD: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2005), 7-15. For more on interdisciplinary partners in the discipline of spirituality, see Arthur Holder, ed., *The Blackwell Companion to Christian Spirituality* (Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell, 2011), 287-416.

³ Philip Sheldrake, “Spirituality and its Critical Methodology,” in *Exploring Christian Spirituality*, ed. Bruce H. Lescher and Elizabeth Liebert (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 2006), 20.

⁴ Berling, “Christian Spirituality: Intrinsically Interdisciplinary,” 41.

spirituality is irrelevant to an exploration of music. As I discuss in subsequent sections, interdisciplinarity is utilized in studies of music in theology, religious studies, and spirituality. I explore Bleiker's research because he links interdisciplinarity to the principle of arts literacy to address the issue of terrorism. By making these links, his research gives further substance to the idea that music is a source of insight into the delegitimizing of violence.⁵

3.1.1 Addressing Terrorism through Interdisciplinary Research and Arts Literacy

It is not my intention in this section to provide a comprehensive analysis of Bleiker's research interests.⁶ The themes presented are a distillation of ideas related to interdisciplinarity and arts literacy in his research on aesthetics and terrorism between the years 2003-2010. The themes are using the full register of human intelligence to address terrorism, the arts as a source of insight into this issue, and the importance of arts literacy to effect social and political transformation.

⁵ The interest in the relationship between religion and international relations in the last decade provides further precedence for using an international relations scholar as a dialogue partner in this chapter. For more on this relationship, see John D. Carlson and Erik C. Owens, ed., *The Sacred and the Sovereign: Religion and International Politics* (Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press, 2002); Douglas Johnston, ed., *Faith-based Diplomacy: Trumping Realpolitik* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2003); Fabio Petito and Pavlos Hatzopolous, ed., *Religion in International Relations: The Return from Exile* (New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2003).

⁶ Since acquiring his PhD in 2000, Bleiker has written and/or edited several books on international conflict and reconciliation. See Roland Bleiker, *Popular Dissent, Human Agency and Global Politics* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2000); Roland Bleiker, *Divided Korea: Toward a Culture of Reconciliation* (Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2005); Morgan Brigg and Roland Bleiker, ed., *Mediating Across Difference: Oceanic and Asian Approaches to Conflict Resolution* (Honolulu, HI: University of Hawai'i Press, 2011).

Like violence, terrorism is a contested and contingent term. It can be understood in different ways depending on the context and people involved.⁷ Emphasizing this point, Robert Goodin comments on the ‘loose talk’ that often accompanies the term. By loose talk, he means that terrorism can describe a spectrum of acts and tactics, including those governments consider disruptive or oppositional.⁸ The reader is reminded, however, that governments can also be the perpetrators of terror.⁹

In his research, Bleiker suggests that the September 11 attacks generated a “breach in understanding.”¹⁰ The idea of a breach can be related to the working definition of violence discussed in Chapter Two. For many, the terror experienced on that day did not fit into their imaginative frameworks of the world. The experience generated anxiety, fear, and a sense that no one was safe.¹¹ Responses to the attacks can be said to have emerged from this break in people’s understanding.

Bleiker’s suggestion resonates with a conceptualization of terrorism as a tactic that “operates at the level of the imaginary.”¹² An imaginary, as noted in the previous chapter, refers to the world of ideas that shape people’s justifications and responses to particular acts. The arts can provide different vantage points from which to not only negotiate the breaches caused by terror but also the justifications to use violence as a legitimate response. I turn to Bleiker’s research below, drawing on the work of other scholars where relevant.

⁷ For a comprehensive history of terrorism, see Matthew Carr, *The Infernal Machine: A History of Terrorism from the Assassination of Tsar Alexander II to Al-Qaeda* (New York, NY: The New Press, 2006).

⁸ Robert E. Goodin, *What’s Wrong with Terrorism?* (Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 2006), 4-5.

⁹ Goodin, *What’s Wrong with Terrorism?*, 2.

¹⁰ Roland Bleiker, *Aesthetics and Politics* (New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2009), 49-53.

¹¹ Mitchell, *Cloning Terror: The War of Images*, 12.

¹² Mitchell, *Cloning Terror: The War of Images*, 21.

Theme I: Using the Full Register of Human Intelligence

To address terrorism, Bleiker calls for the use of the “full register of human intelligence.”¹³ The use of this full register is needed because of the failure of massive military build-ups such as in Afghanistan and Iraq to prevent the threat of future terrorist attacks.¹⁴ The perpetuation of violence, in other words, has not led to a more just and peaceful world. This fact underscores the need for new perspectives to understand and explain terrorism.¹⁵

Other scholars and public intellectuals agree with Bleiker, recognizing the need for new perspectives on this issue. Howard Zinn observes: “We have to broaden our definition of terrorism, or else we will denounce one terrorism and accept another. And we need to create conditions in the world where the terrorism of sections and the terrorism of governments are both opposed by people all over the world.”¹⁶ The idea of broadening one’s definition is not meant to diminish the impacts of terror. Rather, Zinn argues that the act of broadening is a basis from which to imagine alternatives. “Try to explain and understand terrorism is not to justify terrorism,” he continues. “But if you don’t try to explain anything, you will never learn anything.”¹⁷ Perpetuating violence by terrorizing others is not, in his opinion, part of the process of explaining and understanding this issue.¹⁸

¹³ Bleiker, *Aesthetics and Politics*, 1.

¹⁴ Roland Bleiker, “Aestheticising Terrorism: Alternative Approaches to 11 September,” *Australian Journal of Politics and History* 49, no. 3 (2003): 431-432.

¹⁵ Roland Bleiker, “Why, Then, is it so Bright? Towards an Aesthetics of Peace in Time of War,” *Review of International Studies* 29 (2003): 387.

¹⁶ Howard Zinn, *Terrorism and War* (New York, NY: Seven Stories Press, 2002), 16.

¹⁷ Zinn, *Terrorism and War*, 16.

¹⁸ Zinn, *Terrorism and War*, 12.

Thus, in an attempt to explain and understand terrorism, Bleiker undertakes a ‘problem’ or ‘puzzle-based’ approach. A problem or puzzle-based approach works from the assumption of seeking the broadest possible sources of insight into an issue. Instead of using sources of insight familiar to international relations, Bleiker turns to the arts. Poetry in particular is conceived as a way to learn from people who have lived with violence and terror in different cultural contexts.¹⁹ As an art form, poetry not only engages but also stretches language thereby expanding the boundaries of what people believe is possible.²⁰ Through this engagement and stretching, poets offer different vantage points from which to dream of alternative realities. Such dreams were part of the poetic dissent that contested the ‘war on terror;’ dissent that emphasized a common humanity as alternatives to violence and terror.²¹

One of the risks associated with a problem or puzzle-based approach is looking foolish and amateurish.²² This is because its focus is on breadth rather than depth. An overriding benefit, however, is enabling a scholar to reach beyond what is considered mainstream or conventional understandings of the issue under investigation.²³ Bleiker writes:

If a puzzle is the main challenge, then it can be addressed with all the means available, independent of their provenance or label. A source may stem from this or that discipline, it may be academically sanctioned or not, expressed in prose or in poetic

¹⁹ Bleiker, *Aesthetics and Politics*, 128-170.

²⁰ Bleiker, *Aesthetics and Politics*, 86.

²¹ Marguerite G. Bouvard, “Poetry, a New Voice for Dissent,” in *The Impact of 9/11 on the Media, Arts, and Entertainment*, ed. Matthew J. Morgan (New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), 151-163.

²² Bleiker, *Aesthetics and Politics*, 174.

²³ Roland Bleiker, “Learning from Art: A Reply to Holden’s “World Literature and World Politics,” *Global Society* 17, no. 4 (2003): 420.

form, it may be language based or visual or musical or take any other shape or form: it is legitimate as long as it helps illuminate the puzzle in question.²⁴

As the above quote implies, the focus in this approach is less on disciplinary boundaries and academic provenance than on creative illumination. Problem or puzzle-based research facilitates illumination by providing scholars with a creative space to consider a spectrum of sources, including prose, poetry, the visual arts, and music. This focus on breadth and creativity echoes the interdisciplinary approaches used by Sheldrake and Lane discussed in the previous chapter.²⁵

Theme II: The Arts as a Source of Insight

By applying a problem-based approach to terrorism, Bleiker broadens his sources of insight to include the arts. The arts are important because they embody a reaching for the new, the different, and the neglected.²⁶ As noted, they offer a different vantage point on the issue of terrorism. This includes the deeply emotional impact of terrorist attacks.²⁷

Tapping into the arts as a source of insight requires studying the arts on their own terms.²⁸ This means using the frameworks of relevant art-based disciplines in one's research.²⁹ By using these frameworks, Bleiker is not suggesting that they should replace the more conventional theories and methodologies in international relations.³⁰ Nor is he suggesting that artistic insights are better or more authentic than those arising

²⁴ Bleiker, "Learning from Art," 420

²⁵ See Chapter Two, 99-108.

²⁶ Bleiker, *Aesthetics and Politics*, 11.

²⁷ Bleiker, *Aesthetics and Politics*, 4.

²⁸ Roland Bleiker, "Of Things We Hear but Cannot See: Musical Explorations of International Relations," in *Resounding International Relations: On Music, Culture, and Politics*, ed. M.I. Franklin (New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2005), 191.

²⁹ Bleiker, "Of Things We Hear," 193-194.

³⁰ Bleiker, *Aesthetics and Politics*, 94.

from socio-political analysis. He is arguing that exploring other frameworks opens creative spaces in which to rethink an issue, including terrorism.

Like spirituality, however, the arts are ambiguous. They can support violence and terror and/or promote a positive peace. They should not be understood, therefore, as a ‘pure’ source of insight, meaning a source without bias or presuppositions. I discuss this ambiguity at length in subsequent chapters. Here, I am interested in the opening of creative spaces that Bleiker suggests the arts can provide in the aftermath of terrorist attacks. He illustrates this opening with regard to September 11.

In the wake of the attacks, the United States’ response was to return to “the reassuring familiarity of dualistic thinking patterns that dominated foreign policy during the Cold War.”³¹ According to this dualistic thinking, the world is divided into ‘good’ and ‘evil’ and the military presented as the only means of protecting the former from the latter. The result of this thinking has been the generation of new forms of hatred and violence.³² The perpetuation of these realities warns against falling back on old patterns of thinking, particularly when other perspectives and sources of insight exist such as the arts.³³ Bleiker comments:

Aesthetic sources cannot give us certainty. Embracing them is all about refusing a single-voiced and single-minded approach to politics in favor of embracing multiple voices and multiple truths. This is why a novel, a painting, a film or a piece of music can never tell us what to do, whether to go for option A or B. But aesthetic engagements can broaden our ability to understand and assess the challenges at hand...They might also reveal that A and B are in fact not the only options – there is C as well.³⁴

³¹ Bleiker, *Aesthetics and Politics*, 51. This aspect of the United States’ response to September 11 is discussed by religious studies scholars. See for example, Chernus, “George Bush’s War on Terrorism and Sin;” Thomas O’Brien, “Thinking with Murray about the “War on Terror,” *Journal of Church and State* 51, no. 1 (2009), 126-143.

³² Bleiker, *Aesthetics and Politics*, 51.

³³ Roland Bleiker, “Art After 9/11,” *Alternatives* 31 (2006), 94.

³⁴ Bleiker, *Aesthetics and Politics*, 188.

The call for a multi-voiced and multi-minded approach in relationship to aesthetic sources again resonates with Sheldrake and Lane's methodological preferences. These preferences comprised listening to particular spaces on their own terms and shifting their starting points accordingly.

Although Bleiker refers to his approach as problem or puzzle-based, I consider it an example not only of responsible interdisciplinarity but also of creativity. This is because he seeks to listen to the arts on their own terms. Instead of relying on conventional understandings and approaches in his discipline, he shifts his starting point to the arts. He embraces their dynamics to evaluate their socio-political value.³⁵ In doing so, he re-envisioned the role of creative, interdisciplinary scholarship as mirroring that of the poet in effecting social and political change. He writes:

A poet who wants to function as a chronicler of his or her time must do more than merely reflect the *Zeitgeist* of an epoch. Reflection is not enough. To write poetry that is of poetic and political value, the author must produce more than mirror images of an epoch. He or she has to distort visions in order to challenge the entrenched forms of representations that have come to circumscribe our understanding of socio-political reality. The poet's task is to help us see familiar things in new ways, to make us recognize how we have constituted our vision of the world and, by extension, the world itself.³⁶

Like the poet, a creative, interdisciplinary scholar should do more than reflect the staid understandings and approaches of his or her discipline. His or her task is to challenge these forms of thinking and practice. When such a scholar seeks to use the arts as a centerpiece of their research, arts literacy is fundamental.

³⁵ Bleiker, *Aesthetics and Politics*, 2.

³⁶ Bleiker, *Aesthetics and Politics*, 139.

Theme III: The Importance of Arts Literacy

In his research, Bleiker clearly situates himself as an international relations scholar interested in the arts.³⁷ He acknowledges that he is not a trained artist or musicologist and so the “great unread” of arts disciplines remains a daunting presence.³⁸ He addresses this presence by self-reflexively laying out his biases and presuppositions, including the belief that the arts are essential elements in “the quest for knowledge and political thinking space.”³⁹

Such critical self-reflexivity legitimizes the addition of the arts to Bleiker’s interpretative repertoire. By acknowledging his need for arts literacy, he does two things. First, he affirms the importance of creative, interdisciplinary scholarship. Second, through this affirmation, he appreciates and respects the integrity of the arts he sets out to analyze. Instead of imposing a socio-political analysis, Bleiker begins from the perspective that the arts have something of value to teach the discipline of international relations. In an essay on theater in post-conflict Sri Lanka co-authored with Nilanjana Premaratna, he states:

Art alone cannot, of course, solve a conflict, but it is part of a larger set of activities that are essential in the process of transforming conflict into peace. Perhaps even more importantly, artistic engagements, as exemplified by the Jana Keraliya theatre group, can serve as a model – a type of experimental spearheading – from which community leaders, politicians and scholars draw important lessons about larger dynamics at play in peacebuilding processes.⁴⁰

³⁷ Bleiker, “Of Things We Hear,” 181.

³⁸ Bleiker, *Aesthetics and Politics*, 183.

³⁹ Bleiker, “Of Things We Hear,” 181.

⁴⁰ Nilanjana Premaratna and Roland Bleiker, “Art and Peacebuilding: How Theatre Transforms Conflict in Sri Lanka,” in *Palgrave Advances in Peacebuilding: Critical Developments and Approaches*, ed. Oliver P. Richmond (New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010): 389-390.

The point I wish to make is that a scholar interested in the arts does not necessarily need to be a practicing artist. Although being an artist, poet, or musician is helpful, what is needed is the willingness to engage in ‘a type of experimental spearheading,’ to use Premaratna and Bleiker’s words. This spearheading includes learning from those who are either involved in or who have studied the arts in depth. For a creative, interdisciplinary scholar such as Bleiker, this willingness is an outgrowth of his critical self-reflexivity, a characteristic Ursula King emphasized in her definition of a post-modern approach to spirituality discussed in the previous chapter.⁴¹

Along these same lines, John Witvliet writes that those interested in the study of music should immerse themselves in musical experiences.⁴² The idea is that participatory knowledge of music enhances scholarly reflection. Examples of such immersive learning include seeking out a mentor to learn about music, whether how to listen, play, or simply better appreciate its dynamics.⁴³ Witvliet affirms: “Part of the value of a master mentor is that we can witness a good model up close – not only a model of good music, but a model of encountering music”.⁴⁴ The value of immersive learning, as Witvliet implies, is a more literate understanding of music as a complex, multifaceted human phenomenon; an understanding encapsulated by Small’s term, musicking.⁴⁵

⁴¹ See Chapter Two, 71-76.

⁴² John D. Witvliet, afterword to *Resonant Witness: Conversations between Music and Theology*, by ed., Jeremy S. Begbie and Steven R. Guthrie (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2011), 456-457.

⁴³ Witvliet, afterword, 457-458.

⁴⁴ Witvliet, afterword, 457.

⁴⁵ See Chapter Two, 61-65.

Bleiker attributes his interpretation of arts literacy to Alex Danchev.⁴⁶ Danchev also uses the arts as sources of insight into violence and terror.⁴⁷ In the introduction to his study *On Art and Terror and War*, he writes:

These essays are dedicated to the proposition that art matters, ethically and politically, affectively and intellectually. Poetry makes something happen after all. Not only does it make us feel – or feel differently – it makes us think, and think again. We go beyond ourselves, in Gadamer’s phrase, by penetrating deeper into the work: ‘That ‘something can be held in our hesitant stay’ – this is what art has always been and still is today.’ In sum, art articulates a vision of the world that is insightful and consequential; and the vision and the insight can be analyzed.⁴⁸

The arts matter, in Danchev’s opinion, because they offer an alternative vision of and insight into key social and political issues. He also affirms that these artistic visions and insights are worth studying. Arts literacy is an important principle, alongside creativity and interdisciplinarity, with which to undertake the study of these visions and insights.

To draw attention to the importance of arts literacy to social and political transformation, Bleiker cites conversations between Edward Said and David Barenboim published in the book, *Parallels and Paradoxes*.⁴⁹ He writes that both men advance a passionate claim for “making music more central again to societal and cultural life, and thus to politics too.”⁵⁰ In the next section, I turn to Said and Barenboim’s conversations to discuss the principle of music literacy. I discuss this literacy at length because the

⁴⁶ Bleiker, “Of Things We Hear,” 195. See specifically his notes at the bottom of the page.

⁴⁷ For more on violence, terror and the arts, see Matti Hyvärinen and Lisa Muszynski, ed., *Terror and the Arts: Artistic, Literary, and Political Interpretations of Violence from Dostoyevsky to Abu Ghraib* (New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008).

⁴⁸ Alex Danchev, *On Art and War and Terror* (Edinburgh, UK: Edinburgh University Press, 2009), 4.

⁴⁹ Roland Bleiker, “Art, Emotions and Global Terrorism,” *Social Alternatives* 23, no. 2 (2004): 52; Bleiker, “Of Things We Hear,” 193-194; Bleiker, “Art After 9/11,” 93-94; Roland Bleiker, “Art against Terror: Nonviolent Alternatives through Emotional Insight,” in *Nonviolence: An Alternative for Defeating Global Terror(ism)*, ed. Senthil Ram and Ralph Summy (New York, NY: Nova Science Publishers, Inc., 2008), 181-182; and Bleiker, *Aesthetics and Politics*, 63-66.

⁵⁰ Bleiker, “Art against Terror,” 182.

precept is foundational to my arguments about protest music performances in Chapter Four.

3.2 Said and Barenboim: Why Music Literacy Matters

Edward Said was a public intellectual and scholar whose work explored the relationships between culture, post-colonial theory, and politics.⁵¹ Barenboim is a world-renown musician and conductor.⁵² As I discuss below, each has sought to use music as a means of imagining and building spaces for social and political transformation.

I examine three themes from Said and Barenboim's conversations in *Parallels and Paradoxes*. The themes are relevant to my research because they highlight the value of music and music literacy for creatively rethinking how social and political issues are addressed. They include music as a humanizing space, music literacy as a means of fostering intercultural understanding, and the need for adequate approaches to music as a basis for this literacy. I explore each theme in turn.

Theme I: Music as a Humanizing Space

Ideas and music are a binding force in the lives of both Said and Barenboim.⁵³ Hakem Ruston writes: "The Barenboim-Said friendship is complex and cannot be reduced to usual dichotomies and labels. Their affinity for European classical music

⁵¹ See Adel Iskandar and Hakem Ruston, ed., *Edward Said: A Legacy of Emancipation and Representation* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2010).

⁵² Daniel Barenboim, "About," under "Home," <http://www.danielbarenboim.com/index.php?id=86> (accessed February 2, 2012).

⁵³ Ara Guzelimian, preface to *Parallels and Paradoxes: Explorations in Music and Society*, by Daniel Barenboim and Edward W. Said (New York, NY: Vintage Books, 2004), iii.

was the force that brought them together.”⁵⁴ Although Said is recognized for his contributions to cultural, literary, and postcolonial theory, he also wrote extensively on music and was an accomplished pianist.⁵⁵ Barenboim is the first and most prominent Israeli musician to have performed in the Palestinian West Bank.⁵⁶ Both Said and Barenboim committed themselves to understanding the role of music in society and sharing this commitment with others.⁵⁷

Their understanding and advocacy for music literacy begins with the presupposition that music plays important social and political roles in society. One of these roles is music’s ability to provide spaces where individuals and communities can resist oppression.⁵⁸ By providing these spaces, Said suggests that music offers a stark contrast to political inhumanity and injustice.⁵⁹ The contrast lies in the fact that political inhumanity and injustice seek to stifle human creativity and resistance. Music ignites these by providing people with a space to breathe and to feel free.⁶⁰

As a result of this understanding, Said and Barenboim consider musical performance as the preeminent space in which to learn about what it means to be human. The conceptualization of music as a humanizing space is why they lament the decline of

⁵⁴ Hakem Ruston, “The Arab/Jewish Counterpoint: An Interview with Daniel Barenboim,” in *Edward Said: A Legacy of Emancipation and Representation*, ed. Adel Iskandar and Hakem Ruston (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2010), 231.

⁵⁵ Guzelimian, preface, v. See Edward W. Said, *Musical Elaborations* (New York, NY: Columbia University Press, 1991); Edward W. Said, *Music at the Limits* (New York, NY: Columbia University Press, 2008).

⁵⁶ Guzelimian, preface, v.

⁵⁷ Said died in 2003 after a prolonged battle with cancer.

⁵⁸ Barenboim, *Parallels and Paradoxes: Explorations in*, 44.

⁵⁹ Said, *Parallels and Paradoxes: Explorations in*, 168.

⁶⁰ Barenboim, *Parallels and Paradoxes: Explorations in*, 147.

music education in Western societies.⁶¹ Without a strong music education, they suggest music literacy declines.⁶² Barenboim comments:

But, on the other hand, the study of music is one of the best ways to learn about human nature. This is why I am so sad about music education being practically nonexistent today in schools. Education means preparing children for adult life; teaching them how to behave and what kinds of human beings they want to be. Everything else is information and can be learned in a simple way. To play music well you need to strike a balance between your head, your heart and your stomach. And if one of these three is not there or is there in too strong a dose, you cannot use it. What better way than music to show a child how to be human?⁶³

Here, music literacy is conceived as much more than the technical dexterity with which a musician handles his/her instrument or a composer pens a composition. It is also more than the knowledge needed to acquire commercial success.⁶⁴ Music literacy is a means for understanding the complex and multifaceted roles that music plays in society, including the spaces of resistance created in its performance. Barenboim states:

Another very important point, for me, is that if you study music in the deepest sense of the word – all the relationships, the interdependence of the notes, of the harmonies, of the rhythm, and the connection of all those elements with the speed; if you look at the essentially unrepeatability of music, the fact that it is different every time because it comes in a different moment – you learn many things about the world, about nature, about human beings and human relations.⁶⁵

As I show in the following sections of this chapter, acquiring the literacy to understand these roles and spaces has implications for the ways scholars envision and build their approaches to and theories of spirituality.

⁶¹ Barenboim, *Parallels and Paradoxes: Explorations in*, 141.

⁶² Said, *Parallels and Paradoxes: Explorations in*, 148-150.

⁶³ Barenboim, *Parallels and Paradoxes: Explorations in*, 24.

⁶⁴ Barenboim, *Parallels and Paradoxes: Explorations in*, 146; Said, *Parallels and Paradoxes: Explorations in*, 168.

⁶⁵ Barenboim, *Parallels and Paradoxes: Explorations in*, 122.

Theme II: Fostering Understanding through Music Literacy

The idea that music can be a humanizing space is demonstrated in the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra jointly initiated by Barenboim and Said. The Orchestra is an outgrowth of a 1999 workshop in Weimar, Germany, which brought together young musicians from different cultural and religious backgrounds.⁶⁶ Of the Orchestra, Barenboim states:

It is not an orchestra; it is much more than that. It is more like a workshop that gives young musicians from different countries in the Middle East a forum to come and study music and then play in concerts. The idea of the West-Eastern Divan comes from Goethe's work of the same title, since he was one of the first Europeans to enjoy and learn from ideas coming from other civilizations.⁶⁷

In the intervening years since this workshop, the Orchestra has found a home in Andalusia, Spain. It is part of a larger foundation, the Barenboim-Said Foundation, which emphasizes "the importance of music education for dialogue and reconciliation."⁶⁸

The Orchestra meets every summer for a month.⁶⁹ The musicians, often new to the Orchestra, come from a range of countries including Israel, Palestine, Lebanon, and Spain.⁷⁰ Elena Cheah, a member of the Orchestra for several summers, writes: "I heard in the orchestra's playing a certain unity of purpose in each phrase, an understanding of the cumulative effect of so much unresolved tension, a sensual relationship to the never-ending; continually sustained sound, and audible comprehension of the harmonic turning

⁶⁶ Daniel Barenboim, foreword to *An Orchestra Beyond Borders: Voices of the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra*, ed. Elena Cheah (London, UK: Verso Books, 2009), vii; David M. Washington and Devin G. Beecher, "Music as Social Medicine: Two perspectives on the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra," *New Directions in For Youth Development* 125 (Spring 2010): 127-140.

⁶⁷ Ruston, "The Arab/Jewish Counterpoint," 233.

⁶⁸ Ruston, "The Arab/Jewish Counterpoint," 231.

⁶⁹ Elena Cheah, introduction to *An Orchestra Beyond Borders: Voices of the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra* (London, UK: Verso Books, 2009), 1-9.

⁷⁰ Cheah, introduction, 1.

points of the piece.”⁷¹ This sense of musical unity affirms Said and Barenboim’s presuppositions that music is a humanizing space and that it plays a role in fostering mutual understanding.⁷²

In spite of these positive experiences, questions have been raised about the West-Eastern Divan’s contribution to building a positive peace in the Middle East. Many feel that the Orchestra’s performances will not bring an end to violence in the region.⁷³ Those who participate, however, describe the small resonances experienced in their lives, those of their families, and in the lives of those who attend the performances. These resonances are replete in the stories that Cheah collected in her study of the Orchestra. By learning about and making music together, the young musicians found that their assumptions about other cultures and religions were challenged, relationships were built, and new identities forged. As Said and Barenboim discuss throughout *Parallels and Paradoxes*, music literacy is one way of making these resonances possible.⁷⁴

Theme III: The Need for Adequate Approaches to Music Literacy

The themes discussed above reinforce the importance of having adequate approaches for studying music as a source of insight into social and political issues such

⁷¹ Cheah, introduction, 6.

⁷² Solveig Riiser comments that the Orchestra can be understood as a space for conflict transformation. She underscores, however, that this space is complex and multifaceted, replete with its own internal politics and power dynamics. See Solveig Riiser, “National Identity and the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra,” *Music & Arts in Action* 2, no. 2 (2010): 19-37, under <http://www.musicandartsinaction.net/index.php/maia/article/view/nationalidentity>, (accessed February 5, 2012).

⁷³ Washington and Beecher, “Music as social medicine,” 138.

⁷⁴ For more on the use of music in Israeli-Palestinian peace initiatives, see Benjamin Brinner, *Playing across a Divide: Israeli-Palestinian Musical Encounters* (Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2009).

as resisting oppression and fostering intercultural understanding. In this regard, a case could be made despite some people's reservations, that the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra is a source of insight into the individual and communal impacts of violence in the Middle East.⁷⁵ This is because the spaces created in the Orchestra's performances affect the lives of those participating and ripple out into their families and communities. The Orchestra was founded on the hope that these spaces would resonate in wider circles until peace was a realistic prospect not only in the Middle East but also around the world.

This hope in musical spaces is not exclusive to Said and Barenboim. They are shared by others involved in the making of music, the promotion of music literacy, and the building of a positive peace in the region. Kjell Skylstad writes:

As a music educator and researcher, involved for many years in international collaboration for peace, I am convinced that music can be a tool for integration, inclusion, group cohesion, collective cooperation, repairing social relationships, and facilitating dialogue between groups in conflict. This has been demonstrated in unique artistic projects bringing together Palestinian and Israelis, as described herein.⁷⁶

Predicting the outcomes of musical projects such as the West-Eastern Divan is difficult. For Said and Barenboim, it is the ephemeral, unpredictable, and unrepeatable nature of these projects that make them so powerful. The focus is not on results but on the possibilities that musical spaces provide for humanizing others and fostering mutual understanding. In other words, Said and Barenboim seem preoccupied less with how

⁷⁵ For more on these reservations, see Rachel Beckles Willson, "The Parallax Worlds of the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra," *The Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 134, no. 2 (2009): 319-347.

⁷⁶ Kjell Skylstad, "Salaam Shalom: Singing for Peace Between Palestinians and Israelis," in *Beyond Bullets and Bombs: Grassroots Peacebuilding Between Israelis and Palestinians*, ed. Judy Kuriansky (Westport, CT: Praeger, 2007), 177.

they would measure the success of their projects and more on how they would help to envision and build the spaces and literacy that these projects required.

On receiving an award for his efforts with the Orchestra, Said stated: “Who knows how far we will go, and whose minds we will change? The beauty of the question is that it cannot be easily answered or easily dismissed.”⁷⁷ Music literacy provides scholars with a way to understand this complex interplay of imagination, performance, space, and change. This is why it is such an important principle for an adequate approach to the study of music, whether in the discipline of international relations or in the discipline of spirituality.

3.3 Listening for Spirit: Understanding and Approaching Music

In the following sections, I examine a selection of scholarly understandings of and approaches to music in the disciplines of theology and religious studies. With this examination, I continue to affirm the value of creativity, interdisciplinarity, and music literacy for constructing an adequate approach to contemporary protest music in the discipline of spirituality. Before turning to theological and religious studies’ perspectives on music, it is important to acknowledge the long and varied relationship between music and spirituality. As one scholar affirms, “The history of spirituality as lived experience of religion is deeply intertwined with the history of music.”⁷⁸

⁷⁷ Edward W. Said, “Appendix: Edward Said’s Speech upon his Acceptance of the Principe de Asturias Prize,” in *An Orchestra Beyond Borders: Voices of the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra*, ed. Elena Cheah (London, UK: Verso Books, 2009), 277.

⁷⁸ Don E. Saliers, “Music and Spirituality,” in *The New Westminster Dictionary of Christian Spirituality*, ed. Philip Sheldrake (Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 2005), 452.

3.3.1 Music and Spirituality

The idea that music can help human beings understand and express their dreams and experiences of the cosmos has ancient roots.⁷⁹ In the West, this idea reaches as far back as Pythagoras and Plato.⁸⁰ Pythagoras believed that human beings could perceive the harmony of the universe through mathematical ratios, particularly when expressed in sound.⁸¹ For Plato, music was a model of the harmony, unity, and integrity of the universe.⁸² These notions have impacted on Western understandings of music for centuries and continue to influence the ways in which the relationship between music and spirituality is studied. For example, a section on music and the cosmos was included in a recently published collection on theology and music.⁸³

The idea that music expresses human aspirations and experiences is not a singularly Western or Christian notion.⁸⁴ In the worldview of Australian Aboriginal communities, landscape, music, and spirituality are deeply intertwined in the ways these communities perceive themselves in relationship to the cosmos.⁸⁵ Alluding to the centrality of this relationship, Fiona Magowan discusses the significance of the didgeridu in Yolngu culture in northeast Arnhem Land.⁸⁶ She writes:

⁷⁹ Lawrence E. Sullivan, "Enchanting Powers: An Introduction," in *Enchanting Powers: Music in the World's Religions*, ed. Lawrence E. Sullivan (Cambridge, UK: Harvard University Press, 1997), 5.

⁸⁰ Jamie James, *The Music of the Spheres: Music, Science and the Natural Order of the Universe* (New York, NY: Copernicus, 1993).

⁸¹ Jeremy Begbie, *Resounding Truth: Christian Wisdom in the World of Music* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2007), 78.

⁸² Begbie, *Resounding Truth: Christian Wisdom*, 80.

⁸³ Jeremy Begbie and Steven Guthrie, ed., *Resonant Witness: Conversations between Music and Theology* (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing, 2011), 27-134.

⁸⁴ Sullivan, "Enchanting Powers: An Introduction," 8.

⁸⁵ Fiona Richards, ed., *The Soundscapes of Australia: Music, Place and Spirituality* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2007).

⁸⁶ Fiona Magowan, "Playing with Meaning: Perspectives on Culture, Commodification and Contestation around the Didgeridu," *Yearbook for Traditional Music* 37 (2005): 80-102.

The rhythms of the didgeridu accompany singers who tell of the law of the ancestral beings and their movements across the ancestral land. This entangled relationship begins with the carving of a didgeridu whose rhythmic ancestral sounds are inherent in its shape and form.⁸⁷

Helping people conceptualize their relationship to the cosmos is one of many different and varied ways that music and spirituality intersect, historically and in the contemporary world. Guy Beck affirms: “For most religions throughout history, myths and sacred stories seem to have been embodied not only in written literature but, more importantly, in musical performance, combining vocal and instrumental music and, often, dance.”⁸⁸ The celebration of music as divine gift, its central role in worship, and its capacity to solidify community bonds are evident in several of the world’s major spiritual traditions.⁸⁹ In Japanese Zen, for example, the *Shakuhachi* flute is considered a spiritual tool that can facilitate meditative states.⁹⁰ In the West, the Buddhist associations with this flute have resulted in the instrument being appropriated by many in their quest for “an introspective attitude toward life.”⁹¹

To cite another example, in the United States the relationship between music and spirituality is long and varied.⁹² Stephen Marini writes:

Each of America’s religious communities has its own unique tradition of sacred song. Racial, ethnic, class and regional styles further subdivide those musical traditions. The

⁸⁷ Magowan, “Playing with Meaning,” 82.

⁸⁸ Guy L. Beck, introduction to *Sacred Sound: Experiencing Music in World Religions* (Waterloo, ON: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2006), 10.

⁸⁹ Guy L. Beck, ed., *Sacred Sound: Experiencing Music in the World Religions* (Waterloo, ON: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2006); Joyce Irwin, ed., *Sacred Sound: Music in Religious Thought and Practice* (Chico, CA: Scholars Press, 1983).

⁹⁰ Jay Keister, “The *Shakuhachi* as Spiritual Tool: A Japanese Buddhist Instrument in the West,” *Asian Music* 35, no. 2 (Spring – Summer 2004): 99-131.

⁹¹ Keister, “The *Shakuhachi* as Spiritual Tool,” 124. For a general introduction to Buddhism and music, see Ian W. Mabbett, “Buddhism and Music,” *Asian Music* 25, no. 1/2 (1993-1994): 9-28.

⁹² See Stephen A. Marini, *Sacred Song in America: Religion, Music and Public Culture* (Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press, 2003); David W. Stowe, *How Sweet the Sound: Music in the Spiritual Lives of Americans* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2004).

result is a national sacred-music culture that ranges from Native American drum songs to Bach cantatas, from black Pentecostal shout to the Mormon Tabernacle Choir, from Sacred Harp Singing to New Age toning, from blue-grass gospel to hard-rock gospel, from Catholic pilgrimage songs and charismatic concerts to Jewish varieties of Sephardic song and Hasidic klezmer music. The list goes on and on to functional infinity.⁹³

As the above quote implies, the possible intersections between music and spirituality worthy of study in this one context are infinite. Music and spirituality intersect on issues of agency, identity, and community; on politics, tolerance, and tradition; and ritual and worship.⁹⁴

My intention here is not to provide a comprehensive study of the spectrum of intersections possible between music and spirituality. Such a study would require a lifetime's worth of comparative practice and scholarship. Beck, for example, has spent years studying the relationship between music and Hindu theology.⁹⁵ I wish to acknowledge, however, that interest in music and spirituality on behalf of musicians, spiritual practitioners, and scholars is not new. This interest has been explored in different ways and in different contexts, including as part of contemporary pagan and activist communities.⁹⁶

For my purposes, an examination of select understandings of and approaches to music in theology and religious studies represents a particular opportunity. This is to

⁹³ Marini, *Sacred Song in America*, 1.

⁹⁴ Philip V. Bohlman, Edith L. Blumhofer, and Maria M. Chow, ed., *Music in American Religious Experience* (Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2006).

⁹⁵ See Guy L. Beck, *Sonic Theology: Hinduism and Sacred Sound* (Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press, 2008 [1993]); Guy L. Beck, *Sonic Liturgy: Ritual and Music in Hindu Tradition* (Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press, 2012).

⁹⁶ Christopher Chase, "Be Pagan Once Again": Folk Music, Heritage, and Socio-sacred Networks in Contemporary American Paganism," *The Pomegranate* 8, no. 2 (2006): 146-160; also see, Tanice G. Foltz, "Drumming and Re-enchantment: Creating Spiritual Community," in *Popular Spiritualities: The Politics of Contemporary Enchantment*, ed. Lynne Hume and Kathleen McPhillips (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006): 131-143.

explore the ways in which creativity, interdisciplinarity, and music literacy are foundational to construct an adequate approach to contemporary protest music. Since my research concerns examples of this music written in response to the ‘war on terror,’ I discuss understandings and approaches that can be applied to popular music making, particularly in the United States.

3.3.2 Cross-Disciplinary Interest in Music and Spirituality

As a research topic, the relationship between music and spirituality crosses a number of scholarly disciplines. Alongside scholarship in theology, religious studies, and spirituality, the topic is discussed in medical ethnomusicology, music education, and philosophy.⁹⁷ This cross-disciplinary interest suggests that music and spirituality can be understood and approached from a number of different perspectives.

With this in mind, in the following sections, I showcase the creativity, interdisciplinarity, and music literacy employed, whether explicitly or implicitly, in the disciplines of theology and religious studies. This discussion affords me with a more substantive context from which to evaluate the ways protest music has been understood and approached in spirituality. I turn to this evaluation in the final section of the chapter.

⁹⁷ For recent works on music and spirituality in medical ethnomusicology, see Gregory Barz, *Singing for Life: HIV/AIDS and Music in Uganda* (New York, NY: Routledge, 2006); Benjamin D. Koen, *Beyond the Roof of the World: Music, Prayer and Healing in the Pamir Mountains* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2009). For more on music and spirituality in music education, see June Boyce-Tillman, “The Transformative Qualities of a Liminal Space Created by Musicking,” *Philosophy of Music Review* 17, no. 2 (Fall 2009): 184-202. For a philosophical exploration, see Joel Rudinow, *Soul Music: Tracking the Spiritual Roots of Pop from Plato to Motown* (Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 2010).

3.3.3 Selected Understandings of and Approaches to Music in Theology

Below, I explore the work of Jeremy Begbie and Heidi Epstein. I have chosen these scholars' research because each has studied music in some capacity. Begbie trained as a professional pianist. Epstein holds graduate degrees in music. Before I discuss their research, however, I provide a brief overview of understandings and concerns associated with the principles of interdisciplinarity and music literacy in the field of music theology.

3.3.4 Interdisciplinarity and Music Literacy in Music Theology

Explorations of music and theology are categorized under different labels: music and theology, music theology, and theomusicology, to name a few.⁹⁸ Interdisciplinarity is a central precept of these explorations. To underscore this point, Bennett Zon describes music and theology as an “interdiscipline.”⁹⁹ He writes:

As an interdiscipline, therefore, music theology aims to recover the seemingly lost unity at root between musical and theological meaning in modern and historical areas of composition, performance and listening, and it probes the interstices of the material and nonmaterial worlds by freely inverting, exchanging and eroding traditional disciplinary terminologies, not simply between music and theology (and their subdisciplines), but between philosophy, aesthetics and other relevant fields.¹⁰⁰

As the above quote implies, scholars in this interdiscipline recognize the benefit of employing approaches that are interdisciplinary and multileveled.¹⁰¹ These approaches are preferred because they help to avoid reductionism on several fronts. Reductionism is

⁹⁸ See the International Network for Music Theology, “A Select Biography of Music Theology Research,” Durham University, under “Music Theology: Bibliography,” <http://www.dur.ac.uk/musictheology/bibliography/> (accessed March 21, 2012).

⁹⁹ Bennett Zon, “Bedazzled by Breakthrough: Music Theology and the Problem of Composing Music in Words,” *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 136, no. 2 (2010): 429-435.

¹⁰⁰ Zon, “Bedazzled by Breakthrough,” 430.

¹⁰¹ Jeremy S. Begbie and Steven R. Guthrie, introduction to *Resonant Witness: Conversations between Music and Theology* (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2011), 7.

avoided by acknowledging that music is a practice shaped by social, cultural, and political contexts.¹⁰² Small's term, *musicking*, is often used to emphasize this point.¹⁰³

Scholars in music theology are concerned with two reductionist 'hazards': theological instrumentalism and theological aestheticism.¹⁰⁴ As an approach, theological instrumentalism is thought to be reductionist because it allows scholars to read preconceived theological meanings into music.¹⁰⁵ Begbie and Guthrie write:

Whether we speak of theology enriching music or music enriching theology, the danger is that the integrity, distinctiveness and particularities of music will be stifled and distorted as they are made subservient to the requirements of an overbearing theology.¹⁰⁶

Interdisciplinary and multileveled approaches help to maintain music's integrity by acknowledging the need for some level of music literacy on the part of theologians. This includes attention to the internal properties of music (dynamics, structures, and processes) as well as external factors (cultural, political, and social) that shape these properties.

In the case of theological aestheticism, music is allowed to over-determine theology.¹⁰⁷ The reductionist concern is that theological presuppositions and meanings will be downplayed in favor of the music. As part of this approach, scholars can give music a quasi-religious character that can clash with deeply held beliefs, such as the conviction that music is divinely created. The idea that music is first and foremost a human construction, a position held in many music disciplines, is thought to be a

¹⁰² Begbie and Guthrie, introduction, 6.

¹⁰³ Begbie and Guthrie, introduction, 5.

¹⁰⁴ Begbie and Guthrie, introduction, 11-12. Emphasis in original text.

¹⁰⁵ Begbie and Guthrie, introduction, 12.

¹⁰⁶ Begbie and Guthrie, introduction, 12.

¹⁰⁷ Begbie and Guthrie, introduction, 12.

concern because of its potential to diminish the insights that theology contributes to an understanding of music.¹⁰⁸

Avoiding reductionism is important in any scholarly endeavor. Having said this, I believe the concern in music theology over theological aestheticism can be overstated. In my view, the concern involves questions related to one's starting points. Can music be a viable starting point in theology? If so, what principles would allow a scholar to listen to music on its own terms and produce theologically relevant insights? I established that the creativity of scholars in the discipline of spirituality enables them to shift their starting points. As the work of Sheldrake and Lane suggest, this shift does not diminish spiritual insights but enhances them.

Thus, given that interdisciplinarity and music literacy are already utilized in the field of music theology, I am curious about the consequences for scholarship when less attention is focused on the risks of theological aestheticism and more attention is focused on its strengths. Appropriating the idea that both music and theology are human constructs is an opportunity for creative and original thinking. This opportunity involves using music to re-envision theology. As noted, if this re-envisioning employs a responsible interdisciplinarity and honest self-reflexivity, the chances of reducing music and/or theology are diminished. In the next section, I explore these issues using Begbie's research.

¹⁰⁸ Begbie and Guthrie, introduction, 12.

3.3.5 Music Over-determining Theology: Creativity, Interdisciplinarity, and Music Literacy in Jeremy Begbie's Research

In his study *Theology, Music and Time*, Begbie writes: “Here we try to show how the experience of music can serve to open up features of a distinctively *theological* account of created temporality, redeemed by God in Jesus Christ, and what it means to live in and with time as redeemed creatures.”¹⁰⁹ This underlying theological worldview has strengths and limitations for understanding and approaching music.

One of its strengths is the affirmation that music is worthy of theological study. The affirmation arises from the presupposition that music should be taken seriously as a particular and unique source of theological insight.¹¹⁰ For example, Begbie recognizes that music is theologically significant because it is more than a mental exercise.¹¹¹ It is a set of practices that plays an irreducible role in the ways in which people engage with the world.¹¹² More specifically, music's performative mode provides visions and concrete ways of experiencing theological themes.¹¹³ Begbie's creativity is evident in his willingness to shift his starting point to music in certain instances, such as understanding the value of its performative modalities.

With music's theological worth explicitly affirmed, Begbie moves beyond historically ambivalent interpretations of music in theology.¹¹⁴ By historical ambivalence, I am referring to the ways in which music has been considered both a thing

¹⁰⁹ Jeremy S. Begbie, *Theology, Music and Time* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2000), 6-7.

¹¹⁰ Begbie, *Theology, Music and Time*, 8.

¹¹¹ Begbie, *Theology, Music and Time*, 272.

¹¹² Begbie, *Theology, Music and Time*, 20, 241.

¹¹³ Begbie, *Theology, Music and Time*, 154, 280.

¹¹⁴ This relationship is explored in detail in a more recent study of music in which Begbie constructs a Christian understanding of music. See Begbie, *Resounding Truth: Christian Wisdom*, 59-182.

of beauty and corruption in many theological traditions.¹¹⁵ His dialogue with musicologists, however, affords Begbie an understanding that this ambivalence arises from the fact that all theorizing about music is affected by social and cultural contexts.¹¹⁶ This includes his own theorizing, whose parameters he delineates within his stated theological worldview, and his familiarity with instrumental music from the Western tonal tradition.¹¹⁷ Because of this limited focus, Begbie does not claim any comprehensive or universal applications for his study. He warns against painting all genres of music with the same brush.¹¹⁸

His affirmations of music alongside his recognition of ambivalence facilitate Begbie's respect for music's integrity.¹¹⁹ His study is replete with well-informed (meaning musically literate) analyses of meter, melody, rhythm, and performance. From these analyses, he elicits sonically-based, conceptual tools with which to clarify and reinterpret theological understandings of time. As he states, a musical construal allows for a more adequate account of time's complexity and multiplicity.¹²⁰ Thus, his affirmation of music as part of God's created order legitimates his attempt to glean new conceptual possibilities from music instead of using the art form to prove or disprove his stated theological worldview.¹²¹

¹¹⁵ Albert L. Blackwell, *The Sacred in Music* (Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 1999): 125-158.

¹¹⁶ Begbie, *Theology, Music and Time*, 36.

¹¹⁷ Begbie, *Theology, Music and Time*, 6-7.

¹¹⁸ Begbie, *Theology, Music and Time*, 171.

¹¹⁹ Begbie, *Theology, Music and Time*, 9-68; Begbie, *Resounding Truth: Christian Wisdom*, 29-58.

¹²⁰ Begbie, *Theology, Music and Time*, 171.

¹²¹ Begbie, *Theology, Music and Time*, 80.

Having said this, in some instances, a theological worldview can limit the music considered worthy of theological analysis. I understand Begbie's choice to focus primarily on classical instrumental music and jazz in his research. He is familiar with these genres of music as a performer. Also, others recognize the genres as having theological value.¹²² Epstein, however, is critical of Begbie's choice of music. She writes:

In sum, while the freshness of Begbie's insights are laudable, and while he initially seems to read music as a socializing force and to criticize theological clichés, his doctrinal apologetics leads him to construe tonality's narrative form as a seemingly preordained teleological principle and to use music for validating biblical doctrines (creation, incarnation, and the Holy Spirit).¹²³

I interpret Epstein's criticism as a call for creatively rethinking what genres of music are considered theologically relevant. The principles of interdisciplinarity and music literacy evident in Begbie's research are an opportunity to push the boundaries on this issue. As previously alluded to, Begbie does appear to push these boundaries in some ways. In Epstein's opinion and my own, these boundaries could be pushed farther to reach for new, different, and neglected genres of music in theology.

As a theologian, Begbie is justified in his wish to ground his explorations of music in his theological worldview. My sense, however, is that theological worldviews can be laid aside. The goal of my research, for example, is to set aside theological worldviews for ones grounded in contemporary protest music. With this statement, I am not suggesting that musical worldviews are better or more authentic than their theological counterparts. I am suggesting, building on my discussions in previous

¹²² See Jeremy S. Begbie, "Pressing at the Boundaries of Modernity – A Review Essay," *Christian Scholar's Review* 40, no. 4 (June 2011): 453-465.

¹²³ Heidi Epstein, *Melting the Venusberg: A Feminist Theology of Music* (New York, NY: Continuum, 2004), 86.

chapters, that musical worldviews are a legitimate starting point for research in theology, and more specifically, in the discipline of spirituality. The veracity of this suggestion is supported by Begbie's and other theologians' use of creativity, interdisciplinarity, and music literacy in their research, although they can be pushed farther as Epstein's criticism implies.

With this criticism in mind, I explore Epstein's research as a counterpoint to Begbie's. Counterpoint is a musical term referring to "two or more independent lines of melody that are played or sung simultaneously."¹²⁴ As two independent melodies exploring different aspects of a shared interest, Epstein's research affirms and challenges Begbie. She states that the purpose of her research is to disrupt norms, upend dichotomies, and integrate marginalized voices.¹²⁵ This explicitly political undercurrent provides a different perspective on the use of creativity, interdisciplinarity, and music literacy in theological understandings of and approaches to music.

3.3.6 Imaginative Openings: Creativity, Interdisciplinarity, and Music Literacy in Heidi Epstein's Research

Like Begbie, Epstein acknowledges that her understandings of and approaches to music are "Christically attuned."¹²⁶ She writes:

This theology of music reconfigures God, Christ, and humanity in ways that amplify how Jesus the Christ is 'paradigmatic' for comprehending the nature and purpose of divine-human interactions – in this case, describing these relational dynamics within human musicality itself, that is, within the musical activities of composition, performance, and reception.¹²⁷

¹²⁴ Jeremy S. Begbie and Steven R. Guthrie, "Glossary of Musical Terms," in *Resonant Witness: Conversations between Music and Theology*, ed. Jeremy S. Begbie and Steven R. Guthrie (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2011), 473.

¹²⁵ Epstein, *Melting the Venusberg*, 3.

¹²⁶ Epstein, *Melting the Venusberg*, 3.

¹²⁷ Epstein, *Melting the Venusberg*, 3.

Here, music is worthy of theological study because of the ways it challenges exclusivist, masculinist, and triumphalist theologies, particularly those that diminish human sexuality. Thus, as a source of insight, music is understood as helping to re-envision sexuality as a centre of divine-human interactions. Epstein states: “As a new thematic focus, and toned interlocutor in religious reflection, human musicality (receptive and performative) provides an imaginative sound-bank (rather than think-tank) of carnal knowledge, however, defined.”¹²⁸ With this quote, she affirms Begbie’s assertion that music’s performative modes are an essential part of its study. To understand these modes, Epstein, like Begbie, dialogues with musicologists.

In particular, she draws on feminist musicologist Susan McClary’s idea that music is a formative participant in social worlds. This idea emphasizes that music is a culturally and socially determined force that is shaped by and can help to shape competing ideologies.¹²⁹ By acknowledging music’s social and cultural value, Epstein is doing more than using music to validate theological doctrines. As an interdisciplinary scholar, she is seeking to creatively rethink theologies of music. She is challenging the ways these theologies have contributed to the denigration of human sexuality, and by association, music’s bodily, performative modes.

In her book *Melting the Venusberg*, she traces the evolution of this denigration through the theological sublimation of music’s erotic powers. This sublimation was achieved by asserting the primacy of texts over musical performance and by locating music’s theological significance in its ability to model cosmic harmony and

¹²⁸ Heidi Epstein, “Re-vamping the Cross: Diamanda Gala’s Musical Mnemonic of Promiscuity,” *Theology and Sexuality* 15 (2001): 65.

¹²⁹ Epstein, *Melting the Venusberg*, 5.

transcendence.¹³⁰ Epstein questions the veracity of these perspectives through her commitment not only to interdisciplinarity but also to music literacy.

As evidence of these commitments, she is highly critical of theologies of music that do not consult relevant music scholarship.¹³¹ This is a glaring omission because of the opportunities that interdisciplinarity provides for effecting imaginative shifts in theological vocabularies on music.¹³² Such shifts produce the music literacy needed to understand the theological significance of music's "promiscuity;" what Epstein defines as its porosity, effluvia, and heterogeneity.¹³³ She uses these imaginative shifts to expand her own theological vocabulary and to creatively rethink music as a redemptive, transgressive, and bodily instance of Christic *imitatio*.¹³⁴ In this understanding, music becomes a source of insight into the theologically significant dynamics of gender politics and sexual identity.

Whereas Begbie's focus is on classical music and jazz, Epstein examines contemporary performance art and popular music.¹³⁵ In doing so, she provides a sense of the range of music genres that can be used as sources of insight into theology. For example, she explores the work of Diamanda Galas, whose music is described as a "lethal gash."¹³⁶ Galas' *Plague Mass*, which critiques Christian attitudes towards AIDS,

¹³⁰ Epstein, *Melting the Venusberg*, 11-116.

¹³¹ Epstein, *Melting the Venusberg*, 70.

¹³² Epstein, *Melting the Venusberg*, 92.

¹³³ Epstein, *Melting the Venusberg*, 149.

¹³⁴ Epstein, *Melting the Venusberg*, 145.

¹³⁵ Heidi Epstein, "Sour Grapes, Fermented Selves: Musical Shulammites Modulate Subjectivity," *The Bible and Critical Theology* 5, no. 1 (2009): 3.1-3.16.

¹³⁶ Epstein, *Melting the Venusberg*, 170.

gives substance to Epstein's understanding of music as porous, noxious, and heterogeneous.¹³⁷ Of the Mass, she writes:

In my Christian feminist model, I have constructed Galas's music, not as blasphemy, but as the oozing wound of an *imitatio crucis*, abject effluvium. If music is her Lover, in her work, it incarnates the Lover crucified by AIDS and human indifference at whose feet Galas wails and rages even as she simulates this Crucifixion on her own body.¹³⁸

As the above quote implies, Epstein finds insight in the abjection of Galas's music. Her willingness to explore this abjection underscores the importance of imaginatively shifting one's expectations of what constitutes theologically significant genres of music. The point is to remain open to the conceptual possibilities that different genres and modes of music afford, whether or not they easily fit into staid theological categories and worldviews.

Together Begbie and Epstein's research underscore the importance of having a creative and open posture where music is concerned. When supported by interdisciplinarity and music literacy, this posture can be used to rethink the relationship between music and theology. In the next section, I examine the ways a creative and open posture is pursued in selected studies of popular music in theological and religious studies perspectives. I consciously move from discussing music in general to popular music in particular because my research concerns popular protest music, which I discuss at length in Chapter Four.

¹³⁷ Epstein, "Re-vamping the Cross," 57.

¹³⁸ Epstein, "Re-vamping the Cross," 60.

3.4 Popular Music in Theological and Religious Studies Perspectives

According to Christopher Partridge, the study of religion/spirituality and popular music is a relatively recent field of analysis.¹³⁹ I discuss religion and spirituality in tandem in this section because of the fluid terminology in this field of study. By fluid terminology, I mean the interchangeability of the words ‘religion’ and ‘spirituality’ in relationship to popular music. For example, Marcus Moberg discusses the intersections of “religion/spirituality” and music in the transnational Christian metal scene.¹⁴⁰

The label ‘popular music’ defies easy definition, as Michael Gilmour writes.¹⁴¹ The genres of music explored in his study testify to this claim. For example, the lyrics of rap artist Kanye West are examined alongside those of the Canadian indie group, Arcade Fire.¹⁴² Although Gilmour acknowledges that popular music is often defined in relation to mass production and reception, i.e., audience size and technologies, he uses the label to distinguish the music analyzed from that created for niche religious markets, such as gospel and contemporary Christian rock.¹⁴³ In other words, he is interested in the reasons religious imagery, themes, and vocabularies are used in music with no association with organized religion.

¹³⁹ Christopher Partridge, “Popular Music, Affective Space and Meaning,” in *Religion, Media and Culture: A Reader*, ed. Gordon Lynch and Jolyon Mitchell with Anna Strhan (New York, NY: Routledge, 2012), 182.

¹⁴⁰ Marcus Moberg, “The Concept of *Scene* and its Applicability in Empirically Grounded Research on the Intersection of Religion/Spirituality and Popular Music,” *Journal of Contemporary Religion* 26, no.3 (October 2011): 403-417.

¹⁴¹ Michael J. Gilmour, *Gods and Guitars: Seeking the Sacred in Post-1960s Popular Music* (Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2009), ix.

¹⁴² Gilmour, *Gods and Guitars: Seeking the Sacred*, 54-67.

¹⁴³ Gilmour, *Gods and Guitars: Seeking the Sacred*, x. For more on the difficulties of defining popular music, see Roy Shuker, *Popular Music: The Key Concepts*, 2nd ed. (London, UK: Routledge, 2005), 203-205.

The point is that scholars in theology and religious studies often define popular music to suit the nature of their analysis. John McClure understands popular music as referring to music “created with mass audiences and popular tastes or preferences in mind.”¹⁴⁴ Here, the label is used to denote music believed to act as a common resource for ‘ordinary people’ in North American societies. In these societies, a spectrum of genres can be included in his understanding: alternative, hip-hop, pop, punk, and heavy metal. When scholars explore one of these musics, they often provide a definition of the genre, instead of defining popular music in general.¹⁴⁵

Despite different strategies for defining popular music, these scholars share a basic presupposition: popular music should be taken seriously as a topic of study in their respective disciplines. For example, Bill Friskics-Warren states that popular music should be taken seriously because of its ability to express the urge for transcendence.¹⁴⁶ Similar to Gilmour and McClure, he is interested in expressions of transcendence that have “found their way into the popular zeitgeist without recourse to dogmatic or sectarian agendas.”¹⁴⁷ Popular music should also be taken seriously because of its ubiquity in everyday life.¹⁴⁸ It accompanies people throughout their day and, therefore, plays a role in how they manage their thoughts and feelings.¹⁴⁹

¹⁴⁴ John S. McClure, *Mashup Religion: Pop Music and Theological Invention* (Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2011), 8.

¹⁴⁵ See David Fillingim, *Redneck Liberation: Country Music as Theology* (Macon, GA: Mercer University Press, 2003); Cheryl Kirk-Duggan and Marlon Hall, *Wake-Up: Hip Hop Christianity and the Black Church* (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2011); Mark Levine, *Heavy Metal Islam: Rock, Resistance and the Struggle for the Soul of Islam* (New York, NY: Three Rivers Press, 2008).

¹⁴⁶ Bill Friskics-Warren, *I'll Take You There: Pop Music and the Urge for Transcendence* (New York, NY: Continuum, 2005), 9-20.

¹⁴⁷ Friskics-Warren, *I'll Take You There: Pop Music*, 3.

¹⁴⁸ Partridge, “Popular Music, Affective Space and Meaning,” 185.

¹⁴⁹ Partridge, “Popular Music, Affective Apace and Meaning,” 183, 185.

Popular music is also considered significant because of its role as an alternative religion/spirituality, particularly in the West.¹⁵⁰ Here, the music is understood as serving religious/spiritual functions such as building community, creating meaning, and facilitating experiences of the numinous.¹⁵¹ Robin Sylvan notes: “The religious impulse has simply migrated to another sector of culture, that of popular music, in which religious sensibilities have flourished and made an enormous impression on a significant number of people.”¹⁵² Sylvan, at least, has been criticized for overextending the category of ‘religion’ in his work on popular music.¹⁵³ The danger of this over-extension lies in the imposition of particular religious significance onto cultural practices that have complex and multilayered meanings for musical participants.¹⁵⁴

In the next section, I discuss the work of scholars who seek to respect the complexity and multiplicity of popular music without overextending the category of religion/spirituality. This is achieved by using the complexity and multiplicity of particular genres of popular music as a starting point to creatively rethink how religion/spirituality are theorized. Interdisciplinarity and music literacy are key factors in this creative rethinking.

¹⁵⁰ Julie J. Ingersoll, “The Thin Line Between Saturday Night and Sunday Morning,” in *God in the Details: American Religion in Popular Culture*, ed. Eric Michael Mazur and Kate McCarthy, 2nd ed. (New York, NY: Routledge, 2011), 268. Also see Robin Sylvan, *Traces of the Spirit: The Religious Dimensions of Popular Music* (New York, NY: New York University Press, 2002); Robin Sylvan, *The Spiritual and Religious Dimensions of Global Rave Culture* (New York, NY: Routledge, 2005); Rupert Till, *Pop Cult: Religion and Popular Music* (London, UK: Continuum, 2010).

¹⁵¹ Gordon Lynch, “The Role of Popular Music in the Construction of Alternative Spiritual Identities and Ideologies,” *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 45, no. 4 (2006): 484.

¹⁵² Robin Sylvan, “The Future Religion of the World,” in *God in the Details: American Religion in Popular Culture*, ed. Eric Michael Mazur and Kate McCarthy, 2nd ed. (New York, NY: Routledge, 2011), 305.

¹⁵³ Lynch, “The Role of Popular Music,” 482.

¹⁵⁴ See Giles Beck and Gordon Lynch, “We Are All One, We Are All Gods’: Negotiating Spirituality in the Conscious Partying Movement,” *Journal of Contemporary Religion* 24, no. 3 (October 2009): 339-355.

3.4.1 Anthony Pinn and Robert Beckford: Affirming the Importance of Creativity, Interdisciplinarity, and Music Literacy in Approaches to Popular Music

The works of Anthony Pinn and Robert Beckford are pertinent to my research for two reasons. First, they examine the dynamics and spaces of particular genres of popular music, namely rap and dub. Second, Pinn and Beckford draw attention to the social and political dimensions of the aforementioned genres. They value not only the music's dynamics and spaces but also the insights that a social and political perspective provides, both musically and religiously/spiritually. These interests, to examine particular genres and their social and political insights, parallel my concern for studying contemporary protest music as a contesting space.

3.4.2 Anthony Pinn: Following the Flow of Rap Music

In a recent book review, Pinn criticizes a volume edited by Gilmour for its lyrical analysis of popular music.¹⁵⁵ Lyrical analysis is too narrow, in his opinion, to understand the complexity and multiplicity of this music. A multi-pronged approach that considers nonlyrical dimensions, such as performance, would have given the volume's analysis greater depth.¹⁵⁶

The stress on multi-pronged approaches underscores the need to listen to particular genres of popular music on their own terms. Pinn uses this approach in his research. He begins from the presupposition that the complexity and multiplicity of popular music genres challenge how religion and spirituality are theorized. Popular

¹⁵⁵ Anthony B. Pinn, review of *Call Me The Seeker: Listening to Religion in Popular Music*, by Michael J. Gilmour, *Church History* 76, no. 1 (March 2007): 228-230.

¹⁵⁶ Pinn, review of *Call Me The Seeker*, 230.

music, and rap in particular, is understood as a “problematic” or conceptual tool that produces important methodological shifts in religious studies and theology.¹⁵⁷

If one listens to rap music, for example, a scholar is confronted with two realities. The first is that this music is a mode of cultural expression that is marked by “perpetual movement.”¹⁵⁸ Movement is exemplified in the music’s hybridity. By hybridity, Pinn means the ways rap musicians bring together elements from different genres in processes of “high-tech conjuration.”¹⁵⁹ Through these processes, the musical ancestors of rap (jazz, disco, rhythm and blues, etc.) are re-envisioned as part of new urban contexts.¹⁶⁰

Alongside hybridity, rap music is characterized by a synergy between word and action.¹⁶¹ This synergy is referred to as the music’s fluidity. Pinn and Miller write: “The music and the lyrics formed a web of meaning that took a variety of forms and expressed attention to numerous questions of life orientation.”¹⁶² Through this web, rap has become an “irreverent discourse of human counter-meaning,” a discourse that is as complex, thick, layered, and varied as the religiosity of the African American communities out of which it emerged.¹⁶³ If rap is acknowledged as musically hybrid

¹⁵⁷ Anthony B. Pinn, “On a Mission from God: African American Music and the Nature/Meaning of Conversion and Religious Life,” in *Between Sacred and Profane: Researching Religion and Popular Culture*, ed. Gordon Lynch (London, UK: I.B. Tauris, 2007), 143.

¹⁵⁸ Anthony B. Pinn, introduction to *Noise and Spirit: The Religious and Spiritual Sensibilities of Rap Music* (New York, NY: New York University Press, 2003), 8.

¹⁵⁹ Anthony B. Pinn, “Bling and Blessings: Thoughts on the Intersections of Rap Music and Religious Meaning,” *Crosscurrents* 57, no. 2 (Summer 2007): 298.

¹⁶⁰ See the essays in Anthony B. Pinn, ed., *Noise and Spirit: The Religious and Spiritual Sensibilities of Rap Music* (New York, NY: New York University Press, 2003).

¹⁶¹ Anthony B. Pinn, “Rap Music, Culture and Religion: Concluding Thoughts,” *Culture and Religion* 10, no. 1 (March 2009): 104.

¹⁶² Anthony B. Pinn and Monica R. Miller, “Introduction: Intersections of Culture and Religion in African-American Communities,” *Culture and Religion* 10, no. 1 (March 2009): 6.

¹⁶³ Pinn and Monica R. Miller, “Introduction: Intersections of Culture,” 5.

and fluid, Pinn suggests that scholars should not be surprised that these same traits characterize the ways religion and spirituality are negotiated in the music. In other words, this negotiation is often as hybrid and fluid as the music itself.

Echoing Pinn, Miller describes the religious and theological imagination of rap as “messy.”¹⁶⁴ It is in this messiness, however, that she roots the music’s capacity to challenge the ways religion and spirituality have been understood and approached in African American theology and religious studies. One of the challenges that rap presents is its ambiguity.¹⁶⁵ Miller states that some rap songs are “religiously incoherent.”¹⁶⁶ Rather than linear and coherent theological statements, religious ideas in this genre are often circular, creative, performative, and playful.¹⁶⁷

Instead of bracketing out these dimensions of rap, Miller and Pinn argue that the music should be used to reflect on the many ways African Americans live out their religious and spiritual lives. This requires what Pinn calls a “hermeneutic of multiple meanings.”¹⁶⁸ In this hermeneutic, the music acts as the starting point for analysis. As a result, space is created for scholars to consider alternative ways of being religious and/or spiritual. Through this space, they are provided with an opportunity to creatively rethink how they theorize religion and spirituality in different contexts and communities.

For example, Pinn writes that rap music helps to rethink normative understandings of conversion in African American theological and religious studies reflections. Instead of conceptualizing conversion in relationship to the promises of the

¹⁶⁴ Monica R. Miller, “The Promiscuous Gospel: The Religious *Complexity* and Theological *Multiplicity* of Rap Music,” *Culture and Religion* 10, no. 1 (March 2009): 39.

¹⁶⁵ Pinn, “Bling and Blessings: Thoughts on the Intersections,” 291.

¹⁶⁶ Miller, “The Promiscuous Gospel,” 45.

¹⁶⁷ Miller, “The Promiscuous Gospel,” 53.

¹⁶⁸ Pinn, “Bling and Blessings: Thoughts on the Intersections,” 293.

next world, rap presents conversion as “a thick and multi-dimensional evolution” rooted in the struggles of this world.¹⁶⁹ Conversion can be understood in this way because rap musicians call for a more explicit and energetic engagement with the world as it is lived, including experiences of oppression, poverty, and racism.¹⁷⁰ Pinn’s explanation of the importance of this engagement is worth quoting in full:

This alternate hermeneutical posture [of artists Tupac Shakur and Snoop Dogg] problematizes a rigid determinism and focused range of ‘accepted’ signs of religiosity as lived. Rebuffed are efforts to define religious engagement in terms of formal commitments to an array of relationships that seek to jettison life lived within the world as it is. Embraced is a commitment to a religious posture that accepts and works through mundane wants and needs, and views life not through a hermeneutic of escape. Rather, life is arranged through a hermeneutic of style, whereby the movement of bodies in time and space as a matter of creative impulse and sensibilities has vital value and allows for a full range of life pursuits (e.g. being a thug). And, as is the case with the traditional Christian conversion, some rap artists express the tone and texture of their religious experience, and articulate the dimensions of their life, using a specialized language. One need only think in terms of the vocabulary of rap in order to understand this point.¹⁷¹

Rap music should not be valued solely for its affirmation of ‘accepted signs’ of religiosity. Rather, the music should be valued as a source of insight into the complex and fluid ways religion and spirituality are lived and theorized in African American communities. Pinn affirms: “What hip hop [and rap music] offers at its best is an alternate approach – one that seeks to forever alter the cartography of religious life. Interrogating the success or failure of that mapping as well as the criteria used, is part of the challenge facing the exchange between hip hop culture and African American religious studies.”¹⁷² Stated simply, Pinn is asking scholars in this discipline not only to

¹⁶⁹ Pinn, “On a Mission from God,” 145.

¹⁷⁰ Pinn, “On a Mission from God,” 146.

¹⁷¹ Pinn, “On a Mission from God,” 153.

¹⁷² Pinn, “Rap Music, Culture and Religion,” 106.

take the music seriously but also to allow it to challenge and transform their understandings and approaches.

Thus, Pinn's study of rap music echoes Epstein's call for a creative, open posture toward music. This posture is important because genres such as rap do not easily fit into rigid categories such as 'sacred' and 'secular.'¹⁷³ There is often cross-fertilization between musical idioms that blurs these categories; a reality noted by James Cone in his book on the relationship between the spirituals and the blues.¹⁷⁴ David Fillingim makes a similar point where country music is concerned.¹⁷⁵ The roots of country music are heterogeneous and, therefore, the music encompasses a multitude of styles, themes, and backgrounds.

The ambiguity, complexity, and multiplicity inherent to popular music genres have contributed to the idea that they should not be approached with the same understandings used for statements of systematic theology.¹⁷⁶ In this regard, Miller calls for a more "promiscuous approach" to popular music.¹⁷⁷ I interpret this call as demanding greater creativity, interdisciplinarity, and music literacy where popular music is concerned. I am not alone in this interpretation. Pinn states that studies into rap music require a high degree of interdisciplinarity because of the music's many influences and connections.¹⁷⁸ Moberg also stresses the importance of interdisciplinarity for the study of the transnational Christian metal music scene.¹⁷⁹

¹⁷³ Pinn, introduction, 1, 8.

¹⁷⁴ James H. Cone, *The Spirituals and the Blues* (Maryknoll, NY: 2008 [1972]).

¹⁷⁵ Fillingim, *Redneck Liberation: Country Music as Theology*, 10, 13.

¹⁷⁶ Gilmour, *Gods and Guitars: Seeking the Sacred*, 22; Miller, "The Promiscuous Gospel," 48.

¹⁷⁷ Miller, "The Promiscuous Gospel," 56.

¹⁷⁸ Pinn, introduction, 21.

¹⁷⁹ Moberg, "The Concept of *Scene* and its Applicability," 404.

This interdisciplinarity reflects the value of listening to popular music on its own terms, and thereby, acquiring a level of music literacy in the specific genre under investigation. The employment of these principles begins, however, with a posture of creativity and openness out of which the scholar can legitimately shift his or her starting points. These shifts demonstrate the willingness on the part of the scholar to reach for the new, the different, and the neglected, whether musical or spiritual.

3.4.3 Robert Beckford: Dubbing Jesus

Like Pinn and Miller, Robert Beckford shifts his starting point and uses popular music to re-envision aspects of African Caribbean Christian thought and practice.¹⁸⁰ He does so by analyzing dub, a genre of music that originated in the inner cities of post-war Jamaica, as a “hermeneutical act.”¹⁸¹ By acknowledging the hermeneutical potential of this music, Beckford underscores the value of dub to shape worldviews and create spaces where these worldviews can be lived out. Thus, the purpose of his analysis is not to simply “dress up” or Christianize dub music but to use it as a framework to challenge African Caribbean Christian culture and spirituality.¹⁸²

To affect this challenge, Beckford embarks on what he calls a “transparent appropriation” of dub dancehall culture.¹⁸³ In Jamaica and throughout the African Caribbean diaspora, dancehalls are used as spaces of resistance.¹⁸⁴ These spaces are African-Caribbean-owned where the community can negotiate their agency in the face

¹⁸⁰ Robert Beckford, *JesusDub: Theology, Music and Social Change* (London, UK: Routledge, 2006).

¹⁸¹ Beckford, *JesusDub: Theology*, 29-30, 2.

¹⁸² Beckford, *JesusDub: Theology*, 1-2.

¹⁸³ Beckford, *JesusDub: Theology*, 77.

¹⁸⁴ Beckford, *JesusDub: Theology*, 46-54.

of state oppression, poverty, and racism. Dub musicking has played a vital role in both the construction and maintenance of these spaces.

The church hall is also a space of resistance for African Caribbean diasporan communities.¹⁸⁵ It provides a counter-ideological discourse that challenges the discriminatory views of the prevailing power structures, in this case the power structures of urban Britain.¹⁸⁶ In the church hall, the community is presented with identities based on theologies of respect grounded in their accomplishments and hopes instead of ideologies of poverty and race.¹⁸⁷ These theologies are an implicit theology, however.

Beckford explains:

Historically, implicit theology was the product of the slave and colonial subject's negotiation of faith in the light of continued colonial oppression. It was one way of making sense of the meaning of God in a context blighted by extreme physical and social bondage and structural oppression. Apart from rebellion or collusion, another way of negotiating faith was to internalize the concept of freedom, hope and the justice of God, while remaining obedient to the social order.¹⁸⁸

By raising these points, he is not disparaging the implicit resistance that church halls provide. Rather, Beckford seeks to rethink these spaces through the explicit socio-political critiques and practices of the dancehall. Through a 'politics of sound,' the dancehall offers a counter-hegemonic discourse and space in which oppression, poverty, and racism are directly confronted. He states: "Here, Black identities are formed and reformed with reference to socio-political realities. DJs function as organic intellectuals, conscientising and challenging the morality, politics and values of the status quo."¹⁸⁹

¹⁸⁵ Beckford, *JesusDub: Theology*, 54-62.

¹⁸⁶ Beckford, *JesusDub: Theology*, 58.

¹⁸⁷ Beckford, *JesusDub: Theology*, 59.

¹⁸⁸ Beckford, *JesusDub: Theology*, 20-23.

¹⁸⁹ Beckford, *JesusDub: Theology*, 58.

Through his transparent appropriation, Beckford is bringing the church hall and dance hall into dialogue, with the hope of enriching the resistance of both spaces.

Interdisciplinarity is key to this enrichment. Beckford uses insights from acoustemology (the study of sound), Black Atlantic cultural studies as well as scholars and musicians versed in dub thinking and practice. This approach gives him the space to understand dub as a quest for meaning in its own right, with its own culture, dynamics, and vocabulary.¹⁹⁰ For example, he includes an interview with dub DJ and professor of sociology, William (Lez) Henry as part of his analysis. The inclusion of Henry's experiences and thoughts reflects Beckford's own attempt to acquire a level of literacy in dub music and practice.

One of Henry's insights is the idea that transcendence can be conceived of as the capacity for critical self-reflexivity.¹⁹¹ This reflexivity maintains people's resistance to structures of domination by confronting them with their own oppressive practices. In the case of dub, Henry acknowledges that narrow ideas of what constitutes a man or a woman in the dub music scene can be oppressive to some segments of the African Caribbean community.¹⁹²

Thus, underpinned by the principles of creativity, interdisciplinarity, and music literacy, Beckford uses the constructive and deconstructive activities inherent to dub music to re-envision African Caribbean Christian thought and practice. In particular, he focuses on aspects of this thought and practice that he feels need a more emancipatory thrust. He explains:

¹⁹⁰ Beckford, *JesusDub: Theology*, 72.

¹⁹¹ Beckford, *JesusDub: Theology*, 110.

¹⁹² Beckford, *JesusDub: Theology*, 110.

‘To dub’ is to deconstruct. Deconstruction is a transformative process involving dismantling and reconstruction. Deconstructive activity involves taking things apart. However, rather than ending up with nothing, deconstruction seeks to rebuild. Rebuilding is guided by an emancipatory ethic, which seeks out redemptive themes in history, culture and society that can be the focus for transforming the original thesis. However, emancipation calls for action; therefore, ‘to dub’ is to engage with the social world through prophetic action. In short, dub is a three-part process: *deconstruction* guided by the *emancipation ethic* to produce a dub or a *new praxis*.¹⁹³

This musically-conceived framework is used to ‘dub’ three aspects of African Caribbean Christian spirituality: glossolalia, pneumatology, and the prosperity gospel.¹⁹⁴ In other words, ‘dubbing’ is appropriated as a creative methodology.¹⁹⁵

It is important to note that Beckford is not the only scholar who has appropriated particular genres of popular music as a framework to re-envision understandings of and approaches to spiritualities. For example, Marcel Corbussen uses pop music undergirded by postmodern philosophy to rethink spirituality as a threshold; as a space characterized by journeying, transgression, and liminality.¹⁹⁶ Fillingim uses Pinn’s work to rethink country music as a theology of liberation that he calls “Hillbilly Humanism.”¹⁹⁷ He writes:

A text counts as theological discourse to the extent that it interprets the raw experience by (de)constructing systems of order and meaning or to the extent that it relates mundane experience to the perception of ultimate significance or ultimate power. Thus, even if the blues are atheistic, they are still theological because they make statements about matters of ultimate concern. Country music, though usually theistic, is analogous to the blues because both deconstruct narrowly Christian structures of meaning and assert other experiences as ultimate.¹⁹⁸

¹⁹³ Beckford, *JesusDub: Theology*, 91-92.

¹⁹⁴ Beckford, *JesusDub: Theology*, 115-144.

¹⁹⁵ Beckford, *JesusDub: Theology*, 145.

¹⁹⁶ Marcel Corbussen, *Thresholds: Rethinking Spirituality Through Music* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2008), 158.

¹⁹⁷ Fillingim, *Redneck Liberation: Country Music as Theology*, 43-67.

¹⁹⁸ Fillingim, *Redneck Liberation: Country Music as Theology*, 6.

These ideas reflect Pinn's use of the blues and rap to articulate an African American humanism defined as "a nontheistic form of life orientation that relies on human integrity and creativity to achieve greater life options."¹⁹⁹ As noted in the previous section, one of the goals of Pinn's research into popular music is to discover new ways of reflecting on the many and varied examples of African American quests for meaning. Blues and rap are considered important sources of insight into these quests.²⁰⁰

I cite Pinn's ideas as a way to conclude my discussion of Beckford because they reaffirm a particular point. The value of particular genres of popular music to the disciplines of theology and religious studies is greater than their ability to serve as a vehicle for the articulation of accepted signs of religiosity/spirituality. Popular music is significant because of its capacity to act as an alternative conceptual framework or methodology in these disciplines. As Pinn and Beckford make clear, identification and use of these frameworks and methodologies begins with an open posture toward popular music genres, a posture supplemented by creativity, interdisciplinarity, and music literacy.

3.5 Understandings of and Approaches to Popular Music in the Discipline of Spirituality

In this final section, I discuss Don Saliers' understanding of and approach to popular music. I have chosen Saliers' research for several reasons. The first is that he examines the relationship between music and socio-political change. In a book co-

¹⁹⁹ Anthony B. Pinn, "Handlin by Business": Exploring Rap's Humanist Sensibilities," in *Noise and Spirit: The Religious and Spiritual Sensibilities of Rap Music*, ed. Anthony B. Pinn (New York, NY: New York University Press, 2003), 85-86.

²⁰⁰ For example, the blues have been described as a response to the brutal violence, including lynching, which African American communities have confronted in the Southern United States. See Adam Gussow, *Seems like Murder Here: Southern Violence and the Blues Tradition* (Chicago, IL: The University of Chicago Press, 2002).

authored with his daughter, Emily Saliers of the folk duo Indigo Girls, he writes: “If one of our most important human responsibilities is speaking truth to power, we can be grateful when history gives us music that sings truth to power. Music has been and still remains an instrument of social vision and change.”²⁰¹

The second reason is Saliers’ creative, open posture toward music. By creative and open, I mean he acknowledges the porosity of so-called ‘sacred’ and ‘secular’ musics.²⁰² This porosity, as other scholars have suggested, requires listening to the music on its own terms. Saliers affirms:

Today, under the inevitable impact of recorded music, cross-cultural influences, and ecumenical sharing, we have an increasingly contested marketplace of available music. We cannot simply rely on older definitions or inherited categories. The question of specific qualities, objectively given in music, must be raised. Features of human receptivity as well as ritual and non-ritual functions of music are crucial to reach for relationships between music and theology. How shall we listen and become attentive to what music can give to theological reflection?²⁰³

Finally, Saliers addresses the intersection of the arts, including music, with realities of terror, pain, and suffering.²⁰⁴ Music, as others have noted, is ambivalent. It can be used to promote socio-political change and contribute to violence. This ambivalence is not exclusive to popular music. Hymns and other ‘worship music’ have also been used to malign, manipulate, and torture.²⁰⁵

²⁰¹ Don Saliers and Emily Saliers, *A Song to Sing, A Life to Live: Reflections on Music as Spiritual Practice* (San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass, 2005), 152.

²⁰² Don E. Saliers, *Music and Theology* (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2007), 55-64.

²⁰³ Saliers, *Music and Theology*, 62.

²⁰⁴ Don E. Saliers, “Beauty and Terror” in *Minding the Spirit: The Study of Christian Spirituality*, ed. Elisabeth A. Dryer and Mark S. Burrows (Baltimore, MD: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2005), 303-313.

²⁰⁵ June Boyce-Tillman, “Sacred Music and Violence,” in *Weep Not For Your Children: Essays on Religion and Violence*, ed. Lisa Isherwood and Rosemary Radford Ruether (London, UK: Equinox, 2008), 231-259; Anne Morris, “Music in Worship: The Dark Side,” *Practical Theology* 3, no. 2 (2010): 203-217.

For these reasons, Saliers' discussion of protest music is a final antecedent to the application of my approach to contemporary protest music in Chapter Four. His discussion demonstrates some of the strengths and limitations inherent to a spiritually-based approach to understanding this music hinted at in previous sections of this chapter. By demonstrating these strengths and limitations, Saliers' discussion reasserts the role of creativity, interdisciplinarity, and music literacy in an adequate approach to protest music in the discipline of spirituality.

3.5.1 Don Saliers: Spirituality as the Root of Protest Music

Saliers' approach to protest music is spiritually-based. This is evident in his description of the spiritual influences that have shaped his understanding of music.²⁰⁶ He writes: "Early on I was exposed to a whole range of church music, and with early keyboard lessons came good sight-reading skills."²⁰⁷ These influences have provided the foundation for a forty-year career as a professor of theology and worship.²⁰⁸ He is clear, however, that his understanding of music has also been influenced by classical, jazz, and folk music.

Acknowledging his spiritual influences is not a limitation in his approach to protest music. On the contrary, this acknowledgement helps Saliers maintain a creative, open posture toward the music. In his work, he states that he is looking to open channels between "Saturday night and Sunday morning" and advocates that spiritually-based approaches should take seriously the complex ways music functions in people's lives

²⁰⁶ Saliers, *Music and Theology*, viii; Saliers and Saliers, *A Song to Sing*, 5-11.

²⁰⁷ Saliers and Saliers, *A Song to Sing*, 5.

²⁰⁸ Saliers, *Music and Theology*, ix.

outside the church.²⁰⁹ This is a strength of Saliers' approach that resonates with the interdisciplinary precepts of his discipline and the dialogical impulse of the theologians and religious studies scholars previously discussed.

A second reason Saliers' approach can be described as spiritually-based is the examples he uses to explore the relationship between music and socio-political change. His interest is in Christian music and its crossover into social and political spheres. The focus is, therefore, on Biblical canticles, devotional songs, spirituals, and hymns.²¹⁰ Given this interest, I am not suggesting that his choice of music is unwarranted. I am suggesting that his examples provide a narrow view of what constitutes contemporary protest music. What other songs are available with which to explore the relationship between music and socio-political concerns? Is a spiritually-based approach, with its potential for providing a very particular understanding of what constitutes protest music, an adequate approach for its study in all circumstances? Is this approach the most adequate for the study of protest music written in response to the 'war on terror'?

As noted above, Saliers acknowledges the porosity of music in relationship to sacred and secular categories. Protest music does take place outside of the church and other spiritual contexts.²¹¹ Despite these acknowledgements, a spiritually-based approach can be limiting depending on what is being sought after in this particular genre of music. This is an important issue because it colors how protest music is defined and valued in the discipline of spirituality.

²⁰⁹ Saliers, *Music and Theology*, viii.

²¹⁰ Saliers, *Music and Theology*, 44-52.

²¹¹ Saliers, *Music and Theology*, 52-54.

For example, it is not surprising that Saliers and others have turned to the spirituals as exemplifying the relationship between music, protest, and spirituality.²¹² The spirituals emerged from within the brutality, oppression, and racism of slavery in the United States.²¹³ In these conditions, they acted as a voice of dignity, resistance, and struggle for African American slaves. Through these songs, slave communities documented and battled against the “yoke of human bondage we call American slavery.”²¹⁴ Bernice Johnson Reagon, founder of the award-winning African American female a capella group *Sweet Honey in the Rock*, writes: “The songs are called spirituals, named so by the people who created them because they came from the spirit – deep within.”²¹⁵ The link between these songs and those of the American Civil Rights movement reinforces the characterization of the spirituals as exemplary of the relationship between music, protest, and spirituality.²¹⁶

When one looks into this relationship, however, the picture is much more complex and multifaceted than a simple case of musical and spiritual continuity. First, the spirituals themselves have a complex and multifaceted history that scholars such as Cone and Kirk-Duggan have explored in their works.²¹⁷ Secondly, although influenced by the spirituals, the Freedom Songs of the Civil Rights movement were also created by a constant process of adaptation and re-envisioning that included borrowing from genres

²¹² Kirk-Duggan, *Refiner's Fire: A Religious Engagement*, 37-54.

²¹³ Cone, *The Spirituals and the Blues*, 20-31.

²¹⁴ Bernice Johnson Reagon, *If You Don't Go, Don't Hinder Me* (Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska, 2001), 68.

²¹⁵ Reagon, *If You Don't Go, Don't Hinder Me*, 68.

²¹⁶ For more on this link, see T.V. Reed, *The Art of Protest: Culture and Activism from the Civil Rights Movement to the Streets of Seattle* (Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2005), 1-39.

²¹⁷ See Cheryl A. Kirk-Duggan, *Exorcising Evil: A Womanist Perspective on the Spirituals* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 1997).

of popular music and from other social movement music.²¹⁸ The most famous example is the song, “We Shall Overcome.”

Scholars acknowledge that tracing the origins of this song is difficult because it has been adapted and altered throughout the twentieth century.²¹⁹ It was based on different slave spirituals but was used as part of a labor strike in 1945 by black workers at the American Tobacco factory in South Carolina.²²⁰ In this context, words were changed, lyrics added, and the song was sung as a ballad not as a gospel song. After the strike, some of the workers were invited to the Highlander Folk School in Tennessee.²²¹ Pete Seeger learned the song at Highlander. Again, words were changed and lyrics were added. Seeger helped direct the song to the burgeoning Civil Rights movement. As part of this movement, the song was adapted again. Young activists sang the song not as a slow ballad but with more soulful and spirited rhythms.²²²

The complexity and multifacetedness of this one song underscores the importance of analyzing protest music in the particular and on its own terms. As Seeger observes: “Songs have proved a wonderful, flexible art form, going from one person to

²¹⁸ Reebee Garofalo, “Popular Music and the Civil Rights Movement,” in *Rockin’ the Boat: Mass Music and Mass Movements*, ed. Reebee Garofalo (Cambridge, MA: South End Press, 1992), 231-240.

²¹⁹ Phull, *Story Behind the Protest Song*, 1-5.

²²⁰ Ron Eyerman and Andrew Jamison, *Music and Social Movements: Mobilizing Traditions in the Twentieth Century* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1998), 3.

²²¹ The Highlander Folk School was a centre for grassroots mobilization and training that played a significant role as a meeting place for activists throughout the mid twentieth century. For more on the Highlander School, see Highlander Research and Education Centre, “Timeline,” Highlander Research and Education Centre, under “About Us: History,” <http://highlandercenter.org/media/timeline>, (accessed May 17, 2012).

²²² Phull, *Story Behind the Protest Song*, 1-5.

the other.”²²³ Attention to protest music’s flexibility echoes Pinn’s characterization of rap as both a hybrid and fluid art.

Saliers understands music as part of the synaesthetic matrix that is at the heart of liturgy in spiritual traditions.²²⁴ He writes: “The term “synaesthetic” refers to the simultaneous blending or convergence of two or more senses, hence a condition of heightened perception.”²²⁵ Music is fundamental to the synaesthetic matrix of liturgy because it triggers other senses and, thus, shapes and expresses a multi-sensory experience of spirituality. Saliers continues: “Music mediates multiple senses and the reception of religious significance precisely by crossing over to what is not heard.” The idea that music’s spiritual value lies in its ability to express what is not heard is captured in a definition that Saliers cites in several of his works. This is the understanding that music is “the language of the soul made audible.”²²⁶

Given this understanding, it is not surprising that Saliers looks for elements of praise, prophecy, and lament in his exploration of singing as a political act.²²⁷ As a political act, singing is valued for its ability to shape and express these spiritual sensibilities. The question I bring to this understanding is whether these spiritual sensibilities are adequate for studying an antiwar album from a punk band such as Green

²²³ Pete Seeger, foreword to *Singing Out*, by David King Dunaway and Molly Beer (Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2010), xi. For another example of the adaptability and flexibility of song, see Mark Pedelty, “This Land: Seeger Performs Guthrie’s “Lost Verses” at the Inaugural,” *Popular Music and Society* 32, no. 3 (July 2009): 245-431.

²²⁴ Don E. Saliers, “Sound Spirituality: On the Formative Expressive Power of Music for Christian Spirituality,” in *Minding the Spirit: The Study of Christian Spirituality*, ed. Elizabeth A. Dreyer and Mark C. Burrows (Baltimore, MD: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2005), 336.

²²⁵ Saliers, *Music and Theology*, 1.

²²⁶ Saliers, “Sound Spirituality: On the Formative,” 335.

²²⁷ Saliers, *Music and Theology*, 53.

Day's *American Idiot*?²²⁸ The creativity and interdisciplinarity of the theologians and religious studies scholars explored suggest that answering this question involves acquiring literacy in protest music scholarship; a task I turn to in the next chapter.

Spirituality is the starting point of Saliers' approach to protest music. His understanding is a reflection of his conviction that music must not only praise God but also provide a prophetic voice in a world replete with terror, pain, and suffering.²²⁹ He observes with his daughter, Emily:

Hymns that sing of justice and freedom ought to agitate and disturb many of us. Such songs can bring us face-to-face with truths we might rather not know. However, when the church does not learn to sing these challenging songs of faith, it may find that the impulse to justice and freedom is heard only outside its walls.²³⁰

My sense is that learning from those who sing justice and freedom outside of the boundaries and walls of spirituality can only enrich the ways people sing these realities from within. This approach resonates with Saliers' own call for dialogue between Saturday night and Sunday morning. It echoes his idea that a mature liturgical and ecumenical spirituality is forged in the discipline of listening.²³¹ Listening forges this spirituality by softening boundaries and walls between categories such as sacred and secular, between understandings of the body and the spirit, and between communities in conflict.²³²

By stressing the need to cultivate listening as a spiritual discipline where protest music is concerned, Saliers demonstrates an interdisciplinary and musically literate

²²⁸ Green Day, *American Idiot*, CD (Reprise Records, 2004).

²²⁹ Saliers and Saliers, *A Song to Sing*, 133.

²³⁰ Saliers and Saliers, *A Song to Sing*, 146.

²³¹ Don E. Saliers, "Sense, Spirit, and Body in Presiding: A Synaesthetic Environment," *Liturgy* 22, no. 2 (February 2007): 38, 39.

²³² Saliers and Saliers, *A Song to Sing*, 21-28; 163-167.

sensibility. This sensibility is reflected in his recognition that music triggers a multi-sensory experience inside and outside the confines of spiritual communities and institutions. In this way, his approach resonates with the work of theologians and religious studies scholars such as Epstein, Pinn, and Beckford. Despite these affirmations, the issue of whether his approach is adequate for the study of contemporary protest music written in the context of the ‘war on terror’ remains. What should a scholar in the discipline of spirituality be looking for in this music? Why should it be valued? What kind of approach can be used to adequately answer these questions?

3.5 Conclusion

In this chapter, I have constructed an approach to contemporary protest music comprised of three basic components: creativity, interdisciplinarity, and music literacy. I have based this construction on selected understandings of and approaches to different genres of music in the disciplines of theology, religious studies, and spirituality. The fact that creativity, interdisciplinarity, and music literacy exist in these disciplines corroborates my hypothesis that an approach comprised of the principles is adequate for understanding protest music as a source of insight into the delegitimizing of violence.

In the next chapter, I apply this approach to examples of protest music written in response to the ‘war on terror.’ The first step is to take a creative, open posture toward the music. This involves shifting my starting point to see other perspectives. The second step is to use a responsible interdisciplinarity to provide the space to acquire literacy in relevant protest music scholarship. The final step is to answer the questions

posed in the previous section of this chapter guided by the insights gleaned from the literacy acquired.

Chapter Four: Applying a Creative, Interdisciplinary, and Musically Literate Approach to Contemporary Protest Music

Can't say that any song I've ever sung got that quick a reaction. On the other hand, maybe in some individual's life, [it] had a five second reaction. I know that I've been tremendously impressed, moved, and all that sort of thing, by hearing a certain song at a certain time. And so, did it happen to others? Well you have to go on faith a lot of the time. You assume it must do some good, or else you wouldn't do it.
- Pete Seeger, *Singing Out*

Militarism wraps itself in a mantle of glory but conceals the ugly reality that war brings death, destruction, and losses that are physical, financial, and moral.
- Geoff Martin and Erin Steuter, *Pop Culture Goes to War*

4. Introduction

The first three chapters of this dissertation comprised the historical backdrop and construction of an adequate approach to contemporary protest music. In Chapters Four and Five, I apply this approach. In Chapter Four, I follow the flow of popular and protest music performances.¹ First, I define popular music performance and consider the question: Why do these performances matter? Second, I explore the ambiguity of musical performance. Third, I discuss themes drawn from protest music scholarship. These themes are the basis for an analysis of protest music performances in the context of the 'war on terror.'

Insights from this analysis will be discussed in Chapter Five. These insights help to explicitly link protest music and spiritual literacy. Literacy, to remind the reader, involves listening to particular human phenomena such as music and/or space on their own terms.

¹ The idea of 'following the flow' of popular music performances is an adaptation of Pinn's understanding of and approach to rap music discussed in Chapter Three.

4.1.1 Methodological Preferences Explained

Repeating the structure of my previous chapters, I use the research of select scholars as touchstones for my discussions. These scholars work primarily in the field of popular music studies. It is important to acknowledge that popular music studies is a globally established and multidisciplinary field. The field is representative of a range of cultural and disciplinary orientations, but a comprehensive overview of such orientations is not the goal of this chapter.² The goal is to identify and explain some of the debates, issues, and themes that emerge when I, as a scholar in spirituality, listen to musical performances on their own terms.

I discuss three motifs in the chapter that emerged from this listening. The first is that popular music performances are ambiguous, complex, and multifaceted. The second is that such performances can be defined as confluences of imagination and action. The final idea is that performances of popular music, including those of protest music, can make a difference. They contribute to understandings of the ways people imagine and enact social and political change.

4.2 Defining Popular Music Performance

Defining popular music performance is not a straightforward task. One reason is that the question of what popular music comprises remains a contentious issue in popular music studies.³ As with other concepts discussed in my dissertation, popular

² Andy Bennett, Barry Shank, and Jason Toynbee, introduction to *The Popular Music Studies Reader* (London, UK: Routledge, 2006), 1-7.

³ See The International Advisory Editors, "Can We Get Rid of the 'Popular' in Popular Music? A Virtual Symposium With Contributors from the International Advisory Editors of *Popular Music*," *Popular Music* 24, no. 1 (2005): 133-145.

music is a dynamic human phenomenon characterized by layers of complexity and multiplicity.⁴ A popular music scholar observes:

Essentially, [popular music] consists of a hybrid of musical traditions, styles, and influences, with the only common element being that the music is characterized by a strong rhythmical component, and generally, but not exclusively, relies on electronic amplification. Indeed, a purely musical definition is insufficient, since a central characteristic of popular music is a socio-economic one: its mass production for a mass, predominantly youth, market. At the same time, of course, it is an economic product that is invested with ideological significance by many of its consumers. At the heart of the majority of the various forms of popular music is a fundamental tension between the essential creativity of the act of ‘making music’ and the commercial nature of the bulk of its production and dissemination.⁵

As the above quotation implies, popular music is shaped by different cultural contexts and histories. It is also produced and disseminated by and for different groups.

For defining popular music performances, I am interested in spatial complexity and multiplicity. By this complexity and multiplicity, I mean the spaces that are created when people musick. As I discuss below, space can be created through the interaction of ideas and actions or what I referred to as imaginative and performative dynamics in Chapter One.⁶

4.2.1 Creating Space in Popular Music Performance

What ideas are evoked in popular music performances? How are the ideas enacted? These questions are a rethinking of Small’s query into musical performance discussed in Chapter Two.⁷ He asked: What does it mean when this performance takes place at this time, in this place, with these participants? Below, I use the questions on

⁴ Roy Shuker, *Understanding Popular Music Culture*, 3rd ed. (London, UK: Routledge, 2008), 7.

⁵ Shuker, *Understanding Popular Music Culture*, 7.

⁶ See Chapter One, 56-58.

⁷ See Chapter Two, 63-64.

ideas and actions to examine the creation of space in examples of popular music performances.

In the genre of Glam rock, for example, gendered spaces are created through the evocation and enactment of particular ideas.⁸ Gendered spaces can refer to a forum where those participating at a concert imagine and act out ambiguous gendered and/or sexual identities.⁹ In this genre, ideas of androgyny are enacted through the use of “cock-rock gestures.”¹⁰ These gestures include slinging a bass guitar low around the hips, stomping the feet, and thrusting the pelvis.

Similarly, particular dynamics contribute to alternative ideas and spaces for gender in the performances of Laurie Anderson.¹¹ For instance, Anderson filters her voice through a machine known as a vocoder. The machine helps to obscure the gender of this musician’s voice. By performing an obscured gender identity, spaces of social critique are created in Anderson’s concerts to challenge conceptions of female embodiment.¹² Such spaces affirm that women are not just bodies represented in popular music. They are the composers and performers of this music.¹³

Imaginative and performative dynamics also constitute spaces of social and political activism. The performances of British singer-songwriter, Billy Bragg, are

⁸ Philip Auslander, *Performing Glam Rock: Gender and Theatricality in Popular Music Performance* (Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 2006).

⁹ Philip Auslander, “I Wanna Be Your Man: Suzi Quatro’s Musical Androgyny,” *Popular Music* 23, no. 1 (2004): 1-16.

¹⁰ Auslander, “I Wanna Be Your Man,” 13.

¹¹ Susan McClary, “This is not a Story my People tell: Musical Time and Space according to Laurie Anderson,” in *The Popular Music Studies Reader*, ed. Andy Bennett, Barry Shank, and Jason Toynbee (London, UK: Routledge, 2006), 21-35.

¹² McClary, “This is not a Story my People tell,” 24-25.

¹³ See Kay Dickinson, “‘Believe’: Vocoders, Digital Female Identity and Camp,” in *Music, Space and Place: Popular Music and Cultural Identity*, ed. Sheila Whiteley, Andy Bennett, and Stan Hawkins (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2005), 163-179.

illustrative in this regard. They have been described as “a thinking space for activism and social change through popular culture.”¹⁴ Thinking spaces are created through such dynamics as playing smaller venues and inviting fellow activists to share pamphlets and promotional materials on site.¹⁵ Other dynamics include political ranting on stage and the changing of lyrics to address local issues.¹⁶ Affirming the importance of imagination in popular music performances, Bragg writes: “Can’t sing? Who cares? It’s what you are singing *about* that matters.”¹⁷

Another example is the use of imaginative and performative dynamics to create spaces of collective agency at live Hip Hop concerts.¹⁸ The dynamics of a concert can be identified and understood by taking account of both its ‘context’ and ‘form.’ Context refers to such things as the ambiance generated by those musicking in small clubs. Form includes the rhetorical conventions of Hip Hop performance. These and other dynamics constitute a live Hip Hop concert as a space where a range of socio-political issues from democracy to war to corporate monopolies are collectively addressed. Michael Dowdy comments:

In the final analysis, independent hip hop acts need live shows to disseminate their music and their messages (and to make a living), while independent-minded hip hop fans seem to crave the energy, creativity, participation and community that is not possible through mainstream channels. Thus, despite significant problems with live shows at small clubs, not the least of which are audience demographics and occasional

¹⁴ Tara Brabazon, *Thinking Popular Culture: War, Terrorism and Writing* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2008), 139.

¹⁵ Edward Jackiewicz and James Caine, “Scales of Resistance: Billy Bragg and the Creation of Activist Spaces,” in *Sound, Society and the Geography of Popular Music*, ed. Ola Johansson and Thomas L. Bell (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2009), 44-45.

¹⁶ Jackiewicz and James Caine, “Scales of Resistance: Billy Bragg,” 44.

¹⁷ Billy Bragg, *The Progressive Patriot: A Search for Belonging* (London, UK: Bantam Press, 2006), 193. Emphasis in original text.

¹⁸ Micheal Dowdy, “Live Hip Hop, Collective Agency, and “Acting in Concert,” *Popular Music and Society* 30, no. 1 (February 2007): 75-91.

less-than-capacity crowds, these spaces actively create a motivated hip hop community.¹⁹

The dynamics of anti-fascist punk concerts in Germany have also been cited as producing spaces where participants cultivate collective agency.²⁰ The dynamics are discussed in relation to the social power of punk performances. Fabian Holt notes:

Musical performance is always social in that it involves various forms of interaction, among producers and consumers. The social life in a performance reflects and shapes social attitudes and ideas. Public performances, moreover, constitute a space for the formation, articulation, and empowerment of community.²¹

The examples explored affirm the role that particular dynamics play in creating space in popular music performances. The point is that the dynamics and spaces are shaped by the imagination and activities of those participating. Inquiring into such dynamics and spaces requires attention to contextual and ideological factors, which also contribute meaning to particular performances.²² In the next section, I discuss this constellation of dynamics, spaces, and factors with the question: Why do performances of popular music matter?

4.2.2 Why Do Performances of Popular Music Matter?

This question raises several points. First, that discourses, meaning how people talk about popular music, impacts on their understanding of particular performances. Second, the question pinpoints the ubiquity of popular music performances in people's everyday lives. Third, it raises the issue of commodification and technology, particularly debates about live and mediated performances. I draw on themes from

¹⁹ Dowdy, "Live Hip Hop, Collective Agency, and "Acting in Concert," 90.

²⁰ Fabian Holt, "Kreuzberg Activists: Musical Performance as Social Vehicle," *Popular Music and Society* 30, no. 4 (October 2007): 469-492.

²¹ Holt, "Kreuzberg Activists: Musical Performance," 485.

²² Sheila Whiteley, Andy Bennett, and Stan Hawkins, introduction to *Music, Space and Place: Popular Music and Cultural Identity* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2005), 1-2.

Simon Frith's scholarship to address these points. Frith is considered a pioneer in the field of popular music studies and has written seminal books on popular music.²³ His insight into this question is, therefore, relevant to my discussion.

Theme I: The 'Talk' About Popular Music

Why does popular music matter? Several answers to this question are presented in the following quote. The answers resonate with conceptualizations of music explored in previous chapters. Frith writes:

Music may be useful psychologically, socially, politically or whatever. But that's not why people do it. Music matters because it is pleasurable – to do and to experience – and because it is a necessary part of what we are as humans, feeling, empathetic beings, interested in and engaged with other people. To study music is to study what it is to be human – biologically, cognitively, culturally; to play music is to experience what it is to be human – physically, mentally, socially, in an aesthetic, playful, sensual context. Music matters, in short, because without it we wouldn't know who we are and what we are capable of being.²⁴

His remarks resonate, for example, with Sarbanes' notion that musicking is an act of social imagination, Barenboim and Said's emphasis on music as a humanizing space, and Saliers' understanding of music as a multi-sensory experience.²⁵

Alongside these resonances, the answers provided underscore that musical genres are not only historically contingent but also ideologically constructed.²⁶ The meaning and value given to a genre of popular music, such as Glam rock or punk, are the products of particular places and times. To understand popular music performances then, scholars should explore how different people in different contexts talk about a

²³ See Martin Cloonan, "What is Popular Music Studies? Some observations," *British Journal of Music Education* 22, no. 1 (2005): 80.

²⁴ Simon Frith, "Why Music Matters," *Critical Quarterly* 50, no. 1-2 (April 2008): 178.

²⁵ See Chapter Two, 65-68; Chapter Three, 123-125; 161.

²⁶ Simon Frith, *Performing Rites: On the Value of Popular Music* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1996).

musical performance. What discourses inform their understandings? Whether the ‘talk’ comes from consumers, critics, or musicians, it is as vital to appreciating popular music performances as a song’s lyrics or its guitar licks.

The reality is that the meanings and values given to this music evolve.²⁷ This evolution often takes place as part of people’s daily activities, conversations, and relationships.²⁸ For example, changes in one’s perception of particular artists and genres can be shaped through a conversation with friends.²⁹ These changes emphasize that giving meaning and value to popular music is not only mundane but also social.³⁰

The word ‘social’ implies that the music is not just a reflection of or response to individual and/or communal tastes. Rather, popular music is a dynamic way of being in the world.³¹ When people make music, they are living out complex and multiple experiences and understandings.³² Stated differently, performances of popular music create spaces that take us into ourselves and out into the world on a daily basis.³³ How we talk about popular music is part of how we create these spaces.

An example is the use of discourses about popular music performances in educational contexts.³⁴ In these contexts, students learn about social justice issues by listening to, performing, and talking about particular music. Each of these processes is

²⁷ Frith, *Performing Rites*, 3-95.

²⁸ For more on these contexts, conversations, and relationships, see Tia DeNora, *Music in Everyday Life* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2000).

²⁹ Frith, *Performing Rites*, 3-8.

³⁰ Frith, *Performing Rites*, 12-13.

³¹ Frith, *Performing Rites*, 272.

³² For more on this understanding of music, see Thomas Turino, *Music as Social Life: The Politics of Participation* (Chicago, IL: The University of Chicago Press, 2008).

³³ Frith, *Performing Rites*, 276, 278.

³⁴ See Reebee Garofalo, “Honk! Pedagogy: A New Paradigm for Music Education?,” *Radical Teacher* 91 (Fall 2011): 16-25.

participatory and, thus, contributes to the ways students use popular music to take them into themselves and out into the world.

For instance, racism can be discussed using videos of artists performing songs such as Peter Gabriel's "Biko."³⁵ The song was written in response to the death of anti-Apartheid activist, Stephen Biko, in South Africa. Through the processes of listening, performing, and talking about the song, students can re-envision the classroom itself as a space to challenge injustice. It becomes a space from which they can carry that challenge out into the community.

Corroborating the importance of these processes and spaces, "Biko" has also been described as impacting on people's lives in different ways.³⁶ Upon listening to the song, individuals felt compelled to learn more about the struggles for social and political justice in South Africa.³⁷ This learning emerged not only through the song's lyrics but also through the dynamics of Gabriel's performances and the ways the song was framed through particular discourses. For example, political discourses contributed meaning to the song when Amnesty International leaflets were handed out at concerts or when Gabriel challenged audiences to get involved in the anti-Apartheid movement.³⁸

Michael Drewett observes:

The song has achieved more than simply reflect Gabriel's thoughts or feelings: it has brought awareness of Biko's life, the South African situation, and the plight of prisoners of conscience the world over, and it has challenged people and ultimately changed their lives.³⁹

³⁵ Sarah Morrison, "Can Pop Be Relevant? Using Popular Music to Address Issues of Racism," *Canadian Music Educator* 49, no. 3 (Spring 2008): 52-54.

³⁶ Micheal Drewett, "The Eyes of the World Are Watching Now: The Political Effectiveness of "Biko" by Peter Gabriel," *Popular Music and Society* 30, no. 1 (February 2007): 39-51.

³⁷ Drewett, "The Eyes of the World Are Watching Now," 43-45.

³⁸ Drewett, "The Eyes of the World Are Watching Now," 47.

³⁹ Drewett, "The Eyes of the World Are Watching Now," 49.

In the next sections, I continue to explore the question of why popular music matters.

Theme II: The Ubiquity of Music in Everyday Life

With advances in audio technology, music has become ubiquitous in people's everyday lives.⁴⁰ On an individual level, music is used to organize one's activities, demarcate one's personal space, and/or manipulate one's mood.⁴¹ Frith writes: "As a 'technology of the self,' music has become crucial to the ways in which people organize their memories, identity and autonomy."⁴² As an organizing factor in their lives, music accompanies people while they exercise, eat, work, and shop.

While listening to music is important, music-making is equally vital in daily life.⁴³ Each day people make music by joining choirs, forming rock bands, and playing around in home studios or on their laptops.⁴⁴ These activities provide people with "critical pathways through life."⁴⁵ The use of the term 'pathways' evokes the idea of spaces being created when people musick. For example, a study of these pathways revealed the complex and multiple ways people used musical spaces, both real and imagined, to define their individual and communal worlds in a specific English town.⁴⁶

One of the reasons music making matters is the commonsense belief that the experience is somehow special. This means that the power of the musical experience

⁴⁰ Simon Frith, "Music and Everyday Life," in *The Cultural Study of Music: A Critical Introduction*, ed. Martin Clayton, Trevor Herbert, and Richard Middleton (London, UK: Routledge, 2003), 93.

⁴¹ Frith, "Music and Everyday Life," 95, 98.

⁴² Frith, "Music and Everyday Life," 98.

⁴³ Frith, "Music and Everyday Life," 100.

⁴⁴ Frith, "Music and Everyday Life," 100.

⁴⁵ Frith, "Music and Everyday Life," 100. The idea of critical pathways is from Ruth Finnegan's study, *The Hidden Musicians: Music-making in an English Town* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1989).

⁴⁶ Frith, *Performing Rites*, 89-90.

can disturb and surprise people.⁴⁷ I cited an example of this power in Chapter Two.⁴⁸ Dunn's description of a Clash tribute concert suggests that he was both disturbed and surprised by his experience. The experience was disturbing because of the war mongering of the American government that contextualized the concert. Surprise was afforded by the insight, gleaned through musicking, that people could do something about it.

Two interrelated issues complicate the idea that popular music performances are special. The first issue is the fact that popular music is, in the West at least, a commodity. The second is that, for most people in Western cultures, experiences of popular music performances are technologically mediated. By technologically mediated, I am referring to the fact that most people experience music by listening to a recording or watching performances on television and/or the Internet.⁴⁹ These issues reflect the reality that in Western cultures, popular music is part of an industry that is defined by economics and the rapid growth of technology.⁵⁰

Theme III: Commodification and Technology

The issues of commodification and technology can be explored in relation to performances of live music. Economists and sociologists have suggested that the rise of mediated music, whether on records, the radio, or an iPod, would contribute to the

⁴⁷ Frith, "Music and Everyday Life," 101.

⁴⁸ Chapter Two, 67-68.

⁴⁹ Ian Inglis, "History, Place and Time: The Possibility of the Unexpected," in *Performance and Popular Music: History, Place and Time* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006), xiii.

⁵⁰ For more on these issues, see Simon Frith, "The Popular Music Industry," in *The Cambridge Companion to Pop and Rock*, ed. Simon Frith, Will Straw, and John Street (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2001), 26-52.

decline of live performance.⁵¹ For example, as Frith notes, economists cite the acoustic restrictions and high costs of these performances as contributing to their decline. Given that only a limited number of people can be reached through live music, concert promoters raise ticket prices to be cost effective. Similarly, sociologists cite the emergence of new technologies as spelling the decline of live musical performance.⁵² Why would people pay to see a live performance when they can watch it on their laptops or smartphones?⁵³

In spite of these issues, people continue to value the experience of live music.⁵⁴ The experience matters because it is a public statement of people's musical commitments.⁵⁵ Live performances are spaces in which people affirm, celebrate, and explore their understandings of themselves, whether as individuals or as part of a community. In these spaces, people can also experience how a performance works.⁵⁶ They are given insight into what makes particular performances 'just feel right,' as one scholar commented.⁵⁷ These insights include the ways in which the act of performing contributes to what it means to be human. Frith explains:

Music is now tied up with people's sense of self. Listening to music has become a way of laying claim to one's own physical and emotional space. We therefore make both a new demand on music (to meet our personal needs) and a new commitment to it, as a symbol of our individuality. This egocentric and essentially lonely aesthetic is shaped, though, by an equally passionate drive to *share* our musical tastes. Music has become more important too for our social intercourse, in gift relations and the understanding of

⁵¹ Simon Frith, "Live Music Matters," *Scottish Music Review* 1, no. 1 (2007): 1, under <http://www.scottishmusicreview.org/index.php/SMR/article/viewFile/9/8> (accessed June 15, 2012).

⁵² Frith, "Live Music Matters," 2.

⁵³ For more on this question, see Simon Frith, "Look! Hear! The Uneasy Relationship of Music and Television," *Popular Music* 21, no. 3 (2002): 277-290.

⁵⁴ Frith, "Live Music Matters," 4.

⁵⁵ Frith, "Live Music Matters," 14.

⁵⁶ Frith, "Live Music Matters," 14.

⁵⁷ Tim Quirk and Jason Toynbee, "Going Through the Motions: Popular Music Performance in Journalism and in Academic Discourse," *Popular Music* 24, no.3 (2005): 410.

collective identities, to intimacy and our reading of our own and other people's feelings.⁵⁸

The continued significance of live popular music performance is demonstrated by the United Kingdom's love affair with festivals.⁵⁹ Although these events are commercial enterprises and are a part of the music industry's moneymaking strategies, they remain spaces of human insight.⁶⁰ Promoters may be exploiting festivals for profit, but this has not deterred participants from flocking to the events.⁶¹ Over eight hundred summer festivals take place in Britain each year.⁶² In terms of insight, festivals have been used to understand the relationship between ethics, marketing, and the consumption of alcohol and other substances in that country.⁶³

What about the value of mediated performances? With the rise of reality television such as "Pop Idol" and/or "American Idol," Frith suggests that audiences encounter a format of popular music performance that is simultaneously live and mediated. Performances on these shows are valued for their 'liveness,' or the appearance that the audience is experiencing "something remarkable and unique, to genius or talent which only select individuals have (even if as a result of long years of

⁵⁸ Frith, "Live Music Matters," 13-14. Emphasis in original text.

⁵⁹ Frith, "Live Music Matters," 4-5. Emphasis in original text.

⁶⁰ See Gerry Bloustein, "Still Picking Children from the Trees? Reimagining Woodstock in Twenty-First Century Australia," in *Remembering Woodstock*, ed. Andy Bennett (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2004), 127-145.

⁶¹ For an in-depth study of British Pop Music Festivals, see Chris Stone, "The British Pop Music Festival Phenomenon," in *International Perspectives of Festivals and Events*, ed. Jane Ali Knight (Oxford, UK: Elsevier Ltd., 2009), 205-224.

⁶² George McKay, "Festivals," under "George McKay: professor, writer, musician," <http://georgemckay.org/festivals> (accessed August 1, 2012).

⁶³ Louise Tickle, "Music Festivals: the Sound of Escapism," *The Guardian* (July 18, 2011) under "News – Education – Research Notes," <http://www.guardian.co.uk/education/2011/jul/18/music-festivals-research> (accessed August July 19, 2012).

technical training and/or paying their dues).”⁶⁴ Audiences also value these performances because they are part of a television show, which depicts the process by which ordinary individuals become pop stars. These performances, therefore, are representative of the increasing symbiosis between live and mediated performances in British and American cultures.⁶⁵

This symbiosis is not new. Live performances of popular music have long been adapted to emerging technologies, be it the gramophone, the radio, television, or the Internet.⁶⁶ Referring to this adaptation, Philip Auslander writes:

Live performance now often incorporates mediatization to the degree that the live event itself is a product of media technologies. This has been the case to some degree for a long time, of course: as soon as electric amplification is used, one might say that an event is mediatized.⁶⁷

The point is that the advent of new media and technology does not relegate live performances to the dustbin of history. In Western cultures at least, people experience a ‘symbiotic’ rather than oppositional relationship between live and mediated performances on a daily basis.⁶⁸ Even when people listen to a recording their perception of the music is not disembodied.⁶⁹ The recorded music is perceived as a performance unfolding at a particular time and place.⁷⁰

It can be said, therefore, that both live and mediated performances of popular music are a ubiquitous and valued part of people’s everyday lives. This point affirms

⁶⁴ Frith, “Live Music Matters,” 13.

⁶⁵ Frith, “Live Music Matters,” 13.

⁶⁶ Frith, “Live Music Matters,” 7.

⁶⁷ Philip Auslander, *Liveness: Performance in a Mediatized Culture*, 2nd ed. (London, UK: Routledge, 2008), 25.

⁶⁸ Auslander, *Liveness*, 185.

⁶⁹ Philip Auslander, “Performance Analysis and Popular Music: A Manifesto,” *Contemporary Theatre Review* 14, no. 1 (2004): 5.

⁷⁰ Auslander, “Performance Analysis,” 5; Frith, *Performing Rites*, 210-211.

that performances should be studied because they are important sites of musical and socio-cultural innovation.⁷¹ The performances are “moments of transition,” meaning spaces in which old ways of doing things are challenged and new ones are brought into being. Having said this, popular music scholars often study these moments by listening to and/or watching recordings. Scholars can spend hours reviewing bootleg videos and official broadcasts of particular concerts.⁷² These videos and broadcasts are then used to pinpoint the different ways people remember particular acts.

With this discussion, I am acknowledging two things. First, several interrelated debates and issues impact on understandings of popular music performance. The ubiquity of this music and the fact that it is a commodity shaped by technology represent two examples. Second, recordings of live popular music performance are viable methodological starting points and objects of study in popular music studies. This viability provides me with a basis for using recordings and videos of live performances as in-depth examples in subsequent sections of the chapter.

4.3 The Ambiguity of Popular Music Performances

In this section, I address the ambiguity of popular music performance. I devote a separate section to this motif because it has emerged as a significant issue in popular music studies.⁷³ The issue is a reminder that, like spirituality, popular music is a human phenomenon. It is at times porous, noxious, and heterogeneous, as pointed out by Heidi

⁷¹ Inglis, “History, Place and Time,” xv.

⁷² Susan Fast, “Popular Music Performance and Cultural Memory Queen: Live Aid, Wembley Stadium, London, July 13, 1985,” in *Performance and Popular Music: History, Place and Time*, ed. Ian Inglis (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006), 138-154.

⁷³ See for example, Susan Fast and Kip Pegley, ed., *Music, Politics and Violence* (Middleton, CT: Wesleyan University Press, 2012).

Epstein in the previous chapter.⁷⁴ To achieve an adequate understanding of its performances, in other words, one should explore the abjection possible in this music.

Theme I: Radical Ambiguity

Popular music is characterized by a “radical ambiguity.”⁷⁵ This means that the music has the potential to contribute to peace and/or to violence. Punk music, for example, has been mobilized for and against racism in Britain and the United States.⁷⁶ Performances of this music bring people together and communicate ideas.⁷⁷ When this happens, the spaces created can be used to either promote a world of racial segregation or a world of racial equality.⁷⁸

In particular, musical performances are ambiguous because they can make people angry.⁷⁹ People get upset, for instance, if they feel that a particular performance has not lived up to their expectations.⁸⁰ Bob Dylan going ‘electric’ at a folk festival in 1965 is a case in point.⁸¹ Fans got angry because they felt Dylan was dishonoring the idealized conception of his music with which they had come to identify.⁸² By

⁷⁴ Chapter Three, 142-143.

⁷⁵ Martin Cloonan and Bruce Johnson, *Dark Side of the Tune: Popular Music and Violence* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2008), 1.

⁷⁶ See Ugo Corte and Bob Edwards, “White Power Music and the Mobilization of Racist Movements,” *Music and Arts in Action* 1, no. 1 (June 2008): 5-20, under <http://www.musicandartsinaction.net/index.php/maia/article/view/whitepowermusic> (accessed July 1, 2012); Mike Roberts and Ryan Moore, “Peace Punks and Punks against Racism: Resource Mobilization and Frame Construction in the Punk Movement,” *Music and Arts in Action* 2, no.2 (2009): 21-36, under <http://www.musicandartsinaction.net/index.php/maia/article/view/punkmovements> (accessed July 1, 2012).

⁷⁷ Roberts and Moore, “Peace Punks and Punks against Racism,” 26.

⁷⁸ Corte and Bob Edwards, “White Power Music and the mobilization,” 13-16.

⁷⁹ Simon Frith, “Why Does Music Make People So Cross?,” *Nordic Journal of Music Therapy* 13, no. 1 (2004): 64-69.

⁸⁰ Frith, “Why Does Music Make People So Cross?,” 66.

⁸¹ Lee Marshall, “Bob Dylan: Newport Folk Festival, July 25, 1965,” in *Performance and Popular Music: History, Place and Time*, ed. Ian Inglis (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006), 16-27.

⁸² Frith, “Why Does Music Make People So Cross?,” 66-67.

dishonoring this conception, the perceptions of folk music identities were disrupted. Dylan no longer embodied someone who stood up against the mainstream.

That performance of popular music can make people angry cautions against a romanticized understanding of this human phenomenon. Popular music performances may be moments of transition, reflection, and influence regarding socio-cultural patterns, but these moments are not always positive. In the twentieth century alone, popular music has accompanied conflict the world over.⁸³ This reality clashes with an operative assumption in popular music studies that the music is a universal good.⁸⁴ The music's relationship to violence has problematized this assumption, however.⁸⁵

Theme II: Music as Violence

Similar to the definition of violence provided by anthropologists in Chapter Two, music as violence can be conceptualized as existing along a continuum.⁸⁶ This continuum runs the gamut from the discomfort caused by the loud music played by a noisy neighbor at 3:00 a.m. to the use of music as a soundtrack to war. The point is that the music/violence nexus is not an exotic or historical aberration, either in the West or in other parts of the world.⁸⁷ It is very mundane and, therefore, very dangerous. By mundane and dangerous, I mean the pervasiveness of music as violence in contemporary

⁸³ See John Morgan O'Connell and Salwa El-Shawan Castelo-Branco, ed., *Music and Conflict* (Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press, 2010).

⁸⁴ Frith, "Why Does Music Make People So Cross?," 64.

⁸⁵ Martin Cloonan and Bruce Johnson, "Killing Me Softly With His Song: An Initial Investigation Onto the Use of Popular Music as a Tool of Oppression," *Popular Music* 21, no. 1 (2002): 27-39; Bruce Johnson and Martin Cloonan, "Introduction: Special Issue on Popular Music and Violence," *Popular Music and Society* 34, no. 1 (February 2011): 1-6.

⁸⁶ Chapter Two, 76-78.

⁸⁷ Johnson and Cloonan, "Introduction," 2.

life.⁸⁸ When accepted and normalized in the everyday, music becomes another site in the perpetuation of violence.

The use of music as a legal punishment in the United States is one example of this perpetuation.⁸⁹ Judges in some States hoped to deter noise violators by having them enroll in music immersion programs. As their punishment, those charged would be forced to listen to what they considered ‘unpleasant’ music.⁹⁰ Although seemingly trivial, these programs represent the use of music as a weapon.⁹¹ When music is used in this way, even as part of a legal system, it involves coercion and discomfort. “Rather than a subversive anomaly,” Lily Hirsh writes, “these cases reveal music’s destructive possibilities as an enduring and powerful reality throughout our historical past and present.”⁹²

Acknowledging these aspects of popular music compels scholars to reconsider its social and political impact.⁹³ That this music has an impact suggests that its performance can be considered a “site of competing ideas about how the world is and how it should be.”⁹⁴ Stated differently, popular music performances are spaces in which people imagine the world and bring these imaginings to life. What happens when these performances contribute to the violent subjugation of human beings?⁹⁵ How does it affect people’s understanding and valuing of popular music?

⁸⁸ Cloonan and Bruce Johnson, *Dark Side of the Tune*, 148.

⁸⁹ Lily E. Hirsh, “Do you Really Want to Hurt Me?,” *Music as Punishment in the United States Legal System*, *Popular Music and Society* 34, no. 1 (February 2011): 35-53.

⁹⁰ Hirsh, “Do you Really Want to Hurt Me?,” 38-41.

⁹¹ Hirsh, “Do you Really Want to Hurt Me?,” 49.

⁹² Hirsh, “Do you Really Want to Hurt Me?,” 35.

⁹³ Cloonan and Bruce Johnson, *Dark Side of the Tune*, 193.

⁹⁴ Cloonan and Bruce Johnson, *Dark Side of the Tune*, 192.

⁹⁵ Cloonan and Bruce Johnson, *Dark Side of the Tune*, 53.

Theme III: Popular Music and the Violent Subjugation of Human Beings

One context in which popular music is used as violent subjugation is the theatre of war. Advancements in music technology now enable portable devices, whether CD players, laptops, or iPods, to prepare for and accompany soldiers into combat.⁹⁶ These devices are often utilized in military vehicles.⁹⁷ The double-edge character of popular music performances is made explicit in this example. Performances are deployed to simultaneously energize the soldiers and terrify those considered the ‘enemy.’

Another example is the use of popular music as an instrument of torture in the ‘war on terror.’⁹⁸ This music has been deployed as torture by other forces in other wars.⁹⁹ What is distressing about its use as part of the ‘war on terror’ is the ways it was normalized and trivialized in the media. It is worth quoting in full remarks made on the disclosure of the use of the ‘I Love You’ song by Barney the Purple Dinosaur to torture detainees in Iraq:

Let us remember that the subject of all this hilarity is the studied destruction of a human being. Would anyone end a report on the stoning of a rape victim with a waggish, ‘I guess she could start a nice rockery?’ At Human Rights Watch Kenneth Roth could not tell whether the Barney song had been deliberately chosen so that when the story broke humour would dominate public responses. The organization expressed concern that the Barney story was turning stories about interrogations into a joke and that those expressing concern would be dismissed as lacking a sense of humour.¹⁰⁰

⁹⁶ See Jonathan R. Pieslak, “Sound Targets: Music and the War in Iraq,” *Journal of Musicological Research* 26 (2007): 123-149; Lisa Gilman, “An American Soldier’s iPod: Layers of Identity and Situated Listening in Iraq,” *Music and Politics* 4, no. 2 (Summer 2010), under <http://www.music.ucbs.edu/prjects/musicandpolitics/archive/2010-2/gilman.html> (accessed February 10, 2011).

⁹⁷ Pieslak, “Sound Targets: Music and the War in Iraq,” 126.

⁹⁸ See Suzanne G. Cusick, “You are in a place that is out of the world...”: Music in the Detention Camps of the “Global war on Terror,” *Journal of the Society of American Music* 2, no. 1 (2008): 1-26.

⁹⁹ Suzanne G. Cusick, “Music as torture/Music as weapon,” *Revista Transcultural de Música/Transcultural Review of Music* 10 (2006), under <http://www.sibetrans.com/trans/a152/music-as-torture-music-as-weapon> (accessed June 19, 2012).

¹⁰⁰ Cloonan and Johnson, *Dark Side of the Tune*, 190.

If popular music can be used to envision and manifest torture, how does this challenge the perception that the music can be used to imagine and build a positive peace? The seriousness of this question is underscored when framed by the assertion that musical performance is a site of competing ideas about how the world is and ought to be. When the destruction of a human being is normalized in the media and, as a consequence trivialized as an act of violence, what kind of world is being imagined and built? What does this say about the nature of musical performance itself?

These questions reaffirm the ambiguity of musical performance, including those of protest music. I have discussed this characteristic at length because of the risk of reducing the role and significance of protest music performances to their positive impacts. To avoid this reductionism, scholars should acknowledge that, as a genre, this music is more complex and multiple than its use to imagine and build a more just and peaceful world.

For example, protest music was linked to the human responsibility of speaking truth to power in Saliers' research discussed in the previous chapter.¹⁰¹ That popular music in general can be used as a means of humiliation, pain, and terror cautions against an uncritical assessment of protest music's social and political impact.¹⁰² Performances of this music should be understood as much more ambiguous, complex, and multiple than a purely positive assessment allows.

¹⁰¹ See Chapter Three, 156-164.

¹⁰² Art Jipson, "Introduction to the Special Issue: Influence of Hate Rock," *Popular Music and Society* 30, no. 4 (October 2007): 450.

4.4 Literacy in Protest Music Performances

In subsequent sections, I discuss themes relevant to an adequate understanding of protest music performances. The themes are drawn primarily from two studies representing the fields of popular music studies and music and social movements.¹⁰³ Both fields are considered sources of insight into the dynamics, spaces, and factors that constitute protest music and its performances.¹⁰⁴ Thus, where pertinent, I reference other works from these fields.¹⁰⁵

In my discussion, I move from comments on music and politics in general to protest music performances in particular. This move helps to contextualize the understandings of musical performance that I use in my in-depth examples. By contextualize, I mean identifying and explaining some of the debates and issues that arise when considering the social and political impact of music, including its manifestation as protest. These debates and issues support my claim that protest music performances are spaces where people imagine and live out alternative ways of being in the world.

¹⁰³ John Street, *Music and Politics* (Cambridge, UK: Polity, 2012); Rob Rosenthal and Richard Flacks, *Playing for Change: Music and Musicians in the Service of Social Movements* (Boulder, CO: Paradigm Publishers, 2011).

¹⁰⁴ See Ron Eyerman and Andrew Jamison, "Social Movements and Cultural Transformation: Popular Music and the 1960s," *Media, Culture & Society* 17 (1995): 449-468; Ron Eyerman, "Music in Movement: Cultural Politics and Old and New Social Movements," *Qualitative Sociology* 25, no. 3 (Fall 2002): 443-458; Vincent J. Roscigno, William F. Danaher, and Erika Summers-Effler, "Music, Culture, and Social Movements: Songs and Southern Textile Worker Mobilization," *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy* 22, no. 1/2/3 (2002): 141-174; Marc W. Steinberg, "When Politics Goes Pop: on the Intersections of Popular and Political Culture and the Case of the Serbian Student Protests," *Social Movement Studies* 3, no. 1 (April 2004): 3-29; Graham St. John, "Protestival: Global Days of Action and Carnivalized Politics in the Present," *Social Movement Studies* 7, no. 2 (September 2008): 167-190.

¹⁰⁵ John Street, *Rebel Rock: The Politics of Popular Music* (Oxford, UK: Basil Blackwell Ltd, 1986); John Street, *Politics and Popular Culture* (Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 1997); John Street, "Rock, Pop and Politics," in *The Cambridge Companion to Pop and Rock*, ed. Simon Frith, Will Straw, and John Street (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2001), 243-255; John Street, "The Pop Star as Politician: From Belafonte to Bono, From Creativity to Conscience," in *The Resisting Muse: Popular Music and Social Protest*, ed. Ian Peddie (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006), 49-61.

4.4.1 Themes from John Street's *Music and Politics*

Several themes from Street's study help to place popular music at the heart of politics. The first theme consists of the question: Does music make a difference? The other themes include the idea that music constitutes politics through imagination and action. Together, they affirm that protest music and its performances are sources of insight and hope.

Theme I: Does Music Make a Difference?

Popular music makes a difference when it is situated at the heart of politics.¹⁰⁶ Here, politics is defined as larger than "the activities of parties and governments alone."¹⁰⁷ It is understood as relating to a range of actors and issues. Celebrities and grassroots organizations, for example, can be understood as actors addressing political issues such as censorship, racism, and global poverty. This broad conceptualization of politics points to the complex and multiple ways in which popular music can act as the focal point of people's political visions and actions.¹⁰⁸

There are differing opinions, however, on the effectiveness of music to create lasting political change. For some, music is effective in generating this change.¹⁰⁹ Others perceive the relationship between music, politics, and transformation as more tenuous. Whatever camp one falls into, the point is that one-dimensional answers to the question of music's political impact are not adequate. This is because the impact is

¹⁰⁶ Street, *Music and Politics*, 43.

¹⁰⁷ Street, *Music and Politics*, 7.

¹⁰⁸ Street, *Music and Politics*, 5.

¹⁰⁹ Street, *Music and Politics*, 140-149. Also see John Street, "Breaking the Silence: Music's Role in Political Thought and Action," *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy* 10, no. 3 (September 2007): 321-337.

formed and informed by a constellation of factors. Here, the word ‘factors’ describes the actors, contexts, issues, and performances that make up such constellations.

Three factors, for example, have been identified as shaping the political, and I would add social, impact of the 2005 Live 8 concerts and the Rock Against Racism movement from the late 1970s and early 1980s. These factors are organization, legitimation, and performing participation.¹¹⁰ Organization refers to the infrastructural arrangements that are needed to put on a concert, whether an international, multi-city broadcast or a set in a local pub. Legitimation consists of the ways in which musicians come to be perceived as authoritative spokespeople for a cause or issue. Performing participation concerns the dynamics and relationships – social and sonic – that make up a particular performance.¹¹¹

Examining these factors reveals that the relationship between popular music and politics is not a random or spontaneous happening but often a product of “hard work and planning, of networks and various forms of capital.”¹¹² This acknowledgment emphasizes the many ways in which communities, organizations, and even nation states invest music with political meaning. Understanding how and why this investment happens requires an approach that respects the contingent and multifaceted relationship between particular genres of popular music and politics. Stated differently, and as I made clear in my earlier discussions of popular music performance in this chapter, such relationships are not straightforward but ambiguous and complex.¹¹³

¹¹⁰ Street, *Music and Politics*, 71-74.

¹¹¹ Street, *Music and Politics*, 71-74.

¹¹² Street, *Music and Politics*, 74.

¹¹³ See Chapter Four, 166-179.

This point can be illustrated through an examination of the ways governments' construct and apply their policies on music.¹¹⁴ Government policies are often based on the assumption that music does have a social and political impact. In essence, that music makes a difference.¹¹⁵ The reality is, however, that this assumption underpins policies in a range of governments, including those of authoritarian and liberal capitalist states.¹¹⁶

In terms of authoritarian governments, one can point to the repressive policies toward rock music in the former German Democratic Republic.¹¹⁷ These repressive policies included the expulsion of dissident musicians from the country and prohibitions against the performance of rock music. In contrast, the British government has recently sought to revamp its music policies to promote local talent.¹¹⁸ This process has led to reflections on the relationship between academic research and state music policies as well as the declining global influence of British popular music.¹¹⁹ Thus, in asking the question whether music makes a difference, one should consider not only genre but also the understandings and uses to which a particular music is put, whether as part of local communities, nation states, and/or social movements.

¹¹⁴ Street, *Music and Politics*, 24. Also see John Street, "'Fight the Power': The Politics of Music and the Music of Politics," *Government and Opposition* 38, no. 1 (2003): 113-130.

¹¹⁵ Street, *Music and Politics*, 39.

¹¹⁶ Street, *Music and Politics*, 27-30

¹¹⁷ Peter Wicke, "The Times are They A-Changin': Rock Music and Political Change in East Germany," in *Rockin' the Boat: Mass Music and Mass Movements*, ed. Reebee Garofalo (Cambridge, MA: South End Press, 1992), 81-92.

¹¹⁸ John Williamson, Martin Cloonan, and Simon Frith, "Having an Impact? Academics, the Music Industries and the Problem of Knowledge," *International Journal of Cultural Policy* 17, no. 5 (November 2011): 459-474.

¹¹⁹ Simon Frith, "Does British Music Still Matter? A Reflection on the Changing Status of British Popular Music in the Global Music Market," *European Journal of Cultural Studies* 7, no. 1 (2004): 45-58.

In championing such multifaceted conceptualizations of music and politics, Street urges his readers to take music seriously as a collective political experience.¹²⁰ Music becomes political, in his opinion, when it goes beyond private reflection. He writes: “It is only when musical pleasure (or musical displeasure) spills over into the public realm and into the exercise of power within it that it becomes political. It is where music inspires forms of collective thought and action that it becomes political.”¹²¹ The idea that music ‘inspires’ collective thought and action affirms that it can be understood as constituting – meaning creating and shaping – politics. I turn to this theme in the following section.

Theme II: Popular Music as Imagination and Action

Popular music is more than a cipher or symbol for political communities, histories, and identities.¹²² It is a way of imagining and living these realities.¹²³ Street’s argument is that these musical realities should to be understood on their own terms. This means understanding the attributes and qualities that make a particular musical performance political.

Rock against Racism is one example (RAR). RAR was a punk inspired movement that sought to encourage and enact anti-racist politics in Britain.¹²⁴ For those who participated, music was a way of making sense of this politics.¹²⁵ The sounds and visuals of the gigs, where white and black musicians played together, constituted an

¹²⁰ Street, *Music and Politics*, 172.

¹²¹ Street, *Music and Politics*, 8.

¹²² Street, *Music and Politics*, 97.

¹²³ Street, *Music and Politics*, 116.

¹²⁴ Simon Frith and John Street, “Rock Against Racism and Red Wedge: From Music to Politics, from Politics to Music,” in *Rockin’ the Boat: Mass Music and Mass Movements*, ed. Reebee Garofalo (Cambridge, MA: South End Press, 1992): 67-72.

¹²⁵ Street, *Music and Politics*, 93.

alternative political reality built on mutual respect and understanding.¹²⁶ Street

observes:

In Leeds there was a weekly RAR club that hosted local and national bands. The local RAR committee assiduously decorated the corridor to the club with day-glo and homemade banners. They would not let a single punter in until all was ready. The RAR activists saw the music and the venues as providing more than entertainment, and more than straightforward political information or ideology.¹²⁷

The observation implies that the distinctive attributes and qualities of particular performances, what people saw and heard together, helped to create and shape their visions and actions. The social, sonic, and visual elements, therefore, are integral to determining how and why particular performances have social and political impact.

These ideas are explained further through an examination of the ways in which a folk music anthology and/or an iconic music festival “*write* history and *create* political traditions.”¹²⁸ In the case of the anthology, the voices and songs collected therein helped to legitimate a type of musical personality and perspective that influenced the likes of Bob Dylan.¹²⁹ These voices and songs provided a sense of musicianship that constituted the identity of the American folk singer in the late 1950s and early 1960s.

Street notes:

So it is that the *Anthology of American Music* can be seen to run through the history of popular music, becoming a founding ‘constitution’ on the way – or at least that is what is *claimed* for it. But this narrative, in which the *Anthology* is both a musical template and authenticating source of cultural and political identity, is itself a construct, a way of running together various histories and creating meaning out of them. It is an exercise in mythmaking.¹³⁰

¹²⁶ For more on this movement, see Ian Goodyer, *Crisis Music: The Cultural Politics of Rock Against Racism* (Manchester, UK: Manchester University Press, 2009).

¹²⁷ Street, *Music and Politics*, 93.

¹²⁸ Street, *Music and Politics*, 99.

¹²⁹ Street, *Music and Politics*, 101.

¹³⁰ Street, *Music and Politics*, 102-103. Emphasis in original text.

Whether listening to or performing the anthology's music, spaces were created in which to imagine and to act out alternative ideas about America.¹³¹ These alternatives would come to play a significant role in the Civil Rights and Antiwar movements of the period.¹³²

In this regard, musical spaces are interesting because they are not historically or geographically fixed. This means that their social and political impact can continue after the end of a particular performance. An example is the creation of community around the iconic 1969 Woodstock Music and Art Fair.¹³³ Imaginings of the Fair can be found on the web, in the mass media, and as part of social and political history.¹³⁴ By drawing on these Woodstocks, people imagine and feel part of the community of musical, social, and political alternatives that the original event embodied. They use the music, the narratives, and rhetoric of the Fair to understand and live out their political commitments. In doing so, the event continues to create and shape people's emotions, histories, and identities.¹³⁵

Emphasizing the ambiguous, complex, and multiple relationships between popular music, people, and politics suggest that these connections are adequately understood through a constellation of factors, dynamics, and spaces. As noted, these can include the actors, contexts, and issues that make particular performances possible. All

¹³¹ Street, *Music and Politics*, 104.

¹³² See for example, R. Serge Denisoff, *Sing a Song of Social Significance*, 2nd ed. (Bowling Green, OH: Bowling Green University Press, 1983); Jerome L. Rodnitsky, *Minstrels of the Dawn* (Chicago, IL: Nelson-Hall, 1976); Robert Cantrell, *When We Were Good: The Folk Revival* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1996).

¹³³ Street, *Music and Politics*, 109.

¹³⁴ Street, *Music and Politics*, 110-114.

¹³⁵ Street, *Music and Politics*, 117.

of these are analytically important. Below, I discuss these ideas in association with Street's comments on protest music.

Theme III: Protest Music as a Source of Insight and Hope

A distinction between protest and resistance music is made in the study *Music and Politics*. This distinction has to do with the ways in which protest song becomes political. Protest song is described as music whose politics are tied to particular issues or enemies.¹³⁶ In contrast, the politics of resistance music lies in the act of singing.¹³⁷ The performance is what makes the song political and not the issues or enemies addressed. Street does not discuss this distinction at length. It points, however, to the different ways of defining protest music and what aspects of the music are perceived as generating its social and political impact.

For example, the term 'protest song' has been used to "describe a song which addresses a political issue in a way which aligns itself with the underdog."¹³⁸ This broad use of the term acknowledges that the underdog can emerge from a range of genres in different contexts. These genres include the blues, soul, punk, and rock from countries such as Britain, Chile, and Nigeria. The breadth underscores an important point: protest music is not an exclusively Western or 1960s phenomenon.¹³⁹

This point can be affirmed further by connecting the diverse threads that contribute to the social and political impact of protest songs. These include the ways in

¹³⁶ Street, *Music and Politics*, 42.

¹³⁷ Street, *Music and Politics*, 42.

¹³⁸ Lynskey, *33 Revolutions per Minute*, xii.

¹³⁹ See Luis Alvarez, "Reggae Rhythms in Dignity's Diaspora: Globalization, Indigenous Identity, and the Circulation of Cultural Struggle," *Popular Music and Society* 31, no. 5 (December 2008): 575-597; Light Carruyo, "Music and Politics of Protest in Venezuela," *Latin American Perspectives* 32, no. 3 (May 2005): 98-111; Teresita Gimenez Maceda, "Problematizing the Popular: the Dynamics of Pinoy Pop(ular) Music and Popular Music Protest," *Inter-Asia Cultural Studies* 8, no. 3 (2007): 390-413.

which songs provide musicians with a vehicle to articulate their political commitments, to give voice to the marginalized, and to inspire others to do the same. Dorian Lynskey comments:

For a while, in the dizzying rush of the 1960s, it was thought that pop music could change the world, and some people never recovered from the realization that it could not. But the point of protest music, or indeed any art with a political dimension is not to shift the world on its axis but to change opinions and perspectives, to say something about the times in which you live, and, sometimes, to find that what you've said speaks to another moment in history, which is how Barack Obama came to be standing in Grant Park paraphrasing the words of Sam Cooke.¹⁴⁰

The moment referred to was President Obama's victory speech on November 5, 2008. In this speech, the President made allusions to a song by pop-gospel singer Sam Cooke entitled "A Change is Gonna Come."¹⁴¹ The song was written in 1964 at a time of tremendous upheaval in the United States.¹⁴² The previous year had seen the civil rights' march on Birmingham, Alabama, the death of four young girls in that city due to a church bombing, and the assassination of former President Kennedy.¹⁴³ Alongside these events, it has been suggested that the song was a response to Cooke's own experiences of racial inequality and his hope that things could be different.¹⁴⁴ This particular song, in other words, continues to have social and political impact, beyond its original context and meaning.

Alongside President Obama's citing of the song in Grant Park, a version has been recorded by the Playing for Change movement, a movement committed to bringing

¹⁴⁰ Lynskey, *33 Revolutions per Minute*, xiv.

¹⁴¹ Christopher Trigg, "A Change is Gonna Come: Sam Cooke and the Protest Song," *University of Toronto Quarterly*, 79, no. 3 (Summer 2010): 993.

¹⁴² For more on the cultural, political, and social turmoil of the 1960s, see Mark Hamilton Lytle, *America's Uncivil Wars: The Sixties Era from Elvis to the Fall of Richard Nixon* (Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2006).

¹⁴³ Trigg, "A Change is Gonna Come," 992.

¹⁴⁴ Phull, *Story behind the Protest Song*, 38-43.

peace to the world through music.¹⁴⁵ Musicians involved in this movement perform and record songs they believe call for peaceful social and political change. They have also performed and recorded Peter Gabriel's "Biko."¹⁴⁶ Each of the songs is a composite, meaning that the musicians model a community of human coexistence through particular dynamics in the processes of both production and performance. The tracks include performances recorded in different contexts around the world that are then mixed into a coherent musical whole.

The idea that protest songs continue to have impact beyond their original circumstances suggests that they can be understood as more than a means of addressing a particular issue or giving voice to the marginalized in a particular context. They are also a source of insight into the ways in which people try to change opinions and perspectives through their music. This is the case with civil rights anthems. They continue to be used as a source of insight into the role that music plays in American efforts for social and political change.¹⁴⁷ For example, the rhetorical and geographical shifts that marked a move from Martin Luther King, Jr.'s nonviolent, southern-civil rights movement to a more militant, urban Black nationalism in the late 1960s has been explored through the music of singer-songwriter and activist, Nina Simone.¹⁴⁸

¹⁴⁵ Playing for Change, "A Change is Gonna Come," *Songs Around the World*, CD (Hear Music: 2008-2009) HRM-31130-00. It should be noted that one of the studies I explore has the same title as this movement. They are different entities, despite the use of the same title.

¹⁴⁶ Playing for Change, "Biko," *Songs Around the World*, CD (Hear Music: 2008-2009) HRM-31130-00.

¹⁴⁷ See Leslie A. Acevedo, "Developing an Outreach Program Based on Freedom Songs," *Public Library Quarterly* 25, no. 1/2 (2006): 171-179; Leslie Paige Rose, "The Freedom Singers of the Civil Rights Movement: Music Functioning for Freedom," *UPDATE* (Spring-Summer 2007): 59-68.

¹⁴⁸ Tammy L. Kernodle, "I Wish I Knew How It Would Feel to be Free": Nina Simone and the Redefining of the Freedom Song of the 1960s," *Journal of the Society for American Music* 2, no. 3 (2008): 295-317.

This understanding of protest music resonates with several other conceptualizations. Protest music has been defined as a discursive element in people's lives that offers insight into both issues and actions.¹⁴⁹ The music is conceptualized as giving breadth and depth to issues such as class, community, identity, and race. It is also viewed as a means of assertion, critique, cultural defense, a way of life, and/or empowerment.¹⁵⁰ Music that takes up human rights, for example, has been referred to as a "medium of hope" whose potency lies in its immediacy.¹⁵¹ Immediacy points to the ways that music-making is not only integral to the expression of injustice but also to living out the belief that things can be different.

Similarly, 'rebel musics,' or music related to social and political change, have been described as vehicles for the documentation and expression of hope.¹⁵² Ajay Heble observes: "Particularly compelling is music's ability to enable a recognition that social change *is* possible, to sound the possibility of different, and more hopeful, ways of doing things."¹⁵³ Here, rebel musics are understood not only as repositories of ideas, cultural moods, and strategies for change.¹⁵⁴ They are also conceived as enabling imagination and action. This enabling is connected to the ways that these musics 'sound' the

¹⁴⁹ Ian Peddie, introduction to *The Resisting Muse: Popular Music and Social Protest* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006), xxiv.

¹⁵⁰ Peddie, introduction to *The Resisting Muse*, xxii

¹⁵¹ Ian Peddie, introduction to *Popular Music and Human Rights: British and American Music*, vol. 1 (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2011), 2.

¹⁵² Ajay Heble, "Take Two/Rebel Musics: Human Rights, Resistant Sounds, and the Politics of Music Making," in *Rebel Musics: Human Rights, Resistant Sounds, and the Politics of Music Making*, ed. Daniel Fishlin and Ajay Heble (Montreal, QC: Black Rose Books, 2003), 235.

¹⁵³ Heble, "Take Two/Rebel Musics: Human Rights," 235. Emphasis in original text.

¹⁵⁴ Jerome L. Rodnitzky, "The Sixties between the Microgrooves: Using Folk And Protest Music to Understand American History, 1963-1973," *Popular Music and Society* 23, no. 4 (1999): 119-120.

possibility of change. Rebel musics, in other words, are more than symbols or ciphers for hope. They make hope a reality.

Whether labeled protest, rebellion, or resistance, these musics connect to politics and the possibility of social and political change for different reasons and in different ways.¹⁵⁵ Thus, what can be considered protest music is broad, contingent, and multifaceted. The understanding I utilize is that performances of these musics are spaces where people can imagine and act out alternative ways of being in the world. By providing these spaces, such performances become sources of insight. They offer insight into the dynamics of a phenomenon that, alongside spirituality, can contribute to hope, nonviolence, and a positive peace. I explicitly connect this contribution to spirituality in Chapter Five.

4.4.2 Rob Rosenthal and Richard Flacks' *Playing for Change: Music and Musicians in the Service of Social Movements*

Below, I discuss two themes. They are movement musicking as process and musical performance as the creation of 'free space.' Where pertinent, I will draw on the work of other scholars in my examination of the second theme.

Theme I: Movement Musicking as Process

Music has long accompanied political struggles the world over.¹⁵⁶ Despite this accompaniment, some people remain skeptical about a direct causal link between music

¹⁵⁵ See Ian Peddie, ed., *Music and Protest* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2012).

¹⁵⁶ Rosenthal and Flacks, *Playing for Change*, 5.

socio-political changes.¹⁵⁷ This skepticism can be addressed by inquiring into the conditions under which music contributes to such transformations.¹⁵⁸

One important context for this contribution is social movements.¹⁵⁹ Social movements can be understood as ‘cultural laboratories’ in which music is used to construct meaning and mobilize participants for action.¹⁶⁰ These movements are not monolithic or static, however. They represent a synthesis of different communities, contexts, issues, and strategies.¹⁶¹ Given this synthesis, a need arises to “recognize that different musics and different approaches are more and less useful in different times and different stages of a movement, as well as to different individuals with their variety of relations to a movement (activist, participant, potential participant, opponent, etc.).”¹⁶²

The term *musicking* is a starting point to explore music in social movements. Musicking implies a process of political becoming. By this I mean that the music is constituted as political through the meaning it is given and the uses to which it is put as part of particular social movements. Rosenthal and Flacks write:

Political music, for our purposes, is music that, first, engenders what C. Wright Mills called a “sociological imagination”: It helps musickers to see the *social* roots in what might otherwise be felt as *individual* stories or problems. It identifies collective and structural arrangements – who has power? who does the work? who gets the payoff? who decides? – as the origin of much of what is usually felt to be one’s personal situation. But further, political implies, suggests, or openly states that existing arrangements are not natural, normal, or eternal, but the result of previous human decisions and arrangements, *and thus susceptible to change*, especially if those in a similar position band together to oppose those arrangements. And musicking is also

¹⁵⁷ Rosenthal and Flacks, *Playing for Change*, 143.

¹⁵⁸ Rosenthal and Flacks, *Playing for Change*, 7-8.

¹⁵⁹ The idea that social movements can act as a context for music originated with Eyerman and Jamison in *Music and Social Movements*. Rosenthal and Flacks draw on this work throughout their analysis.

¹⁶⁰ Rosenthal and Flacks, *Playing for Change*, 230.

¹⁶¹ See Hank Johnston, ed., *Culture, Social Movements, and Protest* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2009).

¹⁶² Rosenthal and Flacks, *Playing for Change*, 248.

political if it helps achieve the tasks necessary for mobilizing such opposition, whether or not it helped spark the original ideas behind that opposition.¹⁶³

Another way to interpret this statement is that movement musicking becomes political when it is used to imagine and act out alternatives, whether at the levels of meaning, mobilization, or both. The idea that music becomes, constructs, or helps – that it is a verb in Small’s understanding – echoes the assertion that music is not just a symbol or cipher. In the context of social movements, musicking both forms and informs the conditions and ways in which activists seek to effect social and political change.

For example, singing was not just a symbol for the injustices of living in segregationist states in the musicking of the Civil Rights movement. Rather, this act was integral to the ways in which activists became political. It was part of a process of imagination, mobilization, and action. Kerran Sanger observes: “Singing was a part of virtually every gathering and, when activists were not singing, they seem often to have been talking about song.”¹⁶⁴ Singing kept activists’ spirits high. It enabled them to catalogue the principal targets of demonstrations and to refute narratives of the African American community’s inhumanity.¹⁶⁵

Similarly, singing was integral to movement musicking that contributed to the end of the Soviet occupation of Estonia in the late 1980s and early 1990s.¹⁶⁶ Drawing on a tradition of choral festivals, Estonians used collective singing as a nonviolent

¹⁶³ Rosenthal and Flacks, *Playing for Change*, 20.

¹⁶⁴ Kerran L. Sanger, “Functions of Freedom Singing in the Civil Rights Movement: The Activists’ Implicit Rhetorical Theory,” *Howard Journal of Communications* 8, no. 2 (1997): 181.

¹⁶⁵ See Clyde R. Appleton, “Singing in the Streets of Raleigh, 1963: Some Recollections,” *The Black Perspective in Music* 3, no. 3 (Autumn, 1963): 243-252; Bernice Johnson Reagon, “Let the Church Sing ‘Freedom,’” *Black Music Research Journal* 7 (1987): 105-118.

¹⁶⁶ James Tusty and Maureen Tusty, *The Singing Revolution*, DVD (New York, NY: Sky Films Incorporated, 2008).

strategy to mobilize and sustain their dreams for a democratic country. Singing made this dream a reality by constituting spaces for social imagination. An alternative Estonia could be experienced, if only for the duration of a festival, a concert, or a song. This resonates with the ways collective singing made Martin Luther King, Jr.'s beloved community present as part of the Civil Rights movement.

The idea that movement musicking is a process also suggests that political meanings and uses cannot be determined solely by lyrics or the intentions of an artist.¹⁶⁷ Attention should also be paid to musical form and to audience reception.¹⁶⁸ Musical forms can refer to melody, harmony, and rhythm; to instruments and how they are played; or to the sound of the human voice.¹⁶⁹ Political messages can be conveyed through musical form as much as through lyrics.

By adapting music as part of their socio-political imaginings and mobilizations, those participating in social movements are not just passive receivers.¹⁷⁰ They are performers who are creating meaning and possibilities at every moment. For example, music is used to educate people about the issues, to choose and implement viable strategies, and recruit outsiders to the movement.¹⁷¹ Movement musicking, in this understanding, does not happen randomly. It involves not only interactions between contexts, ideas, and people but also sound.¹⁷²

¹⁶⁷ Rosenthal and Flacks, *Playing for Change*, 20-21.

¹⁶⁸ Rosenthal and Flacks, *Playing for Change*, 14.

¹⁶⁹ Rosenthal and Flacks, *Playing for Change*, 51-63.

¹⁷⁰ Rosenthal and Flacks, *Playing for Change*, 91-101.

¹⁷¹ See Rob Rosenthal, "Serving the Movement: The Role(s) of Music," *Popular Music and Society* 25, no. 3 (2001): 11-24.

¹⁷² Rosenthal and Flacks, *Playing for Change*, 208.

Given the complexity and multiplicity of these interactions, I turn to the idea that musical performances create ‘free space.’ This term refers to both the internal and external spaces constituted in particular performances.¹⁷³ In these spaces, musicking forms and informs people’s capacities to imagine and act out alternative ways of being in the world.

Theme II: Musical Performance as Free Space

Free space can be characterized as encouraging experiences of autonomy, empowerment, and possibility.¹⁷⁴ These experiences are important because they shape people’s capacities to imagine and to act. The point I wish to re-emphasize is that these experiences are a constellation of physical, social, and sonic dynamics.¹⁷⁵

By interacting with others and using their bodies to musick, those participating in musical performances can create a “utopian prefiguration.”¹⁷⁶ A utopian prefiguration is a model or template that disrupts assumptions about how the world is or ought to be.¹⁷⁷ In the United States, Woodstock is an iconic example.

As noted in a previous section, this musical event provided an alternative model of community; a community based on the potential of love, peace, and understanding. This model not only impacted on those who attended the concert but also on those who continue to create free space by listening to and sharing the music. A song that comes to mind is Joni Mitchell’s “Woodstock.” In the song, Mitchell recounts the ways in which

¹⁷³ Rosenthal and Flacks, *Playing for Change*, 115-116.

¹⁷⁴ Ray Pratt, *Rhythm and Resistance: The Political Uses of American Popular Music* (Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1994).

¹⁷⁵ Pratt, *Rhythm and Resistance*, 21-43.

¹⁷⁶ Pratt, *Rhythm and Resistance*, 36-37.

¹⁷⁷ Pratt, *Rhythm and Resistance*, 37-40.

thousands of people came together at the Fair to disrupt assumptions about being young and at war in 1969.¹⁷⁸

In terms of movement musicking, the idea that performances can help to demarcate both external and internal free space is important. By listening to and sharing their individual or personal musicking, activists often carry their experiences of autonomy, empowerment, and possibility into the routines of daily life.¹⁷⁹ When this happens, the impact of music can be said to lie in its synthesis of disparate spheres of life.¹⁸⁰ Rosenthal and Flacks state:

The private enjoyment of music can create an inner space where external freedom, otherwise limited, can be imagined. This process is reciprocal: Movements, once established, create spaces...in which culture can flourish, engendering, as one result, free inner space.¹⁸¹

In a sense, the creation of free space – whether through listening, performing, or sharing music – is always a performance. The adaptability and portability of these diverse performances is one reason why movement musicking is a vital resource for social and political activism.¹⁸² People can use their musicking to create free spaces anywhere at anytime using a guitar, an iPod, or the human voice.

These ideas are evoked in discussions of musical performance as a “temporary autonomous zone.”¹⁸³ Similar to the concept of free space, this zone is somewhere

¹⁷⁸ James S. Perone, *Music of the Counterculture Era* (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 2004), 134-135. For a discussion of the ambiguity, complexity, and multiplicity of protest music from this period, see Terry H. Anderson, “American Popular Music and the War in Vietnam,” *Peace and Change* 11 (July 1986): 51-65; Kenneth J. Bindas and Craig Houston, “‘Takin’ Care of Business’: Rock Music, Vietnam and the Protest Myth,” *The Historian* 52 (November 1989): 1-23.

¹⁷⁹ Rosenthal and Flacks, *Playing for Change*, 127.

¹⁸⁰ Rosenthal and Flacks, *Playing for Change*, 179.

¹⁸¹ Rosenthal and Flacks, *Playing for Change*, 117.

¹⁸² Rosenthal and Flacks, *Playing for Change*, 9-10.

¹⁸³ Robin Ballinger, “Sounds of Resistance,” in *Sounding Off! Music as Subversion/Resistance/Revolution*, ed. Ron Salkosky and Fred Wei-Han Ho (Brooklyn, NY:

people can imagine and live out alternative ways of being in the world.¹⁸⁴ In the temporary autonomous zone, music is not just passively listened too. It acts as a counter hegemonic device that works on the mind and body through particular dynamics such as rhythm.¹⁸⁵

By acting on the mind and the body, the music creates both internal and external temporary autonomous zones. These zones are an opportunity to engage with protest as a creative process.¹⁸⁶ This process is dangerous because it is “something pleasurable that everyone can participate in and create their own bit of magic outside the loop of production and consumption.”¹⁸⁷ When people get creative, they often use their capacities to imagine and to act. In doing so, they create spaces for alternatives. The alternatives are understood as present and viable, even if only for the length of a performance.

In the example that follows, I substantiate the claims made about protest music performances in the preceding sections. The first claim is the need to take account of the ambiguity, complexity, and multiplicity of protest music performances. The second claim is that these characteristics require an adequate approach. In my research, this translated into an approach based on creativity, interdisciplinarity, and music literacy. Finally, I have suggested that protest music performances are sources of insight and

Autonomea, 1995): 1-26. The concept of the ‘temporary autonomous zone’ originated in the work of poet and essayist Peter Lamborn Wilson whose pseudonym is Hakim Bey. See Hakim Bey, *The Temporary Autonomous Zone; Ontological Anarchy; Poetic Terrorism* (Charleston, SC: Bibliobazaar, 2007); Simon Sellars, “Hakim Bey: Repopulating the Temporary Autonomous Zone,” *Journal for the Study of Radicalism* 4, no. 2 (Fall 2010): 83-108.

¹⁸⁴ Ballinger, “Sounds of Resistance,” 22.

¹⁸⁵ Ballinger, “Sounds of Resistance,” 23.

¹⁸⁶ Ballinger, “Sounds of Resistance,” 25.

¹⁸⁷ Ballinger, “Sounds of Resistance,” 25.

hope because they create spaces in which to disrupt assumptions. In the context of the ‘war on terror,’ a particular assumption was both affirmed and disrupted by popular musicians. This was that violence is a legitimate way of bringing about a more just and peaceful world.

4.4.3 In-Depth Example: Protest Music Performances in the Context of the ‘War on Terror’

This in-depth example is divided into two sections. The first section examines some of the factors that lead to the use of protest music performances as contesting space in the context of the ‘war on terror.’ These factors include the relationship between militarism and popular culture in the United States and the stories and spaces that emerged in response to the September 11, 2001 attacks, and later the wars in Afghanistan and Iraq. The second section is an analysis of select performances of protest music.

4.4.4 Contextualizing Protest Music Performances

The first theme I discuss is the relationship between American militarism and popular culture in the context of the ‘war on terror.’ Points from Geoff Martin and Erin Steuter’s book *Pop Culture Goes to War: Enlisting and Resisting Militarism in the War on Terror* are the centerpiece of this discussion.¹⁸⁸ Their study provides a succinct introduction to a culture of militarization that has been explored at length elsewhere.¹⁸⁹

¹⁸⁸ Geoff Martin and Erin Steuter, *Pop Culture Goes to War: Enlisting and Resisting Militarism in the War on Terror* (Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2010).

¹⁸⁹ See for example, Catherine Lutz, “Making War at Home in the United States: Militarization and the Current Crisis,” *American Anthropologist* 104, no. 3 (2002): 723-735; Henry A. Giroux, “The Emergence of Authoritarianism in the United States: Political Culture under the Bush/Cheney Administration,” *Symploke* 14, no. 1-2 (2006): 98-151.

Theme I: Militarism and Popular Culture in the ‘War on Terror’

Militarism can be defined as “an approach to the world in which global problems are defined primarily as military problems, where the first response of political leadership, and a segment of the population, is the resort to force, and where the pride of place in American life is given to the military and a culture of violence.”¹⁹⁰ One of the goals of Martin and Steuter’s book is to highlight the ways in which the conditions of militarism permeate American society. In discussing this permeation, a variety of popular cultural forms (comics, movies, music, toys, etc.) are pinpointed as tools with which to reinforce or resist these conditions.¹⁹¹ Thus, a principal insight that arises from their study, and which I have alluded to in this chapter, is that popular culture is ambiguous and cannot be adequately understood without a sense of its negative impacts.

Although examples of popular culture supporting and/or resisting other wars are provided, the focus of *Pop Culture Goes to War* is the ‘war on terror.’¹⁹² In the context of this war, popular cultural forms have been used to legitimize the idea that violence is the best and most effective response to terror. For example, the television series *24* is discussed because the main character, United States counter-terrorist agent Jack Bauer, used torture to extract terror-related information.¹⁹³ Martin and Steuter observe: “Jack Bauer represents a growing movement that supports a new definition of patriotism, following the motto “whatever it takes” to preserve the safety of the United States.”¹⁹⁴

¹⁹⁰ Martin and Steuter, *Pop Culture Goes to War*, 4.

¹⁹¹ Martin and Steuter, *Pop Culture Goes to War*, 4.

¹⁹² Martin and Steuter, *Pop Culture Goes to War*, 52-64.

¹⁹³ Martin and Steuter, *Pop Culture Goes to War*, 129-131.

¹⁹⁴ Martin and Steuter, *Pop Culture Goes to War*, 130.

The series 24 is the subject of other research connecting this understanding of patriotism to the legitimizing of violence in the ‘war on terror.’¹⁹⁵

A connection between patriotism and a motto of “whatever it takes” was part of a highly charged political and social context that emerged in the aftermath of September 11.¹⁹⁶ The context was considered charged for several reasons.¹⁹⁷ One of these reasons was the silencing of any criticism and/or dissent against the ‘war on terror.’¹⁹⁸ As mentioned in a previous chapter, the patriotism of country-pop trio, the Dixie Chicks, was called into question when lead singer Natalie Maines stated she was ashamed former President Bush was from Texas.¹⁹⁹ Maines’ statements led to the destruction of the trio’s CDs, blacklisting on radio stations, and threats of violence against their persons.²⁰⁰ These consequences can be understood as a narrowing of the Chicks’ space to vocalize their critiques and dissent against violence and war.

I say more about this narrowing of space in a following section. Here, I wish to make two points. The first is the importance of identifying and inquiring into spaces narrowed through particular conceptions of patriotism and violence.²⁰¹ Second, this identification and inquiry is complemented by an examination of the ways in which

¹⁹⁵ See Matthew B. Hill, “Tom Clancy, 24, and the Language of Autocracy,” in *The War on Terror and American Popular Culture: September 11 and Beyond*, ed. Andrew Schopp and Matthew B. Hill (Madison, WI: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 2009): 127-148. Also see Brady, *Performance, Politics, and the War on Terror*, 110-123.

¹⁹⁶ Martin and Steuter, *Pop Culture Goes to War*, 125-126.

¹⁹⁷ Henry A. Giroux, “War on Terror: The Militarizing of Public Space and Culture in the United States,” *Third Text* 18, no. 4 (2004): 211-212.

¹⁹⁸ Martin and Steuter, *Pop Culture Goes to War*, 125-126.

¹⁹⁹ See Gabriel Rossman, “Elites, Masses, and Media Blacklists: The Dixie Chicks Controversy,” *Social Forces* 83, no. 1 (September 2004): 61-79; Jada Watson and Lori Burns, “Resisting Exile and Asserting Musical Voice: The Dixie Chicks are ‘Not Ready to Make Nice,’” *Popular Music* 29, no.3 (2010): 325-350.

²⁰⁰ Martin and Steuter, *Pop Culture Goes to War*, 125-126.

²⁰¹ See Patrice Petro and Andrew Martin, introduction to *Rethinking Global Security: Media, Popular Culture, and the War on Terror* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 2006): 1-12.

people resist the conditions of militarism in their society.²⁰² In the case of the United States, this two-part analysis reveals the fragility of these conditions.²⁰³ Militarism can only be sustained as long as people believe that there are no alternatives.²⁰⁴ When alternatives are presented, such as in spiritually-motivated peace activism and performances of protest music, violence, war, and terror are no longer perceived as the only legitimate options. Addressing the conditions of militarism alongside the ways people justify and/or resist them provides a more complete picture of where, why, and how alternatives can be imagined and built.

In terms of popular music culture, continuity and discontinuity exist in its use as a focal point for alternatives in previous wars and the ‘war on terror.’²⁰⁵ For example, popular music culture has changed since the 1960s and early 1970s, the perceived heyday of protest music.²⁰⁶ One difference is that popular music culture in the 1960s and 1970s was more broadly shared among people.²⁰⁷ It was more monolithic and saturated. Today, this culture is characterized by diffusion and diversity. “We now live in a world,” Martin and Steuter write, “in which people can inform, or misinform, themselves without ever buying a newspaper or watching broadcast television or listening to the radio.”²⁰⁸ In the ‘war on terror,’ the Internet became a focal point of

²⁰² Martin and Steuter, *Pop Culture Goes to War*, 13.

²⁰³ Martin and Steuter, *Pop Culture Goes to War*, 113.

²⁰⁴ Martin and Steuter, *Pop Culture Goes to War*, 227.

²⁰⁵ For more on the relationship between popular culture and the ‘war on terror,’ see David Holloway, *Cultures of the War on Terror: Empire, Ideology, and the Remaking of 9/11* (Montreal, QC: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2008).

²⁰⁶ Martin and Steuter, *Pop Culture Goes to War*, 168-173.

²⁰⁷ Martin and Steuter, *Pop Culture Goes to War*, 169.

²⁰⁸ Martin and Steuter, *Pop Culture Goes to War*, 169.

artistic critique and dissent.²⁰⁹ In the context of the 1960s and early 1970s, mainstream radio is understood as having provided this space.²¹⁰

In the next section, I continue to explore the ways popular music was used as a response to September 11 and the ‘war on terror.’ These responses emerged from a range of genres and musicians who adamantly supported or opposed the former Bush administration’s policies. The crux of this exploration is that, in the aftermath of September 11, people had choices about how to respond.²¹¹ Some chose to call for retribution and revenge, others offered pleas for peace. The point is that there were alternatives to violence, war, and terror at this time and there continue to be alternatives more than a decade after the initial attacks and the launch of the ‘war on terror.’

Theme II: Stories and Spaces in the Aftermath of Terror

September 11 has been described as an attack on the very idea of America.²¹² The tragic events were an assault not only on people and physical sites but also on the psyche of the country. Within this psyche, however, the ideas and principles that constitute perceptions of what America stands for are contested.²¹³ The term ‘contested’ signals that there are diverse ways to imagine and to be American. Musical responses to the attacks reflected this diversity.

²⁰⁹ Reebee Garofalo, “Popular and Protest Music Post-9/11: The Music Industry Makes it Hard to Resist,” *Resist* 15, no. 4 (July/August 2006), under <http://www.resistinc.org/newsletter/articles/popular-and-protest-music-post-9/11> (accessed August 29, 2012).

²¹⁰ For more on protest music during the Vietnam War, see Richard A. Lee, “Protest Music as Alternative Media During the Vietnam War Era,” in *War and the Media: Essays on News Reporting, Propaganda and Popular Culture*, ed. Paul M. Hadriakis, Barbara S. Hugenberg, and Stanley T. Wearden (Jefferson, NC: McFarland & Company, Inc., 2009): 24-40.

²¹¹ Martin and Steuter, *Pop Culture Goes to War*, 122.

²¹² Martin Cloonan, “Musical Responses to September 11th: From Conservative Patriotism to Radicalism,” *Beitrag Zur Populärmusikforschung* 32 (2004): 11, under http://geb.uni-giessen.de/geb/volltexte/2010/7541/pdf/Populärmusik_32_S11_32.pdf (accessed August 29, 2012).

²¹³ Cloonan, “Musical Responses,” 11.

Like most people in the United States, popular musicians attempted to “wring meaning from the ashes” of September 11.²¹⁴ Their music contributed, therefore, to competing stories not only about what the country stood for but also about how to respond to the attacks. Describing these stories, Kate McCarthy writes:

In the struggle to make sense of these events, several rhetorical frameworks competed for national consensus in the first months following 9/11. Was this an act of war akin to Pearl Harbor, to which the language of national unity and defense was appropriate? Was it a criminal act requiring cool-headed investigation and legal prosecution? Was it the consequence of years of foreign policy errors calling for national reflection and reassessment? Or was it the opening salvo in a religious war to which only the language of crusades and divine purpose could speak?²¹⁵

For some musicians, the most suitable response was to leave aside questions of politics and war and to focus on helping the nation mourn and reflect. With this focus, these musicians contributed to stories of healing and spaces of hope. Their understanding of popular music echoed an account of music as “a connective tissue in human interaction and a medium which makes clearer our shared humanity.”²¹⁶ One of the musicians was Bruce Springsteen.

Springsteen is an icon of American popular music. He is loved for the ways in which he imagines and enacts what is perceived to be everyday American experiences

²¹⁴ Bryan Garman, “Models of Charity and Spirit: Bruce Springsteen, 9/11, and the War on Terror,” in *Music in a Post-9/11 World*, ed. Jonathan Ritter and J. Martin Daughtry (New York, NY: Routledge, 2007), 72.

²¹⁵ Kate McCarthy, “Deliver Me from Nowhere: Bruce Springsteen and the Myth of the American Promised Land,” in *God in the Details: American Religion in Popular Culture*, ed. Eric Michael Masur and Kate McCarthy, 2nd ed. (New York, NY: Routledge, 2011), 30.

²¹⁶ Gage Averill, “Responses to Musical Perspectives on September 11: A Roundtable on Music, Community, Politics, and Violence,” *Echo: A Music-Centered Journal* 3, no. 2 (Fall 2001), under <http://www.echo.ucla.edu/volume3-issue2/Sept11-roundtable/Sept11.pdf> (accessed October 20, 2008).

and values.²¹⁷ His 2002 album *The Rising* is described as providing the American public with an opportunity to listen and to heal in the aftermath of September 11.²¹⁸

Theme II Continued: Stories of Healing, Spaces of Hope

The Rising and other albums such as the Beastie Boys' 2004 *To the Five Boroughs* helped audiences and listeners engage with their ideas of America and to reflect on the ongoing issues they faced, as individuals and as a nation.²¹⁹ In providing such opportunities, these albums can be understood as contributing to stories of healing and spaces of hope at this time. The album format is considered better suited for this contribution than a particular song.²²⁰ This is because an album provides listeners with numerous points of emotional and experiential identification.

In the case of *The Rising*, the listener is invited to identify with the human side of loss by articulating the stories of firefighters, rescue workers, and families directly touched by September 11.²²¹ Christine Gengaro writes: "In *The Rising*, the songs speak to the concrete things of everyday life, "shirts in the closet/shoes in the hall," but they also draw on metaphor, and the dominant metaphor is rising, whether it is the rising smoke of the towers or the fire fighter rising up the stairwell or a spirit lifting out of despair."²²² The style of the album, said to be an interweaving of the blues and gospel,

²¹⁷ See Adam Lifshey, "The Borderlands Poetics of Bruce Springsteen," *Journal of the Society for American Music* 3, no. 2 (2009): 221-241; David Thurmaier, "The Country We Carry in Our Hearts is Waiting": Bruce Springsteen, Franklin Delano Roosevelt, and the Search for Human Rights in America," in *Popular Music and Human Rights: British and American Music*, ed. Ian Peddie, vol. 1 (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2011), 143-155.

²¹⁸ Bradford L. Yates, "Healing a Nation: An Analysis of Bruce Springsteen's *The Rising*," *Journal of Popular Music Studies* 22, no.1 (2010): 47, 34.

²¹⁹ Christine Lee Gengaro, "Requiems for a City: Popular Music's Response to 9/11," *Popular Music and Society* 32, no. 1 (February 2009): 26-36.

²²⁰ Gengaro, "Requiems for a City," 26, 33-34.

²²¹ Gengaro, "Requiems for a City," 29-30.

²²² Gengaro, "Requiems for a City," 31.

sonically expands this metaphor by giving voice to the possibility of rising from grief to hope.²²³

These characterizations of *The Rising* were born out in performance. For example, Springsteen's performance on "America – A Tribute to Heroes," a telethon organized to raise funds for victims of September 11 and their families, is said to have evoked feelings of reverence, comfort, grief, and hope.²²⁴ His performance has also been described as contributing to an image of a stable and unified American community.²²⁵ This image was built sonically and visually through a number of imaginative and performative dynamics including the presence of background singers and the "dusky-blue background, broken by golden vertical streaks" of light.²²⁶

The therapeutic impact of Springsteen's performances continued in the months and years after September 11. Describing the impact, Bryan Garman notes:

In the context of 'Tribute to Heroes,' the acoustic arrangement of 'My City of Ruins' is both reverent and comforting. When Springsteen has something to say, he frequently reaches for the acoustic guitar and harmonica, tools of the trade that invoke the populist morality of Woody Guthrie and Bob Dylan. The music is spare, but in the chorus, the musical history that would be amplified in the studio version of the song is already discernible. In the opening chords, Springsteen evokes the melody and vocal harmonies of 'The Weight,' a legendary song recorded by The Band, the roots rock-and-roll group that first earned its fame by backing Dylan...In 'My City of Ruins,' Springsteen seemed similarly willing to bear the burden of grief. His grim facial expressions and the solemn glance skyward that comes near the end of the performance broadcast an image of both anguish and a shaken faith. And if the bluesy guitar from the album version of 'My City of Ruins' and the soulful saxophone solo featured on the *Live in Barcelona* concert video are not yet audible, the sacred sounds of African-American gospel already resonate here.²²⁷

²²³ Gengaro, "Requiems for a City," 31.

²²⁴ Garman, "Models of Charity and Spirit," 78-79.

²²⁵ Kip Pegley and Susan Fast, "America: A Tribute to Heroes": Music, Mourning, and the Unified American Community," in *Music in the Post-9/11 World*, ed. Jonathan Ritter and J. Martin Daughtry (New York, NY: Routledge, 2007), 27-42.

²²⁶ Pegley and Fast, "America: A Tribute to Heroes," 34-35.

²²⁷ Garman, "Models of Charity and Spirit," 78-79.

These statements underscore that several dynamics contribute to the meaning of particular performances. This can include the instrumentation, the musician's facial expressions and gestures, as well as the cultural and musical histories that are evoked.

For some, these and other Springsteen performances were visionary acts because they departed from the "jingoistic rhetoric" articulated both by former President Bush and other popular musicians at this time.²²⁸ Here the adjective 'jingoistic' can be understood as referring to an antagonistic patriotism detected in some pro-war stances.²²⁹ These stances often framed September 11 as an act of war, which legitimized the use of violence as a response to the attacks and as part of the 'war on terror.'²³⁰ In contrast to this jingoism, Springsteen's album and performances envisioned and enacted an America characterized by compassion and tolerance despite the devastating loss of life.²³¹

In portraying loss, *The Rising* and Springsteen's performances exemplified the idea that music can act as a 'connective tissue.' The connectivity exposed was that violence disrupts and permeates people's everyday lives. Human life is vulnerable to this disruption and permeation, whether in the United States, Afghanistan, or Iraq. As one music critic commented:

²²⁸ Garman, "Models of Charity and Spirit," 72.

²²⁹ For a discussion of former President Bush's jingoistic performance, see Sara Brady, *Performance, Politics, and the War on Terror: "Whatever it Takes"* (New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2012), 1-32.

²³⁰ Garman, "Models of Charity and Spirit," 81. It is important here to acknowledge, as Garman notes, that Springsteen initially supported the Bush administration's invasion of Afghanistan. Like other artists, Springsteen's opinions on the 'war on terror' evolved. By 2004, he was headlining the "Vote for Change Tour," which supported Democratic candidate John Kerry's campaign for President. See Garman, "Models of Charity and Spirit," 76, 83-86. For a comprehensive discussion of Springsteen's work and how it relates to American identity, see Kenneth Womack, Jerome J. Zolten, and Mark Bernhard, *Springsteen, Cultural Studies and the Runaway American Dream* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2012).

²³¹ Garman, "Models of Charity and Spirit," 77-78.

With his new album, *The Rising*, Springsteen wades into the wreckage and pain of that horrendous event and emerges bearing fifteen songs that genuflect with enormous grace before sorrows that drift in its wake. The small miracle of his accomplishment is that at no point does he give vent to the anger felt by so many Americans: the hunger for revenge. The music is often fierce in its execution, but in essence it is a requiem for those who perished in that sudden inferno, and those who died saving them.²³²

In the next section, I discuss songs and performances of musicians who vented anger and revenge. By voicing these emotions, the musicians discussed contributed to stories about dangerous others. These stories helped to create spaces in which the former Bush administration's justifications for going to war were presented and condoned.

Theme II Continued: Stories of Danger, Spaces of War

Popular musicians from a number of genres supported former President Bush's decision to invade Afghanistan, and later Iraq, as part of the 'war on terror.'²³³ Country musicians have been discussed at length as backing these decisions.²³⁴ Thus, in the songs and performances of certain country artists, violence and war were portrayed as a deeply patriotic response to September 11.

²³² Kurt Loder, "Recordings – Gimme Shelter: Springsteen Searches for Love and Faith in the Ruins," *Rolling Stone* 903 (August 22, 2002): 81-82.

²³³ Garofalo, "Pop Goes to War," 11; Cloonan, "Musical Responses," 28. For more on Rap music's critique of former President Bush's rhetoric and policy decisions, see Katy Khan, "'Sonic Jihad': Black Popular Music and the Renegotiation of Muslim Identities in Post-9/11," *Muziki* 4, no. 2 (2007): 200-208; Paul Williams, "I Could Smell the Dawn of Armageddon When this Dick was Elected": Hip-Hop's Oppositional Voices in the War on Terror," in *The War on Terror and American Popular Culture: September 11 and Beyond*, ed. Andrew Schopp and Matthew B. Hill (Madison, WI: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 2009), 222-238.

²³⁴ See Andrew Boulton, "The Popular Geopolitical Wor(l)ds of Post-9/11 Country Music," *Popular Music and Society* 31, no. 3 (July 2008): 373-387; William Hart, "The Country Connection: Country Music, 9/11, and the War on Terrorism," in *The Selling of 9/11: How a Tragedy Became a Commodity*, ed. Dana Heller (New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2005), 155-173; Randy Rudder, "In Whose Name? Country Artists Speak Out on Gulf War II," in *Country Music Goes to War*, ed. Charles K. Wolfe and James E. Akenson (Lexington, KY: University Press of Kentucky, 2005), 208-226; Peter J. Schmelz, "Have You Forgotten?": Darryl Worley and the Musical Politics of Operation Iraqi Freedom," in *Music in the Post-9/11 World*, ed. Jonathan Ritter and J. Martin Daughtry (New York, NY: Routledge, 2007), 123-154.

This is not to suggest that all artists with ties to country music held these views. Steve Earle, for instance, composed a song about John Walker Lindh, an American who joined the Taliban and was captured in Afghanistan in late 2002.²³⁵ Earle's attempt at reflecting on why an American youth would join the Taliban sparked controversy.²³⁶ His crime was humanizing the 'enemy' at a time when the country was at war. Alongside Springsteen, Earle's response to September 11 and the 'war on terror' have been labeled a 'liberal patriotism.' Liberal patriotism comprised responses that sought to understand the issues and defend an America with the capacity for critical reflection and debate.²³⁷

In contrast, the country musicians who supported the former President and his administration imagined and defended a different perception of the United States. Toby Keith, for example, composed a song entitled "Courtesy of the Red, White and Blue (The Angry American)."²³⁸ Reebee Garofalo states that this song "captured the new, vengeful attitude more than any other song, with lyrics such as "We'll put a boot in your ass/It's the American Way."²³⁹ Released in late 2002, the song is said to have "applauded the move" of the former Bush administration to invade Afghanistan.²⁴⁰

The attitude of revenge embodied in this song contributed to several stories, including one referred to as "regions of danger."²⁴¹ In this narrative, territories, groups of individuals, and sets of values are defined against America, Americans, and American

²³⁵ Cloonan, "Musical Responses," 26.

²³⁶ Reebee Garofalo, *Rocking Out: Popular Music in the U.S.A.*, 5th ed. (Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall, 2011), 443.

²³⁷ Cloonan, "Musical Responses," 25-28.

²³⁸ Garofalo, *Rocking Out: Popular Music*, 441.

²³⁹ Garofalo, *Rocking Out: Popular Music*, 441.

²⁴⁰ Schmelz, "Have You Forgotten?," 124.

²⁴¹ Boulton, "The Popular Geopolitical Wor(l)ds," 377.

values. Territorially, homeland America is demarcated from distant terrorist regions such as Afghanistan. In terms of groups of individuals, the Taliban are defined as the enemy along with those who harbor and sympathize with terrorists. The American way is to take the fight to these distant lands and enemies in the name of democracy and freedom.²⁴²

These ideas are also evident in Darryl Worley's song "Have You Forgotten?" released in conjunction with the build up to military action in Iraq.²⁴³ Alongside warning Americans about dangerous others in distant places, this country artist questioned the patriotism of citizens who contested the war. Thus, the lyrics and tone of the aforementioned song have been described as an attempt to coerce listeners to abandon their antiwar views by assailing them with guilt.²⁴⁴ This guilt was reinforced by allusions to United States troops in Afghanistan: "I've been there with the soldiers/Who've gone away to war."²⁴⁵ The message was straightforward: supporting the former President, the war, and the troops is the American way.

Pro-war stances articulated in these and other country songs served to condense the complexity of the issues that led the former Bush administration to war in Afghanistan and Iraq.²⁴⁶ Worley's song has been characterized as seeking to allay any lingering doubts about the Iraq War.²⁴⁷ This allaying included a performance on February 15, 2003. Worley changed the words of his choruses in this performance, as

²⁴² Boulton, "The Popular Geopolitical Wor(l)ds," 377-378.

²⁴³ Schmelz, "Have You Forgotten?," 124.

²⁴⁴ Schmelz, "Have You Forgotten?," 127.

²⁴⁵ Schmelz, "Have You Forgotten?," 128.

²⁴⁶ Boulton, "The Popular Geopolitical Wor(l)ds," 378, 379, 384-385.

²⁴⁷ Schmelz, "Have You Forgotten?," 137.

Peter Schmelz observes.²⁴⁸ In contrast to the later studio version, the choruses end either with “And you say we shouldn’t worry ‘bout bin Laden” or “Don’t tell me to not worry about bin Laden.”²⁴⁹ The changes affirmed the tenuous link between Saddam Hussein, September 11, and Osama bin Laden put forward by the former President and his administration to justify the invasion of Iraq. One of these links was that Saddam Hussein was an ‘evil’ other who, like bin Laden, threatened the security of the United States.²⁵⁰ In the case of Hussein, the threat came from weapons of mass destruction that never materialized.

The stories of dangerous others exemplified in this country music contributed to spaces where violence and war were considered appropriate responses to September 11 and other perceived threats. They represent another example of the cultural loop that occurs in the production of violence discussed in Chapter Two.²⁵¹ Labels such as ‘unpatriotic,’ ‘stranger,’ or ‘dissident’ contribute to the sense that the individuals and communities so labeled are less than human. They are legitimate receivers of anger, vengeance, and violence. Thus, particular roles were constructed for listeners to embody in the examples of country music explored: the role of the patriotic American who supported his/her President and the military.²⁵² Alternative roles such as listeners supporting the troops while contesting the war or listeners contesting violence altogether appeared to be dismissed.²⁵³

²⁴⁸ Schmelz, “Have You Forgotten?” 130-131.

²⁴⁹ Schmelz, “Have You Forgotten?” 130-131.

²⁵⁰ See Chernus, *Monsters to Destroy*, 151-162.

²⁵¹ Chapter Two, 84.

²⁵² Boulton, “The Popular Geopolitical Wor(l)ds,” 383.

²⁵³ An example of such alternative roles includes the veterans who are antiwar protesters. See Brady, *Performance, Politics and the War on Terror*, 44-61.

In the next section, I discuss examples of popular musicians who challenged the stories and spaces that contributed to the legitimization of violence and war. Although these musicians offered critique and dissent, in doing so they encountered various forms of censorship. The Dixie Chicks are only one example. The censorship experienced impacted on the willingness of musicians to speak out against violence and war. As I explain below, these circumstances lead to debates about the effectiveness of critique and dissent, particularly in the shape of protest music, to act as an avenue to contest the ‘war on terror.’

Theme II Continued: Critique, Dissent, and Censorship in the Context of the ‘War on Terror’

In the immediate aftermath of September 11, people turned to music to “minister to their emotional (if not their intellectual needs).”²⁵⁴ Within five weeks of the attacks, the tone of popular music responses is said to have shifted from one of shock and grief to one of revenge and retribution.²⁵⁵ This tone, exemplified in the country music explored in the previous section, created what Garofalo calls a “new pop reality,” one in which patriotism was equated with standing in solidarity with the government.²⁵⁶ Those who questioned the government were treated as unpatriotic dissidents or in league with terrorists.²⁵⁷

In a political climate characterized by revenge and retribution, musical dissent and its spaces of contestation were dismissed not only as unpatriotic but also as

²⁵⁴ Garofalo, “Pop Goes to War,” 5.

²⁵⁵ Garofalo, “Pop Goes to War,” 8.

²⁵⁶ Garofalo, “Pop Goes to War,” 9

²⁵⁷ Howard Zinn, *Artists in Times of War* (New York, NY: Seven Stories Press, 2003).

irrelevant.²⁵⁸ For many, this dismissal raised the specter of censorship. Although no cases of censorship occurred in the sense of “a legally sanctioned public ban,” musicians did experience restrictions on their abilities and opportunities to dissent.²⁵⁹

These experiences were impacted by the corporate monopolies that existed in the United States at the time of the attacks.²⁶⁰ For example, Clear Channel, one of the largest corporate owners of radio stations in the United States, possessed close to 1200 stations in September 2001.²⁶¹ Alongside reaching an estimated 110 million Americans through these stations, the company also had stakes in performance venues, concert promotion, and billboard advertisement.

This influence and reach was brought into the public eye when, in an attempt at restraint and sensitivity in the wake of September 11, a senior executive at the company sent out a list of songs with “questionable lyrics” to its stations.²⁶² Although some DJs ignored the list, some considered it is an example of the corporate censorship that occurred in the wake of the attacks.²⁶³ Martin Scherzinger and Stephen Smith write: “As the consolidated media industry chips away at sites of non-conformist musical activity, dissenting musical expressions within the established monopoly structures are

²⁵⁸ Lynskey, *33 Revolutions Per Minute*, 650.

²⁵⁹ Martin Scherzinger, “Double Voices of Musical Censorship After 9/11,” in *Music in the Post-9/11 World*, ed. Jonathan Ritter and J. Martin Daughtry (New York, NY: Routledge, 2007), 91-121.

²⁶⁰ Garofalo, “Pop Goes to War,” 13-17.

²⁶¹ Eric Nuzum, “Singing in the Echo Chamber: Music Censorship in the U.S. After September 11th,” *Freemuse: The World Forum on Music and Censorship*, Report 5 (2005): 25, under http://freemuse.synkron.com/graphics/Publications/PDF/Echo_chamber_web_version1-2.pdf (accessed October 20, 2012).

²⁶² Nuzum, “Singing in the Echo Chamber,” 26.

²⁶³ Martin Scherzinger and Stephen Smith, “From Blatant to Latent Protest (and Back Again): on the Politics of Theatrical Spectacle in Madonna’s ‘American Life,’” *Popular Music* 26, no. 2 (2007): 211-229.

increasingly compromised or maimed outright.”²⁶⁴ In the case of Iraq, this chipping away included Clear Channel stations sponsoring pro-military rallies and the blacklisting of musicians for their antiwar statements.²⁶⁵

It has been suggested that these instances of censorship alongside the “myopic jingoism” that permeated the United States at this time contributed to a chilling effect on critique and dissent.²⁶⁶ An atmosphere characterized by this chilling effect impacted on the willingness of musicians to compose and perform protest music. This atmosphere was exacerbated by the “echo chamber” of the media. Eric Nuzum explains:

Heated political discourse is everywhere in the American media, often enjoyed less as news and more as entertainment and sport. But instead of discussing issues in depth, these opinions tend to cycle through the same stories, quotes, and perspectives offered elsewhere. Often times, once a news story enters the mainstream media, it is repeated, practically verbatim, in thousands of news and information outlets. Analysts refer to this as the “echo chamber” of news media, where a report, once entering the national discourse, is repeated endlessly without any sense of the checks and balances normally applied to reporting.²⁶⁷

As has been noted, one of the echoes that resonated throughout the media in the early years of the ‘war on terror’ was that critique and dissent were unpatriotic. In spite of these echoes, protest music was composed and performed between the years 2001-2008. Particularly in the lead up to the Iraq War and as the war dragged on, the chilling effect on critique and dissent began to dissipate.²⁶⁸

For example, in the early months of 2003, musicians joined forces with activist organizations such as the Win Without War coalition to form the Musicians United to

²⁶⁴ Scherzinger and Smith, “From Blatant to Latent Protest (and Back Again),” 219.

²⁶⁵ Scherzinger, “Double Voices of Musical Censorship,” 99-105.

²⁶⁶ Eric Nuzum, “Crash into Me, Baby: America’s Implicit Music Censorship since 11 September,” in *Shoot the Singer: Music Censorship Today*, ed. Marie Korpe (London, UK: Zed Books 2004), 149, 156.

²⁶⁷ Nuzum, “Singing in the Echo Chamber,” 7-8.

²⁶⁸ Lynskey, *33 Revolutions Per Minute*, 667-680; Phull, *Story behind the Protest Song*, 249-261.

Win Without War.²⁶⁹ The coalition gave press conferences and signed petitions contesting the war in Iraq. In November of that year, Billy Bragg organized the “Tell the Truth Tour” featuring several musicians writing and performing protest music, including Steve Earle. Musicians from a number of genres also participated in voter registration drives, performing on tours that encouraged people to vote in the 2004 Presidential election. Two anti-Bush compilation albums were also produced at this time.²⁷⁰

Despite these activities, questions were raised in music magazines and other related media about the effectiveness of protest music to generate social and political change.²⁷¹ The debates concerned the use of music composed and performed during the social movements of the 1960s and early 1970s, in particular the anti-Vietnam War movement, as templates for evaluating contemporary protest music. As one commentator asked in the context of the ‘war on terror’: “Where has ‘Where Have All the Flowers Gone?’ Gone?”²⁷²

These debates have been explored in popular music scholarship. It has been suggested that seeking parallels between the music of the 1960s and early 1970s contributes to a misreading of protest music.²⁷³ Music from earlier eras should not be

²⁶⁹ Garofalo, “Pop Goes to War,” 22-24.

²⁷⁰ Garofalo, “Pop Goes to War,” 22-24; Lynskey, *33 Revolutions Per Minute*, 667-680; Phull, *Story behind the Protest Song*, 249-261.

²⁷¹ See for example David Hajdu, “Where has “Where Have all the Flowers?” Gone?,” *The New Republic* (June 28, 2004): 33-36; Jon Parales, “New Songs, Old Message: ‘No War,’” *The New York Times* (March 9, 2003): 1 (L) col 05 (50 col).

²⁷² Hajdu, “Where has “Where Have all the Flowers?” Gone?,” 33.

²⁷³ Conrad Amenta, “Why Protest Albums Can’t Teach Dissent: The Emergent Complexity of Post-9/11 Protest,” in *The Politics of Protest Music: Sound, Trauma, and the Music Industry in the Time of Terror*, ed. Joseph P. Fisher and Brian Flota (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2012), 57-68; Jeffrey Roessner, “That was Now, This Is Then: Recycling Sixties Style in Post-9/11 Music,” in *The Politics of Protest Music: Sound, Trauma, and the Music Industry in the Time of Terror*, ed. Joseph P. Fisher and Brian Flota

the only means of evaluating the effectiveness of its contemporary counterparts. One reason is that the circumstances and issues leading to war are often different. For example, one of the contentious issues during the Vietnam War was the draft.²⁷⁴ The issue mobilized many American youth to contest the war. Since the draft was abolished in the early 1970s, this was not a mobilizing issue in the ‘war on terror.’ Other differences between these wars include advances in technology and increasing levels of militarism in American society.²⁷⁵

Seeking parallels between musics that arise from particular contexts and which are concerned with specific issues can result in the perception that protest music is monolithic and static. As I have argued throughout this chapter, this perception is inadequate. In the United States, at least, the relevance of protest music and its performances did not end with Woodstock. Rather, protest songs go through cycles of relevance because they are often tied to the willingness of musicians to speak out on

(Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2012), 115-126; Deena Weinstein, “Rock Protest Songs: So Many and So Few,” in *The Resisting Music: Popular Music and Social Protest*, ed. Ian Peddie (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006), 3-16.

²⁷⁴ This is a point discussed in the documentary film, *CSNY/Déjà vu* that follows musicians David Crosby, Stephen Stills, Graham Nash and Neil Young on tour with Young’s 2006 protest album “Living With War.” David Crosby, Stephen Stills, Graham Nash and Neil Young, *CSNY: Déjà vu*, DVD (Toronto, ON: Maple Pictures, 2008). See also, A. Ben Auslander, “‘If Ya Wanna End War and Stuff You Gotta Sing Loud’ – A Survey of Vietnam-Related Protest Music,” *Journal of American Culture* 4 (Summer 1981): 108-113.

²⁷⁵ Samuel Dwinell, “Rock, Enroll: Music and Militarization since 9/11,” in *The Politics of Protest Music: Sound, Trauma, and the Music Industry in the Time of Terror*, ed. Joseph P. Fisher and Brian Flota (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2012), 13-26.

particular issues.²⁷⁶ These cycles are one reason the music continues to survive: it is diverse, elusive, and often champions local issues.²⁷⁷

The arguments discussed above explain my methodological preference to use contemporary protest music as the focal point of my research. Historical comparisons underscore that the use of music to promote social and political change is not new. One should be weary of idealizing a particular moment in popular music culture as the pinnacle of musical critique and dissent. The protest music written in response to the ‘war on terror’ is one example of the ways in which people turned to music to articulate and live out their ideas of a more just and peaceful world. Thus, I have chosen to refer to earlier examples of protest music only where they have been relevant.²⁷⁸

In the next section, I examine one artist who attempted to provide spaces for imagining and living out alternatives to violence and war. This artist is Neil Young. I discuss an album of protest songs that Young composed during the ‘war on terror’ and performances that addressed the realities of living with this war.²⁷⁹

4.4.3 Contesting Space: Neil Young’s “Living With War”

In this section, I analyze particular songs and performances associated with Young’s 2006 album “Living With War.” My analysis consists of three parts. First, I

²⁷⁶ Jerry Rodnitsky, “The Decline and Rebirth of Folk-Protest Music,” in *The Resisting Muse: Popular Music and Social Protest*, ed. Ian Peddie (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006), 17-29.

²⁷⁷ Rodnitsky, “The Decline and Rebirth of Folk-Protest Music,” 28. For more on these qualities of protest music, see Mark Pedelty and Desdmona T. Racheli, “Is the Political Troubadour Dead? Markets Versus Politics in Local Music,” *Journal of Popular Music Studies* 21, no. 3 (2009): 266-283.

²⁷⁸ Lynskey and Phull provide in-depth discussion of the 1960s and the music shaped by the cultural, political, and social contexts particular to that time. Also see, Dick Weissman, *Talkin’ ‘bout A Revolution: Music and Social Change in the United States* (New York, NY: Backbeat Books, 2010). For concurrent readings of protest music, see the works by Serge Denisoff and Jerome Rodnitsky cited in the bibliography.

²⁷⁹ Neil Young, *Living With War*, CD (Reprise Records: 2006), CDW 44335.

outline some of the reasons for choosing these songs and performances. Second, I explore the ways Young and, where relevant his band mates, created contesting space in their performances. Third, I discuss the insights that these spaces provided in the context of the ‘war on terror.’

Theme I: Justifications for Choosing “Living With War”

I have chosen Young’s album for several reasons. The first reason is in an effort to explore a contemporary example of protest music. As a solo artist and as part of bands such as Crosby, Stills and Nash, Young wrote iconic antiwar songs during the Vietnam War. One example is “Ohio,” written in response to the National Guard shooting of antiwar protesters on the campus of Kent State University.²⁸⁰ Examining his more recent songs and performances recognizes that as an artist and activist, Young is ambiguous, complex, and multiple.²⁸¹ The same traits characterize his music.

The second reason is his various musical engagements with September 11. These engagements include a performance of John Lennon’s “Imagine” as part of the “America: A Tribute to Heroes” telethon and his penning of the song “Let’s Roll” in honor of the passengers on Flight 93.²⁸² Young, as commenters have noted, initially endorsed the former Bush administration.²⁸³ Thus, his “Living With War” material is an

²⁸⁰ Lynskey, *33 Revolutions Per Minute*, 205-228; Phull, *Story behind the Protest Song*, 98-102.

²⁸¹ For more on Young as an artist and activist, see Neil Young, *Waging Heavy Peace* (New York, NY: Blue Rider Press, 2012).

²⁸² Garofalo, “Pop Goes to War,” 7, 11. Flight 93 was the fourth plane hijacked on September 11. The plane crashed into a field in Pennsylvania, killing all those on board.

²⁸³ Andrew Buncombe, “Neil Young sets his sights on Bush,” *The Independent* (Monday, April 17 2006), under <http://www.independent.co.uk/arts-entertainment/music/features/neil-yount-sets-his-sights-on-bush-474506.html?printService=print> (accessed October 13, 2012). Also see, Garofalo, “Pop Goes to War,” 11.

example of the cycles and layers that characterize protest music and those who chose to speak out against or for particular issues at particular times.

The third reason for my choice is the description of the album as a full-length protest against the former Bush administration, particularly the war in Iraq.²⁸⁴

According to several sources, the songs were composed and recorded in a few days.²⁸⁵

The speed with which this occurred suggests that Young felt an urgency to release his message to the American public.

Finally, for practical purposes, several versions of the album are available.²⁸⁶

One of these versions, titled “Living With War: In the Beginning,” is said to embody the “essence” of Young’s protest.²⁸⁷ It consists of the original, unedited mixes of songs from the album. A DVD of the studio recording sessions of these mixes accompanies the CD.

Listening to the different recordings emphasizes the fact that protest music performances are ephemeral and evolving. Each performance is shaped by a unique set of dynamics. Together, different recordings provide texture to an analysis. By texture, I mean an adequate understanding of the constellation of dynamics and factors that create contesting space in particular performances. A documentary of the “Freedom of Speech

²⁸⁴ Ken Bielen, *The Words and Music of Neil Young* (Westport: Praeger, 2008), 108.

²⁸⁵ David Frick, “Review: New CDs – Comes a Time: Neil Young – “Living with War,” *Rolling Stone* (May 18, 2006-June 1, 2006): 226. Fricke writes that the album was recorded in six days.

²⁸⁶ Young, *Living With War*; Neil Young, *Living With War: In the Beginning*, CD (Reprise Records: 2006) CDW 43265.

²⁸⁷ Neil Young, “Living With War: In the Beginning – Liner Notes” (Reprise Records: 2006) CDW 43265.

Tour,” which Young undertook with his former band mates David Crosby, Stephen Stills, and Graham Nash was also used as part of my analysis.²⁸⁸

Theme II: Analysis – The Importance of Dialogue, Community, and Peace as a Viable Alternative to Violence and War

The songs on “Living With War” provided an opportunity for audiences, listeners, and performers to create contesting space in the context of the ‘war on terror.’ These spaces challenged particular legacies of the war including a lack of hope in the future, loss of life, and shattered relationships. Young gave voice to these legacies through his lyrics, his performances, and on his website, which became a forum for information, music, and protest.²⁸⁹

The title of the album itself is a somber reminder that violence and war are not abstractions but realities that people live with on a daily basis. This reminder echoes Lederach’s statement about the inability of statistics to capture the realities of living with violence and war. By humanizing these realities, artists such as Young challenged the idea that violence and war can lead to a more just and peaceful world. Footage of Young working with musicians in a studio or on stage with the “Freedom of Speech Tour” reveals the ways he sought to embody this challenge in performance. The performances are collaborative acts, which model the interconnectedness between the individual, the social, and the global that is thought to be foundational to a positive peace.²⁹⁰

²⁸⁸ Crosby, Stills, Nash and Young, *CSNY: Déjà vu*.

²⁸⁹ Crosby, Stills, Nash and Young, *CSNY: Déjà vu*.

²⁹⁰ See the definition of a positive peace, Chapter One, 12-15.

One way to analyze Young's performances is to ask two questions. What ideas are being evoked? How are these ideas being enacted? Answering these questions testifies to the myriad dynamics and factors that help to create contesting spaces in his performances. The analysis below demonstrates some of these dynamics, factors, and spaces. Each of these contributed meaning to the contesting space produced, whether through the activities of performing, listening, dancing, cheering, and/or booing.

A principal idea evoked by Crosby, Stills, Nash, and Young on the "Freedom of Speech Tour" was the importance of dialogue and critique.²⁹¹ This idea was represented on stage by an oversized microphone tied with yellow ribbon during each of their performances. The microphone symbolized the importance of speaking out against the war. It also underscored that musical performances were one of the avenues through which people could dialogue about the issues and, if they were so inclined, critique the necessity and viability of violence and war.

The yellow ribbon emphasized that Young and those performing with him were willing to engage in such dialogue and critique. The ribbon suggested that the musicians supported the troops while questioning the need for sending them to war.²⁹² This position was not only articulated in songs such as "Families" but also in several dynamics in performance.²⁹³ For example, on the soundtrack to the documentary, Young is heard dedicating the performance of this particular song to the men and

²⁹¹ Crosby, Stills, Nash and Young, *CSNY: Déjà Vu*.

²⁹² For a discussion of the ambiguous, complex, and multiple meanings of yellow ribbons, see Ernest A. Hakanen, "Yellow Ribbons Everywhere and No Meaning to be Found," in *Signs of War: From Patriotism to Dissent*, ed. Anne-Marie Obajtek-Kirkwood and Ernest A. Hakanen (New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2007), 3-15.

²⁹³ For a discussion of this position and its tensions, see Tina Managhan, "Grieving Dead Soldiers, Disavowing Loss: Cindy Sheehan and the Im/possibility of the American Antiwar Movement," *Geopolitics* 16 (2011): 438-466.

women serving overseas, their families, and to veterans.²⁹⁴ He states: “We are your family.” While CSNY performed on tour, photographs of the soldiers who died in Iraq were often projected on a screen.²⁹⁵

The way of being that was imagined and acted out at such performances was not one shaped by straightforward narratives of dangerous others and American patriotism. The persona of the band, the large peace sign that provided a backdrop to the stage and the visuals of dead soldiers reflected more complex positions. These positions could be reached through dialogue and critique. Young emphasized this point by tipping the oversized microphone toward the audience during particular songs.²⁹⁶ The gesture invited the audience to lend their voices to debates about war and patriotism.

In another instance, lyrics for the song “Let’s Impeach the President” were projected onto a screen so the audience could sing along.²⁹⁷ The documentary shows that some audience members objected to the tone of the song. People walked out of performances. Booing and cheering can be heard as the song is being performed. Whether negative or positive reactions, the sound of the audiences’ voices contributed to the creation of contesting space. At those moments and in those spaces, audience members were not only imagining but also enacting their freedom of speech.

Alongside dialogue and critique, the idea of community is evoked as a vehicle for social and political change on “Living With War.” This idea is enacted through the inclusion of a one hundred-voice choir on the studio version of the album. The power of

²⁹⁴ David Crosby, Stephen Stills, Graham Nash, and Neil Young, *CSNY/Déjà Vu Live*, CD (Reprise Records: 2008) CD 2-512606.

²⁹⁵ Crosby, Stills, Nash and Young, *CSNY:Déjà Vu*.

²⁹⁶ Crosby, Stills, Nash and Young, *CSNY:Déjà Vu*; Crosby, Stills, Nash, and Young, *CSNY/Déjà Vu Live*.

²⁹⁷ Crosby, Stills, Nash and Young, *CSNY:Déjà Vu*; Young, *Living With War*.

this inclusion is evident on the song “Shock and Awe.” The track refers to former President Bush’s arrival on the deck of the aircraft carrier the USS Abraham Lincoln on May 1, 2003.²⁹⁸ After arriving in a jet, Bush declared that “major combat” operations in Iraq were complete.

“Shock and Awe” opens with the insistent sound of electric guitar, base, and drums. Young sings the first verses solo, challenging the former President’s declaration with the words, “Back in the days of shock and awe/We came to liberate them all/History was a cruel joke of overconfidence/Back in the days of shock and awe.”²⁹⁹ The choir alternates with Young to sing verses in the next three stanzas. This alternation is used to emphasize certain images.

For example, the choir sings: “Thousands of bodies in the ground/Brought home in boxes to a trumpet’s sound/No one sees them coming home that way/Thousands of bodies in the ground.” The multiple voices seem to represent the voices of the ‘thousand bodies,’ bringing to mind the image of flag-draped coffins returning from war. This image is underscored further by the entry of a trumpet repeating the principal melody of the song. Here, the trumpet resists the military fanfare the former President tried to conjure with his arrival on the USS Abraham Lincoln.

Lyrically and sonically, Young and the choir call on people to be more than passive listeners. They imagine and enact an America in which citizens critically reflect on and speak up for social and political change. Capturing these sentiments, a choir member, Alicia Morgan, remarked:

²⁹⁸ Bielen, *The Words and Music of Neil Young*, 109.

²⁹⁹ Young, *Living With War*.

Every time new lyrics would come up on the screen, there were cheers, tears and applause. It was a very spiritual experience... We finished the session by singing an a capella version of 'America the Beautiful' and there was not a dry eye in the house.³⁰⁰

Scenes of this one-day recording session, which Young directed, were included in the "Freedom of Speech Tour" documentary. They show a community of performers who not only deeply care for their country but are also willing to question their government.

This conceptualization of community is sustained in performance through Young's decision to tour with Crosby, Stills, and Nash. His decision tapped into the legacy of peace activism that characterized the social movements of the 1960s and early 1970s. However, the decision also drew attention to the fact that contemporary peace activism was alive and well. In an effort to underscore this point, Young evoked the idea that peace remains a viable alternative to violence and war. The idea is poignantly articulated in the title track of the album, "Living With War."³⁰¹ The track is a plea for listeners not only to remember peace but also to consider the roles that they can take to bring about a more just and peaceful world.

In the chorus, Young sings variations of the phrases: "I'm living with war everyday/I'm living with war in my heart and my mind/I'm living with war right now." The repetition of these phrases conjures the ways in which violence and war insinuate themselves into people's everyday lives. Even when accompanied by the choir or by his band mates, Young's voice is a mixture of reflection and resilience.³⁰² The instrumentation, which includes electric guitar, bass, drums and trumpet, complements

³⁰⁰ Quoted in Buncombe, "Neil Young sets his sights on Bush."

³⁰¹ Young, *Living With War*.

³⁰² Young, *Living With War*; Crosby, Stills, Nash, and Young, *CSNY/Déjà Vu Live*.

this reflective and resilient quality. The sound is soft but full of conviction bringing to mind the strength of spirit needed to live with violence and war on a daily basis.

This reflective and resilient quality permeates the entire song. The interplay of softness and strength is heard when Young and the choir sing:

Don't take no tidal wave
 Don't take no mass grave
 Don't take no smokin' gun
 To show how the west was won
 And when the curtain falls I pray for Peace
 Try to remember Peace.³⁰³

The delivery and timbre of the voices is important because they remind the listener that protest songs articulate more than anger and/or what people are against. They also articulate hope and what people are fighting for; thus, in this song, peace is conjured as a viable alternative to the everyday realities of violence and war through a plea rather than a shout. The sustained vocal harmonies on the word "Peace" affirm this point.

Theme III: Protest Music Performances as Sources of Insight and Hope

As I have noted, Young is not the only musician who created contesting space against the 'war on terror,' and in particular the war in Iraq. Furthermore, my analysis is not the only way to interpret his performances of songs from the album "Living With War." When read in light of the material presented throughout this chapter, however, these performances can be conceived as spaces in which people imagined and lived out alternatives to violence and war. These spaces were created through a constellation of dynamics and factors that advocated for dialogue and critique, community, and the viability of peace.

³⁰³ Young, *Living With War*; Crosby, Stills, Nash, and Young, *CSNY/Déjà Vu Live*.

Debates over the effectiveness of such performances to create lasting social and political change should be taken seriously. They highlight the difficulties of studying a human phenomenon that is both contingent and ephemeral. Even stalwart activists such as Billy Bragg have questioned the idea that popular music performances can change the world.³⁰⁴ At various points in their documentary, Crosby, Stills, Nash, and Young also addressed these difficulties. They suggested that the role of the musician is to frame the issues, to provide different points of view, and to make the audience feel.³⁰⁵ Their suggestions arise from their subjective experiences as artists and activists. These experiences may be difficult to prove definitively, but they should not be dismissed as irrelevant. The insight offered is that, despite their contingency and ephemerality, protest music performances do matter. They bring together those individuals seeking a different way. Performance gives these individuals a communal voice.

This insight is echoed by other musicians who addressed issues of violence and war throughout the years of the former Bush administration. For example, in a 2003 interview Tom Morello, guitarist for the bands Rage Against the Machine and Audioslave, was asked about the role of musicians in the months and years after September 11. He responded by discussing the non-profit organization, Axis of Justice, which he co-founded with fellow musician, Serj Tankian, in 2002.³⁰⁶ Morello commented:

Axis of Justice feels like the most concrete political event that I've been involved in. It's an installation that will go out on band's tours, a tent that brings together

³⁰⁴ Billy Bragg, "Can music still make a difference?," *Democratic Left* 4 (2000), braggtopia.com, under <http://braggtopia.com/Timeline/articles/canmusic.htm> (accessed October 31, 2012).

³⁰⁵ Crosby, Stills, Nash and Young, *CSNY: Déjà Vu*

³⁰⁶ Ann Powers et al., "The power of music," *The Nation* 276, no. 2 (January 13, 2003): 11.

representatives from various activist groups to exchange information with concertgoers. Having been in progressively minded bands, I know it's not easy to help build a bridge between your audience and the causes you support. Axis builds that bridge. It essentially works as a referral service. When we play in your hometown we bring the installation and its divided subgroupings, so whether you are personally a victim of physical or sexual abuse, or whether you are interested in labor issues and globalization, or antiracism or peace issues and the war with Iraq, you will be able that night to belong to an organization or meet with others who are interested in forming one.³⁰⁷

His comments affirm that performances are spaces in which people come to creatively resist a range of overlapping social justice issues. That resistance can involve nothing more than dancing. As Eddie Vedder of the band, Pearl Jam, stated: "One of the best ways to deal with some problems every once and a while is to dance all over them."³⁰⁸ The point is that creative resistance in protest music performances takes different forms. It can involve dancing all over the issues or imagining and building alternative ways of being in the world. Whatever the case, these performances are worthy of study because they provide a window onto the ways people creatively resist, even if only for one night.

To summarize, protest music performances are important and relevant because they are spaces where people resist through their capacities to imagine and to act. By engaging these capacities, those participating in the performance have access to at least two ideas. The first is that alternatives to violence and war not only exist but can also be successfully implemented for the length of a song, the length of an album, or the length of a tour. For a length of time, people can dialogue, dance, listen, and sing their alternative imaginings and responses. Describing a Billy Bragg concert she attended in

³⁰⁷ Powers et al., "The power of music," 11.

³⁰⁸ Powers et al., "The power of music," 11.

2003, Tara Brabazon writes: “Bragg’s songs and mid-set monologues offered alternatives in a time of no alternatives.”³⁰⁹

The second idea those participating in protest music performances have access to is that, as agents of social and political change, they are not alone. The sound of a hundred voices singing on Young’s album is one example of the ways in which this idea can be imagined and lived out. As I have noted elsewhere in this dissertation, such collective singing is not new to American peace activism. Even in an era of iPods and social media, collective singing remains a significant part of this activism.³¹⁰ New songs and activist spaces need to be created and promoted, however, that speak to the issues of violence and war occurring today.³¹¹ It is through these songs and spaces that activists sense they belong to something larger than themselves; something as large as a world characterized by justice and peace.³¹²

Protest music performances are adequately understood when their ambiguity, complexity, and multiplicity are showcased and used as a focal point for analysis. A creative, interdisciplinary, and musically literate approach provides scholars one way of delving into these characteristics. The result of this approach is a responsible and rigorous conceptualization of an admittedly contingent and ephemeral human phenomenon. Ethnomusicologist Ali Jihad Racy encapsulates the significance of this conceptualization in the wake of September 11. He comments:

³⁰⁹ Brabazon, *Thinking Popular Culture*, 138.

³¹⁰ Jeneve R. Brooks, “Peace, Salaam, Shalom”: Functions of Collective Singing in U.S. Peace Activism,” *Music and Arts in Action* 2, no. 2 (2010): 56-71, under <http://musicandartsinaction.net/index.php/maia/article/view/antwarsongs> (accessed June 30, 2012).

³¹¹ Brooks, “Peace, Salaam, Shalom,” 68.

³¹² Brooks, “Peace, Salaam, Shalom,” 65.

In all this I sense the human element in us wherever music goes to the depth of our soul – so often [music] gives back to us different images of ourselves, including the need for togetherness and how fragile we are as human beings. I talked to friends who said, “you know life is a combination of good things and bad things, and you never understand it fully, but something like music keeps us going.” That goes to the heart of my talk. I’m exploring the idea that music is here one time doing one thing, and another time doing something else. And I don’t know if we have an answer to how that works. As educators and teachers, we try to understand how music can humanize our visions at times like these. I think that when people see other people feeling and singing, it communicates something other than just a political message.³¹³

My suggestion is that going to the depth of music’s soul requires a basic knowledge of its relationship to politics, protest, and social activism. If protest music performances are humanizing forces in the world, then scholars in the discipline of spirituality should inquire into the ways these forces are used politically, socially, and spiritually. Combined, such inquiries can provide scholars and practitioners of spirituality an adequate sense of the ambiguous, complex, and multiple roles that protest music performances can play in their advocacy for a more just and peaceful world.

4.5 Conclusion: Vision, Action, and Protest Music Performances

In a preceding section of this chapter, I alluded to questions arising from the relationship between popular music and violence. These questions were: When the destruction of a human being is normalized in the media and, as a consequence trivialized as an act of violence, what kind of world is being imagined and built? What does this say about the nature of musical performance itself? With regards to the first question, the world being imagined and built is one where violence is considered a viable option for pursuing justice and peace. Musical performance can be used in this

³¹³ Hiromi Lorraine Sakata, Ali Jihad Racy and Nazir Jairazbhoy, “Musical Perspectives on September 11: A Roundtable on Music, Community, Politics and Violence,” *ECHO: A Music-Centered Journal* 3, no. 2 (Fall 2001) under http://www.echo.ucla.edu/volume3-issue2/Sept11_roundtable/Sept11.pdf (accessed October 20, 2008).

pursuit. Protest music performances challenge this use, especially when deployed as part of people's imagining and building of a more just and peaceful world.

The second question underscores one of the reoccurring motifs in my research: protest music performances are ambiguous. Acknowledging this ambiguity is important because it points to the fact that genres of popular music as well as their performances cannot be dismissed as simply entertainment. They have significant impacts on the ways people envision and take action in their lives, whether negative or positive. These impacts underscore that, popular music in general and protest music in particular, make demands on scholars and practitioners alike. The music urges people to take the time and the energy to understand it adequately.

In Chapter Five, I discuss the relationship between protest music, space, and spiritual literacy. Insights gleaned from my application of a creative, interdisciplinary, and musically literate approach to protest music performances are the centerpiece of my discussion. This chapter is followed by the Conclusion where I suggest future topics of research in the discipline of spirituality that use these performances as methodological frameworks.

Chapter Five: Weaving a Musical and Spiritual Fabric – A Commentary on Protest Music, Space, and Spiritual Literacy

To create a successful protest song in the twenty-first century is a daunting challenge, but the alternative, for any musician with strong political convictions, is paralysis and gloom. And what I think this book demonstrates is that it has never been easy. To take on politics in music is always a leap of faith, a gesture of hope over experience, because there are always a dozen reasons not to. It falls to musicians to continue to make those attempts; whether they succeed or not depends on the rest of us.

- Dorian Lynskey, *33 Revolutions Per Minute*

I think it is important to have religious institutions, but the church, or the synagogue, or the mosque, or the temple has to be something that is ever evolving, that continues to question itself and continues to ask its place in the world.

- The Indigo Girls, *Sounds of Freedom*

It is easy to avoid ambiguity and seek solace in definitive social critiques and simple political solutions. Might we find, though, a symbolic wonder, engagement, and desire that delights in the play of paradox, anticipates the challenges of unintended consequences, and embraces the requisite humility of being a species marked by fallibility and error?

- Sharon D. Welch, *Real Peace, Real Security*

5. Introduction

In the previous chapter, I demonstrated the need for literacy in protest music scholarship. I acquired this literacy through the application of a creative, interdisciplinary, and literate approach to popular music and related music disciplines. I drew particular attention to the dynamics of popular music and protest music performances. Understanding these dynamics substantiated the value of musical performances as viable starting points in the discipline of spirituality. When used as a starting point, a musical performance acts as a source of insight with implications for the ways in which an engaged spirituality is lived, theorized, and taught.

In this chapter, I weave together comments on protest music, space, and spiritual literacy. The purpose of this weaving is to effect a rethinking of the commitments outlined in the Introduction to the dissertation. To begin, I revisit Ursula King's concept of spiritual literacy and the idea that spaces are required for its cultivation.¹ This idea can be used to conceptualize protest music literacy as an example of spiritual literacy. By example, I mean that insights gleaned by adequately understanding protest music performances engender spaces in which people can foster spiritual literacy and, therefore, contribute to a positive peace.

The following sections examine three spaces that can foster spiritual literacy. The first space is created when violence is understood and contested in all its ambiguity, complexity, and multiplicity. The second space is created in scholarship within the discipline of spirituality to explore different vantage points. Different vantage points are important because they provide another perspective on particular issues. The third space is one in which scholarship can be re-conceptualized as a creative process. By creative process, I mean the use of the capacities to imagine and to act. A recurring idea that runs through these spaces and, throughout my dissertation, is the importance of having options for understanding contemporary spirituality and for approaching its study.

5.1 Spiritual Literacy and the Creation of Space

Spiritual literacy can be understood in conjunction with Ursula King's conceptualization of spirituality as a dynamic search for meaning and action.² This search involves a commitment to greater awareness of the self, others, or the world.

¹ Chapter Two, 74-76.

² See my working definition of spirituality in Chapter Two, 68-76.

Acquiring greater awareness provides spiritual adherents with a particular insight: that interconnectedness is a basic reality of life on planet Earth. Such interconnectedness can be perceived in a spectrum of ways, including the realization that issues such as violence, poverty, and ecological devastation are intertwined. Similarly, expressions and experiences of joy, love, and peace are understood as mutually constituted.

Cultivating a spiritual literacy that responds to this interconnectedness requires the creation of space. King suggested that spaces for literacy should nurture creativity and be structured around empowering ideas or what she called, pneumatophores. Pneumatophores can be discerned through dialogue, collaboration, and interdisciplinary research. The empowering ideas that structure spaces for spiritual literacy can, therefore, emerge from sources outside of spirituality. These statements resonate with the goal of the discipline of spirituality to study the complexity and multidimensionality of lived spiritual experience wherever that experience is found or the direction it leads to, cited in the Introduction.³

With this goal in mind, protest music and its performances can be understood as a source of pneumatophores. A dimension of its spiritual impact and power is the ability of its ideas to contribute to spaces for spiritual literacy. Below, I discuss three of these empowering ideas. They relate to violence, scholarship, and the creative process.

5.2 The Space to Understand and Contest Violence

The need to contest violence is not a new idea in spirituality. In Chapter One, for example, I discussed the legacy of contesting violence in the history of spiritually-motivated peace activism in the United States. Here, this contestation is important

³ Introduction, 4-5.

because it suggests ways in which an understanding of violence can shape scholarship, including that concerned with spirituality.

Understanding violence reveals that it is a cyclical phenomenon: violence gives birth to more violence.⁴ This cyclical nature emphasizes that one cannot imagine and build a positive peace through means or for ends that contribute to the perpetuation of violence. When violence is perpetuated, fear is generated. The result is, as Ursula Franklin suggested, the imagining and building of an artificial or illusory peace, one that does not cultivate conditions of harmony, justice, and equity in society as a whole.⁵

That violence cannot bring about a more just and peaceful world was a basic conviction in the lives and works of figures such as Mahatma Gandhi and Martin Luther King, Jr. In their struggles for social, political, and spiritual change, these activists did not shy away from addressing violence, whether in themselves, their opponents, or in their followers.⁶ Their examples imply that, in the pursuit of a positive peace, one cannot focus solely on what contributes to the flourishing of the human spirit. Spaces also need to be created to understand what denigrates this spirit.

I have taken up this implication by creating space in my dissertation to not only understand but also contest particular manifestations of violence, including terror and torture.⁷ As Howard Zinn observed, understanding these manifestations is not a way to justify their use.⁸ Rather, in attempting to explain violence, there is the potential to discover vocabularies and strategies through which to end its cycles of suffering and

⁴ See my working definition of violence, Chapter Two, 77-78.

⁵ This was Ursula Franklin's understanding of a positive peace discussed in Chapter One, 13-15.

⁶ Chapter One, 37-49.

⁷ Chapter Two, 76-86.

⁸ Chapter Three, 115.

horror. Where both protest music and spirituality are concerned, this has been a significant point.

Protest music and spirituality are characterized by ambiguity, complexity, and multiplicity. These characteristics have been referenced in my research as a caution against presuming that these human phenomena are inherently peaceful. I consider this caution a methodological opportunity for scholars in the discipline of spirituality. The opportunity is to consider what it means to pursue spiritual literacy in light of the need to create spaces to understand and contest violence. The question that arises is the following: What would creating these spaces involve?

Given the material examined throughout my dissertation, I would argue that creating space to understand and contest violence and, therefore cultivate spiritual literacy, involves at least two interlocking ideas. The first is basic, but vital. Scholars must be willing to confront violence, even when it is counterintuitive or difficult. The second idea is to allow presuppositions to be disrupted by what this basic human capacity reveals.⁹ This would include, as noted, the presupposition that spirituality or protest music is inherently peaceful.

My sense is that creating space can strengthen scholarly commitments to understanding and contesting violence. For example, some of the scholars who challenged the ‘war on terror’ understood that the actions of the American government would not lead to a more just and peaceful world.¹⁰ They raised concerns about the label of ‘war’ and its potential for the cyclical violence. In doing so, they created

⁹ Chapter Two, 78-86.

¹⁰ Chapter Two, 88-93.

space to oppose the former Bush administration's policies and drew attention to the ways in which spirituality could be used to perpetuate violence. Their willingness to understand and confront these aspects of spirituality reaffirmed that, as a dynamic search for meaning and action, it plays roles in both the flourishing and denigration of the human spirit.

This willingness to understand and confront violence was also evident in examples of popular music scholarship discussed in Chapter Four.¹¹ Here, the goal was to challenge the presupposition that popular music and its performances always make positive contributions to society. Like the scholars who challenged the 'war on terror,' popular music scholars were confronted with the ambiguity, complexity, and multiplicity of their subject matter. Popular music and its performances were revealed to play roles in the promotion and implementation of violence. This revelation prompted investigations into the music/violence nexus and honest reflections on the relationship between popular music and socio-political change.

Given these scholarly engagements, the question arises: How can scholars in the discipline of spirituality continue to create 'contesting spaces'? These spaces are not simply about understanding violence but also about seeking out nonviolent alternatives. One way that scholars in spirituality can continue to create such spaces is through the shifting of their starting points. By shifting the starting points, the scholars broaden their sources of insight into nonviolent alternatives. In the next section, I discuss how this broadening creates a conceptual space in spiritual scholarship to explore the value and viability of different vantage points.

¹¹ Chapter Four, 179-185.

5.3 The Space to Explore Different Vantage Points

In my research, I have created space by shifting my starting point from spirituality to protest music performances. This space was meant to disrupt presuppositions about the value of this music in the discipline of spirituality. More specifically, I argued that literacy in protest music scholarship provided me with a different vantage point to consider what is viewed as viable methodologies and content in the aforementioned discipline. The result has been insight into examples of nonviolent alternatives with particular spiritual resonance.

5.3.1 The Space for Vantage Points: Implications for Methodology

One of the methodological implications of shifting one's starting point and seeing from a different perspective is the idea that other options are available. As I noted in Chapter Two, Philip Sheldrake and Belden Lane shifted their starting points from spirituality to the dynamics of particular urban and natural spaces.¹² This shift was important because it allowed Sheldrake and Lane to broaden their sources of insight. As a result, their understandings of the connections between space, spirituality, and socio-political change were refined. The refinement was made possible by changing the methodological optic. To use Lane's metaphor, they were able to listen to particular spaces and the connections they revealed on their own terms.

Listening was a methodological preference that grew out of Sheldrake and Lane's conviction that spirituality needed to connect interiority to exteriority. That meant that spirituality should be understood as a resource for individual and societal transformation; a conviction that connects with the notion that individual, communal,

¹² Chapter Two, 99-108.

and societal well-being are deeply interconnected.¹³ Understanding spirituality as a resource for transformation involved dialogue, collaboration, and/or interdisciplinary research. Like King, these scholars worked from the premise that empowering ideas about spirituality are discerned when this human phenomenon is considered porous and flexible. In their case, they broadened their sources of spiritual insight to include the dynamics of urban and natural spaces.

In my research, I adopted a similar methodological preference in relation to protest music. By listening to protest music performances, I created space to refine understandings of its value. My argument was that protest music performances are viable starting points because they are sources of insight into the delegitimizing of violence. Here, the act of listening resonates with what Don Saliers called a mature and ecumenical spirituality.¹⁴ This spirituality is significant because it embraces a softening of the boundaries between the categories of sacred and secular. Such softening implies that protest music performances, and other sources of insight, can be valued because they disrupt these categories.

That protest music performances can be viable and valuable starting points presents scholars in the discipline of spirituality with a challenge, particularly those working out of an anthropological approach. As noted in Chapter Two, the anthropological approach acknowledges that religious traditions and non-religious movements share in the human experience of spirituality.¹⁵ Given this acknowledgment, a particular question arose for me in relation to music: What counts as a musical starting

¹³ Chapter One, 10.

¹⁴ Chapter Three, 162-163.

¹⁵ Chapter Two, 69-71.

point in the discipline of spirituality? More pointedly, is music explicitly linked to spirituality, such as that composed for and performed in liturgical settings, the only option? If not, how do we go about discerning other options?

I pursued these questions by constructing and applying an approach to music based on the principles of creativity, interdisciplinarity, and music literacy. Using these principles revealed that space has already been created in the work of select scholars to rethink the viability and value of particular genres of music. In these spaces, genres of music are considered viable and valuable because of their imaginative possibilities. These imaginative possibilities contribute to an understanding of the ways different music intersects with social, political, and spiritual change in different contexts. They can, therefore, be understood as a source of pneumatophores with which to structure spaces for the cultivation of spiritual literacy.

For example, Anthony Pinn sought literacy in a particular popular music genre, namely rap music. In doing so, he created conceptual space to rethink the genre's viability and value. Rap was revealed to be hybrid, fluid, and messy. These dimensions were then conceived as reflecting the many ways of imagining and being African American and spiritual in the contemporary world. Hybridity, fluidity, and messiness were pinpointed, in other words, as viable starting points for African-American religious studies and theological scholarship. They were valued precisely because they did not easily fit into staid understandings of the sacred and secular.

My point is that this and other genres of music can act as sources of insight for religious studies, theological, and spiritual scholarship. A dimension of these sources' spiritual impact and power lies in the ideas they provide to create conceptual space. In

the spaces created, scholars can consider other options with which to understand and study the complexity and multidimensionality of lived spiritual experience.

5.3.2 The Space for Vantage Points: Implications for Content

The question of what counts as viable and valuable starting points in the discipline of spirituality also has implications in terms of spiritual content. The idea is that spiritual content changes depending on the methodological focus. My focus has been music. Thus, content questions arise such as what dynamics of music are important? What should scholars be listening to? The lyrics? The sounds of particular instruments? The relationships created in performance?

In this regard, I have sought to broaden the imaginative possibilities around what is considered relevant content in protest music performances. One possibility I discussed was Christopher Small's term, *musicking*. As noted, the term was coined to help people better understand what happens in musical performances. According to Small, this includes the multiple relationships that are imagined and enacted in a particular performance.¹⁶

From the perspective of *musicking*, all those participating in a musical performance contribute to its meaning. The meaning generated is, therefore, communal and relational. This communality and relationality do not necessarily imply that there is a consensus about what a performance means, the ideas evoked, and/or how they are enacted. Analysis of Neil Young's performances in the context of the 'war on terror' clearly demonstrated that people participating had wildly different expectations and interpretations of the music, the ideas evoked, and the ways they were enacted.

¹⁶ See my working definition of music, Chapter Two, 61-68.

The idea is that the content of particular musical performances is important. They can provide, for example, relevant content for understanding nonviolent alternatives. While lyrics are one access point to this content, they are not the only option. Identifying and exploring other aspects of music is, therefore, another opportunity for scholars in the discipline of spirituality to discern the new, the different, and/or the neglected, to use Roland Bleiker's phrase.¹⁷

In this regard, scholars in spirituality could explore the possibilities for nonviolent content in the music and performances of a particular musician. The Northern California-based musician and yoga instructor, MC Yogi, provides an example of these possibilities.¹⁸ His song "Be the Change" is dedicated to those called "spiritual activists, truth seekers and peaceful warriors."¹⁹ The goal of the song is to introduce listeners to Gandhian nonviolence. This introduction takes place through a spectrum of dynamics, including but not limited to the lyrics.

As a whole, the music evokes the need to resist fear and foster the small acts that each person can perform to bring about change. This evocation parallels Dorothee Sölle and Mary Grey's assertions that small acts can contribute to larger processes of social, political, and spiritual change.²⁰ As if echoing these assertions, MC Yogi uses a play on a frequently quoted saying from the Mahatma for the refrain of his song: "You gotta be

¹⁷ Chapter Three, 117.

¹⁸ For more on the relationship between spirituality, sound and yoga, see Russil Paul, *The Sound of Yoga: Healing and Enlightenment Through the Sacred Practice of Mantra* (Novato, CA: New World Library, 2004).

¹⁹ MC Yogi, "Be the Change (Niraj Chang's Swaraj Mix," *Elephant Power* (Boulder, CO: White Swan Records, 2008). Also see MC Yogi, "Be the Change: The Story of Mahatma Gandhi," http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=n_gQxVOMod0&list=UUCsSDhvrZHF58X7YDIy2biQ&index=1&feature=plcp (accessed October 31, 2012).

²⁰ Chapter One, 21-22, 54-55.

the change that you want to see, in the world, just like Gandhi.” These ideas are similarly evoked through a sampling of the Mahatma’s speeches.²¹ How does this sampling, in conjunction with the lyrics, contribute to the spiritual impact and power of the song? What potential does sampling have as content for analysis in spirituality?

Another possibility in terms of content is to examine the dynamics that make up a particular MC Yogi performance. This musician performs across the United States and his performances are often part of larger festivals geared toward social and political transformation.²² What ideas are evoked in his performances? How are the ideas lived out, both within the performance space and the festival context? The point is that the performances of this one musician are highly complex, collaborative, and porous spaces. Each performance is replete with potential content for scholarship in the discipline of spirituality. Literacy in protest music scholarship is not only an option through which to pursue new, different and, perhaps neglected, musical content. Literacy is also necessary to assess this content’s spiritual impact and power.

Ultimately, my point is that literacy in particular sources of insight, whether a park, a backcountry trail, or a protest music performance, can help to create an enlarged space within the discipline of spirituality. These spaces foster spiritual literacy since one of their *foci* is to broaden understandings and uses of nonviolent alternatives. The suggestions presented above are given greater substance when read in light of Lane’s conceptualization. He characterized the discipline of spirituality as a balance between

²¹ Mark Lewis Taylor, “Bringing Noise, Conjuring Spirit: Rap as Spiritual Practice,” in *Noise and Spirit: The Religious and Spiritual Sensibilities of Rap Music*, ed. Anthony B. Pinn (New York, NY: New York University Press, 2003), 112-113.

²² MC Yogi, “Tour,” under <http://mcyogi.com/tour/> (accessed December 10, 2012).

analytic rigor and imaginative reflection.²³ Creating contesting spaces that foster spiritual literacy in the goal of broadening people's nonviolent alternatives is one example of this merging of rigor and imagination.

5.4 The Space to Consider Scholarship as a Creative Process

In this section, I discuss another way scholars in spirituality can create contesting space and foster spiritual literacy. This is by re-conceptualizing their scholarship as a creative process. I alluded to this possibility in Chapter One when I suggested that spiritually-motivated activists who imagine and build a positive peace can be considered artists embarking on a creative process.²⁴ They are using their capacities to imagine and to act as a way to provide individuals and communities with alternatives ways of being spiritual in the contemporary world. They are working to broaden people's perspectives and possibilities beyond violence.

The idea of creating space to re-conceptualize scholarship in this way is strengthened by Wuthnow's statement that what artists provide spiritual adherents is an experimental approach.²⁵ Here, what is important is the willingness to experiment with other perspectives and possibilities, a notion captured by the Mahatma's use of the term 'seekers of truth' to describe those committed to nonviolence.²⁶ As Gandhi affirmed, visions about a more just and peaceful world cannot take place without experimentation. The visions need to be put into action. Jim Wallis characterized this need as taking

²³ Chapter Two, 106.

²⁴ Chapter One, 57.

²⁵ Chapter One, 57-58.

²⁶ Chapter One, 37-40.

spirituality into the streets.²⁷ I am suggesting, in addition, that we take spirituality from the streets.

Interestingly, Rob Rosenthal and Richard Flacks' description of movement musicking as a process in Chapter Four resonates with these ideas.²⁸ Their characterization underscored that the music used in social movements is not inherently political. Rather, the music becomes political through the meanings and uses it is assigned in different contexts and by different people. The idea that music 'becomes' emphasized its dynamism and plurality.

When applied to scholarship in spirituality, the idea of 'becoming' has a particular connotation. The connotation is that this scholarship is not static or monolithic. There are many ways of understanding and approaching the contemporary spiritual life. As Lane avowed, broadening one's sources of insight into these many ways is part of striking a balance between analytic rigor and imaginative reflection.

Performances of protest music further emphasized that the ways of understanding and approaching the spiritual life often involve a progression in discernment. By progression, I mean that, from a scholarly perspective, what constitutes the label 'spiritual' is not self-evident. Discerning what this label means in particular circumstances may not approximate a straight line. It may resemble a circle, a vibration, or an echo, as John Paul and Angela Jill Lederach discovered in their research on

²⁷ Chapter One, 21.

²⁸ Chapter Four, 197-200.

peacebuilding.²⁹ They discovered that processes of social healing in local communities are more often understood with spatial metaphors than those of linear phases and stages.

The idea that scholarship in spirituality can be dynamic and plural suggests that spiritual literacy can be similarly described. This is particularly important when this literacy is geared toward greater awareness of alternative stories and spaces that contribute to a positive peace. Such literacy is strengthened, in my view, when the idea of options is continually reaffirmed.

For example, transcendence can be considered a connecting point between spirituality, protest music, and a positive peace. In terms of this peace, spirituality can be understood as involving the transcendence of the self toward others and the wider world.³⁰ Similarly, Young's performances conjured up ideas of transcendence.³¹ Those participating were encouraged to relate their individual well being to that of larger communities. In both cases, spiritual adherents and musical participants were encouraged to achieve greater awareness of the many ways people interconnect for the purpose of imagining and building a more just and peaceful world.

In the pursuit of alternative stories and spaces, examination of connecting points between spirituality and other sources of insight is one option. As with transcendence, points of connection allow scholars to see similarities between their subject matter and these other sources. I have suggested throughout my dissertation, however, that only paying attention to one option is not adequate. This means that attention can also be given to the ways in which spirituality disconnects with other human phenomena. The

²⁹ Chapter Two, 95-97.

³⁰ Chapter Two, 69.

³¹ Chapter Four, 222-227.

idea is that the spectrum of connections and disconnections opens a vista replete with perspectives and possibilities.

A scholarly challenge that arises is how to maintain and operate out of this vista while remaining relevant. In the discipline of spirituality, this challenge can be addressed by asking a particular question: If we consider ourselves artists and our scholarship a creative process, whom are we relevant to? The question is a re-articulation of statements cited by Emily Townes in the Introduction to my dissertation.³² She suggested that scholarship in disciplines such as religious studies needed to be relevant beyond the walls of the academy. In order to achieve this relevance, scholars had to think expansively.

In this chapter, I have sought to think expansively by weaving together comments on protest music, space, and spiritual literacy. Bringing these ideas into conversation has revealed the importance of hope for not only maintaining vistas and but also for operating out of them. Hope, in other words, has implications for the scholarly challenge alluded to above.

Here, hope is understood as the ability to afford people with options. In the context of the ‘war on terror,’ for example, hope was generated when people resisted the idea that violence was the only legitimate and viable response to terrorism.³³ By resisting, vistas of nonviolent alternatives were opened. They were maintained and operated out of each time an individual and/or community pursued this option.

³² Introduction, 3-4.

³³ Chapter Two, 109-110.

When read in light of the hope that arises from such vistas, scholars in spirituality can envision themselves and their research as deeply relevant beyond the walls of the academy. This is because their scholarship can present people with options for how to live, theorize, and teach spirituality, including nonviolent alternatives. These may be small acts, but they grow out of and contribute to an expansive thinking.

This thinking suggests that the full register of human intelligence can be used to pursue understandings of and approaches to contemporary spiritualities.³⁴ The phrase ‘full register of human intelligence’ was used by Bleiker to justify the searching out of the broadest sources of insight with which to address the issue of terrorism. By appropriating this phrase, I am suggesting that the ways scholars imagine and reimagine their work can impact on people’s capacities to imagine and build a positive peace as a deeply spiritual endeavor.

In this understanding, scholars in the discipline of spirituality can use the idea of options to re-conceptualize themselves as artists with vital roles to play in the creation of beloved communities and utopian prefigurations. Acquiring literacy in other sources of insight is simply a different vantage point through which to explore these roles. It is a valuable and viable vantage point because it has the potential to disrupt presuppositions and, in this disruption, renew understandings of and approaches to spirituality and its study in the contemporary world.

³⁴ Chapter Three, 115-117.

5.5 The Space to Imagine and Build a Reconciling America: New Ideas and Fresh Energy

The connections drawn here can be considered a reaffirmation of the stories and spaces of a Reconciling America.³⁵ Although other stories and spaces can dominate American popular culture, both protest music and spirituality challenge this dominance and suggest that cultures of peace are possible in this country. The message is that other options have and continue to exist outside of violence, war, and terror. These options are adequately understood when their ambiguity, complexity, and multiplicity are embraced. Given what has been discussed in the present chapter, this understanding can be viewed as a highly collaborative act of social imagination. It is an act with the potential to link activists, artists, spiritual adherents, and scholars in the goal of pursuing a more just and peaceful world.

To link these people in this common goal scholars can search for new ideas and fresh energy. As Michael Nagler noted, new ideas and fresh energy help individuals and communities to break out of the closed discourses surrounding violence.³⁶ This statement resonates with King's notion of pneumatophores, previously discussed. In the Conclusion, I use a particular idea to suggest ways of re-envisioning engaged spirituality. This idea is that protest music performances can be used as methodological frameworks. These re-envisionings can be understood as topics for future research in the discipline of spirituality.

³⁵ Chapter One, 22-25.

³⁶ Chapter One, 56.

Conclusion: A Love Song for Music, A Manifesto for Peace

The urge for hegemony and preponderance by some will be matched with greater intensity by the longing for dignity and justice by others. Exactly what form that battle takes, whether it's beautiful or bloodthirsty, depends on us.

- Arundhati Roy, *Public Power in the Age of Empire*

All we are saying is give peace a chance.

- John Lennon and the Plastic Ono Band, *Campaign for Peace Bed-In*

A progressive social change movement can draw upon the cultural resources of existing religious and spiritual traditions. But it should also seek to build its own cultural resources and traditions – because a spiritual politics must also be one that speaks to the institutions and emotional needs of secular people. We need music, stories, rituals, and more to build that culture.

- Rabbi Michael Lerner, *The Left Hand of God*

6. Introduction

In the last chapter, I have suggested that spaces for spiritual literacy are needed where ideas about a positive peace can be spearheaded. These spaces underscore that nonviolent alternatives have and continue to be available to address violence, war, and terror.

Such spaces, whether created in protest music performances or in spiritual scholarship allow people to not only imagine other options but also to experience them in the concrete. The idea of options, therefore, can be understood as foundational for the belief that a more just and peaceful world is a realistic prospect. In this conclusion, I discuss some of the ways in which protest music can contribute to this belief when used as a methodological framework in the discipline of spirituality.

6.1 Protest Music Performances as a Methodological Framework

How can protest music performances, as methodological frameworks, contribute to the belief in a more just and peaceful world? In answering this question, I am

providing topics for future research in the discipline of spirituality. These topics can be considered part of the new ideas and fresh energy needed to disrupt presuppositions about violence, war, and terror. Here, the ideas and energy function as focal points for re-envisioning how engaged spirituality can be lived, theorized, and taught.

Re-envisioning I: Engaged Spirituality as Contesting, Humanizing Space

Engaged spirituality can be theorized as a contesting space, or a space in which people imagine and act out alternative ways of being in the world. Theorizing this space includes acknowledging the diverse traditions of spiritually-motivated peace activism that are part of what Ursula King called the world's common spiritual heritage.¹ Attention to these traditions reaffirms the history of people struggling to bring about a more just and peaceful world. Such struggles underscore that the delegitimizing of violence is imagined and lived out in diverse and dynamic ways the world over.

Theorizing this diversity and dynamism is important. It undermines monolithic, simplistic, or static conceptualizations of other peoples and places. In challenging such conceptualizations, engaged spirituality becomes a focal point for humanizing those perceived as other. This humanizing can be accomplished in various ways from dialogue to spiritually-inclusive protest actions and prayer services. The point is to emphasize engaged spirituality's capacity to act not only as a contesting space but also as a connective tissue and medium for expressing people's humanity. In these ways, engaged spirituality can contribute to the growth and maintenance of alternatives. A future topic of concern in the discipline of spirituality is how to continually imagine and re-imagine scholarship as directly linked to social, political, and spiritual change.

¹ Chapter Two, 74.

Re-Envisioning II: Engaged Spirituality as Performance

Re-envisioning engaged spirituality as performance affirms that scholarship has practical implications. Ideas need to be put into action. Throughout this dissertation, I have reaffirmed the importance of embodying ideas of a more just and peaceful world in people's daily lives. Such embodying can take place through activism, music, spirituality or a composite of all three. Thus, conceptualizing engaged spirituality as performance is an attempt not only to draw attention to the everydayness of these activities but also to bridge the spheres of daily life in which they occur.

Separately, activism, music, and spirituality create small resonances. Witnessing and/or participating in these small resonances can motivate larger processes of social, political, and spiritual change. Engaged spirituality as performance is one way to conceptualize the small, the local, and the mundane as intrinsic to these larger processes. Powerful and profound changes can begin with one truth seeker and his/her willingness to perceive the need to contest violence in his/her own life. This admittedly proximate vision of truth, as Mahatma Gandhi would call it, is a vantage point from which to experiment with the new, the different, and the neglected.

One local space in which small resonances and proximate visions can be imagined and lived out is the university classroom. In this space, students can understand their assignments and research as part of their spiritually-engaged performances. These understandings can connect what happens in the classroom to what happens in the streets. The possibilities of this re-envisioning are only limited by the professor's own creativity. Such possibilities may not be for everyone, but exploring

their potential is an avenue through which to consider the relationship between scholarship, engaged spirituality, and socio-political transformation.

Thus, a topic of future research for those interested in engaged spirituality as a pedagogical tool is the link between protest music and spiritual literacies. In particular, these literacies have the potential to re-envision the ways engaged spirituality is taught. Teaching this spirituality can be conceptualized as a creative act, thereby reinforcing the idea that scholars are artists with a particular craft to lovingly hone, mold, and share.

6.2 A Love Song for Music, A Manifesto for Peace

Ultimately, this dissertation is a love song for protest music and a manifesto about a positive peace as a realistic prospect. Protest music performances are one example of a space where people can imagine and enact this peace. The experience may only last for the length of a song or a concert but, in the space created, seeds of possibility are planted. Sometimes, as Eddie Vedder observed, people just need to dance all over their problems.² Adequately understanding what this musicking means contributes to the creation of spaces in spiritual life, scholarship, and in the streets, that challenge the idea that violence, war, and terror are inevitable and unchangeable.

Thus, my goal in this dissertation was not to make definitive statements but to suggest possibilities. For example, I noted that there are many reasons why people justify and pursue violence, war, and terror. They may be angry or scared. They may feel it is their patriotic duty. Whatever the reasons, I wanted to underscore that there are other options. In the context of my research, this translated into emphasizing the diverse

² Chapter Four, 231.

ways people imagine and enact their perceptions, whether of an individual, a community, or a country.

In the case of the United States, I acknowledged that the country has been shaped by both reconciliation and war. People need to understand how these dual realities continue to shape the stories and spaces of their everyday lives. Protest music performances are another framework through which to explore such stories and spaces. Alongside and intermingled with spirituality, they are a path to the common human pursuits of peace and justice. They remind those participating, as Young proposed, that they don't have to live with war everyday. By getting creative, scholars in the discipline of spirituality can contribute to these reminders that a positive peace is a realistic prospect.

Bibliography

- Acevedo, Leslie A. "Developing an Outreach Program Based on Freedom Songs." *Public Library Quarterly* 25, no. 1/2 (2006): 171-179.
- Ackerman, Peter, and Jack DuVall. *A Force More Powerful: A Century of Nonviolent Conflict*. New York, NY: Palgrave, 2000.
- Akbar, Ahmed, and Brian Frost, eds. *After Terror: Promoting Dialogue among the Civilizations*. Malden, MA: Polity, 2005.
- Alomes, Anna. "Search for an Exit in the Corridor of Fear: Revisiting Gandhi and King in Times of Terror[ism]." In *Nonviolence: An Alternative for Defeating Global Terror(ism)*, edited by Senthil Ram and Ralph Summy, 31- 46. New York, NY: Nova Science Publishers Inc., 2008.
- Alvarez, Luis. "Reggae Rhythms in Dignity's Diaspora: Globalization, Indigenous Identity, and the Circulation of Cultural Struggle." *Popular Music and Society* 31, no. 5 (December 2008): 575-597.
- Amenta, Conrad. "Why Protest Albums Can't Teach Dissent: The Emergent Complexity of Post-9/11 Protest." In *The Politics of Protest Music: Sound, Trauma, and the Music Industry in the Time of Terror*, edited by Joseph P. Fisher and Brian Flota, 57-68. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2012.
- Anderson, Patrick, and Jisha Menon. Introduction to *Violence Performed: Local Roots and Global Routes of Conflict*, 1-14. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.
- , eds. *Violence Performed: Local Roots and Global Routes of Conflict*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.
- Anderson, Terry H. "American Popular Music and the War in Vietnam." *Peace and Change* 11 (July 1986): 51-65.
- Anderson, Terry H. *Bush's Wars*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2011.
- Appelbaum, Patricia. *Kingdom to Commune: Protestant Pacifist Culture between World War I and the Vietnam War*. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2009.
- Appleby, R. Scott. *The Ambivalence of the Sacred: Religion, Violence and Reconciliation*. Lanham, MD: Rowan and Littlefield Publishers, 2000.
- Appleton, Clyde R. "Singing in the Streets of Raleigh, 1963: Some Recollections." *The Black Perspective in Music* 3, no. 3 (Autumn 1963): 243-252.

- Apostolos-Cappadona, Diane, ed. *Art, Creativity, and the Sacred*. New York, NY: Continuum, 2001.
- Auslander, A. Ben. "'If Ya Wanna End War and Stuff You Gotta Sing Loud' – A Survey of Vietnam-Related Protest Music." *Journal of American Culture* 4 (Summer 1981): 108-113.
- Auslander, Philip. "I Wanna Be Your Man: Suzi Quatro's Musical Androgyny." *Popular Music* 23, no. 1 (2004): 1-16.
- . *Liveness: Performance in a Mediatized Culture*. 2nd ed. London, UK: Routledge, 2008.
- . "Performance Analysis and Popular Music: A Manifesto." *Contemporary Theatre Review* 14, no. 1 (2004): 1-13.
- . *Performing Glam Rock: Gender and Theatricality in Popular Music Performance*. Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 2006.
- Averill, Gage. "Responses to Musical Perspectives on September 11: A Roundtable on Music, Community, Politics, and Violence." *Echo: A Music-Centered Journal* 3, no. 2 (Fall 2001). <http://www.echo.ucla.edu/volume3-issue2/Sept11-roundtable/Sept11.pdf> (accessed October 20, 2008).
- . Forward to *Music in the Post-9/11 World*. Edited by Jonathan Ritter and J. Martin Daughtry, xix-xxxi. New York, NY: Routledge, 2007.
- Bacevich, Andrew J. *Washington Rules: America's Path to Permanent War*. New York, NY: Metropolitan Books, 2010.
- Ballinger, Robin. "Sounds of Resistance." In *Sounding Off! Music as Subversion/Resistance/Revolution*, edited by Ron Salkosky and Fred Wei-Han Ho, 1-26. Brooklyn, NY: Autonomedia, 1995.
- Barash, David P., and Charles P. Webel. *Peace and Conflict Studies*. 2nd ed. Los Angeles, CA: Sage Publications, 2009.
- Barenboim, Daniel. "About." Daniel Barenboim. <http://www.danielbarenboim.com/index.php?id=86> (accessed February 2, 2012).
- . Foreword to *An Orchestra Beyond Borders: Voices of the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra*, edited by Elena Cheah, vii-viii. London, UK: Verso Books, 2009.

- Barenboim, Daniel, and Edward Said. *Parallels and Paradoxes: Explorations in Music and Society*. New York, NY: Vintage Books, 2004.
- Barz, Gregory. *Singing for Life: HIV/AIDS and Music in Uganda*. New York, NY: Routledge, 2006.
- Basler, Carleen, Thomas L. Dumm, and Austin Sarat, eds. Introduction to *Performances of Violence*, 1-17. Amherst, MA: University of Massachusetts Press, 2011.
- Beck, Giles, and Gordon Lynch. "We Are All One, We Are All Gods': Negotiating Spirituality in the Conscious Partying Movement." *Journal of Contemporary Religion* 24, no. 3 (October 2009): 339-355.
- Beck, Guy L. Introduction to *Sacred Sound: Experiencing Music in World Religions*, 1-27. Waterloo, ON: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2006.
- , ed. *Sacred Sound: Experiencing Music in the World Religions*. Waterloo, ON: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2006.
- . *Sonic Liturgy: Ritual and Music in Hindu Tradition*. Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press, 2012.
- . *Sonic Theology: Hinduism and Sacred Sound*. 1993. Reprint. Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press, 2008.
- Beckford, Robert. *JesusDub: Theology, Music and Social Change*. London, UK: Routledge, 2006.
- Begbie, Jeremy S. "Pressing at the Boundaries of Modernity – A Review Essay." *Christian Scholar's Review* 40, no. 4 (June 2011): 453-465.
- . *Resounding Truth: Christian Wisdom in the World of Music*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2007.
- . *Theology, Music and Time*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- Begbie, Jeremy S., and Steven R. Guthrie. "Glossary of Musical Terms." In *Resonant Witness: Conversations between Music and Theology*, 471-480. Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2011.
- , and Steven R. Guthrie. Introduction to *Resonant Witness: Conversations between Music and Theology*, 1-24. Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2011.

- , and Steven Guthrie, eds. *Resonant Witness: Conversations between Music and Theology*. Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing, 2011.
- Benjamin, Medea, and Jodie Evans. Afterword to *Stop the Next War Now: Effective Responses to Violence and Terrorism*, 223-225. Maui, HI: Inner Oceans Publishing Inc., 2005.
- . Preface to *Stop the Next War Now: Effective Responses to Violence and Terrorism*, xv-xviii. Maui, HI: Inner Ocean Publishing, Inc., 2005.
- . *Stop the Next War Now: Effective Responses to Violence and Terrorism*. Maui, HI: Inner Oceans Publishing Inc., 2005.
- Bennett, Andy, Barry Shank, and Jason Toynbee, eds. Introduction to *The Popular Music Studies Reader*, 1-7. London, UK: Routledge, 2006.
- Bennett, Clinton. *In Search of Solutions: The Problem of Religion and Conflict*. London, UK: Equinox, 2008.
- Berling, Judith. "Christian Spirituality: Intrinsically Interdisciplinary." In *Exploring Christian Spirituality*, edited by Bruce H. Lescher and Elizabeth Liebert, 35-52. Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 2006.
- Berquist, Jon L., ed. *Strike Terror No More: Theology, Ethics, and the New War*. St. Louis, MO: Chalice Press, 2002.
- Berrigan, Daniel. *To Dwell in Peace: An Autobiography*. San Francisco, CA: Harper & Row Publishers, 1986.
- Berrigan, Philip, with Fred A. Wilcox. *Fighting the Lamb's War: Skirmishes with the American Empire*. Monroe, ME: Common Courage Press, 1996.
- Bey, Hakim. *The Temporary Autonomous Zone; Ontological Anarchy; Poetic Terrorism*. Charleston, SC: Bibliobazaar, 2007.
- Bielen, Ken. *The Words and Music of Neil Young*. Westport, CT: Praeger, 2008.
- Bilal, Wafaa, and Kari Lydersen. *Shoot an Iraqi: Art, Life and Resistance under the Gun*. San Francisco, CA: City Lights Books, 2008.
- Bindas, Kenneth J., and Craig Houston. "'Takin' Care of Business': Rock Music, Vietnam and the Protest Myth." *The Historian* 52 (November 1989): 1-23.
- Blackwell, Albert L. *The Sacred in Music*. Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 1999.

- Bleiker, Roland. *Aesthetics and Politics*. New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2009.
- . “Aestheticising Terrorism: Alternative Approaches to 11 September.” *Australian Journal of Politics and History* 49, no. 3 (2003): 430-445.
- . “Art After 9/11.” *Alternatives* 31 (2006): 77-99.
- . “Art Against Terror: Nonviolent Alternatives through Emotional Insight.” In *Nonviolence: An Alternative for Defeating Global Terror(ism)*, edited by Senthil Ram and Ralph Summy, 169-186. New York, NY: Nova Science Publishers, Inc., 2008.
- . *Divided Korea: Toward a Culture of Reconciliation*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2005.
- . “Learning from Art: A Reply to Holden’s “World Literature and World Politics.”” *Global Society* 17, no. 4 (2003): 415-428.
- . “Of Things We Hear but Cannot See: Musical Explorations of International Relations.” In *Resounding International Relations: On Music, Culture, and Politics*, edited by M.I. Franklin, 179-190. New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2005.
- . *Popular Dissent, Human Agency and Global Politics*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- . “Why, Then, is it so Bright? Towards an Aesthetics of Peace in Time of War.” *Review of International Studies* 29 (2003): 387-400.
- Bloustein, Gerry. “Still Picking Children from the Trees? Reimagining Woodstock in Twenty-First Century Australia.” In *Remembering Woodstock*, edited by Andy Bennett, 127-145. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2004.
- Boff, Leonardo. Foreword to *Relentless Persistence: Nonviolent Action in Latin America*, edited by Philip McManus and Gerald Schlabach, vii-xi. Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock Publishers, 1991.
- Bohlman, Philip V. “World Musics and World Religions: *Whose World?*” In *Enchanting Powers: Music in the World’s Religions*, edited by Lawrence E. Sullivan, 61-90. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1997.
- Bohlman, Philip V., Edith L. Blumhofer, and Maria M. Chow, eds. *Music in American Religious Experience*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2006.

- Boulding, Elise. "The Other America: The Forgivers and the Peacegivers." *Peace and Change* 28, no. 3 (July 2003): 446-454.
- . "Peace Culture: The Problem of Managing Human Difference." *Crosscurrents* 48, no. 4 (Summer 1998): 445-457.
- Boulding, Kenneth E. "Nonviolence and Power in the Twentieth Century." In *Nonviolent Social Movements: A Geographical Perspective*, edited by Stephen Zunes, Lester R. Kurtz, and Sarah Beth Asher, 9-17. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishers, 1999.
- Boulton, Andrew. "The Popular Geopolitical Wor(l)ds of Post-9/11 Country Music." *Popular Music and Society* 31, no. 3 (July 2008): 373-387.
- Bouvard, Marguerite G. "Poetry, a New Voice for Dissent." In *The Impact of 9/11 on the Media, Arts, and Entertainment*, edited by Matthew J. Morgan, 151-163. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.
- Boyce-Tillman, June. "Sacred Music and Violence." In *Weep Not For Your Children: Essays on Religion and Violence*, edited by Lisa Isherwood and Rosemary Radford Ruether, 231-259. London, UK: Equinox, 2008.
- . "The Transformative Qualities of a Liminal Space Created by Musicking." *Philosophy of Music Review* 17, no. 2 (Fall 2009): 184-202.
- Brabazon, Tara. *Thinking Popular Culture: War, Terrorism and Writing*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2008.
- Brady, Sarah. *Performance, Politics, and the War on Terror: "Whatever It Takes."* New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2012.
- Bragg, Billy. "Can music still make a difference?" *Democratic Left* 4 (2000). <http://braggtopia.com/Timeline/articles/canmusic.htm> (accessed October 31, 2012).
- . *The Progressive Patriot: A Search for Belonging*. London, UK: Bantam Press, 2006.
- Brigg, Morgan, and Roland Bleiker, eds. *Mediating Across Difference: Oceanic and Asian Approaches to Conflict Resolution*. Honolulu, HI: University of Hawai'i Press, 2011.
- Brinner, Benjamin. *Playing across a Divide: Israeli-Palestinian Musical Encounters*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2009.

- Brooks, Jeneve R. "‘Peace, Salaam, Shalom’: Functions of Collective Singing in U.S. Peace Activism," *Music and Arts in Action* 2, no. 2 (2010): 56-71.
<http://musicandartsinaction.net/index.php/maia/article/view/antwarsongs>
 (accessed June 30, 2012).
- Brown, Harry. *Hammered by the Irish: How the Pitstop Plowshares disabled a U.S. War-plane – with Ireland’s Blessing*. Petrolia, CA: CounterPunch, 2008.
- Bryant, M. Darrol. "Shanti, Shalom, Salaam: Reflections on the Quest for a Culture of Peace." *Dialogue and Alliance* 22, no. 1 (Spring/Summer 2008): 75-89.
- Buncombe, Andrew. "Neil Young sets his sights on Bush." *The Independent*. April 17, 2006. <http://www.independent.co.uk/arts-entertainment/music/features/neil-young-sets-his-sights-on-bush-474506.html?printService=print> (accessed October 13, 2012).
- Burton-Christie, Douglas. "Poesis." *Spiritus* 2, no. 2 (Fall 2002): vii-ix.
- Bush, George W. "Address to the Nation." (September 20, 2001)."
<http://www.presidentialrhetoric.com/speeches/09.20.01.print.html> (accessed September 26, 2011).
- Butigan, Ken. "What is Engaged Spirituality?" *Tikkun* 23, no. 5 (September/October 2008): 66-68.
- Butler, Judith. *Precarious Life: The Powers of Mourning and Violence*. London, UK: Verso, 2004.
- Cantrell, Robert. *When We Were Good: The Folk Revival*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- Carlson, John D., and Erik C. Owens, eds. *The Sacred and the Sovereign: Religion and International Politics*. Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press, 2002.
- Carr, Matthew. *The Infernal Machine: A History of Terrorism from the Assassination of Tsar Alexander II to Al-Qaeda*. New York, NY: The New Press, 2006.
- Carrette, Jeremy, and Richard King. *Selling Spirituality: The Silent Takeover of Religion*. New York, NY: Routledge, 2005.
- Carruyo, Light. "Music and Politics of Protest in Venezuela." *Latin American Perspectives* 32, no. 3 (May 2005): 98-111.

- Chang, Nancy. *Silencing Political Dissent: How Post-September 11 Anti-Terrorism Measures Threaten Our Civil Liberties*. New York, NY: Seven Stories Press, 2002.
- Chase, Christopher. "Be Pagan Once Again": Folk Music, Heritage, and Socio-Sacred Networks in Contemporary American Paganism." *The Pomegranate* 8, no. 2 (2006): 146-160.
- Chatfield, Charles. "Nonviolent Social Movements in the United States: A Historical Overview." In *Nonviolent Social Movements: A Geographical Perspective*, edited by Stephen Zunes, Lester R. Kurtz, and Sarah Beth Asher, 283-301. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishers, 1999.
- Chavez, Cesar. "Letter from Delano." *Christian Century* 86, no. 17 (April 23, 1963): 539-540.
- Cheah, Elena, ed. *An Orchestra Beyond Borders: Voices of the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra*. London, UK: Verso Books, 2009.
- . Introduction to *An Orchestra Beyond Borders: Voices of the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra*, 1-9. London, UK: Verso Books, 2009.
- Chernus, Ira. *American Nonviolence: The History of an Idea*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2004.
- . "George W. Bush's War on Terrorism and Sin." *Political Theology* 5, no. 4 (2004): 411-430.
- . *Monsters to Destroy: The Neoconservative War on Terror and Sin*. Boulder, CO: Paradigm Publishers, 2006.
- . "Religion and Nonviolence in American History." In *The Blackwell Companion to Religion and Violence*, edited by Andrew R. Murphy, 554-567. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing Inc., 2011.
- . "The Theology of American Empire." In *Voices of Dissent: Critical Readings in American Politics*, edited by William F. Grover and Joseph G. Peschek, 8th ed., 72-77. New York, NY: Longman, 2010.
- Cloonan, Martin, and Bruce Johnson. *Dark Side of the Tune: Popular Music and Violence*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2008.
- . "Killing Me Softly With His Song: An Initial Investigation Into the Use of Popular Music as a Tool of Oppression." *Popular Music* 21, no. 1 (2002): 27-39.

- . “Musical Responses to September 11th: From Conservative Patriotism to Radicalism.” *Beitrage Zur Populärmusikforschung* 32 (2004): 11-32.
http://geb.uni-giessen.de/geb/volltexte/2010/7541/pdf/Populärmusik_32_S11_32.pdf (accessed August 29, 2012).
- . “What is Popular Music Studies? Some observations.” *British Journal of Music Education* 22, no. 1 (2005): 77-93.
- Coleman, Daniel. *In Bed with the Word: Reading, Spirituality, and Cultural Politics*. Edmonton, AB: University of Alberta Press, 2009.
- Cone, James H. *The Spirituals and the Blues*. 1972. Reprint. Maryknoll, NY: 2008.
- Cooper, Thia. “Liberation Theology and the Spiral of Violence.” In *The Blackwell Companion to Religion and Violence*, edited by Andrew R. Murphy, 541-553. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2011.
- Corbussen, Marcel. *Thresholds: Rethinking Spirituality Through Music*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2008.
- Corte, Ugo, and Bob Edwards. “White Power Music and the Mobilization of Racist Movements.” *Music and Arts in Action* 1, no. 1 (June 2008): 5-20.
<http://www.musicandartsinaction.net/index.php/maia/article/view/whitepowermusic> (accessed July 1, 2012).
- Cortright, David. “Gandhi’s Influence on the US Peace Movement.” *International Studies* 34, no. 3 (1997): 359-375.
- . *Peace: A History of Movements and Ideas*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2008.
- Coward, Harold, and Gordon S. Smith, eds. *Religion and Peacebuilding*. Albany, NY: State University of New York, 2004.
- Croft, Stuart. *Culture, Crisis and America’s War on Terror*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2006.
- Cox, Damian, Michael Levine, and Saul Newman. *Politics as Unusual: Violence, Sovereignty and Democracy in the ‘War on Terror.’* New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.
- Cusick, Suzanne G. “Music as Torture/Music as Weapon.” *Revista Transcultural de Música/Transcultural Review of Music* 10 (2006).
<http://www.sibetrans.com/trans/a152/music-as-torture-music-as-weapon> (accessed June 19, 2012).

- . “You are in a Place that is out of the World...”: Music in the Detention Camps of the “Global war on Terror.” *Journal of the Society of American Music* 2, no. 1 (2008): 1-26.
- Danchev, Alex. “Like a Dog!”: Humiliation and Shame in the War on Terror.” *Alternatives*, 31 (2006): 259-283.
- . *On Art and War and Terror*. Edinburgh, UK: Edinburgh University Press, 2009.
- Danielson, Leilah C. “In My Extremity I Turned to Gandhi”: American Pacifists, Christianity, and Gandhian Nonviolence, 1915-1941.” *Church History* 72, no. 2 (June 2003): 361-362.
- Danner, Mark. *Torture and Truth: America, Abu Graib, and the War on Terror*. New York, NY: New York Review Books, 2004.
- Dear, John. *Put Down Your Sword: Answering the Gospel Call to Creative Nonviolence*. Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2008.
- Debrix, Francois. *Tabloid Terror: War, Culture, and Geopolitics*. London, UK: Routledge, 2008.
- Deer Park Monastery. “Thich Nhat Hanh – Biography of our teacher Thich Nhat Hanh.” <http://deerparkmonastery.org/about-us/thich-nhat-hanh> (accessed January 23, 2012).
- Defronzo, John. *The Iraq War: Origins and Consequences*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 2010.
- De Gruchy, John W. *Christianity, Art and Transformation: Theological Aesthetics in the Struggle for Justice*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2001.
- Dekar, Paul R. *Creating Beloved Community: A Journey with the Fellowship of Reconciliation*. Telford, PA: Cascadia Publishing House, 2000.
- Denisoff, Serge R. *Sing a Song of Social Significance*. 2nd ed. Bowling Green, OH: Bowling Green University Press, 1983.
- DeNora, Tia. *Music in Everyday Life*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- Deyoung, Curtiss Paul. *Living Faith: How Faith Inspires Social Justice*. Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2007.

- Dickinson, Kay. "'Believe': Vocoders, Digital Female Identity and Camp." In *Music, Space and Place: Popular Music and Cultural Identity*, edited by Sheila Whiteley, Andy Bennett, and Stan Hawkins, 163-179. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2005.
- Dowdy, Micheal. "Live Hip Hop, Collective Agency, and 'Acting in Concert.'" *Popular Music and Society* 30, no. 1 (February 2007): 75-91.
- Drewett, Micheal. "The Eyes of the World Are Watching Now: The Political Effectiveness of 'Biko' by Peter Gabriel." *Popular Music and Society* 30, no. 1 (February 2007): 39-51.
- D'Souza, Diane. "Creating Spaces: Interreligious Initiatives for Peace." In *Religion and Peacebuilding*, edited by Harold Coward and Gordon S. Smith, 169-189. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2004.
- Dunbar-Hall, Peter. "'We Have Survived': Popular Music as Representation of Australian Aboriginal Cultural Loss and Reclamation." In *The Resisting Muse: Popular Music and Social Protest*, edited by Ian Peddie, 119-131. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006.
- Dunn, Kevin C. "The Clash of Civilization." In *Resounding International Relations: On Music, Culture, and Politics*, edited by M.I. Franklin, 263-283. New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2005.
- . "'Know Your Rights': Punk Rock, Globalization, and Human Rights." In *Popular Music and Human Rights*, edited by Ian Peddie, Vol. 1, 27-37. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2011.
- Dwinell, Samuel. "Rock, Enroll: Music and Militarization since 9/11." In *The Politics of Protest Music: Sound, Trauma, and the Music Industry in the Time of Terror*, edited by Joseph P. Fisher and Brian Flota, 13-26. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2012.
- Engle, Karen. *Seeing Ghosts: 9/11 and the Visual Imagination*. Montreal, QC: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2009.
- Epstein, Heidi. *Melting the Venusberg: A Feminist Theology of Music*. New York, NY: Continuum, 2004.
- . "Re-vamping the Cross: Diamanda Galá's Musical Mnemonic of Promiscuity." *Theology and Sexuality* 15 (2001): 45-65.
- . "Sour Grapes, Fermented Selves: Musical Shulammites Modulate Subjectivity." *The Bible and Critical Theology* 5, no. 1 (2009): 3.1-3.16.

- Eyerman, Ron. "Music in Movement: Cultural Politics and Old and New Social Movements." *Qualitative Sociology* 25, no. 3 (Fall 2002): 443-458.
- Eyerman, Ron, and Andrew Jamison. "Social Movements and Cultural Transformation: Popular Music and the 1960s." *Media, Culture & Society* 17 (1995): 449-468.
- . *Music and Social Movements: Mobilizing Traditions in the Twentieth Century*. Cambridge, NY: Cambridge University Press, 1998.
- Fast, Susan. "Popular Music Performance and Cultural Memory Queen: Live Aid, Wembley Stadium, London, July 13, 1985." In *Performance and Popular Music: History, Place and Time*, edited by Ian Inglis, 138-154. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006.
- Fast, Susan, and Kip Pegley, eds. *Music, Politics and Violence*. Middleton, CT: Wesleyan University Press, 2012.
- Feigenbaum, Anna. "'Now I'm a Happy Dyke!': Creating Collective Identity and Queer Community in Greenham Women's Songs." *Journal of Popular Music Studies* 22, no. 4 (2010): 367-388.
- Fillinim, David. *Redneck Liberation: Country Music as Theology*. Macon, GA: Mercer University Press, 2003.
- Finnegan, Ruth. *The Hidden Musicians: Music-making in an English Town*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1989.
- Flanagan, Kieran, and Peter C. Jupp, eds. *A Sociology of Spirituality*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2007.
- Floyd-Thomas, Stacey M., and Anthony B. Pinn, eds. *Liberation Theologies in the United States: An Introduction*. New York, NY: New York University Press, 2010.
- Foltz, Tanice G. "Drumming and Re-enchantment: Creating Spiritual Community." In *Popular Spiritualities: The Politics of Contemporary Enchantment*, edited by Lynne Hume and Kathleen McPhillips, 131-143. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006.
- Franklin, Ursula. *The Ursula Franklin Reader: Pacifism as a Map*. Toronto, ON: Between the Lines, 2006.
- Franti, Micheal. "Power to the Peaceful." In *Sounds of Freedom: Musicians on Spirituality and Social Change*, edited by John Malkin, 17-26. Berkeley, CA: Parallax Press, 2005.

- Frick, David. Review of *Living with War* by Neil Young. *Rolling Stone*. May 18, 2006-June 1, 2006.
- Fricks-Warren, Bill. *I'll Take You There: Pop Music and the Urge for Transcendence*. New York, NY: Continuum, 2005.
- Frith, Simon. *Performing Rites: On the Value Popular Music*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1996.
- . "Live Music Matters." *Scottish Music Review* 1, no. 1 (2007): 1-17.
<http://www.scottishmusicreview.org/index.php/SMR/article/viewFile/9/8>
(accessed June 15, 2012).
- . "Look! Hear! The Uneasy Relationship of Music and Television." *Popular Music* 21, no. 3 (2002): 277-290.
- . "Music and Everyday Life." In *The Cultural Study of Music: A Critical Introduction*, edited by Martin Clayton, Trevor Herbert, and Richard Middleton, 92-101. London, UK: Routledge, 2003.
- . "The Popular Music Industry." In *The Cambridge Companion to Pop and Rock*, edited by Simon Frith, Will Straw, and John Street, 26-52. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2001.
- . "Why Does Music Make People So Cross?" *Nordic Journal of Music Therapy* 13, no. 1 (2004): 64-69.
- . "Why Music Matters." *Critical Quarterly* 50, no. 1-2 (April 2008): 165-179.
- Frith, Simon, and John Street. "Rock Against Racism and Red Wedge: From Music to Politics, from Politics to Music." In *Rockin' the Boat: Mass Music and Mass Movements*, edited by Reebee Garofalo, 67-72. Cambridge, MA: South End Press, 1992.
- Fuhr, Michael. "Performing K(yopo)-Rock: Aesthetics, Identity, and Korean Migrant Ritual in Germany." *Inter-Asia Cultural Studies* 11, no. 1 (March 2010): 115-122.
- Galtung, Johan. Foreword to *Building New Pathways to Peace*, edited by Noriko Kawamura, Yoichiro Murakami, and Shin Chiba, vii-viii. Seattle, WA: University of Washington Press, 2011.

- Gandhi, Mohandas K. "The Acid Test." In *Nonviolence in Theory and Practice*, edited by Robert L. Holmes and Barry L. Gan, 2nd ed., 83-84. Long Grove, IL: Waveland Press, Inc., 2005.
- . *Essential Writings*, edited by John Dear. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2007.
- . *Non-Violence in Peace and War 1942*. Vol. 1. New York: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1972.
- . *The Story of My Experiments with Truth*, translated by Mahadev Desai. 1948. Reprint. New York, NY: Dover Publications Inc., 1983.
- Garman, Bryan. "Models of Charity and Spirit: Bruce Springsteen, 9/11, and the War on Terror." In *Music in a Post-9/11 World*, edited by Jonathan Ritter and J. Martin Daughtry, 71-89. New York, NY: Routledge, 2007.
- Garofalo, Reebee. "Honk! Pedagogy: A New Paradigm for Music Education?" *Radical Teacher* 91 (Fall 2011): 16-25.
- . "Pop Goes to War, 2001-2004: U.S. Popular Music after 9/11." In *Music in the Post-9/11 World*, edited by Jonathan Ritter and J. Martin Daughtry, 3-26. New York, NY: Routledge, 2007.
- . "Popular and Protest Music Post-9/11: The Music Industry Makes it Hard to Resist." *Resist* 15, no. 4 (July/August 2006).
<http://www.resistinc.org/newsletter/articles/popular-and-protest-music-post-9/11> (accessed August 29, 2012).
- . "Popular Music and the Civil Rights Movement." In *Rockin' the Boat: Mass Music and Mass Movements*, edited by Reebee Garofalo, 231-240. Cambridge, MA: South End Press, 1992.
- . *Rocking Out: Popular Music in the U.S.A.*, 5th ed. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall, 2011.
- Gengaro, Christine Lee. "Requiems for a City: Popular Music's Response to 9/11." *Popular Music and Society* 32, no. 1 (February 2009): 26-36.
- Gilboa, Avi, Nechama Yehuda, and Dorit Amir. "Let's Talk Music: A Musical-Communal Project for Enhancing Communication among Students of Multi-Cultural Origin." *Nordic Journal of Music Therapy* 18, no. 1 (March 2009): 3-31.

- Gilman, Lisa. "An American Soldier's iPod: Layers of Identity and Situated Listening in Iraq." *Music and Politics* 4, no. 2 (Summer 2010).
<http://www.music.ucbs.edu/projects/musicandpolitics/archive/2010-2/gilman.html>
 (accessed February 10, 2011).
- Gilmour, Michael J. *Gods and Guitars: Seeking the Sacred in Post-1960s Popular Music*. Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2009.
- Giroux, Henry A. "The Emergence of Authoritarianism in the United States: Political Culture under the Bush/Cheney Administration." *Symploke* 14, no. 1-2 (2006): 98-151.
- . "War on Terror: The Militarizing of Public Space and Culture in the United States." *Third Text* 18, no. 4 (2004): 211-221.
- Goodin, Robert E. *What's Wrong with Terrorism?* Malden, MA: Polity Press, 2006.
- Goodyer, Ian. *Crisis Music: The Cultural Politics of Rock Against Racism*. Manchester, UK: Manchester University Press, 2009.
- Gottlieb, Roger S. *A Spirituality of Resistance: Finding a Peaceful Heart and Protecting the Earth*. Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, 2003.
- Gregg, Richard B. *The Power of Nonviolence*. Philadelphia, PA: Lippincott, 1934.
- . *Training for Peace: A Program for Peace Workers*. Philadelphia, PA: Lippincott, 1937.
- Grey, Mary. *To Rwanda and Back: Liberation Spirituality and Reconciliation*. London, UK: Darton, Longman and Todd, 2007.
- Griffin, David Ray. *Spirituality and Society: Postmodern Visions*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 1988.
- Groody, Daniel. "A Heart as Wide as the World:" A Christian Spirituality of Nonviolence." In *Religion, Terrorism and Globalization. Nonviolence: A New Agenda*, edited by K.K. Kuriakose, 215-226. New York, NY: Nova Science Publishers, Inc., 2006.
- Grove Dictionary Online. "Rebeika," Oxford Music Online.
<http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com.proxy.bib.uottawa.ca/subscriber/article/grove/music/51102> (accessed March 13, 2012).
- Gussow, Adam. *Seems like Murder Here: Southern Violence and the Blues Tradition*. Chicago, IL: The University of Chicago Press, 2002.

- Guzeliman, Ara. Preface to *Parallels and Paradoxes: Explorations in Music and Society*, by Daniel Barenboim and Edward W. Said, iii-vi. New York, NY: Vintage Books, 2004.
- Gyatso, Tenzin, the 14th Dalai Lama. Foreword to *Nonviolence: An Alternative for Defeating Global Terrorism*, edited by Senthil Ram and Ralph Summy, ix-x. New York, NY: Nova Science Publishers, Inc., 2008.
- . “War is Anachronistic, An Outmoded Approach.” In *The Iraq War and its Consequences: Thoughts of Nobel Peace Laureates and Eminent Scholars*, edited by Irwin Abrams and Wang Gungwu, 5-6. Singapore: World Scientific Publishing Co., 2003.
- Hajdu, David. “Where has ‘Where Have all the Flowers?’ Gone?” *The New Republic*, June 28, 2004, 33-36.
- Hakanen, Ernest A. “Yellow Ribbons Everywhere and No Meaning to be Found.” In *Signs of War: From Patriotism to Dissent*, edited by Anne-Marie Obajtek-Kirkwood and Ernest A. Hakanen, 3-15. New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2007.
- Hamilton, Andrew. “Exile.” In *The New Westminster Dictionary of Christian Spirituality*, edited by Philip Sheldrake, 294-295. Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 2005.
- Hanh, Thich Nhat. “Ahimsa: The Path of Harmlessness.” In *Buddhist Peacework: Creating Cultures of Peace*, edited by David W. Chappell, 155-164. Boston, MA: Wisdom Publications, 1999.
- . *Calming the Fearful Mind: A Zen Response to Terrorism*. Berkeley, CA: Parallax Press, 2005.
- . *Love in Action: Writings on Nonviolent Social Change*. Berkeley, CA: Parallax Press, 1993.
- Hart, William. “The Country Connection: Country Music, 9/11, and the War on Terrorism.” In *The Selling of 9/11: How a Tragedy Become a Commodity*, edited by Dana Heller, 155-173. New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2005.
- Hauerwas, Stanley. “September 11, 2001: A Pacifist Response.” In *Dissent from the Homeland: Essays after September 11*, edited by Stanley Hauerwas and Frank Lentricchia, 181-193. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2003.

- . *War and the American Difference: Theological Reflections on Violence and National Identity*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2011.
- Hauerwas, Stanley, and Frank Lentricchia, eds. *Dissent from the Homeland: Essays after September 11*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2003.
- Heathcote, Gina. "Feminist Reflections on the 'End' of the War on Terror." *Melbourne Journal of International Law* 11, no. 2 (2010): 277-307.
- Heble, Ajay. "Take Two/Rebel Musics: Human Rights, Resistant Sounds, and the Politics of Music Making." In *Rebel Musics: Human Rights, Resistant Sounds, and the Politics of Music Making*, edited by Daniel Fischlin and Ajay Heble, 232-248. Montreal, QC: Black Rose Books, 2003.
- Hefner, Philip. "Spiritual Transformation and Nonviolent Action: Interpreting Mahatma Gandhi and Martin Luther King Jr." *Currents in Theology and Mission* 31, no. 4 (August 2004): 264-273.
- Helminiak, Daniel A. *Spirituality For Our Global Community: Beyond Traditional Religion to a World at Peace*. Lanham, MD: Rowan & Littlefield, 2008.
- Hertog, Katrien. *The Complex Reality of Religious Peacebuilding: Conceptual Contributions and Critical Analysis*. Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, 2010.
- Heschel, Abraham Joshua. *Abraham Joshua Heschel: Essential Writings*. Edited by Susannah Heschel. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2011.
- Hick, John. "Gandhi: The Fusion of Religion and Politics." In *Religion, Politics, and Peace*, edited Leroy S. Rouner, 145-164. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1999.
- Highlander Research and Education Centre. "Timeline." Highlander Research and Education Centre. <http://highlandercenter.org/media/timeline> (accessed May 17, 2012).
- Hill, Matthew B. "Tom Clancy, 24, and the Language of Autocracy." In *The War on Terror and American Popular Culture: September 11 and Beyond*, edited by Andrew Schopp and Matthew B. Hill, 127-148. Madison, WI: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 2009.
- Hirsh, Lily E. "Do you Really Want to Hurt Me?: Music as Punishment in the United States Legal System." *Popular Music and Society* 34, no. 1 (February 2011): 35-53.

- Hodge, David R. "The Conceptual and Empirical Relationship between Spirituality and Social Justice: Exemplars from Diverse Faith Traditions." *Journal of Religion & Spirituality in Social Work: Social Thought* 31 (2012): 31-50.
- Holder, Arthur, ed. *The Blackwell Companion to Christian Spirituality*. Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell, 2011.
- Holloway, David. *Cultures of the War on Terror: Empire, Ideology, and the Remaking of 9/11*. Montreal, QC: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2008.
- Holt, Fabian. "Kreuzberg Activists: Musical Performance as Social Vehicle." *Popular Music and Society* 30, no. 4 (October 2007): 469-492.
- Howlett, Charles, and Robbie Lieberman, eds. *For the People: A Documentary History of the Struggle for Peace and Justice in the United States*. Charlotte, NC: Information Age Publishing, 2009.
- Hume, Lynne, and Kathleen McPhillips, eds. *Popular Spiritualities: The Politics of Contemporary Enchantment*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006.
- Hunsinger, George, ed. *Torture is a Moral Issue: Christians, Jews, Muslims and People of Conscience Speak Out*. Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2008.
- Hutchinson, Elizabeth D. "Spirituality, Religion and Progressive Social Movements: Resources and Motivation for Social Change." *Journal of Religion and Spirituality in Social Work: Social Thought* 31 (2012): 105-127.
- Hyvärinen, Matti, and Lisa Muszynski, eds. *Terror and the Arts: Artistic, Literary, and Political Interpretations of Violence from Dostoyevsky to Abu Ghraib*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008.
- Ikeda, Daisaku. "Our Power of Peace." In *Hope in a Dark Time: Reflections on Humanity's Future*, edited by David Krieger, 89-94. Santa Barbara, CA: Capra Press, 2003.
- Inglis, Ian. "History, Place and Time: The Possibility of the Unexpected." In *Performance and Popular Music: History, Place and Time*, edited by Ian Inglis, xiii-xvi. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006.
- Ingram, Catherine. "Interview with Cesar Chavez, April 22, 1989, Keene, California." In *In the Footsteps of Gandhi: Conversations with Spiritual Social Activists*, edited by Catherine Ingram, Rev. ed., 97-115. Berkeley, CA: Parallax Press, 2003.

- Ingersoll, Julie J. "The Thin Line Between Saturday Night and Sunday Morning." In *God in the Details: American Religion in Popular Culture*, edited by Eric Michael Mazur and Kate McCarthy, 2nd ed., 258-270. New York, NY: Routledge, 2011.
- The International Advisory Editors. "Can We Get Rid of the 'Popular' in Popular Music? A Virtual Symposium With Contributors from the International Advisory Editors of *Popular Music*." *Popular Music* 24, no. 1 (2005): 133-145.
- International Network for Music Theology. "A Select Biography of Music Theology Research." Durham University. <http://www.dur.ac.uk/musictheology/bibliography/> (accessed March 21, 2012).
- Irwin, Joyce, ed. *Sacred Sound: Music in Religious Thought and Practice*. Chico, CA: Scholars Press, 1983.
- Isasi-Díaz, Ada María. "Justice: A Post-9/11 Theory." In *The Impact of 9/11 on Religion and Philosophy: The Day that Changed Everything?* Edited by Matthew Morgan, 169-187. New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2009.
- Iskandar, Adel, and Hakem Ruston, eds. *Edward Said: A Legacy of Emancipation and Representation*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2010.
- Jackiewicz, Edward, and James Caine. "Scales of Resistance: Billy Bragg and the Creation of Activist Spaces." In *Sound, Society and the Geography of Popular Music*, edited by Ola Johansson and Thomas L. Bell, 33-48. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2009.
- Jackson, Richard. *Writing the War on Terrorism: Language, Politics and Counter-Terrorism*. Manchester, UK: Manchester University Press, 2005.
- Jal, Emmanuel. *War Child: A Child Soldier's Journey*. New York, NY: St. Martin's Press, 2009.
- James, Jamie. *The Music of the Spheres: Music, Science and the Natural Order of the Universe*. New York, NY: Copernicus, 1993.
- Jeffreys, Derek. *Spirituality and the Ethics of Torture*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.
- Jipson, Art. "Introduction to the Special Issue: Influence of Hate Rock." *Popular Music and Society* 30, no. 4 (October 2007): 449-451.
- Johnson, Bruce, and Martin Cloonan. "Introduction: Special Issue on Popular Music and Violence." *Popular Music and Society* 34, no. 1 (February 2011): 1-6.

- Johnston, Douglas, ed. *Faith-based Diplomacy: Trumping Realpolitik*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2003.
- Johnston, Hank, ed. *Culture, Social Movements, and Protest*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2009.
- Juergensmeyer, Mark. *Terror in the Mind of God: The Global Rise of Religious Violence*, 3rd ed. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2003.
- . *Gandhi's Way: A Handbook of Conflict Resolution*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2005.
- . *Global Rebellion: Religious Challenges to the Secular State, From Christian Militias to Al Qaeda*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2008.
- Juhnke, James C., and Cole M. Hunter. *The Missing Peace: The Search for Nonviolent Alternatives in United States History*. Kitchener-Waterloo, ON: Pandora Press, 2004.
- Junor, Beth, and Katrina Howse. *Greenham Women's Peace Camp: A History of Non-violent Resistance, 1984-1995*. London, UK: Working Press, 1995.
- Khan, Kathy. "'Sonic Jihad': Black Popular Music and the Renegotiation of Muslim Identities in Post-9/11." *Muziki* 4, no. 2 (2007): 200-208.
- Keister, Jay. "The *Shakuhachi* as Spiritual Tool: A Japanese Buddhist Instrument in the West." *Asian Music* 35, no. 2 (Spring-Summer 2004): 99-131.
- Kernodle, Tammy L. "'I Wish I Knew How It Would Feel to be Free': Nina Simone and the Redefining of the Freedom Song of the 1960s." *Journal of the Society for American Music* 2, no. 3 (2008): 295-317.
- Khong, Sister Chan. *Learning True Love: Practicing Buddhism in a Time of War*. Berkeley, CA: Parallax Press, 2007.
- King, Coretta Scott. Foreword to *The Strength to Love* by Martin Luther King, Jr., Gift Edition, ix-xii. 1963. Reprint. Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2010.
- King, Martin Luther, Jr. *A Call to Conscience: The Landmark Speeches of Martin Luther King, Jr.*, edited by Clayborn Carson and Kris Shepard. New York, NY: Grand Central Publishing, 2002.
- . *Conscience for Change: Massey Lectures 1967*. Toronto, ON: Canadian Broadcasting Corporation Publications, 1968.

- . “Facing the Challenge of a New Age.” In *Peace is the Way: Writing on Nonviolence from the Fellowship of Reconciliation*, edited by Walter Wink, 178-186. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2000.
- . “Letter from a Birmingham Jail.” *Christian Century* 80, no. 24 (June 12, 1963): 767-773.
- . “Martin Luther King – Nobel Lecture.” Nobelprize.org. http://www.nobelprize.org/nobel_prizes/peace/laureates/1964/king-lecture.html (accessed November 19, 2011).
- . “My Pilgrimage to Nonviolence.” *Christian Century* 77, no. 15 (April 13, 1960): 439-441.
- . *Why We Can't Wait*. New York, NY: Harper & Row, Publishers, 1964.
- King, Robert H. *Thomas Merton and Thich Nhat Hanh: Engaged Spirituality in an Age of Globalization*. New York, NY: Continuum, 2001.
- King, Sallie B. *Socially Engaged Buddhism*. Honolulu, HI: University of Hawai'i Press, 2009.
- King, Stephen A. “Protest Music as ‘Ego-enhancement’: Reggae Music, the Rastafarian Movement and the Re-examination of Race and Identity in Jamaica.” In *The Resisting Muse: Popular Music and Social Protest*, edited by Ian Peddie, 105-118. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006.
- King, Ursula. “Earthing Spiritual Literacy: How to Link Spiritual Development and Education to a New Earth Consciousness?” *Journal of Beliefs and Values* 31, no. 3 (2010): 245-260.
- . “Is There a Future for Religious Studies as We Know It? Some Postmodern, Feminist, and Spiritual Challenges.” *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 70, no. 2 (June 2002): 365-388.
- . “One Planet, One Spirit: Search for an Ecologically Balanced Spirituality.” *Ecotheology* 10, no. 1 (2005): 66-87.
- . *The Search for Spirituality: Our Global Quest for Meaning and Fulfillment*. Norwich, UK: Canterbury Press, 2009.
- , ed. *Spirituality and Society in the New Millennium*. Brighton, UK: Sussex Academic Press, 2001.

- . “Spirituality in a Postmodern Age: Faith and Praxis in New Contexts.” In *Faith and Praxis in a Postmodern Age*, edited by Ursula King, 1-14. London, UK: Cassell, 1998.
- Kirk-Duggan, Cheryl A. *Exorcising Evil: A Womanist Perspective on the Spirituals*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 1997.
- . *Refiner’s Fire: A Religious Engagement with Violence*. Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2001.
- Kirk-Duggan, Cheryl, and Marlon Hall. *Wake-Up: Hip Hop Christianity and the Black Church*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2011.
- Klejment, Anne, and Nancy Roberts. *American Catholic Pacifism: The Influence of Dorothy Day and the Catholic Worker Movement*. Westport, CT: Praeger, 1996.
- Knowles, Allison, Eleanor Heartney, Meredith Monk, and Linda Montano. “Art as Spiritual Practice.” *PAJ: A Journal of Performance and Art* 24, no. 3 (September 2002): 18-34.
- Koen, Benjamin D. *Beyond the Roof of the World: Music, Prayer and Healing in the Pamir Mountains*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2009.
- Korp, Maureen. “Seeing What is Missing: Art, Artists, and September 11.” In *Religion, Terror and Violence: Religious Studies Perspectives*, edited by Bryan Rennie and Philip L. Tite, 254-279. New York, NY: Routledge, 2008.
- Kosek, Joseph Kip. *Acts of Conscience: Christian Nonviolence and Modern American Democracy*. New York, NY: Columbia University Press, 2009.
- Kruse, Robert J. II. “Geographies of John and Yoko’s 1969 Campaign for Peace: An Intersection of Celebrity, Space, Art, and Activism.” In *Sound, Society and the Geography of Popular Music*, edited by Ola Johansson and Thomas L. Bell, 11-31. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2009.
- Kundel, Joseph. “The Spiritual Side of Peacemaking.” In *Spiritual and Political Dimensions of Nonviolence and Peace*, edited by David Boersema and Katy Gray Brown, 31-41. Amsterdam, AN: Rodopi, 2006.
- Küng, Hans. “A New Paradigm of International Relations: Reflections after September 11.” In *Religion, Terror and Violence: Religious Studies Perspectives*, edited by Bryan Rennie and Philip L. Tite, 103-114. New York, NY: Routledge, 2008.
- Lal, Vinay. “Gandhi’s West, the West’s Gandhi.” *New Literary History* 40 (2009): 281-313.

- Lane, Belden C. "Backpacking with the Saints: The Risk Taking Character of Wilderness Reading." *Spiritus* 8, no. 1 (Spring 2008): 23-43.
- . "Giving Voice to Place: Three Models for Understanding American Sacred Space." *Religion and American Culture* 11, no. 1 (2001): 53-81.
- . "Merton's Hermitage: Bachelard, Domestic Space, and Spiritual Transformation." *Spiritus* 4, no. 2 (Fall 2004): 125-150.
- . "Spider as Metaphor: Attending to the Symbol-Making Process in the Academic Discipline of Spirituality." In *Minding the Spirit: The Study of Christian Spirituality*, edited by Elizabeth A. Dreyer and Mark C. Burrows, 108-117. Baltimore, MD: The John Hopkins University Press, 2005.
- . *The Solace of Fierce Landscapes: Exploring Desert and Mountain Spirituality*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 1998.
- . "Writing in Spirituality as a Self-Implicating Act: Reflections on Authorial Disclosure and the Hiddenness of the Self." In *Exploring Christian Spirituality: Essays in Honor of Sandra M. Schneiders, IHM*, edited by Bruce H. Lescher and Elizabeth Liebert, 53-69. Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 2006.
- Leader. "Bush's New World Order: Either You Stand with Us or Against Us." *The Guardian* (September 14, 2001).
<http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2001/sep/14/september11.usa6/print> (accessed February 1, 2012).
- Lederach, John Paul. *The Moral Imagination: The Art and Soul of Building Peace*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2005.
- . "The Poetic Unfolding of the Human Spirit." *Fetzer Institute: Essays Exploring a Global Dream*. Fetzer Institute. http://www.fetzer.org/resources/resource-detail/?type=recent&resource_id=1000188 (accessed September 13, 2010).
- Lederach, John Paul, and Angela Jill Lederach. *When Blood and Bones Cry Out: Journeys through the Soundscape of Healing and Reconciliation*. St. Lucia, AU: University of Queensland Press, 2010.
- Lee, Richard A. "Protest Music as Alternative Media During the Vietnam War Era." In *War and the Media: Essays on News Reporting, Propaganda and Popular Culture*, edited by Paul M. Hadriakis, Barbara S. Hugenberg and Stanley T. Wearden, 24-40. Jefferson, NC: McFarland & Company, Inc., 2009.

- León, Luis D. "Cesar Chavez in American Religious Politics: Mapping the New Global Spiritual Line." *American Quarterly* 59, no. 3 (September 2007): 857-881.
- Lerner, Micheal. *The Left Hand of God: Healing America's Political and Spiritual Crisis*. New York, NY: HarperSanFrancisco, 2006.
- Lesniak, Valery. "Contemporary Spirituality." In *The New Westminster Dictionary of Christian Spirituality*, edited by Philip Sheldrake, 7-12. Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 2005.
- Lester, Julius. "God and Social Change." *Crosscurrents* 56, no. 3 (August 2006): 312-327.
- Levine, Mark. *Heavy Metal Islam: Rock, Resistance and the Struggle for the Soul of Islam*. New York, NY: Three Rivers Press, 2008.
- Lifshey, Adam. "The Borderlands Poetics of Bruce Springsteen." *Journal of the Society for American Music* 3, no. 2 (2009): 221-241.
- Lincoln, Bruce. *Holy Terrors: Thinking about Religion after September 11*. 2nd ed. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 2006.
- Little, David, ed., with the Tanenbaum Center for Interreligious Understanding. *Peacemakers in Action: Profiles of Religion in Conflict Resolution*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2007.
- Little, David, and Scott Appleby. "A Moment of Opportunity? The Promise of Religious Peacebuilding in an Era of Religious and Ethnic Conflict." In *Religion and Peacebuilding*, edited by Harold Coward and Gordon S. Smith, 1-23. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2004.
- Loder, Kurt. Review of *The Rising* by Bruce Springsteen. *Rolling Stone* 903, August 22, 2002.
- Lutz, Catherine. "Making War at Home in the United States: Militarization and the Current Crisis." *American Anthropologist* 104, no. 3 (2002): 723-735.
- Lynch, Gordon. *The New Spirituality: An introduction to Progressive Belief in the Twentieth Century*. London, UK: I.B. Tauris, 2007.
- . "The Role of Popular Music in the Construction of Alternative Spiritual Identities and Ideologies." *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 45, no. 4 (2006): 481-488.

- Lynd, Staughton, and Alice Lynd, eds. *Nonviolence in America: A Documentary History*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 1995.
- Lynskey, Dorian. *33 Revolutions per Minute: A History of Protest Songs*. London, UK: Faber and Faber Limited, 2010.
- Lytle, Mark Hamilton. *America's Uncivil Wars: The Sixties Era from Elvis to the Fall of Richard Nixon*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2006.
- Mabbett, Ian W. "Buddhism and Music." *Asian Music* 25, no. 1/2 (1993-1994): 9-28.
- Maceda, Teresita Gimenez. "Problematizing the Popular: the Dynamics of Pinoy Pop(ular) Music and Popular Music Protest." *Inter-Asia Cultural Studies* 8, no. 3 (2007): 390-413.
- Magowan, Fiona. "Playing with Meaning: Perspectives on Culture, Commodification and Contestation around the Didjeridu." *Yearbook for Traditional Music* 37 (2005): 80-102.
- Managhan, Tina. "Grieving Dead Soldiers, Disavowing Loss: Cindy Sheehan and the Im/possibility of the American Antiwar Movement." *Geopolitics* 16 (2011): 438-466.
- Mann, Robert. *Wartime Dissent in America: A History and Anthology*. New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2010.
- Marini, Stephen A. *Sacred Song in America: Religion, Music and Public Culture*. Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press, 2003.
- Marsh, Charles. *The Beloved Community: How Faith Shapes Social Justice, from the Civil Rights Movement to Today*. New York, NY: Perseus Books, 2005.
- Marshall, Lee. "Bob Dylan: Newport Folk Festival, July 25, 1965." In *Performance and Popular Music: History, Place and Time*, edited by Ian Inglis, 16-27. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006.
- Martin, Geoff, and Erin Steuter. *Pop Culture Goes to War: Enlisting and Resisting Militarism in the War on Terror*. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2010.
- Marullo, Sam, and David S. Meyer. "Antiwar and Peace Movements." In *The Blackwell Companion to Social Movements*, edited by David S. Snow, Sarah A. Soule, and Hanspeter Kriesi, 641-665. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2007.

- McCarthy, Kathy. "Deliver Me from Nowhere: Bruce Springsteen and the Myth of the American Promised Land." In *God in the Details: American Religion in Popular Culture*, edited by Eric Michael Masur and Kate McCarthy, 2nd ed., 20-40. New York, NY: Routledge, 2011.
- McClary, Susan. "This is Not a Story my People Tell: Musical Time and Space according to Laurie Anderson." In *The Popular Music Studies Reader*, edited by Andy Bennett, Barry Shank, and Jason Toynbee, 21-35. London, NY: Routledge, 2006.
- McClure, John S. *Mashup Religion: Pop Music and Theological Invention*. Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2011.
- McKay, George. "Festivals." George McKay: Professor, Writer, Musician. <http://georgemckay.org/festivals/> (accessed August 1, 2012).
- McKenzie, Jon. "Abu Ghraib and the Society of the Spectacle of the Scaffold." In *Violence Performed: Local Roots and Global Routes of Conflict*, edited by Patrick Anderson and Jisha Menon, 338-356. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.
- Merton, Thomas. *Passion for Peace: Reflections on War and Nonviolence*. New York, NY: Crossroad Publishing Company, 2006.
- Miller, Monica R. "'The Promiscuous Gospel': The Religious Complexity and Theological Multiplicity of Rap Music." *Culture and Religion* 10, no. 1 (March 2009): 39-61.
- Mitchell, W.J.T. *Cloning Terror: The War of Images, 9/11 to the Present*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 2011.
- Moberg, Marcus. "The Concept of *Scene* and its Applicability in Empirically Grounded Research on the Intersection of Religion/Spirituality and Popular Music." *Journal of Contemporary Religion* 26, no. 3 (October 2011): 403-417.
- Mollin, Marian. *Radical Pacifism in Modern America: Egalitarianism and Protest*. Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2006.
- Moore, Allan. *Song Means: Analysis and Interpreting Recorded Popular Song*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2012.
- Morgan, Matthew J., ed. *The Impact of 9/11 on Religion and Philosophy: The Day that Changed Everything*. New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2009.

- Morris, Anne. "Music in Worship: The Dark Side." *Practical Theology* 3, no. 2 (2010): 203-217.
- Morrison, Sarah. "Can Pop Be Relevant? Using Popular Music to Address Issues of Racism." *Canadian Music Educator* 49, no. 3 (Spring 2008): 52-54
- Murphy, Andrew R., ed. *The Blackwell Companion to Religion and Violence*, 1st ed. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing Ltd, 2011.
- Nagler, Michael N. "Nonviolence was Key to Changes in Egypt." The Network of Spiritual Progressives.
<http://www.spiritualprogressives.org/article.php?story=20110215154439309>
 (accessed May 5, 2012).
- . "On Meditation." In *Peace Movements Worldwide: Peace Efforts that Work and Why*, edited by Marc Pilisuk and Michael N. Nagler, Vol. 3., 277-283. Santa Barbara, CA: Praeger, 2011.
- . "The Mahatma and the Mujihadeen: Gandhi's Answer to Terrorism." In *Nonviolence: An Alternative for Defeating Global Terror(ism)*, edited by Senthil Ram and Ralph Summy, 47-56. New York, NY: Nova Science Publishers Inc., 2008.
- . *The Search for a Nonviolent Future: A Promise of Peace for Ourselves, Our Families, and our World*. Maui, HI: Inner Ocean Publishing, 2004.
- Nangle, Joseph. *Engaged Spirituality: Faith Life in the Heart of Empire*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2008.
- Nepstad, Sharon Erickson. "Religion, Violence, and Peacemaking." *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 43, vol. 3 (2004): 297-301.
- . *Religion and War Resistance in the Plowshares Movement*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2008.
- The Network of Spiritual Progressives. "NPS Co-Founders." The Network of Spiritual Progressives. http://spiritualprogressives.org/newsite/?page_id=33 (accessed December 7, 2011).
- . "Our Mission and Vision." The Network of Spiritual Progressives.
http://spiritualprogressives.org/newsite/?page_id=303 (accessed December 7, 2011).
- Nojem, Micheal J. *Gandhi and King: The Power of Nonviolent Resistance*. Westport, CT: Praeger, 2004.

- Nordstrom, Carolyn. *Shadows of War: Violence, Power, and International Profiteering in the Twenty-First Century*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2004.
- . “The Tomorrow of Violence.” In *Violence*, edited by Neil L. Whitehead, 223-242. Santa Fe, NM: School of American Research Press, 2004.
- Nuzum, Eric. “Crash into Me, Baby: America’s Implicit Music Censorship since 11 September.” In *Shoot the Singer: Music Censorship Today*, edited by Marie Korpé, 149-159. London, UK: Zed Books 2004.
- . “Singing in the Echo Chamber: Music Censorship in the U.S. After September 11th.” *Freemuse: The World Forum on Music and Censorship*, Report 5 (2005): 5-61.
http://freemuse.synkron.com/graphics/Publications/PDF/Echo_chamber_web_version1-2.pdf (accessed October 20, 2012).
- O’Brien, Thomas. “Thinking with Murray about the “War on Terror.”” *Journal of Church and State* 51, no. 1 (2009): 126-143.
- O’Connell, John Morgan, and Salwa El-Shawan Castelo-Branco, eds. *Music and Conflict*. Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press, 2010.
- Pahl, John. *Empire of Sacrifice: The Religious Origins of American Violence*. New York, NY: New York University Press, 2010.
- Palieri, Rik. “Working in the Trenches: Surviving Conflicts through Folk Music and Tales.” In *Music and Conflict Transformation: Harmonies and Dissonances in Geopolitics*, edited by Olivier Urbain, 187-200. London, UK: I.B. Tauris, 2008.
- Parachin, Janet W. *Engaged Spirituality: Ten Lives of Contemplation and Action*. St. Louis, MO: Chalice Press, 1999.
- Parachin, Janet W. “Educating for an Engaged Spirituality: Dorothy Day and Thich Nhat Hanh as Spiritual Exemplars.” *Religious Education* 95, no. 3 (Summer 2000): 250-268.
- Parales, Jon. “New Songs, Old Message: ‘No War.’” *The New York Times* (March 9, 2003): 1 (L) col 05 (50 col).
- Paris, Peter J. “Martin Luther King Jr.’s Vision of America: An Ethical Assessment.” *Theology Today* 65 (April 2008): 17-25.

- Partridge, Christopher. "Popular Music, Affective Space and Meaning." In *Religion, Media and Culture: A Reader*, edited by Gordon Lynch and Jolyon Mitchell with Anna Strhan, 182-193. New York, NY: Routledge, 2012.
- Pedelty, Mark. "This Land: Seeger Performs Guthrie's "Lost Verses" at the Inaugural." *Popular Music and Society* 32, no.3 (July 2009): 425-431.
- Pedelty, Mark, and Desdamona T. Racheli. "Is the Political Troubadour Dead? Markets Versus Politics in Local Music." *Journal of Popular Music Studies* 21, no. 3 (2009): 266-283.
- Petro, Patrice, and Andrew Martin. Introduction to *Rethinking Global Security: Media, Popular Culture, and the War on Terror*, 1-12. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 2006.
- Pax Christi USA. "Our History." Pax Christi USA.
<http://paxchristiusa.org/about/our-history> (accessed May 3, 2012).
- Peddie, Ian. Introduction to *The Resisting Muse: Popular Music and Social Protest*, xvi-xxiv. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006.
- . Introduction to *Popular Music and Human Rights: British and American Music*, Vol. 1, 1-4. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2011.
- , ed. *Music and Protest*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2012.
- Pegley, Kip, and Susan Fast. "America: A Tribute to Heroes": Music, Mourning, and the Unified American Community." In *Music in the Post-9/11 World*, edited by Jonathan Ritter and J. Martin Daughtry, 27-42. New York, NY: Routledge, 2007.
- Perone, James S. *Music of the Counterculture Era*. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 2004.
- Perrin, David. *Studying Christian Spirituality*. New York, NY: Routledge, 2007.
- Perucci, Tony. "Performance Complexes: Abu Ghraib and the Culture of Neoliberalism." In *Violence Performed: Local Roots and Global Routes of Conflict*, edited by Patrick Anderson and Jisha Menon, 357-371. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.
- Petito, Fabio, and Pavlol Hatzopolous, eds. *Religion in International Relations: The Return from Exile*. New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2003.
- Phull, Hardeep. *Story Behind the Protest Song: A Reference Guide to the 50 Songs that Changed the 20th Century*. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 2008.

- Pieslak, Jonathan R. *Sound Targets: American Soldiers and Music in the Iraq War*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 2009.
- . “Sound Targets: Music and the War in Iraq.” *Journal of Musicological Research* 26 (2007): 123-149.
- Pinn, Anthony B. “Bling and Blessings: Thoughts on the Intersections of Rap Music and Religious Meaning.” *Crosscurrents* 57, no. 2 (Summer 2007): 289-295.
- . “Handlin by Business”: Exploring Rap’s Humanist Sensibilities.” In *Noise and Spirit: The Religious and Spiritual Sensibilities of Rap Music*, edited by Anthony B. Pinn, 85-104. New York, NY: New York University Press, 2003.
- . Introduction to *Noise and Spirit: The Religious and Spiritual Sensibilities of Rap Music*, 1-26. New York, NY: New York University Press, 2003.
- . “On a Mission from God: African American Music and the Nature/Meaning of Conversion and Religious Life.” In *Between Sacred and Profane: Researching Religion and Popular Culture*, edited by Gordon Lynch, 143-156. London, UK: I.B. Tauris, 2007.
- . “Rap Music, Culture and Religion: Concluding Thoughts.” *Culture and Religion* 10, no. 1 (March 2009): 97-108.
- . Review of *Call Me The Seeker: Listening to Religion in Popular Music*, by Michael J. Gilmour. *Church History* 76, no. 1 (March 2007): 228-230.
- Pinn, Anthony B., and Monica R. Miller. “Introduction: Intersections of Culture and Religion in African-American Communities.” *Culture and Religion* 10, no. 1 (March 2009): 1-9.
- Piven, Frances Fox. *The War at Home: The Domestic Costs of Bush’s Militarism*. New York, NY: The New Press, 2004.
- Polner, Murray, and Thoma E. Woods, Jr., eds. *We Who Dared to Say No to War*. New York, NY: Basic Books, 2008.
- Powers, Ann, Eddie Vedder, Boots Riley, Amy Ray, Carrie Brownstein, and Tom Morello. “The Power of Music.” *The Nation* 276, no. 2 (2003).
- Pratt, Ray. *Rhythm and Resistance: The Political Uses of American Popular Music*. Washington, D.C: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1994.

- Premaratna, Nilanjana, and Roland Bleiker. "Art and Peacebuilding: How Theatre Transforms Conflict in Sri Lanka." In *Palgrave Advances in Peacebuilding: Critical Developments and Approaches*, edited by Oliver P. Richmond, 376-391. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.
- Queen, Christopher S. "The Peace Wheel: Nonviolent Activism in the Buddhist Tradition." In *Subverting Hatred: The Challenge of Nonviolence in Religious Traditions*, edited by Daniel L. Smith-Christopher, 10th Anni. ed., 14-37. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2007.
- Quirk, Tim, and Jason Toynbee. "Going Through the Motions: Popular Music Performance in Journalism and in Academic Discourse." *Popular Music* 24, no.3 (2005): 399-413.
- Reagon, Bernice Johnson. *If You Don't Go, Don't Hinder Me*. Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska, 2001.
- . "Let the Church Sing "Freedom." *Black Music Research Journal* 7 (1987): 105-118.
- Reed, T.V. *The Art of Protest: Culture and Activism from the Civil Rights Movement to the Streets of Seattle*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2005.
- Richards, Fiona, ed. *The Soundscapes of Australia: Music, Place and Spirituality*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2007.
- Richards, Jerald. "Spirituality, Religion, Violence and Nonviolence." In *Spiritual and Political Dimensions of Nonviolence and Peace*, edited by David Borsema and Katy Gray Brown, 9-29. Amsterdam, NL: Rodopi, 2006.
- Riiser, Solveig. "National Identity and the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra." *Music & Arts in Action* 2, no. 2 (2010): 19-37.
<http://www.musicandartsinaction.net/index.php/maia/article/view/nationalidentity> (accessed February 5, 2012).
- Roberts, Mike, and Ryan Moore. "Peace Punks and Punks against Racism: Resource Mobilization and Frame Construction in the Punk Movement." *Music and Arts in Action* 2, no.2 (2009): 21-36.
<http://www.musicandartsinaction.net/index.php/maia/article/view/punkmovements> (accessed July 1, 2012).
- Rodnitsky, Jerome L. "The Decline and Rebirth of Folk-Protest Music." In *The Resisting Muse: Popular Music and Social Protest*, edited by Ian Peddie, 17-29. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006.

- . “Iraq is Arabic for Vietnam: The Evolution of Protest Songs in Popular Music from Vietnam to Iraq.” In *Homer Simpson Marches on Washington: Dissent through American Popular Culture*, edited by Timothy M. Dale and Joseph J. Foy, 203-217. Lexington, KY: The University Press of Kentucky, 2010.
- . *Minstrels of the Dawn*. Chicago, IL: Nelson-Hall, 1976.
- . “The Sixties between the Microgrooves: Using Folk And Protest Music to Understand American History, 1963-1973.” *Popular Music and Society* 23, no. 4 (1999): 119-120.
- Rogers, Pattiann. “Small and Insignificant, Mighty and Glorious.” *Spiritus* 2, no. 2 (Fall 2002): 143-146.
- Roscigno, Vincent J., William F. Danaher, and Erika Summers-Effler. “Music, Culture, and Social Movements: Songs and Southern Textile Worker Mobilization.” *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy* 22, no. 1/2/3 (2002): 141-174.
- Roscigno, Vincent J., and William F. Danaher. *The Voice of Southern Labor: Radio, Music, and Textile Strikes, 1929-1934*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2004.
- Rose, Leslie Paige. “The Freedom Singers of the Civil Rights Movement: Music Functioning for Freedom.” *UPDATE* (Spring-Summer 2007): 59-68.
- Rosen, Lawrence. “Anthropological Assumptions and the Afghan War.” *Anthropological Quarterly* 84, no. 2 (2011): 535-558.
- Rosenthal, Rob. “Serving the Movement: The Role(s) of Music,” *Popular Music and Society* 25, no. 3 (2001): 11-24.
- Rosenthal, Rob, and Richard Flacks. *Playing for Change: Music and Musicians in the Service of Social Movements*. Boulder, CO: Paradigm Publishers, 2011.
- Roessner, Jeffrey. “That was Now, This Is Then: Recycling Sixties Style in Post-9/11 Music.” In *The Politics of Protest Music: Sound, Trauma, and the Music Industry in the Time of Terror*, edited by Joseph P. Fisher and Brian Flota, 115-126. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2012.
- Rothberg, Donald. *The Engaged Spiritual Life: A Buddhist Approach to Transforming Ourselves and the World*. Boston, MA: Beacon Press, 2006.

- . “The Spirit of Change: Spiritual and Religious Resources for Peace and Justice Movements.” In *Peace Movements Worldwide: History and Vitality of Peace Movements*, edited by Marc Pilisuk and Michael N. Nagler, Vol. 1, 113-128. Santa Barbara, CA: Praeger, 2011.
- Rossmann, Gabriel. “Elites, Masses, and Media Blacklists: The Dixie Chicks Controversy.” *Social Forces* 83, no. 1 (September 2004): 61-79.
- Roy, Arundhati. *Public Power in the Age of Empire*. New York, NY: Seven Stories Press, 2004.
- Rudder, Randy. “In Whose Name? Country Artists Speak Out on Gulf War II.” In *Country Music Goes to War*, edited by Charles K. Wolfe and James E. Akenson, 208-226. Lexington, KY: University Press of Kentucky, 2005.
- Rudinow, Joel. *Soul Music: Tracking the Spiritual Roots of Pop from Plato to Motown*. Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 2010.
- Ruether, Rosemary Radford. *America, Amerikka: Elect Nation and Imperial Violence*. London, UK: Equinox, 2007.
- Ruffing, Janet K., ed. *Mysticism and Social Transformation*. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 2001.
- Russil, Paul. *The Yoga of Sound: Healing and Enlightenment Through the Sacred Practice of Mantra*. Novato, CA: New World Library, 2004.
- Ruston, Hakem. “The Arab/Jewish Counterpoint: An Interview with Daniel Barenboim.” In *Edward Said: A Legacy of Emancipation and Representation*, edited by Adel Iskandar and Hakem Ruston, 229-246. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2010.
- Rynne, Terrence J. *Gandhi and Jesus: The Saving Power of Nonviolence*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2008.
- Said, Edward W. “Appendix: Edward Said’s Speech upon his Acceptance of the Principe de Asturias Prize.” In *An Orchestra Beyond Borders: Voices of the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra*, edited by Elena Cheah, 273-277. London, UK: Verso Books, 2009.
- . *Musical Elaborations*. New York, NY: Columbia University Press, 1991.
- . *Music at the Limits*. New York, NY: Columbia University Press, 2008.

- Lorraine Sakata, Hiromi Lorraine, Ali Jihad Racy, and Nazir Jairazbhoy. "Musical Perspectives on September 11: A Roundtable on Music, Community, Politics and Violence." *ECHO: A Music-Centered Journal* 3, no. 2 (Fall 2001) http://www.echo.ucla.edu/volume3-issue2/Sept11_roundtable/Sept11.pdf (accessed October 20, 2008).
- Saliers, Don E., and Emily Saliers. *A Song to Sing, A Life to Live: Reflections on Music as Spiritual Practice*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass, 2005.
- . "Beauty and Terror." In *Minding the Spirit: The Study of Christian Spirituality*, edited by Elisabeth A. Dryer and Mark S. Burrows, 303-313. Baltimore, MD: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2005.
- . "Music and Spirituality." In *The New Westminster Dictionary of Christian Spirituality*, edited by Philip Sheldrake, 452-454. Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 2005.
- . *Music and Theology*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2007.
- . "Sense, Spirit, and Body in Presiding: A Synaesthetic Environment." *Liturgy* 22, no. 2 (February 2007): 35-40.
- . "Sound Spirituality: On the Formative Expressive Power of Music for Christian Spirituality." In *Minding the Spirit: The Study of Christian Spirituality*, edited by Elizabeth A. Dreyer and Mark C. Burrows, 334-340. Baltimore, MD: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2005.
- Saliers, Emily, and Amy Ray. "Rock is Cool, but the Struggle is Better." In *Sounds of Freedom: Musicians on Spirituality and Social Change*, edited by John Malkin, 47-57. Berkeley, CA: Parallax Press, 2005.
- Sanger, Kerran L. "Functions of Freedom Singing in the Civil Rights Movement: The Activists' Implicit Rhetorical Theory." *Howard Journal of Communications* 8, no. 2 (1997): 179-195.
- Sarbanes, Janet. "Musicking and Communitas: The Aesthetic Mode of Sociality in Rebetika Subculture." *Popular Music and Society* 29, no. 1 (February 2006): 11-35.
- Scheper-Hughes, Nancy, and Philippe Bourgois. Introduction to *Violence in War and Peace: An Anthology*, 1-31. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2004.
- Scherzinger, Martin. "Double Voices of Musical Censorship After 9/11." In *Music in the Post-9/11 World*, edited by Jonathan Ritter and J. Martin Daughtry, 91-121. New York, NY: Routledge, 2007.

- Scherzinger, Martin, and Stephen Smith. "From Blatant to Latent Protest (and Back Again): on the Politics of Theatrical Spectacle in Madonna's 'American Life.'" *Popular Music* 26, no. 2 (2007): 211-229.
- Schmelz, Peter J. "Have You Forgotten?": Darryl Worley and the Musical Politics of Operation Iraqi Freedom." In *Music in the Post-9/11 World*, edited by Jonathan Ritter and J. Martin Daughtry, 123-154. New York, NY: Routledge, 2007.
- Schneiders, Sandra M. "Approaches to the Study of Christian Spirituality." In *The Blackwell Companion to Christian Spirituality*, edited by Arthur Holder, 5-33. Malden, MD: Wiley-Blackwell, 2011.
- . "Christian Spirituality: Definition, Methods and Types." In *The New Westminster Dictionary of Christian Spirituality*, edited by Philip Sheldrake, 1-6. Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 2005.
- . "Religion vs. Spirituality: A Contemporary Conundrum." *Spiritus* 3, no. 2 (Fall 2003): 163-185.
- . "Spirituality and the God Question." *Spiritus* 10, no. 2 (Fall 2010): 243-250.
- . "The Study of Christian Spirituality: Contours and Dynamics of a Discipline." In *Minding the Spirit: The Study of Christian Spirituality*, edited by Elizabeth A. Dreyer and Mark C. Burrows, 7-15. Baltimore, MD: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2005.
- Schreier, Robert J. "The Catholic Social Imaginary and Peacebuilding: Ritual, Sacrament, and Spirituality." In *Peacebuilding: Catholic Theology, Ethics, and Praxis*, edited by Robert J. Schreier, R. Scott Appleby, and Gerard F. Powers, 366-397. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2010.
- . "Grassroots Artisans of Peace." In *Artisans of Peace: Grassroots Peacemaking among Christian Communities*, edited by Mary Ann Cejka and Thomas Bamat, 287-300. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2003.
- Seeger, Pete. Foreword to *Singing Out*, edited by David King Dunaway and Molly Beer, ix-xi. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2010.
- Sellars, Simon. "Hakim Bey: Repopulating the Temporary Autonomous Zone." *Journal for the Study of Radicalism* 4, no. 2 (Fall 2010): 83-108.
- Sharp, Gene. *Waging Nonviolent Struggle: 20th Century Practice and 21st Century Potential*. Boston, MA: Extending Horizons Books, 2005.

- Sheehan, Cindy. *Dear President Bush*. San Francisco, CA: City Lights Books, 2006.
- Sheldrake, Philip F. "Christian Spirituality as a Way of Living Publicly: A Dialectic of the Mystical and Prophetic." *Spiritus* 3, no.1 (2003): 19-37.
- . *Explorations in Spirituality: History, Spirituality and Social Practice*. New York, NY: Paulist Press, 2010.
- . "Placing the Sacred: Transcendence and the City." *Literature and Theology* 21, no. 3 (September 2007): 243-258.
- . *Spaces for the Sacred: Place, Memory, and Identity*. Baltimore, MD: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2001.
- . "Spirituality and its Critical Methodology." In *Exploring Christian Spirituality*, edited by Bruce H. Lescher and Elizabeth Liebert, 15-34. Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 2006.
- . "Spirituality and Social Change: Rebuilding the Human City." *Spiritus* 9, no. 2 (2009): 137-156.
- Shridharani, Krishnalal. *War without Violence: A Study of Gandhi's Method and its Accomplishments*, Gar. ed. New York, NY: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1972.
- Shuker, Roy. *Popular Music: The Key Concepts*. 2nd ed. London, UK: Routledge, 2005.
- . *Understanding Popular Music Culture*. 3rd ed. London, UK: Routledge, 2008.
- Skyllstad, Kjell. "Salaam Shalom: Singing for Peace Between Palestinians and Israelis." In *Beyond Bullets and Bombs: Grassroots Peacebuilding Between Israelis and Palestinians*, edited by Judy Kuriansky, 177-181. Westport, CT: Praeger, 2007.
- Small, Christopher. *Musicking: The Meanings of Performance and Listening*. Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press, 1998.
- . "Prologue: Misunderstanding and Reunderstanding." In *Music and Solidarity: Questions of Universality, Consciousness, and Connection*, edited by Felicity Laurence and Olivier Urbain, vii-xviii. *Peace and Policy*, Vol 15. New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers, 2011.
- Smith, Andrea. "Roundtable Discussion: Native/First Nation Theology. Dismantling the Master's Tools with the Master's House: Native Feminist Liberation Theologies." *Journal of Feminist Studies in Religion* 22, no. 2 (2006): 85-97.

- Smith, Christian, ed. *Disruptive Religion: The Force of Faith in Social Activism*. New York, NY: Routledge, 1996.
- Smith, Jackie, Marina Karides, Marc Becker, Dorval Brunnelle, Christopher Chase-Dunn, Donatella de la Porta, Rosalba Icaza Garza, Jeffreys S. Juris, Lorenzo Mosca, Ellen Reese, Peter Smith, and Rolando Vázquez. *Global Democracy and the World Social Forums*. Boulder, CO: Paradigm Publishers, 2008.
- Smock, David R., ed. *Interfaith Dialogue and Peacebuilding*. Washington, D.C: United States Institute of Peace Press, 2002.
- Soëlle, Dorothee. *The Silent Cry: Mysticism and Resistance*. Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2001.
- Solnit, Rebecca. *Hope in the Dark: Untold Histories, Wild Possibilities*. Toronto, ON: Penguin Group, 2006.
- Soni, Varun. "Religion, World Order, and Peace: A Hindu Approach." *Crosscurrents* 60, no.3 (September 2010): 310-313.
- Stanczak, Gregory. *Engaged Spirituality: Social Change and American Religion*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University, 2006.
- Steger, Manfred. *The Rise of the Global Imaginary*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- Steinberg, Marc W. "When Politics Goes Pop: on the Intersections of Popular and Political Culture and the Case of the Serbian Student Protests." *Social Movement Studies* 3, no. 1 (April 2004): 3-29.
- Steuter, Erin, and Deborah Wills. *At War with Metaphor: Media, Propaganda, and Racism in the War on Terror*. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2008.
- St. John, Graham. "Protestival: Global Days of Action and Carnivalized Politics in the Present." *Social Movement Studies* 7, no. 2 (September 2008): 167-190.
- Stowe, David W. *How Sweet the Sound: Music in the Spiritual Lives of Americans*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2004.
- Stone, Chris. "The British Pop Music Festival Phenomenon." In *International Perspectives of Festivals and Events*, edited by Jane Ali Knight, 205-224. Oxford, UK: Elsevier Ltd., 2009.

- Strathern, Andrew, and Pamela J. Stewart. Introduction to *Terror & Violence: Imagination and the Unimaginable*, edited by Andrew Strathern, Pamela J. Stewart, and Neil L. Whitehead, 1-39. London, UK: Pluto Press, 2006.
- Street, John. "Breaking the Silence: Music's Role in Political Thought and Action." *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy* 10, no. 3 (September 2007): 321-337.
- . "'Fight the Power': The Politics of Music and the Music of Politics." *Government and Opposition* 38, no. 1 (2003): 113-130.
- . *Music and Politics*. Cambridge, UK: Polity, 2012.
- . *Rebel Rock: The Politics of Popular Music*. Oxford, UK: Basil Blackwell Ltd, 1986.
- . "Rock, Pop and Politics." In *The Cambridge Companion to Pop and Rock*, edited by Simon Frith, Will Straw, and John Street, 243-255. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2001.
- . "The Pop Star as Politician: From Belafonte to Bono, From Creativity to Conscience." In *The Resisting Muse: Popular Music and Social Protest*, edited by Ian Peddie, 49-61. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006.
- Sullivan, Lawrence E. "Enchanting Powers: An Introduction." In *Enchanting Powers: Music in the World's Religions*, edited by Lawrence E. Sullivan, 1-14. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1997.
- Sylvan, Robin. "The Future Religion of the World." In *God in the Details: American Religion in Popular Culture*, edited by Eric Michael Mazur and Kate McCarthy, 2nd ed., 291-306. New York, NY: Routledge, 2011.
- . *The Spiritual and Religious Dimensions of Global Rave Culture*. New York, NY: Routledge, 2005.
- . *Traces of the Spirit: The Religious Dimensions of Popular Music*. New York, NY: New York University Press, 2002.
- The Tanenbaum Center for Interreligious Understanding. "Peace: Religion and Conflict Resolution." The Tanenbaum Center for Interreligious Understanding. <https://www.tanenbaum.org/programs/peace> (accessed December 2, 2011).
- Taylor, Jenny. "Taking Spirituality Seriously: Northern Uganda and Britain's 'Break the Silence' Campaign." *The Round Table* 94, no. 382 (October 2005): 559-574.

- Thurmaier, David. "The Country We Carry in Our Hearts is Waiting": Bruce Springsteen, Franklin Delano Roosevelt, and the Search for Human Rights in America." In *Popular Music and Human Rights: British and American Music*, edited by Ian Peddie, Vol. 1, 143-155. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2011.
- Tickle, Louise. "Music festivals: the Sound of Escapism." *The Guardian* (July 18, 2011). News – Education – Research Notes.
<http://www.guardian.co.uk/education/2011/jul/18/music-festivals-research>
(accessed August 19, 2012).
- Till, Rupert. *Pop Cult: Religion and Popular Music*. London, UK: Continuum, 2010.
- Tite, Philip L. "Sacred Violence and the Scholar of Religion as Public Intellectual." In *Religion, Terror and Violence: Religious Studies Perspectives*, edited by Bryan Rennie and Philip L. Tite, 3-10. New York, NY: Routledge, 2008.
- Townes, Emilie T. "Walking on the Rim Bones of Nothingness: Scholarship and Activism." *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 77, no.1 (March 2009): 1-15.
- Trigg, Christopher. "A Change is Gonna Come: Sam Cooke and the Protest Song." *University of Toronto Quarterly* 79, no. 3 (Summer 2010): 991-1003.
- Turino, Thomas. *Music as Social Life: The Politics of Participation*. Chicago, IL: The University of Chicago Press, 2008.
- Vanier, Jean. *Finding Peace*. Toronto, ON: Anansi, 2003.
- Volo, James. *A History of War Resistance in America*. Santa Barbara, CA: Greenwood, 2010.
- Walgrave, Stefaan, and Dieter Rucht, eds. *Demonstrations Against the War on Iraq*. Minnesota, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2010.
- Wallis, Jim. *The Soul of Politics*. New York, NY: The New Press, 1994.
- . "Reflecting on Our Responses to 9/11." *Huffington Post* (September 12, 2008).
<http://www.huffingtonpost.com/jim-wallis/reflecting-on-our-responses> (accessed August 14, 2010).
- Washington, David M., and Devin G. Beecher. "Music as Social Medicine: Two Perspectives on the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra." *New Directions For Youth Development* 125 (Spring 2010): 127-140

- Watson, Jada, and Lori Burns. "Resisting Exile and Asserting Musical Voice: The Dixie Chicks are 'Not Ready to Make Nice.'" *Popular Music* 29, no. 3 (2010): 325-350.
- Watson, Robert P. "The Politics and History of Terror." In *America's War on Terror*, edited by Tom Lansford, Robert P. Watson, and Jack Covarrubias, 2nd ed., 1-14. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2009.
- Weaver, Douglas. "The Spirituality of Martin Luther King Jr." *Perspectives in Religious Studies* 31, no.1 (Spring 2004): 55-70.
- Weinsteen, Deena. "Rock Protest Songs: So Many and So Few." In *The Resisting Music: Popular Music and Social Protest*, edited by Ian Peddie, 3-16. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2006.
- Weissman, Dick. *Talkin' 'bout A Revolution: Music and Social Change in the United States*. New York, NY: Backbeat Books, 2010.
- Welch, Christina. "The Spirituality of, and at, Greenham Common Peace Camp." *Feminist Theology* 18, no. 2 (2010): 230-248.
- Welch, Sharon D. *After Empire: the Art and Ethos of Enduring Peace*. Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2004.
- . *Real Peace, Real Security: The Challenges of Global Citizenship*. Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2008.
- Wheatley, Margaret J. *Turning to One Another: Simple Conversations to Restore Hope to the Future*. San Francisco, CA: Berrett-Koehler Publishers, Inc., 2009.
- Whitehead, Neil L. Afterword to *Terror & Violence: Imagination and the Unimaginable*, edited by Andrew Strathern, Pamela J. Stewart, and Neil L. Whitehead, 231-238. London, UK: Pluto Press, 2006.
- . *Dark Shamans: Kainaimà and the Poetics of Violent Death*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2002.
- . Introduction to *Violence*, 3-24. Santa Fe, NM: School of American Research Press, 2004.
- . "On the Poetics of Violence." In *Violence*, edited by Neil L. Whitehead, 55-77. Santa Fe, NM: School of American Research Press, 2004.
- . "Rethinking Anthropology of Violence." *Anthropology Today* 20, no. 5 (October 2004): 1-2.

- . “Sacral Violence: Cosmologies and Imaginaries of Killing.” In *Dying for Faith: Religiously Motivated Violence in the Contemporary World*, edited by Madawi Al-Rasheed and Marat Shterin, 167-175. London, UK: I.B. Tauris, 2009.
- . “Violence & the Cultural Order.” *Daedalus* (Winter 2007): 40-50.
- Whitehead, Neil L., and Nasser Abufarha. “Suicide, Violence, and Cultural Conceptions of Martyrdom in Palestine.” *Social Research* 75, no. 2 (Summer 2008): 395-416.
- Whiteley, Sheila, Andy Bennett, and Stan Hawkins. Introduction to *Music, Space and Place: Popular Music and Cultural Identity*, 1-22. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2005.
- Wicke, Peter. “The Times They Are A-Changin’: Rock Music and Political Change in East Germany.” In *Rockin’ the Boat Mass Music and Mass Movements*, edited by Reebee Garofalo, 82-92. Cambridge, MA: South End Press, 1992.
- Williams, Paul. “I Could Smell the Dawn of Armageddon When this Dick was Elected”: Hip-Hop’s Oppositional Voices in the War on Terror.” In *The War on Terror and American Popular Culture: September 11 and Beyond*, edited by Andrew Schopp and Matthew B. Hill, 222-238. Madison, WI: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 2009.
- Williams, Rowan. “End of War.” In *Dissent from the Homeland: Essays after September 11*, edited by Stanley Hauerwas and Frank Lentricchia, 25-36. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2003.
- Willson, Rachel Beckles. “The Parallax Worlds of the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra.” *The Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 134, no. 2 (2009): 319-347.
- Wink, Walter. “Can Love Save the World?” In *Religion, Terror and Violence: Religious Studies Perspectives*, edited by Bryan Rennie and Philip L. Tite, 115-121. New York, NY: Routledge, 2008.
- . *Engaging the Powers: Discernment and Resistance in a World of Domination*. Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 1992.
- , ed. *Peace is the Way: Writings on Nonviolence from the Fellowship of Reconciliation*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2000.
- . *The Powers That Be: Theology for a New Millennium*. New York, NY: Galilee Doubleday, 1998.

- Witvliet, John D. Afterword to *Resonant Witness: Conversations between Music and Theology*, edited by Jeremy S. Begbie and Steven R. Guthrie, 454-463. Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2011.
- Wolfteich, Claire E. "Devotion and Struggle for Justice in the Farm Workers Movement: A Practical Theological Approach to Research and Teaching in Spirituality." *Spiritus* 5, no. 2 (Fall 2005): 158-175.
- Womack, Kenneth, Jerome J. Zolten, and Mark Bernhard. *Springsteen, Cultural Studies and the Runaway American Dream*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2012.
- Wood, Nicola, and Sun J. Smith. "Instrumental Routes to Emotional Geographies." *Social and Cultural Geography* 5, no. 4, (December 2004): 533-548.
- Wuthnow, Robert. *All in Sync: How Music and Art are Revitalizing American Religion*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2003.
- . *Creative Spirituality: The Way of the Artist*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2001.
- Yates, Bradford L. "Healing a Nation: An Analysis of Bruce Springsteen's *The Rising*." *Journal of Popular Music Studies* 22, no. 1 (2010): 32-49.
- Young, Neil. *Waging Heavy Peace*. New York, NY: Blue Rider Press, 2012.
- Zangara, Haifa. "Iraqi Resistance has its Song." *International Journal of Contemporary Iraqi Studies* 3, no. 3 (2009): 277-286.
- . "The Right To Rule Ourselves." In *Not One More Death*, Brian Eno, Harold Pinter, John Le Carré, Richard Dawkins, Michel Faber, and Haifa Zangana, 49-62. London, UK: Verso, 2006.
- Zinn, Howard. *Artists in Times of War*. New York, NY: Seven Stories Press, 2003.
- . *Terrorism and War*. New York, NY: Seven Stories Press, 2002.
- Zon, Bennett. "Bedazzled by Breakthrough: Music Theology and the Problem of Composing Music in Words." *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 136, no. 2 (2010): 429-435.
- Zunes, Stephen, Lester R. Kurtz, and Sarah Beth Asher. Introduction to *Nonviolent Social Movements: A Geographical Perspective*, 1-5. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishers, 1999.

Discography

Crosby, David, Stephen Stills, Graham Nash, and Neil Young. *CSNY/Déjà Vu Live*. CD. Reprise Records, 2008. CD 2-512606.

Green Day. *American Idiot*. CD. Reprise Records, 2004.

Franti, Micheal, and Spearhead. "Hey World (Remote Control Version)." *All Rebel Rockers*. Digital Release. New York: Boo Boo Wax Under, 2009.

MC Yogi. "Be the Change (Niraj Chang's Swaraj Mix)." *Elephant Power*. Digital Release. Boulder, CO: White Swan Records, 2008.

MC Yogi. "Be the Change: The Story of Mahatma Gandhi."
http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=n_gQxVOMod0&list=UUCsSDhvrZHF58X7YDIy2biQ&index=1&feature=plcp (accessed October 31, 2012).

Playing for Change. *Songs Around the World*. CD. Hear Music, 2008-2009. HRM-31130-00.

Young, Neil. *Living With War*. CD. Reprise Records, 2006. CDW 44335.

———. *Living With War: In the Beginning*. CD. Reprise Records, 2006. CDW 43265.

Documentaries

Crosby, David, Stephen Stills, Graham Nash, and Neil Young. *CSNY: Déjà Vu*. DVD. Toronto, ON: Maple Pictures, 2008.

Gittoes, George. *Soundtrack to War: The Movie*. DVD. Beverly Hills, CA: Melee Entertainment, 2006.

Tusty, James, and Maureen Tusty. *The Singing Revolution*. DVD. New York, NY: Sky Films Inc., 2008.