



National Library
of Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services Branch

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa, Ontario
K1A 0N4

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Direction des acquisitions et
des services bibliographiques

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa (Ontario)
K1A 0N4

Your file / votre référence

Our file / notre référence

NOTICE

The quality of this microform is heavily dependent upon the quality of the original thesis submitted for microfilming. Every effort has been made to ensure the highest quality of reproduction possible.

If pages are missing, contact the university which granted the degree.

Some pages may have indistinct print especially if the original pages were typed with a poor typewriter ribbon or if the university sent us an inferior photocopy.

Reproduction in full or in part of this microform is governed by the Canadian Copyright Act, R.S.C. 1970, c. C-30, and subsequent amendments.

AVIS

La qualité de cette microforme dépend grandement de la qualité de la thèse soumise au microfilmage. Nous avons tout fait pour assurer une qualité supérieure de reproduction.

S'il manque des pages, veuillez communiquer avec l'université qui a conféré le grade.

La qualité d'impression de certaines pages peut laisser à désirer, surtout si les pages originales ont été dactylographiées à l'aide d'un ruban usé ou si l'université nous a fait parvenir une photocopie de qualité inférieure.

La reproduction, même partielle, de cette microforme est soumise à la Loi canadienne sur le droit d'auteur, SRC 1970, c. C-30, et ses amendements subséquents.

Canada

**A PERIODICAL FOR THE PEOPLE:
MRS. MOODIE AND THE VICTORIA MAGAZINE**

**BY
KLAY DYER**

**A thesis presented to the University of Ottawa in partial fulfillment of
the degree of Master of Arts in the Department of English.**

© Klay Dyer, Ottawa, Canada, 1992



National Library
of Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services Branch

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa, Ontario
K1A 0N4

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Direction des acquisitions et
des services bibliographiques

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa (Ontario)
K1A 0N4

Your file Votre référence

Our file Notre référence

The author has granted an irrevocable non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of his/her thesis by any means and in any form or format, making this thesis available to interested persons.

L'auteur a accordé une licence irrévocable et non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de sa thèse de quelque manière et sous quelque forme que ce soit pour mettre des exemplaires de cette thèse à la disposition des personnes intéressées.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in his/her thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without his/her permission.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège sa thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

ISBN 0-315-80043-7

Canada



UNIVERSITÉ D'OTTAWA
UNIVERSITY OF OTTAWA

I hereby declare that I am the sole author of this thesis. I authorize the University of Ottawa to lend this thesis to other institutions or individuals for the purpose of scholarly research. I further authorize the University of Ottawa to reproduce this thesis by photocopying or by other means, in total or in part, at the request of other institutions or individuals for the purpose of scholarly research.

Klay Dyer

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

For his encouragement and patience I am grateful to my thesis director at the University of Ottawa, Dr. David Staines. He has given generously of his time, knowledge, and counsel throughout the preparation of this thesis.

Special thanks to Dr. Carole Gerson at Simon Fraser University for sharing her enthusiasm for nineteenth-century Canadian literature with me.

Above all, I must thank my wife, Kathy, for her love and support during this project.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction	<i>i</i>
Preface	<i>v</i>
<i>Chapter One.</i> The Story of <i>The Victoria Magazine</i>	1
<i>Chapter Two.</i> To Entertain and to Instruct: Balancing Editorial Priorities	20
<i>Chapter Three.</i> Relocating <i>The Victoria Magazine</i> : Critical Overview and Context	56
Conclusion	85
Appendix A	89
Appendix B	94
Bibliography	97

PREFACE

In the introduction to her novel *Mark Hurdlestone; or, The Gold Worshipper* (1853), Mrs. Moodie comments on a short-lived periodical that she and her husband, John Wedderburn Dunbar Moodie, had written and edited for a local Belleville businessman in the 1840s:

In 1847, Mr. Moodie and myself undertook the joint editorship of a cheap monthly magazine published in Belleville, under the title of the *Victoria Magazine*. This periodical was issued at the low price of five shillings per annum, and was chiefly intended as a periodical for the people. It had a good circulation, for the brief period of its existence, which only lasted until the end of the year, when the failure of its proprietor, who was engaged in several literary speculations, put a stop to its further progress.¹

In a review of *Mark Hurdlestone* in *The Athenaeum*, an anonymous critic suggests that the story behind Mrs. Moodie's involvement with *The Victoria Magazine*, "if told minutely and with an eye to character, might be worth many a 'Mark Hurdlestone'."²

Preceding the publication of her "major" Canadian work, *Roughing It in the Bush, or Life in Canada* (1852) by five years, Mrs. Moodie's association with *The Victoria Magazine: A Cheap Periodical for the People* has been for the most part overlooked, or at least understated, by modern scholars. Unlike her earlier English novels and the first editions of *Roughing It in the Bush* which were written and published for a British audience, *The Victoria Magazine* was edited and published in

¹ Susanna Moodie, *Mark Hurdlestone; or, The Gold Worshipper*, 1853; introduction rpt. in *Life in the Clearings*, ed. Robert L. McDougall (Toronto, ON: Macmillan, 1959), p. 291. All subsequent references to this introduction (*MH*) will appear in the body of the thesis.

² Anon., "Rev. of *Mark Hurdlestone*," *The Athenaeum* 15 January 1853: 73.

Upper Canada specifically for a working-class Canadian audience. The story behind *The Victoria Magazine*, Mrs. Moodie's involvement in this truly Canadian work, and the circumstances surrounding its publication and failure remains untold. This thesis will tell that story.

The critical positions and methodologies that inform this thesis are necessarily eclectic, bringing together biographical, historical, and theoretical concerns. Given the limited scholarship and bibliographical information available dealing with works other than *Roughing It in the Bush*, it is initially necessary to indulge Milman Parry's (in)famous desire to "make for myself a picture of great detail."³ Fortunately, W.H. New's efforts more than two decades ago to compile a facsimile edition of all twelve issues of the periodical effectively recovered *The Victoria Magazine* in what Roland Barthes calls a Newtonian sense, as "a fragment of substance, occupying a part of the space of books."⁴ John Thurston's recent collection of Mrs. Moodie's other fiction, *Voyages: Short Narratives of Susanna Moodie* (1991), includes narratives that originally appeared in the pages of *The Victoria Magazine*. Both of these books move towards overcoming what Michael Peterman acknowledges as one of the key practical hurdles to inclusive studies of Mrs. Moodie's writing -- the availability of texts other than *Roughing it in the Bush* (1852) and *Life in the Clearings versus the Bush* (1853).⁵ The first chapter of this thesis, therefore, will detail the story of *The Victoria Magazine* in terms of "the

³ Milman Parry, *The Making of Homeric Verse: The Collected Papers of Milman Parry*, ed. Adam Parry (Oxford: Oxford UP, 1971), p. 411.

⁴ Roland Barthes, "From Work to Text," *Image - Music - Text*, ed. and trans. Stephen Heath (New York, NY: Hill and Wang, 1977), pp. 156-57.

⁵ Michael A. Peterman, "Susanna Moodie," *Canadian Writers and Their Works*, Fiction Ser., vol. 1, eds. Robert Lecker, Jack David, and Ellen Quigley (Downsview, ON: ECW Press, 1983), p. 72.

historically different infrastructural environments⁶ in which it was produced, circulated, and consumed. Drawing extensively on archival materials, personal correspondences, and a variety of literary and non-literary documents, this chapter details the work-a-day realities of *The Victoria Magazine* as a literary *and* business venture. The influence of Joseph Wilson, the Moodies' patron and one of the central "characters" in the story of *The Victoria Magazine*, as well as the political and economic factors that may have led to the demise of the publication after only twelve issues will be discussed.

As coeditor and principal writer of *The Victoria Magazine*, Mrs. Moodie had considerable input into the editorial policies and decisions that would define the personality of the periodical. Hoping to attract the attention and subscription dollars of the rural populace of the colony, Mrs. Moodie was forced to reconcile her own editorial priorities with the expectations and demands of her audience. In the second chapter of this thesis I will discuss the text of *The Victoria Magazine* – fiction and non-fiction – in terms of contemporary audience expectations, the Moodies' underlying editorial priorities, and the political and social pressures that informed the nineteenth-century periodical market.

Mrs. Moodie is one of the few Canadian writers of the nineteenth century whose position in terms of the canon of Canadian literature is firmly established. As Donna E. Smyth notes, she is a charter member, as it were, of a small group of women writers from this period, along with her sister Catharine Parr Traill, Anna Jameson, Frances Brooke, Sara Jeannette Duncan and Isabella Valancy Crawford,

⁶ Louis A. Renza, "Exploding Canons," *Contemporary Literature* 28.2 (1987): 260.

who have been reclaimed as "Word shapers in the public eye."⁷ Mrs. Moodie has become as much a part of our modern national consciousness as she has a part of our literary heritage, having "undergone a sort of literary and cultural canonization"⁸ during the latter half of this century.

It is important to recognize, however, that works of literature are produced within a complex of non-literary institutions that support and are supported by the prevailing system of cultural values. One of the most important of these institutions, partially replacing past structures of court and church, is the academy. "Literature," as Leslie A. Fiedler reminds us, "is effectively what we teach in departments of English; or conversely, what we teach in departments of English is literature."⁹ The academic and critical communities, though not the sole gatekeepers of the literary canon, are integral parts of the processes by which certain works, groups of works, and authors are designated as worthy of study and further critical attention. Necessarily tendentious, literary criticism is also "gap" producing, attributing value -- literary, economic, artistic, and otherwise -- that promotes the material reproduction and social recirculation of certain texts and ideas over others.

The final chapter of this thesis will relocate Mrs. Moodie's involvement with *The Victoria Magazine* in terms of modern critical discussions of her life and work. Dominated by Northrop Frye's garrison framework and Margaret Atwood's creative rewriting of a paranoid schizophrenic "Moodie" character, discussions of Mrs. Moodie since the middle of this century have focused almost exclusively on

⁷ Clara Thomas, Carol Shields, and Donna E. Smyth, "Thinking Back Through Our Mothers': Tradition in Canadian Women's Writing," *Re(Dis)covering Our Foremothers: Nineteenth-Century Canadian Women Writers*, ed. Lorraine McMullen (Ottawa, ON: U of Ottawa P, 1990), p. 15.

⁸ Peterman, p. 63.

⁹ Leslie A. Fiedler, "Literature as an Institution: The View from 1980," *English Literature: Opening Up the Canon*, eds. Leslie A. Fiedler and Houston A. Baker (Baltimore, MD: John Hopkins UP, 1981), p. 73.

Roughing It in the Bush. At best, her role as coeditor and principal writer of the periodical, as well as her many contributions to its pages, has been discussed in brief annotative or bibliographical comments attached to critical examinations of her later works. At worst, her work on *The Victoria Magazine* has been ignored altogether. As a writer of fiction for a working-class Canadian audience, an essayist commenting on a variety of contemporary social issues, and an editor concerned with the influence of her periodical on the people of the New World, the Mrs. Moodie we see in this study of *The Victoria Magazine* is a complex and socially aware individual. By telling the story of *The Victoria Magazine*, this thesis will illuminate all the stories of Mrs. Moodie – those we read, those we tell, and those that remain lost in the gaps.

CHAPTER ONE
THE STORY OF THE VICTORIA MAGAZINE

"It must be obvious," wrote coeditors Susanna and J.W. Dunbar Moodie in "To The Public," their opening editorial for the premier issue of *The Victoria Magazine*:

that while one magazine, such as the 'Literary Garland,' may command a certain circulation, in reference to its size and price, another periodical, such as the 'Victoria Magazine' is intended to be, of a smaller size, and at a very low price, should, of course, be expected to obtain a much wider circulation, to enable the proprietor to secure an adequate remuneration. While one class of readers can afford to give two or three dollars a year for a magazine, a much more numerous class can afford to pay only one dollar per annum. Our hopes of success are, in great measure, founded on this calculation.¹

Encouraged by their fiscal "calculations" and with a firm belief in their own motto that "The surest way to *obtain* is to *deserve* success," the Moodies and their patron, "Mr. Joseph Wilson, the sole proprietor and publisher" (*VM*, i.1), thus began publication of their monthly periodical in September of 1847. Their strategy for success appeared straightforward -- avoid direct competition with John Love!'s Montreal-based *The Literary Garland* and secure an audience from within "that most numerous and not least respected class of our fellow Colonists, -- the rural population of the Province" (*VM*, i.2). The decision to avoid competition with *The Literary Garland* was reinforced by two economic realities -- the fiscal restraints that did not allow the Moodies to remunerate contributing writers and Mrs. Moodie's

¹ Susanna Moodie, and J.W. Dunbar Moodie, eds., *The Victoria Magazine, 1847 - 1848*. Rpt. ed. and intro. William H. New, facs. ed. (Vancouver: U of British Columbia P, 1968), I.i.1. All subsequent references to this book (*VM*) will appear in the body of the thesis.

desire to maintain a working relationship with John Lovell and *The Literary Garland*.

As George Woodcock notes in his opening editorial for the journal *Canadian Literature*:

A new magazine always appears in a double guise. It is in one sense the arriving guest, anxious to exert whatever attractions it may possess on its potential host – the particular public to which it has chosen to appeal. But at the same time it sets out to become a host itself, offering its hospitality to writers and their ideas, and ready to welcome to the salon of its pages the most brilliant and the most erudite of guests.²

This double guise was very much in evidence in the mid-nineteenth century too.

"The longest single publishing enterprise before Confederation,"³ *The Literary Garland* "welcomed" to its pages the finest and most widely recognized of contemporary writers in the Canadas. Anna Jameson, Rosanna Leprohon, John Richardson, Charles Sangster, Catharine Parr Traill, and, of course, Mrs. Moodie herself contributed to the magazine during its thirteen-year existence. *The Literary Garland's* ability to attract such a wealth of contributors was largely the result of the financial policies initiated by Lovell, the magazine's proprietor, and his brother-in-law John Gibson, the editor. Not only was *The Literary Garland* a physical product comparable in quality and price with most of the current American and British imports, but the proprietors of the magazine paid their contributors, a liberal policy that guaranteed Lovell and Gibson their choice of the best of contemporary Canadian writing. Given that remuneration for submissions was "a rare thing in Canadian publishing at any time in its history,"⁴ *The Literary Garland* was recognized by writers of this period as an important potential source of income. As

² George Woodcock, "Editorial," *Canadian Literature* 1 (1959): 3.

³ David Arnason, "Canadian Literary Periodicals of the Nineteenth Century," *Journal of Canadian Fiction* 2.3 (1973): 127.

⁴ *Ibid.*

Carole Gerson notes, it was women writers in particular who benefitted from this unique payment policy since "A page count of work by identified authors shows that in *The Literary Garland* (1838-51) women produced 55 per cent of the poetry and 70 per cent of the fiction."⁵

Mrs. Moodie states in her introduction to *Mark Hurdlestone* (1853) that it had been their "earnest desire" with *The Victoria Magazine* "to encourage as much as possible native-born authors, and to make our magazine a medium through which they might gain the attention of the public" (*MH*, 291). Unfortunately for the Moodies, and for the editors of almost all other literary periodicals of the day, remuneration for potential contributors was a financial luxury that could not be afforded. As the Moodies note in their initial issue:

In a Periodical of this kind it is necessary in the outset, to practice a rigid economy, and it can hardly expect to obtain many contributors until it has secured a sufficient circulation to enable the Proprietor to offer them an adequate remuneration for their services. Still any suitable contributions sent in gratuitously, will be thankfully received.
(*VM*, i.2)

Although *The Victoria Magazine* did include a number of verse and prose works by Mrs. Moodie's sisters, Agnes Strickland and Catharine Parr Traill, as well as by aspiring local writers such as Hamilton Alymer, Thomas McQueen, Louisa May Murray, and Rhoda Ann Page, it was for the most part a Moodie affair. "The greater portion of the articles, and all the reviews and notices of new works, were written by us" (*MH*, 291), notes Mrs. Moodie. It would have been very unlikely given the limitations of this "rigid economy" that the fledgling *The Victoria Magazine* could have hoped to attract as rich a selection of contributors to its pages as would have been necessary to compete with *The Literary Garland* for an audience.

⁵ Carole Gerson, "Anthologies and the Canon of Early Canadian Women Writers," *Re(Dis)covering Our Foremothers*, p. 58.

Equally important in the Moodies' decision to undertake the editing and writing of *The Victoria Magazine* was the state of their personal finances during the 1840s. Although their move from the bush in 1839 had improved the Moodies' financial situation somewhat, hardships would persist throughout their lives. Having established herself as the most frequent contributor to the pages of *The Literary Garland*, Mrs. Moodie was neither willing nor able to distance herself from a consistent and relatively reliable source of income. The importance of the monies received from her contributions to *The Literary Garland* cannot be understated. As Clara Thomas asserts, Mrs. Moodie's "writing became more and more a career and a vocation, its income always a needed addition to the family funds."⁶ In *Roughing It in the Bush*, Mrs. Moodie recounts her initial steps towards establishing a successful career "writing for bread" (*MH*, 291):

Several other American editors had written to me to furnish them with articles; but I was unable to pay the postage of heavy packets to the States ... I wrote to Mr. L—, and frankly informed him how I was situated. In the most liberal manner, he offered to pay the postage on all manuscripts to his office, and left me to name my own terms of remuneration. This opened up a new era in my existence ... I actually shed tears of joy over the first twenty-dollar bill I received from Montreal. It was my own; I had earned it with my own hand; and it seemed to my delighted fancy to form the nucleus out of which a future independence for my family might arise.⁷

In 1842, the earning power of her pen allowed her to entrust John Lovell with the task of selecting and overseeing the shipment of a piano from Montreal to Belleville, the resulting account to be settled by a "quantity of writing" that would

⁶ Clara Thomas, "The Strickland Sisters," *The Clear Spirit: Twenty Canadian Women and Their Times*, ed. Mary Quayle Innis (Toronto, ON: U of Toronto P, 1966), p. 68.

⁷ Susanna Moodie, *Roughing It in the Bush; or, Life In Canada*, 1852; ed. Carl Ballstadt (Ottawa, ON: Carleton UP, 1988), pp. 440-41. All subsequent references to this book (*RI*) will appear in the body of the thesis.

allow her "to pay off the old arrears."⁸ In "a mere business letter" to Louisa May Murray in 1851, Mrs. Moodie emphasizes the generosity of John Lovell as well as the need for writers to attend to the business as well as the art of writing: "If remuneration is any object to you, I have named the sum I receive [five pounds per sheet], thinking it might afford you a clue to fix your own terms with Mr. Lovell, whom I have ever found a most liberal and kind friend."⁹ Ranging by her own account "from twenty to forty pounds per annum" (*MH*, 290), the monies Mrs. Moodie received for her contributions to *The Literary Garland* were needed to supplement the approximately 250 pounds that J.W. Dunbar's unsalaried position as Sheriff of Hasting provided. Sheriff Moodie's financial arrangement was far from being atypical. All sheriffs of the day were unpaid, their sparse earnings coming from the fees they collected for serving writs and the like.¹⁰ Given J.W. Dunbar's well-documented lack of business acumen, however, and the local practice of deferring payment of his official fees for extended periods of time, Mrs. Moodie's income from writing was essential to her family.

In their first issue, the Moodies announce that they had not undertaken the management of *The Victoria Magazine* "for Mr. Wilson, with any desire to rival, still less to injure, any other magazines in Canada" (*VM*, i.1). On the contrary, Mrs.

⁸ Susanna Moodie, "To John Lovell," 26 November 1842, letter 40 of *Susanna Moodie: Letters of a Lifetime*, eds. Carl Ballstadt, Elizabeth Hopkins, and Michael Peterman (Toronto, ON: U of Toronto P, 1985), p. 97.

⁹ "To Louisa May Murray," 13 January 1851, letter 42, *Letters of a Lifetime*, p. 99. Whatever the final arrangements may have been, Murray's "Fauna; or the Red Flower of Leafy Hollow" was serialized in *The Literary Garland* between April and October of 1851. Mrs. Moodie repeated this rate per sheet agreement later as well, adding that "The magazine was of large size, with double columns, and in very small type. It required a great deal of writing to fill a sheet" (*MH*, 286).

¹⁰ Audrey Y. Morris, *Gentle Pioneers: Five Nineteenth-Century Canadians* (Toronto, ON: Hodder and Stoughton, 1968), p. 184. In later years Sheriff Moodie was a member of a committee of sheriffs who petitioned the Governor for adequate and regular compensation.

Moodie's new editorial position would in no way interfere with her association with *The Literary Garland*. There was, they state, "no intention, on her part, of discontinuing her long connection with the 'Garland,' should her contributions continue to be received with the same kindness they have always experienced from the esteemed and spirited conductors of that magazine" (*VM*, i.1). The Moodies went on to review and promote issues of *The Literary Garland* three times during the "literary existence" of *The Victoria Magazine*, celebrating the Montreal-based periodical's tenth year of publication with the hope that "Long may it continue to bloom and flourish; and to hold, as it has hitherto done, the first place in the periodical literature of this country" (*VM*, vii.168).¹¹ It is obvious that Lovell and Gibson found this open arrangement acceptable. From September 1847 to August 1848, the period during which Mrs. Moodie edited and wrote extensively for her own "cheap periodical," *The Literary Garland* published five of her verse submissions as well as the prose works "Brian, The Still Hunter" and the first eight installments of "Jane Redgrave -- a village story."¹² Mrs. Moodie would continue to publish regularly in Lovell and Gibson's periodical following the demise of her own magazine project in 1848.

Encouraged by the success of *The Literary Garland*, and considering it as a model rather than a rival, the Moodies and Wilson sought to attract subscribers from among the poorer settlers of the colony. As the Prospectus that appeared in a number of local newspapers and journals promised, the physical layout of the publication was to be standard in terms of contemporary periodicals:

¹¹ See also iii.72 and x.240 for similar reviews of issues of *The Literary Garland*.

¹² Mary Markham Brown, *An Index to The Literary Garland* (Toronto, ON: Bibliographical Society of Canada, 1962), p. 28.

The *Victoria Magazine* will contain twenty four pages in each number, printed on new type, and upon good paper; and will form at the end of the year a neat Volume, of 288 pages, together with the Title Page and Index.¹³

The magazine would be issued monthly from Wilson's office on Front Street in Belleville at a yearly subscription rate of one dollar per annum, invariably to be paid in advance. "The low price at which the Periodical is placed," the Prospectus outlines, "is in order that every person within the Colony, who can read, and is anxious for moral and mental improvement, may become a subscriber and patron of the work."

But *The Victoria Magazine* found itself competing in a market in which "the average life expectancy of literary magazines ... was about two years, though there does not seem to be any relationship between quality and viability."¹⁴ In addition to their reflections on *The Literary Garland*, which had a wide circulation all through the colony, the Moodies noted the introduction or current condition of a number of local newspapers and periodicals competing for subscribers. Originating from Belleville were *Wilson's Experiment*, another "cheap and excellent periodical" (*VM*, iv.96), and *Wilson's Canada Casket* (*VM*, xi.264), both published by the Moodies' patron, Joseph Wilson. Joseph Leonard, previously the editor of the *Canadian Christian Advocate*, commenced publication of his monthly *Canadian Gem and Family Visitor* (1848-49), "a periodical, entirely devoted to moral and religious instruction" (*VM*, vii.168), at Cobourg. The *Newcastle Courier*, edited by James McCarroll and also published at Cobourg was reviewed by the Moodies (*VM*, v.120). Peter Ruthven's semi-monthly *The Calliopean* came out of Hamilton (*VM*, v.119), and in Goderich Thomas McQueen edited the weekly *Huron Signal* (*VM*,

¹³ See Appendix A of the thesis for a detailed list of dates and locations of advertisements, reviews, and notices of *The Victoria Magazine*.

¹⁴ Arnason, p. 128.

vii.167).¹⁵ In addition, *Barker's Canadian Magazine* (1846-47), "decidedly the best magazine that had appeared in the Upper Province" (*MH*, 291), originated from Kingston during this period. As New suggests, the picture is of a market that "must have come close to being glutted"¹⁶ in the late 1840s.

Even in this competitive environment, *The Victoria Magazine* was able to attract a substantial number of subscribers with its "low price of five shillings per annum" (*MH*, 291). "Our subscription list contained eight hundred names," wrote Mrs. Moodie in 1853, all of whom "had paid their twelvemonth's subscriptions in advance" (*MH*, 291). She would later lower this number, stating to Richard Bentley in the mid-1860s that "the Mag. was a success, having obtained the first year 500 subscribers, who *all paid in advance*, and who were ready to subscribe again, if we would continue to conduct it."¹⁷ The "List of Subscriber's Names" included with the final issue supports the higher figure, registering 781 names and covering an area from Toronto with thirty-seven listed subscribers to Montreal with six. The city of Belleville provided the foundation of subscriber support with 260 of the 781 subscribers listed, or thirty-three percent of the subscription base. Given that Belleville in the late 1840s was a city "containing a population of about 3,000 souls" (*VM*, v.116),¹⁸ the subscription rate in relation to population is, as New suggests, a

¹⁵ Both James McCarroll and Thomas McQueen were also contributors to *The Victoria Magazine*.

¹⁶ New, introduction, *The Victoria Magazine, 1847-1848*, vii.

¹⁷ "To Richard Bentley," 24 April 1865, letter 78, *Letters of a Lifetime*, p. 217.

¹⁸ This accurate estimation of Belleville's population is consistent with those forwarded by the Moodies in other writings. In his contribution to *Roughing It*, J.W. Dunbar notes that in 1839 the population of Belleville was about 1500, in 1850 it had reached 3326, and by 1852 it appeared to be 4554 (*RI*, 536). In *Life in the Clearings versus the Bush*, Mrs. Moodie notes that population of Belleville in 1840 was 1500 (49).

number that "would make a modern magazine publisher justifiably envious."¹⁹ In comparison, the location with the second highest subscriber population, Kingston, had a relatively small proportion with sixty listed names, or just under eight percent.

In the final installment of their "Editor's Table," the Moodies suggest that it was the working-class population of the region to whom the magazine was indebted:

To the strong handed and right-hearted Yeoman, the glory of the Canadian soil, and to the industrious mechanic, from whose labors we derive so much of our national independence, prosperity and comfort, our thanks are due. — They generously paid their subscriptions in advance, and that during a season of agricultural and commercial distress, unparalleled [sic] in the country. (*VM*, xii.287)

What is evident from the subscriber list, however, is that a large number of subscribers came from outside the sector of the population to whom Wilson and his editors had looked "for encouragement and support in our undertaking" (*VM*, i.2). Included are the names of such notable figures as the Governor General Lord Elgin, Lord Bishop Strachan, and the Hon. Robert Baldwin as well as eleven doctors, eight clergy, and sixty-six esquired gentlemen. Whether or not *The Victoria Magazine* succeeded in attracting the attention and financial support of the rural populace and lower classes, as the management's "calculations" had suggested it would, remains open to question.

In spite of an apparently secure subscription base established during its first year of operation, *The Victoria Magazine* ceased publication in August of 1848 after only twelve issues. "It has been deemed advisable," explained the Moodies,

not to commence the second volume of the Victoria Magazine, until the first of January 1849; when some new arrangements will in all probability be made respecting it. (*VM*, xii.288)

Although these "new arrangements" were obviously never made, the circumstances surrounding the collapse of *The Victoria Magazine* remain sketchy. Morris suggests

¹⁹ New, introduction, p. vii.

that the magazine failed because "The peasants were not interested in cheap culture,"²⁰ but the closure was more likely the result of a number of interrelated factors. Although few personal or business letters have been recovered from this period, three factors in particular seem to have contributed to the cessation of publication.

In retrospect the most obvious and ultimately unavoidable ingredient in the demise of *The Victoria Magazine* originated from without. The Canadian periodical market was changing rapidly in the late 1840s with competition increasing from both the United States and, to a lesser extent, Britain. "These American monthlies," lamented Mrs. Moodie in 1853, "got up in the first style, handsomely illustrated, and composed of the best articles, selected from European and American magazines, are sold at such a low rate that one or the other is to be found in almost every decent house in the province. It was utterly impossible for a colonial magazine to compete with them" (*WH*, 290). Compounding the problem of competition originating from south of the border were, according to Arnason, "copyright laws that discriminated against Canadian authors and Canadian publishers."²¹ Even *The Literary Garland*, languishing somewhat after the death of its editor John Gibson in 1850, was unable to overcome these obstacles. In 1851 it too ceased publication, "done to death," as Mrs. Moodie would note, "by *Harper's Magazine* and the *International*" (*MH*, 290).

On a more personal level, the Moodies' adjustment to the schismatic political and social environment of Belleville was not without some problems. As Mrs. Moodie noted in *Life in the Clearings versus the Bush*, Belleville during the late 1830s and 40s was a city divided by party politics:

²⁰ Morris, p. 206.

²¹ Arnason, p. 128.

Men looked distrustfully upon each other, and the demon of party reigned preeminent, as much in the drawing-room as in the council-chamber.

The town was divided into two fierce political factions; and however moderate your views might be, to belong to one was to incur the dislike and ill-will of the other. The Tory party ... branded, indiscriminately, the large body of Reformers as traitors and rebels ... But the odious term of rebel ... gave rise to bitter and resentful feelings, which were ready, on all public occasions, to burst into a flame.²²

Morris concurs, remarking that "unlike the backwoods, this community was progressive enough to have lines rigidly drawn on the basis of religion, politics and racial origin, distinctions so bitterly maintained that no one was allowed to be neutral."²³ J.W. Dunbar's appointment by Sir George Arthur to the shrievalty of Victoria District (soon thereafter renamed Hastings County) placed him in a highly politicized position prior to the Moodies' relocation to the community in 1839. The new sheriff was thrown, albeit unwittingly, into the centre of each factional conflict. In "winning" the post, he found himself in direct confrontation with at least one notable local, Thomas Parker, who had garnered considerable support for the job of sheriff prior to J. W. Dunbar's appointment.²⁴ Because Parker was a prominent Belleville Tory who had "lost" the job, the new sheriff, and by association his spouse, in the minds of the townspeople had to be Reformers. Further fueling these speculations was the Moodies' growing friendship with the prominent Reform leader Robert Baldwin.²⁵

The battle lines were clearly drawn. In 1841 and 1842, Sheriff Moodie was

²² Susanna Moodie, *Life in the Clearings versus the Bush* (1853; Toronto, ON: McClelland and Stewart, 1989), p. 56. All subsequent references to this book (LC) will appear in the body of the thesis.

²³ Morris, p. 169.

²⁴ Parker would later hold the more financially lucrative post of Inspector of Potashes for the District (Morris, 206).

²⁵ Ballstadt et al., p. 83 and Morris, p. 208. In honour of this friendship, the Moodies named their last child, a son born 8 July 1843, Robert Baldwin.

the Returning Officer for two general elections that pitted Baldwin and Belleville Tory Edward Murney against each other in increasingly bitter local campaigns. Riots erupted all over the province, and in Belleville Sheriff Moodie reacted by closing the polls prematurely and calling in the militia in an attempt to stop the spread of factional violence. Although his decisions succeeded admirably in the short term, he found himself subsequently accused of political bias and "undue manipulation of the poll."²⁶ While eventually acquitted of these charges, he remained under fire from those opposed to his appointment. A public confrontation with the local magistracy and other malicious rumours of political chicanery did little to enhance his already precarious position in Belleville.²⁷ In a letter to Richard Bentley in 1865, J.W. Dunbar recalls his experiences during his tenure as Sheriff:

From the time of my appointment to the Shrievalty in 1839 I had to contend with a succession of petty persecutions got up by parties desirous of holding my office. A number of civil actions of one kind or another were one after another instituted against me. I had never attached myself to either of the violent parties that distracted the colony.²⁸

Sheriff Moodie's career, summarizes Morris, "although not entirely without blemish ... sparkled in contrast with the usual standards of behaviour" (172). But as Gerson notes, J.W. Dunbar considered it necessary to use the Introduction to his *Scenes and Adventures, As a Soldier and Settler, During Half a Century* (1866) as "a catalogue of the virtues and sufferings of himself and his family, and a justification of the

²⁶ Morris, p. 195.

²⁷ *Ibid.*, 189.

²⁸ J.W. Dunbar Moodie, letter to Richard Bentley 6 May 1865, letter 78, Patrick Hamilton Ewing Collection, National Archives of Canada, Ottawa.

practices which in 1863 led to his reluctant resignation from his position as Sheriff of Hastings County."²⁹

Even in this passionately political environment, the Moodies' ambition was to establish *The Victoria Magazine* as neutral political territory. Their position, as J.W. Dunbar articulates in his essay "Religion and Loyalty," is one of compromise, not confrontation: "We wish to promote peace -- not stir up war" (*VM*, v.104). In reviewing McQueen's *Huron Signal*, the Moodies emphasize that "It is enough for us to believe, which we do most sincerely, that he has the good of mankind at heart. We care not whether he be a reformer or conservative" (*VM*, vii.167). In the final issue of *The Victoria Magazine*, they again repeat their claim to "have endeavoured to eschew all party feelings, and to banish from the pages of the Victoria, all subjects, however interesting, that might lead to angry discussion" (*VM*, xii.287). The actions that frequently resulted from such discussions were often violent. During the late 1830s and throughout the 1840s, Douglas Fetherling notes, "the Tories virtually eliminated the Reform press."³⁰ Lynching of publishers of Reform newspapers, including S.P. Hart of the Belleville *Plain Speaker*, was not uncommon. As late as 1849, according to Fetherling, "the London *Free Press* was wrecked by a political mob."³¹ Regardless of how frequently they attempted to depoliticize the existence of *The Victoria Magazine*, it seems highly unlikely, given the bitterness of the conflicts that dominated the local scene, that the magazine could escape being negatively impacted to some degree.

A third factor in the failure of *The Victoria Magazine* to extend publication

²⁹ Carole Gerson, "Mrs. Moodie's Beloved Partner," *Canadian Literature* 107 (1985): 42-43.

³⁰ Douglas Fetherling, *The Rise of the Canadian Newspaper* (Toronto, ON: Oxford UP, 1990), p. 24.

³¹ *Ibid.*

beyond one year may have been the outside interests of its proprietor. An active figure in the local publishing community, Joseph Wilson had come to *The Victoria Magazine* project with a range of publishing experience, probably hoping "to capitalize on Mrs. Moodie's popularity and through her that of the *Literary Garland*."³² Beginning on 28 December 1830 and based at this time in Hallowell, Ontario, he had published *The Hallowell Free Press*, a weekly newspaper appearing every Tuesday. Edited for a short time by W.A. Welles, who would later resurface in Belleville as a principal in *The Anglo-Canadian*,³³ Wilson's newspaper continued through until December of 1834 at a subscription rate of fifteen shillings per annum, eighteen by mail.³⁴ With its mixture of "miscellany and foreign intelligence," local announcements, grain and stock prices, and anonymous or pseudonymous letters, *The Hallowell Free Press* fits neatly into Mrs. Moodie's description of contemporary newspapers:

A Canadian newspaper is a strange *melange* of politics, religion, abuse, and general information. It contains, in a condensed form, all the news of the Old and the New World, and informs its readers of what is passing on the great globe, from the North Pole to the gold mines of Australia and California. So much matter has to be contained in so small a space that no room remains for dulness.
(*MH*, p. 292)

The classified pages of the paper also reveal Joseph Wilson as, if nothing else, a businessman attentive to all entrepreneurial opportunities. His offices housed a printing operation willing to "execute ... Circulars, Blanks of every description, Handbills, Cards &c, in a neat and expeditious manner,"³⁵ as well as a full book-

³² Morris, p. 205.

³³ W.C. Mikel, *City of Belleville History* (Picton, ON: Picton Gazette, 1943), p. 313.

³⁴ The date of the final issue of the *Hallowell Free Press* remains vague. The final issue recovered to date places publication to November of 1834.

³⁵ *The Hallowell Free Press*, 4 January 1831.

binding service and bookstore.³⁶ Included in Wilson's numerous advertisements during the five years of *The Hallowell Free Press* are announcements of the "recent arrivals" of Pope's *Essays*, a two-volume edition of *Paradise Lost*, Galt's *Life of Byron*, and the standard selection of Bibles and hymn books. Wilson also handled subscriptions for the *New York Mirror*, and published and distributed his own editions of a number of texts, including Lindley Murray's *Introduction to the English Reader* (1832) and Samuel Thomson's *New Guide to Health, or Botanic Family Physician* (1833).³⁷ His inventory expanded at various times to include a "full range of perfumery," seasoned floor planks, walnuts by the bushel, and, on at least one advertised occasion, whiskey.³⁸

In *Mark Hurdlestone*, Mrs. Moodie comments that concurrent with his involvement in *The Victoria Magazine*, Joseph Wilson "was engaged in several literary speculations" (MH, 291). A Prospectus for *Wilson's Experiment* began appearing in at least one local newspaper as early as November of 1847.³⁹ Advertising Wilson's newest periodical as "The Cheapest Paper in the Canadas" at one shilling and three pence per annum, the notice also states that "in order to ensure success, the Subscription List must reach 20,000; and in order to arrive at this

³⁶ Around December of 1833 Wilson's Bookstore underwent a name change. Located at the same address and under the same ownership, it became known as the Prince Edward Book-Store.

³⁷ Patricia Lockhart Fleming in *Upper Canadian Imprints, 1801-1841: A Bibliography* confirms Wilson as printer and publisher of editions of Susanna Rowson's *Charlotte Temple*, (1832), *The Canada Almanac and Farmer's Calendar* (1833 and 1834), *The Constitution of the Canada's* (1833), the Holy Bible (1834), and *Wilson's Calendar or Canada Almanac* (1835). In the role of printer, Wilson also assisted in the preparation of Ahira Griswold Meacham's *A Compendious History of the Methodist Church* (1832) and Moses Marcus' *The Tear of Sympathy* (1834).

³⁸ 14 March 1831: "All persons indebted to the subscriber for WHISKEY will be sued without reserve by the first day of April next, if their accounts are not settled previous to that date."

³⁹ Appeared in the *Cobourg Star* on three occasions: 17 and 24 November 1847, and 8 December 1847.

enormous circulation, the Proprietor is aware that it must not only be the *Cheapest Paper in Canada*, but the most *Interesting, Amusing and Useful*." To this end Wilson promises to record thrilling romances, picturesque descriptions, original stories, and scientific material. In sharp contrast to his policies with *The Victoria Magazine*, Wilson also states his intention to offer "Premiums to quite an amount, for the Best Original Articles -- thereby securing THE Talent of the Country to be its Contributors." Notices of *Wilson's Experiment* appeared in *The Victoria Magazine* (VM, iv.96) and in the *Huron Signal*.⁴⁰

The Moodies review another of Wilson's literary endeavours, *Wilson's Canada Casket*, in September of 1848, pronouncing the subscription rate of fifteen pence per year affordable and the text of the magazine "in no way inferior to its elder brother [*Wilson's Experiment*], and likely to enjoy a still wider circulation" (VM, xi.264). In June of 1849, an anonymous reviewer writing for McQueen's *Huron Signal* gives a less favourable review of yet another of Wilson's publications, *Wilson's Eclectic Magazine*:

We have received the first number of Wilson's Eclectic Magazine published by Mr. JOSEPH WILSON of Belleville. We are always proud to see and to hail attempts to establish periodical literature, especially in Canada, and we have, oftener than once, had the pleasure of complimenting Mr. Wilson for his enterprise in this description of publications. In fact we seldom feel disposed to censure attempts in literature, and it is with reluctance that we pronounce the "Eclectic Magazine" *very far from being an improvement* on the "Victoria Magazine." -- The Engraving and the letter press are both passable, but there is evidently that lack of an Editor ... We hope Mr. Wilson will, by securing the services of some Literary person, render the second number of the Eclectic Magazine more worthy of public patronage.⁴¹

⁴⁰ Anon., *Huron Signal* 29 September 1847: "WILSON'S EXPERIMENT is the name of a new monthly paper, to be issued at the cheap rate of 1s. 3d. per annum. Of course the intention of the Publisher, is to make this more a paper of selections, than original material, and his labours will be well requited if he shews a proper taste in making the selections. We wish Mr. Wilson every success in his undertaking.-- Belleville Intelligencer."

⁴¹ Anon., *Huron Signal* 29 June 1849.

Although no extant issues of *Wilson's Eclectic Magazine* have been located, William Canniff suggests that the publication lasted only one year and was "discontinued, not because [it] did not pay; but in consequence of embarrassment from other causes."⁴² Mikel notes that following the demise of *The Victoria Magazine* "Mr. Wilson then attempted various publications, 'The Eclectic Magazine,' 'Wilson's Experiment,' 'Wilson's Canada Casket,' etc., but none of them were of long or robust life."⁴³

Evidently Wilson's entrepreneurial enthusiasm was not diminished by his move to Belleville. The four extant pages of *Wilson's Experiment* contain two ads for his Victoria Bookstore, located on Front Street, Belleville. Again his selection of titles is diverse, including William Hazlitt's *The English Comic Writers* and *Table Talk*, and Sir Francis Head's *Bubbles from the Brunnen*. New's suggestion, therefore, that at the end of *The Victoria Magazine's* first year "Joseph Wilson supplied no further financing ... his interests were moving in another direction"⁴⁴ is not unlikely.

Mrs. Moodie's version of Wilson's involvement in *The Victoria Magazine* raises further questions about his role in the magazine's closure and his relationship with the Moodies. The final issue gives some indication of a series of financial problems curtailing the scope of the articles that were published. The Moodies apologize for a "want of pecuniary means," which would have allowed them to review and print extracts from recently released books rather than from "works already generally known" (*VM*, xii.288). Continuing in this apologetic tone, they cite "adverse circumstances" as the reason for the delay in publication of the twelfth and ultimately final issue, announcing the cessation of publication shortly thereafter:

⁴² William Canniff, *The Settlement of Upper Canada* (1869; Rpt. Belleville, ON: Mika Silk Screening, 1971), p. 362.

⁴³ Mikel, p. 313. See also Canniff, p. 362.

⁴⁴ New, introduction, p. x.

Finding it impossible in the present state of our finances to remove this difficulty, we shall in the future drop the *Editor's Table*, altogether, and substitute in its place, miscellaneous articles, gathered from other sources of general interest. (*VM*, xii.288)

In their final "Editor's Table" the Moodies also suggest that "Perhaps we may become both Editor's and Proprietor's of the work, or our connection with it, may cease altogether" (*VM*, xii.288). A notice in the *Huron Signal* in December of 1848 suggests that the Moodies may have been serious in these plans for another magazine before setting aside the idea for financial reasons:

VICTORIA MAGAZINE -- We beg to call attention to an Advertisement in this paper of the above named Magazine. The Prospectus of "*Moodie's Magazine*" to take the place of this monthly, will probably appear next week.⁴⁵

In *Mark Hurdlestone* Mrs. Moodie states that it was Wilson who ultimately put a stop to progress of *The Victoria Magazine*, undoubtedly "a considerable gainer by the publication, although we received nothing for our trouble" (*MH*, 291). Seventeen years later in a letter to Bentley, Mrs. Moodie would again repeat that "The proprietor [Wilson] was such a dishonest fellow," adding that she and her husband would have declined any offer to return in their editorial roles even if the project had continued.⁴⁶ At least one contemporary of the Moodies, Thomas McQueen, was not surprised at the turn of these financial affairs. In a letter to J.W. Dunbar in 1850, he writes:

I am not at all disappointed in the character of Wilson, for I had put him down as a humbug the first time I ever conversed with him, and although I once or twice gave him a [puff] on the score of enterprize, I was fully aware that a sordid love of the "Dimes and Dollars" lay at the bottom of all his enterprize.⁴⁷

⁴⁵ Anon. *Huron Signal* 15 December 1848.

⁴⁶ "To Richard Bentley," 24 April 1865, letter 78, *Letters of a Lifetime*, p. 217.

⁴⁷ Thomas McQueen, letter to John Wedderburn Dunbar Moodie, 23 February 1850, letter 41, Patrick Hamilton Ewing Collection.

The "new arrangements" to which the Moodies alluded in the final issue were never made, however, and since they were unable to finance the continuance of the project themselves, *The Victoria Magazine* never returned.

Although *The Victoria Magazine* survived for only twelve issues, it remains, as Thomas suggests, a monument to the enterprise of the Moodies.⁴⁸ Unable to attract the quality or quantity of outside writing that they felt would consistently satisfy their editorial standards and appeal to readers, the couple ambitiously wrote the majority of each issue. Looked upon as outsiders in the volatile political environment of Belleville and frequently thrust into the middle of physical and ideological battles, they struggled to keep their magazine above politics, to write "with the interest of mankind" (*VM*, i.2) rather than the interest of party in mind. In the end, the common "work-a-day realities" of a "rigid economy," politics, and free market competition combined to spell the end of the business and literary venture that was *The Victoria Magazine*.

⁴⁸ Thomas, "The Strickland Sisters," p. 69.

CHAPTER TWO
TO ENTERTAIN AND TO INSTRUCT:
BALANCING EDITORIAL PRIORITIES

In the Prospectus for *The Victoria Magazine*, the Moodies announce to their potential readers exactly what to expect in the pages of the periodical:

The Editors of the Victoria Magazine will devote all their talents to produce a useful, entertaining, and cheap Periodical for the Canadian People; which may afford amusement to both old and young. Sketches and Tales, in verse and prose, Moral Essays, Statistics of the Colony, Scraps of Useful Information, Reviews of New Works, and well selected articles from the most popular authors of the day, will form the pages of the Magazine.¹

As both the editors and principal writers of the magazine, and working as they did for a proprietor whose primary interest was, apparently, monetary rather than editorial, the Moodies were in a strong position to exert strict editorial control over their "periodical for the people" (*MH*, 291). They were responsible for establishing the policies that would ensure that each issue of *The Victoria Magazine* would deliver to its intended audience a specific political, philosophical, and moral view of the reader and the world. Considering themselves "literary philanthropists wishing hearty and heartfelt success, to every sincere pioneer in the exalted and noble cause of mental improvement" (*VM*, xii.288), the Moodies were part of the cultural elite, the men and women privileged by socioeconomic status or education who "took it

¹ See Appendix A for full bibliographic details concerning publication dates and locations of this Prospectus.

upon themselves to shape the writing and reading habits of their compatriots."² As they state in the final issue of *The Victoria Magazine*:

The hope of inducing a taste for polite literature among the working classes; for we are no respectors of persons, the mental improvement of the masses being the object nearest our hearts, first stimulated us to accept the editorship of the Magazine. (*VM*, xii.287)

It is important to recognize that the text of *The Victoria Magazine* was not structured entirely by the editorial pens of the Moodies. Sociocultural influences, including the expectations of both the editors and the audience of *The Victoria Magazine* as to what periodical literature should and could accomplish, as well as contemporary political and economic realities informed the selection of material for publication. For the Moodies, the desire to avoid political controversy was a central concern: "All subjects, however interesting, that might lead to angry discussion" (*VM*, xii.287) were avoided. Their primary impulse was pedagogic rather than based in party politics. Their goals in editing *The Victoria Magazine* were to induce a taste for polite literature, to promote the benefits of mental improvement and the institution of a system of common schools, and to call for a reevaluation of the current goals of education in the colony. For Mrs. Moodie these editorial goals were a natural extension of her own childhood experiences in a family that emphasized education and intellectual pursuits.

Born into a literary family and educated at home by her father, the young Susanna Strickland became aware early in her life of the advantages of what she calls "mental cultivation." Although recurring illness and business misfortunes did not allow her father the opportunity to continue the "severe but well-planned tutelage"³ he had undertaken with Susanna's three eldest sisters, he did continue to

² Carole Gerson, *A Purer Taste: The Writing and Reading of Fiction in English in Nineteenth-Century Canada* (Toronto, ON: U of Toronto P, 1989), p. xi.

³ Ballstadt et al., *Letters of a Lifetime*, p. 4.

make the education of his daughters a personal priority. As Sara Eaton suggests, he recognized that "girls [as well as boys] should develop their brains to the best of their ability."⁴ In the autobiographical fiction "Rachel Wilde, or, Trifles from the Burthen of a Life,"⁵ Mrs. Moodie paints a vivid picture of a dedicated father who is modelled closely after her own. Like Mr. Strickland, the patriarch of the Wilde family "had lost a large fortune in entering too deeply into commercial speculations" (*VM*, v.113). "The youngest of a very large family, composed mostly of females," Rachel is raised along with her sisters "in solitude, and educated at home, their amusements and pursuits were chiefly of the mental cast" (*VM*, v.113). The principal educator of the Wilde offspring is their father,

a man of great scientific and literary acquirements. He was a vigorous and independent thinker, and paid little regard to the received prejudices and opinions of the world. He acted from conscience, and the dictates of a powerful mind; was an excellent husband and father. (*VM*, v.113)

The narrator of Rachel's story emphasizes the significance and influence such a strong parental role model has in the life of an individual, suggesting that "The memory of such a parent never dies; it lives for ever in the heart of his children. In after-life they are proud to echo his words, and maintain his opinions" (*VM*, v.113).

Like Mr. Strickland, the fictional Mr. Wilde tutors his children using pedagogic strategies and techniques promoted by followers of the Swiss pedagogic reformer and philosopher Johann Heinrich Pestalozzi (1746-1827). Inspired by Rousseau's *Emile* (1762), Pestalozzi wrote extensively on the social and humanitarian benefits to be realized through the democratization of the existing elite educational system. A frequent contributor of essays to the journal

⁴ Sara Eaton, *Lady of the Backwoods: A Biography of Catherine Parr Traill* (Toronto, ON: McClelland and Stewart, 1969), p. 4.

⁵ "Rachel Wilde" was serialized in seven of the twelve issues of *The Victoria Magazine*: v.113-15, vi.126-28, vii.156-59, viii.183-87, ix.212-14, x.234-37, xi.250-52.

Ephemerides, he published a series of three "Essays on Education of the Children of the Poor" between 1775 and 1778 promoting the institution of a system of common schools.⁶ Two years later, he returned to the periodical format to publish anonymously *The Evening Hours of a Hermit* (1780), a series of aphorisms in which he detailed his programme of pedagogic reform. Democratization of education was again the central issue:

Education is nothing more than the polishing of each single link in the great chain that binds humanity together and gives it unity. The failings of education and human conduct spring as a rule from: our disengaging a single link and giving it special treatment as though it were a unit itself, rather than part of the chain.⁷

In a number of later and longer prose works, Pestalozzi continued to refine and promote his belief that schools and educational systems must be kept free from the antagonisms of class. He argued that the traditional techniques of rote learning must be replaced by an emphasis on intellectual discussion and reflection. Education must be considered as an ongoing and stimulating process, he argued, not limited by rigid hours of studies, classroom walls, or inflexible timetables. In perhaps his most well-known book, *Leonard and Gertrude* (1781), a four-volume work subtitled "A Novel For The People," Pestalozzi expands the parameters of his discussion to include family life and the importance of the home environment for learning, affirming that parental intervention is the most potent of all forces for education.⁸ A number of especially vocal proponents of Pestalozzianism were

⁶ For further details of his life and works influencing nineteenth-century education, see Robert B. Downs, *Heinrich Pestalozzi: Father of Modern Pedagogy* (Boston, MA: Twayne, 1975).

⁷ Johann Heinrich Pestalozzi, *The Education of Man: Aphorisms*, trans. Heinz and Ruth Norden (New York, NY: Philosophical Library, 1951), p. 32.

⁸ In his next extended prose piece, *Christopher and Elizabeth* (1782), Pestalozzi has four characters, two male and two female, discuss chapter by chapter the programme laid out in *Leonard and Gertrude*. His later prose works of note include *Inquiry into the Course of Nature in the Development of the Human Race* (1797) and *How Gertrude Teaches Her Children* (1801).

active in Britain during the period of the young Stricklands' education, including Robert Owen (1771-1858), James Greaves (1777-1842), and Charles Mayo (1792-1846).

As the elder Strickland daughters -- Eliza, Agnes, and Sarah -- became prosperous in their own literary endeavours, Susanna and the other younger siblings witnessed firsthand the material and social benefits that came to those who remained dedicated to their intellectual pursuits and attentive to their father's training. Susanna's later experiences in the social and intellectual circles of London, her friendships with Thomas Harral, Thomas Pringle, and James and Emma Bird, and her brief work as a pamphleteer for the Anti-Slavery League, only reinforced her belief in "the indispensable requirements of education" (*RI*, 208).⁹

Mrs. Moodie's desire to perpetuate this familial emphasis on mental improvement through the pages of *The Victoria Magazine* was curtailed somewhat by the economic and cultural realities of the marketplace in Upper Canada in the 1840s. By the mid-nineteenth century there was an established "pattern of the literary miscellany or magazine that was to dominate Canadian literary publishing throughout the nineteenth century."¹⁰ As New notes, by the Moodies' day "the appeal of the miscellany as a literary entertainment" and of the "local journals and newspapers which themselves served as monthly miscellanies of literature and politics, and as outlets for stories and poems by local authors"¹¹ were trends that could not be overlooked by publishers or editors. In a periodical and newspaper market glutted with publications dedicated solely to colourful and often libellous

⁹ James Bird's "To A Friend on His Emigration to Canada" is printed in the premier issue of *The Victoria Magazine* (*VM*, i.17).

¹⁰ Arnason, p. 125.

¹¹ W.H. New, *Dreams of Speech and Violence: The Art of the Short Story in Canada and New Zealand* (Toronto, ON: U of Toronto P, 1987), p. 34.

personal and political attacks, rigidly didactic journals were unlikely to attract or hold the attention of readers for an extended period. In order to attract an audience from within that diverse "class of readers who peruse books more for amusement than instruction" (*RI*, 518), a periodical had to be first and foremost entertaining and cheap. At a subscription rate of one dollar per annum *The Victoria Magazine* was affordable, but the question remained as to whether it could be entertaining. In selecting and writing material for publication in *The Victoria Magazine*, therefore, the Moodies were forced to strike a delicate balance between their primary pedagogic impulse and the paying audience's desire for amusement and diversion. As J.W. Dunbar notes in *Roughing It in the Bush*, "travellers and book-makers, like cooks, have to collect high-flavoured dishes, from far and near, the better to please the palates of their patrons" (*RI*, 234). It was the fiction of *The Victoria Magazine*, much of which would reappear in the Moodies' later works, that was to be the spice that would please readers.

FICTION AS ENTERTAINMENT

As the editors of a periodical for the people, the Moodies found themselves facing a classic Horatian dilemma. Aware of the dynamics of a highly competitive market economy, they were forced to recognize and cater to contemporary tastes in fiction and periodical literature in order to secure an audience. At the same time, however, the Moodies considered themselves morally responsible for the selection of fictional material for *The Victoria Magazine*. As well as "literary philanthropists" dedicated to the mental improvement of their audience, the Moodies, like other members of the publishing community, pictured themselves in a socially responsible role as "unacknowledged legislators" of the minds of their readers. Forced to entertain in order to guarantee the survival of their magazine, they were nonetheless intent on maintaining their emphasis on political neutrality and their dedication to

the mental improvement of their audience which they had established as the cornerstones of their editorial policies.

Opinions in the nineteenth century on the effects of reading and writing fiction strictly for entertainment were varied, however. As Gerson notes, a basic question asked by and of writers of this period was "whether the reading and writing of fiction were acceptable activities, especially in a society preoccupied with the task of nationmaking."¹² In her essay "A Word for the Novel Writers," published in *The Literary Garland* in 1851, Mrs. Moodie explores these same issues. She supports, in part, the contemporary intellectual reaction against "any books but those that treat of religious, historical, or scientific subjects."¹³ A diet of reading limited to imaginative fictions, she suggests, "would have the same effect upon the mind, as a constant diet of sweetmeats would have upon the stomach; it would destroy the digestion, and induce a loathing for more wholesome food."¹⁴ But she also recognizes and acknowledges the need for reading material to entertain, to act as a brief diversion from the common work-a-day realities that engage the mind and body: "Still, the mind requires recreation as well as the body, and cannot always be engaged upon serious studies without injury to the brain, and the disarrangement of some of the most important organs of the body."¹⁵ As she notes in *Life in the Clearing versus the Bush*, verse and prose sketched with "a light pencil" can be read to "while away an idle hour, or fill up the blanks of a wet day" (*LC*, 13-14).

In an attempt to reconcile her fear of the intellectual and moral stagnation believed to result from the reading of imaginative fiction with her recognition of its

¹² Gerson, *A Purer Taste*, p. x.

¹³ Susanna Moodie, "A Word for the Novel Writers," *The Literary Garland*, August 1851: 348.

¹⁴ *Ibid.*

¹⁵ *Ibid.*

appeal, Mrs. Moodie adopts what Gerson calls "the most radical position to be found in Canadian criticism at that time."¹⁶ Praising novelists such as Charles Dickens and Eugene Sue for their "heart-rending pictures of human suffering and degradation,"¹⁷ she stresses the connection between the burgeoning interest in social realism in popular fiction and the potential for social benefits to be realized from reading such works. As her epigraph to "Rachel Wilde" suggests, fiction writing was to Mrs. Moodie a process of description rather than imaginative creation:

Fiction, however wild and fanciful,
Is but the copy memory draws from truth;
'Tis not in human genius *to create*;
The mind is but a mirror, which reflects
Realities that are; or the dim shadows
Left by the past upon its placid surface,
Recalled again to life. (*VM*, v.112)¹⁸

"Most novels, or romances ... are founded upon real incidents ..." she asserts, "and the closer the story or painting approximates to nature, the more interesting and popular it will become."¹⁹ Fiction is seen as functional in that it provides a means by which the more fortunate readers, those who could afford periodical subscriptions for example, can be made conscious "of the wants and agonies of the poor, and make them, in despite of all the conventional laws of society, acknowledge their kindred humanity."²⁰ "Every good work of fiction," she concludes, "is a step towards the mental improvement of mankind, and to every such writer we say, God

¹⁶ Gerson, *A Purer Taste*, p. 31.

¹⁷ Moodie, "A Word for the Novel Writers," 349.

¹⁸ Mrs. Moodie uses this same verse epigraph for "A Word for the Novel Writers" (1851) as well.

¹⁹ Moodie, "A Word for the Novel Writers," 348.

²⁰ *Ibid.*, 350.

speed."²¹ This definition of fiction as descriptive and socially responsible is a key factor in the Moodies' selection and composition of short narratives for publication in *The Victoria Magazine*. The short narratives in *The Victoria Magazine* reflect these guidelines by following two basic narrative formulae – bringing to life incidents and characters from "the dim shadows left by the past," or reflecting "the realities that are," that is, the tensions associated with emigration and New World settlement.

Continuing in the successful tradition of John Lovell and John Gibson with *The Literary Garland*, the Moodies make historical tales and historical romances the standard fare for the audience of *The Victoria Magazine*. Mrs. Moodie's "The Pope's Promise. A Historical Sketch" (*VM*, ii.27-31) and "The Son of Arminius. A Tale of Ancient Rome" (*VM*, iv.77-82) are historical tales set in Italy. Her "Achbor: An Oriental Tale," (*VM*, xi.253-56), a story of neither "love or war" but one that "records events not the less interesting" (*VM*, xi.253), is a tale of exile and lost homeland set in Persia during the first century A.D., and "The Native Village" (*VM*, xii.283-86) is a tragic tale of unrequited love, madness, and infanticide in seventeenth-century Germany. J.W. Dunbar adds Nordic flavour to the distant settings depicted in *The Victoria Magazine* with his "Iarl Sigurd. A Ballad from the Norse" (*VM*, ii.25-26), recalling the voyage of Haralld in A.D. 888, and "Brodir's Fleet in Clontarf Bay" (*VM*, iv.74-77). The serialization of Catherine Parr Traill's "The Hunter's Glen" (*VM*, viii.188-90, ix.200-206) and Agnes Strickland's "The Court of Solyman" (*VM*, x.217-22, xi.241-45) and "Catherine of Lancaster, or the Tournament of Toledo" (*VM*, xii.270-78) are consistent selections given the Moodies' attempts to entertain from a distance, as it were, with the fiction of *The Victoria Magazine*. A number of nonfiction works selected for *The Victoria Magazine* also focus on foreign locales and past experiences. J.W. Dunbar's four-part series "South Africa and Its

²¹ *Ibid.*, 351.

Inhabitants" (*VM*, vii.159-63, viii.171-75, ix.193-99, x.224-33) and the anonymously submitted "Recollections of a Residence in the Southern Division of the Island of Ceylon – Between the Years of 1838 and 1843" (*VM*, ii.37-40) are the most obvious examples.

The Moodies' emphasis on these tales of other times and other places underscores the complexity of the considerations that informed the editorial decisions which shaped the tone and literary content of *The Victoria Magazine*. In their selection of stories and sketches that "may afford amusement to both old and young" as their Prospectus promised, the Moodies, like other editors of the day, exhibited a firm belief in the transatlantic influence of literary traditions and tastes. The historical romances that comprised the bulk of the text of *The Victoria Magazine* reflect a dedication to stories of the past and to the bringing alive of history which suggests obvious ties to the literary tradition of Walter Scott. Popular in the literary markets of Britain prior to and immediately after the Moodies' emigration in 1832, the Scott-inspired historical romance was, in the opinion of the Moodies at least, a genre that would attract and entertain the emigrant audience of the New World. Consistent with the Moodies' vision of *The Victoria Magazine*, these stories also avoided dealing with issues and characterizations that could stir up the political fires that smouldered in Belleville in the 1840s.

In practical terms, this reliance on a transplanted taste in literature proved fiscally advantageous to the Moodies. As Appendix B of the thesis details, the stories of other times and other places were for the most part reprints of previously published works by both the Moodies and the Strickland sisters. Restricted by Wilson's rigid economics from remunerating well-known local authors for original work, and familiar with the quantity of time and effort necessary to produce the amount of original work necessary to fill up the pages of *The Victoria Magazine*, the Moodies solved both problems by republishing their own or Mrs. Moodie's sisters'

works. An obvious added benefit of this practice was the opportunity it provided for the Moodies to exploit not only Mrs. Moodie's reputation as a literary figure but also the reputations of Agnes Strickland and Catherine Parr Traill. Unable to solicit original work with the promise of remuneration, the Moodies were nonetheless able to boast at least three internationally recognized writers as regular contributors to the pages of *The Victoria Magazine*. Accentuating her faith in the transatlantic appeal of the historical romance, Mrs. Moodie reprinted a number of her own short narratives originally published *prior* to her emigration in 1832. Her "The Son of Arminius," for example, appeared in Frederic Shoberl's *Ackermann's Juvenile Forget-Me-Not* for 1830 before being reprinted for a working-class Canadian audience in November of 1847.

This dedication to historical fiction in *The Victoria Magazine* may have fit the psychological environment of the New World as well as the socioeconomic realities associated with contemporary periodical publishing. "The imaginative values ... assumed by the past" during the nineteenth century, according to Michel Foucault,

the whole lyrical halo that surrounded the consciousness of history at that period ... all this is a surface expression of the simple fact that man found himself emptied of history, but that he was already beginning to recover in the depths of his own being, and among all the things that were still capable of reflecting his image (the others having fallen silent and folded back upon themselves), a historicity linked essentially to man himself.²²

Increasing anxiety over the socioeconomic threats to the traditional social structure at "home" in Britain coupled with the trials of emigration and relocation across miles of open seas to a new land lacking the tradition of shared history may have influenced the contemporary editorial emphasis on looking back through the pages of fiction.

²² Michel Foucault, *The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences* (London: Tavistock/Routledge, 1989), p. 369.

Recognizing that the intended audience for their periodical was drawn from an emigrant population, and perhaps reflecting Mrs. Moodie's own longing for her homeland, the Moodies draw on England and Scotland for the settings and characters of a few of the short narratives. Mrs. Moodie's "Rachel Wilde," an autobiographical work set in various English countryside locales, relates the experiences of an artistic young girl from ages six through twelve.²³ As the narrator of Rachel's story reminds readers in the opening chapter, the tale is of youthful days in England "in which love, hope, and innocence, formed the prism in the rainbow of life" (*VM*, v.114). Mrs. Moodie moves away from autobiographical fiction in "The Quiet Horse; A Domestic Sketch" (*VM*, xii.265-68), a light tale of a British gentlewoman's misadventures driving a chaise and not so "quiet horse" on a "flying visit" to her husband.

In "The Two Fishermen. A Tale of the Coast" (*VM*, i.4-10), a tale representative of the tone and themes developed in her English sketches, Mrs. Moodie relates the tragic history of the orphaned Sowerby brothers. Robert Sowerby, "grave and steady, in his deportment, and plain in his person" (*VM*, i.5), finds happiness in his marriage to his innocent and beautiful cousin Fanny. His brother William, "handsome, gay, passionate, and thoughtless" (*VM*, i.5), is unhappily married to Lucy. Robert is abducted by smugglers, only to escape and return years later to find his wife dead from grief and his brother hanged for his apparent murder. English settings and characters are equally prominent in Mrs. Moodie's three "Papers on Practical Jokes" (*VM*, vi.139-41, vii.151-54, viii.177-81). J.W. Dunbar's two contributions to the practical joke papers (*VM*, ix.208-11, xi.246-47) are set in the Orkney Islands, and his serialized narrative "The Advantages of

²³ Mrs. Moodie's sequel to "Rachel Wilde," entitled "Trifles From the Burthen of Life," was serialized in *The Literary Garland* from March to July 1851, and was later expanded to novel form in *Flora Lyndsay, or Passages in an Eventful Life* (London: Bentley, 1854).

Being Ugly" (*VM*, i.18-20, ii.40-45, iii.49-53) is set throughout England. Again, the publication history of these works detailed in Appendix B shows the Moodies as writers who remained attentive throughout their careers to the possibilities of reusing their material to the fullest financial advantage. The Strickland family connection with *The Victoria Magazine* is evident in the selection of stories and sketches set in and around Britain as well, with Agnes' distinctly British poem "Death of Edward, Prince of Wales" appearing in the eighth issue (*VM*, viii.169-70).²⁴

Aside from the autobiographical details in "Rachel Wilde," a story that has been dismissed by some critics for employing an "episodic structure [that] has many jerky transitions and changes in point of view"²⁵ or as being "diffuse and plotless throughout,"²⁶ the majority of the Moodies' fiction contributions to *The Victoria Magazine* are conventional and unexceptional. The histories and historical romances that constitute the greater part of the magazine's text are indistinguishable in tone and style from those fictions that found a more receptive audience in *The Literary Garland*. The potential impact of these historical fictions on an audience is weakened by the intermingling of J.W. Dunbar's frequent puns, riddles, acrostics, and humorous verse pieces throughout *The Victoria Magazine*.²⁷ Even the Moodies' "Papers on Practical Jokes," which, by the nature of the subject-

²⁴ The following shorter verse pieces written by Agnes Strickland were also included in *The Victoria Magazine*: "The Bride" (*VM*, i.17), "Night in the Metropolis" (*VM*, iii.63) and "Morning in the Metropolis" (*VM*, iv.87), "On the Closing Year" and "On the New Year" (*VM*, v.100), and "Sonnet: The Infant" (*VM*, ix.211).

²⁵ Margot Northey, "Completing the Self-Portrait: Moodie's 'Rachel Wilde'," *Essays on Canadian Writing* 29 (1984): 119.

²⁶ John Thurston, introduction, *Voyages: Short Narratives of Susanna Moodie*, ed. John Thurston (Ottawa, ON: U of Ottawa P, 1991), p. xx.

²⁷ J.W. Dunbar had a special flair for riddles and "light" verse contributions, most notably "My Dina She's A Lubley Gall" (*VM*, xi.261) and "John and Nan: A Tale of Epping Forest" (*VM*, vi.129-30).

matter, suggest the possibility of levity and light entertainment, are subverted by Mrs. Moodie's stern prefatory warning that "a more pernicious or fatal method of entertainment can scarcely be imagined" (*VM*, vi.139). Her intention is to

illustrate this subject fairly by giving instances of the many things which have come under my own knowledge, both grave and gay, ludicrous and dreadful, to shew [sic] in what the mirth of the one, and the misery of the other consisted. (*VM*, vi.139)

In the introduction to her second paper she tempers her stance somewhat, promising to lighten the tone of future sketches:

Our last paper on practical jokes was, we must confess, somewhat of the saddest, and, in order to make an atonement for the gloom which it might have cast over the minds of some of our readers, we have chosen for this month a livelier illustration of our theme. (*VM*, vii.151)

The Moodies continue to foreground the tragic rather than the comic in this series of tales, however, with the death of one or more of the parties to the joke, public humiliation and ridicule, and shattered friendships figuring frequently in the endings.

When the Moodies write or select short fictions that examine contemporary subjects, the emphasis is on realism, not as a complex philosophical notion, but as a narrative representation of some of the trials of emigrant life. These experiences are not, however, like those that Margaret Atwood represents critically and creatively in *The Journals of Susanna Moodie* as reflecting Mrs. Moodie's struggle with a violent psychic duality.²⁸ According to Atwood, Mrs. Moodie's understanding of the New World was informed by a schizoid reaction that fluctuated between revelling in the freedom and opportunity now available and a pathological fear of the land and the chaos that surrounds her. In the few short narratives written by the Moodies for *The Victoria Magazine* that explore local issues, the

²⁸ Margaret Atwood, *The Journals of Susanna Moodie* (Toronto, ON: Oxford UP, 1970), p. 62. All subsequent references to this book (*JSM*) will appear in the body of the thesis.

underlying desire appears to be the need to articulate and understand the complex ambiguities rather than the dualities of experience and emotion associated with emigration and settlement. In order to secure a future, emigrants were forced to leave families and homelands steeped in a sense of shared history. Those who succeeded in traversing miles of unforgiving sea were rewarded with the opportunity to disembark on to an equalling unforgiving and harsh, but beautiful landscape. Caught between the security of the Old World and the adventure of the unknown, emigrants were faced, personally and collectively, with the need to find a balance between custom and necessity, Old World tradition and New World reality. Mrs. Moodie's "The Well in the Wilderness; A Tale of the Prairie – Founded on Facts" (*VM*, iii.54-58) and her two-part "Scenes in Canada" (*VM*, i.14-17, iii.65-68)²⁹ are examples of short narratives or sketches published in *The Victoria Magazine* that examine the complex tensions associated with emigration and New World settlement.

Representative of the tales of emigration that appear in *The Victoria Magazine*, "The Well in the Wilderness" is a short narrative originally written and published by Mrs. Moodie for a Canadian audience. "The son of one of those small landholders, who are fast disappearing in merry Old England" (*VM*, iii.54), Richard Steele is forced by economic hardship to sell his land and belongings and emigrate with his family to North America. Based on the Moodies' personal financial and social situation prior to emigrating in 1832, the story depicts the Steele family as victims of circumstances beyond their control. Specifically, they are trapped by the declining economic and social opportunities available to the impoverished English middle class:

²⁹ See Appendix B for subsequent publications.

The crops that year were a failure and the heart of the strong man, began to droop. He felt that labor in his native land, could no longer give his children bread, and unwilling to sink into the lowest class, he wisely resolved while he retained the means of doing so, to emigrate to America. (*VM*, iii.55)

Like Mrs. Moodie, Jane Steele is "dreadfully cast down" by this dramatic change in social status and the necessity to leave her beloved home. Her misery is intensified when the Scarlet Fever sweeps through their ship during the voyage to New York and her "two youngest boys died and were committed to the waters of the great deep" (*VM*, iii.55). Their arrival in the New World does little to lessen the angst and trauma of emigration. On the advice of an unscrupulous land dealer in New York, the Steeles head west to Illinois.

The wilderness that they eventually discover is, on the one hand, Edenic and sublime. The Steeles' isolated plot of land is a "vast wilderness of sweets planted by the munificent hand of nature, with profuse magnificence" (*VM*, iii.56). But the wildness of the setting is also deadly for the untrained and unaware settler. When her remaining two children fall ill with intermittent fever, and with her husband working in the fields, Jane Steele ventures into the gloomy forest to "the heart of a dark swamp" (*VM*, iii.56) to draw water from the only local source, a well in the wilderness. When his wife fails to return, Richard goes in search of her only to discover her mutilated body partially devoured by a cougar. Although the story ends suddenly with the settlement growing into a vibrant community and the pioneer spirit of Richard Steele prospering, "The Well in the Wilderness" is a compressed depiction of the hardships, rewards, and internalized fears that many readers of *The Victoria Magazine*, as well as its coeditors, would have recognized as inherent in the trials of emigration.

Mrs. Moodie's two-part "Scenes in Canada," which was later revised and reprinted as individual chapters in *Roughing It in the Bush*, continues this exploration of the details of emigration and experiences in the New World. When

asked if his voyage had been good, the captain of an emigrant ship does not answer in either the affirmative or the negative, but with an ambiguous catalogue of experiences: "Tedious -- baffling winds -- heavy fogs -- detention for three weeks on banks -- foul weather making the gulf -- people short of water -- ship nearly out of provisions -- steerage passengers starving" (*VM*, i.14). Whether the voyage was good or bad remains undetermined and, ultimately, irrelevant. Subjective evaluations such as good and bad have become meaningless during the captain's numerous voyages from the Old World to the New. The experiences he lists are the realities of the emigrant's voyage. Success is measured by disembarkation at Quebec, failure by drowning in the waters of the Atlantic or succumbing to any of a number of fatal diseases. Later, when the thick fog lifts, Mrs. Moodie sees for the first time the mountains of the New World:

As the clouds rolled away from the hoary peaks of their grey, bald brows, and cast a denser shadow upon the vast forest belt that girdled them round, and they loomed out like mighty giants, Titans of the earth, in all their wild and awful grandeur, a thrill of wonder and delight pervaded my mind; the spectacle floated dimly on my sight, for my eyes were blinded with tears. (*VM*, i.15)

Her romantic reverie is soon interrupted, however, by scenes of death, disease, and mayhem which materialize when she goes ashore. Emigrants may have their dreams of a paradisaical New World, but as the ship's captain warns at the end of the sketch, it is better not to "dream of Grosse Isle" (*VM*, i.17).

Often cited by modern critics in discussions of *Roughing It in the Bush* as one of the most obvious examples of Mrs. Moodie's schizophrenic reaction to the New World, "A Visit to Grosse Isle" underwent numerous alterations between its initial publication in *The Victoria Magazine* and its subsequent appearances in *Bentley's Miscellany* and *Roughing It in the Bush*. As Peterman details, further alterations to the language and tone of the sketch took place between the British and Canadian editions of *Roughing It*:

In *The Victoria Magazine* original, [Mrs.] Moodie is very much the detached observer of the outwitting of the pretentious French doctor, the striking features of the new landscape, and the behaviour of the newly arrived emigrants ... The Canadian, "Grosse Isle" is freer, more adventurous, and more colourful overall.³⁰

Again, the implications are that the Moodies were writing and selecting material for *The Victoria Magazine* with an eye towards what they believed to be an imported British taste in periodical fiction rather than what they would later and more accurately recognize as a Canadian taste in literature.

Although the Moodies and Stricklands were responsible for a significant portion of the fiction published in *The Victoria Magazine*, a few local contributors did appear in its pages. As Gillian Whitlock notes,

in the elementary literary landscapes of colonial societies both writers and critics were dependent on the numerous, often short-lived magazines, journals and newspapers which sprung up in the urban centres behind the frontiers. It was from periodicals that significant initiatives in the indigenous intellectual and literary traditions of these developing cultures emerged.³¹

In a verse submission to *The Victoria Magazine*, Thomas McQueen acknowledges the importance of Canadian periodicals to the future of a national literature:

Then hail the magazine -- it forms
A centre for a lengthen'd chain
Of minds, whose strange magnetic charms
Shall vibrate and be felt again;
Till this our country shall secure
A fair and fertile literature. (*VM*, v.103)

In her introduction to *Mark Hurdlestone*, Mrs. Moodie expresses her disbelief at the shortage of native-born writers: "Has Canada no poet to describe the glories of his parent land -- no painter that can delineate her matchless scenery of land and wave? Are her children dumb and blind, that they leave to strangers the task of singing her

³⁰ Peterman, "Susanna Moodie," pp. 86-87.

³¹ Gillian Whitlock, "The Bush, the Barrack-Yard and the Clearing: 'Colonial Realism' in the Sketches and Stories of Susanna Moodie, C.L.R. James and Henry Lawson," *Journal of Commonwealth Literature* 20.1 (1985): 36.

praise?" (MH, 292). Reflecting on her experiences as the coeditor of *The Victoria Magazine*, she recollects:

Whilst conducting this periodical, we had many opportunities of judging of the literary taste and capacity of the public, from the articles that we were constantly receiving for insertion. We had some clever contributions offered to us for the magazine, but they were all, with a very few exceptions, from persons born and educated in the mother country, and could scarcely be ranked under the head of Canadian talent. (MH, 291)

The few local writers who realized publication of their work in the pages of *The Victoria Magazine* did so, for the most part, with short verse submissions. Only three submitted prose works met the editorial standards established by the Moodies: Hamilton Aylmer's "Alciphron Leicester; or Love and Genius. A Miniature Romance" (VM, v.108-12, vi.121-25, vii.146-50), Rhoda Ann Page's "The Lost Boy: A Tale of the Burning Plains" (VM, v.97-100), and Thomas Page's "The Wolves: A Tale of Western Canada" (VM, vi.131-36).³² A fourth extended prose work, Louisa May Murray's "Fauna, the Red Flower of Leafy Hollow," was accepted in July 1848 with the announcement that "Its insertion will form the leading attraction of the coming year" (VM, xi.264). *The Victoria Magazine* ceased publication the next month, however, and Miss Murray subsequently sold her story to *The Literary Garland*.³³

The selection of these contributions is consistent with a number of the Moodies' editorial goals. Thematically, Hamilton Aylmer's "Alciphron Leicester," like Mrs. Moodie's "Rachel Wilde" and her story of the Steele family, is, in part, the

³² Hamilton Aylmer and Rhoda Page contributed a number of unexceptional verse pieces to *The Victoria Magazine* as well. Aylmer's included "Ianthé" (VM, ii.36), "The Wreath" (VM, iii.64), "Ode, Written on Revisiting Lake George" (VM, iv.82-3), "Address to a Young Poet" (VM, vii.155), and "Lamia" (VM, viii.176). Page, using the initials R.A.P., published three pieces: "Last Words" (VM, iii.53), "The Death of Queen Mary" (VM, vii.154-55), and "Evening Hymn" (VM, xi.245).

³³ Serialized in *The Literary Garland* from April to October 1851.

story of a family caught in the economic and social decline brought about in England by radical social and technological changes. The story is, as Aylmer's subtitle suggests, a "miniature romance" following the young hero from impending financial and personal disaster in England to prosperity and happiness in the New World. Both Thomas Page's "The Wolves," a tale set in the year 1830 "ere the little villages of western Canada has aspired to become towns (*VM*, vi.131) and billed as a "web of truth, into which, we have woven some of the parti-colored threads of fiction" (vi.131), and Rhoda Ann Page's "The Lost Boy" reflect the Moodies' interest in stories of the ambiguous experiences of emigration and settlement. As in Mrs. Moodie's "The Well in the Wilderness," the natural world is represented in these stories as possessing both the potential to nourish both mind and body and the power to take life violently.

Inclusion of native-born talent also helped to ensure notices and reviews in other newspapers and journals interested in local writers. The *Cobourg Star*, for example, reviewed *The Victoria Magazine* favourably on 10 November 1847, mentioning that the current issue includes "a beautiful poem from the pen of our R.A.P. [Rhoda Ann Page]."³⁴ Later, the same newspaper notes:

THE VICTORIA MAGAZINE For February has come to hand. It is decidedly the best yet issued and is well worth a whole year's subscription. The story of "The Wolves," by T. Page Esq., Editor of the *Newcastle Farmer*, will be transferred to our columns next week.³⁵

Unfortunately, no extant issues of Thomas Page's own short-lived periodical, the *Newcastle Farmer*, have been recovered to see whether the Moodies' literary venture benefited further from any of Page's self-promotion.

³⁴ Anon., *Cobourg Star*, 10 November 1847

³⁵ *Ibid.*, 9 February 1848. "The Wolves" was reprinted in the *Cobourg Star* on 16 and 23 of February 1847.

While considering themselves "literary philanthropists" dedicated to the mental improvement of their audience, the Moodies were nonetheless subject to the whims and fancies of the reading public. Forced by the dynamics of an increasingly competitive periodical market to recognize their intended readers' desire for amusement and diversion, they dedicated the fiction of their "periodical for the people" to the less than noble cause of entertainment. Constrained by the rigid economy that informed the business of *The Victoria Magazine* from soliciting well-known local contributors, the Moodies were limited in their selection of material by their own unwillingness to abrogate what they believed to be their moral responsibility to their readers. They refused to disgrace the pages of their "cheap periodical" with local gossip, satire, or political polemic, no matter how inexpensively it could be produced.

Caught between the demands of the market and their moral conscience, the Moodies turned to historical romances and brief sketches of emigrant life in an attempt to appease their working-class audience's appetite for entertainment. The decision was both morally and fiscally responsible. Dealing with characters and events from other times and other places, the historical tales were politically benign, unlikely to stir up controversy or provoke argument among the passionately partisan factions that dominated the local scene. Inspired by the popularity of Walter Scott in Britain in the nineteenth century, these romances allowed the Moodies to maintain *The Victoria Magazine* as politically neutral ground. This editorial decision to entertain from a distance, as it were, also gave the Moodies an opportunity to draw extensively on Mrs. Moodie's previously published work, thereby reducing the amount of time and creative effort needed to fill the twenty-four pages of each issue.

When the Moodies do turn their pens to more contemporary and local topics, the emphasis is on "the realities that are," revealing a bias for social realism rather than creative genius. But it is, again, a realism tempered by the Moodies'

overriding concern for social responsibility. Political conflicts and controversy, while an undeniable reality of the day, are avoided in favour of brief considerations of the complexities of emotion associated with settlement.

As Mrs. Moodie would note years later, the editorial emphasis in *The Victoria Magazine* on reprinted historical tales and sketches of the emigrant experience was a case of the Moodies misreading the tastes of their intended audience. "The Canadian people are more practical than imaginative," she observes. "Romantic tales and poetry would meet with less favour than a good political article from their newspapers" (*MH*, 292). What the working-class audiences of the day apparently wanted, and what they found elsewhere in contemporary periodicals and newspapers, was exactly what the Moodies had decided to banish from the pages of their periodical -- gossip and political argument. What the Moodies made a priority in their magazine, and the concern most evident in their non-fiction contributions to its pages, was "the exalted and noble cause of mental improvement" (*VM*, xii.288).

THE CAUSE OF MENTAL IMPROVEMENT

"In the era of Victoria and Edward," summarizes Fraser Sutherland in his discussion of nineteenth-century Canadian periodicals, "magazines were seen and saw themselves as instruments of moral and pedagogic mental improvement. Man was perfectible, and the periodicals he read would perfect him."³⁶ According to the Moodies, the editors and publishers of these instruments of "mental improvement" must observe a strict code of editorial propriety. Any writing "which awakens angry and resentful feelings, rarely tends to improve the heart, or produce those great moral changes, which must take place before we can hope to realize a permanent

³⁶ Fraser Sutherland, *The Monthly Epic: A History of Canadian Magazines 1789-1989* (Markham, ON: Fitzhenry and Whiteside, 1989), p. 15.

improvement in mankind individually or in the mass" (*VM*, iii.71). These standards were not a case of editorial posturing on the part of the Moodies. No *ad hominem* attacks, "low and vulgar abuse" (*VM*, v.120), or inflammatory political polemic were to be published in *The Victoria Magazine*. "All subjects, however interesting, that might lead to angry discussion" (*VM*, xii.287) were to be avoided. The Moodies monitored their own work and evaluated that of others by the same rigid criteria. In a letter to Sumner Lincoln, the editor of the *North American Magazine*, more than a decade before the Moodies undertook the editorship of *The Victoria Magazine*, Mrs. Moodie suggests that he attend more rigorously to similar standards of editorial propriety:

There is only one portion of your excellent periodical which offended my taste. The invectives hurled against a host of contemptible adversaries. This is beneath a man of your genius, and superior attainments. They triumph, in the indignation, their malice calls forth. Silent indifference to their calumnies, would place you beyond the reach of them.³⁷

As she complains in *Roughing It in the Bush*, "the freedom of the press being enjoyed to an extent in this province [is] unknown in more civilised communities" (*RI*, 75). Not all contemporary newspaper editors insulted Mrs. Moodie's sense of propriety, however. James McCarroll, editor of the *Newcastle Courier*, is praised in *The Victoria Magazine* for not being "at all likely to stain his pages by low and vulgar abuse, a practice too commonly resorted to by editors of papers" (*VM*, v.120).

Even with these editorial guidelines firmly established, however, some of the opinions expressed in the editorials of *The Victoria Magazine* met with opposition from its predominantly conservative audience. In their final "Editor's Table" the Moodies acknowledge this fact without hesitation or apology:

³⁷ "To Sumner Lincoln, Fairfield," 23 January 1835, letter 36, *Letters of a Lifetime*, p. 93.

Having deeply at heart, the general good of mankind, our opinions may appear too liberal for many of our readers, but as the mists of prejudice clear away, and the individual importance of the most obscure member of the human family is recognized, those who now think, that we go too far, in the course of a few brief years, may think that we did not go *far enough*. (*VM*, xii.287)

It is somewhat ironic, given the Moodies' dedication to "the exalted and noble cause of mental improvement," that it was their editorials dealing explicitly with pedagogy and the politics of education that may have drawn negative reactions from readers of their magazine.

As Gerson notes, the Moodies shared a belief in the importance of education and intellectual development.³⁸ It is not surprising, therefore, that as coeditors they made the promotion of education and the social benefits to be derived from intellectual cultivation an editorial priority of *The Victoria Magazine*. As Sutherland's earlier statement suggests, the Moodies were not alone in attempting to forward this ideal through periodical literature. There were a number of contemporary editors whom the Moodies considered as being successful in advancing similar views. Besides Lovell and Gibson of *The Literary Garland*, one of the more influential members of this group was Dr. John Sherren Bartlett (1790-1863), who edited and published the *Albion of New York* from 1822 until 1848. In a letter to Dr. Bartlett in the winter of 1833, Mrs. Moodie praises him as "the Editor of a Journal, which finds its way into the study of every respectable family on this side of the Atlantic, and is not inferior in literary merit, to any publication of the same class in Britain."³⁹ As Ballstadt, Hopkins, and Peterman note: "While Susanna may seem to gild the lily in her letter by praising the *Albion* so highly, it is

³⁸ Gerson, "Mrs. Moodie's Beloved Partner," 36.

³⁹ "To the editor of the *Albion*, New York," 14 February 1833, letter 35, *Letters of a Lifetime*, p. 90. In the "Editor's Table" in the first issue, Mrs. Moodie acknowledges that she "met with an account of Dandelion Coffee published in the New York Albion" (*VM*, i.22), and in her introduction to *Mark Hurdlestone* notes that the *New York Albion* has "a wide circulation in Canada" (*MH*, 293).

important to recognize that it was generally perceived by emigrants to be the most literate and reliable weekly newspaper in North America.⁴⁰ Peterman also suggests that Charles Fothergill (1782-1840), editor of the *Upper Canada Gazette* (later renamed the *Weekly Register*) and the *Palladium of British America and Upper Canada Mercantile Advertiser*, Adam Thom, editor of various newspapers and periodicals in both Upper and Lower Canada, and Dr. John Rolph (1793-1870) were contemporary editors whom the Moodies also considered successful.⁴¹

The Moodies concern for the mental cultivation of their periodical audience informed their reviews of books, papers, and magazines in *The Victoria Magazine* too. In their review of the style and content of *The Calliopean*, published in Hamilton by Peter Ruthven and under the management of the Burlington Ladies Academy, they reiterate their own editorial priorities while suggesting some loosening of aesthetic standards may be allowable so long as a concern for the good of the people remains near the heart of the editor:

Every attempt to raise the standard of morals and education, in a rising country like this, should be hailed with pleasure by every person, who has the welfare of that country at heart; and whatever faults such productions may possess, they are in themselves, a sign of the times, and an earnest of better things. (*VM*, v.119)

They do suggest, however, that a name change may be in order for this aspiring periodical since the current title "savors too much of the pedantry of the schools" (*VM*, v.119). Readers are encouraged to read *Festus*, a poem by James Bailey, and "share in the intellectual feast ... of this great and original work" (*VM*, i.22). "It is a mine of inexhaustable wealth which cannot be explored without yielding a rich store of mental treasure," continue the Moodies. "It will learn those to think who have

⁴⁰ *Letters of a Lifetime*, p. 74.

⁴¹ Michael Peterman, personal correspondence, 4 January 1992. In his prospectus for the *Palladium of British America* (14 November 1837), Fothergill further illustrates the influence of Bartlett, suggesting that the physical layout and appearance of his new paper will be "after the manner of the *Albion of New York*."

never thought before" (*VM*, i.22). Mrs. Grant's *Memoirs of an American Lady* (*VM*, iv.94), Joseph Leonard's *Canadian Gem and Family Visitor* (*VM*, vii.168), and James McCarroll's *Newcastle Courier* (*VM*, v.120) are given favourable reviews according to this same criterion. The coeditors of *The Victoria Magazine* remained confident that "such publications well conducted, cannot fail to do good" (*VM*, vii.168).

Defining the policies that would establish *The Victoria Magazine* as a literary vehicle to promote the virtues of education was not the end of the Moodies' decision-making. They expanded the scope of their magazine to include critical discussions of contemporary educational techniques and goals, and to promote pedagogic reforms that address a number of traditionally contentious social issues. The editorials and essays dealing directly with questions concerning nineteenth-century pedagogy, issues of social stratification, and the politics of education are important for understanding the Moodies' views and policies, yet are, New suggests, most likely the editorials considered "too liberal" by the nineteenth-century local audience.⁴² Their editorial on the personal trials of the Swiss pedagogic reformer Pestalozzi provides a significant clue to the origin and full scope of the Moodies' apparently controversial stance on education.

"Every well-informed reader knows," write the Moodies in their final issue, through what opposition, misfortune, and trouble, arising from exhaustion of his own means; the revolutionary disturbances of those times, and the wrangling's of those that even came forward to assist in his plans for elevating the people, Pestalozzi passed his life. His plans however, succeeded; and were spread over all the civilized world: they have been introduced more or less, into all popular systems of tuition. (*VM*, xii.286)

As noted earlier, Mrs. Moodie's exposure to the pedagogic strategies and ideals of Pestalozzi can be traced to the teaching strategies employed by her father during her childhood. Although the point of contact between the Moodies and the

⁴² New, introduction, p. viii.

Pestalozzian movement in Britain and Canada has never been directly established, a few influences appear likely.

While a number of proponents of Pestalozzianism were actively promoting educational reforms throughout Britain during the early nineteenth century, it was "women writers who were among the early advocates of Pestalozzi's method."⁴³ One notable writer forwarding Pestalozzian principles was the Irish novelist Maria Edgeworth, who collaborated with her father on two major treatises on pedagogy -- *Practical Education* (1798) and *Essays on Professional Education* (1809) -- in addition to a number of her own didactic novels and a series of moral tales exhibiting a strong Pestalozzian bias.⁴⁴ In a letter to Frederic Shoberl in 1829, Susanna Strickland reveals a familiarity with at least one of these tales, "Lame Jervis," published in Edgeworth's *Popular Tales* in 1804.⁴⁵ As Silber notes, the Anti-Slave Movement in which the young Susanna Strickland worked was also influential in promoting similar ideas calling for the education of the poor. Henry Brougham (1778-1868), another dedicated Pestalozzian, was a frequent contributor to the *Edinburgh Review*, a position that may have brought him in contact with Mrs. Moodie's close friend Thomas Pringle, who was an active figure in the Edinburgh newspaper and periodical publishing industry at the time. On 4 December 1833, one year after the Moodies sailed from Leith, Mrs. Moodie was sent a copy of Samuel Reade Hall's *Practical Lectures on parental responsibility and the religious*

⁴³ Kate Silber, *Pestalozzi: The Man and His Work* (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1960), p. 279. Silber goes on to cite Elizabeth Hamilton's *Letters on the Elementary Principles of Education* (1801) and *The Cottages of Glenburnie* (1808) as other examples of women writers working with Pestalozzian ideas during this period.

⁴⁴ These works include *The Parent's Assistant* (1796) and a four-volume collection of *Moral Tales* (1801).

⁴⁵ "To Frederic Shoberl" 22 April 1829, letter 13, *Letters of a Lifetime*, p. 31.

education of children by S.E. Hall; or the seminary for teachers (1759),⁴⁶ a text with a marked Pestalozzian focus.

In her "Trials of a Travelling Musician,"⁴⁷ Mrs. Moodie reveals further knowledge of the Pestalozzian movement on both sides of the Atlantic. In an attempt to impress a visiting vocalist, a rural music teacher introduces a new style of teaching to his "ragged" group of working-class students. Her allusion to the ragged schools established throughout Britain to reclaim "the youthful vagrants of London, and [teach] the idle and profligate the sublime morality of sobriety and industry" is clear.⁴⁸ Barely managing to retain control of his students, the music teacher exhibits his "knowledge" of this new style of instruction:

After a long pause, during which the youngsters tried their best to look grave, he continued. "Now all of you, Boys and Galls, give your attention to my instructions this evening. I am going to introduce a new style for your especial benefit, called Pest-a-lazy (Pestalozzi) system, now all the fashion." (*VM*, iii.61)

In a later sketch, the narrator suggests that another young musician "change his residence, and settle down for life in *New Harmony*" (*VM*, iv.87), a reference to both his questionable skills as a musician and the site of Robert Owen's Pestalozzian school in New Harmony, Indiana.⁴⁹

The more dogmatic and polemical works written by the Moodies for publication in *The Victoria Magazine* expound the individual and social benefits to be realized through Pestalozzian-based educational reform, the democratization of schools, and a reevaluation of the contemporary emphasis on rote learning. In her essay "Education – The True Wealth of the World," Mrs. Moodie argues that "The

⁴⁶ Patrick Hamilton Ewing Collection, National Library of Canada.

⁴⁷ Serialized in four issues of *The Victoria Magazine* (*VM*, i.10-12, ii.32-35, iii.59-63, iv.84-87). See Appendix B for subsequent publication history.

⁴⁸ Moodie, "A Word for the Novel Writers," 351.

⁴⁹ Silber, p. 308.

want of education and moral training is the only *real* barrier that exists between the different classes of men. Nature, reason, and christianity [sic], recognize no other" (*VM*, iv.90).⁵⁰ The Moodies state:

We are advocates for equality of mind -- for a commonwealth of intellect, and we feel a confident belief in the possibility of our theory. Let education be widely diffused through the world; and the barriers that divide one class from another with a wall of adamant will melt away and the master and servant will enjoy a reciprocal communion of mind and ideas, and look upon each other as brethren, without lessening the respect due from the one to the other. (*VM*, x.240)

Educated minds "are, in themselves, an inexhaustible mine of wealth to the fortunate country" (*VM*, v.91), argues Mrs. Moodie, and to deny further training on the grounds of social class was to impede the progress of colonial society. "The most brilliant of gems are often enclosed in the rudest crustations ..." she reminds her readers, "the most powerful intellects are often concealed amidst the darkness and rubbish of uneducated minds" (*VM*, iv.89). And later: "it is to the education and mental culture of the lower classes, that we must look for the moral improvement so much needed in the world" (*VM*, vii.168).

As Mrs. Moodie notes in "Education -- The True Wealth of the World," settlers must recognize that their minds and, more importantly, the minds of their children are the most valuable of the abundant natural resources available for cultivation in the New World:

We have extended this paper to a greater length than we at first intended; but deeply impressed with the importance of the subject to which we are indeed wholly inadequate to do justice, we were yet anxious to fix upon the minds of our Canadian readers, the great results which might reasonably be expected from the united efforts of a well educated people ... it becomes an act of duty, of true *patriotism*, to give to your children the best education which lies in your power.
(*VM*, iv.92)

⁵⁰ Mrs. Moodie repeats this view earlier: "The ignorance of the great mass of the people must, while it remains, for ever separate them from their more fortunate brethren. Remove this stumbling-block out of the way, and the hard line of demarcation which now divides them from each other, will soften and gradually melt away" (*VM*, iv.90).

In *Roughing It in the Bush*, the character of Old Woodruff articulates the same idea in much simpler terms with his observation that "children are riches in this country" (*RI*, 512). It is only through the improvement of such riches, the Moodies believe, that the future financial and intellectual prosperity of the country will be guaranteed.

It is not surprising, recalling Mrs. Moodie's praise for the realistic techniques of Dickens and Sue, that the Moodies use their fiction to emphasize the importance of education, frequently contrasting the actions and decisions of educated characters with those of characters with little or no interest in intellectual pursuits. Rachel Wilde overcomes the harsh treatment of Miss Betsy and the evil schemes of Nancy, whose "education in a country workhouse, forty years ago, had been for evil, not for good" (*VM*, viii.185). In "The Advantages of Being Ugly," J.W. Dunbar portrays the Everard sisters as extremes examples of the powers, or lack thereof, of intellect. Laura, plain, intelligent and the hero's love interest, is juxtaposed with Emily, beautiful but with a mind

like a stagnant pool, without any perceptible current of its own, but always ready to show by a slight ruffle on the surface the effect of the pebble thrown into it, and a most faithful mirror of surrounding objects. (*VM*, ii.43)

Not coincidentally, Emily is a voracious reader of contemporary imaginative fictions, whereas Laura and John Selby, her suitor and the story's protagonist, have Mr. Everard as their mentor, guiding their education and intellectual development much like Mr. Wilde does in "Rachel Wilde." Mrs. Moodie adds to this catalogue of characters who benefit from the cultivation of intellect with her brief discussion of "Cardinal Wolsey, and Sextus the V ... striking illustrations of great minds, rescued by education from the lower walks of life" (*VM*, i.12).

Besides proposing a programme for the establishment of common schools, the Moodies argue for the reevaluation of the traditional emphasis on rote learning

that was at the core of the elite British education system. Mrs. Moodie again uses a fictional teacher in "The Trials of a Travelling Musician" to underscore what she considers to be the detrimental effects of rote techniques on young minds:

it is evident that their teacher has been in the habit of raising sheep, and has caught many of their peculiar notes. This style he very kindly imparts to his pupils, and as apt scholars usually try to imitate their master choirs taught by these individuals, resemble a flock of sheep going one after another over a wall. (*VM*, iii.59)

Education to the Moodies was more than the memorization and recollection of facts and figures. What is needed, they emphasize, is a universal programme of extensive and ongoing intellectual training that promotes reflection and contemplation. "Put your sons in a situation," instructs Mrs. Moodie,

to acquire solid and useful information, from masters who will not merely teach them to repeat lessons like parrots by rote; but who will teach them to think -- to know the meaning of what they learn -- and to be enabled by the right use of those reflective faculties, to communicate the knowledge thus acquired to others. (*VM*, iv.91)

This pedagogic strategy is employed with remarkable results in the plot of "Rachel Wilde." Since the patriarch of the family

held all public schools in abhorrence ... his mode of tuition was the very opposite to that pursued in the seminary. Lessons were seldom committed to memory. He read, -- he explained, -- he argued with his children. He called their attention to the subjects which he selected for their information, and set them thinking. They were allowed freedom of discussion; and they were never suffered to abandon a point until they understood its meaning. (*VM*, v.114)

The ultimate aim of education, argue the Moodies, is to have a populace capable of intellectual reflection and understanding of complex theories, not skilled in memorization and repetition. As J.W. Dunbar reiterates in his essay "Memory": "Once on the great sea of the world, the man who *thinks*, quickly shoots ahead of the man who merely [sic] *learns* and *remembers*" (*VM*, xii.281).

However liberal the Moodies' call for the democratization of education may have appeared to the contemporary audience, the editorial position established in *The Victoria Magazine* did not signal the Moodies abandoning their basic belief in

the need and benefits of social stratification. As Robin Mathews notes, Mrs. Moodie was far from being an egalitarian: "Ideas of total equality in her day were expressed in terms of political republicanism and social individualism. She rejected both."⁵¹ In their editorial review of McQueen's *Moorland Minstrel*, the Moodies recognize and accept the inevitability of some form of social stratification in the New World:

men of wealth, talent, and education will exert a certain influence over the minds of their fellow men, which could continue to be felt and acknowledged in the world, if mankind were equalized to-morrow.

Perfect unadulterated republicanism, is a beautiful but fallacious chimera, which never did really exist upon earth, and which, if the Bible be true, (and we have no doubts on the subject,) we are told will not exist in heaven. (*VM*, iii.71)

J.W. Dunbar continues this line of thought in *Roughing It in the Bush*, suggesting that even the strong American impulse towards republicanism necessarily incorporates recognition of social strata: "These genuine Republicans, when their theory of the original and natural equality among them is once cheerfully admitted, are ever ready to show respect to *mental* superiority, whether natural or acquired" (*RI*, 256). In *Roughing It in the Bush*, Mrs. Moodie justifies her practice of not eating with her servants: "There is no difference in the flesh and blood; but education makes a difference in the mind and manners, and, till these can assimilate, it is better to keep apart" (*RI*, 227).

What the Moodies did endorse, however, was the formation of a new aristocracy, "in effect, a meritocracy based on education and manners, an upper-class segment of society which is composed of the well educated, not necessarily of the well born and wealthy."⁵² Within this new social structure mental advantage

⁵¹ Robin Mathews, "Susanna Moodie, Pink Toryism, and Nineteenth Century Ideas of Canadian Identity," *Journal of Canadian Studies* 10.3 (1975): 4.

⁵² Elizabeth Thompson, *The Pioneer Woman: A Canadian Character Type* (Montreal, PQ: McGill-Queens UP, 1991), p. 45. See also Mathews, p. 4.

would take precedence over socioeconomic status, with education rather than acquired wealth the primary means by which a person can be "rescued from the very lowest walks of life" (*VM*, iv.90). Within this more fluid social structure it would be the "educated sons" of the New World who would "become the aristocrats of the rising generation" (*RI*, 219). Not coincidentally, this system would also guarantee the Moodies a position at the top rather than at the bottom of the New World social scale. With little land and less money, and far removed from a social framework that recognized status as a birthright, the Moodies faced the prospect of finding themselves at the wrong end of a social scale imported from Britain. They would not command the respect and social position that they believed they deserved within a transplanted social structure. If education could be considered the "true wealth of the world," as the title of Mrs. Moodie's essay suggests, then the Moodies would be among the wealthier people in Belleville.

There were additional benefits of a meritocracy. The Moodies believed that this new social organization would promote cooperation rather than facilitating social levelling and a breakdown of a hierarchical system between the now educated working class and the new intellectual aristocracy. Education would have a regulatory function, suggest the Moodies, rather than a revolutionary one, allowing members of each class to "look upon each other as brethren, without lessening the respect due from the one to the other" (*VM*, x.240). "The man that knows his duty," argues Mrs. Moodie, "is more likely to perform it, and perform it well, than the ignorant man whose services are compulsory, and who is influenced by the moral responsibility which the knowledge of right must give" (*VM*, iv.90). As for the children of the lower classes, parents are encouraged to "Teach them early, and impress the lessons deeply upon their minds, that there is *no disgrace in labor, in honest honorable poverty*, but that there is a *deep and lasting disgrace in ignorance*"

(*VM*, iv.91). In support of this argument, the editors of *The Victoria Magazine* reprint an excerpt from Thomas Carlyle's "The Dignity of Labor" in their fifth issue.

Again, the short narratives written and selected by the Moodies reflect ideals expounded in the Moodies' essays on pedagogy. The short fictions in *The Victoria Magazine* are without representations of the social tensions and class-based confrontations that distinguish the sketches included in *Roughing It in the Bush* (1852) and *Life in the Clearings versus the Bush* (1853). There are no characters such as Brian the Still Hunter, Old Satan, or Uncle Joe to underscore the tensions that exist between Old World ideals and New World challenges to those ideals. Aside from the openly anti-Catholic sentiments expressed in Mrs. Moodie's reprinted sketch "The Pope's Promise," the Moodies effectively avoided controversial subject-matter in their own fiction and that published from other sources. Although Mrs. Moodie would later be sharply rebuked for the anti-Catholic sentiments expressed in her sketch "Michael Macbride,"⁵³ no such reactions resulted from her contribution to *The Victoria Magazine*. Perhaps the audience appreciated what Vernon Lindquist reads as Mrs. Moodie's "range in working with various types of humor" in the sketch, "her pleasure in satirizing through language and wit."⁵⁴ Or perhaps contemporary readers recognized, as Thurston suggests, "that her target was a professional clergy closer to home"⁵⁵ rather than a sweeping condemnation of Roman Catholicism. Whatever audience perception may have been in 1847, Pietro Ariano's castigation of "a rich community of Franciscan monks" as "the hooded

⁵³ "Michael Macbride" was published originally in *The Literary Garland* in February 1851, pp. 49-55. The review reproaching Mrs. Moodie for her anti-Catholic/Irish stance was published in the 21 February 1851 issue of the *Montreal True Witness and Catholic Chronicle* (*Letters*, 109).

⁵⁴ Vernon L. Lindquist, "The Soil and the Seed, The Birth of the Canadian Short Story in English: Haliburton, Moodie, and Others, 1830-1867," Ph.D. diss., U of New Brunswick, 1979, 152.

⁵⁵ Thurston, introduction, p. xv.

locusts that devour the substance of the land, and receive a patent from the Pope, heaven bless him! to live in idleness" (*VM*, ii.27) and similar comments apparently went unnoticed by readers.⁵⁶

Unlike Mrs. Moodie's English novels, and the earliest editions of *Roughing It in the Bush*, which were published in Britain with an eye towards a distant British audience, *The Victoria Magazine* was published, edited, and partially written in Upper Canada specifically for a Canadian audience. In control of the editorial policies that would shape the personality of their "cheap periodical for the people," the Moodies were forced by sociocultural and economic necessities to balance the text of their magazine – to amuse "both old and young" while attempting to remain true to their principal concern for the mental improvement of their readers. Relying on their knowledge of British tastes in literature and believing in the transatlantic influence of these tastes, they stocked the pages of their magazine with reprinted historical romances, brief sketches of emigrant life, and potentially entertaining but politically benign jokes and riddles. Vigorously refusing to deal with political controversy or contentious issues of local interest, they aimed to entertain from a distance, telling their readers what they should like rather than giving them what they wanted – gossip and political argument. Fiscally and morally responsible, the Moodies' editorial policy with regards to selecting fiction for *The Victoria Magazine* denied the magazine the vibrant personality that would have attracted and held the attention of working-class readers.

But writing and selecting fiction for the entertainment of their readers were not the Moodies' primary concern in undertaking the editorship of *The Victoria*

⁵⁶ The monks are also extortionists (*VM*, ii.27), children of fortune (*VM*, ii.28), and lecherous womanizers (*VM*, ii.28-9). When Father Felix Peretti becomes Pope Sixtus the Fifth he is described as a man bearing "the glance of an eagle, before which the monarchs of the earth trembled, when it flashed in wrath from beneath a brow that appeared formed to rule the world" (*VM*, ii.31).

Magazine. They were, as they make clear through their editorials, essays, and reviews, dedicated to "the exalted and noble cause of mental improvement." Their goals were predominantly pedagogic rather than political; their writing didactic rather than entertaining. Apparently controversial yet never apologetic, the Moodies vigorously promote the social and individual benefits to be realized through attention to the cultivation of intellect. And they advance the need for a system of common schools and reevaluation of the current emphasis on rote learning. According to the Moodies, education was the true wealth of the world, and intellect rather than socioeconomic status should be the measure of an individual's success.

In terms of Mrs. Moodie's later work, *The Victoria Magazine* is a virtual crossroads for much of her writing – the final point of publication for some pieces and the initial appearance of others that would go on to a more widely recognized life in *Roughing It in the Bush* or *Life in the Clearings versus the Bush*. In her essays, editorials, and reviews in *The Victoria Magazine*, she reveals a degree of social awareness and concern that gives way in her later autobiographical fictions to romantic musings, depiction of character types, and attention to local colour. Her interest in the political aspects of education, pedagogic techniques and reforms, and Pestalozzianism disappears altogether in her later works. Less entertaining by today's standards than *Roughing It in the Bush* or *Life in the Clearings versus the Bush*, Mrs. Moodie's fiction and non-fiction contributions to *The Victoria Magazine* reveal a far more complex and intimate concern for the future of the New World than modern readers have come to expect.

CHAPTER THREE
**RELOCATING THE VICTORIA MAGAZINE:
 CRITICAL OVERVIEW AND CONTEXT**

More than three decades ago, Robert L. McDougall wrote that with the exception of three works – *Roughing It in the Bush*, *Life in the Clearings versus the Bush*, and *Flora Lyndsay* – “we can with good conscience abandon [the balance of Mrs. Moodie’s work] to survive as best it may in the form in which it was originally printed.”¹ Since McDougall’s statement, critics and scholars writing about Canadian literature in general and Mrs. Moodie’s life and works in particular have moved beyond even this degree of selectivity. Aside from Carol Shields’ uneven treatment of a number of Mrs. Moodie’s other texts in *Susanna Moodie: Voice and Vision* (1977) and Thurston’s more thorough discussion in his doctoral dissertation “Susanna Moodie (1803-85): The Canonization of a Colonial Writer” (Queen’s, 1989), the critical focus has become increasingly narrow. Scholarly articles about Mrs. Moodie, including biographical, bibliographical, historical, and thematic considerations, have concentrated almost exclusively on *Roughing It in the Bush*. Her novels dealing primarily with English characters and landscapes – *Mark Hurdlestone* (1853), *Matrimonial Speculations* (1854), and *Geoffrey Moncton* (1855) – as well as the large body of her poetry, sketches, stories for children, and articles written for contemporary periodicals have been, at best, used as secondary illustrations of minor themes or relegated to brief annotative or bibliographical comments. At worst, Mrs. Moodie’s “other” works, including the many sketches and

¹ Robert L. McDougall, Introduction, *Life in the Clearings versus the Bush* (Toronto, ON: Macmillan, 1959), p. 285.

essays appearing in *The Victoria Magazine*, have been omitted entirely from critical discussions of her "major" Canadian works.

Summarily dismissed by Woodcock as representative of "the dregs of early Victorian genteel writing, the *low* colonialism,"² *The Victoria Magazine* has been all but ignored in discussions of Mrs. Moodie's life and work. In addition to the direct textual links between the Moodies' "cheap periodical for the people" and *Roughing It in the Bush* and *Life in the Clearings versus the Bush* detailed in Appendix A of this thesis, *The Victoria Magazine* is an extant document written and edited by the Moodies specifically for a working-class and Canadian audience. Unlike Mrs. Moodie's English novels and, ironically, the earliest editions of *Roughing It* which were published overseas or south of the border with an eye towards a distant British audience, *The Victoria Magazine* was published and edited in Upper Canada for a Canadian readership. In terms of the location of its publication and the intended audience, therefore, *The Victoria Magazine* must clearly be recognized as one of Mrs. Moodie's Canadian works. Further, the non-fiction written by Mrs. Moodie for *The Victoria Magazine* was used to express publicly her views on a variety of contemporary social issues which are later explored in less specific detail in the autobiographical fictions *Roughing It in the Bush* and *Life in the Clearings versus the Bush*. In terms of critical valuation and subsequent academic discussion of texts, however, "Breeding ... may count for a good deal more than birth. What matters may not be where you came from but how people treat you."³

As literary critics working within the New or Critical Historicism emphasize, "criticism must factor itself and its own mediations into its explanations. In the final accounting, 'the work' and its mediations are as inseparable as are 'the

² George Woodcock, "Editorial," *Canadian Literature* 40 (1969): 3.

³ Terry Eagleton, *Literary Theory: An Introduction* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1983), p. 9.

(original) work' and its (subsequent) critical explanations."⁴ Since the middle of this century, critical discussions of Mrs. Moodie's work have rewritten both her and her texts in ways that effectively exclude considerations of such works as *The Victoria Magazine* which challenge what has been essentially a totalizing critical impulse. In Foucauldian terms, Mrs. Moodie has become a victim of her own writing. Her complex personality and the social conscience that find a forum through the editorials and essays of *The Victoria Magazine* and her other "lesser" works have been sacrificed and rewritten in terms of an ahistoric author-function. A number of unifying "Moodie themes," constructed through the critical handling of her texts, "in the comparisons we make, the traits we extract as pertinent, the continuities we assign, or the exclusions we practice,"⁵ have replaced the multifaceted Mrs. Moodie, author and editor. As Peterman notes, she has become "a writer whom we have, out of our own cultural needs, made over into a variety of striking and often distorting images -- a one-woman British garrison, a snobbish bluestocking, a heroic pioneer, an ill-equipped Crusoe, or a literary sort of paranoid schizophrenic."⁶ Thurston emphasizes the distortion of Mrs. Moodie and her texts in this critical quest for a unified, or at least unifiable, and definable Canadian consciousness: "The Canadian imagination' in criticism on *Roughing It* has little to do with social, political and economic determinants, little to do even with the text out of which it is

⁴ Jerome J. McGann, "Introduction: A Point of Reference," *Historical Studies and Literary Criticism*, ed. Jerome J. McGann (Madison: U of Wisconsin P, 1985), p. 5.

⁵ Michel Foucault, "What is An Author?" *Language, Counter-memory, Practice: Selected Essays and Interviews by Michel Foucault*, ed. Donald F. Bouchard, trans. Donald F. Bouchard and Sherry Simon (Ithaca, NY: Cornell UP, 1977), p. 127.

⁶ Peterman, "Susanna Moodie," p. 77.

conjured."⁷ In order to relocate *The Victoria Magazine* in terms of its social, political, and economic determinants, it is necessary to reconsider the two major critical frameworks that inform contemporary criticism on and creative rewritings of Mrs. Moodie – Northrop Frye's description of her as a "one-woman garrison" and Atwood's poetic interpretation of what she reads as Mrs. Moodie's violent psychic duality.

INSIDE THE GARRISON WALLS

Frye detailed the significance of the garrison mentality in the development of the Canadian imagination in his "Conclusion" to the *Literary History of Canada*:

Small and isolated communities surrounded with a physical or psychological "frontier," separated from one another and from their American and British cultural sources: communities that provide all that their members have in the way of distinctively human values, and that are compelled to feel a great respect for the law and order that holds them together, yet confronted with a huge, unthinking, menacing, and formidable physical setting – such communities are bound to develop what we may provisionally call a garrison mentality.⁸

Especially important in terms of subsequent discussions of Mrs. Moodie's work is the vital position allocated her writing and emigrant experiences within Frye's critical framework: "Susanna Moodie in the Peterborough bush, surrounded by a half-comic, half-sinister rabble that she thinks of indifferently as Yankee, Irish, native, republican, and lower class, is a British army of occupation in herself, *a one-woman garrison*" (emphasis mine).⁹ And later, in *Divisions on a Ground*, Frye notes that "in Susanna Moodie's *Roughing It in the Bush* (1852), the positive virtues of

⁷ John Thurston, "Susanna Moodie (1803-85): The Canonization of a Colonial Writer," Ph.D. diss., Queen's University, ON 1989, 108.

⁸ Northrop Frye, "Conclusion" *Literary History of Canada*, ed. Carl F. Klinck (Toronto, ON: U of Toronto P, 1965), p. 830.

⁹ Frye, "Conclusion," p. 839.

what I have elsewhere called a garrison society show up with great clarity."¹⁰ This reading of Mrs. Moodie as a "one-woman garrison" is clearly a central illustration of Frye's garrison mentality, with *Roughing It in the Bush* "often said to be one of the foundation stones in the garrison wall."¹¹

Frye's "provisional" naming of the garrison mentality provided an immediate framework for the subsequent development of Canadian criticism and specific considerations of Mrs. Moodie's *Roughing It in the Bush*. Various elaborations of the garrison theme have been forwarded in the more than two decades since Frye's initial suggestion. Notable is the proliferation of critical interpretations focusing on the tension between wilderness and culture, the theme of exile, and theme of survival that deal almost exclusively with *Roughing It in the Bush*. For the most part, however, these discussions do little to expand the parameters of Frye's original garrison walls and extend the discussion of Mrs. Moodie beyond considerations based solely on her *Roughing It in the Bush*.

Drawing directly on Frye's "Conclusion," D.G. Jones introduces his *Butterfly on Rock* (1970) by aligning his ideas explicitly with the critical framework of the garrison mentality. "Again and again," he writes, "we are confronted by a garrison culture confronting a hostile wilderness. The present study confirms and illustrates this point."¹² By extending Frye's argument into a discussion of the Old Testament

¹⁰ Frye, *Divisions on a Ground: Essays on Canadian Culture*, ed. James Polk (Toronto, ON: Anansi, 1982), p. 46.

¹¹ Susan Y. Greenfield, "The Follies Incident to Human Nature: Susanna Moodie's Life Story as Spiritual Autobiography in "Rachel Wilde," *Flora Lyndsay, Roughing It in the Bush and Life in the Clearings*," Ph.D. diss., U of Western Ontario, 1990, 344.

¹² D.G. Jones, *Butterfly on Rock: A Study of Themes and Images in Canadian Literature* (Toronto, ON: U of Toronto P, 1970), p. 6. See also Peter C. Noel-Bentley's aptly titled review of *Butterfly on Rock*, "Our Garrison Mentality," *Mosaic* 4.1 (1970): 127-33.

patterning and perspective that he reads as central to Canadian literature.¹³ Jones hopes "to confirm and amplify" many of his predecessor's observations.¹⁴ One of his central observations is that of Mrs. Moodie as undifferentiating in her considerations of the New World populace. The critical connection with Frye's depiction of a "rabble that she thinks of indifferently" is obvious:

The Yankee farmer and his slattern daughter were for Mrs. Moodie as insolent, scheming, and uncouth as any of the Indians. For a type of middle-class gentry, the French and the Irish, the Italians, the Poles, and various others could be lumped together among the children of the devil.¹⁵

A series of critical texts propounding the validity of Frye's garrison formula followed in quick succession. Atwood's *Survival* (1972) establishes Mrs. Moodie as a combatant against "Monster Nature," struggling "to preserve her Wordsworthian faith ... when Nature fails time and time again to come through for her."¹⁶ "Again and again," observes Atwood, "we find her gazing at the sublime natural goings-on in the misty distance – sunsets, mountains, spectacular views – only to be brought up short by disagreeable things in her immediate foreground, such as bugs, swamps, tree roots and other immigrants."¹⁷ In *The Haunted Wilderness* (1976), Margot Northey elaborates the basic garrison theme in her discussion of "the dark band of gothicism which stretches from earliest to recent times"¹⁸ in Canadian fiction, commenting that while Jones and Atwood headed towards discussion of the

¹³ *Ibid.*, 15.

¹⁴ *Ibid.*, 4.

¹⁵ *Ibid.*, 36.

¹⁶ Margaret Atwood, *Survival: A Thematic Guide to Canadian Literature* (Toronto, ON: Anansi, 1972), p. 51.

¹⁷ *Ibid.*

¹⁸ Margot Northey, *The Haunted Wilderness: The Gothic and Grotesque in Canadian Fiction* (Toronto, ON: U of Toronto P, 1976). p. 3.

wilderness in terms similar to those detailed in her book, they chose "only to veer off" and return to the more traditional critical path. Again considering only *Roughing It in the Bush*, Northey discusses Mrs. Moodie's work in terms of the prototypical Canadian response to the natural world that Northey sees as exemplified in Richardson's *Wacousta* (1832). The critical foundation underlying Northey's discussion is informed by the idea of gothic terror and horror associated with the confronting of the Canadian wilderness, and the associated need to garrison oneself off from the dangers inherent in that environment, real or imagined. "This tension between the isolated, dangerous freedom of primitive nature and the sense of claustrophobia of a 'garrison culture' (to use Frye's term) is *of course* a recurring theme in Canadian literature from Susanna Moodie to contemporary writers" (emphasis mine).¹⁹

Perhaps the most comprehensive elaboration of Frye's garrison theme has been Gaile McGregor's *The Wacousta Syndrome* (1985) which emphasizes the intensity and pervasiveness of the negative responses to nature central to the garrison mentality. These powerful reactions give rise to the image of a hostile and threatening wilderness that "pervades and dominates not just Canadian literature but Canadian culture as a whole,"²⁰ a characteristic Canadian response "omnipresent in all aspects of Canadian cultural history."²¹ Mrs. Moodie is again a pivotal figure in the argument: "Moodie's determined attempt to control her response -- to minimize her sense of menace -- by clinging to safe, consoling, Wordsworthian conventions is unable to withstand the impact of the landscape

¹⁹ *Ibid.*, 24.

²⁰ Gaile McGregor, *The Wacousta Syndrome: Explorations in the Canadian Landscape* (Toronto, ON: U of Toronto P, 1985), pp. 9-10.

²¹ *Ibid.*, 26.

itself."²² Discussion of Mrs. Moodie in terms of similar garrison configurations inform Marian Fowler's "*Roughing It in the Bush: A Sentimental Novel*" (1980) and *The Embroidered Tent* (1982), Coral Ann Howells' introductory comments to *Private and Fictional Words* (1987), and, to a lesser extent, Susan Wood's *The Land in Canadian Prose 1840-1945* (1988) and Elizabeth Thompson's recent book *The Pioneer Women: A Canadian Character Type* (1991).²³

A prominent variation on Frye's garrison formula has been the critical discussion of Mrs. Moodie and her work as exemplars of any of a number of exile themes. John Moss, for example, suggests:

The *mythos* of such a nation as Canada whose original population came from abroad, usually under duress of either force or circumstance, has taken its present shape through countless stories of exile.²⁴

Pinpointing Frye's provisional "epithet" as "facile,"²⁵ Moss nonetheless agrees that the observations that support this critical framework are fundamentally accurate: "The immigrant as exile in an alien land is one of the most pervasive themes of Canadian prose fiction."²⁶ As a prisoner of both her own inflexibility within the social environment of the New World and the immense, harsh physical landscape, Mrs. Moodie is a prominent representative of Moss's "Immigrant Exile": "By

²² *Ibid.*, 37.

²³ See Fowler, "*Roughing It in the Bush: A Sentimental Novel*" *The Canadian Novel: Beginnings*, ed. John Moss (Toronto, ON: New Canada Publications, 1980), pp. 85-95, and *The Embroidered Tent: Five Gentlewomen in Early Canada* (Toronto, ON: Anansi, 1982), pp. 111-131; Howells, *Private and Fictional Words: Canadian Women Novelists of the 1970s and 1980s* (London: Methuen, 1987), pp. 22-25; Wood, *The Land in Canadian Prose 1840-1945* (Ottawa, ON: Carleton Monographs, 1988); Thompson *The Pioneer Women: A Canadian Character Type* (Montreal, PQ: McGill-Queen's UP, 1991).

²⁴ John Moss, *Patterns of Isolation in English Canadian Fiction* (Toronto, ON: McClelland and Stewart, 1974), p. 11.

²⁵ *Ibid.*, 15.

²⁶ *Ibid.*, 83.

exploiting the tensions between present experience and the impositions of the past upon present perceptions, Mrs. Moodie manipulates the action of [*Roughing It in the Bush*] in order ultimately to achieve the peculiarly British victory of benign resignation.²⁷ Her work, he continues, is an attempt at "fusing memories with aesthetic consciousness to create a reality which is both a novel and the means of her conciliation with herself and with her exiled state."²⁸

David Stouck continues this line of critical thought with his suggestion that *Roughing It* "is no splendid celebration of pioneer life ... rather it is a tale of hardship and misery which culminates in withdrawal and defeat,"²⁹ a self-imposed exile in a new land. Extending his reading of Mrs. Moodie's experiences beyond the text, Stouck concludes with his assessment that *Roughing It* "is not a work of art, but the narrator's personal drama of rejection and exile and her search for a refuge from an uncaring world is very central to what is imaginative in the Canadian experience."³⁰ In his chapter "Roughing It in Exile," Hallvard Dahlie suggests that "the theme of exile constituted a relatively unsophisticated and undeveloped component"³¹ in the writing of literary pioneers like Mrs. Moodie. In an interesting critical twist, he reads *Roughing It in the Bush* as a non-fiction account of "what it meant to be an exile in an emerging land." Again, focusing exclusively on *Roughing It in the Bush*, he argues for the recognition of "the 'roughing it' theme"³² in Canadian literature,

²⁷ *Ibid.*, 86.

²⁸ *Ibid.*

²⁹ David Stouck, "'Secrets of the Prison House': Mrs. Moodie and the Canadian Imagination," *Dalhousie Review* 54 (1974): 463.

³⁰ *Ibid.*, 472. Stouck repeats here an exact line from his earlier "Notes on the Canadian Imagination," *Canadian Literature* 54 (1972): 13.

³¹ Hallvard Dahlie, *Varieties of Exile: The Canadian Experience* (Vancouver: U of British Columbia P, 1986), p. 10.

³² *Ibid.*, 13.

the various dimensions of which have "become part of the mythology of Canada so conveniently and accurately designated by the title of Susanna Moodie's mid-century [work]."³³ In just over two decades following Frye's provisional labelling, Mrs. Moodie and one of her many works are seen by at least one critic as synonymous with a thematic framework derived directly from Frye's garrison formula.

Perhaps anticipating W.J. Keith's argument that by the time of *Roughing It in the Bush* the garrison mentality "has surely become at least partly metaphorical,"³⁴ William D. Gairdner (1972) and T.D. MacLulich (1976) read Frye's one-woman garrison as a metaphor for a psychic strategy for survival in a threatening New World environment. According to both critics, it is Mrs. Moodie's engagement with a harsh environment that precipitates "a near-archetypal pattern" of a crisis in faith.³⁵ Contrasting the emigrant experiences of Mrs. Moodie with those of her sister Catherine Parr Traill, Gairdner suggests that rather than looking objectively at the exterior realities of her new environment, Mrs. Moodie turns inwards, relying on her mind and emotions to verify and validate her new world reality. Recalling Atwood's *Survival*, Gairdner's argument presents Mrs. Moodie as a woman whose fundamental struggle is with a personal "revelation of the inadequacy of conventional European modes of thought in [her] new environment."³⁶ Accordingly, she strives to protect her fundamental belief in the justice of God and avoids the "path from romantic individualism to solipsism, to atheism, to the absurd, [that] may end in despair and insanity" by

³³ *Ibid.*, 12-13.

³⁴ W.J. Keith, "The Function of Canadian Criticism at the Present Time," *Essays on Canadian Writing* 30 (1984-85): 7.

³⁵ T.D. MacLulich, "Crusoe in the Backwoods: A Canadian Fable?" *Mosaic* 9.2 (1976): 120.

³⁶ William D. Gairdner, "Traill and Moodie: The Two Realities," *Journal of Canadian Fiction* 1.2 (1972): 42.

"compartmentalising her beliefs."³⁷ To Mrs. Moodie the reality of the New World is centred in subjectivism and romanticism, according to Gairdner, whereas for her sister reality is defined through objectivism and rationalism.³⁸ Mrs. Moodie's garrison walls are constructed psychologically as a means of protecting herself from the challenges raised by interaction with the exterior world. In the end, Gairdner suggests, Mrs. Moodie's experiences are "structured around a more mythopoetic evocation of the dark forces of life and the primal elements of the universe" than are her sister's experiences.³⁹

MacLulich suggests a similar process of psychic restructuring with his suggestion that Mrs. Moodie compartmentalizes New World characters "into one or another of the two classes into which the colonial defensively schematizes [her] world."⁴⁰ Her colonial schemata distinguish, on the one hand, the "demonic" local inhabitants whom she considers "as little better than monsters; to her, they appear almost like an extension of the undisciplined and hostile wilderness, not as human beings."⁴¹ The similarity to Frye's image of the undifferentiated rabble of the New World is obvious. The other predominant colonial category of character "is that of the morbid Englishmen, who fail and brood and with whom she identifies because they in fact resemble her to a great extent."⁴² Drawing, as did Gairdner, on the apparent dichotomous experiences of the Strickland sisters, MacLulich concludes that while "Mrs. Traill comes to see her emigration as a journey to freedom ... [Mrs.

³⁷ *Ibid.*, 41.

³⁸ *Ibid.*

³⁹ *Ibid.*, 42.

⁴⁰ MacLulich, 119.

⁴¹ *Ibid.*

⁴² *Ibid.*

Moodie] undergoes exile."⁴³ The one-woman garrison functions as a psychological strategy that allows Mrs. Moodie to use colonial psychic schemata in order to filter and reconcile the social experiences of the New World with her reified view of herself, her God, and the world. As MacLulich suggests, this mediation of experience is a matter of survival: "She must impose her vision upon the world, for she fears that the world seeks to impose itself upon her."⁴⁴

Introducing Mrs. Moodie's work as writer and coeditor of *The Victoria Magazine* into this critical framework raises the question as to whether the critical centre can hold, as it were, when asked to explain another substantial and multifaceted body of her authorial *and* editorial work. By definition a garrison culture or garrison mentality ostensibly guarantees isolation and protection. As Moss notes, the garrison is "a closed community"⁴⁵ that, if properly constructed, keeps the exterior at bay and the interior secure from real or imagined threats. In the strictest configurations of Frye's garrison formula these threats are external, located in the physical realities of the New World. Such critics as Jones, Atwood, and McGregor emphasize the threatening wilderness as the focal point of the tensions and fears expressed in Mrs. Moodie's *Roughing It in the Bush*.

These real or imagined threats may also be social: the fear of social interactions made manifest in an individual's repulsion when confronted with Frye's undifferentiated rabble. Irish, Scotch, Yankee, and Indian are homogenized into an Other, an alien, that is distinctly different, distinguishable, and inevitably deficient when compared to a necessarily subjective social standard, which in Mrs. Moodie's case is undisputably British and genteel. Automatic assumptions based on class and

⁴³ *Ibid.*, 124.

⁴⁴ *Ibid.*, 125.

⁴⁵ Moss, *Patterns of Isolation*, p. 12.

these perceived intellectual and cultural deficiencies inform all decisions involving social interaction.

The threats that invoke the need for a garrison state may also be psychological, as noted in the essays of Gairdner and MacLulich and elaborated in Atwood's emphasis on survival. Psychological defense mechanisms and psychic schemata are engaged by the immigrant in an attempt to assimilate incongruous New World environments and encounters into existing world views. Whether the walls of the fort are erected physically or psychologically in response to actual or imagined threats, the garrison mentality is driven by a desire to remain separate from the encompassing Otherness that an individual is unable or unwilling to confront. Frye argues that "a feature of Canadian life that has been noted by writers from Susanna Moodie onward: 'the paradox of vast empty spaces plus lack of privacy,' without defences against the prying or avaricious eye."⁴⁶ In part, the garrison fulfills this need to combine space and privacy, creating a physical or psychological paradise (or perhaps gentlewoman's estate) isolated from the intrusive rabble and threatening physical space of the New World.

This impulse towards separation through exclusion is underscored by Frye's description of Mrs. Moodie as a "one-woman garrison" surrounded by a "rabble that she thinks of indifferently." Not surprisingly, Jones reinforces this view with his suggestion that Mrs. Moodie looks on the various emigrant groups around her as "lumped together among the children of the devil."⁴⁷ What Frye, Jones, and subsequent proponents of the garrison theme miss, however, is the emphasis on the differentiation between emigrants on the basis of education which the Moodies promote in *The Victoria Magazine*. The Moodies use the fiction and non-fiction of

⁴⁶ Frye, "Conclusion," p. 827.

⁴⁷ Jones, *Butterfly on Rock*, p. 36.

their periodical as a public forum through which to express their firm belief in the individual and social benefits to be realized through common education, promoting, in part, the recognition of a meritocratic social structure based on intellect and education. In such essays as "Education -- The True Wealth of the World," "Memory," and "Religion and Loyalty," as well as through the serialized fictions "Rachel Wilde" and "The Advantages of Being Ugly," they articulate guidelines for differentiation rather than support for Frye's central notion of a homogeneous rabble. They do not stare indifferently at the emigrant populace of the New World, but establish and make public the criteria by which to differentiate among groups that have traditionally been defined in strictly socioeconomic terms. Their central statement is concise -- "The want of education is the only *real* barrier that exists between different classes of men" (*VM* iv.90).

Similarly, in *Roughing It in the Bush* Mrs. Moodie details at great length the distinctions between the native and non-native characters of Frye's rabble. Whereas emigrants like Uncle Joe, Emily, and Old Satan are depicted as coarse, vulgar, and untrustworthy, native characters, particularly those introduced in her chapter entitled "The Wilderness, and Our Indian Friends," are referred to collectively as Nature's gentlemen. The Nogans, Jacob Faithful, Susan Moore, and the numerous unnamed native women are distinct and welcome visitors to the Moodies' home. "There never was a people more sensible of kindness, or more grateful for any little act of benevolence exercised towards them," Mrs. Moodie writes of these encounters. "We met them with confidence; our dealings with them were conducted with the strictest integrity; and they became attached to our persons, and in no single instance ever destroyed the good opinion we entertained of them" (*RI*, 298). The Moodies' feelings towards their neighbours, native or otherwise, are represented not by mutually exclusive distinctions based solely on nationality or race but by a more complex and less rigid structure than has been suggested by Frye and

others. To the Moodies, sophistication of intellect is the criterion that distinguishes persons within any national group.

But as critics and theorists working within the New Historicism emphasize, literary meaning is as much a product of a complex of non-literary factors as it is the result of an author's artistic decisions. "The price of a book, its place of publication, even its physical form and the institutional structures by which it is distributed and received, all bear upon the production of literary meaning, and hence all must be critically analyzed and explained."⁴⁸ As I have shown in the preceding chapters, these non-literary factors were fundamental influences in shaping the structure and content of *The Victoria Magazine*. Writing in a periodical rather than novel format and intending their publication as an inexpensive magazine for rural, working-class readers, the Moodies made a conscious decision to engage their audience in a dialogue. Through the pages of *The Victoria Magazine* they made public their personal views on the need for a system of common schools, issues of class and social stratification, the intrinsic value of literature, and the immediate future of the New World. The views expressed directly through their essays, editorials, and reviews and more subtly through their editorial decisions became public property, as it were, open to debate and with the power to anger, persuade, entertain, or challenge their readers. The magazine's audience, on the other hand, was not without a voice with which to make their concerns known. Readers could become writers, sending letters and submitting articles for consideration. Subscriptions could be renewed in support of general editorial policy or cancelled in disagreement with any stated position. Newspapers and other periodicals of the day could and did

⁴⁸ McGann, p. 4. For a critical application of these ideals, see Thurston's (re)examination of *Roughing It in the Bush* as a "cultural collaboration" freed from "the spatial and temporal limitations of author and publication date" in "Rewriting *Roughing It*" (*Future Indicative*, 1987).

publish comments about the magazine's contents and the decisions of its editors (see Appendix B).

Whereas the garrison framework emphasizes disengagement and the essential need for separation from the physical, social, and psychological environment, *The Victoria Magazine* as both a business and a literary venture relied on engagement with this same environment in order to survive. Mrs. Moodie "was a commercial writer; she wrote for money"⁴⁹ prior to emigration, during her stay in the bush, and throughout her years in Belleville. In focusing exclusively on a single text and reducing the sociohistorical and economic complexities of the emigrant experience to anecdotal asides or piecemeal illustrations of central and unifying literary themes in that text, critics working within this framework have erected the walls of the critical garrison around Mrs. Moodie. Effectively excluded from interpretations of Mrs. Moodie's life and work within the garrison framework are considerations of the complex social, political, and economic environment in which her texts are produced, circulated, and consumed.

ATWOOD'S MOODIE

Since the middle of this century Mrs. Moodie "has become a central foundation figure in both critical and creative attempts to define the condition of the imagination in Canada."⁵⁰ While Frye's seminal garrison framework continues to be a persistent influence on critical discussions of Mrs. Moodie, Atwood's *The Journals of Susanna Moodie* (1970) has carried a significant double impact, influencing both critical and creative rewritings of Mrs. Moodie and her work. Employing a tripartite structure to arrange her collection of poems, Atwood

⁴⁹ Carol Shields, *Susanna Moodie: Voice and Vision* (Ottawa, ON: Borealis, 1977), p. 2.

⁵⁰ Peterman, "Susanna Moodie," p. 63.

purports to "follow, more or less, the course of Mrs. Moodie's life" (*JSM*, 63). "Journal I" spans the years from Mrs. Moodie's arrival at Quebec, her settlement and seven years in the bush, and the decision to leave for Belleville. "Journal II" deals with what can be called the Belleville years, which in the chronology of Mrs. Moodie's real-life story corresponds with the period of her involvement with *The Victoria Magazine*. The poems that make up the third and final "Journal" "take [Mrs. Moodie] through an estranged old age, into death and beyond" (*JSM*, 63).

Atwood's use of Mrs. Moodie as "a touchstone and a signpost"⁵¹ in her attempts to explore creatively our literary and cultural heritage is not unique. Robertson Davies' play *At My Heart's Core* (1950) and Charles Pachter's series of ten lithographs in 1969 preceded Atwood's *Journals* in creative explorations of various aspects of Mrs. Moodie's life and work. In her novel *Small Ceremonies* (1976) Carol Shields creates another "Moodie" character who exhibits, among other distinctly Canadian traits, "a pleasing schizoid side."⁵² Beth Hopkins and Anne Joyce rewrite a dramatic "Moodie" in their *Daughter by Adoption: A Play Based on the Writings of Susanna Moodie* (1983). None of these previous or subsequent creative revisions, however, has had the critical impact of Atwood's.

In the "Afterword" to *The Journals of Susanna Moodie*, Atwood recalls her disappointment upon reading Mrs. Moodie's two books about Canada: "The prose was discursive and ornamental and the books had little shape: they were collections of disconnected anecdotes" (*JSM*, 62). The only unifying aspect "was the personality of Mrs. Moodie, and what struck me the most about this personality was the way in which it reflects many of the obsessions still with us" (*JSM*, 62). At this point Atwood recognizes what she considers to be the deepest and most violent psychic

⁵¹ Sherrill E. Grace, "Moodie and Atwood: Notes on a Literary Reincarnation," *The Canadian Novel: Beginnings*, p. 79.

⁵² Carol Shields, *Small Ceremonies* (Toronto: Totem, 1976), p. 6.

duality underlying these national obsessions. "If the national mental illness of the United States is megalomania," Atwood diagnoses, then "that of Canada is paranoid schizophrenia. Mrs. Moodie is divided down the middle" (*JSM*, 62). Atwood's Moodie becomes the archetype for what Atwood the poet and critic sees as the definitively Canadian condition of living with "a violent duality" (*JSM*, 62). As Laura Groening summarizes, "The actual poems that comprise *The Journals of Susanna Moodie* enact with remarkable faithfulness the critical position which is articulated in the Afterword."⁵³ Atwood's Moodie is a schizoid personality. Although she expresses her love of the Canadian landscape with a romantic fervour, she fears that the same landscape is destroying her. She exiles herself from the people around her, including her husband, only to find that she needs humanity as a garrison against the threat of the wilderness. In "The Double Voice" this duality is made explicit:

Two voices
took turns using my eyes:

One had manners,
painted in watercolours, ...

The other voice
had other knowledge:
that men sweat and drink often. (*JSM*, 42)

Atwood maintains in her "Afterword" that "although the poems can be read in connection with Mrs. Moodie's books, they don't have to be: they have detached themselves from the books in the same way that other poems detach themselves from the events that gave rise to them" (*JSM*, 63). But Atwood is as much a critic in her *Journals* as she is a poet, creating for her audience a portrait of Mrs. Moodie that supports the critical assumptions that inform her own discussions in *Survival* as

⁵³ Laura Groening, "The Journals of Susanna Moodie: A Twentieth-Century Look at a Nineteenth-Century Life," *Studies in Canadian Literature* 8.2 (1983): 169.

well as various configurations of the garrison framework. In his "Preface" to *The Bush Garden*, Frye notes that his own title was "pilfered" from Atwood's *Journals*, "a book unusually rich in suggestive phrases defining a Canadian sensibility."⁵⁴ Dahlie concurs, commenting that Atwood's poetic reflections on Mrs. Moodie's emigrant experiences "can stand as a tribute to the strength of character not only of Susanna but also of many of her fellow exiles."⁵⁵ But as Heather Murray notes, Atwood's treatment of Mrs. Moodie's life and work has become so influential, "so seriously controlling our contemporary view that the question has been put, of whether we can any longer read Moodie herself, or only Atwood's Moodie."⁵⁶

A number of subsequent critical discussions of Mrs. Moodie have emphasized the violent duality that is the defining characteristic of Atwood's Moodie. Fowler suggests that *Roughing It in the Bush* is marked by "two Susannas: sometimes one will be dominant, sometimes the other."⁵⁷ While Mrs. Moodie's book ultimately realizes the synthesis of these distinct voices, achieving a balance between the dualistic aspects of Mrs. Moodie's vision, "in actual life, the duality of her personality probably remained, painfully, in jagged splinters."⁵⁸ Stouck sees the psychic split which "finds its essential expression in such ... works of the imagination as Susanna Moodie's journals" as a typical configuration of the Canadian imagination: "The artist's struggle is never really with nature, but with his own

⁵⁴ Frye, "Preface," *The Bush Garden: Essays on the Canadian Imagination* (Toronto, ON: Anansi, 1971), p. x.

⁵⁵ Dahlie, p. 12. See also Howells' *Private and Fictional Words*, p. 3.

⁵⁶ Heather Murray, "Women in the wilderness," *A Mazing Space: Writing Canadian Women Writing*, eds. Shirley Neuman and Smaro Kamboureli (Edmonton, AB: Longspoon/Newest, 1986): 78.

⁵⁷ Fowler, *The Embroidered Tent*, p. 130.

⁵⁸ *Ibid.*, 101.

divided self and with the society from which he is separate."⁵⁹ Whitlock makes Atwood's violent duality part of a universal colonial mindset rather than a strictly Canadian condition, linking Mrs. Moodie with Australian colonial writers like Henry Lawson. There is a similarity between the experiences of the two colonial writers, Whitlock suggests,

which emerges from their shared position as colonial realists facing the psychological dimensions of "seeing" a new world and placing oneself within it. The frontier emerges like a psychic terrain ... [which], as Margaret Atwood perceptively suggests in her *The Journals of Susanna Moodie*, "breaks in" upon the observer, becoming a meeting place of virgin nature and modern man, and a frontier of what is unknown and feared in oneself.⁶⁰

Like Atwood, Whitlock continues to probe the psyche of the colonial writer in search of pathology, concluding that "It is this personal and social frontier which lurks behind all their writings, the edge of absurdity and madness in self and society."⁶¹

Atwood's Moodie views and reacts to the physical, psychological, and social environments of the New World in strictly dichotomous psychological terms. Her experiences are dramatically ahistorical, stripped of any historically relevant social, political, or economic significance. Atwood's Moodie *is* pathological in her understanding and articulation of her experiences in the New World, relying extensively on violent and dualistic images and language. Mrs. Moodie herself was not pathological. Her involvement in the Anti-Slavery League prior to her emigration, her articles in *The Victoria Magazine* arguing for the establishment of a system of common education, and her concerns for the potential of the new country to exist as a viable economic and political force reveal a level of social conscience

⁵⁹ Stouck, "Notes on the Canadian Imagination," 10-11.

⁶⁰ Whitlock, 40-41.

⁶¹ *Ibid.*, 41.

not present in Atwood's Moodie. Mrs. Moodie's role in securing her husband's appointment to the shrievalty of Victoria District and her attempts to maintain a distance from the subsequent political turmoil that defined Belleville during the 1840s suggest a woman aware of, although not necessarily successful in dealing with, the political aspects of national and local settlement. Her recycling of previously published materials in order to maximize the financial gains from her writing, a significant practice in the history of *The Victoria Magazine*, reveals a woman who understood the economic power available to her through her pen. Again, this awareness and manipulation of the business of writing are lost in Atwood's Moodie, replaced by the simplistic and reductive statement in "Further Arrivals" that "It was our own / ignorance we entered. / I have not come out yet" (*JSM*, 12). The complexity of the woman, her work, and her emigrant experiences is lost, as Thurston observes, in "a late twentieth-century consciousness in search of itself."⁶²

Relocating *The Victoria Magazine* in terms of Atwood's creative and critical rewriting of Mrs. Moodie also requires a reconsideration of the significance of J.W. Dunbar as a factor in her life and work. Atwood's Moodie is effectively isolated from her husband who, in "Further Arrivals," is defined as nothing more than a "shadowy figure" (*JSM*, 13). In "The Wereman" the physical being to whom Mrs. Moodie should be most intimately connected becomes one with the threatening wilderness. He is absorbed by the enemy:

⁶² Thurston, "Susanna Moodie (1803-85): The Canonization of a Colonial Writer," 99. For similar discussions of Atwood's critical/creative distortion of Mrs. Moodie, see Susan Glickman's "The Waxing and Waning of Susanna Moodie's 'Enthusiasm,'" *Canadian Literature* 130 (1991): 20, Laura Groening's "The Journals of Susanna Moodie: A Twentieth-Century Look at a Nineteenth-Century Life" (1983), and Eva-Marie Kroller's "Resurrections: Susanna Moodie, Catharine Parr Traill and Emily Carr in Contemporary Canadian Literature," *Journal of Popular Culture* 15.3 (1981): 39-42.

My husband walks in the frosted field
 an X, a concept
 defined against a blank;
 he swerves, enters the forest
 and is blotted out.

Unheld by my sight
 what does he change into
 what other shape
 blends with the under-
 growth, wavers across the pools
 is camouflaged from the listening
 swamp animals. (JSM, 19)

Anticipating his inevitable return, Atwood's Moodie is fearful that he too will become the enemy:

At noon he will
 return; or it may be
 only my idea of him
 I will find returning
 with him hiding behind it.

He may change me also
 with the fox eye, the owl
 eye, the eightfold
 eye of the spider. (JSM, 19)

Shields continues this creative characterization of J.W. Dunbar as a shadowy, almost threatening character, depicting him in *Small Ceremonies* as "a negative personality."⁶³ Fowler suggests that Mrs. Moodie's portrayal of her husband as a "loser, too weak to cope with frontier life" who needed someone "to prop him up, rather like a lean"⁶⁴ reflects the reality of his ineptness and the insignificance of his role in their relationship.

But as this study of *The Victoria Magazine* shows, J.W. Dunbar was not a "shadowy" figure disappearing into the woods of his partner's psyche. His contributions to *The Victoria Magazine* are significant in quantitative terms and in establishing, with his coeditor, the personality of the publication. As Gerson points

⁶³ Shields, *Small Ceremonies*, p. 122.

⁶⁴ Fowler, *The Embroidered Tent*, p. 102.

out, J.W. Dunbar's views on political and social issues were similar to those of his wife and his literary activity and involvement in social movements in England prior to emigration were no less substantial than that of the then Susanna Strickland.⁶⁵ In *The Victoria Magazine* his attacks on British xenophobia in "Religion and Loyalty," his promotion of the benefits of education in "Memory," his contributions to the series of sketches on practical jokes as well his collaborative input to the regular "Editor's Table" are as important in developing the tone and social vision of *The Victoria Magazine* as is the work of his coeditor and partner in the bush. In February of 1848, an anonymous reviewer for McQueen's *Huron Signal* suggests that J.W. Dunbar's contributions were not without merit and the potential for social impact in their own right:

the article to which we would particularly direct attention is the article by Mr. Moodie himself, entitled "Religion and Loyalty," which would certainly do honor to any author or to any Magazine. The extensive circulation of such sentiments would do more, in one generation, to dissipate prejudices – to smooth down the sectarian asperities, and to produce peace and good-will among men – than has been accomplished by all other means during the last century.⁶⁶

The only essay that McQueen chose to reprint from *The Victoria Magazine* (11 February 1848) was J.W. Dunbar's "Religion and Loyalty."

As Peterman observes, the primary text that gave rise to Atwood's image of the shadowy J.W. Dunbar is deficient. J.W. Dunbar's considerable contributions to *Roughing It in the Bush* have been the victims of frequent editorial decisions "to ignore the informative, objective, and generally optimistic voice he sought to bring to the book."⁶⁷ Klinck's substantial editorial excision of J.W. Dunbar from the 1962

⁶⁵ Gerson, "Mrs. Moodie's Beloved Partner," 36.

⁶⁶ Anon. *Huron Signal* 4 February 1848. See also Appendix B for further contemporary comments regarding J.W. Dunbar's contributions to *The Victoria Magazine*.

⁶⁷ Peterman, "Susanna Moodie," p. 83.

New Canadian Library edition of *Roughing It in the Bush* has been well documented.⁶⁸ This is not to say that J.W. Dunbar did not commit the blunders in judgment and action that critics have focused on in their brief considerations of him. His lack of business acumen in negotiating with the land speculators upon his arrival and his naivete in attempting to skirt the political infighting of Belleville in the 1840s are obvious. What is often overlooked by critics working with Atwood's Moodie in mind is not only J.W. Dunbar's significant involvement with *The Victoria Magazine* during the 1840s but also his willingness, with the benefits of experience and hindsight, to make his errors public knowledge. In *Roughing It in the Bush* and in his introduction to his own *Scenes and Adventures*, he admits responsibility for his errors, holding up his mistakes in failed real estate speculations as lessons for the reader:

I had ... about 300 [pounds] when I arrived in Canada. This sum was really advantageously invested in a cleared farm, which possessed an intrinsic and not a merely speculative value. Afterwards a small legacy of about 700 [pounds] fell into my hands, and had I contented myself with this farm, and purchased two adjoining cleared farms ... I should have done well, or at all events have invested my money profitably. But the temptation to buy wild land at 5s. an acre, which was expected to double in value in a few months, with the example of many instances of similar speculation proving successful which came under my notice, proved irresistible. (*RI*, 263)

Contemporary critics such as Atwood and Fowier are not quite as willing, however, to admit the shadowy Mr. Moodie into the pictures they have drawn of his beloved partner.

Clearly, not all criticism on Mrs. Moodie aligns itself neatly under one of these two obviously interconnected critical frameworks. Regardless of the critical approach or goal, however, the spotlight has, for the most part, remained firmly focused on a single text in the body of Mrs. Moodie's work -- *Roughing It in the Bush*. Works as diverse as Ballstadt's thematic consideration of Mrs. Moodie's

⁶⁸ Thurston, "Rewriting *Roughing It*," pp. 198-99.

"responses to water throughout the book"⁶⁹ to Giltrow's discussion of Mrs. Moodie as travel writer⁷⁰ to David Jackel's attempt "to show that the book is a questionable choice for inclusion in the canon of classic Canadian literature"⁷¹ share a common element that underscores the need to relocate critically *The Victoria Magazine* in critical discussions of Mrs. Moodie. Each of these critics discusses in varying degrees of detail the importance of two sketches to *Roughing It in the Bush* – "A Visit to Grosse Isle" and "Quebec." None, however, discusses either the textual connections between these sketches and *The Victoria Magazine* in which they were published four years prior to their appearance in *Roughing It in the Bush*. Nor do they suggest, in the case of "A Visit to Grosse Isle," the importance of the variations in the texts as noted by Peterman⁷² and discussed in my previous chapter. In his essay "Susanna Moodie, Pink Toryism, and Nineteenth Century Ideas of Canadian Identity," Robin Mathews, while attempting to locate Mrs. Moodie in terms of contemporary politics with her own provocative quotation concerning "the only *real* barrier" between classes, accurately cites *The Victoria Magazine* as the source of the quotation but fails to locate either the words or the publication in terms of the sociopolitical environment in which the magazine circulated. Nor does he consider the Moodies' conscious decision to eschew all party feelings from the pages of their magazine, Sheriff Moodie's unwelcome involvement in the election riots in the years immediately preceding the publication of the essay from which this quotation is

⁶⁹ Carl Ballstadt, "Proficient in the Gentle Craft," *Copperfield* 5 (1974): 99.

⁷⁰ Janet Giltrow, "Painful Experience in a Distant Land": Mrs. Moodie in Canada and Mrs. Trollope in America," *Mosaic* 14.2 (1981): 131-44.

⁷¹ David Jackel, "Mrs. Moodie and Mrs. Traill, and the Fabrication of a Canadian Tradition," *The Compass* 6 (1979): 10.

⁷² Peterman, "Susanna Moodie," pp. 86-89.

taken, or the highly politicized nature of periodical literature during this same period. The story of *The Victoria Magazine* is, again, relegated to a brief endnote.

Regardless of the underlying critical approach or methodology, however, one impulse informs almost all critical discussions of Mrs. Moodie's work – the desire to totalize her pioneer experiences so as to make them prototypical and germane to the modern Canadian consciousness and quest for national identity. The underlying question, as McGregor asks earnestly, is "what Susanna Moodie's experience implies for the Canadian experience as a whole."⁷³ R.D. MacDonald argues for the recognition of a formal pattern to *Roughing It in the Bush* that accentuates Mrs. Moodie's movement from "romantic anticipation to disillusionment,"⁷⁴ whereas for Noonan, the critical goal is to define the "strategy of fiction which amalgamates the disparate findings and the elements of the book into a cohesive if multi-faceted flow."⁷⁵ McGregor's notion of an omnipresent negative response to the Canadian wilderness, Northey's transhistorical band of gothicism, Stouck's Canadian imagination, Atwood's diagnosis of a national psychopathology – each of these critical labels attempts to define the essence of a uniquely Canadian sensibility.

Remaining for the most part text-centred in their critical discussions, proponents of the garrison theme inevitably discuss Mrs. Moodie's writing in terms of her struggle with Wordsworthian language and sensibilities (Atwood and McGregor), her development of gothic conventions in *Roughing It in the Bush* (Howells, Fowler, and Northey), or her obvious thematic emphasis on exile,

⁷³ McGregor, p. 38.

⁷⁴ R.D. MacDonald, "Design and Purpose," *Canadian Literature* 51 (1972): 30.

⁷⁵ G. Noonan, "Susanna and Her Critics: A Strategy of Fiction for *Roughing It in the Bush*," *Studies in Canadian Literature* 5.2 (1980): 280.

imprisonment, isolation, and separation. Although Mrs. Moodie's short prose pieces in *The Victoria Magazine* such as "The Well in the Wilderness" and the two-part "Scenes in Canada" do develop to some extent what would traditionally be considered as garrison themes and imagery, the text of *The Victoria Magazine* reveals a more complex, socially conscious, and less unified view of the New World. The fictions that comprise the bulk of the magazine's text are for the most part republished histories and historical romances set in other times and other places and written *prior* to the Moodies' departure from Leith in 1832 (see Appendix A). These works accurately reflect what would sell in the literary markets of London and Edinburgh during the early nineteenth century. Mrs. Moodie's serialized "Trials of a Travelling Musician," on the other hand, written in Canada for the working-class audience of the magazine, is a series of local colour sketches. Aylmer's "Alciphron Leicester," accepted by the Moodies for serialization in the pages of their periodical, is a tale of success and vigor in the New World. The only threats the story's hero faces are those originating from within his own family in Britain prior to his emigration. His transatlantic crossing and wilderness experiences are undernarrated and uneventful. The reviews, essays, and editorials written for *The Victoria Magazine* are generated more from a pedagogic impulse than from a struggle with Wordsworthian convention and fear of the unknown. The Moodies' concern for mental cultivation and social reorganization rather than physical or psychological survival provides the central focus. The usual miscellany of jokes, riddles, and witticisms used to fill up the balance of the pages were written and selected with a working-class Canadian audience in mind. The only sense of struggle that marks the existence of *The Victoria Magazine* as a literary venture is that which apparently took place between the Moodies and Joseph Wilson, and the Moodies' efforts to understand better the tastes of their rural audience.

Revealing a multi-faceted and socially concerned Mrs. Moodie, the text of *The Victoria Magazine* is written and selected with an eye towards entertainment, instruction, and economic viability rather than as a cathartic reaction to the emigrant struggle with the wilderness. Mrs. Moodie was not simply an emigrant, a struggling Romantic, a paranoid schizophrenic, author of *Roughing It in the Bush*, woman, wife, mother, although she may well have been all of these. And she was definitely much more. Mrs. Moodie was, as Susan Glickman celebrates, "robustly inconsistent" in her opinions,⁷⁶ diverse in her writing, and proficient in her craft. She was politically aware but not always correct in her assessments of the issues and their immediate relevance to her work in *The Victoria Magazine*. She was concerned about social issues and acutely attentive to the opportunities to turn her words into money. She did write *Roughing It in the Bush* -- along with her husband and a number of editors -- but she also wrote *other* stories and poems as well as writing and editing a periodical for the people of her New World. She was not two voices, she was a multitude of voices interwoven through and around the texts that she wrote and published in order to secure a future for herself and her family. As Louis A. Montrose points out,

The writing and reading of texts, as well as the processes by which they are circulated and categorized, analyzed and taught, are being reconstrued as historically determined and determining modes of cultural work; apparently autonomous aesthetic and academic issues are being reunderstood as inextricably though complexly linked to other discourses and practices -- such linkages constituting the social networks within which individual subjectivities and collective structures are mutually and continuously shaped.⁷⁷

The Victoria Magazine -- printed, edited, bought, read, and, in part, written in Upper Canada for a distinctly Canadian audience -- should not be used only as a source of

⁷⁶ Glickman, 21.

⁷⁷ Louis A. Montrose, "Professing the Renaissance: The Poetics and Politics of Culture," *The New Historicism*, ed. H. Aram Veeser (New York, NY: Routledge, 1989), p. 15.

anecdotal ornaments for discussions of Mrs. Moodie's "major" Canadian works. It should be relocated in critical discussions of Mrs. Moodie as a challenge to the garrison, the diagnosis, and the practice of abrogating the complexities of the past in an attempt to allay the anxieties of the present.

CONCLUSION

Every culture makes choices about the texts, oral or written, that most economically express its story -- the series of events, ideals, and aspirations that have led to the historical present. But as Hayden White observes, all these events are essentially value-neutral: "Whether they find their place in a story that is tragic, comic, romantic, or ironic ... depends upon the ... decision to *configure* them according to the imperatives of one plot structure or mythos rather than another."¹ White's emphasis is crucial. It is important to recognize that the events that make up these stories are configured, "*made* into a story by the suppression or subordination of certain of them and the highlighting of others, by characterization, motific repetition, variation of tone and point of view, alternative descriptive strategies, and the like."²

Within a Canadian context the search for a national story inevitably leads to other stories. As Frye notes, there is an "obvious and unquenchable desire of the Canadian cultural public to identify itself through its literature."³ Fiction, autobiography, essays -- all combine to appease but never quite quench the desire to find a definable national identity: a Canadian story. Since the middle of this century, Mrs. Moodie and her work have been essential elements in the building of this national plot structure. She has "become a central foundation figure in both

¹ Hayden White, "The Historical Text as Literary Artifact," *Tropics of Discourse: Essays in Cultural Criticism* (Baltimore: John Hopkins UP, 1978), p. 84.

² *Ibid.*

³ Frye, "Conclusion," p. 822.

critical and creative attempts to define the condition of the imagination in Canada."⁴ Rewritten by critics, poets, playwrights, and artists, her life has become representative of *the* Canadian experience during the settlement of Upper Canada in the years prior to Confederation. Her own fictional autobiography, *Roughing It in the Bush* (1852), originally written for a distant audience in a distant land, has become one of the key literary events in the writing of the Canadian story. But as White suggests, none of these tales is ever complete.

Launched with only moderate fanfare from Joseph Wilson's printing shop in Belleville in the fall of 1847, *The Victoria Magazine: A Cheap Periodical for the People* is a chapter in the story of Mrs. Moodie's literary career that has been all but ignored by critics of Canadian literature. Ironically, *The Victoria Magazine* was distinctly Canadian. Published, edited, circulated, consumed, and partially written in Upper Canada, the magazine was intended specifically for the rural populace of the colony. "We shall spare no pains," pledged its editors "to make this Magazine as acceptable to their tastes, and as worthy of their approbation, for its intrinsic merits, as we can possibly render it" (*VM*, i.1). During her brief tenure as the magazine's coeditor and principal writer, Mrs. Moodie worked ambitiously to fulfill this promise. Considering herself a literary philanthropist dedicated to "the exalted and noble cause of mental improvement," she used her fiction and non-fiction in the pages of *The Victoria Magazine* to express her opinions on a variety of contemporary social issues, particularly those dealing with pedagogy and education. Calling for the establishment of common schools throughout the colony and the democratization of the educational system, she stated her position clearly and without apology. "The want of education and moral training," she writes, "is the only *real* barrier that exists between the different classes of men" (*VM*, iv.90). Drawing

⁴ Peterman, "Susanna Moodie," p. 64.

extensively on the pedagogic ideals of Pestalozzi, her views on education were progressive. Intellectual training was to be ongoing and reflective, not rigidly structured rote lessons that rewarded memorization and repetition. Children of both genders and of all socioeconomic groups were to be taught how to think, not only how to remember.

The story of Mrs. Moodie's involvement in *The Victoria Magazine* has distinct political overtones as well. Amidst the volatile political climate of the 1840s, the Moodies somewhat naively attempted to establish the pages of their periodical as neutral territory. By omitting all subject-matter that could possibly incite confrontation between the numerous political and religious factions in Belleville, they hoped to promote cooperation rather than confrontation. In the pages of the magazine, Mrs. Moodie expressed her own desire for the recognition of a social meritocracy based on intellect and education rather than on the traditional aristocratic distinctions grounded in socioeconomic standing and family history. Her goal was, again, regulatory rather than revolutionary. An educated working class, she suggests, would better understand and fully accept their position within the new hierarchy and perform their assigned duties accordingly.

In editing *The Victoria Magazine*, Mrs. Moodie was herself forced to deal with the question of stories. Market pressures and audience expectations made it necessary for her to write and select fictions that would entertain and amuse readers of the magazine. Her attempts to reconcile her own uncertainties concerning the moral and intellectual repercussions of reading and writing imaginative fiction led her to rely heavily on reprinted stories from the past – Scott-inspired historical romances that she believed would suit the literary tastes of the New World. When she turned her pen to stories of the present, Mrs. Moodie revealed a predilection for social realism, dealing with the experiences of emigration and settlement.

Revealing a multi-faceted and socially concerned Mrs. Moodie, this *other* chapter in her life and literary career challenges a number of the basic assumptions underlying modern critical and creative rewritings of this pioneer Canadian writer. Rather than finding a free-woman garrison attempting to separate herself physically, psychologically, and socially from the world around her, we find, instead, a woman ambitiously writing and editing a periodical for the working-class "rabble" of the New World. Rather than finding a paranoid schizophrenic with a shadowy husband and a reality based in a violent psychic duality, we find a writer with serious social concerns willing to express her ideas through the pages of her periodical. As the anonymous reviewer of *Mark Hurdlestone* predicted in 1853, the story of *The Victoria Magazine* is indeed worth telling. In the end, it is a story that suggests the need to reread, and possibly rewrite, the stories we have made of Mrs. Moodie.

APPENDIX A

**THE VICTORIA MAGAZINE IN THE 1840S:
REVIEWS AND ADVERTISEMENTS**

ADVERTISEMENTS

The Prospectus reprinted below in its entirety was the advertisement most frequently circulated by the Moodies and Wilson.

PROSPECTUS OF THE VICTORIA MAGAZINE
Mr. and Mrs. MOODIE, Editors.

The Editors of the Victoria Magazine will devote all their talents to produce a useful, entertaining, and cheap Periodical, for the Canadian People; which may afford amusement to both old and young. Sketches and Tales, in verse and prose, Moral Essays, Statistics of the Colony, Scraps of Useful Information, Reviews of New Works, and well selected articles of the day, will form the pages of the Magazine.

The Editors feel confident that the independent country to whose service they are proud to dedicate their talents, will cheerfully lend its support to encourage their arduous and honorable undertaking. The low price at which the Periodical is placed, is in order that every person within the Colony, who can read, and is anxious for mental improvement, may become a subscriber and patron of the work.

The Victoria Magazine will contain twenty four pages in each number, printed on new type, and upon good paper; and will form at the end of the year a neat Volume, of 288 pages, together with the Title Page and Index.

It will be issued Monthly, commencing on the First of September, from the offices of JOSEPH WILSON, Front Street, Belleville – the Publisher and sole Proprietor, to whom all orders for the Magazine and letters to the Editors must be addressed, (post-paid.)

The terms of subscription – ONE DOLLAR PER ANNUM – [invariably] to be paid in advance.

This Prospectus appeared in:

Huron Signal (Goderich), weekly from 3 March 1848 until 30 August 1849, and on the following dates: 27 September; 4, 11 October; 6, 27 December of 1849; 3 January and 4 April of 1850.

Wilson's Experiment (1849): 7.

* * *

Cobourg Star (Cobourg)

The following excerpt appeared at the end of the Prospectus for *Wilson's Experiment* on 17, 24 November 1847, and 8 December 1847.

Subscriptions received by Messrs Goodeve & Corrigan, Book Sellers, Cobourg who are also agents for the *Victoria Magazine*, edited by Mr. and Mrs. Moodie, at only \$1 a year.

REVIEWS AND NOTICES

Cobourg Star (Cobourg)

Anon. 8 September 1847.

We received the first No. of this new monthly, on Saturday last, and are much pleased with the contents.

Mrs. Moodie, who is well known in Canada by her admirable prose fictions, as by her beautiful poetry, is remarkable for her talents, and for a playful lively humour that shews itself in all her works. Both in her prose and her poetry she displays great knowledge of the world, and cuts up its follies with the keenest satire.

Her sketches of scenery are true and pleasing; and her narratives are graceful and natural.

But the following extracts from [sic] her introductory Poem, "*Canada*," will go further towards sitting her merits as a writer, before the readers of the *STAR*, than any praise of ours, displaying as they do a serious tenderness and elevation of thought truly feminine, and at the same time exhibiting in their imagery and allusion the fruits of extensive and varied reading, which would do honour to the most masculine understanding:

(excerpt of Mrs. Moodie's poem "Canada")

Mr. Moodie is less known to the public by his writings; indeed we do not remember ever having seen any of his prose, but his poetry shews his ear attuned to harmony, and his taste to all the beauties of expression. Had his life been less occupied with cares and duties of the world, he would by this time have become no mean poet and author.

We sincerely thank the editors of the *Victoria Magazine* for the pleasure which the perusal of their labours has afforded us, and we hope that the work may meet with that unbounded success which it so richly deserves.

Anon. 10 November 1847.

The third number of this excellent monthly has made its appearance. It contains among the other excellent articles, a beautiful poem from the pen of *our* R.A.P.

Anon. 19 January 1848.

The 5th number of this excellent number is now before us, and we are happy to state that it is steadily increasing in interest and typographical excellence. There is however one objection to it, and that is, that there is not enough of Mrs. Moodie's poetry in it. The letter A solves the riddle of Mr. Hughes -- Does Hamilton Aylmer mean Shelley?

Anon. 9 February 1848.

THE VICTORIA MAGAZINE For February has come to hand. It is decidedly the best yet issued and is well worth a whole year's subscription. The story of "The Wolves," by T. Page Esq., Editor of the *Newcastle Farmer*, will be transferred to our columns next week.

* * *

Huron Signal (Goderich)

Anon. "Literature." 4 February 1848.

We have just received the fifth number of the "Victoria Magazine," edited by Mr. and Mrs. Moodie, and published by Mr. Joseph Wilson, Bellville [sic]; and we are happy in being able to state, that notwithstanding the talent and respectability of the former numbers, the present is a decided improvement upon its predecessors. In fact there are some articles in the present number that would do honor to any periodical.

It would be superfluous to recommend the Tales or Poetry of Mrs. Moodie to the reading population of America or Britain -- they are already well known and admired in both countries. With the popularity of the contributors we are not so well acquainted, but they certainly possess talent to render them popular. But the article to which we would particularly direct attention is the article by Mr. Moodie himself, entitled "Religion and Loyalty," which would certainly do honor to any author or to any Magazine. The extensive circulation of such sentiments would do more, in one generation, to dissipate prejudices -- to smooth down the sectarian asperities, and to produce peace and good-will among men -- than has been accomplished by all other means during the last century. Such Magazines should be encouraged and patronised by all who have the good of the country at heart.

Anon. "Literature." 17 March 1848.

We shall notice the "Garland" and the March number of the "Victoria Magazine" in our next.

Anon. "Literature." 24 March 1848.

... We would next refer to the "Victoria Magazine" as a Canadian Periodical, of which the country ought to be proud. Mrs. Moodie, under her maiden name, Miss Susannah Strickland, was a favourite as far back as we can recollect anything of Poetry; and although she seems to have grown lazy at *rhyming*, her articles in the Magazine give evidence that her imagination is just as young, and as vigorous, and as poetical as ever. Mr. Moodie possesses a fair proportion of the Poet, and a much larger share of those qualities that constitute a shrewd practical common-sense writer. We love his manner and the honest goodness of his heart. — We are glad to understand that the circulation of the "Victoria Magazine" is increasing and we do hope that all who are solicitous for the formation of a refined and correct taste in Canada, or who are ambitious of associating the idea of national greatness with our common country will extend their patronage to such efforts in Literature.

Anon. 12 May 1848.

(Reprinted the Moodies' review of the *Huron Signal* published in *The Victoria Magazine*, I.vii.167)

Anon. 15 December 1848.

VICTORIA MAGAZINE — We beg to call attention to an Advertisement in this paper of the above named Magazine. The Prospectus of "*Moodie's Magazine*," to take the place of this monthly, will probably appear next week.

Anon. 29 June 1849.

We have received the first number of Wilson's Eclectic Magazine published by Mr. JOSEPH WILSON of Belle:ille. We are always proud to see and to hail attempts to establish periodical literature, especially in Canada, and we have, oftener than once, had the pleasure of complimenting Mr. Wilson for his enterprise in this description of publications. In fact we seldom feel disposed to censure attempts in literature, and it is with reluctance that we pronounce the "Eclectic Magazine" *very far from being an improvement* on the "Victoria Magazine." — The Engraving and the letter press are both passable, but there is evidently that lack of an Editor. The only original article in the number is "The Great Cave," by H. Bull, and the admission of it into any periodical cannot enhance its literary character. It is neither poetry or prose, nor even *prose run mad*, as it seems to have been *born mad*. We hope Mr. Wilson will, by securing the services of some Literary person, render the second number of the Eclectic Magazine more worthy of public patronage.

* * *

Montreal Weekly Pilot

Anon. 31 August 1847.

The Victoria Magazine is the title of a new monthly publication about to be issued at Belleville, U.C. It is to be edited by Mr. and Mrs. Moodie, whose writings are deservedly popular in Canada.

Anon. 19 October 1847.

We have been favoured with a copy of the "Victoria Magazine," edited by Mr. and Mrs. Mcodie, Belleville, C.W., Joseph Wilson, Publisher and Proprietor.

The conductors of this excellent journal of polite literature are deservedly held in high estimation by the Canadian public, and the style, character and matter of the several original effusions which render it both popular and attractive, truly merit, and receive a liberal and extensive patronage.

APPENDIX B

The literary connections between *The Victoria Magazine* and previous and subsequent publications by both Susanna and J.W. Dunbar Moodie are listed below. This checklist is compiled from a number of sources besides primary research. *The Wellesley Index to Victorian Periodicals 1824-1900* and John Thurston's unpublished doctoral dissertation "Susanna Moodie (1803-85): The Canonization of a Colonial Writer" (1989) have been invaluable. The work of Carl Ballstadt, Elizabeth Hopkins, and Michael Peterman on the editorial apparatus for *Letters of a Lifetime* and the CEECT edition of *Roughing It in the Bush* has also been useful.

The checklist of works is arranged by order of appearance in *The Victoria Magazine* with original or subsequent publication information, including year, issue, and page numbers listed where available. The following abbreviations of titles of books and periodicals have been used throughout: *Ackermann's Juvenile Forget-Me-Not* (AJ), *Belford's Monthly Magazine* (BMA), *Bentley's Miscellany* (BM), *Canadian Literary Magazine* (CLM), *Friendship's Offering: A Literary Album* (FO) *La Belle Assemblee or Court and Fashionable Magazine* (LBA), *Life in the Clearings versus the Bush* (LC), *North American Quarterly* (NAQ), *Roughing It in the Bush* (RI), *The Odd-Fellow's Offering* (OF), *The Victoria Magazine* (TVM). Verse items will be identified by a (v) preceding the entry, while those written and published by John Wedderburn Dunbar Moodie in *Scenes and Adventures, As a Soldier and Settler, During Half a Century* (Montreal: Lovell, 1866; abbreviated SA) will be preceded by a (JWD).

TITLE OF WORK AS APPEARED IN <u>TVM</u>	PUBLICATION HISTORY		
	PRIOR TO <u>TVM</u>	<u>TVM</u>	SUBSEQUENT
(v) "Canada"		i.3	<i>Cobourg Star</i> Sept. 1847 <i>Metropolitan Magazine</i> 1848 RI I.intro
"The Two Fishermen. A Tale of the Coast"	<i>LBA</i> (1827, 6: 109-14)	i.4-10	
"The Trials of a Travel(l)ing Musician No. I .. No. II .. No. III .. No. III conclusion"		i.10-12 ii.32-35 iii.59-63 iv.84-87	<i>LC</i> v <i>LC</i> vi
"Scenes in Canada. A Visit To Grosse Isle"		i.14-17	<i>RI</i> I.i <i>BM</i> (1852, 32: 300-309)

(JWD) "The Advantages of Being Ugly"		i.18-20 ii.40-45 iii.49-53	SA xiii
"Editor's Table -- The Dandelion and the Uses to Which It is Applied"		i.22	RI II.xxi
"The Pope's Promise. A Historical Sketch"	<i>LBA</i> (1828, 8: 245-250)	ii.27-31	
(v) "The Captive"	<i>FO</i> for 1831 (184-86)	ii.36	
"The Well in the Wilderness: A Tale of the Praire -- Founded on Facts"		iii.54-58	<i>OF</i> (1852) <i>BM</i> (1853, 33: 318-324)
"Scenes in Canada. No. II. First Impressions -- Quebec"		iii.65-68	RI I.ii
"The Son of Arminius. A Tale of Ancient Rome"	<i>AJ</i> for 1830 (241-61)	iv.77-82	
"Education -- The True Wealth of the World"		iv.89-92	LC iii
"Description of a Whirlwind which passed through the town of Guelph in the summer of 1829" ^a		v.100-101	RI II.xxv
(v) "The Whirlwind" ^a		v.101-102	RI II.xxv
Mrs. Moodie's additional untitled comments on the whirlwind		v.102-103	RI II.xxv
(JWD) "Religion and Loyalty"		v.104-107 vi.137-139	<i>Huron Signal</i> 11 Feb. 1848 SA xi
(v) "The Coming Earthquake"		v.112	LC xiv
(v/JWD) "To the Woods! To the Woods!"		v.117	RI I.xii
"Papers on Practical Jokes I"		vi.139-141	<i>BM</i> (1853, 34: 299-303)
"Papers on Practical Jokes II"		vii.151-154	<i>OF</i> (1852) <i>BM</i> (1853, 34: 410-416)

(JWD) "South Africa and Its Inhabitants: A Lecture Delivered at the Mechanics Institute at Belleville .. Lecture I .. Lecture I concl.	vii.159-163 viii.171-175	SA iii-vii
(JWD) "South Africa ..." .. Lecture II .. Lecture II concl."	ix.193-199 x.224-233	SA iii-vii
"Papers on Practical Jokes III"	viii.177-181	BM (1854, 35: 393-399)
"Chess. From the Persian"	viii.181-182	BMA (1877)
(JWD) "Papers on Practical Jokes No. IV"	ix.208-211	SA viii
"Achbor: An Oriental Tale" <i>CLM</i> (1833) <i>NAQ</i> (1834)	xi.252-256	
(JWD) "Memory"	xii.279-283	SA xii
"The Native Village" <i>LBA</i> (1829, 9: 74) ^b	xii.283-286	LC

^a This poem and short prose piece was attributed in *The Victoria Magazine* to the anonymous PIONEER. When reprinted in *Roughing It in the Bush* (1853), Mrs. Moodie's brother, Samuel Strickland, was identified publicly as the author.

^b A verse work entitled "The Maniac" was included in Mrs. Moodie's "The Native Village."

Bibliography

Primary sources

- McQueen, Thomas. Letter to John Wedderburn Dunbar Moodie. 23 February 1850. Patrick Hamilton Ewing Collection. National Archives of Canada, Ottawa, ON.
- Moodie, John Wedderburn Dunbar. Letter to Richard Bentley. 6 May 1865. Patrick Hamilton Ewing Collection.
- . *Scenes and Adventures, As a Soldier and Settler, During Half a Century*. Montreal: Lovell, 1866.
- Moodie, Susanna. "A Word for the Novel Writers." *The Literary Garland*, August 1851: 348-51.
- . *Life in the Clearings*. Ed. Robert L. McDougall. Toronto, ON: Macmillan, 1959.
- . *Life in the Clearings versus the Bush*. 1853. Toronto, ON: McClelland and Stewart, 1989.
- . *Roughing It in the Bush; or, Life In Canada*. 1852. Ed. Carl Ballstadt. Ottawa, ON: Carleton UP, 1988.
- . *Susanna Moodie: Letters of a Lifetime*. Eds. Carl Ballstadt, Elizabeth Hopkins, and Michael Peterman. Toronto, ON: U of Toronto P, 1985.
- Moodie, Susanna, and J.W. Dunbar Moodie, eds. *The Victoria Magazine, 1847 - 1848*. Rpt. Facs. ed. Ed. and intro. William H. New. Vancouver: U of British Columbia P, 1968.

Secondary Sources

- Anon. [Advertisement]. *The Hallowell Free Press* 4 January 1831.
- Anon. [Notice of *The Victoria Magazine*]. *Montreal Weekly Pilot* 31 August 1847.
- Anon. [Review of *The Victoria Magazine*]. *Cobourg Star* 8 September 1847.

- Anon. [Review of *Wilson's Experiment*]. *Huron Signal* 20 September 1847.
- Anon. [Review of *The Victoria Magazine*]. *Montreal Weekly Pilot* 19 October 1847.
- Anon. [Review of *The Victoria Magazine*]. *Cobourg Star* 10 November 1847.
- Anon. [Review of *The Victoria Magazine*]. *Cobourg Star* 19 January 1848.
- Anon. [Review of *The Victoria Magazine*]. *Huron Signal* 4 February 1848.
- Anon. "Literature." *Huron Signal* 4 February 1848.
- Anon. [Review of *The Victoria Magazine*]. *Cobourg Star* 9 February 1848.
- Anon. "Literature." *Huron Signal* 17 March 1848.
- Anon. "Literature." *Huron Signal* 24 March 1848.
- Anon. [Notice for *The Victoria Magazine*]. *Huron Signal* 15 December 1848.
- Anon. [Review of *The Victoria Magazine*]. *Huron Signal* 29 June 1849.
- Anon. [Review of *Wilson's Eclectic Magazine*] *Huron Signal* 29 June 1849.
- Anon. [Review of *Mark Hurdlestone*]. *The Athenaeum* 15 January 1853: 73.
- Arnason, David. "Canadian Literary Periodicals of the Nineteenth Century." *Journal of Canadian Fiction* 2.3 (1973): 125-128.
- Atwood, Margaret. *Survival: A Thematic Guide to Canadian Literature*. Toronto, ON: Anansi, 1972.
- . *The Journals of Susanna Moodie*. Toronto, ON: Oxford UP, 1970.
- Ballstadt, Carl. "Proficient in the Gentle Craft." *Copperfield* 5 (1974): 99-109.
- Barthes, Roland. "From Work to Text." *Image - Music - Text*. Ed. and trans. Stephen Heath. New York, NY: Hill and Wang, 1977.
- Brown, Mary Markham. *An Index to The Literary Garland*. Toronto, ON: Bibliographical Society of Canada, 1962.
- Canniff, William. *The Settlement of Upper Canada*. 1869. Rpt. Belleville, ON: Mika Silk Screening, 1971.
- Dahlie, Hallvard. *Varieties of Exile: The Canadian Experience*. Vancouver: U of British Columbia P, 1986.

- Davies, Robertson. *At My Heart's Core*. Toronto, ON: Clarke, Irwin, 1950.
- Downs, Robert B. *Heinrich Pestalozzi: Father of Modern Pedagogy*. Boston, MA: Twayne, 1975.
- Eagleton, Terry. *Literary Theory: An Introduction*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1983.
- Eaton, Sara. *Lady of the Backwoods: A Biography of Catherine Parr Traill*. Toronto, ON: McClelland and Stewart, 1969.
- Fetherling, Douglas. *The Rise of the Canadian Newspaper*. Toronto, ON: Oxford UP, 1990.
- Fiedler, Leslie A. "Literature as an Institution: The View from 1980." *English Literature: Opening Up the Canon*. Eds. Leslie A. Fiedler and Houston A. Baker. Baltimore, MD: John Hopkins UP, 1981.
- Fleming, Patricia Lockhart. *Upper Canadian Imprints, 1801-1841: A Bibliography*. Toronto, ON: U of Toronto P, 1988.
- Foucault, Michel. *The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences*. London: Tavistock/Routledge, 1989.
- . "What is An Author?" *Language, Counter-memory, Practice: Selected Essays and Interviews by Michel Foucault*. Trans. Donald F. Bouchard and Sherry Simon. Ed. Donald F. Bouchard. Ithaca, NY: Cornell UP, 1977. 113-38.
- Fowler, Marian. "Roughing It in the Bush: A Sentimental Novel." *The Canadian Novel: Beginnings*. Ed. John Moss. Toronto, ON: New Canada Publications, 1980. 85-95.
- . *The Embroidered Tent: Five Gentlewomen in Early Canada*. Toronto, ON: Anansi, 1982.
- Frye, Northrop. Conclusion. *Literary History of Canada*. Ed. Carl F. Klinck. Toronto, ON: U of Toronto P, 1965. 821-49.
- . *Divisions on a Ground: Essays on Canadian Culture*. Ed. James Polk. Toronto, ON: Anansi, 1982.

- . Preface. *The Bush Garden: Essays on the Canadian Imagination*. Toronto, ON: Anansi, 1971. i-x.
- Gairdner, William D. "Traill and Moodie: The Two Realities." *Journal of Canadian Fiction* 1.2 (1972): 35-42.
- Gerson, Carole. *A Purer Taste: The Writing and Reading of Fiction in English in Nineteenth-Century Canada*. Toronto, ON: U of Toronto P, 1989.
- . "Anthologies and the Canon of Early Canadian Women Writers." *Re(Dis)covering Our Foremothers: Nineteenth-Century Canadian Women Writers*. Ed. Lorraine McMullen. Ottawa, ON: U of Ottawa P, 1990. 55-76.
- . "Mrs. Moodie's Beloved Partner." *Canadian Literature* 107 (1985): 34-44.
- Giltrow, Janet. "'Painful Experience in a Distant Land': Mrs. Moodie in Canada and Mrs. Trollope in America." *Mosaic* 14.2 (1981): 131-44.
- Glickman, Susan. "The Waxing and Waning of Susanna Moodie's 'Enthusiasm'." *Canadian Literature* 130 (1991): 7-26.
- Grace, Sherrill E. "Moodie and Atwood: Notes on a Literary Reincarnation." *The Canadian Novel: Beginnings*. 73-79.
- Greenfield, Susan Y. "The Follies Incident to Human Nature: Susanna Moodie's Life Story as Spiritual Autobiography in "Rachel Wilde," *Flora Lyndsay, Roughing It in the Bush* and *Life in the Clearings*." Ph.D. diss. U of Western Ontario, 1990.
- Groening, Laura. "The Journals of Susanna Moodie: A Twentieth-Century Look at a Nineteenth-Century Life." *Studies in Canadian Literature* 8.2 (1983): 166-80.
- Howells, Coral Ann. *Private and Fictional Words: Canadian Women Novelists of the 1970s and 1980s*. London: Methuen, 1987.
- Jackel, David. "Mrs. Moodie and Mrs. Traill, and the Fabrication of a Canadian Tradition." *The Compass* 6 (1979): 1-22.

- Jones, D.G. *Butterfly on Rock: A Study of Themes and Images in Canadian Literature*. Toronto, ON: U of Toronto P, 1970.
- Keith, W.J. "The Function of Canadian Criticism at the Present Time." *Essays on Canadian Writing* 30 (1984-85): 1-16.
- Kroller, Eva-Marie. "Resurrections: Susanna Moodie, Catharine Parr Traill and Emily Carr in Contemporary Canadian Literature." *Journal of Popular Culture* 15.3 (1981): 39-46.
- Lindquist, Vernon L. "The Soil and the Seed, The Birth of the Canadian Short Story in English: Haliburton, Moodie, and Others, 1830-1867." Ph.D. diss. U of New Brunswick, 1979.
- MacDonald, R.D. "Design and Purpose." *Canadian Literature* 51 (1972): 20-31.
- MacLulich, T.D. "Crusoe in the Backwoods: A Canadian Fable?" *Mosaic* 9.2 (1976): 115-126.
- Mathews, Robin. "Susanna Moodie, Pink Toryism, and Nineteenth Century Ideas of Canadian Identity." *Journal of Canadian Studies* 10.3 (1975): 3-15.
- McDougall, Robert L. Introduction. *Life in the Clearings versus the Bush*. Toronto, ON: Macmillan, 1959.
- McGann, Jerome J. "Introduction: A Point of Reference." *Historical Studies and Literary Criticism*. Ed. Jerome J. McGann. Madison: U of Wisconsin P, 1985. 3-21.
- McGregor, Gaile. *The Wacousta Syndrome: Explorations in the Canadian Landscape*. Toronto, ON: U of Toronto P, 1985.
- Mikel, W.C. *City of Belleville History*. Picton, ON: Picton Gazette, 1943.
- Montrose, Louis A. "Professing the Renaissance: The Poetics and Politics of Culture." *The New Historicism*. Ed. H. Aram Veenser. New York, NY: Routledge, 1989. 15-36.

- Morris, Audrey Y. *Gentle Pioneers: Five Nineteenth-Century Canadians*. Toronto, ON: Hodder and Stoughton, 1968.
- Moss, John. *Patterns of Isolation in English Canadian Fiction*. Toronto, ON: McClelland and Stewart, 1974.
- Murray, Heather. "Women in the wilderness." *A Mazing Space: Writing Canadian Women Writing*. Eds. Shirley Neuman and Smaro Kamboureli. Edmonton, AB: Longspoon/Newest, 1986: 74-83.
- New, William H. *Dreams of Speech and Violence: The Art of the Short Story in Canada and New Zealand*. Toronto, ON: U of Toronto P, 1987.
- . Introduction. *The Victoria Magazine, 1847-1848*. vii-x.
- Noel-Bentley, Peter C. "Our Garrison Mentality." *Mosaic* 4.1 (1970): 127-33.
- Noonan, G. "Susanna and Her Critics: A Strategy of Fiction for *Roughing It in the Bush*." *Studies in Canadian Literature* 5.2 (1980): 280-89.
- Northey, Margot. "Completing the Self-Portrait: Moodie's 'Rachel Wilde'." *Essays on Canadian Writing* 29 (1984): 117-27.
- . *The Haunted Wilderness: The Gothic and Grotesque in Canadian Fiction*. Toronto, ON: U of Toronto P, 1976.
- Parry, Milman. *The Making of Homeric Verse: The Collected Papers of Milman Parry*. Ed. Adam Parry. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1971.
- Pestalozzi, Johann Heinrich. *The Education of Man: Aphorisms*. Trans. Heinz and Ruth Norden. New York, NY: Philosophical Library, 1951.
- Peterman, Michael A. Letter to the author. 4 January 1992.
- . "Susanna Moodie." *Canadian Writers and Their Works*. Fiction Ser. Vol. 1. Eds. Robert Lecker, Jack David, and Ellen Quigley. Downsview, ON: ECW Press, 1983. 62-104.
- Renza, Louis A. "Exploding Canons." *Contemporary Literature* 28.2 (1987): 257-70.
- Shields, Carol. *Small Ceremonies*. Toronto, ON: Totem, 1976.

- . *Susanna Moodie: Voice and Vision*. Ottawa, ON: Borealis, 1977.
- Silber, Kate. *Pestalozzi: The Man and His Work*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1960.
- Stouck, David. "Notes on the Canadian Imagination." *Canadian Literature* 54 (1972): 9-26.
- . "'Secrets of the Prison House': Mrs. Moodie and the Canadian Imagination." *Dalhousie Review* 54 (1974): 463-74.
- Sutherland, Fraser. *The Monthly Epic: A History of Canadian Magazines 1789-1989*. Markham, ON: Fitzhenry and Whiteside, 1989.
- Thomas, Clara. "The Strickland Sisters." *The Clear Spirit: Twenty Canadian Women and Their Times*. Ed. Mary Quayle Innis. Toronto, ON: U of Toronto P, 1966. 42-73.
- Thomas, Clara, Carol Shields, and Donna E. Smyth. "'Thinking Back Through Our Mothers': Tradition in Canadian Women's Writing." *Re(Dis)covering Our Foremothers: Nineteenth-Century Canadian Women Writers*. 5-21.
- Thompson, Elizabeth. *The Pioneer Woman: A Canadian Character Type*. Montreal, PQ: McGill-Queens UP, 1991.
- Thurston, John. Introduction. *Voyages: Short Narratives of Susanna Moodie*. Ed. John Thurston. Ottawa, ON: U of Ottawa P, 1991. vii-xxix.
- . "Rewriting *Roughing It*." *Future Indicative: Literary Theory and Canadian Literature*. Ed. John Moss. Ottawa, ON: U of Ottawa P, 1987. 195-204.
- . "Susanna Moodie (1803-85): The Canonization of a Colonial Writer." Ph.D. diss. Queen's University, ON, 1989.
- White, Hayden. "The Historical Text as Literary Artifact." *Tropics of Discourse: Essays in Cultural Criticism*. Baltimore, MD: John Hopkins UP, 1978. 81-100.

- Whitlock, Gillian. "The Bush, the Barrack-Yard and the Clearing: 'Colonial Realism' in the Sketches and Stories of Susanna Moodie, C.L.R. James and Henry Lawson." *Journal of Commonwealth Literature* 20.1 (1985): 36-48.
- Wood, Susan. *The Land in Canadian Prose 1840-1945*. Ottawa, ON: Carleton Monographs, 1988.
- Woodcock, George. "Editorial." *Canadian Literature* 1 (1959): 3.
- . "Editorial." *Canadian Literature* 40 (1969): 3-4.