

Rosalinda Hernandez Linares
Information Literacy Librarian
Oberlin College Libraries
rlinares@oberlin.edu

Where have all the experts gone?

AN EXPLORATION OF DELIBERATIVE PEDAGOGY IN
LIBRARY INSTRUCTION

Library Instruction

Bibliographic Instruction (Winsor, Root & Woodruff, late 19th c.)

Problem-based vs. access-skills approach (Dewey, Knapp, 1966)

Information literacy as a trait or set of skills (ALA/ACRL)

Critical information literacy (Elmborg, 2006)

Critical library pedagogy (#critlib)

Pedagogy in Higher Education

'German model' (late 19th c.)

Experiential learning (Dewey, 1916)

Progressive education (1920s)

Learning Theories (Behaviorism, Cognitivism, Constructivism...)

Critical Theory & Engaged Pedagogy (Freire, 1970)

Workshop Problem, Stage 1

**What is a reliable source?
How do I know it's reliable?**

Introduction: Deliberative pedagogy

Deliberative Democracy + Engaged Pedagogy = Deliberative Pedagogy

A definition:

A democratic educational process and a way of thinking that encourages students to encounter and consider multiple perspectives, weigh trade-offs and tensions, and move toward action through informed judgement (Longo, et al, 2017)

Wicked problems (Rittel & Webber, 1973)

Socially complex

No one 'right answer', or distinctive, conclusive or technical solution

Demand consistency of communication to deal with tensions raised by differing values

(Wicked) Workshop Problem?

**What is a reliable source?
How do I know it's reliable?**

(Wicked) Workshop Problem, Stage 2

- 1. Get in small groups.**
- 2. Discuss your list of ideas.**
- 3. What are possible outcomes if you act on those ideas?**

Deliberative democracy

Two main principles

- Reasoning between people
- Public act

Public deliberation (Gastil, 2008)

- Analytic process
- Social process

Engaged pedagogy

Learning vs. instruction (Barr and Tagg, 1995)

Participatory or 'high impact' education practices (Kuh, 2008)

Addresses education as tool of domination (hooks, 1994)

- Curricular interventions
- Student life experiences
- Off-campus engagement
- Classroom practices

Critiques & Remedies

Influence of power on deliberation	Addressing power
Issues of inclusion	Building trust
Aspirational nature	Shift away from expert-centric models
Vague connections between talk and action	Expanding rhetoric (Young, 1996) Storytelling (Stone-Mediatore, 2016)

Deliberative pedagogy: a model

Sam Kaner's (2014) diamond model of participatory decision-making

Stage 1: Divergent thinking

Stage 2: Working through the 'groan zone'

Stage 3: Convergent thinking

Deliberative mind-set (Carcasson, 2016)

Alternative to adversarial and expert processes

Intended to foster creativity, empathy and social connectivity

Key assumptions:

- Wicked problems exist and persist
- Other problem-solving models don't always work
- Humans are flawed, with strengths and weaknesses
- Communication is paramount to understand differing perspectives
- Developing judgement skills on an individual and public level is important

Stage 1: Divergent thinking

Actions

- Brainstorming
- Generating alternatives
- Holding free-flowing and open discussions
- Gathering diverse points of view
- Suspending judgement

Key obstacle: false certainty, self-doubt

Stage 2: Working through the groan zone

Actions

- Considering potential consequences to proposed actions
- Assigning or assessing outcome of acting on proposed solutions (positive, negative, neutral)
- Face-to-face disagreement
- Talking through key tensions
- Recognizing and responding to complicated nature of problem

Key obstacle: manufactured polarization

Stage 3: Convergent thinking

Actions

- Clarifying
- Consolidating
- Refining
- Judging
- Choosing

Key obstacle: analytical paralysis

(Wicked) Workshop Problem, Stage 3

Consolidate your ideas and pick two or three that you can agree on as a group that you could see yourself using in the future

Towards a deliberative library pedagogy

Cognizant of concept/theory vs. access skills

Include 'wicked problems'

Content-driven

Deliberate in building trust

Awareness of rhetoric

Acknowledge storytelling

Follow Kaner's participatory decision-making model

Bibliography

Barr, Robert B. and John Tagg. 1995. "From Teaching to Learning: A New Paradigm for Undergraduate Education." *Change* 27(6): 12-25.

Carcasson, Martin. 2016. "Rethinking Civic Engagement On Campus: The Overarching Potential of Deliberative Practice." *Higher Education Exchange*, 37-48.

Dewey, John. 1916. *Democracy and Education: An Introduction to the Philosophy of Education*. New York: Free Press.

_____. 1929. *The Quest for Certainty: A Study of the Relation of Knowledge and Action*. New York: Putnam

Elmborg, James. 2006. "Critical Information Literacy: Implications for Instructional Practice." *The Journal of Academic Librarianship* 32(2): 192-199.

Freire, Paulo. 1970. *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. Translated by Myra B. Ramos. New York: Continuum.

Bibliography, cont'd. 1

Gastil, John. 2008. *Political Communication and Deliberation*. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications.

hooks, bell. 1994. *Teaching to Transgress: Education as the Practice of Freedom*. New York: Routledge.

Hopkins, Frances L. 1982. "A Century of Bibliographic Instruction: The Historical Claim to Professional and Academic Legitimacy." *College & Research Libraries* 41(3): 192-198.

Kaner, Sam. 2014. *Facilitator's Guide to Participatory Decision-Making*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Knapp, Patricia. 1966. *The Monteith College Library Experiment*. New York: Scarecrow.

Kolko, Jon. 2012. *Wicked Problems: Problems Worth Solving*. Austin: Austin Center for Design.

Kuh, George. 2008. *High-Impact Educational Practices: What They Are, Who has Access to Them, and Why They Matter*. Washington, DC: Association of American Colleges and Universities.

Bibliography, cont'd. 2

Longo, Nicolas V., Idit Manosevitch, Timothy J. Shaffer, and Maxine S. Thomas, eds. 2017. *Deliberative Pedagogy: Teaching and Learning for Democratic Engagement*. Transformations in Higher Education: The Scholarship of Engagement. East Lansing: Michigan State University Press.

Pagowsky, Nicole and Kelly McElroy, eds. 2016. *Critical Library Pedagogy Handbook Vol 1: Essays and Workbook Activities*. Chicago: ACRL Editions.

Rittel, Horst W. J., Melvin M. Webber. 1973. Dilemmas in a General Theory of Planning. *Policy Sciences* 4(2): 155-169.

Stone-Mediatore, Shari. 2016. "Storytelling/Narrative." In *The Oxford Handbook of Feminist Theory*, edited by Lisa Disch and Mary Hawkesworth, 934-954. New York: Oxford University Press

Young, Iris M. 1996. "Communication and the Other: Beyond Deliberative Democracy." In *Democracy and Difference: Contesting the Boundaries of the Political*, edited by Seyla Benhabib, 120-135. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Questions? Comments? Concerns?

Rosalinda Hernandez Linares
Information Literacy Librarian
Oberlin College Libraries
rlinares@oberlin.edu