

**The Making of a Model Refugee:
Refugee Resettlement and Employment Services in Ottawa, ON**

Haley Glenen

Under the Supervision of Dr. Larisa Kurtović

A thesis submitted to the
Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the Master of Arts in Anthropology

School of Sociological and Anthropological Studies
Faculty of Social Sciences
University of Ottawa
October 2018

Table of Contents

Abstract	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
Introduction	1
Settlement Services in Canada	7
Methodology	9
Thesis Outline	12
Chapter 1: The Model Refugee	16
Introduction	17
The Model Refugee	20
Subject Formation and Governmentality	27
Care, Moral Obligation, and Deservedness	34
Conclusion	43
Chapter 2: Barriers to the Model Refugee and Employment	46
Introduction	47
Anthropology of Labour	48
Barrier #1: Access to Settlement Services	50
Barrier #2: Language	61
Barrier #3: Mental Health	67
Conclusion	71
Chapter 3: The Deskillng of Immigrants	74
Introduction	75
The Canadian Context	77
Entering into Settlement Services	83
Re-Education	87
Entering a Parallel (Unregulated) Field	93
Translating Experience into the Canadian Market	96
Conclusion	97
Conclusion	101
Newcomers and Labour	103
Immigration Today	104
Policy Recommendations	107
Final Reflections	111
Bibliography	113

Abstract

In 2015/2016, Canada accepted and resettled thousands of Syrian refugees fleeing the Syrian civil war. As a country that has for decades participated in refugee resettlement, Canada has an extensive network of settlement services available to facilitate this process. These services are developed and implemented by the Canadian state and various non-governmental organizations. This thesis focuses on Canadian employment services that are meant to facilitate the newcomers' entrance into the Canadian labour market. Since participation in the labour market is seen as an essential step in the resettlement and integration process, employment services have also become key sites for reshaping newcomers into the desirable, self-reliant citizens.

Drawing on fieldwork and semi-structured, in-depth interviews, that focus on the experience of highly professional and educated refugees (some of whom have become service providers themselves), this thesis examines the complex role employment services play in the process of refugee resettlement. To better capture how employment services facilitate this transformation, this thesis will introduce the concept of the "model refugee," imagined as a financially stable, independent, and socially participatory citizen. By examining the barriers newcomers confront when entering the Canadian labour market, this thesis problematizes the notion that newcomers arrive in Canada destitute and uneducated and instead shows how the Canadian labour market devalues foreign credentials (a process known as 'deskilling'). Ultimately, my research shows that a crucial aspect of becoming a "model refugee" is demonstrating a willingness to accept downward mobility and deskilling as a cost of socio-economic integration.

Acknowledgements

There are many individuals I wish to thank that have contributed to the creation of this thesis. My time at the University of Ottawa has been an incredible learning opportunity, and it would not have happened without the support of each and every one of you.

Most importantly, I want to thank everyone at the Ottawa Community Immigrant Services Organizations in downtown Ottawa in the Settlement and Integration department - I learned so much during my time with you all. Thank you for welcoming me into your space and into your lives, for putting up with my constant questions, and for making me feel so welcomed. Without your insights and expertise, this thesis would not be possible. I will forever hold this time close to my heart.

The majority of the experiences discussed in this thesis are not mine; therefore, I would like to thank all of my participants who took time out of their busy lives to speak with me. You all continue to motivate me to continue working and researching in this field. Thank you for trusting me with your stories and experiences. I hope you feel I have done them justice.

I would like to thank my supervisor, Dr. Larisa Kurtović, for her continued support and patience throughout my time at uOttawa. Without your guidance, this thesis would not have been possible. I want to thank Dr. Thushara Hewage and Dr. Ari Gandsman as well for being on my thesis committee. This thesis would not be what it is without your thoughtful comments and insights over the past two years.

Lastly, to my family - Jill, Ray, and Sam. My biggest supporters, this thesis is as much yours as it is mine. There are no words to express how thankful I am for your continued support. To my dad - the strongest man I know - it is the work ethic I learned from you that allowed me to work as hard as I did. And to my mom - without your love, guidance, and friendship, this project would never have been possible.

This thesis is dedicated in loving memory to my grandmother, Betty Daphne Evans (1930-2013), and my grandfather, Sydney Frank Evans (1926-1994).

Introduction

In 1969 Canada signed the United Nations' Convention Relating to the Status of the Refugee, and in so doing, made a commitment to help resettle populations affected by war (Government of Canada, 2011). Prior to the creation and ratification of this convention, the Canadian state was hesitant of accepting refugees seeking asylum, as it was common knowledge many would be unable to return home in the future. It was this reasoning given that Canada famously refused the entry of 907 Jews fleeing Nazi Germany in 1930's aboard the vessel *St Louis* (The Canadian Council for Refugees, 2013). It was only after international pressure to address the growing issue of displaced peoples that Canada began to consider the implementation of a more tolerant and open immigration policy (Ibid). These events shaped how Canada later responded to the approximately 1.5 million refugees fleeing their homes in South-East Asia in the 1970's - known as the Vietnamese 'boat people'. The Canadian state pledged 50,000 refugees would be resettled, leading to the creation of private sponsorship program (The Canadian Council for Refugees, 2013). For this, Canada gained international praise for welcoming so many refugees, cementing Canada's reputation as a humanitarian nation, and showing that these campaigns played a crucial role in the expansion of those eligible for resettlement in Canada.

Since then, Canada has conducted its international affairs on a humanitarian platform and continues to focus on alleviating the distant suffering of millions internationally. These efforts include monetary donations, medical supplies, and even peacekeeping services when necessary. Offering such forms of aid has become ingrained in Canadian society, in some ways becoming a part of what it means to be a

'good Canadian' and a global citizen. Today, refugee claimants¹ can apply for asylum at one of two points within Canada: their point of entry (I.e. "airport, seaport of land border"), or at a designated Immigration, Refugees and Citizenship Canada offices (Refugees and Citizenship Canada, 2007). Those applying from outside of Canada (I.e. those who are either sponsored privately or by the government), are often vetted, processed and recommended for resettlement in Canada by the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) in various locations internationally (Immigration, Refugees and Citizenship Canada, 2017).

These humanitarian sentiments, which as it turns out, are not universal across the many segments of the Canadian population² were magnified during the last federal election, which resulted in the rise of the Liberal government and the election of Prime Minister Justin Trudeau. Shortly after being sworn in, Prime Minister Trudeau responded to the ongoing European refugee and migration crisis by pledging to open Canada's borders to over 25 000 Syrian refugees³ (Government of Canada, Immigration 2015). This promise cemented Canada's position as a leader in refugee resettlement, earning praise from the United Nations for displaying great generosity and accepting the highest

¹ Defined by the UNHCR as "a person who has fled their country and is asking for protection in another country. We don't know whether a claimant is a refugee or not until their case has been decided" (Canadian Council for Refugees 2010)

² As Howell (2005) states, "there is no set definition of what Canadian values are. Instead, [there are] a wide range of assertions as to the content of Canadian values ... more often, however, these statements take the form of a list of our positive attributes," instead of what Canadians value or practice (50). When humanitarian aid is linked to new migration, a more complex view of Canadian values emerges. In a more recent survey, researchers found 6 in 10 Canadians disagreed when asked, "are immigration levels too high?" (Perreux 2018). Specifically, "eight in ten [believe newcomers] have a positive economic impact", though Canadians living in Alberta and Quebec continued to express doubt towards immigration and refugee claims (Ibid).

³ According to the UNHCR, a refugee is defined as "someone who has been forced to flee his or her country because of persecution, war or violence. A refugee has a well-founded fear of persecution for reasons of race, religion, nationality, political opinion or membership in a particular social group. Most likely, they cannot return home or are afraid to do so. War and ethnic, tribal and religious violence are leading causes of refugees fleeing their countries." (UNHCR 2018)

number of refugees (46,700) since the 1970s (UNHCR 2017b). However, even though the UNHCR praised PM Trudeau, he did not receive praise from all Canadians. In a poll conducted by IPSOS, over 60% of Canadians did not want to accept such a large number of Syrian refugees, with the highest opposition to the proposal in the province of Alberta (Russell 2015). Many opponents argued that Canada has enough poverty in its own backyard that should be addressed first, and that increasing immigration and opening borders so suddenly could result in threats to national security (Ibid). Authors have argued that what started as a campaign promise to accept Syrian refugees was not a decision made out of kindness, but a ploy to accumulate votes after the release of the photo of Alan Kurdi - the three-year-old Syrian boy lying lifeless on a Greek beach (Friscolanti 2016). As Friscolanti (2016) states;

“Booking all those plane tickets was the easy part. The real slog — helping these newcomers learn the language, find work and integrate smoothly into Canadian society — has only just begun. And as more Syrians continue to arrive (at last count, more than 29,400 since the day Justin Trudeau moved into the Prime Minister’s Office), the questions loom: ‘Now that they’re here, will all of them thrive? Are we doing enough to ensure their long-term integration? And if not, what are the consequences years down the road?’”

In addition to leaving open the question of what kind of a future these resettled refugees would have in Canada, these humanitarian acts of the new Canadian government obscured the fact that there are strings attached to the offer of resettlement. Canada is not in the business of boundless charity -resettled refugees are expected to become self-reliant citizens who contribute to Canadian society. To ensure this outcome, newcomers are guaranteed financial support from the Canadian state for one year, post arrival. This includes access to low-income housing, grocery vouchers, language training and other settlement services that are subsidized by the Canadian welfare state. At the

conclusion of one year, benefits lapse and newcomers are expected to have become adjusted, self-sufficient, financially independent citizens.

Unfortunately, this plan often does not correspond to the harsh realities of the newcomers' situation. It assumes that one year is an adequate amount of time to adjust to a new way of life and learn a new language. During the first year of sponsorship, newcomers are expected to have become fluent in the local language, can socially participate in society and earn a living wage by having found stable, full-time employment. This leaves very little room to process emotions or to deal with any physical or mental trauma caused by displacement. In reality, when government subsidies end, the majority of newcomers are forced to apply for welfare services. It is easy to argue that these expectations are unfair and sets newcomers up for failure from the beginning. Upon closer inspection, one can see that the "[refugee] experience reveals an ironic contradiction of the refugee resettlement program: the very people who must present themselves as dependent recipients of charity in order to gain resettlement must, within the space of a few weeks, become economically independent and productive residents who make no demands on their ... host communities" (Besteman 2016, 104).

Along with financial support provided by the Canadian state, newcomers are given access to a variety of settlement services. Government-sponsored refugees are immediately assigned a settlement worker upon arrival. In the case of privately sponsored refugees, obtaining a settlement worker is not required - though many do seek out settlement services. These services include French and English language courses, counselling, legal support, community information, housing support, and employment services, among others. The services available to newcomers are incredibly diverse and

fluctuate according to the needs of the current refugee population. Hence, before starting my research, I decided to narrow my focus down to employment services. Employment services include resume-writing workshops, support for developing interview skills, and language classes. The importance of these services was brought to my attention when conducting preliminary fieldwork during which I observed that there was an intense eagerness to find employment among the newcomer population in downtown Ottawa. This eagerness primarily stems from the need to earn a wage to afford the necessities of life, thanks to which paid, full-time work has become essential. The evolution of labour has made employment a necessity when attempting to become a fully participating citizen, therefore playing a crucial role in the lives of newcomers. Because of the position of the workplace, it acts as space where newcomers can embody the characteristics deemed advantageous by their host society. As Weeks (2011) argues, “work is the primary means by which individuals are integrated not only into the economic system but also into social, political and familial modes of cooperation” (Weeks 2011, 8). Along the same lines, Ferguson (2015) argues that work has become so internalized that it could be seen as an extension of oneself, and without work, a person cannot be considered a full citizen.

Acting as an extension of the government apparatus, these services are responsible for facilitating the transformation of newcomers into a particular kind of a subject and a participating citizen. The workplace not only serves as space where newcomers can access wage labour and work towards financial independence but also as a site that enables newcomers’ relationships with locals and offers the opportunity to observe implicit social protocols and values. To properly examine the effects of the

administrative intervention that so profoundly influence the newcomer experience, I will be developing the concept of the “model refugee.”⁴ The model refugee represents the theoretical figure that newcomers are meant to become - a financially independent citizen that is productive and socially participatory.

To fully understand the role of the workplace in the transformation of newcomers into desirable citizens, it needs to be noted that the workplace also functions as space for regulatory bodies to enforce policies that “work as instruments of governance” in newcomer resettlement (Shore and Wright 1997, 3). I see my work as contributing to the anthropology of policy, which attempts to shed light on how policies act as “instrument[s] of power” and to examine the implicit ways policy governs the everyday life. As policies have become more entangled in the day to day, the responsibility of enforcing these policies are distributed among regulatory bodies and divided among various local and international organizations. In the case of newcomers in Canada, the implementation of related policies has become the responsibility of non-governmental organizations on the front lines of resettlement. It is within the workplace where all of these elements - policy, wage earning, and resettlement - intersect, creating a unique space for anthropological research and for light to be shed on the realities of policy implementation.

I would also like to state that the majority of the material that follows focuses on the experiences of highly educated newcomers, the majority of whom arrived in Canada with professional backgrounds. Because of this, I am writing against the common assumption that newcomers arrive in Canada destitute, poor and uneducated. Though

⁴ As this research is occurring during what has been titled the ‘global refugee crisis’, I am interested in this political moment and the notion of deservedness. Therefore it is more appropriate to use the term ‘model refugee’ as opposed to model immigrant or other legal immigrant category.

Canada does resettlement newcomers who fit this description, my participants actively go against this stereotype but still speak to what happens to someone entering the labour market as a racialized outsider.

Settlement Services in Canada

While Canada has been a decades-long leader in admitting newcomers of varying legal categories, settlement services have not always been the sole responsibility of the government. More recently, the responsibility has shifted to various organizations to ensure accessibility. The first known settlement agency in Canada was formed by the Jewish community in Montreal, Quebec. The Jewish Immigrant Aid Society (JIAS) was created after seeing the success of American programs implemented to help populations fleeing war-torn Europe (Jewish Immigrant Aid Services 2010). First specializing in providing temporary shelter and employment support, JIAS services wanted to avoid “[any newcomers] becoming a public charge” while attempting “to foster British ideals ... and to install ... a knowledge of Canadian history and institutions” (Canadian Council for Refugees 1998, 12). Before the creation of this official organization, resettlement was left to the surrounding community, or religious/ethnic groups already familiar with Canadian life (Ibid). Shortly after the beginning of the Second World War, when Canada began receiving refugees fleeing communist Europe, was emphasis placed on providing specialized services to those who had experienced significant physical and psychological trauma (Ibid).

In the late 1970s, when Canada resettled approximately 60 000 South-East Asian refugees from Vietnam, Laos, and Cambodia, there were very few services available due

to post-WWII stagnation (Fine 2017). Canadians began demanding more resources be available for those displaced due to war and violence, leading to the creation of private sponsorship that allowed groups of private citizens to sponsor South-East Asian refugees (Fine 2017). Upon arrival in Canada, refugees had access to “financial help to cover basic needs until self-sufficiency was achieved,” as well as programs designed to help with the transition into the Canadian labour market (Employment and Immigration Canada 1990, 13). These services were available for six months post arrival, after which time it was assumed refugees would be self-sufficient (Ibid, 16). All services were the responsibility of the government, who would often contract out to agencies to ensure easier access.

It was in 1974 when the federal government pledged an official commitment to settlement services by introducing the Immigrant Settlement and Adaptation Program (ISAP) (Canadian Council for Refugees 1998, 2). In 1990, the federal government announced that integration and language instruction would be the responsibility of the immigration department, believing that “integration is a long-term process and a two-way street that requires accommodations and adjustments on both sides” (Canadian Council for Refugees 1998, 2). Modern settlement services across the country are now evaluated and implemented based on a national standards framework, with the ultimate goal of having consistent services throughout all provinces (Canadian Council for Refugees 2000, 4). This standards framework, put forth by Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC), “recognize[s] the need for consistency across the country,” while encouraging “accountability, comparability, and protection of settlement clients.” As it outlines intake protocols and the ethical obligations of settlement employees, it is now the outline for the creation of all resettlement services (Canadian Council for Refugees 2000, 4).

Today, settlement services are in a transitional period. Canada received such a massive influx of Syrian refugees so quickly (whose needs were mostly unknown upon arrival) that many agencies were left unable to reformulate services before their arrival. Many settlement agencies choose to continue the same programs and assessment tools, which had been created from previous data collected from past migrations and did not necessarily meet the needs of this new population. By consequence, data collection had only begun on the needs of the current wave as services are being accessed. This means that, while in the field I had access to very little new data, as many of the programs I consulted were still considered 'pilot projects.' In many cases, services are only now being implemented that cater specifically to Syrian refugees and have been active for less than two years. Therefore, the effectiveness of these programs is unknown, and data will not be available for years to come. Therefore, my thesis is a limited contribution to understanding the effects of these new programs.

Methodology

My fieldwork officially began in the summer of 2017 while volunteering with Ottawa Community Immigrant Services Organization (OCISO). I had begun volunteering in January of the same year; therefore I had already started to build relationships and make connections with those in the settlement field. My interest in immigration began while completing my undergraduate degree in Halifax, Nova Scotia. Working towards a Bachelor of Arts in international development studies, I was fascinated by the refugee figure, the diversity of the category, and the concept of integration, and wanted to expand my knowledge on these complex social issues. I remain very interested in the concept of

integration, and after spending three months researching integration through employment, my personal view of the concept has indeed shifted, becoming more critical of Canadian resettlement practices. I continue to believe integration is beneficial as a guiding concept in newcomer resettlement, as it encompasses a sense of belonging and having a connection to a place that is considered 'home;' aspects I believe contribute of the overall quality of life. When speaking with my interlocutors, I ended each interview by asking what their definition of integration was, and what integration looked like to them. Upon analyzing my data, I found each believes integration to be closely associated with a sense of belonging and connection or pride for where you call home. Having a sense of belonging is crucial not only to resettlement but happiness and mental well-being (I.e. Hagerty et al. 1992; Enayati 2012). Though I understand how the Canadian state apparatus facilitates the integration of newcomers is problematic, I remain optimistic about the concept itself and the potential it has.

Through volunteering at OCISO, I was given access to various forms of data that could be used to construct a picture of newcomers' experiences in the Ottawa area. At first, I was tasked with inputting data collected over the phone of people calling for a variety of reasons. Because OCISO is both a private and publicly funded organization, keeping records of enquiries is crucial to ensure donors that OCISO services are beneficial (I.e. RBC Foundation, Ottawa-Carleton District School board, Scotiabank). Therefore, every time the phone rang, a brief intake form was filled out and inputted into a computer program. On my first of day of volunteering, I sat for 3 hours and inputted roughly 200 intake forms. Once I proved to be a reliable volunteer, I was trained on reception - where I continued to volunteer for 2 years - to cover the receptionists' breaks,

answer and transfer phone calls, and notify settlement workers when clients arrive. Volunteering at OCISO also allowed me to observe the inner workings of a settlement agency, to see how settlement workers interacted with their clients, the needs clients arrived with, and the places clients arrived from, among other things. It is through these observations that many of the most impactful fieldwork experiences occurred, becoming the basis of each chapter's opening vignette.

It was not until I began conducting semi-structured interviews with service providers that the model refugee concept became clear. When I began interviewing service providers, a pattern emerged - many had previously been newcomers in Canada and had accessed employment services themselves. I had not anticipated the newcomer background, and hence, in the beginning, I assumed that refugees and settlement workers would be two distinct research groups. In reality, the two groups significantly overlapped and profoundly influenced the direction of my research. Because of this, I knew I needed to explore further the role these services played in the trajectory of my participants' professional and personal lives. Upon conducting further secondary research, I found a large body of literature on the importance employment plays in the formation of citizens, leading me to believe that employment services would offer a unique space to explore policy implementation, governmentality, and citizen formation among newcomer populations.

It should also be noted, that when I was observing the various day-to-day interactions between settlement workers and their clients, various immigrant⁵ categories

⁵ According to the UNCHR, a migrant is defined as, "any person who moves, usually across an international border, to join family members already abroad, to search for a livelihood, to escape a natural disaster, or for a range of other purposes." (UNHCR 2014)

were often used interchangeably. The term 'newcomer' is most commonly deployed as an umbrella term referring to all categories. Specific legal designations (i.e. refugee, immigrant, permanent resident etc.) are often used solely when discussing the particular legalities or specific applications/services that are available to specific categories. This use of terminology will be reflected throughout.

Thesis Outline

This thesis is divided into three chapters, each of which has a theme. Chapter 1 develops the concept of the model refugee. Inspired by the concept of the model minority - created in reference to Japanese Americans in the United States, the model refugee is a theoretical figure that newcomers can aspire towards, as well as an analytical device I am using to think through my collected data. This figure is a participatory, financially independent subject that can positively contribute to the Canadian economy. The model refugee is intrinsically linked to participating in the labour market and earning a wage, and as such, is linked to the role that public policy and governmentality play in the lives of immigrants and refugees.

This chapter also debates whether or not "living up" to the figure of the model refugee is possible, as newcomers are often relegated to menial positions with low wages, unable to overcome adversity and "succeed." This creates an impossible situation, as a newcomers' ability to emulate this figure is what determines whether or not they are worthy of resettlement. More often than not, refugees are either placed in the category of a moral or a political being and are rarely considered to occupy both at the same time. In reality, the refugee condition is both moral and political. Humanitarian intervention in the

lives of those displaced is intended to supply services and representation that is ultimately the responsibility of the nation-state. As the nation-state is incapable of providing these necessities, this intervention is effectively replacing the nation-state. Therefore, many migrants begin their journey as a refugee occupying both the political and the moral categories simultaneously - acting as two sides of the same coin.

Chapter 2 discusses the specific barriers faced by newcomers within employment services. Accessing settlement services has proven to be more difficult than many realize, as my data has shown that policymakers have a very artificial understanding of target populations. The services newcomers have access to often depends on the legal category in which they are placed (i.e. refugee, economic migrant, skilled worker etc.). This leaves many newcomers questioning what services they are eligible for and unaware of how to access them. Both the refugee category and the needs are equally diverse; therefore understanding these needs is no easy task. The next barrier faced by many was language, as having an elementary understanding of the local language is crucial for resettlement to be successful. This barrier is also in a place of transition, as many of the most recently arrived refugees lack knowledge of English or French. As newcomers often struggle to participate in the labour market without the knowledge of at least one of Canada's official languages, this has proven to be one of the most significant barriers to overcome. Lastly, I found mental health and overcoming past political trauma to be a reoccurring issue among newcomer populations. As has been seen recently in Canada, mental health has taken center stage as a topic of conversation when discussing the concept of 'self-care.' Many refugees that arrive in Canada are found to be harbouring feelings of guilt for a variety of reasons, and living through traumatic events such as

violence and war play a significant role in a newcomers ability to resettle and to gain entrance into the labour market, both of which are crucial to overall integration. Each of these barriers is further complicated when entering into a foreign labour market as a racialized individual, and many newcomers find themselves the subject of racism and discrimination both inside and outside of the workplace.

Chapter 3 shifts towards the anthropology of policy, focusing on how immigration policy, in reality, hinders a newcomers ability to occupy a similar position in the Canadian labour market to the one they were forced to vacate before displacement. In Canada, many professional fields are regulated. This means that strict rules and regulations must be met before entrance can be granted. When newcomers arrive with professional degrees or prior education (i.e. degrees in medicine or engineering), they are required to have their education and prior experiences assessed to ensure they meet all qualifications before entering into the field. While many newcomers arrive in Canada with education obtained overseas, their education is often devalued and not considered equivalent to education obtained in North America. The process of recognition requires detailed documentation and testing, which has proven to be a long and expensive process that does not come with the guarantee of successful recognition. Because of this, newcomers are often forced to consider other options, such as returning to school or changing careers entirely. While I had an interest in this topic prior to beginning my fieldwork, it wasn't until I began examining my data that it appeared to be standard practice that immigrants would avoid official certification by choosing one of three options: entering into settlement services, choosing to return to school, or entering into a parallel field. Dividing this chapter into these three subsections, this chapter focuses on how

newcomers navigated these options and the experiences that brought them to their point of choosing.

Finally, this thesis will conclude with a discussion on policy. Because I spoke to settlement workers who experience first-hand the effects of policy implementation, I asked each during their interview what qualms they had with Canada's immigration system. While many agreed that it is a beneficial system compared to others (such as the United States under the Trump administration), there are many things that on paper appear to be productive but are not in practice. Therefore, a discussion on the various ways a more productive and open environment can be created for both service providers and newcomers will be offered, in the hopes of lending to the development of future policy creation.

Chapter 1 - The Model Refugee

As soon as you enter the main doors at OCISO, you are drawn to the posters on the walls and the large pole in the centre of the room covered in children's artwork, which immediately makes you feel welcome. The posters visible from the waiting room - in English, French, and Arabic - are mainly recruitment posters for research studies, advertisements for local events, and other services offered in the community aimed at the local newcomer population. Shortly after I began volunteering at OCISO on a weekly basis, I learned that an average day is chaotic, loud, and busy, with the phone ringing every 5 minutes and a constant flow of clients and workers in-and-out of the building. There are always conversations happening all around me as I sit at the front desk covering the receptionists break; I usually understand only about one-third of what is said, due to the diversity of the languages spoken in this context.

It was in November of 2016 when I first walked into OCISO as a new Master's student. I was looking to interview an employee for an assignment in my methodology course, as well as begin making connections at a possible research site, where I was hoping to conduct fieldwork in five months' time. It was not until I had been volunteering there for about six months that I encountered a short, frail, middle-aged Middle Eastern man that came to OCISO with his wife. I remember thinking it is doubtful this man is searching for a job, given the apparent state of his health and lack of English language skills. Both he and his wife spoke little to no English and had come in to access the walk-in counselling clinic. Since they were both getting counselling separately, he was waiting in the lobby for about an hour, sitting directly across the room from my seat behind the large reception desk. While waiting, the man got up and began looking at the stand containing reading materials located across the room, where he decided on an OCISO brochure containing descriptions of services offered at this location. I was surprised by what he chose because the brochure he picked up and took back to his seat was in English.

I was surprised because I knew this man spoke Arabic and not English. When he and his wife came in, he merely said 'counselling' and 'walk-in,' with a smile on his face while nodding to make sure I understood, before sitting down in one of the lobby's available chairs. Clients often check in like this with the reception desk when I am there, probably because they assume that I do not speak Arabic (a correct assumption) and they know enough English only to convey their immediate needs. However, after sitting down and briefly scanning the brochure, he decided to take the opportunity to practice his English, and he began reading it aloud quietly to himself.

On an average day, I do not think I would have been able to hear him over the constant conversations happening throughout the office and due to the hushed tone in which he was speaking. Since this was a quiet time of the day, I sat and discreetly listened to him sound out and attempt to piece together words. This man seemed ready and willing to embody the refugee ideal: a would-be job-seeker determined to master the local language and move forward. This picture left me pondering both the sense of determination, but also fear and uncertainty facing the refugee population, particularly the seniors. The tremendous amount of drive and willpower that is required to learn a new language and make a life in a new country is trying at any age, let alone for an older man

who has been forced to change his life at a time when many are expecting to slow down and retire.

Introduction

In the book, *Refugees of the Revolution: Experiences of Palestinian Exile*, Diana Allan (2013) explores how Palestinian exiles in Lebanon have reclaimed the term refugee and turned it into a focal point of their identity, often in resistance against the Lebanese government that has refused to recognize their political rights. This act of embracing their own identity as refugees, however, comes at a cost:

“Palestinian refugees in Lebanon and elsewhere are almost always discussed in ideological terms, as if they dwelled entirely within a political realm, as if their aspirations and inner lives lacked the fractured complexities of Western-consciousness and identity, and as if their cubicle needs were spiritual and ethnonational but not material and economic” (Allan 2013, 5).

Allan (2013) argues that Palestinian refugees are so hyper-politicized, that it is difficult to think of them as human beings whose lives have other dimensions. This argument runs counter to that of Miriam Ticktin and Liisa Malkki, whose work on the humanitarian production of the refugee category suggests that this population is both depoliticized and dehistoricized – to be remade into an object deserving of humanitarian support. Often, political dimensions of refugee experience are presented in moral terms, to make the issue more understandable to the general public, as well as to justify intervention and aid. While the Palestinian case is unique due to the growing unlikelihood of return, their situation highlights the paradoxes of the refugee experience, each characterized by both the excess of politics and the absence of it. Much of the contemporary understanding of this issue links back to Arendt (1973), who conceives of a refugee as someone whose human rights are endangered precisely because they no

longer belong to a political community; it is the refugees' statelessness that both erases their political rights and brings political dimensions of their experience to the forefront. As a consequence, Allan (2013) suggests that refugee issues are spoken about in 'ideological terms' instead of as concrete, contemporary matters (5).

It is for this reason that I believe when images such as that of Alan Kurdi - the young Syrian boy whose lifeless body washed up on a beach in Greece after attempting to flee Syria by boat with his family - make such an impact in popular culture and mass media. The photo that was released in April of 2015 sparked international outrage as it was seen plastered across various media platforms and on the front page of various newspapers. Indeed, this image became the visual representation of what was designated the 'European refugee crisis,' furthering the idea that all refugees are helpless and require saving. When it was later speculated that the young boy and his family were attempting to seek asylum in Canada, many Canadians felt personally responsible for the tragedy and demanded more be done by the Canadian government.

Much like in the case of Alan Kurdi, the media has a large contributing role in the creation and dissemination of the stereotypical refugee image (Yurich 304). Focusing on the construction of the refugee category, this chapter will discuss the ways refugees are shaped and moulded into subjects deemed worthy of aid and resettlement. In other words, my focus is on what has been classified as a 'good refugee,' a figure produced — rather than encountered or discovered— by the various government and non-governmental entities spearheading the process of resettlement. Ultimately, this chapter argues that the 'model refugee' is a product of humanitarian governance and neoliberal subject formation, whose goal is to produce worthy, self-reliant citizens.

In this chapter, I develop the concept of the model refugee as a way to think through data collected during my fieldwork. Also, as a way to show that the workplace offers an ideal space in which to analyze integration and to examine the ways refugees, in turn, learn to internalize and embody the qualities deemed desirable by the Canadian government. Simultaneously, my ethnography questions the limits to such grand designs and asks how much integration can occur when newcomers are relegated to menial positions, part-time, and overnight work. To understand the processes that lead to this particular form of subject formation, I look at the role decentralized government and nongovernmental agencies play in the lives of refugees and newcomers. To that end, I offer a brief overview of the history of settlement services in Canada, documenting various processes experienced and endured by resettlement candidates pre and post arrival in Canada. The process of becoming a self-reliant (and therefore desirable) citizen often begins before stepping foot on Canadian soil, as refugees are required to attend classes and training modules that begin this transformation into 'good refugees.' I then examine the role that morality and deservedness play in the lives of refugees and in how humanitarian decisions in Canada are made, showing how a hierarchy of deservedness pits each legal immigrant category against the other. Focusing on the concept of humanitarianism and humanitarian government, the following section focuses on how Canada has placed great importance on strictly helping those deemed 'worthy' therefore creating an inherent hierarchy among legal immigration categories, and how both government and non-government bodies perpetuate their hierarchy.

The Model Refugee

The concept of the model minority heavily influences the concept of the model refugee that I am introducing here. This concept “primarily refer(s) to ethnic minorities whose members are more likely to achieve higher success than other minority groups, especially in economic advantage, academic success, family stability, low crime involvement etc.” (Chou 2008, 219). The concept is most commonly (and stereotypically) associated with those of Asian heritage. For example, “Japanese Americans who, [in the 1960s] despite their wartime incarceration in camps, managed to gain upward mobility, ‘leading generally affluent, and for the most part, [a] highly Americanized life’” (Ong 2003, 77). The idea of being a “model” suggests that one’s conduct falls in line with the expectations of the host society, and perhaps even surpasses them. It follows then that the model refugee is a more specific but related category encompassing refugees that go on to achieve relative success working in settlement services while living lives fully integrated into their country of asylum.

The idea of “model minority” is not without its critics, however. While others argue that the term only has negative repercussions, such as the “creation of social pressure to achieve, the threat to relationships, and detrimental assumptions that are inherently related to possible interpretations of the image,” all because of inaccurate generalized assumptions (Kaing et al. 2017, 2). Previously referred to as a ‘model minority myth’, defined by Poon et al. (2016) as “a monolithically hard- working racial group whose high achievement undercuts claims of systemic racism made by other racially minoritized populations” (469), and is most commonly associated with the idea that a particular minority - or in this case, legal immigrant category - is more likely to succeed in

comparison to other minorities (I.e. Gao 2008). Though there are various works of literature dedicated to debunking this concept, it is derived from the concept of the 'middleman minority.' This is defined as those who have "long served as 'buffer groups' or pawns in the power struggle between the two major classes - elite and peasant" (Poon et al. 2016, 473). It was agreed that those placed in the middleman minority category played a crucial role in the economy and that many occupied "an intermediate rather than low-status position" in society while tending to be concentrated in certain occupations (Blalock 1967, 583). Those in this category were considered to be middlemen due to their place between the elite and the masses - not quite of high economic status but still not considered of low economic status. Bonacich (1973) was the first to really explore and begin disproving the concept of the 'middleman minority,' first coined by Blalock (1967) as a way to describe minority populations in many countries throughout the world who fell in the middle to low socioeconomic status categories (583). It is argued that the explanation of this minority group was developed in the 1960s as a way to openly speak about racial minorities in a way that did not appear discriminatory, though it often resulted in further marginalization for the groups given the middleman minority label (Bonacich 1973, 584). The term middleman minority is no longer relevant, though the model minority is still in use within various disciplines, especially sociological and psychological literature (I.e. Ong 2013, Kalman-Lamb 2013). Regardless, it is argued that "at its core, [the term is] a patronizing practice that maintains White dominance by disregarding the lived experience of one group to shame another" (Poon et al. 2016, 474).

The goal of the model refugee concept introduced here is not to create competition among legal immigrant categories or to glorify particular career paths. The model refugee

is a constructed figure meant to represent the ways refugees and newcomers alike are framed as both moral and political subjects and to explore how many consciously seek to meet or exceed the expectations set forth by governing bodies. This option takes advantage of previous knowledge gained from personal experience, leading to newcomers becoming a part of the same apparatus encountered upon arrival that played a part in shaping them into what is deemed a governable citizen. “Amir” is a young professional who came to Canada during the first influx of Syrian refugees in 2015. He arrived at OCISO looking to access employment services and went on to become the manager of the RAISE (*Refugee and Immigrant Supports to Employment*) program, created specifically for Syrian refugees who arrived in Canada with little knowledge of English or education. Amir arrived in Canada with vast management experience and fluency in both English and Arabic. Upon hearing of an opening at OCISO, Amir decided to try his hand in the non-profit sector and help those with whom he had similar experiences, cultural knowledge, and everyday language. While Amir has a background in engineering, he explained why he chose a different field;

“I came to OCISO as a newcomer, and I heard about the opportunity [with the] RAISE program. I got excited about the idea ... it is all about talking [to] refugees, and also, I am Syrian, so it really relates to me ... you need to do something, on a human side as well. It’s really good too because it gives you market exposure, so I thought it was a good fit for me” (author interview, August 2017)

Leaving aside for a moment the issue of Amir choosing to forgo assessment to become a recognized engineer in Canada (which will be discussed in later chapters), what is crucial here is his choice of workplace. As Amir mentioned, the position he currently holds offers a unique opportunity to make connections in various fields in Ottawa. It also allows him to utilize his background (i.e. his upbringing and knowledge of

Syrian culture) and space to channel his personal experience as a refugee coming to Canada and conducting his own job search. These experiences allow Amir to stand out from other applicants, as he has lived through similar experiences to his clients. This situation offers an interesting example of how the Canadian state absorbs integrated migrants and the fact that Amir, who was once an object of resettlement, has become an agent within the resettlement apparatus by embodying the most desirable characteristics as laid out by regulatory bodies. Further, the government has awarded these actions by hiring him to utilize his niche personal experiences, and the opportunity to earn a living wage through stable, full-time employment.

As has been previously stated, the workplace is integral to newcomers as it offers space for various forms of integration to occur, and the opportunity to observe the more inconspicuous or underlying social cues. As the labour market is shifting and becoming more precarious than Canada has ever seen, Ferguson (2015) argues the increase in free-market ideologies and capitalism has led to a new type of welfare system, where people are receiving less social assistance from the government due to reduced government regulation (11). As neoliberal capitalism brought forth this reduction of governmental regulation, people occupying the working class have become increasingly “marginalized and impoverished” showing a “sign of their very limited relevance to capital at any scale” (Ibid). In contrast to Keynesian social policies that were dominant during World War Two, neoliberal capitalism has made “the poor ... more exposed to the depredations of ‘the market,’” and subjected to a reduction in employment opportunities, decreased job stability, and wages (Ferguson 2015, 3). This new welfare system that embraces reduced social assistance has left a significant population internationally to fall

into poverty, and into what it has been labelled to the “working poor,” or precariat. This refers to those who are participating in the labour market and earning a wage but continue to live on or below the poverty line. According to Zuberi and Ptashnick (2012), roughly 7.7% of recent immigrants to Canada were considered working poor, compared to 2.7% of Canadians (66). Standing (2011) argues similarly that migrants are becoming the largest growing population in this new class, as migration has increased with the rise of globalization, it is migrants that “fuel the growth of the precariat” (91).

Neoliberal restructuring of the global economies has also ushered in privatization and increased the number of public-private partnerships (i.e. Adams 2013). These programs are often advertised as the preferable “long-term performance-based approach to procuring public infrastructure where the private sector assumes a major share of the risks in terms of financing and construction and ensuring effective performance... from design to planning, to long-term maintenance” (PPP Canada, Inc.). Like in the case of newcomers, the responsibility of resettlement into Canadian society is placed on the shoulders of many organizations like OCISO. However, even though these partnerships are meant to affect employment and economic growth positively, the proliferation of public-private partnerships has in fact led to an increase in decentralized government, resulted in the growing importance of private donors and has had a negative impact on the labour market. As Hall (2015) explains, increased private ownership reduces employment opportunities for the public because there is “greater incentive to ... increase profit margins, and ... less incentive to maintain overheads such as training ... [this] may lead to further casualization through the use of short-term contracts or secondary subcontracting” (37). When organizations are privatized, it reduces the employment

opportunities because privatization is meant to increase productivity and financial earnings and decrease overheads. Publicly owned infrastructure is (in theory) more concerned with improving infrastructure and increasing employment opportunities and workplace conditions (I.e. Alonso et al. 2016; Michaels 2017).

Casualization of labour can have enormous social consequences, even in relatively wealthy nations. In *Precarious Japan* (2013), Ann Allison shows how the end of Japanese-style Fordism - characterized by life-long employment - has bled into all other realms of everyday life, leading many in Japan to stray away from what is deemed the 'ideal life.' Allison (2013) explains a lack of employment security has led to Japanese citizens falling into precarity, with young people living in 'net cafés,' the elderly starving in their homes, and parents resolving to murder-suicides due to lack of ability to provide for their families. The restructuring of Japanese capitalism was meant to 'modernize' the economy and increase growth similar to other international economic powerhouse countries, but it appears to have led instead to a localized economic crisis with enormous social consequences. This argument put forth by Allison (2013) challenges the bedrock of neoliberal ideology that argues for deregulation, privatization, and market self-regulation with minimal government intervention.

Though the Canadian context is much less extreme, newcomers arrive and are expected to enter the workforce at a full-time capacity within one year of arrival, at a time when full-time labour is becoming scarce overall. Taking into consideration this increased precarity in finding and keeping long-term employment, and the way this problem bleeds into everyday life, begets the question of how we should make sense of the pressures placed on refugees and newcomers to find full-time employment - with a wage that allows

them independence - within one year of arrival in Canada. Considering with how work life as we know it is changing internationally, many argue that we are coming to the 'end of work' at the hand of these broader, structural transformations, and it may be unreasonable to place these expectations on newcomers in such a precarious environment, therefore creating a particular kind of precarity that applies specifically to the refugee figure (I.e. Muehlebach 2012; Ferguson 2015).

With the neoliberal push towards privatization and decentralization, the labour market has become a much more precarious territory and one into which it is more difficult to gain entrance, especially for those disadvantaged or marginalized. It has become more common for people to have multiple part-time jobs at once making minimum wage, as opposed to one full-time salary position as was common in the 1970s (Grant 2017). This has proven to be more favourable for employers, as it "allows them to keep a lid on labour costs, improving their margins at a time of heightened competition and changing business models" (Ibid). For workers, precarious employment often trickles into other areas of life, as is evidenced in the Japanese context (Allison 2013). Many positions no longer offer benefits and pension plans, provide less sick days, reduced vacation pay, and even fewer opportunities to accumulate savings and financially plan for the future (Grant 2017). This results in many people living an all-around more precarious existence (Ibid). Most recently, there has been a shift towards the service industry, with 153,000 part-time positions being added to the workforce and only 64,000 full-time positions created in 2016 - a drop from 147,000 full-time positions created in 2015 (The Canadian Press, 2017).

Throughout my fieldwork, I found that during the initial job search in Canada, refugees and immigrants most commonly found positions in menial work in the service

sector as custodians/cleaners, in the foodservice industry, and in convenience stores situated within their community. The resettlement manual published by the Canadian government offering tips to newcomers resettling in Canada suggests first to use personal contacts to find employment - such as asking family and friends who may be aware of available positions and who might be able to vouch for them with prospective employers (Citizenship and Immigration Canada 2013, 62). This leads many newcomers to positions that keep them both working and socializing within their community instead of the community at large, and in many ways fails to offer integration opportunities to the same extent that a position outside of their community would offer - the exact opposite goal that many argue participating in the workplace achieves. Li (2004) argues the main issue with newcomers working within their community can “in the long run ... risk being trapped in the ethnic sector due to complacency, indebtedness, and obligation” (185). On the other hand, being surrounded by one’s ethnic community in a modern ethnic enclave after arriving in a new country that claims and strongly encourages multiculturalism⁶ is a type of integration in and of itself and can offer a vital support system at a time when support is crucial to thriving in new surroundings. Having someone who lived through similar circumstances can act as a guide and a role model to those they are helping.

Subject Formation and Governmentality

These support systems are a vital piece in the apparatus responsible for remoulding people into self-governing subjects that will act as they ought. The work of

⁶ According to Charles Taylor, multiculturalism is the “demand for recognition ... on behalf of minority of ‘subaltern’ groups ... by the supposed links between recognition and identity, where this latter term designates something like a person’s understanding of who they are, of their fundamental defining characteristics as a human being” (Taylor et al. 1994, 25)

refashioning subjects through governmental power starts as early as the first contact with humanitarian services - whether that be in a refugee camp overseas, or contact with a Canadian migration representative such as the International Organization for Migration (IOM). Once newcomers have arrived, many settlement services to which they have access are sponsored and regulated by the Canadian government but are organized, facilitated and implemented by independent bodies such as OCISO. In a nutshell, the government has begun to outsource various settlement services due to the increase in newcomer populations and an inability to accommodate large populations. Settlement services have shifted from strictly the public sector to the private by distributing the responsibility of shaping and training refugees into desirable citizens that are easily governable. As Ong (2003) explains, "...we [must] think not in terms of an overarching state apparatus but in terms of a multiplicity of networks through which various authorities, nonprofit agencies, programs, and experts translate democratic goals in relation to target populations" (80). While many continue to function in such a way that government policies and practices are mirrored, these organizations act as government representatives and cogs in the machine that shapes newcomers into the most desired type of citizen. This is, self-reliant, English or French speaking, and participatory - creating a "broader governance" that consists of more than the official government entity.

It is at the hand of resettlement organizations like OCISO that are both privately operated and publicly funded, that refugees and newcomers are moulded into ideal citizens as imagined by the Canadian resettlement apparatus. Along with the initial vetting process, the Canadian state and the private sector offer a plethora of settlement and integration services available to newcomers from locations outside of Canada to help

guide and prepare newcomers towards the ultimate goal of becoming a Canadian citizen that is both financially independent and participatory. It is here where the concept of governmentality plays an essential role in both settlement programs and my research. As Li (2007) explains, governmentality “is the attempt to shape human conduct by calculated means” (275) - in this case, the services made available to newcomers play a significant role in shaping the integration and settlement experience as well as the type of citizen a refugee will become and the career path they will eventually venture down. As Ong (2003) explains, “various state agencies and private associations converge in facilitating the transition of displaced peoples, with the goal of changing refugee-subjects, perceived as shiftless and abject, into normalized citizens who can be reasonably integrated into the host society” (80). Offered both pre and post-arrival, these courses function as an attempt to prepare newcomers for what to expect upon arrival in Canada, as well as to facilitate a smooth settlement transition after arrival.

I found service providers in Canada to have spoken very highly of the pre-arrival services offered to newcomers who have been accepted for resettlement in Canada. For those living in refugee camps before resettlement, it is humanitarian agencies that provide the various services and workshops that must be taken prior to arrival. Charlotte, a young woman that I was introduced to at OCISO who was completing a work placement in the counselling department, grew up in a refugee camp in Malawi and described to me the classes she was required to attend prior to leaving for Canada. These classes consisted of lessons on the Canadian way of life and Canadian values, as well as various institutional settings and systems (such as government and university policies that will directly affect her). Since Charlotte was coming to Canada to attend university through a

scholarship program, it was especially important that she take these courses in order to make sure she understood the rules that must be followed during her time in Canada, and what might happen if those rules are broken (e.g. deportation, loss of status, etc.). Here, the integration process did not start upon arrival to the country of asylum, but as early as in the refugee camps or processing centres abroad. These courses are partly sponsored by the Canadian government and the International Organization for Migration (IOM), which is also in charge of implementing and facilitating programs on the ground in refugee camps and processing centres, acting as an unofficial representative of the Canadian government (which is unable to have an official presence). This practice of neoliberal governmentality and distributing government duties is standard practice in both Canada and the United States, particularly in times of disaster and crisis when it is common for governments to contract private organizations to spearhead cleanup efforts, disperse first aid etc. (e.g. Adams 2013).

For my research, I focused on the way this is done through employment services, which is believed to not only result in economic integration but also acts as a facilitator to both social and political integration. Ager and Strang (2008) argue that employment is one of the “key domains of integration,” along with “housing, education and health; assumptions and practice regarding citizenship and rights; processes of social connection within and between groups within the community; and structural barriers to such connection related to language, culture and the local environment” (166). This has not been conclusively proven, as in many cases immigrants and refugees end up in low paying, highly insecure positions that are also most commonly situated within their community (Creese and Wiebe 2012, 58). As is the case for many, newcomers end up

further marginalized from the community at large. Because of the need to earn a wage, many have no choice but to accept low-wage positions. Refugees are then required to seek more than one job, which hampers their ability to access resettlement services, effectively participate in society, or form social bonds with the local population.

Employment services offered in Canada today consist of language-benchmark training in both English and French, resume writing clinics, interview skills, and job search workshops. While they are most commonly accessed after refugees have arrived in Canada and the resettlement process has begun (i.e. paperwork is finalized and housing secure), the way employment services are being offered are currently in transition, as programs are now available in transient countries and refugee camps, as well. This is beneficial, as many refugees arrive at settlement agencies with a sense of desperation for normalcy and independence, which includes the desire to find employment to support one's family. This desperation comes from the constant push by service providers and the Canadian government to be a 'good refugee' - meaning one that is working. "Yuki" - an intake worker who acts as the first point of contact when arriving at OCISO and assessing a client's needs - recounted such a situation:

"They just want to get working. And sometimes it is a little bit challenging, we're like, okay, but maybe you should be looking at improving your English [first]. But ... of course [they] are eager to provide for [their] families, and get secure financial means ... that's huge in terms of [mental] well-being and self-confidence" (author interview, July 2017)

This quote captures well the contradictions of Canada's approach to resettlement, showing how the refugees have so strongly internalized the need to work, that the services providers find themselves forced to tell them to slow down, that there are other aspects of resettlement that must be dealt with first before even thinking about

employment. The desperation to find employment is understandable; as having employment is not only vital financially, but it is also essential to mental well-being. Not being able to provide for one's family can cause a great deal of physical and emotional stress "when so much (of the self and the soul) gets absorbed into work, the loss of not having that work (and longing for it) can be all-absorbing as well" (Allison 2013, 16). This quote also offers a brief glimpse at the order of priorities encouraged by settlement workers. Here, more importance is placed on learning English than on finding employment, leading one to believe that learning the local language is the basis of successful resettlement, followed by other resettlement practices such as securing housing and seeking employment.

Lastly, this quote also introduces a new form of care that many refugees arriving in Canada are not used to experiencing and are therefore unsure of how to navigate. In the book *Buddha is Hiding*, Ong (2003) examines Asian refugees in the United States, specifically the state of California, exploring the ways refugees learn to navigate their new society through the unfamiliar ways Western countries care for newcomers, and how newcomers mitigate this new set of expectations placed upon them when entering the workforce. Specifically, Ong (2003) states, "to become 'good enough' citizens, newcomers must negotiate among different forms of regulation, and be taught a new way of being cared for and of caring for themselves in their new world" (xvii). Concerning the above quote, all newcomers and refugees enter into offices where settlement services are offered and are essentially told to 'slow down' and take care of themselves first while settling into their new lives and then start searching for employment. As settlement workers encourage the same path regardless of legal status, it is this new form of care

that newcomers must navigate. This can prove to be difficult as many newcomers are used to working hard to provide for their families, and want to recapture some normalcy from the lives they left behind. Regardless of the circumstance of the newcomer - which has been shown can vary extensively - they are all encouraged to complete the same steps prior to employment. Similar to what Stevenson (2014) calls 'anonymous care,' this idea that "care should be administered indifferently, without it mattering for whom" (5), that the process of resettlement is a 'one size fits all' process without taking into consideration newcomers unique circumstances, experiences, and needs. Therefore, the ability to adapt to this new form of care and regulation is crucial to succeeding in being a 'good citizen.'

Requiring the ability to adapt quickly has shown to be crucial in the resettlement process. "Micaela" is a mentorship coordinator at OCISO with 30 years of experience in adult education. During our interview, she relayed a story of an older man who arrived in Ottawa and had previously worked for decades as a well-known operations manager. Micaela explained;

"I found that with a fellow from South America... he was in the 50s and he had never had to work for a job, because, in his field, he was sort of an operations manager...he ... made all the deals for the products to be moved from one place to another, [worked in] manufacturing and all that - [employers] came to get him. He worked in three different countries with a Coca-Cola plant, so he had never had to have a resume first of all, and secondly, he didn't even have to work for a job!" (author interview, August 2017)

Not only was this gentleman frustrated that he was unable to begin working, but he also struggled to understand that he was unable to utilize his previous work experience to enter the Canadian job market. As a part of participation in the mentorship program, participants must take particular courses, such as English classes, and consult with a

mentor who actively works in the same or closely related field. Micaela explained that this situation faced by this man is widespread and that many of her clients struggle to understand the reluctance shown by Canadian employers to hire people with international experience. They also do not understand the need to attend classes or courses in a field where they believe they already have plenty of experience. It is this the new form of “care” or regulation that many refugees seem to struggle with, offering an interesting space to examine how newcomers navigate these unfamiliar forms of care.

Care, Moral Obligation, and Deservedness

Micaela’s client openly expressed his inability to grasp this new form of care, and repeatedly expressed frustration over his inability to continue working in the field when he had years of experience in various countries. What’s more, this gentleman was matched with a mentor who worked in an adjacent field - as no operations managers were available as mentors due to the lack of manufacturing plants located in Ottawa. This particular mentor did not have nearly as much experience in the field as the newcomer did, which created a slightly awkward situation during their first meeting. This is a prevailing sentiment among refugees, who feel they are not taken seriously due to having been educated in and obtaining work experience from another country. A similar sentiment was communicated by another participant (Charlotte) who felt she had to continue reminding people that even though she came to Canada as a refugee and referred to herself as such, she was more than capable of participating in the Canadian workforce. It was this refugee label that Charlotte found to be the most difficult to navigate, relaying to me an instance when a fellow student disagreed with Charlotte being placed in the category:

“I remember the last time I was telling someone I came as a refugee student, she was like ‘no, [you need to pick a category]... You either say you came as a refugee or you came as an international student.’ I was like ... If I wasn’t a refugee, I couldn’t get this scholarship. My status as a refugee is what gave me the scholarship because it is specifically for refugees. Because they call it refugee sponsorship for students.” (author interview, August 2017)

It appears as if this student was unable to grasp what many Canadians would interpret as inherently conflicting identities - one that is deemed hopeless and in need of saving (the refugee), the other that is celebrated for hard work (the student). I would argue that this tension emerges out of the fact the refugee category is both political and moral; what’s more, the moral weight of the category shapes political aspects of the problem in precise ways.

In his work concerning humanitarian influence on governments, Fassin (2011) introduces the concept of ‘humanitarian government,’ arguing that morality has become the bedrock of many political decisions (1). This is most certainly the case in Canada, due to the way in which overarching Canadian nationalist discourses lay claim to a multicultural society that openly accepts all ethnicities and religions. However, that is only one aspect of the story. In recent years, due to many Canadians foregoing having children, accompanied with Canada’s vast amounts of available land, Canada has become a sort of the ‘new frontier’ of immigration. This has, in turn, made Canada an attractive place for migrants and those forcibly displaced. In many cases, Canada has openly accepted these applicants to counteract an ageing population, to fill in the gaps in the economy that native-Canadians are unable to (see Tencer 2017, The Conference Board of Canada Report 2016). In a report released in early 2017, Statistics Canada found that for the first time in Canada’s history, the Canadian population is comprised of

more senior citizens than children, and opening Canadian borders have and will continue to serve as a relatively simple way to counteract stagnant population growth (Ciolfe 2017).

Regardless of population growth, Canada has always placed an importance on humanitarianism and helping those in need, so much so that it has become ingrained in the bedrock of Canada's liberal ideology. Ticktin (2011) examines this desire to help those suffering in *Casualties of Care: Immigration and the Politics of Humanitarianism in France* (2011). Here arguing that "those who intervene in the name of compassion are looked to as morally and ethically untainted, the only allowable, legitimate response to injustice and suffering" (8). It is the occupation of this moral high ground that Canadians desire to achieve, most often through humanitarian endeavours and to support initiatives to help those suffering at a distance. People are often motivated by "a universalistic moral obligation to alleviate 'distant suffering'" (Malkki 2015, 51). This need to help was evident in the number of calls I received while volunteering at the front desk at OCISO. Community members often call enquiring about volunteering or more commonly where they can donate furniture, clothing or children's toys to newcomers, thinking OCISO was a place where they could get rid of things they no longer wanted or needed. Unfortunately, OCISO does not accept donations, but they do refer people to locations throughout the city that will accept donations depending on the item they wish to donate. This was something I expected when I began volunteering at OCISO; as it was evident when the recent refugee crisis began, Canadians all across the country were eager to help this displaced population. As a country that promotes humanitarian aid and support both overseas and at home, the arrival of this refugee population allowed Canadians to practice being a good person above and beyond government humanitarian policies. By

donating goods or volunteering at settlement agencies, they were able to further embody what is considered to be a 'good person.'

While working on the desk one day, a woman called looking to get rid of bunk beds and wanted to offer them to those in need. After explaining to me that she had a set of bunk beds her children were no longer using, she told me she wanted to give them to the 'new refugees' and was wondering if OCSIO would be interested in taking them, and if so, would be able to pick them up. I told her OCISO does not accept donations and referred her to the local furniture bank that OCISO recommends to clients when furniture is a need. After giving her the phone number, she asked if I knew if the organization would pick up donations, to which I replied I was not sure, but to ask when she called. A few hours later the same woman called back angry because the furniture bank was not answering her calls, and she could not understand why it was so difficult to give something away for free when she was trying to do something nice for 'these people.' These sentiments were not surprising, as many believe resettlement organizations should accept whatever help people are willing to give and should be grateful people are willing to help.

Liisa Malkki (2015) explores this craving to be a good person in her new book *The Need to Help*, where she examines what she believes is a 'neediness' to help those less fortunate in the context of the Finnish Red Cross and the organization's employees who travel on humanitarian missions throughout the world. This self-fulfilling need to not only help but to break up the monotony of one's personal life, and to exist differently in the world, was something that was found in each the author interview conducted:

"Their personal desires to get a break from the safe predictability and routinization of their work in Finland, and perhaps especially to find a self-conscious respite

from *how they themselves were in Finland*, were definitely factors in their decisions as to whether to accept an international mission or not ... In those moments, they did not have awkward selves to manage or what they sometimes described as an encumbering Finnish self-consciousness getting in the way; they experience, I think, a kind of pleasurable *self-loss*.” (11)

Malkki (2015) sees the motivations behind travelling with the Red Cross on various missions as a form of self-care, which allows humanitarian workers to step away from their lives and into another world - what many deemed “the world outside.” This is to alleviate their own “neediness, allowing them to be a part of something greater than themselves” (8). Many of her participants explained that working with the Red Cross and volunteering to participate in overseas missions offers the opportunity to be a part of something bigger while helping those less fortunate. It also provided a space for personal growth that many felt they were entitled to - with the Red Cross offering the best of both worlds. These findings are a harsh contrast to the arguments supporting humanitarian workers as selfless and morally pure beings at the hands of the work they choose. This leaves one to wonder how self-serving motivations could impact the work being done.

The findings presented by Malkki (2015) regarding the reasons behind why people chose to get involved with the humanitarian endeavours leads me to consider the role morality and moral obligation play in the lives of refugees and locals when refugees begin resettlement. As a country that places a great deal of importance on humanitarian work and support, it is obvious there is a universal feeling of moral obligation to help those less fortunate. This could be the cause of this woman's frustrations - that it is so ingrained in the Canadian subconscious that citizens must help those suffering, when they are told they are unable to help or prevented from helping within their capacity, it leaves them

feeling helpless and unable to perform the acts that make them a 'good person' or what could ultimately be a rejection of what it means to be a true 'Canadian.'

The self-centred desire to donate feeds into the ways Canadians imagine and interpret newcomers, particularly those in the refugee category. In the same interview, Yuki described the ways the Canadian population often misunderstands refugees and immigrants, which she had witnessed during in her time working in settlement services. She believes it is these misunderstandings - combined with the self-centred desire to help those suffering - that have led to the emergence of various ideas about what is considered acceptable and unacceptable for newcomers to possess, or what newcomers do and do not deserve to have during their time of displacement and resettlement. Specifically,

“People have weird understandings of what refugees are, and what they are entitled to have. Even the general population, I find they are kind of constipated around the idea of what an immigrant (or refugee) is and what they deserve to have. I saw a poster the other day that I thought was really interesting, ... it was this kind of breaking myths ... refugees wouldn't have ... smartphones, because smartphones are for privileged people, and refugees are not privileged. In a place of chaos, it's like, no, that might be their [only] method of survival.” (author interview, August 2017; also see Ahmad 2017)

Hence there is an underlying belief that when a refugee possesses the technology, or more generally what is considered beyond what is minimally required for survival, it is as if they are not desperate enough - and therefore not worthy - of our help. As mentioned above, there are instances where a smartphone becomes a lifeline, allowing access to life-altering services, such as “maps with directions to border crossings, weather reports, language translators to help refugees communicate with volunteers and locals, and social media, which helps refugees share reliable information with one another - many of who

might otherwise have perished managed to reach safety thanks to technology” (Ahmad 2017).

These moral discourses, therefore, play an integral role in both humanitarian relations and government decisions, as exemplified by Ticktin (2011). Ticktin (2011) challenges the claim that humanitarianism is a strictly a moral project, which is by nature apolitical; her research indicates instead that in the course of a crisis, humanitarian organizations often effectively replace the services governments are unable to provide (Bulley 2014, 64). Writing about France’s attempt to promote medical humanitarianism, a set of policies guaranteeing asylum to the sick and vulnerable, Ticktin (2011) shows how ethical projects such as humanitarianism can have unintended political consequences. By creating this “illness clause” as a possibility for achieving status, the French state ended up privileging the sick, making ill a desirable state to be in and therefore leading some asylum seekers to self-harm to achieve recognition as a worthy humanitarian subject (Ticktin 2006, 33). What’s more, while this illness clause made some refugees eligible for residency permits in France, it limited their ability to receive work permits (Ticktin 2006, 39). This, in turn, rendered those that were allowed to stay economically and politically vulnerable and to offer a stark example of the ways the refugee category has both moral and political stakes. In the case of refugees in Canada, there is already a sense of hierarchy among immigrants depending on the legal designation they are given and therefore an undertone that some designations are more deserving of our help than others. In her essay “When is a Refugee a Refugee?” Baker (2017) examines the hierarchy among newcomer populations, stating that “too often, these categories function not to create refuge for the displaced but to construct a moral hierarchy of human value

in which 'refugee' is more deserving than 'immigrant' (which is much more deserving than an irregular or undocumented person), in an era when all of these [categories] are regarded with suspicion" (6). There is also a hierarchy placed within the various ways newcomers suffer before arrival in their country of asylum that "privileges certain forms of displacement over others" and therefore dictates the deservedness of Canadian humanitarianism (Baker 2017, 7).

This was something I witnessed in my fieldwork, particularly when I examined the ways that programs were made available and accessible to particular legal designations over others. For instance, when sitting down with Micaela, she explained to me the requirements that participants must possess to be eligible to participate in the mentorship program. She explained that due to restrictions placed on programs due to funding, they were only able to offer services to those with a status of either permanent resident or convention refugee;

"They have to be permanent residents or convention refugees. They cannot be a refugee claimant, we can't take them on ... this is determined by our funder. So, these are the ones or the people they want us to target. We can't take international students, we can't take people with work permits, you know - so permanent resident or convention refugee. Um, we also can't take citizens."
(author interview, August 2017)

The parameters placed on services available immediately creates a hierarchy among statuses when accessing settlement services. While these parameters are set by those who provide funding for settlement programs - both public and private - it limits those able to access the program, placing convention refugees and permanent residents higher on the scale of deservedness than economic migrants or refugee claimants, for example. In other programs offered by OCISO, any newcomer is eligible for services such

as counselling or housing support, with the only eligibility requirement being that they reside in Ottawa and the immediate surrounding region.

There is also an inherent hierarchy within the refugee category that considers whether a refugee is 'good enough' based not only on their past sufferings but also on their willingness to integrate into Canadian society and accept the Canadian way of life. Considering the definition of the refugee as laid out by the UNHCR, many modern forms of displacement are not included in this category (i.e. those displaced by environmental disaster), and therefore deem those not included in the definition as unworthy of international aid because they are not 'refugee enough.' Reflecting on her own time as a refugee coming to the United States, author Dina Nayeri recounts her experience in a piece written for *The Guardian* titled, "The Ungrateful Refugee." Here, Nayeri (2017) explains that she has always felt this sense of indebtedness to the American people for allowing her and her family to flee Iran, which also generated an expectation that she ought to be eternally grateful. This rhetoric lends to the moral obligation many immigrants feel towards their country of asylum and its citizens for graciously offering them safety in their time of desperation. Not only do Canadian people feel a sense of moral obligation to help, but refugees feel a moral obligation to return the favour - be that through future career choices, volunteering with other newcomer populations etc. Upon reading Nayeri's (2017) article, it left me wondering when does a refugee stop being a refugee? Today, Dina Nayeri is a dual citizen of Canada and the UK and is a happily married professor with a small child. When is she allowed to stop being 'grateful'?

Accompanied by this lens of debt there is an added pressure on a refugee in the form of obligation to the family that was left behind. In the case of one of my participants,

Charlotte still has multiple siblings and her mother living in the refugee camp she left to come to Canada in pursuit of a university degree. During our interview, Charlotte explained to me the pressure she feels when trying to budget her money to pay for everyday expenses, and still have funds to send home. She stated it makes her feel there are almost unreachable expectations placed on her, stating that “[due to] having our families back there [in the camp], we have high expectations that we are going to change lives.” Much like Nayeri (2017), Charlotte is now expected to thrive in her new country and eventually bring her family with her, as she left a dire situation for a place where opportunities are presumed to be bountiful. She is therefore held to a higher standard with demands for excellence; the expectation comes from many sides since her family now also expects that she will send them a portion of her wages.

Conclusion

The bedrock of this chapter is the concept of the model refugee, based on the concept of the model minority, which helps frame the contradictory expectations refugees face upon resettlement in a new country. I found that many of my participants harnessed their personal experiences as a newcomer in Canada and went on to become a part of the grand machine that shapes and forms newcomers into the type of citizen deemed governable by the Canadian state. It is the various settlement agencies, both government and non-governmental, public and private, that are responsible for the training and formation of newcomers into these governable citizens. Foucault’s concept of governmentality and the decentralization of government have proven to be crucial in understanding how these public and private organizations carry out these responsibilities

and have played a significant role in the dissection and understanding of my collected data.

Understanding the role of morality in humanitarian work in the context of Canada also proved to be invaluable due to the importance Canada as a country has placed on being a welcoming and accepting nation, and the commitment to providing hundreds of thousands of dollars in aid to various humanitarian causes worldwide and welcoming thousands of newcomers to settle each year. The Canadian government even implemented a program of private sponsorship that directly allows Canadians to get involved in bringing newcomer populations to Canada that today remains uniquely Canadian. While this appears to be an excellent idea that allows Canadians to appease their moral duty to help those suffering, it has created a way for the government to legitimately transfer the burden of support from the shoulders of the government to those of the general population, offering an exquisite example of how decentralization has taken form in Canada. Due to the importance placed on morality and the desire to help, various moral hierarchies have been created, such as the morally pure humanitarian workers or the deservedness created within legal immigrant categories. These pyramids of deservedness play an integral role in understanding the model refugee and the reasons supporting the choice to enter into settlement services, though this will be explored further later on. This chapter has focused on the idea that, while many paint humanitarian work and all actors involved as apolitical, I believe, in reality, that all humanitarian work and participants are actually entirely political and have an influential role in political decisions that have lasting effects in both the country of asylum and the country origin.

The main argument of this chapter was that these political dimensions of refugee newcomer integration become especially visible concerning the pressures they face to enter the job market and become self-sufficient. However, this kind of pressure ignores the conditions on the ground. Due to more precarious employment throughout Canada in the form of increasing part-time work and decreasing full-time positions that at one time offered benefits and pension funds, it is becoming more difficult for native-born Canadians to enter the workforce let alone newcomers who are unfamiliar with the Canadian system and culture. Some academics, like James Ferguson, believe that waged life is itself in danger of extinction, leaving many to wonder what the workplace of the future will look like, and consider the repercussions that could arise out of a lack of employment that will eventually bleed into other aspects of life that require a steady wage for survival. While newcomers in Canada already face adversity on various levels when beginning their employment search, a further increase in precarious employment will have a more significant effect on newcomers than the rest of the population, as many newcomers can only find employment in precarious positions that offer low wages and inconsistent hours. To better understand these barriers and the hardships many newcomers must overcome to become financially independent - and therefore a model refugee - the next section will look at the various setbacks and hurdles that must be overcome to reach what is deemed acceptable integration into Canadian society.

Chapter 2 - Barriers to the Model Refugee and Employment

About eight months after I began volunteering at OCISO while covering the front desk during the receptionist's break I received a call from a woman who was audibly upset. OCISO employees had advised me that people calling can have a tendency "to tell their life's stories" as soon as they get someone on the phone. In contrast to service providers, who sometimes find these stories excessive, anthropologists welcome such interactions, as they can often be the source of essential revelations and previously unknown information. However, service providers operate under a different set of rules. First, during my fieldwork, the staff felt it was inappropriate for the receptionist to spend an extended period on the phone because this would mean not having enough time to attend to clients who are arriving on site or trying to complete other administrative tasks. Second, as these stories can be distressing to hear, the staff worried they would upset me as a new volunteer. Lastly, the office is imagined as a professional space for newcomers to access settlement services, not an outlet for their emotions. The service providers provide concrete forms of aid; they do not see themselves as capable or able to address greater social, economic and political issues.

The people that take the time to tell their stories often fall into one of two categories: they want to make sure you understand exactly what they need, why they need it and when, or they simply need someone to talk to who might understand what they are going through and are desperate for the sympathetic ear of a third party. When newcomers call OCISO, settlement workers act as a sympathetic third party, one that also understands and has in-depth knowledge of the struggles faced by newcomers. In this particular case, this phone call fell into both categories.

After my usual greeting of "Good Afternoon, OCISO," the woman on the other end proceeded to tell me in a trembling voice about her husband's legal issues and the revocation of his medical license, which had left him without pay and unable to work until the conclusion of the legal proceeding. Clearly distressed and having already explored all other options available to her, she explained to me she has two young children. She was worried about how she would feed them, and that she was unable to pay next month's rent. It was getting cold out, and she needed a job as soon as possible before her children went hungry, or she would have to leave their apartment and move into a shelter. This was the sort of a phone call I was worried about answering when I began both volunteering and studying newcomers' issues, due to the immense empathy I feel for those in distress. As an anthropologist, I was interested to see how this situation would be dealt with by the settlement workers in the office, and the procedures they would take to help this distressed mother. Right away, I wanted to tell her OCISO could help and things would be fine - her children would not go hungry, she would not lose her home. Unfortunately, I also knew that her fears were real and there was a chance that OCISO would be unable to help her.

After telling her that I understood she needed help and support as soon as possible, I transferred her to the OCISO intake worker. There, she was told we, unfortunately, don't deal with economic issues or loans in this department, nor do we provide emergency housing. The intake worker gave her the phone numbers of shelters located in her area, and then transferred her to the community economic development department next door, where she would be connected to an employment counsellor to

help her find employment based on her previous work experience and/or education. The issue of finding employment is not something that happens quickly though, and this woman made it clear she needed a job and money immediately.

By actively seeking a solution to her family crisis, as well as attempting to avoid dependence on homeless shelters and government services, this woman was embodying the characteristics of the model refugee figure. After the intake worker finished the call, she explained to me the woman had started to cry while on the phone, but she did all she could do for her at this time, and just hoped that another department or organization would be able to offer her support more suited to her situation. I felt overwhelming sadness for this woman, both because of her situation as well as the inability to alleviate her distress. Unfortunately, sometimes problems are unable to be easily fixed.

Introduction

While the previous chapter focused on the intricacies of subject formation and how newcomers find themselves working in the very resettlement industry they first encountered in Canada, the following focuses on data collected based on the experiences of service providers who were previously newcomers themselves. Because these service providers interact with these issues in their professional lives, they are privy to a range of scenarios and have developed an even more systematic understanding of impediments faced by all newcomers. I would like to use this chapter to focus on the barriers and impediments those who work in settlement services face in both their personal and professional lives. As is seen in the opening vignette, there are limits to the abilities of settlement workers. These limits, produced by more substantial societal barriers, can pose a threat to a newcomer's ability to achieve socioeconomic integration. This "can encompass quality of life attributes as well as the opportunities and privileges afforded to people within society" (Ibid). Conversely, successful resettlement becomes that much more meaningful when barriers are eventually overcome.

This chapter will focus on the various barriers encountered by newcomers attempting to enter the Canadian workforce, which I discovered during my fieldwork in the

summer of 2017. My interviewees offered unique perspectives on integration into the Canadian labour market, as many themselves were at one point newcomers looking for employment and choose to access settlement and integration services. This dual perspective allowed participants to speak of a unique critique of the ways Canada has handled newcomer affairs. To give these issues a broader context, I begin this discussion with a brief overview of the anthropology of labour. Then, I examine the three main barriers as ethnographic objects that newcomers face according to data collected: barriers to settlement services, language, and past suffering and mental health issues. Despite the importance placed on gaining employment and reaching the figurative model refugee, various barriers impede this process. Focusing on these barriers and the forms of support meant to overcome these issues, this chapter will examine how, regardless of the availability of support services, socioeconomic integration is by no means guaranteed.

Anthropology of Labour

The exploration of labour from an anthropological perspective is no new phenomenon, though labour itself is currently shifting. Jiménez (2003) states, “the language and imagery of labour have become part and parcel of what makes a person today (I.e. of our definition of personhood)” (14). This emphasis on employment in the way a person self-defines could prove to be problematic due to the increase in various forms of precarious employment and the growing difficulty of participating in the labour market. However, according to James Ferguson (2015), shortage of jobs is a global condition, the result of a decrease in mass employment which once characterized Fordist economies, accompanied by unprecedented population growth that has led to over-

saturation of the labour market. Labonté et al. (2015) came to similar conclusions when conducting fieldwork among immigrant and refugee families in Vancouver, Montreal, and Toronto regarding the effects of globalization. When speaking to participants who came to Canada as skilled labourers, many stated their surprise by the lack of opportunity available due to the decrease in employment in the manufacturing sector and an increase in the use of technology instead of human labour (Labonté et al. 2015, 6).

Ong (2003) argues it is this precariousness in the labour market that has led to the formation of a new type of citizen. Having conducted fieldwork among what she terms “other Asians” (Cambodians, Laotians, and Mien, 2) and their “process of becoming free,” Ong (2003) found that precarity and migration together have resulted in a new type of American citizenship (17). This is partly based on “the stark contrast between the positioning of Southeast Asian refugees, and that of the new Asian professionals is a dramatic illustration of how globalizing forces are producing new forms of American citizenship. The employment of unprotected migrant workers combined with managerial strategies that exploit the ambiguity of borders creates new latitudes of citizenship that reach beyond the United States” (Ong 2003, 21). Hiring immigrants is seen as attractive to employers as vulnerable populations are less likely to complain about or contest problems in the workplace such as low wages or unsafe conditions, but are also responsible for increased productivity when hired (Green et al. 2015, 2)

Further, “the neoliberal logic of exploiting the ambiguities of social and economic borders has erased many hard-won battles for labour rights and promoted tolerance of historically inferior American working conditions for people judged to be socially, morally, or economically inferior - namely, minorities and the latest wave of immigrant workers”

(273). Arguing that even though it appears inequality in the workplace is no longer tolerated, Ong (2003) states that the reality of capitalism has led to further inequality. It is often those socially marginalized that fall into this type of employment that forces those already living a marginalized existence further into the category of the “other.”

Barrier #1: Access to Settlement Services

As Shaw and Byler (2016) argue, a lack of institutional recognition can lead to an increase in precariousness, especially in cases when racism and exploitation are evident. This lack of institutional recognition was the basis of an event I attended facilitated by Ottawa Local Immigration Partnership (OLIP). This event was meant to create space for open dialogue about the concept of equity in employment in the city of Ottawa, including how this concept differs from *equality*. One speaker described this difference by using the analogy of needing to use different types of snowshoes depending on the type of snow that was falling. Some snowshoes are more useful in light, fluffy snow, while others are more useful in densely packed snow. Regardless of its intended use, all of the snowshoes are useful, but not all are equal. It is important to acknowledge this inequality, and that each newcomer has a unique experience concerning how and why they arrived, and therefore requires a unique combination of support and settlement services. Recognizing this is the first step toward creating a space for action. This shift in terminology from equality to equity has proven to be very interesting. What struck me during this event was how important it is to acknowledge that even though employment and settlement services are available to those living in Ottawa, people accessing these services continue to encounter a variety of barriers. Still, many of the sources I consulted during my preliminary

research expressed how essential settlement services were in ensuring 'successful' integration of newcomers into their country of asylum. These supports are usually offered free of charge and available in both rural and urban areas. Indeed, many settlement workers I encountered maintain the belief that it is almost foolish for newcomers not to take advantage of further support and guidance.

Though it may seem foolish, it is important to remember that not all newcomers require the same amount of support and guidance; therefore the services needed vary. The newcomers that arrive in Canada come with varying backgrounds - in the last migration to Canada, only 10% came from Refugee camps, while the rest came from both urban and rural areas in surrounding countries (The Canadian Press, 2016). As Malkki (1996) argues, refugee populations are imagined with "no names, no funny faces, no distinguishing marks, no esoteric details...[and are instead pictured] ... as a sea of [wretched] humanity" (388). With helplessness often being used interchangeably with speechlessness, these images inspire the image of the helpless victim (Ibid). Refugees - regardless of backgrounds - are placed in an overarching category of vulnerability, making people assume that refugees only come from camps and therefore low socioeconomic statuses. In reality, a refugee by definition is someone displaced from their home for varying circumstances, meaning they arrive from varying socio-economic, educational, and social backgrounds, and will require unique services, dependent on their previous circumstances.

Regardless of the services newcomers require, the Canadian government is responsible for making these services available, as has been the practice for decades. Recently, the global "refugee crisis" has forced Canadian settlement services and

newcomer support programs to reassess and reformulate. Many programs are currently in their pilot phase, continuing to adjust to the needs of the target population - which can only be done once these programs are up and running, and settlement workers have evaluated specific needs. This means many programs have very little collected data to work with, as they have only been running for an average of approximately 18 months. This proved difficult when I began looking at the idea of *successful integration* - how did or could settlement workers know their programs were beneficial and supportive when there was no comparable data to work with? What does successful integration look like? Moreover, how can such an outcome be measured? This was something I asked settlement workers when my fieldwork began; and many responded there was no definitive answer, though each had a personal definition of what successful integration and resettlement looked like, and expressed interest in seeing what statistics will look like in coming years. However, until data is compiled and published, programs are being created from previous knowledge, assumptions, and data from past migratory influxes into Canada.

There are many different types of settlement services available to newcomers across the country. For the sake of this thesis, I have narrowed my focus to employment services - specifically the services that help newcomers enter the Canadian workforce for the first time. These services include resume-writing clinics, interview skills, and mentorship programs. By focusing on these particular services, I was hoping to collect information on the ways these services are accessed, how newcomers can find these programs, and what these programs entail. Spending time at OCISO as both a researcher and volunteer allowed me to see how these services are implemented. While I was

observing, it appeared as if these programs were created without space for people to emotionally process their displacement and resettlement. It is common for newcomers to find themselves feeling anxious during their intake assessment, conducted upon arrival at a settlement agency. Unfortunately, this space is not meant to facilitate the processing of emotions, but to facilitate successful resettlement, in this case, defined more narrowly, as the newcomers' ability to become a financially independent, working, and participating, citizen. This can leave clients feelings overwhelmed, and unaware of where to process these emotions.

There are multiple reasons why emotions are actively marginalized from this space. The services available are rigorous and regimented, and when clients display emotional needs or disturbances, they are immediately referred to counselling services. There are multiple reasons why this is the procedure, though it is primarily because settlement workers are not equipped to handle these situations. They are trained to assess the needs of newcomers and refer them to the appropriate services, not advise on emotional distress, as these are seen as two very different forms of care. Because services are so regimented, many settlement offices have counselling on site where psychologists with experience working with victims of torture, war, and displacement are immediately available. This allows clients to talk about their experiences in a safe space, and to be heard by a 'sympathetic ear.' From my personal experience as a volunteer at OCISO, I could see that sometimes people just needed to air out feelings without wanting advice or an explanation. Multiple participants recounted times where they simply sat and cried with a client as they relayed their displacement journey. One participant told me that each client situation is unique and depending on the vibe of the client you can tell whether

or not it is appropriate to express your own emotions - as long as your empathy does not overtake their needs or mourning. This example, in particular, offers an interesting window into the day-to-day functioning of resettlement services, which typically represent a professional, rational and emotionless space, but practically can also become a place where people can sit and cry. Settlement workers, I found, allow - if not encourage - clients to feel and process their emotions, pointing to the fact professional expectations exist in tension with the practical day-to-day management of different cases.

Frustration, anxiety, and fear were commonly expressed by my participants when speaking about various aspects of both their personal and professional endeavours with settlement services. One of my participants, Charlotte, expressed all of these emotions in our interview but told me she was most surprised that she felt surprised after arriving in Canada. Charlotte could not believe how little support she received upon arrival, as she was given the impression before arriving that support would be readily accessible should she need it. She found herself having to take it upon herself to find the services she required, such as googling employment agencies that would help her build a resume to Canadian specifications and to learn how to apply for jobs in Canada as this is primarily done online.

In this case, Charlotte came to Canada through a scholarship program - falling under the category of a privately-sponsored refugee - and was not immediately assigned a settlement worker to help facilitate her resettlement. For those that come to Canada as a government-sponsored refugee, they are immediately assigned a settlement worker to guide them through available services. Unfortunately, in the case of the most recent mass migration of Syrian refugees into Canada, many organizations were not prepared for such

an influx and became overwhelmed with so many new clients. As government-sponsored refugees are immediately assigned a settlement worker with the Catholic Centre for Immigrants (CCI), the long wait times with their assigned settlement worker led to many reaching out to other settlement agencies. Privately sponsored refugees can access settlement services should they choose, but it is not a requirement. In this case, some sponsors will call organizations like OCSIO to inquire about services and procedures, but this is not mandatory. Therefore, how a newcomer gets to Canada can significantly affect the information they have access to and how they access those services. “Abeer,” a local service provider, actually encourages private sponsorship over government sponsorship, as she feels it makes it easier for newcomers to integrate and helps create a sense of belonging quicker. She states;

“Some are sponsored by groups or churches; they feel [like they] belong more than the ones brought by the government because they were sponsored by Canadian families. And these families speak either French or English, and sometimes they speak Arabic a little bit, but during contact, the Syrian immigrants learn a little bit of English and French, and the sponsors are learning a little bit of Arabic, so there is a ‘brassage des culture.’ But the other ones that were sponsored by the government, they received services at their location, at their building, with Arabic speaking people, so it is Arabic, Arabic, Arabic, Arabic ... So you won’t get this feeling of integration without dealing with Canadians. This is why I told them. Even last year when I was working with the families. I told them: open your doors, go out in the snow, take the bus, get lost on the bus, and tell the bus driver you are lost, ask them how to get back. Ask the driver, ask anybody, and listen to people talking on the bus. Go to the mall and listen to people talking English at the mall between themselves.” (author interview, July 2017)

As the facilitator of a business program and a past cultural liaison for the French Catholic school board, Abeer came to Canada as an immigrant from Lebanon 10 years ago. She explained to me that she believes too many programs are ‘coddling’ newcomers when in reality they should be left to interact with the general public on their terms. While she is referring to the ways the state tends micromanage the lives of citizens through

policy, she encourages informal interactions between newcomers and Canadians that allows them to build relationships on their own. She advocates for newcomers to spend less time in structured programming, and more time learning the ways of their new home for themselves. This lends new insights to the ways in which newcomers are governed, specifically since neoliberal forms of government are assumed to encourage less governing. By contrast, here we see an overabundance of governing that takes the form of micromanaging of newcomers' everyday life.

In her own experience, Abeer was shocked by how individualistic Canada was when she arrived. She found many things were done alone and conducted with minimal interaction with others. Especially today, individualism and independence are greatly encouraged among immigrant populations and native-born Canadians alike, whereas in many Arab countries it is the exact opposite. Abeer explained that in Lebanon people are used to being together. This makes North American individualism quite a shock upon arrival. She recounted stories from her childhood about how her extended family and friends spent time together on weekends sitting together in a living room simply listening to the radio. She found Canada very isolating upon arrival and quickly realized that these types of family/communal get-togethers' were not as common as in her home country. In her career, Abeer explained that she has worked with many newcomers that have expressed the same sentiments. This is why she encourages clients to go out and talk to those around them. In the summer, she encourages clients to simply leave their door open, sit outside, and greet people as they walk by. This was her largest policy recommendation when she was expressing her frustrations with Canada's immigration policies and something that I will discuss further below.

Abeer also expressed frustration about the lack of understanding elected officials have of immigrant cultures. She believes those who are responsible for making policy, as well as those in positions of power in the settlement field, tend to be out of touch with the population, and therefore unable to create useful policy. She used the example of advertising when she spoke to a local radio station to promote her program;

“I did an interview for an advertisement [on the multicultural radio station] ... in December or January, [when I got the position and wanted to advertise the programs I would be offering] my boss said “No, no, no! Stick to the flyers in a classical way!” and I told him, “Look ... I know my people. They do not read, they listen and watch. We cannot have something on the TV, we [need] something on the radio ... this is how it works.” And now whenever I meet people, they say, “Oh, you! I heard you on the ad!” I know what they want ... what they need, and this is what we should do ... [Usually] the government tells them to go on some website and [find a] service themselves. No, it is not going to work. You need to have someone with them who can go and open the screen and tell them exactly how to do it. And this is how I try to show them.” (author interview, August 2017)

Having a better understanding of everyday practices of the target audience is crucial to ensuring these programs reach the intended communities. Otherwise, it will remain ineffective. In this case, communicating with people who immigrated to Canada and are subject to the Canadian immigration system could offer crucial information to ensure the success of these programs. In reality, these issues are embedded in broader societal issues that should be addressed on a larger scale and will, therefore, require an overhaul of the way Canada accepts and interacts with newcomers.

Services are also restricted due to parameters set forth by funders. This has caused organizations to restrict access to particular immigrant categories, and left them unable to serve others. This has led to the creation of narrowly focused programs that exclude large portions of newcomer populations. This was mentioned at the (previously mentioned) “Community Dialogue on Equity” event when many of the participating

presenters advocated that policies and funds are too limiting. The only way to resolve these limitations is for policy makers and service providers to stop assuming that “we know what they [newcomers] want without asking the target audience.” The only way to remedy this problem is to create a dialogue that allows decision makers at the top to communicate with those whose lives are dictated by these policies. The same panel of presenters was asked to recount a time when they felt racialized in the workplace or had their differences highlighted (one woman on the panel wore a hijab). All had many examples of stories both within the workplace and their private life. It was not until after this event that I recalled a story from one of my first interviews. “Reyna” explained;

“I was out with my child [who was] around two years old, walking by the river. And then passing by a woman, who was jogging, and she was giving me this smile, and then she said, ‘What you are wearing in your culture is offending Canadian women’...I was like, I never expected anything like this. And I thought, imagine me being a newcomer with no language. So, I paused, I went back and said, ‘It is my religion, not my culture.’ And then she turned back, and said ‘No, it is your culture!’ and I said ‘No, it is my religion and I don’t think you know my religion more than I know myself and I don’t think you know my culture more than I know it myself!’ So, then she paused, and she came back, and she saw that I am the kind of person who wasn’t going to take disrespect. It wasn’t like you are going to throw those words and keep going, like, no, you need to stop and then listen to others. So, she turned back and she came like, bombarding me with ... accusations, about Muslim women, and [things like] ‘You are frustrated; you are followers, your men want you to do this because you are afraid of sex because you are afraid of mingling with the community, because, because, because...’ And I kept listening, and I said, ‘Did you finish,’ and she said ‘Yes,’ and I said ‘Okay, can you listen to me now? Just to let you know, I came here on my own, I immigrated on my own, I wasn’t married when I came, I wasn’t married when I put my hijab on. I am living in Lebanon ... it is a very open country, I am not living in a culture that is oppressive, and that forced me to do this. When I put on my veil, I was teaching in an IB program in a school, and I had to make a decision where no one, no single student or teacher or anyone is wearing a headscarf... I met my husband, and my husband was raised here ... then we got married. He doesn’t have any input. He respects the way that I am thinking, and he respects my decision to wear the headscarf.” (author interview,

July 2017)

Reyna is a Palestinian refugee from Lebanon with a background in education and has worked in various positions within OCISO. The occurrence of such an attack shows that the idea of Canada being inclusive and accepting of differences is precisely that - a myth. Had an event like this occurred in the workplace, the effects of such racism on newcomer job prospects are unknown, as there are many ways employers can disguise not wanting to hire newcomers. Reyna later found out this woman is a local elementary school teacher. One would assume a person who is presumably well educated would have more successfully embodied the traits that are believed to be most important to Canadians. In reality, this woman actively went against the commonly accepted values of multiculturalism, tolerance, civility, and general respect for others.

This left me curious about whether how to handle racist confrontations is officially addressed within settlement services. From observations conducted while volunteering, the answer is no. Having people react so viscerally to your physical appearance can make participation among greater society daunting. Reyna told me, after walking away from the situation, that all she could think of was if it had been her daughter this woman yelled at, or if this attack had of occurred when she was a newly arrived refugee. She explained she would have thought that this is how all Canadians would react to her wearing her hijab and would have been afraid to leave her home for fear of something more serious occurring. She explained she was not as shaken as she could have been because she had been in Canada for many years, and knew the majority were accepting of her choice to wear a headscarf.

The occurrence of this event shows that racism still exists in Canada (even though many believe it does not) and that both overt and subtle racist reactions could hinder newcomers' social participation and participation in the workplace. Overt racism is the practice of dismissing and condemning differences, and while religious symbols have become widely accepted throughout Canada, (minus Quebec - see Montgomery 2017) there remains a prejudice against those who are visibly different. As Ong (2003) argues, targeting those ethnically marked is common and has a long history of occurring, as newcomers often find themselves overlooked based on their physical difference, regardless of the skills they possess or potential contribution to society (as will be discussed later on) (128). I remember thinking as I was transcribing this interview that Reyna could have encountered someone with similar racist beliefs in the workplace and a position of power. In theory, this person could have had the ability to block Reyna from getting a job regardless of her qualifications. If this were the case, Reyna would have been forced into an uncomfortable power dynamic, leaving her unable to defend herself and hindering her ability to support her family. Many offices that provide settlement and integration services offer a unique work environment that encourages multiculturalism and pride in one's religion/ethnicity/culture, as well as knowing multiple languages; as such, they are spaces where differences are celebrated and made into an asset, rather than a source of risk.

Persistent risk of discrimination against ethnically marked refugees also might explain why the Canadian state encourages newcomers to first search for employment among already established networks - i.e. within their ethnic/religious community or already established ethnic enclaves. Not only are the forms of support and opportunity

available in these communities essential and useful to newcomers, but it is also a way for the Canadian state to capitalize on the cultural, religious and linguistic knowledge that already exists in these communities. These services even act as a way for the Canadian state to outsource the business of social integration. The irony, however, is that this advice offers a slightly mixed message to newcomers. Integration, by and large, is imagined as having regular interaction with the greater community; therefore, it is an open question whether advising a newcomer to remain within one's community should be considered a type springboard towards full integration. As well, the confrontation between Reyna and the racist stranger shows that a person marked by noticeable difference lives with the constant knowledge that they are racialized, and could be on the receiving end of a potentially harmful situation at any time. Reyna was simply out walking with her daughter when the event in question occurred. Even though Canada presents an image of acceptance and understanding, taking pride in its multicultural society and the fact that Canada has two official languages, racism and Islamophobia are still very much present issues in modern Canadian society.

Barrier #2: Language

As one of the handful of countries with more than one official language, it is crucial to understand the national language(s) for a variety of reasons - from communicating with locals to accessing resettlement services and applying for employment opportunities. Ager and Strang (2004) argue that in the process of integration, language falls under the domain of 'facilitators,' defined as "areas of cultural competence that are necessary for people to effectively integrate into the wider community" (4). Due to language competency

being so crucial to survival, the Canadian government mandates resettlement candidates take pre-arrival language classes, meant to expose refugees to French and English before they even arrive in Canada. Beiser and Hou (2000) argue that being exposed to the new language before arrival yielded faster fluency and that “the ability to speak the language of the receiving society is a powerful predictor of successful resettlement” (311/313). Unfortunately, these pre-arrival services are often reserved for strictly government-sponsored refugees, or those coming to Canada through a sponsorship organization. By contrast, privately sponsored refugees do not get access. When this is the case, settlement workers often recommend that newcomers sign up for language classes before any other steps are taken towards resettlement.

In Ottawa, these services are provided by the Centre for Canadian Language Benchmark (CCLB), which administers placement tests in both English and French. These tests consist of written and oral components meant to help determine the proper language class by “describing, measuring and recognizing second language proficiency of adult immigrants and prospective immigrants for living and working in Canada” (Centre for Canadian Language Benchmarks 2017). The goal of this test is to create a “common language for the entire immigrant-serving community” (Ibid). This has proven to be problematic, as it creates a hierarchy of language among the newcomer population. Even though Canada’s official languages are French and English, there are many other languages spoken in the country. According to Statistics Canada’s latest census from 2016, there has been an increase in approximately 1 million people who speak a language other than English or French at home since 2011 – bringing the total to approximately 7.6 million (Statistics Canada, 2017a).

Ornella, an employment consultant from the YMCA in Ottawa, facilitates two different online pre-arrival information hubs for newcomers located overseas. Working with clients who will be settling in Ontario and Quebec, one information hub Ornella facilitates is for youth, while the other helps adults looking to find work in skilled trades. The one thing these two info hubs have in common, according to Ornella, is the interest their participants show for language training. Youth especially are worried they will be held back in school due to their lack of competency in English or French, as they worry they are already obviously different from their peers, they do not want to be more of an outsider. The programs Ornella facilitates do not offer language services; instead, she works closely with international organizations who facilitate classes overseas, as well as local organizations throughout Ontario and Quebec (depending on where the client will settle).

For some, accessing these classes has proven to be difficult. Amir, a services coordinator at OCISO, explained to me that many of his clients struggle with attending classes due to scheduling conflicts. Amir explained that among his clients, it is most common for the man of the house to be the sole family member that leaves to pursue employment. This means that men are often forced to miss classes due to both familial responsibilities (i.e. drive someone to work or to a medical appointment) and work commitments. This is due to inconvenient class times that do not accommodate everyday life. In the case of female clients, Amir explained many had expressed frustration with classes as there is little affordable childcare available during the day when classes are offered, and what childcare is available is an unnecessary expense when it is easier for them to stay home and watch the children themselves. This has resulted in newcomers

being unable to attend classes, delaying language learning, which in turn has stalled entering the workplace.

At the time the interview took place, OCISO was in the process of implementing a new language program to manage these scheduling conflicts. OCISO was beginning to offer on-the-job English training. This means that once clients find employment, depending on the field, they are to be assigned a mentor in the same field who will then act as their language teacher - what they are calling an 'employmentor.' Amir explained;

"The program ... started as a pilot [project] matching our refugee clients with mentors who would eventually help them find a job - and it is still a pilot, but we found out we need to make changes... [then] it became more [of an effort] towards matching refugee clients with 'employmentors' or employment mentors. We are giving them job opportunities, but we also match them with mentors who are ideally from the [same] workplace, somebody from the team who would act as a buddy to the client, [who is] also a volunteer language trainer. We give them [the mentor] language training, to teach the client based on their occupation. So, if they are working in a restaurant, then we match them with language training in the restaurant field. This is really where we give them a lot of support to ensure their retention in the workplace." (author interview, August 2017)

This program allows clients to learn specific vocabulary and verbal expressions that are crucial to their success in the workplace, instead of learning general inflection in the classroom. This also eliminates the issue of scheduling conflicts with work and language class, as language class and work become merged. Language trainers are given prepared lesson plans and materials to help ensure the success of the program, and clients are required to meet with their employmentor for three hours a week, for up to three months.

Those who are accepted for resettlement in Canada and have a working knowledge of English and/or French, which in the past has been a significant number of newcomers, do not always need to take classes. Often, these newcomers find themselves

pressured into attending these classes based on program requirements to ensure their language ability is appropriate to participate in the workforce. Charlotte, a student and volunteer at OCISO, described to me the classes she was required to take before coming to Canada through a scholarship program. Even though Charlotte grew up in a refugee camp where classes were in English provided by British humanitarian workers, she was still required to take English classes, as well as Canadian culture classes. Charlotte grew up in a refugee camp in Malawi with her mother and siblings and has been speaking English for years. She is now practically fluent, with a slight accent. She explained to me that she learned English in school and that because of her knowledge of the language, she was able to acquire a translating job with the United Nations. Charlotte explained that she included all of this information on her resume after arrival in Canada, but still struggled to find employment. Multiple employers told her that this was because of her accent, as many believed her accent was too strong and would cause problems in the workplace. She explained;

“I remember, I once applied for a job at a call centre, [but] I was denied because of my accent. They were like, ‘people will be annoyed, they don’t have the patience, they don’t want to listen to someone who has an accent’ ... So, I went to [an employment service] and was like, is that a big issue? Because people have come [to Canada] ... from all over and speak differently ... but that does not mean they should be excluded.” (author interview, August 2017)

Having been told this, Charlotte felt greatly discouraged and believed she would never be able to find employment since she could not just get rid of her accent. She explained she had arrived in Canada with the idea that because Canada was known as a multicultural country, she would be accepted regardless of any differences. These ideas were first given to her by the staff in the refugee camp, which made all the more shocking the potential employer’s response to her accent. This experience left her unaware of how

to proceed in finding employment. Eventually, she found a job through a friend who worked at a local cleaning service and was very proud to tell me that she paid for her third year of tuition at the University of Ottawa with money she earned herself.

Unlike Charlotte - a young woman - Abeer explained to me that many of her participants are older, and therefore much more reluctant to learn English or French because they firmly believe they will eventually return home. This leaves children speaking Arabic at home and English or French elsewhere. Abeer believes this creates a distance between children and parents and allows children more leeway than is advisable for young adults. She explained;

“I tell parents, you need to learn the language [for your kids]. Sometimes you will hear your son say, “Hey, yeah yeah we’ll meet at the pub,” and whenever you ask your son where are you going? He will say “Oh, I’m going to the bib, bibliotheque” so ... the next day, you hear on the news a young man died ... and you never knew it was your son because you didn’t know he was there. They are free to do whatever they want, and when you don’t act responsibly, and in a new place, freedom [can be] dangerous. This is why I think parents should learn their language, understand what they say, meet their friends, see where they go, be involved. You can’t be involved if you can’t speak the language.” (author interview, August 2017)

While Abeer offers a dramatic example of what could occur when there is a disconnect between parents and children, it is nonetheless essential to speak the local language for a variety of reasons. Beiser and Hou (2000) argue that “the level of personal investment in remaining in a receiving country is an influential factor of resettlement” (314). It should be recognized that the continuation of speaking native languages is crucial to cultural preservation and heritage, therefore speaking a native language should continue (I.e. Salgado and Silva 2018). Regardless, Abeer maintains that if this language divide between parents and their children continue, significant issues will appear within

immigrant families in the future. Abeer also maintains there could be an issue of identity among children and young adults due to this division of language, stating;

“Kids are going to schools, and they start speaking French and English - mostly English [for the majority]. But the kids start speaking English between themselves, cousins, friends, and the parents speak Arabic at home. And when the kids are at home, parents are speaking to them in Arabic, and kids are answering in English. There is [broken] communication, and it is easier [for kids] to get away with things. Kids want to get rid of [their] accent; they want to integrate, to feel like everyone else.” (author interview, August 2017)

Abeer explained that in Lebanon, children are taught French in school before they are taught Lebanese, therefore the younger generation has already developed this dual identity. In Abeer’s experience, adults need to conclude themselves that they need to understand at least one of the official languages to advance within Canadian society. While many can find employment within the Arabic speaking community upon resettlement, there is little opportunity for growth, and if they want to be considered for higher up positions, they will need to speak at least one of the official languages.

Barrier #3: Mental Health

Finally, the last barrier many newcomers have to overcome is mental health issues and addressing any suffering experienced both before arrival and after resettlement. Refugees fleeing violence and war often show signs of post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD), which has become ‘normalized’ among refugee populations. Malkki (1995) does argue against this generalization though, cautioning people that, “we cannot assume psychological disorder or mental illness a priori, as an axiom, nor can we claim to know, from the mere fact of refugeeness, the actual sources of a person’s suffering” (510). Malkki (1995) argues that when trauma is assumed, refugees become “not just a mixed

category of people sharing a certain legal status; they become “a culture,” “an identity” (511). Regardless, the effects of past political trauma or violent displacement can significantly deter the ability for a newcomer to fully participate in the labour market. Han’s (2012) ethnography of neoliberal Chile, for example, demonstrates how past political violence affects people’s capacity to maintain consistent employment. What’s more, though it is assumed past suffering due to displacement is the sole source of trauma for refugees, mental health issues can also develop during resettlement.

Upon resettlement, refugees are also introduced to the North American perception of mental health that differs from other contexts in understanding causes and treatment of such issues. Malkki (1995) furthers this argument by commenting on the fact that displacement, in general, is a traumatic experience, and it would be ridiculous to assume that there are no psychological effects from such an experience (510). Malkki (1995) writes, “as Brik et al. have observed, ‘it is a generally accepted conclusion ... that refugees constitute a high-risk group as far as mental health is concerned, due to the mere fact that they have been forced to emigrate’ ... although many people might benefit from therapeutic interventions of psychiatry and psychology, [and] psychologizing modes of knowledge ... ” (509-510), it must be noted that these are the ways North America deals with mental illness, and can often constitute as a new form of care newcomers are unfamiliar with. An article published in the *New York Times* in 2010 titled “The Americanization of Mental Illness” explains that even though American classifications of mental illness might be more widespread and therefore common due to globalization, there remain vast differences in diagnosis and treatment depending on the country (Watters 2010).

When speaking to settlement workers about the employment process, many expressed that the road to finding fruitful employment is incredibly long and often tedious, and an experience newcomers are not prepared for, as many find themselves coming to Canada with the idea that jobs are plentiful. With employment being so intertwined with what it means to be a person today, lack of success in the job market can have a negative impact on the mental well-being, especially when a newcomer arrives in Canada possessing education and work experience that (in theory) should be easily transferred into the Canadian labour market. Harnois and Gabriel (2000) suggest that employment can provide five crucial 'psychological experiences' promoting mental well-being; "time structure, social contact, collective effort and purpose, social identity, and regular activity" (5). As a newcomer, these particular experiences are crucial when fostering a new sense of belonging in a host country. Harnois and Gabriel (2000) state;

"The workplace is one of the key environments that affect our mental well-being and health. There is an acknowledgement and growing awareness of the role of work promoting or hindering mental wellness and its corollary - mental illness. Although it is difficult to quantify the impact of work alone on personal identity, self-esteem, and social recognition, most mental health professionals agree that the workplace environment can have a significant impact on an individual's mental well-being." (Harnois and Gabriel 2000, 5)

Yuki, a settlement worker at OCISO with a graduate degree in social work and a background in working with marginalized populations, explained to me the desperation of clients who arrive in her office anxious to work but unable to secure employment. Being unable to financially provide for one's family when you are accustomed to doing so can make a person feel inadequate and foster a sense of hopelessness. Employment has also become integral to social connections, and lack thereof can foster a sense of isolation (i.e. Diechoff and Gash 2015). I experienced this first hand while volunteering at OCISO

when a man came in with his three small children. All were under the age of 12, but he had to bring them along as he had no one to babysit and he had an appointment to see a psychologist. As he was leaving, the counsellor he spoke to was attempting to soothe his anxieties by telling him 'it will work out, you will find a job, just keep doing what you are doing.' I remember thinking the man looked so worn-out and stressed. I asked the psychologist if this man was okay as he was leaving, and she explained he had been looking for employment for months but was struggling because his wife and newborn son were still in Syria. Because his wife was in the late stages of her pregnancy and unable to travel when his family had the opportunity to come to Canada, they decided to evacuate the other children in hopes that his wife and newborn son would be along shortly after. Unfortunately, she remained in Syria a year and a half later. The stress this man was under was palpable. Besteman (2017) speaks extensively of these sentiments among her interlocutors who were forced to leave loved ones behind for various reasons. She explains one participant was forced to decide whether or not to leave her eldest son behind in the refugee camp, as he was denied resettlement to the United States (93). While she chose to continue with her other children, she continues to live each day with feelings of guilt for leaving her son, hoping she made the right choice (ibid).

Based on research findings regarding stress in the lives of refugees, Bala (2005) found that many refugees felt haunted by the conditions they left behind, accompanied by feelings of anxiety due to family and friends remaining in potentially deadly conditions (177). This can result in "social isolation, unemployment, [and] marginalized status" (Ibid). I witnessed this first hand in my research, though it manifested differently - instead of social isolation, it was a motivation to work harder. Charlotte, having lived in a refugee

camp before arriving in Canada, had to leave siblings and her mother back in Malawi to pursue a university degree. Because of this, she is inspired to work harder every day, with the ultimate goal of being financially capable of one day bringing her family to Canada. During our interview when the subject of her family and growing up in a refugee camp was discussed, Charlotte understandably got emotional. I decided to pause the interview to give her a few minutes to collect herself, and once we continued, she told me that the conditions she left make her work harder during feelings of hopelessness;

“So, I can say it’s not easy ... but most of it keeps me motivated and hardworking [when] reflecting back on where I came from. I could compare the refugee life in the camp ... and the opportunities here, and I think, I am better than yesterday ... so I have to persevere until I have achieved every goal I have set. I look forward to sponsoring my family after getting established, so that also motivates me ... despite working nights and studying at the same time. I keep telling people that whatever step I am making in life, it’s inspiring me. It is a part of the process. So, despite how hard it is or how difficult it is ... I am not seeing myself yesterday, I am seeing myself today and tomorrow. And I am different from who I was yesterday.”
(author interview, August 2017)

Charlotte admirably displays the resilience required to resettle into a new country and to work towards overcoming issues that are structurally embedded in a new society.

Conclusion

This chapter was meant to shed light on the barriers faced by newcomers when entering the Canadian job market. Drawing from my ethnographic research and both the personal and professional experiences of my participants, I sought to show the various hardships faced when on their journey towards embodying the model refugee - that of financial independence. While these barriers are discussed on a more micro level, it is often the larger macro processes that end up determining a newcomer’s fate. From

language and cultural misunderstandings among individual newcomers to the lack of funding for programs and support or policy issues, there are many barriers newcomers must conquer. However, to understand micro barriers, there needs to be a greater understanding of the systemic issues in Canada and internationally, the issues that occur both in the lives of refugees as well as the native population. While refugees require specialized services due to their unique circumstances, many argue that the same struggles with finding employment are also present among Canada's native populations, and in general, people who are poor and lack resources needed for upward mobility. Hence, what I describe here are much bigger issues, which do not only affect immigration and refugees. They include things like food scarcity, mental illness, and poverty, as well as systemic racism and discrimination. These are accompanied by large-scale global trends, such as decreased employment opportunities due to a shifting job market and economic downturn, which affect anyone attempting to enter into the workforce, but especially impact minority populations such as refugees. This will be further explored in the following chapter.

During one interview, a participant was explaining to me how one of the hardest things for her to overcome was learning how to complete mundane tasks such as creating a budget and withdrawing money from the bank. She explained that in refugee camps, these are not things that need to be done or even need to be considered. It was something that was not spoken of before her arrival in Canada, though she maintains it is crucial to understand to excel in their new home. But like Charlotte, there seems to be an unbreakable sense of hope in each of my participants, regardless of the barriers they must overcome. This hope comes from simply considering the life they would be living

had they not come to Canada, a life with significantly fewer opportunities in all aspects of life. As Charlotte said, “I think if I were sitting in a refugee camp, I would not be graduating university. The fact that I have this opportunity to go to university, to get a degree and a diploma, to be able to make different connections and [acquire] all this knowledge, it is big progress which has given me hope that the future is bright.”

Along with feelings of hope, there is also the belief that all hardships must be temporary. One hopes that having multiple jobs to support oneself and family is a temporary condition, as is living in a low-income housing apartment made for two but being occupied by nine. In the same vein, one hopes that not being able to work immediately upon arrival due to lack of language skill is a temporary problem. It appears that it is within this sense of transition that the hope of a better and brighter future can grow, and this drives many towards the model refugee status and financial self-sufficiency.

Chapter 3 - The Deskilling of Immigrants

During an interview with a mentorship coordinator at OCISO, “Micaela” relayed a story about a former client, a middle-aged man who came into her office with over twenty-five years of experience in the medical field. As a respected and well-known surgeon in his home country, he was expecting to continue practicing medicine again once he settled in Canada. This assumption is common among newcomers who come to OCISO looking for work in professional or regulated fields. They believe there are many jobs and opportunities in Canada and they would be working in their respective fields in virtually no time. Unfortunately, this is rarely the case - especially in fields that are considered ‘regulated professions.’ Regulated professions are those that are overseen by governmental agencies and professional organizations which can validate that a person has the proper education and skills to work in that very profession.

The medical field, for example, is heavily regulated in Canada, which is why Micaela had to explain to her client that reentry into the field would be no quick and easy task, and it would likely be months if not years before he could begin practicing again. These types of encounters are difficult, Micaela explained, Canadian officials had told this man before arriving that Canada was desperate for doctors, and with his particular skill set he could quickly get a job. In reality, to even begin practicing medicine, he would be required to complete another three years of medical school, followed by a residency placement in a Canadian hospital. Not only is this long, but also an extremely costly procedure. After arriving in Canada as a refugee, Micaela’s client was unable to afford the process of having his credentials recognized and was understandably frustrated and angry. Micaela explained; “[he was] not happy, especially since they [the Canadian representatives overseas] told him that “you needed doctors... and that there are places in Canada that there are no doctors.” Yes, Michaela told him, he was correct. However, there are things that they can do that are related to the health profession in, let’s say, the far north, in the Yukon, in all that. It is a huge change - a change of perspective, values, practices, everything. In the end, Micaela explained that he did not want to take this route, as it would take too long, cost too much, and he was ‘too old’ to start over again. He simply wanted to work as soon as possible and was “desperate to gain a sense of normalcy again.”

Micaela also told me that mentorship coordinators work with clients to identify parallel or related fields that are unregulated, and therefore easier to access. This compromise allows clients to use prior knowledge and work experience to find a new job. In the case of this client, they looked at various medical fields such as health promotion and medical sales, where he could still apply his years of medical knowledge and practice, but not have to worry about going through the months of accreditation from various regulatory bodies. While this is the easier option of the two, this process still takes on average eight months before clients can find employment. Before this, they are matched with a mentor who has contacts within their chosen field that is meant to help them with their employment search. This has resulted in many clients leaving OCISO frustrated and feeling deflated, as many have worked hard for years to earn degrees and education, only to be told their hard work has no significance in Canada.

This newcomer did go on to find employment in a related field; he accepted his fate in order to achieve financial independence and to be able to fully participate in society. In doing so, he also revealed another, more troublesome aspect of being a “model refugee.” The man’s skills were devalued, and he was forced to instead take a job in a less prestigious, less gainful field despite being a qualified medical doctor. Ironically, Canada does, in fact, have a large shortage of medical doctors, and this man, in light of his advanced skills and experience, could have been a great asset. Instead, he has been effectively “de-skilled”: despite the work and sacrifice he has made to earn his academic achievements, he remains unable to reach the same status he occupied at home. This situation is especially difficult, as this specific client was told there would be plenty of positions and opportunities available. This reveals a different, more protectionist side of the Canadian labour market – which effectively discriminates against high-skilled newcomers who arrive in Canada through refugee resettlement programs.

Introduction

Newcomers immigrating to Canada often arrive after what can only be imagined as a tumultuous experience, only to find themselves confronted with another difficult journey ahead - having to have their prior work experience and education recognized to participate in the Canadian workforce. Many professional occupations in Canada are considered ‘regulated professions’ (i.e. medicine, engineering etc.), which refers to professions regulated by overarching provincial and/or federal bodies. These bodies regulate who can work in particular fields. Foreign credentials are defined as, “any formal education higher than a high school diploma, including professional or technical qualifications and any other degrees, diplomas, or certificates received outside of Canada” (Guo 2009, 40). Therefore, any degrees or education obtained outside of Canada are subjected to extensive evaluation; most credentials need to be assessed before participation in the workforce can begin. While Canada prides itself on being a country of immigrants, the government also places great importance on the use of a point system when newcomers apply for resettlement. This system views newcomers with prior skills and education as the most desirable candidates for resettlement, therefore receiving

the most points. Unfortunately, the credential transfer and recognition program in Canada is incredibly convoluted, and strongly contradicts the image Canada has for so long projected to the international community, while also rendering invalid and meaningless the use of a points system to determine resettlement candidacy. The debate surrounding international credential transfers and recognition has existed in Canada for decades, at one point being deemed the most controversial policy issue of the 20th century (Guo 2009, 38). Advocates of strict regulations of fields that deal directly with the public claim that these rules “protect the public interest with respect to health, safety, and welfare,” and argue that eliminating these restrictions could lead to serious overall consequences (Foster 2006, 301). By contrast, researchers critical of these policies have shown that newcomers in Canada generally arrive and begin participating in the workforce in “low earnings [positions] after settlement, a job that typically represents a sharp drop in skill requirements, status, and pay from the kind of work done before migrating” (McCoy and Masuch 2007, 186).

During my fieldwork, credential recognition proved to be a prominent issue and topic of conversation, particularly among service providers, who themselves fully embody the characteristics of the model refugee. Since many previously arrived in Canada with degrees in what are considered regulated professions, many newcomers chose not to have their education (re)evaluated. Instead, they chose to participate in unregulated professions such as the field of settlement work. Upon further observation, I also found that resettlement services tended to recommend this course of action to most refugees, as this is the path of least resistance when it comes to entering the Canadian workforce. Though entry into adjacent professions is still a slow process, it is faster than waiting to

have credentials assessed (and potentially denied). Because there is no guarantee that past experiences will be recognized or past education accepted, in some cases, newcomers have received inconsistent results as they are required to submit documentation to different regulatory bodies - i.e. accepted by one regulator, yet rejected by another (Guo 2009, 42). Further analysis proved that there appeared to be three common ways services providers with whom I spoke navigated the issue of regulated professions in Canada. These are: i) choosing to work in settlement services and utilizing personal experience over professional expertise, ii) returning to school to earn accreditation at a Canadian institution, or iii) choosing to work in a parallel or related field that is unregulated. While none of these options compensate for the loss of status and invalidation of credentials earned in the past, they do allow for faster access to the Canadian workforce and speed up “self-sufficiency.” In what follows, I offer some contextual information on the deskilling of immigrants in Canada by exploring in detail the three most common ways my research participants have chosen to negotiate the path towards entrance into the workplace.

The Canadian Context

While Canada prides itself on its inclusiveness and multiculturalism, some of its actual policies toward newcomers erode this image. To immigrate to Canada, candidates are put through an extensive vetting process that places those with professional skills and educational backgrounds at the top of the list of desirable candidates for resettlement. This is done through the use of a point system based on the notion that those in possession of advanced skills will directly boost the Canadian economy. Even though

Canada's current Liberal government pledged to increase the number of refugees accepted for resettlement during what was dubbed the "Syrian refugee crisis," its policies favour as candidates for resettlement those who possess the best potential to contribute to Canada's economic prosperity. During the 19th and 20th centuries, Canadian immigration policy was discriminatory and restrictive, placing focus on accepting those of European descent as they were seen to have the best chance at assimilating. This was accompanied by a global increase in mass displacement, and the substantial pressure placed on the Canadian state by international bodies to commit to the settlement of a larger number of people, eventually led to a change in immigration policy. In the context of continued economic growth, there was also a need for more labourers – these shifts resulted in expansion of the immigration policy and the implementation of the points system that made it more possible to come to Canada from the "Third world" - primarily Africa, Asia and Latin America (Guo 2009, 39). Further cementing the hierarchy among potential immigrants, more points were assigned to advanced education and professional skills than those assigned to refugees and asylum seekers (Ibid). Unfortunately, no office or governmental agency was created to regulate and ensure these skilled immigrants would be able to work upon arrival, and due to workplace racism and the devaluation of international education, many struggled to find employers who were willing to hire foreign workers. What's more, since many immigrants had backgrounds in what are considered regulated professions, many newcomers found themselves in a type of purgatory - having acquired all the necessary paperwork, yet lacking opportunities.

Five key organizations were created in various provinces across Canada (British Columbia, Alberta, Manitoba, Ontario, and Quebec) that later amalgamated into what is

currently the *Alliance of Credential Evaluation Service of Canada* (ACESC) (Guo 2009, 41). This organization was created as an attempt to bring provincial regulatory bodies together with more cohesive regulations, as well as offer support to smaller regulatory bodies who might not possess the resources to calculate equivalency (Guo 2009, 42). There are currently two other organizations directly affiliated with the Canadian government that facilitate credential recognition and evaluation processes: *The Canadian Information Centre for International Credentials* (CICIC), established in 1990 as a database for those seeking credential recognition or information on the recognition process prior to arrival, and the *Foreign Credential Referral Office*, established in 2007 directly under the Minister of Immigration as a way to monitor pre-arrival services and support the assessment process prior to resettlement. These organizations are the most notable in recognizing international credentials, though there remain smaller recognition organizations throughout the Canadian provinces. Regardless, the recognition process remains incredibly difficult, and even after recognition is successful, newcomers are not guaranteed employment in their field.

Because these restrictions solely pertain to regulated professions, many newcomers are forced to accept positions beneath their educational level – a process better known as ‘deskilling the immigrant’ or ‘credentialism.’ The process of deskilling has been officially defined as a situation where “immigrants whose foreign education and credentials are not recognized in Canada...lose access to the occupations they previously held” (Bauder 2003, 702). While this deskilling is not only demoralizing, it ultimately restricts newcomers who have worked hard to obtain the credentials they possess from accessing the most highly paid and prestigious industries. Deskilling leads

to downward mobility, and sometimes restricts the ability of newcomers to fully participate in society. It also puts newcomers at risk of unemployment, decreases available opportunities, and significantly reduces future earnings (Guo 2009, 48). Andersson and Guo (2009) go as far as to argue that even though these assessment and evaluation tools are meant to facilitate entrance into the Canadian workforce and to ensure participants possess all required training and knowledge of safety measures, they actually pose the most “serious barrier to adult learning” and can further prevent workplace integration of professionally educated newcomers (4).

Some scholars have argued that these regulations are a form of systemic racism, which creates a hierarchy among those who have a high-educational background that favours degrees earned in North America above diplomas earned elsewhere. As Türegün (2013) argues, “credentialism can thus be seen as a form of exclusionary closure designed to control and monitor entry to key positions in the division of labour” and that these “mechanisms [are] covering discrimination against the foreign-trained who belong to a racial minority group” (599/600). Bauder (2003) agrees, arguing that “professional associations and the state actively exclude immigrant labour from the most highly desired occupations in order to reserve these occupations for Canadian-born and Canadian-educated workers” (699). This argument is taken further by Foster (2006), who argues that these barriers are “segmented along colour lines ... [as] new immigrants are from developing countries and are people of colour ... [and] are [often] better educated than native-born Canadians, yet they’re having a tougher time finding the work they’re trained to do” (285). Foster (2006) also argues that many employers are hesitant to hire potential employees who hold international education due to a lack of familiarity with foreign

degrees, as it is believed there are too many potential risks that come with hiring people with foreign experience (299). These forms of credentialism appear by and large to affect those occupying the ethnic minority category, thereby completely refuting Canada's claim to general acceptance. Therefore, these issues are not simply immigration issues but deeply ingrained, systemic issues that directly dissuade newcomer participation and impede any efforts to embody the qualities of the model citizen.

Girard and Bauder (2007) found in their investigation of engineering regulatory bodies in Ontario that "the tendency of Canadian regulatory organizations to valorize Canadian credentials over foreign degrees suggests that these organizations seek to reproduce their own membership of Canadian-born and educated professionals by excluding foreign-trained immigrants" (38). These findings lead me to two significant conclusions. First, if regulatory bodies are protectionist and make receiving recognition of foreign credentials difficult, newcomers are from the start discouraged from entering the Canadian workforce. Secondly, the actions of regulatory bodies offer Canadian employers a valid excuse not to hire anyone with foreign training - they can argue that if regulatory bodies are not accepting of foreign credentials, why should they be open to hiring them? This creates a substantive barrier that newcomers must overcome, resulting in an inability to access opportunities and turn themselves into financially independent subjects. This constant marginalization of newcomers from essential spaces means that refugees are at risk for further marginalization.

In a study conducted by Ferrer and Riddell (2008) regarding "how the human capital of immigrants is rewarded in Canada's labour market," the researchers found that "immigrants from the US/UK and the native-born receive similar returns ... however,

immigrants from other regions generally experience lower returns [after] years of schooling” (214). Li (2001) offers similar findings, stating that the lack of recognition of foreign credentials in Canada is due to foreign earned credentials having a “lower market value” compared to credentials acquired in Canada (23). While both claims that lack of credential recognition is difficult due to discriminatory practices of giving preference to those educated in the ‘global north’ or to those with experience in the Canadian labour market, Li (2001) believes it is impossible to identify specific reasons why newcomers are disadvantaged. Due to the many other factors that could influence a newcomer’s inability to find employment (i.e. racism, language etc.), it is nearly impossible to deduce which (ibid, 25). Each factor can then contribute to difficulty becoming what is considered a desirable citizen. Türegün (2013) calls this “aversive racism — how “individuals with prejudice against racial minority immigrants have recourse to non-prejudice justifications - such as ... lack of Canadian work experience” (600).

Türegün (2013) argues in his article “Rebuilding Professional Lives: Immigrant Professionals Working in the Ontario Settlement Service Sector,” that there are three options available to newcomers who chose to forego credential recognition: “exit, deprofessionalization, and professional rebuilding” (600). Within the context of my fieldwork, I found each applicable to my participants’ experiences. Though all choose new fields where previous skills could be applied, many choose settlement services as both ‘a new adventure’ upon resettlement in Canada, accompanied by the desire to choose the path that appeared to offer the best opportunity to enter the workforce quickly, corresponding to the acute need to earn a wage. Hence, these represent an instance of professional rebuilding, the third of Türegün’s (2013) categories. The following sections

examine the three ways my participants avoided credential recognition and overcame protectionist regulations by choosing not to have their advanced education evaluated.

Entering into Settlement Services

“Amir” - a young man who arrived in Canada from Syria roughly two years ago - has a background in engineering and management consultation. He chose to enter into settlement services as he did not feel it necessary to be recognized as an engineer. When he came to OCISO as a client looking to enter the workforce, the RAISE program was being newly implemented and was looking to hire someone to facilitate the program. When he realized he was eligible for this opportunity, he decided to apply right away - even though it has nothing to do with his engineering background (a field where he worked for ten years). He stated;

“I came to OCISO as a client when they offered me the opportunity to apply, and ... it happened [to be] a good match. In the beginning ... it [gave me] exposure to the market, it is a good cause, and it's not really far away from what I have been doing. So yeah, it's really good, but obviously, I applied for other jobs. I wouldn't have thought to apply for a non-profit because all my experience was with corporate, and business really. I haven't worked in non-profit before, so it is a good experience to even learn how the not-for-profit works. If you want to work in business you don't really need to be called an engineer because, the only reason that maybe you want to be pursuing the engineer [title], let's say, because you want to be recognized as an engineer, and I don't necessarily need to be recognized as an engineer.” (author interview, July 2017)

I remember leaving the interview with Amir and his co-worker “Jahara,” and feeling angry on Amir's behalf. After spending years earning a degree in engineering and working in a primarily English environment, Amir has not been given credit for the many hours put into earning his degree. While he considers himself lucky to have experience in a managerial position before his displacement that allowed him to transition into his current

position with the RAISE program quite easily, he also knows it would have been an incredibly long process had he chosen to have his engineering credentials evaluated and recognized in Canada.

The case of Amir's coworker, Jahara, who is originally from Lebanon and is now a permanent resident (PR) working on her Ph.D. at the University of Ottawa, is a bit different. Jahara started working at OCISO in a volunteer capacity, using her knowledge of the Arabic language to offer translation services. Only later did she apply to work with the RAISE program when the position became available. When I asked her about her experience with obtaining degree equivalency, she explained she did not require any assessment as she arrived first as an international student, and to be accepted to the Ph.D. program her degrees had to be verified by the university and not the Canadian government. She did, however, complete the equivalency for her own records - as this information will be required when she goes to apply for citizenship, which she eventually plans to do. Unfortunately, she found her previous degrees to be devalued, as her Bachelor of Arts completed in Lebanon over four years was equivalent to only three years of schooling in Canada. She explained this devaluation was not a big deal to her, as it will not create a barrier for her upon entering the workforce in the future - she would like to work in settlement services once she completes her Ph.D., and will do so with Canadian experience and a Canadian degree.

Over the past few decades, neoliberal restructuring has had a profound effect on how labour is both conceived of and made to work. In an increasingly globalized economy, production has shifted towards "greater specialization." This means that companies have begun producing fewer products to specialize in the production of particular goods

(Bowles 2010, 15). While this has led to a reduction in competition among manufacturers and essentially guaranteed business, it has also led to greater income inequality among unskilled workers in industrialized countries. As manufacturing plants have moved production to developing countries due to significantly lower labour costs that allow companies to save production costs, this has led to a reduction in positions available to unskilled workers. This has created competition among unskilled labourers in both developing and developed countries, resulting in a significant loss of jobs that have either been offshored or disappeared completely in developed nations (Ibid). Despite the relative availability of certain kinds of jobs, developing countries remain ripe with exploitation, with workers receiving little pay and being forced to work in unsafe conditions that are the result of measures meant to lower production costs.

Global capital has seen positive outcomes as well, as it has allowed certain classes of labourers to move more freely across borders. This has become standard practice in Canada as employment has become more difficult to secure, and many Canadians over the past five years have migrated West to Edmonton and Calgary to work in oil and gas production (I.e. Klinkenberg 2017). According to Statistics Canada's (2018) latest data release, Canada lost 88,000 jobs in January 2018, with unemployment up to 5.9% (1). In Ontario alone, employment declined by 51,000 jobs, "entirely due to losses in part-time work" (Ibid, 2). This has also reflected positively in union membership. As Durrenberger (2017) states, "the disintegration of stable employment into transitory contractual relationships" internationally has created a space for unions to function in a more "global setting," allowing workers to communicate and coordinate across industries and demand better working conditions internationally (17). This lack of opportunity often significantly

affects marginalized populations as they most commonly occupy non-skilled or partially skilled positions, therefore existing as one of the most significant barriers to reaching the model refugee status. While the concept of the model refugee offers a fictional being that represents the ultimate goal of newcomers, by entering and succeeding in a career in settlement services, newcomers are unofficially having their past experiences and knowledge recognized and validated. If people with these experiences and unique knowledge did not exist, Canada would be unable to offer the particular services required for newcomer integration, and the model refugee status would be inaccessible.

My interlocutors who chose to enter into settlement services and neglect previously earned education or training, also felt they had been presented the opportunity to use their personal experiences to help those in similar situations. Reyna explained she found herself “hooked” on working in settlement services because many of the clients she was encountering “reflected [her] suffering and [her] experience,” which encouraged her to continue in the field. Jahara offered similar sentiments, as she works in settlement services “for a good cause, not for applause,” specifically;

“You are ... using your own background, being an Arabic speaker ... using the fact that you are an immigrant yourself. You know the process, you know the challenges, you know how [difficult] this process can be, and how to just do research and find solutions for what you and they are going through. It’s a great cause. And it is really nice to hear when people appreciate the little things, like even telling them that a specific service exists, or even just that you understand and can really sympathize.” (author interview, August 2017).

Even though international education is not equivalent to the same human capital as Canadian education, many employers are skeptical about hiring potential employees who have not received education locally. In the field of settlement services, these newcomers have lived through experiences that many Canadians cannot even begin to

fathom, and therefore are worth more in terms of human capital than native Canadians with Canadian credentials, making hiring newcomers in this field the more logical decision. Though regardless of whether my interlocutors forewent certification recognition, they were able to take charge of their professional futures by honing in on skills and experiences from their past, even though it was not officially recognized by the Canadian workforce, instead of being left at the mercy of the official processes of degree verification. Based on this discussion, it appears the deskilling of newcomers is actually a form of integration into the labour market by the government apparatus. When a newcomer can adjust both themselves and their skills to fit into the labour market, which often includes reducing their abilities and expectations of potential work, they are in fact embodying the core characteristics of the model refugee.

Re-Education

Re-education was the next path chosen to bypass official assessment and recognition. According to one of the latest Statistics Canada census reports (2017b), roughly 31.5% of refugees who went on to become permanent residents “upgraded their educational credentials after arriving” (1). Upon applying for resettlement in Canada, many newcomers with high levels of education are admitted in the ‘skilled worker’ category, as they are seen as an economic asset rather than a burden to their host nation. Though as was the case in the most recent migration, skilled newcomers were placed in the refugee category and not the skilled worker category. Unfortunately, once they arrive, “immigrants are compelled to ‘Canadianise’ their education in order to regain a foothold in the labour market” (Ng and Shan 2010, 176). Until then, they find themselves “stripped

of the right to practice ... until they satisfy the credential requirements in Canada,” resulting in re-education (Ibid). Ng and Shan (2010) argue that re-education - or “lifelong learning” - is crucial to surviving in a capitalist economy, and that “Canada must continually renew and upgrade the skills of its workforce” to remain competitive, even if this requires the devaluing of newcomer credentials (169).

In light of her first job-seeking experience with an employment centre following the end of financial support from the scholarship program which sponsored Charlotte to come to Canada, Charlotte found herself face to face with a service provider who actually discouraged her from continuing her education in a university setting. Charlotte was roughly half-way through her Bachelor of Social Science degree, which would enable her to become a social worker when she went looking for a local employment service that could help improve her resume. As she had never applied for a job in Canada before, she wanted to ensure her resume was in the correct format before submitting it to potential employers. She explained:

“I remember when I was being assisted [with my] CV, I told one of the employment consultants, she asked me ‘you are going to a university?’ I said yes, she said ‘so why can’t you go to a college [instead]? You are wasting your time going to university, you don’t need a university degree, you can go to college, technical is better, don’t waste your time.’ I remember being so offended. I was looking forward [to] her fixing my resume and helping me get a job, whatever job I could apply for, and then she actually started criticizing me. Then she was like, ‘no I can’t find a job for you. I will give you a website where you can find a job for yourself, I [only] help you work on your resume. Not apply, that will be like mothering.’ I was shocked!” (author interview, August 2017)

While this experience was demoralizing for Charlotte, she went on to find a different employment service where she “met a nice lady [who] worked on my resume, and then

in the same week helped me submit several job applications. I got two invitations for job interviews from two [different] employers, and they hired me immediately!”

Unlike Charlotte who arrived in Canada shortly after graduating high school, many newcomers arrive in Canada hoping to continue working in the field in which they left. Among my interlocutors, three of seven choose to return to school to acquire a degree from a Canadian institution to remain in a field similar to the one they occupied prior to displacement. Many choose this route by default as they lacked the Canadian experience employers require. The majority of employment opportunities available today require a minimum amount of Canadian work experience before an employer will even consider hiring an applicant. Because of this, newcomers are limited to what they are eligible to apply for. In some cases, newcomers have years of experience in a particular field, but because it is experience earned outside of Canada, it is not the ‘right kind’ of experience and therefore carries no weight. Foster (2006) argues this is a never-ending circle is a “catch-22” that continues to put newcomers at a disadvantage, stating “within Canadian experience, many cannot get certified even with extensive training; without a certificate, they cannot get the experience to secure employment or peer acceptance” (299), going as far as to argue that “Canadian experience is most likely used as a euphemism for racism” (298).

In the case of “Abeer” - who obtained a teaching degree in Lebanon - she explained she chose to go back to school after arriving in Canada because she wanted to continue teaching. She explained that in Lebanon are able to teach in schools with a four-year bachelor’s degree, which she completed with a major in French literature. She had been working as a teacher for three years prior to arriving in Canada. Once here, she found

that her diploma from Lebanon was recognized as a three-year Bachelor of Arts degree in Canada and that in order to continue teaching she would have to return to school and get her Bachelor of Education followed by multiple practicum positions. To afford to return to university, Abeer secured a full-time administrative position while becoming a part-time student. On average, a Bachelor of Education takes students two years to complete - it took Abeer seven on a part-time basis while working full-time. She explained to me that she believes she was “lucky” because the administrative job she secured was very supportive of her education and allowed her to take leaves of absences in order to complete her practicum requirements. She also believed she was lucky because of the career path she chose. With her previous degree obtained in French, it was relatively easy for credentials to be recognized in Canada - even though it was not exactly equivalent to the degree she obtained in Lebanon. She explained, “as long as it is recognized as a bachelor [degree], it did not matter to me the years.” The issue here is the blatant devaluation of the hard work that was put into completing this degree, only because it was obtained outside of Canada.

After graduating, Abeer had begun teaching when the French-Catholic School Board approached her about a position as a community liaison with the newly arrived Syrian refugee population;

“I was teaching in September 2015 when suddenly the big rush of Syrians arrived ... the French Catholic School Board hired me as Agent Relations Communautaire, so community work with Syrian refugees arriving. Because I speak Arabic, French and, English, and I come from that side of the world, so I know a little bit of them. My mom is Syrian, and my dad is Lebanese - so I am very familiar with the culture. So, from January 2016 until August 2016, I worked with the Syrians. Whenever a family arrived, I used to help them in all fields - food, clothing, school - everything.” (author interview, July 2017)

Currently, Abeer is responsible for a program dual-funded by La Cité College and the French Catholic School Board that supports refugees in starting their own business in Canada. This program supports its clients through all stages of the process, from making a business plan to applying for funding. She believes that while this is different in form, it is still teaching, as she is helping teach newcomers the intricacies of Canadian business regulations and how to thrive in their new home, both by sharing own experience and knowledge. In many cases, her clients are entrepreneurs and business people in their home country and wish to start similar businesses in Canada. However, because the regulations are so strict and the industries so vastly different, many are unaware of where to begin.

When newcomers choose to go to gain Canadian accreditation by returning to the classroom, a type of resocialization occurs, as the classroom serves as a place for newcomers to interact with and later enact the expectations defined in policies meant to shape them into the type of citizens Canadian employers want to hire. According to settlement workers, deferring entrance into the workplace for re-education has multiple benefits, and is often encouraged when newcomers arrive looking for guidance. First, it allows newcomers to gain educational credits that employers are familiar with and more willing to hire. Much like the workplace, educational institutions serve as a place for people to network with others already working in the field, as well as other newcomers. It also offers a space for newcomers to observe both social conventions and implicit norms while allowing newcomers to participate within greater society and make connections (Korte 2007, 1).

I recently experienced this role of educational spaces firsthand while volunteering. An OCISO employee recounted a story from the time when she worked as an ESL (English as a Second Language) teacher. She explained that one day after class, one of her students asked her why Canadians are so keen to talk about the weather when they greet each other. She explained that the weather acted as a safe way to start a conversation with a stranger, while both parties get familiar with the other. She explained that the student was fascinated by this, as it was so different from how strangers interacted at home. Without participating in this particular class, the knowledge of how Canadians initiate conversation with strangers would have gone unnoticed, showing the classroom acts as a space of resocialization of newcomers.

The previous example of an informal discussion in the classroom is crucial to the resocialization of newcomers into the Canadian labour market, though also problematic. I am arguing that choosing to return to education in Canada offers extensive benefits to both newcomers, employers and the Canadian state alike. It also acts as a racist barrier and an accepted form of discrimination that prevents highly educated newcomers from participating in the workplace. Some argue this inadvertent forcing of newcomers to return to school as a last resort is “systemic racism targeting minorities,” enacting protectionist values and creating a hierarchy among educational systems that place North American and European institutions above education obtain elsewhere (Türegün 2013, 600). Canadian governments have spent decades encouraging migration into Canada in order to keep pace with economic growth as well as remain internationally competitive, but the message that is sent to newcomer populations when governments are essentially forcing newcomers to return to school in order to be taken seriously in the job market. This does

not mesh with the multicultural message of ‘welcome to our country.’ In reality, it leaves the impression that Canada does not value the skills of ‘skilled workers’ and that international education is unworthy of recognition. With many predicting that immigration into Canada will not slow down anytime soon, not having a productive and cohesive recognition program could begin to deter migration into Canada resulting in catastrophic side effects for the Canadian economy (I.e. Harris, Hall and Zimonjic 2017; Smith and Katem 2018).

Entering a Parallel (Unregulated) Field

While some have chosen to begin a career in settlement work, and others have chosen re-education, others have chosen a third option: to enter into an unregulated profession. As a mentorship coordinator, Micaela explained she encourages newcomers to look into unregulated professions, as it allows newcomers to gain sought-after experience in the Canadian workplace. Reitz et al. (2014) argue that lacking Canadian experience is one of the most considerable barriers educated newcomers must overcome because many employers feel international experience is inferior to experience earned in the Canadian context and therefore do not trust skills and training earned internationally (5). Entering into an unregulated profession appeared to offer a way for newcomers to avoid re-education, but in reality, both options often go hand in hand. Finding employment in a regulated profession is no easy feat due to the current condition of the labour market; it remains difficult for anyone to enter the workforce let alone a newcomer unfamiliar with the Canadian labour market.

Newcomers often arrive in Canada with the hopes of continuing to work in the same field they previously worked. My data shows that many newcomers choose to enter into unregulated fields that are similar to the regulated professions in which they are educated – and that step is often encouraged by settlement workers who urge newcomers to apply to what is considered ‘entry-level positions’ in unregulated fields. Unregulated professions not only solve the problem of credential assessment; they are, in general, more accessible and allow faster entrance into the workplace. These professions often do not require any particular education or certification for employment, making it easier to find a job regardless of previous experience (or lack thereof). Like the vignette offered at the beginning of this chapter, this path allows newcomers to continue using their acquired skills while avoiding regulatory bodies and reducing the amount of time spent searching for employment. This was the path chosen by Reyna, who arrived in Canada with a teaching degree acquired in Lebanon. Unfortunately, her teaching credentials were not valid to continue teaching in Canada, and in order to continue in this line of work, she would be required to return to school.

She explained to me she was unable to do this as she was not in a financial position to afford tuition. This resulted in her seeking out an employment agency that recommended she use her skills in another way. This strategy led to her finding a job as a multicultural liaison officer (MLO). The opportunity to work as an MLO was appealing to Reyna because it allowed her to remain in the classroom, as teaching is (and remains to be) her life’s passion. Since she was unable to go back to school when she arrived, it allowed her to earn an income while still working in an area with which she was familiar. She was also able to activate her social knowledge stemming from her experience as a

refugee twice over to connect with those entering the Ontario school system. The path Reyna chose allows newcomers to internalize the values the Canadian state believes to be crucial for citizens to possess, allowing Reyna to become the physical embodiment of the figurative model refugee.

She explained;

“So, what happened was I came, and I went to an organization called World Skills and got this job through them. I saw the advertisement and applied, but the main attraction for me was [working at] schools... So, I was a kind of a guide for newcomers and [acted as a] liaison between newcomers, staff, and the administration ... I started helping people and getting involved with all of the crisis issues ... I was doing presentations and educating newcomers and empowering them and helping them to integrate into the community. That definitely helped me find a sense of belonging [in Canada].” (author interview, July 2017)

Not only did she enter into the workplace and begin earning a living wage as an MLO, but she was also using her personal and professional experience to act as a guide to other newcomers, all while avoiding the lengthy process of certification and re-education.

Whether a newcomer chooses or is forced into an unregulated profession before obtaining recognized qualifications to enter regulated fields, this option offers both creates and resolves barriers to entering the Canadian workforce. By choosing to enter the workforce instead of staying home and waiting for a positive accreditation assessment from one or more bodies, newcomers are embodying many of the values and actions that the Canadian state encourages among refugees and newcomers. As entering unregulated professions offers a smoother transition into the workforce and therefore towards integration, this option is the most attractive option for both settlement workers and government apparatus as well.

Translating Experience into the Canadian Market

Though choosing the re-education path remains the most attractive to almost all parties involved, it is not without its controversies, oppositions, and even barriers faced by newcomers attempting to find entry-level positions in unregulated professions. According to Micaela, a common issue her clients have faced when looking for employment in Canada is figuring out which skills are transferable to the Canadian labour market, and which skills are unnecessary to put on their Canadian resume. As Micaela explained to me, internationally trained individuals often offer a vast range of experience, and it is her job to figure out how to tailor a resume to best suit a Canadian employer and the specific position they are hoping to secure;

“The job titles involve a huge array of tasks. In Canada, we tend to be much more specialized. So, if you are working in human resources ... you’re working in pension and benefits, or payroll - that’s one thing. You’re working in performance management, that’s another thing. Working in talent management, that’s another thing. So, people who are used to being generalized have all kinds of things they can do. We have to try and get them to focus on the areas that they’re really good at, and what are the [jobs] that [they] would want to do.” (author interview, September 2017)

McCory and Masuch (2007) found that many fields internationally are “so broad, with so many job titles and types of companies... it requires ... research and first-hand experience to figure out ... how previously held job titles and responsibilities map onto Canadian ones” (200). They refer to these particular barriers as “the glass wall” because of their informal nature; such barriers are often going unnoticed as it is not often thought that a newcomer will have too many skills to work with (190). In practice, the glass wall refers to newcomers choosing to accept an entry-level position, even though they are aware they are “taking a few steps backward in order to go forward again” (McCory and

Masuch 2007, 191). Many newcomers, in turn, are forced to accept menial positions, such as “retail sales, food services, or cleaning,” due to a desperation to earn a wage (McCory and Masuch 2007, 192). This leads to a significant drop in status compared to lives they led in their home countries and is an especially frequent phenomenon among newcomers who are waiting (and hoping) for the successful evaluation of their credentials (Banerjee and Phan 2014, 306). Banerjee and Phan (2014) also found that when immigrants who do chose to obtain certification but struggle to find a position in regulated fields not only find themselves accepting any menial position to support their families, but “are unable to close the gap over time relative to their counterparts in unregulated occupations through promotions and job change” (306).

Conclusion

This chapter shows how despite Canada’s claim to be welcoming of newcomers, the reality faced by recently arrived job-seekers is often bleak. Many find themselves forced to confront multiple barriers before they are considered a desirable potential employee, and are recognized by the Canadian employers as such. Being unable to utilize hard-earned education credentials, as has been previously shown, can be a frustrating and demoralizing process, and the Canadian administration has not made the process any easier. The deskilling of immigrants is a wide scale problem. While these are micro-level effects, it is the on the macro level that immigration policies need to be addressed and reconfigured to begin to remedy this issue. Using the excuse of unfamiliarity with international credentials by Canadian employers was frequently referred in literature, as a way to explain why they were hesitant to hire newcomers with foreign

credentials without being accused of discriminatory practice. Having a more comprehensive immigration policy that directly addresses credential recognition and begins to value international education could help to begin collecting systemic racism in Canada. Though this is a considerable feat, and one that is ingrained in Canadian society, without more progressive policies, newcomers will continue to struggle to enter the workforce.

As has been argued in the previous sections, entrance into the workforce is crucial to the integration process and the development of desirable and “hireable” citizens. The choice to enter into a career in settlement services is beneficial to both the Canadian state and newcomers as settlements services are crucial in a society that boasts increased immigration levels. Therefore, remaining within one's ethnic community ultimately contradicts the definition of integration encouraged by the Canadian state, and the programs in place to encourage integration into greater society. Newcomers therefore sometimes have the opportunity to use their own lived experiences as a means of securing employment in the resettlement apparatus by becoming services providers themselves. Known as “affective labour,” this type of work focuses not only on economic ends but is also meant to affect the emotional aspects of one's life. According to Muehlebach (2011), affective labour in Italy has led to a creation of a new form of citizenship, what she is calling a “citizenship of the heart” (61). This type of labour is most often used to describe work that capitalism once considered “non-work” (i.e. work in the domestic sphere) (60). Muehlebach (2011) explains that “the very citizens summoned into the affective labour regime are in fact newly dispossessed. Their labour is enabled by the privileges of good feeling while simultaneously being grounded in a logic of despair”

(68). As the service providers I spoke with have chosen their career path based on a sense of camaraderie with other newcomers and a desire to help those like them, they were able to make a career out of a feeling or an emotion. These feelings led them to become a cog in the resettlement apparatus, in the hopes of reproducing the process that led them to where they are today. While these emotions have allowed newcomers to enter into the workforce in a way that is welcomed by the Canadian government apparatus, it has limited newcomers from participating to the fullest extent of their abilities due to both policy restrictions and prejudice against international credentials. Settlement workers offer unique services that profoundly and positively affect Canadian society, and without these services, the Canadian welfare state would be even more strained than it already is.

Assuming that international credentials are not as worthy as credentials obtained in North America or Europe deprives the economy of potential growth. If Canada continues to place such importance on resettling newcomers in the skilled workers category, who are accepted for resettlement in Canada based on the points earned in exchange for the education and their transferable skills, or in general accepting newcomers with higher levels of education, more services need to be available to ensure they can capitalize on these skills upon arrival. The absence of these services and policies ensure they will be unable to fulfill the expectations set by the Canadian state apparatus, Canadian employers and the labour market upon acceptance for resettlement. Having employment has become ingrained in our definition of what it means to be a person, and what it means to be a true member of a nation-state (i.e. Ferguson 2015). It also deprives the Canadian state of skilled labours, who arrive in Canada hoping to contribute to the

economy as a skilled worker. It is pointless to facilitate the resettlement of people who possess a higher level of education and experience without the infrastructure in place to ensure successful outcomes that lead to the employment of the intended population. Focusing on the acceptance of educated newcomers sets the precedent that newcomers in this category are guaranteed support to find employment when in reality, many are unable to get recognition and end up choosing re-education to gain entry into the workplace.

Conclusion

This thesis is based on ethnographic fieldwork conducted in the summer of 2017, which sought to shed light on the intricacies of both settlement and employment services, and the ways these services seek to transform newcomers into working, financially independent citizens. To make sense of this process, I introduced the concept of the “model refugee” – a set of characteristics that newcomers are supposed to embody, including a desire for self-sufficiency, financial independence, and a willingness to adapt to a new context, even if that means deskilling or downward mobility. This model refugee is meant to express feelings of gratitude being welcomed into a new country, as this act is often thought of as an “act of compassion,” creating a sense of obligation to those who helped, instead of “a gift to be given by those in safe countries” with no strings attached (CBC Radio 2017). This thesis has argued that particular forces are in place to shape newcomer resettlement, leading to the personification of the model refugee through accessing employment services. By focusing on employment services, I was able to observe a space where newcomers can begin embodying these desired ideals, as set out by the Canadian state and the multiplicity of regulatory bodies responsible for resettlement. The need to earn a wage has become crucial to existing in a capitalist society such as Canada. Therefore, the perspective of employment services offers a fresh look at the intricate processes of subject formation.

Even though Canada is considered a welcoming place for all newcomers, racist and discriminatory policies have existed for decades, and have become ingrained in Canadian society. Because of Canada’s reputation as an immigrant (or settler) society, it is easy to assume that when immigrants arrive the resettlement process is simple. In

reality, these processes are complicated, and opportunities are not given freely. Upon arrival, newcomers are expected to use the first year of their resettlement not only to settle but to begin repaying the Canadian state for graciously resettling them. This is done by fully embodying the characteristics most desired and reaching the model refugee status. Unfortunately, reaching this status is no easy feat, and can take many years before a newcomer reaches a place where they are seen as entirely self-sufficient and 'successfully integrated.' Being offered refugee status requires subjects to forget their former selves and accept a level of downward mobility and deskilling, in order to successfully transition into a member of a minority community in the Canadian context. As has been argued, the workplace is a beneficial space for this to occur, as it offers the opportunity to achieve self-sufficiency through wage labour and social connections to grow.

The processes that occur and are responsible for facilitating subject formation (that I have focused on here) are deeply ingrained in the workplace. Entrance into the labour market has become much more difficult for all citizens, and due to the integral role of the workplace in the development of the model refugee, many newcomers find themselves in a state of precariousness while attempting to reach the model refugee status. Therefore, having access to employment services, in a minor way, might help to facilitate entrance, but there remains a lack of available positions and a systematic devaluation of newcomer credentials. Unfortunately, these problems are systemic issues with no simple solution.

These processes have not been the sole responsibility of the Canadian state for quite some time, and with such a significant - and growing - population to serve, the Canadian state apparatus has dispersed much of the responsibility of resettlement and

settlement services to both local and international organizations to make services more readily available. Because of the division of responsibilities, newcomers are constantly subject to conditioning meant to produce the ideal citizen. They are often lengthy and expensive affairs, at times appearing abrasive and unwelcoming, or even micromanaging (I.e. Besteman 2016, 172). While the majority of my participants would fall into the 'successfully resettled' category based on their success in finding employment by channelling past experiences into a career in settlement services, this is not the reality for others. Newcomers arrive in Canada from different backgrounds, with various skills and abilities, though this is often forgotten due to the images to which the public is exposed to that paint these populations as a "blur of humanity" (Malkki 1996, 387). Regardless of the skills brought to Canada, many newcomers are forced to accept employment that devalues their capabilities, often being forced to accept menial positions, and often multiple positions to support themselves and their families.

Newcomers and Labour

Currently, we are entering into what is being called "the fourth industrial revolution" (Poloz 2018, 7). This means the use of technology in the workplace will continue to increase, which will, in turn, replace many jobs currently held by humans. Regardless, he remains optimistic that job creation will remain steady as human employees will be required to operate this technology, to write code, and to fill manufacturing positions (6). As the labour market continues to fluctuate at the mercy of the capitalist economy and the continuing development of technology, it will become more and more difficult for newcomer populations to gain entrance. Regardless of the conditions of the labour

market, there remains to be a disconnect between the Canadian immigration system and market needs (McDaniel 2015, 101). Most recently, Canada has focused on accepting and resettling newcomers from the refugee and family classes. Those occupying these classes require extensive support before they even begin interacting with the labour market. Due to the Canadian state previously focusing on resettling immigrants from the economic class, the services and policies in place are unable to support these populations. This has, in turn, created an unwelcome space for newcomers trying to enter the labour market.

As Ferguson states, “new social groups lacking access to both land and regular employment have emerged ... Under such circumstances, wage labour appears less and less capable of serving as a universal relay either between production and consumption or between capital and ‘the masses.’ Instead, regimes around the globe struggle to accommodate new populations (urban and rural alike) whose livelihoods are often starkly disconnected from both agriculture and wage labour” (192). In Canada, newcomers will continue to face resistance upon entry in the labour market until model refugee characteristics are embodied, and newcomers have shown that they have officially become ‘worthy’ of entrance into the Canadian workplace.

Immigration Today

Immigration remains a hot-button issue in Canada and internationally. The civil war that has plagued Syria and forced millions to flee their homes has entered its 8th year (World Vision 2018). Canada has resettled approximately 40 000 refugees throughout the provinces (Government of Canada 2015). While many refugees received financial support

from either the federal government or private sponsorship groups, that financial support has ceased as the one-year anniversary of their arrival has long passed; therefore, Canadian resettlement services are currently in the space of transition. Programs are being updated, and services are being created to accommodate new populations of newcomers and their unique needs. Most recently, it is the flight of Haitian refugees landing at Canadian borders that have become the next focus of the media, especially in Quebec where they are fleeing from the United States (Sargeant 2017). After the various threats from the Trump administration to end the no-deportation promise extended to Haitians refugees after the earthquake disaster in 2010, many Haitians fled to Canada (Markusoff 2018). Rumours flew through the Haitian community that Canada was a much more welcoming country and was 'altogether better' than the United States, leading to mass migration into Canada from the United States (Ibid). Unfortunately, this has not entirely been true. In 2017, Canada quietly deported 563 Haitians back to their home, while another 804 were waiting to learn whether or not they would also be forced to return (Ibid). As of early 2018, there is a backlog of 41 000 refugee claims waiting to be heard by the Immigration and Refugee Board (IRB) (Markusoff 2018).

Many of the settlement services available to newcomers are still developing and working out the kinks in their programs, meaning it is still unknown whether or not they are having the intended result of successful resettlement. Because of this, the next few years will be an exciting time due to the emerging data of these new resettlement programs. This data will offer fascinating insights into how Canada has fared in resettling such a large, relatively quick influx, and whether or not the anticipation of needs was

correct. It will also offer insight into the types of needs that had not been anticipated and will hopefully lead to the development of more useful programs and policies in the future.

Internationally, the Rohingya refugee crisis became the focus of international attention in August 2017 when more than half a million people fled to neighbouring Bangladesh due to what the United Nations calls “a textbook example of ethnic cleansing” (BBC News 2018). Médecins Sans Frontières (MSF) continues to spearhead humanitarian efforts within Myanmar and surrounding countries, though organizations have struggled to get official statistics due to the Myanmar government's refusal to allow international access (Griffiths 2017). In December 2017, Canadians and Trudeau's Liberal government have pledged over \$50 million to the humanitarian crisis (Harris 2017). These funds will focus on “sexual and reproductive health services and psychosocial counselling” for women and girls, specifically “survivors of sexual and gender-based violence, pregnant and nursing women, and woman-headed households” (Harris 2017). As of January 2018, over 6700 Rohingya have been killed and at least 288 villages destroyed (Ibid).

Though Canada rests on a platform that encourages inward migration and has pledged to continue to resettle newcomers, I have found the reality is that current policies prevent successful resettlement. These policies will require an extreme overhaul as newcomer populations continue to increase, to address the various issues that are blocking newcomer entrance into the labour market. One of the most persuasive arguments for resettlement is to increase human capital as it will allow Canada to remain competitive internationally, though the Canadian state appears only to be implementing policies that prevent newcomers from accessing the labour market. The reality of the

situation is that there are very few opportunities for newcomers to enter the market quickly, while the barriers remain plenty. Due to the importance placed on the space of employment, this is obviously problematic.

Policy Recommendations

In November 2017, Immigration Minister Ahmed Hussen announced the Liberal Party's new immigration strategy that will see "nearly one million immigrants" accepted for resettlement in Canada over the next three years (Harris et al. 2017). Minister Hussen stated, "Five million Canadians are set to retire by 2035, and we have fewer people working to support seniors and retirees" (Ibid). During times of economic downturn, Canada has made borders more accessible to increase human capital and jump-start the economy. While in practice the borders are not as accessible as they are advertised to be - as is shown in the case of the Haitian diaspora mentioned above. People are led to believe borders are opened merely because helping those in need is the right, moral thing to do, when in reality this statement by Minister Hussen proves that Canadian borders will continue to fluctuate from accessible to impenetrable depending on the state and the needs of the Canadian economy at the time. Minister Hussen explicitly states that accepting one million immigrants in the future will benefit the Canadian economy by helping to replenish Canada's ageing population. For Canada to accommodate this influx in population, immigration policy needs to be adjusted and expanded to ensure future newcomers have access to settlement services to facilitate resettlement, but also to ensure that the arrival of newcomers does not result in an increased dependence on the Canadian welfare state.

During my fieldwork, I spent time within a settlement agency that allowed me the opportunity to observe the ways newcomers and service providers interact with Canadian immigration system, and how this system both encourages and discourages resettlement and encourages and discourages workplace integration. Volunteering at OCISO, specifically working reception at the front desk, offered a perspective to both see and hear the complaints and praises from service providers and clients. This information has put me in a position to offer recommendations towards how policy could be updated and made more effective to accommodate future migration into to Canada. As Canada starts to accept the beginning of the 1 million newcomers Canada has pledged to resettle in the next three years, resettlement agencies need to start preparing for such an increase in the usage of their services. This means hiring more settlement workers to provide services. This was a frequent complaint from service providers after the arrival of Syrian refugees in 2015. Many felt they are unable to keep up with the clients they have now, and the thought of this increasing tenfold is almost unbearable. An increase in service providers would allow for more programs to be available at more times to accommodate new clients. As was previously mentioned, many clients struggle to attend classes or programs required for resettlement. The addition of another large group of newcomers to this clientele will put more strain on these classes, and a way to reduce this strain is to offer more classes at different times to allow newcomers more options. The following offers three policy recommendations that I believe need to be formulated and implemented to accommodate the migration into Canada and will be crucial to Canada's future as inward migration continues to increase.

First, credential recognition and the transfer of foreign credentials from international institutions need to be addressed. Canadian policy needs to create and implement a more comprehensive policy that allows newcomers to utilize education obtained elsewhere. Regulations differ from province to province; therefore a standard framework needs to be created that can easily explain the process of recognition and how to obtain it within each province. Professional fields such as medical and engineering, where standards vary from country to country, prove to be more complicated. Because many professional fields have direct contact with the general public, these standards are set to ensure public safety which is crucial. To ensure public safety is upheld, there should be an implementation of a type of apprenticeship program that allows newcomers to shadow a certified Canadian professional in their chosen field. This will allow newcomers to become familiar with Canadian standards while learning the intricacies of the Canadian workplace.

Credential recognition is not an easy process, and often newcomers are forced to choose between returning to school to obtain a degree at a Canadian institution or accepting employment - often in a menial field such as fast food industry - due to inability to afford re-education. An apprenticeship program will reduce the amount of time a newcomer has to wait to enter the workplace and should be followed by a qualifying exam to ensure procedures and standards are understood before entering into the field. There remains the issue of affordability, because, in reality, a newcomer would be unable to sustain a full-time job while shadowing a professional. Therefore, for this program to succeed, some sort of subsidy program will need to be implemented. An apprenticeship program will also act as an encouragement to Canadian employers to hire those

internationally educated, allowing them to feel more comfortable hiring newcomers with international credentials. Because apprenticeships allow newcomers the chance to get on the job/in the field experience, it will allow newcomers the chance to get experience in the Canadian workplace. This was one of the most substantial complaints by newcomers during my fieldwork since many jobs require prior Canadian experience, but no employers would give them the opportunity.

Second, those responsible for researching, creating, recommending, and implementing policies need to ensure a better understanding of the target population. More research needs to be done to understand how target populations are absorbing media. This understanding will ensure that newcomers are better equipped with the knowledge of where these services are available and how to access them. As was previously mentioned, many people from Arab countries consume radio instead of TV, meaning it would make more sense to dedicate funds to advertising on various local Arabic or multicultural radio stations. For this to happen, more consultation needs to be done with those familiar with specific cultural intricacies. This would mean speaking to those who work closely with newcomer populations, community and religious leaders. Not knowing where or how to access services continued to come up in my interviews making it a common issue among the newcomer population. Having a greater understanding of people's lives will ensure useful information reaches the intended audience, instead of just being released into society and never reaching the people for which it is intended.

Lastly, returning to the discussion on the notion of strictly regimented programs in chapter two, and the lack of space available for newcomers outside of counselling for emotional adjustment and expression, I would advise that future immigration policy allows

for more flexibility and creativity within programs. Programs that are more informal and unplanned should be available to newcomers to allow them space to informally adjust to their new surroundings for themselves, instead of being lead along a pre-constructed path. For example, have more open-ended activities planned, such as a walk through a local park or nature area, maybe an afternoon trip grocery shopping. These types of activities will allow enough structure for newcomers to come together at a predetermined place and time but allow each the opportunity to socialize in a more casual setting. This takes the pressure off of the situation where newcomers can feel forced to act and be a certain way and allow for more casual interaction between participants.

Final Reflections

To conclude, I want to reflect on the process of researching and compiling this data. Resettlement will continue as a long and complicated process all newcomers must navigate. Because each regulatory body has a unique view of how to facilitate resettlement and what programs work, this process will remain convoluted and lengthy. As newcomer populations in Canada continue to grow, the responsibilities of resettlement will remain divided among various regulatory bodies to accommodate this increasing population, some of which will ‘successfully’ integrate, while others will not. I continue to believe, that in comparison to other countries, Canada remains a relatively welcoming society to newcomers.

There is still a great deal of work to be done concerning access to the labour market that involves both newcomers and Canadians alike. It is easy to believe these issues are unique to the newcomer community, when in reality, issues like poverty,

racism, lack of affordable and safe housing, income inequality etc. are rampant among native-Canadians. Focusing on these issues within the newcomer community allows one to see the issues that are often more widespread, and to see the areas of the overall welfare system that are lacking. As Besteman (2016) states, “these are problems for mainstream people also” (186), and are not to blame on any particular population, but on entire systems instead.

Bibliography

- Adams, Vincanne. 2013. *Markets of Sorrow, Labors of Faith: New Orleans in the Wake of Katrina*. Durham, North Carolina: Duke University Press.
- Agamben, Giorgio. 1998. *Homo Sacer: Sovereign Power and Bare Life*. Stanford University Press.
- Ager, Alastair, and Alison Strang. 2004. "Indicators of Integration: Final Report." 2004.
- Ager, Alastair, and Alison Strang. 2008. "Understanding Integration: A Conceptual Framework." *Journal of Refugee Studies* 21 (2): 166–91.
- Ahmad, Tazeen Dhunna. 2017. "Refugees Using Technology to Tackle Everyday Challenges | Tazeen Dhunna Ahmad." *The Guardian*, June 20, 2017, sec. Voluntary Sector Network. <http://www.theguardian.com/voluntary-sector-network/2017/jun/20/hackathons-3d-printing-prosthetics-technology-world-refugee-day>.
- Allan, Diana. 2014. *Refugees of the Revolution: Experiences of Palestinian Exile*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Allison, Anne. 2013. *Precarious Japan*. London, England: Duke University Press.
- Alonso, José M., Judith Clifton, and Daniel Díaz-Fuentes. 2016. "Public Private Partnerships for Hospitals: Does Privatization Affect Employment?" *Journal of Strategic Contracting and Negotiation* 2 (4): 313–25.
- American Psychological Association. "Ethnic and Racial Minorities & Socioeconomic Status." <http://www.apa.org>, 2018.
- <http://www.apa.org/pi/ses/resources/publications/minorities.aspx>.

- Anderson, Benedict. 1983. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. London: New Left Books.
- Andersson, Per, and Shibao Guo. 2009. “*Governing through Non/Recognition: The Missing ‘R’ in the PLAR for Immigrant Professionals in Canada and Sweden.*” *International Journal of Lifelong Education* 28 (4): 423–37.
- Arendt, Hannah. 1973. *Origins of Totalitarianism*. New York: A Harvest Book Harcourt Brace and Company.
- Baker, Bath F. 2017. “When Is a Refugee a Refugee?” In *Maintaining Refuge: Anthropological Reflections in Uncertain Times*, edited by David Haines, Jayne Howell, and Fethi Keles, 4–10.
- Bala, Julia. 2005. “Beyond the Personal Pain: Integrating Social and Political Concerns in Therapy with Refugees.” In *Forced Migration and Mental Health: Rethinking the Care of Refugees and Displaced Persons.* Edited by David Ingleby, 169–218. Boston, MA: Springer.
- Banerjee, Rupa, and Mai Phan. 2014. “*Licensing Requirements and Occupational Mobility Among Highly Skilled New Immigrants in Canada.*” *Relations Industrielles / Industrial Relations* 69 (2): 290–315.
- Bauder, Harald. 2003. “*‘Brain Abuse’, or the Devaluation of Immigrant Labour in Canada.*” *Antipode* 35 (4): 699–717.
- BBC News. 2018. “Myanmar Rohingya: What You Need to Know about the Crisis.” *BBC News*, January 16, 2018, sec. Asia. <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-41566561>.

- Beiser, Morton. 2005. *"The Health of Immigrants and Refugees in Canada."* Canadian Journal of Public Health / Revue Canadienne de Sante Publique 96: S30–44.
- Besteman, Catherine. 2016. *Making Refugee: Somali Bantu Refugees and Lewiston, Maine.* London: Duke University Press.
- Blalock, Hubert M Jr. 1967. *Toward a Theory of Minority Group Relations.* New York: Wiley.
- Bonacich, Edna. 1973. *"A Theory of Middleman Minorities."* American Sociological Review 38 (5): 583–94.
- Bowles, Paul. 2010. "Globalization's Problematic for Labour: Three Paradigms." *Global Labour Journal*, Special Issue: Globalization(s) and Labour in China and India, 1 (1).
- Bulley, Dan. 2014. *"Inside the Tent: Community and Government in Refugee Camps."* Security Dialogue 45 (1): 63–80.
- The Canadian Council for Public-Private Partnerships. 2005. "What Are Public-Private Partnerships (P3s)?" What Are Public-Private Partnerships (P3s)? 2005. <http://www.pppcouncil.ca/>.
- Canadian Council for Refugees. 1998. "Best Settlement Practices: Settlement Services for Refugees and Immigrants in Canada." Montréal. <http://ccrweb.ca/sites/ccrweb.ca/files/staticfiles/bpfina1.htm#5.%20SETTLEMENT%20SERVICES>.
- Canadian Council for Refugees. 2000. "Canadian National Settlement Service Standards Framework." Montréal.

Canadian Council for Refugees. "Refugees and Immigrants: A Glossary." Montréal.
<http://ccrweb.ca/en/glossary>.

Canadian Council for Refugees. 2013. "Brief History of Canada's Responses to Refugees." Montréal. <http://ccrweb.ca/sites/ccrweb.ca/files/static-files/canadarefugeeshistory2.htm>.

CBC Radio. "Expecting Gratitude from Refugees Can Be Toxic." CBC, May 3, 2017.
<http://www.cbc.ca/radio/thecurrent/the-current-for-may-3-2017-1.4095703/expecting-gratitude-from-refugees-can-be-toxic-says-author-1.4095737>.

The Canadian Press. 2016. "*Canada's Ambitious Syrian Refugee Program, by the Numbers*." CBC News, February 29, 2016.
<http://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/syrian-refugees-by-the-numbers-1.3469080>.

The Canadian Press. 2017. "*Canadian Job Market in 2016 Propelled by Part-Time Work as Full-Time Jobs Faded: StatsCan*." January 6, 2017.
<https://globalnews.ca/news/3164417/canadian-job-market-2016-part-time-work-full-time-jobs-statistics-canada/>.

Centre for Canadian Language Benchmarks. 2006. "What Is CCLB?" 2006.
<http://www.language.ca/about-us/what-is-cclb/>.

Chou, Chih-Chieh. 2008. "Critique on the Notion of Model Minority: An Alternative Racism to Asian American?" 9 (3): 219–29.

Ciolfe, Terra. 2017. "*What the Census Tells Us About Canada's Aging Population*." Macleans.ca, May 3, 2017. <http://www.macleans.ca/news/canada/what-the-census-tells-us-about-canadas-aging-population/>.

- Citizenship and Immigration Canada. 2013. "Welcome to Canada: What You Should Know." Government of Canada.
- CNN. 2017. "The Rohingya Crisis." CNN. 2017.
<https://www.cnn.com/specials/asia/rohingya>.
- Creese, Gillian, and Brandy Wiebe. 2012. "*Survival Employment: Gender and Deskillling among African Immigrants in Canada*." *International Migration* 50 (5): 56–76.
- Durrenberger, E. Paul. 2017. *Uncertain Times: Anthropological Approaches to Labor in a Neoliberal World*. Boulder, Colorado: University Press of Colorado.
- Dieckhoff, Martina, and Vanessa Gash. 2015. "Unemployed and Alone? Unemployment and Social Participation in Europe." *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy* 35 (1–2): 67–90.
- Employment and Immigration Canada. 1990. "Indochinese Refugees: The Canadian Response, 1979 and 1980." <http://cihs-shic.ca/wp-content/uploads/2015/03/Indochinese-Refugees-Cdn-Response-report-ENG.pdf>.
- Enayati, Amanda. 2012. "The Importance of Belonging." CNN. June 1, 2012.
<https://www.cnn.com/2012/06/01/health/enayati-importance-of-belonging/index.html>.
- Fassin, Didier. 2011. *Humanitarian Reason: A Moral History of the Present - California Scholarship*. London: University of California Press.
- Ferguson, James. 2015. *Give a Man a Fish: Reflections on the New Politics of Distribution*. London, England: Duke University Press.

- Ferrer, Ana, and W. Craig Riddell. 2008. "*Education, Credentials, and Immigrant Earnings.*" *The Canadian Journal of Economics* 41 (1): 186–216.
- Fine, Sean. 2017. "Historic Canadian Resettlement of Vietnamese Sets Precedent for Action." *The Globe and Mail*, March 25, 2017, sec. Canada.
<https://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/national/historic-canadian-resettlement-of-vietnamese-sets-precedent-for-action/article26235892/>.
- Foster, Lorne. 2006. "*Foreign Credentials in Canada's Multicultural Society.*" In *The Professionalization of Work*. Toronto: De Sitter Publications.
- Friscolanti, Michael. 2016. "Getting Syrians Here Was Easy. Now Comes the Hard Part. - Macleans.Ca." *Macleans*. August 2016.
<http://www.macleans.ca/news/canada/warm-hearts-cold-reality/>.
- Gao, Fang. 2008. "What It Means to Be a 'Model Minority': Voices of Ethnic Koreans in Northeast China" 9 (1): 55–67. 8 September 2016.
- Girard, Magali. 2010. "*Match Between Pre- and Post-migration Education among New Immigrants: Determinants and Payoffs.*" *The Canadian Journal of Higher Education* 40 (3): 81–99.
- Government of Canada, Refugees, Immigration and Citizenship. 2007. "Apply – Refugee Status from inside Canada." Service initiation. March 31, 2007.
<https://www.canada.ca/en/immigration-refugees-citizenship/services/refugees/claim-protection-inside-canada/apply.html>.
- Government of Canada, Immigration. 2011. "Canada: A History of Refuge." June 20, 2011. <http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/refugees/timeline.asp>.

Government of Canada, Immigration. 2015. “#WelcomeRefugees: Key Figures.”
December 2, 2015.

<http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/refugees/welcome/milestones.asp>.

Grant, Tavia. 2017. “One Year after Arrival, Syrian Refugees Continue to Face
Employment Barriers.” The Globe and Mail, April 7, 2017.

[http://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/national/syrian-refugees-facing-barriers-
to-finding-work-one-year-after-arrival/article33204887/](http://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/national/syrian-refugees-facing-barriers-to-finding-work-one-year-after-arrival/article33204887/).

Green, Kelli, Mayra López, Allen Wysocki, Karl Kepner, Derek Farnsworth, and Jennifer
L Clark. “Diversity in the Workplace: Benefits, Challenges, and the Required
Managerial Tools.” *The Institute of Food and Agricultural Sciences*, Food and
Resource Economics Department, October 2015, 3.

Guo, Shibao. 2009. “*Difference, Deficiency, and Devaluation: Tracing the Roots of Non-
Recognition of Foreign Credentials for Immigrant Professionals in Canada*.” The
Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education; Toronto 22 (1): 37–52.

Haddad, Emma. 2008. *The Refugee in International Society: Between Sovereigns*. New
York, N.Y: Cambridge University Press.

Hagerty, Bonnie M.K., Judith Lynch-Sauer, Kathleen L. Patusky, Maria Bouwsema, and
Peggy Collier. 1992. “Sense of Belonging: A Vital Mental Health Concept.”
Archives of Psychiatric Nursing 6 (3): 172–77.

Hall, David. 2015. “Why Public-Private Partnerships Don’t Work: The Many Advantages
of the Public Alternative.” Public Services International Research Unit. London:
University of Greenwich.

Han, Clara. 2012. *Life in Debt : Times of Care and Violence in Neoliberal Chile (1)*.

Berkeley, US: University of California Press.

Harnois, Gaston, and Phyllis Gabriel. 2000. "Mental Health and Work: Impact, Issues and Good Practices." Nations for Mental Health. Geneva: World Health Organization.

Harris, Kathleen, Chris Hall, and Peter Zimonjic Zimonjic. 2017. "Canada to Admit Nearly 1 Million Immigrants over next 3 Years | CBC News." CBC. November 1, 2017. <http://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/immigration-canada-2018-1.4371146>.

Harris, Kathleen. 2017. "Canada's Response to Rohingya Humanitarian Crisis Tops \$50M." CBC. December 13, 2017. <http://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/canada-aid-rohingya-myanmar-bangladesh-1.4446139>.

Howell, Alison. 2005. "Peaceful, Tolerant and Orderly? A Feminist Analysis of Discourses of Canadian Values in Canadian Foreign Policy." *Canadian Foreign Policy/La Politique Etrangere Du Canada* 12 (1). http://search.proquest.com/docview/59893360?rfr_id=info%3Axri%2Fsid%3Aprimo.

Immigration, Refugees and Citizenship Canada. 2017. "How Does Canada's Refugee System Work?," February 14, 2017. <https://settlement.org/ontario/immigration-citizenship/refugees/basic-information-for-refugees/how-does-canada-s-refugee-system-work/>.

JIAS. 2010. "Jewish Immigrant Aid Services of Canada." 2010. <http://jias.org/#>.

Jiménez, Alberto Corsín. 2003. "Working out Personhood: Notes on 'Labour' and Its Anthropology." *Anthropology Today* 19 (5): 14–17.

- Kalman-Lamb, Nathan. 2013. "The Athlete as Model Minority Subject: Jose Bautista and Canadian Multiculturalism" 19 (2): 238–53.
- Kiang, Lisa, Virginia W. Huynh, Charissa S. L. Cheah, Yijie Wang, and Hirokazu Yoshikawa. 2017. "Moving Beyond the Model Minority" 8 (1): 1–6.
- Klinkenberg, Marty. 2017. "Alberta Sees Influx of New Residents as Canadians Head West." *The Globe and Mail*, April 14, 2017.
<https://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/national/alberta-sees-influx-of-new-residents-as-canadians-head-west/article33959776/>.
- Korte, Russell F. 2007. *"The Socialization of Newcomers into Organizations: Integrating Learning and Social Exchange Processes."* University of Minnesota.
- Labonté, Ronald, Elizabeth Cobbett, Michael Orsini, Denise Spitzer, Ted Schrecker, and Arne Ruckert. 2015. "Globalization and the Health of Canadians: 'Having a Job Is the Most Important Thing.'" *Globalization and Health* 11 (1): 19.
- Li, Peter S. 2001. "The Market Worth of Immigrants' Educational Credentials." *Canadian Public Policy / Analyse de Politiques* 27 (1): 23–38.
- Li, Peter S. 2004. "Social Capital and Economic Outcomes for Immigrants and Ethnic Minorities." *Journal of International Migration and Integration / Revue de l'integration et de La Migration Internationale* 5 (2): 171–90.
- Li, Tania Murray. 2007. "Governmentality." *Anthropologica* 49 (2): 275–81.
- Malkki, Liisa. 1994. "Citizens of Humanity: Internationalism and the Imagined Community of Nations." *Diaspora* 3 (1): 41–68.
- Malkki, Liisa H. 1995. "Refugees and Exile: From 'Refugee Studies' to the National Order of Things." *Annual Review of Anthropology* 24: 495–523.

- Malkki, Liisa H. 1996. "Speechless Emissaries: Refugees, Humanitarianism, and Dehistoricization." *Cultural Anthropology* 11 (3): 377–404.
- Malkki, Liisa H. 2015. *The Need to Help: Domestic Arts of International Humanitarianism*. London: Duke University Press.
- Markusoff, Jason. 2018. "Canada's Failing Refugee System Is Leaving Thousands in Limbo." *Macleans*. January 10, 2018.
<http://www.macleans.ca/news/canada/canadas-refugee-system-is-in-chaos/>.
- Médecins Sans Frontières (MSF). 2017. "Rohingya Refugee Crisis." MSF USA. December 13, 2017. <https://www.doctorswithoutborders.org/rohingya-refugee-crisis>.
- McCoy, Liza, and Cristi Masuch. 2007. "Beyond 'Entry-Level' Jobs: Immigrant Women and Non-Regulated Professional Occupations." *Journal of International Migration and Integration*; Dordrecht 8 (2): 185–206.
- Michaels, Jon. 2017. "How the American Government Slowly Became a Business." December 18, 2017.
<https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2017/dec/18/american-government-business-privatisation-jon-michaels>.
- Montgomery, Angela. 2017. "What You Need to Know about Quebec's Religious Neutrality Legislation." *CBC News*. October 18, 2017.
<http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/montreal/burqa-niqab-national-assembly-quebec-liberal-government-stephanie-vallee-1.4357463>.
- Muehlebach, Andrea. "On Affective Labor in Post-Fordist Italy." *Cultural Anthropology* 26, no. 1 (2011): 59–82.

- Muehlebach, Andrea. 2012. *The Moral Neoliberal: Welfare and Citizenship in Italy*.
University of Chicago Press.
- Nader, Laura. 1972. "Up the Anthropologist: Perspectives Gained from Studying Up."
Edited by Dell Hymes. *Reinventing Anthropology*, 284–311.
- Nayeri, Dina. 2017. "*The Ungrateful Refugee: 'We Have No Debt to Repay.'*" The
Guardian, April 4, 2017, sec. World news.
<http://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/apr/04/dina-nayeri-ungrateful-refugee>.
- Ng, Roxana, and Hongxia Shan. 2010. "Lifelong Learning as Ideological Practice: An
Analysis from the Perspective of Immigrant Women in Canada." *International
Journal of Lifelong Education* 29 (2): 169–84.
- Ong, Aihwa. 2003. *Buddha Is Hiding: Refugees, Citizenship, and the New America*.
London, England: University of California Press.
- Perreaux, Les. 2018 "Canadian Attitudes toward Immigrants, Refugees Remain
Positive: Study." Accessed May 6, 2018.
<https://www.theglobeandmail.com/canada/article-canadian-attitudes-toward-immigrants-refugees-remain-positive-study/>.
- Poon, OiYan. 2016. "A Critical Review of the Model Minority Myth in Selected Literature
on Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders in Higher Education" 86 (2): 469–502.
- Reitz, Jeffrey G., Josh Curtis, and Jennifer Elrick. 2014. "*Immigrant Skill Utilization:
Trends and Policy Issues*." *Journal of International Migration and Integration* 15
(1): 1–26.
- Russell, Andrew. 2015. "60% of Canadians Disagree with Liberal Plan to Accept Syrian
Refugees: Ipsos Poll." November 20, 2015.

<https://globalnews.ca/news/2352983/60-of-canadians-disagree-with-liberal-plan-to-accept-syrian-refugees-ipsos-poll/>.

Salgado, Laura Rodríguez, and Iria Vázquez Silva. 2018. "‘I Believe People Need to Know Us in Order to Integrate Us’: Immigrant Women’s Cultural Attitudes and Needs." *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, February, 1–21.

Sargeant, Tim. 2017. "Asylum Seekers Entering Quebec on the Rise: Immigration Department - Montreal | Globalnews.Ca," August 15, 2017.

<https://globalnews.ca/news/3669515/asylum-seekers-entering-quebec-on-the-rise-immigration-department/>.

Shaw, Jennifer, and Darren Byler. 2016. "Precarity — Cultural Anthropology." 2016. https://culanth.org/curated_collections/21-precarity.

Shore, Cris, and Susan Wright. 1997. *Anthropology of Policy: Critical Perspectives on Governance and Power*. New York: Routledge.

Smith, Stephen, and Eman Katem. 2018. "*Canada Committing \$440 Million to Immigration over next Three Years*." *CIC News*. February 15, 2018.

<https://www.cicnews.com/2018/02/canada-committing-440-million-to-immigration-over-next-three-years-0210201.html>.

Standing, Guy. 2011. *The Precariat: The New Dangerous Class*. New York, N.Y.: Bloomsbury Academic.

Statistics Canada. 2017a. "*The Daily — An Increasingly Diverse Linguistic Profile: Corrected Data from the 2016 Census*," August 17, 2017. <https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/daily-quotidien/170817/dq170817a-eng.htm>.

- Statistics Canada. 2017b. “*Education in Canada: Key Results from the 2016 Census.*” 11-001–X. <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/daily-quotidien/171129/dq171129a-eng.pdf>.
- Statistics Canada. 2018. “Labour Force Survey, January 2018,” no. 11 (February): 11. <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/daily-quotidien/180209/dq180209a-eng.htm>
- Stevenson, Lisa. *Life Beside Itself: Imagining Care in the Canadian Arctic*. Oakland, California: University of California Press, 2014.
- Taylor, Charles, Amy Gutmann, and Kwame Anthony Appiah. *Multiculturalism*. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1994.
- Ticktin, Miriam. 2006. “*Where Ethics and Politics Meet.*” *American Ethnologist* 33 (1): 33–49.
- Ticktin, Miriam. 2011. *Casualties of Care: Immigration and the Politics of Humanitarianism in France*. Berkeley, US: University of California Press.
- Türegün, Adnan. 2013. “*Rebuilding Professional Lives: Immigrant Professionals Working in the Ontario Settlement Service Sector.*” *Journal of International Migration and Integration* 14 (3): 597–614.
- United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees. 2014. “Migrant Definition.” *Emergency Handbook*, March 2014. <https://emergency.unhcr.org/entry/176962/migrant-definition>.
- United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees. 2016. “Syria Conflict at 5 Years: The Biggest Refugee and Displacement Crisis of Our Time Demands a Huge Surge in Solidarity.” UNHCR. March 15, 2016. <http://www.unhcr.org/afr/news/press/2016/3/56e6e3249/syria-conflict-5-years-biggest-refugee-displacement-crisis-time-demands.html>.

United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees. 2017. "Canada's 2016 Record High Level of Resettlement Praised by UNHCR." UNHCR. April 2017.

<http://www.unhcr.org/news/press/2017/4/58fe15464/canadas-2016-record-high-level-resettlement-praised-unhcr.html>.

United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees. 2018. "What Is a Refugee? Definition and Meaning." UNHCR. February 2018.

<https://www.unrefugees.org/refugee-facts/what-is-a-refugee/>.

Watters, Ethan. 2010. "*The Americanization of Mental Illness*." The New York Times, January 8, 2010, sec. Magazine.

<https://www.nytimes.com/2010/01/10/magazine/10psyche-t.html>.

Weeks, Kathi. 2011. *The Problem with Work: Feminism, Marxism, Antiwork Politics, and Postwork Imaginaries*. London: Duke University Press.

World Vision. 2018. "Syrian Refugee Crisis: Facts, FAQs, and How to Help." *World Vision* (blog). March 15, 2018. <https://www.worldvision.org/refugees-news-stories/syrian-refugee-crisis-facts>.

Yukich, Grace. 2013. "*Constructing the Model Immigrant: Movement Strategy and Immigrant Deservingness in the New Sanctuary Movement*." *Social Problems* 60 (3): 302–20.

Zuberi, Dan, and Melita Ptashnick. 2012. "In Search of a Better Life: The Experiences of Working Poor Immigrants in Vancouver, Canada: Working Poor Immigrants in Vancouver." *International Migration* 50 (February): e60–93.