

**In Their Own Words: Prefaces and Other Sites of Editorial Interaction
in Nineteenth-Century Canadian Magazines**

Suzanne Bowness

**Thesis submitted to the
Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies
In Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements
For the PhD Degree in English Literature**

**Department of English
Faculty of Arts
University of Ottawa**

© Suzanne Bowness, Ottawa, Canada, 2012

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract.....	iv
Acknowledgements.....	vi
Introduction.....	1
Chapter 1: Context and Historical Overview of Canadian Magazines.....	13
Foreign Models for Canadian Magazines.....	15
A Canadian Industry is Born.....	18
A Quiet Beginning: Magazines to the Mid-1820s.....	22
Lots of Enthusiasm, Little Longevity: Magazines in the 1830s.....	29
Literary Development, Specialization, and Experimentation in the 1840s.....	39
The Quieter 1850s.....	44
Towards Confederation.....	49
Approaching a Golden Age: Magazines Around the 1870s.....	53
An Industry at Last: the 1880s and 1890s.....	56
Chapter 2: Themes in Canadian Magazine Prefaces.....	67
An Exemplary Preface: <i>The Nova-Scotia Magazine</i>	70
Civic Betterment to National Pride.....	74
Variations on the Nationalist Theme: British, Regional, and Literary.....	87
Negative Threads: Indifference, Anti-Americanism and Trashy Literature.....	96
Literature for the People.....	110
Practical Concerns.....	115
Chapter 3: Rhetoric in Canadian Magazine Prefaces.....	119
Literary Tools in Aid of the Editorial and Magazine Persona	120
Shared Concerns for a Lost Literary Aspirant.....	137
Do We Want a Good Canadian Magazine? Rhetorical Questions and More.....	150
Creative Writing Beyond the Prefaces.....	154
A Final Note of Scepticism.....	158
Chapter 4: Sites of Editorial Interaction in Canadian Magazines.....	161
A Few Sample “Notices to Correspondents” in Full.....	170
Practice Makes Perfect: Poetical Critiques and Prose Grievances.....	177
Explaining the Editorial Process.....	195
Reader to Reader and the Editor’s Meditation.....	214

Chapter 5: Canadian Magazínists.....	218
The Early Period to Mid-Century.....	221
Susanna Moodie	
Rosanna Leprohon	
Successful but Obscure Magazínists.....	233
Charles Durand	
Diana Bayley	
W. Arthur Calnek	
Amelia Clotilda Jennings	
Promising Trajectories Cut Short.....	242
Samuel Douglass Smith Huyghue	
Hugh E. Montgomerie	
Elizabeth Mary Maclachlan	
James Haskins	
Mysterious Disappearances.....	249
Eliza Lanesford Cushing	
Mary Jane Katzmánn Lawson	
Mid- to Late-Century Magazínists.....	256
Contributors to <i>The Canadian Monthly and National Review</i>	
Contributors to <i>The Week</i>	
Other Late-Century Magazines	
Magazínists' Reputations Beyond the Magazines.....	273
Conclusion.....	276
Works Cited.....	284

ABSTRACT

This dissertation investigates nineteenth-century Canadian literary and general interest periodicals through the prefaces and other editorial missives written by the editors who created them. It seeks to demonstrate how these cultural workers saw their magazines as vehicles for promoting civic and literary development. While the handful of previous Canadian magazine dissertations take a “snapshot” approach to the genre by profiling a handful of titles within a region, this study attempts to capture the editorial impulse behind magazine development more widely. To do so, it examines multiple titles over a wider geographical and chronological span.

To provide context for these primary documents, the dissertation begins with a chapter that summarizes the development of magazines as a genre and the history of publishing in nineteenth-century Canada. Subsequent chapters examine prefaces by theme as well as by rhetorical strategy. Themes such as nationalism, cultural development, and anti-Americanism emerge most prominently, alongside rhetorical techniques such as metaphor, imagery, analogy and personification. The dissertation also examines other sites of editorial interaction, most commonly the “correspondent’s columns,” where editors provided public feedback on topics ranging from versification to currency to prose style as a means of educating writers and readers alike.

Finally, the dissertation relies on existing indexes to identify some of the most prolific contributors to the magazines, considering how these writers used the magazines to boost their literary careers. In the early century, these sources verify the productivity of canonical writers such as Susanna Moodie and Rosanna Leprohon, and call attention to obscure writers such as Eliza Lanesford Cushing, W. Arthur Calnek, James Haskins, and

Mary Jane Katzmann Lawson. In the later century, the same approach is used again to examine the hive of writers who emerged to contribute to late century magazines like *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* and *The Week*, confirming the immense productivity of writers such as Agnes Maule Machar and drawing attention to now-obscure contributors like Mary Morgan. By recovering these overlooked editorial elements and figures, this dissertation draws scholarly attention to a more nuanced view of literary production and affirms the importance of magazines to literary development in nineteenth-century Canada.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This dissertation owes much to many people. I would like to thank my supervisor Dr. Janice Fiamengo for her kind mentorship, encouragement, enthusiasm, and careful editing throughout the entire project. I am grateful for the feedback and interest of my examiners Dr. Tracey Ware, Dr. Gerald Lynch, Dr. Seymour Mayne, and Dr. Cynthia Sugars, who encouraged me to think about ways to expand my project. I also appreciate the insights and advice that I gained from other professors at the English Department, whether as a student in their classes, or in casual conversation. I furthermore appreciated the kindness of the department's administrative staff. Since I did not think to include an acknowledgements page in my MA thesis, I would also like to thank my supervisors at York University, Dr. Ray Ellenwood and Dr. John Lennox.

I would also like to thank my fellow students in the graduate community, and particularly the handful who joined me in creating a "thesis club" to support each other through the dissertation writing: Jenn Macquarrie, Poonam Bajwa, Bonnie Hughes, Marissa McHugh, Carmela Coccimiglio, and Marla Arbach. Our many sessions in the library sharing ideas made this whole undertaking more manageable. Finally, I would like to thank my parents William and Sandra Bowness, my brother Robert, and my friends for their constant support.

I am pleased to acknowledge the financial support I received from the Ontario Graduate Scholarship and the University of Ottawa. I am grateful for the digitization project at Early Canadiana Online that made a project of this scope much more feasible. This thesis is dedicated to the workers of the Canadian magazine industry, past and present.

INTRODUCTION

By way of introducing “A Study of Canadian Periodical Literature of the Nineteenth Century” (1950), a dissertation that he describes as an “initial assault” on the field, Robert L. McDougall notes that “the thought and tastes of the nineteenth century are recorded nowhere more liberally, nowhere with greater comprehensive accuracy, than in the periodical literature of the time” (1). In his excellent study of five of the era’s most significant periodicals, *The Literary Garland*, *The Canadian Journal*, *The Anglo-American Magazine*, *The British American Magazine*, and *The Canadian Monthly and National Review*, McDougall substantiates his assertion by revealing how each magazine’s contents, publication efforts, and literary criticism supplied a home-grown forum for intellectual debate and literary taste-making. Unfortunately, his initial assault has not been adequately sustained. While a handful of scholars have followed McDougall’s lead to produce further excellent profiles, the number of magazines worth investigating far outweighs the number of existing studies. Nor does the field yet have a satisfactory overview that explores nineteenth-century Canadian magazines directly as a genre and an industry rather than tangentially in relation to some other literary investigation.

A lack of scholarly regard for magazines is not a particularly Canadian oversight. In his essay “Victorian Periodicals and Academic Discourse,” in Laurel Brake, Aled Jones and Lionel Madden’s *Investigating Victorian Journalism*, B.E. Maidment calls the dearth of work on the magazine genre a “startling absence.” He adds that there is also an overwhelming sense that “there is almost no attention paid to Victorian periodicals in

themselves, though many articles and essays depend on evidence drawn from periodicals to substantiate, illustrate or reinforce arguments constructed out of other kinds of scholarly evidence” (143).¹ Canada follows this pattern too: whereas scholars seem aware of magazines as a repository, little attention is given them as a genre. This dissertation, therefore, arises from a desire to find new ways to continue McDougall’s assault, and to verify that the magazines of early Canada were more than passive repositories for creative work. Instead they were vehicles of an active literary community seeking to support and enact cultural development in nineteenth-century English Canada.

As book history and print culture continue to expand as disciplines, scholars are finally starting to give periodicals the attention they deserve. Yet the most comprehensive survey of a country’s magazines is probably still Frank Luther Mott’s Pulitzer Prize-winning *A History of American Magazines 1741-1930*, which traces in five volumes the emergence of periodical publication in the United States, providing an overview of the industry’s evolution alongside detailed profiles of dozens of individual magazines.

Ideally, every other national industry would have such an ample study as a baseline, but unfortunately the Mott volumes stand alone. In Canada, the best overview of English-Canadian magazines remains freelance journalist Fraser Sutherland’s *The Monthly Epic: A History of Canadian Magazines 1789-1989*,² which surveys the field generally, offers

¹ While Maidment speculates that this absence relates to the sheer size of the field (of Victorian periodicals), the risks of analyzing such a mediated form, the selective survival of magazines (which obscure a complete picture), and even the awkwardness of fitting periodicals into traditional academic disciplines, he still encourages further attempts particularly at investigating periodicals “as expositions of processes by which change occurs and is made legible” (147).

² W.H. Kesterton’s *A History of Journalism in Canada* and particularly the *Literary History of Canada: Canadian Literature in English* edited by Carl F. Klinck are also good starting points, although their focus is more on journalism or literature than magazines in particular. Noel Robert Barbour’s *Those Amazing People! The Story of the Canadian Magazine Industry 1778-1967* is another introductory volume focussed on magazines, although many scholars note that several factual errors make it a source to be approached

illustrative examples and highlights some of the industry's major editors, publishers and contributors. However, the fact that this popular book has passed its twentieth anniversary without being significantly expanded confirms an absence in this important domain, as do the receding publication dates for other significant works dealing with magazines less directly, such as Carole Gerson's *A Purer Taste: The Writing and Reading of Fiction in English in Nineteenth-Century Canada* (1989), George Parker's *The Beginnings of the Book Trade in Canada* (1985), and Paul Rutherford's *A Victorian Authority: The Daily Press in Late Nineteenth-Century Canada* (1982).³

More recent noteworthy works include titles such as N. Merrill Distad and Linda Distad's chapter on Canada in J. Don Vann and Rosemary T. VanArsdel's *Periodicals of Queen Victoria's Empire: An Exploration* (1996) or Marjorie Lang's *Women Who Made the News: Female Journalists in Canada, 1880-1945* (1999), but again these studies, while admirable, address the Canadian magazine industry tangentially, in the former case as just one of several countries in the Commonwealth and in the latter as a backdrop to the activities of women journalists. Perhaps most alarmingly, although a handful of excellent dissertations follow McDougall's lead to provide snapshots of individual magazines, including Marilyn Flitton's MA thesis and index "The Canadian Monthly 1872-1882" (1973), and Gwendolyn Davies' excellent doctoral dissertation, "A Literary Study of Selected Periodicals from Maritime Canada, 1789-1872" (1980), the fact that these projects remain unpublished makes the discovery of this important research more

with caution. While focussed more widely on texts beyond periodicals, Mary Lu MacDonald's *Literature and Society in the Canadas 1817-1850* is also excellent.

³ Douglas Fetherling's *The Rise of the Canadian Newspaper* is another relevant source on nineteenth-century newspaper journalism.

challenging and haphazard, and it is difficult to discern which magazines have already been investigated and which remain unexamined.⁴

Fortunately, there is ample evidence that scholarly interest in book history in Canada has expanded in the past decade. To highlight a few select examples, Carole Gerson's *Canadian Women in Print, 1750-1918* (2010) provides a significant contextual overview of women's contributions in fields from book production to journalism to manuscript culture. Janice Fiamengo's *The Woman's Page: Journalism and Rhetoric in Early Canada* (2008) offers insights into the ways that early women journalists used their writing as vehicles for intellectual development and social improvement. Nick Mount's *When Canadian Literature Moved to New York* (2005) looks at the ways in which late century writers embraced or rejected their Canadian identity as they pursued magazine work and editorial careers south of the border. Heather Murray's *Come Bright Improvement! The Literary Societies of Nineteenth-Century Ontario* (2002) investigates the importance of literary societies to cultural development. Perhaps most encouraging is the emergence of larger collaborative projects, most significantly the *History of the Book in Canada* volumes, and the digitization in progress at "Early Canadiana Online" (www.canadiana.org). This last project is arguably the best development for the study of early Canadian magazines as it releases them from their captivity on microfilm and makes them more widely accessible.

⁴ Given the difficulty of tracking down such unpublished dissertations, I am inclined to highlight additional projects here: L.J. Loggie's *The Literary Garland - A Critical and Historical Study* (1948), Carl Ballstadt's "The Quest for Canadian Identity in Pre-Confederation English Canadian Literary Criticism" (1965), Nancy W. Fraser's "Two Nova Scotian Literary Periodicals of the 1830s: *The Halifax Monthly Magazine* and *The Pearl*" (1977), Branko Gorjup's "A Study of Travel Literature, Biography and Criticism in English-Canadian Magazines 1880-1920" (1989), Klay Dyer's "A Periodical for the People: Mrs. Moodie and *The Victoria Magazine*" (1992) and Gwendolyn Guth's "'A World for Women: Fictions of the Female Artist in English-Canadian Periodicals, 1840-1880" (1999).

Poised at this moment of enhanced accessibility, this dissertation aims to maximize the potential of these primary documents in order to attempt a more continuous overview of nineteenth-century English-language magazines than the snapshot approach taken by previous dissertations has permitted. In order to do so in a manageable way, the dissertation focuses on moments of editorial insight within the magazines, from editorial prefaces to correspondence columns. If this thin-slice approach risks being cursory, that potential disadvantage is balanced by the benefits to be gained from comparing these common elements and identifying progressions and continuities in the editorial impulse as expressed by editors as they launched similar projects in different eras and regions. This broader perspective is intended to complement the existing snapshot dissertations by providing a roadmap through the industry as a whole, with a focus on the ways in which these editors saw themselves and their magazines as part of a continuous literary community.

As Canadianists embrace periodical history, so too have researchers in the field of book history continued to develop new parameters for studying periodicals as a genre. Particularly interesting are theoretical insights such as the ones that Lyn Pykett arrives at in her essay “Reading the Periodical Press: Text and Context,” in Laurel Brake, Aled Jones and Lionel Madden’s *Investigating Victorian Journalism*. Pykett notes how book history scholars have begun to urge mainstream historians to see periodicals as important to their fields and furthermore to move beyond initial theories by scholars such as Michael Wolff and Walter Houghton, who saw periodicals as a secondary reflection of culture (where magazines are a backdrop to “real” society—a background/foreground or

reflection/record model), towards a conception that sees magazines as more central, active and integral to society. Pykett writes that

The periodical press is now defined not as a mirror reflecting Victorian culture, nor as a means of *expressing* Victorian culture, but as an “inescapable ideological and subliminal environment,” a (or perhaps *the*) constitutive medium of a Victorian culture which is now seen as interactive (7).

Besides urging scholars to see magazines (and their editors) as engaged elements of literary creation, such a perspective highlights the centrality of magazines to cultural as well as literary development, a fact that has particular significance for the study of Canadian magazines in the nineteenth century when few other media featured so directly in readers’ quotidian exposure to literature.

While Canada’s later entry into magazine publishing in 1789 fated the industry to be at least initially imitative of its British and American predecessors, as scholar Mary Lu MacDonald points out in *Literature and Society in the Canadas 1817-1850*, to merely dismiss these native efforts as derivative or colonial without trying to see them as products of their time and place bypasses an opportunity to more fully understand them (1).⁵ To explore the Canadian magazine industry on its own terms is to discover the ways that editors marshalled the best of existing foreign templates and celebrated the domestic angle as a competitive advantage in an attempt to galvanize literary and cultural development. For readers, periodicals offered a means to educate and entertain themselves as well as to stay current with trends in literature and culture. For writers,

⁵ In her article on criticism in the early nineteenth century titled “A Very Laudable Effort: Standards of Literary Excellence in Early Nineteenth-Century Canada,” MacDonald expands this point to note that in contrast with our modern appreciation for innovation, this earlier period favoured an author’s ability to work within established conventions (85).

magazines offered opportunities to experiment with publication, develop their craft, and establish literary reputations, particularly at a time when a relatively weak book publishing industry limited other outlets. Perhaps most significantly, for the editors and publishers who created them, magazines offered a meaningful way to engage a reading public in their altruistic quest to enhance the civic and cultural development of their communities (and, of course, for editors to establish successful business ventures and writers to establish their reputations). Even though several of the factors observable in domestic magazines will not be particularly startling to Canadian literary scholars—the appreciative yet competitive relationship with British literary productions and the perception of real and imagined threats from American encroachment are a couple of examples—the perspective provided by these magazines lends a contemporary energy and nuance to even the most orthodox conclusions, and provides an opportunity to analyze sentiments more closely as they emerged from the pens of these cultural workers.

At a practical level, perhaps one of the greatest challenges in a dissertation attempting to survey Canadian magazines as purveyors of literary culture is to define what exactly constituted a general interest or literary magazine. To begin with, this study focuses on English-Canadian magazines. Although the early era saw a couple of bilingual titles, the French and English periodical industries developed relatively separately in Canada. Of course, French language magazines are equally interesting and worthy of further study, particularly given the fact that several titles saw greater longevity and continuity than those in English Canada. There have already been several attempts to create bibliographies or checklists of English-Canadian periodicals. One of the most frequently cited is Linda M. Jones' *Preliminary Checklist of Pre-1901 Canadian Serials*

(1986), a broad listing of some 2,000 titles covering magazines, journals, gazettes, and other periodical forms (excluding newspapers). In addition to this comprehensive source, other bibliographies focus on the literary and cultural titles that are the main purview here, including Dorothea D. Tod and Audrey Cordingley's *A Bibliography of Canadian Literary Periodicals, 1789-1900* (1932), Emilio Goggio, Beatrice Corrigan and Jack H. Parker's *A Bibliography of Canadian Cultural Periodicals (English and French, from Colonial Times to 1950)* (1955), and Thomas Brewer Vincent's *Index to Pre-1900 English Language Canadian Cultural and Literary Magazines* (1993)⁶. Given the dual focus of this dissertation on magazines as a genre and their role in promoting literary development, the general interest titles common to these latter, more literary, lists are most relevant. Although specialization did not always exclude literary character (many religious magazines, for instance, published literary works), for simplicity's sake specialty titles are mainly excluded from this dissertation except to provide context for the industry's development. Again, such specialty periodicals are also very worthy and in need of further scholarly examination, both for the insights they provide into particular fields and to extend the current understanding of the genre.

Following a first chapter that presents a chronological overview of the magazine industry's development, this dissertation's organization is mainly thematic in order to highlight the continuities and differences in editorial attitudes throughout the century, with chronology as a secondary mode of organization as needed for clarity. Chapter 1, "Context and Historical Overview of Canadian Magazines," departs from this central

⁶ This excellent source is currently largely inaccessible due to its entrapment in an obsolete DOS-based format. Dr. Vincent is in the process of investigating solutions for its recovery. I tracked down an old computer with a Windows 98 platform in order to read the CD-ROM, which proved invaluable. Happily, just after my defence, I heard from Dr. Vincent that there had been movement on the plan to resurrect the database, so hopefully it will be operational and accessible again soon.

organization by tracing the Canadian magazine industry's development chronologically, examining the evolution and consistencies of the periodicals by providing details on their appearance, content, and longevity, as well as contextual information about the social, regulatory and technological developments that affected the publishing industry at various stages. The influences of the British and American magazine industries are also noted at each juncture, along with the progress of the inter-related domestic newspaper industry. This background is intended to prepare the reader for a more nuanced understanding of the primary texts to be discussed in subsequent chapters.

The next three chapters follow up on Claude Bissell's proposal in his essay on "Literary Taste in Central Canada During the Late Nineteenth Century," where he promotes literary periodicals as a source by suggesting that the student of literary taste must "search out the direct comment made by writers who have either a professional or a personal interest in literature and who are addressing themselves to an audience that clearly shares their interest" (237). Chapter 2, "Themes in Canadian Magazine Prefaces," examines the inaugural prefaces of major (and some minor) nineteenth-century Canadian general interest and literary magazines to discover how editors articulated their goals and ambitions in print. By examining these prefaces thematically, the chapter summarizes continuities as well as departures to note how editorial prerogatives changed as the century progressed and the industry matured and expanded. Since this dissertation seeks to explore the ways in which editors designed their magazines as domestic forums for intellectual and cultural development, the chapter focuses particularly on such themes as patriotism, cultural nationalism, and anti-Americanism.

Chapter 3, “Rhetoric in Canadian Magazine Prefaces,” deepens the exploration of the prefaces introduced in the previous chapter by considering rhetorical devices such as metaphor, imagery and persona, employed by editors in their efforts to rally readers and potential contributors in support of their editorial vision. Again, by noting the consistency with which certain techniques and even specific metaphors were used by editors, this chapter reinforces the continuities in this realm, as well as mapping the unique turns of phrase that make the prefaces stand out individually as quasi-literary texts in their own right.

Chapter 4, “Sites of Editorial Interaction in Canadian Magazines,” attempts to gain further insights into the editor-writer relationship by examining sites of editorial interaction. With a primary focus on the editorial correspondence departments in which editors published acceptances, rejections, and editorial feedback on submissions, this chapter examines the advice that editors provided to potential contributors and considers the editorial values established within these spaces. Given the public nature of these editorial correspondences, the chapter considers the didactic effect of these columns not only on contributors but on the reading public at large in conveying the magazine’s editorial standards.

Finally, Chapter 5, “Canadian Magaziners,” profiles some early magazine writers to consider how they used the periodicals to develop their craft and access a literate audience. The chapter maximizes existing resources by using existing indexes as sources to determine the most prolific contributors to a handful of significant periodicals across the decades. In the early century, the chapter traces individual writers and their trajectory through the magazines. In the later century, the chapter examines the contributors who

emerged around some of the more successful and long-lasting titles of this era. In the case of canonical writers, their prolific magazine contribution often justifies their renown and sheds light on their efforts. For the majority of magazine writers whose status is now minor or obscure, their prolific appearance in the magazines speaks to the possible value of their recovery in providing a more nuanced picture of Canada's early culture and literary community.

By bringing renewed attention to nineteenth-century Canadian magazines, this dissertation seeks not only to remind researchers in fields from history to literature to political science of their value as repositories of contemporary thought, but also to encourage fellow Canadian magazine enthusiasts to expand the field of research around magazines as a genre. As contemporary witnesses to emerging literature, magazines provide a refreshing perspective on their eras unaltered by the benefits of retrospect, as Dr. A.J. Christie, then editor of *The Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository*, eloquently and presciently noted in his preface to the magazine's fourth volume:

...the writer who lives at the moment the performance is going on, can perceive and appreciate the secret motives of many an actor and place these in their proper light: which the future historian who only judges of the act by its effects cannot do. ("Preface to the Fourth Volume." *The Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository* Jan. 1825: n. pag)

For literary scholars in particular, magazines allow a closer vantage point from which to gain a more nuanced picture of early cultural life, adding a wider range of voices to the existing canonical texts from which we draw most of our conclusions about Canadian literature. Such an opportunity frees us momentarily to witness editorial judgement (good

and bad) afresh as it unfolded, and to regain a more nuanced perspective on a creative world whose contributors paved the way for literary development in Canada.

CHAPTER 1

Context and Historical Overview of Canadian Magazines

To place the first issue of Canada's first periodical, *The Nova-Scotia Magazine and Comprehensive Review of Literature, Politics, and News* (1789-92), beside the first issue of a late nineteenth-century title such as *The Canadian Magazine of Politics, Science, Art and Literature* (1893-1937) is to witness a significant contrast and a notable evolution. Beyond a double-column layout and an eighty-page length, the magazines share few visual similarities. *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* features mostly reprinted content, a plain cover, no advertising, few attributions, and certainly nothing as bold as an identifiable by-line. By contrast, *The Canadian Magazine* (one of several with this title over the years) features spot illustrations on several pages as well as four full-page illustrations, and thirteen pages of advertising. Perhaps most noticeably, nearly all the contents of *The Canadian Magazine* are original, with by-lines listed directly on the title page boasting some of the late century's best known-writers, including William Wilfred Campbell and E. Pauline Johnson.

Yet beyond improved production values and greater originality, the later magazine shares more with its earlier counterpart than is apparent at first glance, particularly in the ways that it echoes its predecessor's mandate to engage readers in civic and ultimately national improvement. While the measure and reliability of this community betterment had evolved—the editor of *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* called out into the wilderness for local farmers to share agriculture tips, whereas the editor of *The Canadian Magazine* confidently announced he had secured contributions from “many of the leading public men and writers of both political parties” (“Announcement.” *The*

Canadian Magazine Mar. 1893: 1)—the notion that a literary magazine could offer a forum for intellectual information sharing remained constant. Although the rest of this chapter will trace the industry’s evolution, these continuities, particularly of purpose and outlook, are equally important to the story of magazines in Canada.

Since this dissertation aims principally to trace the development of the nineteenth-century Canadian magazine industry through the original words of its editors, the present chapter aims to establish a context for this reading by offering a chronological overview of the industry from its origins through to 1900. Brief background information on the wider Canadian journalism field, as well as on the influential British and American magazine industries, provides further perspective, as do technological, historical, regulatory, and socio-economic details on relevant topics such as printing, literacy, and copyright. Besides describing individual magazines, this overview draws readily on existing magazine histories such as N. Merrill Distad and Linda Distad’s excellent chapter on Canada in *Periodicals of Queen Victoria’s Empire*, as well as related histories like George Parker’s *The Beginnings of the Book Trade in Canada* and Paul Rutherford’s *A Victorian Authority*.

In documenting the emergence of the Canadian magazine industry, previous historians have tended to approach the genre by region, tracing periodicals through Atlantic Canada or Upper and Lower Canada respectively, yet the fact that so many magazine publishers faced the same hardships and decisions suggests that a collective consideration may be productive. As Carole Gerson noted in explaining her similar approach in *A Purer Taste*, here too “consistency overrides regional variation” as each community embraced a common British heritage, and faced similar obstacles in dealing

with American competition, and in developing its own sense of a national literature (ix).⁷ As such, chronology provides the main organizing principle for the chapter, although regional developments are occasionally addressed within that organization as needed for clarity.

Before delving into specific titles, it is helpful to consider some overall characteristics and particularly limitations that plagued Canada's periodical press from the beginning. In their chapter on Canadian periodicals in *Periodicals of Queen Victoria's Empire*, N. Merrill Distad and Linda M. Distad accurately summarize the Canadian publishing industry's challenges: a small population base, geographic dispersal, linguistic fragmentation, low historical literacy levels, discriminatory copyright regulations, and foreign competition (64). Of these, the small population base and foreign competition were probably the greatest hindrances to literary development and the reasons that, in spite of their editors' altruistic efforts, the magazine industry remained relatively weak. Yet viewed another way, perhaps these factors also shaped the nature of general interest and literary magazines in nineteenth-century Canada, as they forced editors to embrace their domestic positioning as a unique selling point in the face of behemoth competition.

Foreign Models for Canadian Magazines

As W. H. Kesterton points out in *A History of Journalism in Canada*, even at their earliest stages, British North American print ventures were not originals but transplants of templates developed in Britain and New England. Britain's first newspaper, the *Oxford Gazette*, appeared in 1665, and America's inaugural *Boston News Letter* began in 1704

⁷ Gerson also reminds readers that her literary history is that of a cultural elite, "dedicated, articulate and usually privileged by education or economic status," a note that applies equally to the study of magazines (xi).

(Kesterton 1).⁸ While magazines followed newspapers into existence even in Britain and America, by the time magazines appeared in Canada in 1789, these foreign industries had each seen several decades of growth. In Britain, Edward Cave's *Gentleman's Magazine*, established in 1731, is widely recognized as the first true miscellany as well as the first to use the term "magazine,"⁹ in spite of important precursors such as Daniel Defoe's *Review* and Addison and Steele's *Tatler* and *Spectator*. Andrew Bradford's *American Magazine* and Benjamin Franklin's *General Magazine* appeared within days of each other to inaugurate the United States magazine industry in 1741, lasting for three and six months respectively (Mott 1: 24).

By 1789, these foreign industries were already substantial, especially in Britain, where the population would rise from 6 million mid-century to 10.5 million by 1800 (Dudek 39). As Harold Herd remarks in *The March of Journalism*, in 1753 over seven million copies of journals were being sold annually in Britain, a number that would double within a quarter of a century (65). By 1797, as Alvin Sullivan notes in *British Literary Magazines*, the circulations of major British monthly reviews and magazines had already reached between 3,250 and 5,000, which was high by comparison to the average book run. The form had also evolved. Enumerating Cave's many imitators, Walter Graham explains in *English Literary Periodicals* that the late eighteenth-century magazine had moved towards more original contributions and increased in variety beyond literature and politics to include topics such as science and agriculture, forms

⁸ The most comprehensive general overviews of foreign magazine industries include Alvin Sullivan's four volume *British Literary Magazines* and Frank Luther Mott's five volume *A History of American Magazines 1731-1930*. Walter Graham's *English Literary Periodicals*, Harold Herd's *The March of Journalism: The Story of the British Press from 1622 to the Present Day*, and Louis Dudek's *Literature and the Press: A History of Printing, Printed Media, and Their Relation to Literature* provide further context.

⁹ Cave borrowed the word "magazine" from the military term for a munitions storehouse, redeploying it to indicate his publication's role as a repository for literary selections.

such as biographical sketches, novels and essays, and visual aspects such as illustrations (192). By the early nineteenth century, British magazines sold at a price range between one shilling, six pence and two shillings, six pence (Sullivan 1: xvi). Such parameters provided Canadian editors with templates as well as standards against which readers could compare inaugural local efforts.

Despite the fact that the American magazine industry by 1789 was still in what Frank Luther Mott describes as its “lean years,” by late century a handful of magazines were circulating simultaneously at any one time, most commonly issued from the three publishing hubs of Philadelphia, Boston, and New York. At 4.5 million, the United States’ population was already much higher than that of British North America, and as such American magazines had achieved far higher circulations than a Canadian newcomer could expect. At the top, the *Pennsylvania Magazine* edited by Thomas Paine briefly achieved 1,500 subscribers by 1775 and the *American Museum* reached 1,250 in 1792. Yet American magazine circulation was still low compared with Britain, and at an average lifespan of 18 months magazines were still short-lived (Mott 1: 14). Typical American magazines still followed Cave’s template, featuring a sixty-four-page octavo with small type, occasionally illustrated with woodcuts. With an annual subscription rate around \$2.00 before and \$2.50 to \$3.00 (or fifteen to twenty shillings) after the Revolution, magazines were a luxury item that would cost a labourer approximately a week’s salary (Mott 1: 33-34).

Remarkably, Mott’s enumeration of the obstacles faced by American magazines at this time closely mirrors those that would hinder the Canadian market for years to come: manufacturing difficulties, inadequate distribution, discriminatory postal rates,

public indifference, and subscriber delinquency (1: 13). On a more positive note, Canadian editors also shared the motivations that Mott claims had spurred their American counterparts: to present their nation back to the world. No doubt writers and editors from both new nations had taken note of the important role that magazines were playing in the careers of leading British writers such as Samuel Johnson, Oliver Goldsmith, and Tobias Smollett¹⁰ and aspired to develop their own magazine industries to the point where they could be equally useful in building their national cultures and literary reputations.

A Canadian Industry is Born

For John Howe,¹¹ already an established printer and publisher of the *Halifax Journal*, and Reverend William Cochran, an Anglican minister turned editor,¹² starting *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* in the shadow of such advanced industries carried the advantage of established templates and public enthusiasm for the genre, but also the potential burden of being judged against more sophisticated foreign products.¹³ This concern was expressed directly in the magazine's inaugural preface, to be discussed in the next chapter. As Howe was well aware, domestic print had been a fixture in Nova Scotia, and even Canada, for decades. Boston printer John Bushell had established the region's first newspaper, the *Halifax Gazette* (1752-66), over thirty-five years earlier. Subsequent newspaper inaugurations in other cities included the *Quebec Gazette* (1764-1934) in Quebec City, the *Royal Gazette and Nova Scotia Intelligencer* (1783-1807) in Carleton (soon to detach as New Brunswick a year later), and the *Upper Canada Gazette or*

¹⁰ Johnson started his own essay magazine, *The Rambler* (1750–52), Goldsmith contributed to *The Monthly Review* (1749–1845), and Smollett edited *The Critical Review* (1756–1817).

¹¹ John Howe was father to the famous publisher and politician Joseph Howe.

¹² Cochran departed a year later to take up an appointment as president of King's College in Windsor. Davies provides an extended biography of Cochran in her dissertation chapter (21).

¹³ Davies cites library holdings and bookseller lists to show that Nova Scotians were already consumers of foreign periodicals even from the earliest eras (4).

American Oracle (1793-1849) in Newark (later Niagara-on-the-Lake) (Kesterton 2-4). As Kesterton describes them, these early colonial papers were typically dependent on government patronage, published weekly or biweekly, and boasted between 50 and 150 subscribers. Printed on flatbed, hand-operated presses, newspapers were rarely longer than four pages, and featured government announcements and foreign news (local news was circulated by word of mouth) in a fairly monotonous layout (Kesterton 6-8). Marie Tremain's *A Bibliography of Canadian Imprints, 1751-1800* provides a thorough accounting of these early attempts, their proprietors, and their character. By the time *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* appeared, three newspapers published regularly in Halifax: the *Nova Scotia Gazette* (founded in 1769), the *Halifax Journal* (1781), and the *Halifax Chronicle* (1786).

Nevertheless, by being the first to declare his publication a magazine, Howe signalled his interest in inaugurating a new kind of public conversation in his community. The timing was also right for such a venture. In her dissertation chapter on the magazine, Gwendolyn Davies credits the arrival of the 30,000 United Empire Loyalists to the "largely undeveloped" Halifax (which housed fewer than 2,000 permanent residents in 1783) as motivating the development of the cultural institutions such as newspapers, churches, and academies that appeared in this era. That said, Davies warns that "to approach *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* as a totally Loyalist journal is to ignore the subtleties of its execution and the character of its two editors" (18). Sent out to two hundred subscribers solicited through an advance "prospectus"¹⁴ (an established practice

¹⁴ The prospectus appeared in the Saint John *Royal Gazette* as well as in Halifax (Davies 23). Davies identifies *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* as the only Maritime periodical pre-Confederation to publish its subscriber list, revealed as merchants, barristers, doctors, clergy, and members of his Majesty's Council. Davies notes however that subscribers were not just from Nova Scotia but also from P.E.I., Cape Breton

for new literary ventures), the first *Nova-Scotia Magazine* appeared in July 1789, measured five by eight inches with a blue cover, and offered at its outset eighty pages monthly at a cost of four dollars per annum or two shillings an issue.

Contents included primarily non-fiction articles that were several pages in length (and occasionally serialized) on subjects from local history to geography to natural history to exotic curiosities. Although its articles were mostly reprinted from books, encyclopedias, and other magazines, they were also remarkably current, date-stamped as originating within the past year. Even in the early issues there is remarkable variety and didactic authority evident in editorial choices. For instance, the magazine included histories of both Nova Scotia and Canada in its first few numbers, as well as selected articles on topics such as “the rise and progress of agriculture” that would appeal to readers’ practicality,¹⁵ alongside investigations on “the manners of the Italians,” “account of the Patagonians,”¹⁶ “the nourishment of vegetables,” and “observations on the natural history of the cuckoo” (to name a few from the first issue), that would appeal equally to their curiosity. By layering the magazine’s contents with a balance of local and cosmopolitan topics, Cochran provided an editorial mix that was grounded in a sense of place but that also offered a connection to the world beyond the colony.¹⁷

and New Brunswick, and represented a wider spectrum than just the elite, with occupations including hairdressers, carpenters and shopkeepers. The magazine’s circulation later stabilized at 270 subscribers (19).

¹⁵ Tremaine notes that these practical articles were particularly vital given the crop failures that had occurred in the “Hungry Year” of 1788-89 (xiv).

¹⁶ These are only the first of a series of profiles of different world nationalities, a choice that lends a cosmopolitan sensibility which would be shared by many successors.

¹⁷ Further editorial customization is evident, for instance, in the decision in the third issue to interrupt a historical account of early Canada from Abbé Raynal and insert another version from histories by Hutchinson and Major Walley with an editorial note that indicated these latter sources dealt less superficially with the invasion of Canada in 1690 (Untitled note. *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* Sept. 1789: 162), an intervention that demonstrates editorial prerogative.

Original work, mostly poetry but occasionally articles, was either anonymous or marked with initials such as J.C., W. (likely editor William Cochran), or pseudonyms such as “Pollio.” The magazine also contained departments such as meteorological tables, birth and death announcements, foreign reports, and parliamentary debates.

Unfortunately, as Davies reports, the magazine saw a decline in its regional and literary identity after Cochran left the magazine, as well as attempts by Howe to make the publication more affordable, including a reduced length from eighty to sixty-four pages that enabled a price reduction to fifteen shillings per annum (29). Clearly neither strategy worked as the magazine finally closed in March 1792, with subscriber delinquency identified as the major culprit in its demise. In spite of Howe’s disappointment at its closure (as his farewell address quoted in the next chapter will verify), at 33 issues the magazine demonstrated relatively good longevity, notably more so than the first American periodicals.

Naturally magazines would evolve throughout the century, yet many aspects of *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*’s template became typical. Howe’s use of a prospectus and inaugural preface, coupled with the magazine’s eclectic mix of historical, didactic, and topical articles alongside a smattering of poetry remained remarkably consistent through the century. Although it is unwise to generalize extensively about dozens of magazines, editorial features documenting regional and then Canadian history, geography, and public figures continued to appear throughout the century. Magazines consistently used “departments” as a means of organizing regular topics. Since originality was a competitive advantage in a market saturated with sophisticated foreign competitors, many editors called readers’ attention to such contents with labels such as “original” or “for the

[magazine title].” These are just some of the continuities in Canadian magazines, more of which will be highlighted as this chronology progresses.

A Quiet Beginning: Magazines to the Mid-1820s

After *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*, the only other magazine attempted in the eighteenth century was the 68-page bilingual¹⁸ monthly *The Quebec Magazine; or Useful and Entertaining Repository of Science, Morals, History, Politics etc, Particularly adapted for the use of British America* (1792-94), launched in Quebec City by printer Samuel Neilson and continued by his brother John after his death.¹⁹ Edited by Presbyterian minister Alexander Spark²⁰ and presented by “a society of gentlemen,” *The Quebec Magazine* featured articles on a range of topics, including history, politics, religion, education, and agriculture, with serious subjects such as the voyages of Christopher Columbus and the American Revolution alongside lighter fare such as an interview about a discovery of ambergris (a secretion of sperm whales used to make perfume) and an account of spontaneous human combustion. A twenty-page “Monthly Chronicle” of foreign news as well as a “Provincial Register” of local events provided a newsier element. As with *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*, the magazine’s (principally non-fiction) works were occasionally attributed with pen names or initials but mostly selected from other magazines.²¹

¹⁸ The bilingual tradition would not continue. As previously noted, this dissertation focuses only on English language periodicals, even though French Canadian periodicals are very worthy of further study.

¹⁹ John Neilson was also the first of many journalists to enter active politics. George Parker’s *The Beginnings of the Book Trade in Canada* provides a biography of Neilson (36).

²⁰ Tremaine notes that Spark was paid 59 pounds 10 shillings for his work over nearly two years (657).

²¹ In “Magazines in English” in the first volume of the *History of the Book in Canada*, Thomas Brewer Vincent, Sandra Alston and Eli MacLaren note a contrast between the urban/mercantile concerns and public affairs focus of *The Quebec Magazine* and *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*’s vision of rural retirement and intellectual curiosity (242).

After the appearance and closure of two solid and relatively long-lived journals in the eighteenth century, the early decades of the nineteenth century witnessed mostly infrequent, solitary, and short-lived attempts. The newspaper industry fared better with twenty news sheets appearing in British North America by 1813, although Kesterton notes that these journals were similarly erratic, with fairly low circulation. Many folded or were suspended by the War of 1812, when the total dropped to six (11). No doubt such preoccupations similarly stalled the magazine industry, since almost ten years would pass between the 1794 demise of *The Quebec Magazine* and the emergence of *The British-American Register* (Jan.-Aug. 1803), started in Quebec by printer Pierre-Edouard Desbarats along with John Neilson. As the first weekly magazine, this sixteen-page bilingual paper was newsier than its monthly predecessors, with parliamentary and foreign reports, poetry, essays, and articles on topics such as travel and politics. By its secular, public affairs focus, *The British-American Register* stands in contrast with the decade's other magazines, which were mostly religious. Efforts in this realm included the single issue *The Nova Scotia and New Brunswick Magazine: The Historical, Literary, Theological and Miscellaneous Repository* (1806)²² and Anglican leader John Strachan's Kingston-based (later York-based) *Christian Recorder* (1819-20), a forty-page monthly that was the first magazine to be attempted in Upper Canada (Vincent et al., "Magazines in English" 243).

As these examples demonstrate, even at this early juncture magazines started to exhibit the wide variety that makes their categorization as "literary" or even "magazine" a challenge. A religious magazine's denominational focus did not preclude it from being

²² Davies also describes another eight-page weekly magazine called the *Novator* that published from 1808-1810 (46).

literary, yet not every religious magazine could be described as such. Furthermore, not every magazine succeeded in fulfilling the ideals of the genre to provide relevant articles (ideally original but even selected) and opportunities for reader engagement. For example, a comparison of *The Nova Scotia and New Brunswick Magazine* with the *Christian Recorder*, both religious productions, reveals the latter to be much more culturally interesting, with original (unsigned) articles focussed on local religious issues and a column intended to address readers' moral and philosophical questions (presenting some of the first domestic examples of editorial interaction). At the other end of the spectrum, *The British-American Register*, with its shorter items and newsier focus, reveals a close proximity between magazines and newspapers.²³ With most newspapers published weekly or semi-weekly (Canada would not see its first consistently daily paper until the *Globe* made the switch in 1853),²⁴ periodicity did not yet define magazines. Nor did magazines have a monopoly on literature, given that newspapers could equally attract literary content (Thomas McCulloch's Mephibosheth Stepsure Letters in *The Acadian Recorder* and Thomas Chandler Haliburton's Sam Slick sketches in *The Novascotian*). In summary, it is most helpful to look at magazines and newspapers, particularly in this era, as existing along a spectrum, given—to echo Distad and Distad—their common origins and custom of sharing subject matter, social roles, audience, contributors, and personnel (63-64).

²³ This particular title is in fact not referenced on any of the three major magazine lists, but is suggested by Kesterton. While the lists overlap considerably, there are also a number of titles left out by each list at points throughout the century, a fact that confirms the ongoing difficulty of identifying magazines even as the century progressed.

²⁴ Canada's first failed attempts at dailies include Montreal's *Daily Advertiser* in 1833 and Toronto's *British Standard* in 1836. By the 1840s, the Montreal *Herald* and *Gazette* published daily during the busier summer months (Distad and Distad 69).

While the first two decades of the nineteenth century were relatively quiet for Canadian magazines, foreign industries continued to grow. In Britain, the new century saw the rise of the great reviews, celebrated for their high quality literary criticism and partisan identity. The Whig *Edinburgh Review* (1802-1929), which published in 252-page volumes priced at five shillings, saw a peak circulation of 14,000 by 1818 (Herd 189-190). The magazine also set a standard to pay contributors at a decent rate of about one pound five shillings per page (Dudek 85). Subsequent reviews included the Tory rival *Quarterly Review* (1809-1967), and the Radical *Westminster Review* (1824–1914). Other important British literary magazines in this early period were also celebrated for their high-quality contributions from the likes of Charles Lamb, William Hazlitt, Thomas De Quincy, and Leigh Hunt. Examples include Hunt’s radical weekly *Examiner* (1808-81), the *New Monthly Magazine* (1814-84), the *London Magazine* (1820-29), and *Fraser’s Magazine* (1830-82). Perhaps the most significant was *Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine* (1817-1980). In America, Mott calls 1794-1825 “the period of nationalism” in American magazines, during which the impulse towards a national literature ran as a prominent theme (Mott 1: 183). Weeklies were most significant in the early century, to the point where “nearly any town of any size had a literary miscellany at some time in this period” (Mott 1: 126). The most successful of these was the Philadelphia *Port Folio* (Mott 1: 123). By 1825, one hundred magazines were circulating in the United States (Mott 1: 20), and by 1819 the *Christian Spectator* had become the first American magazine to pay contributors, at a rate of one dollar per page (Mott 1: 197).

By contrast with foreign counterparts, the Canadian magazine scene of the 1820s could scarcely be called an industry. Yet the genre had stabilized to the point where titles

appeared slightly less sporadically and, for the first time, concurrently. Lower Canada, which had a population of 479, 288 by 1825 (MacDonald, *Literature and Society in the Canadas* 9), inaugurated the majority of significant magazines in this decade. The launch of two relatively contemporary weeklies,²⁵ a sixteen-page, Quebec-based *The Enquirer: A Quebec Publication* (1821-22), edited by C.D.E. (Chevalier Robert-Anne d'Estimauville de Beaumouchel), and *The Scribbler: A Series of Weekly Essays Published in Montreal, L.C., on Literary, Critical, Satirical, Moral, and Local Subjects: Interspersed with Pieces of Poetry* (1821-27), an eight-page Montreal-based publication edited by Lewis Luke McCulloch, Esq. (Samuel Hull Willocke), represented not only a shift in periodicity but in character, with the editors presenting a notably more informal and colourful personae than in the earlier magazines.²⁶ As the next chapters will discuss in more detail, C.D.E., who according to Carl Klinck's description in the *Literary History of Canada* was a native Canadian returned to Quebec in 1812 at age fifty-seven after many years abroad (143), used humour, wit, informality, and a playful tone to develop a style that allowed him to write relatively innocuously about contentious subjects such as press freedom, politics, and education. Creative works, including the editor's autobiography as well as a forward-looking serial that imagined life in Canada five hundred years in the future, added to the magazine's imaginative bent.

In producing a weekly that "had the notoriety of a scandal sheet in its own time" (Klinck, *Literary History* 148), *The Scribbler's* Willocke pushed this persona device even further, inviting early sympathy with a story about his plight editing his magazine in exile

²⁵ Yet another semi-monthly, *The Literary Miscellany*, edited by Henry John Hagan in Montreal was even shorter lived from November 1822-June 1823 (Klinck 146).

²⁶ This persona approach was likely modelled on British figures like "Sylvanus Urban" of the *Gentleman's Magazine* of 1731, or, more contemporaneously, "Christopher North" of *Blackwood's Magazine* of 1817.

from Vermont because he was evading forgery charges brought by his employers.²⁷

Originally offering a single weekly essay, *The Scribbler* evolved into a review format and eventually engaged readers to contribute letters and poetry (Adam Hood Burwell was a prolific contributor under the pseudonym “Erieus”). Willocke’s loyal following was speculated to have been at least partially motivated by fear given his penchant for scandalizing citizens through malicious gossip.

Other Montreal-based magazines appearing in the 1820s present a contrast to these weeklies in their size and serious approach. *The Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository* (1823-25) was a monthly printed by Nahum Mower for bookseller Joseph Nickless and sold for six dollars per annum (Vincent et al., “Magazines in English” 246), anonymously edited by David Chisholme, a protégé of Lord Dalhousie. The editorship was subsequently assumed by Dr. A.J. Christie (previously editor of the *Montreal Herald*) when Chisholme left the magazine to edit a new venture, *The Canadian Review and Literary and Historical Journal* (1824-26, later renamed *The Canadian Review and Magazine*).²⁸ *The Canadian Review* was published semi-annually by rival bookseller H.H. Cunningham²⁹ and sponsored by the founders of the newly formed Quebec Literary and Historical Society. Both *The Canadian Magazine* and *The Canadian Review* were large volumes at over ninety and two hundred pages respectively, and in their

²⁷ Klinck profiles the spry Willocke and his adventures in the *Journal of Canadian Fiction*, expanding not only on his forgery trial but also providing details on his immigration to Canada, and his other publishing ventures, including his involvement with a political sheet called *The Free Press*, and his final position post-*Scribbler* as a parliamentary reporter in Quebec. A doctoral dissertation has recently been completed on this magazine as well.

²⁸ MacDonald notes that Chisholme was paid one hundred pounds per annum as editor of the *Montreal Gazette* and ten pounds per month as editor of *The Canadian Magazine*. Christie was paid 200 pounds per annum for the joint editorship (MacDonald, “Some notes” 35). Christie penned a vicious review of the new journal on its initial appearance. *The Canadian Magazine* attained four hundred subscribers (MacDonald, *Literature and Society in the Canadas* 51).

²⁹ Parker emphasizes that bookseller-publishers were a frequent business combination in the colonial publishing trade, one that originated in Britain and was transplanted from the American experience (25).

resemblance to the great British reviews their editors (as Klinck rightly notes) “were courageously, and perhaps naively, determined to make the large and handsome issues of their magazines not unworthy Canadian parallels of the Edinburgh models” (146). Like previous titles, these magazines offered selections that were clearly tailored to local readers given their focus on the region’s history and geography. *The Canadian Magazine*, for instance, published articles on arctic exploration, a history of Montreal, the fur trade, and the Lachine Canal. *The Canadian Review* was decidedly more review-oriented and used books as a means of discussing contemporary subjects, from geography to literature.³⁰ After three issues, *The Canadian Review* evolved into *The Canadian Review and Magazine*, noted for its role in reprinting Oliver Goldsmith’s *Rising Village*. Unlike the weeklies, the tone of these quarterlies is somewhat more formal and institutional, foregoing wit and informality in favour of a more serious and authoritative style.

Although the Maritimes had not seen a major publication since *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*, this decade saw a new magazine emerge to reflect the intellectual stimulation and cultural development in that region. In Halifax, *The Acadian Magazine; or, Literary Mirror, Consisting of Original and Selected Matter on Literary and Other Subjects* (1826-28) was a double-column, forty-page monthly magazine published by Jacob Sparling Cunnabell³¹ and edited anonymously, although Davies identifies the editors (via a late century newspaper interview with Cunnabell) as Beamish Murdoch and J. Scott Tremain (53). Davies notes that the magazine cost four dollars per annum, and “introduced the miscellany format into literary periodical publishing in the Maritimes in a

³⁰ Ballstadt estimates in his unpublished thesis that *The Canadian Review* maintained approximately 77 percent Canadian content (18).

³¹ Jacob Sparling Cunnabell and his brother William would become Halifax’s most active publishers until the late 1850s (Parker 60).

more comprehensive way than had *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*,” by offering elements such as fiction and literary criticism in addition to the standard essays, articles, and poetry (92). The magazine cemented its reputation by its support for regional poets and by publishing its first wholly original issue in January 1827.

Religious titles continued to proliferate in the 1820s. These included Montreal’s *The Canadian Miscellany, or, The Religious, Literary and Statistical Intelligencer* (Apr.-Sept. 1828), published by H. Esson, the Saint John’s weekly *The New-Brunswick Religious and Literary Journal* (1829-30), published by Alexander McLeod, and Kingston’s *The Lower Canada Watchman* (1829).³² The 1820s also witnessed the first appearance of trade magazines, including farm journals first appearing in the mid-1820s, and the first medical journal, to name a couple of examples. The first youth magazine, *Youth’s Monitor and Monthly Magazine* appeared in 1836. Although a detailed account of trade periodicals is beyond the scope of this general overview, it is worth noting that these magazines also suffer from scholarly neglect and are worthy of further study.³³

Lots of Enthusiasm, Little Longevity: Magazines in the 1830s

The 1830s witnessed a significant increase in attempts at literary magazines, with varying degrees of success. In order to keep track of a plethora of titles in this decade, a review by region is fitting before moving into consideration of their generic and literary commonalities. Nova Scotia remained a hub, with *The Halifax Monthly Magazine* (1830-33), *The British North American Magazine and Colonial Journal* (1831-?), edited by Edmund Ward in Halifax, *The Bee: A Weekly Journal Devoted to News, Politics,*

³² A single issue of a magazine called the *Rose Harp* also appeared in Upper Canada in 1823 (Vincent et al., “Magazines in English” 246).

³³ Specialized magazines were also important to literary development because they represented additional markets for writers’ work. Distad and Distad provide a good introduction to some of the major specialty journals by category (100-129).

Literature, Agriculture, etc. (1835-38) in Pictou, and the weekly *Pearl: Devoted to Polite Literature, Science, and Religion* (1837-40, continued in 1838 as the *Halifax Pearl* and in 1839 as the *Colonial Pearl*). Saint John, New Brunswick, saw two literary magazines appear: the *Two Penny Magazine; A Weekly Museum of Literary Amusement and Instruction* (1834, editor George Blatch, no extant issues), and the short-lived *The Saint John Monthly Magazine* (July-Dec. 1836, editor Patrick Bennett).

Started by Jacob Sparling Cunnabell and edited by John Sparrow Thompson, who later took over as proprietor, the single-column, forty-page (later forty-nine-page) *Halifax Monthly Magazine* at twelve shillings per annum offered topical articles on religion, politics, education, music, and science as well as tales, biographical sketches, poetry, and fiction. Distad and Distad note that it even innovated with an advertising supplement (73). In her MA thesis covering both *The Halifax Monthly Magazine* and *The Pearl*, Nancy Fraser points to the former magazine's literary criticism and local character, which she cites as evidence of Thompson's personal interest in both of these concerns (42). Thompson would go on to become the second editor of *The Pearl*, published by William Cunnabell, which Fraser assesses to be similarly literary under his direction, in contrast with its first editor Reverend Thomas Taylor.³⁴ As eight-page weeklies, *The Pearl* and the earlier *Bee* offer a contrast to the typical monthly, not only in their more frequent publishing schedule but in their denser layout and newsy appearance, including much advertising in their final pages. Both included fiction and poetry as well as topical articles, although *The Bee* seems slightly newsier with regular departments such as

³⁴ Fraser notes further differences between the two editors, including Taylor's greater flamboyance in contrast to Thompson's more subdued style (she credits his journalistic training) as well as Thompson's greater success in soliciting local contributions (which she attributes to his closer involvement in and ties to the community). She observes that the practical results of Thompson's dedication meant that he printed one and a half times as much original poetry in 14 months as Taylor had in two years (60).

agricultural, colonial, shipping news, and miscellany. Fraser notes that *The Pearl* cost 15 shillings per annum and had a circulation of eight hundred by May 1839 (42).

New magazines continued to appear in Lower Canada, with *The Montreal Monthly Magazine* (Mar. 1831-?), *The Montreal Museum, or, Journal of Literature and Arts* (1832-34), Quebec's *Literary Transcript* (1839), and the most successful literary magazine to date, *The Literary Garland* (1838-51) published in Montreal. Published by John Wilson, the single extant issue of the single-column, twenty-four-page *Montreal Monthly Magazine* features original poetry but reprinted articles. The industry's first female editor, Mary Graddon Gosselin,³⁵ produced *The Montreal Museum* as a single-column, sixty-four-page monthly aimed principally at women with a broad range of contents, including poetry and fiction as well as science articles, biographical sketches, literary criticism, and fashion illustrations.³⁶

Yet Montreal's overwhelming success in this and the next decade was decidedly *The Literary Garland*,³⁷ a magazine that many literary historians rightly describe as a watershed both for its longevity and for its promotion of important writers such as Susanna Moodie, Rosanna Leprohon, and many others both known and obscure. Founded by publisher John Lovell and edited for most of its existence by his brother-in-law John Gibson, the monthly *Literary Garland* published everything from sketches and poetry to

³⁵ Gosselin was assisted initially by Elizabeth Tracey, sister of reform politician Daniel Tracey. The magazine was printed on the press of *La Minerve*, which was edited by Mrs. Gosselin's husband (MacDonald, "Montreal Museum" 139).

³⁶ In her article "The Montreal Museum, 1832-34: the Presence and Absence of Literary Women," Mary Lu Macdonald discusses the magazine's self-presentation, and offers a more precise formulation of its contents. She notes that many articles in the magazine dealt with the education of children, particularly girls (141).

³⁷ The cover title varies as *The Literary Garland and Canadian Magazine*, then *The Literary Garland and British North American Magazine* after 1847. The subtitle varies as "A monthly magazine devoted to the advancement of general literature" and "A monthly magazine of tales, sketches, poetry, music, engravings, &c. &c." The magazine began a second series in 1843.

serialized novels, sheet music, illustrations, literary criticism and reviews, in a principally double-column layout that spanned around fifty pages per issue. Besides prioritizing fiction serials and sketches, the magazine also featured a regular “Our Table” department that alerted readers to new books as well as new selections to appear in the magazine. In its sheer volume of creative work and particularly in the editorial commentary, the magazine demonstrated a commitment to literary development that will be further explored in subsequent chapters of this dissertation.

In Upper Canada, the 1830s finally witnessed the solid emergence of literary publishing, despite the limited longevity of many titles. The great migration was probably the most important factor in this expansion, given that the region’s population rose from 130,000 in 1823 to 450,000 by 1840, in a wave that arrived primarily from Britain and included not only agricultural settlers but also the elites who are presumed to have been the main consumers of early magazines, such as officials, clergy, and lawyers (Klinck, *Literary History* 155). Titles included the *Literary Miscellany* (1832) in Niagara, the *Voyager* (Feb. 1832, no extant issues), *The Canadian Casket* (1831-32), *The Canadian Garland; A Semi-Monthly Literary and Miscellaneous Journal* (1832-33, started as *The Garland*) all in Hamilton, and *The Canadian Magazine* (Jan.-Apr. 1833) and *The Canadian Literary Magazine* (Apr.-Oct. 1833), both published at York. The decade also saw the short-lived *The Mirror of Literature* published in Prescott (Nov.-Dec. 1835?), as well as *The Roseharp: For Beauty, Loyalty And Song* (1835) and the *Cabinet of Literature* (1838-39), both published in Toronto.

The semi-weeklies carried substantial fiction and poetry as well as topical articles, presented in a shorter format due to their limited space. Edited by John Gladwin and

published by A. Crossman, the semi-weekly, eight-page *Canadian Casket* (1831-32)³⁸ cost twelve shillings, six pence, and featured three columns divided by headers into departments such as arts, historical, biographical, natural history, and anecdotes. Fiction and a half-page poetry section, eventually labelled “Muse’s Corner,” rounded out the offering. Just before *The Casket*’s demise, the double-column, eight-page *Canadian Garland* (1832-33) was launched by Wyllys Smyth, with similar departments, serials, and topical articles organized by department for a price of \$1.50 per annum. The short-lived magazine garnered a circulation of around four hundred (Vincent et al., “Magazines in English” 249).

The monthlies shared similar features too. *The Canadian Magazine* (Jan.-Apr. 1833) was a single-column, ninety-six-page monthly, priced at three shillings per issue. Published by the king’s printer Robert Stanton and edited by William Sibbald, the magazine featured a regular, albeit pseudonymous, pool of contributors, including The Emigrant, The Rover, Cinna, and Outis. *The Canadian Literary Magazine* (Apr.-Oct. 1833) was a double-column, sixty-four-page monthly published by George Gurnett at a cost of three shillings per issue or six dollars per annum and edited by John Kent, a teacher at Upper Canada College (Klinck, *Literary History* 193). The magazine lasted for only three issues and featured fiction, geography, biography, travel, and science, with several inclusions appearing to be excerpts from works advertised for sale at the end of the issue. Advocated by Klinck as the most interesting publication of the decade (*Literary History* 155), *The Canadian Literary Magazine*’s table of contents featured the by-lines of Susanna Moodie, Dr. William “Tiger” Dunlop, “Guy Pollock” (Robert Douglas

³⁸ MacDonald notes a high percentage of Canadian content in these periodicals, suggesting domestic origins for two thirds of the poetry in *The Canadian Garland* and *The Canadian Casket* as well as a notably high domestic fiction content (*Literature and Society* 50, 57).

Hamilton), and student Henry Scadding (later to become a historian). The magazine also carried a lithographic portrait in each issue, making it the first to be regularly illustrated (Distad and Distad 79).

If previous decades witnessed the tentative arrival of magazines, the 1830s saw a more substantial establishment, particularly in Upper Canada. The decade saw more publishers and editors make second attempts at publication; for instance, publisher Cunnabell of *The Acadian Magazine* with *The Halifax Monthly Magazine*, and George Gurnett, who had previously published the *Gore Gazette* and other publications, with *The Canadian Literary Magazine*. Editors also began to be attached to successive publications; for instance, John Sparrow Thompson edited both *The Halifax Monthly Magazine* and *The Pearl* (and later Joseph Howe's *Novascotian*), and David Chisholme published *The Lower Canada Watchman* in 1829 after his experiences as editor of *The Canadian Magazine* and *The Canadian Review* of the 1820s (Chisholme would also edit the *Montreal Gazette* from 1837 to 1842). Various periodicities continued to appear, with weeklies such as the *Halifax Bee* and *Pearl* and semi-monthlies such as *The Canadian Garland* and *The Canadian Casket* appearing alongside the more common monthly format. Magazines experienced various degrees of longevity, from the possibly single issue *British North American Magazine and Colonial Journal*, and *Montreal Monthly Magazine*, to the short-lived Upper Canada titles that survived anywhere from four to over a dozen issues, to the weekly *Pearl* and *Bee*, which each lasted well over one hundred issues, to the ultimate watershed *The Literary Garland*, spanning more than a decade. Finally, an overall increase in fiction content is also remarkable in this era.

In addition to editorial developments, this era also witnessed important political and social changes that expanded both the reach and the readership of magazines and newspapers. Immigration, which had the greatest impact on Upper Canada, increased the population in the two Canadas to 677,000 in the 1840s (Kesterton 10),³⁹ a factor that made print even more essential as communities outgrew word-of-mouth as a means for circulating news. Newspapers expanded not only in numbers—Kesterton notes they reached 27 by 1829, 37 in 1831, and 50 by 1836 (11)—but also in circulation, such that by 1833 the thirty newspapers in Upper Canada had a combined circulation of 20, 000 (25).⁴⁰ Involvement in the complex political tensions leading up to the Rebellions of 1837 meant that editors and their newspapers became increasingly identified according to their political status as reform (such as the *Colonial Advocate*, or *La Minerve*), anti-reform, (such as the *Quebec Mercury* or *Montreal Gazette*) or moderate (such as the *Quebec Gazette* or *Christian Guardian*) (Kesterton 11). Journalists and proprietors developed political reputations, most notably Joseph Howe and William Lyon Mackenzie. Politicization had the effect of differentiating newspapers and magazines, the latter of which reacted to such partisanship by embracing a stance of neutrality, as verified by the prefaces discussed in the next two chapters. This stance furthermore marked a departure from British magazines known for their partisan affiliations.

³⁹ Populations had expanded from 1825 totals of 479 288 in Upper Canada and 157 923 in Lower Canada to 553 134 in Upper Canada and 236 702 in Lower Canada in 1831 to 890 261 in Upper Canada and 952 004 in Lower Canada in 1851, essentially tripling in 26 years (MacDonald 9).

⁴⁰ Kesterton further notes that Maritime newspapers had an average circulation of less than three hundred before 1850. In 1840 Halifax's nine newspapers had fewer than four thousand subscribers, while that same year the five weeklies in Saint John, New Brunswick did not reach a combined circulation of six hundred. Mary Lu MacDonald quotes various circulation figures (noting the rarity of disclosure), including the *Montreal Transcript* which claimed the largest in British North America at 2,250 in 1843. Most others did not claim higher than six to seven hundred and were often distinctly lower (50). MacDonald notes that almost all newspapers of this era were four pages, and cost three to four dollars or fifteen shillings (48).

Alongside magazines, other channels emerged to promote literacy and self-improvement. Beyond the parliamentary libraries which had appeared as early as the eighteenth century,⁴¹ and professional libraries which had begun to develop in the 1820s, this era saw increasing numbers of public and subscription libraries, as well as the continued establishment of informal literary societies and institutions of higher learning.⁴² Booksellers such as Montreal firms Armour and Ramsay and John Lovell continued to emerge and provide opportunities for writers as well as promote literary interest (Klinck, *Literary History* 194). By the late 1820s, newly-founded Mechanics' Institutes (an institution inaugurated in Britain) also offered lectures, classes, and lending libraries (Parker 95-97). In England, the impetus to cater to the growing interests in adult education programs and widen readership to a variety of classes had led to the establishment of cheap magazines such as Knight's *Penny Magazine* in 1832, which saw a circulation of 200,000 (Sullivan 1: xv) and Chambers' *Edinburgh Journal* in 1833.⁴³ This impulse towards wider availability was mirrored by Canadian penny tri-weeklies such as the *Montreal Transcript* in 1836 and *Saint John News* in 1839 (Rutherford, *A Victorian Authority* 37). Canadian magazines would begin to experiment with lower pricing in the next decade.

Mechanical improvements introduced at this time also had the potential to make publishing easier. Measures like the domestic sourcing of newsprint after 1800 aided cost-cutting, and the gradual replacement of wood hand-operated flatbed presses with

⁴¹ Ballstadt quotes J.M. Le Moine in noting that a circulating library in Quebec carried 2000 volumes as early as 1783 (8).

⁴² Foster Vernon's doctoral dissertation "The Development of Adult Education in Ontario, 1700-1900" provides further details on many of the institutions that contributed to the domestic adult education movement. Heather Murray's *Come Bright Improvement!* addresses early literary societies in Ontario.

⁴³ Richard Altick discusses the impact of these magazines on the increase of mass reading in *The English Common Reader* (332-338).

faster iron presses starting in the 1830s, helped to speed the printing process (Kesterton 24). Attaching steam power to the presses, as William Cunnabell of Halifax did with his Washington press by 1840, further increased output (Parker 47).⁴⁴ Yet these advancements were unfortunately undercut by legal and regulatory elements such as duty, postage rates, and copyright. High postage rates made importing from Britain less attractive since books and periodicals were charged a prohibitive letter rate compared with a cheap rate for newspapers, a factor that would not be resolved until later in the century (Parker 104). Although all American books until 1842 were subject to a high thirty percent duty (by comparison, books from Britain were assessed at 2.5 percent, although these faced high postage and transportation costs), this measure had little effect because American wholesalers provided a thirty to forty percent discount to Canadian buyers (plus six months credit). As a result, most books were still imported from the United States, which recognized no copyright but its own and therefore pirated British publications.

In 1842, the Imperial Copyright Act was instituted to eliminate the practice and protect British authors by forbidding the reprinting or importing of reprints of British copyrighted works into British North America.⁴⁵ The law made reading material unduly expensive for Canadians as it prohibited the import of cheap American editions. As a result, the statute was ignored by many and American reprints continued to flow across

⁴⁴ George Parker provides a detailed overview of the mechanics of the printing presses in *The Beginnings of the Book Trade in Canada* (44-52).

⁴⁵ The original British Copyright Act of 1709 had already established that copyright belonged to the author and limited the term of copyright initially to twenty-one years, extended later to forty-two years or seven years past an author's death. In practice authors often sold their copyright to publishers either outright or for profit-sharing.

the border.⁴⁶ An antagonistic relationship also developed between the custom houses and the booksellers as the former tried to confiscate the latter's wares (Wiseman 20).⁴⁷ Later, the copyright law was amended by the Foreign Reprints Act of 1847, which permitted the importation and sale of American reprints at a duty of 12.5 percent as compensation to British authors in lieu of royalties (Parker 107). But again the Act was difficult to put into effect since the control of customs houses had become the jurisdiction of the provinces, which had little incentive to enforce it. As a whole, the discriminatory laws stifled Canadian publishers, their overall effect being that they "created the anomaly of a foreigner having the right to supply a market," to quote publisher John Lovell (qtd. in Parker 107).

Meanwhile, foreign magazine industries were booming. Although British magazines were already entrenched in the literary culture, their impact and influence continued to grow, as over 50,000 titles would appear during the Victorian period (Sullivan 2: xiii). Magazines were already an established boon to a writer's career trajectory, but in this era the role of publishing and novel serialization became even more significant, with the rise of innovators like Charles Dickens, who began editing *Bentley's Miscellany* in 1837 (serializing *Oliver Twist*), followed by his *Household Words* in 1850 (which started as a twenty-four-page weekly miscellany costing two pence) and *All the Year Round* in 1859 (Graham 297). In *Literature and the Press*, Louis Dudek calls

⁴⁶ Americans booksellers also found a way around the law by sending parcels through the mail directly to individual subscribers. In his article "American Publications in Nineteenth-Century English Canada," Allan Smith documents the effect of this plethora of American reprints on the book review columns of several magazines, citing several instances where the majority of titles originated in the United States (17).

⁴⁷ In his article "Silent Companions: the Dissemination of Books and Periodicals in Nineteenth-Century Ontario," John Wiseman describes the conflicts that arose over these copyright issues, as well as the tactics that booksellers and agents used to maintain the flow of books to the public.

Bentley's “the first true example of the new type of popular fiction magazine,” that abandoned politics in a middle-class embrace of fiction serials (107).

In the United States, what Mott calls “the period of expansion,” saw an increase from approximately one hundred periodicals in 1825 to six hundred in 1850, along with an increase in average longevity from two to four years (1: 342). Notable American magazines included *Godey's Lady's Book* (1830-98), *Knickerbocker* (1833-65), and *Graham's Magazine* (1841-52). Each of these also moved towards a more popular style. By 1839 *Godey's* claimed a circulation of 25,000 and by 1842, *Graham's* had a circulation of 40,000 (Wood 51, 55). By mid-century, New York took the lead over Boston and Philadelphia as the industry's centre, although there was also remarkable growth regionally (Mott 1: 375). Mott furthermore notes the rise around the 1840s of the magazine writer (1: 494), who by mid-century might expect pay rates in the range of six dollars per page or fifty dollars per poem (although these rates varied widely).⁴⁸ Many of the best American authors to emerge this century were writing for the magazines, including Thoreau, Poe, Lowell, Hawthorne, Cooper, and Irving (Wood 64).

Literary Development, Specialization, and Experimentation in the 1840s

On the Canadian scene, *The Literary Garland's* continuation through the 1840s solidified its watershed status, and would soon be joined by other magazines that stood out for their literary qualities. In the Maritimes, the *New Brunswick Literary Journal* (1840), edited by H.B. Sancton, inaugurated the decade, followed by the very literary *Amaranth*, also in New Brunswick, and by *The Nova Scotia New Monthly Magazine* (Feb.-Apr. 1842) in

⁴⁸ By later century the pay rate increased further to ten dollars per page, and higher to high profile writers. Yet Mott points out this pay was not a living wage considering that \$2,000 was required to make a moderate living at the time, which would have required the difficult task of producing and selling at least an article per week (1: 511-512).

Halifax. Published in Saint John by editor Robert Shives, *The Amaranth; A Monthly Magazine of New and Popular Tales, Poetry, History, Biography, &c., &c.* (1841-43) was a double-column, thirty-two-page monthly magazine that printed fiction, poetry, book reviews, articles on cultural topics, and lectures from the recently established Mechanics' Institute. Davies notes how the selections of *The Amaranth* and its contemporary *The Nova Scotia New Monthly Magazine* in Halifax (also a thirty-two-page monthly, published by Joseph Kirk), marked a shift from the focus of previous magazines on content for a classically-educated readership to more "popular" material, including locally-situated articles and stories better suited to the second or third generation inhabitants who looked to magazines for insights on the best ideas at home and abroad, and who furthermore "sought in the indigenous essays and creative writing of their literary journals some testimony to their accomplishments in developing a society beyond its frontier stage" (103). Davies furthermore notes the ways in which *The Amaranth* acted as a "literary testing ground" for some of its more regular contributors.

In the regions known after the Union Act of 1841 as Canada East and Canada West, literary magazines also emerged. In Canada East, the steadfast *The Literary Garland* witnessed the emergence of contemporaries such as the four-page, three-column penny bi-weekly *The Paul Pry* (1844), and the two-column, eight-page bi-weekly *People's Magazine* (1846-47),⁴⁹ edited by R.D. Radsworth and published by John Dougall,⁵⁰ which featured mostly topical articles and poetry along with innovative

⁴⁹ This title was continued in October 1846 as *The People's Magazine and Weekly Journal*, with increased frequency. Mary Lu MacDonald notes the circulation of *The People's Magazine* at 1,500 in 1847, but considering that the title went out of business three months later, she questions its accuracy (52).

⁵⁰ Dougall would become one of Montreal's biggest publishers, launching papers like the Montreal *Witness* in daily, semi-weekly and weekly editions, the French Canadian magazine *L'Aurore*, the temperance magazine *Canadian Messenger* and *The New Dominion Monthly* magazine.

woodcut spot illustrations that seem to anticipate the later illustrated magazines.

Bookseller Peter Sinclair inaugurated the first of three magazines to bear his name, beginning with the sixteen-page semi-monthly *Sinclair's Journal of British North America* (1849), priced at twelve shillings, six pence and featuring content that included topical articles, reviews, fiction serials, poetry, and an advertiser appended to each issue.⁵¹ *The Gaspé Magazine and Instructive Miscellany* (Aug. 1849-June 1850), edited by R.W. Kelly, appeared as an eighteen-page monthly in New Carlisle, featuring fiction, poetry, and topical articles.

In Canada West, the single-column, fifty-five-page *Barker's Canadian Monthly Magazine* (1846-47) was started in Kingston by surgeon Edward John Barker (also founder of the *Kingston Whig* newspaper) at a price of ten shillings per annum, and included fiction alongside book reviews, civic-minded content such as profiles of public men of Upper Canada, imaginative legends of the early settlement, and the more practical commercial reports found at the end of each issue. Already recognizable for her prolific contribution to *The Literary Garland* and other magazines, Susanna Moodie and her husband started the double-column monthly *Victoria Magazine; A Cheap Periodical For the Canadian People* (1847-48) for publisher Joseph Wilson in Belleville. Mary Lu MacDonald reports the circulation of *Barker's* at four hundred and *The Victoria Magazine* at just under eight hundred (*Literature and Society* 52), furthermore noting that both titles featured (nearly) 100 percent Canadian content (58). Later in the decade, the more religious *Canadian Gem and Family Visitor: A Literary and Religious Magazine* (1848-49) appeared in Cobourg.

⁵¹ Sinclair's subsequent titles included the *Sinclair's Monthly Circular and Literary Gazette* (1855-57) and *Sinclair's Weekly Advertiser* (1860), each of which seems more advertising oriented than the previous.

Perhaps one of the most notable developments of the 1840s was the impulse to experiment with lower pricing in an effort to expand readership by making magazines affordable to a wider range of classes. At seven shillings six pence annually, *The Amaranth* cost just over half of what its predecessors charged (Davies 105), as did *The Nova Scotia New Monthly Magazine*. Of course these experiments followed the aforementioned British trend, a connection acknowledged by the proprietor in his preface to *The People's Magazine*, which charged one shilling, three pence per half year as a bi-weekly and five shillings per annum as a weekly. The Moodies were also adamant that their *Victoria Magazine* (at a cost of five shillings per annum) was a benevolent experiment designed for "a class whose reading has hitherto, almost necessarily, been confined to the perusal of the local newspapers" ("To the Public." *The Victoria Magazine* Sept. 1847: 1-2). As the prefaces examined in the next chapter will verify, these magazines and their editors intended to extend the established moral benefit of magazines to a wider class of readers.

The 1840s and 1850s also saw the continued specialization of general magazines in focus and audience. Satirical magazines (many of which were bi-weekly or weekly) appeared in great numbers, including *Montreal Punch* in 1846, *The Satirist* in 1847, *The Magic Lantern* in 1848,⁵² *Punch in Canada* in 1849, the *Grumbler* in 1858, and the longstanding *Grip* published by J.W. Bengough (1873-94).⁵³ In a more serious vein, *The Monthly Review: Devoted to the Civil Government of Canada* (Jan.-June 1841) made

⁵² Klinck notes that the *Magic Lantern* was established particularly to oppose the sap and sentimentality of *The Literary Garland* (163).

⁵³ Later satirical magazines included *The Sprite* (June-July 1865), *Diogenes* (1868-70), *New Dominion And True Humorist* (1868, started as *True Humourist* in 1864), *The Canadian Punch* (1868), *Banter* (1874-?), *Grinchuckle* (1869-70?), and *Gripsack* (1888-1902). Each variously featured illustrated covers, political cartoons, and satirical articles on contemporary politics.

constitutional debate its major focus, and the formal, proto-academic *The Canadian Journal: A Repertory of Industry, Science and Art and a Record of the Proceedings of the Canadian Institute* appeared in Toronto in 1852, edited by geologist Henry Youle Hind.⁵⁴ Other magazines launched in this era provided general content intended for specialized audiences, for example, by demographic, occupation, or cause. Like the religious magazines earlier in the century (which continued to proliferate),⁵⁵ these specialized magazines could also provide much in the way of literary and cultural content. For instance, as Davies demonstrates, Halifax's first women's magazine, *The Mayflower, or, Ladies' Acadian Newspaper* (May 1851-Feb. 1852), offers a significant repository of work by its editor, established local poet Mary Eliza Herbert, as well as other writers. With several fiction selections per issue alongside articles of interest to female readers, the thirty-two-page monthly provides a good example of a periodical that targeted a demographic yet offered material of wide cultural interest. Hamilton's *The Calliopean* (1847-48) is yet another example of a magazine aimed at a female readership.

Other specializations included titles for children such as *The Snowdrop, or Juvenile Magazine* (1847-53), *The Maple Leaf; A Juvenile Monthly Magazine* (1852-

⁵⁴ One of several Canadian Institutes founded in this era, this society tied subscriptions as a benefit of membership (Klinck 167) and saw several iterations and new series. Several other institutes published their papers over the century, including the Literary and Historical Society of Quebec starting in 1829, the Nova Scotia Literary and Scientific Society in 1859, and the Royal Society of Canada in 1882.

⁵⁵ Mid-century religious magazines include the *British North American Wesleyan Magazine* (Halifax, 1840-44, 46-47), the *Colonial Protestant And Journal Of Literature And Science* (Montreal, 1848-49), the *Christian Mirror: Devoted to the Interests of Religion and General Literature* (Montreal, 1841-44), the *Wesleyan* (1838), then *Wesleyan Repository And Literary Record* (1860-62), the *Wreath* (1845, no extant issues), the *Church Magazine* (Saint John 1865-67, 67-68), *The Rose Of Sharon Monthly*, continued as *The Monthly Rose: A Literary and Religious Magazine* (Lunenburg, 1868-69), and *Grand Rounds* in 1876. In the later century, *The Canadian Methodist Magazine; Devoted to Religion, Literature and Social Progress* founded in 1875 and lasting in various forms until 1906 is substantial for its longevity. Again, evidence that a religious magazine could also attract literary authors, in its longevity *The Canadian Methodist* is a substantial presence in the Vincent database and published many contributors who also wrote for more general magazines.

54),⁵⁶ *The Cottager's Friend and Guide of the Young* (1854-55), and *The Weekly Miscellany: Devoted to the Moral and Intellectual Improvement of the Young*, with tales aimed at school-aged readers, and articles on moral and educational subjects. Family-oriented magazines such as the weekly *Canadian Family Herald* (1851-52) or *The Glowworm* (July 1891-?) embraced popular literature in their aim to interest “the family circle” with light fiction. Magazines could also target self-selecting groups; for instance, titles like the *Canadian Son of Temperance and Literary Gem* (1851-54, various titles) or even the *Canadian Military Gazette: Sporting and Literary Chronicle* (1857) clearly aimed at particular readership groups defined by cause or occupation.

Distad and Distad point out several other categories of magazine to emerge at mid-century. Fraternal magazines were inaugurated by the Odd Fellows’ first journal in 1846, and the labour movement was represented by the *Workingman’s Journal* launched in Hamilton in 1864 (111). The first law journals appeared in the 1840s and 1850s, with titles like the *Upper Canada Law Journal and Local Courts Gazette* in 1855. Other industry journals began to proliferate later in the century, such as *Canadian Grocer* in 1887, *Canadian Architect and Builder* in 1888, and *Canadian Banker* in 1893, to name a few examples (112). Periodicals were also launched to celebrate various hobbies, inaugurated by titles like *Sporting Life* in 1863, the *Canadian Journal of Photography* in 1864, or the *Canadian Wheelman* in 1883, which catered to the bicycling craze (109-111).

The Quieter 1850s

In addition to the specialized magazines featuring literary content, some 1850s general magazines continued to declare literary and cultural development their primary aim. In

⁵⁶ A popular annual was also titled *The Maple Leaf; or Canadian Annual, a Literary Souvenir* (1847-49).

Montreal, the 1850s saw the closure of *The Literary Garland* in 1851 after more than a decade, as well as the appearance of short-lived titles such as *The Canadian Review And Journal Of Literature* (established in 1855 as a literary supplement to the Montreal *Witness* newspaper), and the double-column, thirty-two-page *The Montreal Literary Magazine* (1856, single extant issue) edited by John Reade. Toronto saw the launch of *The British Colonial Magazine* (1852-53), edited by William H. Smith and featuring mostly reprinted fiction, serials, poetry, and anecdotes.

Yet the most critically praised magazines of this decade were *The Provincial, or, Halifax Monthly Magazine* (1852-53), edited by Mary Jane (Katzmann) Lawson and published by James Bowes, and the Toronto-based *The Anglo-American Magazine* (1852-55), edited by Reverend Robert Jackson MacGeorge and published by Thomas Maclear. The single-column, forty-page *The Provincial* featured tales, essays, sketches, and travel articles, along with dialogues, plays, and biographical sketches of area poets. In her dissertation chapter on the magazine, Davies remarks on the ways in which the magazine was praised by contemporary critics for its original content and regional character (214). The double-column, ninety-six-page *The Anglo-American Magazine* from Toronto sustained exemplary longevity at seven volumes and appeared more national in character even though by virtue of being mostly reprinted it published fewer domestic authors. Alongside a standard editorial mix of history, biography, sketches, original serials and poetry, the magazine featured several substantial departments or columns, including “The Editor's Shanty,” with books and editorial commentary, “Facts for the Farmer,” on agriculture, and “Mrs. Grundy's Gatherings,” on women's fashions, among other newsy and topical departments. One of its most fully developed features was

“Chronicles of Dreepdaily,” a relatively lengthy (eight to ten pages per issue) two-year serial featuring tales, witty anecdotes, and eccentric characters set in a fictional Scottish town (McDougall 183).

While Canada saw relatively few excellent general magazines in the 1850s, this era in the United States saw the launch of some of the century’s most important magazines, including *Putnam’s* in 1853 (noted to be the first comparable with high quality British titles like *Fraser’s* and *Blackwood’s*) as well as the watershed *Harper’s* in 1850 and *The Atlantic Monthly* in 1857 (Mott 2: 32). Beyond high quality literary magazines, cheap weekly story papers also proliferated. The era also witnessed impressive circulation tallies. Quoting from the 1860 census, Mott estimates the average circulation of quarterlies at 3,300, monthlies at 12,000, and weeklies at 2,400 (2: 10). Yet the most popular periodicals headed towards even higher numbers; for instance, *Frank Leslie’s Illustrated* achieved a circulation of 164,000 in 1860, Godey’s *Lady’s Book* reached 150,000, *Harper’s Weekly* achieved 120,000 by the end of 1861, and *Harper’s New Monthly* reached 110,000 (Mott 2: 11).

Priced at three dollars (some weeklies and cheaper monthlies sold for two dollars), magazines had also started to offer discounts for subscription “clubs” (Mott 2: 13), tactics naturally aimed at boosting circulation in order to attract advertising revenue (these and other incentives would later be taken up in Canada). Magazines that had previously eschewed advertising as coarse had begun to embrace the revenue source; for instance, *The Atlantic Monthly* carried between ten and fifteen pages of advertising in 1865.⁵⁷ Still, some magazines continued to reject outside advertising altogether, most

⁵⁷ The highest editorial salary at this time was the \$2,500 paid to Lowell for *The Atlantic Monthly* in 1857; by comparison the editor of *Graham’s* received six hundred dollars annually (Mott 2: 24). Anonymity

remarkably *Harper's New Monthly*, which would not accept advertising until 1882 (Mott 3: 10).

In Britain, magazines continued to be important destinations for writers' work, and significant titles at mid-century included the eighty-page monthly *MacMillan's Magazine*, started in 1859, and the *Cornhill*, started in 1860. The latter was initially edited by William Thackeray, who achieved a peak circulation of 100,000. These titles exemplified a new brand of middle-class family-oriented reading material including serials and instructive articles, and the latter counted Trollope, Eliot, Gaskell, Collins, the Brontës, Tennyson, Meredith, Swinburne, and many others among its contributors (Graham 303). Sullivan notes that with these new magazines, anonymity finally began to decline or at least be debated (2: xiv). Other popular magazines featured more sensational works and authors, including the *Temple Bar* magazine (1860-1906) and *Belgravia* (1866-99), edited by Mary Elizabeth Braddon (Sullivan 2: xvi). By the 1860s, a new generation of more serious British quality monthlies also appeared, including the *Fortnightly Review* in 1865 and the *Contemporary Review* in 1866 (Sullivan 2: xvii).

In Canada, the social and technical developments taking place at mid-century would produce favourable conditions for increased magazine production around Confederation. Canada's own population had grown to 2.4 million by 1851 and would rise to 3.3 million by 1867 (Distad and Distad 61). Literacy was also increasing: one quarter to one third of the British North American population that was illiterate around 1850 would fall to only nine or ten percent by the end of the century (Rutherford, *A Victorian Authority* 27). Technological improvements also increased the potential for

began to disappear in both Britain and the United States, although some magazines maintained the practice and in others editors inserted a slip identifying the authors for newspapers or included authors in the indexes (Mott 2: 26).

Canadian periodicals to move towards greater circulation and better production values. By 1860, the *Globe* (which had become Canada's first daily newspaper in 1853) was printed on two new American double-cylinder presses that could each print 3,000 sheets an hour (Rutherford, *A Victorian Authority* 40).⁵⁸ Linotype machines imported in the 1880s further alleviated a typesetting bottleneck (Distad and Distad 78). The telegraph had arrived in 1846 (Kesterton 23), the typewriter in 1868, and Alexander Graham Bell's telephone in 1876.

These innovations, coupled with the enthusiasm of increasingly professionalized publishers and editors, prompted an increase in both the number and circulation of periodicals, a trend that would accelerate even more later in the century. Newspaper growth was particularly impressive. By 1857, there were 291 newsheets in British North America, including 159 in Canada West and 54 in Canada East (Kesterton 11). Distad and Distad note that the 1860s saw the circulation of individual dailies approach 5,000 copies, and that by 1876, the combined circulation of nine daily papers in nine urban centres across Canada totalled 113,000, a number that would double seven years later (69).

The press had also started to expand westward. By 1860, 2,000 miles of rail had been laid throughout British North America (Rutherford, *A Victorian Authority* 10), and print had moved all the way to British Columbia, which saw the launch of the *Victoria Gazette and Anglo-American* as well as the *British Colonist* newspaper in 1858. Other Western provinces followed: Manitoba's first periodical appeared a year later with the *Nor'Wester* at Fort Garry, the *Saskatchewan Herald* appeared in Battleford in 1878, and

⁵⁸ Distad and Distad note that besides the direct improvement from such upgrades, older printing machine cast-offs were passed to the smaller towns, allowing further expansion (78).

Alberta welcomed the *Edmonton Bulletin* in 1880. *The Yukon Midnight Sun*, the *Caribou Sun*, and the *Klondike Nugget* all competed to be the first newspaper established in the north in 1898 (Kesterton 30-32). Magazines also began to appear in the West, including *The Canadian North West; A Monthly Journal Devoted to the Settlement and Development of Manitoba and the North West* in Winnipeg in 1880, *The Nor'West Farmer; The Pioneer Farm Journal of Western Canada* in 1882, the *Manitoba and North West Illustrated Quarterly* (1883-84?), *The Colonist* in the late 1880s,⁵⁹ *The Manitoban* (1891-93) and *The Victoria Home Journal; A Journal Devoted to Social, Political, Literary, Musical and Dramatic Gossip* (1891-94, initially titled *The Pacific Harbour Light*).

Towards Confederation

All this activity, combined with the intellectual movement towards Confederation, seemed to energize the growing magazine industry and propel it in more nationalist directions. Some were adamant in their positioning by title. Both the single-column, forty-page monthly *British Canadian Review: Devoted Exclusively to Canadian Literature*, (Dec. 1862-Feb. 1863), offered at twenty cents an issue or two dollars per annum by Hunter Rose in Toronto, and the double-column, twenty-four-page monthly *Canadian Patriot: A Monthly Magazine and Review of Social and Political Science* (Jan.-July 1864), published by J. Willet in Montreal for one dollar per annum, although short-lived, were highly patriotic even by title. Although each of these magazines carried the usual mix of poetry, fiction and reviews, they also featured nationalist-oriented articles in their first few issues; for instance, *The Canadian Patriot* included a book review on the benefits of a monarchy over a republic whereas *The British Canadian Review* offered

⁵⁹ Extant copies appear from volume six in 1892, so this date is estimated.

essays on “the new northern nationality” and musings on Canadian intellectual celebrities.

At the same time, other magazines were more locally focussed, including *The Guardian: A Monthly Magazine of Education and General Literature* (Jan.-Sept. 1860), produced by R. Aitkin and E. Manning in Saint John, continued to declare a regional mandate. *The Colonial Review; A Weekly Journal of Politics, Literature and Society* also launched in Saint John in 1862. Montreal’s three-column, sixteen-page weekly *The Saturday Reader* (1865-67),⁶⁰ edited by W.B. Cordier and priced at five cents, offered patriotic content such as a series on Canadian history in its opening issues, although the bulk of its contents were more general. With short breezy pieces organized into departments like reviews, musical notes, pastimes, and scientific, the magazine is also interesting for its regular reader feedback, as a later chapter will verify. The more religious Hamilton-based *The Canadian Quarterly Review and Family Magazine, Devoted to National Politics and Interesting Family Literature* (1864), edited by G.D. Griffin as a double-column, sixty-four-page monthly magazine, included opening articles focussed on questions such as reciprocity, the notion of a Canadian aristocracy, and the national currency.⁶¹

In the years leading up to and surrounding Confederation, the magazine industry solidified in many respects, showing greater longevity, higher circulation, more recognizable contributors, and solidly nationalist aspirations. One of the first to exemplify these qualities was the single-column, 112-page *The British American Magazine Devoted To Literature, Science and Art* (1863-64), published by Graham

⁶⁰ The magazine briefly changed format to be the *Illustrated Saturday Reader* from September 1866-March 1867 then returned to its original title *The Saturday Reader* until its closure in August 1867.

⁶¹ After six issues the magazine takes a completely religious direction for the last two extant issues.

Mercer Adam and edited by Henry Youle Hind (previously editor of *The Canadian Journal*).⁶² Among other elements, the magazine presented a series of articles about public men in Canada and several other nationalist-oriented articles, not the least of which was D'Arcy McGee's thoughts on "A Plea for British American nationality" (McDougall 204). The nationalist bent of these and other articles gesture towards the more established role that some 1870s magazines would take on as a platform for intellectual debate. Klinck's observation that *The British American Magazine*'s table of contents "looked as if Hind and Adam had possessed, four years before its time, Henry J. Morgan's *Bibliotheca Canadensis* (1867)—an impressive 400-page volume of bio-bibliographical sketches of pre-Confederation authors—and had solicited contributions from the most promising among them" (*Literary History* 168) is equally accurate for many of the post-Confederation magazines. The dissertation's final chapter will look more closely at the new corps of professional writers to emerge in the 1870s as anonymity decreased and the magazines became a more consistent forum for public dialogue.

George Stewart's ten-cent, double-column, forty-page *Stewart's Literary Quarterly Magazine: Devoted to Light and Entertaining Literature* (1867-72)⁶³ was yet another periodical to set its sights on a national reputation. Having founded the periodical to cater to provincial interests, Stewart by 1868 declared a national trajectory and began actively to reach out to prominent writers. The effort netted the editor prestigious contributors from Nova Scotia, Newfoundland, Ontario, and Quebec (Davies 267).

⁶² McDougall notes that in contrast to *The Canadian Journal*, *The British American Magazine* was substantially more dedicated to *belles lettres* with substantial reviews and realist fiction.

⁶³ Stewart reminisced about his editorships in articles in *The Dominion Illustrated Monthly* in August 1892 (400-408) and *The Canadian Magazine*'s June 1901 commemorative issue.

Stewart furthermore renamed his publication *Stewart's Quarterly: An Original Magazine* by 1870 and increased its size from 40 to 65 to 112 pages and its price from ten to twenty-five cents (Davies 277). In Montreal, the double-column, sixty-four-page *The New Dominion Monthly* (1867-79) led a trend for longevity. Founded by John Dougall (already publisher of the successful Montreal *Witness*, and former publisher of *The People's Magazine*), this title lasted well into the next decade, evolving sections for music, youth, and domestic interests, as well as fiction and some articles, and becoming increasingly originally-authored as it progressed. Fraser Sutherland points out that at one point *The New Dominion Monthly* claimed to be printing 9,000 copies, a circulation which dropped to 3,500 by 1875 (44).

Another extension of the nationalist impulse to appear around Confederation was the illustrated magazine genre. Inaugurated in Britain with the sixteen-page weekly *Illustrated London News* in 1842, the form was further developed by American magazines such as *Frank Leslie's Illustrated Weekly* in 1855 and *Harper's Illustrated Weekly* in 1857. While previous Canadian magazines had featured illustration occasionally, images became central only with the first *The Canadian Illustrated News* (1862-64) of Hamilton. Started by Alexander Somerville, the four-column, twelve-page weekly magazine sold for three dollars per annum or six cents an issue and published five illustrations per issue alongside departments of domestic columns, literary reviews, selections from other magazines, and a section of foreign news, a mix that evolved as the magazine progressed. The second *Canadian Illustrated News* (1869-83) was not only impressive for its longevity and documentary qualities but achieved a place in the history of journalism for publishing the world's first photographic half-tones (beginning with

William Notman's portrait of Prince Arthur at his visit to Montreal), a technology devised by William Leggo (Distad and Distad 79). Founded by publisher George Desbarats and edited by John Lesperance, the three-column, sixteen-page weekly was first published in an edition of 10,000 copies (Parker 154), and often featured detailed written sketches to accompany its portraits of the new nation's public figures and historic events. Besides several half- and full-page illustrations per issue, the magazine featured domestic, American, British and foreign news, as well as topical articles, a regular fiction serial, poetry, and two or three pages of classified advertising. Single copies cost ten cents. Desbarats also launched a French version called *L'Opinion Publique*, and later *The Dominion Illustrated* (1888-93), also edited by Lesperance, in which he continued to experiment with imaging technologies such as photogravure (Parker 156). His efforts established the illustrated magazine in Canada, a trend that continued with later magazines such as *Winnipeg Illustrated* in 1882, *Toronto Saturday Night* in 1887, *Massey's Illustrated: A Journal of News and Literature for Rural Homes* in 1882 (new series in 1888),⁶⁴ and the *Nova Scotia Illustrated* in 1895.

Approaching a Golden Age: Magazines around the 1870s

If the nationalistic articles published in magazines of the late 1860s gestured towards intellectual debate on national issues, the 1870s witnessed periodicals finally achieve the longevity that would sustain such discussions. Whereas in the past only one or two magazines had straddled the decades, in this era *The New Dominion Monthly*, *Stewart's Quarterly* and *The Canadian Illustrated News* all continued from the 1860s. The 1870s also saw the inauguration of several new titles, including Toronto's *The Canadian Literary Journal* in 1870, which evolved into *The Canadian Magazine* by 1871. The

⁶⁴ *Massey's* absorbed a magazine called *The Trip Hammer* created in 1885 for Massey's employees.

Maritime Monthly, which appeared in Saint John in 1872, as did *The Torch* in 1877.

Other Toronto titles include *The Nation* in 1874 and *Belford's Monthly Magazine* (1876-78). Finally, the watershed *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* launched in 1872, later absorbing *Belford's* in 1878 to become *Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly and National Review* until 1882. This era also witnessed the rise of professional editors, publishing businesses, and regular contributors.

As the inaugural title of the 1870s, *The Canadian Literary Journal* (1870-71) appeared in Toronto as a double-column, sixteen-page (later twenty-four-page) monthly magazine, offering fiction serials, attributed poetry, and topical articles at a cost of sixty-nine cents plus six cents postage. Published by Flint and Van Norman, the magazine's editor was announced by the third issue as George V. LeVaux, who would also become a regular contributor to other magazines. The magazine lasted for twelve issues before evolving by 1871 into *The Canadian Magazine* (now published by Irving, Flint and Co.), which appeared as a larger single-column, sixty-four-page production for a higher cost of two dollars per annum or twenty cents an issue and edited by Robert Ridgeway, author of the previous iteration's fiction serial. The *Canadian Eclectic Magazine of Foreign Literature, Science and Art* (Dec. 1871-Feb. 1872), a double-column, 128-page monthly was almost entirely reprinted using selections from magazines such as *Blackwood's* and the *Contemporary Review*. After the closure of *Stewart's Quarterly*, a new title called *The Maritime Monthly* was started in its stead in 1873 by the Maritime Monthly Club, comprised of many of Stewart's contributors and supporters, although Davies notes that it embraced a more regional market and folded in 1875 (282).

As the magazine that came closest to realizing the aspirations of a truly national title, *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* is recognized by many as a watershed for its longevity and high quality intellectual discourse. Started in 1872 by publisher Graeme Mercer Adam, the double-column, 96-page magazine cost \$3.50 per year or thirty cents per issue by 1875, which Marilyn Flitton notes put it in the price range of shilling monthlies like the *Cornhill* and *MacMillan's*, although its contents were more similar to the serious periodicals such as the *Fortnightly* and *Contemporary Review* (34). The magazine was financially and editorially supported by Goldwin Smith until he parted ways briefly with it in 1874 to become involved with *The Nation*. Smith would return to *The Canadian Monthly* five years later when he published several inaugural papers by “A Bystander” (his pseudonym), a column that he eventually turned into a separate magazine.

By 1878, *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* was consolidated with *Belford's Monthly Magazine* to become *Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly and National Review* until the magazine's closure in 1882.⁶⁵ George Stewart, whose efforts with his own magazine had not gone unnoticed in Toronto, took over the editorship in 1878, but resigned in 1879 to edit the *Quebec Chronicle* whereupon Adam's name was listed as editor. *The Canadian Monthly* featured articles and essays covering a range of political, cultural, social, religious, and literary topics, and regular departments focussed on current literature, science and nature, fine arts, music and drama, book reviews, and literary notices. Fiction and poetry were also staples, and contributors included a cross-section of

⁶⁵ The “Rose” represented the further consolidation of the magazine's printers Hunter Rose with the Belford Brothers.

the country's increasingly professionalized writers, as will be explored in the last chapter of the dissertation.

Already noted for its crossover with the producers of *The Canadian Monthly and National Review*, *The Nation* (1874-76) began as the main organ of the patriotic "Canada First" movement started by Charles Mair, William Foster, and others. A fourteen-page weekly that sold for two dollars per annum, its three-column layout and shorter political front page gave the *Nation* a newsy appearance, featuring foreign reports from continental Europe, as well as non-fiction topical articles on Canadian subjects, literary reviews, and gossip. Later developments included columns on finance and commerce and a women's section called "Gazette des Dames." *Belford's Monthly Magazine* was founded by the Belford Brothers book publishers in 1876 and, prior to its consolidation with *The Canadian Monthly and National Review*, featured a great deal of fiction with unusually long serials (and spot illustration after the second volume), long topical articles, sheet music, and departments on topics such as current literature and music. These two titles exemplify different approaches to the genre, with the *Nation's* literary gossip column, topical articles, and occasional serials presenting literary material in a newsy format, in contrast to *Belford's* equally literary character but distinct approach with longer fiction serials and a more book-like appearance.

An Industry at Last: the 1880s and 1890s

In the 1880s, magazines continued to provide opportunities for literary publishing and intellectual discussion. Besides the persistence of *Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly and National Review* until 1882 as well as *The Canadian Illustrated News* until 1883, the decade saw the emergence of other magazines with greater emphasis on intellectual and

political issues. Two titles were pioneered by Goldwin Smith. In 1880, Smith started *The Bystander: A Monthly Review of Current Events, Canadian and General* as a single-column monthly at a cost of ten cents per issue or one dollar per annum. Published by Hunter Rose (with Graeme Mercer Adam serving as business manager), the magazine offered essays and opinions on Canadian and American affairs, as well as events in Europe. Purportedly written mostly by Smith and presented under the motto “not party but people,” the magazine saw three iterations: as a 56-page monthly from 1880-81, as a 78-page quarterly in 1883, and again as a 40-page monthly in 1889-90. Meanwhile, Smith also launched *The Week, A Canadian Journal of Politics, Society and Literature* (1883-96), with editor Charles G.D. Roberts initially at the helm. Like *The Canadian Monthly and National Review*, this double-column weekly magazine featured a variety of topical articles, fiction, and several departments, including its newsy “Chronicle of the Week” and “Music and the Drama” columns alongside current events and opinion features, regular book notices, and a literary gossip column. Sold for three dollars per annum or seven cents a copy, the magazine provided a new venue for the corps of writers who had gathered around the now-defunct *Canadian Monthly*.

Along with Smith’s offerings, the decade saw the launch of *Truth: A Weekly Magazine of Canadian Literature for the People* in 1884 and *The Halifax Critic* in 1887. The double-column Toronto-based weekly *Arcturus: A Canadian Journal of Literature and Life* appeared in 1887, edited by John Charles Dent and featuring topical articles mostly on Canadian subjects, fiction serials, literary notes, and poetry at a cost of two dollars per annum. This title lasted only six months (until June of that year). The same year also saw the launch of the longstanding *Saturday Night* (initially *Toronto Saturday*

Night) by former *Toronto News* editor Edmund E. Sheppard as a five column, sixteen-page weekly magazine that sold for five cents a copy or two dollars annually and reached a circulation of 10,000. Regular departments included news, society, music, and domestic columns, and dispatches from out-of-town. Topical articles featured cultural subjects including women's issues, music, theatre, literature, sports, and fashion. The magazine also included a number of serials (the editor serialized at least two of his own novels) as well as poetry and short stories, and lasted well into the twenty-first century, where it continued to publish many of Canada's notable authors.

Beyond these core titles that solidified the presence of literary magazines in Canada, the industry continued to sprout new genres of specialty magazines. The arts were represented by titles such as a very musically-oriented eight-page monthly called *The Arion; A Canadian Journal of Art, Devoted to Music, Art, Literature, and the Drama*. (1880-81), and the arts-oriented *Arcadia: A Semi-monthly Journal Devoted to Music, Art, and Literature* (1892-93). Magazines such as *Canadiana: A Collection of Canadian Notes* (1889-90) aimed to foster a popular interest in Canadian history. University magazines, which Distad and Distad point out played an important role in literary development even beyond their campuses, emerged by the 1870s, beginning with the *King's College University Magazine* in 1871 and continuing with titles such as *Queen's Quarterly* founded by George Munro Grant in 1893, and the *University of Toronto Quarterly*, briefly, in 1895 (122). Student publications emerged with the *Lennoxville Magazine* in 1868 at Bishop's University, the *Acadia Athenaeum* in 1874 at Mount Allison in Wolfville, Nova Scotia, the *Acta Victoriana* in 1878 at Victoria College

in Toronto, and the College of Ottawa *Owl* in 1888, among others.⁶⁶ Magazines directed at various cultural groups continued to appear in titles such as the Irish *The Harp* in Montreal in 1874 and the *Scottish Canadian* in Toronto in 1890.⁶⁷

If magazine editors consistently expressed a desire to become a national platform for literary development and intellectual discourse, this era saw the realization of that aspiration. In spite of continued faltering by short-lived magazines, the longevity of titles such as *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* (in its various iterations) in the 1870s and *The Week* in the 1880s not only demonstrated the possibilities for a more sustained industry, but given their weighty coverage, showed the magazines to have a true capacity for intellectual debate and literary publishing. In his contribution to the *Literary History of Canada*, Roy Daniells suggests that *The Canadian Monthly* and *The Week*, along with the later *Canadian Magazine* of 1893, provide “a reliable conspectus of the central English literary tradition in Canada” (208). General interest magazines continued to be identifiable on a spectrum not only in terms of their periodicity (monthly, weekly) but in their contents, which ranged from the very literary, focussing mostly on fiction and poetry, to those more oriented towards political and intellectual discussion. To place magazines like *The Week* and *The Nation* alongside others like *The New Dominion Monthly*, *The Canadian Illustrated News*, and *Toronto Saturday Night* is to witness a continuum of tones and intended audiences from the highly intellectual to the more popular and family-oriented. This spectrum also reveals the range of ways in which a

⁶⁶ The Vincent database lists many college and student magazines, beginning with the *College Fry Pan* in 1861 and *Dalhousie Gazette* in 1868. Others include the *Collegium*, *Portfolio* (Wesleyan Ladies College), *White and Blue*, *University Review*, the *Presbyterian College Journal*, *Rouge et Noir* (which evolved into the *Trinity University Review*), the *McMaster University Monthly*, the *Mitre*, *Sesame*, the *McGill Fortnightly*, *Woodstock College* and *College Topics*.

⁶⁷ Distad and Distad point out that the earliest periodicals for Aboriginal peoples also emerged late century, produced by missionary groups. Titles include the monthly *Petaubun*, *Peep of the Day* in 1861, printed in Ojibway and English, and the *Algoma Quarterly* in 1874 (127).

magazine could project a literary identity; for instance, a magazine with fewer fiction serials but a literary gossip column can seem equally, if not more, literary than a magazine with a higher percentage of actual fiction.

Other cultural, political, and technological improvements had an effect on these magazines. Another Copyright Act of 1872 proposed to legalize the reprinting of British authors based on a payment of 12.5 percent of the wholesale price. The amendment never became law, and publishers John Lovell and Graeme Mercer Adam went to London to protest the refusal. In 1875, a Canadian Act offered a compromise but still left Canadians at a disadvantage (Parker 186). By 1880, a second class postage rate for all domestic periodicals finally replaced the previously prohibitive letter rate (Distad and Distad 65). The late century saw increased advertising in titles like *The Canadian Illustrated News*, although some magazines continued to appear without advertising. Anson McKim launched the first national advertising agency in 1889 (Distad and Distad 80) and by 1892, *The Canadian Newspaper Directory* began to supply audited circulation figures, which had the result of deflating circulation claims. As advertising increased, so too did the tactics with which editors tried to increase their circulation, including incentive programs like clubbing where subscribers could join together for reduced rates, and premiums from sewing machines to pianos. Finally, if magazines were beginning to coalesce as an industry by this juncture, daily newspapers made an even more impressive surge forward in the 1870s and 1880s, doubling from 47 titles in 1873 to 94 in 1892 (Rutherford, *A Victorian Authority* 44).

For both newspapers and magazines, the emergence of a professional corps of editors and publishers was one of the most significant drivers towards success in this era.

Past decades had already seen the appearance of dedicated printers and publishers such as Joseph Howe, John Lovell, and John Dougall, yet even more editor-proprietors emerged in this era, showing great dedication to building media empires or at least life-long editorial careers. Among others, Distad and Distad note that George Desbarats, Graeme Mercer Adam, and Goldwin Smith are three solid examples who represent, in their diverse ways, a new dedication to editorial endeavour. Representing the editor-publisher as business magnate, Desbarats descended from a long line of printers and succeeded his father as the Queen's Printer in 1865. George Desbarats built on this existing family reputation to fashion an empire that included not only the impressive *The Canadian Illustrated News* in 1867 but several other publications in English and French, including *L'Opinion Publique Illustré*, the weekly fiction magazine *Hearthstone* (1870-72, later renamed the *Favourite*), and *The Dominion Illustrated* in 1889. Desbarats furthermore expanded into New York to found the *New York Daily Graphic* as the world's first illustrated daily paper (Distad and Distad 88).

Graeme Mercer Adam was another type of professional to emerge at this time, a career editor and publisher who had married the daughter of *The Literary Garland's* editor John Gibson and started *The British American Magazine* as well as *The Canadian Monthly and National Review*. Adam also edited the publishing trade journal *Canadian Bookseller and Miscellany* (1865-67) and the *Canadian Educational Monthly* (1879-84), and managed Goldwin Smith's *The Bystander*. At several points, Adam crossed the border to pursue editorial opportunities. In 1876, he started a New York book publishing firm in partnership with Lovell to reprint cheap British books. He emigrated again in 1891 to work for Lovell as a hired editor, never to return (Flitton 38). Goldwin Smith was

a man of letters and an editorial entrepreneur with independent means that allowed him to provide financial backing for several ventures. Smith settled in Toronto in 1871 and put his pen to work for *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* before becoming involved with *The Nation* in 1874, founding *The Bystander* in 1880, and inaugurating *The Week* in 1883. Later, he contributed regularly to *The Canadian Magazine*, founded in 1893. Beyond such editorial mainstays, the industry was bolstered by the emergence of public intellectuals such as James MacPherson Le Moine, John George Bourinot, Thomas D'Arcy McGee, and creative writers including the Confederation poets. The last chapter will examine these literary contributors in detail. Finally, beyond the handful of female editors that had already appeared, the later century witnessed more women becoming regular magazine contributors. These women included Sara Jeannette Duncan, Kathleen "Kit" Coleman, and Cora Hind.

If the 1870s and beyond saw Canadian magazines begin to solidify as an industry, their foreign counterparts exploded. New York had emerged decidedly as the centre for magazine publishing, and the number of magazines in America rose from 700 in 1865 to 3,300 in 1885, with an average longevity of four years—between 8,000 and 9,000 magazines were started in this era (Mott 3: 5). Perhaps even more remarkable is the fact that thirty titles, including *Harpers*, *Godey's*, and *Scribner's*, achieved circulations of over 100,000 (Mott 3:6). The most successful, *Youth's Companion*, had 385,000 subscribers, largely due to its use of premiums. Circulation, which began to be audited and thus verifiable, soared by the end of the century due to an innovative risk by editors to cut their prices (formerly twenty-five to thirty-five cents per issue) in half. In 1893, Samuel McClure introduced *McClure's Magazine* at a rate of fifteen cents, an experiment

soon repeated by *Cosmopolitan* and *Munsey's Magazine* (Mott 4: 5). Other titles included *Collier's*, *Scribner's Monthly*, and the *Saturday Evening Post*. Along with more gradual content transformations that included publishing more current and livelier material, and adding copious illustration. The increased circulation significantly increased the magazines' advertising base: in 1885, four 25 to 35 cent monthlies averaged a 100,000-plus circulation for a total of 600,000, but by 1905, twenty 10 to 15 cent monthlies held a circulation of 5.5 million (Mott 4: 8). By the 1890s in Britain, the American titles had inspired popular British magazines, including *The Strand* (1891-1950), *Pall Mall* (1893-1914) and *Yellow Book* (1894-97), with lighter articles and short stories complete within a single issue (Sullivan 2: xxi).

Expansion into mass market territory seemed to have an effect on Canadian periodicals of the 1890s as well. The newspaper industry continued to grow, as dailies saw their circulation increase to 574,000 in 1900, from 359,000 in 1891 (Rutherford, *A Victorian Authority* 75). The decade saw the continuation of titles such as *Toronto Saturday Night*, as well as new national titles, including *CANADA; A Monthly Journal of Religion, Patriotism, Science and Literature* (Jan.-July/Aug. 1892, seems to be continued to Nov. 1892 with different subtitle), *The Antidote* (1892-93), *The Lake Magazine: Devoted to Politics, Science and General Literature* (1892-93), *The Canadian Magazine of Politics, Science Art and Literature* (1893-1937), *The Dominion Review*, *A Monthly Journal of Science, Religion and Politics* (1896-99) and *Our Monthly; A Magazine of Canadian Literature, Science and Art* (May- June 1896). *Massey's Magazine* evolved in 1896 out of *Massey's Illustrated* and was absorbed in 1897 by *The Canadian Magazine*. With the exceptions of *CANADA* from New Brunswick and *The Antidote* from Montreal,

these titles were all based in Toronto, a fact that substantiates the industry's consolidation.

The Canadian Magazine, which lasted well into the next century, appeared as a double-column, eighty-two-page monthly at a price of \$2.50 per annum or twenty-five cents per issue. Edited initially by J. Gordon Mowat, the title ran to 150 pages, and featured an illustrated cover as well as several spot illustrated stories, and several pages of advertising. Contents included topical articles, fiction, and poetry, many of which featured by-lines of known Canadian authors. Sutherland notes that the magazine was patterned after quality monthlies like *The Atlantic* and *Harper's* yet wavered between being a solid literary journal and a popular mass circulation magazine (98). After absorbing *Massey's Magazine* under editor John A. Cooper, *The Canadian Magazine* offered even more illustrated stories and a print run of 20,000 copies.

Another general interest magazine, the double-column Toronto-based *Our Monthly: A Magazine of Canadian Literature, Science and Art* was edited initially by George Moffat and linked to the Manufacturers' Life Insurance Company. At a cost of one dollar per annum or ten cents an issue with spot illustration on most pages, the magazine offered profiles of local literary and cultural figures, topical articles, various columns, and contributors that included such names as Jane Wetherald and Stephen Leacock. With greater visual interest incorporating images and several pages of advertising, these titles began to resemble the modern magazine format, yet they also

clearly still relied by title and content on their Canadian identity to set them apart from the American and British magazines that continued to flood the market.⁶⁸

While geographic isolation had limited magazines to regional coverage in the early century, by the 1890s, some magazines deliberately embraced their regional identity as a niche, including such titles as *The Prince Edward Island Magazine* (1889-1905), *The Manitoban: A Monthly Magazine and Review of Current Events* (1891-93), Winnipeg-based *The Western Sunbeam: A Monthly Magazine of Art, Science, Literature and General Information* (1891-?), the *Nova Scotia Illustrated* (Apr.-Nov. 1895), and *The New Brunswick Magazine* (1898-1906). *The Manitoban* was launched in Winnipeg as a double-column, thirty-page monthly that offered Western residents local articles, fiction, and poetry at a cost of one dollar per annum or ten cents an issue. Although similar in style to the more national magazines, with advertising, spot illustration, and by-lined articles, such regional publications could declare a double allegiance; for instance, *The Manitoban* vowed that the magazine “supplies the readers of our great western country with a paper of their own” yet also noted it was a “Canadian magazine for Canadians” (“and should be supported by them”) (“A Talk With Our Readers” *The Manitoban* Feb. 1892: 82). By straddling both regional and national identities, the magazine increased its potential circulation. Another regional magazine, the twenty-page monthly *Nova Scotia Illustrated*, launched in 1895 by G.B. Bradford, offered a tourist-oriented, advertising-laden 10,000 copies for distribution on railroads, steamships, area hotels, and clubrooms.

Although nineteenth-century Canadian magazines never achieved the robust character of their foreign counterparts, by the end of the century a Canadian periodical

⁶⁸ Other general magazines of the later century include the *Occasional Magazine* (1892-95), *The Rockwood Review* (Mar.-Dec. 1894), *The Comet* (Mar. 1894), *Walsh's Illustrated Monthly Magazine* (1895-96), *Tarot; A Monthly Illustrated Magazine* (Feb.-Mar. 1896), and *The Pen* (1897-98).

was no longer an alien artifact doomed to failure. As Rutherford notes, in 1899 Toronto alone boasted 150 separate publications (*A Victorian Authority*, 3). The number of newspapers and periodicals mailed had increased to over 100 million by the end of the century, and the number of monthly magazines multiplied from 41 in 1874 to 202 in 1900 (Distad and Distad 65). Distad and Distad note that occasional mimicry of British format and appearance (they use *Punch in Canada* as an example) “saddled much of Canada’s nineteenth-century literary heritage with a reputation for imitation and mediocrity” (65), but considering the industry’s positioning in the midst of such foreign behemoths and even alongside the country’s own stronger newspaper system, the magazines’ derivative nature might be better considered a survival strategy than explicit proof of failure. And as the dissertation’s final chapter reveals, many a short-lived magazine inspired a young contributor to develop a life-long interest in creative work. In the face of such challenges, editors showed themselves to be enthusiastic advocates for both literary development and the magazine genre. The following chapters will substantiate this passion by examining the words they chose to express this enthusiasm and the ways in which they saw themselves as participants and even leaders in the effort to promote a public conversation.

CHAPTER 2

Themes in Canadian Magazine Prefaces

In July 1789, when Reverend William Cochran introduced readers to the first Canadian magazine, he outlined his hopes and dreams for *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* in a two page “Preface.” Halfway through the text, the editor made his initial appeal for contributors:

The editor conceives, that the Nova-Scotia Magazine might be made highly conducive to the improvement of this and the sister Provinces, if gentlemen acquainted with the local circumstances and interests, would make it the vehicle of their observations. (“Preface.” *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* July 1789: vii)

By articulating the magazine’s potential as a catalyst for civic improvement and positioning local contributors as its facilitators, already this short excerpt crystallizes some fundamental self-justifications that would be shared by many subsequent prefaces. Part sales tool, part apology, part rallying cry, prefaces appeared ostensibly as a friendly greeting that outlined the proprietor’s intentions and solicited reader support. More profoundly, these prefaces represented an editor’s first and perhaps only opportunity to convince readers of the magazine’s benefits to the community. Although each magazine would express this prerogative differently, the basic impetus to position magazines as a forum for civic (and later national) improvement, as well as intellectual and cultural expression, remained fairly consistent throughout the nineteenth century.

For scholars looking back at the nineteenth century, prefaces⁶⁹ offer an expedient constant for tracing perpetual and changing editorial motivations and concerns. Predictably, Canadian magazine editors adopted the convention from British and American magazines. Some magazines offered extensive prefaces while others omitted them altogether. Of course, the preface form itself must be approached with an awareness of its role as an extra-textual tool, written purposefully as a charm offensive to turn readers into the readership. As Gérard Genette notes in *Paratexts: Thresholds of Interpretation*, a critical work that examines the function of many extra-textual elements including prefaces, the role of the original preface is to ensure the text is read properly, or, at minimum, to get the text read (197). Modern readings of the preface form must take this agenda into account, maintaining critical awareness of the techniques enlisted by their writers in pursuit of this aim. In spite of this caveat, prefaces still offer sufficient insights into the editorial process to make these close readings worthwhile, particularly in the absence of other relevant documentary materials.

In this chapter and the next, editorial prefaces are considered collectively as a source of insight into the broad motivations and concerns of Canadian magazine editors. This chapter traces the themes that emerged from the prefaces, almost all of which were rooted in notions of civic betterment in its various expressions: nationalism, intellectual development, and literary cultivation. Since much of the collective charm of the prefaces resides in the creative approaches taken by each editor, the next chapter focuses directly

⁶⁹ While “preface” was most widely used, these editorial missives appeared under a variety of headlines, from “prospectus” to “introductory” to “salutatory” to “To the public.” This dissertation will use “preface” from this point forward as the standard term. Prefaces appeared most often in the first issue but occasionally in the second issue, with placement often on the front page but occasionally on an inner page. Prefaces ranged in length from as little as a paragraph to as much as ten pages, but were most commonly one to two pages.

on the rhetorical and literary tools such as metaphor, imagery, analogy, repetition, and other techniques that editors used to dazzle and engage their readers.

Although these chapters offer a more extended survey and analysis than has previously been undertaken, this is not the first time that these prefaces have been brought to light. Douglas M. Daymond and Leslie G. Monkman collected (without commentary) a handful of magazine prefaces in *Towards a Canadian Literature: Essays, Editorials and Manifestos, Volume 1: 1752-1940*, including those for *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*, *The Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository*, *The Literary Garland*, *Stewart's Literary Quarterly Magazine*, *The Canadian Monthly and National Review*, and *The Week*. Furthermore, Mary Lu MacDonald analyzed a handful of early magazine prefaces in her contribution to *Prefaces and Literary Manifestoes/Prefaces et manifestes littéraires*. In her essay titled "Reading Between the Lines: An Analysis of Canadian Literary Prefaces and Prospectuses in the First Half of the Nineteenth Century," MacDonald quotes from a handful of English-Canadian periodical prefaces as well as French-Canadian periodical prefaces and book prefaces, finding that of the social attitudes that affected literary production, national imperatives were the most common, with moral concerns a close second and individual creativity third (30). This chapter generally echoes, expands, and amplifies MacDonald's findings.

An Exemplary Preface: *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*

In order to provide some orientation to the preface form, it is helpful to consider a typical preface in its entirety before proceeding to trace broad issues by theme. A close reading of *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*'s preface will suffice as a representative model. Like many to follow, this preface begins by referencing a "prospectus" that was published in advance in local newspapers to rally support for the venture prior to the magazine's launch.⁷⁰ In this case, because the prospectus had already netted approximately 200 advance subscribers, the editor began his missive with an expression of "gratitude for the universal approbation, with which his proposals have been received, and the very respectable subscription under the patronage of which the work commences" ("Preface." *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* July 1789: vii).⁷¹ By prioritizing this acknowledgement, editor Cochran (indicated by Davies as the author of the preface) not only adopts a deferential tone but implicates those supporters in the magazine's progress by linking their patronage to the magazine's success.

Cochran proceeds to pre-empt potential criticism by acknowledging the inevitable comparison of his efforts with the more sophisticated British and American magazines:

He is aware of how small the credit is which a mere compiler can claim; but he has found that the labour which he is obliged to undergo, is by no means

⁷⁰ Publishing a prospectus was a common convention to solicit advance support. While prospectuses and prefaces were occasionally identical, the former were often more marketing-oriented, outlining details such as contents and subscription requirements, whereas prefaces appeared as more qualitative, philosophical, and rhetorical. In some cases where a preface was unavailable but the prospectus was printed in the first issue of the paper, this chapter references the latter. While it would also be interesting to track down advance prospectuses for each periodical, the fact that the prefaces are more predictably located at the beginning of each periodical also made them preferable for an overview of this scope.

⁷¹ Davies points to the importance of looking at both Cochran's preface and his note of 1790 to fully understand his mandate of encouraging native contributions as well as selections. She furthermore examines the differences between the prospectus and preface, notably a change in title and more specific focus on contents to suit the needs of local readers (26).

proportionably small. He will not regret his trouble if after all his readers be put pleased with his earnest and, he hopes, not unsuccessful endeavours to contribute to their improvement or amusement. ("Preface." *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* July 1789: vii)

Cochran ends his apology by outlining the challenges of pleasing a varied audience with a single editorial selection, a tactic that reinforces the deferential tone established at the outset and acknowledges a common editorial problem. At the same time, he affirms his commitment to readers' improvement and amusement (a standard prerogative for magazines throughout the next century), a pledge that emphasizes his servitude to the reader and presumably was designed to absolve him of any shortcomings.

In his next statement, Cochran shrugs off his earlier apologies by putting his endeavour on par with existing magazines:

He might plead also the difficulties attending an infant undertaking, in extenuation of the defects which may be found in it; but, without availing himself of this reasonable apology, he will trust the Nova-Scotia Magazine in comparison with any that is now published in America or Great-Britain itself, either for quantity, variety and importance of the matter, or correctness and beauty of the press-work. ("Preface." *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* July 1789: vii)

By acknowledging the possibility of defects yet calling attention to his efforts with regard to the selections and press-work, here the editor both follows the social conventions of modesty and yet bolsters his readers' confidence in his ability to make the magazine a competitive success. The declaration may also be read as subtly goading the readership, since mechanical preparedness shifts the variable upon which the magazine will succeed

or fail to the content requested from the community. In this light, potential contributors are central to the project's success.

After clarifying the magazine's broad documentary purpose, noting that "EVERY thing that is connected with the history of this Province must be interesting to the people who inhabit it" ("Preface." *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* July 1789: vii), Cochran proceeds to enumerate the various article types that he requires, from profiles on natural history to instructive articles to educate the community. These would become editorial staples in many subsequent Canadian magazines. He even calls for ensuing issues to extend backwards by including "a chronological summary of the principal events in 1788" as well as a catalogue "of the most distinguished publications which have appeared last year" ("Preface." *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* July 1789: vii), invoking an additional repository function.

In the latter half of the preface, Cochran concretizes the magazine's (and by extension, contributors') role in solving the province's intellectual dearth:

It is remarkable that the Province of Nova-Scotia, with a soil confessedly more favourable to agriculture, is nevertheless fed by the industry of her neighbours. This seems a strong indication that the husbandry of the place must be faulty. It will probably continue long unimproved, unless gentlemen of education and leisure, who reside in the country, will condescend to instruct the peasantry, by communicating the result of their own experience. ("Preface." *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* July 1789: viii)

In this segment, the editor stimulates competitiveness by alluding to the greater success of neighbouring provinces (or states), positioning the magazine as a catalyst for

redeeming that imbalance. He flatters his patrons by alluding to their status as educated gentlemen, yet simultaneously embraces a “peasantry” as readers and beneficiaries (thus shrewdly claiming an additional readership).

Finally, the editor makes his call for contributions concrete by printing an extensive half page of direct questions, such as “What are the defects in the common instruments of husbandry?” and “What the [sic] errors in the usual methods of clearing lands?” (“Preface.” *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* July 1789: viii). As well as increasing the likelihood that he would receive specific, usable contributions, the tactic to solicit specific articles (mostly on the topic of agriculture, although natural history and topography are also mentioned) positions the magazine as a site of information-sharing for the community, a quality that boosts its value above foreign periodicals with no connection to local concerns. The editor’s alternately deferential and confident tone furthermore appeals to readers’ altruism and sense of community as well as to the gentlemanly class’s sense of leadership within that community.

By declaring a general mandate for civic and self-improvement, and then implicating the magazine (and by extension, its readers and contributors) in that mission, Cochran exemplified fundamental tactics that subsequent magazine editors would deploy in the interest of community and even national betterment. In effect, these editors used their magazines in part to invoke what Benedict Anderson has described as an “imagined community” (6). Although anonymous to each other, readers knew that the magazine was being read simultaneously by many others, and through their shared experience of reading the magazine they formed a sense of community crucial to a stable readership and, by extension, a nationality. As each magazine editor embarked on this same venture,

the community-building initiative was invoked anew. Having presented *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*'s "Preface" as an illustrative first example of a Canadian magazine's hopeful self-presentation to its citizens and subscribers, the chapter will proceed to trace the evolution of this salutatory through the rest of the nineteenth century. Unfortunately, this survey is precluded from being exhaustive by the fact that not all magazine prefaces survived, nor did all magazines include prefaces. Exemplifying the latter trend, *The Halifax Monthly Magazine* (1830-33), *The British American Magazine* (1863-64), and *Belford's Monthly Magazine* (1876-78) are all examples of prominent titles that seem to have started without a formal introduction. Of course, practical constraints also limit the examination to illustrative examples. The discussion of these prefaces is organized primarily by theme, with a chronological secondary organization where warranted for clarity.

Civic Betterment to National Pride

As alluded to by *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*'s preface, the magazine form was already familiar to locals by the time Howe and Cochran's venture arrived in July 1789. Foreign offerings would have been more sophisticated too. So why buy a Canadian magazine? In Cochran's focus on community betterment and civic commitment lies the key argument to be reprised by many an editor: that domestic magazines with their interest in and understanding of local (and later national) issues offered the potential for home-grown information-sharing and cultural development that foreign alternatives could never match, regardless of sophistication. Since this civic interest represented a fundamental competitive advantage, its promotion became the principal theme running consistently through the prefaces. Whether expressed as devotion to a local community or

as nationalism transcendent of region, this central assertion forms both the starting point for analysis here and also the fundamental heart from which most other themes radiate.

A number of prefaces articulated their aspirations as national in scope from the beginning. Contemporaneous Montreal publications *The Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository* (1823-25) and *The Canadian Review and Literary and Historical Journal* (1824-26) used extended prefaces to position their efforts as tools of intellectual liberation for an emergent colony. Likely written by the same editor, David Chisholme, who left the first magazine to edit the second, these prefaces trace at length the roots of civilization from Biblical creation through the Egyptians, Greeks, Romans, and Europeans right down to Britain and her colonial inheritors, celebrating such markers of civilization as art, music, and science in each era. In establishing a contrast between sophistication and savagery, the editor remarked particularly on the rise and fall of civilizations, noting Britain's rise from its low state during the Roman empire to its current imperial glory, and drawing a parallel with the colony by asking "who knows but that the wild and unpeopled provinces of this modern Continent might become the refuge of the sciences and the mother of the arts?" ("Introduction." *The Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository* July 1823: 4). In its promise to bring "the calm serenity of cultivation" and "the permanency of the most civilised countries" to the new land, *The Canadian Magazine* positioned itself as an imperial antidote to intellectual darkness, and solidified its position as the inheritor of a proud tradition. *The Canadian Review* furthermore identified its affiliation with the newly founded Quebec Literary and Historical Society to borrow a sense of authority through that institution.

Later prefaces focussed their attention on the advantages of the new country. Less lofty than Chisholme's positioning though equally focussed on cultural continuity, editor William Sibbald of the short-lived, York-based *The Canadian Magazine* posited a variation on the cultural inheritance narrative that focussed on the immigrants themselves. Noting that "English, Irish and Scots, leaving the Rose, Shamrock and Thistle, crossed the Atlantic for successive years," Sibbald emphasized the effects of the great migration to Upper Canada by describing how "the stream of emigration continued to flow, and encreased until it has become a mighty flood" ("The Editor's Address, to the Inhabitants of Upper and Lower Canada." *The Canadian Magazine* Jan. 1833: 1). In the title of his address, it is also worth noting his aims at a wider territory than his own location in Upper Canada.

Furthermore, the editor described his country as already transformed by its new arrivals:

In short, this country, with its Churches, Houses, Shops, Signs, names, and manners, is no longer "the Land of Strangers"—it is Europe, with only one difference—means to gratify a love of reading, and intellectual acquirement.—That difficulty is now about to be surmounted, and then the resemblance will be complete. ("The Editor's Address." *The Canadian Magazine* Jan. 1833: 1)

For Sibbald, the cultural transfer had been achieved ("it is Europe"), so the new task at hand—a perfect role for a magazine—was to nourish the newly arrived intellect. He reminds readers of the importance of keeping up with stories from "the Mother Country" and rallies readers to retain the love of knowledge and reading that was already cultivated in them before they crossed the Atlantic as he exclaims, "No! no, you have not forgot!—

‘eternity forbids you to forget!’—You have all the thirst for knowledge which Parents and Pastors instilled” (“The Editor’s Address.” *The Canadian Magazine* Jan. 1833: 1). The next chapter examines in more detail how the editor appealed specifically to particular readership groups by describing the magazine’s benefits for each type of reader, from farmer to sinner. Sibbald’s preface articulates the sort of cultural continuity that would presumably appeal to readers eager to recreate the intellectual properties of their countries of origin. If Sibbald’s language is not as imperialist as other prefaces, it is still focussed on cultural inheritance and transplant rather than on identifying the cultural potential of the new country.

Other expressions focussed more intently on the new population than on replicating the old country. John Kent, editor of the short-lived *Canadian Literary Magazine* in York, was one of the first to describe settlers’ tenacity, if by way of a rather backhanded compliment:

I did not expect to find the Canadians an ignorant people, plunged in mental sloth and intellectual darkness,—senseless as the stumps around their dwellings,—or as inaccessible to light, as the buck-wheat pines of Dorchester or Galt. I find them advanced in civilization, beyond my expectations. [...] The severe trials of an early settler, and a daily warfare with mental and physical difficulties, may have superinduced a crust of roughness over the outward man; but the same feelings which the settler brought with him from his native land, or which the Canadian-born inherits from his parents, exist, though perchance it may be, in a latent state. (“The Editor’s Address to the Public.” *The Canadian Literary Magazine* Apr. 1833: 1)

Here, Kent's use of understatement acknowledges backwoods stereotypes even as he dispels them. That the editor describes the people as "the Canadians" rather than as a collection of immigrants from disparate homelands furthermore invites readers to similarly self-identify. Although the notion of cultural transference was still present in this editor's nudge to "encrusted" readers to recall the civilization of their homeland, he clearly aimed for them to transfer that fondness to their new land and community. In his reference to Canadian-born readers, he furthermore acknowledged and appealed to second generation homesteaders.

If civic betterment was the editors' primary goal, the means by which it could be enacted was often expressed in the rhetoric of self-improvement, as editors promised to encourage literary development by providing readers with material that would "contribute to their improvement or amusement," to quote *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*. This mantra was repeated by many subsequent editors, from *The Quebec Magazine*'s vow to "select such pieces as we judge best adapted to afford an innocent entertainment—to enlighten the public mind—to communicate useful instruction, or to create a taste for letters" ("To the Public." *The Quebec Magazine* Aug. 1792: n. pag.) to *The Canadian Magazine*'s assertion that "this magazine will contain whatever is useful, amusing, instructive" ("The Editor's Address." *The Canadian Magazine* Jan. 1833: 1) to *The Mirror of Literature*'s declaration that "our highest aim shall be to mingle information with amusement" ("Preface." *The Mirror of Literature* Nov. 1835: 1) to *The Amaranth*'s promise to be "not only amusing, but useful" ("To Our Patrons." *The Amaranth* Jan. 1841: 1).

Even later nineteenth-century magazines like *The British Canadian Review* vowed to "make this magazine a trustworthy source of information and amusement" ("To

Our Readers.” *The British Canadian Review* Dec. 1862: 2), *The Week* to “furnish instruction and wholesome entertainment for our reading classes,” (“Topics of the Week.” *The Week* 6 Dec. 1883: n. pag.) and the musical *Arion* to offer that which was “interesting and instructive” (“Ourselves.” *The Arion* Oct. 1880: 1). In this equation, instruction was always placed above amusement, principally to forestall concerns over morally questionable reading material, as a later section of the chapter explores. Such statements were not only rooted in the Victorian mindsets of self-improvement and moral correctness, but also in the anxieties related to creating a domestic literary industry (and more fundamentally, a people) that would measure up to more established and accomplished competition.

While the positioning of magazines (particularly those that vowed they could be trusted to avoid scurrilous content) as keys to self-improvement was not uniquely Canadian, editors regarded the new land as having an even greater need for enlightenment. Not only did the new territory need immediate cultural development, but that development also needed to be conveyed to the rest of the world to show that the country and its inhabitants were progressing. Besides encouraging readers to identify as a community, editor John Kent also urged them to see their adopted nation’s cultural value. Perhaps his best argument concerned the ways in which his periodical would “rescue from oblivion's stream those floating fragments, which some Canadian Hume or Robertson will hereafter search for, when composing the annals of his country” (“The Editor’s Address to the Public.” *The Canadian Literary Magazine* Apr. 1833: 1). Here, Kent took the opposite tactic to those who would simply replicate Europe, by identifying Canadian events as worthy of preservation. Perhaps such wording would have compelled

someone like a Susanna Moodie, who published some of her first Canadian poetry in the magazine, to aspire to become the Hume of her new territory. Rather than consider Canada a land without ghosts, this editor expressed a belief that “events which have characterized the infancy of this extensive country afford ample material for the Historian, the Poet, and the Novelist” and proceeded to list examples including the U.E. Loyalists, the victims of the famine in Hungry Bay, the adventures of the Hunter, the Guerilla-like achievements of the late War, and the past and present condition of the Aborigines (“The Editor’s Address to the Public.” *The Canadian Literary Magazine* Apr. 1833: 1).⁷²

Although later magazines would express the impulse towards literary and cultural development even more strongly, simply to concretize the intellectual and creative potential of these domestic stories urged potential contributors to see their home-grown history as worthy of narrative attention. By enumerating the ways in which the new nation could be interesting in its own right, editors invited their readers to move from mere longing for the old country to embrace the inspiration of a fresh nation. And like Cochran to his *Nova Scotia Magazine* readers, this editor’s specific suggestions provided specific story ideas upon which potential writers could meditate.

⁷² Three decades later, the editor of *The Guardian* magazine made a similar argument with a more provincial focus, arguing that “we have a fine Province that requires advancement in many ways, and will afford topics enough for the most prolific pen. We cannot be expected to have the legends of an old country—to gather such from some dusty and worm eaten volume, that has long escaped notice in the muniment room of ‘Castle eld,’ is denied us; but surely in our history and even in our every day life there must be some ‘moving accidents by flood and field’ that are as well worth recounting as tale of fay or goblin. Gallant Knights with lance in rest ‘sans peur, sans reproche’ we have not, but are there not the Loyalists, without reproach or fear, overcoming the giant troubles that obstruct the career of the first Colonist of the wilderness; and had they not wives and daughters as beautiful, and having more womanly virtues, than the ‘Ladye faire’ of old romance? We have the primeval forest, the remnant of the red men, land and sea, hill and dale, for the imaginative. Human nature is here; action, passion, and thought, can therefore, be examined by the speculative. The soil, trade, navigation, the wonders of sea and land, are they not as patent to us as to the inhabitants of other lands, or do ours require no chronicling?” (“To Our Readers.” *The Guardian* Jan. 1860: 2).

Another way to encourage this shift was to emphasize the ways in which magazines could function as a repository for the new country. *The British-American Register*, for instance, suggested that it would become “a repository of every useful information, concerning the British Provinces in North America, and would thereby be not altogether uninteresting to Foreigners” (“Prospectus.” *The British-American Register* 18 Dec. 1802: 1). By alluding to foreign interest, the editor suggests that such a record would not only be historical but documentary, conveying the country’s activities beyond its borders and therefore showcasing its intellectual progress to the world. *The Acadian Magazine* emphasized the necessity of such a showcase not only to “advance the literary standing of the Country” but “to efface the impression which has been far too prevalent abroad, and particularly in the mother Country, that we were completely ignorant and barbarous” (“Preface.” *The Acadian Magazine* July 1826: i). That such sentiments were unchecked even among those who decided to join the new nation is suggested by John Kent’s surprise expressed in *The Canadian Literary Magazine* quoted above.

In later decades, the illustrated magazines touted the ways in which their efforts would also reflect the country visually:

A Canadian illustrated magazine would be as it were a mirror that would reflect Canadian nature, enterprise and art throughout the world, and tell the multitudes who crowd the cities and hamlets of Europe how much Providence has done for us, what our energy is adding to nature's ample store, and what a promising field lies open to their capital and industry. (“Prospectus.” *The Canadian Illustrated News* 30 Oct. 1869: 16)

The fact that the credit for such progress is deferred to Providence tempers the statement with a touch of reverence and modesty, while its promise beckons foreign interest and even investment. Such advertising could also rally patriotism within the country, as *The Dominion Illustrated* promised that it would not only supply material “that Canadians would not be ashamed to send abroad” but also images that could make Canada “better known not only to other nations, but to the various and far spreading sections of our own Dominion” (“Prospectus.” *The Dominion Illustrated* 7 July 1888: 2). *The Canadian Illustrated News* of 1862 complained that the country had until that point been neglected by foreign illustrated papers where “the Provinces receive not quite so much attention as a small English county, a coral reef in the Pacific, or a contemptible German principality” (“Our Purpose.” *The Canadian Illustrated News* 8 Nov. 1862: 2).

Even though he stipulated that he was not appealing to a spirit of nationality (instead positioning the magazine more dispassionately as a scholarly forum), Henry Youle Hind made a similar argument about intellectual knowledge at mid-century. As the first editor of the proto-academic journal of the Canadian Institute, Hind declared an interest in addressing the problem that while “numerous foreign scientific and artistic periodicals which meet with a liberal patronage in Canada, and which are not unfrequently made the medium of communicating to the world the discoveries and inventions of the ‘sons of the soil,’” the lack of similar Canadian enterprises meant that “many useful additions to knowledge—especially the knowledge of our own country—are withheld from the light by the absence of that encouragement and assistance” (“Editorial.” *The Canadian Journal* Aug. 1852: 5). *The Canadian Journal*’s aim to reciprocate such communications suggested a role for magazines not only as a repository

but also as a site of information sharing, and a showcase for Canada's achievements. In another example, poet and editor John Reade declared his hope to foster a similar platform within the creative field, noting, "I fondly hope that the time is not far distant, when Canada shall win that proud rank in the mighty republic of letters, to which the exertions of her sons and daughters shall entitle her" ("Introduction." *The Montreal Literary Magazine* Sept. 1856: 1).

Whether expressed in terms of sharing local information, boosting cultural continuity, addressing a longing for home, or reflecting the nation back to the world, the preceding prefaces reveal the spectrum of ways in which editors promoted their ventures as catalysts for civic betterment and cultural development. Such sentiments were even more boldly expressed in *The Literary Garland*, renowned for its unprecedented longevity and literary character. Standing out as one of the most ardent expressions of literary nationalism, editor John Gibson's introduction uses flowery metaphor and impassioned language to lay out his "manifesto":

Dispiriting as is the influence of the failure of all who have preceded us, we enter upon the arena with no fear the result. Asking nothing, claiming nothing, and expecting nothing, until it shall have been fairly earned, we throw ourselves unreluctantly upon the good faith of an honourable community, to whom we offer a secure pledge, that for one year at least our effort shall not be relaxed. If, at the expiration of that time, the GARLAND shall not have gathered a stem sufficiently powerful to support itself, it must fall and wither, as has been the fate of many a more beautiful and classic wreath. But it shall not be without a struggle. Our predecessors may have brought to their undertaking, an immeasurably greater

degree of talent, experience, and tact; but none have ever encountered the task with an enthusiasm surpassing ours—with a mind that laughed at difficulty with a truer scorn. (“To Our Readers.” *The Literary Garland* Dec. 1838: 1)

Although the next chapter will examine the full bloom of Gibson’s extended floral metaphor, suffice to say here that his intense optimism and literary commitment reveals a tone of unprecedented confidence. Gibson is less demanding and deferential towards his community in his “asking nothing, claiming nothing, and expecting nothing” attitude, confidently inviting his reader’s judgement and going so far as to set a timeline on the magazine’s progress. His acceptance of potential failure alongside his commitment to struggle suggests a faith in his readership to make the right choices. All the while he balances such confidence with the expected conventions of gentlemanly self-deprecation and enthusiasm.

Future prefaces would be hard pressed to top *The Literary Garland*’s exaltation, yet as the century progressed so did the patriotic impulse. Perhaps magazine editors began to glimpse a greater sense of continuity within their industry, and cultural progress more generally. For instance, Robert Shives, editor of *The Amaranth*, declared that he would seek out “original articles of undisputed merit, written by residents of New-Brunswick” and furthermore “with confidence appeal to the *patriotism* of the many who can write for us” (“To Our Patrons.” *The Amaranth* Jan. 1841: 1). Confederation in 1867 provided editors with even more of a nationalistic hook for their prefaces. In his second preface to *The New Dominion Monthly* (the magazine released a second first issue in October), publisher John Dougall alludes to the recent occasion of union directly:

Canada has long felt the want of a Monthly Periodical of a high literary character, and several attempts have been made to supply it. These attempts, however, have all proved abortive hitherto, for want of sufficient patronage; and it is partly on account of the wider field, resulting from the Confederation of the British American Provinces, that success may be hoped for the present enterprise.

(“Prospectus.” *The New Dominion Monthly* Oct. 1867: n. pag.)

Editor Robert Ridgeway of *The Canadian Magazine* echoes Dougall’s confidence, using rhetorical questions (examined in the next chapter) to interrogate the barriers to Canadian intellectual development before concluding:

Look at our specimen number, examine it carefully, judge impartially, decide generously, act promptly, subscribe for the CANADIAN MAGAZINE, and recommend it to your friends and acquaintance. We confidently appeal to the Canadian public for a generous, hearty, universal support. (“Preparatory Business Address to Subscribers and Contributors.” *The Canadian Magazine* July 1871: 1)

Further along in the preface, the editor suggests that his readers could regard the magazine as an addition to rather than a replacement for their regular reading material, although urging them to prefer it, suggesting that “whatever other periodical literature is taken let the ‘Canadian’ be the family magazine, the household companion, the domestic favourite” (“Preparatory Business Address to Subscribers and Contributors.” *The Canadian Magazine* July 1871: 1). Whereas some earlier editors expressed animosity towards foreign periodicals, here the editor seems confident in his abilities to compete with them.

While the language used by the previous preface established that magazine's positioning as a family title, which typically implied a lighter mix of fiction and articles intended for light leisure reading, other magazines, particularly post-Confederation, put intellectual development at the heart of their nationalist expressions. The watershed *Canadian Monthly and National Review* assumed this position with a preface that vowed to maintain "a national object in view" and to preserve "a tone beneficial to the national character and worthy of the nation" ("Introductory." *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* Jan. 1872: 1). Its confident tone dismisses failure, and positions itself at the centre of Canadian intellectual life:

Where several attempts have failed, the success of a new attempt must always be doubtful. But it is hoped that the effort to give an organ, in the form of a periodical, to the intellectual life of Canada, is now made under better auspices than before. There has been of late a general awakening of national life, which has probably extended to the literary and scientific sphere: of the large number recently added to our population, the ordinary proportion may be supposed to be writers or readers; and special circumstances have favoured the present publishers in obtaining literary assistance in the conduct of their Magazine. ("Introductory."

The Canadian Monthly and National Review Jan. 1872: 1)

These proprietors not only had the "better auspices" of a more mature publishing industry, but of superior connections and experience: Graeme Mercer Adam was a reputed editor, and Goldwin Smith equally a noted public intellectual. Although they retained a degree of modesty in noting the labour and risk involved in their national endeavour, their expressed desire to "sincerely endeavour to preserve, in all its

departments, a tone beneficial to the national character and worthy of the nation” and “to deal with Canadian questions and to call forth Canadian talent” (“Introductory.” *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* Jan. 1872: 1) reveals a confidence no doubt derived from industry experience and community connections.

Goldwin Smith’s later magazines *The Bystander* and *The Week* would earn an equally impressive reputation by putting nationalism front and centre. *The Bystander*’s preface notes that “experience has proved the difficulty of maintaining a Canadian Magazine in the face of the competition to which it is exposed both from the side of England and from that of the United States” (“Introductory Words.” *The Bystander* Jan. 1880: 1). Smith also expressed confidence that his readership would be interested in its home-grown public affairs coverage. *The Week* (initially edited by Charles G.D. Roberts) expressed its nationalist interests even more overtly as intending to “furnish instruction and wholesome entertainment for our reading classes, and to have but one policy—that of stimulating our national sentiment regarding our national morality and strengthening our national growth” (“Topics of the Week.” *The Week* 6 Dec. 1883: n. pag.). Although still observant of the social decorum, the authoritative tone of these last couple of prefaces suggests a more relaxed confidence rooted in a more mature intellectual community.

Variations on the Nationalist Theme: British, Regional, and Literary

The editorial territory examined thus far demonstrates an overt expression of civic and nationalist sentiment based on embracing a common identity. Yet other editors connected their efforts and even their patriotic stances with or against other nationalities or interests. Of these variations on the theme of national or civic pride, the most popular affiliations included a specifically pro-British stance, a regional focus (that did not necessarily

preclude a national focus), and finally a more literary-oriented nationalism in which patriotic sentiment was expressed through the lens of cultural development.⁷³

If earlier prefaces expressed ties to Britain in terms of imperialism and cultural transference, by later century pro-British expressions seem increasingly related to cultural rapprochement and anxieties around independence. *The British Canadian Review* acknowledged that its esteem “springs from the relations of the mother country,” while expressing loyalty to its local community. Ultimately though, the editor wanted to “humbly endeavour to foster the growing spirit of Nationality—the pride of Country—which is the true secret of a people’s strength” (“To Our Readers.” *The British Canadian Review* Dec. 1862: 2) and makes an argument for cultural unity. Yet the editor bolstered his preface with a more pro-British editorial, titled “Our future: In our present union lies our future greatness,” that argued “the necessity of having in Canada but one nationality” (“Our Future.” *The British Canadian Review* Dec. 1862: 3).. Editor J. Willet of *The Canadian Patriot* was less ambiguous in his note that “as to our national sentiments, we are thoroughly British. ‘*The Queen and Constitution*’ is our motto.” Afterward he delved into the specifics of that allegiance:

We have no sympathy whatever with those who are seeking to change her mild pacific government, for that of an American monarchy. [...] We long to see those bonds of union drawn closer. We want all the artificial barriers, those relics of a by-gone age, to be cleared out of the way. The interests of England, and of Canada, ought to be identical. It is only mis-government that has made them otherwise. (“Our First Number.” *The Canadian Patriot* 1 Jan. 1864: 1)

⁷³ Specialized magazines, particularly those that supplied general content to narrower readerships also tied their interests to nationalism; for instance, religious periodicals positioned their efforts as advancing Christianity in the nation, while juvenile publications were intent on educating the youth of the nation.

Here, the negative is implicit in its contrast with the positive: in *The British Canadian Review*'s advocacy of "one nationality" is an awareness of the country's bi-cultural reality (and indeed his preface discusses and embraces a number of cultures), and in *The Canadian Patriot*'s more active opposition is the spectre of American annexation vigorously alive in this era. However, the evolution from earlier perspectives also speaks to Canada's late-century identity as an independent nation—neither editor is suggesting a return to colonial status or even the sort of cultural transference that had been celebrated in past prefaces, but rather a renewed commitment to the British connection.

Other magazines expressed a stronger regional commitment, a loyalty that did not necessarily preclude national interests. In specifying that "no exertions will be spared to make it in some measure worthy of the Provinces, and of the City whose name it bears" ("Our Address." *The Provincial, or, Halifax Monthly Magazine* Jan. 1852: 2), Mary Jane Katzmann Lawson embraced the regional, as did the editor of *The Guardian*, whose efforts focussed on "the literary tastes of the community," pointing out that "progress is the motto of the age and the Province of New Brunswick is quite alive to its importance" ("To Our Readers" *The Guardian* Jan. 1860: 1). As magazines moved west, those editors also pointed to the need for regional coverage. *The Canadian North West*'s preface justified its appearance by pointing to the uselessness of immigration pamphlets which became quickly outdated, claiming that "it is to take the place of such pamphlets that the CANADIAN NORTH WEST will be published in future from month to month" (Untitled. *The Canadian North West* Jan. 1880: 1). Other magazines that articulated their primary loyalties to their provinces included *The Amaranth* in its focus on the *literati* of New Brunswick, and *The Nova Scotia New Monthly Magazine* in its focus on Halifax.

Confederation brought a swell of nationally-oriented magazines, but the decades after witnessed national and regional magazines coexisting, as is made evident by prefaces like that of *The New Brunswick Magazine* edited by William Kirby Reynolds, who declared “its special field is the Maritime Provinces and the Colonies which have an historical connection with them” (“By Way of Introduction.” *The New Brunswick Magazine* July 1898: 3) and the Winnipeg-based *The Western Sunbeam*, which stated that “it is our aim to place within the homes of Western Canada a good, readable journal at a price within the reach of all” (“Our Bow,” *The Western Sunbeam* Apr. 1891: 4). By the later century, when national general interest magazines (such as *The Canadian Magazine* founded in 1893) were presumably sufficiently established, editors seemed to identify a regional niche as one to be serviced alongside the national.

More than any other sub-category, literary development provided another clear focus for nationalist expression. This mandate further divides to include both the cultural development of the readership as well as the fostering of literary talent. Given that literary productions such as fiction, poetry, and intellectual essays were the magazines’ stock in trade (and for some magazines an exclusive focus), editors were inclined to link the opportunity to read and write such literary works to community and national improvement. Editors also emphasized the potential for literary production to preserve domestic events for posterity and to increase the chances that the new nation would produce talent (a Burns or a Hume, to echo the preface quoted above) and bring pride to the nation. As the next chapter demonstrates, editors reserved much of their most impassioned rhetoric for the unknown writer who might well languish should his or her creative talents be neglected.

Throughout the century, magazine editors continually lamented the lack of venues for literary publishing as yet another justification for their inauguration. Impassioned advocates included *The Montreal Museum*, whose editor Mrs. Gosselin complained that “in the Canadas there is not a single Literary Journal” (“Introduction.” *The Montreal Museum* Dec. 1832: 1), and *The Roseharp*, whose publishers resolved to encourage “a taste for literature, and the fine arts” (“Introduction.” *The Roseharp* Jan. 1835: 1). Later magazines also focused on literary development; for instance, *The Guardian* vowed “to encourage a home literature” in the hopes of offering “an opportunity for those, who wish to improve themselves by writing, to bring their works before the public” (“To Our Readers” *The Guardian* Jan. 1860: 2).

By the time *The Canadian Literary Journal* appeared, devoting itself almost exclusively to literature, its editor declared that “there is no deficiency in this country of talent necessary to sustain a Canadian literary periodical” (“To the Public.” *The Canadian Literary Journal* July 1870: 11). Yet even he felt the need to articulate fears concerning literary development:

That in this vast Dominion of Canada there exists such a scarcity of purely literary periodicals of native production, is no proof that there is any lack of ability to sustain them, but is rather an evidence of a very great want of enterprise. It may be argued that hitherto there has not been sufficient scope—that a feeling of provincialism has rendered any such attempt a step too ambitious; but now, when the Dominion has attained such large proportions, a corresponding feeling should possess the national mind that we are not as we once were, but are elevated to play an important part, and occupy a prominent position amongst the nations of

the earth. If there is one thing more than another that contributes to a nation's greatness, it is its native born literature. ("To the Public." *The Canadian Literary Journal* July 1870: 11)

Here, the editor advocates literary development as a key to national progress, making native literature his "principal object" by outlining the specific content to appear in the periodical, including sketches of the early settlement of Canada, a profile of the United Empire Loyalists, and a serial novel written by a Canadian author.

If some editors saw the development of native talent as central to their publishing projects, others focussed exclusively on reader satisfaction. Even as the editor of *The Canadian Literary Journal* emphasized his devotion to Canadian writers, he still compromised that position by noting that

It is our intention almost exclusively to confine the columns of the JOURNAL to original contributions from Canadian writers, although we will by no means exclude good selections, that in all respects we may contribute to the satisfaction of our readers. ("To the Public." *The Canadian Literary Journal* July 1870: 11)

Several magazines otherwise advocating nationalist ideals also pushed back against restricting themselves to purely native contributions, noting their intention instead to gather material chiefly from foreign periodicals. Most defiantly, *The Saturday Reader*, even as it speculated on the causes of indifference to native literature, emphasized its loyalty to readers over writers. Editor W.B. Cordier vowed unapologetically to "confine ourselves chiefly to the reproduction of the works of British authors of repute" ("Our Undertaking." *The Saturday Reader* 9 Sept. 1865: 1). John Dougall of *The New*

Dominion Monthly, while embracing Confederation in his mandate, identified the route to success as avoiding the limitations of original content. He noted that “previous magazines had a somewhat heavy character” and expressed his intention to rely on contributions mostly from foreign sources:

Unless original matter is both good and interesting, they will prefer to cull from the most spirited and successful periodicals of Britain and the United States.

They, however, hope that by degrees, the proportion of original matter, of a really suitable kind, will increase in each number; and so soon as the circulation of the MONTHLY will afford it, they mean to pay a fair rate of remuneration for native talent. (“Prospectus.” *The New Dominion Monthly* Oct. 1867: n. pag.)

These expressions are useful reminders that editors sometimes experienced conflicting allegiances, with their strongest loyalty necessarily tied to their readers and ultimately their own commercial survival. In a field where slick foreign periodicals and, in the later century, even multiple domestic offerings competed for fickle readers, editors and publishers no doubt had to balance altruism with what must have been a strong reader demand for familiar foreign authors. Again rather mercenary in its declarations, *The Saturday Reader* advanced this position even further by making the unusual admission that “our primary object, and we may just as well own it, is to make money” (“Our Undertaking.” *The Saturday Reader* 9 Sept. 1865: 1). Such a rare pronouncement is an important reminder that magazines did not survive on altruism alone.⁷⁴

Still, the success and longevity of more nationalistic titles suggests that patriotism was a selling point for many readers. By realizing their aspirations to become forums for

⁷⁴ In spite of his hard line in this preface, *The Saturday Reader*’s W.B. Cordier seems in fact to have been fairly supportive of local writers, judging from his regular feedback on submissions and queries, as a subsequent chapter will examine more closely.

intellectual debate, weighty titles like *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* and *The Week* become required reading for those classes who wanted to keep up with and even express their own views on the new nation's intellectual development. As anonymity fell away, the names of now-identifiable Canadian *literati* appeared in the magazines, and those who aspired to such reputations could establish themselves as contributors.⁷⁵ Instead of calling out in the wilderness to contributors, the editor of a title like *The Canadian Magazine* asserted confidently from his first line that the magazine needed “no apology for appearing,” positioning his efforts not only in title but in preface as a national platform:

The policy will be steadily pursued of cultivating Canadian patriotism and Canadian interests, and of endeavouring to aid in the consolidation of the Dominion on a basis of national self-respect and a mutual regard for the rights of the great elements which make up the population of Canada. (“Announcement.” *The Canadian Magazine* Mar. 1893: 1)

The editor, J. Gordon Mowat, additionally noted his intent “to stimulate Canadian thought and to aid in opening mines of literary worth that are yet undeveloped” (“Announcement.” *The Canadian Magazine* Mar. 1893: 1) and connected his own efforts to the greater literary potential that he saw in his time, citing college attendance and literary interest as other evidence of a healthy intellectual climate. While he acknowledged that “few have made literature a profession,” he furthermore granted that “the few who have done so, speak well for the subsequent career of our native writers. It

⁷⁵ The point here is not that earlier magazines did not have established literary connections; in fact as one example from the 1830s reveals, *The Canadian Casket*'s editor noted that he “has the assurance that several gentlemen of respectable literary talents will occasionally contribute instruction and amusement” (“Prospectus.” *The Canadian Casket* n.d. 1831: 7). Yet the later century did see the greater promotion of known writers and references to professionalization.

is because we have faith in home talent, that we open our pages to encourage the production and growth of a native literature.” He also lauded the arrival of a professional class of authors, noting that “we intend to supply a standard of first-class journalism from the pens of professional writers, so that our contributors may have a model, and our readers a rich mental treat” (“Announcement.” *The Canadian Magazine* Mar. 1893: 1).

In 1896, George Moffat vowed to make his *Our Monthly* “a Canadian ‘Maga’” (a reference to the famous *Blackwood’s*), revealing himself as yet another enthusiastic nationalist with his declaration that

A country is not made great by the blarney or astuteness of its politicians, the successful barter and exchange of its brokers, its manufactures, imports or exports, or by the prize turnips or bull-beef of its smiling homesteads, but by the deeds of its heroes, the blood of its martyrs, the songs of its singers and the literature of its writers. (“Argument.” *Our Monthly* May 1896: n. pag.)

By contrast with earlier editors, who felt the need to suggest sources of national pride, here the basis for patriotism is an acknowledged creative class, with the magazine positioned as a natural receptacle for their original works.⁷⁶ Although these later prefaces still call for submissions and appeal for reader support, their tone is more assured and assertive than the earlier editors who wondered timidly whether their magazines would be well received.

⁷⁶ Other magazines with a more specialized focus also positioned themselves nationally, such as the arts-oriented *Arcadia* whose editor expected “the support of all who are interested in the promotion of cosmopolitanism and culture” (“Introductory.” *Arcadia* 2 May 1892: 1) and the history-oriented *Canadiana* whose editor articulated its purpose as “to foster and stimulate the sentiment which is growing amongst Canadians of interest in the past, pride in the present and confidence in the future of our Dominion” (“Prospectus.” *Canadiana* Jan. 1889: 1).

As these prefaces have shown, nationalism ran as a consistent and predominant thread through the mandate of these early magazines, yet to investigate this topic is also to witness a fair spectrum of perspectives within such patriotic self-presentation. What began as a desire for cultural transference diffused in several directions, at times with a more imperialist or monarchist bent, at times in favour of intellectual or literary development, and at times as the backdrop to regional pride. Regardless of focus, these magazine editors articulated a common desire for civic betterment, and tried to convince readers that their magazines were effective catalysts for such progress.

Negative Threads: Indifference, Anti-Americanism, and Trashy Literature

As editors articulated their desire to foster community and cultural activity, they also emphasized that the demand for such ventures arose from within the community itself. Just as *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* thanked its subscribers, so too did Canada's second arrival, *The Quebec Magazine*, note "early proof, in the number of subscriptions which appeared soon after the proposals were issued" that "seemed at once to justify the plan we had formed and promise it success" ("To the Public." *The Quebec Magazine* Aug. 1792: n. pag.). Similarly, the Quebec-based *British-American Register* acknowledged that "a few Gentlemen in different parts of the province, have for some time past, shewn a disposition to support a Periodical work" ("Prospectus." *The British-American Register* 18 Dec. 1802: 1). By citing reader demand for the publication, editors created a sense of anticipation surrounding the publication's arrival. Echoing *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*, both the *Register* and *The Acadian Magazine* also called for assistance from literary men of their communities.

Even late in the century, the editor of *The Pen* magazine noted being

...extremely grateful to the many friends who have so far encouraged our venture. It could scarcely be expected that merchants would sign advertising contracts with only a prospectus and a blank sheet of paper before them; yet a glance at our columns will show how heartily the mere idea has been received. ("Editorial Summary." *The Pen* 11 Dec. 1897: 1)

The editor of the Catholic-oriented *Walsh's Illustrated Monthly Magazine* furthermore acknowledged that its confidence was boosted by "the most practical evidence of good feeling, namely, a subscription list which already gives the magazine front rank among Canadian publications more especially intended for the Catholic people" ("Just Starting Out." *Walsh's Illustrated Monthly Magazine* Oct. 1895: iii). Additionally, several magazines quantified advance interest in terms of the size of their local population or expressed optimism about the dawning cultural interests that they saw as soon boosting their circulation and success.⁷⁷

If these images of a willing community calling out for tools to promote national betterment represents a positive and optimistic scene, such spirits could also be deflated by the spectre of past failures, a reality that occasionally emerges as a pessimistic counterpoint through the prefaces. Some negative threads appealed to reader sympathy by revealing the real challenges of publishing, while others raised spectres of various threats to their communities, positioning the magazines as defenders. Reader indifference was perhaps one of the most pervasive threads.⁷⁸ In dealing with this issue, editors typically

⁷⁷ While another common tactic to prove reader interest was to publish the positive reviews of a new endeavour in a later issue of the magazine, at least one editor published a private testimonial directly in his preface, from no less than the impressive Goldwin Smith who was quoted as writing that "your company will render a service to this country if you can succeed in setting on foot a magazine which will reward native talent" ("Argument," *Our Monthly* Jan. 1896: n. pag.).

⁷⁸ Frank Luther Mott notes that American magazines were also briefly obsessed with this question of literary indifference, particularly before 1820. He quotes one editor in 1799 suggesting several factors for

revealed the evidence for such indifference (often identifying a preoccupation with material concerns) and then articulated the ways in which their ventures would help to redeem past failures and assist communities in overcoming their intellectual darkness. This sentiment first emerged not in a preface but in the closing editorial of *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*, in which publisher John Howe expressed his disappointment at the magazine's failure:

The number of subscribers is so small, compared with the expence [sic] attending the Publication; and the want of punctuality in the payment of many of the Subscriptions is so great, that it is impossible, except at the Printer's own expence, [sic] to continue it. ("To the Public." *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* Mar. 1792: 192)⁷⁹

Howe concludes his valedictory by putting a finer point on the politely worded "want of punctuality in the payment" as he notes that "those who wished to encourage it should have the ability to contribute more than their *wishes*" ("To the Public." *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* Mar. 1792: 192). The accusing tone implied by Howe's italicized *wishes* reveals his disappointment over delinquent subscribers who reneged on their commitment to the magazine, a problem that would continue throughout the century.

John Howe's reflection provides a moment of honest revelation, yet most publishers expressed their concerns over the lack of support for cultural activities more sympathetically. Even within the grand cultural inheritance narrative of *The Canadian*

this indifference, including a preoccupation with business and industry, defective college educations, the lack of rewards for authors, and the scarcity of books (187).

⁷⁹ This disappointment did not come out of nowhere for *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*, which regularly assessed its progress at the start of each volume and had already conveyed its disappointment at the beginning of its third address "To the Public" as the editor noted "it is much to be regretted, that gentlemen of talents and leisure in the country, do not discover a readiness to communicate their speculations" ("To the Public." *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* July 1790: 3-4). The editor lamented that he was forced to source most material from British and Irish periodicals.

Review and Literary and Historical Journal, the editor noted that Canada had made “but little progress in Letters,” writing that the country was “not destitute of the elements necessary for calling forth the inspiration which flows from education and mental acquisition,” but that “no effort has yet been made to organize the information and the talents which are scattered so supinely and inactively throughout the country” (“Quebec Literary and Historical Society.” *The Canadian Review and Literary and Historical Journal* July 1824: 21). Of course, given that the Quebec Literary and Historical Society’s established purpose was to enact such organization (and did so successfully for decades to follow, far outlasting the magazine), this note was self-serving as it emphasized a deficiency that the magazine would redeem.

In *The Enquirer*, editor C.D.E. similarly lamented past failures and reader preoccupations:

It seems that one ought to be discouraged to offer such a kind of work as this to the public after the failure of many of the same nature. Indeed the difficulty attending the attempt appears almost invincible. Immersed in mercantile speculations the greater part of the Canadian Community think they have hardly leisure to bestow any time on any other object, preferring profit to intellectual improvement. (“Introductory Observations.” *The Enquirer* 1 May 1821: 4)

Considering that scarcely thirty years had passed since the launch of Canada’s first periodical, C.D.E.’s concerns seem a bit premature (if prescient). Perhaps the most interesting word in C.D.E.’s editorial, however, is “think,” implying mercantile focus as a choice rather than a certainty. Such wording also challenges readers to renounce apathy, and again reinforces the magazine’s position as a catalyst for cultural development.

Nationalist rhetoric may have overshadowed reader indifference as the century progressed, but pessimism did not disappear entirely. For instance, even at mid-century the editor of *The Anglo-American Magazine* pointed out that

... ‘the battle of life’ is mainly fought in the fields of commerce and labour, and in which the combatants, and of these comparatively few, have neither the leisure nor the means—alas! that we should think the inclination also wanting to partake of the relaxation of intellectual pursuits and to encourage the attempts which are made to promote them. (“Prologue.” *The Anglo-American Magazine* July 1852: 67)

Here, the editor both excused and accused his reader, as he speculated on potential reasons for avoiding cultural participation yet also hinted at an “inclination also wanting” that alludes to readers’ negligence and indifference to intellectual pursuit. W.B. Cordier of *The Saturday Reader* registered similar disappointment in past readers’ lack of passion:

The occasions on which Canadians have had an opportunity of bidding welcome to a literary paper, on its advent, have been few, and we must add that the greetings at such occurrences have not been of a very hearty nature; and, indeed the griefs and regrets at the decease of such publications, although of almost as frequent recurrence, have been equally tame and ephemeral in their character.

(“Our Undertaking.” *The Saturday Reader* 9 Sept. 1865: 1)

In describing such an unresponsive attitude even to the demise of prior attempts, the editor depicts a fairly passive and disengaged public, themselves a threat to civic engagement and cultural life. Yet rhetoric is also at work here since the bleaker the

situation expressed, the brighter the magazines seem in their potential to redeem such imbalances.

The moral threat of “trashy literature” was another negative factor opposed by editors. As Carole Gerson notes in *A Purer Taste*, “the English-Canadian response to prose fiction reflected many of the disputes familiar to English and American observers of the novel’s struggle for approval” (17). In the prefaces, such concerns were often articulated in conjunction with anti-Americanist sentiments, as editors positioned their literary provisions as a fortification against the threat of cultural invasion. In many ways, the divisive power of American magazines provided a more tangible scapegoat than the threat of literary indifference, both in its avoidance of awkward accusations towards the reader and in the fact that it suggested a simpler switch for those who were already magazine readers to become home-grown consumers. In her preface to *The Montreal Museum*, editor Mrs. Gosselin, who described her magazine as “deeply interested in the honour of our country, and conscious of her claims to a great degree of intelligence” (“Introduction.” *The Montreal Museum* Dec. 1832: 1), railed against critics who would contradict these claims, and made the first overt articulation of the American threat:

In the Canadas there is not a single Literary Journal, whilst the neighbouring states abound with Periodical Publications, devoted to the general diffusion of knowledge—although we must admit the fact, we deny the inference—it is not from a deficiency of taste or of talent, that local Literature is not duly encouraged; but from a cause perhaps as culpable though not so humiliating, to a supineness, which render the reading community content, whilst strangers administer to their demands for information, regardless of all their own Country suffers by this ready

given preference to the industry and activity of Foreigners, for we cannot cede to them a higher degree of superiority. The extraordinary facility with which American Works may be obtained, and their multiplicity, goes far to confirm this prevailing indifference toward the development of native genius, and the increase of national respectability. ("Introduction." *The Montreal Museum* Dec. 1832: 1-2)

Even as Gosselin absolves her fellow citizens and lays blame on American magazines, she still covertly accuses readers of collusion in allowing "strangers" to "administer to their demands for information," with inferior results. With a mix of reproach and understanding, Gosselin both accused her readers of passive neglect and offered redemption through her magazine.

Other editors positioned their periodicals as challengers to the American problem. In his preface to *The Amaranth* ten years later, editor Robert Shives echoed Gosselin's concern by writing that "some substitute of *home manufacture* should be placed as a barrier in the way of the too free circulation of American publications" ("To our Patrons." *The Amaranth* Jan. 1841: 1). He declared his intention to fight the flow of American magazines with their "wholly anti-British" articles:

American Magazines are now flooding the country, and many of them, it is to be regretted, convey principles of a levelling tendency, odious certainly in the estimation of every true Briton—it is a fact, that upon the sensible man, the only effect produced by the promulgation of such principles, is upon the risible faculties. ("To our Patrons." *The Amaranth*, Jan. 1841: 1)

Here, Shives establishes American and British magazines as moral opposites, a divide he widens as he identifies the offending articles not just as American but as "anti-British,"

essentially fashioning foreign reading as a treasonous act. His statement subtly confronts and chastises readers for their support of the foreign industries, turning magazine consumption into a choice of loyalties. If Shives seems rather focussed on the American threat for a first editorial, perhaps his attitude is explicable by the fact that even the relatively weak Imperial Copyright Act would not be passed until 1842, and concerns about American titles flowing across the border were presumably at a peak.

Two decades later, the editor of *The Guardian* framed the problem as a need for a domestic platform as much as a need to combat the American influx:

Magazines are imported in great quantities, it is true, but they are not ours: they belong to other people; we seem merely to have the privilege of reading them; they are, as it were, beyond us. The valuable ones mostly belong to Britain; while America produces some that are excellent, but a great many that are very trashy.

(“To Our Readers.” *The Guardian* Jan. 1860: 1)

Here, the editor reiterates the American problem as he reminds readers of the more significant danger of consuming reading material generated by outsiders. Indeed, several concerns are relevant here: that intellectual productions created by foreigners did not meet domestic moral standards, that support for these offerings stunted the Canadian industry, and that the foreign products currently on offer were (mostly) trashy.

Even though the words “American” and “trash” sometimes become interchangeable in these prefaces, editors had to have been more than slightly envious of the success and relative advancement of American literature and periodicals, particularly given the spectre of indifference they occasionally identified in their own readers. The need to compete with such magazines was clearly on the mind of many editors, for

instance when the editor of the Prescott-based *Mirror of Literature* noted that he was “aware of the extreme difficulty, and the labour that will be required in order to attract attention or merit a place among the many refined literary productions of the day” (“Preface.” *The Mirror of Literature* Nov. 1835: 1). Perhaps the relative success of almost five years of continuous publication gave editor John Gibson the grace to see the American problem in a more positive light, as he revealed outright admiration in an 1843 preface to *The Literary Garland*’s new series:

But far in the distance as, to many, the time may seem, when Canada shall become known as a literary country, the experience of our Anglo-Republican neighbours is proof sufficient that the predictions we have ventured may very soon be verified. It is not so many years since some English Reviewer, Jeffrey or Gifford, or some one of their fellow-critics, exclaimed contemptuously: "Who reads an American book?" The taunt was felt—but it was a spell to wake the sleeping energies of that giant country. It was like the Enchanter's Wand. It called spirits from the deep, and they came. Poets and novelists sprang into being as if by magic. Now no such reproach can justly cling to the country which numbers a Sprague, a Halleck, a Percival, and a Bryant, among its poets—a Cooper and an Irving among its novelists and historians. (“Introduction to the New Series of the *Garland*.” *The Literary Garland. New Series* Jan. 1843: 3)

Finding inspiration in the way that American literature, once derided, had come into its own, Gibson called for Canadians to follow its example, concluding his argument by stressing the importance of a national literature to encouraging patriotism. These more positive expressions reveal that Canadian editors in spite of their complaints did aspire to

emulate the trajectory of American publications which had aided in developing their writers' reputations and their country's emergent literature.

Later on, magazines perhaps equally secure in their own industry began to admit to occasional admiration for foreign industries; for instance, *The Gaspé Magazine and Instructive Miscellany* noted that "Our ambition, even at a far distance, is to become the 'CHAMBERS OF CANADA'" ("The Rock at Percé." *The Gaspé Magazine* Aug. 1849: 1) and *The Canadian Magazine* of 1893 aspired to the level of "the great reviews" of Britain and the United States while *Massey's Magazine* aspired to offer a periodical that "will compare favourably with the best magazines of England and the United States" ("Editorial Notes." *Massey's Magazine* Jan. 1896: 64). Such aspirations to be measured alongside rather than to replace foreign reading suggest a more confident attitude towards these competitors and an acceptance of their place in a wider industry.⁸⁰

American magazines may have been both a real threat and a convenient scapegoat, but they were also a euphemism for the threat of morally questionable literature and the harm it posed for Canadian readers, particularly the country's youth. In his prospectus to *The People's Magazine and Weekly Journal*, which represented the continuation of his original *People's Magazine* launched that April, proprietor John Dougall was more blunt than in his original prospectus. He extended the national bias and scope of this critique to a range of "exceedingly low-priced" materials that included magazines, encyclopedias, and journals from a number of countries, not only America but also Britain, France, and Germany. Dougall emphasized the need to "keep out the

⁸⁰In the *Literary History of Canada*, M.H. Scargill quotes a writer from *The Week* asserting that American magazines outsold the British one hundred to one in Canada, also noting that Sara Jeannette Duncan wrote in that publication that "the British magazines could not compete in numbers, liveliness, variety and price with the Americans" (280).

pernicious and trashy portions of the literature in question,” while noting that “it is almost impossible to overrate the importance of introducing speedily into general circulation that which is wholesome” (“Prospectus.” *The People’s Magazine and Weekly Journal* 7 Oct. 1846: 8). He was even more incisive about the harmful consequences of such literature:

Without [wholesome literature] a stunted and dwarfish growth of the public mind must ensue as the result of a deficiency of mental food; and in that case, the people of Canada must occupy a much lower place in the intellectual scale than other nations. (“Prospectus.” *The People’s Magazine and Weekly Journal* 7 Oct. 1846: 8)

Whereas other editors boosted their magazines by establishing American magazines as a negative contrast, Dougall shows the threat to be even worse by suggesting the ways that bad literature could devastate Canada’s future intellectual viability amongst other nations. To risk such dire consequences simply by choosing the wrong magazine seems catastrophic.

The suggestion that Canadians deserved a superior offering was further advanced by the proprietor of *The Anglo-American Magazine*:

....the lighter class of publications, we speak strictly of those produced on this continent, are more abundant than profitable. It is with no desire to detract from their literary merits that we venture on this bold assertion. The talent displayed in many of the original compositions which they contain, is unquestionable; the industry evinced in their compilation is most commendable; we have no doubt also, that much discrimination is employed in selecting such articles as are best suited to the tastes of the majority of the people among whom they circulate; but

it is precisely in this particular that we deem them deficient and inapposite for the Canadian public. ("Prologue." *The Anglo-American Magazine* July 1852: 67)

Rather than comment on the quality of the literature, he flips the issue on its head by suggesting that such implicitly inferior magazines were "suited" for Americans but "deficient and inapposite" for Canadians.⁸¹ As such, he goads Canadian readers to see themselves as culturally and morally superior to Americans.

Although many threads in the overarching narrative of magazines remained consistent over the decades, the tendency to bash American magazines and literature was mainly a trend of the early century, later to be replaced by a tendency to acknowledge a spectrum of quality. In his preface to *Stewart's Literary Quarterly Magazine*, George Stewart established himself as one of the century's most vocal critics on the subject of morally questionable reading material with a lengthy discussion that further elucidated the problem:

We have depended too long on our "American Cousins" for reading of this kind, and trusted too little to our own energies and efforts. As a consequence, the rising generation has thrust into its hands many publications of a very questionable moral character, and not at all adapted for the instruction of British youth. In most of the cheap Yankee literature which finds its way into our Province, there is a deep morbid hatred evinced of everything British, and every opportunity taken to stigmatise our country and constitution, and exalt unduly everything American. This should not be. ("Introductory." *Stewart's Literary Quarterly Magazine* Apr. 1867: 1)

⁸¹ MacDonald notes that this magazine's contents do not for the most part reflect this initial editorial impulse (115).

Like his predecessors and contemporaries, Stewart notes a stark contrast between the two literatures, positioning American periodicals as aggressors and even going so far as to outline the consequences of exposure to the “cheap Yankee” material. The specificity of his claims about American boosterism and taunts about “everything British” go beyond abstract accusation. He admits the Canadian industry’s culpability in failing to develop sufficient alternatives.

Stewart furthermore separates the worthy American publications from the trashy to isolate the real problem:

We are not to be understood as saying that all American publications are objectionable; far from it. We allude only to the cheap novels—the trashy weeklies and immoral monthlies—which, we regret to say, have too many purchasers among the young of our city. It is these we condemn, and would, if we could, prohibit altogether. There are many respectable and talented periodicals in the United States, which we are pleased to see imported, and read by our youth; but it is to be feared that this class of reading has fewer charms for the young than the pernicious cheap literature which panders to the worst passions of the human mind, and undermines its virtue, by giving to vice a gloss and glitter that is false and fiendish. (“Introductory.” *Stewart’s Literary Quarterly Magazine* Apr. 1867: 1)

If Stewart notably implicates the youth of his city (Stewart was relatively youthful himself at this point, a teenager at the start of his editorial career), he also shows them sympathy over the lack of wholesome alternatives. As will be explored in the next

chapter, Stewart also used rhetorical tools to depict more starkly the dark fate in store for those young men caught up in reading trashy dime novels.

American magazines were often used as a scapegoat, yet a more neutral positioning lamented simply that Canadians did not have enough access to their own news. By late century, when Canadian editors no longer needed to convince their readers that the country produced newsworthy events, they still pointed to the wide circulation of foreign magazines as evidence of an interest in reading and justification for increased domestic sources. For instance, *The Lake Magazine* noted that

the magazines of the United States have a very large circulation in the Dominion, even such of them as treat of public questions almost exclusively from an American point of view and illustration. While this is not to be regretted, it is unfortunate, to say the least, that Canada has herself no monthly dealing as only a magazine can deal with the great and important public questions engaging from time to time the attention of Canadians. ("Salutatory." *The Lake Magazine*, Aug. 1892: 1)

The editor of *Our Monthly* also lamented Canadian consumption of large amounts of literature that unfortunately covered "every subject under the sun except Canada!" ("Argument." *Our Monthly* May 1896: n. pag.). In these cases the editors were not expressing distaste for American fare (as their readers were clearly consuming it) as much as lamenting the fact that such sources naturally had no particular interest in Canadian issues and therefore left important topics untouched.

Literature for the People

If the word “cheap” was often used interchangeably with the word “trash” (and at one point, the word “American”) to indicate literature of low moral standards, another notion of “cheap” emerged to indicate a greater circulation to a wider audience. Since magazines depended on subscriptions and later on advertising, circulation numbers were important. With their mandate to amuse and instruct, even early magazines embraced multiple classes, from the more overt hierarchy expressed in *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*’s desire to recruit gentlemen contributors to educate humble readers, to the more sympathetic expression of the magazine as a democratizing tool by *The Enquirer*’s editor C.D.E., who earnestly aimed to educate a wider readership beyond “that class of Society blessed with the smiles of fortune” (“Introductory Observations.” *The Enquirer* 1 May 1821: 1).

In 1847, Susanna Moodie and her husband were among the first to refer deliberately to class issues, founding their *The Victoria Magazine* specifically to extend literary reading beyond the privileged classes.⁸² With an editorial that began by noting the literary celebrity of its editors, the preface outlined the aim of *The Victoria Magazine* to embrace a wider class of subscribers than those who could afford *The Literary Garland*’s higher price:

While one class of readers can afford to give two or three dollars a year for a magazine, a much more numerous class can afford to pay only one dollar per

⁸² Other specialized magazines also advocated the intellectual development of a niche readership; for instance, the women’s magazine *The Calliopean* aimed “to elevate the standard of female education in Canada, and thus to promote domestic happiness and social virtue” (“Editorial Department.” *The Calliopean* 23 Nov. 1847: 8) and *The Canadian Family Herald* described itself as a “family paper in which all the members of the household can find something suited to their individual tastes and capacities” (“Prospectus.” *The Canadian Family Herald* 22 Nov. 1851: 3).

annum. Our hopes of success are, in great measure, founded on this calculation.

(“To the Public.” *The Victoria Magazine* Sept. 1847: 1)⁸³

The editorial specified that those readers would be found among “a class whose reading has hitherto almost necessarily been confined to the perusal of the newspapers,” particularly focussing on “intelligent farmers.” Moodie furthermore elaborates on the compatibility of reading with the lifestyle of the farmer, who had “plenty of time during his daily labors, which become mechanical from habit, to arrange and digest in his mind the knowledge he has previously acquired” (“To the Public.” *The Victoria Magazine* Sept. 1847: 2). Moodie concluded that “to this class, no less than to the intelligent inhabitants of the Towns, do we look for encouragement and support in our undertaking” (“To the Public.” *The Victoria Magazine* Sept. 1847: 2). This new direction emulated the sort of pricing experimentation that had started in Britain a decade earlier.

The Victoria Magazine stands out for devoting part of its preface to articulating its benevolence, while other magazines such as *The Amaranth* in New Brunswick and *The People’s Magazine* in Montreal advertised their lower prices by announcing themselves as cheap and affordable in their prospectuses and subtitles. Beyond class benevolence, advertising revenue was also a factor in the expansion. Again remarkable for his frank admissions, W.B. Cordier of *The Saturday Reader* made his intentions plain by noting that “in a new country like this, where the literary arena is limited, the success of a periodical, whose existence depends chiefly upon the extent of its circulation, can only be attained by embracing a large number of interests, or rather by interesting a large number of readers” (“Our Undertaking.” *The Saturday Reader* 9 Sept. 1865: 1). In enumerating

⁸³ The editorial was careful to note that “Mrs. Moodie has no intention, on her part, of discontinuing her long connection with the ‘Garland’” (“To the Public.” *The Victoria Magazine* Sept. 1847: 1).

reasons for past magazine failures, John Dougall of *The New Dominion Monthly* noted that “another cause of failure has been, the high price, rendered necessary by paying for original matter, and consequently small circulation; but the NEW DOMINION MONTHLY aims at a very large circulation at a very low price. In fact, it is meant to give more value for the money than can be found elsewhere” (“Prospectus.” *The New Dominion Monthly* Oct. 1867: n. pag.).⁸⁴ Given the extensive advertising even in the first issue of Dougall’s new venture, the economic benefits of circulation were also a clear driver for pricing experimentation. Other late-century magazines similarly embraced a larger audience; for instance, *The Lake Magazine* hoped to “be welcomed by a much larger constituency of readers than any Canadian magazine issued in previous years” (“Salutatory.” *The Lake Magazine* Aug. 1892: 1).

If claims to genteel exclusivity were diminished by the acknowledged attempt to reach a wider audience, editors still sought to confirm their magazines as morally and intellectually responsible. In *The Provincial, or, Halifax Monthly Magazine*, editor Mary Jane Katzmann Lawson addressed the democratization of periodicals themselves, which “have become so common, and have been promoted and supported by such an amount of talent and character, that they now occupy a position in literature, and exercise an influence upon society, superior perhaps to many expensive books of higher pretensions” (“Our Address.” *The Provincial* Jan. 1852: 1). She praised the cheap magazine specifically, noting particularly its expanding readership:

The cheap periodical, now no longer humble in its pretensions, but rich both in material and interest, is welcome alike in the cottage of the mechanic, and the

⁸⁴ The publisher noted that *The New Dominion Monthly* needed about 6,000 subscribers and a reasonable advertising patronage to become self-supporting.

drawing-room of the man of wealth and refinement. The revolution which has taken place in this class of publications is alike extraordinary and desirable. (“Our Address.” *The Provincial* Jan. 1852: 1)

Further expanding the range of contributors from the “enlightened statesman” and the “grave philosopher,” Lawson noted how “Now, the highest intellects of the day send forth the rich and varied produce of their minds, to the world at large, in the form of periodical publications” (“Our Address.” *The Provincial* Jan. 1852: 1). Periodical writing was, she asserted, an acceptable activity for a range of classes. The editor finally boosted the altruism of her mission by noting that “in submitting a new Periodical to the public, therefore, we are only in some manner enlarging the means of human happiness” (“Our Address.” *The Provincial* Jan. 1852: 2).⁸⁵

Although magazines had become decidedly more popular and accessible by later century, the uglier correlation of “cheap” with morally questionable was still an issue occasionally tackled in the prefaces. Within general interest magazines, a range of titles had emerged to serve different types of readers. Yet even a magazine such as the popular *Canadian Family Herald*, while acknowledging its focus on lighter fiction that aimed “to enlighten the general family circle,” was quick to distance itself even in its “Prospectus” from suspicious works:

The success of a cheap publication, of a strictly moral cast, may be doubted, were an examination made into the kind of literature which prevails most in our streets and in our steamboats; but this is no correct criterion, and only proves that people will read, and must have cheap literature, although, in many cases, it may be at

⁸⁵ The editor furthermore noted “it is not our intention to endeavour to supplant any contemporary,” likely a reference to contemporary magazine *The Mayflower* which she did in fact supplant.

the expense of sound morality. (“Prospectus.” *The Canadian Family Herald* 22 Nov. 1851: 3)

In articulating its awareness of these interloper magazines and commiserating with the reader, the *Family Herald* used contrast to bolster its own moral positioning. By specifying the arena of consumption as a “household” rather than the public spaces of the trashier fare, *The Canadian Family Herald* echoed its contemporaries in specifying the parameters of moral reading matter and even reading spaces. In spite of its aim at mass appeal, the magazine was still preoccupied with establishing its moral acceptability and distancing itself from questionable literature. *Toronto Saturday Night* similarly tried to distance itself from ill-reputed forms, noting that the weekly “should not be looked upon in any sense as simply ‘a story paper,’ though novels, illustrated sketches and stories will form one of its many features” and asserting that its advertising “...will be clean. No quacks or ‘before taking’ and ‘after taking’ illustrations will ever appear in its columns” (“Salutatory.” *Toronto Saturday Night* 3 Dec. 1887: 6). *The Glowworm* too positioned itself as a magazine for “the family circle” but specified that it “will always carefully exclude everything bordering on the sensational or immoral” (“To Our Readers.” *The Glowworm* July 1891: 1). In *A Purer Taste*, Gerson notes how questionable and particularly sensational fiction was roundly denounced especially in the later century (27), a fact that confirms the need for periodical editors to be seen as adamantly opposed to questionable content particularly if they embraced a “family” focus.

In tracing the problems of the American periodical encroachment, this discussion has looked at the ways in which American competition was both reviled and grudgingly admired. In different prefaces, the word “American” and the word “cheap” could be used

as euphemisms for trashy literature, although at various points these words were also redeemed, particularly “cheap” when it was aligned with democracy and benevolence. While it would be easy to generalize that magazine editors expressed wariness in their prefaces about anything American, trashy, and cheap, to unpack these terms is to realize the nuances in their interpretation, and the ways in which these complaints evolved over time. In any case, such negatives were mostly used rhetorically as a means to provide a contrast against which the benefits of the superior Canadian offerings could be articulated.

Practical Concerns

While the themes discussed thus far have focussed primarily on self-presentation strategies, some editors also communicated practical aspects of their editorial process. The most common and straightforward expression in this vein was to list the types of articles and stories the magazine intended to publish. Other communications included everything from boasting about editorial acquisitions to acknowledging challenges in the editorial process (particularly those beyond their control). As outlined in the initial *Nova-Scotia Magazine* preface above, the editor noted pride in the magazine’s “press-work.” Perhaps such disclosures were intended to impress on readers the magnitude of the editors’ efforts, or at least pre-empt potential criticisms. In any case they also made the editorial process seem more transparent: by making confidantes of their readers, they opened themselves to greater support even at the expense of revealing cracks in an otherwise confident façade. For modern researchers, these notes offer insight into the challenges of publishing as well as the nuances of editorial self-presentation.

In some cases, editors seemed to reveal the editorial process in order to excuse negative aspects of the publication. This happened most often with technical issues; for instance, *The Quebec Magazine* begged pardon for the delayed appearance of its number by noting that “the late arrival of the Types, which were commissioned on purpose for it, hath unavoidably retarded it till the present time” (“To the Public.” *The Quebec Magazine* Aug. 1792: 1), and *The British North American Magazine and Colonial Journal* made a similar apology by explaining that “the difficulty of procuring a vessel by which freight could be sent, caused their subsequent detention” (“To the Public.” *The British North American Magazine and Colonial Journal* Feb. 1831: 2). By making these production disclosures, editors not only pre-empted criticisms but informed readers about publishing perils, thus implicating them as collaborators in a manner parallel to their sharing of cultural concerns.

Besides negative revelations, editors embraced opportunities to boast about technical achievements. For instance, *The Montreal Monthly Magazine*’s editor J. Wilson was the first to call attention to his connections with a “Lithographic establishment” and indicate that imagery he accessed “will greatly assist [the magazine] in the instructive as well as the ornamental department” (“The Editor, To the Public.” *The Montreal Monthly Magazine* Mar. 1831: 1). With only one extant issue, a frontispiece is all that exists to verify this claim. *The Canadian Garland* advertised in its preface that it would be published “on fine Super-royal paper, with good type” (“To the Public.” *The Garland* 15 Sept. 1832, n. pag.), *The Canadian Illustrated News* called attention to its (truly innovative) new Leggotype process, and several decades later, *Massey’s Magazine* would boast of acquiring a new set of type that would “challenge the very best efforts of the

great metropolitan presses of New York and London” (“Massey’s Magazine.” *Massey’s Magazine* Jan. 1896: 6). *The Amaranth*’s Robert Shives promised to “use utmost care in his selections” and “render the mechanical portion of the work neat and creditable” as well as to offer excerpts from the local Mechanics Institute—“in a word, to perform his part of the engagement, faithfully” (“To Our Patrons.” *The Amaranth* Jan. 1841: 1). Boasting about content was even more common, such as *The Canadian Magazine*’s promise of “first-class journalism from the pens of professional writers” including “a very choice production from the author of ‘John Halifax, Gentleman’” (“Preparatory Business Address to Subscribers and Contributors” *The Canadian Magazine* July 1871: 1). *The Canadian Literary Journal* similarly promised “a serial expressly written for *The Canadian Literary Journal* by a Canadian Author” (“To the Public.” *The Canadian Literary Journal* July 1870: 11) and the editor of *CANADA* noted that “Mr. LeMoine and other of our literary men have promised their efficient and valued help” (“Publishers’ Column.” *CANADA* Nov. 1892: 4). Just as pre-emptive confessions acknowledged problems, these proactive disclosures called for positive attention and substantiated editors’ efforts to produce worthy competitors to foreign periodicals.

In spite of their wide variety of approaches and thematic coverage, the fact that the preface remained in use as a form suggests that most editors saw it as a useful tool. Indeed, several editors maintained many of the conventions established from the start. For instance, they continued to thank readers for support, outline a general mandate, justify their superiority over foreign periodicals, issue calls for contributors, and outline proposed contents. Throughout the nineteenth century, most magazines established their overall mandate to be instructive and amusing. While consistently articulated as a

personal and civic benefit, such claims were more specifically aligned with nationalist aims as the century progressed. Above all, the prefaces were essentially sales tools for editors, rallying reader support for their ventures, and educating readers and contributors about their magazines' potential as forums for information sharing. In these introductory texts they made the most of the opportunity to urge readers to take just one more chance in supporting a new venture for cultural, intellectual, and literary development. As the next chapter will demonstrate, the preface was also the first opportunity for editors to display a rhetorical dexterity that did not often disappoint.

CHAPTER 3

Rhetoric in Canadian Magazine Prefaces

In his preface to *The Literary Garland*, which was destined to become one of the century's most successful magazines, editor John Gibson did not merely announce the magazine's arrival, but instead proclaimed that "opponents already in the field should be warned that a new combatant has entered the lists, ready to lift the gage of battle in all honourable warfare" ("To Our Readers." *The Literary Garland* Dec. 1838: 1). From this combat scenario he proceeded to the more genteel flower metaphor that became his signature. Like most editors, Gibson saw the preface as an opportunity not only to convey information but to demonstrate his literary prowess. While the last chapter focussed on the themes that emerged from nineteenth-century prefaces, this chapter investigates the rhetorical strategies that editors used to amplify their magazines' literary qualities.

Of course, examples of this rhetoric have already emerged from the previous chapter's thematic discussion, particularly in the editorial deference towards readers and the nationalist language deployed to rally patriotism. Yet the most impressive literary flourishes appear in examples of extended metaphor, analogy, imagery, levity, wit, sarcasm, and other elements that editors relied on to support their argumentation and engage the reader. Literary devices were also used to concretize or humanize a philosophical problem related to publishing; for instance, editors often personified contributors whose talents might be lost for want of publication, or young readers at risk of turning wayward due to a lack of wholesome reading materials. Naturally, many editors used more than one technique within the same preface, even switching between

editorial tones or selecting literary devices at random, all in an effort to sustain interest in their introductory remarks and the publication.

Given the centrality and constancy of the editor-reader relationship, investigating rhetorical approaches to developing this bond is an appropriate starting point, and one that carries over from the previous chapter. The alternating confidence and deference of *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*, the assured enthusiasm of *Literary Garland* editor John Gibson as he described his periodical's capacity for struggle, and the confident optimism of the late-century *Canadian Magazine*, which declared in 1893 it needed "no apology for appearing," all represent different approaches towards the reader, whether friendly, confident, deferential, or authoritative. As the previous chapter revealed, most magazine editors incorporated both confidence and apology. The former was often used to assure readers of the magazine's competence, and the latter to pre-empt criticism over such concerns as mechanical errors or partisanship. Both tactics positioned the editor in the readers' service. Other common approaches included the earnest editorial tone conveyed through the nationalist language outlined in the previous chapter, an informative or even authoritative stance towards literary development, and an overwhelming enthusiasm and optimism.

Literary Tools in Aid of the Editorial and Magazine Persona

In addition to the relatively straightforward editorial approaches outlined above, some editors employed more whimsical tactics to create a closer and possibly more informal relationship with the reader using techniques that included levity, sarcasm, and self-deprecation. In an early example, *The Enquirer's* C.D.E. shifts abruptly from an erudite

discussion of the dissemination of knowledge and education to an animated confession of his lack of qualification for editorial tasks:

Do not frown most learned Sir! Methinks your stern countenance assumes features of a contumelious nature! Methinks, I hear you exclaim What! will the blind guide the insecure steps of the blind? will the ignorant attempt to dispel the darkness of ignorance? (“Introductory Observations.” *The Enquirer* 1 May 1821: 1)

By using levity, the editor not only flexes his creative muscles but pre-empts potential criticisms by making readers aware that he is aware of their prospective quibbles over his credentials. He uses self-deprecation to put himself on par with the reader (the blind leading the blind), benevolently levelling the established editorial hierarchy to bring readers close even as he reminds them that they too lack qualifications for editorial judgement (that they are also the blind).

As he makes light of this notion of qualification, C.D.E. is confident and authoritative in his dismissiveness. The passage continues to describe with mock humility the lengths to which the editor will go to educate his readers, before returning to the previous more demure editorial tone by casually noting that he has “exhausted the whole stock of our rhetorical powers in order to deprecate the ire of the mighty” (“Introductory Observations.” *The Enquirer* 1 May 1821: 2). His playful language offers a contrast to his more serious meditations, and his levity has the potential to endear him to his readers even as he conveys some difficult messages. In another example, the editor of *The Montreal Monthly Magazine* used sarcasm to apply a light tone to the darker issue of editorial failure as he wrote “But why a Magazine? It was the only vacancy I found in

Canada, and I have a particular dislike to crowd myself into any business already overstocked with professors and candidates” (“The Editor, To the Public.” *The Montreal Monthly Magazine* Mar. 1831: 2). Again, this use of humour has the potential to disarm critics and bring smiles to readers’ lips, enticing them to turn the page and examine the rest of the magazine.

Metaphor also provided levity and literary flair. In some cases, the same metaphors were used by different publications; for instance, both *The Enquirer* and the later *The Nova Scotia New Monthly Magazine* used a stage metaphor. The former addressed issues of editorial bias, as editor C.D.E. notes that “to say that our views in appearing as Actors on the public stage are perfectly disinterested would be exposing ourselves to the suspicion of a want of candour” (“Introductory Observations.” *The Enquirer* 1 May 1821: 2). As in the previous instance, this phrasing allows C.D.E. to interrogate concerns of political neutrality in a manner that acknowledges the issue but refuses to claim a concrete position. *The Nova Scotia New Monthly Magazine*’s editor used an even cheekier tone in employing the stage metaphor:

We come forward, therefore, with diffidence; the public are our audience,—the printer is our prompter,—and his devil is most surely the *call boy*,—we ourselves are the actors, (no, not actors, performers,) and the curtain being drawn up, we beg leave to make our first bow. (“Our Opening Number.” *The Nova Scotia New Monthly Magazine* Feb. 1842: 29)

With this extended metaphor, the editor not only presents a light touch that plays with the editorial and stage roles, but also acknowledges tricky issues such as modesty and rhetorical performance.

Another magazine, *The Saturday Reader*, invoked the stage again with an allusion, as its proprietor W.B. Cordier noted, “Hitherto Canadian writers have acted towards the public the part of Rosencrantz and Guildenstern to Hamlet” (“Our Undertaking” *The Saturday Reader* 9 Sept. 1865: 1). With this literary reference, the editor not only reveals his own erudition but also invites readers who grasp the reference to delight in their own sophistication. The remark furthermore prefaces a discussion of journalistic objectivity, linking their understanding of the character reference to a deeper editorial commentary on the need to eliminate bias in journalism. Even the more general stage references call for readers to recognize theatre conventions in order to fully understand the humour, so each allusion emphasizes the magazine’s suitability for those readers who might appreciate it (or even those who would aspire to grasp such witty remarks).

Other shared metaphors offered simpler embellishment. Editor George Stewart used a nautical metaphor to describe the ways in which his introductory remarks to *Stewart’s Literary Quarterly Magazine* would “launch our craft upon the world of literature” (“Introductory.” *Stewart’s Literary Quarterly Magazine* Apr. 1867: 1). Earlier, William H. Smith had used an analogous comparison to pre-empt criticism of the first issue of *The British Colonial Magazine*, claiming that as he launched his first issue “upon the troubled waters of public opinion,” it should be judged as a first issue “rather than as being a fair specimen of the contents and style of the whole work” (“To the Reader.” *The British Colonial Magazine* n.d. 1852: n. pag.). *The Canadian Patriot* echoed the nautical

metaphor as well. Finally, the editor of *The Torch* similarly noted that

We launch our little "lighter" on the great sea of literature this morning, laden with an assorted cargo, and trust that, with fair winds and careful pilotage, it may long ride the stormy billows with safety, and at last, when its mission has been accomplished, sail peacefully into the haven of rest. We know the dangerous rocks and quicksands of private personalities on which we, if not careful, are liable to strike, and shall always endeavour to give them a wide berth.

("Salutatory." *The Torch* 22 Dec. 1877: 4)

Here, the metaphor is extended to include not only the editor (careful pilotage) but the social conditions (stormy seas) and potential dangers of "private personalities." While such remarks are light-hearted, they also acknowledge and perhaps therefore temper the reality that readers could be excessively harsh towards new publications.

Employing a different metaphor near the end of his address, Smith of *The British Colonial Magazine* elaborated on the positioning of the first issue, which he argued should instead be regarded as

A foundation stone of a building—the keel of a ship—the radical leaves of a plant—give but a poor idea of the succeeding grandeur or architectural elegance of the one, or the dazzling beauty of the other. We trust that each successive issue of our periodical will serve more and more strongly to elucidate our meaning, and, that our readers will confess that, like the produce of the vintage, our Magazine "improves with age." ("To the Reader." *The British Colonial Magazine*, n.d. 1852: n. pag.)

Based on the editor's allusion to early judgement, this multiple metaphor was useful in its depictions of various elements that grow to maturity, and its reminder to readers to be patient with new projects.⁸⁶ Again, these metaphors allowed editors to tread lightly around more serious magazine issues, such as being judged on first appearances (as rejection could potentially destroy a new venture). A handful of magazines even had metaphor built into their names, such as *The Literary Garland*, *The Amaranth* (an ancient grain), *The Bee*, which expanded the titular link to be its guiding principle in claiming that "like the honey Bee, we shall be diligent in making such Selections as will amuse and instruct our readers" ("Prospectus." *The Bee* 27 May 1835: 1). The editor of *The Trip Hammer*, in turn, built his entire preface around the metaphor of the mechanical trip hammer, describing that "if our capacity were commensurate with our will, we should erect a five thousand horse Corliss engine and harness it to a hammer so powerful that nothing we wished to break in pieces should withstand its force" and furthermore that "We believe there is an opening for a TRIP-HAMMER in the workshop of Journalism. There are a thousand and one evils rampant within its world-wide walls which deserve to be smitten by an engine so powerful that they shall be shattered forever" ("Greeting." *The Trip Hammer* Feb. 1885: 1). Since the magazine was designed for the agricultural workers of the Massey company, the editor tailored his metaphor to the readers of that

⁸⁶ Other magazines even late century echoed the need for a trial issue, safe from public critique. For instance, *The Pen* informed readers that "the first issue has its many difficulties, that once mastered re-appear no more" and reminded them that "Rome was not built in a day" ("Editorial Summary." *The Pen* 11 Dec. 1897: 1). *The New Brunswick Magazine* wished that "The first number of a newspaper should be carefully edited, set up, printed—and destroyed before it is issued. In other words, a publisher ought to have an experimental issue for his own benefit" ("By Way of Introduction." *The New Brunswick Magazine* July 1898: 1). *The Torch* expressed its fear of appearance in the form of a little poem: "Don't scan our first with critic's eye/please pass our imperfections by/we hope to make our little paper/in every home, a welcome taper" ("Salutatory." *The Torch* 22 Dec. 1877: 4).

particular community for which such machinery would have been familiar, while conveying a strong message about the power of print.

Such playful tactics as outlined above show editors trying to endear themselves to readers by inviting them to share a smile. However, many cultivated a more earnest rhetoric of gentility in an effort to avoid or counteract controversy. Given that many newspapers were politicized party organs, such a tactic also resulted in a stronger identity for the magazine genre. As early as *The Quebec Magazine*, the editor declared “the subject of politics we mean entirely to avoid; and we would recommend our editors do the same” (“To the Public.” *The Quebec Magazine* Aug. 1792: n. pag.). In addition to denouncing bias, editor C.D.E. of *The Enquirer* also took up the question of political impartiality, vowing that “influenced by no party our lines will not be defiled by personalities, our columns not contaminated by illiberality, our lucubrations not subversive of religious, moral or political order” (“Introductory Observations.” *The Enquirer* 1 May 1821: 2).

Many publications echoed these sentiments. For instance, *The Montreal Monthly Magazine* vowed to “guarantee the public against anything of a mischievous or dangerous tendency” (“The Editor, To the Public.” *The Montreal Monthly Magazine* Mar. 1831: 2). *The Canadian Casket* asserted itself “exempt from all political and religious controversy” (“Prospectus.” *The Canadian Casket* n.d. 1831: 7). Adding further explanation, *The Canadian Literary Magazine*’s editor John Kent noted, “Religious and political controversy I have determined to banish from my pages altogether; such debatable topics sadly interrupt the peaceful pursuits of Literature” (“The Editor’s Address to the Public.” *The Canadian Literary Magazine* Apr. 1833: 2). However, he was slightly less passive as

he hinted at the need to balance respect for the private with freedom of opinion, writing, “I intend to serve the Public faithfully, though not to be its slave. The veil which covers, and always ought to cover, private affairs, shall never be removed by me;—at the same time, I shall speak my mind plainly and boldly” (“The Editor’s Address to the Public.” *The Canadian Literary Magazine* Apr. 1833: 1). By depicting such a politically neutral atmosphere, these magazines typified a genteel stance that suggested a rise above such pedestrian controversies, even in times of political conflict to which writers would not necessarily have been immune. These introductory missives also set the magazines in contrast with the partisan fare being offered by both British magazines and local newspapers.

Writing in the era of the Rebellions, *The Literary Garland*’s John Gibson echoed this neutral position in his vow “to still the angry passions as they rise, and shed upon the troubled waters the oil of peace” (“To Our Readers.” *The Literary Garland* Dec. 1838: 1). In this articulation, his effort not only avoided controversy but offered itself as an antidote to any hostility. *The Paul Pry* took a lighter stance with regard to politics, adding levity to its solemn vow that “we are not the tool of any faction, or the dumb slave of any set of paid patriots” by declaring that “We vote for the total ‘obsturnation’ of soap locks,⁸⁷ big whiskers and ferocious looking moustaches” (“To the Public.” *The Paul Pry* 3 Oct. 1844: 1). In taking a mocking stance against such non-partisan but presumably divisive issues as facial hair fashions, the magazine editor mocks the fiction of complete political neutrality even as he establishes his own irreverent tone. Indeed, while

⁸⁷ Soap locks featured hair cut long in front and short at the back, so that locks of hair fell down near the ears. The hairstyle had the reputation of being worn by rowdy men.

magazines proclaimed their neutrality, their overarching tone should be judged by a closer look at their contents and coverage over multiple issues.

As the century progressed, magazine editors expanded their collective stance on partisanship from one that vowed strict impartiality and neutrality, to one that deliberately sought a balance of viewpoints. For instance, the preface to *The Saturday Reader* contained a short meditation on journalistic objectivity. In another example, publisher Graeme Mercer Adam stated that his *Canadian Monthly and National Review* would ensure that “the utmost latitude will be allowed to contributors in the expression of opinion, as well as in the choice of subjects” even as he vowed that “the Magazine is not open to party politics or to party theology; nor will anything be admitted which can give just offence to any portion of the community.” The magazine declared its intent furthermore to pay for all contributions, in order to ensure “that perfect liberty of selection which could not be enjoyed by the managers of periodicals conducted on the other system” (“Introductory.” *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* Jan. 1872: 1). In his reference to the “other system,” perhaps Adam was alluding to partisan papers or broader cronyism in publishing. Indeed, this title was among the first of the late century to become known for its intellectual discussions drawn from various perspectives; its relative longevity allowed it to capture many viewpoints.

Later magazines such as *Toronto Saturday Night*, *Arcturus*, and *The Canadian Magazine* also took this stance. For instance, *Arcturus* described a fairly modern attitude towards journalistic impartiality:

ARCTURUS will be the organ of no individual, party, or clique. In its columns political questions will be discussed from time to time as occasion may arise, but

this will be one from a national and not from a partisan point of view. With respect to religious, social and literary questions, it will enrol in its service writers of various and diverse shades of opinion, who will be allowed the utmost freedom of expression consistent with recognized fitness and propriety. No meritorious contribution on any subject whatever will be excluded merely because it may not be in accord with the prevalent tone of public opinion, or because it does not reflect the personal views of the editor. (“Editorial Notes.” *Arcturus* 15 Jan. 1887:

1)

This preface not only reflects a more inclusive editorial stance, but hints at a wider pool of contributors. The partisan is placed in contrast with the national. In 1887, *Toronto Saturday Night* took a slightly more insouciant tone on the subject of impartiality, vowing not to be a political paper, but to ‘have its remarks to make about politics and politicians, and in a breezy yet thoughtful way will point out the follies and foibles of those who assume so much and do so little’” (“Salutatory.” *Toronto Saturday Night*, 3 Dec. 1887:

6). Again, the fact that these notes appeared at the very inauguration of the magazines suggested that editors deemed this issue of political bias to be sufficiently significant to address it in their opening remarks. Of course, given the near impossibility of complete impartiality, these statements reveal more about the magazines’ rhetorical stances than the actual political biases that the magazines would exhibit as they began publication.

Beyond politics, some editors were compelled to deflect potential judgement even with regard to the mere act of publication. Mrs. Gosselin, editor of *The Montreal Museum*, showed significant anxiety as she wrote meekly: “In the timid and anxious hope that this work may meet with a favourable reception, and that public indulgence may

extend to the defects of a first essay, we take the liberty to premise a few remarks explanatory.” She noted furthermore that “our pride has been often and severely wounded by the sarcastic remarks of uninformed strangers, on our defective education, our slight acquaintance with literature” (“Introduction.” *The Montreal Museum* Dec. 1832: 1). By using such submissive wording, (interestingly as the industry’s first female editor),⁸⁸ Gosselin deflected judgement and invited sympathy and empathy from readers. Gosselin’s fears about judgement by other readers and even editors were well founded given the occasional attacks on periodicals and their editors, particularly in this pre-Rebellion era of partisan newspapers (Gosselin’s husband was editor of Montreal’s reform paper *La Minerve*). Of course, Gosselin later railed against American trash in the same preface, so not all of her commentary was meek, and perhaps this gentle approach was intended to balance out her subsequent attack.

In another example, *The Bee: A Weekly Journal, Devoted to News, Politics, Literature, Agriculture, Etc.* established its intention to “be careful to exclude every thing from our Pages which may have a tendency to create personal, or party animosities,” writing somewhat passive-aggressively that “we carry arms, but not for the purpose of offensive operations, and, they shall only be used in self defence” (“Prospectus.” *The Bee* 27 May 1835: 1). Peter Sinclair in his *Sinclair’s Journal of British North America* confided that it “requires some nerve to present himself before your fastidious eye as a disseminator of readable articles” (“Peter Sinclair to the public!!!” *Sinclair’s Journal of British North America* 3 Mar. 1849: 1). *The Montreal Literary Magazine*, whose editor

⁸⁸ In a section on prefaces to women’s poetry in *Canadian Women In Print 1850-1918*, Gerson reveals that prefaces authored by women often contained a recurring diffidence conveyed through negative and passive phrasing (50).

John Reade would become renowned as a poet, expanded particularly on the loss of privacy inherent in publishing:

There is scarcely any position so awkward as that in which a person finds himself placed, when he has inconsiderately pushed into the presence of a vast public. He loses his private rights, and makes himself a thing of common property, which every one may use as he pleases. ("Introduction." *The Montreal Literary Magazine* Sept. 1856: 1)

As with the non-partisan assertions, declaring one's fear of publishing at the moment of publication seems more strategic than genuine, and thus suggests a shrewd approach to cultivating readers' sympathy and understanding.

In contrast to the aforementioned editors who expressed their worries about the act of publication, others made a point of emphasizing how little they feared such exposure. For instance, editor C.D.E. of *The Enquirer* vowed to be fearless even as he acknowledged the risks of exposure:

To the shafts of the envious, to the lash of the critic, to the scourge of the satirist, to the pun of the facetious, to the sharp pointed dagger of the witty, to the blunt edged blade of the conceited do we abandon these unfortunate lucubrations thus unprotected, for even the word *Mercy* shall not be extracted from us however immanent might be our danger. ("Introductory Observations." *The Enquirer* 1 May 1821: 2)

In characteristic fashion, C.D.E. again used levity (and parallelism) as he personified the various characters who might take issue with his works, mitigating the particular venoms of each party by revealing their various agendas. *The Canadian Patriot* declared itself

“open to criticism, and so far from shrinking from it, we court the free and honest strictures of those who may be opposed to us” (“Our First Number.” *The Canadian Patriot* 1 Jan. 1864: 3).⁸⁹ The very act of publication invited evaluation, but these preliminary pleas represented an opportunity for editors to demonstrate bravado or humility in the face of harsh judgements. *The Arion*, which positioned itself as a forum for arts criticism, not only stressed that “the real value of any journal depends upon its absolute freedom to speak out plainly, and fearlessly” but emphasized how the community would ultimately benefit from such critical honesty, since “although in the exercise of this right we may find it necessary to lop off a rotten bough or two, it will, in the end, be productive of a healthier growth, and more perfect fruit (“Ourselves.” *The Arion* Oct. 1880: 1).⁹⁰ Such fearless positions on publication furthermore echo the aforementioned bravado about allowing multiple viewpoints into their pages.

Despite emphasizing their intentions to avoid partisanship, most editors clearly advocated civic and national development. The previous chapter examined the straightforward uses of words such as “country” and “patriotism” to heighten nationalist sentiments; this chapter considers how editors also deployed literary techniques to the same ends. Early examples of literary prowess appear in the language of imperialism in *The Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository* and *The Canadian Review and Literary and Historical Journal*, magazines which, as mentioned in the previous chapter, positioned themselves as inheritors of human history and culture from Biblical creation through Egyptian, Greek, Roman, and European civilization down to Britain and her

⁸⁹ The preface went on to critique such issues as the “rowdyism of the last session” and committed the magazine to investigating such concerns.

⁹⁰ In the same issue, *The Arion* belied the confidence of its introduction with an amusing personification of itself as “The Young Arion,” a hesitant youngster dumped into the “troubled sea” of Canadian society (“The Young Arion.” *The Arion* Oct. 1880: 3).

colony. Due to the similarities between the two prefaces, and the fact that they were likely written by the same editor David Chisholme, a quotation from one will suffice to exemplify the ways in which he interwove natural and imperialist imagery:

Though the country which we inhabit still bears the impress of infancy on her brow, and the stamp of uncultivated wildness on her forehead—though her woods are interminable and her soil lying waste—though the bear, the wolf and the buffaloe [sic] roam in all the untractability of their ferocious nature through all her regions—and though many of her *native* sons and daughters remain still unblest with the light of knowledge and Christianity—yet the time may come when her present condition will be remembered no more—when the wilderness shall give place to the calm serenity of cultivation—when the wild beasts of the fields shall fly at the voice of man, and give place to the busy hum of a cheerful and industrious population—when the sun of human intellect shall shine with refulgence on the darkest mind that ever traversed the woods—when the truth and glory of Christianity shall spread throughout the land the cheering and peaceful beams of their consolation—and when society shall resume the order, the elegance, and the permanency of the most civilised countries on the face of the earth! It is not human vanity to anticipate all this; neither is it foolishness in man, experienced as he is in the revolutions of the world, to expect the highest consummation of his wishes in the improvement and happiness of the whole human race. Let us, then, be permitted to lend our feeble aid to the advancement of the one as well as the other. Let us be permitted to mark a period in the history of CANADA, and open a page in which her future historian may descry the feeble

glimmer of the first rise of a great, prosperous, and independent nation!

(“Introduction.” *The Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository* July 1823: 5-6)

In this passage, the editor articulates an elaborate contrast. First, he describes the wilderness as a menace, with its frightening “interminable” woods and “ferocious” animals. He heightens that contrast by characterizing the country as infantile and unenlightened, describing the “impress of infancy” on “her” (gendered) forehead, as she houses native sons unblest by Christianity. Clearly, a heroic intervention is essential to attain the redemption described by the end of the passage, where civilization is a “calm serenity,” and human intellect shines like “the sun.” In addition to the “glory of Christianity,” literature itself (and its vehicle, the magazine) is implicated in the deliverance, particularly given the cultural inheritance to be passed down from previous civilizations. The editor’s final turn of phrase clinches this connection as he urges readers to metaphorically “open a page” on the rise of the nation. Of course, the editor later reins in his modesty by assuring readers that “we entertain a far higher opinion of its education, information and general accomplishments than to approach it with the bronzed and unbending countenance of unabashed confidence” (“Introduction.” *The Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository* July 1823: 5-6).

In spite of this backpedalling, the image is intractable in its lofty articulation of the role the editor foresaw for magazines not only in promoting literary development but also in civilizing the nation. *The Canadian Review and Literary and Historical Journal*’s editorial was even more aggressively imperial not only in its celebration of Britain over France, but in its aspirations for a time “when the spires and glittering pinnacles of Cities have laid their foundations on the ruins of the ‘red man’s’ hovels” and where society was

ready for the historian “to collect the scattered fragments that every where lie around him into one solid and enduring mass of intelligibility, instruction and amusement” (“Quebec Literary and Historical Society.” *The Canadian Review and Literary and Historical Journal* July 1824: 18). This later preface or opening article furthermore performed a double duty in promoting both the magazine and its sponsor, the Quebec Literary and Historical Society, as incoming institutions of cultural progress, driving the editor to furthermore highlight parallel efforts such as public libraries and the contemporary newspaper publishing landscape.⁹¹

Subsequent editors were even more specific in describing the individuals and groups they envisioned as readers. William Sibbald of the York-based *Canadian Magazine* who, as articulated in the previous chapter, saw the cultural transference complete in his declaration that the new land “is Europe” save for a lack of intellectual development, used representative figures to classify specific groups. Such characterizations clearly invited readers to identify with the figures described and therefore to see themselves as part of the readership. Sibbald positioned his magazine as a catalyst, offering historical and cultural continuity for each type of reader, making it possible for the young “to know what the rest of the world have done, and are doing,” for the ladies to realize “how their Ancestors loved, fought, conquered, and bled for freedom, fame, and their God,” and for the old to sit by the fire in winter, pondering on pages that transport them in idea to the paternal hearth (“The Editor’s Address.” *The Canadian*

⁹¹ The preface’s footnote describes the nineteen newspapers published and circulating in the Provinces of Upper and Lower Canada, and provides information on various libraries. The editor also expressed concern that the British Empire in India had received more attention than Canada in terms of its value to England, and promoted Canada’s relative prosperity and desirability as a destination for emigrants. In 1826, *The Acadian Magazine* echoed this concern as it named the encouragement of schools and colleges, the establishment of public libraries, and a general spirit of improvement as reasons for the publication’s founding (“Preface.” *The Acadian Magazine* July 1826: 1).

Magazine Jan. 1833: 1-2). Rather than the grand cultural inheritance narrative of his predecessor, this editor emphasized a simpler and therefore perhaps more accessible continuity in the notion of farmers keeping up with contemporaries and families connecting personally with the history of their ancestors.

Having established the benefits of continuity, Sibbald validated the magazine's didactic potential by describing the benefits that the periodical held for each group:

This magazine shall contain whatever is useful, amusing, instructive, "lovely, and of good report."—Whatever tends to the temporal and eternal happiness of mankind, shall be recorded in language of the strongest, most indelible, and undying energy;—"the young idea" shall be instructed "how to shoot," the adult to live, and the aged to die—the maiden to be faithful, wife prudent, mother exemplary, and widow respectable. The boy as he reads will exclaim 'oh! was I only a man,' and, applying to books with redoubled energy, strive to fit himself for the important, though difficult period, of self-control and self-management.

("The Editor's Address." *The Canadian Magazine* Jan. 1833: 2)

Sibbald further articulates the benefits that the magazine would offer to readers from various occupations, from the soldier to the seaman and even the sinner who "will be horrified, and forever forsake the sin with which he was most grievously beset" ("The Editor's Address." *The Canadian Magazine* Jan. 1833: 2). In mentioning the sinner, he extends the target of potential cultural redemption from the merely languishing to the downright bad, as such articulating a moral or even Christian notion of deliverance. By singling out demographics by occupation (soldier, student), gender (maiden, boy), and

age (young, old), he invites all members of society to see themselves as the magazine's target readership.⁹²

The editor further elevated that notion of community by calling on those in particular occupations to contribute to the magazine directly; for instance, after noting the devastation caused by a recent cholera epidemic, he asks medical practitioners "to send a report of any unusual disease, or radical cure—that publicity may be given, and thereby the days of many become lengthened" ("The Editor's Address," *The Canadian Magazine* Jan. 1833: 3). He extends a similar call to clergy, lawyers, professors, merchants, and even the ladies "to exercise 'the fairy fingers' in tracing their thoughts upon paper" ("The Editor's Address," *The Canadian Magazine*, Jan. 1833, 4). By inviting readers to become contributors, the editor encouraged public ownership of the magazine as a forum for community information sharing and improvement. Near the end of the preface, Sibbald even made a character of himself, as an immigrant who had made the typical sacrifices in the interest of this didactic mission: "I have left my country—my home, for your amusement and mental entertainment.—To satisfy your angelic passion for knowledge am I come" ("The Editor's Address," *The Canadian Magazine* Jan. 1833: 2). With these words, he martyrs himself for his readers' education, with the implication that such a grand sacrifice ought to at least be reciprocated by reader support.

Shared Concerns for a Lost Literary Aspirant

While Sibbald used representative characters to identify and appeal to potential readership groups, other editors also employed personified potential contributors. This tactic highlighted a role for magazines in rescuing literary talent and sanctioning the

⁹² *The Victoria Magazine* would later use similar characterization to describe readers from the town and the country, also identifying each in terms of readership potential.

creative salvation of writers whose genius might otherwise languish or even perish. For instance, Mary Graddon Gosselin, the editor of *The Montreal Museum*, described the ways in which the magazine would furnish

[A] medium through which the young aspirant to Literary honour shall become distinguished from his less gifted contemporaries, and by thus securing to him the admiration due to his merit, arouse his energies, and incite him to such exertions as may ultimately lead to excellence, and secure to him the reward of an undying fame. ("Introduction." *The Montreal Museum* Dec. 1832: 2)

Here, Gosselin pulls her contributor character into sharp relief by describing him very particularly: he is personified as young, male, aspiring, and competing with others less gifted. By implication, the fame he could achieve would be a credit to the community that produced him. By contrasting the tragedy of forsaking him with the triumph of his salvation via a community of supporters, Gosselin established her magazine as the practical catalyst for such efforts. More drastic was the expression of Wyllys Smith in his prospectus to *The Canadian Garland*, calling on the public to "to put in motion *again* pens that have for a long time laid in sluggish inactivity, merely for the want of emanating medium" ("To the Public." *The Garland* 15 Sept. 1832, n. pag.). Such sluggish pens potentially faced even worse fates than the undiscovered geniuses previously identified, as their talents had once been encouraged but had since stagnated from lack of practical expression.

Taking the character of the languishing literary aspirant even further, the editor of *The Guardian* described his magazine as a forum to rescue idle writers, who, for want of a destination for their creative writing were limited to penning "the hurried effusions of

the day,” with the result that “a letter upon some small local dispute or political job, more frequently engages their pens than an article fit for general reading” (“To Our Readers.” *The Guardian* Jan. 1860: 1). Given the educational and nation-building potential of creative endeavours, to be reduced to pedestrian letter writing was indeed a dark condition for a literary aspirant. Such a description clarifies the intellectual and creative tenor of the writing to be cultivated by magazines.

Another editor described his literary aspirant as not only languishing but potentially at risk of becoming an idle burden on society. In *Stewart’s Literary Quarterly Magazine*, editor George Stewart, who also railed against the ills of American trash, relied on vivid characterization to describe the redemptive powers of magazine writing for the local boys whose pens he vowed to engage, noting that the magazine would be “the work chiefly of young men belonging to our own Province, who have spent, in study and self-improvement, the spare time that many, more favorably circumstanced than they, have spent in frivolity and idleness” (“Introductory.” *Stewart’s Literary Quarterly Magazine* Apr. 1867: 1-2). With this sentiment he offered not only native content but an opportunity for his young readers to escape potential depravity. His aside about those more favourably circumstanced may also have class implications.

Stewart furthermore articulated the damaging effect of “dime novels” on the young men of his community:

The reading of “Dime Novels,” and other books of that ilk, has wrought uncalculable injury to many a bright and promising lad. Tales of buccaneers, murderers and highwaymen: of “fast young men,” and “gay and festive gamblers,” deaden the moral sensibilities—familiarise the mind with crime and

lead it on to moral ruin. It is true there are no highwaymen now with mask and pistol, demanding “your money or your life!” nor blood-thirsty pirates, compelling unfortunate victims to “walk the plank!”—but if our youth cannot find work of this kind to do there is something else for them: they can learn to drink and smoke and swear and swagger in the truest dime novel style, and become the heroes and haunters of bar and billiard rooms. That numbers have been ruined in this way indicated is beyond question, but how many, eternity only will reveal! It behoves everyone to use his influence to free his country from the vice breeding literature with which it is now flooded. (“Introductory.” *Stewart’s Literary Quarterly Magazine* Apr. 1867: 1)

In this scenario, Stewart shows how those who were neglected would succumb to the very habits of the deplorable characters that filled their harmful reading material as they fell into bad habits such as drinking, smoking, and swearing. Worse, the threat of non-productivity saw such characters wasting time in bars and billiard rooms. By establishing his efforts as a potential intervention in such wanton lifestyles, Stewart appealed not only to the young men themselves but to their community, which could avoid this damage simply by supporting Stewart’s magazine.⁹³

Other editors turned to metaphor to articulate the ways in which their magazines could redeem the cultural void and aid their literary aspirants. The neglected flower proved to be the most longstanding image in this industry, thriving particularly well in

⁹³ Later in the century, *The Pen*’s editor aligned himself with the literary aspirant by writing that he “having experienced so often the lack of encouragement which young writers, timid literary aspirants encounter, the Editor resolved, if ever the opportunity offered, to deal with others as he would have wished that others should have dealt with him. Consequently, THE PEN will be, as far as is practicable, an aid, a true friend for all those of the younger generation who feel a desire and the capacity to write, yet who fail to reach the great public with their effusions” (“The Raison d’Etre.” *The Pen* 11 Dec. 1897: 4).

the early century. The flower was a useful metaphor in that it invoked the surrounding natural world and could be extended to the editorial process, with editorial tasks likened to cultivation in their abilities to nurture and improve the wild flora. Wyllys Smyth of *The Canadian Garland* was among the first to use the floral metaphor as he wrote that “we have long been convinced that ‘many a flower is born to blush unseen’ in this province, and that many a polished author was ‘compelled to contribute to exotic journals, or remain in obscurity’” (“To the Public” *The Garland* 15 Sept. 1832: 1). Here, the editor amplifies the consequences of literary neglect by suggesting that a failure to support his publishing efforts would not only relegate potential authors (and, by extension, the nation) to obscurity, but reciprocally elevate rival nations already capable of supporting literary works. His address furthermore emphasizes two kinds of writers, both the newcomers tragically “born to blush unseen,” and perhaps even more disconcertingly, the “polished authors” who represented newly arrived talent already established in their home nations and poised to elevate their new nation’s literature only to be met with a lack of opportunity to do so.

In another example of a floral reference, editor John Kent of *The Canadian Literary Magazine* used flower imagery to represent creators and their creations as he vowed to “endeavor to rescue the modest flower from wasting ‘its sweetness on the desert air,’ and to root out the rankly luxuriant weeds that would choke the ‘wee crimson-tipped’ daisy” (“The Editor’s Address to the Public.” *The Canadian Literary Magazine*, Apr. 1833: 2). Here, it is interesting to note the flower described as “modest” and specified as a “daisy,” characteristics that emphasize its simplicity, particularly when such vulnerability is contrasted with the menace of “luxuriant weeds.” The threat is also

implicit in the contrast between the flower's sweetness and the "desert air." If the initial threat of stagnant air is passive, the second image is more aggressive in its description of the malicious weeds intent on choking out the innocent flower. The hazard is made even more specific by the description of the weeds as luxuriant, which alludes perhaps to the decadence of an established culture.

Of course, both *The Canadian Garland*'s "born to blush unseen" and *The Canadian Literary Magazine*'s "sweetness on the desert air" are direct quotations from Thomas Gray's poem "Elegy Written in a County Churchyard," in which Gray described the forgotten men of his rural setting as "Full many a flower is born to blush unseen, / And waste its sweetness on the desert air" (14.3-4). Beyond the literary reference, in this reference there is also a parallel between the poem's forgotten rural community and the new world backwoods in danger of being neglected without writers (or magazines) to capture its quiet but not inconsequential experiences. Again the literary reference would also have rewarded those readers who recognized the literary reference.

Besides representing writers and their works, the flower and garden could also be extended to represent the gentility and neutrality with which editors tried to characterize the Canadian magazine form. In *The Canadian Literary Magazine*, editor John Kent began with a garden metaphor to describe the magazine's fair-mindedness, taking it subsequently in several directions to emphasize a sense of tranquility:

I wish the Public to regard the Magazine as neutral ground,—as a grove sacred to the Muses, where men of all parties may mingle in intellectual union, discarding from their discourse the acrimony of public disputes Trojan and Tyrian, York and Lancaster, at their entrance into this peaceful region, must leave their religious

and political tenets behind them, as the Moslem puts off his slippers before entering the Mosque. (“The Editor’s Address to the Public.” *The Canadian Literary Magazine* Apr. 1833: 2)

Besides establishing the magazine’s neutrality, the editor’s allusions to literary Muses, historical disputes, and an exotic religion further elevate the passage’s literary character, acknowledging the erudition of readers who would understand such references. In the Halifax-based women’s magazine *The Mayflower*, editor Mary Eliza Herbert went beyond her flowery title to invoke tranquility in her invitation to “lovers of Literature, those who delight to step aside, now and then, from the beaten and dusty paths of life, to roam a while in the flowery fields of romance,—to hold communion with the Muses” (“Editorial.” *The Mayflower; or Ladies’ Acadian Newspaper* May 1851: 3). By depicting a scene elevated from the quotidian lifestyle of most readers, her image reminds readers that to partake in her magazine was to embrace a more refined existence that would leave the bustle of daily life behind, if only “now and then.”

Of course the renowned *The Literary Garland* outdid all of its contemporaries in raising the flower metaphor (and flowery language) to new heights. Editor John Gibson’s flower imagery, already discussed in the previous chapter’s discussion of literary nationalism, is worthy of further examination from a rhetorical standpoint. As the previous chapter noted, Gibson began his foray into the world of flowers by vowing “If, at the expiration of that time, the GARLAND shall not have gathered a stem sufficiently powerful to support itself, it must fall and wither, as has been the fate of many a more beautiful and classic wreath” (“To Our Readers.” *The Literary Garland* Dec. 1838: 1). Later, he returned to the garden and its languishing literary blossoms:

Nor it be supposed, that we look upon the literary garden as unadorned with native gems. That were judging most unwisely and unwell. For ourselves, we are of those who trace with as much delight, the magnificence of creation in the humble floweret that grows neglected by the way side, as if we scanned the petals of the richest passionflower that ever bloomed in a garden dedicated by wealth to taste and luxury; and with minds so constituted, it were strange indeed, if we could not find much to admire in what has already been produced. Be the task ours, to gather up these the most beautiful, and by giving them a "local habitation and a name," in the pages of the GARLAND, as well preserve them from oblivion, as assist in fostering the spirit of literary enterprise, and, it may be, aid in urging the authors themselves, to produce something still more valuable than any that have hitherto appeared. ("To Our Readers." *The Literary Garland* Dec. 1838: 2)

Here, Gibson echoes previous editors in developing the notion that literary talents are not lacking but simply untended, as he argues that cultivating the "humble floweret" from a barren environment (Canada) will ultimately be more satisfying than tending to the thriving literature of an old society, as symbolized by the passionflower (although he still admires "what has already been produced"). He ends his missive by describing *The Literary Garland* as a space where flowers/literature will not only be collected but also preserved from oblivion, and where new flowers/authors can be encouraged to grow. As the last chapter will explore, the *Garland* did in fact provide space to several new writers, proving its flowery mandate to be more than rhetorical flourish.

Other metaphors also appeared at random in Gibson's initial preface. Recall, for instance, that he introduced his magazine as a new combatant on the literary scene. Later he noted the patience required in cultivating literature, as "the richest ground yields not its fruits untilld—the muse, as well as beseems a modest maiden, not 'unsought is won'—nor did the rock yield its tribute to the perishing Israelites until struck by the prophet's wand." He then predicted that

The time is not so distant but that some with beards as grey as ours may see it, when the fated lover shall have won the maiden, when the true prophet shall have struck the rock, when the soil shall yield its golden fruits to the skilful husbandman, as readily as in the most genial clime, fostered, as the literary blossoms will doubtless be, with smiles the warmer as they approach maturity.

("To Our Readers." *The Literary Garland* Dec. 1838: 2)

By trying out several metaphors in this follow-up, Gibson elaborates his argument before returning to the flower imagery, all the while emphasizing the patience required of editors and readers alike in the cultivation of such a literary endeavour.

Since the *Garland* proved itself to be hardier than most sites of literary cultivation, editor John Gibson clearly felt he had earned the opportunity to make a second address a few years later in introducing the magazine's new series in January 1843. Once again, the garden resurfaced in Gibson's reflection on the past journey of "weary feet [that] wandered from garden to garden, culling blossoms the rarest and fairest" noting that "tastes long cultivated were necessary to form the wreath, and to render it a meet offering for the divinities of perfumed boudoirs" ("To Our Readers." *The Literary Garland, New Series* Jan. 1843: 1). If his opening address was somewhat

gendered merely by its use of the flower metaphor, here the phrase “divinities of perfumed boudoirs” plays even more on the femininity of such images. In his *Literary History of Canada*, Klinck links these images and their implied femininity to a wider vogue of gentility inspired by American magazines like Godey’s *Lady’s Book* that were “upheld by a polite reaction to the cruder aspects of western expansion” (158). Along with its strong female contributorship and penchant for historical romance, Gibson’s persistence with the floral metaphor certainly solidified *The Garland’s* feminized air, although such a characterization is somewhat unfortunate, since it has made it easier for scholars to be dismissive of its authors and contents.

Far from the lofty, nationalist salvation of literary flowers, *Sinclair’s Journal of British North America* saw editor Peter Sinclair putting extended metaphor to more mundane use as he wrote:

That as a good deal of time is devoted in our quiet city of Quebec—to eating—drinking—dancing—fiddling—making love and jilting—laughing and the contrary, he thinks that when good people are at home—sitting down in a sober contemplative frame of mind, that his little journal may prove an agreeable companion—that is—if they treat it as people should treat a bag of filberts placed on the table after dinner—sit down to its contents in the full anticipation of finding something good in them—throw away the bad ones of course, and crack only the good, and not condemn the whole lot because there happen to be one or two among them, not quite so sound as the rest—if this is done kindly, as if people had made up their minds to enjoy themselves—finding fault reluctantly and allowing the good fruit to outweigh in their judgment the bad—Peter Sinclair

promises all who rise from the table—spread by his little journal—a contented feeling and a satisfied appetite. (“Peter Sinclair to the public!!!” *Sinclair’s Journal of British North America* 3 Mar. 1849: 2)

In contrast to the earnest expression of flower metaphors, this description of a man at home enjoying his filberts and quiet hour of reading is comically banal, the intellectual burden of a nation supplanted by an image of personal enjoyment and relaxation. In positioning magazine habit alongside other ubiquitous but essential activities and recreations, Sinclair normalized periodical reading as a part of everyday life, even as a simple treat. Yet as the bag of filberts slyly progresses from a neutral snack to an analogy for the editorial mix, the editor also figures a scenario in which the bad nuts (articles) are to be taken with the good, echoing the defensive position assumed more overtly by other editors.

Beyond metaphor, editors also employed analogy in their prefaces, presumably also in aid of bolstering an intellectual tone. In *The Canadian Garland*, for instance, the editor began his address “To our Patrons” with a meditation on the stages of taste:

At an immature age, the sense of beauty is weak and confused, and requires an excess of coloring to catch its attention. After this it prefers extravagance and rant, to justness; a gross, false wit, to the engaging light of nature, and the showy, rich, and glaring, to the fine and amiable: this is the child-*hood* of taste. But as the human genius strengthens and grows to maturity, if it be assisted by a happy *education*, the sense of universal beauty awakes; it begins to be disgusted with the false and misshapen deceptions that pleased, and rests with delight on elegant

simplicity—on pictures of easy beauty and unoffended grandeur: This is the manhood of taste. (“To our Patrons.” *The Garland* 15 Sept. 1832: 7)

Having established his discussion of taste, the editor followed his treatise by addressing the immediate concern of cultivating Canadian literature, suggesting that:

The cultivation of literature has had considerable effect in changing the manners of our nation, and in introducing that civility and refinement by which we are now distinguished; and we have now arrived at that state of society in which those faculties of the human mind that have beauty and elegance in their objects, begin to unfold themselves. (“To our Patrons.” *The Garland*, 15 Sept. 1832: 7)

In spite of his exuberance, the editor went on to note that “perfection, alas! is not the work of a day” and lamented that literary development had failed before, calling his effort “the THIRD attempt to sustain *Canadian* literature” (“To our Patrons.” *The Garland* 15 Sept. 1832). Although the magazine was not itself destined to have a long life span, the preface’s analogy was clearly positioned to impress readers both with the editor’s erudition and his commitment to continued efforts.

The Canadian Garland’s tone reverberated a couple of decades later in the more scholarly *Canadian Journal*, where editor Henry Youle Hind extended this sense of refinement to the state itself, establishing a complicated intellectual path:

“In the infancy of a state arms do flourish, in the middle-age thereof letters, in the decline and fall commerce,” a true saying of the sage of Verulam, is this which we have chosen for a motto, and *arms*,—the arms, namely, that swing the axe and guide the plough—have flourished, and long may they flourish in Canada; nor has the middle-age of mental vigour, and intellectual exertion been tardy in

succeeding to that fine stage of advancement. It would even be well if no premature signs of undue prominence in the last of the three, already portended, like early grey hairs, the decay of a ripe and vigorous manhood. ("Introduction."

The Canadian Journal Aug. 1852: 1)

Here, this later magazine established itself quite confidently as an organ of the new Canadian Institute, refusing to question success and vowing to avoid the possible decadence of the later stage. The references to various stages of a state and the allusion to the sage of Verulam (presumably the philosopher Sir Francis Bacon, for whom the first title "Baron of Verulam" was created) lend an appropriately scholarly air to the preface, while the images of manual labour in the axe and plough ground the passage in healthy vigour. Given its concern with academic (and applied) knowledge, the last point may have been a dig at the commercial ventures of contemporaries that would pervert intellectual exertion for monetary gain.

Other extended analogies were less formal, yet still charming and approachable. For instance, the editor of *The Antidote* prefaced his magazine's arrival with a discussion of the merits of various handshakes, comparing the "honest friendly shake" with the one that was "withdrawn almost as soon as you take it, the clammy unclasped digits reminding you of a fish, and leaving as much warmth behind." Also deprecated was the hand which "seizes yours in a vice which recalls the tortures of the historical thumbscrew" in addition to the "man with such an exalted opinion of himself that he feels bound to patronize everyone else, and so thrusts out a couple of fingers towards you, as though he deemed it an honor for you to be noticed at all" ("Shaking Hands." *The*

Antidote 18 June 1892: 4). Of course, the editor completed the analogy by relating it to the magazine:

In conclusion, we think the recent fashion of what we may call the square-elbows-over-hand-shake simply detestable. It is awkward in appearance and expresses neither warmth nor heartiness. It is not in that manner but with an honest, straightforward shake and clasp that the ANTIDOTE would welcome all its readers. (“Shaking Hands.” *The Antidote* 18 June 1892: 4)

The editor clearly aligned his magazine with the agreeable handshake; it is interesting to consider what comparisons may have been implied in the other handshake metaphors, given that they could represent various disagreeable magazines, such as the trashier American fare alluded to by earlier editors.

Do We Want a Good Canadian Magazine? Rhetorical Questions and More

In addition to poetical language, editors also used more strictly rhetorical techniques. For instance, the publisher of *The Canadian Magazine* employed rhetorical questions to make his argument:

Do we want a good CANADIAN MAGAZINE? The answer we have often heard given to the query is—“Yes, we do.” Can we maintain a good magazine? That is to say—Is there sufficient *notice* and *imported* talent—literary, scientific and artistic ability in the country to furnish material of such a standard as will satisfy the public taste and general education? We are fully persuaded there is. Have we literary and artistic skill among us competent to produce a periodical which will bear comparison with our English and American periodicals? (“Preparatory

Business Address to Subscribers and Contributors.” *The Canadian Magazine* July 1871: 1)

Here, the editor uses parallelism in his multiple questions about whether the nation needs a magazine, answering himself in the affirmative in each case by delineating all of the elements in place to help him provide it: talent, editorial skill, and a receptive public.⁹⁴ His timing was apt, given that this era would see the industry rise to peak performance (although this particular magazine lasted only a few months). In boldly urging comparison with foreign competitors and asking readers to judge the magazine impartially as a specimen, this editor echoes John Gibson of *The Literary Garland* in his confident attitude and faith in a judicious audience. His is a more overt response to the questions that other editors deflected by metaphor and other tactics.

Another clever rhetorical strategy involved normalizing racy-sounding fiction to sound respectable. As Gerson points out in *A Purer Taste*, while all of English-Canada’s attitudes towards the novel were “tinted conservative,” they ran the spectrum from “absolute abhorrence” to “restrained attraction” to “qualified justification” (18). A shrewd editor trying to appeal to as wide an audience as possible therefore had to choose his words carefully if he was going to justify suspect literary selections. Following a vow to “neither spare pains nor expense, to make our Magazine more and more worthy the patronage of every rank, in this our native country,” the editor of *The British North American Magazine and Colonial Journal* described his selection criteria to “be marked

⁹⁴ Other magazines also used parallelism; for instance, the single issue *Montreal Monthly Magazine* vowed “to expose vice in all its hateful forms—To encourage virtue by exhibition of virtuous characters, who have shone in different ages; and by so doing create a laudable emulation in youth—To teach youth to discriminate as far as possible, by historical examples, between real and apparent virtue—To hold the mirror up to folly—To unmask hypocrisy...” (“The Editor, To the Public.” *The Montreal Monthly Magazine* Mar. 1831: 2). Later in the century, *The Lake Magazine* noted that the new magazine would justify itself “if it can please and interest; if it can call forth careful thought; if it can furnish to its circle of home readers the best thoughts of our best writers” (“Salutatory.” *The Lake Magazine* Aug. 1892: 1).

by purity of morals, correctness of style and good taste” (“To the Public.” *The British North American Magazine and Colonial Journal* Feb. 1831: 1). And yet those sentiments seem more than a little incompatible with the titles and descriptions that followed: his first pieces of fiction were titled “The Demon Ship,” a story “of intense and powerful interest” and “The Forger,” “a tale of deep and pathetic character” from *Blackwood’s Magazine* (“To the Public.” *The British North American Magazine and Colonial Journal* Feb. 1831: 1). While the renown of a title like *Blackwood’s* would have reassured readers, the titles themselves suggested less innocent fare with their depiction of demons and forgers.

The Nova Scotia New Monthly Magazine offers yet another example of questionable rhetoric on the subject of fiction. Introducing the standard magazine imperative to be amusing and instructive, the editor declared that his “one great object” was “to furnish what is useful,” even as he qualified that “from this idea we do not exclude that which is amusing—but this we consider only a means to obtain the important end.” The editor then described his major criteria for fiction selections:

By means of imagination, of fancy, or of wit, we shall endeavour to convey instruction or to induce a love of reading. That which is merely fanciful, which carries no moral, may tend to refine the taste and elevate the thought. And we shall always recollect the different degrees of cultivation of mind of those to whom we address ourselves, and endeavour to present to each class something they will not only look at, but read. (“Our Opening Number.” *The Nova Scotia New Monthly Magazine* Feb. 1842: 29)

To read between the lines here is to witness an intricate editorial balancing act. To begin with, the “one great object” is usefulness, with amusement admitted only as a corollary to that aim. And yet imagination, fancy and wit are permitted for a second purpose, to induce a love of reading, and so the editor relaxes his criteria sufficiently to include material that might be less morally upright. This tempers his initial aim (if moral and instructive were conflated, as they often were). He further widens the scope by hinting at the diversity of the audience and their “degrees of cultivation” (implying class), acknowledging the challenge in satisfying that diversity. In doing so, he maintains his claim to upright moral standards even as he accepts the merely fanciful and amoral as publishable. By vowing to present each class with reading material, he allowed for readers to identify with a higher class on the spectrum while reading the material intended for the lower class.

Stronger still than the editor’s justifications for a morally suspect editorial policy were his alleged concerns about the specific stories. He introduced “The Last Hours of an Old Maid” with a somewhat disapproving tone:

The writer seems to have given way to an extravagance of imagination which, however, does not fail to heighten both the humour and the interest. But it prevents any thing of a moral which might otherwise attach to the story, because we are not at all afraid that a single lady of 39 years ever was, or is to be induced from that circumstance to bid farewell to the world. (“Our Opening Number” *The Nova Scotia New Monthly Magazine* Feb. 1842: 29)

The editor admitted that “our author, however, is entitled to his own opinion” and emphasized that in all literary selections “if we had not considered them equal to such as

appear in the generality of the Magazines of the day, they should not have been inserted” (“Our Opening Number.” *The Nova Scotia New Monthly Magazine* Feb. 1842: 29). Here, the moral slippery slope plays out at a practical level: on the one hand, the story is admitted to be without moral, yet the intriguing description with its elements of spinsters and suicide entices the reader. Deferring to the author’s “opinion” allows the editor to distance himself (and by extension the reader) from the story by placing its genesis with the author (even the author is given some leeway if he has “given way” to imagination, a phrase suggesting a creative process beyond his control). Finally, the establishment of the fluid standard of “the generality of the Magazines of the day” gave all involved an external standard to protect the contents from criticism.⁹⁵ While discussions of particular articles and particularly acknowledging potential concerns in such depth were relatively rare in the prefaces, these examples reveal that the subject was not far from the minds of some editors as another topic on which their publication would be judge even from the outset.

Creative Writing Beyond the Prefaces

On rarer occasions, some editors saw fit to include delightful imaginative expressions of the challenges of editorial production. Mary Jane (Katzmann) Lawson, editor of *The Provincial, or, Halifax Monthly Magazine* supplemented her standard preface with a theatrical script that playfully interrogated her project. This selection provides a flavour of the dialogue between the editor and his/her interviewer, Snaffle:⁹⁶

⁹⁵In the next chapter, which examines editorial notes, a subsequent missive reveals the magazine’s editor later calling attention to changes in the story’s ending designed to make it more palatable.

⁹⁶The word “snaffle” is a British colloquialism for stealing or being cheeky.

Snaffle—So you are actually going to try your hand at a Literary Magazine—with all the ghosts of your departed predecessors staring you in the face? Boldness deserves success; I wish I could say, that in this case it is likely to command it.

Editor—The material is ample, the field is large, and if we fail we must blame our own incapacity, not that of the public.

Sn.—To be sure, the field is large enough in one sense, there are some two or three millions of square miles to work upon, but then the difficulty will be, to persuade the woods and forests, or the denizens thereof to become subscribers.

Ed.—Yes, and among these forests there are a million and a half of human hearts, not unwilling to be either instructed or amused, if we can only reach them.

(“Editorial Colloquy.” *The Provincial* Jan. 1852: 3)

Following this opening, the editor asks Snaffle for advice, whereupon the advisor reminds him (her?) that “every thing of the kind has hitherto failed,” after which the editor acknowledges that “we cannot give literature equal to Blackwood or the Edinburgh Review, we will not pretend to do so, but we hope to bring forward subjects of a distinctive character, possessing deep interest to every inhabitant of this magnificent country” (“Editorial Colloquy.” *The Provincial* Jan. 1852: 4). Snaffle scoffs at the editor’s reference to “distinguished Colonists,” calling them “great in a little circle,” to which the editor earnestly responds that “it is this little circle—I would wish to address” (“Editorial Colloquy.” *The Provincial* Jan. 1852: 4). Snaffle therefore asks him to name his subscribers, at which point the editor reveals Hon. Samuel Cunard (a merchant), Sir Allan McNab (a political figure), and Judge Haliburton (noted author of *The Clockmaker*).

The editor then outlines (as other magazines often did directly in their prefaces) the proposed contents of the magazine. These included profiles, articles on the cities of British North America, the rise and fall of Quebec, the heroism of Wolfe, the patriotism of Montcalm, a history of Atlantic cities, and the rapid growth of Toronto. The advisor further inquires about the editor's contributors, noting that "for my part I don't know six people who can write three sentences of grammar or common sense" and the editor replies that "one of these no doubt is Mr. Snaffle—and another Mr. Snaffle's wife," replying that "we must make best use of the material we have; and notwithstanding your sneer, Snaffle, we have the sterling ore—not in great abundance, but we have it" ("Editorial Colloquy." *The Provincial* Jan. 1852: 5). With its humour and playful rhetorical jousting between the editor and his/her interrogator, this dialogue's form establishes a light tone that allows the characters to go on at length concerning editorial issues, promoting reader awareness of the challenges of publication. Many issues that had dogged magazines over the years arise in this extended treatment, including the building of a readership, the character of that colonial readership as indifferent and uneducated, the shadow of British periodical and literary publishing over Canadian efforts, and the question of what constituted appropriate content. Snaffle is characterized as a buffoon (and rather racist in the later discussion of the aboriginal). By setting this discourse in the fictional context of a dialogue or play, the editor was able to distance herself from such issues even as she freely conveyed her concerns. In its formal allusion to *Blackwood's* famous "Noctes Ambrosianae,"⁹⁷ the missive further plays with an established magazine convention and cultural reference.

⁹⁷ The "Noctes Ambrosianae" were 71 colloquies that appeared in *Blackwood's* magazine from 1822-35 depicting fictional scenes of the magazine editor (John Wilson as "Christopher North") and his advisors in

In *The Saturday Reader*, an inaugural poem explored some of the same challenges of publication:

“TO THE PUBLIC”

A boon, good Public—yield it of your grace—
 “Let us be friends,” behold the boon we crave.
 We’re not the Publisher, with serious face,
 Dreaming of Printer’s bills and things as grave.
 Nor yet the Editor, with anxious mien,
 As small boys shout for “copy, if you please,”
 Nor e’en the printer armed with weapons keen
 Which make and unmake prodigies with ease.
 But we’re, so please you, one who fain would be
 Your right good friend and always welcome guest,
 Whispering at times set strains of poesy,
 Then sober prose—anon some sprightly jest.
 We’ve themes exhaustless, “Half a million,” nay,
 We know no limit to our varied store—
 Of flood and field adventures, grave and gay—
 Games for the parlour—philosophic lore—
 Thoughts for the statesman—scientific truth—
 Problems and puzzles framed for studious youth.
 Fiction all healthful—not of *Ledger* store,

conversation at Ambrose’s Tavern in Edinburgh. *The Anglo-American Magazine* borrowed the convention to present similar dialogues.

Something of everything, we trust, but—lore.

Then yield the boon, good Public, of your grace,

As we forswear the role of special pleador,

And stand unveiled and hopeful, face to face,

Your friend and servant to command,

THE READER

(“To the Public.” *The Saturday Reader* 9 Sept. 1865: 1)

Like *The Provincial*’s Snaffle play, this poem educates its readers as to the various roles within a magazine office and topics to be found in its pages, successfully acknowledging and addressing some of the problems of magazine publishing (the printer’s bills, the editor’s busy day) in a light-hearted manner. Written from the perspective of the magazine itself, the poem’s conceit is cute, but, perhaps more importantly, distanced from the editor or publisher, a technique that permits freer dialogue. As it ends on a note of deference, the poem not only begs the public’s approval, but vows to be its friend, a potentially endearing declaration. While such creative expressions were relatively rare, they performed the same function as some of the other figurative language outlined thus far, both to impress the reader with creative flair while addressing and potentially diffusing sensitive editorial issues in a light-hearted manner.

A Final Note of Scepticism

In showcasing the editors’ own words, prefaces reveal the ways in which editors tried to educate potential readers as to their publishing and literary ambitions while also communicating the practical challenges of publication. They furthermore convey the ways in which magazines could benefit readers individually and as a nation, and the ways

in which editors invited readers to identify as a community. In spite of their mostly earnest expressions, a handful of self-references within the prefaces reveal that even as editors employed the form, they recognized its pretences. As early as 1831, the editor of *The Montreal Monthly Magazine* joked:

Upon entering myself as a candidate for public patronage, it may be expected I should lay my claims before the public, as is usual on these occasions, and inform the world, what I was—what I am—and what I expect to be by public favour and liberality, modestly disavowing any idea of my own ability, or the existence of talent, sufficient to prosecute the undertaking. Stating at the same time, my only motive is to benefit the public, &c, &c, &c.

But I intend to be more candid. Bear with me my kind readers, while I explain the causes, which induced me to undertake this *little* work. (“The Editor, To the Public.” *The Montreal Monthly Magazine* Mar. 1831: 1)

That he would publish such a comment and expect readers to share in the joke about editorial posturing suggests a certain awareness of the preface’s function as a rhetorical tool. The specific topics addressed in his comment, including his intentions to lay claims before the public and disavow his abilities, acknowledge the pretence in such rhetoric and hint at undisclosed motives that no doubt drove at least some editors, including the chance for literary renown or the opportunity to influence and dictate cultural preferences. The editor’s use of “&c, &c, &c” alludes to the occasionally long-winded nature of the preface and stands in for additional stock aspects of the form. His italics on *little* emphasize the editorial tendency towards contrived modesty.

Not all editors were so light-hearted towards what they must have viewed as a tired convention. In spite of writing an articulate and quotable preface, John Kent of *The Canadian Literary Magazine* dismissed the form as “prejudicial to literary independence” (“The Editor’s Address to the Public.” *The Canadian Literary Magazine* Apr. 1833: 1). Thomas Maclear of *The Anglo-American Magazine* furthermore labelled the form as “a kind of officious interloper—a useless advertisement of persons and things that must be judged entirely by their own merits” (“Prologue.” *The Anglo-American Magazine* July 1852: 67). Of course, Maclear was correct in his shrewd assessment: in spite of their best rhetorical efforts in the preface, editors had to realize that their efforts would ultimately be judged on how well they fulfilled their mandate, or perhaps more intriguingly, how they relaxed it in order to walk that careful line between moral instruction and amusement. Even as they cajoled their readers, editors knew that from the moment the first issue rolled off the presses, their magazines would shift from a broadcast format to a three-way conversation, open not only to the editor but to the less predictable voices of contributors and readers. These implicit conversations are the subject of the next chapter.

CHAPTER 4

Sites of Editorial Interaction in Canadian Magazines

If editorial prefaces represented an initial broadcast to an unseen reading public, subsequent editorial communications mark the responses that transformed that one-way transmission into a conversation between the three interested parties of editor, reader, and contributor. Although most readers were a silent majority (letters to the editor could sometimes be few and far between depending on the magazine), this chapter attempts to uncover those exchanges made visible, primarily via public “notes to correspondents” in which editors signalled their acceptances and rejections of contributor submissions. Of course, not every magazine printed such material, nor was all of it revealing, yet the examples that exist provide a unique window onto the editorial process.⁹⁸ For editors in particular, such spaces represented an ongoing opportunity to educate readers and contributors about their editorial standards.

Since the first chapter on prefaces investigated the inaugural *Nova-Scotia Magazine* as a representative template, here too that example will prove useful to introduce standard features of editorial feedback that the rest of this chapter will analyze thematically. Consider this submission letter, which appeared in all its deference and humility in the magazine’s second issue, directly above the writer’s printed poem:

If the subjoined solution is not too trifling or puerile, the writer offers it to the Editor of the Nova-Scotia Magazine, with too humble an opinion of its merit to expect seeing it in print: However his good wishes towards the success of so

⁹⁸ Mary Lu MacDonald shows that such criticism also appeared in newspapers, quoting a few examples from the *Kington Chronicle* and *Chatham Journal* (91).

useful a work, must plead his excuse for tendering so undeserving a tribute. (“To the Editor of the Nova-Scotia Magazine.” *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* Aug. 1789: 140)

Replying directly below, editor Reverend Cochran noted, “We could not make out the signature, of this writer. His modesty induces us to think favourably of him; and we should be glad of his correspondence on more important subjects” (“To the Editor of the Nova-Scotia Magazine.” *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* Aug. 1789: 140). Even as he commends the writer’s modesty, Cochran hints at what would become a persistent editorial irritant: the legibility of submissions. In later issues, Cochran established a regular spot at the end of the issue for an occasional “Notification to Correspondents” feature where he published further receipts and rejections. For instance, in that same issue he noted that “C.W.T. is by much too incorrect for insertion” (“Notification to Correspondents.” *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* Aug. 1789: 160). Even though the reprimand addresses a single author, its publication signals a general flaw that could result in rejection. The note furthermore alerts subscribers to the magazine’s quality control and its editor’s role as gatekeeper.

A few more examples from *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* demonstrate the variety of issues that could be dealt with in this forum. For instance, in the third issue, the editor delicately admonished a young contributor:

The verses on spring, by our fair correspondent at *Shelburne*, are by no means contemptible; especially when considered as coming from a girl of nine. But if the young lady will cultivate poetry in preference to her *Sampler*, we advise her to let

her infant Muse get more strength before she puts her upon the world.

(“Notification to Correspondents.” *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* Sept. 1789: 240)

In his understated phrasing of “by no means contemptible,” Cochran avoids fully dismissing the young girl’s submission, but neither does he offer praise. Again, his response balances encouragement with quality control by refusing to indulge even a child whose verses do not meet the magazine’s editorial standards.

Other communications were more factual. For instance, in the fifth issue, the editor wrote that “*Enigmaticus* will appear in our next, G is received, and is under consideration” (“Notification to Correspondents.” *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* Nov. 1789: 400). Communications could also be humorous, and convey a sense of familiarity. Also in the fifth issue, the editor published a “Poetical Letter to the Editor of the Nova-Scotia Magazine,” whereby “A Farmer,” upon seeing his neighbour reading a “book with a blue paper cover” and discovering it to be a magazine (and not, “a Methodist sermon, / The country, of late, being full of such vermin”), decides he wants to become a subscriber. The latter half of the poem conveys the farmer’s proposal for doing so:

It exceedingly pleas'd me, and made me enquire
 How I could obtain it; why, answer'd the Squire,
 You may have twelve a year, for the trifling expence
 Of four crowns, two shillings, and one single six-pence.
 I went home, and have been three days a contriving
 Which way I could pay, for I've thoughts of subscribing:
 as cash in the country is quite out of use,
 the only way left, is to pay in produce.

Indeed, my friend Jacob tells me, he supposes

An honest Hibernian will deal in *blue noses*,⁹⁹

If this pay will answer, to be sure, Sir, I shall

Become a subscriber, and pay every fall.

(“Poetical Letter to the Editor of the Nova-Scotia Magazine.” *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* Nov. 1789: 389)

Besides printing the cheeky poem, the editor included a footnoted reply that gave him the last word on the issue. He wrote: “We have already agreed to this writer’s proposal; but we positively stipulate that his *blue noses* must be of a quality much superior to his poetry” (“Poetical Letter to the Editor of the Nova-Scotia Magazine.” *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* Nov. 1789: 389). By matching the tone of the poem and responding to the proposal with a sense of humour, the editor reveals his flexibility in agreeing to accept “produce” as payment for a subscription. The poem’s opening scene with the neighbours reading together furthermore confirms the magazine’s community-building role and wider second-hand readership.

While the concerns of “A Farmer” were settled within an issue, the most revealing editorial relationship in *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* developed over multiple issues between the editor and a regular contributor named Pollio. The editorial notes that surrounded his submissions provide insight into editorial mentorship. Whereas most writers submitted single or occasional submissions, Pollio, whose work initially appeared in issue five with “Winter: An Original Poem,” became its most frequent contributor,

⁹⁹ “Blue noses” was a colloquialism for potatoes as well as Nova Scotians. Gwendolyn Davies analyzes the poem’s value (as a social document rather than a literary text) in her thesis chapter on *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*, noting particularly the class differences between the Squire who can afford the magazine and the honest Hibernian who must negotiate its value in produce (32).

appearing in almost every other issue. Yet his acceptance into the magazine was not unequivocal. For instance, in a footnote to Pollio's next submission, "Rural Happiness," the editor gently critiqued:

It is hardly necessary to observe, in justification of the Author, that the scene of "*Rural Happiness*" must have been laid in some other country than that which we inhabit; otherwise the 'Hawthorn glades, and eglantines, / The laughing primrose on its mossy bed / The violet blue, the daily tinged with red. (Blessed be the fields where we wont to view them) might be deemed out of place. Many of the American writers absurdly appropriate the rural images of Europe: They tell you of the *gentle western breezes*, enough to freeze one to death; and every night piece is enlivened by the *Nightingale*, where her voice was never heard. But our Author has abundantly more judgment than to fall into such errors. (Note below "Rural Happiness." *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* Dec. 1789: 472)

Although these comments are addressed to Pollio, their public appearance had the potential to educate other writers as to the editor's preference for domestic images. Far from singling out Pollio, the editor excuses him by describing his error as a common misstep, and therefore challenges him to improvement. Furthermore, the editor establishes his authority by taking on a new role as Pollio's mentor.

The editor's acceptance and publication of Pollio's work in spite of his reservations demonstrates both his flexibility and faith in this particular writer's talent. In fact, the editor was equally quick to note his appreciation for Pollio, writing that "we are much obliged by this gentleman's correspondence." When Pollio affixed a postscript below his poem noting, "Pollio, by some, has been accused of vanity, in affixing 'An

original Poem’ to the ‘Verses on Winter,’” the editor chastised the contributor’s detractors and invited even more of “Rural Happiness,” which Pollio had indicated was part of a larger manuscript. The editor furthermore publicly rejected another contributor for attempting to parody the protégé:

We have received the poem entitled *Winter Reversed*: Though it is not altogether void of humour, it is much too incorrect for insertion. We would recommend the compositions of Pollio to this writer, rather as subjects for imitation than burlesque. (“Notification to Correspondents.” *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* Dec. 1789: 480)

Yet even as Cochran defended Pollio, he maintained his advisory role, complaining in the next issue about Pollio’s rhyming, in a footnote to “Odin, a highland ballad versified”:

We take the liberty of calling our ingenious correspondent’s attention to a few of his rhymes. He well knows that their harmony in no wise depends on the similarity of his written words, but on sound only: Therefore, though we are aware he can produce too many instances from the greatest English poets, we would advise him to be guided by his ear alone. The same likeness of letters and unlikeness of sound occurs further on:

Where Arden lifts to heaven his rocky *brow*,
Far seen, and white with everlasting *snow*—

Neither are we quite satisfied with—Heath, Death—Breath, Heath—Move,
Love—Red, Mead—Craft, Left—Convey, Sea... (Untitled note after “Odin, An Highland Ballad Versified.” *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* Jan. 1790: 67)

But again the editor quickly smoothes his complaint with reassurances, noting that:

These remarks, we confide, will be received with the same spirit they are offered; which is only that of friendly communication. Cheap as they are, we would not have spent them upon an inferior writer. But from Pollio we hope for many future favours; and if he thinks with us, the least attention can easily remedy this trifling defect; arising, we know, not from poverty of words, but more likely from too hasty composition. (Untitled note after “Odin, An Highland Ballad Versified.”

The Nova-Scotia Magazine Jan. 1790: 67-68)

In these critiques, the editor addresses Pollio directly while by their public appearance his work also becomes a concrete example for more general instruction regarding half-rhymes and uncritical imitations of the English poets. In his praise for Pollio, in calling him “ingenious” and in his note that he “would not have spent them” on an inferior writer, the editor affirms a respectful relationship. Finally, the editor’s reference to “hasty composition” serves as yet another public reminder of the need for proofreading.

Almost a year later, this editorial dialogue was opened to a third voice through a letter to the editor, revealing that at least one reader was left wondering about Pollio’s absence of several issues:

Sir, I join you in lamenting that so few originals appear in the Nova-Scotia Magazine; and particularly regret that *Pollio* has ceased to adorn your entertaining miscellany, with his numbers.—The enclosed lines can boast no merit, but they express the real sentiments of a large circle of your readers; if they are worthy a place in the Magazine, they may, perhaps induce Pollio again to favour the public

with his productions. With warm wishes for the success of your undertaking, I am, Sir,

Your's, &c, A.Z. ("To the Editor of the Nova-Scotia Magazine." *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* Dec. 1790: 472)

A.Z. followed his letter with a 24-line poem "To POLLIO" in which he laid out his concerns in verse, beginning:

Why cease, oh Pollio! thy musical lays?
 Why no more do thy sonnets appear?
 Soft tenderness *feels* and re-echoes their praise,
 While Judgement the verse must reverse
 Tho the passion of Love never planted its thorn
 Yet my heart has oft lost its repose;
 I have thought that I felt myself sadly forlorn
 and the tear of adversity flows....

("To Pollio." *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* Dec. 1790: 472)

At the end of the poem, A.Z. furthermore pondered possible factors behind Pollio's disappearance, wondering particularly about "the Sneer of the Critic." His plea for Pollio's return was rewarded when the poet reappeared a few months later with a new contribution titled "Spring" accompanied by an editorial postscript:

Pollio returns his respectful acknowledgements for the unmerited honour A.Z. was pleased to confer on him. He is resolved, that, however undeserving his Muse may be of A.Z.'s flattering encomiums, or however incapable of affording amusement, he shall never give cause for any greater displeasure, than that of a

generous mind in perusing an unsuccessful attempt to please. (Untitled note after “Spring.” *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* Apr. 1791: 244)

In Pollio’s polite and deferential response to A.Z., the editorial chain was completed, with the reader now included in the conversation. In his own way, the reader had also become a contributor in his encouragement of the continued missives of Pollio.

In this exchange among Pollio, the editor, and the reader, the dimensions of the editorial relationship are in full view: from the editor’s declaration that his magazine would be a forum for creative expression, to Pollio’s response as a contributor, to the reader’s implied and then published response. Pollio exposed himself to the notoriety of publication and was met with relatively critical feedback, but he was also rewarded by seeing his work in print. The editor’s critical notes equally signalled his commitment to the protégé, an obligation that the editor fulfilled through continued publication and mentorship. As the reader (self-described as representing “a large circle” of readers) entered the conversation, the magazine fulfilled its promise as a community forum connecting all three members.

This first example is a conveniently transparent depiction of the editorial relationship. Most magazines did not reveal all or any of these voices as clearly. Even the most revealing source for editorial insights, the occasional “notes to correspondents” columns that some magazines used as a forum for acceptances, rejections, and general feedback, did not appear in all magazines, nor were they always consistent. Although correspondence notes seem likely to have been instated because anonymity made it difficult for editors to return or respond to rejected submissions, the public nature of such a device meant that the columns could additionally educate contributors and readers alike

about common reasons for acceptance or rejection. Such notes also had the potential to improve the quality of the periodical as well as to minimize the need to repeat such advice, and make readers aware of the editor's quality control. Presumably due to the wider abandonment of anonymity late century, this sort of feedback eventually dropped off as writers could be addressed directly and privately.

A Few Sample "Notices to Correspondents" in Full

Before delving thematically into the types of advice typically conveyed in correspondence columns, it is fruitful to consider some sample columns in their raw entirety. Such examples demonstrate the variety of comments as well as the ways in which individual notes mitigated each other within the same column. Samples here are sourced from the limited number of magazines that regularly published such correspondents' columns, including *The Canadian Magazine* (1833), *The Literary Garland* (1838), *The Amaranth* (1841), and *The Saturday Reader* (1865).¹⁰⁰

In a note published under the heading "To Correspondents" in the table of contents of the second issue of the York-based *The Canadian Magazine*, editor William Sibbald covered a remarkable amount of information in a brief space:

Our friend "*The Emigrant*" has taken the hint in part—but is still rather long, notwithstanding his amusing remarks. We sincerely hope "*Cinna*" will continue to embellish our pages, with his very splendid productions. We trust "*An Observer*," will again favour us with his valuable observations. We hope to hear frequently from the tender "*Outis*." We have received the beautiful Poems, signed

¹⁰⁰ Other magazines that conveyed feedback in regular "notes to correspondents" or other forums include *The Acadian Magazine*, *The Canadian Garland*, *The Provincial*, *The Canadian Illustrated News* (1862) and *The New Dominion Monthly*.

“B” one of which is inserted; the rest will appear in our next. “*The doomed Chief of Pakagama*” in our next; when also will appear the communication of “W.D.P.” (“To Correspondents.” *The Canadian Magazine* Feb. 1833: 1)

In its almost point-form delivery, this missive conveys several details whose meaning might only be fully understood by the contributors, yet contains implied tips for the general reader and aspiring author. From the first line, it is clear that shorter submissions are preferred. The editor also praises and compliments other contributors, two of whom would become regulars. As this particular column is fully complimentary, readers could furthermore consider any of these published works as examples of acceptable submissions. The note also alerts readers to upcoming content.

In the Montreal-based *Literary Garland*, notes from editor John Gibson appeared fairly regularly, although the informative tone eventually devolved into a style that was more effusive and obsequious. Since Gibson’s earlier critical and informative manner is most revealing, consider the notes that appeared under the heading “To Correspondents” in the January 1839 issue:

The continuation and conclusion of “*The Vicar’s Daughter*,” by “E.M.M.” will be found in our preceding pages. We are much indebted to the author of this very beautiful tale, for her attention. We have much pleasure in acknowledging the receipt from her, of a new story from “*Aunt Mary’s Note Book*,” entitled “*The Confided*,” the commencement of which will adorn the pages of our February number.

“Robin” we must decline publishing. We would recommend the author to study the earlier poets of England, for, although eschewing all imitation and

calculated to destroy the freshness of imagination and idea, we are of the opinion, that the purity of his style might be much improved. We are thus particular, for we think we observe in the attempts of our correspondent, a boldness of composition which we should very much regret to see run to waste.

We regret very much that the favour of "E.L.C." was received too late for the present number of the *Garland*. We shall, however, in our next, have the satisfaction of publishing the touching and elegant story of "*Josepha of Austria*."

"W.S." will observe that his verses have been attended to.

In accordance with our design of encouraging the productions of native genius, we have inserted one of the pieces transmitted by "G.R."

"JESSIE" is altogether too vapid in style. It lies at the office of the publisher, and will be returned when called for.

The satirical lines by "J.W." are good of their kind, but as they are supposed to contain some allusions of a personal nature, we cannot publish them.

"ALPHA" is too pedantic in style. His contribution is declined.

"N." is of a character which we propose uniformly to exclude from our pages.

We beg to acknowledge our obligations to correspondents generally, for the favours which we have received, and beg forgiveness of those who remain unnoticed, for in the multiplicity of calls upon our time, we have received some contributions which are yet unread, and upon which we cannot consequently form any opinion. ("To Correspondents." *The Literary Garland* Jan. 1839: 96)

These notes communicate a variety of recommendations. Beginning with acceptance and moving towards rejection, the missive compliments regular contributor “E.M.M.” (Elizabeth Mary Maclachlan) on a story in progress. Although redundant, such a compliment enacts a social nicety and furthermore highlights the serial and its author within the issue. The second note, ultimately a rejection, is still fairly positive in acknowledging “Robin’s” aptitude. Perhaps more importantly, the missive invites potential contributors who would consider themselves equally talented as Robin to avoid rejection by following the editor’s advice to read more widely among successful authors even as they develop their own voices. While the rest of the notes are shorter and more purely informative, many of them contain hints on how to get work into print. The note to G.R. regarding publication “in order to encourage productions of native genius” reminds the reader of the magazine’s mandate to publish original content. Negative aspects reveal grounds for critique; in this instance, submissions were rejected for being “vapid” or “pedantic,” or containing “allusions of a personal nature.” Such publicly described reasons for rejection educated contributors, reinforced editorial standards, and upheld the editor’s role as gatekeeper and protector of readers’ delicate sensibilities.

In the New Brunswick-based *Amaranth*, editor Robert Shives’ note to correspondents again cobbled together acceptances, rejections, and encouragement:

To Correspondents—“A Scrap from the Forest,” by “K”; and “A Tale of the West Indies,” by “W.T.” have been received. “Clara’s” Sketch came too late for insertion in this number, but will appear in our next. We hope to hear from her again. “Midnight Musings,” has some merit, but will not answer in its present shape—rhymes are *not* poetry. ‘Alicia,’ is the production of a youthful mind, and

exhibits more fancy than judgment.—We think the author might *try again* and be more successful. A great many favors, which we cannot particularize, are under consideration. (“To Correspondents.” *The Amaranth* Sept. 1841: 288)

Shives’ advice is curt yet instructive, from the warning that “rhymes are not poetry,” to the suggestion that writing should exhibit “more judgement than fancy.” As in the previous example, the editor encourages some contributors and holds back from others, a tactic that signals an editorial standard. “Clara” is warmly welcomed, and the fact that she would become a regular contributor suggests Shives could spot the type of writing he liked rather quickly. The editor’s allusion to his growing pile of unread submissions (his “great many favours”) reminds readers of the editor’s overwhelming workload.

In W.B. Cordier’s *The Saturday Reader*, where a lengthy “Answers to Correspondents” column appeared weekly to provide both editorial feedback as well as answers to general questions (a convention borrowed from several British publications), the editor provided even more specific feedback. Consider the following column from the fourth issue:

ACROSTIC. We cannot insert the Acrostic in the “SATURDAY READER.” Although we like subscriptions well, we like independence and self-respect far better, and have no notion of begging for subscribers. The other contributions were more acceptable.

G.H.H. Could you not travel over a less beaten track? Try. You will see the use we have made of your communication, for which, please accept our thanks.

FALLINUS. Your boatmen dreamt too disjointed a dream; please see general notice below.

J.H., TORONTO If you are, as we gather from your letter, quite a young student, why then there is plenty of time to write and re-write your compositions before offering them for publication. We cannot use those you have sent, although we would willingly do so. Work and wait.

JEAN, A Rhymer, L.B. Please see notice below.

H.H. Can you favour us occasionally with similar contributions?

HERMAN L. Will insert shortly.

JAMES J-l-d. Your paper will be regularly delivered in future: pay collector full amount. We have dated your subscription from No 3. When writing again, please give your full address.

REV –C. Manuscript received, will have attention.

A.H. “Honour” is waiting for you at the office of the READER. Too long and heavy—light, racy sketches would be acceptable. Many thanks nevertheless.

GRADUATE. We believe the first obscure mention of Academical Degrees was in 1214 in the University of Paris, from which the other Universities of Europe borrowed most of their customs. In 1231, Degrees had become general.

ANTI-FANATIC. We would not insert your communication even as an advertisement. Once for all, we wish it to be understood that the READER is intended to be a family paper, and not a vehicle for the diffusion of scepticism.

JAMES H., GUELPH. The weekly issues of the Reader have thus far been stereotyped; we shall consequently be always able to supply the early numbers to

complete sets. We thank you for your good wishes, and may state that the success of the *READER* is beyond our most sanguine anticipations.

GENERAL NOTICE – The space which we can devote to Poetry is but limited, and we have already upon our table of original poems, good, bad, and indifferent (especially the latter) sufficient to last us for six months. Our correspondents must not feel surprised then if their effusions do not appear. Why not devote to prose compositions the time which is wasted in the effort to “tag rhymes?” We shall be glad to receive well written original tales and sketches in prose. (“Answers to Correspondents.” *The Saturday Reader* 30 Sept. 1865: 64)

Here, the information is varied and detailed, featuring not only contributor feedback but even answers to general questions. In the first missive, ACROSTIC is reminded of the magazine’s editorial standards of modesty, while G.H.H. is encouraged to be more original and J.H. to spend more time on his work. In responding to A.H. that his submission was “too long and heavy—light, racy sketches would be acceptable,” the editor provides general guidelines, and in his note to ANTI-FANATIC he dismisses scepticism. In fact, only H.H. is asked directly to become a regular contributor. In his final “General Notice,” the editor provides even broader advice, informing readers that his poetry roster was full, and encouraging them to turn their hands to sketches and tales instead. Interestingly, he describes the poetry he had received as good, bad, and indifferent. In noting that the greatest abundance lies in the last category, the editor implies that such middling work may be redeemed by following the weekly recommendations in these notes. Even though the magazine published in Montreal, it is interesting to note contributors originating from as far away as Toronto and Guelph.

Examining several correspondence corners in their entirety reveals how individual notes within these columns added up to a collectively palatable mix of praise, rejection, and instruction, by which editors clarified their standards, demonstrated their willingness to mentor aspiring writers, encouraged their best contributors, and stressed the demands on their time. From this point on, the chapter will examine common threads within these didactic spaces, particularly those that are most revealing of editorial preferences. For editors, the potential to improve submissions was no doubt a major incentive for providing public editorial feedback. Not only would such instruction save repeating the same advice, but it also presented another avenue through which they could fulfil their mandates to nurture native talent as articulated in the prefaces. Furthermore, the feedback had the potential to engage readers and contributors alike in the editorial process, ensuring their greater investment in the magazine.

Practice Makes Perfect: Poetical Critiques and Prose Grievances

Poetry was one of the more common subjects for editorial critique. Given the popularity of poetry publishing within nineteenth-century magazines, instructing readers collectively on how to write better poetry rather than addressing one bad verse at a time had the potential to save editors considerable energy. In one of the earliest notes on this question, the editor of *The British-American Register* provided some general advice to a poet named W.H.B. by critiquing his defective versification and his use of the abbreviation “d’int” for “did not.” He noted more generally that although the editor “would not discourage young Poets,” novices should have “always before them, the words which the great master of English Poetry puts into the mouth of the gallant Percy.” The editor quoted a relevant passage from Shakespeare’s *Henry IV* (III.1.129), the last lines of

which read, “that would nothing set my teeth on edge, / Nothing so much, as mincing Poetry / T’is like the forc’d gate of a shuffling nag (“To Correspondents.” *The British-American Register* 22 Jan. 1803: 46). In his remarks, the editor raises two major recurring concerns: rhyming and grammar. His Shakespearean reference lends erudition to the critique yet also disarms its severity by its playfulness.

In *The Literary Garland*’s criticism of “A Traveller,” editor John Gibson echoed this complaint against bad verse as he noted “we would recommend to the author a greater attention to the rhythm and versification of the stanzas, by which considerable improvement might be effected” (“To Correspondents.” *The Literary Garland* Sept. 1839: 488). Later still, *The Canadian Literary Journal*’s editor was equally direct in telling B. EWART that “Your revised effusion is declined. Poetry is certainly not your FORTE” (“Notices to Correspondents.” *The Canadian Literary Journal* Nov. 1870: 97). These editors clearly disapproved of the submissions, yet all but the last provided relatively constructive suggestions that were helpful in their specificity. In one case, the editor seemed to kindly attempt to save the writer from his own overly personal submission as his rejection noted that “*Stanzas*, by J.H.H. would no doubt gratify the *lady* to whom they are addressed, but could not edify the ladies of our city in general” (“The Amaranth.” *The Amaranth* May 1841: 159). In another example from the next issue, the editor similarly rejected the submission “Lines to Miss L—,” by noting “if the author lives to be three years older, he will thank us for not publishing this effusion” (“The Amaranth.” *The Amaranth* June 1841: 192). Besides being somewhat funny and causing the reader to wonder about the rejected items, the feedback also reveals the more serious fact that inappropriate or even simply immature writing would not be accepted.

Besides responding to specific submissions, editors occasionally supplied more general feedback on poetry. In *The Nova Scotia New Monthly Magazine*, the editor began an extensive diatribe on bad poetry by complaining that “it has been well observed, that of nine persons who write, eight write poetry.”¹⁰¹ The editor continued to complain about those who “at some period of life, commit the sin of versification,” concluding by accusing more directly the arrogance of “the verriest loon, that knows nothing of literature, and cares as little, [who] lets his fancy wander to some cloudy region, and sighs over what may be justly described as ‘a most woeful ballad made to his mistress’s eyebrows.’” The editor furthermore added that “we are never sorry, therefore to meet with a man who is not ashamed to own that he has written bad verses” and proceeded to present an example of a bad poem that the editor somewhat redundantly invited the reader to assess before noting that such poems had “a defiance of common sense about them, a sweet touch of insipidity, a delicious twaddle, which render them quite charming in their own way” (“Our Drawer.” *The Nova Scotia New Monthly Magazine* Apr. 1842: 94). By analyzing a bad poem so publicly, the editor helped to educate his contributors and even his readers on the pitfalls that good poetry should avoid. Yet the specifics of the critique were also telling: in his complaint that the masses write poetry, he warns those who are serious about it need to take the form more seriously, to avoid trivial subjects, and pay attention to craft. The notice also made contributors (particularly the unfortunate target of his criticism) aware of the ferocity and public nature of the editor’s judgement.

This habit of direct critique was taken up again and in fuller force by *The Provincial, or, Halifax Monthly Magazine*, where Mary Jane (Katzmann) Lawson

¹⁰¹ This blunt phrasing was echoed almost exactly some twenty years later in *The Saturday Reader* when the editor noted to C.H.S. that “Nine-tenths of the original poetry we receive is transferred to the waste basket with but scant hesitation” (“Answers to Correspondents.” *The Saturday Reader* 21 Oct. 1865: 112).

demonstrated editorial didacticism at its harshest. A few examples are illustrative. For instance, in the sixth issue of the first volume, Lawson wrote that “Another correspondent sends us some verses headed by the question—what is life? The subject is so hackneyed—almost every poetaster having tried his hand at the solution—that one grows weary of the enigma and its thousand answers” (“Our Correspondents.” *The Provincial*, June 1852: 203). About “Lines on seeing a human skull in a churchyard, in the city of Halifax, N.S. in April 1850,” Lawson noted that “the subject is certainly a *grave* one, and the author has treated it in a solemn, but by no means original manner. It is an imitation (designedly or otherwise we cannot say) of Gray’s *Elegy in a Country Churchyard*, both in metre and ideas” (“Our Correspondents.” *The Provincial* May 1852: 196). After presenting some lines of the poem, the editor advised the correspondent (whom she noted had previously appeared in the paper) “to endeavour to condense and classify his ideas;—a thought reflected in several verses, weakens the force of the sentiment, and detracts from the merit of the stanza” (“Our Correspondents.” *The Provincial* May 1852: 197). Again, by their public presentation, these practical notes were potentially instructive to an audience wider than the offending writer: in these examples, the editor reveals that poets needed to work on originality and conciseness. The fact that the last contributor had already appeared suggests that each work would be judged on its own merit, reassurance that one bad review would not necessarily ban a writer from publication altogether.

Versification was also a subject for critique by Lawson. For instance, in the last issue of the first volume the editor encouraged the author of “Morning” and “Cool Evening Breezes” to realize that “there is a wide difference between rhythm and poetry; the former may be written without reason or originality, the latter must have both.” She

further advised that “it is therefore better to avoid committing every chance thought to paper, and dignifying it in the name of poetry” (“Our Correspondents.” *The Provincial* Dec. 1852: 472). In the first issue of the second volume, Lawson made a similar comment regarding “Lines addressed to a lady on her birthday,” noting that the verse was “written in such barbarous metre for a congratulatory or complimentary ode, that we fear even its recipient found it a difficult task to discover its intentions” (“Our Correspondents.” *The Provincial* Jan. 1853: 13). In the eighth issue of the second volume, Lawson counselled more broadly that literary aspirants ought to consider switching to prose, noting that:

To write poetry requires much genius and refinement, but prose articles can be instructive and interesting with very little of either. It is, therefore, greatly to be desired, that young and inexperienced literary aspirants will not labour at the verse machine they imagine they possess; but, if they *will* write, jot down their remarks in plain, unassuming prose. If the latter course be pursued, their efforts will generally meet with success; if the former, failure will almost sure to be the result. (“Our Correspondents.” *The Provincial* Aug. 1853: 317-318)

The editor proceeded to present several illustrative examples of hackneyed topics for verse, such as revisiting childhood, meditation on dreams, and death, ending on a mixed note that concluded that while correspondents’ “ability is not equal to their will,” still “we would not discourage them from persevering in the path of literary endeavour” (“Our Correspondents.” *The Provincial* Aug. 1853: 319). In these few examples, lessons included the need to avoid tired subject matter, to refrain from imitation, and to practice self-expression through prose as an easier route to publication. Even more than the advice

itself, Lawson's propensity for publicly dissecting their works would certainly encourage contributors to take greater care with their submissions.¹⁰²

Prose could also be a focus for editorial suggestion, where grievances included everything from length to style to plot to pacing. In *The Canadian Casket*, the editor was compelled to note that "Junius is too lengthy for his subject: his article would do with pruning. And here it is proper to remark, it is desirable that articles for the *Casket* should generally be short, as our sheet is yet small, and we wish to give a variety" ("To Correspondents." *The Canadian Casket* 29 Oct. 1831: 15). This request for short, light articles specifies the magazine's requirements as well as calling writers to pay attention to the editorial style of a magazine before making their submissions. In *The Canadian Garland*, the editor responded to the author of "An Indian Legend," who wanted his manuscript returned, by noting that "had this been published at the time it was received, its great length would have excluded many articles then on file. Should he again favor us in this way, we humbly beg of him to be more concise" ("To Correspondents." *The Canadian Garland*, 16 Mar. 1823 [sic]: 111). Such advice is echoed in *The British American Magazine* as the editor conveyed to "Minetti" that "we regret we cannot insert your communication in its present form; if condensed it might be admissible" ("To

¹⁰² Underlying many editorial comments was the caution against hasty composition. In *The Canadian Garland*, the editor addressed this directly by writing that "The best performances, have generally cost the most labor, and that ease which is so essential to fine writing, has seldom been attained without repeated and severe corrections—the truth is, every sentiment has its particular expression, and every word its precise place, which do not always immediately present themselves, and generally demand frequent trials, before they can be properly adjusted" ("To Correspondents." *The Garland* 29 Sept. 1832: 15). Later in the century, when contributors were largely professionalized and editors had generally dropped their habit of offering feedback, the opportunity to advise was sometimes irresistible. In spite of having a roster of recognizable contributors in his first Table of Contents, editor George Moffat of *Our Monthly* warned hasty writers in his preface that "As soon as you have dashed off something good set it down in a cool place for a week; at the end of that time if it reads as good as when you first wrote it, mail it to OUR MONTHLY and chance it ("To Contributors." *Our Monthly* Jan. 1896: 1).

Correspondents.” *The British American Magazine* Nov. 1863: 112), and *The Saturday Reader* whose editor wrote:

WOLF—We have read your manuscript, but cannot insert it in its present form. It is not without merit, but the story would read better if cut down to about half its present length, as too much prominence is given to details which are uninteresting to the reader. We throw out this hint for your guidance in the future contributions you promise us. (“Answers to Correspondents.” *The Saturday Reader* 14 Oct. 1865: 96)

Here the editor educates his contributor with regards to the shorter style and tighter writing required by the magazine form. He also encourages the writer by inviting him to make future contributions, proving that even bad feedback did not close the door to publication.

Perhaps related to the call for shorter papers was the notion that magazine writing required a lighter style and fresh subject matter. For instance, the editor of *The Canadian Casket* noted that

The “Lesson for Youth,” sent to us by “Finis” is a good lesson in its place, but in too serious a strain for the Casket. His smooth style, terse character, and careful punctuation, show him to be no novice with the quill; and we hope he does not intend his signature to apply to his correspondence. He will reflect that our aim is “to blend the *useful* with the *sweet*.” (“To Correspondents.” *The Canadian Casket* 29 Oct. 1831, 15)

By critiquing the submission’s tone, this editor reaffirms a call for didacticism while also emphasizing the lighter style that was commonly requested of magazine submissions.

Again, the editor is supportive rather than dismissive, and credits the contributor for his care and craft (reinforcing such positive attributes as careful punctuation and character development). He even takes the opportunity in his last line to remind readers of the magazine's motto and moral prerogative. *The Provincial's* editor echoed these sentiments in her characteristically harsher tone as she wrote, "This paper is written in so disconnected a manner, that we are unwilling to present it to our readers until the writer has given it a careful revision. The ideas are good, and with pruning and arrangement it may be made an interesting article" ("Our Correspondents." *The Provincial* Aug. 1852: 313). Later in the century, John Dougall of *The New Dominion Monthly* noted in a long treatise on submissions that the style of articles "should be simple and clear, sentences should be short, and the paragraphs carefully marked," warning that,

...the ordinary mistake of young writers is to attempt to produce something like the school "compositions" by which they gained applause in their younger days; and abstract essays on "Spring," "Happiness," and such-like subjects are the result. These are of absolutely no value. ("To Contributors." *The New Dominion Monthly* Mar. 1877: 285-87)

Further examples reveal other editors to be equally interested in fresh subjects. The editor of *The Saturday Reader* counselled I.L. of HAMILTON that "The tale is fairly written, but we must decline it. The subject is hackneyed" ("Answers to Correspondents." *The Saturday Reader* 11 Nov. 1865: 160), and the editor of *The Canadian Literary Journal* advised MATTHEW ARNOLD that his submission was "Scarcely appropriate. Let us hear from you with something shorter and upon a newer subject" ("Notices to Correspondents." *The Canadian Literary Journal* Nov. 1870: 97). The editor of *The New*

Dominion Monthly similarly advised “Aural Mead” that “Your subject is not of sufficiently immediate interest. Try again” (“Notices to Correspondents” *The New Dominion Monthly* Feb. 1868: 320). These comments reinforce the importance of currency.

If fresh subjects and lighter tones were generally encouraged, work could also be critiqued as too airy. Consider this missive from *The Saturday Reader*:

CON.—We do not care to publish articles of the style you forwarded. Our friends should emulate the healthy tone and vigorous style of the writers for the best English periodicals, rather than the insipid sentimentalism which is the stock in trade of so many journals published on this continent. You can if you choose forward the other articles indicated, but we will not promise to insert them.

(“Answers to Correspondents.” *The Saturday Reader* 14 Oct. 1865: 96)

Here, the editor distinguishes between lightness and sentimentality, and points to the English periodicals as the authority, slighting (likely American) trashy literature. His reservation of editorial judgement on the other articles is a reminder that each submission would be judged on its own merit.

Beyond commenting on prose style, editors also picked up on elements such as plot and pacing. In the response published after the insertion of a story in *The Nova Scotia New Monthly Magazine*, the editor examines several difficulties:

The writer of “The Last Hours of an Old Maid,” has not failed to make amends, in the conclusion of his tale, for the apparent improbability of the former portion; and we have found that, instead of a beautiful *young* lady having really meditated and attempted suicide, while in the possession of her faculties of mind, it was

while under the influence of monomania for which philosophers do not easily account. The tact of the writer, in the conduct of his tale, is evident—and the effect with which its little *vaudeville*-sort of plot is worked up, will cause it to be perused with a great deal of interest, more especially by that class of ladies whom it is designed to compliment. (“Gossip for March.” *The Nova Scotia New Monthly Magazine* Mar. 1842: 61)

Here the editor half apologizes for the writer’s shortcomings with regards to plot, yet commends him for correcting the story’s trajectory with the more acceptable justification of monomania. Given its racy topic, the story sounds less chaste than most magazines purported to accept (the editor had already expressed reservations about this story in his preface), but that fact was conveniently avoided in this note.

W.B. Cordier of *The Saturday Reader* was similarly specific about pacing problems:

MARY DASHWOOD—It will never do to make your hero propose and your heroine softly whisper “yes, and thank you kindly,” after sixty minutes acquaintance. Croquet must be a dangerous game, if such tremendous results habitually flow from it. The gentle Minnie and the impressible Mr. Leslie should have been allowed at least twenty-four hours to dream and sigh over their true, true love of marvellous sudden growth, ere they were discovered on the sofa clasped in each other’s arms. You must try again, Mary. The game at croquet won’t do. (“Answers to Correspondents.” *The Saturday Reader* 4 Nov. 1865: 144)

Again, this editor’s public critique provides general advice on the subject of plot and pacing in language that is kind but firm and even humorous in his comment about the

dangers of croquet. In another example from *The Acadian Magazine*, the editor agreed to insert the story pending a change, similarly educating his reader by suggesting that “the little maid, according to the general style of fairy tale, should be ultimately restored, or rescued by some counter spell, and if possible by some interesting youth” (“To Correspondents.” *The Acadian Magazine* Mar. 1827: 360).¹⁰³ Such concrete suggestions not only encourage the writer in specific directions but demonstrate the editor’s own creativity to the reader.

Editors also made suggestions to help non-fiction prose writers achieve a more descriptive and journalistic style. In *The Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository*, the editor included a suggestion for future works alongside the contributor’s submission:

To our obliging correspondent who has favoured us with the foregoing sketch, we feel ourselves much obliged—such subjects, as being intimately connected with the country, fall immediately under the scope of our miscellany. It would have been highly gratifying had we been favoured with a description of the building, its site, extent, number of apartments allotted for the different purposes, &c. but these he can oblige us with a detail of at another time should he see it proper.

(Untitled note. *The Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository* July 1824: 6)

By publicizing such commentary, the editor not only informed this contributor and future contributors but alerted readers to his efforts to provide them with better articles.

¹⁰³ Later, *The Acadian Magazine* made the same request for a different story: “Cecil’s productions are, on the whole, always acceptable. We must, however, be permitted to remark, that we do not consider his ‘Cell of Solitude’ fully finished. No intimation is given, whether the ‘Lovely Power,’ was a ghost or human being IN CARNE. Why had it taken up its abode in that place? or, what light is intended to be cast by the narrative, on the history of the ancient tower in which it has fixed its cell?” (“To Correspondents.” *The Acadian Magazine* May 1827: 448).

The editor of the first *Canadian Illustrated News* made similar suggestions to two contributors, adding accuracy as yet another factor in the latter note:

CABOTIAN, Port Hope.—Your article is respectfully declined, and will be returned. A fresh, lively, gossiping sketch of Port Hope, with human interest in it, would be greatly preferable to a dry skeleton catalogue of streets and old events gathered out of Murray's Handbook, or the Travellers' guidebooks to Venice and Naples.

Mr. McK., Blandford.—The Lecture has been returned. It was probably interesting, if well delivered; but its statistics were inaccurate, as a glance at the Canadian Almanac might have shown you. The grammar was incorrect, and the diction below the standard of a good lecture. If you are young and ambitious read carefully; write your thoughts and punctuate each as you see the punctuation in well printed books. If you are not young, your literary efforts are hopeless. Try an original, lively sketch of Blandford; its first settlers, and present industrial condition. ("Notice to Correspondents." *The Canadian Illustrated News* 16 May 1863: 12)

In both cases, the underlying implication points to some laziness on the part of these writers: in the first instance, the writer assumed that he could simply recycle old facts without engaging in reportage, and in the second, that he could dash off any old submission without proper proofreading. Remarkably, the authors are still invited to submit new material, and yet by his specific suggestions the editor warns contributors and readers alike that his magazine demanded a higher standard. In the second instance, the

editor additionally revealed his own access to sources like the almanac, intimating that submissions would be fact-checked and edited before publication.

In a similar vein, Mary Graddon Gosselin of *The Montreal Museum* suggested that the magazine would benefit not only from descriptive but fictionalized contributions:

...many of our Correspondents, more ready to furnish us with matter of fact advice, than with fiction, have recommended the topography of the country as worthy of our attention—we freely admit it. Canada offers an extensive field to the painter. Her noble rivers, numerous lakes, her finely combined and picturesque views, afford the finest objects in the world for scenic description, whether of pen or pencil. But mere geographical details—such as the circumference of a lake, the length and breadth of a river, with the number of its verdant isles, the height of a mountain or the extent of a vale, would be dry and uninteresting, if imagination lent not its witching wand to enliven and animate the scene. (“To Readers, and Correspondents.” *The Montreal Museum* Jan. 1833: 128)¹⁰⁴

After making this plea for greater imagination even in factual writing, the editor listed a poem by Hawley on “Quebec” by way of example, noting that “as we cannot draw upon the legendary lore of ages past, imagination must be invoked to supply the deficiency” and invited similar contributions by writing that “we hope some of our gifted friends may

¹⁰⁴ Another editor made the opposite plea with regards to a story that seemed too familiar, noting “*A Tale of Fiction*, is no fiction. The circumstances, as well as the individuals, are familiar. The writer can have his MS. again” (“To Correspondents.” *The Garland* 22 Dec. 1832: 63).

be induced to direct their talents to this object”¹⁰⁵ (“To Readers, and Correspondents.” *The Montreal Museum* Jan. 1833: 128).

Since these editorial criticisms could sometimes be quite harsh, it is interesting to read hints of a rare contributor response to the feedback itself. The editor of *The Canadian Illustrated News* informed “Chesterfield” that his submission “was not only faulty in such mistakes as giving the population of Quebec to Montreal, and omitting the latter, but was feeble in language and cloudy in idea.” The editor’s further response reveals that the contributor must have complained about the submission process, as he assures the writer that “we do not read to discover faults but to find beauties” and warns that “the writers who voluntarily send contributions to this office must expect to see them made the subject of remark” (“Editor’s Notices.” *The Canadian Illustrated News* 20 June 1863: 155). By these words the editor seemed rather unapologetic about such a practice.¹⁰⁶

¹⁰⁵ Earlier in the same issue, Gosselin had already encouraged a specific writer to “direct her descriptive talents to local society and manners,” noting of the author that “she writes in a pretty style, a little of the old school of novels observable, but all the better for it. Sketches from her pen of fashionable life, as it is at home, would be more to the purpose, more piquant, than stories told of ‘gallant lords and ladies fair’ who figure in a far far land” (Untitled note. *The Montreal Museum* Jan. 1833: 102).

¹⁰⁶ While the chapter has quoted some harsh responses, an extended note from the late century *Toronto Saturday Night* magazine reveals frustrations about the process. Even though his overall reputation was that of a mentor, particularly for female writers, Edmund Sheppard demonstrated a certain frustration with feedback when he wrote “So many people who have never written a line for the press feel a divine afflatus that their manuscripts in ninety-five cases out of a hundred are rejected. It is a tedious thing to wade through oceans of rubbish to find an island of either sense or beauty. The editor is not paid as a philanthropist or to encourage native talent. He is supposed to provide a certain amount of interesting reading matter for the paper, and he is not inclined to plow through a lot of trash if, when he discovers something in the shape of a nugget, he will have to pay for it as liberally as if it had been written by a writer of reputation. The point is this: when a writer who has achieved some eminence sends in a manuscript, the editor is certain to find something of value though it may not reach his standard. With the effusions of the amateur it is different. Lawyers, doctors, parsons and members of every profession, have to serve many years before the hand of either Leah or Rachel crowns their brow with laurels or fills their purse with shekels, yet the ambitious newspaper contributor expects to make money out of his or her first attempt. This is a mistake. Those who desire to write for newspapers and magazines must be willing to serve an apprenticeship and comprehend the fact that their society should not more than compensate for their board until they have achieved a status of some sort (“Hints to Young Writers.” *Toronto Saturday Night* 2 Mar. 1889: 6).

The editorial comments reviewed so far have revealed some occasionally blunt rejections. However, editors could also be quite generous with their encouragement. For instance, John Gibson of *The Literary Garland* saw fit to praise a piece even in spite of the author's self-deprecation:

Among the original articles we have in the present number the pleasure of presenting to our readers, is a spirited poem entitled "The Passions," accompanying the manuscripts of which was received an explanation, to the effect that the poem had been too hastily prepared to admit of that careful revision necessary to arm it against the shafts of mere verbal criticism, whatever might be the opinion formed of its poetical merits. Certainly we are of opinion that in the poem may be traced evidences of rapidity—we cannot say of haste—in its composition; but it is the unstudied freedom with which it is written, as well as the richness of originality, and boldness of expression which distinguish it, we should imagine it is sufficiently shielded against any mere war of words, were it probable that such should be waged against it. Even in this respect, however, we look upon it as very securely fortified; and lay it before the literary world, confident that our judgment, given though it be in all humility, will be confirmed.

("Our Table." *The Literary Garland* Oct. 1840: 528)

Here, the editor seemed to feel he had identified a diamond in the rough, complimenting the work's features even as he acknowledged some truth in the author's self-deprecation. As with the criticisms analyzed thus far, Gibson's praise is useful in its specificity as it outlines the elements required for success, including originality and bold expression. The

poem's author was James Holmes, who had already seen several of his works published in the *Garland*, and would become one of the magazine's most prolific contributors.

Other instances saw editors begin mentoring relationships with presumably unknown writers by encouraging their talents beyond a single work. For instance, in *The Montreal Museum*, editor Mary Graddon Gosselin reached out to her contributor with simple praise that "We trust the fair authoress of 'Sketches of an idle moment' has not laid by her pen; one who writes with such purity and feeling, should exercise her rare talents" ("Montreal Museum." *The Montreal Museum* Mar. 1833: 255). *The Literary Garland*'s John Gibson took such praise further by urging a contributor to break through anonymity and establish face-to-face contact as he noted, "'Eliza' is rather below the standard although promising well. It would afford us pleasure to converse with the author" ("To Correspondents." *The Literary Garland* Dec. 1838: 48). The editor also noted of another contributor:

Although we beg to decline the acceptance of the lines of "Maria," we must express our conviction that the pen which produced the latter piece, requires only a little practice to become an ornament to our Canadian literature. We have a fancy for the boldness which characterises the spirit of the captive monarch. The fair young author has our thanks for her kindness in favouring us with a glance at her stanzas. ("To Correspondents." *The Literary Garland* June 1839: 336)

By reaching out to the writer and inviting further submissions, Gibson fulfilled his mandate to nurture talent, demonstrating his willingness to mentor writers eager to develop their skills.¹⁰⁷

¹⁰⁷ At least one editor directly expressed gratitude for this process in a missive that noted "We are glad that our Correspondents have taken our remarks in the good temper which their private notes display. It is with

Editor Peter Sinclair also broke his established rule against personal contact in his offer to mentor the author of a manuscript called *THE BETROTHED*:

We were very anxious to give a place to the story bearing this name which was sent to our office; but the manuscript requires so much correction that we cannot for the present attend to it,—if the writer will send for it we will break thro’ our rule and return it, with a few lines for his guidance. (“To Correspondents.”

Sinclair’s Journal of British North America 31 Mar. 1849: 40)

By offering feedback, Sinclair too demonstrates his willingness to reach out to promising contributors. In *The Victoria Magazine*, Susanna Moodie similarly reassured writer Rhoda Ann Page with her note that

R.A.P. has our sincere thanks. Her articles are always an ornament to our little Mag. The Prose Communications she half promises would be most welcome. The praise bestowed by our generous Contemporary the Literary Garland upon her "Lost Boy," should convince her, that tales and sketches from her pen, would be well received by the Canadian public.” (“To Correspondents.” *The Victoria Magazine* Feb. 1848: 240)

Here, Moodie not only encourages the new contributor but also reaffirms her talent by noting that another editor had selected and praised her work, calling attention to both magazines. Of course, repeated publication stood as the most substantial reward, along with promotion of those authors who became regular contributors.¹⁰⁸

pain that we refuse articles, and with diffidence that we offer advice,—but we receive much pleasure when we see reason to believe that hints have produced good effect” (“To Correspondents.” *The Halifax Monthly Magazine* 1 Mar. 1831: 412).

¹⁰⁸ Yet another example discouraging a potential contributor provides an interesting counterpoint. In his response to “LITERARY” in *The Saturday Reader*, the editor warned, “Our advice is, ‘stick to the warehouse.’ Literature is, at best, an uncertain profession, especially in the young countries. As for fame, it is a perfect ‘Will-o’-the-wisp’ that will lead you a sorry dance, probably to the tune of empty pockets, if

Beyond inviting further contributions, another form of encouragement was to suggest alternative markets. For instance, the editor of *The Amaranth* recommended that “J.B.’s communication is not suitable for the columns of our magazine—the newspaper press of our city is the proper medium for discussing his subject” (“The Amaranth.” *The Amaranth* May 1841: 159) and *The Canadian Literary Journal* counselled OSCAR that “Your article is good but more adapted to a weekly. Declined with thanks, but hope to hear from you again” (“Notices to Correspondents.” *The Canadian Literary Journal* Nov. 1870: 97). By making such suggestions, these editors assisted not only aspiring authors but also the wider editorial community by redirecting new talent.

Editors’ public praise not only provided encouragement but also called attention to their regulars. John Gibson’s editorial columns in *The Literary Garland* routinely praised the efforts of his top contributors Susanna Moodie, E.L.C. (Eliza Lanesford Cushing) and E.M.M. (Elizabeth Mary Maclachlan). *The Canadian Garland* praised its regular writer C.M.D. (Charles Durand, also the most prolific contributor to *The Canadian Casket*) as well as other contributors such as “L.R.” about whom he wondered “L.R. is deficient of late. Shall we hear from him soon?” and “Lorenzo” to whom he wrote “we have fulfilled our promise. We hope he will comply with our wishes—i.e. become a regular correspondent” (“To Correspondents.” *The Garland* 19 Jan. 1833: 79). In another instance, *The Canadian Garland*’s editor pointed to a regular contributor Donna Julia as a model for others, noting on the occasion of her first sketch that “Ah! this is what we wish our authors to turn their attention to. Our thanks, Miss Julia, for thy example” (“To Correspondents.” *The Canadian Garland* 30 Mar. 1823 [sic]: 119). Yet

there be any tune in them” (“Answers to Correspondents.” *The Saturday Reader* 18 Nov. 1865: 176). Clearly, this editor felt he had spotted an opportunist.

these commendations pale in comparison to the praise regularly lavished by the editor of *The Canadian Illustrated News* on a poet named Pamela S. Vining, whom he acknowledged on one occasion by writing, “the poem is received. It comes like the fragrance of fresh flowers; like the riches of ripe fruit; like the news of the golden mines; like the voices of the reapers in harvest; like the music of birds and of happy children (“To Correspondents.” *The Canadian Illustrated News* 20 June 1863: 155). Certainly this is praise that most writers then and since would aspire to receive.

Explaining the Editorial Process

In addition to conveying advice and editorial standards for both poetry and prose, many editors were eager to transmit information regarding the selection and publication process, particularly in the interest of pre-empting questions and complaints. Educating readers and contributors alike had the practical effect of justifying rejections and explaining delays, yet also enabled the editors to boast about production advances or even to convey the drudgeries of the editorial selection process. To begin with the very practical, consider several missives that were strictly informative on subjects ranging from translation to submission policies. In an early issue of *The Quebec Magazine*, the editor asked for contributors to indicate whether they would like their works published in both languages and if so to send copies in each (“Correspondence.” *The Quebec Magazine* Jan. 1793: 397).¹⁰⁹ W.B. Cordier of Montreal’s *The Saturday Reader* informed a contributor named NEMO that “Communications intended for insertion should reach us not later than the Saturday preceding the day of publication, as we go to press early in the week” (“Answers to Correspondents.” *The Saturday Reader* 28 Oct. 1865: 128). This

¹⁰⁹ *The Montreal Museum* also informed readers that French submissions were welcome and would furthermore be considered for translation for English readers (“Correspondence.” *The Montreal Museum* Dec. 1832: 64).

announcement was disseminated more widely by its public appearance. Format and price changes were also conveyed, as when the editor of *The Canadian Magazine* noted that he would reduce the size of his magazine to forty-eight pages and his price in half in response to reader complaints (“To Subscribers for The Canadian Magazine, and to the Public.” *The Canadian Magazine* Apr. 1833: 383).¹¹⁰ Such notes not only informed readers of the change, but showed their editors as responsive to reader concerns.

Editorial notes could also report new content additions. For instance, *The Saturday Reader* mentioned in a note to B.S., TORONTO that “So soon as we have collected the necessary information, we shall commence to publish lists of Masonic meetings, together with other items interesting to the craft” (“Answers to Correspondents.” *The Saturday Reader* 7 Oct. 1865: 80), and in a later issue noted to S.W., “We intend in future to devote more space to reviews of new books. Much obliged for your suggestion; you can best aid us by extending our circulation into your neighbourhood” (“Answers to Correspondents.” *The Saturday Reader* 25 Nov. 1865: 192). With this kind of proactive disclosure, the editor not only alerted the readers to changes but also made them aware that he was open to suggestions and constantly working to improve the publication.

Some editors even advertised specific works soon to appear in print. Editor John Gibson of *The Literary Garland* frequently promoted upcoming serials and even poetry:

We may be excused if we advert to some other of the poetical tributes which enrich our pages for the present month. “The Approach of Insanity” is a startling and vivid picture of a being in the full pride of a noble intellect, writing under a

¹¹⁰ Publisher John Howe made a similar announcement in the fourth volume of *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* when he acknowledged a suggestion from subscribers to reduce the size and price of the magazine (“To the Public.” *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* Jan. 1791: iii-iv).

knowledge of the coming of that terrible malady, which is to pluck his Reason from its throne, and cast him into the depths of unutterable misery and degradation. The language and the thoughts are alike brilliant, powerful, and energetic. The composition, indeed, taken in all its parts, might be owned by any writer of the day, without taking a leaf from his chaplet. ("Our Table." *The Literary Garland* May 1842: 292)

In another instance, the editor of *The Nova Scotia New Monthly Magazine* also made a specific recommendation, of course no doubt intriguing readers with its description:

The tale entitled "The Loved Too Late" we recommend to all young boarding school misses from fifteen to eighteen,—a young gentleman with black eyes who wants to "do" the romantic,—and to all others "whom it may concern;" only as it certainly "piles up" the sentimental to a great height, we should advise young ladies, if they hear *papa* coming during the perusal, to slip it expeditiously under the table cloth. Of the first article, we hope to present a continuation to our readers: the subject is an interesting one. ("Gossip for March." *The Nova Scotia New Monthly Magazine* Mar. 1842: 61)

If the disapproval of racier fiction ran as a common thread through the editorial prefaces, such advertisements suggest that these standards may occasionally have been relaxed for such stories, which sound more racy than chaste.¹¹¹ Yet if editorial communications were

¹¹¹ While these examples notably avoid mentioning style, presumably to avoid a moral critique, the more high-minded *Canadian Monthly and National Review* was quick to call attention to its more virtuous literature in an editorial note that prefaced an upcoming serial translated from its original German: "We throw down the gauntlet to the sensation school of novelists, of which these stories are the very opposites. Rush through 'In the sunshine' as you would through a sensation novel, in haste to arrive at the murder scene, and you will be utterly disappointed: read it with attention and forms of beauty will appear. It appeals, like other stories of the same class, not to the nerves, but to the taste and feelings. The reader will be the better, not the worse, for its perusal" (Untitled Note. *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* Feb. 1872: 152).

also intended covertly to raise reader interest, then certainly these advertisements serve that purpose.

Transparency allowed editors to communicate and presumably try to eliminate the practical frustrations of the editorial process. Legibility seems to have been a major irritant. In *The Literary Garland*, the editor remarked, ““The Story of a Dreamer”” has been received. We cannot yet offer an opinion upon it. It is written in such a confounded scrawl, that we can scarcely read it in a sufficiently connected manner to judge of its real value” (“To Correspondents.” *The Literary Garland* Apr. 1839: 240). Here, Gibson warns that illegibility had its consequences in the fact that potentially acceptable submissions risked being overlooked. In a more general note to correspondents, Robert Shives of *The Amaranth* confessed that “our patience has been severely tried in useless attempts to decipher some of them, which are as unintelligible as the Hieroglyphics of Herculaneum” (“To Correspondents.” *The Amaranth* June 1841: 192). A few issues later, Shives concretized that complaint by noting that “the rejected articles are very numerous,” and proceeded to describe several, including “The Tale without a name, which comprises twenty-five pages of closely-written foolscap, [and] is so imperfectly written as to prevent insertion” (“To Correspondents.” *The Amaranth* June 1841: 192). He then brought the problem into sharper relief by clarifying the ways in which such carelessness put a strain on editorial resources:

The contributors to our Magazine would confer a great favour on us by sending their contributions in a clear and plain hand;—many are rejected merely from our not being able to decipher them; and some we are obliged to transcribe, which frequently requires more time than we can conveniently devote to such purposes.

Many errors which now appear in original articles after they are before the public, could be prevented by very little attention on the part of the authors in writing their contributions in a plain hand, and by paying due observances to punctuation.

(“To Correspondents.” *The Amaranth* June 1841: 192)

Here, Shives emphasizes not only the time consumed by transcription but also the likelihood that errors would be translated into the magazine (a fact borne out by regular notices of *errata* in many magazines). His note effectively transferred responsibility for such errors onto his writers (thus alleviating some of his own responsibility for bad copy).¹¹²

In another editorial note, Robert Shives discussed contributor carelessness more generally:

....we would recommend our correspondents to use greater care, as we are often compelled to devote more time than we can well spend in divesting their productions of such defects, arising from the neglect of the requisite precaution, as unfit them for publication in their first dress; and many that have appeared have undergone strict revision preparatory to insertion, in consequence of improper haste in their authors. We may be, and doubtless are, often mistaken in judging of the merits of original articles; but our duty should be, to reject any article that we do not consider as *good*. (“The Amaranth.” *The Amaranth* May 1841: 159)

¹¹² A problem seldom raised though no doubt equally aggravating was plagiarism. Two examples include an instance in *The Acadian Magazine* in which the editor wrote “We refer R.O. to Pope’s ‘Elegy to the memory of an unfortunate young lady.’ Plagiarism of this kind does not give a very favourable opinion of his poetical talents” (“To Correspondents.” *The Acadian Magazine* Jan. 1828: 280) and in *The Amaranth* when Robert Shives was prompted to write that “The poetry, entitled ‘The Dying Chief,’ which appeared in our last number, as an original contribution, is an extract from a volume of poems, published in England. The gentleman (?) who sent the manuscript to our office, and who, instead of placing his own initials to it, added those of another, is cautioned against trying his plagiarisms in future. We had strong doubts as to the originality of the piece when we gave it a place in our pages” (“To Correspondents.” *The Amaranth* Oct. 1841: 320). Here, the editor’s parenthetical question mark after “gentleman” speaks volumes.

By highlighting the time and effort wasted on poor submissions, Shives emphasizes a real cost and justification for rejection on this basis. His final statement reinforces his editorial standards and confirms that such interventions were always in the interest of readers.

The editor of *The Canadian Illustrated News* echoed Shives' complaints both with regard to legibility in noting that "Dellwn's lively sketch is inserted; but the haste and inaccuracy of his penmanship causes much trouble and uncertainty" and with regards to time wastage as he wrote, "Mr. W., Niagara Falls. Some verses bearing your name led us a year ago to exclaim 'Niagara Falls has at least one Poet'. Why do you send an imperfect fragment and bid us make corrections? We have no time; and if we had nothing else to do, it is undesirable to change an author's words or sentiments ("Editor's Notices." *The Canadian Illustrated News* 6 June 1863: 38). In the second instance, the editor hints at another editorial aggravation, the habit of contributors sending in work that they knew would need fixing and expecting their editors to handle their mistakes. In *The New Dominion Monthly*, editor John Dougall not only emphasized the importance of legibility but went so far as to note that "the paper should be white and firm in texture, and the ink should be black" warning that "poor paper and watered ink are distressing alike to the reader and the printer" ("To Contributors." *The New Dominion Monthly* Mar. 1877: 285-287).

Overstock and consequent delays in publication were further issues discussed in editorial columns. The discussions often put editors on the defensive, likely because of reader complaints. Undoubtedly, John Gibson of *The Literary Garland* must have been motivated at least in part by the need to appease contributors impatient to see their works

in print when he described how an abundance of submissions was causing delays in his workflow:

We have, since the publication of the September GARLAND, received so great a variety of original contributions, that we have experienced some difficulty in selecting from them. The most prominent among those which have been inserted are, the tales by E.L.C. and E.M.M., the productions of whose pens have heretofore been received with so great a share of public favour. (Untitled note, *The Literary Garland* Oct. 1839: 536)

Although the main purpose of his note was to acknowledge overstock, Gibson did not miss the opportunity to praise steady contributors E.L.C. (Eliza Lanesford Cushing) and E.M.M. (Elizabeth Mary Maclachlan), a reference indicating that established contributors might see preferential treatment, particularly if they had been well received by their public.

Overstock was also an issue for *The New Dominion Monthly*, whose editor John Dougall provided some insight into the editorial process with his clarification:

Some explanation is perhaps due to the many kind friends who have favored us with communications, of the non-appearance of their articles for so long a time. The truth is that we have generally a sufficient supply of original matter on hand for several numbers in advance; and, if there is no special reason of haste, the accepted articles are printed in the order in which they were received. Then, again, poems and papers, more particularly suited to certain seasons of the year, coming to hand too late, have to be kept over a year, to the inevitable

disappointment of the sender. (“To Our Contributors.” *The New Dominion Monthly* Oct. 1868: 64)

By sharing these details, editors managed contributors’ expectations and potentially allayed further correspondence in this same vein. This example also brought readers’ attention to the standard practices within the production process, such as publishing articles in the order received, and timing for occasional or holiday submissions.

In his editorial communications, John Dougall of *The New Dominion Monthly* was perhaps one of the most organized editors not only in conveying acceptances and rejections, but also in providing clear submission guidelines and regular updates as to the state of his publication including future plans, circulation details, and other information. In his fourth issue, Dougall devoted an entire page to clearing out submissions, as he listed forty-two pieces submitted to both the magazine and its sister publication, the *Montreal Witness*. The editor first listed thirteen poems that magazine and paper “cannot for various reasons, make room for,” followed by the six poetry acceptances to the *Witness*, plus eight poetry acceptances, six prose rejections, and nine prose acceptances to the *Monthly*. Dougall concluded by noting that:

It will be seen from the above list of 27 pieces of Poetry, and 14 Tales, and articles in prose, besides all that have been inserted, that the publication of the N.D. Monthly has already elicited an amount of Canadian talent that is highly creditable to our country. (“Editors and Publishers Notices.” *The New Dominion Monthly* Jan. 1868: n. pag.)

Dougall proceeded to apologize as well as explain some reasons for the rejections:

It is painful to reject any article upon which much pains and labor have been expended, and which is very respectable in point of ability; but we have not room for all, and any article that is longer than its interest and importance warrants is not likely to obtain insertion in the magazine. (“Editors and Publishers Notices.”

The New Dominion Monthly Jan. 1868: n. pag.)

Dougall also encouraged further submissions, noting that “Several of the writers who have not succeeded this time in obtaining insertion for their articles, are, however, we perceive, quite capable of writing tales and sketches that would be highly acceptable” (“Editors and Publishers Notices.” *The New Dominion Monthly* Jan. 1868: n. pag.). He furthermore included the first of several submission guidelines to appear over the years:

We will be indebted to all correspondents to observe the following rules in future:

1. The manuscript should be written only on one side of the paper, and in as distinct and legible a hand as may be. It should always have the writer’s name and address at the beginning or end, and the date when it was forwarded; and it should have stated upon it whether it is intended for the N.D. MONTHLY or WITNESS, or if the author is willing that it should appear in either.
2. The letter accompanying a manuscript should bear the same date and signature, and give the title of the piece it encloses. Should further letters be written on the same subject, they shou’d refer to the article by name, and repeat the writer’s address. We sometimes do not know whether to reply to writers as Revd. or Esq., or as Miss or Mrs. (“Editors and Publishers Notices.” *The New Dominion Monthly* Jan. 1868: n. pag.)

Issues that followed made slight alterations and additions to these rules, providing clues to new editorial concerns. For instance, subsequent guidelines requested contributors to state whether they wanted manuscripts returned (and if so to add a stamp), to send heavy manuscripts by book post, and to send contributions two months before the date in which they were intended to appear (“Notices to Correspondents.” *The New Dominion Monthly*. Feb. 1868: 320).

By the first issue of the third volume of *The New Dominion Monthly*, further rules had been added: proper names were to be written “with unusual care, so that there may be no possibility of a mistake,” letters relating to subscriptions or advertisements were to be written on separate sheets of paper from submissions intended to reach editors, as “inattention to this rule is often the cause of delays or mistakes.” Dougall additionally noted that:

Editors claim the privilege of making any slight alterations in accepted M.S.S., which may, in their view, be required for the perspicuity of the style, or to preserve the tone of the Magazine. It is also sometimes necessary to cut down communications to a considerable extent, and while we are upon this subject, we would respectfully urge the importance of condensation and brevity in

competition. (“To Our Contributors.” *The New Dominion Monthly* Oct. 1868: 64)

The editor’s response suggests that some contributors may have bristled at having their submissions edited for length and tone. Educating readers on workflow and editorial policies may have had the effect of improving legibility and correctness in submissions. A later, more extended missive in March 1877 addressed contributors directly and discussed everything from legibility to proofreading to style to postage suggestions. For

instance, Dougall noted that letters to the editor were not to be included along with their manuscript since such actions would subject the package to letter postage, and hinted that “with regard to *noms de plume*, such names as ‘Daisy’ and ‘Flora,’ before alluded to, are slightly undignified, and lead the reader to expect a second rate, or school-girl production” (“To Contributors.” *The New Dominion Monthly* Mar. 1877: 285-87). In providing this extensive missive, Dougall not only informed potential contributors about amateur errors but sought to lessen the number of unusable submissions.

In fact, editors could sometimes be transparent to a fault, sharing even their own production errors. For instance, the editor of *The Montreal Museum* asked for a letter from Mrs. Fales of Halifax to be re-sent as it “has been mislaid” (“To Correspondents.” *The Montreal Museum* Dec. 1832: 64) as did *The Amaranth* in his note that “*Asteios* will have to excuse us for not inserting his article—the manuscript has been mislaid” (“To Correspondents.” *The Amaranth* Nov. 1841: 352). Susanna Moodie noted in *The Victoria Magazine* that “The riddles sent to us by our good friend Pioneer have been unaccountably mislaid. Would he favour us with them by the first opportunity that offers” (“To Correspondents.” *The Victoria Magazine* Mar. 1848: 264).

Of course, editors were even more likely to apologize and inform when the issue was beyond their control. In *The Literary Garland*, the editor expressed regret over a mysterious gentleman who had misplaced the periodical’s manuscripts:

We are under the disagreeable necessity of apologising for the non-appearance, in this number, of the continuation of the interesting tale of “Beatrice, or the Spoiled Child,” the manuscripts of which were confided to the care of a gentleman of this city, who, in the multitude of business, suffered the matter to escape his memory.

The annoyance to us from this cause has been extreme, knowing as we do the anxiety with which the tale is looked for by the public. The omission is, however, solely owing to accidental causes, over which neither the author nor the publisher had any control whatever, which to a public proverbially indulgent may be deemed apology sufficient. In our next number the deficiency will be made up.

(Untitled note. *The Literary Garland* May 1841: 288)

In this case, the gentleman was clearly set apart from the editorial team, whose aggravation was made plain.

In *The Amaranth*, Shives addressed correspondents after a fire with a note that “several original articles which were laying in our office at the time of the fire of the 15th November, which were either destroyed or mislaid, will be inserted if the authors would furnish us with copies of the same” (“To Correspondents.” *The Amaranth* Feb. 1842: 64).

In another case, the editor of *The Canadian Casket* mentioned his own ill health as a reason for the “irregular appearance” of his magazine, as well as the “accidental illness of others from whom we expected assistance.” Furthermore, he noted:

We hope that the false and malicious reports of evil minded persons who endeavoured to take advantage of our illness, will be treated with the contempt which they deserve. We neither expect nor intend that this paper shall stop, but should such an event take place, we will ourselves make it known to our subscribers, therefore it will be *quite unnecessary* for those who have made themselves so busy about it do so any more, or for our subscribers to listen to their base misrepresentations. (“The Casket.” *The Canadian Casket* 29 Sept. 1832: 143)

Here, the note provides some insight into the consequences of non-communication, and a window onto the unforgiving nature of those who had the magazine on death watch. By their confessional nature, these missives invite reader understanding and even sympathy.

If missives concerning the editorial process seem to have a defensive edge, notes such as the one above, particularly the reference to the “base misrepresentations” of detractors, provide the reason why. The letters to the editor that do appear suggest that readers were watching and judging every editorial move. Wariness over accusations of partisanship was as evident in subsequent editorial notes as it was in the prefaces, and was frequently cited as a reason for manuscript rejection. Consider several examples: *The Canadian Casket*’s response that “Querist seems to have forgotten that we scrupulously avoid Politics” (“To Correspondents.” *The Canadian Casket* 29 Oct. 1831: 15), *The Canadian Magazine*’s simple announcement that “the paper signed Z, is inadmissible from its party spirit” (“To Correspondents.” *The Canadian Magazine* Jan. 1833: Table of Contents), the message from *Sinclair’s Journal of British North America* noting “We cannot insert the tale forwarded by ‘ONE OF THE LOW IN THE LOWER-TOWN’, because, although well written, it contains many political allusions, which ‘SINCLAIR’S JOURNAL’ has resolved not to have anything to do with” (“To Correspondents.” *Sinclair’s Journal of British North America* 3 Mar. 1849: 7), and *The Saturday Reader*’s reminder to W.J.P., that “The READER has no interest in party politics: and cares but little whether Mr. Brown’s or Mr. Macdonald’s nominee proves successful in a controverted election” (“Answers to Correspondents.” *The Saturday Reader* 11 Nov. 1865: 160). In these instances, the editors not only upheld the mandate they expressed in the prefaces, but made a careful public expression of political neutrality.

Editors must regularly have been called to justify their editorial choices even beyond politics, given the number of general missives on this point. In some cases, they were clearly responding to specific complaints; for instance, when *Amaranth* editor Robert Shives noted that “‘*Calchas*’ will please accept our thanks for his advice, but we need not be told that we are wanting in discernment, because we refused to insert his satirical effusion” (“To Correspondents.” *The Amaranth* Aug. 1841: 256). More often the complaints must have been directed towards the magazine generally, as suggested by editor Peter Sinclair’s string of responses to correspondents, published not long after his magazine had launched:

We are grateful for the kind suggestions contained in the letter of “VERITAS”, and think it true that a public journal should endeavour to please the public. Will our good-natured correspondent take the trouble to remember the old story of the man who in endeavouring to please everybody, pleased nobody.

Mr. W.—You should not be too severe on our first number. Canada is not a hot bed of literature: before you expect perfection in our little plant, give it time to grow, make some allowance for the untried soil and the coldness of the climate.

Mr. B.—We have most gladly availed ourselves of your communication, and shall at all times be pleased to hear from you. We are neither elated by the encouragement we have received, nor frightened by the dash of cold water that some have thought proper to throw on our little journal; we may not be able to command success, but we shall endeavour to deserve it. (“To Correspondents.” *Sinclair’s Journal of British North America* 17 Mar. 1849: 24)

By sharing his responses, the editor attempts to deflect their concerns, and establish his own authority. His inclusion of complaints reveals the feedback he encountered as an editor, and possibly invites the sympathy of readers more partial to the magazine.

In spite of Sinclair's note about pleasing nobody, the need to please everyone was in fact a great challenge of the general interest literary magazine. Again, several examples show the prevalence of this concern. In *The Saturday Reader*, W.B. Cordier reminded a correspondent:

H.A.M. must bear in mind that we have to please a great variety of tastes, and that probably the articles he refers to are to his next door neighbour, amongst the most interesting in the paper. It is our aim to make the contents of the READER as varied as possible. ("Answers to Correspondents." *The Saturday Reader* 28 Oct. 1865: 128)

In *The Provincial*, Mary Jane Katzmann Lawson similarly pondered the challenge of pleasing multiple readers:

We are aware of the difficulty of pleasing every taste; nor can we hope to ever succeed in doing so. One reader will tell us, 'let us have none of that trashy stuff which inundates the American Periodicals: give us solid substantial articles!' A young lady reader informs us in confidence, that 'there is no use taking up the Magazine with cumbrous articles about Telegraphs, &c.—why not give us some more of your tales and sketches: they are pretty and everybody reads them?' Give us short articles and plenty of them,' says a lively young clerk, 'variety is the life of a Magazine!' 'What is the use of giving one a mouthful when he expects a meal?' says a rather testy 'constant reader.' In short, we find that to please

everyone is impossible: so we must content ourselves with supplying what we think will be most likely to minister to the general interest. (“A Few Words to Our Readers.” *The Provincial* Jan. 1853: 2)

While Lawson concludes with a vow to continue to pursue a general editorial mix, in another issue of *The Saturday Reader*, Cordier extended his claim to reveal the editorial consequences of failing to satisfy as many readers:

We need not do more than hint at the great variety of tastes to be catered for. Possibly you are of the sterner sex, and have a decided opinion as to what ought to be the character of the READER. You possess a taste for metaphysical disquisitions—for essays on abstruse themes—for philosophical enquiries into the origin of species, and so forth. All good, very good in their place, but a word in your ear, friend. Were the pages of the READER loaded with articles for your especial delectation, we should soon number our subscribers by the hundreds where we are now able to count thousands. (“A Word from the Editor.” *The Saturday Reader* 18 Mar. 1866: 1)

The editor’s final point affirms why variety is so necessary: it ensures the wide subscriber base essential to survival. In the same missive, the editor concretized his point by addressing other subscribers’ preferences, showing the variety required to please the politician who would eschew “abstruse philosophy” in favour of politics, which he deemed “the life blood of the nation,” or the lady whose “fine sensitive nature delights in poetry” and would not object to “flowing stanzas upon every second page of our paper.”¹¹³

¹¹³ In another issue, the editor noted with greater confidence to “J.W.H., Montreal—Whilst on the one hand a great number of our correspondents are saying ‘Give us tales and light reading,’ others like yourself write,

In one of the most extensive meditations on the editorial process to be found within his or any other magazine of this era, Cordier detailed his progress through the contributors' pile, providing an extended look at its trials and tribulations:

On the charmingest of rose-tinted paper, we have first a note, appealing to the Editor's well known indulgence to ladies, and requesting the favour of the insertion of the accompanying lines in the next issue of the *READER*. We turn to the lines—perhaps they are not very, very bad; and we hesitate between our natural desire to oblige the fair writer, and our sense of duty to the public, until finally, with something like a pang, we consign this contribution to the waste basket. Next we have a manuscript of unconscionable length, with the author's request that the editor will at least read it through before rejecting it. Two hours are wearily occupied in this task, and the waste basket becomes heavier. Here is a letter, indignantly demanding why a former contribution of the writer's was rejected; and hinting strongly that the Editor's judgment must be at fault. Next is an intimation that a certain article, in the previous week's issue of the *READER*, had better have been left out; and following quickly, here is a pleasant letter of commendation, singularly enough referring specially to the very article which gave offense to the writer of the previous letter. Next we have several gratuitous hints thrown out for what the writer conceives to be the better editorial management of the *READER*. Here is an angry request to know why a certain manuscript had not been returned, coupled with the intimation that the writer intends to forward it to some other Editor who would act in a gentlemanly

'We want solid articles—something to think about,' what can we do? Simply use our own judgement" ("Answers to Correspondents." *The Saturday Reader* 23 Dec. 1865: 256).

manner. (The writer of this letter chooses to forget our well-understood rule.)

Next is a well-written article, accompanied by a few modest lines from the author, really pleasant to read; and to crown all, here is a letter from a small town in Upper Canada, suggesting that the READER be transferred to a decided temperance journal, and that then the writer would devote his valuable energies to the extension of its circulation. ("A Word from the Editor." *The Saturday Reader* 10 Mar. 1866, 1)

At this point, the editor suggests he could go on but that readers ought by then to comprehend the demands on his patience. His extensive description elucidates not only the difficulties of pleasing the multitudes, but the inherent personal conflict in the rejection process; for instance, his sympathy for the "ladies" being at odds with his critical duties as editor, or the constant threat of potential criticism from impertinent readers. In his entire submission pile, only one article redeemed the editor's afternoon. For self-interested readers and contributors, such occasional missives had the potential to open their eyes to the editor's workload and potentially foster some patience and sympathy for the editorial process.¹¹⁴

¹¹⁴ Other examples reveal editors under similar duress. Following a letter of complaint, the editor of *The Acadian Magazine* explained "it is a painful part of our editorial duty to reject the well meant, perhaps, but feeble productions we occasionally receive. We assure our correspondents that it goes to our very hearts to condemn the children of their brains: we know with what a paternal eye every man views his own literary bantling, and with what filial affection he regards it, notwithstanding his friends may think it deformed ("To the Editor of The Acadian Magazine." *The Acadian Magazine* Apr. 1828: 398). John Dougall of *The New Dominion Monthly* also recalled the stress of the editor's chair as he wrote, "Some one who had experienced the labors and anxieties of the editorial chair, cried out, in an unguarded moment, that no one who had wit enough to get into the Penitentiary would be an editor. This exclamation we do not endorse, though we can imagine the state of mind which dictated it. That editor, doubtless, had, like us, ten times as much good selected matter on hand as could be got in, with an equal surplus of original matter, still more urgently claiming a place and mostly too good to be rejected" ("Editorial Trials." *The New Dominion Monthly* Jan. 1869: 246). By putting the first comment into the mouth of another editor, Dougall avoided directly commenting on his own editorial situation while still articulating the difficulties of the office.

In the face of disrespect, some editors must have relished having the final word. Editor Peter Sinclair demonstrates this quiet triumph in this note to some presumably abusive contributors:

We have received two or three angry letters from anonymous contributors, expressing their annoyance because their contributions were not published: we beg to assure these gentlemen that we have acted kindly towards them, ourselves, and the public, by consigning their writings to oblivion. ("To Correspondents." *Sinclair's Journal of British North America* 28 Apr. 1849: 71)

In another rejection, the editor of *The British Canadian Review* shamed his contributor even more aggressively over his or her partisanship:

FUROR—Your article is of course rejected. It is evident you are one who has not the interest of this country at your heart, or you would never stoop to the prostitution of the ability you seem to possess as a writer to stir up one section of the people against another. It is impossible to return your manuscript, as it is mislaid. We anticipate the impertinence of your asking for it, which can only equal the impertinence of your sending such a production to the BRITISH CANADIAN REVIEW. ("Answers to Correspondents." *The British Canadian Review* Feb. 1863: 120)

These rare missives reveal the absolute power of the editor and remind readers that such a gatekeeper demanded a certain respect.

Reader to Reader and the Editor's Meditation

A less frequent yet still interesting example of correspondence within magazines was the occasional published exchange between readers. The previous example of A.Z.'s concern for Pollio in *The Nova-Scotia Magazine* is a friendly instance of this interaction.

However, not all exchanges were amiable. For instance, *The Quebec Magazine* saw a volley of letters between two correspondents named Polyhistor and Polycarpus, and *The Halifax Monthly Magazine* saw a disagreement on a philosophical topic between "A" and "Sophos" in which the editor had to go so far as to police the conversation by noting, "We have taken the liberty of removing some phrases from the communication of 'A,' because we think that sarcasm and ridicule should not be allowed to mingle in Philosophical or Scientific discussion" (Untitled note. *The Halifax Monthly Magazine* 1 May 1832: 534). *The Acadian Magazine* saw several such exchanges, one particularly on the finer points of the mathematics of circles. *The Colonial Pearl* contains several instances of readers involving themselves in public debates, addressing both the editors and each other. In one such debate, a contributor felt the need to submit a nasty poem to fellow correspondent "R.R." regarding a disagreement over phrenology, and in another, a long letter from a reader named Marmion agreed with the editor's anti-war stance. These are just a few early examples of the negative reader interaction that was tolerated in the interest of free communication. Of course, in later century magazines, these interactions formalized as established contributors used magazines such as *The Canadian monthly* and *National Review* as a platform to engage with other established writers in debate on issues of public interest.

Many editors also took the opportunity, particularly at anniversaries, to return to the fundamental issues initially addressed in the prefaces. After thanking readers and contributors, editors often used this occasion to reiterate their mandates, articulate future plans, and occasionally crow (modestly of course) about their successes. Some magazines regularly published new prospectuses. Since such meditations occurred in many magazines, a few examples reveal the practice. For instance, at the end of his first volume, John Gibson of the watershed *Literary Garland* took advantage of the opportunity to celebrate literary progress and renew his commitment to the magazine's floral metaphor:

For ourselves, we have earned no credit beyond that of having prepared the soil—other and more skilful hands have trained the flowers whose beauty has adorned it—their generous aid has stripped our task of its toil, and left us little else than to wander among the blossoms they have so profusely scattered, over our editorial pathway. (“To Our Readers.” *The Literary Garland* Nov. 1839: 538)

Yet another watershed publication, *The Canadian Monthly and National Review*, indulged a rarer moment of self-reflection in a preface to its second volume as the proprietor took pride in seeing the publication's major goals accomplished both in its “steadily upward” circulation and in “the appearance among our contributors of members of both the political parties. It shows that our profession of neutrality is felt to be sincere, and that the Magazine is regarded as a suitable place for the impartial discussion of questions relating to the broad interests of our common country” (“Introductory.” *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* July 1872: 1). In these missives, editors most commonly affirmed that they had succeeded in their mandate—and as such these

editorials were reminiscent and directly echoed the themes and rhetoric of the editorial prefaces.

Occasionally, these missives would even celebrate the magazine form itself. John Dougall, who frequently updated readers as to the practical aspects of *The New Dominion Monthly*, wrote an article about “Magazine Literature,” at the beginning of his second volume that celebrated the differences between the newspaper and magazine, noting that “the magazine has quite a different mission from the Newspaper:”

... its objects are to afford a pleasing recreation to cultivated minds, and to promote literary tastes. Its matter will be as interesting after a year or ten years, as at present; and hence, it becomes in a family a mine from which each succeeding member of it may dig treasure. The newspaper, however good, is apt to be torn or lost,—the magazine lies on the parlor table or on the book-shelf from month to month, and year to year, without loss of value. (“Magazine Literature.” *The New Dominion Monthly* Apr. 1868: 2)

More philosophically, early editor A.J. Christie captured yet another quality of magazines in his preface to the fourth volume of *The Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository*:

Periodical publications are the germs of historical details. They catch events as they rise, note them at the moment with strict adherence of fidelity of relation; because, the periodical writer will be afraid to deviate from truth, well knowing that, a detection and immediate refutation would follow from the knowledge of contemporaries, in whose mind every passing event is freshly stamped. (“Preface to the Fourth Volume.” *The Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository* Jan. 1825, n. pag.)

Here, the editor establishes a timeless and prescient definition of the intrinsic strengths of periodicals and their potential as an accurate archive. In noting how periodical writers faced the analysis and refutation of contemporary readers, the editor summarizes some of the issues discussed in this chapter and dissertation, including the magazine's centrality and even accountability to the intellectual community.

CHAPTER 5

Canadian Magazínists

To this point, the dissertation has explored the ways in which editors tried to position their magazines as vehicles for cultural and literary development. With this chapter, the focus shifts to the writers who responded to those editorial calls to become regular magazine contributors. Examining the example of *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*, the previous chapter witnessed how an editor's praise and critical feedback provided encouragement to his most prolific contributor. Yet the writer's own persistence seems equally significant: Pollio's six appearances in the magazine imply that he may have pursued that market more aggressively, demonstrated more talent, worked harder at developing a relationship with the editor, or simply been more productive and available than his contemporaries. So who were the other "Pollios" of nineteenth-century Canadian magazines? Without seeking to privilege magazine publishing above other media as a route to literary success (newspapers could be equally valuable), this chapter uncovers similarly eager contributors. In line with the magazine industry's progression from a series of short-lived magazines produced by amateur writers in the first half of the century to a more consistent and professionalized network of periodicals later on, this investigation divides accordingly into early and late century.

Tracking writers through the magazines is a daunting task, given the industry's discontinuity (particularly in its early years), the sheer bulk of contributors and their relative obscurity (not to mention anonymity), and the challenge of paging through so many volumes in pursuit of authors worth recovering. Although previous magazine dissertations have pointed out some of the more prolific contributors to individual

periodicals, a general awareness of the identities of early magazine contributors among Canadianist scholars seems low. Most basic references to early magazines call attention only to the now-canonical contributors within their pages; for instance, the many references to *The Literary Garland* often list Susanna Moodie, Charles Sangster, John Richardson, and Anna Jameson as representative writers. Although such statements rightly confirm that these now-celebrated literary figures published in the magazine, only Moodie was a particularly substantial contributor, with the result that the observation represents an incomplete picture derived from a present-oriented, canon-centric understanding. Continuing the genre-centric purview of the dissertation by consulting the magazines themselves therefore seems preferable as a means of achieving a deeper insight into the world of magazines, and uncovering a more significant percentage of the actual corps of contributors.¹¹⁵

As the prefaces of the previous chapters reveal, in spite of occasional grumbling about literary indifference, editors were overwhelmingly enthusiastic about their efforts to provide contributors with venues for their literary development in Canada. Taking a cue from this optimistic vision, this chapter highlights early writers who most closely modelled an ideal writerly trajectory through the magazines. For most editors, such a trajectory was presumably epitomized by a writer who would gain his or her first

¹¹⁵ This is not to say that the role of magazine publishing in the careers of individual writers has been completely ignored. As referenced later in the chapter, John Thurston's *The Work of Words: The Writing of Susanna Strickland Moodie* and Carl Ballstadt, Elizabeth Hopkins, and Michael Peterman's comprehensive *Susanna Moodie: Letters of a Lifetime* touch significantly on Moodie's magazine writing, and the publication of such collections as *Forest and Other Gleanings: The Fugitive Writings of Catharine Parr Traill* and *Voyages: Short narratives of Susanna Moodie* has helped to make the magazine writings of these prolific authors more widely available. Early long poems published or reprinted in the magazines have also received some attention and revival; examples include George Longmore's *Tecumthe* (originally published in *The Canadian Review and Literary and Historical Journal* in December 1824) and Oliver Goldsmith's *The Rising Village* (reprinted in *The Canadian Review and Magazine* in February 1826). Adam Hood Burwell, who contributed substantially as a poet to *The Scribbler* under the pseudonym "Erieus," is yet another example of an early author recovered from the magazines.

publication credits in their magazines, becoming thereafter a regular contributor to that title or, even better, to subsequent titles. Even more successful were those writers who made the transition from ephemeral magazine writing to more permanent book publication, eventually achieving literary recognition in their own time and a level of future renown that would reflect positively on the writer, the magazine, and even the nation. While few authors achieved this full trajectory, it is a worthwhile organizing principle to consider writers in descending order of their success. In the latter half of the century, when writers were professionalized and the trajectory more assured, the task becomes more a matter of discerning which authors were the most prolific in using the magazines to develop their craft and reputation.

In practical terms, finding writers worthy of consideration as magazinists is best accomplished by relying on existing magazine indexes to reveal the most prolific contributors. This strategy has the advantage of maximizing the work already put into these indexes¹¹⁶ by expanding their use from their usual function as a reference to a source. Although not every index reveals a prolific writer who rises above the rest (and some reveal several), enough writers emerge to enable some generalizations about magazine contribution. Given the historical and genre-centric emphasis of this study, the focus here will be more descriptive than evaluative in its attempt to reveal and consider

¹¹⁶ Resources for determining prolific authors include Thomas Brewer Vincent's *Index to Pre-1900 English Language Canadian Cultural and Literary Magazines*, as well as his indexes to *The Nova-Scotia Magazine*, *The Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository*, *The Acadian Magazine*, *The Amaranth*, and *The Provincial, or Halifax Monthly Magazine*. Mary Markham Brown's *An Index to the Literary Garland* is the primary source for that periodical, as is Marilyn Flitton's *Index to The Canadian Monthly and National Review (1872-1882)*, and D.M.R. Bentley's *Checklist of Literary Materials in The Week (Toronto, 1883-1896)*. The fact that Vincent's database is currently inaccessible due to the much needed upgrade from its obsolete DOS-based platform meant led me to rely on the more accessible paper-based indexes as my primary sources, using the database as a secondary cross-reference to verify these sources and to investigate magazines without indexes. As I mentioned in an earlier note, I recently learned that this database is expected to be soon resurrected online.

as a whole the identities and types of writers who contributed regularly to the magazines. In order to keep the writers themselves in the foreground, the tallies that substantiate their prolific contributions are included mostly in footnotes. Of course, prolific contribution is not necessarily an indicator of literary ability, given the numerous factors (relative productivity or editorial favouritism, to name just a few)¹¹⁷ that may have contributed to a writer's frequent appearance, yet it is not insignificant that these more prolific by-lines represent a glimpse into editorial choices. In any case, this approach is just that—a starting point intended to inspire further exploration of these magazines and their contributors.¹¹⁸

The Early Period to Mid-Century

In spite of the editorial enthusiasm revealed in previous chapters, the discontinuity of the early industry inhibited its viability as a medium for writerly development. The relatively short lifespan of most early magazines limited the window through which writers could pursue publication in a single title, and sporadic successors meant waiting sometimes years for a next opportunity, which no doubt led many writers to abandon their creative pursuits as youthful interests. As Mary Lu MacDonald pointed out in assessing writers to 1850, “the economic reality of the colony precluded a life devoted solely to literature” (36). In spite of these challenges, several writers emerged as prolific contributors to

¹¹⁷ Furthermore, struggling magazines were arguably in the habit of preserving the status quo rather than seeking out the avant-garde, so prolific standbys potentially fed expectations rather than forging literary innovation. Lastly, domestic writers not appearing in Canadian magazines may have been pushing their wares more ambitiously to newspapers with greater circulation, or foreign periodicals as explored in Nick Mount's *When Canadian Literature Moved to New York*.

¹¹⁸ Although this chapter examines singularly prolific authors, on occasion groups of contributors emerged as relatively equally productive within a single magazine. Examples include *The Canadian Magazine* (1833), *The Amaranth* and *Barker's Canadian Monthly Magazine*. While it would be over-reaching to label these as coteries given the difficulty in knowing whether these writers socialized beyond their shared pages, the more prolific would likely have been aware of and even have read each other's work (and were sometimes communally thanked by their editors).

individual titles. This section investigates those writers in descending order of their proximity to the ideal writerly trajectory outlined above, looking first at Susanna Moodie and Rosanna Leprohon as examples of authors who were both prolific magazinists and authors of renowned book-length works. Following these most successful examples, the chapter considers a handful of writers who emerged as prolific magazinists, yet remain relatively obscure today. Finally, the chapter examines writers who began as promising contributors to a single title but whose trajectories as Canadian authors were interrupted by external factors such as death, immigration, or more elusive reasons.

Susanna Moodie (1803-85)

As one of the most canonical nineteenth-century Canadian writers, Susanna Moodie (née Strickland) barely requires an introduction. Yet to examine her presence in the magazines is to confirm her reputation and productivity, and to affirm “magazinist”¹¹⁹ among her Canadian literary identities. Not only does she emerge as the top contributor to early Canada’s celebrated *Literary Garland*, but she also contributed to or had her poems reprinted in titles such as *The Canadian Magazine* (Jan.-Apr.1833), *The Canadian Literary Magazine* (Apr.-Oct. 1833), *The Amaranth* (1841-43), *The Maple Leaf* (1847-49), *The Calliopean* (1847-48), and *The Anglo-American Magazine* (1852-55). She showed great longevity by appearing even in later century titles such as *The British American Magazine* (1863-64), *The Canadian Literary Journal* (1870-71), *Belford’s Monthly Magazine* (1876-78), and *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* (1872-

¹¹⁹ “Magazinist” was a term invented by Edgar Allan Poe, himself an important magazinist (Wood 64).

82).¹²⁰ She furthermore founded, edited and wrote much of *The Victoria Magazine* (1847-48).

From the literary Strickland family, in which five out of six sisters and a brother pursued writing careers, Susanna and her sister Catharine (Parr Traill) are celebrated for their Canadian tales of early emigrant life. Susanna's elder sister Agnes achieved renown in Britain (along with her sister Elizabeth) for writing about the lives of the queens of England. First published alongside her sisters in the British women's magazines and annuals of the 1820s, Susanna Strickland moved to London, published her first book of poetry (*Enthusiasm*), and married in 1831. She then emigrated with her new husband John Wedderburn Dunbar Moodie and settled first near Cobourg, then outside Peterborough, and finally in Belleville in Upper Canada. Moodie's most famous book, *Roughing It in the Bush*, was published in 1852, followed by *Life in the Clearings* (1853) and other works. Her husband was also an author and contributor to Canadian periodicals (including eight original insertions in *The Literary Garland*), as was her sister Catharine Parr Traill, who had thirteen insertions in *The Literary Garland* and also published in subsequent journals such as *The Anglo-American Magazine*.¹²¹

Moodie's centrality to early Canadian literature is already indisputable and her presence in *The Literary Garland* well known. Moodie's magazine publishing is documented through such sources as Carl Ballstadt, Elizabeth Hopkins, and Michael Peterman's comprehensive *Susanna Moodie: Letters of a Lifetime* and John Thurston's

¹²⁰ Moodie's appearance in these titles is confirmed (and the more obscure ones discovered) by searching her name as a keyword in the Vincent database. This source is used to find works by author throughout the chapter.

¹²¹ Strickland sisters Agnes and Jane also contributed once and three times respectively to *The Literary Garland*. Catharine Parr Traill is listed in the Vincent database as a prolific contributor to *The Anglo-American Magazine* with 14 insertions, as well as to *The Canadian Methodist Magazine*, the *Canadian Gem and Son of Temperance*, *The Maple Leaf*, *The Victoria Magazine*, *The Canadian Monthly and National Review*, and *Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly and National Review*.

The Work of Words: The Writing of Susanna Strickland Moodie. Prior to immigration, Moodie started out by writing poetry and sketches for British magazines including *La Belle Assemblée*, the *Athenaeum*, and the *Lady's Magazine*, as well as gift-books and annuals (Thurston 41). In his article "In Search of Agnes Strickland's Sisters," which annotates the *Letters* project, Michael Peterman enumerates the periodicals to first publish Moodie upon her arrival in Canada, including the New York *Albion*, the Cobourg *Star*, *The Canadian Magazine*, *The Canadian Literary Magazine*, and the *North American Quarterly Magazine*.¹²²

Even more significant is Moodie's trajectory through these publications, with its clear indications of her agency in the publishing process. Moodie's poems appeared anonymously in the Cobourg *Star* even before her immigration, likely passed along by her brother Samuel (Thurston 83). In 1833, Moodie wrote to the editor of the New York *Albion* and, as a result, made several contributions to that publication (Thurston 84). These first approaches seem to have snowballed: *The Canadian Magazine* credits the *Albion* origin in reprinting her poem "The Sleigh-Bells" in its third issue (Mar. 1833: 273). The York-based *Canadian Magazine* ended in April 1833, but when *The Canadian Literary Magazine* started that same month (also in York), three Moodie contributions appeared in its first issue. And as *Letters of a Lifetime* notes, it was Moodie's appearance in *The Canadian Literary Magazine* that caught American poet Sumner Lincoln Fairfield's attention as he travelled through Canada. Not only did he print her poetry in his own *North American Magazine*, but he also praised her as "one of that beautiful and

¹²² Peterman notes that close to 170 poems were published in various periodicals, and cites various American archives as excellent sources for following the trail of her works (many pirated) through American magazines (123). Peterman credits Ballstadt's unpublished doctoral thesis, "The Literary History of the Stricklands," as a starting point for his investigation.

brilliant constellation which has shed much glory on the British name; she is one of that bright band who have exalted the female character and adorned human nature” (Ballstadt et al., *Letters* 76).¹²³ Thus, in spite of *The Canadian Literary Magazine*’s short lifespan, its impact on Moodie’s career (and she was just one of the authors to benefit from its exposure) highlights the importance of such domestic publishing platforms.¹²⁴ Further evidence shows Moodie’s work being reprinted in many newspapers and magazines: for instance, as far away as New Brunswick, editor Robert Shives reprinted her poems “The Banner of England” (May 1841: 151 - attributed to Susan Moodie) and “The Maiden’s Enquiry” (Dec. 1841: 362) in *The Amaranth*. Each poem is credited as originating in *The Literary Garland*.

Indeed, *The Literary Garland* with its dozen-year lifespan proved to be the most consistent platform of Moodie’s career. Mary Markham Brown’s *An Index to The Literary Garland*¹²⁵ lists 168 Moodie works in the magazine, 133 of which were marked original and over half of which are prose fiction. Such numbers are even more impressive by the fact that they almost double the number of insertions made by the second most prolific contributor, Eliza Lanesford Cushing, who made 90 insertions.¹²⁶ Moodie’s

¹²³ Fairfield published 11 of Moodie’s poems in the *North American Magazine*, sometimes called the *North American Quarterly Magazine*, from 1834-36, at which time he lost control of the magazine (*Letters* 76).

¹²⁴ While this chapter is focussed on magazine publication, Moodie also published extensively in newspapers. Thurston notes that she took advantage of the climate around the Rebellions to publish several patriotic poems, and contributed afterwards to Tory papers such as the Kingston *Chronicle and Gazette*, the Bytown *Gazette*, and the St Catharine’s *Journal* (88).

¹²⁵ While Mary Markham Brown’s *Index* is the main point of reference for all of *The Literary Garland* tallies, where applicable, her numbers are cross-referenced with the Vincent database. When using Brown’s *Index*, I counted each insertion of a serial separately as these presumably could have been discontinued at any time.

¹²⁶ By the numbers, the most prolific *Garland* contributors according to the Brown *Index* are Susanna Moodie with 168 insertions, Eliza Lanesford Cushing with 90 insertions, Rosanna Leprohon with 60 insertions, Hugh E. Montgomerie (“Edmond Hugomont”) with 52 insertions, Elizabeth Mary MacLachlan (“E.M.M.”) with 49 insertions, Miss T.D. Foster with 42 insertions, Mrs. Harriet V. Cheney with 38 insertions, James Haskins (“Dr. Haskins”) with 25 insertions, James Holmes with 25 insertions, Miss M. Hungerford with 21 insertions, M. with 21 insertions, Andrew Picken with 19 insertions, A.J. with 17

appearance in *The Literary Garland* begins at the magazine's launch and lasts until its closure. Her works are included in almost every issue, from occasional poems to sketches to several serials. The serials include: *Geoffrey Moncton*, *The Royal Election: A Tale...from Poland*, *The First Debt: A Tale of Every Day*, *Mark Hurdlestone*, *Richard Redpath*, *Mildred Rosier: A Tale of the Ruined City*, *Matrimonial Speculations*, *Monica; or, Witchcraft*, *Canadian Sketches*, *Jane Redgrave: A Village Story*, *Trifles from the Burthen of a Life*, and *Noah Cotton: A Tale of Conscience*. Moodie later turned several of these works into books.¹²⁷

To investigate Moodie's *Garland* contributions more closely is to witness a professional at work, focussed not only on literary development but also on turning her work into a paying career. In *The Work of Words*, John Thurston delves into Moodie's *Garland* works to explain that almost half of Moodie's more than one hundred contributions are reprints,¹²⁸ with nineteen of the remaining poems dealing with Canadian subjects and forty-one maintaining a focus on European topics. Nineteen poems from Moodie's poetry collection *Enthusiasm* reappear in the *Garland*, three of them twice, and she completed versions of several of her *Garland* stories in England (Thurston 90). Thurston also notes how this pattern of reprinting continued in Moodie's own *Victoria*

insertions, and W.P.C. from Williamstown with 14 insertions. The Vincent database approximates these numbers fairly closely, listing the above authors as follows: Moodie 177, Cushing 87, Leprohon 61, Montgomerie 32, Maclachlan 50, Foster 30, Cheney 37, Haskins 27, Holmes 26, Hungerford 21, M. 21, Picken 25, A.J. 16, and W.P.C. 19. In the case where the discrepancies are more substantial such as with Montgomerie or Cheney, the most common explanation is that the Vincent database listed a translated serial under the name of the original author rather than the translator.

¹²⁷ These include *Mark Hurdlestone* (London, 1853); *Matrimonial Speculations* (London, 1854); and *Geoffrey Moncton* (New York, 1855).

¹²⁸ This obviously differs from the *Brown Index* which notes poems marked original in the magazine with an asterisk and lists only 35 as reprints. Indeed, Mary Lu MacDonald in her article "An Index To *The Literary Garland* Updated" (in which among other notes she adds two Moodie poems and one Haskins poem previously left out of the index), counsels students of the magazine to be wary of accepting all the Moodie works as original since some marked as such were reprints (80). However, the fact that more Moodie poems were reprints does not diminish the prolific nature of her appearance in the magazine.

Magazine. As he points out, “not only did she rely on British models when submitting work, but half the time she relied on poems and stories pre-approved by a British audience” (90). While possibly disappointing to literary scholars seeking innovation, the fact that so many of Moodie’s stories had been pre-approved and featured old-world settings and subjects confirms her as a pragmatic professional with a shrewd eye for satisfying the prescribed format of a periodical that would prove such a reliable constant in her writing career.

Furthermore, a penchant for recycling signals a busy writer’s need to maximize her existing resources. Moodie said as much in her introduction to *Mark Hurdlestone* (reprinted in Robert L. McDougall’s edition of *Life in the Clearings*) when she noted that “Time to me was money—it belonged by right to my family, and was too valuable a commodity to give away” (286). This attitude is confirmed by other expressions in this vein, including her delight at being invited to negotiate payment with John Lovell for her work in *The Literary Garland*,¹²⁹ and her letter to writer Louisa Murray, in which she urged the newcomer to demand payment for her writing (Ballstadt et al., *Letters* 99). Reprinting was a part of this process, as was the inclination to keep the subject matter of much of her early work within the norms demanded by the publishers of her day. Her rigorous pursuit of publishing opportunities and willingness to cater to various markets is also well documented, from her first letter to the editor of the New York *Albion*, to her opportunistic submission of patriotic poems to various newspapers at the moment of the Rebellions (Thurston 87), to the fact that her most famous books met an existing demand for immigrant stories. Such practical pursuits are the mark of a professional writer

¹²⁹ Moodie documented Lovell’s offer to pay contributors in her introduction to *Mark Hurdlestone*, calling his willingness to let her set her own terms “a generosity unusual in this country” (286). Moodie noted that she requested five pounds per sheet, and earned 20 to 40 pounds a year (290).

interested in developing consistent markets and making connections with the potential to lead to further opportunities.¹³⁰

In the years that followed the demise of her own *Victoria Magazine* and *The Literary Garland*, Moodie moved more definitively into book publishing. Yet she continued to publish in magazines even into the later century, including Canadian magazines such as *The British American Magazine* (1863-64), *Belford's Monthly Magazine* (1876-78), and *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* (1872-82).¹³¹ In 1852, she also began to cultivate a relationship with Richard Bentley, publisher of *Bentley's Miscellany*, who became her publisher. As a writer, she demonstrated professionalism by treating publication as a job, sending out letters to editors to request their inclusion of her poems and regularly insisting on payment for her work. She was also quickly identified as a professional, for example by Sumner Lincoln Fairfield, who discovered her through the magazines, and by John Lovell, who made initial contact with her based on her existing reputation. Even though her dissatisfaction with less than perfect reviews of her books from Canadian authors led her to vow in a letter to her sister in 1854 that "I never mean to write for a Canadian paper or magazine again, after their unjust abuse of me" (Ballstadt et al., *Letters* 152), her use of the magazines (and newspapers), particularly the longstanding *Garland*, as a market to develop an audience and material later published as books was undeniably fruitful. In her professionalism, Moodie exemplified the most successful possible trajectory for a magazine writer, not

¹³⁰ Thurston furthermore notes that while large sections of *Roughing It in the Bush* and *Life in the Clearings* were written expressly for the books, of the 47 poems included only five were not already written (91).

¹³¹ In addition to noting Moodie's 177 items in *The Literary Garland*, the Vincent database lists her work as appearing in *The Canadian Magazine* at York (1), *The Canadian Literary Magazine* (6), *The Amaranth* (2), *The Maple Leaf* (3), *The Victoria Magazine* (54), *The Calliopean* (1), *Belford's Monthly Magazine* (8), *The Anglo-American Magazine* (1), *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* (2), and the *Presbyterian College Journal* (1).

only by her extreme productivity but also by her astute navigation through multiple magazines and editorial relationships.

Rosanna Leprohon (1829-79)

Although Susanna Moodie's longstanding contributorship to the most successful early periodical and her shrewd pursuit of publication through multiple markets made her the epitome of a successful magazinist, her arrival in Canada as a published author meant that she transplanted existing skills to a new locale. Perhaps even more consistent with the editorial vision described in the prefaces was a writer whose career paralleled Moodie's trajectory, but whose raw talent was first captured by a Canadian magazine at the very outset of her career. Rosanna Leprohon exemplifies this ideal.

Born in Montreal, Rosanna Eleanor Leprohon, née Mullins ("M" or "R.E.M.")¹³² made her first contributions to *The Literary Garland* at the age of seventeen, and continued to publish in magazines throughout her career. She furthermore used the connections she made through magazines to transition into the more durable realm of book publishing. Following an education at the Convent of the Congregation of Notre Dame, Mullins married Dr Jean-Lucien Leprohon, with whom she had thirteen children and participated in a relatively aristocratic social circle that inspired the background of her later fiction (*Dictionary of Canadian Biography (DCB) Online*, Stockdale). Although Leprohon's most celebrated novel is arguably *Antoinette de Mirecourt; or, Secret Marrying and Secret Sorrowing* (1864), she also published a poetry collection and wrote several other novels, many of which were first serialized and later found their way into book form. Leprohon stands out as the third most prolific *Literary Garland* contributor

¹³² The unpublished MA thesis of A.-H. Deneau, "Life and works of Mrs. Leprohon," Université de Montréal (1949) is regularly cited as a source of information on Leprohon.

with 60 insertions,¹³³ all but two of which are marked as original, and two-thirds of which are prose and the rest poetry. The fact that Leprohon only began contributing in 1846 (compared with Moodie, whose contributions date from 1839) makes her tally even more impressive, as does her youth. Leprohon's works in *The Literary Garland* include five serialized novels: *The Stepmother*, *Ida Beresford; or, The Child of Fashion*, *Florence Fitz-Hardinge; or Wit and Wisdom*, *Eva Huntingdon*, and *Clarence Fitz-Clarence; Passages from the Life of an Egoist*.

Leprohon's appearance in *The Literary Garland* may have launched her literary career in the early part of the century, but her magazine publishing continued for several decades. In their profile on Leprohon in *Silenced Sextet*, Lorraine McMullen and Elizabeth Waterston note that she was also encouraged to submit her poetry to the *True Witness* and *Montreal Pilot* (24).¹³⁴ Following *The Literary Garland*'s closure in 1851, and after several years away from writing, presumably to focus on bearing and raising her large family, Leprohon returned to magazine publishing in 1859 with a serialized novel, *Eveleen O'Donnell*, in the Roman Catholic weekly *Boston Pilot*, which would have been widely read in Montreal (McMullen and Waterston 28).

McMullen and Waterston track Leprohon's further serializations, including her novel *The Manor House of Villeraie* (the first of a trilogy of titles to deal with French Canada) in the *Montreal Family Herald* in 1859, *Armand Durand* in Lovell's *Montreal Daily News* in 1868, *Ada Dunmore* in *The Canadian Illustrated News* in 1869, and a

¹³³ The Vincent database records this number as 61, and additionally notes publications in *The British American Magazine*, *The Canadian Monthly and National Review*, and *The New Dominion Monthly*.

¹³⁴ McMullen and Waterston provide excellent biographical detail as well as extensive literary analysis of Leprohon's serialized novels, and rightly express surprise that her work is not better known, considering its readability. They argue that her "relative obscurity raises questions about the critical standards of academic scholars and editors, especially as they apply to the women writers who satisfied so large an audience in their own time" (15). Indeed, the same questions ought equally to be extended to other neglected authors (both male and female) publishing in the magazines.

story called “Clive Weston’s Wedding Anniversary” in *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* in 1872 (31-46). She also published short stories in several of these magazines. Leprohon furthermore contributed poetry to the *Journal of Education*, *The Saturday Reader*, and the *Hearthstone*, among others (McMullen and Waterston 46). Her novels *Ida Beresford*, *The Manor House of Villerai*, and *Antoinette de Mirecourt* were all translated into French and serialized in *L'Ordre* magazine. Leprohon clearly parlayed her magazine relationships into book publication, given that novels such as *Antoinette de Mirecourt* and *Armand Durand* were published as books by John Lovell, the same publisher who had serialized them in his magazines and newspapers. That her works were translated into French made her one of the few authors to cross between English and French-Canadian literature (McMullen and Waterston 49).

Leprohon’s sheer output (particularly given her family obligations and active social status) attest to a dedication to literary endeavour as well as the discipline to pursue publication (and to be pursued by eager editors) not only in *The Literary Garland* but in later magazines. That her early novels in *The Literary Garland* are set in the same upper-class British society featured by other authors suggests that, like Moodie, she shrewdly observed the work published in magazine pages to ensure that her contributions fit conventional patterns, thus establishing her reputation before venturing to set future novels more adventurously in Canadian locales. Leprohon’s success in building this reputation is evident from the fact that, as McMullen and Waterston note, future serials were solicited by the editors of *The Family Herald* and *The Canadian Illustrated News* (31). They also note her growing renown in Montreal literary circles, as evidenced by her connections with John Lovell, writer and politician Thomas D’Arcy McGee (who was

her neighbour), and *Montreal Gazette* literary editor and poet John Reade, who would edit her posthumous poetry collection (McMullen and Waterston 31).

Both Moodie and Leprohon stand as significant magazinists who established reputations not only in one periodical but through several magazines. Both successfully transitioned to book publication, a fact which likely helped them to establish more lasting literary reputations. No doubt these authors were aided by the good fortune that *The Literary Garland*, which published their early work, turned out to be the most longstanding and reliable market of that era, providing each woman with sufficient time to develop a readership and establish a reputation. Beyond *The Literary Garland*, both writers shared several common opportunities; for instance, they were both invited to submit to additional magazines based on their initial published work.

Moodie and Leprohon also differed in several ways; for instance, in the fact that Moodie began her writing career before leaving England, whereas Leprohon built her entire career in Canada. They also inhabited very different milieus in rural Upper Canada and urban Montreal, locations that are reflected in the settings of their most significant works. Unlike Leprohon, Moodie ventured into editorship herself with the publication of *The Victoria Magazine* in 1847, where, as McMullen and Waterston observe, she praised Leprohon by noting that “she may become the pride and ornament of a great rising country” (21). As well as illustrating Moodie’s well-documented support for younger writers, such sentiments echo the ambitions of many magazine editors to promote the development of youthful literary aspirants.

Successful but Obscure Magazínists

Although Moodie and Leprohon are among the most canonical authors to appear as prolific early Canadian magazinists (many other now-canonical authors appeared in early magazines, but less frequently), many minor authors followed a similar trajectory through multiple magazines. Examples of writers who distinguished themselves as prolific contributors in one magazine and then continued to publish through subsequent Canadian magazines include Charles Durand in *The Canadian Casket* (1831-32) and *The Canadian Garland* (1832-33), Diana Bayley in *The Montreal Museum* (1832-34), W. Arthur Calnek in *The Amaranth* (1841-43), and Amelia Clotilda Jennings in *The Provincial, or, Halifax Monthly Magazine* (1852-53). Even though these authors did not achieve the same lasting renown as Moodie and Leprohon, they otherwise shared a similar trajectory and are therefore interesting to consider as representatives of the early corps of magazine writers whose energies as contributors matched that of the editors calling out to them from the prefaces. These writers are considered in chronological order of the first magazine in which they appeared prolifically.

Charles Durand (1811-1905)

Charles Durand (“Briton,” “C.M.D.”) emerged as the most prolific contributor to *The Canadian Casket* (1831-32), a semi-weekly Hamilton magazine edited by John Gladwin. Identified by handwritten marginalia as Charles Durand, “Briton” made 12 insertions between the magazine’s inaugural edition in the fall of 1831 and its demise in August 1832. With over twice as many insertions as the next most prolific contributor (E.W.H.E.), Briton’s works ranged from poetry, with titles such as “For the Poles,” “The Hermit’s Prayer,” “The Suicides’ Grave,” and “On the Death of a Beautiful Child,” to

articles, titled “Genius and Talent,” “The Principle of Life,” and “Instinct in Animals,” and stories titled *An Indian Legend* (incomplete serial) and “Jane Somers.” Durand contributed even more substantially to *The Canadian Garland* (1832-33) under the initials “C.M.D.” (and once as “Briton”) with 26 insertions, mostly of poetry and fiction. He then contributed six insertions as “C.M.D.” mostly published in 1849 to the *Canadian Son of Temperance and Literary Gem*, which he later owned and edited from 1851-54.

In *Literature and Society in the Canadas 1817-1850*, MacDonald provides biographical details on several obscure early writers including Durand. She notes that Durand was born near Hamilton and that his father was a military captain who fought at Queenston and became a member of the Upper Canada Legislature from 1814 to 1822 and registrar of the counties of Halton and Wentworth (Durand’s brother James was also a reform member of the Legislature). Becoming a barrister in 1836, Charles Durand practiced in Hamilton, but on suspicions aroused during the Rebellions was convicted of treason in 1838, condemned to death, and exiled. He then practised law in Chicago until 1844, at which time he returned to Canada and resumed his practice as a lawyer in Toronto (MacDonald 305). Late in the century, Durand published a memoir called *Reminiscences of Charles Durand of Toronto, Barrister* (1897) recalling his experiences as a political prisoner, a major source for background information on his life.¹³⁵

For Durand, who was born in 1811, *The Canadian Casket*’s appearance in 1831, when he was only twenty years old, would have provided his first opportunity for publication, an interest that he pursued for the rest of his life, as evidenced by his

¹³⁵ George Fetherling’s relatively recent article in *Books in Canada* (“A Bitter Exile: Charles Durand and the Mackenzie-Papineau Rebellions,” *Books in Canada* May 1994: 61) provides a neat recapitulation of Durand’s experiences as described in his *Reminiscences*, including his having unwittingly being caught in the Battle of Yonge Street, then subsequently arrested on suspicion of being a spy, followed by a prison term and six-year exile.

becoming editor in his forties and publishing his memoir at age eighty-six. The variety of work he published in *The Casket* shows him experimenting with numerous genres, including poetry, articles, and fiction. His memoir provides further details about his poetic impulses, other writing markets, and his editorship of the *Canadian Son of Temperance and Literary Gem*. Some of Durand's *Casket* and *Garland* poems are reprinted in the memoir, along with background for example on the "Suicide's Grave" poem and a poem called "The Poles," based on the Russian-Polish conflict of 1830. Durand notes in the memoir that he also wrote articles and letters for the *Hamilton Free Press*, *Globe*, and *Examiner*, and provides details about his own paper, for which he claimed a circulation in 1851 of about 4,000 (Durand 469).

Like Leprohon, Durand's creative impulses found early outlets in magazines, yet the fact that these markets dried up relatively quickly may have left the author without sufficient venues to practice his craft. His occupation as a barrister and his involvement and exile around the 1837 Rebellions no doubt also provided further distractions from a literary path, although his return to editorial work at later points emphasizes a consistent interest in publishing. Durand left a final legacy in the form of a daughter, Laura Durand, who became a journalist for the *Globe* in the later century and whose work was highly praised by late-century journalist John Willison in Henry Morgan's *Types of Canadian Women* (99).

Diana Bayley

Diana Bayley (Mrs. H. Bayley, "D.B") was the most prolific contributor to *The Montreal Museum* (1832-34), with 12 insertions (eight as Mrs. Bayley, four as "D.B") in 12

issues.¹³⁶ She wrote mostly fiction for the magazine, as well as a few pieces of poetry and a couple of pieces of non-fiction prose. At first, Bayley's stories were attributed only as "By a Lady, the Author of 'Tales of the Heath, Scenes at Home and Abroad, &c.'" Her work includes fiction such as "Enthusiasm, or Female Friendship," and "The Discovery or the Marriage Prevented," and non-fiction such as "Female Education" and "A West Indian Sketch." In the ninth issue, the author was further identified as "D.B." with the date and location of "Île aux Noix" (a Quebec town along the Richelieu River). By the eleventh issue, editor Mary Graddon Gosselin publicly thanked Bayley in an editorial note, which provides further information about the author:

The editor of the Montreal Museum takes this opportunity of offering her grateful thanks to Mrs. H. Bayley, a lady well known in the literary world, for the productions with which she has several times enriched the pages of the Museum; the present number contains an article equalling the preceding in merit. We have the more reason for grateful feeling toward Mrs. Bayley knowing her to be almost constantly employed, either in completing a series of Moral Tales, she is about publishing in New York, or in writing in prose or verse for the London Literary Periodicals. We hope soon to be enabled to give a review and extracts from some of her works published in England. (Untitled note. *The Montreal Museum* Oct. 1833: 706)

Bayley later contributed ten works to *The Literary Garland* in the form of three serials, and is noted in Henry Morgan's *Bibliotheca Canadensis* as a contributor to the English and American literary press and as the author of several books, including *Tales of the*

¹³⁶ Bayley's *Montreal Museum* insertions are tallied from the Vincent database, and her insertions in *The Literary Garland* from the Brown Index.

Heath (1825), *Employment the True Source of Happiness* (1825), *Scenes at Home and Abroad* (1827), and *Improvement; or a Visit to Grandmamma* (1832), a work for children (22). She also published *Henry; or, the Juvenile Traveller* (1836).

MacDonald provides further biographical detail on Bayley, noting that her husband Henry Addington Bayley was an officer in the Commissariat stationed at Île aux Noix, Lower Canada, and that she was referenced in *The Montreal Gazette* as the mother of the British poet F.W.N. Bayley (299), whose work also appeared twice in *The Montreal Museum*.¹³⁷ Bayley's prolific appearance in *The Montreal Museum* establishes her as a contributor to local publications, and yet the editor's note about her contributions to British and American periodicals piques further interest as to her success as a writer for foreign markets, particularly given her self-identity as a "wife of a British Officer, Resident in Canada" on the title page of *Henry or, the Juvenile Traveller*. Her son F.W.N. Bayley saw even greater success as an author and editor, becoming the first editor of the *Illustrated London News* established in 1842 (*Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* 442). Like the other authors under consideration here, Bayley appeared in multiple magazines, although it is unclear when she began contributing or when her writing career may have ended. Like Durand, she also left a legacy in the form of the son who followed in her literary footsteps.

¹³⁷ MacDonald's article "*The Montreal Museum*, 1832-34: The Presence and Absence of Literary Women" indicates that the Bayleys lived in Barbados from 1825-29, at Île aux Noix in the 1830s, in Montreal in 1837-38 where Bayley was Deputy Assistant Commissary-General, and in Sorel in 1843 (148).

W. Arthur Calnek

Although relatively obscure today, William Arthur Calnek first drew attention to himself as the third most prolific contributor to *The Amaranth* (1841-43),¹³⁸ with fourteen insertions under the pseudonym “Arthur.” He also seems likely to be “W.A.C.,” who published five insertions in *The Provincial, or, Halifax Monthly Magazine* (1852-53). Perhaps more remarkably, Calnek also resurfaced as a prolific contributor under his given name to *Stewart’s Literary Quarterly Magazine* (1867-72), with six insertions, and as a major contributor to Montreal’s *The New Dominion Monthly* (1867-79) with eighteen insertions, both some thirty years after his appearance in *The Amaranth*. In spite of his presence in the periodicals, Calnek is absent from most reference books, including Henry Morgan’s *Bibliotheca Canadensis* and *The Canadian Men and Women of the Time* as well as from the *Dictionary of Canadian Biography* and *Dictionary of Literary Biography: Canadian Writers Before 1890*.

Fortunately, a preface in Calnek’s posthumously published *History of the County of Annapolis* includes a biography compiled by editor A.W. Savary (who mentions that Calnek’s son had hired him to complete the manuscript). Educated at the Collegiate School in Windsor, Nova Scotia, Calnek became a teacher, a land-surveyor, and then an editor of county newspapers. A member of the Nova Scotia Historical Society, Calnek is described by Savary as having a “genial and kindly disposition and while of strong political convictions, moderate and considerate in his expression of them, a loyalist and a patriot” (Calnek viii). Noting the author’s failing health in later years, Savary reprinted an

¹³⁸ The most prolific contributor was Samuel Douglass Smith Huyghue profiled below, along with editor Robert Shives with sixteen insertions and Emily Beavan with fifteen insertions. Beavan is best known for her 1845 book *Sketches and Tales Illustrative of Life in the Backwoods of New Brunswick* (DCB Online, Cogswell).

obituary detailing Calnek's last day alive. Savary also recalls him as the first to establish a newspaper, the *Western News*, in his native county, and credits him as a poet, writer, historian and scholar who wrote for many magazines. Calnek was awarded an Akins prize for his previous county histories (Calnek ix).

Like Leprohon and Durand, Calnek first appeared in magazines at a relatively young age, in his case twenty-one, and the magazine's presence clearly provided a place for the youthful poetic experimentation that turned into a lifelong pursuit. Writing mostly poetry for *The Amaranth*, "Arthur" was noted to originate in Liverpool, then Bridgetown, Nova Scotia. His poetry features rhyming couplets that are metrically quite uneven, and concerned with somewhat generic topics such as "summer" and "night." In *The Provincial, or, Halifax Monthly Magazine*, "W.A.C." hailed from Church Cottage, Wilmot (Nova Scotia), and wrote in a similar rhyming style on topics such as the mayflower and the sunset. In *Stewart's Literary Quarterly Magazine*, Calnek wrote under his own name, contributing a series of memorial sonnets titled "distinguished Canadians" on figures such as shipping magnate Samuel Cunard, Admiral Sir Edward Belcher, and Maritime writers Thomas Chandler Haliburton and Griselda Tonge. In *The New Dominion Monthly*, Calnek's poems are similarly generic and topical, but his style improves with more regular meter. He also wrote a memorial poem on the occasion of Thomas D'Arcy McGee's assassination. Much of Calnek's poetry tends to be on rather forgettable generic subjects and his versification is often unsuccessful, but his sonnets in *Stewart's Literary Quarterly Magazine* are interesting for their revival of local historical figures. That Calnek's works were accepted by editors in disparate magazines suggests a writerly persistence and continued dedication through several markets and eras.

Amelia Clotilda Jennings (-1895)

Amelia Clotilda Jennings (“Maude”) stands out as the second most prolific contributor (after editor Mary Jane Katzmann Lawson) to *The Provincial, or, Halifax Monthly Magazine* (1852-53). Her 13 insertions (12 as “Maude,” one as “Clotilda Jennings”) include five “Letters from Linden Hill,” as well as poetry on local wildflowers. Raised at Linden Hill in Halifax, Jennings is credited in Henry Morgan’s *Bibliotheca Canadensis* with writing various prose tales, sketches, and short poems for the local newspaper press (204). In 1854, Jennings published her first poetry collection titled *Linden Rhymes*, which features her wildflower poems. She also won two literary prizes, one of which led her to publish as a book *The White Rose in Acadia; and Autumn in Nova Scotia, a Prize tale and poem* under the pseudonym “Maude” (1855).

Davies describes Jennings’ Linden Hill letters as “sprightly and colloquial,” but notes that they fall into sentimentality in spite of an aim at satire (242). Gossipy and locally focussed, the letters fit into *The Provincial*’s clear mandate to feature local content, and also dovetail with Lawson’s own local series. As Davies notes in her *Dictionary of Canadian Biography* entry, contemporary sources (*Bibliotheca Canadensis*) credit Jennings with later publishing in Montreal’s *The Saturday Reader* (1865-67),¹³⁹ and a romance called *Isabel Leicester* in the *Hamilton Spectator*. After a move to Montreal around 1875, Davies notes, Jennings’ work began to appear in the “Red and Blue Pencil” literary column of *The Dominion Illustrated* (starting in 1889 with the poem “Sable Island”), until her death in 1895 in Montreal (*DCB Online*, Davies). The Vincent database lists six insertions in *The Dominion Illustrated*, including three poems

¹³⁹ Davies notes that the magazine’s “To correspondents” column contains rejection notes from the editor to “Alma” and “Maude” which recall Jennings’ early pseudonyms, thereby suggesting her as the author of further pseudonymous poems and sketches.

and three pieces of fiction. A final volume of poetry titled *North Mountain, Near Grand-Pre* (1883) under the by-line “Mileta” is also attributed to Jennings.

Calling Jennings’ work “of little significance in the overall development of Canadian literature,” Davies suggests her to be typical of periodical writers who succeeded at the sketch form without rising above the conventions of popular poetry and fiction (*DCB Online*, Davies). Indeed, Jennings’ most interesting works are those that reveal the local colour of her home province, such as the Linden Letters published in *The Provincial* or her prize-winning “Autumn in Nova Scotia” poem. Ironically, she ends her *Linden Rhymes*, composed mostly of poetry on generic topics, with a poem titled “Appeal to the Poets of Nova Scotia” that urges fellow poets to celebrate the local land and its characters (Jennings, *Linden Rhymes* 142-149). In her pursuit of further magazine publication, however, Jennings demonstrated ongoing ambition as a writer and made use of local publications in her new locale, although the title of her final publication suggests that she continued to identify as a Maritime writer.

Durand, Bayley, Calnek, and Jennings exemplify four early magazinists noteworthy for being prolific contributors to their chosen magazines who then continued their writerly trajectories by contributing to subsequent magazines. Each of these writers is minor or even obscure within the Canadian literary canon, yet their prolific contributions indicate that they reciprocated the enthusiasm that editors expressed in their editorial prefaces and notices. Unlike Moodie and Leprohon, these authors did not have the good fortune to become associated with a magazine that could sustain their contributions: in contrast with *The Literary Garland*, each of their initial titles lasted only a couple of years, and was not run by a powerhouse like John Lovell who could provide

later publishing opportunities. Perhaps they did not share the talents and tenacity of a Moodie or a Leprohon. Yet with their contributions and continued magazine publishing, they do represent the realization of editorial aspirations to cultivate Canadian talent. Moreover, at least two of these writers, Calnek and Durand,¹⁴⁰ were very young at the time of their initial contributions, so in them the magazines realized the additional editorial ambition to catch authors in their youth. In spite of the fact that in each of these cases the initial market proved unreliable, the enthusiasm of these writers, as well as their sustained dedication to magazines, is not unremarkable.

Promising Trajectories Cut Short

If Susanna Moodie and Rosanna Leprohon represent the ideal trajectory of writers through the early magazines, and minor writers like Durand, Bayley, Calnek, and Jennings demonstrate similar trajectories with less successful results, it is interesting to consider those writers whose prolific appearances in one magazine set them up for an equally promising career yet whose trajectory was cut short either by death or immigration. In this category, Samuel Douglass Smith Huyghue's promising appearance as the most prolific contributor to *The Amaranth* was cut short by immigration, as was that of *The Literary Garland*'s contributor Hugh E. Montgomerie ("Edmond Hugomont"). More tragically, the promising trajectories of Elizabeth Mary Maclachlan ("E.M.M.") and James Haskins ("Dr. Haskins") through *The Literary Garland* were cut short by their unexpected deaths. Finally, the cases of Eliza Lanesford Cushing and Mary Jane Katzmann Lawson are perhaps most puzzling, as they appeared quite prolifically in

¹⁴⁰ While Jennings' birth date is unlisted in the standard biographical sources, she must also have been relatively young given that *The Provincial* started in 1852 and Jennings' death date is listed as 1895.

their chosen magazines seemingly on the same trajectory as a Moodie or a Leprohon but disappeared from the magazines to become decidedly more obscure.

Samuel Douglass Smith Huyghue (1816-91)

Identified by many scholars as the first excellent literary magazine in New Brunswick, *The Amaranth* (1841-43) attracted several relatively consistent contributors, the most prolific of whom (tied with editor Shives) was Samuel Douglass Smith Huyghue (“Eugene”), with sixteen insertions including poetry, essays, and fiction. Born in Prince Edward Island in 1816 as the son of a military officer, Huyghue moved to Saint John in 1817. By 1840, he began contributing to the *Halifax Morning Post and Parliamentary Reporter* and then to *The Amaranth*, where he serialized his first novel *Argimou: A Legend of the Micmac* (DCB Online, Davies). After working as an agent for the boundary commission to survey the line between New Brunswick, Lower Canada, and Maine in 1843, Huyghue moved to London, where he published four essays about his New Brunswick experiences in *Bentley’s Miscellany* from 1849-50, along with a second novel called *The Nomades of the West; or, Ellen Clayton* in 1850 (DCB Online, Davies). He then moved to Australia in 1852,¹⁴¹ working as a civil servant in Ballarat, Graytown, and Melbourne as he continued to engage in creative writing as well as to work as an artist and illustrator (Davies, “Periodicals from Maritime Canada” 117-118).

In her detailed analysis of Huyghue’s serialized *Amaranth* novel, Davies identifies *Argimou* as the first Canadian novel to describe the Acadian expulsion of 1755 and as one of the earliest novels of social conscience in Canada to focus on the plight of

¹⁴¹ Davies explains that in Australia Huyghue witnessed and recorded the Eureka uprising in the Ballarat gold fields in 1854 under the pseudonym “Pax,” that his drawings appear in a personal memoir called *The Ballarat Riots*, and that a water-colour of The Eureka Stockade hangs in the Ballarat Fine Art Gallery and a memoir titled *The Ballarat Riots* resides in the Mitchell Library in Sydney. She also notes the presence of extant manuscript poems in the Reynell Eveleigh Johns papers in the State Library of Victoria (117-118).

native peoples (Huyghue's second novel revisits these themes). She furthermore notes its reappearance as a book published by *The Halifax Morning Courier* in 1847, as a serial in *The Saint John Albion* in 1859-60, and its publication in America and Britain ("Periodicals from Maritime Canada" 115-116). Davies also examines Huyghue's other *Amaranth* contributions "Malosep; or, The Forsaken" and "The Unknown," which also deal with European confrontations with the native. Even though she points to the limitations of both Huyghue's prose and poetry (the latter for its occasionally abstract images and clichés), Davies asserts that "Eugene" represented the most original and talented voice in the magazine (she also praises writer Moses Perley for his sporting sketches), especially amidst the magazine's overall focus on predictable subjects such as wilderness, sea life, and the military. Although she praises Huyghue's ambition and calls attention to his poetry as the best to appear in the magazine, Davies suggests that a "firm editor" for both poetry and prose would have helped Huyghue to "trim his excesses in language" and improve his craft (162).

In spite of these shortcomings, the opportunity for a twenty-five-year-old writer to practice his craft and gain the confidence of publication, in Huyghue's case to the extent that he would later have the confidence to submit work to a magazine such as *Bentley's Miscellany* and to continue writing novels, suggests that *The Amaranth* fulfilled its role as a domestic forum for creative experimentation. Although Huyghue is not unknown to literary scholars (he receives some notice, for example, in the *Literary History of Canada*) and his immigration complicates his national identity, the strength of his work in *The Amaranth* and its important subject matter suggest that he is worthy of even further examination.

Hugh E. Montgomerie

As the fourth most prolific contributor to *The Literary Garland* (1838-51), Hugh E. Montgomerie (“Edmond Hugomont”) made 52 contributions, of which 50 are marked original, including 29 translations. Comprising mostly prose and published between 1843 and 1849, Montgomerie’s contributions include translated serials from Tomasso Grossi, Emmanuel Gonzales, and Elie Berthet, as well as a handful of translated stories and reviews. Montgomerie is recalled only briefly in Henry Morgan’s *Bibliotheca Canadensis* for his role as president of Montreal’s Shakespeare Club. The entry also notes that he returned to his native Scotland in 1849 (280), which may partially explain his obscurity.¹⁴² MacDonald additionally identifies him to have been a merchant, and one of those charged with inciting the Rebellion Losses riots (17). As a *Garland* contributor, Montgomerie’s insertions range from historical missives, including a tale based on the Guelphs and Ghibalines, and a paper on the Picts and the Welsh, to topical essays on subjects such as the literary merits of valentines and rejection (prompted by the editor’s sending the author an engraving titled “The Belle of the Ball” as the basis for a sketch) to a longer narrative poem about a child rescued from drowning.

Based on the couple of editorial notes that surround his contributions and the regularity with which he appeared in *The Literary Garland*, Montgomerie seems to have enjoyed a fairly regular relationship with the magazine. In at least one sketch noted

¹⁴² Montgomerie’s greatest notoriety is perhaps through an accusation of plagiarism from Susanna Moodie, recounted and investigated by Mary Brown in “The *Literary Garland* and A Case of Literary Larceny.” Upon seeing a story that she had published in a British magazine over a decade ago newly translated by Edmond Hugomont under a different title (“Christina Steinfort: A Tale from the French”) in *The Garland*, Moodie complained to the editor. She demanded a republication under her own name, to which Montgomerie responded that he had merely found and translated the tale from a French magazine where it had appeared under the by-line “Marceline Desbordes-Valmore.” The editor’s comments and Hugomont’s letter appear in *The Literary Garland* Apr. 1844: 192. Interestingly, there is also an editorial note at the end of one of Moodie’s stories, *The Royal Quixote*, wondering about its plot similarities with a story in the *New York Albion* three years prior (Untitled note. *The Literary Garland* July 1839: 363).

above, he seems to have been commissioned to write text to accompany an illustration supplied by the editor. In a preface to what looks to have been intended as a regular feature, “Notices of New Works,” Montgomerie outlined the benefits of such a feature as an element of adult education important in the colonies, citing the greater availability of cheap literature through publishers such as Chambers in Edinburgh and locally through Armour and Ramsay of Montreal as impetus for the column (“Notices of New Works.” *The Literary Garland* June 1844: 255). In spite of its deferential tone, this preface nonetheless established Montgomerie in an authoritative position to guide the reader through new literature, and the fact that he was asked to participate in the column (he was not its only contributor) suggests that he was a relative insider at the magazine. His identity as one of the magazine’s few translators further substantiates this position, although it also mitigates his identity as an original contributor. His immigration back to Scotland made his literary trajectory incomplete, but his prolific status within the magazine suggests him to be a writer possibly worthy of further investigation.

Elizabeth Mary Maclachlan (-1845)

With 49 insertions in *The Literary Garland*, the productivity of Elizabeth Mary Maclachlan (“E.M.M.”) is even more impressive in light of the fact that her works all appeared in the limited time frame between the magazine’s inception and her death in 1845. On the occasion of her final contribution, Maclachlan added a poem and a note of thanks to her readers:

And now, dear Canada, I bid you a last farewell! While I live will your
remembrance be warmly cherished in my heart. I came to you in stormy times,
when the dark clouds of disunion hovered over you; these have rolled away, and,

praise be to God! the sunshine of peace has returned. Long, long may this
 continue for it is the harbinger of prosperity to your land. (Untitled note. *The
 Literary Garland* Dec. 1845: 536)

At the end of the issue, the editor revealed further information about the author, including the fact that she had left Canada for England a few months previously but had died after a few weeks. The note also reveals a bit more about her biography, including the fact that she was the sister of Sir William Colebrooke, Lieutenant Governor of New Brunswick, and the wife of Colonel Maclachlan of the Royal Engineers ("Close of the Volume." *The Literary Garland* Dec. 1845: 576). MacDonald further notes that Maclachlan's husband had embarked for Canada in the spring of 1838 and was commandant in Kingston from 1840-45 (313), so Maclachlan's *Garland* contributions clearly map to her time in Canada.

Two thirds of Maclachlan's contributions are prose fiction (the rest are verse), including several serials: *Aunt Mary's Notebook*, *The Confided*, *The Maiden of Saint Margaret's*, *The Woodland Manor; or the Disputed Title*, *Beatrice; or the Spoiled Child*, *The Orphan; or, the Affianced*, and *The Girl's Choice*. In a number of instances, her articles received preferred placement as the lead feature in an issue, yet in at least one serial was discontinued (*The Maiden of Saint Margaret's*) with a note from the editor rationalizing that he did not want to devote too much space to one subject (Untitled note. *The Literary Garland* Sept. 1839: 487). Her stories feature mostly upper class English settings and characters that were typical of the magazine's fare. Her poems commonly carry religious overtones, and commemorate occasions such as "On the Birth of a Most Beloved Child," "The Fall of the Leaf," "The Bereaved Parents," or "The Lament of Mrs. ___ for a Favourite Dog." Her status as a Canadian writer is somewhat complicated

by the fact that she had just immigrated to Britain, yet the fact of her death meant that her career as a writer ended in Canada.

James Haskins (1805-45)

Yet another prolific *Literary Garland* poet, James Haskins (“Dr. Haskins”) made 25 contributions, 23 of which were marked original, and all of which were poetry. He is also remembered briefly in Henry Morgan’s *Bibliotheca Canadensis* (179) for his *Poetical Works of James Haskins*, edited by Henry Baldwin and published posthumously in 1848. A teacher, doctor, and poet, Haskins attended Trinity College in Dublin and taught in Ireland and England before returning to Trinity to study surgery. He then immigrated to Belleville in 1834, married, and opened a classical school in 1836 and then a medical practice in 1837 at Yarker’s Mills in Loughborough Township on the Trent River. After his wife and child died in childbirth, Haskins moved to Frankford, where he practiced medicine and wrote most of his poetry (*DCB Online*, Ballstadt).

In his *Dictionary of Canadian Biography* entry on Haskins, Carl Ballstadt notes that the poet’s record is hindered by conflicting information in the two major sources regarding his character and death. A commemorative sonnet published in *The Literary Garland* by Susanna Moodie fashions Haskins as a “Neglected Son of Genius,” unable to cope with an anti-intellectual society and thus driven to a reclusive life and alcoholism.¹⁴³ By contrast, Haskins’ editor Henry Baldwin, in a preface to his poetry, makes no reference to a drinking problem, but instead ascribes the poet’s solitude to grief and a “deeply religious nature” (*DCB Online*, Ballstadt). Ballstadt comments that the religious

¹⁴³ MacDonald indicates that Haskins was accused of being a drunkard in the *Kingston News* of August 15, 1844 (35). She also notes that he published poetry in periodicals *The Church* and the *British Whig*, and that he had an ongoing feud with fellow writer John Breckenridge (309). Moodie reprints her tribute to Haskins and makes more of an example of him as a cautionary tale about alcohol in *Life in the Clearings* (45).

and elegiac nature of Haskins' poetry, particularly in an epic entitled "The Cross," supports this reputation, adding his own lament that "in Canadian literary history Haskins has been, like so many other minor poets, neglected" (*DCB Online*, Ballstadt). The *Garland* poetry reflects a melancholy and dreamlike tone, with some longer poems devoted to moody and romantic European landscapes ("Italian Night Song," "Wicklow"), while others focus on nature scenes set in Ontario on the Trent River. Other works feature personified nature and more personal subject matter, including a tribute to the poet's infant daughter. As one of the more talented yet tragic authors to emerge from *The Literary Garland*, Haskins' work deserves further investigation.

Mysterious Disappearances

If death and immigration were two devastating interruptions to a successful literary trajectory, it is perhaps even more interesting to consider the fate of those who simply disappeared from magazine contribution following their prolific appearances, including Eliza Lanesford Cushing and Mary Jane Katzmann Lawson. Although Cushing went on briefly to edit a successful children's magazine called *The Snow Drop* and Lawson later ran a local bookstore and wrote country histories, neither woman appears to have continued her trajectory as writer through the periodicals.

Eliza Lanesford Cushing (1794-1886)

Second only to Moodie as the most prolific *Literary Garland* contributor, Eliza Lanesford Cushing née Foster ("C"/"ELC") made ninety contributions to the magazine, eighty-six of which are marked original and approximately two thirds of which are prose with the rest identified as verse. Five of these works are labelled as verse dramas, and others are identifiable by title as dramatic sketches. While several works carry over to a

subsequent issue, only one is a longer serial spanning several issues. Cushing is also notable for taking over as editor of *The Literary Garland* in its final year, after John Gibson passed away in 1850.

Cushing was born in Massachusetts to a clergy father and a writer mother named Hannah Webster who achieved literary recognition for writing one of the first American sentimental novels, *The Coquette; or The History of Eliza Wharton* in 1797 (*Dictionary of Literary Biography*, Wagner 85). Publishing her own first two historical romance novels *Saratoga* and *Yorktown* anonymously in Boston in the 1820s, Cushing immigrated to Montreal in 1833, where her husband, Dr. Frederick Cushing, established a medical practice. She began writing for *The Literary Garland* from its inception in 1838, and also contributed to American periodicals such as *Godey's Lady's Book*. Following her husband's death in 1846, Cushing started one of the first children's magazines in 1847, *The Snow Drop*, with her sister Harriet Vaughan Cheney, an editorship which lasted until a new publisher took over in 1852 (*DCB Online*, Trofimenkoff).

Cushing's writing spans the genres from historical tales to sketches to poetry, yet her dramatic writing, including *Esther, a Sacred Drama; with Judith, a Poem* (published in Boston in 1840), as well as her dramatic sketches in the *Lady's Book* and *The Literary Garland*, have garnered the most critical attention. But even that attention is still limited to standard biographical dictionaries such as the *Dictionary of Literary Biography*—*Canadian Writers before 1890* and the *Dictionary of Canadian Biography*. Although she is briefly mentioned in Henry Morgan's *Bibliotheca Canadensis*, Cushing is excluded from his *The Canadian Men and Women of the Time*. Particularly when considered alongside a figure like that other most prolific *Garland* contributor Susanna Moodie,

Cushing is relatively unknown; comments on her work are often perfunctory, even condescending, with a typical reference seeing her as one who “contributed to the tone of moralizing sentimentality in 19th-century Canadian letters” (*DCB Online*, Trofimenkoff). Yet other commentary such as that of Anton Wagner in the *Dictionary of Literary Biography—Canadian Writers before 1890*, suggests that works by Cushing “mark the beginning of playwriting as a literary art form in English Canada” (85-86). These discrepancies suggest that further investigation and critical attention are warranted.

Although Cushing’s writing features relatively little Canadian content and frequently deals with religious themes (which may explain a scholarly bias against it), her regular appearance in *The Literary Garland* suggests that she found a consistent readership (and an eager editor, as verified by comments quoted in the previous chapter). Wagner notes her most significant dramatic works published in *The Literary Garland* to be her “Dramatic Sketch from Scripture History” (Apr. 1844) and *The Fatal Ring* (July-Sept. 1840). Much of Cushing’s work in *The Literary Garland* includes the now oft-discounted historical romance, yet other insertions are more realistic sketches and stories, a few touching on Canadian themes. According to Wagner, her stories “almost invariably feature a romantic plot and contrasting characterization sharply depicting the conflict between virtue and sensual passion, love and duty, vice and religious faith, morality and jealousy, and violence and greed” (86).

If Cushing is obscure, her literary family is even more so. Her sisters were also prolific contributors to *The Literary Garland*: T.D. Foster (“F”/”T.D.F.”) made 42 contributions (29 of which are marked original), featuring mostly prose works, including one serialized translation, and Harriet Vaughan Cheney (“C.”/”H.V.C.”) made 38

contributions (26 are marked original) also featuring largely prose, including two serials. Cheney's stories were mostly set in New France.¹⁴⁴ Given their collective productivity and Cushing's insider status as an editor, these sisters collectively deserve more attention generally and in relation to *The Literary Garland* specifically. Cushing lived many years beyond *The Literary Garland*'s and even *The Snow Drop*'s demise, yet she is noted to have disappeared from public view after these projects (*DCB Online*, Trofimenkoff). In spite of her initial book publishing, she does not seem to have returned to that more stable medium, a fact that may also help explain her later descent into obscurity.

Mary Jane Katzmann Lawson (1828-90)

Regardless of the conflict of interest in her identity as the magazine's founder/editor *and* its most prolific contributor, it is nevertheless interesting to investigate Mary Jane Katzmann Lawson's 74 works in *The Provincial, or, Halifax Monthly Magazine* not only for insights into her writing but into the ways such self-generated content supported her editorial mandate. She is also just one example of an early editor/writer who wrote prolifically for her own magazine—John Sparrow Thompson in *The Halifax Monthly Magazine* (1830-33) and Robert Shives in *The Amaranth* (1841-43) are other examples. Born in Nova Scotia to a German father and a mother descended from a prominent New England family, Lawson had already contributed poetry to local newspapers before starting *The Provincial* at age 24. After the magazine's demise, Lawson operated the Provincial Bookstore in Halifax in 1866, a job she passed on to her younger sister after

¹⁴⁴ In her *Dictionary of Literary Biography* entry, MacDonald describes Cheney's writing as "sound, if unexciting," noting her focus on description over character development and in poetry her focus on moral correctness. However, MacDonald also notes that Cheney's more outstanding qualities, including her sympathy for native peoples, her enlightened view of children, and her historical work all suggest her for more scholarly attention (71-72). Little information is readily available on T.D. Foster beyond an aside in Cushing's biographical entry that she was the wife of lecturer and essayist Rev. Henry Giles of Boston, who also contributed a handful of works to *The Literary Garland* (85).

she married (*DCB Online*, Kernaghan).¹⁴⁵ Later, she wrote a *History of the Townships of Dartmouth, Preston, and Lawrencetown in Halifax County, Nova Scotia* based on a series that had run in *The Provincial*. The history won the Akins Prize in 1887. A posthumous volume of poetry titled *Frankincense and Myrrh* was published along with the history in 1893 (*DCB Online*, Kernaghan) and Gerson notes that she collaborated on the *Church of England Institute Receipt Book* in 1888 (Gerson, *Women in Print* 35). Lawson furthermore appears in a couple of anthologies later in the century.

As a magazine writer, Lawson contributed everything from editorials to poetry to fiction to non-fiction to her journal. Davies assesses Lawson's poetry as relatively conventional, sentimental, and didactic (247).¹⁴⁶ Yet Lawson's most common contributions took the form of prose. As well as regular editorials and reviews of local news, she also wrote a fiction series called "Tales of Our Village" and a non-fiction series called "Half Hours with our Poets." In the former series, the author begins by providing background information on the village of "P—", following up with monthly sketches set in the town. In the latter series, Lawson offers both biographical detail as well as several sample poems per author, which include Mrs. Cotnam, Grizelda Tonge, John McPherson, Sarah Herbert, and Charles M. Desbrisay. Both of these features contributed to the local aspect for which Lawson's magazine was praised, and the writerly focus in the latter series also accentuated the magazine's literary character.

¹⁴⁵ In "'Dearer than his Dog:' Literary Women in Pre-Confederation Nova Scotia," Davies notes the journal ended abruptly when Lawson ran into financial difficulties, adding that it seems her brother-in-law Elikanah Morton was the likely financial backer who withdrew his assistance when he ran into difficulties himself. She had promised she would remunerate contributors once circulation reached one thousand and in her final editorial noted she was one hundred shy of viability (86).

¹⁴⁶ Essayist Thomas O'Hagan also noted that Lawson's poems were "written too hurriedly, are uneven, and in some instances lack wholly the fashioning power of true inspiration." He does, however, recommend a handful of poems as "proof that if poetic powers had been carefully cultivated, and less prose fuel burnt upon the hearth, the poetic flame in her work would have been stronger and clearer and better defined" (59).

Lawson penned perhaps her most interesting contributions in her “Our Correspondents” columns, examined in the previous chapter, in which she scathingly critiqued reader submissions. Her commentary shows her to be a fairly shrewd critic, especially given her age and presumably limited experience. Her poet profiles offer today’s scholars a contemporary glimpse at the region’s minor poets and her “Tales of Our Village” offer local colour and historical interest.¹⁴⁷ As was the case with several writers examined so far, Lawson was remarkably young when she embarked on the editorship of her magazine, a fact that affirms the accessibility of such a venture to those with interest in editorial work. She also repeated the pattern of several writers noted thus far by transforming several of her magazine works into a published history later in the century,¹⁴⁸ and her posthumous poetry book affirms her ongoing commitment to creative writing.

As the profiles discussed so far reveal, prolific magazine contributors demonstrated a variety of career trajectories through the early magazines.¹⁴⁹ Now-canonical authors Moodie and Leprohon took advantage of magazine publication to help continue or establish their writing careers, as did more minor authors whose works are now relatively or almost completely unknown. The fact that both Moodie and Leprohon

¹⁴⁷ Davies provides a more in-depth examination of Lawson’s works, noting for instance her moral rather than aesthetic approach to her writer profiles, and the critical perspective from which she approached her poetical critiques (“Periodicals from Maritime Canada” 237).

¹⁴⁸ Published posthumously, the editorial preface to Lawson’s *History* notes that the magazine sketches refrained from mentioning names and places, and “were interwoven with much material which was avowedly fictitious.” The preface’s author Harry Piers notes that “he who desires an ornate account, will consult *The Provincial*; he who wishes to have only such information as is authentic, will find it in this volume” (iii).

¹⁴⁹ Among the other authors who deserve further attention given their prolific contributions to their chosen magazines are two writers with a common pseudonym, Cinna. These are best identified by Mary Lu MacDonald. The first Cinna, speculated to be Robert Sullivan Baldwin, appears as the most prolific contributor to *The Canadian Magazine* (1833). The second, identified by MacDonald as William Benjamin Wells, was the most prolific contributor to *Barker’s Canadian Monthly Magazine* with nine insertions that included profiles, local legends, and long poems.

began or expanded their careers at the most longstanding magazine in early Canada demonstrates the benefits of longevity in a magazine for writers looking to develop their craft. For writers who did not achieve similar permanence, the short-lived nature of their magazines may have played a role. Yet in spite of the fact that, as MacDonald points out, “all writers in the Canadas in the first half of the nineteenth century were amateurs who made their living in some other activity” (36), to some extent writers and editors such as Leprohon, Moodie, Jennings, and Calnek challenge the amateur label by their consistent pursuit of publication throughout their lives. Even those who identified as professionals in other disciplines, such as Charles Durand as a barrister or Samuel Douglass Smith Huyghue as a surveyor and civil servant, maintained their writing as a serious sideline alongside more financially viable occupations.¹⁵⁰

Other commonalities are also interesting. The fluidity of national identity at this period is demonstrated by the fact that immigration took *The Amaranth*’s Huyghue away to Australia and *The Literary Garland*’s Montgomerie back to Scotland. Elizabeth Mary Maclachlan had also moved back to England just before her death. Also interesting is the relative youth of so many of these prolific early contributors: when they began publishing Leprohon was only 17 years old, Durand and Calnek were each 19, Lawson was 24, and Huyghue was 25.¹⁵¹ Other writers’ birth dates are less clear, but even these few examples suggest that magazines provided an early opportunity for these writers to experiment with publication. These opportunities had an impact, since many writers continued to produce creative work throughout their lives. While this chapter is divided into early and late

¹⁵⁰ MacDonald shows the predominance of law among the professions of native born writers (18). The next most common occupations, although far below law, were the church and the civil service.

¹⁵¹ MacDonald notes that of the English Canadians in her study 20 percent were middle-aged or older when they started writing, 47 percent only wrote in their youth, and 33 percent published throughout their lives (15).

century to reflect the clear advancement in stability and sophistication in the latter half, many of these authors published into the late century as well,¹⁵² where they were joined by an entirely new crop of writers in a much busier literary scene.

Mid- to Late-Century Magazinists

Although the short life spans of most periodicals in the first half of the nineteenth century limited their effectiveness as venues for literary development, by late century greater longevity and stability allowed several magazines to emerge as true platforms for intellectual discourse on relevant domestic topics such as literature, culture, and politics. Editors still expressed uncertainty about whether their society would support their magazines, but they no longer appealed as randomly to the community for contributors. Perhaps this self-assurance derived in part from the fact that editors themselves were increasingly experienced and professionalized. As mentioned previously, several dedicated editorial figures emerged around Confederation, including George Stewart Jr., editor of *Stewart's Literary Quarterly Magazine* (later *Stewart's Quarterly*); Graeme Mercer Adam, who serially founded *The British American Magazine* and *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* among other titles; Georges Desbarats, who produced *The Canadian Illustrated News* and *The Dominion Illustrated*, along with an empire of titles in both English and French; and Goldwin Smith, who contributed both financially and editorially to several magazines, including *The Canadian Monthly and National Review*, *The Nation*, *The Week*, and *The Bystander*. Even though other editors had already emerged as substantial forces in earlier eras in Canadian publishing (Joseph Howe and

¹⁵² Perhaps as a sign of their growing comfort with publication as well as the reduced practice of anonymity, many of these early authors gradually abandoned their pseudonyms; for instance, Rosanna Leprohon moved from "R.E.M." to Mrs. Leprohon, Charles Durand moved from "Briton" to "C.M.D.," and William Arthur Calnek moved from "Arthur" in *The Amaranth* to "W.A.C." in *The Provincial* to W. Arthur Calnek in *The New Dominion Monthly*.

John Lovell are prominent examples), the fact that post-Confederation editors co-existed relatively contemporaneously in larger numbers, and were even becoming increasingly centralized in Toronto, no doubt helped to create a more stable and reliable industry and community.

Contributors, too, despite being employed as lawyers, civil servants, teachers, or in other professions, took up magazine writing with increased prominence, finally publishing under their own names (with some exceptions), and developing relatively solid literary reputations. Yet with the exception of the most prominent names, such as John George Bourinot, James MacPherson Le Moine, and William Dawson LeSueur, many of these contributors are less familiar than they perhaps ought to be, considering how active they were in their own time. Again, turning to existing magazine indexes as sources, this section looks at two of the most important post-Confederation magazines, *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* (1872-82) and *The Week* (1883-96), in order to draw out their most prolific contributors. Additionally, a handful of contemporary magazines will also be explored more briefly to provide context on contributor crossover between magazines. Whereas the previous section focussed on prolific individuals in terms of how successfully they completed an ideal trajectory through the magazines, in the later century the trajectory was more assured, so this section focuses instead on these magazines as hives of productivity to see which writers were the busiest bees to emerge from these prominent titles.

Contributors to *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* (1872-82)

As introduced in previous chapters, *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* was one of the most significant magazines of the later nineteenth century due to its high quality

intellectual discussion, longevity, and likely connections with the nationalistic Canada First movement. In the *Literary History of Canada*, Roy Daniells furthermore remarks on the magazine's "extraordinary unity of topic and tone" in the interest of substantiating national unity, noting its solid core of articles on Canadian history, geography, and culture (209). Founded and published by Graeme Mercer Adam, the 96-page monthly magazine was modelled after the British shilling monthlies like *The Cornhill Magazine* and *MacMillan's Magazine* (Flitton 34). At first the magazine had the strong financial and editorial support of Goldwin Smith, but Smith left the magazine in 1874 after some editorial differences. He became involved instead with *The Nation*.

By 1878, the magazine was consolidated with *Belford's Monthly Magazine* to become *Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly and National Review*, at which point it was edited by George Stewart Jr., who resigned from the magazine in 1879, whereupon Adam's name returned to the masthead as editor. Celebrated for its great number of high-calibre contributors, the magazine produced many articles that later became the basis of book-length works. In her dissertation on the magazine (which includes an index), Flitton notes that original contributions to the magazine included John G. Bourinot's *The Intellectual Development of the Canadian People*, Samuel Thompson's *Reminiscences of a Canadian Pioneer for the Last Fifty Years*, Samuel J. Watson's *The Powers of Canadian Parliaments*, Agnes Maule Machar's *Lost and Won*, and Rosanna Leprohon's "Clive Weston's Wedding Anniversary." Flitton further notes the appearance of articles that became the basis of later books, and that the magazine also featured original poetry by Charles Mair, Charles G.D. Roberts, Alexander McLachlan, Kate Seymour Maclean,

George Murray, Susan Frances Harrison, and William Kirby (Flitton, “Canadian Monthly” 2).¹⁵³

Titled in its published form as the *Index to The Canadian Monthly and National Review (1872-1882)*, Flitton’s index is organized by author and subject and reveals names both known and obscure. Agnes Maule Machar (“Fidelis”) stands out as the most prolific contributor by far with 81 contributions compared with the next most prolific, Goldwin Smith, with 53. The next most prolific contributors include obscure writer Alice Horton, with 33 insertions, obscure writer Mary Morgan, with 33 insertions (mostly under her standard pseudonym of “Gowan Lea,” but four as “Aurora”), minor writer Louisa Murray with 30 insertions, and known intellectual William Dawson LeSueur, with 26 insertions. Rounding out the top contributors are Charles Pelham Mulvany, Francis Rye, John G. Bourinot, Alice Maud Ardagh (“Esperance”), Frederick Augustus Dixon (“F.A.D.”), John Reade, Kate Seymour Maclean, and Hiram Ladd Spencer.¹⁵⁴

In its mix of obscure authors writing everything from fiction and poetry to intellectual essays, this list reveals a wide variety of types of writers. Recognizable

¹⁵³ While this chapter approaches the magazines from a production and industry standpoint to identify the most prolific writers, the conversations that these contributors produced within the magazines are naturally of ultimate interest and importance. Although the magazines have not been analyzed exhaustively, elements of these conversations particularly as they touch on issues of public interest and debate are addressed in books such as A.B. McKillop’s *A Disciplined Intelligence* and Ramsay Cook’s *The Regenerators*, which quote readily from the magazines.

¹⁵⁴ By the numbers, top contributors included Charles Pelham Mulvany, with 24 insertions, Francis Rye, with 20 insertions, John G. Bourinot, with 19 insertions, Alice Maud Ardagh, with 19 insertions, Frederick Augustus Dixon, with 17 insertions, John Reade, with 16 insertions, Hiram Ladd Spencer, with 15 insertions and Kate Seymour Maclean, with 14 insertions. Most prolific writers contributed to the magazine throughout its existence, in spite of several changes in publisher and editor. Exceptions include Francis Rye, who only contributed from 1877-79, and Mulvany and LeSueur who contributed mostly in the *Rose-Belford*’s phase. Smith parted ways with the magazine from 1875-79, so his contributions are compressed into the early phase, when he was heavily involved, and the later phase when he returned. The Vincent database approximates these numbers relatively closely: Machar 87, Smith 29 (the discrepancy seems due to some of Smith’s work being listed in Flitton as anonymous. Smith is listed in the Vincent database variously under his “Bystander” pseudonym, G. Smith and Goldwin Smith), Horton 32, Morgan 35, Murray 28, LeSueur 21, Mulvany 28, Rye 32 (Rye is listed under his pseudonym F.R. which may include other people, confusingly his wife Amy Rye is listed under Mrs. Francis Rye), Ardagh 20, Dixon 15, Reade 15, Spencer 14.

intellectuals include journalist Goldwin Smith (perhaps closest to the magazine as its financial supporter), critic William Dawson LeSueur,¹⁵⁵ and journalist John G. Bourinot who became a longstanding clerk of the House of Commons (*DCB Online*, Banks). Among literary writers, prolific fiction author and poet Louisa Murray, who previously wrote for *The Literary Garland*, and *The British American Magazine* (*DCB Online*, Godard), figures prominently along with poets John Reade, who started *The Montreal Literary Magazine* at age eighteen before becoming an established literary editor of the *Montreal Gazette* (*DCB Online*, Monkman), and Kate Seymour Maclean, who was a teacher as well as a writer for Canadian and American magazines and published three collections of poetry (Morgan, *Canadian Men and Women* 709).¹⁵⁶

Perhaps the most striking feature of this tally is the almost incredible productivity of Agnes Maule Machar (“Fidelis”). Although not obscure, Machar is hardly as well known as she deserves to be, given her position as contributor to this important magazine. With 30 more contributions than the magazine’s close associate Goldwin Smith, and 50 more insertions than the average prolific contributor, Machar is more than just slightly ahead of her cohort. Such an observation is compounded by the fact that she was also the most prolific contributor to *The Week*, the next magazine to be highlighted in this section.

¹⁵⁵ A civil servant, LeSueur also wrote prolifically for the *Montreal Daily Star*, the *Montreal Gazette*, the *Ottawa Citizen* and *The Nation*, and was a contributing editor to *Popular Science Monthly* (*DCB Online*, Holland).

¹⁵⁶ Yet other writers are even more obscure: Charles Pelham Mulvany was an Anglican clergyman who published several county histories (*DCB Online*, Killan); Frederick Augustus Dixon was the author of several stage productions who started his career as a writer for the *Toronto Mail* before becoming a tutor at Rideau Hall and then a civil servant (Morgan, *Canadian Men and Women* 329); Hiram Ladd Spencer was the editor of several publications, including *The Maritime Monthly*, also published four books (Morgan, *Canadian Men and Women* 1049). Other writers are even harder to identify, including Francis Rye and Alice Maud Ardagh (the latter is briefly mentioned and identified as being from Barrie in O’Hagan’s essay on “Canadian Women Writers.” O’Hagan’s essay also provides some information on other lesser-known female poets including Lawson, Machar, Harrison, Merrill, Wetherald, and Morgan).

Based in Kingston, Ontario, Machar published eight novels and six works of popular history in addition to her magazine contributions (*DCB Online*, Brouwer).

In *The Canadian Monthly and National Review*, Machar's contributions started from the magazine's launch (at which time she was thirty-five years old), continued until its closure, and included everything from poetry to serials to articles. Of these, roughly a third are marked in Flitton's *Index* as poetry, and the rest appear as articles and two serials, *For King and Country: A Story of 1812*, beginning in February 1874 and *Lost and Won: A Story of Canadian Life*, beginning in January 1875. Several articles touch on Canadian subjects; for instance, a historical sketch of the War of 1812 and a prose piece titled "The Thousand Islands," along with several occasional poems with titles including "A Birthday Song: for Dominion Day," "Dominion Day 1879," "Mary Magdalene: An Easter Poem," and "A Christmas Carol." Machar is also known for her non-fiction articles and essays, in which she frequently engaged in debate with fellow contributors and intellectuals on topics such as religion and education.¹⁵⁷

Another interesting discovery amongst the top contributors to *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* are the third and fifth most prolific contributors, Alice Horton and Mary Morgan, who are almost completely obscure today. Of these, the most information is available on Mary Morgan, whose relatively substantial quarter-page entry in Henry Morgan's *The Canadian Men and Women of the Time* recalls her involvement in successfully protesting the exclusion of women from McGill medical school, as well as her writing for *The Week* and other publications under the pseudonym "Gowan Lea" (822). Yet the entry also notes that "she now lives much abroad" and "calls herself a

¹⁵⁷ Janice Fiamengo provides a more extensive discussion of Machar's journalism, along with that of Sara Jeannette Duncan, also published in these magazines, in *The Woman's Page: Journalism and Rhetoric in Early Canada*.

citizen of the world,” a removal that could possibly explain her obscurity. Morgan also became relatively prolific as a poet, noted in Watters’ *Checklist of Canadian Literature* to have published nine books of poetry (144). She began submitting her work to *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* at the young age of nineteen. All of her contributions are poems (including many sonnets), two-thirds of which were made after the magazine had transitioned to the *Rose-Belford’s* iteration.

The second obscure writer, Alice Horton, is more difficult to identify, as she is absent from the standard biographical reference books. Even though Horton’s work was anthologized at least once, in Susan Frances Harrison’s *Canadian Birthday Book*, the anthology’s biography section provides no information on her. Some of her poetry in *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* is marked as originating in Ottawa. As with Morgan, Horton’s contributions are entirely poetic. She began contributing in 1873 and contributed until 1881. Her poetry is frequently narrative, with several short numbered stanzas, and often has religious overtones. Love and regret are other prominent themes. Although many poems tend to be somewhat generic in subject matter (none contains particularly Canadian images), several stand out; for instance, “Gold for Silver” (Apr. 1873: 288), a poem written from a male perspective about being spurned by a female acquaintance; “The Cross-roads” (Aug. 1874: 113), a sentimental love poem with a novel structure; and “Dancing the Old Year Out” (Dec. 1875: 504), which personifies the dying spirit of the old year, to name just a few examples. It is curious that Horton appears so prominently in this magazine and yet fails to progress even through to *The Week*, which picked up so many other contributors. These mysteries suggest Horton as worthy of further investigation.

The Canadian Monthly and National Review reveals a range of prolific contributors, from the aforementioned younger unknowns to older, more established writers such as Goldwin Smith and Louisa Murray, in their fifties. As Flitton notes, the magazine attracted contributors who had already cultivated reputations as academics, journalists, and historians (“Canadian Monthly” 24), yet it is interesting to see younger contributors like Morgan in the mix (Horton’s age is not identified but by tone and subject matter seems youthful), suggesting that in spite of the more mature literary community that had now been established by professionalized contributors, magazines remained accessible to newcomers.

Contributors to *The Week* (1883-96)

If *The Week* might fairly be called the intellectual inheritor of *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* by virtue of its similarly high quality literary contents and the carryover of the efforts of founder Goldwin Smith, perhaps it is not surprising that it saw significant crossover in contributors. Of the prolific *Canadian Magazine and National Review* authors outlined above, Goldwin Smith, Louisa Murray, William Dawson LeSueur, Charles Pelham Mulvany, John G. Bourinot, Alice Maud Ardagh (“Esperance”), Frederick Augustus Dixon, John Reade, Kate Seymour Maclean, and Hiram Ladd Spencer all continued to write for *The Week* (though many wrote less often for the new title). As already noted, Agnes Maule Machar (“Fidelis”) maintained her status as the most prolific writer for this publication. Initially edited by poet Charles G.D. Roberts, *The Week* became a forum for intellectual discussion as well as literary publishing in Toronto.

In the *Checklist of Literary Materials in The Week (Toronto, 1883-1896)*, D.M.R. Bentley and Mary Lynn Wickens list the magazine's contents by author in the categories of articles, poetry, fiction, book reviews (by author reviewed), and miscellaneous (which includes such texts as columns, notes, editorials, and letters). Although admittedly a checklist rather than an index, noted by its editor to aim to "facilitate access to *The Week* for literary readers until such time as a complete index to the periodical is completed" (iv), the *Checklist's* focus on literary materials makes it useful as a source for information on contributors. Tallying from all these categories, Machar appears with 109 insertions, including poetry and articles, followed by Sara Jeannette Duncan, with 79 insertions of both articles and columns, Susan Frances Harrison, with 71 insertions, including both poetry and articles, and Edward Burrough Brownlow ("Sarepta"), and John Campbell ("J. Cawdor Bell"), with 52 insertions apiece comprised of poetry and articles for the former and poetry and fiction for the latter.

As a whole, the prolific contributors in both *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* and *The Week* reveal a busy community of minor writers often employed in other professions, but with strong literary interests and an involvement in publishing endeavours that often extended even beyond the magazines. Examining the categories individually, *The Week's* top ten poetry contributors¹⁵⁸ include Susan Frances Harrison ("Seranus"), Agnes Maule Machar ("Fidelis"), Edward Burrough Brownlow ("Sarepta"), Archibald Lampman, H.K. Cockin, William McGill, John Campbell ("J. Cawdor Bell"),

¹⁵⁸ By the numbers, *The Week's* top ten poetry contributors include Susan Frances Harrison with 43 poems (including 3 reprints), Agnes Maule Machar with 40 poems, Edward Burrough Brownlow with 38 poems, Archibald Lampman, with 38 poems including 10 reprints and a sheaf in one issue, H.K. Cockin with 36 poems, William McGill with 30 poems including 10 reprints, John Campbell with 25 poems, F.G. Scott with 26 poems, and John Henry Brown with 23 poems and Agnes Ethelwyn Wetherald with 23 poems. These numbers are based on the Bentley checklist, which is fairly closely matched by the Vincent database that records slightly different numbers for the following authors: Harrison 41, Cockin 29, Scott 24, Campbell 23, Lampman 24.

F.G. Scott, John Henry Brown, and Agnes Ethelwyn Wetherald. *The Week's* top ten contributors of articles¹⁵⁹ were Sara Jeanette Duncan, Agnes Maule Machar ("Fidelis"), Nicholas Flood Davin, Susan Frances Harrison ("Seranus"), Archibald MacMechan, William Clark, Arnold Theodore Haultain, William Douw Lighthall ("Alchemist," "Wilfred Chateaucclair"), Edward Burrough Brownlow ("Sarepta"), and Thomas Guthrie Marquis. *The Week's* most prolific fiction writers¹⁶⁰ were Edgar Fawcett, John Campbell ("J. Cawdor Bell"), Helen M. Merrill, and Archibald MacMechan.

In the poetry category, some names are familiar (Archibald Lampman and F.G. Scott are the most canonical), yet a numerical breakdown affirms the substantial output of lesser-known writers such as Susan Frances Harrison, Agnes Maule Machar, and Agnes Ethelwyn Wetherald. Although they now receive relatively limited scholarly attention, Harrison and Wetherald were well known in their time. Harrison (briefly editor of *The Week*) is noted for her contributions to various British and American magazines, as well as for several published works including a collection of short stories, an anthology, books of poetry, and novels (*Oxford Companion* 517). Wetherald's career trajectory included editorship of the Women's department of the Toronto *Globe* under the pen name "Bel Thistlewaite," a staff position at the *Ladies Home Journal*, and publication of four books (Morgan, *Canadian Men and Women* 1156).

¹⁵⁹*The Week's* top ten contributors of articles were Sara Jeannette Duncan with 25 articles and book reviews plus 53 columns for a total of 78 insertions, Agnes Maule Machar with 65 articles and book reviews plus six columns for a total of 71 insertions, Nicholas Flood Davin with 20 articles plus three serializations that added another 30 for a total of 50 insertions, Susan Frances Harrison with 9 articles plus 19 columns for a total of 28 insertions, William Clark with 27 insertions, Archibald MacMechan with 23 articles, Arnold Theodore Haultain with 18 articles, and William Douw Lighthall, Edward Burrough Brownlow, and Thomas Guthrie Marquis, each with 14 articles. Again the Vincent database differs somewhat (presumably due to the difference in identity between a checklist and an index), listing Duncan with 55 insertions, Machar 73, Davin 44, Harrison 20, Clark 32, Haultain 37, Lighthall 38, Brownlow 29, Marquis 15.

¹⁶⁰ By the numbers, Edgar Fawcett made 28 insertions in the form of a serial "The Adventures of a Widow," John Campbell made 27 insertions with a serialized novel "Two Knapsacks: A Novel of Canadian Life," Helen M. Merrill made 14 insertions, and Archibald Macmechan made 10 insertions. The Vincent database echoes all of these except for Merrill for whom it lists three insertions.

Other poets to appear prolifically in this magazine are even less recognizable: Edward Burrough Brownlow is absent from the biographical dictionaries although noted in Watters' *A Checklist of Canadian Literature* to have published a book of poetry called *Orpheus and other poems* (1896);¹⁶¹ Hereward K. Cockin would later become an editor at *Saturday Night* magazine and the author of two books (Morgan, *Canadian Men and Women* 245); John Campbell ("J. Cawdor Bell") was a professor and writer mostly based in Montreal who was a prolific contributor to academic publications as well but whose career ended with heresy charges brought against him (*DCB Online*, Moir); and John Henry Brown was an Ottawa-based civil servant who authored a volume of poetry (Morgan, *Canadian Men and Women* 155).

The tallies by author for articles verify journalist and author Sara Jeannette Duncan as the magazine's top non-fiction writer, with Machar and Harrison also appearing as prolific contributors. Other recognizable names include Nicholas Flood Davin, a prominent journalist and lawyer (*DCB Online*, Thompson), Archibald MacMechan, an English professor at Dalhousie College who was also president of the Nova Scotia Historical Society and author of several books (Morgan, *Canadian Men and Women* 713), and William Douw Lighthall, a lawyer, author, and publicist known for his prolific involvement in many cultural organizations and for his role as an early anthologist in compiling *Songs of the Great Dominion* (Morgan, *Canadian Men and Women* 657).¹⁶²

¹⁶¹ The book's dedication reads "These poems are now collected and published in memory of Edward Burrough Brownlow, born in London, England, 27 November 1857, died in Montreal, Canada, 8 September 1895, by his fellow-members of The Pen and Pencil Club." Unfortunately, the book includes no biography.

¹⁶² Other names are more obscure, including William Clark, a professor, clergyman, writer, and lecturer mostly in the Niagara region (Morgan, *Canadian Men and Women* 236); Theodore Arnold Haultain, an essayist and private secretary to Goldwin Smith (Morgan, *Canadian Men and Women* 515); Thomas

It is interesting to compare the contributors in these two sample magazines of the late century. In *The Canadian Monthly and National Review*, almost half of the top contributors were women, and the most prolific contributors are almost all female, with the exception of Goldwin Smith. In *The Week*, only a third of the poetic and non-fiction contributors were women, but again female contributors are the most prolific.¹⁶³ Almost all of the top contributors are identifiably Canadian, a fact that reveals the editors fulfilling their commitment to local and national literary and intellectual development. Even more top contributors to *The Week* seemed to be relatively young; for instance, poets Lampman, Scott, Harrison, Wetherald, Brownlow, and Brown were all born in the late 1850s or early 1860s (putting them in their mid-twenties at the magazine's inception), as were non-fiction prose writers Duncan, MacMechan, and Lighthall. Also remarkable is their commitment to craft. Wetherald, Harrison, Machar, and Cockin pursued journalism work directly through their careers. Although some contributors were employed in other fields, for instance, Lampman and Brown in the civil service, MacMechan and Campbell in academia, and Scott in the church, these writers also made time to maintain prominent literary identities.

Guthrie Marquis, a teacher and magazine writer who also collaborated with Machar on a collection of stories of New France (Morgan, *Canadian Men and Women* 731), and again Edward Burrough Brownlow. Of *The Week*'s most prolific fiction writers, MacMechan and Campbell have already been mentioned, Edgar Fawcett was a minor American author, and Helen M. Merrill was a contributor to Canadian and American periodicals and staff member at the Ontario Archives in Toronto (Morgan, *Canadian Men and Women* 789).

¹⁶³ In her essay "Anthologies and the Canon of Early Canadian Women Writers," in *Re(dis)covering Our Foremothers*, Gerson points to the high proportion of women publishing in both of these late century magazines, noting that in *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* 52 percent of poetry and 30 percent of fiction is attributable to women, and in *The Week* 29 percent of both poetry and fiction. *The Literary Garland* had even higher percentages with 55 percent of poetry and 70 percent of fiction attributable to women (58). Gerson's table of "Lost Women Poets" born before 1875 lists the top formerly anthologized women as Wetherald, Machar, and Harrison. Others include magazinists Helen Merrill and Pamela S. Vining.

Other Late-century Magazines

Beyond their reputation for intellectual excellence, *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* and *The Week* are also useful examples in that their longevity allows them to provide a meaningful glimpse into late-century writers contributing to the magazine industry. A cross-check with other magazines is also interesting to confirm how widely these writers contributed to magazines, particularly in this era when a greater number of general interest magazines were publishing contemporaneously than at any other time. This cross-check is facilitated by the Vincent database, which allows keyword searches by author. To consider possible crossover in this productive era, it is interesting to examine a few more magazines of the Confederation and post-Confederation era that appear relatively contemporaneously, including *The British American Magazine* (1863-64), *Stewart's Literary Quarterly Magazine* (subsequently *Stewart's Quarterly*) (1867-72), *The New Dominion Monthly* (1867-79), *The Canadian Literary Journal* (1870-72) (subsequently *The Canadian Magazine* after 1871), and *Belford's Monthly Magazine* (1876-78) (later amalgamated into *Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly and National Review*, already examined).¹⁶⁴

The British American Magazine (1863-64), founded by publisher Graeme Mercer Adam and edited by Henry Youle Hind (who was also its most prolific contributor, with

¹⁶⁴ While this investigation of later century writers aims at a snapshot of writers post-Confederation, this exercise of uncovering the most prolific writers could be repeated at different times in the later century. In my MA thesis on *Saturday Night Magazine*, I conducted the same investigation with that magazine's index, finding the top ten most prolific poets in founder Edmund E. Sheppard's era included Ernest E. Leigh (57 poems); E. Pauline Johnson (52); James A. Tucker (38); Bert Kelly (34); Reginald Gourlay (31); Edwin William Sandys (pseudonym Nomad) (28); H.K. Cockin (27); A.L. McNab (26); Hector Charlesworth (pseudonym Touchstone) (21); W.T. Allison (20). Sheppard's dozen most prolific fiction writers (in this tally I counted by work rather than by insertion as in this thesis) included Joseph T. Clark (28); Charles Lewis Shaw (20); Grace Elizabeth Denison (19); Marjory MacMurchy (10); Edmund E. Sheppard (10); Elmina Atkinson (6); William Beadsell Cameron (9); C. Langton Clarke (7); J. Smiley (7); James A. Tucker (6); E. Pauline Johnson (5); and Frances Morrison (5).

13 insertions) has been identified by Robert McDougall as a precursor to the more longstanding *Canadian Monthly and National Review*. The 112-page monthly magazine, which lasted for two volumes or twelve issues, featured contributors Mrs. Holiwell¹⁶⁵ and Louisa Murray most prolifically, with nine and eight insertions respectively. Other recognizable contributors included John Reade, Susanna Moodie, J.W.D. Moodie, Rosanna Leprohon, Thomas D'Arcy McGee, poets Charles Sangster and James McCarroll, and historian Henry Scadding.

Based in New Brunswick, *Stewart's Literary Quarterly Magazine* (1867-72) was founded by George Stewart Jr. at the young age of nineteen. The magazine started out at 40 pages and lasted for 12 issues, and its new iteration *Stewart's Quarterly*, which expanded to 112 pages in 1870, lasted for 8 issues. Both magazines are considered together in these tallies. In these magazines, Dr. Daniel Clark, M.D., a physician who held a longstanding post as medical superintendent at the Provincial Lunatic Asylum in Toronto and was also president of the college of physicians and surgeons (Morgan, *Canadian Men and Women* 233), stands out as the most prolific, with 24 insertions. Others included Rev. M. Harvey, a Presbyterian minister in St. John's Newfoundland (Morgan, *Bibliotheca Canadensis* 178) with 19 insertions, Professor Lyall, a professor at Dalhousie college, philosopher and clergyman (*DCB Online*, Hamilton) with 22 insertions, William Peters Dole ("W.P.D."), with 11 insertions, James Hannay, a journalist, newspaper editor and historian based in Saint John (*DCB Online*, Bell) and the aforementioned W. Arthur Calnek each with 6 insertions. J.M. Le Moine, John G. Bourinot and Charles Sangster each made 5 insertions. Other authors recognizable from

¹⁶⁵ Holiwell contributed to the *Toronto Newsboy*, the *Home Journal* and *The British American Magazine*, and serialized a novel in the *Globe* in 1859 (Morgan, *Bibliotheca Canadensis* 192).

other publications include Louisa Murray, John Reade, Hiram Ladd Spencer (“Enylia Allyne”), and Thomas D’Arcy McGee.¹⁶⁶

The New Dominion Monthly (1867-79), which appeared in Montreal at the same time as *Stewart’s Literary Quarterly Magazine* was published in Saint John, was published by John Dougall and Son. The Vincent database reveals the magazine’s most prolific contributors to be poet John Reade with 48 insertions, Mrs. A. Campbell with 37 insertions, “Alicia” with 32 insertions (both women contributed serials), W. Arthur Calnek with 18 insertions, J.M. Le Moine with 14 insertions, and John G. Bourinot with 10 insertions. Additionally, authors recognizable from other magazines include “H.K.C.” (Cockin), Rosanna Leprohon, Kate Seymour Maclean, Thomas D’Arcy McGee, and George V. Le Vaux (editor of *The Canadian Literary Journal*).

A couple of short-lived magazines may be considered as well. In *The Canadian Literary Journal* (1870-71), which later became *The Canadian Magazine* (1871-72), edited by Robert Ridgeway, poet Alexander McLachlan emerges as the top contributor with 9 insertions, followed by “Omicron,” and George V. Le Vaux (the *Journal*’s editor), with 6 insertions, “Emma J.M.R.” with 5 insertions, and Dr. Daniel Clark, with 4 insertions. Eventually absorbed into *The Canadian Monthly and National Review*, *Belford’s Monthly Magazine* (1876-78) saw Charles Sangster and George Stewart Jr. stand out as the most prolific authors, with 8 insertions apiece, followed by poet George Murray,¹⁶⁷ with 6 insertions, John Reade, and Rev. A.E.N. McDonell Dawson, a priest,

¹⁶⁶ Given the magazine’s origins in New Brunswick, it is interesting to observe common contributors between this and the Toronto publications, a fact certainly attributable to the magazine’s enterprising editor George Stewart. In her dissertation chapter on the magazine, Davies notes how Stewart reached out to prominent authors across the country in an attempt to turn his magazine into a national publication (268).

¹⁶⁷ Murray is absent from the usual biographical sources, so fortunately a short memorial written by John Reade is included in his *Poetical Works of George Murray* (1912). Born in 1830 and educated at Oxford, Murray immigrated to Canada in the late fifties and eventually settled in Montreal, where he taught classics

lecturer, and religious writer (Morgan, *Bibliotheca Canadensis* 91), with 5 insertions apiece, and Susanna Moodie, with 3 insertions. Other recognizable names include Charles Pelham Mulvany, and John G. Bourinot.

Although this survey is admittedly cursory, a few significant observations are possible nonetheless. The wider sampling reveals several authors already observed to contribute to both *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* and *The Week* also as contributors to these additional titles, notably John Reade, Louisa Murray, John G. Bourinot, J.M. Le Moine, and Kate Seymour Maclean. Additional names stand out in this set as contributors to more than one magazine in the sampling, including Dr. Daniel Clark and George V. Le Vaux, and perhaps most substantially W. Arthur Calnek, already familiar from his prolific presence in *The Amaranth* thirty years previously. Furthermore, a quick check of the most prolific contributors to these magazines reveals many of them, including Murray and Reade from *The British American Magazine*, Clark, Dole, Lyall, and Harvey of *Stewart's Quarterly*, and LeVaux, McLachlan, and Murray of *The Canadian Literary Journal* as minor contributors also to the relatively contemporaneous *Canadian Monthly and National Review*, a fact that affirms a cross-over between publications. Seeing the same names appear in different magazines emphasizes a growing sense of writerly community in which writers contributed both concurrently and consecutively to different publications even in different cities. These writers may also have been increasingly solicited directly by editors who became familiar with their names through other periodicals.

for over 30 years at the Montreal High School. Beyond magazine contribution, Murray's literary involvement included contributing to the literary sections of the *Montreal Gazette* and *Star*, and membership in many literary clubs.

Frequent appearances in multiple titles would have made authors' names widely known across a larger readership. To investigate just a couple of these most prolific names directly through a keyword search of the Vincent database is to gain a wider perspective on their contribution to multiple magazines (the database does not include every late-century magazine, so these authors may have contributed even more widely). For instance, the prolific Agnes Maule Machar also contributed to the *Globe's Christmas, Canada, The Dominion Illustrated Monthly*, and the *Queens College Journal*. Susan Frances Harrison additionally contributed to *The Dominion Illustrated, The Canadian Magazine* (1893), *Massey's Magazine*, and holiday annuals such as *Bryce's Christmas, Globe's Christmas*, and *Green Holly*. Even more remarkable is the ubiquitous appearance of other writers such as poet and *Montreal Gazette* literary editor John Reade, who contributed to 21 titles¹⁶⁸ (he was also one of the most prolific writers for *The Canadian Illustrated News*, a magazine not included in the Vincent database) or John G. Bourinot who contributed to 14 titles. Several other authors already discussed also maintained ubiquitous as well as prolific contributions, including Archibald Lampman, Charles Pelham Mulvany, Goldwin Smith, and others. Such numbers recommend these authors for further study as late-century Canadian magazinists.

¹⁶⁸ To provide a sense of the range of magazines, Reade contributed to *The New Dominion Monthly* (48), *The Week* (15), *Canadians* (11), *Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly and National Review* (10), *The Royal Society* (8), *The British American Magazine* (6), *Belford's Monthly Magazine* (5), *The Canadian Monthly and National Review* (5), *Stewart's Literary Quarterly Magazine* (5), *Arcadia* (4), *The Dominion Illustrated* (4), *The Lennoxville Magazine* (3), *The Students Monthly* (3), *Acta Victoriana* (2), *The Canadian Methodist Magazine* (2), *The Dominion Illustrated Monthly* (2), *The McGill University Gazette* (2), *The Trip-Hammer* (2), *The Literary and Historical Society of Quebec* (1), *The Canadian Magazine* (1), *The Literary Garland* (1), *The Montreal Literary Magazine* (1), *The Torch* (1), and the *Presbyterian College Journal* (1).

Magazinists' Reputations Beyond the Magazines

As a final consideration, it is interesting to verify the literary reputations of these magazine authors outside of that medium, to confirm whether their magazine appearance corresponded to literary significance in the culture at large. Notwithstanding the politics of anthologizing, contemporary verse collections can serve as one point of verification.¹⁶⁹

Widely anthologized in at least six out of seven anthologies are Davin, Harrison, Lampman, Machar, Reade, Scott, and Wetherald. Slightly less abundant yet still appearing in at least half the anthologies are Lighthall, Mulvany, and Smith, followed by only a few appearances by Brown, Brownlow, Cockin, Dixon, Merrill, and Morgan. Anthologized only once are writers Ardagh, Duncan, Haultain, Horton, Le Moine, Maclean, MacMechan, Murray, Rye, and Spencer. Those never anthologized include Bourinot, Campbell, Clark, Marquis, McGill, and LeSueur. With the exception of Campbell and Clark, this last group features mostly non-fiction prose writers, so it is not surprising to find them excluded from verse anthologies (in fact, it is rather more surprising to see some writers better known for their prose included in verse anthologies).¹⁷⁰

¹⁶⁹ Anthologies consulted include Edward Hartley Dewart's *Selections from Canadian Poets* (1864), "Seranus's" *The Canadian Birthday Book: with poetical selections for everyday in the year from Canadian writers, English and French* (1887), William Douw Lighthall's *Songs of the Great Dominion* (1889), William Douw Lighthall's *Canadian Poems and Lays: Selections of Native Verse, Reflecting the Seasons, Legends and Life of the Dominion* (1893), Theodore H. Rand's *A Treasury of Canadian Verse* (1900), Wilfred Campbell's *The Oxford Book of Canadian Verse* (1913), and Watson and Pierce's *Our Canadian Literature* (1922). As is apparent from their titles, these anthologies feature mostly poetry, with the exception of Watson and Pierce, which also features prose.

¹⁷⁰ Earlier magazinists Susanna Moodie and Rosanna Leprohon also appear in every anthology. Several magazine publishers and editors also appear in the anthologies (beyond Goldwin Smith already mentioned), including *Canadian Monthly and National Review* publisher Graeme Mercer Adam in Susan Frances Harrison's *Canadian Birthday Book* (1887), Rev. R.J. MacGeorge (editor and columnist for *The Anglo-American Magazine*) in the *Oxford Book of Canadian Verse* (1913) and Mary Jane Katzmann Lawson in the Harrison anthology (1887), Lighthall's *Canadian Poems and Lays* (1893) and Rand's *A Treasury of Canadian Verse* (1900). Such appearances reaffirm the connection of these editors to the literary community.

As a whole, the anthologies offer a mixed testimony regarding the significance of the prolific magazine writers. The consistent presence in every anthology of Machar and Harrison confirms them as significant contributors to the literature of their time, as does that of more minor writers such as Davin, Reade, and Wetherald. In the case of other prolific writers, particularly Brownlow and Morgan who were so central to their magazines, it is surprising that each appears in only one or two anthologies. In these two cases, it is interesting to speculate whether the same causes that affected writers in the early century, in Morgan's case immigration and in Brownlow's a relatively early death, affected their posterity. Overall, the fact that the bulk of these prolific magazinists appear in more selective literary form attests to their relatively high literary status.

In uncovering some of the most prolific among the hundreds of writers who helped nineteenth-century Canadian magazine editors fulfil their mandates for literary and cultural development (and for native content: it is remarkable that of the top prolific authors surveyed here only Edgar Fawcett was identifiably American),¹⁷¹ this chapter has verified an immense response to editors' calls for contributors, and clear interest in magazine writing. The chapter also suggests some individuals worthy of further scholarly attention based on their prolific and ubiquitous magazine presence. In the early century, magazine publishing confirms the productivity and efforts of canonical writers Susanna Moodie and Rosanna Leprohon, yet also calls attention to such writers as Samuel Douglass Smith Huyghue and even minor poets such as Amelia Clotilda Jennings or James Haskins. In the later century, the survey affirms the literary significance of writers such as Agnes Maule Machar and Susan Frances Harrison in the post-Confederation

¹⁷¹ The Vincent database provides an option to select authors by origin and lists 99,499 as Canadian and only 72 as foreign authored (the database also lists 38,372 works as originating from foreign periodicals).

period. Using the indexes as sources rather than references reveals the major presence of many authors who seem underappreciated today. The goal of this chapter has been to present such a corps of contributors en masse, yet the findings here suggest many further projects: from tracing canonical authors through the magazines (and newspapers) to further examination of the work of obscure authors in order to determine their literary value.

CONCLUSION

A look back through the archives of nineteenth-century Canadian magazines reveals that, despite their sporadic development and persistent lag behind foreign competitors, the industry's optimistic and altruistic editors created an exciting resource full of literary texts, cultural information, local colour and contemporary intellectual debate that awaits further exploration and appreciation by Canadian scholars. This dissertation has attempted to trace the editorial impetus behind Canadian magazines and to show how editors saw themselves as active promoters of civic and cultural life, and their magazines as rallying points for literary publishing and intellectual development. Notwithstanding the cynicism that might rightly be directed at the chances of success for periodicals birthed into a backwoods where few titles survived and fewer citizens seemed to care, the overarching optimism that emerged with each new attempt is striking, particularly given the real difficulties of starting a magazine in Canada, with its small population and persistent foreign competition, magnified by discriminatory regulatory issues.

Besides providing a forum to promote domestic literature and to allow native writers to practice their craft, magazines made contemporary British and American literature available to Canadians, allowing them to stay current with literary trends. Critical commentary in the prefaces, editorial notes, and literary criticism fostered taste and judgement, and the magazines as a whole acted as vehicles of adult education and cultural betterment that responded to Victorian-era impulses towards self-improvement. Furthermore, the magazines made a space for Canadians to discuss their own issues, a fact that remained a major competitive advantage in the face of more sophisticated

foreign offerings. Magazines also offered the new nation a way to showcase its development to the wider world, and regardless of whether any famous authors were destined to be born into the new nation, a platform ready to nurture such literary aspirants should they arrive.

In the minds of the editors and publishers who created them, magazines offered a meaningful way to engage a reading public in their altruistic quest to enhance the civic and cultural development of their communities, and their prefaces offered that first opportunity to express this vision and invite readers to participate in that community. Given their focus on civic betterment, nationalism was the most prominent theme to emerge from the prefaces, although such expressions were also focussed on community, imperial loyalty, region, and cultural development. With this focus, Canadian editors invited their readers to see themselves as part of a new “imagined community.” Literary development was another common rallying point for the nationalist sentiment, particularly given its potential to capture home-grown stories and provide native literary aspirants with space to practice their craft and bring pride and renown to their new nation.

As a quasi-literary text, the preface form offered editors, writers themselves, an opportunity not only to communicate their intentions but to dazzle readers and potential contributors with their erudition and creative language. In doing so, editors invited readers to participate in a community elevated to a higher intellectual level, and with their rhetorical dexterity challenged writers to match their efforts. With their subsequent editorial commentaries, some editors expanded that role to become literary educators by mentoring existing and potential contributors. These commentaries also solidified their roles for readers in maintaining editorial standards. While many of their comments

encouraged a national literary tone through the choice of Canadian imagery and settings over foreign material, editors were also interested in developing their writers' understanding of the craft more generally, as evidenced by advice such as the suggestion that writers should focus on current subjects, exercise greater care in their versification, engage in original reporting, and spend more time polishing and proofreading.

The dissertation also considers the writers who responded to these magazines. While limited longevity inhibited their trajectories through individual magazines and challenged their ability to retain continuous identities as magazinists, several examples reveal determined authors receiving early encouragement. In the most successful examples, authors such as Susanna Moodie and Rosanna Leprohon used their prolific magazine contribution to develop literary reputations that translated into extended magazine contributorship and even more permanent book publishing. More obscure writers also used their initial publications as an opportunity to practice their craft, often moving on to other creative endeavours. In many cases, authors who stand out as prolific were also quite young, so magazines caught these writers at the outset of their careers and offered them the potential to gain confidence through publication and to refine their craft, thus fulfilling their common mandate to offer opportunities to domestic literary aspirants. While in practical terms the industry's sporadic nature made it less successful as a vehicle for these writers, in theoretical terms the industry offered native authors the potential to realize creative ambitions, and in some cases to move on to other platforms. In the case of the more robust literary community that emerged in the late century, magazines did provide a site for rigorous intellectual discussion and original literary publishing, while maintaining an accessible platform that accepted writers of all ages. For Canadianist

scholars, magazine archives offer an opportunity to pursue the century's intellectual discussions, and to read and recover writers whose literary output and renown at the time recommend them for examination today.

Of course, much work remains to be done. While this dissertation aimed to elucidate broad themes and investigate the magazine genre, many topics that received cursory coverage here are worthy of closer scrutiny and verification by future scholars. This study focussed on the positive rhetoric that editors used to bring a magazine industry into existence, but it remains to verify how well their periodicals succeeded in fulfilling those sometimes grandiose mandates. For instance, in spite of *The Literary Garland's* avowed neutrality and gentility, the magazine's actual attitude was, as McDougall points out, sometimes conservative, reactionary, imperialist, anti-republican, and relatively pious (355-356). Given the preface's function as a marketing tool, a closer look at magazines' success or failures will reveal the extent to which their vows were rhetorical. Such content analyses also have the potential to reveal a good deal about reading tastes, commercial positioning, and texts and authors with literary merit. It would be interesting, while challenging, to analyze whether the editorial advice provided by editors in each magazine improved the literature published within its pages; for instance, to trace the progress of the works of preferred authors through a selected magazine, in order to examine the impact of an editor's advice on his or her work and the work of other authors. Finally, although the dissertation touches on some reader interaction within the magazines, a more focussed study of letters to the editor would provide additional feedback on the sorts of issues that commonly prompted reader engagement and reveal the occasional debates that emerged between readers themselves within the pages of the

magazines (and even across publications as letters of complaint occasionally appeared in other publications).

While I have attempted to pare down this study's wide scope by focussing on only the most general literary magazines, other genres are also deserving of close study. Magazines for religious denominations, fraternal or association (particularly temperance) magazines, domestic/women's magazines, agricultural/farm magazines, sporting/hobbyist titles, and even children's magazines were potential destinations for writers' creative works and forums for literary debate within their specific communities. University and student magazines were particularly longstanding sites of early creative development, and scholarly journals have the potential to provide fascinating details on the state of early Canadian research and knowledge-sharing. The plethora of humour or satire magazines in a relatively small industry affirms our national reputation for humour writing and the work published in these titles deserve to be decoded as a source of commentary on Canadian political and social life. Trade and professional magazines not only provided information on their industries, but also had the potential to reveal more about the way that the magazine form was customized for specific purposes. N. Merrill Distad and Linda Distad's chapter on Canada in *Periodicals of Queen Victoria's Empire* provides a good starting point, with several titles in each of these areas suggested by the authors for further exploration.

Revisiting and refining the bibliography of general/literary magazines would also be a useful exercise for future scholars. While I have limited this study (for the most part, with a few additions and many omissions) to the titles suggested by the three checklists created by Tod and Cordingley, Goggio et al, and Vincent, a perusal through Linda M.

Jones' more comprehensive *Preliminary Checklist of Pre-1901 Canadian Serials* (1986) reveals many titles amongst that listing of some 2,000 that suggest themselves for possible addition to these more general lists. Also, while the three lists I used agree on many core titles, the outliers in the existing general/literary lists affirms the difficulty in agreeing on the definition of general magazines. Whittling down or expanding the list will no doubt be aided by more specific studies of each magazine. The most urgent task in this regard is to recover Thomas Brewer Vincent's *Index to Pre-1900 English Language Canadian Cultural and Literary Magazines* from its DOS-based platform and transfer it to more modern software so that this terrific resource can return to circulation. Shortly after my defence I learned from Dr. Vincent that this upgrade is thankfully now closer to being a reality.

Comparative studies would also be interesting to pursue at many levels. For instance, while this study has been focussed on magazines, newspapers were also a destination for creative work, so it would be interesting to trace the interactions between these media in different communities, and even to investigate the publishing patterns by author to see who published in both media and who contributed exclusively to one or the other. Regional magazines reveal the ways in which the genre could be tailored to suit various areas of Canada, and to study these titles comparatively as a means of investigating how the form evolved in disparate areas would prove equally interesting. A comparative study of how French-Canadian magazines developed alongside the English-Canadian magazine industry would also be interesting as a means of investigating cultural differences and foreign influences, among other elements. Transnational studies with a focus on the precise features that Canadian magazines borrowed from or rejected

elements from the British and American industry would further elucidate the ways in which Canadian editors took advantage of their position as latecomers to the industry to select the best ideas of their competitors and profit from their experimentation.

Much remains to be done to investigate the authors publishing in the magazines. While this study has uncovered some of the prolific magazinists, the focus has been on revealing a vibrant community full of possibility, so it remains to evaluate these authors' literary merit or even their usefulness in revealing the cultural life of their communities. The more promising authors among them offer themselves as candidates for fuller recovery, and many deserve inclusion in national resources like the *Dictionary of Canadian Biography Online*, including Mary Morgan, Edward Burrough Brownlow, George Murray, Susan Frances Harrison, William Douw Lighthall, and Agnes Ethelwyn Wetherald, to name a few (these last three are marked as having expected to have biographies appear in upcoming volumes).

In June 1901, *The Canadian Magazine* (1893-1937) celebrated the occasion of its hundredth issue with a handful of articles that celebrated the magazine and literary industry. The tribute featured some retrospective articles, including Arthur Colquhoun's history "A Century of Canadian Magazines," editor George Stewart's "Literary Reminiscences" on his various editorships, including the founding of *Stewart's Literary Quarterly Magazine*, and articles on a decade of Canadian prose and poetry (the latter written by Duncan C. Scott). As founding editor of *The Canadian Magazine*, J. Gordon Mowat offered some reflections on "The Purpose of a National Magazine," calling magazines "a great national university, diffused, without loss of effectiveness, throughout an entire nation" (167). Within this retrospective the magazine's current editor claimed

the last word for himself. As he reflected on the dawn of a new century of magazines in his article “Making One Hundred Magazines,” he mused that “The rising sun of a second century of Canadian Magazines is colouring the new morning. We face it with hope and confidence. What work presents itself will be met with cheerful countenance and steady determination” (197). In these words, the optimism evident through the pages of all nineteenth century magazines seems to have carried over to a new era.

WORKS CITED

Magazines

The Acadian Magazine; Or Literary Mirror, Consisting of Original and Selected Matter, on Literary and Other Subjects. Monthly. Halifax. July 1926–June 1828.

The Amaranth; A Monthly Magazine of New and Popular Tales, Poetry, History, Biography, &c, &c. Saint John, N.B. Jan. 1841–Dec. 1843.

The Anglo–American Magazine. Monthly. Toronto. July 1852–Dec. 1855.

The Antidote. Weekly. Montreal. 18 June 1892–10 June 1893.

Arcadia; A Semi–monthly Journal Devoted Exclusively to Music, Art and Literature. Montreal. 2 May 1892–1 Mar. 1893.

The Arion, A Canadian Journal of Art Devoted to Music, Art, Literature and the Drama. Monthly. Montreal. Oct. 1880–Sept. 1881.

Arcturus; A Canadian Journal of Literature and Life. Weekly. Toronto. 15 Jan.–25 June 1887.

Barker's Canadian Monthly Magazine. Kingston. Apr. 1846–Apr. 1847.

The Bee; A Weekly Journal Devoted to News, Politics, Literature, Agriculture, etc. Pictou, N.S. 27 May 1835–16 May 1838.

Belford's Monthly Magazine; A Magazine of Literature and Art. Toronto. Dec. 1876–May 1878.

The British American Magazine; Devoted to Literature, Science and Art. Monthly. Toronto. May 1863–Apr. 1864.

The British–American Register. Weekly. Quebec. 8 Jan.–6 Aug. 1803.

The British Canadian Review: Devoted Exclusively to Canadian Literature. Monthly. Quebec. Dec. 1862–Feb. 1863.

The British Colonial Magazine. Weekly. Toronto. 1852–53.

The British Columbian Magazine. Monthly. Victoria, B.C. June 1889–?

The British North American Magazine and Colonial Journal. Monthly? Halifax. Feb. 1831–?

The Bystander; A Monthly Review of Current Events, Canadian and General. Toronto. Monthly Jan. 1880–June 1881; Quarterly Jan.–Oct. 1883; Monthly Oct. 1889–Sept. 1890.

Cabinet of Literature. Monthly. Toronto. Nov. 1838–Sept. 1839.

The Calliopean. Semi-Monthly. Hamilton. 23 Nov. 1847–9 Oct. 1848.

Canada; A Monthly Journal of Religion, Patriotism, Science and Literature. Benton, N.B. Jan. 1891–July/Aug. 1892, seems to be continued to Nov. 1892 in Hampton, N.B.)

The Canadian Casket. Bi-weekly. Hamilton. ? Oct. 1831–29 Sept. 1832.

Canadian Eclectic Magazine of Foreign Literature, Science and Art. Monthly. Toronto. Dec. 1871–Feb. 1872.

The Canadian Family Herald. Weekly. 29 Nov 1851–?

The Garland. Continued as *The Canadian Garland; A Semi-Monthly Literary and Miscellaneous Journal.* Hamilton. Sept. 1832–Aug. 1833.

Canadian Gem and Family Visitor; A Literary and Religious Magazine. Monthly. Toronto. Jan. 1848–Dec. 1849.

The Canadian Journal; A Repertory of Industry, Science and Art and a Record of the Proceedings of the Canadian Institute. First Series. Monthly. Toronto. Aug. 1852–Dec. 1855. Continued as *The Canadian Journal of Industry, Science and Art.* Second Series. Semi-annual. Toronto. Jan. 1856–Dec. 1867. Continued as *Canadian Journal of Science Literature and History.* Quarterly. Toronto. 1868–78. Continued by the *Proceedings of the Canadian Institute.*

The Canadian Illustrated News. Weekly. Hamilton. 8 Nov. 1862–13 Feb. 1864.

The Canadian Illustrated News. Weekly. Montreal. 30 Oct. 1869–29 Dec. 1883.

The Canadian Literary Journal, Devoted to Select Original Literature, and the Interests of Canadian Literary Societies. Monthly. Toronto. July 1870–June 1871. Continued as *The Canadian Magazine.*

The Canadian Literary Magazine. Monthly. York. Apr.–June 1833.

The Canadian Magazine; Religion, Science, Literature, Morality, Agriculture, and Fiction. Monthly. York. Jan.–Apr. 1833.

The Canadian Magazine. Monthly. Toronto. July 1871–Jan. 1872. Continues *The Canadian Literary Journal.*

The Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository. Monthly. Montreal. July 1823–June 1825.

The Canadian Magazine of Politics, Science, Art and Literature. Monthly. Toronto. 1893–1937. Absorbs *Massey's Magazine*.

The Canadian Monthly and National Review. Toronto. Jan. 1872–June 1878. Continues as *Rose Belford's Canadian Monthly and National Review*. 1878–82. Merged with *Belford's Monthly Magazine*.

The Canadian Miscellany; or, the Religious, Literary and Statistical Intelligencer. Monthly. Montreal. Apr.–Sept. 1828.

The Canadian North-West, A Monthly Journal Devoted to the Settlement and Development of Manitoba and the North West. Winnipeg. Jan. 1880–?

The Canadian Patriot; A Monthly Magazine and Review of Social and Political Science. Montreal. Jan.–July 1864.

The Canadian Quarterly Review and Family Magazine, Devoted to National Politics and Interesting Family Literature. Hamilton. Oct. 1863–Apr. 1866.

The Canadian Review and Literary and Historical Journal. Quarterly. Montreal. July 1824–Mar. 1825. Continues as *The Canadian Review and Magazine*.

The Canadian Review and Magazine. Semi-annual. Montreal. Feb.–Sept. 1826.

The Canadian Review and Journal of Literature. Literary Supplement to *Montreal Witness*. 1855–56.

Canadian Son of Temperance and Literary Gem. 26 Feb 1851–29 Dec. 1851
Continued by *Canadian Son of Temperance*. 5 Jan. 1852–20 Dec. 1852 Continued by
The Canadian Son of Temperance and Literary Gem. 3 Jan. 1853–27 Jan 1853.
Continued by *Son of Temperance and Canadian Literary Gem* 7 Jan. 1854–30 Dec. 1854.

Canadians; A Collection of Canadian Notes. Monthly. Montreal. Jan. 1889–Oct./Dec. 1890.

Colonial Pearl; A Volume Devoted to Polite Literature, Science and Religion. January 4, 1839–August 14, 1840. Weekly. Halifax. Continues *The Pearl, Devoted to Polite Literature, Science and Religion*. 3 June 1837–30 Dec. 1837, *Halifax Pearl*. 6 Jan. 1838–28 Dec. 1838.

The Colonial Review: A Weekly Journal of Politics, Literature and Society. Saint John. Jan. 1862–?

The Colonist. Monthly. Winnipeg. 1890-98. Continues *Manitoba Colonist*. Continued by *Great West Magazine*.

The Dominion Illustrated. Weekly. Montreal. 7 July 1888–26 Dec. 1891. Continued by *The Dominion Illustrated Monthly*.

The Dominion Illustrated Monthly. Montreal. Feb. 1892–June 1893.

The Dominion Review; A Monthly Journal of Science, Religion and Politics. Toronto. Mar. 1896–Dec. 1900.

The Enquirer: A Quebec Publication. Monthly. Quebec. 1 May 1821–1 April 1822.

The Gaspé Magazine and Instructive Miscellany. Monthly. New Carlisle. Aug. 1849–June 1850.

The Glowworm. July 1891.

The Great West Magazine. Winnipeg. Sept. 1898–Oct. 1899. Continues *The Colonist*.

The Guardian; A Monthly Magazine of Education and General Literature. Saint John, N.B., Jan.–Sept. 1860.

The Halifax Monthly Magazine. Halifax. June 1830–Nov. 1833.

Halifax Pearl. 6 Jan. 1838–28 Dec. 1838. Continues *The Pearl, Devoted to Polite Literature, Science and Religion*. 3 June 1837–30 Dec. 1837.

The Harp; An Illustrated Magazine of General Literature. Monthly. Montreal. May 1874–Oct. 1882. Vol. 7 pub. in Hamilton.

The Lake Magazine, Devoted to Politics, Science, and General Literature. Monthly. Toronto. Aug. 1892–Apr. 1893.

The Literary Garland. The Literary Garland and Canadian Magazine. Monthly. Montreal. After 1847: *The Literary Garland and British North American Magazine*. Subtitle varies: *A Monthly Magazine Devoted to the Advancement of General Literature; A Monthly Magazine of Tales, Sketches, Poetry, Music, Engravings, &c. &c.* Dec. 1838–Nov. 1842. New series. 1843–51.

Literary Miscellany. Niagara. 1832.

Literary Transcript and General Intelligencer. Quebec. Tri-weekly. 13 Jan.–28 Dec. 1839.

The Lower Canada Watchman. Monthly. Kingston. 1829.

The Manitoban; A Monthly Magazine and Review of Current Events. Winnipeg. Dec. 1891–Oct? 1893.

Manitoba and North West Illustrated Quarterly. Winnipeg. Dec. 1883–?

The Maritime Monthly; A Magazine of Literature, Science and Art. Saint John. Jan. 1873–June 1875.

Massey's Magazine. Monthly. Toronto. Jan. 1896–June 1897. Absorbed by *The Canadian Magazine*.

Massey's Illustrated; A Journal of News and Literature for Rural Homes. Monthly. Mar. 1882–Dec. 1884. New series Dec. 1888–Dec. 1895. Absorbed *The Trip Hammer*.

The Mayflower; or, Ladies' Acadian Newspaper. Monthly. Halifax. May 1851–Feb. 1852.

The Mirror of Literature. Monthly. Prescott, U.C. Nov.–Dec. 1835.

The Monthly Review; Devoted to the Civil Government of Canada. Toronto. Jan.–June 1841.

The Montreal Literary Magazine. Monthly? Sept. 1856–?

The Montreal Monthly Magazine. Mar. 1831–?

The Montreal Museum; Or, Journal of Literature and Arts. Monthly. Montreal. Dec. 1832–Feb./Mar. 1834.

The Nation. Weekly. Toronto. 2 Apr. 1874–29 Sept. 1876.

The New Brunswick Magazine. Monthly. Saint John. 1898–1906.

The New Dominion Monthly; A Magazine of Original and Selected Literature. Montreal. Aug. 1867–Jan. 1879.

The Nova Scotia and New Brunswick Magazine; or Historical, Literary, Theological and Miscellaneous Repository. Monthly. Halifax. Feb. 1806.

The Nova–Scotia Magazine and Comprehensive Review of Literature, Politics and News. Monthly. Halifax. July 1789–Mar. 1792.

The Nova Scotia New Monthly Magazine. Halifax. Feb.–Apr. 1842.

Nor' West Farmer; The Pioneer Farm Journal of Western Canada. Winnipeg. Jan. 1882–1936. Starts as *Nor' West Farmer and Manitoba Miller*. Jan. 1882–Apr. 1889; *Nor West Farmer and Miller*. May 1889–Dec. 1892, Continues as *Nor West Farmer*. Jan. 1893–May 1936.

Nova Scotia Illustrated. Monthly. Halifax. Apr. 1895-?

Occasional Magazine. Monthly. Halifax. Apr. 1892-June 1895.

Our Monthly: A Magazine of Canadian Literature, Science and Art. Toronto. May–June 1896.

The Paul Pry. Weekly. Montreal. 3 Oct. 1844.

The Pearl, Devoted to Polite Literature, Science and Religion. Weekly. Halifax. Aug? 1875–Mar. 1877. Continued by *Halifax Pearl*. 6 Jan. 1838–28 Dec. 1838, *Colonial Pearl; A Volume Devoted to Polite Literature, Science and Religion*. 4 Jan. 1839–14 Aug. 1840.

The People's Magazine. 1 Apr. 1846–14 Sept. 1846. Weekly. Montreal. Continued by *The People's Magazine and Weekly Journal; Comprising Information on the Arts and Sciences, Interesting Histories and Biographies, etc.* 7 Oct. 1846–Oct. 1847?

The Pen, A Literary, Historical and Critical Review. Weekly. Montreal. 11 Dec. 1897–?

The Prince Edward Island Magazine. Monthly. Charlottetown. Mar. 1899–1905.

The Provincial; Or, Halifax Monthly Magazine. Halifax. Jan. 1852–Dec. 1853.

The Quebec Magazine; Or, Useful and Entertaining Repository of Science, Morals, History, Politics, etc. Particularly Adapted for the use of British America. Monthly. Quebec. Aug. 1792–Jan. 1794.

Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly and National Review. Toronto. July 1878–June 1882. Continues *The Canadian Monthly and National Review*.

The Roseharp; For Beauty, Loyalty and Song. Weekly. York. 1 Jan. 1835.

The Saturday Reader. Weekly. Montreal, 9 Sept. 1865–1 Sept. 1866. Interrupted by *Illustrated Saturday Reader*, then returned to *The Saturday Reader*. 9 Mar. 1867–31 Aug. 1867.

Toronto Saturday Night. Weekly. Toronto. 3 Dec. 1887–15 July 1911. Continues as *Saturday Night*.

The Scribbler; A Series of Weekly Essays Published in Montreal, L.C. On Literary, Critical, Satirical, Moral and Local Subjects: Interspersed With Pieces Of Poetry. Weekly, bi-monthly, irregularly. Montreal. 28 June 1821–27 July 1827.

Sinclair's Journal of British North America. 3 Mar.–18 Aug. 1849 Weekly. Quebec. Continued by *Sinclair's Monthly Circular and Literary Gazette*. Jan. 1855–Mar 57? *Sinclair's Weekly Advertiser* 2 Mar-14 Dec 1860?

Stewart's Literary Quarterly Magazine; Devoted to Light and Entertaining Literature Saint John. Apr. 1867–Jan. 1870. Continued by *Stewart's Quarterly; An Original Magazine*. Apr. 1870–Jan. 1872.

Tarot; A Monthly Illustrated Magazine. Toronto. Feb.–Mar. 1896.

Torch; Devoted to Light Literature. Monthly. Saint John. Dec. 1877–78?

The Trip Hammer. Monthly. Feb. 1885–Feb. 1886. Absorbed by *Massey's Illustrated*.

Truth; A Weekly Magazine of Current Literature for the People. Toronto. 1884–1885 New series. 1870–1880, 1883–90.

The Victoria Magazine: A Cheap Periodical for the Canadian People. Monthly. Belleville. Sept. 1847–Aug. 1848.

Walsh's Illustrated Monthly Magazine. Monthly. Toronto, Oct. 1895–Mar. 1896.

The Week; A Canadian Journal of Politics, Society and Literature. Toronto. 6 Dec. 1883–20 Nov. 1896.

The Western Sunbeam. Monthly. Winnipeg. Apr. 1891.

Winnipeg Illustrated. Monthly. Dec. 1882.

Secondary Sources

Altick, Richard. *The English Common Reader: A Social History of the Mass Reading Public, 1800–1900.* Chicago: U of Chicago P, 1957. Print.

Anderson, Benedict. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism.* Revised Edition. London and New York: Verso, 2006. Print.

- Ballstadt, Carl. "The Quest for Canadian Identity in Pre-Confederation English-Canadian Literary Criticism." MA thesis. U of Western Ontario, 1959. Print.
- Ballstadt, Carl, Elizabeth Hopkins and Michael Peterman, eds. *Letters of a Lifetime: Susanna Moodie*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1993. Print.
- Bayley, Diana. *Henry; or, the Juvenile Traveller*. London: Simpkin Marshall, 1836. Print.
- Bentley, D. M. R., and Mary Lynn Wickens. *A Checklist of Literary Materials in The Week (Toronto, 1883–1896)*. Ottawa: The Golden Dog Press, 1978. Print.
- Bissell, C.T. "Literary Taste in Central Canada During the Late Nineteenth Century." *Canadian Historical Review* 31 (Sept. 1971): 237–51. Print.
- Brake, Laurel, Aled Jones and Lionel Madden, eds. *Investigating Victorian Journalism*. New York: St.Martin's Press, 1990. Print.
- Brown, Mary Markham. *An Index to The Literary Garland (Montreal 1838–1851)*. Toronto: Bibliographical Society of Canada, 1962. Print.
- . "The Literary Garland and A Case of Literary Larceny." *Journal of Canadian Fiction* 2:3 (1973): 65–8. Print.
- Brownlow, Edward Burrough ("Sarepta"). *Orpheus and Other Poems*. Montreal: Pen and Pencil Club, 1896. Print.
- Calnek, W. A. *History of the County of Annapolis*. Belleville: Mika Studio, 1972. Print.
- Campbell, Wilfred, Ed. *The Oxford Book of Canadian Verse*. Toronto: Oxford UP, 1913. Print.
- Colquhoun, Arthur H.U. "A Century of Canadian Magazines." *The Canadian Magazine* June 1901: 141–149. Print.

- Davies, Gwendolyn. "A Literary Study of Selected Periodicals from Maritime Canada 1789–1872." Diss. York U, 1979. Print.
- . "Dearer than his Dog: Literary Women in Pre-Confederation Nova Scotia." *Studies in Maritime Literary History*. Fredericton: Acadiensis, 1991. Print.
- Daymond, Douglas M. and Leslie G. Monkman, eds. *Towards a Canadian Literature: Essays, Editorials & Manifestoes, Volume 1: 1752–1940*. Ottawa: Tecumseh Press, 1984. Print.
- Dewart, Edward Hartley, ed. *Selections from Canadian Poets with Occasional Critical and Biographical Notes and an Introductory Essay on Canadian Poetry*. Montreal: Lovell, 1864. Print.
- Dictionary of Canadian Biography Online*. DCB/DBC, 2011. Web. 14 Oct. 2011.
- Ballstadt, Carl. "James Haskins"
- Banks, Margaret A. "Sir John George Bourinot"
- Brouwer, Ruth Compton. "Agnes Maule Machar"
- Cogswell, Fred. "Emily Elizabeth (Beavan) Shaw"
- Davies, Gwendolyn. "Samuel Douglass Smith Huyghue"
- . "Amelia Clotilda Jennings"
- Godard, Barbara. "Louisa Annie Murray"
- Hamilton, William B. "William Lyall"
- Holland, Clifford G. "William Dawson LeSueur"
- Kernaghan, Lois K. "Mary Jane Katzmann (Lawson)"
- Killan, Gerald. "Charles Pelham Mulvany"
- Moir, John S. "John Campbell (J. Cawdor Bell)"

Stockdale, J.C. "Rosanna Eleanora Mullins (Leprohon)"

Thompson, John Herd. "Nicholas Flood Davin"

Trofimenkoff, Susan Mann. "Eliza Lanesford Foster (Cushing)"

Dictionary of Literary Biography: Canadian Writers Before 1890. Ed. William H. New.

Detroit: Gale Research, 1990. Web.

Distad, N. Merrill and Linda M. Distad. "Canada." In J. Don Vann and Rosemary T.

VanArsdel, eds. *Periodicals of Queen Victoria's Empire: An Exploration*.

Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1996. Print.

Dudek, Louis. *Literature and the Press: A History of Printing, Printed Media, and Their*

Relation to Literature. Toronto: Contact Press, 1960. Print.

Durand, Charles. *Reminiscences of Charles Durand of Toronto, Barrister*. Toronto:

Hunter Rose, 1897. Print.

Dyer, Klay. "A Periodical for the People: Mrs. Moodie and *The Victoria Magazine*."

Diss. U of Ottawa, 1992. Print.

Early Canadiana Online. Canadiana.org. Web. 14 October 2011.

Fetherling, Douglas. *The Rise of the Canadian Newspaper*. Toronto: Oxford UP, 1990.

Print.

—. "A Bitter Exile: Charles Durand and the Mackenzie-Papineau Rebellions." *Books in*

Canada May 1994. Print.

Fiamengo, Janice. *The Woman's Page: Journalism and Rhetoric in Early Canada*.

Toronto: U of Toronto P, 2008. Print.

- Flitton, Marilyn. *An Index to The Canadian Monthly and National Review, and to Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly and National Review*. Toronto: Bibliographical Society of Canada, 1976. Print.
- . “The Canadian Monthly 1872–1882.” MA Thesis. Simon Fraser U, 1973. Print.
- Fraser, Nancy. “Two Nova Scotian Literary Periodicals of the 1830s: *The Halifax Monthly Magazine* and *The Pearl*.” MA Thesis. Dalhousie U, 1977. Print.
- Genette, Gérard. *Paratexts: Thresholds of Interpretation*. New York: Cambridge UP, 1997. Print.
- Gerson, Carole. *A Purer Taste: The Writing and Reading of Fiction in English in Nineteenth-Century Canada*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1989. Print.
- . *Canadian Women in Print 1750–1918*. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier UP, 2010. Print.
- Goggio, Emilio, Beatrice Corrigan and Jack H. Parker. *A Bibliography of Canadian Cultural Periodicals (English and French from Colonial Times to 1950) in Canadian Libraries*. Toronto: Dept. of Italian, Spanish and Portuguese, U of Toronto, 1955. Print.
- Graham, Walter. *English Literary Periodicals*. New York: Octagon Books, 1966. Print.
- Harrison, Susan Frances (“Seranus”), Ed. *The Canadian Birthday Book: With Poetical Selections for Everyday in the Year from Canadian Writers, English and French*. Toronto: Blackett Robinson, 1887. Print.
- Herd, Harold. *The March of Journalism: The Story of the British Press from 1622 to the Present Day*. Connecticut: Greenwood Press, 1952. Print.
- Jennings, Amelia Clotilda (“Maude”). *Linden Rhymes*. Halifax: 1853. Print.
- . *The White Rose in Acadia and Autumn in Nova Scotia*. Halifax: 1855.

- Jones, Linda M. *Preliminary Checklist of Pre-1901 Canadian Serials*. Ottawa: Canadian Institute for Historical Micro-reproductions, 1986. Print.
- Kesterton, W.H. *A History of Journalism in Canada*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1967. Print.
- Klinck, Carl F. "Samuel Hull Willocke." *Journal of Canadian Fiction* 2:3 (1973): 13–21.
- , ed. *Literary History of Canada: Canadian Literature in English*. Second Ed. Vol. 1. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1976.
- Lawson, Mary Jane Katzmann. *History of the Townships of Dartmouth, Preston, and Lawrencetown in Halifax County, Nova Scotia*. Belleville: Mika Studio, 1972. Print.
- Lamonde, Yvan, Patricia Lockhart Fleming, and Fiona A. Black, eds. *History of the Book in Canada. Volume Two: 1840–1918*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 2005. Print.
- Lang, Marjory. *Women Who Made the News: Female Journalists in Canada, 1880–1945*. Montreal and Kingston: McGill–Queen's UP, 1999. Print.
- Lighthall, W.D., ed. *Canadian Poems and Lays: Selections of Native Verse, Reflecting the Seasons, Legends and Life of the Dominion*. London: W. Scott, 1893. Print.
- . *Songs of the Great Dominion: Voices from the Forests and Waters, the Settlements and Cities of Canada*. London: W Scott, 1889. Print.
- MacDonald, Mary Lu. "An Index To *The Literary Garland* Updated." *Papers of the Bibliographical Society of Canada* 19 (1980): 79–83. Print.
- . "A Very Laudable Effort: Standards of Literary Excellence in Early Nineteenth-Century Canada." *Canadian Literature* 131 (1991): 84–98. Print.

- . "English and French-Language Periodicals and the Development of a Literary Culture in Early Victorian Canada." *Victorian Periodicals Review* 26:4 (1993): 221–27. Print.
- . *Literature and Society in the Canadas 1817–1850*. Lewiston: The Edwin Mellen Press, 1992. Print.
- . "Reading Between the Lines: An Analysis of Canadian Literary Prefaces and Prospectuses in the First Half of the Nineteenth Century." In Blodgett, E.D. and A.G. Purdy, eds. *Prefaces and Literary Manifestoes / Préfaces et Manifestes littéraires*. Edmonton: Research Institute for Comparative Literature, 1990. 29–42. Print.
- . "Some Notes on the Montreal Literary Scene in the Mid-1820s." *Canadian Poetry* 5 (1979): 29–40. Print.
- . "*The Montreal Museum 1832–1834: The Presence and Absence of Literary Women*." In *Women's writing and the literary institution/L'écriture au féminin et l'institution littéraire*, Eds. C. Potvin and J. Williamson. Edmonton: U of Alberta Research Institute for Comparative Literature, 1992. 139–50. Print.
- "Making One Hundred Magazines." *The Canadian Magazine* June 1901: 194–97. Print.
- McDougall, Robert L. "A Study of Canadian Periodical Literature of the Nineteenth Century." Diss. U of Toronto, 1950. Print.
- McMullen, Lorraine and Elizabeth Waterston, Eds. "Rosanna Mullins Leprohon: At Home in Many Worlds." In MacMillan, Carrie, Lorraine McMullen and Elizabeth Waterston, eds. *Silenced Sextet: Six Nineteenth-Century Canadian Women Novelists*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's UP, 1993. 14–51. Print.

- Moodie, Susanna. *Life in the Clearings: To Which is Added this Author's Introduction to Mark Hurdlestone*. Ed. Robert L. McDougall. Toronto: MacMillan Canada, 1959. Print.
- Morgan, Henry James. *Bibliotheca Canadensis: or A Manual of Canadian Literature*. Ottawa: G.E. Desbarats, 1967. Print.
- . *The Canadian Men and Women of the Time: A Hand-book of Canadian Biography of Living Characters. Second Edition*. Toronto: William Briggs, 1912. Print.
- . *Types of Canadian Women and of Women who are or have been Connected with Canada*. Toronto: William Briggs, 1903. Print.
- Mott, Frank Luther. *A History of American Magazines 1741–1930*. 5 vols. Cambridge: Harvard UP, 1968. Print.
- Mount, Nick. *When Canadian Literature Moved to New York*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 2005. Print.
- Mowat, J. Gordon. “The Purpose of a National Magazine.” *The Canadian Magazine* June 1901: 166–67. Print.
- Murray, George. *Poetical Works of George Murray*. Montreal: Edward G. O'Connor, 1912. Print.
- Murray, Heather. *Come Bright Improvement! The Literary Societies of Nineteenth-Century Ontario*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 2002. Print.
- O’Hagan, Thomas. *Canadian Essays Critical and Historical*. Toronto: William Briggs, 1901. Print.
- Oxford Companion to Canadian Literature*. Ed. Margaret Drabble. Sixth Edition. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2000. Print.

- Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2004. Web. 14 Oct 2011. Print.
- Parker, George L. *The Beginnings of the Book Trade in Canada*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1985. Print.
- Peterman, Michael. "In Search of Agnes Strickland's Sisters." *Canadian Literature* 121 (1989): 115–124. Print.
- Rand, Theodore H., ed. *A Treasury of Canadian Verse: With Brief Biographical Notes*. Toronto: William Briggs, 1900. Print.
- Rutherford, Paul. *A Victorian Authority: The Daily Press in Late Nineteenth-Century Canada*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1982. Print.
- Smith, Allan. "American Publications in Nineteenth-Century English Canada." *Papers of the Bibliographical Society of Canada* 9 (1970): 15–29. Print.
- Sullivan, Alvin, ed. *British Literary Magazines: The Romantic Age, 1789–1836*. London: Greenwood Press, 1983. Print.
- . *British Literary Magazines: The Victorian and Edwardian Age, 1837–1913*. London: Greenwood Press, 1984. Print.
- Sutherland, Fraser. *The Monthly Epic: A History of Canadian Magazines 1789–1989*. Markham: Fitzhenry & Whiteside, 1989. Print.
- Thurston, John. *The Work of Words: The Writing of Susanna Strickland Moodie*. Montreal: McGill–Queen's UP, 1996. Print.
- Tod, Dorothea D. and Audrey Cordingley. *A Bibliography of Canadian Literary Periodicals, 1789–1900*. The Royal Society of Canada, Series 3, Vol. 26. (1932): 87–96. Print.

- Tremaine, Marie. *A Bibliography of Canadian Imprints, 1751–1800*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1952. Print.
- Vernon, Foster. “The Development of Adult Education in Ontario, 1700–1900.” Diss. U of Toronto, 1969. Print.
- Vincent, Thomas Brewer. *The Amaranth, 1841–43: Contents Report and Index*. Kingston: Royal Military College, 1984. Print.
- . *Index to Pre-1900 English Language Canadian Cultural and Literary Magazines*. CD ROM. Ottawa: Optim Corporation, 1993.
- Vincent, Thomas Brewer, Sandra Alston and Eli MacLaren. “Magazines in English” in Patricia Lockhart Fleming et al., eds. *History of the Book in Canada. Volume One: Beginnings to 1840*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 2004. Print.
- Vincent, Thomas Brewer and Ann LaBrash. *The Nova–Scotia Magazine, 1789–1792: Contents Report and Index*. Kingston: Royal Military College, 1982. Print.
- . *The Provincial, or, Halifax Monthly Magazine, 1852–1853: Contents Report and Index*. Kingston: Royal Military College, 1984. Print.
- Watson, Albert and Lorne Pierce, eds. *Our Canadian Literature: Representative Prose and Verse*. Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1922. Print.
- Watters, Reginald Eyre. *A Checklist of Canadian Literature 1628–1960*. Second Ed. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1972. Print.
- Wiseman, John A. “Silent Companions: The Dissemination of Books and Periodicals in Nineteenth–Century Ontario” *Publishing History* 12 (1982): 17–50. Print.
- Wood, James Playsted. *Magazines in the United States*. Second Edition. New York: The Ronald Press Company, 1956. Print.

WORKS CONSULTED

- Alston, Sandra and Patricia Lockhart Fleming. *Early Canadian Printing: A Supplement to Marie Tremaine's "A Bibliography of Canadian Imprints, 1751–1800."* Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1999. Print.
- Andrews, Alexander. *The History of British Journalism from the Foundation of the Newspaper Press in England, to the Repeal of the Stamp Act in 1885, with Sketches of Press Celebrities*. Vols. 1 & 2. New York: Haskell House, 1968. Print.
- Arnason, David. "Canadian Literary Periodicals of the Nineteenth Century." *Journal of Canadian Fiction* 2:3 (1973): 125–8. Print.
- Baker, Roy Palmer. *A History of English–Canadian Literature to Confederation*. New York: Russell & Russell, 1920. Print.
- Ballstadt, Carl, ed. *The Search for English-Canadian Literature: An Anthology of Critical Articles from the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1975. Print.
- Barbour, Noel Robert. *Those Amazing People! The Story of the Canadian Magazine Industry 1778–1967*. Toronto: Crucible, 1982. Print.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. *The Field of Cultural Production: Essays on Art and Literature*. New York: Columbia UP, 1993. Print.
- Brake, Laurel, Bill Bell, and David Finkelstein, eds. *Nineteenth–Century Media and the Construction of Identities*. New York: Palgrave, 2000. Print.
- Bullen, J.B., ed. *Writing and Victorianism*. New York: Addison, Wesley Longman, Ltd., 1997. Print.

- Buss, Helen M. and Marlene Kadar, eds. *Working in Women's Archives: Researching Women's Private Literature and Archival Documents*. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier UP, 2001. Print.
- Buxton, William J. and Catherine McKercher. "Newspaper, Magazines and Journalism In Canada: Towards a Critical Historiography." *Acadiensis* 28.1 (1998): 103–26. Print.
- Charlesworth, Hector. *Candid Chronicles: Leaves from the Note Book of a Canadian Journalist*. Toronto: Macmillan, 1925. Print.
- . *More Candid Chronicles: Further Leaves from the Note Book of a Canadian Journalist*. Toronto: MacMillan, 1928. Print.
- Coleman, Daniel, et al., eds. *ReCalling Early Canada: Reading the Political in Literary and Cultural Production*. Edmonton: U of Alberta P, 2005. Print.
- Cook, Ramsay. *The Regenerators: Social Criticism in Late Victorian English Canada*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1985. Print.
- Craick, W.A. *A History of Canadian Journalism: In the Several Portions of the Dominion with a Sketch of the Canadian Press Association 1859–1908*. Toronto: Canadian Press Association, 1908. Print.
- Dagg, Anne Innis. *The Feminine Gaze: A Canadian Compendium of Non-Fiction Women Authors and Their Books, 1836–1945*. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier UP, 2001. Print.
- Darnton, Robert. *The Kiss of Lamourette: Reflections in Cultural History*. New York: Norton, 1990. Print.

- Desbarats, Peter, ed. *Canadian Illustrated News 1869–1883: Canada's First National Magazine*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1979. Print.
- Doyle, James. *The Fin de Siècle Spirit: Walter Blackburn Harte and the American/Canadian Literary Milieu of the 1890s*. Toronto: ECW, 1995. Print.
- Eggleston, Wilfrid. *The Frontier & Canadian Letters*. Toronto: The Ryerson Press, 1957. Print.
- Fauteaux, Aegidius. *The Introduction of Printing into Canada*. Montreal: Rolland Paper Co., 1957. Print.
- Frye, Northrup. *Mythologizing Canada: Essays on the Canadian Literary Imagination*. Branko Gorjup, ed. New York: Legas, 1997. Print.
- Giles, Paul. *Transatlantic Insurrections: British Culture and the Formation of American Literature, 1730-1860*. Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 2001.
- Gorjup, Branko. "A Study of Travel Literature, Biography and Criticism in English Canadian Magazines 1880–1920." Diss. York U, 1989. Print.
- Gross, Robert A. "Books, Nationalism, and History." *Papers of the Bibliographical Society of Canada* 36.2 (1998): 107–23. Print.
- Guildford, Janet and Suzanne Morton. *Separate Spheres: Women's Worlds in the 19th Century Maritimes*. Fredericton: Acadiensis Press, 1994. Print.
- Guth, Gwendolyn. "'A World for Women: Fictions of the Female Artist in English–Canadian Periodicals, 1840–1880.'" Diss. U of Ottawa, 1999. Print.
- Harris, Sharon M. *Blue Pencils and Hidden Hands: Women Editing Periodicals, 1830–1910*. Boston: Northeastern UP, 2004. Print.

- Harrison, Susie Frances. *Crowded Out and Other Sketches*. Ottawa: Evening Journal Offices, 1886. Print.
- Heggie, Grace F. and Gordon R. Adshead, eds. *An Index to Saturday Night: The First Fifty Years, 1887–1937*. Toronto: Micromedia, 1987. Print.
- Houghton, Walter E. *The Victorian Frame of Mind*. New Haven: Yale UP, 1957. Print.
- Howsam, Leslie. *Old Books and New Histories: An Orientation to Studies in Book and Print Culture*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 2006. Print.
- Kamrath, Mark L. and Sharon M. Harris. *Periodical Literature in Eighteenth–Century America*. Knoxville: U of Tennessee P, 2005. Print.
- Kertzer, Jonathan. *Worrying the Nation: Imagining a National Literature in English Canada*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1998. Print.
- La Bossière, Camille R, ed. *Context North America: Canadian/U.S. Literary Relations*. Ottawa: U of Ottawa P, 1994. Print.
- Lamonde, Yvan. “Canadian Print and the Emergence of a Public Culture in Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries.” *Les idées en mouvement: Perspectives en histoire intellectuelle et culturelle du Canada*. Ed. Damien–Claude Belanger, et al. Sainte Foy: Les Presses de l’Université Laval, 2004, 175–90. Print.
- Loggie, L.J. “*The Literary Garland: A Critical and Historical Study*.” Diss. U of New Brunswick, 1948. Print.
- MacDonald, Mary Lu. *Cherchez L'imprimeur: Printers and the Development of Printing in Lower Canada Before 1860*. Sherbrooke: GRÉLQ, 1995. Print.
- MacMechan Archibald. *Headwaters of Canadian Literature*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1974. Print.

- McGill, Meredith L. *American Literature and the Culture of Reprinting, 1834–1853*. U of Pennsylvania P, 2007. Print.
- McKillop, A.B. *A Disciplined Intelligence: Critical Inquiry and Canadian Thought in the Victorian Era*. Montreal: McGill–Queen's UP, 1979. Print.
- McMullen, Lorraine. *Re(dis)covering our Foremothers: Nineteenth–Century Canadian Women Writers*. Ottawa: U of Ottawa P, 1990. Print.
- McMullen, Lorraine. *Twentieth Century Essays on Confederation Literature*. Ottawa: Tecumseh Press, 1976. Print.
- Moodie, Susanna. *Voyages: Short Narratives of Susanna Moodie*. Ed. John Thurston. Ottawa: U of Ottawa P, 1991. Print.
- Morgan, Henry J. *Sketches of Celebrated Canadians*. London: Hunter, Rose, and Co., 1862. Print.
- Moritz, Albert. *Canada Illustrated: The Art of Nineteenth–Century Engraving*. Toronto: Dreadnaught Co–operative, 1982. Print.
- Moss, Laura and Cynthia Sugars. *Canadian Literature in English: Texts and Contexts*. Toronto : Pearson Longman, 2009. Print.
- Okker, Patricia. *Our Sister Editors: Sarah J. Hale and the Tradition of Nineteenth Century American Women Editors*. Athens: U of Georgia P, 1995. Print.
- Price, Kenneth M. and Susan Belasco Smith, eds. *Periodical Literature in Nineteenth–Century America*. Charlottesville: UP of Virginia, 1995. Print.
- Reed, David. *The Popular Magazine in Britain and the United States 1880–1960*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1997. Print.

- Rutherford, Paul. *The Making of the Canadian Media*. Toronto: McGraw–Hill Ryerson Limited, 1978. Print.
- Shattock, Joanne and Michael Wolff, eds. *The Victorian Periodical Press: Samplings and Soundings*. Leicester: Leicester UP, 1982. Print.
- Sotiron, Minko. *From Politics to Profit: The Commercialization of Canadian Daily Newspapers, 1890–1920*. Montreal and Kingston: McGill–Queen's UP, 1997. Print.
- Stewart, George. "Literary Reminiscences." *The Canadian Magazine* June 1901: 163–66. Print.
- . "The History of a Magazine." *The Dominion Illustrated Monthly*. Aug. 1892: 400–8. Print.
- Sutherland, John. *Victorian Fiction: Writers, Publishers, Readers*. London: Macmillan, 1995. Print.
- Tebbel, John William and Mary Ellen Zuckerman. *The Magazine in America, 1741–1990*. New York: Oxford UP, 1991. Print.
- Traill, Catherine Parr. *Forest and Other Gleanings: The Fugitive Writings of Catharine Parr Traill*. Ed. Carl Ballstadt and Michael Peterman. Ottawa: U of Ottawa P, 1994. Print.
- Vann J. Don and Rosemary T. VanArsdel, eds. *Victorian Periodicals: A Guide to Research*. New York: Modern Language Association of America, 1978. Print.
- . *Victorian Periodicals and Victorian Society*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1996. Print.

Vincent, Thomas Brewer. *The Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository, July 1823–June 1825: Contents Report and Index*. Kingston: Royal Military College of Canada, 1984. Print.

—. *A Directory of Known Pseudonyms, Initial Sets and Maiden Names found in Selected English–Canadian Magazines, Newspapers and Books of the Nineteenth Century*. Kingston: Loyal Colonies Press, 1993. Print.

Vincent, Thomas Brewer and Ann LaBrash. *The Acadian Magazine 1826–1828: Contents Report and Index*. Kingston: Royal Military College, 1984. Print.

Waite, Peter B. *The Life and Times of Confederation, 1864–1867: Politics, Newspapers and The Union Of British North America*. Toronto: Robin Brass Studio, 2001. Print.

Wallace, Elizabeth. *Goldwin Smith, Victorian Liberal*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1957. Print.

Weisbuch, Robert. *Atlantic Double–Cross: American Literature and British Influence in the Age of Emerson*. Chicago: U of Chicago P, 1986. Print.

Wynne, Deborah. *The Sensation Novel and the Victorian Family Magazine*. New York: Palgrave, 2001. Print.