

**LIBERAL THEOLOGY IN THE LATE QING CHINA:
THE CASE OF TIMOTHY RICHARD**

by Cuiwei Yang

Thesis submitted to the Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral
Studies in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the PhD
degree in History

Department of History

University of Ottawa

© Cuiwei Yang, Ottawa, Canada, 2014

ABSTRACT

Liberal Theology in the Late Qing China: the Case of Timothy Richard

PhD Candidate: Cui Wei Yang

Supervisor: Micheline Lessard
André Laliberté

30 April 2014

The opium wars in China during the 1840s were followed by a surge of Christianization in the late Qing dynasty. What a kind of role played by missionaries in the modernization of the Qing China has been a long-lasting issue since the early 20th century. Due to political reasons, the contribution of the Christian mission was either underestimated in view of *Cultural Invasion* paradigm or overemphasized in view of *Modernization* paradigm.

The thesis employs a less-distorted model, *Liberal Theology*, to analyze the influences of liberal missionaries, exemplified by Timothy Richard, on the social reform in the modernization movement of the late Qing. It describes the relevance of missionary activities to the development of Chinese history in view of the biographical records of Christian missions. The entry point of this presence is traced in the text through Richard's activities to contribute to famine relief, literary work, reform advocacy, higher education, cross-cultural exchange, a product of the development of his ideas and strategies gained from the promotion of European models of modernization. Particularly, the thesis brings to light Richard's symbiotic conception between religion and secularism (i.e., science, technology, education, and political reform). The main contribution of the study hinges on a couple of aspects: (1) Building a thorough portrait of Richard and of his life-long

vocation by means of a number of primary and secondary sources in both English and Chinese; and (2) Interpreting the liminal role Richard played in his missionary work to answer the question: are missionaries a proxy of imperialism, or a paragon of modernization, or something in between?

After pointing out the limitations of the two old paradigms, the thesis exposes that, armed with the hybrid *Liberal Theology* model, we can better understand the nature of the mission work done by liberal missionaries, such as Richard. Thus, though their activities happened in an era marked with colonial imperialism, the Christian mission should not be regarded as simply an imperialistic invasion in the cultural field; what is more, though missionaries introduced western civilization to Chinese people in various proselytizing approaches, they could not be considered as one of the prime movers for China's modernization in the late Qing Dynasty, because the contributions they made subordinately promoted China's modernization through a series of religious and cultural contacts with Chinese elites via, e.g., meetings, media, literary work, higher education.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

With my great pleasure I would like to express my gratitude to all who have contributed to my PhD study. First and foremost I thank my supervisor, Professor Micheline Lessard and Professor André Laliberté. Without their sincere, timely, resourceful, and consistent supervisions, it would be impossible for me to enjoy the sunrise during my research life. Their fruitful achievements, extraordinary patience, and everlasting enthusiasm have impressed me deeply and will continue to shed light on my future. I also thank Professors Jean-Guy Daigle (retired) and Viren Murthy (University of Wisconsin-Madison) who offered their partial supervisions. I show my great appreciation to Professor Li Shen-wen (Université Laval) for the help with reference materials, conference attendance, and discussions about some topics of mutual interests.

I express my sincere appreciation to Professor Gregory Blue, Professor Éric Allina, Professor Lotfi Ben Rejeb, and Professor Alberto G. Flórez-Malagón! They commented on the thesis and suggested important advice to guide me for a final version. I do not know where to find proper words to express my thanks to them. Their resourceful ideas on the subject under investigation, including those on the most recent advances in research and their connections with the thesis, have led the revised version to being a significant improvement.

With my love I express my thanks to my parents. Their partial financial support to my family and good wishes to my study encouraged me to endeavor step by step in the last eight years. Especially, my father Yang Shaopu helped me to collect Chinese literature about Timothy Richard in the China National Library, Beijing. It deserves mention that, to commemorate my study on missionaries in China represented by Protestant Timothy Richard, I named my son Richard, who was born in the middle of my study. I also express my dearest love to my daughter, Helen, who helped me a lot to look after Richard so as to offer me plenty of time. Finally, I show my gratitude to my husband, Zhen Guo, who managed to make my family survive during my study.

I acknowledge that the Quebec government and the Department of History provided the financial support for the study.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT		ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS		iii
TABLE OF CONTENTS		iv
CHAPTER 1	INTRODUCTION	1
	1.1 Statement of Issue	1
	1.2 Different Models of Scholarships on Mission Work	3
	1.2.1 Western Academia	3
	1.2.2 Chinese Academia and Political Community	13
	1.2.2.1 <i>Invasion</i> Paradigm	17
	1.2.2.2 <i>Modernization</i> Paradigm	24
	1.2.2.3 Comparison between the Two Paradigms	31
	1.3 Emergence of Modernity and Liberal Theology in Europe	34
	1.4 Elements of Richard’s Liberal Theology	40
	1.5 Purpose, Significance, and Structure of Study	46
	1.5.1 Purpose of our Study	47
	1.5.2 Significance of our Study	49
	1.5.3 Structure of the Thesis	52
CHAPTER 2	STUDIES ON CHRISTIAN MISSIONS EXEMPLIFIED BY RICHARD: NECESSITY OF LIBERAL THEOLOGY	56
	2.1 Introduction	56
	2.2 Necessity of Liberal Theology Paradigm	63
	2.3 Review of Studies on Richard’s Mission Work	70
	2.3.1 Missionary Records	71
	2.3.2 Studies by Other Western Scholars	77
	2.3.3 Studies by Chinese scholars	84
CHAPTER 3	MODERNITY FEATURE IN THE FORMATION OF RICHARD’S LIBERAL THEOLOGY	94
	3.1 Missions in China before Richard’s Arrival	94
	3.2 Richard’s Awakening of liberalism from Fundamentalist Missions	100
	3.3 Resistance from Chinese Officials and Richard’s Responses	105
	3.4 Resistance from Fundamentalists & BMS and Richard’s Responses	115
	3.5 Positive Responses from Chinese People	127
	3.6 Richard’s Endeavour to Maintain Mission Work in China	135
	3.7 Discussion	145
CHAPTER 4	EXPANSION FEATURE IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF RICHARD’S LIBERAL THEOLOGY	147
	4.1 Importance of Publishing	147
	4.2 Mission Work at <i>Shibao</i>	150
	4.3 Mission Work in the S.D.K.	152
	4.3.1 S.D.K. Output and Responses from Chinese Elites	154

	4.3.2 Influence on Emperor's Reform	165
	4.3.3 Influence on Empress's Reform	183
	4.3.4 Connections with Western People	189
	4.4 Contributions in the C.L.S.	191
	4.5 Significance of Publishing	197
CHAPTER 5	MODERNITY FEATURE IN RICHARD'S MISSION WORK: WESTERNIZATION OF EDUCATION	199
	5.1 Background	199
	5.2 Advocacy of Educational Reform through EAC	200
	5.2.1 Reform Plan	201
	5.2.2 Practice	203
	5.3 Promotion of Educational Reform through Higher Education	207
	5.3.1 Situation	207
	5.3.2 Initiation of Project	208
	5.3.3 Challenges and Advances	213
	5.3.4 Accomplishment and the Significance	220
	5.4 Honors	226
CHAPTER 6	EXPANSION FEATURE IN RICHARD'S MISSION WORK: CHRISTIANIZATION OF BUDDHISM	228
	6.1 Cultural Conflict and Solution	228
	6.2 Intrinsic Connection between Han-Buddhism and Christianity	230
	6.3 Literary Evidence of Buddhism-Christianity Relation	235
	6.3.1 <i>QI Shin Lun</i>	235
	6.3.2 <i>Lotus Sutra</i>	241
	6.3.3 <i>A Mission to Heaven</i>	243
	6.3.4 Other Resources	245
	6.4 Great Unity under Christian Universalism	249
	6.5 Discussion	256
CHAPTER 7	SUMMARY, DISCUSSION, AND FUTURE WORK	261
	7.1 Summary	261
	7.2 Discussion	264
	7.3 Future Work	279
APPENDIX I	TABLE OF CHINESE NAMES: CONVERSION OF HANYU PINYIN AND WADE-GILES	272
APPENDIX II	TIMOTHY RICHARD'S CHRONOLOGICAL LIFE OUTLINE	275
APPENDIX III	TIMOTHY RICHARD'S COMPLETE OEUVRE	279
	III-1 Literary works in English	279
	III-2 Literary works in Chinese	280
BIBLIOGRAPHY		281
	B1 Primary Sources in English	281
	B1-1 Manuscripts	281
	B1-2 Books	282
	B1-2-1 Annotated Books	282

B1-2-2 Non-annotated Books	282
B1-3 Pamphlets	283
B1-3-1 Annotated Pamphlets	283
B1-3-2 Non-annotated Pamphlets	283
B1-4 Articles	284
B1-5 Reports and Proceedings	286
B1-6 Newspapers	286
B2 Secondary Sources in English	286
B2-1 Books	286
B2-1-1 Annotated Books	286
B2-1-2 Non-annotated Books	292
B2-2 Articles	302
B2-2-1 Annotated Articles	302
B2-2-2 Non-annotated Articles	306
B3 Primary Sources in Chinese	307
B3-1 Annotated Books	307
B3-2 Non-annotated Books	309
B4 Secondary Sources in Chinese	309
Annotated Books and Articles	309

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Statement of Issue

Timothy Richard (1845-1919) was one of the most influential and famous British protestant missionaries in Late Qing China (1840-1911). He was brought up in a historical period when western colonization and Christianization were simultaneously expanding globally after the European Industrial Revolution. Armed with a unique liberal theology for Christianization, he came to China in 1870 and worked there as a Liberal missionary for 45 years.

In those days, mission work relied dominantly on Fundamentalist activities, e.g., preaching in the street and at chapel, distribution of tracts and pamphlets, hymn singing, itinerant ministry, making translations of Western literature, organizing charity and famine relief. Nevertheless, far beyond participating in these traditional missions, Richard developed a nontraditional, top-down approach to evangelize China: to disseminate Western civilization to Chinese elites, and through them to convert more Chinese people. In addition, he pushed forward China's political and educational reforms by exerting necessary influences through literary work on Chinese reformers, including even the Emperor Guangxu and Empress Cixi. Moreover, he designed a Christianity-dominated League of Religions to remove secular misunderstandings in China on Christianity, eliminate spiritual estrangement, and dispel ideological

oppositions among different cultures. Last but not least, he was one of the early advocates and practitioners in the world to disseminate Christianity via spreading science and technology after the Jesuits.¹

Therefore, he became a forerunner in China's reform as "a pioneer missionary, philanthropist, missionary statesman, scholar, educationist, author, publicist, friend and advisor of princes and peasants."² Conspicuously, his life-long missionary endeavors in the modernization of China won him the highest honor of the Qing government: the highest rank (Red Button) of the Double Dragon Mandarin retroactive for three generations.³

For tens of years, how to evaluate objectively the influence of missionaries on China's modernization in the late Qing dynasty is one of the major issues in the study of Chinese history, or, more precisely, of modern Chinese history. The assessment of the role played by Richard in late Qing times thus has become an important wind in academia to recognize the position and status of Western missionaries in the modern history of China, especially in the transition period of the country from an isolated, hierarchical society to an industrialization-oriented eastern world at the turn of the 19th - 20th centuries.

With regard to Western missionaries and mission work, Chinese researchers and Western scholars have had different views, especially among those living in different historical periods. There had emerged different evaluation models in scholarship, depending on various political backgrounds and respective academic emphases. The

¹W. E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China, Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Limited, 1924), p.17; *Timothy Richard of China* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Limited, 1924), pp.127-129.

²E. W. P. Evans, *Timothy Richard: A Narrative of Christian Enterprise and Statesmanship in China* (London: The Carey Press, 1945), p.10.

³A. J. Garnier, *A Maker of Modern China* (London: The Carey Press, 1945), p.85.

Western world was permeated with two main models, John K. Fairbank's "Impact-Response" theory and Paul Cohen's "China-centered" formalism. By contrast, the "cultural invasion" paradigm and "modernization" paradigm prevailed in Chinese academia.

In this chapter, we will first of all introduce the frame of these models. Then, we will discuss the emergence of modernity and liberal theology in Europe, as well as their influences on a new generation, as represented by Timothy Richard. Furthermore, we will pay attention to the less distorted perspective of liberal theology to analyze Christianization in late Qing China. Finally, we will introduce the purpose and significance of the thesis in the study of modern Chinese history.

1.2 Different Models of Scholarships on Mission Work

1.2.1 Western Academia

Epistemologically, Western scholars own numerous opinions on mission work. Because China had long been the representative of the East in culture and civilization before the 1800s, "Sinology" (Han-hsüeh 汉学, Chinese Studies) in the West can be traced back to as early as the mid-18th century in Europe. At the early stage, Sinology sometimes focused on missionaries' records of China missions and their translations of Chinese classics. In America, early Chinese study was just a replica of the European Sinology. After the 1st World War, the United States became the postwar hegemon in the West and paid growing attention to China which was changing from an Empire to a

Republic. Particularly from the 2nd World War, due to the growing up of the Chinese Communist Party which appeared to set up harmonic relations with another superpower, the Soviet Union, the States began to further develop Sinology in order to know China and to underpin the US relationship with this ancient, giant country.

The initiative was led by a professor at Harvard University, John King Fairbank (1907-1991). He was the leading representative of American Chinese studies from the 1950s to the 1980. By switching from the traditional European Sinology which emphasized the records of mission activities and the understanding of the Confucian books, Fairbank developed American Sinology, characterized with particular concern for the historical changes that happened in imperial China. Due to his life-long endeavour, a modern school of scholars on Chinese studies was formed, called the “Harvard School,” and the Fairbank Center for Chinese Studies was established at Harvard in 1955. Against Marxism-Leninism, Fairbank built a new theory on the basis not only of Max Weber and Talcott Parsons’ modernization theory, but also of Arnold Toynbee’s “Challenge-Response” paradigm. This theory was well described by the “Impact-Response” model which was later reformulated by one of his disciples, Joseph R. Levenson, to a so-called “Tradition-Modernity” model.⁴ The Western-centered main points include:⁵

(1) China's own traditional culture, Confucianism, was unable to meet the cultural requirements of an industrial society, and thus hindered the development of both her ability of self-renovation and her initiative to open the door for modernization in the 18th

⁴Joseph R. Levenson, *Confucianism and its modern fate: A Trilogy* (Berkeley University of California Press, 1968); The “impact-response” model runs through most of his works, for example, *The United States and China, Trade and Diplomacy on the China Coast: the Opening of the Treaty Ports, China’s Response to the West: A Documentary Survey*.

⁵John K. Fairbank, *The United States and China*, the revised and enlarged edition, (Cambridge Harvard University Press 2008), pp. 162-166.

and 19th centuries. The late Qing was a transition period for China to move from a country isolated from the world to one that is integrated in the world. As the prime mover of China's modernization, the *impact* of the West in the Opium Wars triggered a series of changes in traditional China, and pushed her forward to becoming a modernized country. In response, while China was passively engaged with western culture and civilization, it actively learned modern science and technology for vigorously rejuvenating herself.

(2) The traditional Chinese imperial tributary system had to be replaced by a kind of internationally accepted, treaty-based system. For the success of the update, it was necessary for China to comply with the provisions of all unequal treaties and offer privileges to missionaries. This was because that missionary activities in China (such as, church-run schools and hospitals, recruiting and promoting of talented people, making translations of Western literature, promoting of women's education, as well as contributing to charity and famine reliefs) were all indispensable for the destruction of the old China, and the construction of a new one. To some extent, missionaries were the precursors of the Chinese Communists.

(3) The tragic conflict between the West and China in the 19th century was due to the fundamental heterogeneity and the mutual incompatibility of the Western Christian civilization and the Chinese Confucian civilization. The tragedy was inevitable in the development of human history when advanced civilization spread worldwide; it was also the cost that developing societies were bound to pay for their progress.

Fairbank's achievements were popular in the West. His theory won a leading position in Western Sinology, and, more importantly, influenced the design of the

United States' policy toward China. Unfortunately, this theory had not gone unchallenged as a standard in academia. Starting from the 1970s, his viewpoints were questioned by other scholars. Paul A. Cohen, a historian at Wellesley College, and one of Fairbank's former students, criticized Fairbank's model by considering it ethnocentrically distorted. He argued that "by exposing the myth of American global supremacy—political, moral, cultural—" he "freed American historians, perhaps for the first time, to abandon Western norms and measures of significance and to move toward a more genuinely other-centered historiography, a historiography rooted in the historical experience not of the West but of China."⁶ To correct Fairbank's misleading orientation, Cohen proposed a "China-centered" approach during the Vietnam War (1955-1975), in the light of the new reality of world history in which the understanding and recognition of modern Chinese history should be renewed.⁷ To justify his viewpoint, Cohen commented that the facile assumption, that "reform was a mere subcategory of Sino-Western relations—something that came into existence in the wake of, and had meaning only in reference to, a Western impact," should be taken special care to resist; and that Chinese reform-related thought and activity in the late Qing, "although increasingly influenced by the West, were also part of a longstanding reformist tradition, which, in its origins, its style, and even much of its content, owed little or nothing to foreign inspiration."⁸

⁶Paul A. Cohen, *Discovering History in China: American Historical Writing on the Recent Chinese Past*(New York, Columbia University Press 1984)p. 7

⁷ Li Tongqi " 'China-Centered Model: Features, Thoughts currency and Internal Tension' ", preface by translator in Paul A. Cohen, *Discovering History in China: American Historical Writing on the Recent Chinese Past* (Chinese version: 在中国发现历史)(Beijing Zhonghua Book Company 2005), p.5.

⁸Paul A. Cohen, *Discovering History in China: American Historical Writing on the Recent Chinese Past* (New York, Columbia University Press 1984), p.21

Different from Fairbank's model, which stressed external factors that exerted crucial impacts on China's modernization, Cohen's argument concentrated on the internal factors of the Chinese society. He considered that it was the self-motivation for innovation that drove China's own initiative of reform, as had happened previously in the long history of China. Indirectly, Cohen weakened, even denied, the importance of the Western impact on the development of China. Instead, he insisted that all of the reforms which happened in China from the late Qing were nothing else but the continuation of the revolution in the long process of China's self-modernization in history. In the new model, Cohen multilayered various phenomena and events in the modern Chinese history: there existed three domains from the inside to the outside, namely, culture and custom, economy and politics, military affairs and diplomacy. The innermost one was the region least influenced by the West's invasion, while the outermost one experienced the heaviest momentum from the West.⁹ Ironically, this model, especially in discussing the situation of the "outermost" sphere, appeared to verify the effectiveness of Fairbank's "Impact-Response" assumption.

The model asserted that the conflict between missionaries and those who behaved as the defenders of Chinese traditional culture occurred in the least influenced sphere. To this problem, Cohen was aware of the fact that in China "the role of gentry and official classes became crucial;" and that the "anti-missionary incidents were not spontaneous but were planned in advance and, to some extent, organized."¹⁰ In his view, the conflicts between the "Western", "new", "modern culture-equipped" missionaries

⁹Paul A. Cohen, *Discovering History in China: American Historical Writing on the Recent Chinese Past* (New York: Columbia University Press 1984), p.53.

¹⁰Paul A. Cohen, *Discovering History in China: American Historical Writing on the Recent Chinese Past* (New York: Columbia University Press 1984), p.47.

and the “Chinese”, “old”, “traditional culture-equipped” gentry constituted an aspect in the evolution of modern Chinese history; but the effect of the missionary movement in China was limited within, but did not extend beyond, the Sino-West relations in the cultural field, as expressed by the mutual misunderstandings between foreign missionaries and indigenous intellectuals.

We point out here that before 1840, there had been no external factors that were involved in China’s self-renovations. The transitions that had happened then were not comparable to the reforms in the late Qing when the process was driven dominantly by Western powers with gunboats and goods, and China was forced to face Western Imperialism and enhanced itself by learning from Western civilization. During this process, any kind of reform thinking and activity was triggered by the impact of the West, and showed an increasingly Westernized style. Furthermore, the content and nature of the reform in the late Qing Dynasty had a much more far-reaching significance than any previous ones in the long history of China. For example, profound social changes had happened in the fields of military, education, politics, even in ideological and cultural aspects. Though the reformers at that time were not aware of this series of inevitable, precious consequences, the social transformation in the late Qing was clearly of great importance. Without a doubt, it is hard to recognize and understand the modernization in the late Qing if cutting off the ties between the impact of the West and the response of the Chinese society. As introduced previously, Cohen himself also admitted the merits, though indirectly, of Fairbank’s “Impact-Response” relation in his multilayered model. Thus, Cohen’s “internal initiative” model may be still viewed as a

variant of Fairbank's model to examine the history of the introduction of Christianity into China, but paying attention to the Response.

As a matter of fact, Fairbank's theory was not only congenial for the description of the Sino-West relation in the 19th century when the external force dominated China's transition, but also suitable to explain the interaction between Jesuit missionaries and Chinese people in the 16th - 17th centuries. An eminent French Sinologist, Jacques Gernet, concentrated on the reaction of the Chinese to the introduction of Christianity into China and the conflict between Christianity and Confucianism at that time. His famous book, entitled *China and the Christian Impact: A Conflict of Cultures*, was the first masterpiece to demonstrate unequivocally that (1) in the transitions of China, Christianization was the initial western impulse to drive China's adaptation to the outer world; (2) China responded passively to this cross-cultural action and resisted the spread of the exotic religion, Christianity; (3) inevitably, there occurred cultural conflicts. Gernet's study supported Fairbank's "Impact-Response" model. We can enjoy Gernet's similar theme to Fairbank's theory from the titles used for his books published in different languages: while the English, German and Chinese versions emphasized *Impact*, its French, Italian and Spanish versions stressed *Response*.¹¹

More generally, Fairbank's theory also had a place for internal missionary groups to discuss better approaches in mission work, as well as to deal with problems emerged in evangelization, as shown in the Post-Christendom movement of the late 20th and

¹¹English version: *China and the Christian Impact: A Conflict of Cultures*

German version: *Christus kam bis nach China: Eine erste Begegnung und ihr Scheitern*

Chinese version: 《中国文化与基督教—中西文化的首次碰撞》（北京：中华书局 2005 年）

French version: *Chine et Christianisme*

Italian version: *Cina e cristianesimo: Azione e reazione* (China and Christianity: Action and Reaction, 1984)

Spanish version: *Primeras reacciones chinas al cristianismo* (China's initial reaction to Christianity, 1989)

early 21st centuries. The movement was a direct reflection in the religious field of a host of late 20th-century postmodern movements that departed from the late 19th and early 20th-century modernism.¹² The *impact* of the postmodernism, centered at the absence of absolute truth on the Earth, resulted in open-minded seekers' refusal to obey long-held beliefs and conventions of Christianisation which held that God and the Bible provided the absolute truth. As a typical *response* in the Christian world, emerging church came into being, labelled by questioning the beliefs of modern-day Christianity and contrasted itself with what has gone before with inherited church traditions, e.g., Christendom, namely, the creation and maintenance of a Christian nation by ensuring a close relationship of power between the Christian Church and its host culture.¹³ According to Stuart Murry's analysis,¹⁴ inherited church attempted to use this power-discourse in evangelism, and adhere to modern-day values such as, commitment to hierarchy and the status quo, the use of political power to bring in the Kingdom, marginalisation of women, the poor, and dissident movements, partiality for respectability and top-down mission, etc.; on the contrary, the emerging church sought for a post-Christendom approach to being church and mission through, e.g., renouncing imperialistic approaches to language and cultural imposition, overcoming the public/private dichotomy, moving from the center to the margins and from a place of privilege in society to one voice amongst many, a transition from control to witness.

In contrast to the above mentioned epistemological "Impact-Response" model, there was a methodological model of "Contextualization/Syncretism" in missiological

¹²Kaya Yilmaz, "Postmodernism and its Challenge to the Discipline of History: Implications for History Education," *Educational Philosophy & Theory*, 42, No.7, pp. 779-795

¹³Stuart Murray, *Post Christendom, Church and Mission in a Strangle Land* (Carlisle: Paternoster Press, 2004), pp.83-88.

¹⁴ *Ibid.*, pp.83-88, pp. 200-202.

research. It was developed by Gailyn Van Rheenen.¹⁵ The concept of *Contextualization* came from the efforts of formulating, presenting and practicing the Christian faith in such a way that it was relevant to the cultural context of the target group in terms of conceptualization, expression and application; yet maintaining theological coherence, biblical integrity and theoretical consistency.¹⁶ For the *syncretism*, it could be either described as the conscious or unconscious reshaping of Christian plausibility structures, beliefs, and practices through cultural accommodation, or stated as the blending of Christian beliefs and practices with those of traditional culture, so that Christianity lose its distinctiveness and was spoken with a voice reflective of the culture.¹⁷ This model was effective to analyze different mission approaches under different cultural environments. Its kernel lay in the mutual dependence between contextualization and syncretism: on the one hand, syncretism was unable to be assumed to take place without an understanding of contextualization; and, on the other hand, contextualization could not be stated without the syncretism of biblical meanings with the contemporary cultural setting that determined the emphasis placed upon scripture.¹⁸ At the end of the last century, this model was used in Chinese studies and formed a so-called the Sino-theology, as compared to the use of traditional Western theology in Chinese studies. This newly proposed theology was specifically designed not with transplanting Christianity in the “pot” of Western culture, but by planting Christianity in the Chinese

¹⁵Gailyn Van Rheenen, “Contextualization-Syncretism” [<http://www.missiology.org/?p=119>], March 2014.

¹⁶Enoch Wan, “Critiquing the method of Traditional Western Theology and Calling for Sino-Theology,” [http://www.missiology.org/?page_id=303], March 2014.

¹⁷Gailyn Van Rheenen, “Modern and Postmodern Syncretism in Theology and Missions,” in *The Holy Spirit and Mission Dynamics*, ed. C. Douglas McCommell (William Carey Library 1997), pp.164-207.

¹⁸A. Scott Moreau, “Contextualization: From an Adapted Message to an Adapted Life” in *The Changing Face of World Missions*, by Michael Pocock, Gailyn Van Rheenen, and Douglas McConnell (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic), p.335.

cultural soil to root, flourish and grow, including, but not limited to, e.g., Chinese ways of social interactions, communicated through the use of Chinese grammar, and expressed in terms of Chinese topics.¹⁹

Although the theory was proposed as late as in the late 20th century, the “Contextualization/ Syncretism” approach had been employed by the Jesuit missionaries in China as early as in the 16th and 17th centuries. When facing indigenous Chinese culture, especially meeting with contradictions between Christian doctrine and traditional Chinese beliefs and customs, Jesuits made compromising attitudes and practices like, explaining the Bible with Chinese teachings, living in the style of local people, etc., to construct a favorable environment for improving and promoting mission work. The representative of the most successful missionaries was Ricci, who combined Christianity with Confucianism to produce a syncretic Christian culture which incorporated non-Western, indigenous contextualization into translating, modelling and preaching the Gospels. However, as Jaques Gernet pointed out, such a syncretic Christianity was actually not the real Christianity on the track of Western religion, but a hodgepodge of faiths and thoughts in its pattern.²⁰

Based on the review of the Christian missions in the late Qing China, we found that it was different from the previous Jesuit mission. On the one side, Christianity was introduced by missionaries into China after the 1840s in the background of the West’s colonial expansion of imperialism; on the other side, China was forced by the powerful West to open its door for modernization, and thus its reactions to the external force were

¹⁹Enoch Wan, “Critiquing the method of Traditional Western Theology and Calling for Sino-Theology,” [http://www.missiology.org/?page_id=303], March 2014.

²⁰Jaques Gernet, *Chine et Christianisme* (Chinese version) (Shanghai: Shanghai Classical Publishing House 2003), p. 49. 谢和耐, 《中国与基督教—中西文化的首次撞击》增补版, 上海 上海古籍出版社, 2003 年。

both passively and helplessly tinted. The sudden *impact* of the foreign culture on the traditional Confucianism brought about unexpected pressure to indigenous people. It was a natural *response* of the Chinese to reject, rather than to syncretize, Christianity. In this situation, Timothy Richard and other Protestant missionaries came to China, engaging in mission work similar to their Jesuit pioneers in the late Ming and early Qing. They inherited Jesuits' approaches of finding a balance between Christianity and Confucianism in missionary activities, e.g., using Chinese concepts to translate and interpret biblical and theological writings.

However, the work by Richard and his colleagues were virtually different from and more significant than Jesuits: it was *contextualized* with concerns of Western ideas relating to materialization and social reforms that could be used for the change of Chinese people's livelihood and, stepping further, the modernization of the whole Chinese society through the effects of Chinese elites. While faithful to the original, the missionaries' literal work aimed at triggering the renovation of China by means of Western knowledge and information, especially science and technology, instead of a kind of pure translations and interpretations of Western theology and missiology. With the help of this *syncretism*, they hoped Christianity might be well blended with traditional Chinese culture and dominate China's development in the kingdom of God.

1.2.2 Chinese Academia and Political Community

In history, most of the Chinese were the victims of the self-isolated Confucian culture, including not only almost all the uncultured and ignorant Boxers in the late Qing and most Chinese intellectuals before 1978, but also those powerful rulers like Empress Dowager Cixi (tz'u-hsi 慈禧 1835-1908) and the Communist Party leader, Mao Zedong (Mao Tse-tung 毛泽东 1893-1976). These nationalists were intolerant of almost everything from the West. They advocated that China should continue to close its door from the outer world, as did in last thousands of years. They also insisted that mission work was the West's imperialistic invasion in the cultural field, in tandem with the West's imperialistic military, economic, and political actions in China.

On the contrary, there had been a few progressive Chinese officers and scholars who were increasingly aware of the severity of both domestic and diplomatic problems which were arising from the 18th century to challenge Chinese people. These included Li Hongzhang (Li Hung-Chang 李鸿章 1823—1901), a famous politician, general, and diplomat in the late Qing; Kang Youwei (K'ang Yu-wei 康有为 1858–1927), a prominent Chinese scholar and political reformer during the transition period from Qing to Republic; and some Chinese scholars after 1978 under the influence of Deng's opening-up policy. Seeking for effective ways to innovate China, these people viewed mission work as an ally which was capable of engendering China's social improvement, cultural & educational enhancement, and technological industrialization. They considered missionaries pushed forward reforms in China for modernization.²¹

²¹Wang Lixin, *American Missionaries and China's Modernization of Late Qing* (Tianjin: Tianjin People Publishing House, 1997), p.166. 王立新, 《美国传教士与晚清中国现代化》, 天津: 天津人民出版社, 1997年, 第166页。

Because missionaries were featured by a dual character, there occurred a couple of widespread opposite interpretations in Chinese academia and political community pertaining to the significance of missionary activities. One of them is what may be termed the *Cultural Invasion* paradigm.²² This paradigm was based on the Leninist concept of imperialism, which had dominated China's academia as a standard framework until 1978.²³ While emphasizing and overplaying the imperialistic nature of mission work, this paradigm denied categorically missionaries' contribution to facilitating China's modernization in the late Qing dynasty. Here and throughout the thesis, we use the concept of "modernization" to refer to the transition from a 'traditional' agrarian society (e.g., the Qing China) to the kind of 'modern' society (i.e., a Westernized country) that is based on trade and industry. There are a few differences between the two societies: (1) the former is 'vertically' organized by hierarchical division by class — a specialization of prestige, while the latter is 'horizontally' organized by function, such that the major functions are performed by modular social systems; (2) the former is like a pyramid of top-down authority, while the latter is more like a mosaic held together by the cement of mutual inter-dependence; (3) the former consists of a single, unified system with a single center of power, while the latter is composed of a plurality of autonomous systems with multiple centers of power which interact with each other, influence each other, but do not absorb each other. The continued process of modernization tends to break down any remaining vestiges of

²²Qu Qiubai, *Ways of Imperialist Aggression to China* (Volume 2, Beijing: People's Press, 1988), p.80. 瞿秋白, 《帝国主义侵略中国之各种方式》, 北京: 人民出版社, 第二版, 1988年, 第80页。

²³After Mao Zedong and Chinese Communist Party set up the People's Republic of China, China closed its door again to the Western world. Until 1978, Deng Xiaoping began an economic reform called "socialism with Chinese characteristics". China opened its door to the world again, literally "Reform and Opening up".

hierarchy and centralized domination of social functions.²⁴ In the late Qing, China was just driven by the West to develop itself from a traditional agricultural society to an industrialized one through Westernization. We employ this word, “modernization”, with the above definition to denote the transition of China in the late Qing Dynasty.

On the contrary, after 1978, Deng’s reform policy made some open-minded Chinese historians to revise their verdict on the missionaries’ endeavor to modernize China in the late Qing. They re-evaluated Lenin’s revolutionary theory and reviewed the influence of missionary activities on China’s modernization. On this issue, Wang Lixin, a professor at the Department of History, Beijing University, is a representative. These Chinese scholars paid attention to the positive aspect of mission work and suggested a new *Modernization* paradigm.²⁵ They declared that modern Chinese history, onward from the Opium Wars, was essentially a process of modernization, in which missionaries were the pioneers of the progressive reform in the late Qing. They regarded the *Invasion* paradigm as an interpretive framework that was colored by too much political or ideological tint. Consequently, they maintained that the paradigm was inadequate to evaluate mission work.

However, both of the paradigms were insufficient to provide a neutral interpretation of the mission work. While the *Invasion* model stood on the nationalist stance and regards missionaries as the accomplices of imperialism, the *Modernization* model went to another extreme by ignoring the innate imperialist nature of missionaries and setting aside the fact that the late Qing was invaded by the West in political,

²⁴In detail, see: B. Charlton and P. Andras, *The Modernization Imperative* (Exeter: Imprint Academic, 2003), p.p.1-96.

²⁵Tao Feiya and Yang Weihua, “Studies of History of Chinese Christianity since Opening-up”, *Journal of Historical Science* 10 (2010), pp.5-18. 陶飞亚、杨卫华, “改革开放以来的中国基督教史研究”, 《史学月刊》, 2010年第10期, 第5-18页。

economic, and military fields, but merely emphasizing the contribution of missionaries in China's modernization. More details are as follows.

1.2.2.1 *Invasion Paradigm*

From 1840 to 1911, Western missionaries actively took part in activities in China's education, famine relief, medical care, even political reforms. Although their social reforms pushed forward the movement of the modernization of China and helped the country to be embraced eventually by the world, missionaries were doubted, reproached, and treated with indifference or hostility by Chinese people and Chinese government before 1911. From 1840 to 1911, there were more than four hundred religion riots all over the country. However, from 1911, the Nationalist Government (KMT) was welcoming the Western missionaries in Mainland China and it continued to do so in Taiwan after 1949. Unfortunately, armed with Leninist Revolution theory, the Communist Party of China (CPC) had always opposed the West actively and forcefully since its establishment in 1921. Before 1949 More and more people welcomed and upheld Marxism-Leninism and Mao Zedong Thought and treated mission work as one part of the West's invasion. After CPC reigned the Mainland in 1949, Christian missionaries became difficult in China and withdrew from China in the 1950s. Under the ideology of the Revolution and Communism, all Chinese scholars before 1978 even

considered the Western missionaries as the accomplices of imperialists. There were many reasons for this point of view.

First of all, there was a popular belief among uncultured Chinese people that Christianity embraces inhumanity and brutality.²⁶ This was because some mission work for charity appeared to be against Chinese ethics and sense of humanity. For example, surgeries in church-running hospitals were seen as killing people by arbitrarily digging out eyes, hearts, or other organs from human bodies. In addition, males and females praying together in one room were imagined as sexual promiscuity. According to Confucius, principle of “separation between men and women”, both the missionaries and those women were cursed.

Secondly, gatherings of tens or hundreds of Christians worshipping indoors or outdoors at the same time were interpreted as rallies which were out of governmental control and might trigger anti-governmental movements. This recognition was similar to that engendered by the activities of secret Chinese societies such as the White Lotus and the Tianli Sects which had already caused social instabilities. To some extent, there were kernels of truth in these perceptions since churches did attract a lot of people to oppose local governments with respect to certain public policies.²⁷

Furthermore, Christian doctrine was viewed as counter-cultural to Chinese tradition.²⁸ For instance, Chinese hierarchy had heretofore lasted thousands of years and Chinese people had had a deep-rooted viewpoint from the Qin Dynasty (221BC-207BC):

²⁶ Hu Weige and Zheng Quan, “Cultural conflict and anti-Christian Struggle: Cultural perspective of Religious Case in Late Qing,” *Journal of North East University* (Philosophy and Social Science version), no.1 (2001), p.25. 胡维革、郑权, “文化冲突与反洋教斗争”, 《东北师大学报》(哲学社会科学版), 2001年第1期, 第25页。

²⁷ *Ibid.*, p.23.

²⁸ *Ibid.*, p.26.

Chinese emperors were the successive sons of Good Lord of Heaven (老天爷) and had a mandate from the Heaven to rule. This is a traditional concept held in Chinese people which is similar to the “God” appearing in the Bible, however, not merely one son but many sons.²⁹ Because all of the emperors were considered to have ruled China, or the “world” centered on China, Dynasty after Dynasty, successively on behalf of the Heaven, the *only-son* concept of Jesus in the Bible was indeed perceived as bizarre. In addition, ancestor-worship was a prevalent custom in China. For missionaries, this was a kind of idol worship which should be banned. Here, we concede that all Christian denominations or sects have Christ as the core of their beliefs. But there exist no universal Christian doctrines. For example, there is a huge difference between Catholicism and Protestantism, so is between Baptists and Methodists, etc. Nevertheless, to Chinese people from either rural regions or Forbidden City, all of the Christian branches, either Protestant or Orthodox, were the same from one to the other, and all were called “洋教” (“foreign religions”). In the eyes of the Chinese, all the west were monoliths to invade China, and all the missionaries appeared the same, in the same name of Christ, to evangelize against the Chinese Confucianism.

Lastly, mission work was considered to be against China’s long-lasting egocentrism in the world. For thousands of years, Chinese people believed that China was the center of the world, and that Chinese people had the absolute privilege to control the world, and that China was the metropolitan state and the others were its

²⁹According to Confucianism, all Chinese emperors are Tianzi (天子, sons of the Heaven), i.e., the sons of the Heaven though as humans. Here are some evidences to show the definition of Tianzi in ancient Chinese classics: (1) The Book of Rites: the person who rule the country is named as Tianzi (礼记: 君天下曰天子); (2) The Book of Han: The father of all the emperors is the Heaven and thus they are the sons of the Heaven (汉书: 王者父事天, 故爵称天子). Although emperors were the sons of the Heaven, the word “Tianzi” reflects the emphasis of the Divine Right of kings, similar to the West’s tradition.

protectorates. Chinese people were self-recognized as far more civilized than foreigners. The Sino-foreign relations were under the tributary system.³⁰ From this Sino-centric view of point, any non-trade activities performed by any foreigners in China were more or less part of a plan or conspiracy with which invaders sought to conquer China and plunder China's resources. There was a long lasting proverb usually cited by Chinese emperors, “非我族类，其心必异” (“Outsider must be devious due to a different kin”). Though many intellectuals in the 19th Century believed that China was lagging behind, the majority of the people did not care because they were not aware.

Consequently, even though there were some benevolent contributions to famine relief, cultural exchange, and medical charity such as to build hospitals, oranges and schools, traditional Chinese elites regarded missionary activities as one of the ways for the West to conquer and colonize China, and worried about the negative impact of mission work on Chinese culture. Duan Zhaoyong (Tuan Chao-yung 段兆鏞), an official in the Hanlin Academy of the late Qing Dynasty, pointed out in 1857 that the final goal of the Western religion was to sugar-coat the process of imperialist invasion. Officials familiar with Western affairs also had similar opinions. For instance, Guo Songtao (Kuo Sung-t'ao 郭嵩焘), the Chinese ambassador to Great Britain in 1877-1878, supported the argument that mission work was linked closely with commercial exchange and military invasion.³¹

This nationalist stance was reinforced by the victory of the Russian revolution in 1917. Guided by Russian revolutionaries, some Chinese nationalists accepted Marxist-

³⁰Denis Twitchett and J. K. Fairbank, *The Cambridge History of China*, Vol.10 (London, New York, Melbourne: Cambridge University Press, 1978), pp.29-31.

³¹Wang Zhichun, *The Complete History of China's Trade* (Beijing: Chinese Book Company, 1989), pp.13-14. 王之春, 《国朝柔远记》, 北京: 中华书局, 1989年, 第13-14页。

Leninist conceptions of history as well as the Leninist theory of imperialism. Chinese Marxism-Leninism stated that (1) China faced two contradictions, a principal one and a secondary one; (2) the principal contradiction existed between colonialism and anti-colonialism, or between imperialism and anti-imperialism; (3) the secondary one existed between the backward feudalism and the advanced capitalism.

According to this theory, China should first of all engage in a revolution against the West's invasion to safeguard Chinese sovereignty, independence, territorial integrity, and to eliminate what had transformed China into a colony. In 1919, there broke out the famous May 4th Movement. It was critical of imperialism but not of Western concepts like democracy and science. Both Chinese intellectuals and politicians hope to expel the imperialist invaders from China; at the same time, to root science and democracy in the soil of the Chinese culture so that it would burgeon forth to enlighten Chinese people. While the KMT paid more attention to the latter and took advantage of mission activities in its "New-Life Movement", the CPC members were seemly more insistent to the former, at least partially due to the influence exerted by the Russian Revolution in 1918.

In 1920, a famous Chinese Leninist, Yun Daiying (Yün Tai-ying 恽代英), first used the term, *Cultural Invasion*, to define the policy of the West: undermining China through a gradual but consistent loss in culture and education via such activities like running Christian schools or publishing newspapers, in good agreement with political, economic, and military purposes of Western invaders. He analyzed that the more the missionaries worked, the faster would be the dying process of Chinese culture.³² Another CPC nationalist, Qu Qiubai (Ch'ü Ch'iu-pai 瞿秋白), claimed that church-

³²Yun Daiying, *Yun Daiying Corpus* (Beijing: People's Press, 1984), p.180. 恽代英, 《恽代英文集》, 北京: 人民出版社, 1984年, 第180页。

running schools were the useful tools of the West's cultural aggression, aiming at weakening Chinese national identity.³³

The *Invasion* ideology was supported by some Chinese nongovernmental organizations and even the KMT government. In 1924, the Chinese Non-Christian Association³⁴ published a manifesto.³⁵ The document expounded that Christianity was akin to spiritual opium which anaesthetized Chinese people and thus diminished their struggle against the Western colonialists. It asserted that Chinese national identity and nationalism were destroyed in the process of Christianization. At the same time, the Chinese Nationalist Party government edited a book entitled *Study Set of Unequal Treaties*.³⁶ The monograph collected a series of missionary stories to expose examples in which Western missionaries played roles in Western Imperialist invasion against Chinese society and thus weakening Chinese sovereignty. For example, it was stated that mission work effectively eliminated any significant or sustained resistance against Western political, economic, and military domination in China; what is more, it even prevented any personal or organizational resistance to foreigners, especially to Western armies.

Yun and Qu's visions were popular among nationalists in both the Chinese Communist Party and the Chinese Nationalist Party, the two dominant parties in China after 1920. One among these elites was Mao Zedong (Mao Tse-tung 毛泽东). In his

³³Qu Qiubai, *Qu Qiu-bai Corpus* Vol.2 (Beijing: People's Press, 1988), p.80. 瞿秋白, 《瞿秋白文集》, 第二卷, 北京: 人民出版社, 1988年, 第80页。

³⁴With the development of anti-imperialism movement initiated in 1922, this movement reached its climax during 1925-1927. Communist Li Dazhao (Li Ta-cha 李大钊) supported non-religious alliance, in 1924, non-religious alliance developed into Chinese non-Christian Association in Shanghai.

³⁵Zhang Xinshi, *China's Religious Thoughts over the Past Decades* (Beijing: Yanjing Huawen School, 1927), p.377. 张钦士编, 《国内近十年来之宗教思潮》, 北京: 燕京华文学校, 1927年, 第377页。

³⁶Publicity Committee of Chinese Nationalist Party, *Study Set of Unequal Treaties* (Shanghai: Republic Daily, 1929), p.44. 中国国民党上海特别市党务指导委员会宣传部编, 《不平等条约研究集》, 上海: 《民国日报》社, 1929年, 第44页。

famous paper entitled *The Chinese Revolution and Chinese Communist Party* published in December of 1939, Mao outlined ten ways that the West had consistently used to invade and oppress China. One of them was to paralyze the ideology of Chinese people by supplying a sort of spiritual *opium*—Christianity. Mao indicated that, by means of such a *cultural invasion*, western imperialists forced China to accept directly or indirectly the world view of the West. He concluded that, in this way, mission work was serving imperialist policies by training Chinese people to be westernized.³⁷ Mao's analyses were evidently in accordance with the anti-imperialist theories. His argument successfully mobilized masses of Chinese populace to struggle against imperialism in the last century. Because of the high regard with which he was held among the Chinese people, Mao's theories were fully accepted and developed in China.

For example, a representative work, *A History of the U.S. Invasion of China*, was published in 1951 by a famous Chinese historian, Liu Danian (Liu Ta-nien 刘大年). In the book, Liu claimed that Western imperialists consistently used commerce, gunboats, and missionaries to establish, maintain, acquire, and expand their colonies. He suggested that the *cultural invasion* by Western missionaries in China had cultivated a group of Chinese agents to serve the West. He provided evidence that the missionaries employed espionage tactics to provide information and advice for the West's invasion into China. He concluded that the Western *cultural invasion* was not simply a cultural phenomenon at all, but a process which served political, economic and military imperialism.³⁸

³⁷Mao Zedong, *Mao Zedong Anthology* Vol. 2 (Beijing: People's Press, 1991), pp.629-630. 毛泽东, 《毛泽东选集》, 第二卷, 北京: 人民出版社, 1991年, 第 629-630 页。

³⁸Liu Danian, *A history of American aggressing China* (Beijing: People's Press, 1951), pp.84-89. 刘大年, 《美国侵华史》, 北京: 人民出版社, 1951年, 第 84-89 页。

After the establishment of CPC's People's Republic of China in the Mainland, Marxism-Leninism-Maoism dominated all the fields of the country from 1949 to 1978, surely, including the academia. All the Chinese historians were forced to hold the official viewpoints in historical research. Otherwise, they would definitely suffer from political prosecutions. For this reason, the theme of all publications was always in favor of the *Invasion* paradigm, a natural product of Lenin's imperialism theory, in the research of Western missionaries in China. The paradigm was so popular in China that it permeated the entire Chinese academia over three decades till 1978 when Deng's *Reform and Opening-up* policy came into being. But it deserves mentioning that even till 1993 there were still some scholars who believed that mission work was one of the expressions of the West's invasion.³⁹

1.2.2.2 Modernization Paradigm

In China, Leninism-Maoism dominated the ideological field till 1978. In that year, Deng Xiaoping committed China to adopting the capitalist-oriented policy of promoting market forces, foreign trade & investment, and economic development. This policy aimed at a complete modernization of China in industry, agriculture, science & technology, and national defense. Over the last 35 years, China has developed a so-

³⁹Ou Duoheng, "Studies on the Aim and Means of Western Christian Mission Work in China," *Guizhou Social Science*, no.4 (1993), p.78. 欧多恒, "论西方基督教教士在中国传教的目的和方法", 《贵州社会科学》, 1993年第4期, 第78页。

called socialist market economy,⁴⁰ i.e., a capitalistic free-market economic system running under the control of the Communist Party. The reform resulted in significant and long-lasting changes in China's political, military, and economic domains. Importantly, the reform liberated intellectuals to some extent from the ideological constraints of the traditional Marxism-Leninism.

In the field of Chinese historical research, scholars began to reevaluate the significant events of Chinese history. With respect to the subject of Westerners' mission work in China, they began to reexamine the two basic points asserted by the *Invasion* paradigm: (1) Mission work was an important part of foreign domination over the late Qing China; (2) Mission work facilitated Western political, commercial, and military invasions.

In fact, the *Invasion* model revealed a biased opinion more politically than academically. It overemphasized the imperialist feature of the missionary activities in the West's colonization. This was because that there had been neither convincing evidence to show mission work (e.g., the church sermons and the activities of missionaries) being carried out to meet the needs of the West's invasion, nor direct evidence to show that both Catholics and Protestants (i.e., the two major groupings of Christianity) in China were exploited by colonialists to fulfill the political, economic, and military objectives.⁴¹ It was therefore unreasonable and illogical to make use of only

⁴⁰“The socialist market economy,” or, “the socialist market economy with Chinese characteristics”, has been the official title of the economic system in the People's Republic of China since Deng Xiao-ping's reforms in 1978. It is based on Deng's political platform of socialism with Chinese characteristics (中国特色社会主义) and Reform and Opening (改革开放). It consists of a mixture of state-owned enterprises with an open-market economy.

⁴¹Liu Danian, *A History of American Aggressing China* (Beijing: People's Press, 1951), p.86. 刘大年, 《美国侵华史》, 北京: 人民出版社, 1951年, 第86页 (Liu was the only lucky scholar before 1978 who was not politically persecuted but in disagreement publicly with the Chinese government on Imperialism and Modern China).

subjective imaginations, which relied on political preconceptions, to describe the missionary enterprise. Without a doubt, an alternative pattern should be employed to reevaluate mission work.

Interestingly, by checking the *Reform and Opening-up* policy, more and more Chinese intellectuals found that the new national policy contained the main ingredient of *Modernization* which had already been demonstrated by numerous missionary activities in the late Qing China. Yet the main difference lay in that Deng's focus was on the political and economic aspects, whereas mission work concentrated on the cultural and educational fields, though some of the missionaries also got involved in Qing political reforms. Significantly, Chinese scholars realized that, due to political reasons at Mao's time before the 1970s, the positive influence of the mission work on China's modernization was absolutely ignored or at least underestimated, even distorted, according to political needs. That is to say, neither did the term *Cultural Invasion* define the mission work exactly, nor did it describe the positive impact on the late Qing transition properly, more than that, nor did it dissect adequately the historical trends of the social development in the late Qing China.

For instance, it is well known that, since the late Qing, Christianity has been slowly, but steadily, disseminated in Mainland China, especially after the end of a Cultural Revolution in 1976. More important, the Sino-West cultural exchange has never suspended from the late Qing and developed onwards due to the fact that, Sun Zhongshan, the father of the Republic, was a Christian; the powerful KMT leader, Jiang jieshi (Chiang Kai-shek 蒋介石 1887-1975), was also a Christian. In 1949, there were 400,000 Christians in Mainland China; from 1966-1976, the number reduced to zero due

to the Cultural Revolution; from 1980 to 2010, the Protestants increased rapidly to 1.8% of the total population, about 23,050,000.⁴² If the domain of Western culture had been nothing but only within a colonial discourse and a subordinate force to assist military, political, and economic invasions, Christianity would have not won such an achievement in the absence of Imperialism.

After 1978, Chinese scholars could discuss publicly that the late Qing dynasty was a transition period for China to become modernized; that while forced to enhance military power under the pressure of the West's invasion (i.e., the so-called Self-strengthening Movement), China began to initiate social reforms for modernization in virtue of the influence exerted by missionaries; and that the Opium Wars triggered substantially the Sino-Western cultural exchange, albeit with a conflict between colonialism and nationalism. Gradually, A *Modernization* paradigm was suggested to marginalize the politically tendentious *Invasion* one.

This paradigm originated from the theory of Modernization,⁴³ described in Lipset's classic paper on Modernization.⁴⁴ According to the author, wealthier societies have higher levels of education and urbanization, more sophisticated and varied means of communication, larger middle classes, and greater social equality and mobility; and that all of these are associated with, and necessary for the emergence and proper functioning of, democratic political institutions. After the emergence of the theory, a backlash appeared among intellectuals in the late 1960s to argue that the formulation was too linear, teleological, and optimistic. The major challenge came from Samuel Huntington.

⁴²"Chinese Christians: More Than 20 Millions", *Beijing Evening Daily*, 11 August 2010.

⁴³Li Shiyue, "From Western Affairs, Reform to Bourgeois Revolution," *History Studies* 1 (1980), pp.31-40. 李时岳, "从洋务改革到资产阶级革命", 《历史研究》, 1980年第1期, 第31-40页。

⁴⁴Seymour Martin Lipset, "Some Social Requisites of Democracy." In *American Political Science Review* 53, no. 1 (1959): pp. 69-105.

In his seminal book, *Political Order in Changing Societies*, Huntington argued that it was right to see “economic development as unleashing profound social changes,” however, wrong to assume “those changes were necessarily benign or progressive;” in addition, “societies in the throes of dramatic social transformation ... tend to be unstable and even violent;” furthermore, positive outcomes were likely to emerge “only where healthy political institutions capable of channeling and responding to such changes exist,” however, “building such institutions was an extremely difficult and time-consuming.”⁴⁵

Huntington’s viewpoints interpreted the twists and instabilities of a society, like the late Qing, in its transformation from a traditional society to a modern one. More than this, the theory described that modernization was an irreversible process in which the social change took place continuously from an agricultural dominance to the domination by trade and industry.⁴⁶ It affirmed that the process had a distinct West-centered “historical teleology,” that is, the West was more advanced than the East in all aspects, e.g., democracy, politics, economy, culture, religion, and so on, and had a built-in purpose or goal to guide all the other societies of human beings modernized, including those in the East.⁴⁷

In the analysis of the Sino-Western cultural relationship, this basic framework was spontaneously employed by open-minded Chinese scholars to examine the impact of mission work on the modernization of China in the introduction, diffusion, and

⁴⁵Samuel P. Huntington, *Political Order in Changing Societies* (New Heaven& London: Yale University Press, 1968)

⁴⁶Qian Chengdan, "Constructing a New Disciplinary Framework of Modern World History around the Theme of Modernization," *Chinese Studies in History* 42, no.3 (2009), pp.7-24.

⁴⁷Arif Dirlik, “Modernity as History: Post-revolutionary China, Globalization and the Question of Modernity,” *Social History* 27, no. 1 (2002), pp.16-39; Q. E. Wany, “Rise of the Great Powers=Rise of China? Challenges of the Advancement of Global History in the People’s Republic of China,” *Journal of Contemporary China* 19, no.64 (2010), pp.273–289.

localization of the West's civilization to the late Qing Dynasty. Basically, this *Modernization* paradigm suggested that (1) Chinese history after 1840 was not a revolutionary history but the one of modernization; (2) Western missionaries were the pioneers to modernize China through a top-down approach⁴⁸ to the development of Chinese society, with the help of Chinese elites including Chinese leaders, officials, and intellectuals; (3) Without the missionaries' advice and guidance, it would have been hard for China to initiate any kind of reforms for modernization; or, at least the process might have delayed.

Specific details of the paradigm in the study of Chinese history were exposed in a representative book, *Centennial Historical Retrospect of China: Studies on Hot Issues in Modern Chinese History*.⁴⁹ Its main points included:⁵⁰ (1) The dominant feature in modern China is the process of modernization, achieved with the help of Western culture; (2) The process of modernization had never been interrupted however it was influenced heavily and positively by Western culture; (3) As a colonial and semi-colonial country, China had unequal regional development, and some regions had never been developed economically before the presence of Western mission work; (4) Only when the Sino-West cultural fusion (or, cultural integration; acculturation) was

⁴⁸ For the phrase "top-down", it is an approach to indigenous people adopted by missionaries in evangelization for the conversion of entire peoples at once to Christianity, rather than the conversion of individuals one by one. In late Qing China, the growth rate of population is 27 million annually on average [C. N. Li, *The Political History of China, 1840-1928* (Princeton, N.J.: Van Nostrand 1956), p.48]. However, during 40 years of 1865-1905, there were only 0.125 million converted to Christians under Fundamental approaches [A. J. Broomhall, *Hudson Taylor and China's Open Century* (7 volumes; London, O M F Books, 1981)]. Thus, a top-down approach was necessary in missions. This pyramid-type mission approach to convert indigenous elites first and then through them to convert the whole nation appeared consistent with the world-view of traditionally hierarchic countries like China. Richard preferred this non-Fundamental approach.

⁴⁹ *Centennial Historical Retrospect of China: Studies on Hot Issues in Modern Chinese History*, ed. Fen Lin (Beijing Reform Publishing House 1998).

⁵⁰ Yuan Weishi, "Modernization and the Issues of Chinese History Textbooks," *China Youth Daily*, 1 January 2006. 袁伟时, "现代化与中国历史教科书", 《中国青年报》, 2006年1月1日。

implemented, were Chinese elites able to lead their people to establish an independent and democratic country.

It is worth to point out that the paradigm also accounted for religious cases⁵¹ (such as the outbreak of Tianjin missionary persecution, the anti-missionary Boxer movement, and so on) during the late Qing dynasty:⁵² they were natural phenomena expected to occasionally occur in the acculturation of two different cultures, reflecting the conflict, integration, and reconciliation during the assimilation process; and, more interestingly, the temporary tense relations between the two cultures were necessary to help transform the traditional culture to a modernized one more effectively and more systematically.

This *Modernization* perspective replaced the previously mentioned *Invasion* model. It pushed forward the study on missionary activities in the late Qing China with a new insight in the Eastward spread of the West's civilization through Christianization. In this new vision, mission work, rather than being an ingredient of the West's invasion which incited ethnic hostility and cultural conflict, was necessary for the late Qing dynasty to enhance economic strength, promote cultural development, and improve China's international position through a kind of approach guided actively by missionaries.

Modernization paradigm has become the mainstream in China in the studies of modern Chinese history from 1978. In recent years, most Chinese scholars have been converted to the *Modernization* stand. The Department of History, Beijing University, set up a Center for Studies of World Modernization Process (CSWMP). The principal investigator is Luo Rongqu (Lo Jung-ch'iu 罗荣渠). His field is World History,

⁵¹“Religious Cases” refers to the conflicts and clashes between Chinese people and missionaries and Chinese Christians, including Catholic, Protestant, and Orthodox. Between 1840 and 1900 as many as 600 such cases happened in China.

⁵²William Ernest Hocking, *Commission of Appraisal, Re-thinking Missions: A Layman's Inquiry after One Hundred Years* (Ehram Press, 2007), pp.9-10.

including American history and Latin-American history. There is another leading scholar of *Modernization* in CSWMP, Qian Chengdan (Ch'ien Ch'eng-tan 钱乘旦), who specializes in British History. Their *Modernization* paradigm has influenced a new generation. Under their leadership, Chinese authority has approved the rewriting of the textbook on Modern Chinese History and rectification of the previous wrongly-formulated Invasion paradigm.⁵³

1.2.2.3 Comparison between the Two Paradigms

The *Invasion* paradigm is diametrically opposed to the *Modernization* one. Firstly, the former accentuates the violent overthrow of the so-called “reactionary” sociopolitical order in revolutions against imperialism, whereas the latter highlights the incremental reforms in China to update *traditional* institutions and systems. Secondly, the former stresses the enthusiasm and initiative of the *masses*, whereas the latter emphasizes the considerations and experiments of missionaries in a top-down approach. Lastly, the former sees mission work as a necessarily inimical and exploitative activity, like the Western military and political invasion, whereas the latter underscores its positive effects in initiating and inspiring the modernization progress in China. Consequently, both of them are unable to evaluate the mission work impartially and effectively due to their intrinsic non-objective features in assessing Christianization.

⁵³Yuan Weishi, “Modernization and the Issues of Chinese History Textbooks,” *China Youth Daily*, 1 January 2006. 袁伟时, “现代化与中国历史教科书”, 《中国青年报》, 2006年1月1日。

A closer look at the *Modernization* paradigm revealed that it neglected the major contradiction between the West and their colonies during the colonial period in the 19th and 20th centuries. Consequently, the theory appeared apparently to overestimate the positive impact of mission work on the modernization process in China. This was in sharp contrast with the *Invasion* paradigm which stressed only the colonial nature of missionary activities. It is thus necessary to reexamine these two polar paradigms suggested under different ideological considerations of modern Chinese history.

To date there has only been one study which attempted to propose a balanced framework with respect to missionary activities in late Qing China. The work was done by Liang Jialin (Liang Chia-lin 梁家麟). The author held an eclectic and mixed viewpoint, hoping to find a compromise between the two opposing paradigms in order to interpret the nature of mission work.⁵⁴ He argued that the two extreme paradigms really overemphasized their respective concepts about the social position of missionaries in the late Qing dynasty, when Chinese people faced the challenge of both western powers and self-strengthening. He believed that neither was the missionaries' work a kind of imperialistic aggression under the umbrella of western powers in the cultural field, nor were missionary activities so powerful as to destroy Chinese traditional culture. On the one hand, though admitting that most missionaries shared the same ideology as that of the imperialists, Liang stressed that some missionaries, even if not all of them, were opposed to the western military, political and economic invasion to China. He concluded that mission work did not fit the *Invasion* paradigm. On the other hand,

⁵⁴ Liang Jialin, "Westernization vs Traditional Culture: Missionaries and Cultural Invasion," In *Christianity and China's Modernization*, ed. Lin Zhiping (Taipei: Taipei Yuzhouguang Publishing House, 1994), pp.700-710. 梁家麟, "西化对传统文化: 传教士与"文化侵略"问题", 载林治平主编:《基督教与中国现代化》, 台北: 台北宇宙光出版社, 1994年, 第700-701页。

considering the fact that mission work was scattered over different regions in China with a wide variety of different political and economic developments, Liang suggested that mission work might not have been as effective as imagined by those who adhered to the *Modernization* paradigm in the enhancement of China's modernization.

Liang's argument tended to over-simplify the scope and the impact of missionary activities in the Qing Dynasty, and was at most partially valid based on the missionaries' individual experiences in different regions with different mission policies under respective social conditions. The advantage of Liang's theory was very limited because it obscured the clear perception and discernment of mission work: it failed to recognize the intrinsic imperialistic quality of the missionary activities, and meanwhile eliminated the real positive effects of the mission work on the process of China's modernization. As most of the scholars who supported either the *Invasion* paradigm or the *Modernization* one, Liang evaded the rational, outstanding distinctive features of each paradigm.

Luckily, a more accommodative paradigm, "Liberal theology", emerged in the West in the early 1970s.⁵⁵ It was based on the application of a new *Imperialist Spirit* theory in cultural studies, the theme of which lies in the dissemination of Western civilization to traditional regions of the world in all fields.⁵⁶ The new concept has a two-fold meaning: one is the "dissemination" regardless of receptor's ratification, and the other is the "civilization" which refers to "the advanced". The former stresses the nature of imperial expansion while the latter indicates an enhancement from the traditional to

⁵⁵See Chapter 2 Cultural Imperialism for details.

⁵⁶ Liang Jialin, "Westernization vs Traditional Culture: Missionaries and Cultural Invasion," In *Christianity and China's Modernization*, ed. Lin Zhiping (Taipei: Taipei Yuzhouguang Publishing House, 1994), p.711. 梁家麟, "西化对传统文化: 传教士与"文化侵略"问题", 载林治平主编: 《基督教与中国现代化》, 台北: 台北宇宙光出版社, 1994年, 第711页。

the modernized. Undoubtedly, the new paradigm emphasizes a dialectical unification and complementation between the two to characterize Christian missions.⁵⁷

1.3 Emergence of Modernity and Liberal Theology in Europe

Wales is Richard's motherland. Before the 19th century, it was largely an agrarian nation ruled by England. Though forced to bow before the English monarch in London and speak with a foreign English tongue, the Welsh had never stopped struggling to retain their cultural integrity. The nation had struggled to regain their autonomy since King Edward of England subjugated its Celtic kings in the 13th century. Success came later, however, not in the form of political release from English domination, but via that of social modernization which was thrust upon them with the advent of modernity in the Renaissance (1300-1600), the Enlightenment (1650-1800) and the well-known Industrial Revolution (1760-1850) in Europe.⁵⁸

The word "modern" came into English from the late 16th century as a conventional contrast to "ancient" used to describe the era before the Renaissance.⁵⁹ It became virtually synonymous with "improved" from the 19th century and especially in the 20th century. By extension, the word "modernity" was used in the 17th-18th century as a kind of cultural valorization of newness and efficiency. It was tied directly to the notion of, or deep faith in, the advance of science appeared in Europe, a complex of development in

⁵⁷Wang Lixin, "A Review of the Major Paradigms of Modern History of Christian Missionary in China," In *Re-interpretation of Christianity in East Asia*, ed. Tao Feiya and Liang Yuansheng (Hong Kong: Hong Kong Chinese University, 2004), p.114. 王立新, "近代基督教在华传教史研究的主要范式述", 载陶飞亚、梁元生 编《东亚基督教再诠释》, 香港: 香港中文大学出版社, 2004 年, 第 114 页。

⁵⁸D. Gareth Evans, *A History of Wales 1815-1906* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 1989), p. 228.

⁵⁹R. Williams, *Keywords: A vocabulary of culture and society*. Revised ed. (NY: Oxford University Press 1988), p.208.

philosophy, industry, politics, technology,⁶⁰ as well as social changes and theology.⁶¹ The usage of “modernity” epitomized the confidence of the European people in modern science, their devotion to rationality, and their reliance on economic market and centralized administrative system coming into being during the 15th to 18th centuries. New worldviews and cognitive methods replaced the previously predominant religious-based ones of the Middle Ages⁶² and brought stronger powers to dominate nature and other human beings.⁶³ The natural development of modernity led to the secularization of Christianity. This was a process closely associated with rationalization and the disenchantment of the world,⁶⁴ through which sectors of society and cultures became removed from the domination of religious institutions and symbols.⁶⁵

Christianity started in the mid-1st century, and experienced the East-West Schism from 1054 to 1400 (the separated branch from Roman Catholic Christianity was called Eastern Orthodox). In the 16th century, Catholicism again experienced the second schism triggered by Martin Luther’s Protestant Reformation.⁶⁶ Protestant Christianity was characterized by Fundamentalism till the era of the Enlightenment during which the Industrialization began.⁶⁷ Fundamentalists arose from fears of cultural change and

⁶⁰ A Yazdani, The Relationship between Religion and Modernity, *Comparative Theology*, 2010, 1(3), pp.103-120.

⁶¹ Hans Haferkamp and Neil J. Smelser, *Social Change and Modernity* (Berkeley, Los Angeles, Oxford: University of California Press 1992), pp.1-3.

⁶² Kurt Bowen, *Christians in a Secular World: The Canadian Experience*, (Montreal: McGill-Queen's Press-MQUP 2005), pp.3-22.

⁶³ Mark Elvin, A Working Definition of "Modernity"? Past & Present, 113, 1986, pp. 209-213.

⁶⁴ Max Weber, Science as a Vocation, *Wissenschaft als Beruf*, from *Gesammelte Aufsätze zur Wissenschaftslehre*, Tübingen, 1922, pp. 524 - 555. [<http://www.wisdom.weizmann.ac.il/~oded/X/WeberScienceVocation.pdf>].

⁶⁵ P. L. Berger, *The Sacred Canopy: Elements of a Sociological Theory of Religion*, (Reprint: NY: Anchor Books Editions, 1969,1990; Originally published: NY: Garden City: Doubleday, 1967), p.107.

⁶⁶ R. P. McBrien, *The Church: The Evolution of Catholicism* (NY: HarperCollins 2008), p.xvii.

⁶⁷ Fundamentalism is a denomination or a systematic, which gained ascendance after the release of a ten-volume set of essays, apologetic and polemic, written by many well-known conservative Protestant theologians to defend what was seen as Protestant orthodoxy. This theology asserted that the Bible was

resorted to a form of static socio-cultural isolation, while confusing the interpretation doctrine with that which is interpreted (an issue in faith), persisting in various outdated conventions and customs (e.g., viewing a Utopian religious ideology as the basis for personal and communal identity), considering Biblical statements in the Bible as inerrant and unchangeable and the Bible as the most inspirational book of spiritual faith and teachings dictated by God to human beings, assuming science and technology to be a double-edged sword which might negatively affect evangelization, seeing themselves as part of a cosmic struggle between good and evil, and reinterpreting life in the light of this cosmic struggle by seizing, whenever possible, on historical moments. They believed that by following the Bible's tenets people would be granted salvation. They advocated that the global dissemination of the Gospels should be under the spirit of a so-called Christian Universalism, i.e., *Christ Conquers All*, meaning that all creatures will be ultimately reconciled to God through the power of the Savior, Jesus Christ.⁶⁸

In the 17th-century England, and the 18th-century Europe and North America, Fundamentalists concentrated dominantly on the salvation of individuals' souls. Although they did not object to Christian social concerns, they opposed the prioritization of social over individual salvation. They were confident that the salvation of the whole world would happen first with that of individuals. However, Fundamentalism was endangered by the modernity that emerged during the Renaissance. The movement was indicated by an increasing rationalization and the progress in science. This is understandable because the physical world was scientifically explained

inerrant because it had been dictated by God and written by men who took that dictation. This meant that the Bible should not be read differently from any other historical document, and also that modernism and liberalism were believed to lead people to hell just like non-Christian religions.

⁶⁸Richard Carwardine, *Transatlantic Revivalism: Popular Evangelicalism in Britain and America, 1790-1865* (San Francisco: Greenwood Press, 1978), pp.1-249; Gregory MacDonald, *The Evangelical Universalist* (Eugene: Wipf & Stock, 2008), pp.1-214.

with convincing experiments, while the spiritual world remained nothing else but endless doctrinaire preaching as usual. Inevitably, there existed an inbred tension between science and religion because of their opposite attitudes towards existence: Science is featured by “the methodical thinking directed toward finding regulative connections between our sensual experiences”, “leading to methodical action if definite goals are set up in advance;” while, by contrast, religion “deals with goals and evaluations,” and “with the emotional foundation of human thinking and acting” “by concerning with man's attitude toward nature at large, with the establishing of ideals for the individual and communal life, and with mutual human relationship.”⁶⁹ Many cases exhibited this tension. For example,⁷⁰ during the Renaissance, Nicolaus Copernicus (1473-1543) published his *On the Revolutions of the Celestial Spheres* in 1543 after observations of Mars, Saturn, and the Sun for tens of years.⁷¹ He verified the Earth is rotating around the Sun, rather than the Geo-centrism as the Bible claimed. His achievement began the most important revolution before Newton’s discoveries in the history of science. However, the religious power was strong enough to resist the spread of scientific findings at that time, even Martin Luther abused Helio-centrism. The Catholic Church prohibited the book’s publication, and brutally Roman Inquisition burned at the stake another scientist, Giordano Bruno, who confirmed and expanded Copernicus discoveries based on experiments. Despite the fact, science continued forward, independent of the wills of men though sometimes some suppressed science.

⁶⁹ Albert Einstein, Carl Seelig (Editor), Sonja Bargmann (Translator), *Ideas and Opinions*, 5th Printing, (NY: Crown Publishers, Inc. 1960), p.50.

⁷⁰ The stories of several scientists and comments on the scientific development are drawn from John Z. G. Ma’s Lecture Notes on Classical Mechanics and Electromagnetism, Physics 205, Department of Physics, Concordia University, 2013.

⁷¹ Sheila Rabin, “Nicolaus Copernicus”, *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Fall 2010 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), [<http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2010/entries/copernicus/>].

In the 19th century, another significant recognition of the Nature was reached through Natural Selection Laws. In 1859 the famous work, *On the Origin of Species*, was published by Charles Darwin (1809-1882) on the basis of his biological research.⁷² This simple, powerful, and elegant scientific achievement implicitly challenged again traditional religious beliefs of any divine cosmic order for fixed natural categories. On the topic, the British bishop, Samuel Wilberforce (1805-1873), conducted a despicable attack in a debate in 1860 with a scientist, Thomas Henry Huxley, but Huxley prevailed at last.⁷³ Fortunately, the Church of England did not officially declare its opposition to biological evolution this time.

In fact, after 1750 Protestant Christians were all facing the challenges in the Evangelization of how to, on the one side, Christianize indigenous people both effectively and efficiently for weakening individual's faith and trusting in hierarchical religious bonds, on the other side, celebrate the growth of scientific knowledge and material welfare.⁷⁴ No matter what they thought of the increasingly insufficient faith in Lord among disciples, they had to cope with all the new challenges they encountered in spreading the Gospel, either willingly or unwillingly, in response to a modernized theology given birth to by Enlightenment and the Industrial Revolution.

In the 19th century, enlightened Protestant theology, Liberalism, developed rapidly.⁷⁵ Liberal Christians adopted quite distinct attitudes from Fundamentalists though both of them shared the same goal of evangelization. Liberal respected their

⁷²James Lennox, "Darwinism", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Fall 2010 Ed.), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), <http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2010/entries/darwinism/>.

⁷³J. R. Lucas, Wilberforce and Huxley: A Legendary Encounter , *The Historical Journal*, 1979, 22 (2) pp.313-330.

⁷⁴Peter Van Der Veer, The Global History of "Modernity", *Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient*, 41(3), 1998, pp. 285-294.

⁷⁵*Ibid.*, pp.11-13.

opposition and other civilizations; they were not selective in what parts of the religious tradition and heritage they would stress; they saw the world as colorful instead of black and white and had a functional relationship with other peoples; they upheld the spread of science and technology in view of the dissemination of the Gospel in a pluralistic world, and tried hard to merge into any events to change social and political environments for better evangelization;⁷⁶ they viewed Western civilization in all fields (including science and technology) as the gift of God to the secular world, and the purpose of Christianization was to meet the needs of people in the Kingdom of God, not only to promote their spiritual enlightenment, but also to enhance their material lives on Earth, in agreement with Bentham's *greatest happiness principle*.⁷⁷ Besides, they insisted that, after people accepted and enjoyed the modernity of Western civilization, they could inherently understand and appreciate Christianity through the material benefits gained from God. For the liberals, the exhibition of Western civilization, demonstrated by the fruits of science and technology, was the most authoritative approach to demonstrating the existence of God and His doctrines. What is more, liberals advocated that effective mission work was needed to indigenize Christianity in other countries through cultural exchange by adaption and synthesis. For this purpose, they suggested that missionaries should first and foremost try to attract local elites (e.g., rulers, leaders, officials, intellectuals) who controlled the bureaucracy upon which the social, political, and cultural structures were built. Then, through the elites, Christianity would spread over all levels of people via a *top-down* conversion, just as had happened in some countries

⁷⁶M. Momen, *Fundamentalism and Liberalism: Towards an Understanding of the Dichotomy*. in: Vol. 13, *Studies in the Babi and Baha'i Religions*, (Los Angeles: Kalimat Press 2002), [http://bahailibrary.com/momen_fundamentalism_liberalism_dichotomy]

⁷⁷Gary Abraham, "The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Utilitarianism: The Case of the East," *Theory and Society* 12, no. 6 (1983), pp.739-773.

of Africa where a whole country or a nation had been Islamized after the King and/or the elites had adopted Islam.⁷⁸

Unambiguously, the enlightenment movement made liberals not restricted to Fundamentalism any more. They attributed secular modernity to God's gifts for the mankind; they aimed at relying on elites, rather than individuals, for effective and efficient Christianization; they were positive and active to spread Gospels along with achievements of Western civilization.⁷⁹ As a kind peculiar cultural phenomenon, liberal theology is characterized saliently by both the cultural expansion feature and the modernity feature. As one of the missionaries in China, Richard was a proponent and practitioner of this liberal ideology developed in his early life in both Europe and China.

1.4 Elements of Richard's Liberal Theology

Born in a blacksmith farmer's family in 1845 in south Wales, Richard was the youngest of nine children. His parents, Timothy and Eleanor Richard, along with several relatives who had distinguished themselves in Christian ministry, were devout Nonconformists, i.e., Welsh Christians who were devoted to eliminating Anglicanism's influence in Wales through the Church in Wales. They took their responsibilities seriously to provide spiritual training for the younger generation.

⁷⁸Nicolas Standaert, "Christianity Shaped by the Chinese," In *The Cambridge History of Christianity*, Vol. 6: *Reform and Expansion 1500-1660*, ed. R. Po-Chia Hsia (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), pp.559-561.

⁷⁹Wang Lixin, *American Missionaries and the Modernization of China in the late Qing* (Tianjin: Tianjin People Press, 1997), pp. 27-28. 王立新, 《美国传教士和晚清中国现代化》, 天津: 天津人民出版社, 1997年, 第27-28页。

Until 14 years old, Richard received a formal education at a school associated with a church built in one of his father's fields. At that age, he proclaimed his faith in Jesus Christ and was baptized by the Rev. John Davies of the Salem Baptist Church in May 1859. The sermon given in the Chapel was *Obedience is better than sacrifice*.⁸⁰ During the lecture Richard told his older brother of a "call" for him to become a missionary.⁸¹ Notwithstanding the fact, his actual missionary service came into effect 10 years later. After the baptism, he remained for one more year to receive more education, including music training. At the end of the year, he became a teacher at a school in Penygroes. During the daytime he taught pupils, and at night he taught coal miners, some of whom were more than twice his age.⁸² At the same time, he himself paid for further training⁸³ in a grammar school in Llanybyther where he was often put in charge of his classmates in the absence of teachers. He was successful on these occasions because of his ability to manage a classroom. He was then asked to fill in an unexpected vacancy as a schoolmaster in New Inn.

But he refused the offer and supported himself to attend a Normal School in Swansea for a brief period, and then became a schoolmaster in an endowed school at Conwil Elvet. He was then merely 18 years old. Due to his skills in management, enrollment in Richard's school increased to 120 students from tens of teenagers within 18 months. In the school, he spent his spare time teaching older boys a weekly Bible class in the evenings. After a period of time, they all became church members. This early period of teaching experience made him set up a belief that education was

⁸⁰K. S. Latourette, *A History of Christian Missions in China* (New York: Russell & Russell, 1967). p.22, p.386.

⁸¹Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.22.

⁸²Unfortunately there were no references which recorded the courses Richard taught during this period.

⁸³Unfortunately there are no references which record what Richard was trained.

necessary to shape people's mind and to change the interactions between people and the environment around them. This might be the reason why Richard paid extraordinary attention to education later from the outset of his missions in China. During his 45 years in China, Richard kept requesting his Baptist Society and Chinese officials for financial support to run schools. In 1865, Richard left his teaching position in Wales and enrolled as a student at Haverfordwest Theological College, Pembrokeshire in England.

At the College he spent four years. Though the education received was based on fundamentalism, he gradually veered toward a liberal ideology. At the beginning, he concentrated on the fundamentalist theological education as scheduled by the college. The curriculum consisted primarily of an introduction to the classical civilizations of Rome and Greece, as well as to various metaphysical and theological theories, irrelevant to the rapidly developed European colonialism in the 19th century when⁸⁴ In addition, during that time he got a unique understanding of the nature of "the Kingdom of God". In his eyes, the Kingdom should be "established not only in the hearts of men, but also in all institutions on earth, for the salvation of man, body and soul, now and hereafter;" and, missionaries were "ambassadors with a divine mandate to minister to the many and varied needs of the people, as well as their families they served in ministry."⁸⁵

Richard also doubted that the Bible alone was sufficient to guide missionary activities. Nor did he accept that it was sufficient for a missionary to engage only in evangelical work. Rather, he regarded the Bible as merely one of the many sources of authority in missionary activities, and was aware of the fact that missionaries should pay attention to the social, economic, and intellectual needs of people in order to hasten

⁸⁴*Ibid.*, p.26.

⁸⁵Timothy Richard, "Christian Missions in Asia," in *Records of the General Conference of the Protestant Missionaries of China*, Shanghai, 7-20 May 1890.

Christianization.⁸⁶ Particularly, Richard was deeply touched by the nontraditional explanation of liberalism,⁸⁷ as revealed in *Missionaries after the Apostolic School*,⁸⁸ a sermon written in 1824 by Edward Irving (1792-1834). Irving was a Scottish Presbyterian minister who had worked in London from 1822 until his death. He was one of the founders of the Catholic Apostolic Church. The subject of his article was God's mighty power and its injunction to the twelve Apostles to *seek out the worthy*. In this speech, Irving accused the church of having drifted from its ancient roots, and expressed the view that an ideal missionary should be an independent traveler without the support of mission institutions.⁸⁹

Richard was extremely attracted by Irving's instruction that missionaries should seek out the "worthy" (i.e., the elites) as described in Matthew 10:11.⁹⁰ He understood that a missionary should cultivate relationships with educated and powerful people in what he perceived was an uncultivated society, especially those who had already shown an interest in religious matters and who would thus be more open to a Christian message.⁹¹ In fact, Richard had in mind two necessary elements in such a society like China for an effective Christianization: "the devout teachers of the different religions (especially the leaders of the reforming sects), and the highly educated scholar-officials who formed the imperial civil service."⁹² Though these two groups were mutually

⁸⁶K. S. Latourette, *A History of Christian Missions in China* (New York: Russell & Russell, 1967), p.386.

⁸⁷D. Macgillivray, *Timothy Richard of China: A Prince in Israel* (pamphlet; Shanghai. 1920), pp.5-6.

⁸⁸Edward Irving, "Missionaries after the Apostolic School," in *Collected Writings of Edward Irving*, ed. The Rev. G. Carlyle (London: Alexander Strahan and Co., 1864), pp.427-521.

⁸⁹Arnold Dallimore, *Forerunner of the Charismatic Movement: The Life of Edward Irving* (Chicago: Moody Press, 1983), pp.62-63.

⁹⁰"And into whatsoever city or town ye shall enter, enquire who in it is worthy; and there abide till ye go thence."

⁹¹E. W. P. Evans, *Timothy Richard, A Narrative of Christian Enterprise and Statesmanship in China* (London: The Carey Press, 1945), pp.27-28.

⁹²B. Stanley, *The History of the Baptist Missionary Society, 1792-1992* (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1992), p.180.

exclusive or independent from each other, he believed that both of them should be intimately involved in Christianization.

Along with gaining insights into the Protestant liberal ideology about mission work which was totally different from those of fundamentalism, Richard developed his own personality traits, such as tenacity, rebelliousness, and adaption by joining in various religious activities. For instance, though busy with his course learning and reform efforts in the College, he visited a lot of churches in Pembrokeshire and made frequent contact with various levels of religious people, like pastors, theologians, and simple Christians, to solicit their opinions about mission work. In order to succeed, he even took advantage of his technical skill at musical instrument playing to contribute to these activities as a volunteer so as to increase the possibility of contacts.⁹³ Through these communications, Richard used and further developed his exceptional innate personal quality which he would put to use in his future missionary activities.

In the 1860s there emerged new missions to China which ultimately had a far-reaching effect on Asia. In 1865, Mr. Hudson Taylor (1832–1905) founded the China Inland Mission (CIM).⁹⁴ He published what has been called “Occasional papers” in which he explained the principles of his Mission to Christianize China: “Faith in God to provide all necessities for support.”⁹⁵ The CIM arranged a series of public lectures to attract people to join in the great career. In 1868, Richard attended Mrs. Grattan Guinness’s passionate lecture on behalf of the CIM.⁹⁶ He was not only deeply

⁹³*Ibid.*

⁹⁴For a comprehensive story of Hudson Taylor, see: A.J. Broomhall, *Hudson Taylor and China’s Open Century*, 7 volumes (London: Hodder & Stoughton Religious 1981–1989).

⁹⁵*Ibid.*, p.28.

⁹⁶For a comprehensive story of Hudson Taylor, see A.J. Broomhall, *Hudson Taylor and China’s Open Century*, 7 volumes. China Inland Mission (CIM) was founded by Hudson Taylor in 1864. As a missionary society, it was unique in its self-sacrificial principles: (1) faith in God to provide full support;

encouraged by Taylor's famous motto, "if I have a thousand lives, I would give them all to China," but also deeply attracted by CIM's heroic and self-sacrificing program. He thus refused two invitations of employment upon graduation from home churches (a Church in Pembrokeshire and the other in Glamorganshire), and decided instead to apply for a missionary position to North China to face what he believed was a greater challenge. At that time, there were very few mission stations in the northern part of China.

As a Baptist, Richard was directed to apply for support to the Baptist Missionary Society (BMS) before embarking on such a journey.⁹⁷ During the interview, Richard exhibited his liberal interpretations of the nature of mission work in three points:⁹⁸ (1) Collective salvation. Different from Fundamentalists, Richard did not pay attention to individual conversion but concentrated on the collective conversion of a society. (2) Dissemination of science and technology. He insisted that Western civilization was the product of the advance in science and technology granted to human beings by God. (3) A top-down approach in mission work. He preferred to convert indigenous elites first and then through them to convert the whole nation. This pyramid-type mission approach appeared quite consistent with the world-view of traditionally hierarchic countries like

(2) trust in guidance received through prayers rather than religious education before going to the mission field; (3) readiness to go to the interior adopting the native dress and lifestyle.

⁹⁷Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences by Timothy Richard* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.29. The B.M.S was founded almost two hundred years earlier than the pioneering efforts of the great British Baptist missionary to India, William Carey. Because the guiding principles of the CIM were so different from most denominational organizations, any candidate who declared a denomination was referred to his or her own denominational mission society. This was what happened during Richard's missionary candidacy to the CIM.

⁹⁸Wang Lixin, *American Missionaries and the Modernization of China in the late Qing* (Tianjin: Tianjin People Press, 1997), p.33. 王立新,《美国传教士和晚清中国现代化》, 天津: 天津人民出版社, 1997年, 第33页。

China. He justified his choice of North China and his search for elites in his future mission work as follows:

As the Chinese were the most civilized of non-Christian nations, they would, when converted, help to carry the gospel to less advanced nations, and that by working in the North Temperate Zone Europeans could stand the climate, while the natives of North China, after becoming Christians, could convert their fellow-countrymen all over the Empire.⁹⁹

The three points of liberal Theology Richard held epitomized the two salient qualities of Liberal theology: (1) to pay attention to elites to attract collective salvation rather than individuals for an effective and efficient evangelization; and, (2) to make use of science and technology to display God's power, the wisdom, the will, the knowledge in mission work. While the former represented the nature of cultural expansion in the colonization of the West, the latter was the symbol of modernity transfer from the West to the East in order to modernize indigenous nation for conversion. In the light of these considerations, Richard appeared confident to evangelize in China though there were unexpected difficulties to overcome such as culture shock, language barriers, social isolation.¹⁰⁰ In 1868, Richard became a member of BMS¹⁰¹ and was sent to China in 1869.

1.5 Purpose, Significance, and Structure of Study

⁹⁹Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences by Timothy Richard* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.29.

¹⁰⁰Peter Tze Ming Ng, "Timothy Richard: Christian Attitudes towards Other Religions and Cultures," *Studies in World Christianity* 40 (2008), pp.74-78.

¹⁰¹E. W. P. Evans, *Timothy Richard: A Narrative of Christian Enterprise and Statesmanship in China* (London: The Carey Press, 1945), p.18.

1.5.1 Purpose of our Study

As mentioned earlier, missionaries played dual roles in China: (1) they appeared to be envoys of Western civilization not only to introduce advanced science and technology to China, but also to advocate equality, freedom, and independent thinking;¹⁰² (2) they were considered the representatives of Western *Imperialism* in the domains of culture and religion due to their close relationship with Western powers, and thus naturally thought of bringing about serious damage upon traditional Chinese culture by means of evangelism which aimed at training pro-Western Chinese people to work for the West in China. Here, *Imperialism* means “thinking about, settling on, controlling land that you do not possess, that is distant, that is lived on and owned by others”¹⁰³ Specifically, the word refers to the practice, the theory and the attitudes of a dominating imperial metropolitan centers in the 19th century to acquire and rule distant territories, almost always with a consequence of “Colonialism”, i.e., to implant settlements on these regions.¹⁰⁴ Politically and economically, the word first entered into being in Britain in the 1870s, and became part of the journalistic vocabulary during the 1890s in the course of the arguments about colonial conquest by Western powers, and was used to define the highest stage of Capitalism by Lenin’s theory.¹⁰⁵

For decades, the activities of western missionaries in China have been studied within the framework of either the *Invasion* paradigm or the *Modernization* one.

¹⁰²Wang Lixin, *American Missionaries and China's Modernization of Late Qing* (Tianjin: Tianjin People Publishing House, 1997), p.86. 王立新, 《美国传教士与晚清中国现代化》, 天津: 天津人民出版社, 1997年, 第86页。

¹⁰³E. W. Said, *Culture and Imperialism* (New York: Vintage Books, A Division of Random House, Inc., 1994), p.7.

¹⁰⁴E. W. Said, *Culture and Imperialism* (Toronto: York University, February 10, 1993), speech, [<http://archive.is/vLOTo>].

¹⁰⁵E. J. Hobsbawm, *The Age of Empire* (New York: Vintage Books, A Division of Random House, Inc., 1994), p.12,59.

Accordingly, missionaries were classified either as imperialist accomplices in the invasion of China, or as Western pioneers to help China modernized. Because of ideological reasons, the role played by Western missionaries in the modernization of China have been either underestimated in view of the *Cultural Invasion* Paradigm or overemphasized in view of the *Modernization* Paradigm. The scholars with the former view, especially those communist ones in China, regarded indigenous culture as a kind of virtual territory which constituted part of the sovereignty. By applying this approach, historians emphasized the effect of West's intrusion and damage to traditional Chinese culture, while ignoring, either intentionally or unintentionally, the positive influence on China's modernization. On the contrary, the latter had an underlying assumption that China was stalled in under-development and thus in dire need of a jolt from without. In this case, Christianized Western culture was viewed as the norm, and missionaries played a dominant role to facilitate China marching onto a modern society in the kingdom of God.

Based on my study, mission work did, on the one hand, export Christianity and Western culture with the direct aid of imperialist invasions via, e.g., military, political, economic means which were committed by Western powers; however, on the other hand, it introduced the modernity of Western civilization to underdeveloped nations which was crucial to encourage reforms there for modernization. We adhere in our research to the rational crux of liberal theology paradigm. The objectivity and impartiality of this model made it valid to demonstrate its appropriateness in the study of Christian missions:¹⁰⁶ it can be used as a tool to illustrate the trend and behavior of indigenous cultural development influenced by missionaries as a whole, as reflected by individual

¹⁰⁶William A. Williams, *The Tragedy of American Diplomacy* (Cleveland, 1959), p.47.

missionaries' activities. Though liberal theology occurred more than 100 years, to our knowledge, there have been no systematic, empirical studies on missionary work in the modernization of China by examining the paradigm. This study will fill up the gap. By adopting the Liberal theology model, this thesis will enrich the knowledge on Christian missions in China through deploring and transcending traditional homogenized recognitions of evangelism. While exposing in our study that missionaries were subjectively dominated by the goal to assimilate and replace indigenous culture under Christian Universalism, we will demonstrate that they had exerted an objectively positive influence on China's modernization in the late Qing.

1.5.2 Significance of our Study

Hard to get rid of the predicament adroitly with their biased theory of cultural invasion which was unable to explain China's modernization lasted from the late Qing, postcolonial scholars were reluctant or refused to admit the salient "modernity" feature of the western expansion in the colonial countries, even avoided to discuss the positive roles played by missionaries in disseminating modern science and technology, advocating equality of sexes and races, enhancing western education, pushing forward social reforms, and promoting freedom of thought, conscience, and non-Confucian religions. Clearly, that of neglecting or excluding the "modernity" feature undermined the integrity of the liberal theology paradigm. Hence, it was difficult for those scholars

to make use of the theory for an articulate, unbiased formulation of China's sustained modernization.

By recognizing this status quo, we rely on archives and literatures to validate the influence of western missionaries on Chinese elites and reforms, the effect of cultural exchange and dialogue on China's modernization, and the impact of Western modernity on the renovation of indigenous tradition and custom, while, at the same time, to evaluate dispassionately the semi-colonial tendency appeared in modern China, especially the suffering of both political and economic oppressions by the imperial powers that Chinese people were readily conscious of, and the transformation everywhere of the late Qing into a colony of the foreign powers. Only rooted in this kind of neutral, objective, and honest attitude, will we make a balanced analysis on the relation between the colonial and colonized countries, avoid holding a biased view on the knowledge-power structure in social control, and, to sift and winnow the truth of the interaction between culture and modernization from the mass of evidence exposed in modern Chinese history.

Our study is distinguished by the originality of the subject. Not only is limited the number of academic works specifically to discuss the influence of missionaries on China's modernization, but also the gap has not filled to apply the liberal theology paradigm to Christian missions. Though studies by other authors on *Invasion* and *Modernization* paradigms offered useful information from respective perspectives on mission work, the evaluations appeared ideologically-inclined. We will rely on wide sources from both Western and Chinese primary sources to validate that the liberal theology model presents a balanced evaluation on mission work. It contains a couple of

aspects: cultural expansion and modernity. While the former accounts for the imperialist properties of mission work, the latter does expose comprehensively and insightfully the positive influence of Christianization on China's modernization in the late Qing Dynasty. Another unique feature of the study is the direct translation and use of both primary and secondary sources in Chinese to develop a more complete and complex picture for the intercultural encounter. This is different from other scholars whose research is based primarily on second-hand materials in Chinese.

The research has used the methodology featured by an approach of comparative cultural study. The success of this approach has paid off because in the PhD work we have been able to compare the strategies proposed by both Liberal and Fundamentalist missionaries in China and those by various kinds of Chinese elites. We will rely on this approach to analyze not only the differences and disagreements between the Western and Chinese traditions in contact, but also their compatibility and reconciliation. We mention here that this thesis did not deal with religion problems as Goossaert and Palmer did,¹⁰⁷ but focused on the cultural phenomena in Christian missions in late Qing China.

While the thesis exhibits the imperial nature of mission work in the cultural expansion endorsed by the political, economic and military powers of the West, it also gives due emphasis on the feature of modernity inoculated to the late Qing in evangelization, on the challenges and opportunities of indigenous culture when encountering colonial, racist, and alien discourse, and, on the innovation of Chinese society enhanced by the interaction and dialogue between missionaries and indigenous

¹⁰⁷Vincent Goossaert and David A. Palmer, *The Religious Question in Modern China* (Chicago&London, University of Chicago Press, 2011). pp.1-464.

Chinese. Different from either Tomlinson's "cultural imperialism" or Said's "Orientalism" which addressed in details almost all the regions of the world, but cautiously downplayed the discussions when referring to China (maybe owing to the obvious complexities and perplexities when applying the theory to the billowy and surging Chinese history which does not fit to any simplified models in description), this thesis concentrates on providing a less-distorted perspective by taking the both sides, i.e., expansion and modernity, of liberal theology into consideration, and weighs the both sides evenly.

1.5.3 Structure of the Thesis

The following Chapters are as follows. Chapter 2 is the historiographical review on the studies of Christian missions exemplified by Timothy Richard in late Qing China, and emphatically, on the necessity of the sublimation of the two popular paradigms with a less distortive liberal theology. Chapters 3 describes the Modernity feature in the formation of Richard's liberal theology developed during his early life in both Europe and China. Chapters 4 expresses the Expansion feature in Richard's top-down mission through publishing after becoming an independent missionary in China. Chapter 5 and 6 introduce Richard's mission work in practice, westernization of China's education and Christianization of Buddhism. While the former dominantly reveals the Modernity feature of Liberal theology, the latter does the Expansion feature. Finally, Chapter 7 summarizes the study, presents discussion and conclusion, as well as future studies.

There are three Appendices and one Bibliography at the end of the thesis. Appendix I is the Table of Chinese Names with Conversions of Hanyu Pinyin and Wade-Giles; Appendix II outlines Richard's life experience chronologically; Appendix III is Richard's complete oeuvre in two parts: literary work in English and that in Chinese. Throughout the text, the names of Chinese persons and places are Romanized by using the Hanyu Pinyin system, e.g., Li Hongzhang (Li Hung-Chang 李鴻章; 1823—1901, a Chinese elite in the late Qing China), Tianjin (Tientsin 天津; a treaty port in north China). Footnotes are used wherever necessary on every page of the text, and Bibliography appears at the end of the thesis. According to the requirements,¹⁰⁸ the Bibliography is divided into two parts, primary sources and secondary sources, in both English and Chinese, respectively. It includes all the references in the footnotes. To be discerned clearly by readers, the references used in footnotes are highlighted in the Bibliography.

Here, we discuss *Protestant liberalism* equipped by Richard. First of all, liberal theology was formed in the Biblical criticism in the 19th and 20th centuries. It characterized the style of Scriptural hermeneutics (interpretation of the Bible) as non-propositional, that is, the Bible was not a collection of factual statements but instead an anthology within a historical or cultural context that documents the human authors' beliefs and feelings about God at the time of its writing. Besides, it did not claim to discover truth propositions but rather create religious models and concepts that reflect the class, gender, social, and political contexts from which they emerge. Moreover, it

¹⁰⁸Department of History, *Graduate Student Guide*, University of Ottawa, 2013, p.15.

looked upon the Bible as a collection of narratives that explain, epitomize, or symbolize the essence and significance of Christian understanding.¹⁰⁹

There were several influential understandings up to now on liberal theology. Concisely, liberal theology was defined as “Maximal acknowledgement of the claims of modern thought” in theology.¹¹⁰ In more words, it was defined as “its openness to the verdicts of modern intellectual inquiry, especially the natural and social sciences; its commitment to the authority of individual reason and experience; and its commitment to make Christianity credible and socially relevant to modern people.”¹¹¹ For liberal Christians, they were a kind of people who sought to understand their faith with reference to their experience within contemporary culture, view accommodation to culture as necessary and positive, understood God and their moral responsibility in terms of the best available scientific knowledge and social analysis.¹¹² All of the above indicate that liberal theology is not just a deviation from orthodoxy but an elevation of modern reason and discovery, the “modern mind,” to a source and norm for theology.¹¹³

Throughout the thesis, we use *Protestant liberalism* as a type of *modern Christian liberalism*, which has little nothing to do with the *political liberalism* as used in the field of political philosophy. Dramatically influenced by the Enlightenment in the 19th century against the Christian doctrines, Protestant liberals considered that the whole world was sympathetically and socially integrated in the kingdom of God and all advances in this world revealed the mercy of God. Therefore, it was necessary to

¹⁰⁹ Montgomery, John Warwick. *In Defense of Martin Luther* (Milwaukee: Northwestern, 1970), p. 57.

¹¹⁰ Claude Welch, *Protestant Thought in the Nineteenth Century, Volume I, 1799-1870* (Wipf & Stock Pub 2003), p. 142.

¹¹¹ Gary Dorrien, *The Making of American Liberal Theology: Imagining Progressive Religion 1805-1900* (Westminster John Knox Press, 2001), p. xxiii.

¹¹² Donald E. Miller, *The Case for Liberal Christianity* (Harper, 1981), p. 33.

¹¹³ Roger E. Olson, What Is “Liberal Theology”, 8 October 2013, <http://www.patheos.Com / blogs /rogereolson/2013/10/what-is-liberal-theology/>

establish the relation between Christianity and modern cultures in scientific age so as to create religious models and concepts that will reflect the class, gender, social, and political contexts from which they emerge with the aid of modernity in civilization. In short, liberal theology is featured by two tenets, cultural expansion and modernity.

CHAPTER 2

STUDIES ON CHRISTIAN MISSIONS EXEMPLIFIED BY RICHARD: NECESSITY OF LIBERAL THEOLOGY

2.1 Introduction

Before the 1st Century BC, the Roman Empire defeated Greece. During the 1st Century AD, Christianity was originally born as a small sect in a remote corner (namely, the Middle East) of the Empire. Though suffering from intermittent persecutions in the following ~200 years, Christianity was spreading slowly throughout Europe. In the 4th Century, it won a state support and thereafter became the leading religion. The situation was not changed even during the fall of Rome in ~500 AD when the Roman civilization was continually weakened by various, continuous wars and conflicts within the Empire.

In the Medieval Era (500-1400; commonly referred to as the Middle Ages), Europe experienced the destruction and breakup of the Roman Empire and disorders in faith, disease and terror. During this period, the first Christian missionaries, called Nestorians, which originated from the Eastern Roman Empire, came to China in 635 in Tang Dynasty (t'ang-ch'ao 唐朝 618-907) and survived in China for as long as 150 years.¹¹⁴ At that time, though Christianity was accepted in the most part of Europe, the Roman East-West Schism eventually led to the split of Churches from 1054. In 1294 the second contact between Europe and Yuan China (yüan-ch'ao 元朝 1271-1368) came true when

¹¹⁴ Zhu Qianzhi, *Nestorian Christianity to China* (Beijing: People Publication Press 1993), pp.79-97. 朱谦之, 《中国景教》(北京: 人民出版社), 1993, 第 79-97 页.

a Roman Catholic missionary and an Italian Franciscan priest, John of Monte Corvino, appeared in Beijing and built a church there.¹¹⁵ Starting from the 1300s, catastrophes struck Europe in the form of the Great Famine and the devastating pandemics (i.e., the Black Death) that killed roughly one-third of European population. Encouragingly, starting from the end of the Era, the European people struggled to get well through alliances and trade with other states, renew faith in God under the direction of the Roman Catholic Church, and make advancements in Feudalism, literary, art, architecture and science.¹¹⁶

During the 14th - 17th centuries, Europe underwent an awakening Renaissance. It was characterized by a flourishing of philosophy, arts, culture, science, and social studies, and an enhancement from spiritual, decentralized, authoritarian, and hierarchical states to secular, centralized, democratic and individualistic ones. From the beginning of the 15th century, trade and mercantilism greatly prospered in Europe. European powers such as Portugal, Britain, France, began exploring the world. Colonies were established in America, Africa, as well as Asia, to exploit natural resources and expand territories. The colonialism lasted till the mid-1900s. In Asia, India began its colonial era in 1502, firstly subordinated to the Portuguese Empire and then to Britain.¹¹⁷

The period of 1500-1650, known as the Reformation, described the change from unity to diversity in religious beliefs and practices. Martin Luther (1483-1546)

¹¹⁵Medieval Sourcebook: *John of Monte Corvino: Report from China 1305*: Letter of John Monte Corvino, in *Cathay and the Way Thither*, translated and edited by Sir Henry Yule, second edition revised by Henri Cordier (London: Hakluyt Society, 1914), Vol. III, Second Series, Vol. 37, pp. 45-51, passim. Slightly abridged and reprinted in Leon Barnard and Theodore B. Hodges, *Readings in European History*, (New York: Macmillan, 1958), pp.107-108.

¹¹⁶M. Perry, *Western Civilization: A Brief History* (7th edition; MA: Cengage Learning, 2010), pp.2-183.

¹¹⁷Benedikt Stuchtey, *Colonialism and Imperialism, 1450–1950*, in: Europäische Geschichte Online (EGO), hg. vom Institut für Europäische Geschichte (IEG), Mainz European History Online (EGO), published by the Institute of European History (IEG), Mainz 2011-01-24.[<http://www.ieg-ego.eu/stuchteyb-2010-en>].

advocated his Protestant theology (e.g., priesthood, Bible's highest authority, sacramental system, salvation via Faith alone). The new theology lessened the grip of the Roman Catholic Church on men's minds, and thus opened the way for freedom of thought. John Calvin (1509-1564) institutionalized Protestantism in Predestination, Protestant ethic (e.g., industry, thrift, hard work, and ceaseless activity), and advocacy of rebellion against tyranny.¹¹⁸ In 1552, Jesuit China Mission was initiated by the Society of Jesus. The Italian Matteo Ricci (1552-1610) were sent to China (Ming Dynasty 明朝 1368-1644) in 1582.¹¹⁹ This was the third time of the Sino-West dialogues. However, because of the giant cultural gap between China and the West, the same as the Nestorians, Catholics failed to convert a significant part of the population in China after tens of years' endeavor.

In the 17th - 19th centuries, large-scale Industrial Revolutions spread throughout Europe and North America until 1850. A great advance was achieved in Western science and technology through industrialization. The progress in science and technology drove Europe to transit from manual labor to machine-based manufacturing in industries, to expand trade and transport via new canals and improved roads and railways, to enhance agriculture, mining, and military production with new technologies. The European achievements constituted a complete set of cornerstones for Western civilization.¹²⁰ By virtue of the powerful military force, the West opened the door to China in the late Qing Dynasty (wan-ch'ing 晚清 1840-1911) in the Opium Wars in the 1840s. The imperialist invasion made it possible for missionaries to enter China freely

¹¹⁸M. Chambers, B. Hanawalt, T. K. Rabb, I. Woloch, R. Grew, L. Tiersten, *The Western Experience* (9th edition; New York: McGraw-Hill), pp. 34-64; 120-156; 249-278; 365-394.

¹¹⁹Jonathan D. Spence, *The Memory Palace of Matteo Ricci*, (New York: Penguin Books 1985).

¹²⁰M. Falkus, *Britain Transformed An Economic and Social History 1700-1914*. 4th ed. (Ormskirk: Causeway Press Ltd., 1987), pp.1-12.

and resulted in a surge of evangelization. This was the fourth contact of Christianity with China in history.¹²¹

China is an ancient country in the world. For millennia, it had developed a peculiar Eastern culture, Confucianism, which has sustained the development of its Eastern civilization without interruptions with flourishing arts, philosophy, and religions. The Silk Road grew at as early as in the Han Dynasty (han-ch'ao 汉朝 206BC-220) to connect Huanghe (huang-ho 黄河 the Yellow River) with the Mediterranean Sea, even to Rome, by the extension through other Asiatic and European junctions. However, growing in an isolated cultural environment of Confucian monopolization and the resultant autocratic monarchy, Chinese people, starting from the Ming Dynasty, became ignorant of the outer world, and with intense self-centered prejudice against it. Successive Dynasties enjoyed a Chinese celestial diplomacy for the surroundings: a core tributary system complemented with strict application of moral ethical standards in Confucianism. Brought up in such a cultural environment generation after generation, Chinese Emperors regarded all foreign countries as China's protectorates and all foreigners as barbarians, and often held in contempt those they considered as the upstarts from the West; more seriously, Chinese people had always believed that China was the center of the world, as indicated by its Chinese name, 中国 (chung-kuo, namely, the Country at the Center of the World), and that Chinese people were superior to all others, as indicated by the combination of the official title of every Emperor, 天子 (T'ien-tzu, namely, the son of Heaven), and that of every person in the country, 子民 (tzu-min, namely, a citizen dominated by the son of the Heaven).

¹²¹T. Ashton, *The Industrial Revolution 1760-1830*. 4th ed. (Oxford: Oxford University Press 1948), pp.58-93.

Consequently, China completely neglected or at least underestimated significant developments in the West in the Renaissance during 1300-1600, the Industrial Revolution after 1600, and the evangelical revival in the 18th century. For Chinese, it was completely unbelievable to accept that Confucianism-based civilization had already fallen behind the rapidly developed Western civilization, that China was incapable of meeting the challenges coming from the surged and consolidated Western capitalism and colonialism, and that China had begun to lose its superiority in the world due to the lack of continued abilities of self-education, self-innovation and self-creation.

It was just this self-isolation culture that made China initiated its direct trade with the West from as late as the 16th Century. In 1557 the Portuguese leased an outpost at Macau.¹²² In order to reduce any damage to the economy from outside, the Chinese government restricted the spread of European trades by limiting foreigners' use of business ports and forbidding any direct trades of the West with Chinese commoners. This was the background to the so-called Canton System which was later inaugurated in 1756.¹²³ As a result, the British East India Company faced a trade imbalance. To compensate for the loss, the British government invested heavily in opium production for profit. They brought the products from India to China and sold them to Chinese smugglers.¹²⁴

Aware both of the drain of silver and the growing numbers of addicts, the Qing China (ch'ing-ch'ao 清朝 1820-1850) initiated a campaign to suppress the opium trade.

¹²²Jack Gray, *Rebellions and Revolutions: China from the 1800s to 2000* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2002), pp.22-23.

¹²³Immanuel C.Y. Hsü, *The Rise of Modern China* (New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), p.139.

¹²⁴Maggie Keswick and Clara Weatherall, *The Thistle and the Jade: A Celebration of 175 Years of Jardine Matheson* (London: Francis Lincoln Publishing, 2008), p.78.

Lin Zexu (Lin Tse-hsu 林则徐 1785-1850) was sent to Guangzhou (Kwangchow 广州), one of the 10 most famous port cities in mainland China, to destroy the smuggling market. In 1839, 20,000 bales of opium were burnt.¹²⁵ In response, the British government soon sent expeditionary forces from India to wage the Opium Wars (also known as the Anglo-Chinese Wars) against China,¹²⁶ including the first War (1839-1842) and the second War (1856-1860). China was defeated in the Wars and was forced to sign a series of 173 treaties between the late Qing China (1839-1911) and main Western countries, e.g., the Treaty of Nanjing (Nanking 南京) in 1842; the Treaty of Peace, Friendship and Commerce in 1885; the Convention of Beijing (Peking 北京) in 1860; the Convention for the Extension of Hong Kong in 1898. These treaties were known as the Unequal Treaties which converted China to a semi-colonial country¹²⁷ and were recognized by Chinese people as the start of China's century of humiliation.¹²⁸

The treaties endowed the West, i.e., those Western countries which invaded China through the series of unequal treaties, with a lot of prerogatives and privileges. For example, protected by the terms related to religious activities, Western missionaries obtained diplomatic immunity and were able to cross the borders freely. Foreigners thus flowed into China. In fact, after the first Opium War a historical surge of Christianization emerged in China. Missionaries were allowed to proclaim the Gospel, reorder religious societies, participate in educational and political reforms, run schools,

¹²⁵News Center, "China Commemorates Anti-opium Hero," [<http://news.cultural-china.com/20090604103010.html>], *Global Times*, 4 June 2009.

¹²⁶Jonathan D. Spence, *The Search for Modern China* (New York, London: W·W· Norton & Company, 1991), p.154.

¹²⁷Hu Sheng, *Imperialism and China's Politics* (Beijing: People Publishing House, 1978), p.5. 胡绳, 《帝国主义与中国政治》, 北京: 人民出版社, 1978年, 第5页。

¹²⁸Alison A. Kaufman, "The 'Century of Humiliation,' Then and Now: Chinese Perceptions of the International Order," *Pacific Focus* 25, no.1 (2010), pp.1-33.

journals & newspapers, translate and publish Western books, and disseminate scientific knowledge and Western civilization. Many of them became architects to modernize China on the basis of Western values in view of Christian visions. Some of them even behaved as the forerunners in the modernization of China. Without exaggeration, Christian missions introduced major aspects of Western culture to Chinese people; and, Westernization forced the legal culture of Confucianism, as well as the traditional dominant Chinese religions, Buddhism and Taoism, to face unprecedented challenges.¹²⁹ These challenges induced ideological transformation and social stratification in the late Qing Dynasty.¹³⁰

Opium Wars ended China's self-isolation from the world. Missionaries came to China for Evangelization. Both missionary historical archives and academic literature recorded their activities in mission work, the effects of Christianization on indigenous culture and the process of China's modernization. We take Timothy Richard as an example to review evaluations and studies on the Christian missions from different schools of people, to outline definitions of liberal theology, and to compare this new paradigm with other commonly used ones, i.e., Invasion and Modernization.

¹²⁹ "Contact zone" refers to "social spaces where cultures meet, clash, and grapple with each other, often in contexts of highly asymmetrical relations of power, such as colonialism, slavery, or their aftermaths as they are lived out in many parts of the world today" This concept is in part to contrast with "community" that underlie much of the thinking about cultures. See details in: Mary Louise Pratt, *Arts of the Contact Zone*, *Profession*, 1991, pp. 33-40.

¹³⁰ Wang Lixin, *American Missionaries and China's Modernization of Late Qing* (Tianjin: Tianjin People Publishing House, 1997), p.62. 王立新, 《美国传教士与晚清中国现代化》, 天津: 天津人民出版社, 1997年, 第62页。

2.2 Necessity of Liberal Theology Paradigm

As exposed in Chapter 1, there are various opinions on Christian mission in China from different political and academic backgrounds. For example, in the Christian world, the role played by missionaries was exaggerated on purpose, so as to influence, attract, and encourage more disciples to devote to the expansion of the Kingdom of God. At the same time, some Western scholars considered that it was necessary to colonize the East and make it civilized. As a result, they supported the argument that Christianization in the 19th and 20th centuries was helpful for the East to transform itself from a traditional, underdeveloped region to a modern, civilized one, and that missionaries, especially liberal Christians like Richard, were the Western pioneers to disseminate civilization for the modernization of the Eastern world through the spread of Gospel.

On the contrary, most of Chinese scholars, including late Qing intellectuals, the PRC scholars, and those from Republican China, held the nationalist stand to view the western missions, especially the PRC scholars before 1978 who had been fully educated by the revolutionary theories of Marxism-Leninism. They followed the Leninists' Imperialism theory to describe mission work as a typical example of imperialist activities in the field of culture and education, serving the military and political invasions of the West into the East. Thus, *Cultural Invasion* paradigm was applied to account for any kind of contributions made by any foreigners to China. By contrast, with the enforcement of the Reform and Opening-up after 1978 in mainland China, Chinese scholars began to favor *Modernization* paradigm to illustrate all phenomena related to any pursuit of foreigners in China. Within this paradigm, Richard was considered to be

one of the greatest missionaries who participated in leading China's late Qing reforms for modernization.

Notwithstanding the above, our study shows that both the *Invasion* paradigm and the *Modernization* one are not so neutralized as to depict the historical significance of Christian missions in the Qing China. As revealed in Chapter 1, while the Leninism-based *Invasion* paradigm was inadequate by trampling down the positive influence of mission work on China's modernization, the *Modernization* paradigm neglected the imperial nature of missionary activities which made Confucianism endangered in the Christianization in the late Qing China. We are aware that, without the ideology of liberal theology in Christianization, it would have been impossible for protestants like Richard to everlastingly participate in the non-religious reform movements for modernization in China. In view of the difference from fundamentalism, this ideology claimed the superiority of a modern Christianity which included science and technology as one of the gifts God offered to the world, as well as the necessity of Christianizing China through peaceful imperialistic invasions like running Western schools, issuing magazines and newspapers, providing medical cares, and so on, to accelerate a nationwide modernization. We thus suggest that missionaries like Richard did enlighten Chinese people and push forward the unprecedented social reforms in the late Qing, at last to some extent; however, their activities were well-shaped by the liberal theology which was tinted with imperial color due to the historical limitation of the development of that era.

Therefore, liberal theology paradigm is suitable to evaluate Protestant missions due to its two salient features. One lies in its focus on mission work: it does not pay attention

to individuals but concentrates on the trend and behavior of indigenous cultural development influenced by missionary activities as a whole. It analyzes the missionary movement under the umbrella of a so-called Spirit of Imperialism, i.e., the urge to disseminate and spread Western civilization globally protected by, at least in the view of some Western scholars, a series of unequal treaties between the West and China from the 19th century, especially after the first Opium War. It was this imperialist protection that made Christianization in China more successful than ever. Here, it is important to note that, in order to win this kind of protection, the behavior of some missionaries were so contemptible and disgraceful as to certainly derogate from the fame of God. For example, Louis De Lamarre was a missionary from France after the Opium Wars. He was appointed as the translator of the "Sino-French Treaty of Beijing" in 1860. Without authorization, he tampered with the Final Provisions by taking the liberty to add Articles in the Chinese-version Treaty which allowed missionaries to buy or rent land for constructions. Though the dirty conduct was found tens of years later, foreigners had already built churches and various mission facilities all over China.¹³¹

Certainly, we admit that this protection was not specifically negotiated between China and the West, and therefore there were no related clauses in the treaties to deal with mission work. What missionaries had benefited was nothing but their personal identification as foreigners in China who were entitled to the right of residence in a few port cities, as well as Hong Kong, which made them easy to develop missionary activities in inland China. Whether admitting it or not, missionaries made use of this

¹³¹Gu Changsheng, *Missionaries and Modern China* (Shanghai: Shanghai Bookstore Publishing House, 2005), pp.65-66. 顾长声, 《传教士与近代中国》, 上海: 上海世纪图书出版公司, 2005 年, 第 65-66 页。

imperialistic protection in evangelizing, not mentioning the extraterritoriality which ensured them more than personal immunity from Chinese laws.

As a cultural phenomenon, missionaries' work to Christianize China seriously challenged Chinese indigenous culture and encountered strong opposition from Chinese people. Nevertheless, during the mission work, missionaries disseminated seeds of Western civilization, especially in relation to science, technology, and democracy in China which initiated the prelude of the reform and modernization in late Qing China. Paying attention to the entire trend of mission work which was associated with nothing else but both cultural expansion and modernity transfer, we are convinced that it is appropriate to employ this paradigm in the analysis of the Christian missions.

The other quality of the liberal theology paradigm is more outstanding: it identifies the entire missionary undertaking as an essential part of the cultural relations between the West and the East. The paradigm insists that western culture has never been separated from the West's political, military, financial, and economic hegemonies. It admits that mission work did damage the stability and the coherence of traditional Eastern Chinese culture and dramatically intensified the withering of Confucianism and Han-Buddhism. In the bilateral relations, mission work behaved as a destabilizing factor which weakened, at least partially, indigenous cultural identity. However, without missionary activities, it was impossible for Chinese people to recognize the big gap between China and the world, and initiate a nation-wide reform for modernization, at the very least without much more time. Furthermore, missionaries introduced Chinese culture to the West through numerous channels which played an irreplaceable role to promote mutual culture interchange.

We thus conclude that the liberal theology paradigm provides a fruitful new angle to view the Sino-West relationship via mission work. Actually, the two salient qualities of the paradigm were vividly embodied in missions did by missionaries like Richard in every aspect of their endeavors in China. Our work focuses on the assessment of the role played by missionaries in China's modernization in the late Qing dynasty. Different from two commonly used, politically-biased paradigms, i.e., the *invasion* and *modernization*, we employ liberal theology paradigm to evaluate Christian missions in the late Qing. According to what missionaries, like Richard, had done in their missions, we are unable to refuse missionaries' positive influence on China's modernization, objectively speaking. But we admit Christian missions were dominated subjectively by approaching the goal to assimilate and replace indigenous culture under Christian Universalism.

In order to authentically describe historical events and to show the significance of these events, we use primary sources, e.g., Richard's memoir¹³² and Soothill's biography¹³³. These sources are the raw, original materials of history to accounts or interpretations of events written by firsthand authors. Especially, they were the most direct materials to expose Richard's situations in China, such as his conflicts with his colleagues, his considerations about liberalism, his liberal thinking and behavior in mission work. Some of the historical facts are listed as follows.

(1) The conflict between Richard and his colleagues was not the one between individuals, but one between traditional and modern theologies and corresponding

¹³²Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916)

¹³³William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary and the Most Disinterested Advisor the Chinese ever had*, (London: Seeley, Service and Co. Limited, 1924)

mission strategies within the Christian world. It originated from a couple of challenges to Christianity. One was internal, brought about by the modernity of western civilization, especially advanced science and technology, to traditional Christian theology. The other was external, coming from the challenge of the multi-faceted indigenous culture, as well as ethnic diversity, in colonialized countries to the Christian Universalism and the West-centrism.

(2) Richard was a typical missionary equipped with Christian liberal theology which was the best tool to deal with the internal and external challenges. He used science and technology as the gift of God to human beings, and naturally the Western modernity through the development of science and technology was nothing else but the achievements of Christianity in the secular world. Meanwhile, Richard's theology viewed indigenous cultures as the different manifestations of the Christian enlightenment in different regions of the secular world, that is, they were all integral parts of Christianity. As a result, Christianity should tolerate and assimilate indigenous cultures, including those incompatible with traditional Christianity, and interpret them within the context of Christianity. It had appeared a pity for Fundamentalists who were unable to accept this vision of view due to outdated Christian methodology.

(3) Richard had never stood outside West-centrism in his mission work, never forgot Western modernity was to be used as one of the tools of Christianity in evangelization, and never suspended his study of indigenous religions for their transformation into colonial culture. Nevertheless, neither his home Society nor other missionaries in China could have had such profound considerations. He was equipped

with an advanced theology in the treatment of Western modernity and indigenous cultures, but without any loss of unshakable Christian stance.

Richard and Soothill's writings are the primary sources to record in details cultural conflicts and solutions, as well as historical events during the turn of the 19th-20th century. It is not strange that these publications became part of the main primary sources in the text in following Chapters. In these sources, we pay attention to the historical facts the authors recorded which can be verified by other archives, documents, or facts, but not solitary evidence inaccessible via other means, so as to accurately have a good commend of the reality of historical events. For example, Richard's autobiography and Soothill's book mentioned a lot of times about the violence of the Yihetuan (I-ho-t'uan 义和团) Movement (Boxer rebellion). There are a thousand sayings about the event in previous studies. We do not judge the movement in the thesis but provide a few references in a footnote for readers to have a comprehensive view on the event. In reality, the movement was firstly supported by the Qing Court to against imperialist invasion, but later was considered as a force to threaten the Qing government and thus be suppressed.

While primary sources make it possible for us to get sufficient sense of history and the complexity of the past, and then to get higher-order thinking about the subject of the thesis, we use secondary sources to verify the facts and check, analyze, generalize historical phenomena. The secondary sources include not only Western scholars' research achievements, but also Chinese historians' papers and monographs. Even if the primary sources had some choices or applauses, this will not prevent us from using a completely different look on the activities in history, and reevaluating the records.

2.3 Review of Studies on Richard's Mission Work

Richard lived in China for 45 years.¹³⁴ He was born on 10 October 1845 in a devout Baptist blacksmith farmer's family in a small village of Faldybrenin, Carmarthenshire, in South Wales. During the Great Welsh Revival (1858-1860), he professed his faith in Jesus Christ at the age of 13 and became a member of the Caeo Baptist church. He was baptized in May 1859. After his primary and second school education, he taught for some years. During this period, he was inspired by the Second Evangelical Awakening movement and hoped to become a missionary. In 1865, he entered the Haverfordwest Baptist College. In 1869, he was accepted by the Baptist Missionary Society (BMS) and was assigned to Yantai (Yen-t'ai 烟台 also known as "Chefoo"), Shandong (Shan-tung 山东), China. From 1870 to 1873 he worked in Yantai. Then, he moved to Qingzhou Fu (Ch'ing-chou Fu 青州府), Shandong, till 1877. After that, he relocated to Taiyuan (T'ai-yüan 太原), Shanxi (Shansi 山西), where he participated in relief work during a devastating famine (1876-1879). At that time, his liberal missionary principles took shape. From 1880 to 1890, he was engaged in Christianizing Chinese elites and discussing with BMS colleagues about Christianization. In 1890 he became editor of a newspaper in Tianjin where he introduced his ideas of Christianity and Western civilization for reform. In 1891, he became the secretary of the Society for the Diffusion of Christian and General Knowledge among the Chinese (S.D.K., later the Christian Literature Society, C.L.S.) in Shanghai (上海). From then on, he wrote a number of articles and books pertaining to Christianization and westernization. These writings greatly influenced and even guided

¹³⁴Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences by Timothy Richard* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916).

the 1897-1898 Chinese national reform movement prior to the Boxer uprising in 1899-1900. In 1902, he and the governor of Shanxi province, Cen Chunxuan (Ts'en Ch'un-hsüan 岑春煊, 1861-1933), co-founded Shanxi University, one of the three earliest national universities in China. He took the post of Co-Chancellor of the University for 10 years. He retired in 1915 and returned to Britain the same year. He died in London on 17 April 1919.

For such an extraordinary missionary, available literature may be roughly divided into three groups: (1) biographies by missionaries and mission societies, most of which follow a chronological order to record Richard's activities in China; (2) papers by sinologists, namely, non-Chinese scholars who studied Chinese culture, history, philosophy or literature; and, (3) papers and books by Chinese historians.

2.3.1 Missionary Records

Missionary activities are an essential element in history, in the field of multicultural amalgamation via cultural exchanges. However, detailed records of the worldwide mission work were not compiled by historians, but by churches and missionary societies themselves. These records are the most complete and comprehensive; nonetheless they often bear theological interpretive constraints of rules or policies of religious orders and congregations. As a highly influential missionary in late Qing China, Richard drew the most attention from religious societies. There were four important biographies, 45 obituary notices, as well as one centennial anniversary collection devoted to him.

Biographies

The most important biography was written by Richard's assistant, William Edward Soothill (1861-1935), a Methodist missionary to China from Great Britain. The book is entitled *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had*.¹³⁵ Soothill was Richard's successor in the Shansi Imperial University (now Shanxi University), China. It was co-established and co-managed by Richard and Cen. Richard resided in the West Department as the co-Chancellor of the University for almost 10 years. After his own career in China, Soothill became a professor of Chinese studies at Oxford University. He was a leading British sinologist. He published many books on China and Chinese culture.¹³⁶ Soothill wrote Richard's biography on the basis of both his experience as Richard's assistant and his collection of Richard's reminiscences. In Soothill's opinion, Richard was not only an outstanding missionary in late Qing but also a statesman who always pursued and achieved excellence due to his concerns of humanity beyond the parochial scope of ideology. For instance, he held that Richard was one of the pioneers and one of the mentors of China's modernization who had contributed greatly to the establishment of the Republic of China. In addition, he believed that Richard proposed and developed a non-fundamentalist missionary approach based on his unique liberal ideology. This approach guided other missionaries to carry out more influential missionary activities beyond the limits of particular religious denominations. Last but not least, he considered

¹³⁵W. E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & The Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Limited, 1924), pp.1-330.

¹³⁶Soothill wrote and edited a lot of books and dictionaries in China, such as *The Three Religions of China; A Dictionary of Chinese Buddhist Terms; The Hall of Light; A History in China; A Mission in China; China and England; A Dictionary of Chinese Buddhist Terms, with Sanskrit and English Equivalents and a Sanskrit-Pali Index; China and the West; Timothy Richard of China; A Typical Mission in China; The Lotus of the Wonderful Law, or the Lotus of Gospel*.

that, more than a missionary, Richard was not only an inspirer with a gracious spirit towards the millions of Chinese people, but also a self-challenging man toward unusual difficulties rarely met by most missionaries. As the most important reference on Richard, this book was translated into Chinese in 2002¹³⁷ as a Subject in the Subdivision of China National Compilation Project of the Qing Dynasty History.

Another biography, *Timothy Richard: A Narrative of Christian Enterprise and Statesmanship in China*,¹³⁸ was written by Edward William Price Evans (1887-1972). Evans was also a missionary from BMS, but he never met Richard. The manuscript was prepared on the request of BMS in 1945, in commemoration of the 100th Anniversary of Richard's birth. As an overview of Richard's whole life, the book provided a comprehensive summary of his missionary activities guided by the unique theology developed in China.

The third biography is *Timothy Richard, D.D.: China Missionary Statesman and Reformer*,¹³⁹ written by the Baptist missionary Reverend B. Reeve. The materials in this book were mostly collected from two sources: the BMS records and Richard's articles and memoranda, most of which were from Chinese periodicals later collected by Richard in a book, *Conversion by the Millions*.¹⁴⁰ The book was published in 1910 when Richard was still working in China. This publication indicated that Richard's BMS colleagues began to shift from a long-lasting rejection of his open-minded theology and

¹³⁷W. E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & The Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (London, Seeley, Service & Co. Limited, 1924). 苏慧廉, 《李提摩太传》, 香港, 世华天地出版社, 2002 年。

¹³⁸E. W. P. Evans, *Timothy Richard: A Narrative of Christian Enterprise and Statesmanship in China* (London: The Carey Press, 1945), pp.1-160.

¹³⁹R. B. Reeve, *Timothy Richard, D.D.: China Missionary Statesman and Reformer* (London: S.W. Partridge & CO. LTD., 1910), pp.1-198.

¹⁴⁰Timothy Richard, *Conversion by the Million in China* (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907), Vol.1, 2.

liberal mission work to a more positive view toward his activities and achievements in China. For this purpose, the BMS did provide the necessary support for the preparation and publication of the book. In the Preface, Richard's mission work was described as an important part of BMS's modern mission history.

The fourth biography, entitled *A Maker of Modern China*, was written by Albert J. Garnier.¹⁴¹ The book introduced how Richard tried to awaken Chinese people for a transformation from an "uncivilized" condition in the eyes of the author to a modern kingdom. Compared to other authors, Garnier described Richard as a revolutionary figure who played a necessary role in the revolutionary period of China that was a sleeping giant ready to roar. In the book, he outlined emphatically a series of revolutionary events in which Richard was involved to overthrow the Manchu Dynasty and establish the Republic of China in 1911. These events included the Reforms of 1898, the Boxer Uprising, and the Revolution of 1911. The book was printed in 1945 in honor of Richard's 100th anniversary.

As a whole, these biographies are worthwhile in a couple of aspects. One is that they recorded Richard's peculiar missionary conceptions of Christian Protestantism; and the other is that they provide Richard's detailed activities and all the honors he received in China as an outstanding missionary. Here are some examples of Richard's liberal conceptions impressive among his colleagues of his time: (1) it was not sufficient for missionaries to engage only in evangelistic work as ambassadors of God; instead, they must be engaged in more activities, e.g., to meet the social, economic, and intellectual needs of the people they served; (2) Missionaries needed to dispel Chinese ignorance and superstition by introducing God's word which was essential for salvation and

¹⁴¹A. J. Garnier, *A Maker of Modern China* (London: The Carey Press, 1945), pp.1-117.

prosperity, and superior to any religions Chinese people had believed in the past; (3) Missionaries must have the highest personal qualities and be eminently qualified academically for the greatest responsibility of Christianization. Here, we mention that these theoretical contributions were expressed in more details in one of Richard's collections, the theme of which was that both body and soul are of the same importance in this world as well as the next.¹⁴² For the second aspect, examples included (1) Richard was one of the advisors to the Qing Court on educational policies and political reform; (2) He was appointed the first Co-Chancellor of Shanxi University, an institution which was established in response to his long-run suggestion; (3) He obtained the highest honor (something akin to a Dukedom) that a Chinese emperor was able to confer upon foreigners.

Obituary Notices and a Centennial Anniversary Collection

Richard's outstanding achievements in mission work were also demonstrated by the 45 obituary notices following his death. They appeared in English, Scottish, and Welsh newspapers and periodicals. There were also tributes to his life appearing in the *Peking Daily News*, the *Peking Leader*, and the *North Baptist Herald*. Here are some representative ones.

The BMS Committee announced that Richard was a passionately earnest missionary who concentrated on nothing else but the spread of the kingdom of God: "his life call was to be an ambassador of Christ, and a herald of universal peace and brotherhood; and he was always towards the future, with unquestioning faith in the conquest of Christ and His truth." In addition, the Reverend H. Cerny Williams

¹⁴²Timothy Richard, *Conversion by the Million in China* (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907), Vol.2, p.57.

commented that Richard loved the land of his birth but appeared to love the land of his adoption even more.¹⁴³ In the *North China Daily News*, C. Spurgeon Medhurst wrote that Richard's genuine simplicity concealed his real greatness: he was "ahead of his time in his efforts and blueprints for the uplift of humanity in China;" and, he was "such a prince of missionaries: British after the flesh, and Chinese after the spirit."¹⁴⁴

Dr. Henry Williamson was one of Richard's closest friends. In the centenary observance of Richard's birth, he talked about the importance of Richard to the breakdown of the deep-rooted, pervasive prejudices against the Christian Missionary Movement in China: Richard had wide contacts with Chinese elites, especially influential officials and intellectuals, so as to make use of them to change the ideology of more Chinese people; meanwhile, he pushed forward westernization in modern China through publishing numerous literary works which influenced a lot of Chinese reformers in Chinese national movements (like the 1911 political revolution which led to the set-up of the Chinese Republic). Specifically, Williamson considered Richard as a pioneer in Christian education for cultivating Chinese Christians ready to step up into government positions and other important national posts.¹⁴⁵

In memory of Richard, a missionary who believed that the Kingdom of God was "a Kingdom in which justice and righteousness, mercy and peace among men were to be the result of a proper understanding of, and obedience to, the laws of God," a centennial anniversary collection was published which paid tribute to him: "Timothy Richard was the prophet, the writer of books for officials and scholars, the statesmanlike apostle of a

¹⁴³D. Wyre Lewis (Timothy Richard Group), *Annual Report 1963-64* (Aberystwyth: National Library of Wales, 1964/063), unpublished.

¹⁴⁴Spurgeon Medhurst, "A Tribute to Dr. Richard," *North China Daily News*, 27 April 1919.

¹⁴⁵Henry R. Williamson, "To the Friends Who Will Be Assembled at Caio on the One Hundredth Anniversary of the Birth of Timothy Richard," In: *Richard MSS.*, ed. BMS (London: 18 July 1945).

social and international Order based on obedience to the laws of God, the Nation Builder of Modern China.” Again, the book expressed the view that, like all prophets, Richard “was ahead of his time and therefore misunderstood by some;” however, “The Lord is King was his weapon against all forms of oppression among people;” and, “he lived and died beloved by the Chinese people who knew him to be their friend.”¹⁴⁶

The examples of the missionary records listed above provided us with both a rough profile of Richard’s mission work and a sketch of the lofty & overwhelming status of his theological ideology as a missionary pioneer on several fronts throughout his 45 years of missionary activities in China. We are thus able to see that, undergirded by an advanced theological vision, Richard devised an approach which was useful to Christianize and modernize China; and, as one of the early founders of BMS in North China, Richard prepared a practical way with a purpose to make China civilized through Christianization.¹⁴⁷ Notwithstanding the above, all of the high appraisals on Richard came from his missionary colleagues and societies which shared the same basic Christian values and thoughts as Richard. Thus, these positive comments were not considered objective.

2.3.2 Studies by Other Western Scholars

Unlike the missionary authors who produced Richard’s biographies with an emphasis of his evangelical life in China, western scholars concentrated more on

¹⁴⁶A. J. Garnier, *A Maker of Modern China* (London: The Carey Press, 1945), p.7.

¹⁴⁷C. H. Norman, “Building the Protestant Church in Shandong, China,” *International Bulletin of Missionary Research* 22, no. 2 (1998), pp.62-68.

Richard's endeavors in the fields of politics, culture, and education. These include mainly two classical studies on Chinese history and two theses on missionary activities.

Books

One of the two studies is Paul Cohen's Christian missions and their impact to 1900, Chapter 11 of Vol. 10 of *The Cambridge History of China*,¹⁴⁸ edited by Denis Twitchett and John K. Fairbank. It recorded Richard's translations of Western books and international laws into Chinese, as well as his activities in and influences on Chinese political reform in 1898. Cohen suggests that Richard, together with his missionary colleagues, helped Chinese reformers to learn about western civilization, to design specific reform, and to develop ideas for reform. To reach their goals, these missionaries tried various methods, including meeting with the educated Chinese elites, distributing Christian religious literature. Particularly useful was the missionaries' decision to make use of the presence of Chinese scholars at the annual national examinations.

As far as missionaries' influence on the organization and implementation of Chinese reform, Cohen analyzed this influence as a multi-level phenomenon which included: to open Protestant schools, to educate reformers with Western science and technology, and to guide elites to know the benefits of Christianity. In these activities, Protestant schools nourished an atmosphere which was conducive to reform by communicating the knowledge of the West and of Western culture: "Missionaries, in their policies, methods and social attitudes, furnished live, on-the-spot models for Chinese reformers to emulate,"¹⁴⁹ as shown in, e.g., the famine relief (to be introduced in the next Chapter). Moreover, missionaries (e.g., Timothy Richard, Young J. Allen and

¹⁴⁸D. Twitchett and John K. Fairbank, *The Cambridge History of China*, Vol. 10 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1978).

¹⁴⁹*Ibid.*, p.582.

Gilbert Reid) established close relations with Chinese elites such as leading reformers (e.g., Kang Youwei) and dignitaries (e.g., the Emperor's tutors), both within and without officialdom, in order to spread the Gospel and Western civilization by means of public media (e.g., newspapers, magazines) and lectures in meetings to facilitate the Chinese reform movement. As Cohen concluded, the reform in China, "if not directly inspired by missionary models, was at least strongly influenced" by the establishment of these relations and the use of the periodical press.¹⁵⁰

Cohen also argued that these missionaries believed that Chinese people's acceptance of Western learning would automatically lead to the acceptance of Christianity. For this reason, the missionaries actively took part in activities in the fields of, e.g., medical care, education, the press and publication, etc., so as to influence Chinese people to accept God. Cohen found that they were "least successful in convincing the Chinese that the Western learning and institutions, and the wealth and power that accompanied them, were somehow rooted in Christianity."¹⁵¹ Cohen claimed that, although the Chinese Christian reformers eventually became the earliest group in modern China who escaped from the highly closed Confucian world, Christianity appeared not so much to be an *alternative* worldview in China to replace Confucianism; however, it provided a possible legitimate or perspective which could be used to modernize traditional Chinese culture.

Cohen also suggested that missionary activities did substantially undermine the principles and uniqueness of Chinese Confucianism.¹⁵² More importantly, through the mission work, Richard and his colleagues might have become the inner circle of the

¹⁵⁰*Ibid.*, p.588.

¹⁵¹*Ibid.* p.589.

¹⁵²*Ibid.* p.605.

Guangxu Emperor's advisers had the *coup d'état* of September 1898 not taken place, as to be seen in Chapter 4.¹⁵³

Another account of Christian missions in China is *A History of Christian Missions in China*,¹⁵⁴ a monograph written by Kenneth Scott Latourette (1884-1968). The author was a missionary who in the late 1910s volunteered to come to China as a student member of Yale Mission in China (or Yale-China Association). He taught in the school of the Yale Mission in China. In 1920, he went back to the USA and returned to China again to take up the post of council member of the Association and its Medical School in Xiangtan City in Hunan Province. This book was published when he was the Professor of Mission History and Oriental History at Yale Divinity School. It represents a landmark book in Western academia about mission history and Sino-American history.

In the book, Latourette viewed Richard as “one of the greatest missionaries whom any branch of the Church, whether Roman Catholic, Russian Orthodox, or Protestant, has sent to China”¹⁵⁵ not only because Richard had a deep appreciation of ancient Chinese culture, but also because he believed himself obligated to modernize Chinese culture through Christianization and Westernization, in order to benefit Chinese lives. In addition, Latourette admired the fact that Richard struggled to “broaden the outlook of the educated classes and so to aid in nation-wide reform”¹⁵⁶ in China, and to “remove the prejudice that had helped give rise to anti-foreign feeling”¹⁵⁷ by the establishment of Shanxi University after the Boxer uprising. However, as Cohen commented, Latourette's book, although “the best general Western-language survey of the

¹⁵³*Ibid.* p.606.

¹⁵⁴K. S. Latourette, *A History of Christian Missions in China* (New York: Macmillan, 1929), pp.1-930.

¹⁵⁵*Ibid.*, p.346.

¹⁵⁶*Ibid.*, p.456.

¹⁵⁷*Ibid.*, p.466.

missionary enterprise”, did not use any Chinese sources and was written with a definite evangelical Protestant bias.¹⁵⁸

We note here that Cohen’s idea is valid due to the fact that in China a lot of documents about missionary records were written in Chinese. Without them, it really is impossible to gain a complete view of mission work and its impact on China’s reform for modernization. Cohen’s book is thus more appropriate to evaluate Richard’s missionary activities. However, it is worth mentioning that Cohen’s book has three biased viewpoints: (1) Western culture was superior to the Chinese one and the mission work brings modern culture to China; (2) Chinese indigenous cultural tradition was not challenged during the Christianization and Westernization; (3) Richard and his colleagues respected and protected Chinese culture during mission work, without any Western-centered standpoints.¹⁵⁹

Theses

Two theses were written about Richard’s missionary life. One of them was a PhD thesis by Paul Richard Bohr, entitled *Famine in China and the Missionary: Timothy Richard as Relief Administrator and Advocate of National Reform, 1876-1884*.¹⁶⁰ This study focuses on Richard’s relief work and provides an analysis of the difference between Richard’s highly efficient relief structure and the less adequate social system set up by the Qing Government. In addition to an extensive record of Richard’s activities during that special period, the thesis describes in great detail the North China

¹⁵⁸P. Cohen, “Bibliographical Essays of 10. Christian Missions and Their Impact to 1900,” In *The Cambridge History of China*, Vol.10, ed. J. K. Fairbank (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1978), p.612.

¹⁵⁹P. Cohen, “Missionaries and the New Order,” In *The Cambridge History of China*, Vol.10, ed. J. K. Fairbank (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1978), pp. 581-588.

¹⁶⁰Paul Richard Bohr, *Famine in China and the Missionary: Timothy Richard as Relief Administrator and Advocate of National Reform, 1876-1884* (Harvard University Asia Center, 1972).

Famine of 1876-1879, one of the great mortality crises in world history, originated from a drought that extended over five provinces, affecting a population of over 100 million people and leaving an estimated 9.5-13 million dead.¹⁶¹

The author argued that, firstly, it was this calamity that prompted Richard to develop a broad program of national reform with the objective of rooting out poverty and misery of the Chinese people. Secondly, it was the relief work during and after the Great Famine that prompted Richard to shape his ideas and become an advocate for reform in China. For example, Richard expressed his reform ideas in Chinese books and newspapers intended for Chinese elites who could potentially support the reforms necessary to improve the daily lives of people. Richard had countless conversations with Chinese officials during which he urged them to consider approaches to reform in order to eradicate the main causes and effects of poverty and famine, as well as other hardships created by similar natural disasters. Lastly, it was the missionary activities in these special years of famine relief that inspired Richard to realize the necessity of a politically top-down reform roadmap for the development of China's economy and modernization. Without a doubt, the Famine drove Richard to broaden his mission work beyond the scope of a narrow Christianization with a coupling to Chinese politics.

The other work is the Master thesis of Paul A. Cohen, *Missionary Approaches: Hudson Taylor and Timothy Richard*.¹⁶² It was cited many times in subsequent studies on Richard. The thesis compared Richard and another missionary, Hudson Taylor (1832–1905), and their respective missionary activities in China in the late 19th century.

¹⁶¹L. M. Li, "Introduction: Food, Famine, and the Chinese State," *Journal of Asian Studies* 4 (1982), p.687.

¹⁶²P. A. Cohen, "Missionary Approaches: Hudson Taylor and Timothy Richard," *Papers on China* 11 (1957), pp.29-62.

Taylor was a conservative missionary, the founder of the China Inland Mission (CIM)¹⁶³ in 1864. The study shows that, while the two missionaries shared common characteristics, they were vastly different from each other in mission work. The similarities included: both of them were among the most influential missionaries in China at approximately the same time; both hoped to educate first of all native Chinese Christians and establish ultimately domestic Chinese churches; both disseminated Christianity so effectively that traditional Chinese culture was challenged; and, both shed light on the cultural exchange achieved between the West and the East through their missionary activities.

By contrast, however, their missionary ideologies and approaches were completely different. Taylor had a traditional fundamentalist approach to Christianization, i.e., stressing adhering exactly to the words in the Bible. He encouraged missionaries to engage in personal evangelism in inland China to redeem the souls of Chinese people, rather than to improve their material life. He believed that the redemption of souls should take place prior to the modernization of China.¹⁶⁴ Unlike Taylor, Richard made use of a top-down approach to promote Christianization effectively, combined with a Sinicization of Christianity. This approach was used to enlist a large number of Chinese who were members of elites (e.g., leaders, officials, and intellectuals), whom Richard met. Because these elite figures were able to influence a much wider and a more diverse range of Chinese people, Richard hoped to take advantage of them to influence more

¹⁶³For a comprehensive story of Hudson Taylor, see A.J. Broomhall, *Hudson Taylor and China's Open Century*, 7 volumes. China Inland Mission (CIM) was founded by Hudson Taylor in 1864. As a missionary society, it was unique in its self-sacrificial principles: (1) faith in God to provide full support; (2) trust in guidance received through prayers rather than religious education before going to the mission field; (3) readiness to go to the interior adopting the native dress and lifestyle.

¹⁶⁴P. A. Cohen, "Missionary Approaches: Hudson Taylor and Timothy Richard," *Papers on China* 11 (1957), pp.32.

Chinese individuals, as well as groups, political parties, to receive, accept and even spread Christianity; in this way he hoped the whole country could eventually “enjoy” the Gospel of God.¹⁶⁵ With respect to Sinicization, Cohen argued that Richard Christianized China in a way that had been done before by Matteo Ricci (1552-1610), an earlier famous missionary in China: Richard studied traditional Chinese culture and introduced Western civilization in his mission work within the context of traditional Chinese custom developed for thousands of years following Confucianism. Because of this he was partially successful because more and more Chinese became less resistant to Christianity. Cohen concluded that Sinicization was essential in Richard’s approach and that without it Richard could never have progressed in China.

In summary, we see that Western scholars have tended to analyze Richard’s mission work more objectively and rationally than the Western missionary societies.

2.3.3 Studies by Chinese scholars

As described by the famous scholar, John K. Fairbank, China’s 19th century was “a stark tragedy, an unforeseen and certainly enormous decline and fall almost without equal in history.”¹⁶⁶ Under Western imperialist pressure, modern China (specifically in the late Qing Dynasty) was constantly challenged by the unequal treaties it had been

¹⁶⁵*Ibid.*, p.47.

¹⁶⁶J. K. Fairbank, “1, Introduction: The old order,” In *The Cambridge history of China: Late Ch’ing, 1800-1911*, Part 1, Volume 10, ed, J. K. Fairbank (London, New York, Melbourne: Cambridge University Press, 1978), pp.1-34.

forced to sign with Western countries, while the West gradually gained the following main privileges between 1840 and 1911:

- The opening of ports to Western trade (the number of which increased from 5 in 1842 to about 50 in 1911);
- The expansion of extraterritorial consular jurisdiction (over treaty-power nationals, their property, trade and industry);
- The allowance of foreign shipping in inland waters (from gunboats to steamship lines on main rivers);
- The employment of foreign administrators (from the maritime customs to the post office and salt revenue administrations);
- The spread of missionary work to education and medicine in every province; and,
- A multitude of other rights (like the stationing of foreign garrisons in Peking after 1900, and pre-emption of customs revenues after 1911 to pay off foreign loans and indemnities).

Before 1978 when Lenin's theory of imperialism dominated Chinese ideology, as introduced in Chapter 1, these Western privileges prompted Chinese scholars and researchers of that historical period, to agree that the late Qing Dynasty was invaded, exploited, and victimized by Western powers, and that the country was experiencing a period of "national humiliation". With this interpretive framework, they viewed Christian missions as a form of *Cultural Invasion*.

After 1978, academics in the PRC followed Deng Xiaoping open-minded *Reform and Opening-up* policy to modernize China. More and more researchers began to review missionary activities, and some Chinese scholars proposed a *Modernization* paradigm to

re-analyze missionary activities. This new model was very different from the *Invasion* paradigm. The transition was obvious.

Studies before 1978

Before 1978, a limited number of publications that dealt with Richard appeared among the vast amount of literature which studied the imperialist nature of the mission movement in China. In general, these analyses viewed Richard as a typical imperialist missionary in China and claimed that his work deepened China's social, economic, and political crises.

One paper, entitled *Timothy Richard's Aggressive Activities in Shanxi Province* and written by Guo Wuzhen (Kuo Wu-chen 郭吾真, 1909-2009),¹⁶⁷ divided Richard's activities into two main phases: 1877-1886 and 1901-1911. The first period was when the Great Famine swept through North China, and the other was when Richard was recognized by the Qing Government as the representative of missionary victims in missionary cases regarding compensations of the loss brought about by the Boxer rebels.

In the first period, Guo claimed that Richard was allowed to visit North China freely in order to provide famine relief, but that he made use of this opportunity to initiate invasion activities, including the collection of topographic information, interference in anti-Christian movements, and the dissemination of Western culture, lifestyle, and ideology. Guo listed the following examples to support his argument: (1) Richard did a lot of things not suitable to be done by a foreigner in China. For instance, in Taiyuan, Richard conducted a survey design and drew topographic maps in Fenyang (Fen-yang 汾阳), Hongdong (Hung-tung 洪洞) and Lu'an (Lu-an 潞安, now Ch'ang-

¹⁶⁷Guo Wuzhen, "Timothy Richard's Aggressive Activities in Shansi Province," *History Teaching* no.4 (1964), pp.11-18. 郭吾真, "李提摩太在山西的侵略活动", 《历史教学》, 1964年第4期, 第11-18页。

chih 长治); in Shanxi, Richard acted as a representative of missionaries to force local Chinese officials to guarantee missionaries' safety, social position, and privilege. (2) By preaching the Gospel and by releasing relief funds and establishing facilities, Richard attracted and brainwashed more and more Chinese people to become Christianized, resulting in a situation whereby local Chinese authorities and Chinese culture were challenged. (3) Richard built orphanages and schools to cultivate and select future pro-Western intellectuals by indoctrinating young people with Western education. Therefore, Guo concluded, as the product of the unequal treaties, Richard's activities were a form of imperialist invasion of the West into mainland China.

In the second period, Guo described Richard as the greatest traitor of Britain. Guo argued that in the late Qing Dynasty Richard became the representative of missionary victims, invited by the leading Qing officer, Li Hongzhang, to solve the compensation problem after the Boxer rebellion. More than this, Richard wrote proposals to officials and articles for the public in China, rather than working for his own country, to advocate reform, run Westernized universities, etc. Guo thus concluded absurdly that Richard intervened in the fields of Chinese culture and education as a typical imperialist who betrayed his country.

Another representative article on Richard was *The Conspiracy of Timothy Richard and Li Hongzhang after the Treaty of Shimonoseki*.¹⁶⁸ It was written by Ding Zeliang (Ting Tse-liang 丁则良, 1915-1957). In the study, the author claimed that Richard worried about the dangers that Britain faced in China when other foreign countries (e.g., France, Russia and Japan) came in, and was also concerned with the ignorance of

¹⁶⁸Ding Zeliang, "The conspiracy of the commit treason instigated by Timothy Richard to Li Hongzhang before the Treaty of Shimonoseki," *History Teaching* no.3 (1951), pp.14-17. 丁则良, "马关议和前李提摩太策动李鸿章卖国阴谋的发现", 《历史教学》, 1951年第3期, 第14-17页。

Chinese officials and people which would likely result in suspicion and rejection of Western culture. The author revealed that it was Richard who first suggested Li to divide China into several parts for western powers, respectively, in order to avoid war and, most importantly, to resist Japanese invasion after the Treaty of Shimonoseki.

In addition to this article, the author published a book in 1951: *Timothy Richard: A Typical Missionary Giving Service to Imperialism*.¹⁶⁹ Based on Marxist-Leninist ideology, the author listed five facts that sought to demonstrate Richard was indeed an imperialist in his mission work:

(1) He was zealous to establish connections with Chinese officials, especially those who participated in politics and won the Emperor's trust, so as to influence China's politics directly or indirectly.

(2) He convinced Chinese reformers to institute a constitutional monarchy similar to that in Great Britain or Japan.

(3) Though merely a missionary, he was involved in the conflicts between Chinese Emperor Party and Empress Party, as a consultant for the former. He helped the Empress' Party obtain support from Western powers, especially Great Britain and the United States.

(4) As the chief foreign advisor to the prime minister, Li Hongzhang, he helped Li in the suppression of the Boxer movement, and in the negotiation of China's compensation paid to Western countries.

¹⁶⁹Ding Zeliang, *Timothy Richard: a typical missionary giving service to Imperialism* (Beijing: Kaiming Publishing House, 1951), pp.1-134. 丁则良, “李提摩太: 一个典型的为帝国主义服务的传教士”, 北京: 开明书局, 1951年, 第1-134页。

(5) During the severe internal conflict at the end of the late Qing Dynasty between Sun Zhongshan's Republican Revolution and Yuan Shikai's Sui Generis Restoration, Richard supported Yuan and interfered with Sun's revolutionary activities.

The author concluded that, although Richard did not kill any Chinese people with a sword or a gun, he was involved in the Boxer suppression and was thus a blood-stained foreign executioner who was complicit in the slaughter of Chinese people.

Interestingly, Richard was described differently in the book entitled *Timothy Richard*,¹⁷⁰ that was published later in 1964 by Li Shiyue (Li Shih-yüeh 李时岳, 1928-1996). Li was a famous Chinese historian who specialized in the study of Richard's activities in China. He is the representative of scholars who highly appreciated the Westernization movement in the late Qing Dynasty. He collected a lot of firsthand archival materials of Richard's mission work in the dissemination of western culture throughout China, e.g., his reminiscences, journals and books published by C.L.S., and his papers & reports written for newspapers. Though the author accepted that missionary activities appeared to be a form of cultural invasion directed by imperialistic ideology, the dissemination of Western civilization was necessary for the Chinese people to learn science and technology and to construct a modernized China by integrating Christianity and Confucianism. We note here that this book was quite different from the mainstream in academia at the time it was published. It was considered as heterodoxy in 1964 on the eve of the Chinese Cultural Revolution. The book reflected positive attitudes among some Chinese scholars towards the missionaries' Christianization and Westernization.

¹⁷⁰Li Shiyue, *Timothy Richard* (Beijing: Zhong Hua Book Company, 1964), pp.1-98. 李时岳, 《李提摩太》, 北京: 中华书局, 1964 年, 第 1-98 页。

Studies after 1978

From 1978, the historical *Reform and Opening-up* policy brought about an obvious change in Chinese ideology. After the 10-year Cultural Revolution (1966-1976), the Chinese government started a *Four-Modernization* Campaign (namely, modernizations in agriculture, industry, national defense, and science & technology). Accordingly, in the field of Chinese History, PRC scholars proposed a new dominant interpretation, the *Modernization* paradigm, to downplay and replace the previous revolutionary *Invasion* paradigm. They paid closer attention to the missionaries' activities in the late Qing Dynasty and contributed new analyses in the study of Richard.

Gu Changsheng (Ku Ch'ang-sheng 顾长声) was such a Chinese scholar in the 1980s, focusing on mission work in the 19th and 20th centuries. He studied missionary activities in depth in the late Qing Dynasty and published a couple of monographs which are the most influential in China nowadays. One is *Missionaries and Modern China*¹⁷¹ published in 1981 and reprinted in 1991; the other is *From Robert Morrison to John Leighton Stuart*¹⁷² published in 1985, in which Richard's work was briefly described and commented on.

The first book was a detailed review of missionary activities from the first Opium War to 1949 when the People's Republic of China (PRC) replaced the ROC to rule mainland China. It discussed the *Cultural Invasion* Paradigm. Gu admitted that Western missionaries had a close relationship with the modernization of China. In the two editions of the book, he introduced every aspect of missionary-related events in China

¹⁷¹Gu Changsheng, *Missionaries and Modern China* (Shanghai: Shanghai Bookstore Publishing House, 2005), pp.1-347. 顾长声, 《传教士与近代中国》, 上海: 上海世纪图书出版公司, 2005年, 第1-347页。

¹⁷²Gu Changsheng, *Robert Morrison to John Leighton Stuart* (Shanghai: Shanghai People Press, 2004), pp.1-298. 顾长声, 《从马礼逊到司徒雷登》, 上海: 上海人民出版社, 2004年, 第1-298页。

from 1840 to 1949 which could be found in archives, such as presence of missionaries in China, the wars between China and the West, the organization and activities of missionaries, religious cases, Western-style schools, church charities, sinicization, missionaries and the anti-Japanese war, Bible translation and distribution, Sino-Western cultural exchange.

In the second book, Gu provided biographies of all Protestant missionaries in the late Qing Dynasty and accounts of their principal missionary activities. Similar to Ding's viewpoints, he labeled Richard as a typical missionary who exhibited the features that identified liberal missionaries in China under the control of imperialism.

A recent work, *American Missionaries and the Modernization of China in the Late Qing*, was written by Wang Lixin (Wang Li-hsin 王立新). The author argued that, more than tools of imperialism, missionaries in fact behaved as cultural envoys or ambassadors to contribute much more than expected to China's modernization in the late Qing Dynasty. The author pointed out that most missionaries did not have direct ties to imperialism, but came to China with good intentions towards the Chinese people. Considering the missionaries' contributions to medical care, famine relief, education, newspapers, etc., he concluded that the mission work was obviously beneficial to China. The author also mentioned negative aspects of missionary activities, e.g., missionaries described God differently, although their interpretations emanated from the same texts of Bible. This plurality of interpretations made Chinese people skeptical about Christianity. What was worse, some missionaries were dishonest when they presented Western civilization to their audience. For example, they downplayed the significance of historical events such as the French Revolution, and concepts such as Darwin's

evolutionary theory. Beyond the above, some missionaries lacked basic knowledge about Chinese history and its culture.

The author found that missionaries were principally divided into two groups, depending on their theologies and approaches: One was the fundamentalist group, and the other was the liberal one.¹⁷³ The former followed the Bible literally and regarded Jesus Christ and his teachings as the exact Word of God, and did not accept that the God's Word included science and technology, nor science and technology was a gift from God to human beings. In their mission work, Fundamentalists always adopted a rigid individual preaching approach in these practical evangelizing. By contrast, the latter believed that science and technology were an important part of what God provided to the world, and that western civilization was just the reflection of this precious gift. Therefore, this group of missionaries preferred to make use of science and technology in Christianization, and to integrate mission work with the spread of Western civilization. Liberals expanded the influence of God by means of the products of civilization, e.g., newspapers, scientific instruments, Westernized schools and hospitals.

In spite of Richard's British identification, Wang discussed Richard's identification overall as a typical liberal in the late Qing Dynasty. This conclusion was based on Richard's struggle to change China through Christianization by means of publishing reform essays and books, setting up Western-style schools, and running newspapers and journals, among other things. The author found that Richard's ideology was much advanced among missionaries during the 19th century with respect to two points: (1) Science and technology was an indispensable part of God's benefit to human beings,

¹⁷³Wang Lixin, *American Missionaries and the Modernization of China in the late Qing* (Tianjin: Tianjin People Press, 1997), pp.1-277. 王立新, 《美国传教士和晚清中国现代化》, 天津: 天津人民出版社, 1997年, 第1-277页。

and once combined with it evangelization became easier in practice; (2) Western civilization embodied the advance in science and technology and helped people to get rid of various superstitions and enjoy new lives which they had never expected. Consequently, people were prone to converting to God confidently by reevaluating traditional culture and custom. The author admired Richard as a forerunner, though as a foreigner in China, to initiate reforms for the modernization of this ancient country as early as more than a century years ago.

CHAPTER 3
MODERNITY FEATURE
IN THE FORMATION OF RICHARD’S LIBERAL THEOLOGY

3.1 Missions in China before Richard’s Arrival

Before Richard, Western missionaries had already long been cultivating ties with China as early as from the 7th century. As mentioned in Chapter 1, the first Christian missionaries called Nestorians came to China in 635 (Early Tang China). As long as after about 660 years later, the second group of the Franciscans appeared in Yuan China and built the first Catholic Church in Beijing in 1299. However, neither of these two early Christian communities survived. The third act was represented by the Society of Jesus, founded by St. Ignatius (1491-1556), for “the defense and propagation of the faith.” Of the many places that the early Jesuits evangelized, they would soon prize China as one of their key missions during which the Jesuits inaugurated modern Chinese Christian history.¹⁷⁴ The Jesuit China mission started in 1552 when China was in the Ming Dynasty to continue the career initiated by a founding member of the Society, St. Francis Xavier (1506-1552). He died on a Chinese island of Shangchuan which was overlooking mainland China. He had never reached the mainland during his ten years as the first Jesuit apostle; though he was successful in India, Indonesia, and Japan, but

¹⁷⁴Paul Mariani, S. J., “The Jesuit China Mission: A Brief History, Part I (1552-1800)”, *The New Jesuit Review*, Vol. 3., 2012.

frustrated in China. Later groups of Jesuit missionaries fulfilled Xavier's dream, led by several figures including the well-known Italian Matteo Ricci (1552-1610).

Ricci was sent to China in 1582. Among tens of missionaries, including Jesuits, Franciscans, Dominicans, and Augustinians trying to enter the mainland, the Jesuits successfully introduced Western science, mathematics, astronomy, and visual arts to the Chinese imperial court, and carried on inter-cultural and philosophical Christian-Confucian Dialogue. Although Matteo Ricci was offered a privileged position at the Ming court, he was not allowed to spread Gospel outside.¹⁷⁵ Emperor Kangxi (K'ang-hsi 康熙) issued a decree in 1721 to ban Christianity; but in practice the restriction was not placed on the missionaries strictly. During the throne of Emperor Yongzheng (Yung-cheng 雍正), he inhibited foreigners' activities severely from 1735 because the Catholic missionaries got involved in the scramble for the throne between Yongzheng and his brothers just after Kangxi Emperor died. The closed-door policy lasted till the Opium Wars in the early 1840s, through the reigns of Qianlong (Ch'ien-lung 乾隆), Jiaqing (Chia-ch'ing 嘉庆), and Daoguang (Tao-kuang 道光), during which the activities of the Catholic missionaries and Christians nearly disappeared. Historically, the Jesuit delegation had a peak influence on China among all missionaries before the beginning of the 19th century. From 1552 to 1800, a total of 920 Jesuits participated in the China mission; of whom 314 were Portuguese, and another 130 were French.¹⁷⁶

¹⁷⁵Qian Zhikun, "The Rites Controversy and Kangxi's Catholicism Restriction," *Journal of Hangzhou Teachers College* (Humanities and Social Sciences), no.2 (2002), pp.63-67. 钱志坤, "礼仪之争与康熙禁教", 《杭州师范学院学报》, 2001年第2期, 第63-67页。

¹⁷⁶D. E. Mungello, *The Great Encounter of China and the West, 1500-1800*, (Rowman & Littlefield Publishers 2005), p. 37.

The fourth China mission surged after the two Opium Wars (1839-1842 and 1856-1860) when China experienced a series of military defeats and had to make concessions to foreign powers. Unequal Sino-West treaties forced China to open its door for all Western countries (e.g., England, France, Portugal, Holland, Germany, as well as the United States) to establish trade relations with China. At the same time, the treaties guaranteed the right of all Roman Catholic and Protestant missionaries to travel inland freely for mission work. Numerous missionaries came to China to build churches, run schools, and establish medical services, among other things.¹⁷⁷ However, due to travel and language limitations missionaries were restricted within only a few port cities like Guangzhou, Fuzhou, Amoy, Ningbo, Nanjing, and Shanghai. Until the early 1870s, most of the Protestant missionaries in China were Fundamentalists. Facing indigenous people of a totally unfamiliar and mysterious country, these early missionaries took little care of local cultures and traditional customs but adopted only Fundamentalist approaches by insisting on strict adherence to Christian doctrines. They seemed to be safer and freer than ever in history to Christianize individuals, villages and towns. However, missionaries were surprised to encounter resistance to Christianization from the two sides as follows.

On the one side, they usually faced suspicion from the majority of Chinese people who felt that mission work endangered Chinese culture, while some even believed that missionary activities were part of the West's invasion of China and, therefore, it was proposed that unarmed Christians should also be attacked, expelled, or eliminated. On the other side, unfortunately, missionaries were also subjected to indifference, even

¹⁷⁷I. C. Y. Hsü, *The Rise of Modern China*, 4th ed. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000), pp.160-220. See also K. S. Latourette, *The Chinese, Their History and Culture*, 3ed. rev. (New York: The Macmillian Company, 1947), pp.344-353.

opposition, from the Western world, because missionary activities were not always directly related to the commercial or military interests of their native countries, and thus they were sometimes considered by colonial powers to play unhelpful roles in the colonial expansions. Especially for missionaries (like Richard) who hoped to help colonial territories (like China) become modernized, they were always spontaneously opposed by the imperialists owing to the fact that, unlike these missionaries, colonial powers preferred to keep colonialized countries undeveloped, instead of leading the countries to become a formidable rival to the West's trade and industry.

At that time of the Opium Wars, China already had got a huge pressure from its vast population: more than 400 million (1841) with a yearly 27 million increase on average in past 10 years.¹⁷⁸ After the Wars, the late Qing Court experienced a precipitous decline in its economy and extremely hard political conditions due to the outflow of silver payments to foreign powers (~22 million taels annually, about 867 million US dollars; ~1.3 billion taels from 1840 to 1901 in total),¹⁷⁹ and the expense to suppress numerous internal destructive rebellions, especially a massive civil war initiated in southern China against the ruling Manchu Qing Dynasty, called the Taiping Rebellion.¹⁸⁰ The Rebellion lasted 14 years from 1850 to 1864,¹⁸¹ disrupted 16 out of 18

¹⁷⁸Chien-nung Li, *The Political History of China, 1840-1928*, tr., S.-Y. Teng, (Princeton, N.J.: Van Nostrand, 1956), p.48.

¹⁷⁹J. K. Fairbank, "The Creation of the Treaty System" in *The Cambridge History of China* Vol. 10, ed. J. K. Fairbank (London, New York, Melbourne: Cambridge University Press, 1978), pp.213-216.

¹⁸⁰R. L. Worden, A. M. Savada, and R. E. Dolan, *China: A Country Study* (Washington: GPO for the Library of Congress, 1987).

¹⁸¹(太平)—*Great Peace*: the name given the rebellion (1850-65) against the Manchus and Westerners in China. It was started by Hong Xiuquan (Hung Hsiu-ch'uan 洪秀全) among the discontented peasants of Guangxi Province. It was finally suppressed by mixed Army forces under Zeng Guofan, Li Hongzhang, and Major Charles Gordon of the British Army. Directly and in-directly, the rebellion cost the lives of about twenty million Chinese. Nine provinces were devastated. The Manchu dynasty was bankrupted by the cost of suppressing it. Since the Taiping leaders professed to be Christians, Chinese officials came to look upon Christianity as a loathsome disease. It was undoubtedly, one of the most destructive rebellions of all times.

provinces of China, caused destruction in more than 600 cities and resulted in the deaths of more than 15 million people.¹⁸² In culture, there was only one newspaper at that time in China where the public's opinions could be presented. The literacy ratio of Chinese males was approximately 5%, and those who could write were fewer. Very few women could read and some anti-cultural customs, e.g., girls' feet-binding, were still in vogue among the majority of illiterate Han-females.¹⁸³

The Qing Court was controlled by Empress Dowager Cixi (Tz'u-hsi 慈禧). Till the Opium Wars most of the Chinese elites had always had a closed and conservative worldview, believing that China was the center of the world and also the strongest and richest country.¹⁸⁴ Fortunately, China's defeat in the Wars had awaken them to accept that Western science and technology was far more developed in the West than in China. Yet they still insisted that Chinese civilization and culture were superior to that of the Western barbarians, and that the difference lay only on the lack of enough advanced weapons. With this kind of recognition, the Qing Court determined to develop westernized military technology and enhance armaments through a Self-Strengthening Movement in order to compete against the West. The Movement lasted from 1861 to 1895 to bring renovations, such as establishing shipyards & arsenals, hiring foreign advisers to train Chinese artisans to manufacture such wares in China, and so on. However, it paid little attention to any social, political, or cultural reforms beyond the scope of military modernization. In order to deal with the matter, Prince Gong, the

¹⁸²For an overview of the Taiping Revolution, See I. C. Y. Hsu, *The Rise of Modern China* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000), pp.221-253.

¹⁸³E.W. Bu, "Timothy Richard: His Contribution to Modern China," *International Review of Missions* 34 (1945), p.295.

¹⁸⁴A. Snyder and S. West, *Readings in Global History* (Vol. II, Revised 2nd Ed.; Dubuque: Kendall-Hunt, 1997), pp.166-169.

Regent and Grand Councilor of the late Qing Dynasty, established the Zongli Yamen¹⁸⁵ (Tsongli Yamen 总理衙门; Office of Foreign Affairs) in 1861 after the Convention of Peking. It was replaced later by a Foreign Office in 1901 when the Qing government was forced to change its foreign service by article XII of the Boxer Protocol 1901 after the Boxer rebellion.¹⁸⁶

Just prior to the initiation of the Movement, the BMS Nanjing station in South China sent five pioneer missionaries to Yantai (Chefoo) in 1860, a coastal city in Shandong province, to establish the first residential BMS station in North China for evangelization work. Though other missionary societies were already in this area, there had not been much apparent success due to the hostility of the local people and the ravages of bandit groups. These included some anti-foreigner secret societies, offshoots of the Taiping rebels and the Nian (捻军 Nien)¹⁸⁷ rebels (a branch of the previous Taiping troops). In this turbulent period, missionaries found it very difficult to engage in “standard” missionary activities. Within 10 years, the BMS staff had dwindled to only one missionary there, the Rev. F. Laughton.¹⁸⁸

¹⁸⁵The most striking institutional innovation of the Restoration period, it was a formal office, established on January 20, 1861, at the suggestion Foreign office, or Tsungli Yamen, was the one place in the government where able officials were found. Such men as Zeng Guofan, Li Hongzhang, and Zhang Zhidong helped to make China’s foreign policy as well as to encourage internal reforms.

¹⁸⁶B. Masataka, *China and the West, 1858-1861: The Origins of the Tsungli Yamen* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1964).

¹⁸⁷Nien Rebellion (1851-1868)—nien (*bands*), a group of secret-society bandit gangs whose genealogy can be traced back to the White Lotus Society in the late eighteenth century. They operated in the area west of the Grand Canal between the Huai and Yellow rivers in the southern part of the North China plain. Nien and Taiping forces co-operated on many occasions.

¹⁸⁸Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.35.

3.2 Richard's Awakening of liberalism from Fundamentalist Missions

On 27 February 1870, Richard arrived at Yantai. Laughton died no more than four months later. As the only BMS representative there, Richard concentrated on Chinese language learning at first. At the end of the year, Dr. William Brown joined Richard. Brown was the first BMS missionary who was also an expert in Western medicine. They were soon engaged in medical services to help local Chinese people. The medical mission work provided Richard the first precious opportunity to gain missionary experience.¹⁸⁹ However, the BMS fundamentalists did not accept medical missionary activities because they meant a departure from “standard” Christian approaches. After three years Dr. Brown had to resign in April 1874.¹⁹⁰

During these years, in addition to the medical mission work, Richard participated in Fundamentalist mission activities with other missionaries, including street and chapel preaching, distribution of tracts and pamphlets, hymn singing, and travelling. he made many friends in learning how to do mission work as effectively and efficiently as possible. Dr. Calvin Mateer was such a friend. Mateer was from the American Presbyterian Mission and was the first missionary who introduced scientific education in Protestant missions in China. He convinced Richard that offering scientific lectures or lab demonstrations with apparatus to audiences when preaching brought about tremendous unexpected effects on the conversion of Chinese people. Another missionary, Dr. Alexander Williamson, taught Richard how to use Christian literature as the best means to introduce the Gospels to the literati. Moreover, Mr. Robert Lilley, who

¹⁸⁹H. R. Williamson, *British Baptists in China: 1845-1952* (London: Carey Kingsgate Press, 1957), pp. 32-33.

¹⁹⁰Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.64.

was from the National Bible Society of Scotland, brought Richard along on his mission trips to Manchuria and Korea so as to broaden Richard's vision on how hard mission work was and how difficult it was to solve unexpected problems missionaries had to face with respect to Christianization.

In the work he noticed that all the previous materials written by either Catholic or Protestant missionaries unapologetically denounced long-standing Chinese cultural practices and customs, and, in general, local people, no matter whether living in town or rural area, were antagonistic towards these activities due to serious mutual misunderstandings based on difference between foreign and traditional indigenous cultures, even oral conversation in English was a big problem for missionaries. These difficulties greatly hindered evangelization, and not much progress was made.¹⁹¹ Few people converted to Christianity in about three years.¹⁹² But delightfully, Richard insisted on learning Chinese¹⁹³ and began to wear Chinese garb, eat Chinese food, and live in a Chinese house in his daily life.¹⁹⁴ He also made use of every opportunity to meet not only with Chinese Catholics, Buddhists, Taoists, and Confucians, but also with peasants, workers, coolies, and intellectuals. It was because of those years of experience that Richard finally came to behave like a mandarin, grow fluent in Chinese, and possess rich knowledge of local customs and culture.

We note here that adopting the local lifestyle was not a particularly special practice for Western missionaries. Whether for Catholic or Protestant, some changes in daily

¹⁹¹Zhang Li and Liu Jiantang, *A History of China's Religion Cases* (Chengdu: Sichuan Social Sciences Academy Press, 1987), pp. 7-16. 张力、刘鉴唐, 《中国教案史》, 成都: 四川社会科学院出版社, 1987年, 第7-16页。

¹⁹²S. A. Forsythe, *An American Missionary Community in China, 1895-1905* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard East Asian Monographs, 1971), pp.34-40.

¹⁹³Albert J. Garnier, *A Maker of Modern China* (London: The Carey Press, 1945), p.53.

¹⁹⁴Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.80.

lives could be completely accepted, even praised and encouraged. As early as from the late Ming Jesuits had adopted such changes for indigenous identification and successful missions. Ricci was even called a “Western Confucian,” wearing traditional Chinese clothes and speaking fluent Chinese language. However, rather than these superficial elements, e.g., clothing worn, the language spoken, the key of Christianization lay in the higher-level understandings of Chinese culture in, e.g., Confucianism, beliefs, customs, and local religions, as well as the points of convergence of Christianity with indigenous culture. This was the dominant issue not only in Christianization but also, to take a larger perspective in all multi-cultural encounters. How to treat these problems, how to deal with cultural diversity, and how to develop mission approaches, were just where the disputes occurred between liberals and Fundamentalists.

Disappointed with such an ineffective Fundamentalist approach, Richard repeatedly studied Irving’s sermon on modernized Christianity¹⁹⁵ and Saint Matthew’s Gospel about mission work.¹⁹⁶ He increasingly realized that only when the Bible’s principles were connected with Chinese culture could the fundamental principles of Christianity be made relevant and attractive to the Chinese.¹⁹⁷ As a matter of fact, Richard was just experiencing a similar hard situation in mission work to that Irving had encountered 45 years before in China when traditional Fundamentalist approaches to Chinese people won little success.¹⁹⁸ At that earlier time, Irving drew a lesson from his

¹⁹⁵Edward Irving, “Missionaries after the Apostolical school,” In *Collected Writings of Edward Irving*, ed. The Rev. G. Carlyle (London: Alexander Strahan and Co., 1864). pp.427-521.

¹⁹⁶BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 31 August 1899: *Fifteen Years Missionary Work in China*. This work was originally an address delivered by Richard in Exeter Hall, London, at the annual meeting of the Baptist Missionary Society, 30 April 1885. See W. E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China* (London: Seeley, Service 1924), ch.15 and 19.

¹⁹⁷Rev. B. Reeve, *Timothy Richard, D.D: China Missionary Statesman and Reformer* (London: S.W. Partridge & CO. Ltd., 1911), p.34.

¹⁹⁸W. E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China* (London: Seeley, Service 1924), pp.3-4.

failures that the native “worthy” was the most important element in mission work in hierarchic nations with a large population like China; only “a few of them are able to convert a million around.”¹⁹⁹ In Irving’s eyes, the “worthy” referred to those who, though maybe non-Christian, were nevertheless devotees to other religions or doctrines. They might be leaders of religious or nonreligious sects or groups, officials of various levels of authority, or intellectuals, for example. If Christians made these elites recognize that Christianity could satisfy their spiritual needs more than other non-Christian religions, including the ones they had believed in, it should be possible to convert them to Christianity, as the fact that the “worthy” had already been spiritually prepared for God in the West before Jesus’s era.

Richard fully trusted Irving’s viewpoints that it would be more effective to convert these individuals, the “worthy”, and then through them to influence more Chinese people for conversion.²⁰⁰ He therefore decided to abandon Fundamentalist methods and prepare to search for the “worthy”. In preparation for this, he studied literature pertaining to Chinese religions and philosophies, and visited local religious people instead of the mostly illiterate masses. He always wore Chinese clothing to reduce undue attention and to express his willingness to become a friend of Chinese people when visiting educated Chinese. With them he could discuss various religious and philosophical issues. In 1873, he even took a long trip to Jinan Fu, 300 miles away from Yantai. There, 12,000 students assembled to take the Civil Service examinations for the Juren degree, and 1000 candidates were waiting for the military examinations. He made

¹⁹⁹E. W. P. Evans, *Timothy Richard: A Narrative of Christian Enterprise and Statesmanship* (London: The Carey Press, 1945), p.27.

²⁰⁰Timothy Richard, “Relation of Christian missions to the Chinese government,” In *Records of the General Conference of the Protestant Missionaries of China Held at Shanghai, 7-20 May 1890* (Shanghai: American Presbyterian Mission Press, 1890). p.413. See also Timothy Richard, *The New Testament of Higher Buddhism* (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1910).

many friends there and got a feeling that, by circulating suitable Christian literature to these elites at all the centers throughout China, it was possible that “one man may preach to a million.”²⁰¹ This trip was his first try to adopt a *top-down* approach to the Chinese “worthy” in his life.

In 1873 Richard moved to Qingzhou Fu (Ch’ing-chou Fu 青州府), Shandong, and worked there till 1877. There were many secret sects (e.g., White Lotus, Heavenly Principles, etc.) whose members were dissatisfied with their native religions and were eagerly seeking something better; and there were also many Muslim mosques and Buddhist temples. Richard continued to visit Chinese political and cultural leaders, and participate in dialogues with Chinese religious people, even Catholics whom the Protestants saw as pagan. More importantly, Richard studied Church History of the Middle Ages, Catholic methods for the spread of Faith entitled *Instruction of the Jesuits*, and Matteo Ricci’s two-volume work, *Ten Dialogues of Religion*. Interestingly, he thought that Matteo Ricci and other Jesuit missionaries who worked in China in the 17th century held a similar liberal ideology to his own: to convert the upper classes so that the elites can influence the lower ones. It was for this purpose that Jesuits worked for the late Ming and early Qing Courts in order to be promoted to a better position for Christianization.²⁰² To gain more information, Richard paid attention to the records worldwide which showed attempts to Christianize elsewhere. Increasingly, he gained confidence to win over Chinese elites to Christianity so as to convert Chinese people.

In practice, Richard began his unusual mission work by taking advantage of catechisms which were used to provide Christian doctrines in the form of questions

²⁰¹Timothy Richard, “How One Man Can Preach to a Million,” *Chinese Recorder* 20, no. 11 (1889), p.498.

²⁰²BMS, Richard correspondence to Baynes, 17 December 1877.

followed by answers. He used them to communicate with various religious leaders and their disciples regarding Confucianism, Buddhism, Daoism, and Nestorian Christianity. In a few years Richard won his first victory: he trained tens of Chinese pastors, and attracted about 2000 Chinese people who expressed interests in converting to Christianity. Increasingly, he attracted several new colleagues of similar mind around him. One of them was Alfred Jones. Jones arrived in 1876, also a Baptist missionary who “shared Richard’s large, forward-looking schemes to the full, and brought to them great business ability and organizing power.”²⁰³

At that time, Fundamentalists were not lucky: they often encountered anti-foreigner riots in areas where biblical materials were distributed, and seldom did Chinese people show interest in Christianity, an apparent difference from Richard’s only one trip to Jinan Fu where many intellectuals showed positive responses. He was thus convinced of his previous considerations gained at Harverfordwest about the traditional missionary approach: it was so inefficient and ineffective that it should be reassessed and replaced by a new *top-down* approach to the “worthy” implemented by missionaries who respected Chinese culture and were knowledgeable in indigenous religions.

3.3 Resistance from Chinese Officials and Richard’s Responses

In 1877 there occurred a terrible year-long Famine in Shanxi, a neighbor province of Shandong. In autumn 1877, Richard was sent to Taiyuan Fu, the capital of Shanxi province, to run the first Baptist mission station for Famine relief. There, Richard

²⁰³W. S. Stewart, *Later Baptist Missionaries and Pioneers* (Judson Press, 1929), Vol. II, p.12.

singlehandedly began his mission work. Initially, he distributed money collected from Great Britain and from China to the suffering people, and at the same time spread the Gospels village to village and door to door.

Gradually Richard found that, although the Qing Empire did provide relief and medical work to victims, which in turn temporarily produced a seemingly harmonious atmosphere of good will between authorities and the people, the disaster exposed a national crisis in following aspects: (1) China's once-extensive public granary network had already collapsed; (2) Long-neglected roads had already prevented grain from reaching many devastated areas; (3) Government corruption at all levels had already siphoned off numerous relief supplies; more seriously, (4) What was mostly a man-made calamity was described as a purely natural one by most Confucianism-Buddhism-minded elites for whom the famine itself appeared to be a normal cyclical case in rural China. As such the Qing Court only ordered short-term rehabilitation measures (such as relocating refugees, improving water control, outlawing opium cultivation, etc.) rather than scheduling a long-run relief system.²⁰⁴

Based on these observations, Richard realized that for China the most important thing was not its military Westernization, but modernization in the “physical, mental, social, national, and international aspects plus saving the individual souls” of its people;²⁰⁵ and, for missionaries, they should concentrate work on educating Chinese elites and then the people, teaching them western culture, science, and technology: “If famine (relief) was Christian work, education to avoid future famine was equally, or

²⁰⁴Paul Richard Bohr, “The Legacy of Timothy Richard,” *International Bulletin of Missionary Research*, 24, no.2 (2000), pp.77-80.

²⁰⁵Timothy Richard, “Discussion,” in *Records of the General Conference of the Protestant Missionaries of China Held at Shanghai, May 7-20, 1890* (Shanghai: American Presbyterian Press, 1890), p.163.

greater Christian work.”²⁰⁶ The famine offered him a good chance to “sow good wheat—the bread of life” in China²⁰⁷ through a great labor and toil in China’s modernization under the mercy of God,²⁰⁸ as he explained in a note:²⁰⁹

I pointed out how God had provided infinite powers for man’s use in the forces of nature, in ignorance of which men lived like drudges and slaves. Many of the Government couriers, after riding with dispatches for long distances at the rate of two hundred miles a day, often died of fatigue, while the electric telegraph was able to transmit in a few minutes messages all around the earth, causing no exhaustion to anyone. The matter of supreme importance was that we should study all the laws of God in Nature, so as to gain the benefits that God intended to bestow upon us when He stored up all these forces for our use, and then show our gratitude for all His loving kindness by obeying His spiritual laws.

Bored of highly ineffective Fundamentalist methods in relief, Richard hoped to begin his new approach to Chinese elites, the “worthy” as instructed by Christ to the Apostles: “...into whatever city or town you enter, find out who in it is worthy; and stay there until you leave.”²¹⁰ In his eyes, these elites, either Chinese officials and/or intellectuals, were able to influence efficiently their numerous followers for conversion²¹¹ because

The worthy are those of all classes whose character has won the respect of their fellows, and who have shown themselves to be aware of and responsive to spiritual issues. Faithful to such light as they have had they are likely to be faithful to the further and fuller light which is brought to them, until finally they will rejoice in the light of the knowledge of the glory of God in the face of Jesus Christ.²¹²

²⁰⁶William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China* (London: Seeley, Service, 1926), p.106.

²⁰⁷Timothy Richard, *Conversion by the Million in China* (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907), Vol.1, p.151.

²⁰⁸*Ibid.*, p.123

²⁰⁹*Ibid.*, p.151.

²¹⁰Matt. 10:11.

²¹¹H. R. Williamson, *British Baptists in China, 1845-1952* (London: Carey Kingsgate Press, 1957), pp.40-41.

²¹²BMS, “Ch4, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 31 August 1899: Fifteen Years Missionary Work in China”, p.28. This work was originally an address delivered by Richard in Exeter Hall, London, at the annual meeting of the Baptist Missionary Society, 30 April 1885.

However, Richard faced unforeseen resistance from most junior and middle-level Chinese officials. The situation in practice was not promising. In the long Chinese history, barbarian invasions had always been transitory, with failure eventually. Before 1900, the closed-minded late Qing Court held that the repeated defeats in wars with the West, though unfortunate, would be passing by, as usually happened in the long Chinese history; and that China could become modernized soon in the military field so as to be more powerful in ships and guns for winning future wars. This was why the Self-Strengthening Movement aimed at absorbing and developing advanced Western technology.²¹³ Even though the catastrophic famine damaged the economy severely, most of the Court members, except the reform-minded Emperor and his few supporters, paid little attention to programs designed to avoid future famines by not only improving the spiritual and material welfare of Chinese people, but also enhancing the competence of China in all the fields by taking advantage of Westernization.

In his contact with Chinese officials in the Famine relief, Richard found these people had several weaknesses: First, they feared a potential loss of their power and prestige if foreigners joined the relief; second, they lacked practical knowledge on how to organize relief efforts; finally, they neglected or were unaware of the fact that missionaries had already accumulated rich relief experience and efficient management skills in similar activities worldwide, especially in poor, regions like India and some rural counties in China.

²¹³I. C.Y. Hsü, *The Rise of Modern China*, 4th ed. (New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), pp.447-448.

In fact, when Richard arrived at Taiyuan Fu, he learned that the governor of Shanxi, Zeng Guoquan (Tseng Kuo-ch'üan 曾国荃, 1824-1890),²¹⁴ was very angry about his presence. Traditionally, rebellions had always occurred during times of famine in China. They were an expression of local people's discontent towards authorities. The Governor was convinced that foreigners were possibly going to steal the loyalty of the suffering people away from his government and aggravate riots. At the same time, Zeng understood that there were tensions between Catholics and Protestants. He therefore arranged Richard to work with the Catholic missionaries who had entered Shanxi earlier. In this way, he hoped to make use of the discord between the two parties to neutralize each group's influence on the Chinese people.

In spite of such efforts, all the Christian missionaries collaborated with one another during the famine relief. While actively joining in the relief activities, Richard had countless specific conversations whenever possible with various officials and famine victims in the 108 counties of Shandong and Shanxi provinces, concerning of the approaches to relief of Western Christianity and Chinese indigenous religions as well as the doctrines of each.²¹⁵ After these investigations, he realized that many of the sufferings of the Chinese, much like the famine itself, could actually be avoided if China was able to develop an understanding of the laws of God, including knowing how to predict natural forces scientifically to avoid catastrophic events, how to take advantage of Western civilization to deal with disasters with the help of effective management and advanced technology, as well as how to deliver the mercy of God to the suffering people

²¹⁴Younger brother of Zeng Guofan (Tseng Kuo-fan 曾国藩 1811-1872), one of the four famous Viceroy in the late Qing China: Li Hongzhang, Zhang Zhidong, Zeng Guofan, and Zuo Zongtang (Tso Tsung-t'ang 左宗棠 1812-1885).

²¹⁵W. E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), pp.126-139.

and guide them to face and overcome formidable present and future difficulties. Because the source of these knowledge and experience was based on a Western educational system, Richard firmly believed that the most important thing was to open the eyes of high-level Chinese elites, even those of the Emperor, and to establish an educational system that would provide the fruits of civilization, which would eventually lead to peaceful and happy lives.²¹⁶

In order to enlighten Chinese elites, Richard treated them differently according to their respective backgrounds. He had two goals for political leaders who were deeply influenced by Confucianism. The first was to gain their good will to the Gospel; the second was to convert them to Christianity and to count on them to wield their influence on Chinese communities. Richard also believed that through regular communication the seeds of Christianity could grow in the fertile soil of all religions. Another special group of people Richard singled out was the *Literati* (scholars), who were attending Civil Service examinations²¹⁷ regularly, e.g., at Taiyuan Fu, where 7000 candidates triennially participated in the Juren (Chu-jen 举人; M.A.) examinations. Out of these people, future intellectuals and officials were chosen. Thus, this group was poised to play a part in the fate of China. Aware of this, Richard prepared Christian materials for them to read. In a speech at a Conference of Missionaries later in 1901, Richard addressed the importance of cultivating these elites:

They too are the ministers of God, and if possible, make your services indispensable to them. There are also other ministers of God, viz., the devout leaders. Convey God's message first to them, for our Lord had ordained that they should be first to receive the glad tidings and be

²¹⁶*Ibid.*, p.151.

²¹⁷The traditional system and the only means of recruiting government officials. These examinations were held at stated intervals and lead to degrees. The system was the agent by which Confucianism monopolized scholarship, and by which the scholarship, in turn, monopolized politics.

privileged to be the first heralds of this new gospel to their fellows in their respective countries. By gaining them you gain all the force of their high moral character and, through gaining them, you practically gain all their followers. Let the privilege of being God's messengers of peace to their followers be theirs. Let them do all they can and reserve all your strength to do what they cannot possibly do at first, viz., guide and inspire the movement.²¹⁸

In the late stage of the Famine relief, along with routine work of material distribution, door-to-door gospel preaching, and contact with Chinese people,²¹⁹ Richard compiled instructions in Chinese to teach how to avoid destructive events and help ease and even avoid the sufferings. He appealed "to the Confucianists who ruled the country, to the Buddhists who filled the Empire with the best temples, to the Taoists²²⁰ who had been half awakened from superstitions, charms, and spells by the spiritual teaching of Lu Dongbin, to the Mohammedans, and to all the secret sects which had followers."²²¹ In addition, due to the lack of enough Protestant theological texts in Chinese at that time, Richard edited relevant materials by making use of religious concepts, ideas and terminology that he had learned from Roman Catholic literature, Greek Church books, and other Christian books, all in Chinese, which he was able to find in China.²²² In order to attract Chinese readers, Richard and his colleagues offered prizes for the best comments sent back from readers on specific religious and moral topics. He also published a series of articles to publicize his considerations and ideas about Western

²¹⁸Timothy Richard, "How a Few Men May Make a Million Converts," *Chinese Recorder* 31, no. 6 (1901), p.276.

²¹⁹*Ibid.*, p.149.

²²⁰*The Way*; older then, but the basis of Taoism. Early Taoist scholars taught that the Tao is the governing principle in the universe that the way of the universe in inaction, that the Tao cannot be fully known, but that it is against human striving for high character and for ordered society.

²²¹Timothy Richard, "How a Few Men May Make a Million Converts," *Chinese Recorder* 31, no. 6 (1901), p.276.

²²²Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), pp.144-145.

civilization and China's modernization in *Wan Guo Gong Bao*²²³ (Wan Kwoh Kung Pao 万国公报; Review of the Times), a monthly magazine run from 1874 by the S.D.K. Its aim was to introduce Western knowledge to Chinese elites. In 1881 Richard reissued this series of articles in a pamphlet entitled *Present Needs* in which he suggested for the first time his reform's design:²²⁴

- (1) Employ meteorology to forecast famine conditions;
- (2) Expand agriculture by improving water conservancy, teaching agronomy, applying chemical fertilizer, cultivating hardier crops, and developing food processing methods;
- (3) Expand industrial wealth through mechanization, mining, and hydroelectric power;
- (4) Expand commerce by stabilizing China's currency, standardizing weights and measures, and promoting entrepreneurial careers in science and industry;
- (5) Open China to international trade and investment by modernizing transportation and communications;
- (6) Nurture practical knowledge and innovation by expanding universal education in Western subjects, inserting science and technology into the civil service examinations, setting up learned societies to promote research, and disseminating new knowledge through newspapers; and
- (7) Promote universal religious education so that Christian love could enrich Confucian morality and thereby make the people loyal to the Qing emperor and respectful of the Christian God.²²⁵

Richard's prescription for China's illness was supported by a few liberal missionaries like Young J. Allen, William Muirhead, and Ernst Faber.²²⁶ These reform-minded Westerners spared no pains to contribute to Richard's extraordinary work and

²²³A monthly edited by Young J. Allen and Ts'ai Erh-kang, the Chinese associate of Timothy Richard. It was in essence a Reform magazine. The Mikado of Japan was a subscriber to the Review.

²²⁴Paul. Richard Bohr, "The Legacy of Timothy Richard," *International Bulletin of Missionary Research* 24, no.2 (2000), pp.77-80.

²²⁵Regarding this last proposal, Richard wrote a year later: "in order to achieve wealth and strength there are two most important matters: first is to achieve wide knowledge and skillful techniques and to make the best of human efforts. All this is actually secondary, however. The other is to complete one's morality by worshipping God and by following God's will--this is the fundamental matter" (Wan Guo Gong Bao, 28 January 1882, p.217).

²²⁶Wang Lixin, *American Missionaries and the Modernization of China in the Late Qing* (Tianjin: Tianjin People Press, 1997), p.197. 王立新, 《美国传教士和晚清中国现代化》, 天津: 天津人民出版社, 1997年, 第197页。

hoped to see China's development through Westernization.²²⁷ For example, after reading Richard's collection of Xinxue Huibian (Hsin-hsüeh Hui-pien 新学汇编; Essays on Reform), Allen helped Richard publish Shishi Xinlun (Shih-shih Hsin-lun 时事新论; New Views on Current Affairs).

After the Famine, Richard's Protestant liberal ideology evolved to a new stage. From his perspective, the ultimate fate of China and Chinese people rested upon Chinese elites, and it was crucial for them to accept, at least tolerate, the expansion of Christianity and the introduction of advanced Western culture into China.²²⁸ Only through them, was China able to prevent or deal with future famines by relying on scientific knowledge and modern technology; were more Chinese people to be influenced to engender peaceful relations with foreigners, especially missionaries; and, more importantly, were necessary reforms to be initiated to lead the most populous country in the world to develop a healthy trade and international diplomacy with the West on equitable Treaties in future. Particularly, for Western modernity developed from the advance in science and technology, Richard used it as a secret tool in evangelization. In his various writings, Richard often implied that Chinese traditional culture was contrary to Western modernity and thus sooner or later should be replaced by Christian culture. Thus, it was crucial to promote science and technology in China.

This enhancement did not deviate away from the Christianity, but, on the contrary, pushed forward the spread of Gospels due to two consequences: (1) the development would improve the livelihood of indigenous people, in accordance with the theme of Christian charity; (2) it would win a good impression of Western modernity among the

²²⁷*Ibid.*, p.210.

²²⁸BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 31 May 1884. Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), pp.223-224.

people through the convenience provided by science and technology, leading them to decrease, even eliminate, rejections to Christianity and then accept it as a more powerful culture to grow and spread in China. This design was certainly beneficial for missionaries to establish a healthy environment for mission work. No matter whatever he was engaged in, Richard never deviated from reaching towards his goal of Christianization featured by expansion and modernity, the essence of *Liberal theology*. Certainly, to avoid repulsion or objections to his mission practice, Richard did not talk too much on Christianity; instead, he stressed more on China's self-strengthening, reforms, and modernizations which had a close relationship with Chinese politics and economy. In fact, he advocated India, one of the British colonies, as China's model in Anglo-American colonization.

Consequently, Richard expected to spearhead a united effort within China and in the outside world for his purpose. In China, he wrote to officials to ask for interviews and submitted articles for publication to publicize his ideas of introducing Western civilization via some cultural and educational renovations. As the first step, he hoped to establish a reading room or a library staffed by an educated missionary. There, scholars could come to read, discuss, and discover the newest information and inventions from the West. The idea was elaborated in 1882 to run a college, staffed by several missionaries, to educate selected students. Before long, Richard did cultivate and win some good will from some Confucian leaders to his endeavor and to the entire mission work, even to Christianity.²²⁹ For example, Zhang Zhidong (Chang Chih-tung 张之洞, 1837-1909), the governor of Shanxi Province, was attracted by Richard's ideas and offered him a position for promoting cultural renovation. However, Richard refused the

²²⁹Timothy Richard, "Wanted: Good Samaritans for China," *The Chinese Times*, no.14 (1888), p.238.

offer. In 1884, he requested his Shanxi missionary colleagues and the London BMS headquarters for intellectual and financial support to build a Western-style university in Shanxi as a model for all the other provinces of China. Expecting passionately to receive positive feedbacks on his liberal effort and to solicit enough financial and faculty support from his home BMS Committee in London, Richard left China and returned to Europe for his first furlough at the beginning of 1885.²³⁰

3.4 Resistance from Fundamentalists & BMS and Richard's Responses

Richard's divergent, unorthodox liberal ideology in mission work drew criticism from Fundamentalists, not only from his CIM and BMS colleagues in China but also those from Europe.

His Fundamentalist colleagues in China considered that he contributed so excessively to the Famine relief that his mission work became beyond the scope of Christianization. His work should be banned because he “taught a mixture of science, popery, and heathenism for the Gospel of Christ,” along with practices contrary to Protestant Christianity including those to border on heresy, especially his sympathetic reading of Chinese literature, Catholic theological writings, and Buddhist scriptures, to make friends actively with all kinds of religious people and Chinese literati, to thoughtfully investigate these non-Christian religions and philosophies, and to discern the “good” or “worthy” among Chinese elites.²³¹ Many arguments were aroused against

²³⁰BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 31 October 1885.

²³¹William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China* (London: Seeley, Service, 1926), p.156.

Richard. For instance, Fundamentalists considered that there was a distinction between the *Secular* and the *Sacred* worlds. One representative of this school of thought was Hudson Taylor, the founder of CIM.²³² By his death, the CIM had established 205 mission stations with more than 800 missionaries in total, and had converted 125,000 Chinese to Christians, most of whom were uneducated. However, Richard considered that such a distinction of *Secular-Sacred* worlds was against scripture and was a heresy.²³³ Besides, while the others emphasized that faith was the sole requisite for salvation, Richard argued that based on natural theology, the Kingdom of God on the Earth was inseparable from progress in every sphere of life. He insisted that, in addition to faith, the ethical act of doing *good*, i.e., devotion to the advancement of the world, was also paramount for salvation,²³⁴ due to the fact that “the kingdom of God to him embraced the whole life, now and thereafter, especially now, and there was as nothing without its pale, Christian energies should leave no branch of life or thought untouched.”²³⁵

In Richard’s eyes these Fundamentalists were both narrow-sighted and near-sighted. Richard had never abandoned Christian culture in spite of his appreciation of Chinese culture. As he underscored in *Present Needs*, he considered that the work of God in Nature had produced Western culture which had made the West civilized by building the wealth and strength in Western countries; as the gift granted by God, Western culture should be expanded across the world through Christianization. In fact, what he was

²³² A. J. Broomhall, *Hudson Taylor and China’s Open Century* (7 volumes; London, O M F Books, 1981).

²³³ Timothy Richard, “Speech on Christian Literature,” In *Report of the Ecumenical Conference on Foreign Missions* (held in Carnegie Hall and Neighboring Churches, April 21 to May 1, 1900; New York: American Tract Society, 1900).

²³⁴ Wang Lixin, *American Missionaries and the Modernization of China in the late Qing* (Tianjin, Tianjin People Press, 1997), pp.40-45. 王立新, 《美国传教士和晚清中国现代化》, 天津: 天津人民出版社, 1997年, 第40-45页。

²³⁵ T.R.Glover, “A Man of Personality,” *North China Daily News*, 26 April 1919.

doing was, on one hand, broadening Christianity by adding the new ingredient, the modernity of Western civilization, especially the advance of science and technology, so as to attract Chinese elites and the people to accept God more easily; on the other hand, guiding China towards modernization by establishing suitable national political, cultural, and educational environment for permanently Christianizing China in all fields.²³⁶

Wishing to get support from his home colleagues, Richard made use of his first furlough in 1885 to present a detailed version of his proposal to the Sub-Committee of the BMS, London.²³⁷ He wished that all the missionary societies in Great Britain could cooperate to run high-class missionary institutions in each of the provincial capitals of China. These institutions should not be inferior to the University Colleges in Britain, in order to justify and strengthen the West's cultural power which could then be used for the conversion of Chinese elites. He also stressed the importance of providing highly qualified missionaries (HQMs), preferably and predominantly highly educated men and women, to train Chinese evangelists through Christian curricula which should emphasize God's enlightenment in natural sciences and advanced technologies, in addition to Gospels.²³⁸ Unfortunately, Richard's project was rejected by the Sub-Committee. The reply mentioned the shortage of funds, along with a comment that "youth would often plant trees that would grow to the sky but Heaven takes care that

²³⁶BMS, Richard Correspondence: to BMS Committee, 12 May 1887.

²³⁷Timothy Richard, *A Scheme for Mission Work in China* (London, Baptist Missionary Society, 1885); BMS, Richard Correspondence: to "Brother and Sister," 26 February 1886.

²³⁸Timothy Richard, *Outline--How to Get a Higher Class of Missionaries for China* (handwritten, BMS, June 1885); Timothy Richard, *A Scheme for Mission Work in China* (London, Baptist Missionary Society, 1885), pp.4-5.

they don't!"²³⁹ However, the Sub-Committee did agree to send six HQMs to China for the work "in the most effect manner possible."²⁴⁰

Richard reemphasized the importance of the plan, but to no avail. With a final attempt, he resubmitted the proposal to the BMS Committee for a positive result before its May meeting; meanwhile, he sent copies of the paper to other missionary Committees.²⁴¹ Providing the same rationale as the Sub-Committee, the BMS China Committee insisted that the project was beyond its financial ability and therefore turned it down.²⁴² Richard was bitterly disappointed by what he regarded as the "short-sightedness" of his BMS leaders and "began to realize that God would have me bear my cross alone, and that I must fit myself more fully for influencing the leaders of China."

Honestly speaking, Richard's plan was too far away from reality: he suggested to establish 19 institutions in all 19 provinces in China, spending approximately one million taels²⁴³ (approximately \$730,000 or \$56,000) for each institution. In all fairness to the BMS, this amount was in fact beyond their financial capacities. However, Richard was not asking BMS to finance the project, but coordinate a united effort of all British mission societies active in China. He believed that some British philanthropists would endow the institutions, and to some stage Chinese government would take over the budget. Actually, many points of this plan became the germinal concepts that came to fruition later in the founding of the Imperial University of Shansi in 1901. As a note

²³⁹K. S. Latourette, *A History of Christian Missions in China* (New York: Russell & Russell, 1967). p.22, p.386.

²⁴⁰BMS, Richard Correspondence: to "Brother and Sister," 26 February 1886.

²⁴¹Timothy Richard, *Wanted: Good Samaritans for China* (London: Baptist Missionary Society, 1885).

²⁴²BMS, Mary Richard Correspondence: to Mary Jane, 15 May 1886.

²⁴³Tael (两)—units of Chinese money. One tael was of 0.742 Gold Dollar and 3.000 Pound Sterling Shilling; 1,000 taels = £150.

here, we mention that in the Committee, there were in fact some members who were in favor of Richard's plan. As Richard recalled,

On its first consideration by the B.M.S. China Committee it was decided that they could not recommend the scheme, as their funds would not allow them to embark on so expensive a project. But the unexpected advocacy of a generous member of the General Committee secured for my proposals the respite of delay and reconsideration at a later meeting. I found a number of who were in full sympathy with it, on the ground that my Mission policy was practically on the same lines as Carey's.²⁴⁴

Richard also visited churches and religious organizations in England to explain the importance of the role of modernization in the process of Christianization and the necessity to spread the Western civilization to the Chinese people. He attended meetings held at, e.g., the BMS General Conference, the Religious Tract Society (a united mission meeting of Baptists and Congregationalists), as well as at churches in Watford, Hastings, Cardiff, and Edinburgh, just to name just a few. In a few months, Richard managed to spark much interest about his work, particularly his educational reform project. He received significant financial commitments. One gentleman was willing to give £1,000 while the other promised a donation of £20,000.²⁴⁵ While encouraged somewhat by the responses from individuals, he felt the financial aid was far less than what was needed.

When Richard was in Europe, natural theology²⁴⁶ prevailed in missionary institutions where the most advanced experimental instruments and installations had been set up for education.²⁴⁷ For the purpose of enriching his knowledge in science & technology and preparing himself to be better able to educate the Chinese elites, Richard

²⁴⁴Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.198.

²⁴⁵BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Brother, 11 March 1886.

²⁴⁶W. Paley, *Natural theology* (New York: American Tract Society, 1881). Natural theology is a branch of philosophy and theology which attempts to either prove God's existence, define God's attributions, or derive correct doctrine based solely from human reasons and/or observations of the natural world.

²⁴⁷BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Brother, 19 November 1885.

attended an Electrical Engineering course at South Kensington. In addition, in order to learn more about what an educational system would be suited the best for China, Richard went to Berlin and Paris in June 1886. In Berlin the Vice-President of the Ministry of Education, a Christian, introduced him to the development of the educational system in Europe; in Paris he learned that the name of God was to be removed from modern textbooks.²⁴⁸

The trip made Richard gain a deeper understanding of Christianization:²⁴⁹ one point was that missionaries should understand, absorb, reconstruct, and unify indigenous cultures in Christianization, rather than discriminate, destruct, reject and supersede them; another one was that missionaries should not neglect God's wonderful gifts to human beings embodied in the modernity of Western civilization as exposed by advanced science and technology, instead, they should incorporate such modernity in their work to shed God's light to every corner of the world. In short, the theme of Christianization contained two fundamental liberal tenets: cultural expansion and modernity incorporation. This ideology was in fact an enhanced version of Edward Irving's idea on mission work, as elaborated in his 1824 sermon.²⁵⁰

The former aspect reflected the essence of Christianization, the Universalism of Christianity. God was the eternal Creator ever revealing Himself in Nature "to rule over matter and energy, mind and character, and, to help men to right wrongs, to ameliorate

²⁴⁸In his autobiography, Richard did not reveal what specific information this vice-president offered him.

²⁴⁹Wang Lixin, *American Missionaries and the Modernization of China in the late Qing* (Tianjin: Tianjin People Press, 1997), pp.197-198. 王立新, 《美国传教士和晚清中国现代化》, 天津: 天津人民出版社, 1997年, 第197-198页。

²⁵⁰Edward Irving, "Missionaries after the Apostolical School," In *Collected Writings of Edward Irving*, ed. The Rev. G. Carlyle (London, Alexander Strahan and Co., 1864), pp. 427-521.

human sufferings and to bring peace and joy into the world”²⁵¹. Thus, God should be gloried in (1) the sacredness of all human beings; (2) the equality of all classes and races, as brethren of the same household; (3) the benefit of all the helpless—old, young, and sick; and (4) the equality of all women with men, in addition to that “Christian energies should leave no branch of life or thought untouched,” and that the expansion of Western culture should embrace “the whole of life, now and hereafter, especially now, and as there was nothing without its pale.”²⁵² Richard took it for granted that all missionaries should keep in mind that the Gospel conferred benefits to all human beings who followed *heaven’s words*, owing to the fact that all the beings were God’s adopted sons, destined to live forever.²⁵³

For the latter aspect, Richard understood that the achievements in science and technology in this world exhibited nothing but God’s infinite mercy for human beings. Richard confessed that the modernity of Western civilization was related to God’s laws of Nature which were applicable to all countries on the Earth, and not limited to Western nations only.²⁵⁴ As a result, Richard affirmed that learning natural sciences (e.g., astronomy, physics, chemistry, etc.) in China was the best way to remove superstition (*fengshui* 风水) from indigenous culture, because “the study of science ought to be held in as much reverence as religion, for it deals with the laws of God.”²⁵⁵

By September 1886, Richard left Europe and returned to China. The home BMS refused his proposal but sent a group of six Baptist missionaries on his request to Shanxi,

²⁵¹Timothy Richard, “God’s Various Methods of Blessing Mankind,” *Chinese Recorder* 25, no. 6 (1894), p.275.

²⁵²T. R. Glover, “Man of Personality,” *North China Daily News*, 26 April 1919.

²⁵³Timothy Richard, “The Spiritual Benefits of Christianity,” *Chinese Recorder* 22, no. 4 (1891), p.176.

²⁵⁴Timothy Richard, “God’s Various Methods of Blessing Mankind,” *Chinese Recorder* 25, no. 6 (1894), p.282.

²⁵⁵Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.123.

a province with approximately a combined size of England and Wales and a population of 9.6~17.2 million.²⁵⁶ Though without the BMS's support, Richard remained undaunted and determined to launch a solitary crusade of his own for enlightening the Chinese elites, the key for the Conversion of the Million.²⁵⁷ He worried that Fundamentalists might miss propitious opportunities to expand Christianity, and believed that he was doing the same thing as His Divine Master, as well as his favorite apostle Saint Paul to seek the *worthy*.²⁵⁸ Clearly, in Richard's eyes, God not only loved the West but also loved all the nations on the Earth: through the guidance of the *worthy*, all the people had the privilege to enjoy the mercy of God. No matter where people were located on the Earth, what religions they believed in, they were merely respective lambs of God in different parts of the world.²⁵⁹ Therefore, a new world religion dominated by Christianity should be constructed by assimilating others like Confucianism, Buddhism, Daoism, and even Islam, in the Kingdom of God, not adhering only to the Old Testament and the dogmatic theology.²⁶⁰ Here we affirm the concept of equality in Christianity. This merit was in stark contrast with guarded hierarchy in China. What Richard stressed here was the racial equality, i.e., that the West and the East were equal in front of God and both of them should share the love from God, either spiritually or secularly.

²⁵⁶BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Committee, 4 March 1887; see also Timothy Richard, Arthur Sowerby, and J.J. Turner, "Statement of Facts being the Report of the Subcommittee on the Province of Shansi," handwritten, BMS, February 1887.

²⁵⁷Timothy Richard, *Conversion by the Million in China* (Shanghai, Christian Literature Society, 1907), p.149.

²⁵⁸Timothy Richard, "Conversion by the Million," *Chinese Recorder* 33, no.10 (1907), p. 542.

²⁵⁹Samuel M. Jackson, *The New Schaff-Herzog Encyclopedia of Religious knowledge* (Michigan: Grand Rapids, 1907-14), Vol. X, pp.27-28.

²⁶⁰E. Morgan, *Timothy Richard and the Christian Literature Society* (in Richard MSS., National Library, Aberystwyth, n.d.).

At the same time, while emphasizing Christian Universalism, Richard insisted on the West-centrism due to the West's embrace of Christianity prior to that of the East, and inevitably the West should become the East's model; and, due to the giant population in the hierarchical China, the conversion of "the Worthy" should be the most significant in mission work for the whole nation's Christianization.

Before his returning to China in 1886, Richard found that the London BMS Committee appeared to side against him. Richard pled to the BMS that "those who...even take away my missionary life....show...a very distorted and highly-colored misrepresentation, produced by an imperfect theology that magnifies unenlightened conscience over charity, and even over common justice."²⁶¹ In addition, he expressed his basic recognition of what God revealed to him²⁶²:

We must let each other alone, for Christ has many members in one body and has distributed different gifts to different members. This has always been my principle with every colleague I have had. Let all bear in mind that the holy men of old who did succeed in mission work were also men of God and were led by His Spirit of God that we learn their ways before we try new experiments ourselves.

Besides, he expounded his Protestant liberal perspective and insistence on his novel mission approach:

Our Lord's great standard is "By their fruits ye shall know them." We vary in degrees of light and knowledge as well as in other gifts. If, therefore, we have not attained to that height of knowledge, charity, and Christian perfection where we can recognize Christ's Spirit in ALL its various manifestations, then, instead of interfering with each other's works, should we not rather humbly and quietly choose our respective plots of ground in the Lord's vineyard and work there diligently, so that our brethren and the world in due time, seeing our good works may glorify Our Father?...I want no license but freedom from unnecessary control and in striving to get this I am striving for the greatest efficiency of the whole mission and for every colleague—not for self.²⁶³

²⁶¹BMS, Richard Correspondence, 23 Oct. 1888.

²⁶²BMS, Richard Correspondence, 25 Jan. 1888.

²⁶³BMS, Richard Correspondence, 30 Oct. 1888.

After his return, the opposition against Richard became open, even at the Taiyuan Fu station that he had founded and worked for many years since 1877. Missionaries there were mostly from CIM and BMS, including the six BMS reinforcements to Richard. In view of Richard's identification as the founder and the most senior missionary there, and perhaps also the oldest and the best educated, these people did not feel at liberty to chastise Richard. Unbeknownst to Richard, however, some of them actively wrote letters to the BMS to criticize Richard's lack of orthodoxy in Christianization at the time when Richard left China to visit Europe. When Richard and those in sympathy with his ideology and approach likely attempted to continue the missionary work in the liberal vein as before, they found themselves in the minority. One letter appeared in the August 1886 issue of BMS's publication, *Missionary Herald*, which came out while Richard was returning to China. Because the criticism had been leveled before publication but without any discussions with him, Richard was irked by the accusations against him from his own station's colleagues.

One such disagreement pertained to the catechism, *Order of Study in Our Religion*, written by Richard. In the text, Richard listed six levels of missionary affiliation, and emphasized the quality of missionaries in addition to their zeal in Christianization. He proposed that, in order to spread the Gospels effectively in China, only those who achieved the fourth of the six levels could be sent to China as a church minister or beyond. At this level, missionaries should have studied European philosophy, geography, geology, physics, chemistry, mathematics, astronomy, Western medicine, Western

history, music for worship, and Chinese culture, before they graduated.²⁶⁴ In practice, these criteria were too demanding for fundamentalists. Though well conversant with religious texts, most of these missionaries were evangelists, church workers, or religious leaders, and were not highly educated and little aware of science and technology before coming to China. Richard's expectations created serious resentment, even from Hudson Taylor. A bitter dispute erupted between Richard and Taylor. This resulted in further opposition among most missionaries towards Richard. It was difficult for him to make any progress in his mission work, even to attend the meetings of a local Missionary Committee of which he was the secretary.²⁶⁵

This situation prompted Richard to spend much of his time in autumn 1887 to communicate with both the British Baptist Mission, the publisher of the accusation letter, and his home BMS in London, in order to defend himself against the accusations and to seek a resolution to this ideological dispute.²⁶⁶ He explained that his liberal approach met with the approval of many European Christians and church ministers; and, his top-down approach to Chinese people was effective and efficient in his practice. He asserted that most missionaries in China adopted an out-of-date method of evangelization, as demonstrated by the book on a devout early Christian Roman Catholic, *Fabiola*.²⁶⁷ At this point, Richard knew that he and his colleagues in Shanxi “could never work harmoniously together; and to remain would induce permanent strife,

²⁶⁴Timothy Richard, *Translation of Order of Study in Our Religion* (handwritten, BMS, 1887). On a close inspection, this document appears to be the embryonic form of the study program that Richard had hoped to initiate in the college of Western learning he proposed to BMS for the educational scheme.

²⁶⁵Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), pp.155-158.

²⁶⁶BMS, Richard Correspondence: to BMS Committee, 12 May 1887.

²⁶⁷Cardinal Wiseman, *Fabiola; Or, The Church of the Catacombs* (New York, Cincinnati, and St. Louis: Benziger Brothers), 1886, pp.1-574. Timothy Richard, 古圣徒殉难记 (Ku-sheng-t'u Hsün-nan Chi), (上海 Shanghai: 广学会 S.D.K.), 1903, 1-310.

which would be fatal to missionary work.”²⁶⁸ He felt it was necessary to leave Shanxi in order to avoid more conflicts.

In a letter to the BMS Committee for a solution, Richard expressed his willingness to become an independent BMS missionary dedicated to English-Chinese translations, just as a former missionary, Dr. Edkins, who was living in Beijing at that time. Only in this way did he imagine himself able to continue his innovative mission work. To avoid the worst case scenario that the BMS would refuse him and did not provide him the financial support anymore, Richard accepted a job offer in November 1887 to become a translator, with a salary of £600 a year, at an Arsenal, a Chinese military school and also at a translation bureau in the coastal city, Tianjin. At the same time, he wished that the BMS would be able to understand his hard situation and continue to support his mission work.²⁶⁹ We note here that the Shanxi missionary community did not stop attacking Richard’s theological and methodological stance. The objection lasted until three years later when Richard was appointed to the position of the General Secretary of the Society for the Diffusion of Christian and General Knowledge (SDK; Guangxue hui 广学会) in Shanghai, just after his one-year editorship in *Shibao*.²⁷⁰ Nevertheless, though embroiled in the controversy in those years, Richard never lost sight of his personal mission of seeking out the *worthy* for Christianization through introducing Western science and technology to China.

At the later 25th anniversary meeting of the foundation of the first Anglo-Chinese College (Shanghai, 1910), Richard reviewed these three rudiments developed before he

²⁶⁸Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.205.

²⁶⁹Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.206.

²⁷⁰*Ibid.*, pp.172-176.

became an editor of *Shibao*. He hoped to inspire rulers with Christian ideals, permeate national institutions with the Christian spirit, and leave the masses with Christian principles.²⁷¹ In his view, the advance to these goals could naturally inaugurate “...thoughts which would eventually lead very many to think of Christ as the Savior of their own souls as well as of the world at large, and then reach the final goal of Jesus Christ Conquers All.”²⁷² Vigorously, he expected to see benefits to:

countless individuals and a mighty nation like China individually and nationally, and later universally for eternity as well as for time, when railways, steamers, telegraphs, roads, etc., are introduced and made for a whole nation. This is because an immense conversion towards the material welfare of men...when modern education is adopted throughout any land...turning millions from the darkness of ignorance and superstition to the light of knowledge,...when better laws, national and international, are adopted by one nation or many nations as a conversion of incalculable good for bringing peace and goodwill to untold numbers,...when a nation encourages the study of religion in order to find out what is highest and best, then we feel as if the Kingdom of God were at hand,...when God’s will shall be done on earth as it is in heaven.²⁷³

Clearly, though encountering extreme difficulties created mainly by his fundamentalist missionary colleagues, Richard had never given up his endeavor to apply his innovative methods into practice.

3.5 Positive Responses from Chinese People

In his mission work to deliver scientific and technological lectures to Chinese officials in Taiyuan Fu, Richard always indicated unequivocally his view that God

²⁷¹ B. Reeve, *Timothy Richard, D.D., China missionary, Statesman, and Reformer* (London: S.W. Partridge & Co., Ltd., 1910), p.160.

²⁷² BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Byenes, 4 September 1887.

²⁷³ Timothy Richard, *Conversion by the Million in China* (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907), p.542.

manifested himself to mankind through the laws of Nature. He stressed to his audience that there was a natural and universal testimony to the Deity's presence in the sea and the stars. He told Chinese elites that God intended to bestow upon the world the best, and to provide all levels of people "with infinite powers for man's use in the forces of Nature, in ignorance of which men lived like drudges and slaves."²⁷⁴ Hence, it was mandatory for missionaries to spread the modernity of Western civilization everywhere on the Earth for improving all beings' material, intellectual, social, national, and international lives in the Kingdom of God. In this Kingdom, the salvation of the body from sufferings was also the will of God, the same importance as that of the soul; and, in order to reach this salvation, missionaries should be responsible to disseminate science and technology in evangelization, an integrated part of God's laws stored up for use, in addition to the biblical gospel. In this way, Richard unified modernity and religion perfectly to eliminate the tension Fundamentalism created between them. This unification under liberal theology made him more easily than his colleagues to approach to Chinese people. He generalized three principles in Christianization:

(1) In addition to the scriptures, missionaries in the process of Christianization should also assimilate all other indigenous cultures, since these were also the ingredients of God's revelation in this world;

(2) In addition to spreading word of God's mercy in the spiritual world of human beings, missionaries should also bring the fruits of Western civilization in the physical world, God's precious gift which belonged to the whole mankind though developed first in the West through the advance in science and technology; and,

²⁷⁴Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.163.

(3) In addition to the basic evangelical approach to individuals, missionaries should pay more attention to the enlightenment of the whole nation which was to be led by the *worthy*—i.e., the elites—within the society, whose conversion would influence and drive the salvation of China.

Luckily, China at that time seemed most receptive to foreign advice on national reform for a successful Self-Strengthening Movement. The advocates of the Movement always tried to graft Western technology onto Confucian-Buddhist institutions. For example, reform-minded treaty-port scholars, Wang Tao (Wang T'ao 王韜, 1828-1897) and Zheng Guanying (Cheng Kuan-ying 郑观应, 1842-1921), championed the idea to build Westernized public schools for boys and girls, to improve people's livelihood, and, even to free China from absolutism. Zheng became a writer-modernizer and the author of *Shengshi Weiyan* (Sheng-shih Wei-yen 盛世危言; Warnings to the Seemingly Prosperous Age). He went so far as to urge the adoption of such foreign institutions as parliament and a constitutional monarchy.²⁷⁵

Strikingly, some Chinese dignitaries also welcomed Western knowledge. Zhang Zhidong was such a leader. He was a Chinese classicist and one of the foremost reformers. He was first a scholar and then was promoted by Cixi as a Governor of Shanxi province, the Viceroy successively of three regions (out of eight in total in late Qing China), i.e., Huguang (Hunan and Hubei provinces), Liangguang (Guangdong and Guangxi provinces), and Liangjiang (Jiangsu, Jiangxi, and Anhui provinces), in chronological order. He also served as a Grand Council member of the Junjichu (Chün-chi-ch'u 军机处; Office of Military Secrets) of the Empire.

²⁷⁵I. C.Y. Hsü, *The Rise of Modern China* (New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), p.357.

Zhang started his connection with Richard from 1882 when Zhang was the new Viceroy of Shanxi after Zeng Guoquan. Zhang was searching archives that year to find references on ways to enrich Chinese people and avert future famines. He came across Richard's proposal and was impressed by the suggestions on the Famine relief. Zhang thus invited Richard to give up missionary work and become his advisor to implement a reform movement. To his surprise, Richard declined the offer because, as a new missionary, there was no possibility to be independent of his missionary organization. Instead, Richard promised Zhang to recommend experts in different fields whenever necessary, and helped Zhang conduct geographical surveys in Shanxi. In 1884, Zhang became the Viceroy of Guangzhou, and in 1889 he was transferred to the Viceroyship at Wuchang where he stayed till 1907.

Influenced by Richard, Zhang established a modern arsenal and military academy in 1887, and two years later he instituted the first modern mint in Guangzhou. At Wuchang, starting from 1889, Zhang opened an iron foundry (later the famous huge Han-Yeh-P'ing Iron and Steel Works 汉冶萍钢铁厂), cotton mills, silk factories, tanneries, and the Beijing-Hankou (Han-k'ou 汉口) railway; more significantly, based on Richard's suggestion, he articulated in *Shibao* of Three-Tier (primary, middle, high school) Westernized educational system and set up an experimental system consisting of a teachers' college and a series of primary, technical, and high schools. Zhang actively sought ways for China to survive and compete in the world that would accommodate Western knowledge but preserve traditional Chinese culture.²⁷⁶ His philosophically dichotomous formulation, *Tiyong* (T'i-yung 体用; Substance and Function) was meant

²⁷⁶I. C. Y. Hsü, *The Rise of Modern China* (New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), p.358.

to highlight and develop Richard's approach to reforms: Zhongxue Weiti, Xixue weiyong [Chung-hsüeh-wei-t'i, Hsi-hsüeh-wei-yung 中学为体, 西学为用; traditional Chinese learning was the substance or value (*Ti*) for producing reform principles; while Western learning was the means (*Yong*) applied advanced science and technology, i.e., to achieve modernization].

However, in Richard's views, *Ti* and *Yong* could not be separated from one another because *Ti* itself was not Chinese learning but a set of achievements in civilized Western countries; the application of them in China was *Yong*.²⁷⁷ Richard's argument was supported by professional Chinese experts as seen, for example, in the famous book mentioned previously, Shengshi Weiyan. This book influenced Qing reformers, as well as Deng Xiaoping in the late 1970s. Its author, Zheng Guanying, discussed in the book that *Ti* represented Western achievements accomplished by a unity of the rulers and their people relying on a modernized educational system, a parliamentary government, and all the other aspects which could accelerate the development of civilization.²⁷⁸

Zhang Zhidong was an important advisor to the Emperor in domestic and foreign policies. He was so immersed in the Chinese cultural and ethical tradition that he was described as "a Chinese to the backbone;" and it was said that to him "there is no country like China, no people like the Chinese, and no religion to be compared with the Confucianism."²⁷⁹ Notwithstanding the fact, he admired Richard's innovative ideology and personal characteristics, and stressed "Chinese culture for the foundation and

²⁷⁷Liu Kwang-ching, "Nineteenth-Century China: The Disintegration of the Old Order and the Impact of the West," In *China in Crisis*, ed. Ho Ping-ti and Tang Tsou (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1968), Vol.1, p.133.

²⁷⁸Zheng Guanying, *Warning to a prosperous age* (Zhengzhou: Zhongzhou Ancient Books Press, 1998) preface. 郑观应（序言），郑州：中州古籍出版社，1998年。

²⁷⁹Xiao Gongquan, "Weng T'ung-ho and Reform Movement of 1898," *Tsinghua Journal*, New Series 1, no.2 (1957), p.153. 萧公权，"翁同龢与戊戌变法"，《清华学报》，1957年，第1卷第2期，第153页。

Western culture for practical use.’’²⁸⁰ In his official discourses, books and memorials, Zhang cited many reform ideas and suggestions proposed by Richard for the rebirth of a new country. Three extraordinary ones were: (1) Rejuvenate the Manchu Dynasty by a revival of Confucianism; (2) Rejuvenate China by education; (3) Rejuvenate China by industrialization.²⁸¹

Another important figure in the late Qing China was Li Hongzhang. Li was one of the eight Regional Viceroys. He was the leading, most able statesman of late Qing China, and also the most influential and the highest civilian among all the officials,²⁸² intellectually towering above others.²⁸³ He controlled the most strategically important region of the late Qing Empire, Zhili (Chih-li 直隶; literally *directly ruled by Empire*) province, which surrounded the capital, Beijing. He oversaw the military and civil affairs of Shandong and Henan (Ho-nan 河南) provinces.

Li was the first top Chinese official whom Richard met in his mission work. It was he who made Richard realize that a *top-down* approach was necessary and applicable. Their personal relationship lasted through their lives ever since 1876 when Li went to Yantai to sign the *Chefoo Convention*.²⁸⁴ During the Famine, his staff and escort were suffering dysentery and anguish which were prevalent among the military. Richard was a director then of a little mission team responsible for the dispensation of medicine and

²⁸⁰*Ibid.*, p.151.

²⁸¹S. Tang and J. K. Fairbank, *China's Response to the West: A Documentary Survey, 1839-1923* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1979), pp.164-166.

²⁸²BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Mary Celia Richard, 23 January 1896.

²⁸³Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.298.

²⁸⁴(烟台条约)—an agreement signed on 13 September 1876 by Thomas F. Wade for Great Britain and Li Hongzhang for China, in settlement of an incident on the Burma frontier in which a British consular officer, Augustus Margery, had been killed. It safeguarded the trade across that route and opened more ports to foreign residence. The Convention was a substantial supplement to Britain's treaties of 1842, 1858, and 1860, in that it secured practically all the concessions the British Minister had been demanding for over two years.

drugs to Li's soldiers. After the Famine, Li invited Richard and one of his colleagues to Tianjin in 1880, where Li's Vice-royalty office was located, to express his personal thanks to all the missionaries for what they did to relieve the suffering of Chinese people during the Famine. However, Li was skeptical about the notion and the purported power of the Western God, and was leery of the effect of Christianization on China: the conversions of Chinese who had been suffering from the Famine might be due to the relief benefits received from missionaries rather than Christian beliefs. Richard, on the one hand, felt much encouraged by the meeting because his mission work was officially recognized by the highest and most influential official; yet, on the other hand, he felt that it was more than ever necessary to show Chinese elites, who had been brought up in a society isolated from the external world, the modernity of West's civilization and the mercy of God.

For this purpose, Richard wrote a book entitled *Historical Evidences of Christianity* to describe in detail what the Good was of Christianity.²⁸⁵ The monograph included the Gospels as well as a collection of facts as evidence to show the intellectual, political, social, moral, and spiritual benefits of Christianity. For example, one of the most useful tools in advanced technology God offered to human beings was the railway. Richard urged Li to build railways for the transportation of agricultural products (e.g., grain) from other provinces to suffering regions for famine relief in future.²⁸⁶ In addition, from 1881 to 1884, Richard organized and presented lectures slides, which had never been seen in China, to Chinese officials and literati on Western civilization, educational systems, cultural development, and modernization in field of science and technology

²⁸⁵ Timothy Richard, *Historical evidences of Christianity* (Shanghai: Commercial Press, 1911), pp. 1-207.

²⁸⁶ Timothy Richard, *The Material Benefits*, In "The Historical Evidence of Christianity," *Chinese Recorder* 21, no. 4 (1890), p.145.

including, but not limited to, Astronomy, Electricity, Chemistry, Geology, Natural History, Engineering, Workshop Tools, Medicine, and various Industries with scientific apparatus such as, telescopes, microscopes, spectroscopes, hand dynamos, Wimshurst machines, induction coils, various galvanized batteries, galvanometers, Geissler tubes, voltmeters, electrometers, pocket sextants and aneroid barometers, photographic outfits, and even a sewing-machine.²⁸⁷ All of these experiments were requested by the Chinese, and were delivered in Taiyuan Fu monthly over the period of three years. Throughout his teachings, Richard linked science and technology with Christianity by arguing that science and technology were gifts offered by God to human beings, that God had provided infinite powers in Nature for people to utilize, and that people not only of the West but also those of the East were blessed by God with gifts produced through the development of science and technology.²⁸⁸

A few years later, Richard sent Li a pamphlet, *Modern Education*, suggesting that China should set aside a million taels annually for educational purposes in order to reap the benefits of the modern education. Although arguing that China could not afford to wait that long for modernization, Li came to realize that Richard's proposal was a strategic guideline for China's nationwide development through a controlled reform beyond the scope of the Self-Strengthening Movement.²⁸⁹

In 1890, a fierce anti-foreign rebellion broke out in the Yangtze Valley. Just after lecturing on *The Relation of Christian Missions to the Chinese Government* in the 2nd General Conference of Missionaries in Shanghai, Richard went to Wuchang, the capital of Hubei (Hu-pei 湖北) province, to meet Zhang Zhidong, hoping Zhang to stop the

²⁸⁷*Ibid.*, p.160.

²⁸⁸*Ibid.*, p.163.

²⁸⁹*Ibid.*, pp.206-207.

persecution to missionaries. He then visited Li in Tianjin to request prohibiting the Empress-controlled government from printing and circulating materials against churches and missionaries.²⁹⁰ As an employee of the Qing Court, Li felt it hard to oppose its policy directly and publicly, though he was in favor of Richard's contributions to intercultural communications and reform designs. To Richard's surprise, in this meeting, Li offered an editorial position for a Chinese daily newspaper, *Shibao*, run in Tianjin to facilitate China's Self-Strengthening movement.²⁹¹ This providential opportunity was very important to Richard: it was to solve Richard's survival problem after the London BMS headquarter refused to support him; it was also to allow Richard, with the help of illustrations, charts, and diagrams, to start a "systematic and daily publication of the leading ideas of Christendom among the Chinese," and, more important, to debate with Chinese intellectuals about, and guide them to recognize, the necessity of a national reform for modernization.²⁹²

3.6 Richard's Endeavour to Maintain Mission Work in China

Richard left Taiyuan for Tianjin at the end of 1887 to fill the "translator" position. On his way to Tianjin, he reviewed the long-lasting controversy. Finally he realized that

²⁹⁰*Ibid.*, pp.214-215.

²⁹¹*Ibid.* *Shih Pao* was the first English newspaper in Zhili sponsored by Li Hongzhang. It was run by a British missionary of German descent, Gustav von Detring (1842-1913), the editor-in-chief of which was Alexander Michie who was from Great Britain. A lot of old China Hands, like Timothy Richard, W. A. P. Martin, John Innocent, Arthur H. Smith, etc., were the column authors.

²⁹²E. W. Price Evans, *Timothy Richard, A Narrative of Christian Enterprise and Statesmanship in China* (London: The Carey Press, 1945), p.108.

he could “not contemplate breaking with missionary work.”²⁹³ He changed his mind and decided to refuse the offer (note: not the later “editor” offer in 1890 by Li Hongzhang) but, instead, to stay in Beijing, the capital of China, which is close to Tianjin. There, he sincerely and eagerly looked forward to the BMS’s instructions. This was the second time that Richard had refused an offer from the Chinese side (the first offer was around 1882 by Zhang Zhidong). In those years there were precedents for missionaries to accept governmental offers in educational and cultural fields. For example, John Fryer from the London Missionary Society became a translator at the Arsenal in Shanghai at that time. Earlier in 1864, W.A.P. Martin from the American Presbyterian Mission was appointed as the first president and dean of the Western Studies Division of Tong Wen Guan (College of Foreign Languages).

When Richard arrived, Beijing was in a state of intellectual ferment. Though working alone, Richard was productive with some translation work, paper publications, and meetings with like-minded missionaries and various Chinese elites. Particularly, in the beginning of January 1888, Richard first wrote a long paper, *The Influence of Buddhism on China*, for the Beijing Oriental Society on non-Christian religions in “the Kingdom of God”. Then, he finished a pamphlet, *Modern Education in Seven Nations*, to introduce the educational systems and their development in Western countries. The pamphlet expressed the view that the advance of a country was coupled with the enhancement of education. Contrary to the contempt he faced at the narrow school in Taiyuan, Richard’s opinions received much respect in Beijing and attracted considerable attention from elite Chinese.²⁹⁴ For example, after reading the pamphlet, Li Hongzhang

²⁹³*Ibid.*, p.206.

²⁹⁴BMS, Mary Richard Correspondence: to Mary Jane, 21 January 1888.

responded that a reform was really necessary to solve China's problem but that China could not wait for as long as 20 years.²⁹⁵ Another powerful official, Zeng Guoquan, was also convinced by Richard's proposals and therefore urged him to circulate his treatise amongst other high officials.²⁹⁶ Even many years later, a Hanlin scholar in charge of a Chinese provincial college told Richard that he had sought to set up an educational system by following the designs set out by Richard in his pamphlet.²⁹⁷ As a matter of fact, Richard's thinking had a widespread impact on elite Chinese. However, the Qing Court was too weak financially then to be able to allocate funds for Richard's project: the Dynasty was facing the Japanese aggression in Korea, a protectorate of the Qing China, just after the Sino-French war in 1885 which followed an internal Muslim Rebellion in Xinjiang (Hsin-Chiang 新疆) in the northwest of China.

In January 1888, the home BMS headquarters refused Richard's requests for autonomy and freedom to work as he saw fit. In turn, Richard first rejected and then accepted the BMS's suggestion to return to Shandong, with a hope to establish a Christian college of western learning at Jinan Fu (Chi-nan Fu 济南府), the provincial capital. Waiting for a reply again, Richard was busy with teaching English to Chinese officials. In this way, he was able, on the one hand, to earn survival money to pay his living costs in Beijing, and on the other hand, to establish closer ties with Chinese officials. In order to increase his income, Richard posted a placard to offer his services for high-school teaching,²⁹⁸ but only three Japanese and one Chinese enrolled to study

²⁹⁵ Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), pp.206-207.

²⁹⁶ *Ibid.*, pp.208-209.

²⁹⁷ *Ibid.*, p.207.

²⁹⁸ BMS, Mary Richard Correspondence: Mary Jane, 16 December 1887.

mathematics. Meanwhile, he was pondering how he would achieve his goal in Shandong if the BMS approved his proposal.²⁹⁹

With the help of his former colleague in Shandong, A. G. Jones, Richard spent five weeks there to discuss with his old and new colleagues what they should do. At the end of February, Richard returned to Beijing and submitted a report to Baynes, the secretary of the BMS. The report called for running the creation of a small newspaper in Chinese, and setting up an Institution for the educated and leading classes of Chinese people in Jinan Fu via (1) appointing a European and two Chinese assistants; and (2) getting funds for suitable teaching appliances and apparatus from private individuals in England.³⁰⁰ In a later letter, Richard disclosed the motive to start the newspaper: “to remove prejudice from the minds of the Mandarins and Literati by showing them how Christians assisted China in all that is for its best interests.”³⁰¹ With the same motive Richard later became involved in another Chinese newspaper, *Shi Bao* (*Shih Pao* 时报), thanks to Li Hongzhang’s offer.

To broaden his vision on missionary approaches in Asia, Richard visited Japan in the spring of 1888. He found that Japan had successfully undergone a cultural and educational reform similar to what he suggested to the BMS with respect to China.³⁰² After returning to China, Richard learned that the BMS refused again to provide any financial support for his project due to the unavailability of sufficient funding sources for mission work; however, the BMS accepted his approach to elite Chinese though no money for labor was provided to run the newspaper and the college. Disappointed with

²⁹⁹BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 13 March 1888.

³⁰⁰BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 12 March 1888.

³⁰¹BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 21 May 1891.

³⁰²Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), pp.211-212.

the BMS once more, Richard considered withdrawing from the BMS in order to gain a complete autonomy and liberty of action. But soon he changed his mind again when Jones invited him to revisit Shandong in September 1888. During this visit, Richard introduced his colleagues in detail his vision for a Christian college at Jinan Fu. He felt assured of their overall support for his reform project. He therefore exchanged numerous letters over the next few months with Baynes to thrash out not only the past controversy in Shanxi but also the new issues in Shandong. Finally in May 1889, Richard moved his family to Tianjin to prepare for their eventual relocation in Shandong.

In the meantime, a new famine raged throughout Shandong. In June 1889 Richard hoped to move immediately to Jinan Fu in order to lend his experience to relief efforts, and to attend the local BMS missionary conference. On this occasion, however, he contracted the famine fever, a deadly illness which he had suffered during his previous relief work in 1876-1879. For a time his life was in imminent danger. While still on convalescence from the fever, he was urged to attend the conference to discuss his reform program. During the meeting, Richard succumbed to *neural prostration* (or perhaps *malarial paralysis*), a common sequel of the dreaded fever. All the 12 members passed his plan and signed a letter to the BMS Committee. At the meeting, Richard was asked to move to Jinan Fu in October. The illness caused Richard great pain and the incapacitation of his right arm for a time, even delaying his return to Tianjin. He left Jinan for Yantai, the coast city where he began his career in China, to meet his wife who had fallen ill already when attending some activities there.³⁰³ She had not been informed

³⁰³BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 23 July 1889.

of the gravity of Richard's illness until he arrived.³⁰⁴ In Yantai, Richard wrote a letter to the BMS to report his illness. In early October 1889, the couple returned to Tianjin.

Richard was recovering very slowly, and his medical doctor refused his relocation to Jinan Fu under that condition. While his wife behaved as his able secretary in both necessary writing and everyday life, Richard awaited the BMS's response eagerly.³⁰⁵ Later in October, Richard received the BMS's refusal of the suggestion made by the local BMS missionary conference at Jinan Fu.³⁰⁶ This was Richard's third failure in his relations with the BMS. Also, as disclosed by a protesting member of the BMS Committee, this was the first time in at least 20 years that the Committee denied a unanimous request from a local sub-Committee.

The continuous rejections from the BMS were an additional emotional shock for Richard. To make things worse, six months later he suffered a relapse of the fever which prevented him from going to Shandong. Significantly, however, the convalescence provided Richard with ample time to *contemplate* his ideological development.³⁰⁷ He made sure that he could never work again in such a forced system as he had experienced in Shanxi. He knew that he would work best in a way to expand *evangelization* among the Chinese people that was different from the traditional method. He was certain that he had been *called* upon by God to reach Chinese elites through the spread of Western civilization. He concluded that God's salvage plan for feeble China was to initiate a cultural and educational reform, the need that most missionaries were unaware of in their traditional missionary approaches. He made up his mind to become more energetic

³⁰⁴Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.206.

³⁰⁵BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 4 October 1889.

³⁰⁶Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), pp.213-214.

³⁰⁷BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 18 March 1890.

than ever to respond to what he believed was God's precious *calling*. Though in poor physical condition, Richard serialized his previous six-chapter monograph in the *Chinese Recorder*³⁰⁸, and then published the papers in a book, to widely promote the influence of Christianity among Chinese elites.³⁰⁹ This was largely in response to the question of the Viceroy, Li Hongzhang: *what is the good of Christianity?* In addition, Richard finished four volumes of a literary work for primary education, with two others in process.³¹⁰ Due to his influence, a devout Chinese scholar was baptized around March 1890 after a few months of contact with Richard. After the baptism, the first thing this man did was to write a tract which provided reasons why one should become a Christian.³¹¹ During that difficult period, a Japanese man also converted under Richard's influence.

Richard failed at last in the conflicts with his Fundamentalist colleagues in view of his liberal theology and missionary strategies. Although he wrote repeatedly to the home Society to argue in favor of the validity of his mission approach and rebut charges to his heterodox evangelization, the BMS insisted Fundamentalist missions after a special investigation carried out by a deputation to China. This showed that, at that time, Christian Fundamentalism was far more deep-rooted in evangelization than liberalism, leading to the fact that the introduction of natural theology was resisted in Christianization efforts, and the upgrade of missions by incorporating modern culture

³⁰⁸A monthly periodical that started in 1869 as a joint literary project by Christian missionaries of various religious denominations in North China, each issue contained articles of missionary significance, book reviews, correspondence, and personal items concerning the missionaries. Half of the members of the editorial board changed volumes of the Recorder yearly. The first four volumes of the *Recorder* were published by Rozario, Marcal and Company in Fuzhou (Foochow 福州); from 1874, the *Recorder* was published by the American Presbyterian Mission Press, Shanghai.

³⁰⁹Timothy Richard, "The Material Benefits," In *The Historical Evidences of Christianity for China* (*Chinese Recorder* 21: 1 April 1890).

³¹⁰BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 7 April 1890.

³¹¹BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 18 March 1890.

was suppressed. This situation was the main reason why Christianity eventually lost the possibility to be Sinicized in the late Qing China.

In May 1890, Richard presented a paper, *The Relation of Christian Missions to the Chinese Government*, to the Second General Missionary Conference held in Shanghai (Shang-hai 上海). Richard predicted in this paper that, if the Government did not do something to quell the negative propaganda coming out against Christianity, a new wave of persecution of Christians would occur. Though some colleagues considered his words too *gloomy*, a seven-member committee including Richard was appointed to study the matter and to draft a memo to the throne. Before the memo was done, a number of violent outbreaks did occur in the Yangtze Valley. The document was drawn up and submitted later after the conference.³¹² In spite of his physician's attempts to dissuade him from more travels due to the health problem, Richard quickly left the conference.³¹³ He went first to Wuchang (Wu-ch'ang 武昌), an industrial city in south China, and then returned to Tianjin to prevail respectively upon the Viceroy Zhang Zhidong and Li Hongzhang to intervene in the religious cases (also named "religious Massacres" and "missionary Incidents": attacks by Chinese extremists on foreigners, in which most of the victims were unarmed missionaries) that had occurred along the Yangtze Valley. These serious events were closely related to the inspiration of the anti-Christian tracts written by some Confucian intellectuals.³¹⁴ Richard's efforts appeared in vain because there were no actions taken by the two officers to protect foreign and Chinese Christians.

³¹²Timothy Richard, "Relation of Christian Missions to the Chinese Government," In *Records of the General Conference of the Protestant Missionaries of China, Shanghai, May 2-20, 1890* (Shanghai: American Presbyterian Press, 1890), pp.401-415.

³¹³BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 26 June 1890.

³¹⁴Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.215.

The sporadic violence continued against Christians for many years until its peak when the Boxer rebellion broke out in 1900.

Until the Shanghai conference, Richard had always paid the cost for his own missionary activities like travel, publishing, attending meetings, and so on, due to the absence of funding from the BMS. Just after the conference, he communicated with Baynes to express his willingness to resign and told him that “I felt very loathe to continue to draw my salary to do work.”³¹⁵ In this letter, Richard reported to the BMS his doctor’s advice concerning his inability to relocate in Shandong for strenuous missionary work. He also revealed that he might contribute to run the Chinese experimental daily newspaper, *Shi Bao*, in Tianjin as an editor, a position offered to him by Li Hongzhang when they met in Tianjin in June 1890. The reason was, unlike his difficult relations with his missionary colleagues, Richard successfully established a healthy dialogue with Chinese elites after returning to Shanxi. He delivered eight educational and cultural lectures to provincial officials there.³¹⁶ The elites were attracted by the modernity of Western civilization and tried to gain as much practical knowledge as possible from Richard. They were particularly interested in technology. Some of the literati actually converted to Christianity at that time or later.³¹⁷ The atmosphere among the Chinese elites in Shanxi was most open towards Christianity. From the 1860s, China had begun its Self-Strengthening Movement to absorb Western science and technology, especially military technology, to resist the military invasion of the West and to protect and promote its national sovereignty. Meanwhile, awakened by Western civilization, more and more literati were willing to turn to Christianity with the purpose of finding

³¹⁵BMS, Richard Correspondence, to Baynes, 26 June 1890.

³¹⁶BMS, Richard Correspondence: to BMS Committee, 12 May 1887, 9; to T.R. Glover, 26 May 1887.

³¹⁷*Ibid.*, p.562.

appropriate cultural means to modernize China and help it to regain its superiority in Asia as had been the case during previous dynasties.

The editorial opportunity was most providential for Richard. Based on his liberal theology and previous missionary activities in China, he knew the importance of the press and accepted the offer just before his communication with the BMS. The new position would not only enable him to engage in the mission work assigned to him before by BMS, but also provide an amicable solution to the long-standing controversy in Shanxi as well as to the new question surrounding his replacement in Shandong.³¹⁸ With this new position, Richard finally withdrew himself from the BMS fold, something he had long been firmly resisting to do because of his deep commitment to serving Christianization as a BMS missionary.

Shi Bao began publishing from 1 July 1890, sponsored by Li Hongzhang. As an eminent senior Qing politician and diplomat, Li knew the power of the press, and often made use of foreign and domestic newspapers in China, America, and Europe to his own advantage and to deal with various international circumstances and events. He hoped *Shi Bao* would open a window for “high Chinese officials to the outer world with an extensive circulation.”³¹⁹ Starting there Richard began a completely different life from before. The employment was just at a time when his Protestant liberal perspective had evolved to form a consolidated liberal theology frame.

After refusing the “translator” offer, Richard selected the editorial position in order to continue his missionary work through print media, a more influential, far-reaching tool of Christianization. What was more significant to him, his consistent top-down

³¹⁸BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 26 June 1890.

³¹⁹R. S. Britton, *The Chinese Periodical Press, 1800-1912* (Shanghai: Kelly & Walsh, Ltd., 1933), pp.77-78.

approach had already begun to take effect on Chinese elites, as exposed by Li's offer. This showed that Christianity was not rejected by China's most powerful figures, and thus it was possible for missionaries to cooperate more with Westernization-minded politicians in China's reform for modernization. Based on such recognition, it was understandable that Richard readily accepted the offer which led him finally to become the mentor later of more radical reformists, like Kang Youwei and Liang Qichao.

3.7 Discussion

Richard's mission work distinctly featured the properties of liberal theology. It was not shaped by accident. Its formation was driven by both internal and external factors. The former included his tenacious, rebellious, and adaptive personality, while the latter included the realistic demands of changes from Fundamentalism to Liberalism in response to industrialization in the 19th century. The mission work in the Famine relief and his trip to Europe provided Richard timely the soil adaptive to the evolution of his important conceptions.

While adhering to the general principle of evangelization, Richard's theology stressed the importance of the modernity in Western civilization.³²⁰ He did so with an innovative view that individual salvation would be best achieved in an enlightened society where everyone could *enjoy the light of revelation, by the will of God as made*

³²⁰C. Larmore, *The Morals of Modernity (Modern Europe Philosophy)* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1996), pp.119-120.

known to him (Matt. 11:20-24; John 3:19).³²¹ Despite serious arguments persisted between Richard and his BMS colleagues, this theology and mission work approach evolved rapidly.³²² However, we pointed out that, though Richard's ideology was clearly different from that of fundamentalists, all of them shared one theme for mission work: Christianization, i.e., the view that Christianity should expand in the world where all the nations should be Christianized so that the whole Earth could become entirely part of the kingdom of God. This is what was called Christian Universalism. Because of the innate expansionism of Christianization, the nature of this Universalism coincided with the colonization which spread Western values and Western civilization to indigenous countries.³²³ For the two types of missionaries, their mission work were well coincided with the cultural expansion of the West into Eastern countries. Thus, Universalism characterized missionary activities no matter which ideology the missionaries stuck to, either Fundamentalism or liberalism.

³²¹Wang Lixin, *American Missionaries and the Modernization of China in the late Qing* (Tianjin: Tianjin People Press, 1997), pp.26-33. 王立新, 《美国传教士和晚清中国现代化》, 天津: 天津人民出版社, 1997年, 第26-33页。

³²²William Paley, *Natural Theology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), p.189.

³²³A. Schlesinger, Jr., "The Missionary Enterprise and Theories of Imperialism," In *The Missionary Enterprise in China and America*, ed, John K. Fairbank (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1974), p.342.

CHAPTER 4
EXPANSION FEATURE
IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF RICHARD'S LIBERAL THEOLOGY

4.1 Importance of Publishing

Among missionaries in China, Richard had gained a unique understanding about an effective and efficient Christianization during his many years of liberal theological practice. In general, his mission work was featured in three facets: (1) liberal evangelization, (2) Westernized education, and (3) Gospel publishing. All of these elements highlighted his understand of the role of the modernity of Western civilization in Christian expansion. Evidence demonstrates that Richard was successful in his mission approach to Chinese.

Relative to publishing, education would need “an immense expenditure of time” for “opening primary, secondary or vocational schools, teaching English in Chinese schools, and training Chinese native pastors, evangelists, and teachers.”⁷³⁶ With regard to this matter, Richard had designed a long-term plan: to establish a Christian college at Taiyuan Fu as a model; then, to expand the institution to each of the 18 provincial capitals. Because all the Chinese officials and other elite figures were selected from among literati, Richard felt it important to Christianize the literati as early as possible. These people would transmit their new knowledge to surroundings from the top-down;

⁷³⁶E. Morgan, “Timothy Richard and the Christian Literature Society,” 1921, In D. Wyre Lewis (Timothy Richard Group), Annual Report 1963-1964 (National Library, Aberystwyth),

even if not converted, they would at least become well-disposed to Christianity due to the religious orientation obtained in Christian schools. However, it was hard for Richard to get any funds from Fundamentalist organizations.

By contrast to the time-consuming and money-consuming education, publishing was the best way to communicate with the literati in this process of Christianization, according to Richard's evaluation. It would involve literary work including, for instance, writing and/or translating books, publishing articles, issuing magazines. In his mind, the dissemination of literary work had two incomparable merits, in addition to the advantages in time and budget:⁷³⁷

First, compared to missionary tasks performed by individuals in evangelistic travels, publishing was able to reach more people in more places rapidly, and thus to influence public opinions more widely; without publishing, many people might never be touched by Christianity if they did not attend Christian worship services, or if they did not permit foreigners or Chinese Christians to enter their homes.

Second, in traditional China, it was reading, rather than preaching, that had been the dominant medium for spreading Chinese culture (e.g., Confucianism, Taoism, and Buddhism). . For this reason, publishing in Chinese should be the primary vehicle for missionary inculcation of Christianity.

Compared to most other Protestant missionaries in China, Richard was richly endowed with talents for publishing after he filled the editorial position in *Shibao* in 1890 and one year later he became the General Secretary of S.D.K. (later C.L.S.).⁷³⁸ For

⁷³⁷*Ibid.*

⁷³⁸A name given to the Society for the Diffusion of Christian and General Knowledge among the Chinese. The staff of contributors was headed by Timothy Richard, who served as General Secretary of the Society from 1891 to 1916. The catalogue of publications grew from three to nearly eight hundred during his stewardship. The Revs. Gilbert Walshe, Donald MacGillivray, W. A. Cornaby, Evan Morgan, Moir

about ten years, Richard continually addressed to his readers the importance of a national reform and the benefits of running a western learning system throughout China. He published books, brochures, tracts on China's economic development, educational reform, international affairs, and relations with Christian missions. Richard himself wrote or translated about 100 of the S.D.K.'s 250 publications. Moreover, S.D.K. distributed its publications at examination centers, sponsored lectures and essay contests, and maintained study associations, museums, and reading rooms. As a result, Richard had a non-negligible impact on Chinese society; at the same time, he drove the Society toward eradicating the elites' reluctance to acknowledge the importance of reforms, and toward helping China to establish modern schools.

Until his retirement in 1916, he contributed to literary works for 25 years. During that quarter of a century, he wrote books in Chinese on the rise and fall of nations, on the benefits Christianity had conferred on all continents through the advance of science and technology, and on Jesus Christ and the Kingdom of God in relation to the world. His publications grew "from a few under ten to nearly eight hundred" and influenced Chinese people including reformers, officers, the Qing Court, even the emperor.⁷³⁹ In addition, he introduced international anthropology, history, religion, and so on, to Chinese readers, through maps and charts he produced. The C.L.S. also published monthly magazines and circulated illustrated booklets on these topics. These writings,

Duncan, W. Hopkin Rees, Isaac Mason, Young J. Allen, and Miss Hilda Bowser were released by their respective missionary Societies to give their full time to this literary project. Hu Shi (Hu Shih, 胡适) later said that this "Society did much in opening China and bringing about the great revolution in thought." From 1888-1895, the yearly reports of the Society were printed at Noronha and Sons, 12 Canton Road, Shanghai; after 1896, the yearly reports were printed at The Shanghai Mercury Office, Shanghai.

⁷³⁹E. Morgan, "Timothy Richard and the Christian Literature Society," 1921, In D. Wyre Lewis (Timothy Richard Group), Annual Report 1963-64 (National Library, Aberystwyth), p.5.

according to Richard “transferred the immense blessing of God to China”⁷⁴⁰ by showing Chinese people that “Christianity does not come to destroy...but to fulfill, and to bring untold material, intellectual, and political benefits, as well as the social, moral and spiritual blessings...a way much better than...gunboats or through consulates.”⁷⁴¹ No doubt, all of the mission work expressed incisively the “cultural expansion” feature of liberal Universalism.

4.2 Mission Work at *Shibao*

The first position which allowed Richard to rid himself of the fetters of his fundamentalist colleagues was the editorship of *Shibao*, a position offered by Li Hongzhang. The newspaper was published in Tianjin, aiming at a readership from Chinese elites, especially high-level officials, and funded by foreign advertisers⁷⁴². At the behest of Li, it was founded by Gustav Detring (1842-1913), one of Li’s foreign counselors, who was a customs officer in Beijing and also a worker for the S.D.K./C.L.S. *Shibao* published its first issue in July 1890. The editorship provided Richard with a convenient pulpit from which he could preach his ideas. Now he had greater autonomy and freedom to advocate Christianization under the guidance of liberalism. He was certain that his reform design would modernize China and benefit Chinese people by a

⁷⁴⁰*Ibid.*, p.82.

⁷⁴¹*Ibid.*, pp.80-81.

⁷⁴²R. S. Britton, *The Chinese Periodical Press, 1800-1912* (Shanghai: Kelly &Walsh, Ltd., 1933), pp.77-78.

shifting emphasis from just saving the Chinese heathen “from the sufferings of hell” to also saving them “from the hell of suffering”.⁷⁴³

From July 1890 to June 1891, Richard produced substantial writings on issues related to Chinese reforms in education, trade, railways, and so on. He also drew comparisons between China and foreign countries. In place of the dull lists typical of official decrees from the Court, Richard expressed his viewpoints through diagrams to advocate reform. He also introduced materials he had presented to the officials and scholars in his three years of scientific and technological lectures in Taiyuan Fu during the early 1880s. This allowed some Chinese people to recognize that Western civilization “sought to discover the workings of God in Nature, and to apply the laws of Nature for the service of mankind.”⁷⁴⁴

His endeavor was successful. The newspaper, *Shibao*, apparently attracted attention from Chinese elites. Within a year, the newspaper was being circulated widely, even reaching the Forbidden Palace and the foreign offices in Beijing and some border provinces.⁷⁴⁵ For example, its readership went beyond the four-province area adjacent to Beijing in Northern China and reached Wuchang, the provincial capital of Hubei in southern China, where Zhang Zhidong was living. Zhang requested copies directly sent there. In addition, Richard’s articles in *Shibao* were often copied one or two months after their publication by five other daily papers (two in Shanghai, two in Hong Kong and one in Canton).⁷⁴⁶ During this period, Li introduced more friends to Richard: Prince Qing, several Hanlin scholars, and officials working in the Zongli Yamen, the office of

⁷⁴³*Ibid.*, p.197.

⁷⁴⁴*Ibid.*, p.158.

⁷⁴⁵Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.215.

⁷⁴⁶BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 21 May 1891.

the Qing Court dedicated to dealing with foreign affairs.⁷⁴⁷ Here we note that Hanlin scholars were members of the Hanlin Academy, China's highest scholarly institution which had been founded in the 8th century AD during the Tang Dynasty and lasted until 1911. The Hanlin Academy was responsible for the up keep of the Court's historical archives, literary tasks, for providing official interpretations of Confucian classics and Han-Buddhism, and for the selection all-level officials through regular national examinations for entrance into the Civil Service.

However, just when the readership seemed to be expanding, financial support ended and the newspaper folded at the end of June 1891. The suspension might have been relevant to the political and religious viewpoints expressed by Richard: he stressed his political concerns, along with a Christian rhetoric, too directly to be accepted by the conservative Court. Just in time again, Richard received another offer from the S.D.K, a more challenging position for him. Though he moved away from Li Hongzhang, he continued his good relationship with Li. For example, a few years later when Li was removed from his high position, he made positive recommendations for Richard to become his successor, as to be discussed below.

4.3 Mission Work in the S.D.K.

In 1884 the *Chinese Book and Tract Society* was established in Glasgow, Scotland. By 1887 the Society had been dissolved. In that year, the Rev. Alexander Williamson, a Scottish Protestant missionary, founded the S.D.K. after receiving a generous donation

⁷⁴⁷BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Mary Martin Richard, 9 October 1895.

from Matheson and Company for purchasing all the equipment of the Society and for shipping them to Shanghai. Williamson served as the General Secretary of the Executive Committee, while Sir Robert Hart, a British Consul and the senior imperial Customs officer in Beijing, filled the presidency of the Society. With Hart's help and support, the S.D.K. could circulate throughout China the literature "written from a Chinese standpoint based on Christian principles but with knowledge of native modes of thought and adapted to instruct and elevate the people, especially through the more intelligent and ruling classes."⁷⁴⁸

Until 1889 the S.D.K. owned properties of only \$1,000 in value, publishing two religious magazines in Chinese: the monthly periodical, *Wan Guo Gong Bao* edited by Dr. Young J. Allen, and another one, *The Boy's Own Paper*. There was little western content in these publications. In 1890, the S.D.K. experienced its hardest time: Williamson died in August, and all the printing facilities were sold to the National Bible Society, in Scotland. Hart hoped to continue the business. At that time, Hart was also involved in *Shibao* which had been founded by Mr Detring, his subordinate both in the Customs Office and the S.D.K. Both Hart and Detring knew Richard well, his ability, his ideology, and his competence to fill the S.D.K. vacancy. They invited him to succeed. We note here that some Chinese scholars have interpreted Richard's relation with Hart as the evidence that Richard was an imperialist missionary in service to the West.⁷⁴⁹ This viewpoint distorts the situation, however.

⁷⁴⁸E. Morgan, "Timothy Richard and the Christian Literature Society," 1921, In D. Wyre Lewis (Timothy Richard Group), Annual Report 1963-64 (National Library, Aberystwyth).

⁷⁴⁹Ding Zeliang, *Timothy Richard: a typical missionary giving service to Imperialism* (Beijing: Kaiming Publishing House, 1951), pp.5-6. 丁则良, 《李提摩太——一个典型的为帝国主义服务的传教士》, 北京: 开明书局, 1951年, 第5-6页。

In June 1891, Richard relocated to Shanghai as the General Secretary of the S.D.K.'s Executive Committee, with a vision that the Society would be an ideal vehicle for him to guide Chinese elites and exert impact on China through literary work because, as he put it:

The generosity of the foreign communities in China and at home has repeatedly been shown in response to appeals for the famine relief; but when through ignorance many of the preventable causes of these famines are not removed, there is a growing feeling that the best way of helping China is to give such kind of enlightenment as this Society attempts to give.⁷⁵⁰

He held this position for the next 25 years until his retirement in 1915.

4.3.1 S.D.K. Output and Responses from Chinese Elites

In October 1891, Richard became the S.D.K.'s full-time General-Secretary. He was now the only member entirely set apart for literary work.⁷⁵¹ Believing that the literary method was far more effective in securing a good understanding of Christianity and Westernization among Chinese people,⁷⁵² Richard suggested four great beneficial policies, namely, Yangmin (Yang-min 养民; to improve people's lives); Jiaomin (Chiao-min 教民; to enlighten people's minds); Anmin (An-min 安民; to maintain people's peace); and Xinmin (Hsing-min 兴民; to guarantee people's civil rights), to

⁷⁵⁰Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), pp.220-221.

⁷⁵¹The other missionaries with the S.D.K. were involved only on a part-time basis. Dr. Young J. Allen was employed as the Principle of the Anglo-Chinese College in Shanghai; therefore, he was able to devote only his spare time to the monthly periodical. Dr. Ernst Faber had become a student of the Chinese classics and was employed full-time as a translator at the Arsenal in Fuzhou (Foochow). He could provide only occasional contributions for publication.

⁷⁵²Timothy Richard, "The Crisis in China and How to Meet It," *Chinese Recorder* XIX, no. 2 (1898), p.81.

introduce Western culture and civilization related to the modernization of China.⁷⁵³ Till the end of his first three-year tenure, Richard wrote paper reviews for magazines, newspapers, books, and pamphlets on the mercy of God to mankind, on the influence of Christianity on Western civilization, on Christian reforms for improving traditional culture, on the witnesses of conversions of non-Christian people, and on the ways to support the motherland through the development of natural resources and railways.⁷⁵⁴

His outcomes included, but were not limited to: providing a series of books and pamphlets to show the bearing of educational and religious development in industries and trade and in every department of national progress; stimulating the interest of the Chinese in enlightenment by making use of lectures, museums, reading-rooms; opening depots for the sale of S.D.K. publications in centers where the civil service examinations were administered, which happened to be in all provincial capitals; securing cooperation with the Chinese in order to get them to form reform societies; advertising the S.D.K.'s aims and purposes at every examination where the best schoolmasters of every distant village attended in order to make S.D.K.'s influence felt in every nook of the Empire.⁷⁵⁵

In his new position, Richard was devoted to his mission work for his purpose of manifesting what he believed were God's benefits to the world in all aspects of life, such as: modern education, industrialization, military and political strengthening. His contributions helped many Chinese to enhance their knowledge of the West, civilization, modern social systems, and to eliminate forms of ignorance like illiteracy, opium use,

⁷⁵³The "four great beneficial policies" provided the theme of a book written by Richard which the S.D.K. published in 1892 entitled *Zhong Xi Si Da Zheng* (Chun-His Ssu-ta Cheng, *Four great policies for China and the West*).

⁷⁵⁴Timothy Richard, "The Crisis in China and How to Meet It," *Chinese Recorder* XIX, no. 2 (1898), p.82.

⁷⁵⁵Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), pp.218-222.

mass poverty, official corruption, religious persecution, and prejudice against foreigners. Such benefits were necessary for 44,036 Chinese elites in total, consisting of high examiners, educational inspectors, professors of colleges, and a small percentage of the literati, along with some of the ladies and children of their families.⁷⁵⁶ Before Richard, there had been no designs in China about modern communications, railways, mining constructions, rationalization of fiscal and tax systems, and so on.

In fact, Richard's work through the S.D.K. received intense response from Chinese people. For example, Richard designed, edited, and translated, from 1892 onwards, a series of publications related to the social reforms that had been set in place in Western countries, including translating *The Nineteenth Century: A History*, written by Robert Mackenzie (1823-1881), a Scottish journalist from Dundee. The original was published in England in 1880, celebrating Western progress and achievements in culture, science, technology, enlightenment, and democracy.⁷⁵⁷ In the author's consideration, human history is a record of progress—a record of accumulating knowledge and increasing wisdom, of continual advancement from a lower to a higher platform of intelligence and well-being.⁷⁵⁸ The book mainly described the history of the 19th century of the world, especially European and American history. It depicted the history of human beings as a record of progress which developed from a barbarous, ignorant and uncivilized situation to an unprecedented scientific, enlightened, and democratic level. The author especially

⁷⁵⁶ Timothy Richard, "The Awakening of China and the Duty of the Home Church," In *The Baptist World Congress: London, July 11-19, 1905: Authorised Record of Proceedings*, ed. J. H. Shakespeare (London: Baptist Union Publication Department, 1905), p. 223. Also see Richard V. Pierard, *Baptists Together in Christ, 1905-2005* (Falls Church, VA: Baptist World Alliance, 2005), pp. 29-30.

⁷⁵⁷ For a discussion of Mackenize's *The Nineteenth Century, A History*, see R. G. Collingwood, *The Idea of History* (Lodon, Oxford, and New York: Oxford University Press, 1967), p.145.

⁷⁵⁸ Liu Yajun, "Timothy Richard and the Translation of Mackenize's *The Nineteenth Century, A History*," *Journal of Hebei Normal University* (Philosophy and Social Sciences Edition) no. 6, (2004), p.120. 刘雅军, "李提摩太与《泰西新史揽要》的译介", 《河北师范大学学报》, 2004年, 第6期, 第120页。

emphasized how European countries became strong and prosperous through political and economic reforms.

The translation of this work was published in 1895, along with a detailed introduction of Richard's observations on China's situation.⁷⁵⁹ This book was so welcomed as to make its way into the Forbidden City where it was read to the Emperor by his tutor Sun Jianai.⁷⁶⁰ By taking advantage of the translation, Richard espoused and lauded Western achievements in science, technology, and democracy; importantly, he postulated that the real strength of Western civilization came from its Judeo-Christian theological underpinnings.⁷⁶¹

In fact, the perception of civilization as hinging on Christianity was not new, because world-wide expansion of modern civilization was always accompanied by the spread of Christianity.⁷⁶² The first case happened before 500 A.D. when the growth of the Graeco-Roman civilization spread Christianity around the shores of the Mediterranean. Before the end of the 16th century, the Christian era, Matteo Ricci introduced Western achievements in science and technology to China through evangelization, featured by the infusion of Chinese Confucianism into Christianity. In Richard's era, Christianity-rooted western civilization appeared to draw into its net all other surviving civilizations as well. Civilization brought about not only an immeasurable improvement in the conditions of secular lives, but also individuals' spiritual progress. In the mind of liberal Christians like Richard, all of the development

⁷⁵⁹Robert Mackenzie, *The Nineteen Century: A History* (London: Thomas Nelson & Sons, 1909). Richard was reading this book in 1891 while he was in Tianjin as an editor of *Shi Bao*. He began to translate the book into Chinese in 1892, and finally published it through the S.D.K. in 1894.

⁷⁶⁰Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.256.

⁷⁶¹*Ibid.*, p.122.

⁷⁶²A. Toynbee, and D. C. Somervell, *Christianity and Civilization*, in: *Civilization on Trial, and the World and the West* (Washington: World Publishing Company 1964), pp.198-220.

in Western societies were the achievements brought about by God's mercy and love, which should be shared by the whole world. In particular, science and technology were regarded as the representative of Western civilization, and could yield the greatest returns on salvation in the expansion of Christianity.

But in China, Buddhism was the popular religion, which had been introduced into China around 67 A.D. after it had spread from India. It had lasted for 1800 years before Richard arrived on Chinese soil. As an imported religion, it was so successful that its teachings had attracted numerous Chinese adherents, who had been patrons of numerous temples built everywhere in China. However, after visiting Buddhist places, Richard found Buddhist activities were corrupt, degenerate, antithetical, ignorant, and idolatrous.⁷⁶³ These perceived deviations from the Christian doctrines made religious societies descend into factions, and made some people superstitious, parochial, hypocritical and xenophobic. These factors, many believed, were the main reason why there were cultural conflicts⁷⁶⁴ and why China was weak and needed to be strengthened.⁷⁶⁵

Richard's work aroused the interest of his missionary colleagues and prompted them to publish papers on as many as 70 topics such as: the post office, immortality, light, sound, agricultural chemistry, rulers and princes, statesmen traveling abroad, the press, national uniform taxation, the new birth in Christianity, sulfuric acid, modern

⁷⁶³Timothy Richard, XXII. Wanted: Good Samaritans for China, in *Conversion by the Million in China: Being Biographies and Articles*, vol.2, (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907), pp.28-59.

⁷⁶⁴Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), P.299.

⁷⁶⁵*Ibid.*, p.123.

education.⁷⁶⁶ The publications spread over main cities in north China like Beijing, Tianjin, Shenyang (Mukden 奉天), Nanjing, and Yantai.

In March 1894, Richard published a circular entitled *How to Multiply Trade in China*.⁷⁶⁷ This circular specifically linked economic development with educational reform. In late Qing China, the highest authority in education was the Educational Association of China. It had a subdivision named the Educational Department of the Chinese Recorder. This Department extracted parts of Richard's circular and published them as a reform plan divided into three aspects: Curriculum, an Examination System, and Funding.⁷⁶⁸ The plan suggested to constitute a Board of Modern Education to supervise the reform under the joint leadership of the Zongli Yamen and Sir Robert Hart, both of who would be responsible "to develop the vast resources of the empire and to further the best interests of China in every possible way by means of modern education."⁷⁶⁹ It also recommended education in classical Chinese culture and in Western subjects, such as Universal History, Physical Sciences, Political Economy, Commerce, Industry, and Mathematics. In addition, it proposed the abolition of the traditional examination system which had lasted for hundreds of years. In addition, it advised that the Board would appoint examiners on Western subjects, and that degrees⁷⁷⁰ would be issued to those distinguished students who attained proficiency in

⁷⁶⁶Timothy Richard, "Letter to the Editor of the Chinese Recorder-S.D.K.," *Chinese Recorder* 23 (1892), pp.237-238.

⁷⁶⁷This scheme was published as "A Practical Plan for Education" and attributed to Richard. See *Chinese Recorder* 25 (1894), p.255.

⁷⁶⁸Paul J. Bailey, *Reform the People: Changing Attitudes towards Popular Education in Early Twentieth-Century China*, (Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1990), pp.31-37.

⁷⁶⁹*Ibid.*

⁷⁷⁰There were three major degrees; only the successful candidates in the lowest of the three could sit for the second, and only those who had passed the second could enroll for the third. For each degree many more were examined than could be passed. When the government was short of funds some degrees could be purchased, but no such prestige was attached to degrees acquired in this fashion as to those awarded

the learning of Chinese and/or Western subjects. More important, it recommended running a new Funding Base for this educational reform. The base was to be composed of two financial sources: (1) 1% of the foreign customs' revenue; and (2) the surplus of an indemnity returned by the US to China, which China had paid to the US as a compensation for losses suffered by US citizens in China. While the first source was to be guaranteed by Hart, the second one was designed by Richard himself.⁷⁷¹

Richard's voice, through the S.D.K., became widespread among Chinese elites, especially with respect to those topics relevant to science and reform, progress of mankind, general principles underlying international relations, practical measures to avert future calamities in China, and cultural assimilation. He knew very well that it was the Chinese elites who "... hold the key to hearts of the masses;"⁷⁷² if their minds were closed to Christianity due to prejudice and ignorance, he believed that any attempt to modernize China by means of spreading Western civilization in the Kingdom of God would never have a chance.⁷⁷³

As a foreigner, Richard continuously and systematically presented recommendations for China's renaissance through the S.D.K. Due to his perseverance, Richard received rewards from 1894 onward. For example, Zhang Zhidong donated 1,000 taels

through competitive channels. The first degree to acquired was Xiucai (hsiu-tsai 秀才), meaning *Flowering talent* (equivalent to B.A.). The second degree was Juren (chu-jen 举人), meaning *a recommended man*. The highest degree was the Jinshi (chin-shin 进士), *a presented scholar*.

⁷⁷¹The surplus American indemnity perhaps resulted from that imposed on China for the loss of life and property during the Tianjin Massacre of 1870 during which American churches were among the four other structures burned besides a French orphanage and cathedral. Then again, it could be for the loss of life and property during the violent outbreaks in the early 1890s (Hsü, *The Rise of Modern China*, p. 301). Most likely possibility was, however, the Chinese indemnity fund held by the U.S.A for losses sustained 1844-1858. By 1884 all the claims had been paid, and there remained a surplus in excess of \$200 thousand with its earning of another \$340 thousand. For details, see: Senate Committee on Foreign Relations, *Chinese Indemnity Fund* (48th Congress: 2nd Session, 1885), S. Rept. 1190, p.3.

⁷⁷²Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.254.

⁷⁷³BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 5 March 1896.

that year; in 1901, Zhang officially allocated \$3,000 to buy the Rev. J. Lambert Rees's three-volume set, *Ancient and Medieval History of the World*. Rees was from the London Mission Society, and had been a translator of Gotthold E. Lessing's remarkable essay on *The Education of the Human Race*. Richard published the Chinese translation and sent a copy to Zhang in 1894. Zhang was highly interested in the topic and hoped to read a work on the history of the whole world. Rees's three-volume-study was thus translated and published by S.D.K. in 1900. It was the most extensive book about world history that China possessed at that time. In addition, Daotai Nie, an official in Shandong, donated 1,000 taels in 1902; and, after becoming the Governor of Zhejiang, he urged local officials and gentry to buy S.D.K. publications worth of 1,600 taels.⁷⁷⁴ What is more, Hanbury uninterruptedly supported the essay competitions year after year. Conspicuously, both the S.D.K. readership and its membership increased: by 1897 there were 69 members most of whom were government officials from US and Great Britain, plus some businessmen, educational missionaries, as well as five Chinese and three women.

The S.D.K. became so strong and influential that a number of obvious changes emerged in Chinese society.⁷⁷⁵ Many members of the elite accepted visions different from that of traditional Confucianism. For example, in the provincial Juren examinations, officials posed candidates questions different from those based only on Chinese literature to those on Rees's book. Richard and his colleagues in the S.D.K. were also considered by Chinese officialdom as wise, unbiased advisors. For this reason,

⁷⁷⁴Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.223.

⁷⁷⁵*Tenth Annual Report of the S.D.K. for the Year Ending October 31, 1897* (Shanghai: Shanghai Mercury Office, 1897).

Zhang invited Richard to meet him three times in 1895 to discuss China's precarious situation and institutional reform. Richard suggested that peace in China was necessary before any reform could take place, and that reform rested upon right education. His ideas included:⁷⁷⁶

1. That China should grant some foreign Power absolute authority to settle all the foreign relations of China for a definite term of years.
2. That the same Power should introduce reforms of all kinds.
3. That one representative of this Power should control each department of railways, mines, industries, etc.
4. That all Chinese ranks be conferred by the Chinese Emperor as before.
5. That at the end of the term this Power should hand back to China all its assets and liabilities.

In spite of Richard's unwavering voice advocating reform, the Chinese reformers had different voices. They can be categorized in roughly three groups. Some Chinese officials and scholars viewed Richard's ideas at most as a "consonant" tone from a foreigner amidst the dominant Self-Strengthening "music", though some suggestions were deemed valuable and linked to military improvement, such as the railway construction.⁷⁷⁷ Those who belonged to this group at no time considered any fundamental, far-reaching, or long term reforms but only seemed concerned with solving the problems at hand. For example, in the famine period, their interest was limited to projects or suggestions whose purpose was to relieve the immediate effects and hardships caused by the disaster. These people showed little interest in the aspects of Richard's work which called for a national revival, and, either intentionally or unintentionally, neglected Richard's larger and more sweeping proposals. There may be

⁷⁷⁶Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.235.

⁷⁷⁷Wang Lixin, *Ameircan Missionaries and the Modernization of China in the late Qing* (Tianjin: Tianjin People Press, 1997), p.335. 王立新, 《美国传教士和晚清中国现代化》, 天津: 天津人民出版社, 1997年, 第335页。

two results for their approach. First, their reluctance may have originated from the hostility of the conservative Court to all foreigners and all kinds of missionary activities because of China's national humiliation engendered by repeated defeats against the West. A second explanation might have to do with suspicions and prejudices regarding Richard's profound analysis on China's situation. This may have led them to misunderstand the essence of Richard's reform ideas and to interpret them as having no other motivation than that of Christianization.

Another group did make use of Richard's lectures and/or publications to broaden their vision of Western civilization. This group was mainly composed of scholars who were patriots, but who were without any bureaucratic powers or financial resources. They were brought up in a traditional Confucian environment, and worried about the fate and future of China. Due to educational and cultural limitations, it was impossible for them to suggest by cogent and feasible reform strategies. They saw Richard's reforms as the best medicine to treat China's sickness. They therefore made use of every chance to spread Richard's practical viewpoints. Wang Tao was such an example.⁷⁷⁸ Wang was an editor of the *Hong Kong News* from 1862. He had visited Scotland in 1867 and helped, James Legge, for two years, translate the Chinese Classics. His experience in Europe made him open-minded about benefitting from the advantages of Western culture and education. After returning to China, he was concerned about the Great Famine, and hoped to see a real national reform not limited to the military field. After reading Richard's articles in *Wan Guo Gong Bao*, Wang borrowed several ideas from Richard and published them to advocate reforms in all fields, such as establishing a

⁷⁷⁸Wang Lixin, *American Missionaries and the Modernization of China in the late Qing* (Tianjin: Tianjin People Press, 1997), p.335. 王立新, 《美国传教士和晚清中国现代化》, 天津: 天津人民出版社, 1997年, 第335页。

parliamentary government in China, preventing future Famines via industrialization like running mines and textile mills, setting up steamers, railways, and telegraph lines, and, developing a strong navy. He described a key concept in Chinese Taoism, that of the *Dao* (Tao 道; way, truth), as one of the Western principles which should be enriched and developed in the East. He urged the Chinese people to learn all about Western culture, including its laws, justice systems, politics, and democratic processes. At the same time, he criticized the traditional Qing bureaucratic system, the corruption in the administration, such as the existence of sinecure posts at all levels of the government, and the unreasonable distribution of financial budgets among all departments of the country, e.g., with over 50% used for military purposes.⁷⁷⁹

There was also a special group of people composed of eminent reformers and the Qing Court, even the Guangxu Emperor (Kuang-hsu 光绪) and his close subordinates. Theoretically, they might be the most powerful Chinese elites who were in a position to exert decisive influence on the policy, both directly and indirectly. The eminent reformers in this group included the Hanlin scholar Kang Youwei (K'ang Yu-wei 康有为) and his disciple Liang Qichao (Leung Chi-tso 梁启超). Kang was the chief reform advocate who was appreciated by the Emperor. These people were in favor of Richard's reforms and accepted his proposals for China's modernization.

⁷⁷⁹*Ibid.*, pp.437-444.

4.3.2 Influence on Emperor's Reform

From 1861 China initiated the Self-Strengthening Movement. Until 1894, China's military force had been more powerful than that of Japan. With respect to warships and equipment, for example, China's total tonnage was 10-20 times more than that of Japan. However, in the Sino-Japanese war in 1894-1895, China was defeated. On 17 April 1895, the Treaty of Shimonoseki was signed. It was the most unequal treaty among all the 343 signed since the Treaty of Nanking, had been signed in 1842. It was a treaty between China and foreign countries which (1840-1949), entrenched more deeply China's status as a semi-colonial society.⁷⁸⁰

The defeat in the war marked the failure and termination of the Self-Strengthening Movement, and also led to Li Hongzhang's removal from his position, that of a famous Chinese prime minister, diplomat, and military commander, and also the founder and the commander of the Qing navy (the Beiyang Fleet). The defeat forced Chinese people, from the Emperor to civilians, to consider the reasons of the failure. Some open-minded elites finally recognized that Japan owed its victory to the reformed political system that had emerged during the Meiji Reformation. Naturally, they were confronted with the fact that, rather than military modernization, a parallel political reform and institutional renovation was crucial for China's survival and even to allow China to catch up with the West. However, all were at a loss as to how they could implement such profound changes.

Concerned with this problem, there emerged three groups of people who viewed reforms differently: the Conservatives, the Moderates, and the Radicals. The

⁷⁸⁰Hou Zhongjun, *Unequal Treaties in Modern China* (Shanghai: Shanghai Bookstore Publishing House, 2012), pp.20-33. 侯中军, 《近代中国的不平等条约》, 上海: 上海书店出版社, 2012 年, 第 20-33 页。

Conservatives were represented by the powerful Empress Dowager, Cixi, surrounded mostly by conservative military ministers and officers in the Qing Court. This group of people hoped to instigate and take advantage of the Boxer Movement to incite a nationalist and anti-foreigner uprising.

The second group was composed of high-level intellectuals, officials, and leaders, representing the largest portion of the Chinese elite, for example, Li Hongzhang, Zhang Zhidong, and other top-level members in the Court such as the Emperor's tutors. These people, on the one hand, hoped to carry out a political reform for a real strengthening of China; on the other hand, they hoped to preserve traditional Chinese culture, dominated by Confucianism and Han-Buddhism, as the foundation of the country. They insisted that the culture might need new ingredients, but should be by no means replaced. The essence of this ideology was an extension of Zhang Zhidong's vision of Chinese learning as the fundamental structure, while Western learning should be reserved for practical use. The vision opposed Christianization and called for adherence to traditional Chinese culture. Most people in this group supported the powerful Empress so as to preserve their professional and political status. However, in their aims to strengthen China, they were in favor of the reform-minded but powerless Emperor. As two of the most important officers in the Court, Li and Zhang, like some other officials, frequently met with scholars and intellectuals for solutions to China's problems during those years. Unfortunately, based on a conservative ideology, most of these people were unable to provide satisfactory answers, even including those scholars who had returned from

Japan or other countries with new knowledge of Western culture or a new spirit of nationalism.⁷⁸¹

The last group consisted mainly of Chinese literati surrounding the Emperor, Guangxu. Most of them were from the Hanlin Academy. They wished to strengthen China through a complete and thorough social reform.⁷⁸² The primary leader of this group was Kang Youwei, an elder Hanlin scholar, a prominent political reformer, a well-known thinker, and a noted scholar calligrapher, who was described as “the modern sage of China.” Among scholars, Kang proposed unusual considerations on reform. He suggested the establishment of a constitutional monarchy, and he proposed that Confucianism was not different from Christianity.⁷⁸³ He even went so far as to advocate the adoption of Christianity as a national religion.⁷⁸⁴

When the unequal *Treaty of Shimonoseki* was signed, the imperial civil service examination was in progress in Beijing. The news reached the candidates and drew reactions from them. Only five days after the signature, Kang drew up a 10,000-word petition which was signed by more than 1300 scholars. The letter was presented to the Throne on 2 May 1895,⁷⁸⁵ requesting that the “Emperor should immediately take steps for reform.” The lines they advocated were the same as those laid down by the S.D.K.

⁷⁸¹Timothy Richard, “The China Problem from the Missionary Standpoint,” In *Conversion by the Million in China* (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907), Vol. 2, pp. 223-233.

⁷⁸²S. Eddy, *Pathfinders of the World Missionary Crusade* (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1945), p.186.

⁷⁸³Zhao Chunchen, “KangYou-wei, Liang Qi-chao and Christianity around 1898 Reform,” *Shan Tou University Journal* (Humanities) 8, no. 1 (1992), pp.24-32. 赵春晨, “戊戌变法前后康有为、梁启超与基督教”, 《汕头大学学报》, 1992 年第 1 期, 第 24-32 页。

⁷⁸⁴William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), p.233.

⁷⁸⁵The letter did not received by the Emperor finally, because it was only one of the hundreds of letters that day to the Emperor and no records showed Guangxu received based on the diary of Weng Tonghe (Weng T'ung-ho 翁同和), the Emperor's tutor.

publications.⁷⁸⁶ The event was well-known in China as *Gongche Shangshu* (Kung-ch'e Shang-shu 公车上书 Memorial to the Emperor by Literati).⁷⁸⁷ The case exposed that through the S.D.K, Richard's "influence on the Reform Movement was undoubtedly important."⁷⁸⁸ His modernization design encouraged Chinese reformers.⁷⁸⁹ According to the Protestant writer, G. Owen, Kang admitted that "I owe my conversion and reform and my knowledge of reform chiefly to the writings of ... the Rev. Timothy Richard, agent of the English Baptist Society."⁷⁹⁰

At this time, Richard's translation of Mackenzie's *The Nineteenth Century: A History* was published by S.D.K. In the preface, Richard pointed out that merely achieving military supremacy over other countries would do little to solve real problems in a country; China should seek an effective, comprehensive reform to upgrade the Self-Strengthening movement for modernization by expanding the traditional education to Western learning, sending students to study abroad, constructing railways and steamers, and improving technologies like communications with telephones and telegraphs, so as to virtually get rid of the backwardness in the "kingdom of God", because it was only "He" who was breaking down the barriers between all the nations in the world via a worldwide modernization which made it possible for human beings to live in peace and happiness as brethren of one family. Richard insisted that China had to take advantage of the achievements of Western civilization under God's benevolence to reach its goal

⁷⁸⁶ *Ibid.*, p.252.

⁷⁸⁷ Li Jianping, Study on Kang Youwei's education ideology (Shenyang: Liaoning Education Press), 1997, pp.82-85. 李剑萍, 《康有为教育思想研究》, 沈阳: 辽宁教育出版社, 1997, 第 82-85 页.

⁷⁸⁸ L. Thompson, *Ta T'ung Shu: The One-World Philosophy of Kang Youwei* (London: Routledge, 1958), p.24.

⁷⁸⁹ S. Eddy, *Pathfinders of the World Missionary Crusade* (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1945), p.186.

⁷⁹⁰ G. Owen, "The Recent Church Reform Movement in China," address given at the Central Presbyterian Church, New York City, 30 April 1900, and printed in *Ecumenical Missionary Conference*, Vol. I, pp.549-552.

of modernization. He expressed the view clearly that the Qing Court's continual refusal of Christianity and its obstruction to prevent China's modernization caused repeated wars, humiliations, and indemnities. But he predicted optimistically that "if this attitude was changed, China might still become one of the greatest nations on earth." Richard pointed out that the key for China was not a well-armed, Westernized military force, but a non-corrupt, democratic government, an effective and efficient administration system, an unprejudiced and well-designed diplomacy, as well as a nationally-conscious population free of poverty.⁷⁹¹

Richard's sincere analysis and advice overwhelmed the entire Qing Court and all the reform-minded Chinese elites.⁷⁹² After its publication, the book became so popular that no less than six pirated editions were on sale, and a million copies were in circulation throughout China.⁷⁹³ Most Chinese officials and scholars, even the Emperor Guangxu, as well as his personal advisor and one of his tutors, Sun Jianai (Sun Chia-nai 孙家鼐, 1827-1909), read the book with deep considerations about China's future.⁷⁹⁴ Though off his position, Li Hongzhang invited Richard to Beijing to educate Hanlin scholars on China's imperative need for social reforms so as to avoid further calamities throughout the Empire, and meeting with his successor, Weng Tonghe (Weng T'ung-ho 翁同和, 1830-1904), one of the Emperor's tutor and soon the Prime Minister of the Court, and Prince Gong, the uncle of the Guangxu Emperor.⁷⁹⁵ In September 1895,

⁷⁹¹Timothy Richard, "The China Problem from the Missionary Standpoint," In *Conversion by the Million in China* (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907), Vol. 2, pp. 223-233.

⁷⁹²Wang Shuhuai, *The Foreigners and the Reform of 1898* (Taipei: National Taiwan University Press, 1965), pp.33-122. 王树槐, 《外人与戊戌变法》, 台北: 台湾大学出版社, 1965 年, 第 33-122 页。

⁷⁹³Liu Yajun, "Timothy Richard and His Translation of Nineteenth Century: A History," *Journal of Hebei Normal University* (Philosophy and Social Sciences Edition), no. 6 (2004), pp.119-124.

⁷⁹⁴V. Purcell, *The Boxer Uprising: A Background Study* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1963), pp.115-116.

⁷⁹⁵BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Mary Martin Richard, 25 May 1901.

Richard visited Li Hongzhang on three different occasions in Beijing, and met Kang on 17 October 1895. In response to Richard's advice that China's regeneration should begin with the reform of higher education, Kang set up a Reform Society called Higher Learning Society, with its Chinese name as Qiang Xuehui (Ch'iang Hsüeh-hui 强学会). The Society included some members from the Office of Military Secrets of the late Qing Court. It had three branches, in Hangzhou (Hangzhou 杭州), Nanjing, and Wuchang.⁷⁹⁶ The Society ran a newspaper at first entitled *Wang Guo Gong Bao*, the same name as that of Richard's S.D.K. magazine [later changed to *Zhongwai Jiwen* (Chung-wai Chiwen 中外纪闻; News from China and the West) in order to avoid the press censorship of the Qing Court. In Shanghai there also developed a Junior Reform Society.⁷⁹⁷

In the same year, Kang's Society published its first issue of the newspaper, reprinting S.D.K.'s publications on Western culture and civilization. Following Issues introduced Richard's *Xinxue Huibian*, edited by one of Kang's disciples, Liang Qichao (1873-1929). The Guang-xu Emperor read about 89 issues of the newspaper. Liang was an editor of *Shiwu Bao* (Shih-wu Pao 时务报; Chinese Progress), a newspaper of the Reform Society in Shanghai. Liang was so attracted by Richard's reform ideology that he volunteered to serve as Richard's personal secretary when Richard was in Beijing from October 1895 to February 1896.⁷⁹⁸ Influenced by Richard, Liang adhered to a doctrine that "all roads lead from the Kang-yang⁷⁹⁹ of the Three Ages to Science,

⁷⁹⁶Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), pp.253-254.

⁷⁹⁷S. Eddy, *Pathfinders of the World Missionary Crusade* (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1945), pp.253-254.

⁷⁹⁸*Ibid.*, p.255.

⁷⁹⁹Kang-yang, also expressed as Gongyang (公羊学说) is a school or theory in Spring-autumn period. The gist of the *Gongyang Comentary*, in their view, was that the ultimate in societal advancement. In the

democracy and peace.”⁸⁰⁰ In 1897, Liang became the president of Reform College located at Changsha (Chang-sha 长沙), the capital of Hunan, and a year later he returned to Beijing as the director of the Society’s Translation Department.

In October, Richard also met one of the Emperor’s tutors, Sun Jianai, several times. Sun told Richard that he had been reading *The Nineteenth Century: A History* to the Emperor every day for two months; and the Emperor was so impressed by the S.D.K.’s literary work that he purchased as many as 129 missionaries’ publications, including the Holy Bible.⁸⁰¹ Due to Richard’s intelligence and personality, Sun, on three different occasions, offered him “the position of President of Peking University, as it was thought Dr. Martin, the former President, had left China for good.”⁸⁰² Richard declined the offer and instead recommended Dr. John Fryer, a translator at the Government Arsenal in Shanghai for many years. We note here that, though Richard was concerned with the speed, content, and outcome of the reform, he fully expected that a virtual change required at least a twenty-year period before any obvious effects would follow from the development of modern education. He thus “had no desire to be mixed up in merely political affairs. He asked to be excused, unless the club (author notes: Reform Club) was meant to be a real power for the service of China, that is, not a centre for intrigue.”⁸⁰³

historical scheme put forward by Gongyang school which include disorder to ascending peace to great peace, which is call the “three ages”.

⁸⁰⁰V. Purcell, *The Boxer Uprising: A Background Study* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1963), p.114.

⁸⁰¹Henry Blair Gray, *The Educational Reform in China* (Hongkong: Kelly & Walsh, Ltd., 1911), p.46.

⁸⁰²Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.257.

⁸⁰³William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), p.224.

On 26 October, Richard met Weng who was accompanied by an official of Zongli Yamen. They discussed religious liberty. Richard suggested that religious liberty for all faiths should replace ignorance and superstition among officials, so as to eradicate the root of religious persecution, particularly against the Christians. He added that educational reforms were thus necessary to enlighten officials to renounce ignorance and superstition. Richard presented Weng with two documents. One of them was a memorial of Religious Riots that had broken out in Hunan, Hubei, Sichuan (Szechuan 四川), Shanxi, Gansu (Kan-su 甘肃), Guizhou (Kuei-chou 贵州), Shaanxi (Shan-hsi 陕西), and Fujian (Fu-chien 福建).⁸⁰⁴ The material listed ample and concrete proof which convinced Weng of the fact that it was Chinese officials who had stirred up the riots and massacred foreigners, and what a kind of social reforms should be adopted in China on the basis of his pamphlet of *Present Needs*, the collection of *Xinxue Huibian*, the translated book of *Taixi Xinshi Lanyao*, and the coauthored monograph of *Shishi Xinlun*. Weng was persuaded by Richard's argument and was now himself convinced that Richard's reform design was appropriate for a new China.⁸⁰⁵ On Weng's request, Richard submitted later a proposal composed of four reforms: Educational Reform, Economic Reform, Internal and International Peace, and Spiritual Regeneration, along with several suggestions such as the appointment of foreign advisors to the Throne, the establishment of imperial finances, the opening of mines and factories, building up an adequate army and navy, and so on.⁸⁰⁶ Specifically for Educational Reform, Richard

⁸⁰⁴Timothy Richard, "Riots," In *China Mission Hand-Book* (Ameican Presbyterian Mission Press, 1896), p.92.

⁸⁰⁵BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Eleanor Richard, 24 January 1896.

⁸⁰⁶Chen Qingsheng, "The Nature of S.D.K. and its relationship with 1898 Reform," *Journal of Historical Science* 10 (1958), pp.10-12. 陈庆升, "广学会的性质及其与维新运动的关系", 《史学月刊》, 1958年, 第10期, 第10-12页。

proposed to establish a Board of Education that would oversee the creation of modern schools and colleges throughout the Empire. This was a reiteration of the idea he had first proposed in his 1894 Circular in which he had described educational reform as the basis for economic prosperity. The proposal was reviewed in the following months by the Zongli Yamen and then approved by the Emperor.⁸⁰⁷

On 30 October Richard was interviewed by Prince Gong, the President of Zongli Yamen, along with his seven subordinates. Gong was an imperious man who often showed his contempt and disdain for Christians as if they were the refuse of China. In a deft and frank talk, but with a respectful manner to the Prince, Richard appealed to Gong's sense of justice to urge that the same liberty be granted to Christianity as to other religions in China.⁸⁰⁸ In a few days, the Throne sanctioned the Memorial and "instructed the Foreign Office to confer with the missionaries until the matter was settled, and at the beginning of December two of the Zongli Yamen members assured us that an edict would shortly be issued, granting the requests in the Memorial."⁸⁰⁹ In addition, Richard heard that Gong admitted Richard's literary work was *very useful to China* in a talk with a Russian Minister.⁸¹⁰

In summer 1896, Richard returned to England. He submitted to the London BMS Committee a box, filled with his Chinese publications, bound annual editions of the *Review of the Times* and *Missionary Review*, and the *Shibao*, as well as an edition of the New Testament presented to the Empress Dowager in honor of her 60th birthday. During

⁸⁰⁷Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.248.

⁸⁰⁸Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.249.

⁸⁰⁹BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Mary Martin Richard, 6 February 1896.

⁸¹⁰William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), p.215.

his furlough, he focused on finding qualified personnel for translation work and other literary work for the S.D.K., and on informing various business and government leaders in London about China's awakening and its new development.⁸¹¹ Specifically, he gave a speech to the Secretaries of various mission organizations on the need of personnel devoted solely to literary work in China. The content of his speech was published in the *Chinese Recorder* after he returned to China at the end of 1897.⁸¹²

When Richard was still on furlough in 1897, his Chinese version of Mackenzie's *The Nineteenth Century* and Allen's monumental eight-volume book in Chinese, *The History of the War between China and Japan*, became fashionable in China and shocked readers across the Empire.⁸¹³ In his book, Allen analyzed China's conflict with Japan and added two supplements: one was a four-volume list which contained telegrams issued and received by Li Hongzhang during the Sino-Japanese war; and the other was a two-volume literary work entitled *The Importance of Educational Reforms*.⁸¹⁴ Copies of the two books were sent to the Emperor and high officials for their reference as the key sources to explain China's defeat. The two books, along with other S.D.K.'s products, established a high reputation of the Society among Chinese elites. The S.D.K.'s literary work helped to revitalize a rapidly developing reform movement in only a few years after the decline of the Self-Strengthening one.

⁸¹¹Timothy Richard, *The Crisis in China and How to Meet it* (London: Baptist Missionary Society, March 1897); Timothy Richard, *Prospectus of a Society for Aiding China to Fall in With Right Principles of Universal Progress* (London: Baptist Missionary Society, July 1897).

⁸¹²The article was published under the same title as the pamphlet published by the B.M.S.: Timothy Richard, "The Crisis in China, and How to Meet It," *Chinese Recorder* 29 (1898), pp.78-87. After the pamphlet was written, efforts were made to secure the cooperation of British and American Societies. According to Richard in a P.S. to the articles in the *Chinese Recorder*, "[a]t present there are three British Societies, three American and one German Society co-operation"(87).

⁸¹³Book Review, "History of the War between China and Japan," *North China Herald*, May 15, 1896, pp.754-755.

⁸¹⁴*Tenth Annual of S.D.K.*, p.7.

At the end of 1897, Richard returned to China and found new impetus for reform. For example, Allen was invited, though he refused, to take charge of a new university to be established in Shanghai. In response to draw up a Code of rules for a National System of Modern Education, Allen prepared an elaborate manuscript, based mainly on the system established by the British Government in India.⁸¹⁵ In addition, Liang Qichao, Richard's former secretary in Beijing and Kang Youwei's chief disciple, started a Chinese newspaper in Shanghai, *Chinese Progress*, which served as an organ of the Reform Party. This newspaper obtained strong support from Zhang Zhidong and other reform-minded literati. In addition, Liang was invited in 1897 to become the president of a Reform College in Changsha, the provincial capital of Hunan. This province was known for its intense anti-foreign and anti-Christian activities. Moreover, a Chinese Girls' School was to be built in Shanghai by the head of the Chinese Telegraph Administration and other reformers. All these were positive signs that China had begun to understand the inadequacy of the traditional education system for modern needs, and was now willing to establish a Westernized learning system. In Richard's eyes, all of these developments meant that Western learning had entered China in important ways and begun to influence intellectuals' minds.

In this year, the S.D.K. made a brilliant record in publishing:⁸¹⁶ An average of 3,300 copies of *Review of the Times* and 550 copies of *The Missionary Review* were distributed every month; Allen and Richard's books were reprinted; Richard's *Essays for the Times* and his *Reform Papers* remained available through the S.D.K.; the S.D.K. catalogue exceeded more than 100 publications; the growth of the S.D.K.'s publishing

⁸¹⁵Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.260.

⁸¹⁶*Tenth Annual Report of S.D.K.*, pp.4-17.

sale increased from \$817.99 in 1893 to \$5,899.92 by 1896, and exceeded \$15,000 in 1897; the S.D.K.'s influence expanding to Korea; and, Li Hongzhang, Zhang Zhidong, and the General Director of the Railways, Sheng Xuanhuai (Sheng Hsüan-huai 盛宣怀, 1844-1916), all asked Allen and Cai to serve in the country's reform in various capacities, etc. We note here that because of the vast demands for Richard's and Allen's books, there were many pirated reprints available on the market. Offenders were even being brought before the Mixed Court in Shanghai and fined. Though the piracy caused a significant loss of income to the S.D.K., it reflected the huge demand for these publications among the public.

In February 1898, Kang's Reform Society published *Huangchao Jingshiwen Xinbian* (Huang-ch'ao Ching-shih-wen Hsin-pien 皇朝经世文新编; a New Collection of Tracts for the Times) in Shanghai.⁸¹⁷ This book was considered the most comprehensive and influential guide in the late Qing Dynasty to initiate a reform movement. It collected 580 essays and papers on reform, among which 31 by Richard, 38 by Kang, and 44 by Liang.⁸¹⁸ In his articles, Richard concentrated on introducing Western civilization, stressing the importance of modernization for China, and recapitalizing his reform design as expressed in his series of publications.⁸¹⁹ Soon after the publication of the *Collection*, a national political, cultural, and educational reform movement was undertaken by the young Guangxu Emperor in order to get rid of China's weaknesses as exposed in the Sino-Japanese War. On 11 June 1898, Guangxu ordered

⁸¹⁷Richard's essays were collected in *Huang Chao Qing Shi Wen Xian Bian*. Six essays were concerned with education and science, while 25 essays dealt with such economic matters as agriculture, industry, commerce, river conservancy, railways, and mines. 11 essays referred to the problems of famine and poverty, e.g., railroad construction, Employment for the idle, and so on.

⁸¹⁸William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), p.235.

⁸¹⁹V. Purcell, *The Boxer Uprising: A Background Study* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1963), p.114.

his first edict to make a sweeping social and institutional change. In the same month, Kang was appointed Secretary of the Zongli Yamen after seven memorials for reforms submitted to the Emperor in last 10 years. During the summer, Richard was asked to advise Kang “on measures of Reform.”⁸²⁰ Between June and September, the Emperor issued at least 40 edicts on education, governmental administration, industry, and international cultural exchange.

Richard received much respect in the reform movement. In addition to Kang and Liang, there were many other reformers who were influenced by Richard. Among them were Tan Sitong (T'an Ssu-t'ung 谭嗣同, 1865-1898), Liu Guangdi (Liu Kuang-ti 刘光弟, 1859-1898), Kang Guangren (K'ang Kuang-jen 康广仁, 1867-1898), Lin Xu (Lin Hsü 林旭, 1828-1898), Yang Rui (Yang Jui 杨锐, 1855-1898), and Yang Shenxiu (Yang Shen-hsiu 杨深秀, 1849-1898). All of these six young men were the members of the Reform Society. They read Richard's articles, books, and monographs, attended Richard's lectures, discussed with Richard face-to-face, and learned modernization from Richard. They are collectively known as the “Liu Junzi” (“Liu Chün-tzu 六君子”; “Six Gentlemen” or “Six Martyrs”).⁸²¹ In addition, there were many late-Qing officials who shared Richard's thoughts on reform, among whom were included the famous Huang Zunxian (Huang Tsun-hsien 黄遵宪, 1848-1905), Yan Fu (Yen Fu 严复, 1854-1921), and Wang Kangnian (Wang K'ang-nien 汪康年, 1860-1911). They were lucky to survive from the *coup d'état* and became the pioneers to follow Sun Zhongshan (Sun Yat-sen 孙中山, 1866-1925) and Yuan Shikai (Yüan Shih-k'ai 袁世凯, 1859-1916) in

⁸²⁰Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.263.

⁸²¹I. C.Y. Hsü, *The Rise of Modern China* (New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), p.379.

the establishment of the Republic of China in 1911. More impressively, Richard was considered so important to China that he was invited to go up to Peking as one of the Emperor's advisors on 21 September 1898.⁸²² Richard arrived in Beijing in mid-September.

However, these reformers, even the Emperor himself, did not realize the danger approaching them. Led by Empress Dowager Cixi, the group of conservative Manchu officials controlled the Court and military forces. These included Yikuang (I-k'uang 奕劻, 1838-1917), the grand Councillor who Victor Purcell described as friendly yet anti-foreign; Prince Gong, the president of the Military and Naval Forces who was a proud Lucifer (i.e., shining star); Ronglu (Jung-lu 荣禄, 1836-1903), the military Commander who was as uncivil as it was possible for him to be; and Li Lianying (Li Lien-ying 李莲英, 1848-1911), a notorious eunuch employed by the Empress. These top-level officials hoped to isolate China from the world in order to pass on their privileges generation after generation. Hampered by the old national conceit, they opposed any kind of reforms.⁸²³ On 20 September, only 104 days after Guangxu initiated the reform movement, a *coup d'état* (the *coup of 1898*) crushed the movement.

The situation quickly deteriorated. The Emperor was arrested; reformers and even some reform-minded officials were considered as bandits and rebels and were either executed without a trial, or arrested or expelled. Most seriously, all "Six Gentlemen" were killed in the *coup d'état*. This short-lived movement was historically named the

⁸²²Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), pp.267-68.

⁸²³Albert J. Garnier, *A Maker of Modern China* (London: Carey Press, 1945), p.64.

Hundred Day's Reform.⁸²⁴ On his way to the Forbidden City to meet the Emperor on the appointed date, Richard learned of the *coup d'état* on the previous day. As a foreigner endowed with certain privileges in China, he turned immediately to helping Kang, Liang, and a few reformers to escape successfully out of China to Japan. Otherwise, Kang would have been executed by the Empress.⁸²⁵ The political reform movement began in hope but ended in despair in 1898.⁸²⁶ However, it was one of the greatest events in modern China immediately after the Sino-Japanese war:⁸²⁷

The repercussions of the failure of 1898 were many and far-reaching. First, it proved that progressive reform from the top down was impossible. Secondly, under the empress dowager and die-hard conservatives who had returned to power, the court was totally incapable of leadership. Thirdly, an increasing number of the Chinese came to feel that their future lay in the complete overthrow of the Manchu dynasty, and that such an occurrence could not be realized by peacefully change, only a bloody revolution from below could effect it. Dr. Sun Zhongshan took the lead in promoting this approach.

After the Movement, all the reform edicts were rescinded, except that which established the Imperial University of Beijing, and several others to establish colleges in the provincial capitals. But Richard remained active about finding an alternative way to save China:⁸²⁸

The general outlook for the Manchus is dark as they do not seem to wish to know their danger or how to avert it. However, God reigns and the Chinese people are not forgotten by God whatever the Manchus may do. We must labor for China. Who knows, perhaps God has some new way of saving

⁸²⁴I. C.Y. Hsü, *The Rise of Modern China* (New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), p.373.

⁸²⁵Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.265.

⁸²⁶Meribeth E. Cameron, *The Reform Movement in China, 1898-1912* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1931); Luke S. K. Kwong, *A Mosaic of the Hundred Days: Personalities, Politics, and Ideas of 1898* (Cambridge: Council on East Asian Studies, Harvard University, 1984); Compilation Group, *The Reform Movement of 1898* (Beijing: Foreign Language Press, 1976).

⁸²⁷I. C. Y. Hsü, *The Rise of Modern China* (New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), pp.383-384.

⁸²⁸BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Mary Martin Richard, 1 August 1899.

China ripening fast. We must be fellow-laborers with God as soon as we discover His will.

To his satisfaction at that time, a group of highly qualified personnel from the missionary societies of Europe and America arrived in China to enhance his literary efforts. In early 1899, the Rev W.A. Cornaby of the English Wesleyan Mission joined the S.D.K. and began immediately to edit the *Chinese Missionary Review*. In May 1899, the Rev. Donald McGillivray, associated with the Canadian Presbyterian Mission in Henan province, was also ready for literary work with the S.D.K. By March 1900, the Church Missionary Society had reassigned the Rev. W. G. Walshe to S.D.K.⁸²⁹ Richard's long-awaited reinforcements finally arrived.

Due to the recurrence of conservatism in China, Richard predicted that there would soon be another crisis for foreigners in China. In May 1900, Richard was invited to present a paper on Christian Literature at the New York Ecumenical Conference on missions.⁸³⁰ Taking advantage of this opportunity, he talked with many American business and government leaders, as well as other missionary leaders, and expressed the hope that they would take concerted actions to prevent any outbreaks of violence against their citizens in China. To his great dismay, most were sympathetic but unable, and more likely unwilling, to do anything. By the time he reached Japan en route to China in June 1900, the violence of the Yihetuan (I-ho-t'uan 义和团) Movement (Boxer movement), which he had foreseen, had reached its peak in Beijing, in the form of the

⁸²⁹Timothy Richard, "Reinforcements for the Christian Literature Society for China," *Chinese Recorder*, 31 (1900), p.159-160. This is the first letter in which Richard referred to the S.D.K. in the name of its parent organization in London. It was McGillivray who stepped into Richard's position as General Secretary of the S.D.K., later known as C.L.S., till his retirement in 1915.

⁸³⁰Timothy Richard, "Christian Literature", *Chinese Recorder*, 31 (1900), pp.597-603.

officially supported Boxer Uprising:⁸³¹ The Boxers threatened foreigners and forced them to seek refuge in the Legation Quarter; and the initially hesitant Empress Cixi and other conservatives of the Court supported the Boxers and declared war on foreign powers. Diplomats, foreign civilians and soldiers, and Chinese Christians who took refuge in the Legation Quarter were placed under siege by the Boxers and the Imperial Army of China for 55 days.

In this case, Richard began to pay attention to more figures among the Chinese elites who were possible allies in China's modernization. These people included Sun, Yuan, and Cen Chunxuan. Cen was the provincial governor of Shanxi (1900-1901), Shannxi (1901-1902), Sichuan (1902-1903, 1907-1908, 1911), Liangguang (Liangkuang 两广 1903-1906), Yungui (Yün-kuei 云贵 1906-1907), Xizang (Tibet 西藏 1911), and the chairman of the Governing Committee of the Military Government of ROC (1918-1920). Sun was a devout Christian, but full of revolutionary thoughts. Richard met Sun in 1900 in a missionary meeting at Yokohama when Sun was there to organize early forces of his Xing Zhong Hui (Hsing Chung Hui, Revive China Society, 兴中会) to end the Manchu regime. Sun presented to Richard his revolutionary tactics, which would ultimately lead to the downfall of the Manchu government and the establishment of a Republic.⁸³² Sun later became the Provisional President of the ROC during January-March 1912, and the first Premier of the Kuomintang government in Guangzhou from October 1919 until his death in March 1925.

⁸³¹For different perspectives on these events, see: Paul. A. Cohen, *History in Three Keys: The Boxers as Even, Experience, and Myth* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1988); Jane Elliot, *Who Died for Civilization? Who Died for His Country? A Revised View of the Boxer War* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2001); Joseph W. Esherick, *The Orgins of the Boxer Uprising* (Berkeley: University of California, 1987); Victor C. Purcell, *The Boxer Uprising* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1963); Chester Tan, *The Boxer Catastrophe* (New York: Octagon Books, 1955).

⁸³²Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.350.

However, Richard was in favor of Yuan's roadmap for a semi-republican and semi-monarchic political system. Yuan was the youngest and ablest governor as far as Richard knew. Though Yuan was unscrupulous, Richard was willing to support this gifted man for the establishment of a Great China monarchy, similar to that of Great Britain.⁸³³ In fact, Yuan showed his respect to Richard's reform thinking on several occasions. Nevertheless, in a few years after the 1898 *coup d'état*, any Chinese person who had connections with foreigners was viewed as *Hanjian* (Han-chien 汉奸; Han-race traitor). Richard came from Britain. This identification prevented Yuan from having deeper communications with Richard. Yuan later was the first President of ROC from March 1912 to June 1916, during which he also declared himself as the Emperor of the Empire of China for 83 days (December 1915-March 1916).

By contrast, Richard had a much longer friendship with Cen. Cen was one of the three famous *killers* in the late Qing Dynasty: he was known as an officer-*killer* who always put forward proposals to impeach officers. The other two *killers* were Zhang Zhidong, a wealth-*killer* who was extravagant in spending money, and Yuan Shikai, a man-*killer* who slaughtered more Boxers than any other Qing officer. From 1901, Cen sought advice from Richard on how to settle the missionary problems after the Boxer Uprising and on how to establish Shanxi University.⁸³⁴ Both men shared the same goal to make Shanxi University an institution that could open the eyes of future Chinese leaders.⁸³⁵ We will discuss this project in Chapter 6. It deserves noting here that in 1905 the “three killers” submitted a joint petition to abolish the traditional Imperial Examinations which had lasted more than 1300 years in China; and, after the 1911

⁸³³*Ibid.*

⁸³⁴BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 25 May 1901.

⁸³⁵*Id.* to *Id.*, 26 March 1902.

Revolution, Cen took a leading role to establish the KMT, together with Sun, while opposing to Yuan's new Empire of China.

4.3.3 Influence on Empress's Reform

After the short-lived *Hundred Days Reform* in 1898, the die-hard conservative officials headed by the powerful Empress Cixi controlled the Court completely.⁸³⁶ On seeing the increasing numbers of Christian missionaries, both Protestant and Catholic, and their privilege of exemption from various Chinese laws based on unequal treaties,⁸³⁷ the Court encouraged grassroots-level uprisings to attack foreigners, foreign missionaries and native Christians. The anti-foreignism policy fostered a large-scale Boxer Uprising in China.

The Boxer Movement incurred the invasion of the Eight-Nation Alliance, including the United Kingdom, the United States, Germany, France, Italy, Japan, Russia and Austria-Hungary. From August 1900, the Alliance brought 20,000 troops to China to defeat the Imperial Army and occupied Beijing. The Empress Cixi was in exile from 14 August 1900 to 8 January 1902 in Shaanxi. To end the case, the Manchu government was forced to sign the Boxer Protocol with the Alliance on 7 September 1901. In the

⁸³⁶Cixi was the de facto ruler of Qing Dynasty for nearly half a century, from 1861 to her death in 1908. In 1889, although Empress Cixi retired at the Summer Palace, she still held the reins of government tightly.

⁸³⁷Joseph Esherick, *The Origins of the Boxer Uprising* (Berkeley California: University of California Press, 1988), p.123.

same year, the Boxer movement was quelled.⁸³⁸ The Qing Court was punished severely according to the Protocol. For example, it had to pay the eight nations involved an indemnity for damages to foreign life and property of 450 million of silver (67 million pounds or US \$333 million). The amount was ~55% of the entire annual income (about 250 million taels), and more than the government's annual tax revenue over a period of 39 years.⁸³⁹

In January 1901 before signing the Boxer Protocol in September, the Empress Cixi was in exile in Xian Fu, the capital of Shaanxi province. Either as an expression of the self-examination of the Court or an effort to resist any further foreign military actions,⁸⁴⁰ Cixi issued an edict through the powerless Emperor to acknowledge the Court's responsibility for the problems, and called for memorials recommending Western learning and reform, in order to restore confidence by strengthening Qing Dynasty.⁸⁴¹ This was later named the *New Deal* reform.⁸⁴² This initiative came because even the conservative Cixi had eventually become aware of the unshakable superiority and advanced modernity of Western civilization and thus hoped to initiate an institutional reform for the modernization of her country.

⁸³⁸E. H. Edwards, *Fire and Sword in Shansi* (New York: Arno Press & The New York Times, 1970), p.111.

⁸³⁹J. D. Spence, *Search of Modern China* (W. W. Norton, & Company, 1991), pp.230-235; R. Keith Schoppa, *Revolution and Its Past: Identities and Change in Modern Chinese History (Mysearchlab Series for History)* (Pearson, 2010), pp.118-123.

⁸⁴⁰Richard seemed to doubt the sincerity of the Chinese government in its reform efforts and in its protection of the foreigners. See: BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 22 January 1903.

⁸⁴¹For an English translation of this imperial edict, see: Douglas R. Reynolds, *China, 1895-1912: State-Sponsored Reforms and China's late-Qing Revolution* (Armonk, NY: M. E. Sharpe, 1996), pp.201-204. For another interesting version in English (partial translation), see: Robert Hart, *These from the Land of Sinim* (London: Chapman & Hall, Ltd., 1903) pp.296-299.

⁸⁴²J. D. Spence, *Search of Modern China* (W. W. Norton, & Company, 1991), pp.230-235.

In 1900, Richard had written six lengthy letters on the Boxer movement and given a full account of mission work throughout China and the world.⁸⁴³ He was convinced that *ignorance and superstition* had led to the Boxer massacres, of more than 50 missionaries and their families in Shanxi Province alone. After the Rebellion, he no longer believed that Chinese officials simply needed a reform; instead, he was convinced that what was needed was direction and speed with which some kind of reform could be implemented.⁸⁴⁴

In response to the Emperor's 1901 edict for reform memorials, Richard vigorously renewed his letters on what he thought was needed to enlighten the Court. Because Chinese officials were familiar with Western military systems, ironically thanks to the recent military conflict between the Boxers and Chinese army and the Allied Forces, Richard illustrated literary work, evangelistic mission work, and education as a virtually interlocking system like the military system with its three different departments:⁸⁴⁵ Literary work provided the “arsenal” of mental and spiritual weapons; evangelical mission work distributed “arm equipment to soldiers”; and, education functioned as artillery “blasting down” the strongholds of ignorance and superstition. It deserves mention that in the S.D.K. the “arsenal” (i.e., publications) produced in 1901 were remarkable; no more than five missionaries contributed 35 new published books with 50,000 copies in Chinese, and an 22 additional books in press.⁸⁴⁶

As an official representative of the S.D.K., Richard submitted to the throne a memorial on educational reforms, e.g., on establishing a Western learning system in

⁸⁴³BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 4 July 1891.

⁸⁴⁴William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), pp.253-254.

⁸⁴⁵Timothy Richard, “Educational Work Indispensable,” *Chinese Recorder* 32 (1901), pp.91-93.

⁸⁴⁶S.D.K., “Christian Literature for China—The Rev. Timothy Richard, Litt. D.D. of Shanghai,” In *The One Hundred and Tenth Annual Report, Missionary Herald* (May 1902), p.220.

provincial capitals throughout China; integrating schools and Civil Service Examinations; etc. His proposal was incorporated by the Court into an edict which was issued in December 1901.⁸⁴⁷ Based on it, the Court appointed Zhang Baixi (Chang Pai-hsi 张百熙, 1847-1907) in January 1902 as the Chancellor of the Imperial University of Beijing and commanded him to “present regulation on a new educational system.”⁸⁴⁸ Zhang “proposed the creation of elementary, primary, and secondary schools under the control and supervision of the national university.” Later, Zhang was appointed to head the Board of Education, a step toward a modern system of education. At that time, commands from the Throne for new changes were issued even before the previous edict had been fully implemented. In fact, soon after the exile Court returned to Beijing in early January 1902, Empress Cixi herself began to issue many edicts calling for educational and institutional changes. Many of the edicts recapitulated those promulgated during the Hundred-Day Reform.⁸⁴⁹ This was a precious opportunity for Richard to make more contributions.

Richard and the S.D.K. became a “bridge” which connected China to the wider world. For most Chinese elites, English language was an insurmountable barrier keeping them from learning from the West. They had to rely on translated information to access Western culture, civilization, politics, and economy. In the first several years of the 20th century, the S.D.K. was the chief interpreter and conveyor of Western knowledge. By means of the S.D.K.’s translations and publications, Richard and his colleagues steadily provided information about the West, as well as about Japan, in the areas of culture,

⁸⁴⁷William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), p.277.

⁸⁴⁸P. Bailey, *Reform the people: Changing Attitudes towards Popular Education in Early 20th Century China* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1990), p.29.

⁸⁴⁹The edict issued in 1898 to guarantee the protection of the missionaries notably absent from the new reform programs.

education, politics, reform, science, technology, value, and morality. Because of the S.D.K.'s introduction of the West, Chinese people maintained their interest in Western learning. However, the situation changed after 1905. In that year, Japan won its war with the giant Russia. Consequently, to Richard's dissatisfaction, more and more Chinese were attracted to Japan for three reasons: (1) Through the 1905 war Japan established firmly its military and political supremacy in Asia, and continued its cultural expansion: e.g., in Shanghai alone there were 50 different book shops to sell a diversity of Japanese-influenced books around 1905; (2) China was Japan's close neighbor having long been more developed, and thus Chinese people were curious about Japan's success in modernization; and, (3) Elements of Japanese culture had been inherited from Chinese culture, e.g., Chinese characters.⁸⁵⁰ In an S.D.K. Report a few years later, Richard revealed that "approximately a hundred students from each of the 18 provinces have been sent to Japan to learn how the Japanese have prospered so rapidly"; and he added, this "trickle became a raging torrent" between 1905 and 1911.⁸⁵¹

Obviously, Richard worried about China's increasing ignorance of the West, which might lead China down a disastrous path: without peace, prosperity, civilization, and international friendship. Considering that "China is awake, and thirsting for knowledge, and this knowledge it is our task to supply,"⁸⁵² and that "the aim of the Society (i.e., the S.D.K.) could be summed up in two roles—that of interpreter and inspiration,"⁸⁵³ Richard reasserted his plan to lead China safely through this stormy transition: to run a model Christian college in every province and at least one model Western learning

⁸⁵⁰ *Seventeenth Annual Report of S.D.K.*, pp.11-12. Douglas R. Reynolds, *China, 1898-1912: The Xincheng Revolution and Japan* (Cambridge: Council on East Asian Studies, Harvard University Press, 1993), p.187.

⁸⁵¹ *Ibid.*, p.48.

⁸⁵² *Ibid.*, p.43.

⁸⁵³ *Ibid.*, p.45.

university for all of China.⁸⁵⁴ This was nothing but what Richard proposed repeatedly before. Because missionaries were more experienced in the subject, he hoped the missionaries could administer the model university in Western ways in its early years.⁸⁵⁵

Richard and his S.D.K. colleagues achieved undoubted success in playing the roles of both interpreter and mentor for the Chinese. Clearly, their literary publications were welcomed throughout China. For example, from 1903 to 1904 alone, the demand for S.D.K. publications continued to increase from an original 25,353,880 pages of new books and reprints to 30,681,800 pages, and the sales kept increasing until 1910 when most key staff members either retired or passed away.⁸⁵⁶ In addition, Richard and other S.D.K. employees facilitated the establishment of several union colleges which were “cross-denominational” in nature.⁸⁵⁷ And, under their influence many Chinese officials made efforts to advance modern education.⁸⁵⁸ For instance, Yuan Shikai, Zhang Zhidong, and Cen Chunxuan submitted a joint memorial in 1905 to the Court to abolish the Civil Service Examination system “in order to allow the expansion of the modern modes of education.”⁸⁵⁹ This examination system had lasted since the 7th century. In response, the Emperor issued an edict on 2 September 1905 for an immediate cessation of the examinations for Xiucai (Hsiu-ts’ai 秀才; B.A.); and further, effective from 1906 for Juren, and Jinshi (Chin-shih 进士; Ph.D.). In the edict, the Emperor also addressed the need of standard textbooks, qualified teachers, and well-developed teaching rules in education, the three issues Richard had frequently discussed with elite Chinese on many

⁸⁵⁴William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), p.18.

⁸⁵⁵*Seventeenth Annual Report of S.D.K.*, pp.11-12.

⁸⁵⁶William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), pp.277-280.

⁸⁵⁷*Ibid.*, p.13.

⁸⁵⁸*Ibid.*, p.5.

⁸⁵⁹*Eighteenth Annual Report of C.L.S.* (Shanghai: Shanghai Mercury, Limited, 1905), pp. 29-30.

occasions since the 1880s.⁸⁶⁰ These changes symbolized the initiation of China's modernization.

4.3.4 Connections with Western People

In order to implement his *top-down* approach to mission work successfully, Richard contacted many Western people from America, Britain, France, and Germany for comments, advice, and help.⁸⁶¹ These people included Sir Robert Hart, the S.D.K. president and the High Commissioner of Customs and British consul in Beijing, Sir Harry Parkes, the British Consul in Beijing; Sir Thomas Hanbury, a frequent donor of funds to C.L.S.; J.O.P. Bland, the Secretary of the Municipal Council; Mr. Ohlmer, the German Commissioner of Customs; the Catholic Bishop Alphonse Favier, and other Roman Catholic missionaries. Unlike his BMS colleagues and most fundamentalist missionaries in China, most of them afforded their assistance voluntarily whenever possible.⁸⁶² For example, Hart had a deep positive impression of Richard's ability, ideology, and competence expressed by his missionary activities, especially in *Shibao*. It was Hart's recommendation that made Richard become the General Secretary of the S.D.K.

Richard also made use of several furloughs to carry on extensive correspondence with religious leaders, such as the Archbishop of Canterbury, and political leaders, like

⁸⁶⁰*Ibid.*

⁸⁶¹Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), pp.321-23.

⁸⁶²Albert J. Garnier, *A Maker of Modern China* (London: Carey Press, 1945), p.83.

Lord Curzon and the Honorable William E. Gladstone. He also visited New York, Boston, Washington, Chicago, and Seattle to introduce the issues of late Qing China to the West.⁸⁶³ In 1900, he tried to visit President Theodore Roosevelt personally and eventually met the President in the White House in 1906 to present his viewpoints and proposals to end the suffering of China.⁸⁶⁴ In addition, he took advantage of all possible opportunities to introduce his liberal approach in mission work and China's new development at, e.g., the Ecumenical Congress in New York, in 1900,⁸⁶⁵ the World Baptist Congress in London, in 1905,⁸⁶⁶ the Peace Congress in 1905, Lucerne,⁸⁶⁷ the Peace Society gathering in London in 1910, etc.⁸⁶⁸ Even after he retired and returned to London in 1915, Richard still continued to work during the last years of his life. He wrote articles for newspapers and periodicals to share his liberal experience in China and his views about world peace. He sent copies of the leaflet, *The Only Certain Way to Prevent War in the Future*, to politicians in England, Canada, the US, and in Asian countries.⁸⁶⁹ Through all these activities, Richard expressed his central idea, as revealed in a letter to BMS Secretary in 1885:⁸⁷⁰

All I plead for in one word is this, that the Church should attempt something worthy of itself towards China, something worthy of China, the greatest empire in the world, and something worthy of China in its presents crisis. May the light of the Kingdom of Heaven be prominent in your committee rooms next Monday, and always gladden the heart of every member there.

⁸⁶³Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.290-292.

⁸⁶⁴*Ibid.*, p.373.

⁸⁶⁵*Ibid.*, p.295.

⁸⁶⁶*Ibid.*, p.326.

⁸⁶⁷*Ibid.*, p.371.

⁸⁶⁸*Ibid.*, p.375.

⁸⁶⁹*Ibid.*, p.376.

⁸⁷⁰BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 7 September 1885.

It was a pity that these valuable efforts were not only ineffective but even evoked sharp, negative comments, mostly from his Fundamentalist confreres. Maybe his personal views were nothing but those of a single, well-intentioned individual, rather than from any official organization; or, more likely, his liberal theology was too idealistic and advanced at his time to be understandable.

Nevertheless, none could deny that Richard was a missionary who worked “for an equally long time in China and rendered far greater service for the establishment of the Kingdom of God” than most of his colleagues.⁸⁷¹ His *top-down* approach, ecumenical spirit, worldwide outlook, and outstanding acumen and foresight became a vast powerhouse and a tremendous source of inspiration for younger generations of missionaries.

4.4 Contributions in the C.L.S.

In 1906, the S.D.K. was renamed the Christian Literature Society for China (C.L.S.). At that time, Richard was gratified to see a couple of new developments: (1) There was a virtual explosion in the number of primary and secondary schools, many of which were founded by gentry without government financial support and merely copying the Japanese model in all the provinces; (2) many students were sent to Japan to spend 1-3 years for education.

⁸⁷¹E. W. Price Evans, *Timothy Richard, a narrative of Christian enterprise and statesmanship in China* (London: The Carey press, 1945), p.148.

Richard worried about the deviation away from his original designs of the educational reform: in Japan, most Chinese students were not qualified for the kinds of education needed; they had to first master Japanese before benefiting from the programs and lectures; more seriously, when coming back to China, they often manifested an intense anti-Western influence xenophobia.⁸⁷² This situation would eventually lead missionaries, even the C.L.S., to lose control of the minds of elite Chinese in Westernization, and drag China in the opposite direction — i.e. against modernization and civilization. Richard began to cast about again for some sort of positive social change. By 1907, he found that there were “three greatest needs of China” before any practical steps could succeed in running Westernized institutions:⁸⁷³ a well-supported Christian press; a missionary council; and a strategic vision unified through study of a common science of missions.

This was nothing but a unification or consolidation of Richard’s tens of years’ of missionary efforts for greater efficiency and Christian impact on China, an endeavor he had been devoted to since his first furlough to Europe.⁸⁷⁴ In those old days, he hoped to establish Western-learning colleges in provincial capitals of China. To his great sorrow, his Home BMS Committee refused his proposal to organize religious societies for the purpose. Now based on his 37 years of experience, he was sure that a cooperative effort among various missionary societies was urgently needed. A council should unite various missionary societies active in China as one body; it could articulate through its press the best counsel that the West would be prepared to provide, while missionaries might still

⁸⁷²*Nineteenth Annual Report of C. L. S.* (Shanghai: Shanghai Mercury, Limited, 1906), p.6.

⁸⁷³Timothy Richard, “Some of the Greatest Needs of Christian Missions,” *Chinese Recorder* 38 (1907), pp.211-212.

⁸⁷⁴Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.195.

gain the ear of government leaders to influence the moral and institutional direction that the country should take.⁸⁷⁵ For Richard, this plan offered a long-term strategy of Westernization analogous to the “arsenal-soldier-firing” one suggested in 1901.⁸⁷⁶

In those years, Richard also took care of the lives of Chinese women and assertively regarded the C.L.S. as a platform to advocate the equality of sexes.⁸⁷⁷ As early as in 1895, a couple of missionaries, Mr. and Mrs. Archibald Little prepared to establish an Anti-footbinding Society. They asked Richard to aid in the production and publication of literature for the purpose of creating a public opinion against the evils of footbinding. Richard supported strongly this Society through publications until Mrs. Little's departure in 1906. What was more important, Richard fully supported his own wife, Mrs. Mary Richard to contribute to Chinese women's liberation movement. Mary did become the representative of Protestant women missionaries in China. For example, in order to influence Empress Dowager Cixi, Mary and her sisters produced a fine edition of the New Testament, instead of a complete Bible, as a gift for Cixi's 60 birthday in 1894. Unexpectedly, in a few days the Zongli Yamen received the decree from the Empress-Dowager conferring two rolls of silk and satin, two handkerchiefs, and embroidered articles for Mrs. Richard and another female missionary. More impressively, encouraged by Timothy Richard, Mrs. Richard compared Christian and Chinese views on women. She concluded that Christianity offered a more equal life for women. For the purpose of ending the misery in the lives of female Chinese, Mary urged the establishment of specialized women's schools and the inclusion of female education in usual schools.

⁸⁷⁵ *Ibid.*

⁸⁷⁶ Timothy Richard, “Educational Work Indispensable,” *Chinese Recorder* 32 (1901), pp.91-93.

⁸⁷⁷ Timothy Richard, *Forty-Five Years in China*, p.225-226.

She wrote an article about her considerations, and it was published later.⁸⁷⁸ Due to Mrs. Richard's unusual influence among female missionaries in China and the importance of the Chinese women problem, the first paper of the issued Volume I introduced Mrs. Richard's biography,⁸⁷⁹ and the second one was the paper Mrs. Richard wrote to compare the mercies of the Chinese Guanyin (观音 Kwan Yin) and the Christian God.⁸⁸⁰

Richard's will prevailed and in part came to fruition in 1907. For example, China steadily and irrevocably updated its system of public education by including Western-learning in addition to Japanese-learning in colleges of provincial capitals, albeit China's education at that time did not focus on Christian morals. Meanwhile, C.L.S. publications continued to draw a high degree of attention among Chinese elites: provincial officials from six more provinces, namely, Manchuria (Man-chou-li 满洲里), Guangzhou (Kuang-chou 广州), Fujian (Fu-chien 福建), Shanxi, Shandong, and Xinjiang (Hsin-chiang 新疆), ordered hundreds of copies of the *Chinese Weekly*. As many as 900 copies were ordered by the Treasury of Shandong, 500 by the Government of Shanxi, and even up to 40 by distant Xinjiang.⁸⁸¹ Encouragingly, in the same year, Richard received the highest recognition given by the Chinese government to foreigners when he was decorated with the Double 2nd Order, 2nd Grade. Obviously, the seed of Richard's reform for China's modernization had in fact sprouted in China. Until 1910,

⁸⁷⁸M. M. Richard, The Christian and Chinese Idea of Womanhood, in: ed., T. Richard, *Conversion by the Million in China*, Vol.I (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907), pp.58-78.

⁸⁷⁹Timothy Richard, "Biography of Mrs. Richard, in: ed., T. Richard", in *Conversion by the Million in China*, Chapter 1, Vol.I, (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907), pp.18-26.

⁸⁸⁰Kwan Yin or Goddess of Mercy, in: ed., T. Richard, *Conversion by the Million in China*, Chapter 1, Vol.I (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907), pp.27-49.

⁸⁸¹*Twentieth Annual Report of C.L.S.* (Shanghai: Shanghai Mercury, Limited., 1906), p.8.

the C.L.S. continued to produce a prodigious amount of literature of both original writings and translations.

However, from 1906 the C.L.S. began to suffer a series of great losses through death. The prolific Rev. Joseph Edkins, died in 1906; the indefatigable editor of *Review of the Times*, Allen, died in 1907; so did the Society's chief individual donor, Thomas Hanbury. In addition, Robert Hart, the Society's President since 1888, became sick and died in 1911; and many of the old Chinese elite left⁸⁸². Even Richard himself was no longer a young man and ill-health compelled him to resign around 1910 from the Society where his team had grown up to include a staff of 18 Chinese translators and assistants, six Western colleagues, and several associates, along with nearly a quarter of a million dollars of assets and more than 100 original translated publications.⁸⁸³

For a more complete historical picture of the late Qing Dynasty, let us introduce here a little more about the outcome of Cixi's *New Deal* Reform from 1900. The Reform triggered drastic social changes, and many new organizations appeared for different purposes built up by different groups of Chinese people. For example, the revolutionary body Tongmeng Hui (T'ung-meng Hui 同盟会; Chinese Revolutionary Alliance) was established in Tokyo, Japan, in 1905. This organization was composed of elite revolutionary Chinese. They set a new direction for China with a goal to overthrow the Qing Dynasty. The political program was exposed in only 16 Chinese characters: Quchu Dalu (Ch'ü-ch'u Ta-lu 驱除鞑虏: Expelling the Manchus); Huifu Zhonghua (Hui-Fu Chung-hua 恢复中华: Restoring Han-Domination); Jianli Minguo (Chien-li Min-kuo

⁸⁸²Emperor Guangxu and Empress Dowager Cixi both died in 1908; Zhang Zhidong died in 1909; Li Hongzhang died in 1901.

⁸⁸³William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), p.8.

建立民国：Establishing a Republic); and Pingjun Diqian (P'ing-chün Ti-ch'üan 平均地权：Equalizing the Land). The historical event known as *Xinhai Geming* (Hsin-hai Ko-ming 辛亥革命：Xinhai Revolution or Revolution of 1911, or the Chinese Revolution) was launched on 10 October 1911 by the first bourgeois party in China, the Chinese Revolutionary League (中国革命同盟会), expanded from Tongmeng Hui under the leadership of Sun Zhongshan, Yuan shikai, Cen Chunxuan. After that, the democratic Republic was established in 1911 which replaced the Qing dynasty.

Unlike the Emperor's 1898 Reform, this revolution had little direct connections with missionaries for information and advice. However, it inherited and accomplished what Richard had long been pursuing in China. From 1902, a Westernized Imperial University of Shanxi (later renamed as Shanxi University) was first established in the provincial capital, Taiyuan Fu, of Shanxi. Richard had been one of the two first-term Co-Chancellors for 10 years. Then, similar Government-supported, modern higher-educational institutions were run in China's most provincial capitals. By 1915, China set up a well-developed system of modern education on all levels: neither a Japanese style nor Richard's model, but a hybrid which was "to instill patriotism, loyalty, and concern for the public good" in China.⁸⁸⁴ In 1915, Richard retired and returned to London, leaving behind the most influential missionary career among thousands pursued in China.

⁸⁸⁴Paul Bailey, *Reform the people: changing attitudes towards popular education in early 20th century China* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1990), p.38.

4.5 Significance of Publishing

Richard's contribution to China's modernization through publishing in *Shibao* and S.D.K./C.L.S. was tremendous. Superficially, the 1898 reform failed, and Richard's top-down approach achieved little success. However, it was just this top-down strategy in his mission work that influenced a lot of people from ordinary intellectuals to as high as the Emperor. This was the basis of the conservative Cixi's reform in 1901-1905, shocked by the unshakable superiority and modernity of the West, as always recounted by Richard in his top-down approach to Chinese people.⁸⁸⁵

This new reform made three concrete improvements: (1) it abolished Civil Service examinations; (2) it established Westernized universities; and (3) it sent students abroad. Beyond doubt, all these initiatives were clearly parts of Richard's reform goals proposed before the 1898 *coup d'état*. Starting from 1901, following Richard's blueprint, a foreign ministry started to work, railroads were built to connect the Northern provinces, and a modern system of primary & middle schools was established; in 1903, a Department of Commerce came into play; in 1904, the Bank of Communications was founded;⁸⁸⁶ particularly, in 1902, to his most satisfaction after many tears of appeal, a model Westernized University, Shanxi university, began to run, followed by 18 modern universities running in each of the provincial capitals, a plan he had begged his own BMS to undertake more than 20 years earlier.⁸⁸⁷

⁸⁸⁵Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.311.

⁸⁸⁶G. Chow, "The Chinese Economy, 1901-2000," *Perspectives*, 2, no. 6 (2001): [http://www.oycf.org/Perspectives2/12_063001/chinese_econ.htm], 16 August, 2011.

⁸⁸⁷Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.198.

By viewing the great changes in China and realizing the hostile attitude of Chinese people to foreigners was dissipating in the new century, Richard predicted in 1905 that Christianization would be more successful if missionaries and Christian teachers

presented Christ and His salvation to deliver wise precepts, faith, and practice to people, and then to find the best Confucians, the best Buddhists, the best Taoists, and the best Mohammedans who will soon be ready to drop the non-essentials in their respective religions and to join to establish the kingdom of God first in human hearts and then in organizations for the salvation of the whole world; in this way, where there were thousands of converts before, there will be tens of thousands now.⁸⁸⁸

⁸⁸⁸Timothy Richard, "Introduction," In *Life in West China*, ed. Robert J. Davidson, Isaac Mason, and Timothy Richard (London: Headley, 1905), pp.1-248.

CHAPTER 5

MODERNITY FEATURE IN RICHARD'S MISSION WORK: WESTERNIZATION OF EDUCATION

5.1 Background

Richard's endeavor for modernity in education started from 1881. At the end of the Great Famine, he submitted a comprehensive reform proposal to Zeng Guoquan, the Governor of Shanxi province from 1876. In the previous year, Zeng was the Governor of Shaanxi. In the proposal, Richard advocated the establishment of Western-learning colleges to introduce modern education to China among other designs, e.g., building railways, opening mines, and developing industry.

Throughout his missionary activities, Richard realized increasingly the importance of Western education to China's modernization. To spread modern science and technology, Richard first discussed with another missionary, Whitewright, to run a missionary museum somewhere, in Jinan Fu for example. Later, Mr. Whitewright moved to Jinan Fu and built the Jinan Fu Institute (now the Jinan Institute of Technology), the first missionary museum in China.⁸⁸⁹ In addition, Richard organized the first magic lantern show for the local magistrate, gentry, secretaries, and minor officials. The show introduced the principles of magnetic forces to the audience. This kind of activities not only reduced the resistance of local people to missionaries but also

⁸⁸⁹ Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.180; E. W. Price Evans, *Timothy Richard: A Narrative of Christian Enterprise and Statesmanship in China*, (London: The Carey Press, 1945), p.90.

helped Whitewright to set up an educational center for Western learning.⁸⁹⁰ Moreover, Richard gave lectures to Chinese elites on subjects like astronomy, chemistry, and mechanics.⁸⁹¹

However, Richard failed repeatedly to persuade his Fundamentalist colleagues and the BMS Committee to support him,⁸⁹² as already shown in Chapter 3. For this reason, Richard finally left Shanxi and became an independent missionary in an editorial position at *Shibao* from 1890 and then became the General Secretary of the S.D.K. in 1891. From that year, Richard was engaged chiefly in three tasks: (1) Publishing literary works on Western modernization among Chinese people, especially Chinese elites; (2) Advocating educational reform through the Educational Association of China (EAC); and (3) Promoting educational reform through the establishment of the Imperial University of Shanxi (now Shanxi University). The first subject was introduced already in Chapter 4. We pay attention in this Chapter to the latter two.

5.2 Advocacy of Educational Reform through EAC

The predecessor to the EAC was The School and Textbook Series Committee (STSC) established at the 1st General Conference of Protestant Missionaries in China (PMC) in 1877. The STSC aimed at producing a series of elementary textbooks for use

⁸⁹⁰BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 2 February 1884.

⁸⁹¹Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.160.

⁸⁹²William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), pp.148-151.

in missionary schools.⁸⁹³ In 1880 Richard became a STSC member. He was responsible for the standardization of terminology about religious terms collected in the 10 years since he arrived in China.⁸⁹⁴

At the PMC's 1890 General Conference held in Shanghai, the STSC changed to the EAC in order to coordinate the efforts among missionary educators for Christianization.⁸⁹⁵ In the same year, Richard relocated in Shanghai to fill the position of S.D.K. General Secretary and participate in the EAC's activities.⁸⁹⁶ In 1893 Richard was appointed by EAC's Triennial Meeting Committee as one of three men on the committee for Revision of the Constitution and By-Laws. From this year, he took the EAC as his arena to advocate educational reform.

5.2.1 Reform Plan

At the EAC's 1893 meeting, Richard delivered the opening address entitled *The Principles of Education*. In his presentation, he discussed educational problems in China and recommended his 3-Tier educational system for the Chinese people. He proposed that an educational system should provide five years of Western Christian education on

⁸⁹³Wang Shu-hwai, *The Educational Association of China, 1890-1912: Its History and Meaning in the Missionary Education in China*, M.A. thesis, University of Hawaii, 1963, pp.12-14.

⁸⁹⁴Richard's interest in standardizing terminology was a persistent issue with him. His first interest in terminology was demonstrated in Shandong when he formulated a list of religious terms used by the Chinese. He employed those in his catechism to instruct to literary endeavors through the S.D.K. While he never tried to operate independently of the Chinese government in this issue, if it did not deliver in a timely fashion, Richard was not beyond taking the initiative to provide what was needed because of the press of his own work at the S.D.K. See, e.g., Timothy Richard and Donald MacGillivray, *A Dictionary of Philosophical Terms Chiefly from the Japanese* (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society for China. 1913).

⁸⁹⁵Wang Shu-hwai, *The Educational Association of China, 1890-1912: Its History and Meaning in the Missionary Education in China*, M.A. thesis, University of Hawaii, 1963, pp.6-18.

⁸⁹⁶*Records of the Triennial Meeting of the Educational Association of China, May 2-4, 1893, Shanghai*, p.xi.

top of 10 years Chinese study; (this was) more adapted to Chinese life and mode of thought.⁸⁹⁷ This model not only influenced Zhang Zhidong for the 1890s' reform as mentioned previously, but also was used by Yuan Shikai eight years later in a memorial to the Court, which was adopted in the Emperor's edict of 25 November 1901.⁸⁹⁸ We point out here that, since 1880, the theme of Richard's liberal practice appeared to be based on a hybrid perspective in culture, Christianity plus Confucianism.

Richard's vision in educational reform was broadened in 1899 when he was elected EAC President⁸⁹⁹ at its 3rd Triennial Meeting in Shanghai.⁹⁰⁰ By this time, EAC-engaged colleagues in Chinese education increased from 73 in 1891 to 189 (with two Chinese members).⁹⁰¹ The EAC committee proposed three substantial steps for educational reform: (1) the EAC Committee collaborate with the S.D.K. Committee to develop an initial plan of "a Public School System" for providing Western learning to Chinese students; (2) the two Committees prepared to form a Joint Committee to recommend "the Public School system" to the Chinese government; and, (3) the above two steps should be expedited with the full authority of EAC before the next Triennial Meeting because of "the country demands in an educational reform."⁹⁰² For these purposes,

⁸⁹⁷*Ibid.*, p.10.

⁸⁹⁸Paul J. Paul Bailey, *Reform the People: Changing Attitudes towards Popular Education in Early 20th Century China* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1990), p.28.

⁸⁹⁹*Records of the Third Triennial Meeting of E.A.C.* (Shanghai: American Presbyterian Mission Press, 1899). p.7. BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 29 May 1899. In this letter, he emphasized to his Home Secretary the "great disproportion between the efforts of British and American Missionaries in Educational line," perhaps as an indirect reminder that the Committee had not followed his recommendation about establishing provincial college of Western learning fourteen years earlier but also as a reminder of the need for educational missionaries.

⁹⁰⁰Paul Kranz, "List of Educational Articles from the *Recorder*, 1869-1894," *Chinese Recorder* 30 (1895), p. 228.

⁹⁰¹*Records of the Third Triennial Meeting of E.A.C.* (Shanghai: American Presbyterian Mission Press, 1899).

⁹⁰²Timothy Richard, "Educational Association of China," *Chinese Recorder* 30, 1899, p.292.

Richard and his colleagues organized a “Committee on Educational Reform”⁹⁰³ to communicate with the Chinese government,⁹⁰⁴ aiming at China’s full acceptance of Western learning.⁹⁰⁵ In addition, trained missionaries were allowed to accept mandarin ranks as qualified instructors in colleges. Moreover, the textbooks and examinations would be edited by missionaries in order to guarantee Christian content as well as missionary control of the modern system of higher education.

Richard was the perfect representative to be responsible for this task as the EAC President, the S.D.K. General Secretary, a member of the EAC/ S.D.K. joint Reform Committee, and, most importantly, a seasoned missionary accustomed to dealing with various Chinese government officials.

5.2.2 Practice

To implement the reform, Richard invited Mr. John Stagg, the representative of the Macmillan publishing house of London, to attend the first Executive Committee meeting of the EAC during Richard’s presidency; this was convened on 25 May 1899. The meeting approved the proposal that Macmillan would publish six textbooks, a bilingual geography, a bilingual series of readers in science, and bilingual editions of the first four books of the *New Orient Readers* for use in Chinese schools. The bilingual

⁹⁰³*Records of the Second Triennial Meeting of E.A.C.* (Shanghai: American Presbyterian Mission Press, 1896), p.19.

⁹⁰⁴Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.293.

⁹⁰⁵Timothy Richard, “Examination Scheme,” *Chinese Recorder* 31 (1900), pp.420-423.

editions were suggested by Richard. In his mind, bilingualism would prove useful when Chinese students would later be appointed to official positions.⁹⁰⁶

The publications were so welcomed in China that each was ordered in at least 400 copies between March and November in 1901⁹⁰⁷, including *Mental Philosophy and Hygiene* (400); *Hand-books on Astronomy* (500); Owen's *Geology* (500); *History of England* (600), *History of Russia* (500), *Moral Philosophy* (400), Muirhead's *Geography* (1,000), and *Handbook on Hydraulics and Hydrostatics* (400). This situation was in sharp contrast with the period of the Hundred Days Reform in 1898 when the demand for EAC publications had dropped sharply, so that to \$1,649.39 was owed in arrears due to the "reactionary policy of the Peking government the past year."⁹⁰⁸

In 1901, the indemnity agreement to the 1900 Boxer Uprising was finally signed.⁹⁰⁹ The Empress Dowager Cixi promulgated an edict on 29 January 1901 through Guangxu the Emperor to proclaim that the Empire's first priority, "even more important than devising new system, is to secure men of administrative ability."⁹¹⁰ Zhang Zhidong, Yuan Shikai, and others submitted reform proposals based, more or less, on Richard's ideas and approaches to educational reforms that was presented to the Throne in both 1898 and 1899.⁹¹¹

The political climate for educational reform was now positive. In the 4th Triennial Meeting of EAC in 1902, Richard and other eight men formed a "Committee to Prepare

⁹⁰⁶*Ibid.*

⁹⁰⁷Executive Committee, "Educational Society of China," *Chinese Recorder* 32 (1901), pp.561-562.

⁹⁰⁸Executive Committee, "Educational Association of China," *Chinese Recorder*, 31 (1900), pp.39-40.

⁹⁰⁹The countries that invaded China included USA, Great Britain, France, Belgium, Italy, Russia, The Netherlands, and Japan.

⁹¹⁰Douglas R. Reynolds, *China, 1898-1912: The Xinhai Revolution and Japan* (Cambridge, MA: Council on East Asian Studies, Harvard University, 1993), p.204.

⁹¹¹Marianne Bastid, *Educational Reform in Early 20th Century China*, (Tr. P. Bailey; Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press, 1988), p.34.

a Memorial to Chinese Government” for a direct, detailed input in response to the Court’s appeal. Though no Imperial edict was issued specially, the trend of the reform underway in China was indeed along the path Richard had assumed earlier.⁹¹² For example, China abolished the stultifying Civil Service Examination system in 1905; and, a Board of Modern Education was founded, one of the reform suggestions presented in 1895 by Richard to the Prime Minister Weng Tonghe on Weng’s request for the “Establishment of a Board of Education to introduce modern schools and colleges throughout the Empire.”⁹¹³ From 1906, a public system of modern education was established ranging from primary schools to higher education with a curriculum including sciences, mathematics, social studies, English, and world history, in conformity with Richard’s long-desired and long-proposed design for a system of government-supported, Western-learning educational institutions.

In 1909, the sixth Triennial Meeting of the EAC elected Richard as one of two Vice Presidents. The EAC now had approximately 500 members, “nearly one-ninth of the Protestant missionaries in China and about one-fifth of the missionaries who were really connected with educational work.”⁹¹⁴ Nevertheless, after the Sino-Japanese War in 1895 and the Japan-Russia war in 1905, those Chinese people who had touched Western religion and education were mostly attracted by Japan, the long-lived small country accompanying China in history.

As a result, the new education established in China gradually shifted to a system which was extrinsically westernized in the system but intrinsically Japanese-oriented in

⁹¹²*Ibid.*, p.35.

⁹¹³William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), p.220.

⁹¹⁴Wang Shu-hwai, *The Educational Association of China, 1890-1912: Its History and Meaning in the Missionary Education in China*. M.A. thesis, University of Hawaii, 1963, p.170.

curriculum.^{915,916} More seriously, EAC educators were asked to comply with the governmental recognition and registration procedures if they hoped to continue the educational work in China. This meant that missionaries had to accept “the government course of study, the prescribed textbooks and the scientific terminology.”⁹¹⁷ Though EAC tried to approach Chinese government through foreign officials for some adjustments, it was unable to turn the Japanese-inclined educational tide aside. In other words, at this time the EAC had very limited influence on China’s education reform.⁹¹⁸

In 1912, at the end of his EAC tenure, Richard pondered the future of the EAC in relation to the newly established Republic of China and various denominational organizations. He appealed to all missionaries and Chinese converts for united efforts among the denominations and for more cooperation with the new government.⁹¹⁹ This was his last stroke to exert his influence on education in China. After that, Richard remained only in his C.L.S. position till his retirement in 1915.

From a historiographical perspective, we conclude that, though active enough to draw considerable attention temporarily in the late Qing Dynasty, western missionaries and Chinese converts at last ended up as a frustrated class with only dreams to achieve a Western standard of livings in China.

⁹¹⁵Wang Shu-hwai, *The Educational Association of China, 1890-1912: Its History and Meaning in the Missionary Education in China*. M.A. thesis, University of Hawaii, 1963, p.151.

⁹¹⁶*Records of the Sixth Triennial Meeting of E.A.C.* (Shanghai: American Presbyterian Mission Press, 1909), p.171.

⁹¹⁷*Ibid.*, p.151.

⁹¹⁸*Records of the Sixth Triennial Meeting of E.A.C.* (Shanghai: American Presbyterian Mission Press, 1909), p.171.

⁹¹⁹Timothy Richard, “The Future of the Educational Association,” *Chinese Recorder* 43 (1912), pp.230-238.

5.3 Promotion of Educational Reform through Higher Education

As early as in 1881 Richard proposed to Shanxi Governor, Zeng Guoquan to establish an educational college of modern learning in Taiyuan Fu as one of the means of averting future famine.⁹²⁰ There was no evidence that Zeng had made any attempt. Richard never stopped trying his best to make use of every opportunity to promote educational reform through, e.g., running a model university in China. From 1901, Richard spent much of his time and energy to play a key role for the birth in 1902 of the Imperial University of Shanxi (now Shanxi University). Different from the earlier Beiyang University (now Tianjin University), founded in 1895, and the Imperial Beijing University (now Beijing University), established in 1898, this university was the earliest modernized university in China which introduced a Western curriculum and Western management, and which had been designed and supervised by a foreigner from its initial phase. We note here that the establishment of these three universities inaugurated the modern era in the history of Chinese higher education.

5.3.1 Situation

As introduced in Chapter 4, eight western states and Japan invaded China in August 1900 to suppress the Boxer Uprising in China. Richard became aware of the

⁹²⁰Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.172.

severity of the situation before the war broke out. On the 2nd of July that year, Richard was returning from the Ecumenical Conference on missions in New York. When his ship arrived in Yokohama, Japan, he read of the murder of a German minister in Beijing and the “narrow escape of the Shandong missionaries.”⁹²¹ Soon after his return, he prodded the British government to send telegrams to Chinese Viceroys and provincial governors, informing them that they would be held accountable for the well-being of the foreigners within their borders.⁹²²

Based on the Boxer Protocol signed in summer 1901, the Qing Court had to pay a large sum of indemnity to the Western countries involved. At the same time, the so-called *New Deal Reform* was initiated under the imperial sanction. It led to drastic institutional changes within the country. The new reform lasted until 1911 when the Qing dynasty and the ancient imperial system were eventually washed away and replaced by the Republic of China. From November 1900, Richard and his colleagues took an active role in receiving credible information about the safety of missionaries and their sufferings throughout China during the Boxer rebellion, while discussing indemnities with Chinese authorities.⁹²³

5.3.2 Initiation of Project

⁹²¹William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), p.249.

⁹²²BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 11 July 1901.

⁹²³BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 19 November 1900.

In 1901, the Peace Plenipotentiaries, Prince Qing and Viceroy Li Hongzhang, invited Richard to go north to assist in quelling troubles and in the settlement of indemnities for the massacres in Shanxi where most missionaries were suffering discrimination, oppression and persecution during the Boxer Uprising.

As the leading missionary, Richard was the only one deemed suitable to deal with this important matter.⁹²⁴ First, Richard was well-known by high-rank Chinese officials for his humanitarian efforts starting from the famine relief program more than 20 years earlier. Second, he had served as a missionary in the Shanxi area for almost 10 years following the famine, while other missionaries in Shanxi had either been massacred or had fled to other provinces, and thus there had been none left in the province with whom Chinese officials could negotiate the indemnities. Third, Prince Qing and Viceroy Li had had many contacts with Richard over past years, and they knew him to be a man of integrity who not only had much experience in China but also was able to exert much influence within the missionary community. Last, it was Richard who, as a representative of the Protestant missionaries, had sent memorials on several occasions over the last 15 years to the Throne, pleading for its intervention to stop the persecution of native and foreign Christians.

Qing and Li were eager to solve the Shanxi indemnity problem. They promised the Allied Forces that they would “instruct the Governor of Shanxi to protect and provide for the surviving native Christians.”⁹²⁵ As a practical step, Richard was invited to “draw

⁹²⁴Richard was also contacted by at least one other Governor for advice in settling various issues related to the Boxer Uprising. See, “Missionary Work and Reform in China,” *London Times*, 15 November 1901, p.6a. In May 1901, Richard was invited first by leading gentry then by the governor of Shanxi province to come there to deal with missionary problems resulting from the recent outbreak of violence against missionaries.

⁹²⁵Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.253.

up an outline of the manner for Religious Liberty which was to be circulated amongst the leading Viceroys and governors in the various provinces throughout China”⁹²⁶ so as to monitor the provincial officials,⁹²⁷ and to deal with the BMS for acceptable indemnity claims for destroyed properties and lost lives.⁹²⁸

On 30 April 1901, with the help of Shanghai Daotai, Richard and Cen Chunxuan, the Governor of Shanxi province, assigned an initial agreement to “settle the missionary and commercial troubles of Shanxi.”⁹²⁹ Soon Li and Qing requested the British Consul Sir Ernest Swatow to allow Richard to travel to Shanxi.⁹³⁰ Informed by Moir Duncan, a British interpreter in Beijing probably privy to the request,⁹³¹ Richard arrived first in Beijing on 14 May and met with Li and Qing. Then, he visited leading Protestant and Roman Catholic missionaries to design a common plan of some general principles for the settlement of the indemnity issue.⁹³² These included:⁹³³ (1) the mission societies were not willing to accept money in payment for the loss of missionary lives; (2) the government had to provide indemnities for the survival of native Christians; and (3)

⁹²⁶ 110th Annual Report, “Christian Literature for China,” *Missionary Herald* (May 1902), p.220.

⁹²⁷ BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 6 February 1901,

⁹²⁸ BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 3 April 1901.

⁹²⁹ Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.253.

⁹³⁰ BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 25 May 1901.

⁹³¹ BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, BMS MSS, 6 May 1901.

⁹³² BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 25 May 1901. On May 29th, Richard with Dr. Atwood (American Board) presented a “plan of regulations for the settlement of the Mission troubles in Shansi.” This plan had seven separate principles, one of which was for the opening of “schools” throughout the province. See: E. H. Edward, *Fire and Sword in Shansi: The Story of the Martyrdom of Foreigners and Chinese Christians* (Oliphant Anderson & Ferrier, 1903), pp. 122-124; pp.160-165.

⁹³³ “Notes,” *Chinese Recorder* 32 (December 1901), p. 625; n.a., “Memorial University,” *The Missionary Review of the World* 25 (April 1902), p.316. These articles indicated the refusal of indemnities at Richard’s suggestion. The refusal was suggested on the instigation of the China Inland Missions (CIM). See: n.a., “The Shansi Governor’s Proclamation,” *The Missionary Review of the World* 25 (June 1902), p.p.460-461. While it was important who initiated this gesture, the most important aspect was the impact it had on the minds of the Shanxi government leadership. The Governor of Shansi had been sufficiently impressed by CIM’s refusal of indemnities that he issued a proclamation as a eulogy at the memorial service “in honor of the Protestant missionaries who died at Taiyuanfu in 1900.” See: “A Noteworthy Document,” *The Missionary Review of the World* 25 (April 1902), n.p.; n.a., “A Heathen Panegyric on the Shansi Martyrs,” *The Missionary Review of the World* 25 (April 1902), pp.291-292.

steps had to be taken to remove the causes of such an outbreak of violence through the establishment of an institution of Western learning in the provincial capital of Taiyuan. In this institution, more exactly called a “university”, “Chinese students should be taught and fitted for positions of usefulness in connection with the government and as professors in other institutions of learning.”⁹³⁴ Specifically, Richard proposed that yearly installments of 50,000 taels (about £100,000) over a period of 10 years were needed for Shanxi province⁹³⁵ to establish “a university on Western lines in Taiyuan Fu to remove the ignorance and superstition that had been the main cause of the massacre of the foreigners.”⁹³⁶

Richard’s “educational program for Shanxi had wider issues”,⁹³⁷ not only satisfying the needs of the West but also supporting China to strengthen education and eventually to usher a permanent educational reform in accordance with the goal of the new reform for modernization. It was considered so excellent that the Chinese Peace Plenipotentiaries promptly approved it, with a Memorial sent to the Throne for approval.⁹³⁸ Meanwhile, Viceroys Zhang Zhidong and Liu Kunyi (Liu K’un-i 刘坤一) made a joint call to the Throne in July 1901 for educational reform after having been aware of Richard’s reform vision and endeavor for many years.

⁹³⁴“Notes,” *The Chinese Recorder* 32 (December 1901), p.625.

⁹³⁵*Ibid.*, p.252.

⁹³⁶Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.299.

⁹³⁷In *London Times*, November 15, 1901, p.6a, an article entitled “Missionary Work and Reform in China” disclosed Richard’s frequent communications with the Court about the necessity of educational reform: “Prompted by the knowledge of the Emperor of Kwang Hsu’s desire for reform, and supported by the powerful booklet, entitled ‘Learn,’ by Viceroy Chang Chih-tung, Mr. Richard telegraphed at regular intervals of a few weeks to officials at Singan-fu where the Court stayed for one year, urging the importance of reform in education.”

⁹³⁸“Notes,” *Chinese Recorder* 32 (June 1901), p.312.

Richard's perseverance was finally rewarded on 14 September 1901 when an edict was "issued commanding the establishment of a provincial university on Western lines in each provincial capital of the country," in addition to call for the conversion of all existing colleges to accept Western learning.⁹³⁹ This edict was the first one promulgated after the Boxer Uprising to establish a new educational system.⁹⁴⁰ Though hard to determine whether this edict was the Court's indirect endorsement of Richard's ideas or an effort to subvert Cixi's previous behaviors, it supported Richard's efforts for the educational reform in China that he had articulated among Chinese and Westerners for more than 20 years. Finally, on 8 November 1901, Richard received the final approval from the Chinese government to establish a university at Taiyuan Fu,⁹⁴¹ and he was authorized to undertake the appointment of professors, the development of curriculum, and the administration of the funds for ten years before passing the university into the hands of the provincial Government.⁹⁴²

Richard's educational reform stimulated what he believed was China's "overcoming evil with good" in its educational system.⁹⁴³ Very soon, on 16 and 25 November 1901, two significant edicts were promulgated to take Yuan Shikai's westernized college and its regulations in Shandong as the model for the new educational reform. Yuan, too, was very familiar with Richard's educational vision due to his involvement in the Reform Movement several years before. In 1902, more Imperial edicts were issued establishing a modern educational system, particularly in

⁹³⁹William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), p.255.

⁹⁴⁰W. A. P. Martin, *The Chinese: Their Education, Philosophy, and letters* (London: Trübner & Company, 1881), pp.1-85.

⁹⁴¹BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 13 November 1901.

⁹⁴²Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.299.

⁹⁴³BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 18 November 1901.

higher education. Obviously, Richard's original educational reform plan provided an impetus to trigger a series of subsequent actions which positively influenced China to learn from the West.

5.3.3 Challenges and Advances

In the late May 1901, Richard received approval from Li and Prince Qing. Invited by the Shanxi Governor, he began to organize a party of missionaries to return to Shanxi for establishing a university, and giving solace to the sufferers there and in the neighbor province, Shaanxi, at the same time, Richard searched for suitable foreign professors for employment.⁹⁴⁴

On 9 July, exactly one year after the missionaries were massacred there, a Shanxi Expedition including eight missionaries and several others arrived in Taiyuan Fu, without any armed guards. The team received a warm welcome. In following days, Richard kept up his correspondence with Edwards and the Governor by means of telegrams and letters.⁹⁴⁵ He also solicited financial support from the BMS for one missionary's salary to fill the presidency. In a letter to Baynes on 28 September, he wrote: "I am strongly pushing the Educational scheme on Shanxi at the expense of the Chinese government under the guidance of a missionary in the hope that it will encourage friendly relations between missionaries and officials."⁹⁴⁶ On 8 November, the fund from the indemnity was made available. A contract was drawn up and formalized between Richard and the Shanghai Daotai, on behalf of the Shanxi Governor, Cen, after negotiations recorded as follows:⁹⁴⁷

⁹⁴⁴BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 25 May 1901.

⁹⁴⁵BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 24 August 1901.

⁹⁴⁶*Ibid.*

⁹⁴⁷Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.301.

During the negotiations at the founding of the University, the Government sent a Taotai⁹⁴⁸ to see me with evident instructions to obtain my promise that a regulation be inserted in the Constitution that Christianity never should be taught in the University. ---I told the Taotai that the question of religious liberty had been agreed to by China in several treaties with foreign nations. If the Governor had now received special authority to supersede all these treaties and abrogate them, we might then discuss such a regulation forbidding Christianity. If he had not this power, there was no need of our wasting further time over the suggestion, as I would never agree to it.

Richard got the first annual installment of 100,000 taels in two months.⁹⁴⁹ Then, he went ahead to staff the institution. A. G. Jones and Mr. Duncan were selected to fill the president's position and Duncan accepted the offer. In early 1902, Richard visited Taiyuan Fu to "arrange some fundamental principles in person face to face with the Governor."⁹⁵⁰ He hoped "to make the Shansi University a lever for the uplifting of the leaders of the whole province to the level of the kingdom of Heaven as conceived in modern days."⁹⁵¹

Unexpectedly, when he arrived with the first foreign professor, he was dismayed to find that a new university was already established but "...placed under the control of an anti-foreign official who had done his best to oppose the Western University."⁹⁵² He believed that this institution violated his original agreement made with Li and Prince Qing, which had now been ratified by imperial edict as well as validated by the Shanghai Daotai for Governor Cen. He immediately appealed to Governor Cen about the impracticality of having two similar institutions. As an alternative, he wisely suggested a compromise of two Departments in one Imperial University: "a Chinese department, to be controlled by Chinese and to have purely Chinese studies, and a

⁹⁴⁸local ruler or governor.

⁹⁴⁹BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 26 August 1901.

⁹⁵⁰BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 26 March 1902.

⁹⁵¹*Ibid.*

⁹⁵²Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.300.

Western department, under my control for ten years, to have purely Western subjects.”⁹⁵³ In this way he hoped

there would be two small colleges, each imperfectly equipped, whereas, if the two were united into one, the Conservatives could have the opportunity in their own department of teaching Chinese learning; while in the other, under foreign direction, Western learning could be taught. By this division of labor greater efficiency would result without the expense of two sets of professors, apparatus and general equipment.⁹⁵⁴

However, the Governor was not convinced of and worried about the rivalry that might operate between the two institutions. In fact, the rival side which supported only Chinese learning had students show their opinions by writing an essay on “The advantages and disadvantages of a united university.” Quite surprisingly, out of 108 essays 68 were in favor of the union and only 13 definitely against it.⁹⁵⁵ Based on Richard’s explanation that an appropriate division of labor between the two Departments could be more efficiently and frugally than in one institution, the Governor and the rival side accepted Richard’s design three and half months later.

In June 1902, a new contract was drawn up to formulate regulations of a united Imperial University. It was signed in September and “confirmed by Imperial Seal from Beijing.”⁹⁵⁶ The settlement of the compromise prodded the Chinese government to overcome its inertia and to establish a system of modernized higher education. More than this, the running of the University, as well as the cascading effect of its establishment upon other provinces, ultimately vindicated the vision Richard had articulated for China’s modernization as early as 1880.

⁹⁵³*Ibid.*

⁹⁵⁴William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), p.256.

⁹⁵⁵*Ibid.*

⁹⁵⁶“Shansi Imperial University,” *The Chinese Recorder* 34 (September 1903), p.461.

The new institution had a firm commitment of governmental financial support of at least 50,000 taels a year for ten years. It also received support for the construction of necessary buildings for faculties and students. Until an appropriate campus could be completed, Governor Cen planned to hand over the best building in the city to the University for temporary use. Interestingly, on a day when he was dealing with the matter, Cen learned that the head of the Chinese Department, who had opposed Richard's plan from the very beginning, was now attempting to undermine Cen's authority. The Governor dismissed and evicted this official⁹⁵⁷ at once out of Taiyuan Fu.⁹⁵⁸

In September 1902, the construction of the university began. It was featured by designs to expand the old campus by including a new medical clinic,⁹⁵⁹ and to ensure further improvement to the buildings for increased enrollment with the advent of the railroad in three or four years.⁹⁶⁰ Besides, the whole university was lighted by electricity, with all the necessary apparatus, from a boiler to switches, transported on mule-back from Tianjin and installed by Mr. N.T. Williams, a mining professor.⁹⁶¹ The building of the Western Department included a reception hall containing Principal's office and a reception room for officials. In addition, the building included lecture rooms for law, literature, science, medicine, chemistry, and engineering, along with necessary offices

⁹⁵⁷Neither Richard's *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* nor Soothill's *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever had* mentioned the name of this official. I checked documents and found this official was Yao Wendong (姚文栋), the first director of Chinese Department. All the files show that Yao resigned.

⁹⁵⁸Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.301.

⁹⁵⁹Myron H. Peck, "Description of Buildings," *East of Asia Magazine* 3 (1904-1905), p.110.

⁹⁶⁰Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.301. The railroad had come to Taiyuan Fu by the time the University was devolved to provincial authorities.

⁹⁶¹Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.301.

for faculties and laboratories of chemistry and physics, respectively, as well as a room for drawing classes, a library, a museum, and a gymnasium. What is more, it contained residences for the foreign faculty members and bachelor members of the Chinese staff, as well as all the servants' quarters. It also owned an entrance yard and waiting-rooms for lower-level officials and their sedan chairs and runners on all occasions, especially in bad weather days.⁹⁶² The buildings were all constructed in Chinese traditional style, with the exception of the doors and windows which followed a Western pattern.⁹⁶³

Nevertheless, there were some problems. There were no suitable textbooks available for various six-year programs. For solutions, Richard used 10,000 taels of his budget every year to prepare textbooks. These textbooks were translated by a dedicated department established by Richard for the University within the S.D.K. in Shanghai. It consisted of 10 Chinese translators and writers and one Japanese translator supervised by a foreign superintendent, the Rev. John Darroch. Standard terminologies were defined in transliterating a list of biographical and geographical names. The productions translated by this bureau included Wallace's *The Wonderful Century*, Clodd's *Evolution*, Brougham's *Introduction to the Study of Science*, Remsen's *Chemistry*, Wang's *Tables of Chinese Chronology from the Chow Dynasty*, Rambaud's *History of Russia*, Meyer's *Universal History*, Gibbons' *History of Commerce in Europe*, *The Progress of Seven Great Nations in Education, Arts, and Commerce* with illustrative diagrams, Johnston's *Physical Geography*, the *Multum in Parvo Atlas of the World*, textbooks of *Mineralogy for Beginners*, and *Physics*, and *The Twentieth Century Atlas of Popular Astronomy* from the Tokyo Normal School. Clearly, these all-field textbooks listed above

⁹⁶²Myron H. Peck, "Description of Buildings," *East of Asia Magazine* 3 (1904-1905), pp.105-106.

⁹⁶³*Ibid.*, p.108.

demonstrated a Westernized education took shape in the Western Department of Shanxi University.⁹⁶⁴

The University opened in 1902, with an enrolment of 205 students. It had several foreign professors on staff. By contrast, Western colleges in other provinces that had started six months earlier had no foreign professors. The University therefore reached one of Richard's designs: allowing students to have access to and to understand foreigners, thereby fulfilling one of his purposes: "to remove ignorance."⁹⁶⁵ Because Western education depended mainly upon the faculties of the colleges and universities, Richard issued urgent appeals to Christian churches in Europe and the United States to "singly or unitedly, open one or two model universities at once, where the best Chinese will be thoroughly trained to become first-class professors in every branch of knowledge," so as to cultivate a friendly environment for Christianity.⁹⁶⁶ By 1904, the University had developed a good reputation: it was being referred to as "one of the leading modern universities in China."⁹⁶⁷ Moir Duncan, the first Principal of the Imperial University of Shanxi, was credited with "much of the success of the University."⁹⁶⁸ Soon after his untimely death in 1906, the Chinese government "conferred posthumous honors on him by raising his status to the first rank red

⁹⁶⁴ Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), pp.303-307.

⁹⁶⁵ Moir Duncan, "The Shansi Imperial University," *Missionary Herald* (September 1903), pp.478-479.

⁹⁶⁶ Timothy Richard, "The Outlook for Christianity in China," *The Missionary Review of the World* 25 (May 1902): pp.31-34.

⁹⁶⁷ R.O. Bevan, "The Imperial University at Taiyuanfu, Shansi," *East of Asia Magazine* 3 (1904-1905), p.100.

⁹⁶⁸ E. Morgan, "In Memoriam—Rev. M.B. Duncan, M., L.L.D.," *Chinese Recorder* 37 (October 1906): pp.558-561.

button.”⁹⁶⁹ Soothill claimed it was the second rank. For a particular look at Moir Duncan, see the book published by his wife and granddaughter.⁹⁷⁰

In the first few years after its establishment, the University was running in the period when China was experiencing a rapid but steady educational reform. In this period, some important innovations took place more broadly in China: in August 1901, it was announced that the *eight-legged essay* in the Civil Service Examination for degrees would be replaced from the following year by questions about current topics; in both September 1901 and October 1902, edicts were issued to provincial authorities to select students for studying abroad; in December 1902, Hanlin scholars and other scholars holding the highest degree in China were forced to have a study in relevant Departments of the Imperial University of Beijing; In July 1905, all the returning students from abroad were invited to attend a special *coup de grace* examination in August, the last one before the abolishment of the long-term, traditional Civil Service Examinations; in December 1905, the Ministry of Education came into being. These last two events marked the demise of the millenary traditional educational system and the advent of a Westernized modern one.

In 1906, a modern system of public education was established in China, and Shanxi University achieved the greatest success in China’s higher education:⁹⁷¹ it had the

⁹⁶⁹Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.306.

⁹⁷⁰J. Duncan and D. Raymer, *Lives lived of Moir and Jessie Duncan* (Toronto, Canada: Windy Ridge Books, 2000).

⁹⁷¹The University was referred to as “one of the leading modern universities in China.” See: L.R.O. Bevan, “The Imperial University at Taiyuanfu, Shansi,” *East of Asia Magazine* 3 (1904-1905): p.100. Richard credited Moir Duncan, the first principal of the Imperial University of Shansi, for “much of the success of the University.” See: E. Morgan, “In Memoriam—Rev. M.B. Duncan, M., L.L.D.,” *Chinese Recorder* 37 (October 1906): pp. 558-561. Soon after his untimely death in 1906, the Chinese government “conferred posthumous honors on him by raising his status to the first rank red button [Soothill claims it was second rank].” See: Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p. 306. Duncan was also awarded a red button. In detail see a book published by his late

largest enrollment of all with 339 students, and its first graduates went abroad for advanced study as well—25 students were sent to England for a further five-year study in mining and railway engineering, and among them 23 graduates were supported by the provincial government.⁹⁷² At that time, there were more students in England from the Shanxi University than from any other educational institutions in China.⁹⁷³

5.3.4 Accomplishment and Significance

As one of the two Joint Chancellors, Richard visited the University in 1908. At that time, the other Joint Chancellor, Bao Fen (Pao-fe 宝棻, 1856-1913), was also occupying the position of the Governor of Shanxi. Two of the original foreign professors, Bevan and Nystrom, were still on duty. Bevan had served as an Interim Principal of 1906-1907 after the death of Duncan in 1906, and was now serving as the vice principal under the new principal, William E. Soothill. In honor of Richard's visit, Dr. Liang, the President of the Provincial Assembly, convened students from all of the provincial schools, not only in Taiyuan Fu but also all other cities of the province. Some 2,000 pupils were gathered there, all from schools opened owing to the stimulus imposed by the University, e.g., agriculture schools, normal schools, military colleges, etc.⁹⁷⁴

wife and granddaughter, only for limited circulation: J. Duncan and D. Raymer, *Lives lived of Moir and Jessie Duncan* (Toronto, Canada: Windy Ridge Books, 2000).

⁹⁷²Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p. 306; William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), p.262.

⁹⁷³William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), p.262.

⁹⁷⁴William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), p.267.

Convinced that modern education had now taken a deep root in Shanxi Province, Richard decided to resign from his chancellorship when his 10-year tenure ended, as had been planned at the very beginning. In almost 10 years, Richard had been a Joint Chancellor with different Governors of Shanxi, men such as Cen Chunxuan and Bao Fen. In November 1910, Richard returned to China after a trip to England. He arranged a sojourn at Shanxi during his trip back from Beijing to Shanghai.

In order to demonstrate the Chinese people's respect to Richard, the Provincial Assembly deferred an official meeting for five days, an honor never voluntarily given before to any missionary by Chinese officials.⁹⁷⁵ More surprisingly, upon his arrival in Taiyuan Fu, Richard was given a remarkable reception with the highest terms of the immense service rendered to the whole province by the University. During this visit, Richard was sure of the fact that modern education would never be eradicated. Though there was still a period of time before the end of his tenure, Richard decided to resign in advance.

On 13 November 1910, Richard received assurance that the University would expand further and that the foreign professors' contracts would be continued. Two days later, Richard signed necessary documents to transfer his control of the University to the Chinese officials and gentry of Shanxi.⁹⁷⁶ By that time, 345 students had been under education in the Preparatory Program, and 252 had already graduated, among them 139

⁹⁷⁵“Shansi University: A Tribute to Dr. Timothy Richard,” *North China Daily News*, 15 December 1910.

⁹⁷⁶“Shansi University: A Tribute to Dr. Timothy Richard,” *North China Daily News*, 15 December 1910; n.a., “Dr. Timothy Richard and Shansi University,” *The Missionary Review of the World* NS 24 (July 1911); p.551. In his biography of *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), Soothill stated that he had expected to appoint Bevan to head the University, so as to retain the foreign faculty after Richard's retirement. However, Soothill alluded that “opposing forces in Peking” and “jealousy of the university and its success” had produced “a grudging spirit” in Peking though not in Shansi. Nevertheless, he indicated that the “success of the university was unrivaled in the country (pp.267-268).”

were bestowed the imperial degree of M.S.-equivalent Juren. Nearly 100 students were taking a four years' post-graduate course in Law under Bevan, in Advance Chemistry under Nystron, in Mining under Williams, and in Civil Engineering under Aust, for a future examination for Ph.D.-equivalent Jinshi. Two classes of sixty had just graduated, and there were sixty more in the Preparatory department set to graduate the following spring.

In addition to Richard's impact on modern education of China, as either recorded or demonstrated by the Imperial edicts of 1901-1906, this transfer of authority was his last contribution to China. It was the best evidence to indicate the greatness of his personality and his unsurpassed devotion to China: "Whatever the future may bring forth the province has most gracefully acknowledged its past indebtedness to Dr. Richard, and his colleagues."⁹⁷⁷ We note here that Richard's policy was sustained after his retirement. His successor, William E. Soothill, the Principal of the Western Department after Moir Duncan's death, was a missionary of the United Methodist Free Church Mission from Great Britain. Soothill considered that, though a University could give "lectures on general topics considered from the religious standpoint," it was not a "place for religious propaganda," but the one for learning about different cultures.⁹⁷⁸

Actually, Shanxi University was significant for serving as a model university throughout the nation. This was reflected in six aspects as follows. First of all, the University was the *role model* in China for the fusion of Chinese and Western cultures. The two Departments of the university were completely government-supported, but with a decidedly Christian bent in the Western Department. Although there were difficulties

⁹⁷⁷"Shansi University: A Tribute to Dr. Timothy Richard," *North China Daily News*, December 15, 1910.

⁹⁷⁸William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), p.258.

in teaching Christianity while learning Western science and technology, it was able to introduce it to students with circuitous approaches. For instance, Christian theology was never normally taught in the University. Mr. Duncan was fully satisfied with the opportunities he had. In his lectures on civilization, he often showed the beneficial results of Christianity. Besides, Governor Cen attempted to exclude the teaching of Christianity, but Richard disagreed.⁹⁷⁹ As a way to get around, foreign Christian faculties made use of every Sunday to do missionary service among the students in the University premises for courses like *Comparative Morals and Religions*. Not surprisingly, Richard found that, while students studied both the classics of the West and those of China, they had “a greater interest in the Bible and considered it as the root of Western civilization.”⁹⁸⁰

Second, the University was the *role model* in China for a successful joint chancellorship of universities. Despite the fact that the governance of the university was performed by both Richard and the provincial Governor, Richard had the power to fully control the funds, personnel, and curriculum of the Western Department. This meant that the Western Department was “an integral part of the Governmental Educational Institution for the province of Shanxi, but the finance, studies, and discipline [were] under the control for foreigners,” specifically, a Christian missionary.⁹⁸¹ More than this, Principal Duncan not only had the responsibility for teaching, but also for the daily management of personnel and students, and for the proper administration of the resources. He also oversaw the construction of new facilities into which the University

⁹⁷⁹Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), pp.300-301.

⁹⁸⁰The Bible was perceived as a classic of Western literature. See: Timothy Richard, *What the Bible is Doing in China*, A speech at the Bible Society’s Anniversary in Exeter Hall, 3 May 1905 (Eunice Johnson Collection on Timothy: Record Group 232, 2011), p.7.

⁹⁸¹Moir Duncan, “The Shansi Imperial University,” *Missionary Herald* (September 1903), p.479.

moved by 1906. As a matter of fact, Duncan was the most important person in the Western Department to communicate amicably with the Eastern one.

Third, the University was the *role model* in China for transfer of power. As the first foreign official of the university, Richard smoothly transferred his power to indigenous officials within the scheduled period, without any disruptions. This was unique in native Chinese universities in a system of feudal bureaucracy, where it was unusual for any officer to leave his position voluntarily. For Richard, the modernity of Western civilization was deeply rooted in Richard's pedagogical methodology and religious beliefs. All of his efforts were aiming at Christianizing China through modernized education rather than keeping power in the hands of a school, or a church, or an organization.

Fourth, the University was the *role model* in China for a successful Sino-foreign cooperation in running schools. During the first three years of a period of six years in total, students in the University participated in a program of studies that prepared them for the matriculation examination at London University. At that time, there were no other government-run universities in China with a similar curriculum. The subjects taught during the early years in China included mathematics, English, chemistry, physics, drawing, zoology, geography, physiology, law, history, and gymnastics. At the end of the three-year preparatory courses, students would be awarded certificates entitling them (a) to be employed as teachers in government schools, or (b) to enter any special courses for higher graduation. Because China required a large number of faculties in modern education, this three-year preparatory program at the University provided a supply of teachers. The last three years of study offered advanced but

specialized studies with degrees in law, sciences, language, medicine, or engineering after students' demonstration of competence in knowledge after examination. After that, the plan was that "the Chinese Government will, by the constitution of the institution, recognize the degrees, and the graduating students will be eligible for public office."⁹⁸²

Fifth, the University was the *role model* in China to resolve the problem of instructional languages in university's curriculum. Usually, there were two types of mission schools in those years. One was run by the fundamentalism, with instructions only in English; the other one was liberal, where students spent half a day in the study of western subjects and the other half on the Chinese classics. By contrast, Richard expedited the education process by hiring directly or indirectly interpreters to enable students to finish a mixed English/Chinese curriculum at the University in six years rather than 12 years.⁹⁸³ This was the right way to ensure a maximum of efficiency in a minimum of time.

Finally, the University was the *role model* in China to provide the admission criteria for the entrance of Chinese students into a university. Qualified applicants had to be Chinese graduates of either B.A.-equivalent Xiucai or M.A.-equivalent Juren, selected by the Literary Chancellor or Governor before some form of entrance examination.⁹⁸⁴ All qualified students were given a Western education in the University, superimposed upon their previous basis of learning in Chinese studies.⁹⁸⁵ The students were expected to be under 30 years of age and to make a contract to study for at least three years. They were charged no fees and received a monthly stipend of 2-8 taels

⁹⁸²Moir Duncan, "The Imperial University of Shansi," *East of Asia Magazine* 3 (1904-1905), p.105.

⁹⁸³William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), pp.261-262.

⁹⁸⁴Duncan Moir, "The Shansi Imperial University," *Missionary Herald* (September 1903), p.479.

⁹⁸⁵E. R. Lyman, "Psychological," *East of Asia Magazine* 3 (1904-1905), p.112.

distributed by the provincial government, not the Western Department.⁹⁸⁶ All academic materials, including books and writing materials, were provided at no charge by respective departments.⁹⁸⁷

5.4 Honors

From 1900, Richard's life-long endeavors in mission work began to be recognized internationally. In 1900, he received an honorary D.D. from Emory College in Oxford, Georgia (the Emory University in Atlanta from 1919).⁹⁸⁸ In 1901, he received another honorary title of Litt. D. from the Brown University of Providence, Rhode Island. In 1902, he was appointed a Co-Chancellor of the Imperial University of Shanxi, and the representative to the Emperor of all Protestant missions in China. In 1903, he obtained the rank of Mandarin of the Highest Grade (the red button), and several years later his ancestors were ennobled to the same rank three generations back.⁹⁸⁹ In 1907, he was decorated by the Chinese government with the rank of Double Dragon, 2nd order, and 2nd grade. These honors demonstrated the appreciation of both Chinese and foreign authorities for Richard's efforts with respect to reforms in China.

Richard has been memorialized by the Chinese people due to his unusual achievement in the educational reform in the late Qing Dynasty. His great influence has even lasted till today. His photo always hangs in the student cafeteria of Shanxi

⁹⁸⁶Moir Duncan, "The Imperial University, Shansi," *East of Asia Magazine* 3 (1904-1905), p.104.

⁹⁸⁷Moir Duncan, "The Shansi Imperial University," *Missionary Herald* (September 1903), p.479.

⁹⁸⁸In his book of Richard (William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had*), Soothill wrongly gave the years 1895 as the year for the D.D. from Emory College and 1900 for the honorary Litt. D. from Brown University (pp.323-324).

⁹⁸⁹A. J. Garnier, *A Maker of Modern China* (London: The Carey Press, 1945), p.85.

University at Taiyuan. His statue was erected in 2002 to highlight his career in the establishment of the University as one of the two Co-Chancellors. In fact, this University was the cornerstone of China's higher education. Since then, the University has weathered various wars and political winds and has endured many permutations. It continues today to be the premier university in the province and one of the leading higher education institutions in China.

CHAPTER 6

EXPANSION FEATURE IN RICHARD'S MISSION WORK:

CHRISTIANIZATION OF BUDDHISM

6.1 Cultural Conflict and Solution

After his first arrival at Yantai in 1870, Richard found that Fundamentalism was futile and of little effect in ridding Chinese people of their antagonism, alienation, and grievance towards Christianity.⁹⁹⁰ This situation was, on the one hand, pitting Western missionaries and Chinese Christians against Chinese local gentry and common people;⁹⁹¹ on the other hand, it resulted in such a situation that unarmed western missionaries and Chinese Christians became the victims of China's broad discontent against Western encroachment. In following years, he became increasingly conscious of the fact that successful mission work could not avoid the localization of Christian values by adaptations toward indigenous cultures. Otherwise, cultural conflicts were inevitable, as recorded by the thousands of "religion cases" in the late Qing China.

As a Christian, Richard believed that *Jesus Christ Conquers the World*. He spared no pains to insist on the ultimate salvation of all the Chinese people through Christianization which subsumed all the other religions. According to his view, western civilization was a precious gift of God to human beings; and it was Christianity alone

⁹⁹⁰ Albert J. Garnier, *A Maker of Modern China* (London, The Carey Press, 1945), p.53.

⁹⁹¹ Zhang Li and Liu Tangjian, *A History of Christian Religious Cases in China* (Chengdu: Sichuan Social Sciences Academy Press, 1987), pp.242-251. 张力、刘鉴堂, 《中国教案史》, 成都: 四川社会科学出版社, 1987年, 第242-251。

that led the advance of science and technology in the West.⁹⁹² Thus, only Christianity was qualified to be developed to a new, universal Religion. This Religion would not only pay extra attention to the modernity of Western civilization, but also be compatible with other religions (such as Christianity, Judaism, Mohammedanism, Buddhism, Confucianism, Taoism, Hinduism, and Shinto) by assimilating all the merits of these religions. Under the guidance of this new Christianity, Richard felt sure that all of the religions would⁹⁹³

dwell on principles and aims with which they are all agreed rather than disagreed, cooperate with one another by focusing essentially on their common objective, contribute to the mankind the great truths it has received from the inspiration of the One Holy Spirit; and, more important, strife and jealousy would disappear, good will and brotherly love would grow and flourish, righteousness and peace would reign, and the coming of the Kingdom of God on earth would be hastened.

With this new Christianity, Richard believed that the cultural conflicts could ultimately be solved thoroughly after building up mutual understanding, tolerance, acceptance, and respect of different cultural norms and values.

As a foreigner, Richard had long been appreciating Chinese culture, starting as early as from his college years in Wales by recognizing that China was the most civilized among non-Christian nations. Thus, he was conciliatory towards and admiring of the beauty, truth and goodness of various religions that had grown in China. In order to grow Christianity in this non-Christian land, Richard took it for granted that it was necessary for any forms of Christianity to take, at least initially, the advantages of all

⁹⁹² BMS, Richard Correspondence: to Baynes, 31 May 1884. Timothy Richard, "Wanted: Good Samaritans for China," In *Conversion by the Million* (Shanghai, Christian Literature Society, 1907), Vol. II, p.28.

⁹⁹³ Timothy Richard, "Proposal for the Formation of a League of Religions," In *Good Will* (Aberystwyth: National Library), dated 7 December 1918 (This was the last article Richard wrote before his death).

indigenous cultures so as to indigenize Christianity for effective evangelization.⁹⁹⁴ For this purpose, Richard studied Taoism, Confucianism, Shinto, Hinduism, Islam, and Buddhism, as well as Catholicism, which was a heresy in Protestants' eyes, before his appointment in *Shibao* in 1890.⁹⁹⁵ He also read different sacred books, visited various temples, sought face-to-face interviews with religious abbots and leaders, and produced tracts on all kinds of doctrines and rites.⁹⁹⁶

Interestingly, he found that, among all the religious beliefs, the formation of Chinese Buddhism, also known as Han-Buddhism, was an exact model for Christianization.⁹⁹⁷ This religion evolved from the imported Indian Buddhism 2000 years before. By getting rid of the fundamentalist fetters, Richard had more freedom in his new position to concentrate on topics in which he had long been engaged in, that is, how to localize Christianity in China by a cultural assimilation in a way similar to which had been used by ancient Buddhists. For this purpose, he concentrated particularly on the relation between Han-Buddhism and Christianity. Based on the results of his study, he proposed a universal norm of Christianization.

6.2 Intrinsic Connection between Han-Buddhism and Christianity

From medieval times on, various legends had circulated in China, telling stories of the growth of Buddhism on Chinese soil from ancient times. Nonetheless, the scholarly

⁹⁹⁴Peter Tze Ming Ng, "Timothy Richard: Christian Attitude towards Other Religion and Cultures," *Studies in World Christianity* 14, no.1 (2008), pp.75-78.

⁹⁹⁵Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.145.

⁹⁹⁶*Ibid.*, pp.86-89.

⁹⁹⁷Timothy Richard, *The New Testament of Higher Buddhism* (Edinburgh: T and Clark, 1910), p.4.

consensus was that Buddhism first came to China in the first century of the Common Era, that is, in the Han Dynasty. In Chinese history, Buddhism played a significant role up to modern times. Nevertheless, it had evolved from an imported Buddhism, the Indian Mahayana (Greater Vehicle) Buddhism, also called higher Buddhism, which assimilated virtues of indigenous Chinese Confucianism & Taoism to form a school of branches like Zen (Chan), Pure Land, and Esoteric schools, for example.

Encouraged by the successful localization of Mahayana Buddhism⁹⁹⁸ in ancient China, Richard studied Buddhism so as to find what differences there were between Buddhism and Christianity, and why Buddhism was so influential in China.⁹⁹⁹ He collected and read almost all of the noteworthy books written in English he could find on the subject.¹⁰⁰⁰ He also visited Buddhist temples. He was left with the impression that ordinary monks were not as well educated as abbots: while abbots were skilled in both Buddhist theory and practice, and followed strictly Buddhism's rules in their daily lives, monks could be issued certificates, stamped by an abbot, after regularly reciting morning and evening prayers, and studying a few points of ritual after only 50 days.¹⁰⁰¹

Richard thus focused more on Buddhist archives and books in Chinese. After becoming the General Secretary of the S.D.K. (later known as C.L.S.) in 1891, he studied a number of Han Buddhist works including, *Da Cheng Qi Shi Lun* (Ta-ch'eng Ch'i-hsin-lun 大乘起信论; *The Awakening of Faith in the Mahayana Doctrine*), *Lianhua Jing* (Lien-hua Ching 莲花经; *Lotus Sutra*), *Xiyou Ji* (His-yu Chi 西游记或天

⁹⁹⁸*The Great Vehicle* (大乘佛教), a major school of Indian Buddhism. Its doctrines were those of "one soul immanent for good in all the universe, of one Divine helper of men, of individual immortality and growth in the likeness of God, of the importance of faith in God to produce good works, and of the willingness of the best spirits to make sacrifices to save others."

⁹⁹⁹*Ibid.*, p.1.

¹⁰⁰⁰*Id.*, *Guide to Buddhahood* (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907), p.1.

¹⁰⁰¹William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary and the Most Disinterested Advisor the Chinese ever had*, (London: Seeley, Service and Co. Limited, 1924), p.183.

国之路; *A Mission to Heaven or Journey to the West*), and *Xuanfo Pu* (Hsüan-fo P'u 佛选谱; *Guide to Buddhahood*). He also collaborated with a Canadian missionary, Donald MacGillivray,¹⁰⁰² to compile a dictionary entitled *A Dictionary of Philosophical Terms*.

One of the important achievements he made in his study was the clarification of the historical relation between Han-Buddhism and Christianity. By following Professor Lloyd's research, a Tokyo College teacher, and both a Cambridge University man and a former missionary in China, Richard found that Buddhism had the same origin as Christianity, both of which came from Jewish religious thought.¹⁰⁰³ He saw a likeness between the doctrines of the Nichiren sect of Indian Buddhism and the speculations of the Alexandrian Gnostics. In reviewing the professor's papers, Richard made sure that the doctrines were drawn from *The Lotus Sutra*, a classical scripture in Han-Buddhism translated from one of the Mahayana scripts. He also confirmed that these scripture were a portion of the work produced by some of the Greek Fathers at Babylonia around the 2nd and 3rd centuries, but recorded by an Indian Buddhist residing in Alexandria during that time. When noticing that Christianity also originated there, Richard concluded that "...both came from a common source, Babylonia, where some of the Jewish prophets had written glorious visions of the Kingdom of God that was to come. Babylon then had

¹⁰⁰² Donald MacGillivray was born in Ontario, he graduated with honors from the University of Toronto. In late 1888 he followed Jonathan and Rosalind Goforth to the new north Henan mission field, where he worked for several years. He learned Chinese rapidly and soon became an authority on the language. He took on the task of revising and updating a standard dictionary, and its publication in 1898 established his scholarly credentials. Upon his return to China, after a furlough in Canada (1897-1898), the Timothy Richard asked him to join the C.L.S. For the next 30 years MacGillivray was a prolific scholar and a popular writer, translator, and editor. At the same time he continued to revise his dictionary, *A Mandarin-Romanized Dictionary of Chinese*, which had seven editions through 1925. He was compiler and editor of the volume *A Century of Protestant Missions in China* (1907) and editor of the first six editions of the *China Mission Year Book*, 1910-1915. He also wrote dozens of articles for the *Chinese Recorder*.

¹⁰⁰³ Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), pp.337-338.

much intercourse with Western India and Persia, as well as with Judea, Egypt, and Greece.”¹⁰⁰⁴

Besides, Richard exposed that Mahayana Buddhism not only had the same objective as Christianity, that is, the salvation of human beings in the world,¹⁰⁰⁵ but also had a similar pedagogy to the liberal Christianization, i.e., through appealing to *worthy* sages.¹⁰⁰⁶ He affirmed that Mahayana followed the doctrine of the merciful God and the salvation path guided by His *worthy* fellow He had chosen for mankind. For example, in Buddhist concepts, everyone was an unenlightened Buddha because of the original *sins* in their bodies; these should be washed out through Xiuxing (Hsiu-hsing 修行; spiritual practice) by following a *worthy* sage, Buddha Siddhartha Gautama¹⁰⁰⁷, nurtured as a model by God. Similarly Christianity considered that the sins could be removed by seeking spiritual faith and then the soul’s salvation (James 1:21) through Jesus, God’s chosen servant (Isaiah 42:1). Clearly, Richard believed, though with different solutions, Mahayana Buddhism and Christianity focused on the same theme, *sins*, and the same purpose, salvation. Therefore, the two religions shared an identical goal but in different “transcendent and immanent forms of God.”¹⁰⁰⁸

Moreover, Richard specifically expounded that Han-Buddhism might be a branch of Christianity. He found that five metaphysical and cosmological virtues of the indigenous Confucianism, i.e., Ren (Jen 仁; Benevolence), Yi (I 义; Righteousness), Li (Li 理; Good Manners), Zhi (Chih 智; Knowledge), and Xin (Hsin 信; Faithfulness),

¹⁰⁰⁴ *Ibid.*, p.339.

¹⁰⁰⁵ Ashvagosha, *Awakening of Faith* (Tr. Timothy Richard; Charles Skilton, 1961), p.xiii.

¹⁰⁰⁶ Alexander Baxter, *The Awakening of Faith*. Part one of series on Richard’s translation: *Chinese Recorder* LIV, no.10 (1923), p.585.

¹⁰⁰⁷ (乔答摩·悉达多 563-483 B.C.)—the prince later called Buddha, founder of the religion, Buddhism.

¹⁰⁰⁸ *Ibid.*, p.340.

contained also the ingredients of Taoism.¹⁰⁰⁹ After being exported to China by Indian Buddhist missionaries, Mahayana Buddhism became localized by assimilating these virtues and spread them in China. Because these moral and ethical conformities demonstrated God's instruction to His disciples to preach to the people in the secular world, Richard realized that Han-Buddhism might be a branch of Christianity in the Eastern world. For this reason, hundreds of millions of Han-Buddhists who were wearing Buddhist garb and using Buddhist nomenclature were in fact not Buddhists but practitioners in the Kingdom of God. In his opinion, Han-Buddhism had never been a religion outside Christianity; on the contrary, it was the gift offered by God to the East, expressing His mercy and love to the people in the Eastern world of the Earth, just as Christianity did to the Western world. Therefore, Richard concluded that any cultural conflicts between Christians and Chinese were unnecessary and unacceptable; on the contrary, mutual respect and harmony between seemingly different but virtually the same cultures should be established to lead Chinese people closer to God through the agency of converted elites under some universal culture.¹⁰¹⁰

Richard's liberal thinking was in sharp contrast to traditional studies. It frightened both religious people and academic researchers. On the one hand, we are in favor of Richard's ability of stretching out in his endeavor for cultural expansion; on the other hand, we are afraid Richard's methodology was not puritan in research which might cause divergence from truth, because historical events happened in history, not the era

¹⁰⁰⁹Timothy Richard, "Spread of Great Religions Throughout the World," In *China Mission Handbook*, ed. Jonathan Chao (Chinese Church Research Center, 1989), p.63.

¹⁰¹⁰Timothy Richard, *Conversion by the Million in China* (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907), pp.291-299.

he was living in. We cannot rely on only imagination, rather than on rigorous methods of science, to reconstruct history.

6.3 Literary Evidence of Buddhism-Christianity Relation

In studying Buddhist scripts, Richard found what he considered was convincing evidence to verify the close relationship between Buddhism and Christianity. It consists of several books, including *Qi Shin Lun*, *Lotus Sutra*, *A Mission to Heaven*, and other resources.

6.3.1 *Qi Shin Lun*

One Buddhist, Yang Wenhui, who had converted from a Confucian,¹⁰¹¹ told Richard that wherever Chinese teachings (e.g., Confucianism) failed to offer answers to life's questions, Buddhist scripts provided them. One such famous book in Chinese was entitled the *Jin Shi Lun*. The book was translated from its original Sanskrit version by a Buddhist missionary, *Paramartha* or *Zhendi* (Chen-ti 真谛), who lived in China during the Liang Dynasty (502-555A.D.).¹⁰¹² The original version was *The Mahayana-Sraddhotpada-Shastra*, written in the 1st century (A.D.) by Ashvaghosha of Benares or

¹⁰¹¹ Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.195.

¹⁰¹² George. E. Moule. "The Awakening of Faith (A discussion of Richard's translation)," *Chinese Recorder* XLII, no. 6 (1911), p.351.

Ma Ming (Ma Ming 马鸣), the reputed founder of Mahayana Buddhism and a Buddhist converted from Hinduism.¹⁰¹³ The book described the Mahayana doctrine which differed greatly from that of so called Primitive (or Hinayana) Buddhism, a derogatory Mahayana term which literally means small Vehicle.¹⁰¹⁴

Intuitively, Richard considered the relation between Mahayana and Hinayana was just like that between liberalism and fundamentalism, and he regarded this book as “a Gospel of great hope to the greater part of East Asian Continent.”¹⁰¹⁵ It was not only “one of the most important books in the world,”¹⁰¹⁶ but also the *Buddhist Bible* which offered its gospel of salvation through faith (or the belief) in Buddha, Buddhist Law, and Buddhist Sangha.¹⁰¹⁷ He ranked the book as the 5th among the sacred books in the world, following the Bible, the Koran, the Vedas, and the Confucian Classics.¹⁰¹⁸ In 1894, he became the first translator in the world to translate Ashvaghosha’s Sanskrit book into English in Shanghai, with the help of a Mr. Yang.¹⁰¹⁹ The translated book was entitled *The Awakening of Faith in the Mahayana Doctrine*. In his memoir Richard explained why he found this book was so important as to appeal to him:¹⁰²⁰

I sat up until the small hours of the morning reading the book (K’i Shin Lun) which had converted the Confucianist to Buddhism. At length I called out to Hill, who was lying down in the same room: “Listen! This is a Christian book. Though the terms are Buddhist, the thought is Christian.”

¹⁰¹³ Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.195.

¹⁰¹⁴ *Ibid.*

¹⁰¹⁵ Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.347.

¹⁰¹⁶ Ashvaghosha, *The Awakening of Faith in the Mahayana Doctrine* (Tr. Timothy Richard; London: T.& T. Clark 1910), p.v.

¹⁰¹⁷ Chan Wing-tsit, *Religious Trends in Modern China* (New York: Division of Farrar, Straus & Giroux. Inc., 1969), p.100.

¹⁰¹⁸ Timothy Richard, *New Testament of Higher Buddhism* (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1910), p.38.

¹⁰¹⁹ Alexander Baxter, *The Awakening of Faith*. Part one of series on Richard’s translation: *Chinese Recorder* LIV, no.10 (1923), p.591.

¹⁰²⁰ Timothy Richard, *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916), p.195.

We note here that the same original was re-translated later by a Japanese scholar, Daisetz Teitaro Suzuki, in 1900 in Chicago, the translation entitled *Ashvagoshā's Discourse on the Awakening of Faith in the Mahayana*.¹⁰²¹ However, both of the translated versions were in English and thus hard to understand by the most of Chinese people.¹⁰²²

Samuel Beal (1825-1889), an Orientalist scholar who had been the first Englishman to translate early records of Buddhism directly from Chinese versions, pointed out in his book, *Buddhism in China*,¹⁰²³ that Richard's *The Awakening of Faith in the Mahayana Doctrine* was in fact a quasi-Christian book.¹⁰²⁴ This reflected Richard's intuition in translation that the book should provide a framework of brotherhood between Christianity and Buddhism ultimately to provide a foundation of a universal world religion in future.¹⁰²⁵ He suggested that this

will satisfy all nations and races will not be born of any party cry, but will be born from the habit of looking at the highest and permanent elements in all religions, and gladly recognizing all that helps to save man, body, soul, and spirit, individually or collectively as Divine.¹⁰²⁶

Thus, what Richard aimed at was to expand Christianity as a universal religion by assimilating the highest and permanent elements of all other cultures so as to eliminate the differences among them, and to adapt Christianity more easily and peacefully to different circumstances in an indigenized appearance. With this in mind, Richard

¹⁰²¹Alexander Baxter, *The Awakening of Faith*. Part one of series on Richard's translation: *Chinese Recorder* LIV, no.10 (1923), p.591.

¹⁰²²Chan Wing-tsit, *Religious Trends in Modern China* (New York: Division of Farrar, Straus & Giroux. Inc., 1969), p.100.

¹⁰²³Samuel Beal, *Buddhism in China*, (London: Society for promoting Christian knowledge, 1884), p.263.

¹⁰²⁴Ashevagosha, *The Awakening of Faith in the Mahayana Doctrine* (Tr. Timothy Richard; London: T.& T. Clark 1910), p.xi.

¹⁰²⁵*Ibid.*, p.xii.

¹⁰²⁶Timothy Richard, *New Testament of Higher Buddhism* (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1910), p.35.

translated two key concepts from Han-Buddhism into English in Biblical words, namely, Zhenru (Chen-ju 真如; True Likeness or The True Model) with *God*; and, Rulai (Ju-lai 如来; God Incarnate, or True Likeness Come, or True Model Come) with *The Messiah*. To justify what he did, Richard referred to the passages he found in an old standard Buddhist text, *Wanfa Guixinlu* (Wan-fa Kwei-hsin-lu 万法归心录) published in the Kangxi reign period (1661-1722). He described in details that¹⁰²⁷

The Awakening of Faith...speaks of the universe being governed by One Mind or Soul which was manifested in two aspects. One was as the Eternal, Transcendent One (i.e., Zhenrumen or Chen-ju-men 真如门), the other as the Temporary, Immanent one (i.e., Shengmiemen or Sheng-mieh-men 生灭门). The book Wan Fa Kwei Sin Lun (i.e., Wan-fa Kwei-hsin-lu 万法归心录) published in the time of K'ang His (i.e., K'ang-hsi 康熙), explains Chen Ju as “tranquil, and deep and formless, like space; the original Form and the true Being from whom all the mountains and rivers, the earth with its grasses and forests of infinite varieties flow forth.” This is practically a description of God such as might be given by Christians. Julai Fo (i.e., Ju-lai Fo 如来佛; Fo 佛: Buddha), Ju Lai, the Eternal Model for man to copy as far as he can. This Eternal Model became immanent in time; in this form he is called Julai, “the Model Come” become immanent, or the Eternal Incarnate. We must remember that these terms are those of another faith, but they seem to me very clearly to express the Christian idea of Immanuel, God with us. He thus becomes more truly the Son of Heaven that is any ruler of the earth.

Richard appeared successful in skillfully applying Christian theistic terms in the translation of Buddhist literature into English. However, it was hard for his colleagues to justify this kind of momentous, nontraditional approach which lacked of a sufficient warrant from either philology, or history, or theology to set up a Christian theological system with Buddhist contents.¹⁰²⁸ For example, in 1907, Bishop George Evans Moule (1828-1912) read Richard's book, *The Awakening of Faith in the Mahayana Doctrine*. He expressed that, though having apparent similarities, there were great differences in

¹⁰²⁷Timothy Richard, *An Epistle to All Buddhists throughout the World* (Shanghai: publisher unavailable, 1916), p.7.

¹⁰²⁸Editorial, *Chinese Recorder* XLII, no. 6 (1911), pp.312-314.

doctrine between Christianity and Buddhism, and thus it was not suitable to assent any doctrinal analogy between them.¹⁰²⁹ Moule argued that early Buddhism was atheistic: e.g., the *Sanbao* (San-pao 三宝; Three Treasures) did not refer to Christian Trinity at all, not to mention that the Christian doctrines of Creation, Sin, and Resurrection were not present in Buddhism. Nevertheless, Moule admitted that there was a Theistic sect of Buddhists in Nepal that did exist, and that a Tathagata was said to manifest compassion.

Here we comment that the famous Jesuit missionary, Matteo Ricci, had contributed an unprecedented mission work in the early Qing China: he explained Christian doctrines and Gospels among Chinese elites with Buddhist terminology, that is, to Christianize people with Buddhist teachings, an easy approach to Chinese intellectuals. In the surge of Christianization in the late Qing China, Richard adopted a similar but more adventurous strategy toward Christianization: assimilating Buddhism as an integral and inalienable part of Christianity. This was an approach never employed before by missionaries.

Richard also insisted that the doctrines of Mahayana Buddhism could be identified with belief in a personal Deity, i.e., a theistic faith.¹⁰³⁰ This meant that Fo was equivalent to God.¹⁰³¹ Moreover, he stressed that Buddhists' Incarnation manifested their deep respect for and fear of the infinite but conceivable God and thus demonstrated their wish to follow Jesus, the *Messiah* (Christ) and the savior of the secular world.¹⁰³²

¹⁰²⁹George. E. Moule, *The Awakening of Faith* (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1911), pp.347-351.

¹⁰³⁰Timothy Richard, "Some Remarks on the Foregoing Paper," *Chinese Recorder* XLII, no. 6 (1911), p.p.353-354 (note: The "foregoing paper" was written by Bishop Moule on Richard's translation of *The Awakening of Faith*).

¹⁰³¹Timothy Richard, "New Buddhism", In *Conversion by the Million in China* (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907), pp.291-299.

¹⁰³²Timothy Richard, "Some Remarks on the Foregoing Paper," *Chinese Recorder* XLII, no. 6 (1911), p.p.353-354 (note: The "foregoing paper" was written by Bishop Moule on Richard's translation of *The Awakening of Faith*).

As a result, it was the duty and privilege of Christians to lead Buddhists to the Fountain of Truth, where Buddhists could find true solutions for secular problems.

Based on his study, Richard claimed that the unequivocal, unchanging message of Christianity was surpassingly superior above Buddhism at least during his time, though both of them were of the same origin. To support his argument, Richard contrasted the weaknesses of Buddhism and the merits of Christianity: Buddhist doctrine was vague, impersonal and dateless, while the Christian was definite, personal and historical; also, Christianity had what the other faith lacked, that without which the other must always be at a loss in dealing with practical problems and human needs.¹⁰³³ Therefore, though admitting that Buddhists also discovered fundamental laws in the Kingdom of God, Richard suggested that Christians had the privilege to guide Buddhists toward a deeper and clearer understanding of these tremendous gifts offered by the mercy of God.¹⁰³⁴

Richard's work was highly appreciated by his assistant in China, William Soothill. Soothill was the author of *Timothy Richard in China*. In recognizing that Richard's interpretation of *The Awakening of Faith in the Mahayana Doctrine* was accepted by numerous Chinese and Japanese Buddhists, Soothill commented that Richard was "the advocate, if not the discoverer, of a new mode of regarding Mahayanism, and of a new interpretation which in principle is more faithful to the form Buddhism found in China than the older method of dependence on Sanskrit or Pali Records."¹⁰³⁵

¹⁰³³*Ibid.*

¹⁰³⁴Timothy Richard, *An Epistle to All Buddhists throughout the World* (Shanghai: publisher unavailable, 1916), p.5. "The Beginning of a Permanent Peace," manuscript dated London, 13 September 1917, in Richard MSS., National Library, Aberystwyth.

¹⁰³⁵William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), p.317-318.

6.3.2 *Lotus Sutra*

Shakyamuni was the founder of Buddhism. Before his entry into Nirvana on the Vulture Peak in India, he was said to have preached to his disciples the last discourse and gave revelations, the compendium of which was the *Lotus Sutra*.

According to Richard's study, the *Lotus Sutra* presented the salvation theme of Christianity.¹⁰³⁶ For example, its text revealed a monistic doctrine that Buddhahood, the perfect Bodhisattvas¹⁰³⁷ (enlightenment), was not reserved for Saints alone, but was latent in every person including the most humble; no matter how wicked a man might be, he was potentially a Buddha; and, all men could achieve salvation through the compassionate help of Bodhisattvas.¹⁰³⁸ Therefore, Shakyamuni revealed that all the ages and all the levels of men were able to obtain salvation through Faith.

This salvation theme motivated Richard to analyze the analogy between Buddhism and Christianity in more details. He compared the *Lotus Sutra* with Jesus's last words to his Apostles before the Ascension, wherein He promised to send His Holy Spirit to guide them in the way of Truth.¹⁰³⁹ Richard found that the Son of God, Jesus Christ in the New Testament, was allegorically similar to Guanyin (Kuan-yin 观音; Bodhisattva), the Divine Being of Infinite Love and Compassion; besides, the animating message of *Life, Light, and Love* in the *Sutra* was parallel to the essence of St. John's Gospel.¹⁰⁴⁰ Richard believed that the *Sutra* proclaimed the uniqueness of the incarnation of the

¹⁰³⁶Timothy Richard, *New Testament of Higher Buddhism* (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1910), p.127.

¹⁰³⁷A saintly Buddhist of the Mahayana School who postpones going to Nirvana in order to help others in the world.

¹⁰³⁸William Theodore de Bary and Donald Keene, *Sources of Japanese Tradition* (New York: Colombia University Press, 1958), p.118.

¹⁰³⁹Timothy Richard, *New Testament of Higher Buddhism* (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1910), p.129.

¹⁰⁴⁰*Ibid.*, p.134.

Great Mighty One by demonstrating the efficacy of His grace and His power to save men through their Faith in Him and through obedience to His doctrine and law.¹⁰⁴¹

Richard translated the *Sutra* with a great many footnote references to the Old & New Testaments (mainly the Psalms, the Books of Job, Daniel, and Isaiah); patristic writings of both Oriental and Occidental sources such as the Epistles of St. Paul, the Synoptic Gospels, St. John's Gospel, the Epistles of St. Peter and St. James; writings of early Church Fathers including St. Ignatius of Antioch, St. Clement of Rome and St. Irenaeus; as well as other sources from ancient Chinese thinkers (e.g., Laozi or Lao-tzu 老子) and various Buddhist scriptures. Richard acknowledged that, like the Bible, the *Sutra* emphasized the elimination of vices and the practice of virtues by setting up a universal outlook on which world unity and harmony could be built; more important, such an ideology would be a synthesis of all that was the noblest, truest, and best in each of the world's greatest religions.¹⁰⁴²

Based on his study, Richard declared that the similarities between the great Eastern and Western religions provided the foundation for a unified worldwide religion; and that the devout of all nations (Chinese, Indian, Arab and the West) could, on one side, worship together one God, to save men, to discover and to use the great forces that God had provided in Nature for the peace and progress of the whole human race; on the other side, live harmoniously as loving members of one great family, with the blue tent of heaven spread over all, and lighted by the ever glorious, never extinguished lamps of sun, moon and stars (Rom. VIII. 14).¹⁰⁴³ Richard thus concluded that the atheism of

¹⁰⁴¹*Ibid.*, p.135.

¹⁰⁴²*Ibid.*

¹⁰⁴³Timothy Richard, *An Epistle to All Buddhists throughout the World* (Shanghai: publisher unavailable, 1916), p.11.

Buddhism should be replaced by Christianity due to the fact that the Christianized world was the real extension of the Kingdom of God on the Earth; and that Christ, regarded as Guanyin in China, was the Incarnate God who undertook the Great Atonement to bring men to Heaven, and was the Great AT-ONE-MENT to reconcile the East and the West and bring them into tune.¹⁰⁴⁴

This study had never been done before Richard. As a real Christian missionary, he believed that the truths of Buddhism about the Life, Light and Love, as expressed in the *Lotus Scripture*, had precisely the same core as those taught in Bible.¹⁰⁴⁵

6.3.3 A Mission to Heaven

In China, there were four literary masterpieces which had lasted for hundreds of years. One of them, written by Wu Cheng'en (Wu ch'eng-en 吴承恩, 1510-1582) in Ming China (1368–1644), was entitled *Xiyou Ji*. (西游记). This novel recalled a real, great event in the history of Chinese Buddhism: the Chinese pilgrim-monk Xuanzang (Hsüan-tsang 玄奘, 602-664), traveled to India in 629 A.D. and stayed there for 15 years to learn Mahayana Buddhism. He later took back to China 658 sacred sutras (Buddhist scriptures), in a total of 5048 volumes, all in the Sanskrit language.¹⁰⁴⁶ In the novel, the author portrayed four animals (a monkey, a pig, a river-ogre, and a horse) to be Xuan Zang's disciples who protected him during the journey to meet Buddha Sakyamuni. The

¹⁰⁴⁴Timothy Richard, *New Testament of Higher Buddhism* (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1910), p.11.

¹⁰⁴⁵William E. Soothill, *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had* (London: Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd., 1924), pp.317-318.

¹⁰⁴⁶Timothy Richard, "One of the World's Literary Masterpieces," *Journal of the North Branch of the Royal Asiatic Society* XLIV (1913), p.2.

novel presented a lot of religious, political, and moral aphorisms in a clever and amusing way through a series of unexpected circumstances that the five characters encountered on their way to India.¹⁰⁴⁷

Though not an epic like the Indian Mahabharata by Vyasa, the Iliad by Homer, or those of Dante and Milton, Richard regarded this book as a combination of Christianity and Buddhism to address two great forces, Good and Evil, which worked through their conflict in Heaven, on the Earth, and in Hell, with the final triumph of the Good.¹⁰⁴⁸ He summarized the three most important insights offered by the novel :¹⁰⁴⁹ (1) the highest creed of Asia (man's refuge or belief) centered on God (Namo Fo or Na-mo Fo 南无佛), in the Laws of God (Namo Fa or Na-mo Fa 南无法), and in the Teachers of those Laws (Namo Seng or Na-mo Seng 南无僧); (2) the highest ideal of all was to be a Godlike; (3) the highest judgment of Heaven was to reward all men equally for doing the best they knew.

While translating the novel into English, Richard made comparisons between the Buddhist teachings in Han-Buddhism and the doctrine of salvation in Nestorian Christianity. The Nestorian doctrine described Jesus as a unified person of two natures, the man Jesus and the divine Son (or Logo) Jesus of God; by following his guidance, mankind could be saved because Jesus was both an elite person and a savior. However, by contrast, Chinese people, like Xuanzang, though able to travel to Heaven, had to return due to the lack of an adequate teacher to express God's complete words in Sutras about the path to salvation.¹⁰⁵⁰ In terms of the deficiency in Buddhism's doctrine,

¹⁰⁴⁷*Ibid.*, p. 3.

¹⁰⁴⁸*Ibid.*, p.1.

¹⁰⁴⁹Timothy Richard, *New Testament of Higher Buddhism* (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1910), p.xxiii.

¹⁰⁵⁰*Ibid.*

Richard thought that Mahayana Buddhism at most had a partial knowledge of salvation; for this reason, he argued that missionaries would perform an inestimable work in missionary activities by guiding Chinese people to uplift spiritually the Divine thought through understanding, accepting, and spreading the complete truth shown in Christianity.¹⁰⁵¹ We admit that Richard's thinking is daring, imaginative, but to some extent unjustified.

6.3.4 Other Resources

Richard also paid attention to other Chinese Buddhist monographs. One of them was *Guide to Buddhahood*, laying out exposing the essence of Buddhist theology. Originally published in 1593 A.D, it provided a detailed and comprehensive illustration of the evolution of human spirituality. It listed all Buddhist levels from the lowest class, “evil”, to the highest one, “Buddhahood”, with a step-by-step growth in Discipline, Contemplation, and Wisdom in middle classes.¹⁰⁵² Richard published its English version in 1907. However, after a comparison with the *Awakening of Faith in the Mahayana Doctrine*, he recognized both the strength and weakness of Buddhist theology: On the one hand, “the Strength...lies in its systematic arrangement of a complete view of the universe, its aim to remove the suffering of all living beings by Ethics and by Union with the Supreme Divine Will which rules all;” on the other hand,

¹⁰⁵¹Timothy Richard, “One of the World’s Literary Masterpieces,” *Journal of the North Branch of the Royal Asiatic Society* XLIV (1913), p.4.

¹⁰⁵²Timothy Richard, *Guide to Buddhahood: Being a Standard Manual of Chinese Buddhism* (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907), p.v.

The Weakness lies in its indictment of the sexual element in the universe and its vain efforts to stamp it out; its countless imaginary worlds and its imaginary beings inhabiting each, its neglecting in China, where most of the Buddhists of the world are, to take part in the practical improvement of the material, social, educational and political conditions of men regarding all such things as compared with the eternal, nothing but vanity.¹⁰⁵³

In addition, *Jingang Jing* (Chin-kang Ching 金刚经; Diamond Sutra), a well-known Buddhist sutra in China, was said to contain a messianic prophecy in the 6th chapter, supposedly uttered by Shakyamuni, though the notes had been issued 500 years after his death. Richard translated that part which predicted a great Teacher of Religion would appear in whom Shakyamuni urged his followers to believe at once, for countless blessings from and through Him.¹⁰⁵⁴ Richard was convinced that this was direct evidence in Buddhist scriptures which confirmed the coming of Christ. He thus supposed that all who believed in the Sutra ought to study the teachings of Christ, because Christ was the great Teacher to lavish his Love and blessing upon mankind, as foretold by Buddha.¹⁰⁵⁵

In 1916, Richard published a bilingual book, *An Epistle to All Buddhists throughout the World*, in both English and Chinese. The book followed the style of St. Paul's Epistle to the Hebrews. It reiterated what was already expressed in *The Awakening of Faith in the Mahayana Doctrine*, *The Lotus Sutra*, and *A Mission to Heaven*. It declared that the doctrines of both Christianity and Mahayana Buddhism came from a common source, Babylonia;¹⁰⁵⁶ and, the most strikingly, it suggested that Mahayana Buddhism was an offshoot of Christianity, or a modified form of

¹⁰⁵³*Ibid.*

¹⁰⁵⁴*Ibid.*, p.2.

¹⁰⁵⁵W. T. De Bary, Irene Bloom, and Joseph Adler, *Sources of Chinese Tradition* (2nd ed.; Columbia University Press, 2000), p.332.

¹⁰⁵⁶*Ibid.*, p.6; Also id., *New Testament of Higher Buddhism* (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1910), p.49.

Christianity.¹⁰⁵⁷ To support these arguments, the book declared that God sent a series of sages and lawgivers to guide mankind: in China the Emperors Yao and Shun (c. 2000 B.C.) and 1500 years later, Confucius¹⁰⁵⁸; Hammurabi in Babylonia (c. 2000 B.C.); Emperor Akhenaton in Egypt (c. 1360 B.C.); Gautama Buddha in India (500 B.C.); the *Bhagavad Gita* in India (100-200 A.D.); Mohammed (600 A.D.); Abraham, David, and Isaiah in the Old Testament; and Christ as well as his Twelve Apostles in the New Testament.¹⁰⁵⁹

In addition, the book listed two examples of Christ's apostles who worked in Asia: John and Thomas.¹⁰⁶⁰ John's influence on Buddhism, according to Richard, was obvious after he *became Bishop of Ephesus*, and his Gospel had a wide circulation in Egypt from which it was carried out by Egyptian merchants to Ceylon in India where the Tian Tai school of Buddhism expounded it into the Lotus Scripture of *Life, Light, and Love*,¹⁰⁶¹ the same in essence as the Johannine Gospel. As for Thomas, Richard claimed he went to India as an architect and built a palace for King Kanishka. There, he met the learned Hindu, Ashvagosha, and educated him in Christian doctrine, especially that pertaining to the Incarnation, Death, and the Redemptive Mission of the Savior, as well as the immortality of the soul. After his conversion to this new Faith, Ashvagosha wrote the work Chinese knew as *Jin Shi Lun*, which all Buddhists regarded as "the fountain-head

¹⁰⁵⁷*Ibid.*, p.4.

¹⁰⁵⁸The Latin form of the name Kong Fu Zi (Kung Fu-tsu 孔夫子 351-479 B.C.), the great philosopher of China's Chou Dynasty period.

¹⁰⁵⁹*Ibid.*, pp.2-3.

¹⁰⁶⁰*Ibid.* p.4.

¹⁰⁶¹*Ibid.* p.6.

or beginning of Higher Buddhism.”¹⁰⁶² In this way, Buddhism virtually embodied the Christian theology handed down from the Apostles of Jesus Christ.¹⁰⁶³

Richard asserted that, though not as complete as Christianity in revealing the truth of God, Buddhism was virtually compatible with God’s revelation and the message of salvation, at least to some extent but in a different way.¹⁰⁶⁴ Unfortunately, as pointed out by some experts in Indian tradition, such as William Theodore de Bary, Stephen Hay, Royal Weiler, and Andrew Yarrow, there were flaws, if not mistakes, in Richard’s studies. For example, the Tian Tai School did not exist at that time; more seriously, Ashvagoshā could not be the converter because Thomas could hardly live in the kingdom of Kanishka (A.D.120-160): it should be Nagarjuna, a philosopher of the Satavahana period, who was the formulator and determiner of Mahayana philosophy, and the founder of the Madhyamika School of Mahayana philosophy.¹⁰⁶⁵ In reality, Mahayana Buddhism took its final shape in the 2nd century A.D., and reached its culmination under the impetus of Nagarjuna, the 13th patriarch.¹⁰⁶⁶

From the above, we see that Mahayana Buddhism did occur later than Christianity. However, there was no direct proofs to show that Buddhism came from Christianity. With a purpose to assimilate Buddhism logically into Christianity, Richard tried hard to demonstrate the close relationship between the two in order to set up a kind of compatible universal ideology for Christianization, and then to take the advantage of the modernity of Western civilization to convert China to a Christianity-dominated country

¹⁰⁶²Timothy Richard, *An Epistle to All Buddhists throughout the World* (Shanghai: publisher unavailable, 1916), p.5.

¹⁰⁶³*Ibid.*, p.6.

¹⁰⁶⁴*Ibid.*, pp.1-11.

¹⁰⁶⁵William Theodore de Bary, Stephen Hay, Royal Weiler, and Andrew Yarrow, *Sources of Indian Tradition* (New York: Columbia University Press,1958), p.158.

¹⁰⁶⁶Maurice Percheron, *Buddha and Buddhism* (New York: Harper, 1957), p.112.

with the help of advanced science and technology. Yet whether correct or wrong academically, Richard's approach to a universal religion was an historically innovative attempt to provide an extraordinary perspective in cultural studies. More important, employing such a religion to solve cultural conflicts was so unprecedented that it transcended mission philosophy of most missionaries of his time, even earlier times.

6.4 Great Unity under Christian Universalism

After finding the compatibility between Buddhism and Christianity, Richard continued his study to establish a universal religion in China through localizing Christianity via assimilating the essence of Han Buddhism, a successfully localized form of Indian Mahayana Buddhism. In his mind, this universal religion should dominate some global body, like a League of Religions, under the guidance of Christian Universalism.¹⁰⁶⁷

However, this Universalism appeared to be too idealized a deep desire to be attainable in practical mission work. The real bone of contention was born from the kernel of this Universalism: there was only one everlasting true God, by Him everything is created in the universe; but everyone of all ethnicities and races needs redemption. Thus, this exclusiveness rather than complementarity of the Universalism made Christianity face a sort of predicament in both cultural exchange and religious symbiosis

¹⁰⁶⁷Timothy Richard, *An Epistle to All Buddhists throughout the World* (Shanghai: publisher unavailable, 1916), p.5. "The Beginning of a Permanent Peace," manuscript dated London, 13 September 1917, in Richard MSS., National Library, Aberystwyth.

in the process of evangelization.¹⁰⁶⁸ As early as in the late Ming the earliest Jesuit missionaries had realized the challenge. They adopted a tactic to make any headway in the propagation of Christianity: to bring about a split between indigenous Confucianism and imported Buddhism in China, i.e., , by augmenting the first and suppressing the second (扬儒抑佛 *Yang-Ju I-Fo*).¹⁰⁶⁹ This technique was well demonstrated in *Matteo Ricci's Complete Corpus in Chinese* (利玛窦中文著译集 *Matteo Ricci's Chung-wen chu-i-chi*),¹⁰⁷⁰ where all of Ricci's written accounts of approaches were collected, e.g., the most influential one, *The True Meaning of the Lord of Heaven* (天主实义 *the T'ien-chu shih-i*).¹⁰⁷¹ It had already had major implications for the Christian theologians and had served as a norm for missionaries¹⁰⁷² before Richard's arrival in 1870.

Ricci was the most successful missionary apologist in China before Richard, though his Christianization failed at last. He was recognized by the Chinese scholars as the pioneer in the development of modern science and technology of China, especially in astronomy as well as celestial mechanics. He spoke fluent Chinese, wore traditional clothes, and behaved as a pure indigenous person to present the Christian faith to the Chinese nation confidently as a “man of China,”¹⁰⁷³ or, more exactly, as an

¹⁰⁶⁸Williston Walker, *A History of the Christian Church*, (New York: Charles Scribner's Son, 1959), pp.425-548.

¹⁰⁶⁹also inaccurately translated as “Remove Buddhism and Augment Confucianism (*Ch'u Fo Pu Ju* 除佛普儒)” in: Matteo Ricci, Nicholas Tregault, *China in the 16th Century: The Journals of Matthew Ricci:1583-1610*, tr. Louis J. Gallagher, (New York: Random House, Inc. 1953), p. 448.

¹⁰⁷⁰Zhu Weizheng, (*Matteo Ricci's Chung-wen chu-i-chi*, *Matteo Ricci's Complete Corpus in Chinese*), (Shanghai: Fudan University Press), 2007, pp.1-802. 朱维铮:《利玛窦中文著译集》, 上海: 复旦大学出版社, 2007年。

¹⁰⁷¹Matteo Ricci, Douglas Lancashire, Peter Hu Kuo-chen, Edward J. Malatesta, *The true meaning of the Lord of heaven = T'ien-chu Shih-i* (天主实义), (St. Louis: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1985), pp.1-485.

¹⁰⁷²D. Lancashire, “Buddhist Reaction to Christianity in Late Ming China”, *Journal of the Oriental Society of Australia*, 6(1-2), 1968, pp.82-103.

¹⁰⁷³G. L. Harris, “The mission of Matteo Ricci, S. J.: A Case Study of an Effort at Guided Culture Change in China in The Sixteenth Century”, *Monumenta Serica*, 25, 1966, p.70.

approximation of a special group, the literati.¹⁰⁷⁴ By realizing that the resistance to Christianization came dominantly from Buddhism as well as Taoism, Ricci believed Confucianism, a mixture to some extent of Buddhism and Taoism, could be helpful to assist mission work as a kind of political and ethical philosophy in communications with Chinese people. He quoted widely the Confucian classics to emphasize that Christianity's supreme deity was the natural fulfilment of all that was best in Confucianism, and he borrowed comprehensively the Buddhist and Taoist words and terms to explain the Christian doctrines, belief, and practices. In this way, he expected Christianity could be easily understood by Chinese literati first of all, and then successively by more and more indigenous people via a top-down flow to eventually wash off Buddhism and Taoism, and at last make a reverse shot to replace Confucianism, a religion more or less influenced by Buddhism.

The strategy seemed to be impeccable for evangelization and as a matter of fact gained some positive responses when started at the level of cultural exchange. However, it was still too weak to shake traditional believes, customs, and thoughts. In spite of nearly 300 years of Christian missions, missionaries failed to establish any independent Chinese Christian theological system, and yet, a little ironically, none of the Chinese converts found it necessary to regard themselves as cutoff from Chinese traditions; while at the same time China initiated training scientific officers and establishing observatories with the help of missionaries in science and technology. It could be said, without fear of exaggeration, that during about 100 years from the end of the Jesuit

¹⁰⁷⁴S. B. Schwartz, *Implicit Understandings: Observing, Reporting and Reflecting on the Encounters Between Europeans and Other Peoples in the Early Modern Era*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), p.416.

campaign to the Opium Wars, Christianity was assimilated and became disappeared in China, with only a few churches standing lonely in major cities, such as Beijing, Tianjin.

The situation changed greatly in both external and internal aspects when Richard came in the mid-19th century. Externally, the European renaissance in the 15th and 16th centuries, the evangelical revival in the 18th century, and the industrial revolutions in the 18th and 20th centuries, drove Western civilization to catch up and surpass China rapidly; and, the power of Western capitalist states surged and consolidated in the 19th century. Internally, the imperial Qing Dynasty gradually waned from the end of the 18th century due to China's self-satisfaction of itself and self-isolation from the rest of the world. The Opium Wars awakened China to face challenges of both an imperialistically-invading West and a technologically-advanced West. In response, a learning-strengthening-defending policy came into effect, leading to, e.g., the Self-strengthening Movement.

Under the new circumstances, Richard's approach to universal religion was historically innovative. It provided an extraordinary perspective in cultural studies. Though out of a normal theological college, he was equipped ideologically with liberal Protestant belief of Christian Universalism that God was a loving God who would not alienate anyone from his presence for all time.¹⁰⁷⁵ Under the love of God, Richard believed that all of the different faiths had their own version of this universal mercy, and every religion reflected its own understanding of the universal light that God showed upon it. Therefore, cultural and ethnic conflicts were unnecessary at all; instead, all religions should co-exist together in the kingdom of God.¹⁰⁷⁶ Clearly, this consideration

¹⁰⁷⁵Beatrice Hitchcock, *The Evolution of Unitarianism & Universalism: A Liberal Inheritance*, Sermon, High Plains Church Unitarian Universalist, 9 June 2013, pp.1-13.

¹⁰⁷⁶Timothy Richard, "The Influence of Buddhism in China," *Chinese Recorder* XXI, no. 2 (1890), pp. 63-64.

of multi-religion coexistence was far more rational in Protestant evangelization than Jesuits' thinking, the theme of which was to destroy indigenous cultures. While Jesuits' approach was shown ephemeral in history inevitably, Richard's leading thought possessed stronger vitality and greater superiority. According to his study, the Messianic teachings of early Christianity had permeated and merged with the salvific will of Indian Buddhism, that is, a desire that all humankind be enlightened or saved; and, the prevalence of Buddhism in China channeled the Christian salvation messages of hope and redemption.¹⁰⁷⁷ For this reason, he believed that a universal religion could grow from the Great Unity of different ones in the secular world. In this way, Richard took advantage of Christian theistic terms in his studies on Mahayana scriptures and expounded more specifically.

However, Richard realized that there was a long way to go before a universal religion could be established. This was because, though modern progress had promoted interactions among all the cultures in the world, the apparent collision of different interests and a lack of mutual understanding had led to competition, jealousy, incompatibility, and even catastrophic conflicts like wars or cases of religious persecution. To deal with this situation, Richard believed that a League of Religions should be established in advance; the League should take measures to avoid any kind of destructive events which might endanger the harmony of the mankind; it should also adopt a universal religion as a moral basis to Christianize China as a whole by converting its elites first and then its people, but not just in one region or in one

¹⁰⁷⁷ *Ibid.*

province----this is nothing else but Richard's Great Unity of different religions under *Christian Universalism*.¹⁰⁷⁸

Richard's Universalism has aroused considerable debate. One opinion has stipulated that, although a dogmatic relation between some texts of Mahayana Buddhism and those of Christianity did exist and was surely worthy of remark, it would have been nevertheless impossible for Christianity to influence ancient India and its Buddhism. This was because of discrepancies in the time of appearance of the two religions: Buddhism was several hundreds of years earlier than Christianity in history.¹⁰⁷⁹ Another comment accepted that there could have been some Christian impact on Mahayana Buddhism because of the early active existence of Christian missionaries in Persia, a region at the center of Nestorian Christianity and of cultural diffusion throughout Asia. However, it was still equally possible that the similarities between Buddhism and Christianity were due to the fact that compassionate minds everywhere tended to think alike.¹⁰⁸⁰ Unexpectedly, David Hill, one of Richard's close friends, opposed Richard's viewpoints of the similarities between Buddhism and Christianity. Hill opposed Richard by saying, though with some admiration, that those results were nothing but Richard's own imagination.¹⁰⁸¹

Richard did not pay much attention to the disputes because he had experienced a lot in his early mission life. He insisted that "there was no truth that could not be apprehended by God." In his book, *The Influence of Buddhism in China*, he consistently

¹⁰⁷⁸Timothy Richard, "The Beginning of a Permanent Peace," manuscript dated London, 13 September 1917, in Richard MSS., National Library, Aberystwyth.

¹⁰⁷⁹Louis de la Valles Poussin, *Buddhism* (England: Catholic Truth Society 1960), p.30.

¹⁰⁸⁰William Theodore de Bary, Stephen Hay, Royal Weiler, and Andrew Yarrow, *Sources of Indian Tradition* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1958), p.163.

¹⁰⁸¹W. T. A. Barber, *Missionary and the Saint* (London: Charles H. Kelley, 1898), p.211.

expressed his dominant positive assessment of Buddhism, a branch in the kingdom of God, by saying that it had¹⁰⁸²

its aim to save all mankind and even all living beings; its doctrines of repentance, faith, love and self-sacrifice; its teaching of the utter vanity of the best in this world, as compared with the future, and an unfailing recompense of our deeds, whether good or ill; its teaching of supreme importance of union with One Mind of the universe though often vague and almost forgotten;

Buddhism...left behind them a far richer soil for their successors to sow in; ...It has been the privilege of Buddhism...to believe that there is a bridge leading directly from the spiritual to the moral to the physical, and a bridge leading from the moral to the physical, until at last a free highway from nature to man, from man to God;...This forms a junction where the interests of science, philosophy and religion all meet;

Future generations can never lose sight of the sacred aim of the great founders of Buddhism to do their utmost to save their fellowmen from suffering now and hereafter. They will also profit by Buddhist experience and employ such means as shall meet universal needs in harmony with all laws, suitable for all times. Then they will not only more certainly gain that holy object of saving their fellowmen from suffering, but will also be able to gain that harmony with nature, that communion with a holy God and that everlasting life, which alone can give supreme rest to human souls.

Despite the above, we must mention here that, although Richard was a sympathetic and appreciative interpreter of Buddhism, entirely unlike most fundamentalist Baptists and other missionaries who refused to adopt such an iconoclastic attitude, he neither expressed nor suggested the view that Buddhism could bring about the ultimate salvation of China. This was because only Christianity could in his mind. In fact, he publicly stated that Buddhism, even in its finest form, lacked a genuine social concern for the whole of China and the whole Chinese people. This included improving the status of women, insisting on public health, and mitigating obvious social evils. He indicated that Buddhism had done nothing to alleviate suffering in China or to remove

¹⁰⁸²Timothy Richard, "The Influence of Buddhism in China," *Chinese Recorder* XXI, no. 2 (1890), pp. 63-64.

its causes, while Christianity had.¹⁰⁸³ He agreed with Fundamentalists that Buddhism was, at least to some extent, corrupt, degenerate, and antithetical.¹⁰⁸⁴ An example he often used was the phenomenon mentioned above in this chapter that monks could be granted diplomas for the priesthood in less than two months.

However, the situation never held him off from admiring the Buddha and Buddhahood. On the one hand, he provided Buddhists the information that their sutras were unquestionably Christian texts; on the other hand, he showed Christians that many of their doctrines paralleled Buddhist doctrines. During the work, Richard not only convinced both sides that Buddhism and Christianity shared much in common, but also initiated his own quest for true enlightenment which “made him see more light to Buddhism” than other missionaries could.¹⁰⁸⁵

6.5 Discussion

In general, western missionaries held the opinion that Christianity was superior to and independent of all other Faiths; and that Christianization should be pursued under the spirit of Christian Universalism, embodied in the saying *Jesus Christ Conquers the World*. Similarly, most missionaries in China considered the Chinese indigenous religions of Confucianism, Buddhism, Daoism to be defective, underdeveloped, and

¹⁰⁸³Albert J. Garnier, *A Maker of Modern China* (London: Carey Press, 1945), p.105.

¹⁰⁸⁴Timothy Richard, XXII. *Wanted: Good Samaritans for China*, in: *Conversion by the Million in China: Being Biographies and Articles* (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society), 1907, vol.2, pp.28-59.

¹⁰⁸⁵Ernest. W. Burt, “Timothy Richard: His Contribution to Modern China,” *International Review of Mission* 34, no.3 (1945), pp.293-300.

moribund when compared to Christianity. They thus hoped to impose western religious culture upon the Chinese people.

No doubt, for the people who lived in an ancient country which had existed for thousands of years and which had experienced collisions, amalgamations, assimilations, and integrations of different cultures, this unequal and discriminating ideological stand inevitably evoked repugnance, refusal, animosity, even some riots toward foreigners, especially when the diplomacy and sovereignty were undermined by the West's military, political, and economical invasions. As a result, xenophobic behavior became more obvious than ever and fueled resentment against defenseless, unarmed missionaries when cultural conflict became inevitable. This situation made it difficult to Christianize China and hindered its people from becoming more civilized or westernized.

Based on his studies, Richard pointed out that the conflict was unnecessary because Buddhism shared a similar source and a same objective to Christianity. He even suggested that Buddhism might be a previously unknown branch of God's enlightenment on Earth but with different nomenclature. In his mind, within a Christianity-dominated League of Religion, Christianization would proceed to remove secular misunderstandings, eliminate spiritual estrangements, and dispel ideological oppositions among different cultures, and finally build harmonious relations among peoples of different countries within a *great Unity*. This was an innovative suggestion that had originated from his imagination based on his references to Buddhist classics: Buddhism and Christianity had the same fundamental doctrines of the same end, *salvation*, though with different sets of terminology and practice to serve the mankind in

different regions on the Earth.¹⁰⁸⁶ For Richard, therefore, there was not much difference between Buddhism and traditional Christianity, and it was possible and feasible to integrate these religions for a universal one in the kingdom of God through decreasing even depriving religious diversity among different cultures.¹⁰⁸⁷

However, we have to say that each of them had its own horizon of responsibility for *salvation*. One fact lies in that, developed from Fundamentalist Christianity which paid attention only to the next world, liberal Christianity laid the responsibility upon saving the heathen not only from the hell of sufferings in the next world, but also from the hell of suffering in this world.¹⁰⁸⁸ That is, the kingdom that God had built existed not only in heaven but also in reality. The same as to be enjoyed in the heaven after death, God's ideal grace and salvation should also be seen through the advance of all other secular fields pushed forward by modern science and technology, including, e.g., the improvement of living standards, the enhancement of civilization, and so on, after social reforms and developments in this world of materiality.

The other one was about the core tenet of Buddhist epistemology. It was represented by the emptiness of all dharmas, including both materialized matter and unmaterialized sensation, perception, volition and consciousness.¹⁰⁸⁹ This was concisely exposed in Prajna paramita Heart Sutra,¹⁰⁹⁰ the essence of Buddhism. Due to this

¹⁰⁸⁶T.R.Glover, "A Man of Personality," *North China Daily News*, 26 April 1919.

¹⁰⁸⁷E. Morgan, *Timothy Richard and the Christian Literature Society* (in Richard MSS., National Library, Aberystwyth, n.d.).

¹⁰⁸⁸E. W. Burt, *The Centenary of Timothy Richard*, *The Baptist Quarterly*, 11 (12-13), 1945, pp.343-348.

¹⁰⁸⁹Khải Thiên, *A Handbook for Buddhists: Buddhism 101 - Questions and Answers*, (Florida: White Sands Buddhist Publications, 2009), pp.1-116.

¹⁰⁹⁰玄奘 Xuanzang, 般若波罗密多心经 (Prajnaparamita Heart Sutra), tr. Venerable Yifa, M. C. Owens, P. M. Romaskiewicz (高雄 Kaohsiung: 佛光出版社 Buddha's Light Publishing 2006),: The Bodhisattva Avalokitesvara, while practicing the profound prajnaparamita, clearly saw that all five skandhas are empty, thus overcoming all suffering. Sariputra, form is no different from empty, empty is no different from form, form is just empty, empty is just form, sensation, perception, volition and consciousness are also like this.

emptiness in the real world, people should not need to care about the hardship in their secular lives but only pay attention to individual Buddhist practices for the goal to become a Buddha in the next world after Nirvana (death).¹⁰⁹¹ Though not characterized by Unitarianism, Buddhism's negative, at least perfunctory, attitude toward the real world was largely similar to that of Fundamentalist Christianity, and of little help or positive significance to put an end to China's sick situation of falling behind the times with poverty and ignorance for future modernization.

We concluded that, according to his studies on Buddhism, Richard's theology was historically innovative because it was equipped with an enlightenment ideology for Christian Universalism, i.e., all the religions in the secular world were parts of the lights God was shedding on the Earth, and thus they should be merged into a universal one in the kingdom of God without conflicts or clashes anymore. This unusual perspective did provide us a new idea to evaluate mission work in the 18th and 19th centuries, even to search for a possible cross-cultural religion beyond politics. However, though with positive attitudes in multi-cultural tolerance, respect, and openness, this theology was still unrealistic, similar to that of Jesuits. Considering geopolitical Conflicts in the world, this idealized design might never come into effect: even when the imperialism and evangelization were brought to a climax in the 19th century, Mahayana Buddhism

Sariputra, this is the emptiness of all dharmas: they neither arise nor cease, are neither defiled nor pure, neither increase nor decrease. For this reason within emptiness there is no form, no sensation, perception, volition or consciousness; no eye, ear, nose, tongue, body or mind; no sight, sound, scent, taste, touch or thought; no seeing,...even no thinking; no ignorance nor end of ignorance,...even no aging and death, nor end or aging and death; no suffering, origin, cessation or path; no wisdom and no attainment. Because nothing is attained, bodhisattvas maintain prajnaparamita, then their heart is without hindrance, and since without hindrance, without fear escaping upside down, dream-like thinking, and completely realizing Nirvana. All buddhas of all times maintain prajnaparamita, thus attaining anuttara-samyak-sambodhi. Hence know, prajnaparamita is the all-powerful mantra, the great enlightening mantra the unexcelled mantra, the unequalled mantra, able to dispel all suffering. This is true, not false. Therefore, proclaim the prajnaparamita mantra. Recite the mantra thus: Gate gate paragate parasamevagate bodhi svaha!

¹⁰⁹¹Khải Thiên, *A Handbook for Buddhists: Buddhism 101 - Questions and Answers*, Florida: White Sands Buddhist Publications, 2009, pp.1-116.

continued to prevail in more lands like Japan, Vietnam, etc. In reality, Richard's promotion of Universalism was in vain, yet left as an evidence to exhibit his liberal theology in mission work.

We mention here that Richard's League was the Christianized *Great Unity* (大同) under Universalism, the core of which is Christianity. By contrast, many Chinese elite figures (e.g., Kang Youwei, Sun Zhongshan) in the late Qing China also used the concept of *Great Unity* in their visionary treatises¹⁰⁹² and writings (e.g., seen in the lyrics of the National Anthem of the ROC),¹⁰⁹³ but with a core of Chinese culture. Whether or not there was a relation between the usages of the concept by Richard and by Chinese elites at the same time in history needs further textual criticism. This topic is beyond the scope of this thesis.

¹⁰⁹²Kang Youwei, *Datong Shu* (Beijing: People's Publishing House, 2010), p.310. 康有为, 《大同书》, 北京: 人民出版社, 2010 年, 第 310 页。

¹⁰⁹³“Three-people's principle (三民主义), (is) the foundation of our party (吾党所宗); With it, [we] establish the Republic (以建民国); With it, [we] advance into a Great Unity (以进大同) ...” Note: The Republic of China (ROC) was recognized as the government of mainland China prior to 1949. Since then ROC has controlled Taiwan and some other nearby islands. At the United Nations, it was replaced by the People's Republic of China (PRC) in 1971.

CHAPTER 7

SUMMARY, DISCUSSION, AND FUTURE WORK

7.1 Summary

As an ancient country in the world, China had developed its own culture over millennia, which incorporated a wide diversity of cultural traditions, of which Confucianism and Taoism are the best-known. China even adopted traditions from abroad, such as Buddhism which originated from India, and made them part of Chinese culture.

However, during the turn between the 18th and 19th centuries, China had lost its impetus toward self-introspection, self-innovation, and self-modernization, unaware of the rapid progress made in the West in only a few hundred years of time. The British tried to impose to China their trade conditions during the Opium Wars in the 1840s. When Western powers made the once-powerful Qing dynasty experience an unprecedented humiliation, the ancient Chinese civilization faced unprecedented challenges against advanced western culture.

Taking advantage of the edge brought about by the West's military invasion, missionaries came to China for the salvation of non-Christian people, under a supreme religious belief that *Jesus conquered the world*. So far, there have mainly been two politically-biased paradigms to discuss missionary activities in China: the *Cultural Invasion* paradigm and the *Cultural Modernization* paradigm. However, both of them

were unable to fully evaluate mission work because they focused on only one dimension of missionary work, at the expense of other views. From a relatively more inclusive approach, we applied a less limitative paradigm, Liberal Theology, in our research to analyze the role played by missionaries in the late Qing China. The proposed paradigm has two salient qualities: Cultural Expansion and Modernity. These two features were exposed more perceptibly in Christianization for liberals due to their more secular and more effective approaches to evangelization relative to Fundamentalists. For example, liberals paid more attention to Chinese elites in the hierarchical China for a top-down approach so as to convert the whole nation; they were more actively engaged in political, economic, and educational reforms so as to cultivate a friendly environment for Christianization in the politically and socially unstable late Qing China.

Based on available documentation, this thesis has focused on the evaluation of the role played by liberal missionaries, as represented by Timothy Richard, a British missionary, in the process of modernization of the late Qing. After an introduction to the Chinese conditions in the 19th century, the thesis described the relevance of missionary activities to the development of Chinese history in view of the biographical records of Christian missions. The entry point of this presence is traced in the text through Richard's activities to contribute to famine relief, literary work, reform advocacy, higher education, cross-cultural exchange, a product of the development of his ideas and strategies gained from the promotion of European models of modernization. Particularly, the thesis has brought to light Richard's symbiotic conception between religion and secularism (i.e., science, technology, education, and political reform). The main contribution of the study hinges on a couple of aspects: (1) building a thorough portrait

of Richard and of his life-long vocation by means of a number of primary and secondary sources in both English and Chinese; and (2) interpreting the liminal role Richard played in his missionary work: was he a proxy of imperialism, or a paragon of modernization, or something in between?

After pointing out the limitations of the two paradigms, *Cultural Invasion* and *Modernization*, the thesis have argued that in combining them into the *Liberal Theology* paradigm, we can better understand the nature of the mission work done by liberal missionaries, such as Richard. Thus, though Richard's activities happened in an era marked with colonial imperialism, his mission work should not be regarded as simply a imperialistic invasion in the cultural field; more critically, though he introduced western civilization to Chinese people in various proselytizing approaches, he could not be considered as one of the prime movers of China's modernization in the late Qing Dynasty, because he contributed mainly to the promotion of China's modernization through a series of religious and cultural contacts with Chinese elites via, e.g., meetings, media, literary work, higher education.

Relative to studies by other scholars who relied commonly on one of the two paradigms, i.e., *Cultural Invasion* and *Modernization*, this thesis employs the liberal theology paradigm to analyze the Christian missions. It took advantage of the formation of Richard's liberal theology to elucidate liberal missionaries' more enlightened visions on Christianity and mission approach, which were different from those of Fundamentalist missionaries. Our study has unveiled that, on the one hand, mission work is characterized by the imperialistic spirit due to the nature of "cultural expansion" under Christian Universalism. It inevitably brought a negative influence on Chinese

tradition through undermining, even damaged more or less, indigenous culture. On the other hand, with the aid of Modernity in Western politics, culture, education, including science and technology, missionaries made indispensable contributions to China's modernization. This is the main contribution of the thesis work.

7.2 Discussion

As the most typical and influential liberal missionary in the late Qing China, Richard had had a multifaceted career in a series of social activities: his commitment as a liberal Christian in social Gospel fashion to improving lives in the here-and-now; his pioneering, syncretic appreciation of Chinese Buddhism; his conviction that missionary priorities should involve a focus on Chinese elites first for a sympathetically top-down conversion; and, his conviction that a responsible Christian approach to society entailed strongly promoting modern science and technology in order to practically improve human lives.

More conspicuously, Richard had never stopped cultivating official or private relations with moderate Chinese elites of the late Qing Court who were generally favored by the West, in order to establish his cultural empire in China through the top-down approach. Li Hongzhang was such an elite Chinese. Due to Richard's influence on Li in educational reform, Li helped Richard to get sufficient fund for the establishment of the most westernized university in 1902 in Shanxi, China. This was one of the most significant contributions Richard had made in his life to China's modernization.

What is more, Richard also exerted an indirect impact on Emperor Guangxu through Emperor's tutors and reform-minded literati like Kang Youwei and Liang Qichao. Though the *Hundred Day's Reform* of 1898 in which he was involved directly became short-lived at the end, Richard successfully laid the groundwork for future modernization among Chinese people. Three years later, his endeavor received prominent requital in the Empress Cixi's *New Deal* reforms: the Civil Service Examination system, which had lasted since the 7th century, was abolished; drastic institutional changes were made within the government; and, the ancient imperial system was washed away eventually. Although Richard was seldom mentioned during and after the last reform due to political reasons, he was the only foreigner who won the highest recognition from the Chinese imperial government among missionaries, the Double 2nd order and 2nd grade.

From these examples, we can say that Richard had had quite a significant amount of influence on China's modernization. His extraordinary devotion among missionaries to China thus highlighted the two features of Liberal Theology. For this reason, we selected him as the illustrative example among missionaries to validate the reliability of applying the liberal theology paradigm to evaluate the impacts of missionaries on the development of the late Qing China. Our study exposes that (1) not only the behavior of Richard, but also that of all other missionaries, can be best described by the liberal theology paradigm; and, (2) Richard is the most suitable person whose mission work supports the application of the paradigm to account for the influence of missionaries on the late Qing China.

Different from his Fundamentalist confreres, Richard considered that the Kingdom of God existed not only in the spiritual heaven but also on the material Earth. God's benefit, the modernity of Western civilization embodied in the advanced science and technology, should thus be enjoyed by all human beings. He insisted that missionaries were responsible in spreading modernity and Christian culture. Though he encountered resistance from his colleagues, Richard took advantage of a top-down approach through publishing for Chinese elites. He also promoted the modernization of China's higher education by establishing a Western-learning university, and he tried to assimilate Chinese Buddhism in Christian Universalization to solve cultural conflicts. Obviously, as represented by Richard, missionaries disseminated the modernity of Western civilization in spreading Christianity-based Western culture. This was just the essence of the liberal theology.

Here, we would like to comment more. As introduced in Chapters 2 and 3, the Mission work by the Western missionaries was a worldwide, outgoing process related to the cultural globalization of dominating societies in the modern world. However, the process was inherently recursive due to the reversed, indigenous cultural flows from dominated societies of a traditional world.^{1094,1095} In this process, the traditional world was brought into the modern one when the strata of its societies were attracted, pressured, forced, and sometimes bribed, into adapting or promoting themselves to both the values and structures of the dominating societies.¹⁰⁹⁶ That is to say, Christianization contains two features: (1) Cultural expansion, which inevitably impairs or replaces the

¹⁰⁹⁴*Ibid.*

¹⁰⁹⁵H. I. Schiller, *Communication and cultural domination* (International Arts and Sciences Press, 1976), pp. 9-10.

¹⁰⁹⁶*Ibid.*

indigenous traditional culture with Christian culture dominated by Christian Universalism, and (2) the transfer of modernity, which pushes forward the modernization of traditional societies after an adapting process. No doubt feature (1) appears negative to the indigenous world where traditional culture was more or less undermined; however, aspect (2) is beneficial for this world to step into a modern society.

By analyzing Richard's mission work, we exhibited that liberals featured both (1) and (2) in their activities. They played an extraordinary role to benefit China in its modernization, though their subjective ideologies were tainted with the colonial color of cultural expansion under the guise of Christian Universalism. However, without their advice and guidance beyond the scope of Christianization in that era, the Chinese would, at the very least, have had to spend much more time groping in the dark to recognize China's real competence in the world, and to find appropriate ways on the road of modernization. This is the main difference between this thesis and studies of other scholars who might feel that Christian missions are only characterized by either feature (1) or (2) solely, without any awareness of the other companion.

The thesis has validated that the tremendous contributions of missionaries to China's modernization was not made by chance. Historically, China began its Self-Strengthening Movement from the 1860s after the Opium Wars. However, for the Qing Court, the purpose of the national Movement was not for modernization, but restricted only to enhance military power against the West's armed force as well as to regain the Qing's superiority in Asia. In comparison with the Court, some Chinese elites were awakened by the advanced science and technology resultant from the West's

industrialization, and began to seek ways to modernize China for national sovereignty and people's welfare. These people were well known in China, like Zhang Zhidong, Li Hongzhang, Kang Youwei, Liang Qichao, Hu Shi, etc. But few people have looked into the contribution of missionaries, though they contributed to making these elites' dreams of modernization come true eventually after surmounting numerous difficulties in virtue of being guided or advised directly or indirectly by liberal missionaries like Richard. From the beginning of the 20th century, Christian missions displayed their exuberant vitality through achievements in modern China, like, the establishment of the earliest modernized Imperial University of Shanxi (now Shanxi University), in 1902; the abolishment of the eight-legged essay tests in the Civil Service Examination (CSE) in 1902, and the removal of the stultifying CSE system in 1905; the running of both the Ministry of Education from 1905 and the public education system from 1906, ... which were all in conformity with Richard's life-long endeavor in China.

The thesis has illustrated that, under the guise of Christian Universalism, Richard was a hybrid of half a missionary who entered China under the protection of imperialism, and half an individual who wanted to sincerely promote Euro-American-Chinese cross-cultural exchanges. This dual identity made it unsatisfactory to interpret his mission either in a pure "imperialist" framework, as an agent from the West, or as a purely disinterested communicator in the interpretive framework of "modernization." Based on our study, we conclude that, though Richard was a missionary in China who subjectively hoped to Christianize Chinese people through the spread of Gospels, he was sincerely committed to China's modernization in order to develop a favorable environment to reach his goal of conversion.

7.3 Future Work

In the study of missionary activities in the late Qing China, we found many issues which need further research. For example, because of missionaries' crucial influence, China became a new nation state from 1911. In its progress towards a modernized country engaged with the world, there occurred a rapid rise of modern Chinese Nationalism. In the mainland China after 1949, the *Sanzi Aiguo Yundong* (San-tzu Aikuo Yün-tung 三自爱国运动: Three-self Patriotic Movement) of the Protestant Churches appeared, featured by a self-administrated, self-funded, and self-Christianizing evangelization.

However, in the campaign of Christianity to assimilate Han-Buddhism and Confucianism, there were more Christians who converted to Buddhism than Buddhists who converted to Christians among highly educated people, while there were more Buddhists who converted to Christianity than Christians who converted to Buddhism among less educated people. We are thus intrigued to know the influence of different religions on different groups of people, and to what a degree Richard's Universalism was suitable for normal Chinese people.

Another subject is also valuable: Educational Sovereignty. Richard and his colleagues played an irreplaceable role in the foundation of China's modern education in the late Qing Dynasty. After 1911, some nationalist and chauvinist members of the Chinese elites proposed the concept of Educational Sovereignty in order to stress the contributions of Chinese people to educational modernization, while either avoiding to admit the missionaries' achievements, or defining their work as one part of a cultural invasion. This arouses our interest in what degree of renovations had been done

according to missionaries' proposals to updating China's educational system and curriculum after 1911.

What is more, one important issue in Sino-Western relations lies in how Christianity was indigenized in China after the late Qing. As introduced in Chapter 1, most studies concentrated on either Western colonization or fundamentalist Christianization. However, based on our study as exposed in this thesis, the prime-mover of the indigenization should be the Sinicization of Christianity as performed by an important group of Buddhism-enlightened Christian Missionaries, like Richard, who assimilated Chinese traditional Han-Buddhism. It was this enlightenment that gave liberal missionaries the insights to solve cultural conflicts by developing a *Great Unity* under the spirit of Christian Universalism, and eventually localize Christianity by influencing Chinese elites to establish a Christian Republic of China through their Buddhist scholarship. It is of great importance about the indigenization of Christianity in China through Western Protestant missionaries' Buddhist scholarship from 1840 to 1949. We hope to employ Comparative Analysis to study the cultural amalgamation between Christianity and Chinese Confucianism in contemporary China after 1978.

Last but not least, another interesting topic is the activities of and the roles played by Quebec French Jesuit Missionaries in the Republican China before 1949. Just after the First World War, an original French mission was initiated in Asia. From 1918, about a hundred French-Canadian Jesuits (mostly from Quebec) were sent to China, mostly in the region of Suzhou (Suchow), Jiangsu. Under the direction of the Holy See, the region became successively an apostolic prefecture (1931), an apostolic vicariate (1935), and finally a diocese (1947). Very active in this distant mission, the French-Canadian Jesuit

missionaries were well adapted to the new cultural environment in spite of language and cultural barriers. They converted tens of thousands of Chinese. The analysis and understanding of the success of French-Canadian Jesuit may be worth a detailed study under circumstance of multi-cultural exchange and conflict in China from the perspective of the interaction and dialogue between these missionaries and indigenous Chinese. Up to now, there have not been any specific studies on this issue. We may thus intend to bring to light the experience of French-Canadian Jesuits in China; and, more broadly, to educate the public about one hitherto unknown dimension in the history of intercultural encounters between Canada and China.

APPENDIX I

TABLE OF CHINESE NAMES:
CONVERSION OF HANYU PINYIN AND WADE-GILES

Pinyin	Wade-Giles	Chinese	Type ^①	Birth-Death Year
B				
Bao Fen	Pao-fen	宝 榮	P	1856—1913
Beijing	Peking	北 京	L	-
C				
Cai Erkang	Ts'ai Erh-k'ang	蔡尔康	P	1851—1921
Cen Chunxuan	Ts'en Ch'un-hsüan	岑春煊	P	1861—1933
Cixi	Tz'u-hsi	慈 禧	P	1835—1908
Changzhi	Ch'ang-chih	长 治	L	-
Changsha	Chang-sha	长 沙	L	-
D				
Deng Xiaoping	Teng Hsiao-p'ing	邓小平	P	1904—1997
Ding Zeliang	Ting Tse-liang	丁则良	P	1915—1957
Duan Zhaoyong	Tuan Chao-yung	段兆鏞	P	1806—1883
F				
Fenyang	Fen-yang	汾 阳	L	-
Fujian	Fu-chien	福 建	L	-
G				
Gansu	Kan-su	甘 肃	L	-
Gu Changsheng	Ku Ch'ang-sheng	顾长声	P	1919—
Guangxu	Kuang-hsu	光 绪	P	1871—1908
Guangzhou	Kwang-chow	广 州	L	-
Guizhou	Kuei-chou	贵 州	L	-
Guo Songtao	Kuo Sung-t'ao	郭嵩焘	P	1818—1891
Guo Wuzhen	Kuo Wu-chen	郭吾真	P	1909—2009
H				
Hankou	Han-k'ou	汉 口	L	-
Hangzhou	Hang-chou	杭 州	L	-
Henan	Ho-nan	河 南	L	-
Hongdong	Hung-tung	洪 洞	L	-
Hubei	Hu-pei	湖 北	L	-
Huang Zunxian	Huang Tsun-hsien	黄遵宪	P	1848—1905
J				
Jinan Fu	Chi-nan Fu	济南府	L	-

K				
Kang Guangren	K'ang Kuang-jen	康广仁	P	1867—1898
Kangxi	K'ang-hsi	康熙	P	1654—1722
Kang Youwei	K'ang Yu-wei	康有为	P	1858—1927
L				
Lao Tian Ye	Lao T'ien-yeh	老天爷	P	-∞ — +∞
Laozi	Lao-tzu	老子	P	604—531 (BC)
Li Hongzhang	Li Hung-Chang	李鸿章	P	1823—1901
Li Lianying	Li Lien-ying	李莲英	P	1848—1911
Li Shiyue	Li Shih-yüeh	李时岳	P	1928—1996
Liangguang	Liang-kuang	两广	L	-
Liang Jialin	Liang Chia-lin	梁家麟	P	N/A
Liang Qichao	Leung Chi-tso	梁启超	P	1873-1929
Linxu	Lin Hsü	林旭	P	1875—1898
Lin Zexu	Lin Tse-hsu	林则徐	P	1785—1850
Liu Danian	Liu Ta-nien	刘大年	P	1915—(alive)
Liu Guangdi	Liu Kuang-ti	刘光弟	P	1859—1898
Liu Kunyi	Liu K'un-i	刘坤一	P	1830—1902
Lu'an	Lu-an	潞安	L	-
Luo Rongqu	Lo Jung-ch'iu	罗荣渠	P	1927—1996
M				
Ma Ming	Ma Ming/ Aśvaghoṣa	马鸣	P	80—150
Manchuria	Man-chou-li	满洲里	L	-
Mao Zedong	Mao Tse-tung	毛泽东	P	1893—1976
N				
Nanjing	Nanking	南京	L	-
Nian	Nien	捻军	O	-
Q				
Qian Chengdan	Ch'ien Ch'eng-tan	钱乘旦	P	1949—
Qinghua Xuetaang	Tsinghua Hsüeh-t'ang	清华学堂	O	-
Qiang Xuehui	Ch'iang Hsüeh-hui	强学会	O	-
Qingzhou Fu	Ch'ing-chou Fu	青州府	L	-
Qu Qiubai	Ch'ü Ch'iu-pai	瞿秋白	P	1899—1935
R				
Ronglu	Jung-lu	荣禄	P	1836—1903
S				
Shaanxi	Shan-hsi	陕西	L	-
Shandong	Shan-tung	山东	L	-
Shanghai	Shang-hai	上海	L	-
Shanxi	Shansi	山西	L	-

Sheng Xuanhuai	Sheng Hsüan-huai	盛宣怀	P	1844—1916
Shenyang	Shen-yang/Mukden	沈阳/奉天	L	-
Sichuan	Szechuan	四 川	L	-
Sun Jianai	Sun Chia-nai	孙家鼐	P	1827—1909
Sun Zhongshan	Sun Yat-sen	孙中山	P	1866—1925

T

Taiyuan	T'ai-yüan	太 原	L	-
Tan Sitong	T'an Ssu-t'ung	谭嗣同	P	1865—1898
Tianjin	Tientsin	天 津	L	-

W

Wang Kangnian	Wang K'ang-nien	汪康年	P	1860—1911
Wang Lixin	Wang Li-hsin	王立新	P	1966—
Wang Tao	Wang T'ao	王 韬	P	1828—1897
Weng Tonghe	Weng T'ung-ho	翁同龢	P	1830—1904
Wuchang	Wu-ch'ang	武 昌	L	-
Wu Chengen	Wu ch'eng-en	吴承恩	P	1501—1582

X

Xian Fu	Hsi-an Fu	西安府	L	-
Xinjiang	Hsin-Chiang	新 疆	L	-
Xizang	Hsi-tsang/Tibet	西 藏	L	-
Xuanzang	Hsüan-tsang	玄 奘	P	602—664

Y

Yan Fu	Yen Fu	严 复	P	1854—1921
Yantai (Chefoo)	Yen-t'ai	烟 台	L	-
Yang Rui	Yang Jui	杨 锐	P	1857—1898
Yang Shenxiu	Yang Shen-hsiu	杨深秀	P	1849—1898
Yikuang	I-k'uang	奕 诤	P	1838—1917
Yuan Shikai	Yuan Shih-kai	袁世凯	P	1859—1916
Yun Daiying	Yün Tai-ying	恽代英	P	1895—1931
Yungui	Yün-kuei	云 贵	L	-

Z

Zeng Guofan	Tseng Kuo-fan	曾国藩	P	1811—1872
Zeng Guoquan	Tseng Kuo-ch'üan	曾国荃	P	1824—1890
Zhang Baixi	Chang Pai-hsi	张百熙	P	1847—1907
Zhang Zhidong	Chang Chih-tung	张之洞	P	1837—1909
Zheng Guanying	Cheng Kuan-ying	郑观应	P	1842—1923
Zhili	Chih-li	直 隶	L	-
Zongli Yamen	Tsungli Yamen	总理衙门	O	-
Zuo Zongtang	Tso Tsung-t'ang	左宗棠	P	1812—1885

①: P-person name (with Birth-Death Year); L-place (city or provincial) name; O-others

APPENDIX II

TIMOTHY RICHARD'S CHRONOLOGICAL LIFE OUTLINE

- | | |
|-----------|---|
| 1845 | Birth at Ffaldybrenin, Carmarthenshire, Wales |
| 1859 | Baptism in River Caio |
| 1865-1869 | Haverfordwest Theological College |
| 1869 | Sailing for China (November 17) |
| 1870 | Arriving in Shanghai (February 12); in Yantai (Chefoo 烟台) (February 27) |
| 1871 | A Trip to Manchuria and Korea |
| 1872 | Attempting to settle in Ninghai; then Lai Yang; returning to Yantai |
| 1873 | First of several visits to Jinan Fu (Chinan Fu 济南府) |
| 1875 | Settling in Qingzhou Fu (Chingchow Fu 青州府), Shandong; Intercoursing with Mohammedans, Religious Leaders, Taoists, Hermits; Preparation of catechism and hymn book; Baptism of the first convert outside the West Gate of Qingzhou Fu |
| 1876-1877 | Famine Relief in Shandong |
| 1877-1878 | Famine Relief in Taiyuan Fu, capital of Shanxi |
| 1878 | Marriage to Mary Martin, a Scotch Presbyterian (October); Settling in Taiyuan Fu |
| 1880 | Visiting Beijing to memorialize throne on Russia-China hostilities; Interview with Li Hongzhang in Tianjin |
| 1881-1884 | Monthly illustrating lectures to officials scholars, 1881; Interviews with Zuo Zong-tang, Zhang Zhi-dong; Visiting to Buddhist sacred mountain Wu Tai Shan; Serious illness in Jinan Fu; Returning to Qingzhou Fu; Taking care of mission during furlough of Alfred Jones |
| 1884 | Visiting Beijing; Interview with Sir Harry Parkes regarding status of missionaries; Talks with Sir Robert Hart about reforms for China; Establishment of an Evangelical Alliance |

- 1885-1886 First Furlough; Educational plan for China presented to the B.M.S.; Suggestions for improved mission methods presented to B.M.S.
- 1886 Returning to China; Leaving Shanxi due to disagreements with colleagues; Moved to Beijing; Literary Work: pamphlet on *Modern Education*; Friendship with Marquis Zeng (son of Zeng Guofan); Studies on Chinese Buddhism and Lamaism
- 1887 Accused by some Taiyuan colleagues of unorthodoxy; defence against charges of heresy and unorthodox mission methodology; Leaving Shanxi Province going first to Tianjin finally staying in Beijing; First Missionary Conference in Shanghai (for representatives of all missions)
- 1888 Visiting Japan to study mission methods
- 1889 Moving with family to Tianjin; Famine Relief in Shandong; Serious illness: Typhus Fever in Qingzhou Fu; B.M.S. refusing to accept his proposals for missions
- 1890 Attending Second General Missionary Conference in Shanghai with a paper on *The Relation of Christian Missions to the Chinese Government*; Becoming an editor of the *Shi Bao*
- 1891 Becoming the General Secretary of S.D.K. (C.L.S.) in Shanghai; Family moving to Shanghai; Translation work; Educational work for Shanghai
- 1894 Translation of Mackenzie's History of the Nineteenth Century; Three interviews with Zhang Zhi-dong; Interview with Zhang Yinhan (张荫桓), First Peace Envoy to Japan
- 1895 Visiting Beijing; Interviews with Li Hongzhang, Prime Minister, Weng Tonghe, Prince Gong, Zongli Yamen members, other officials; Presentation of Mission Memorial to the Throne; First Meeting with Kang Youwei (October 17); Meetings and discussion with Reform Society Members; Reform design presented to Prime Minister and approved by Emperor; Visit to Buddhist Centre, Tiantai Mountain (天台山)
- 1896 Presenting Mission Memorial to Zongli Yamen; Last interview with Li Hongzhang; Prime Minister Weng Tonghe made an unprecedented call on Timothy Richard
- 1896-1897 Second Furlough; Traveling with Li Hongzhang to Russia for coronation of the Czar; Traveling to India, Marseilles, Paris, London; Appeals to Societies in the interest of Peace, Federation of Nations, etc.; Publication of booklet for the use of young statesmen

- 1898 Returning to China via Canada and the United States; Emperor Guang Xu's Reform Edicts (June); Failure to Reform Movement; coup d'état of Empress Cixi (September); Emperor's Decree of Abdication
- 1899 Visiting Beijing for Governmental approval of educational design; Interviews with Sir Robert Hart; Contact with June Lu, and other officials; Li Hongzhang was appointed Viceroy of Canton; Interview with Gang Yi (刚毅)
- 1900 Visiting New York for Ecumenical Conference with paper on *The Need and Value of Literary Work for Missions*; Efforts to save Christians from Boxers by personal appeals in Boston, Washington, D.C., New York; Returning to China via Japan; Boxer Uprising; Receiving Honorary D.D. degree from Emory University, Atlanta, Georgia
- 1901 Settling Boxer troubles in Shanxi; foundation of Shanxi University; Received honorary Litt.D. degree from Brown University
- 1902 Chancellor of Shanxi University appointed by Imperial Edict; Representative of Protestant missions
- 1900-1902 Plan for Chinese Education in Shanghai
- 1903 Visiting Japan for Shanxi University's textbooks; Interviews with Baron Kikuchi, Prince Konoye; Death of Mrs. Richard; Receiving rank of Mandarin with a Red button (of highest grade)
- 1904 Becoming the Secretary of the International Red Cross Society in Shanghai; Visiting Beijing for interviews with Zhou Fu (周馥), Rong Lu (荣禄), Prince Su (肃亲王), Lu Chuanlin (鹿传霖)
- 1905 Returning to England on furlough; Delegate to World-Baptist Conference in London; Delegate to Lucerne Peace Conference where he proposed the Federation plan
- 1906 Formation of China Emergency Committee
- 1907 Third Missionary Conference at Shanghai (May) to commemorate the arrival of the first LMS's Protestant missionary, Robert Morrison, in China; Decorated by the Chinese Government with the Double Dragon, 2nd order, 2nd grade
- 1908 Visiting Korea, Japan; talks with Prince Ito

- 1910 Delegate to the World Missionary Conference at Edinburgh; Handing over Shanxi University to Chinese authorities
- 1911 Outbreak of Revolution in China (October 10)
- 1912 Visiting Qingzhou Fu to attend the first United Conference of the English Baptist Mission
- 1913 Visiting Taoist center at Lao Shan (崂山); Translating Mission to Heaven
- 1914 Visiting Changsha, Hunan province; Second marriage with Dr. Ethel Tribe at Yokohama (August 14)
- 1915 Illness; Visiting Java; Resignation of C.L.S. Secretary
- 1916 Returning to England; To Aberystwyth for Honorary L.L.D. degree from the University of Wales
- 1919 End of life (April 17) in London; Burial in Golders Green, Northwest London

APPENDIX III

TIMOTHY RICHARD'S COMPLETE OEUVRE

III-1 Literary Works in English

(Including the authored, co-authored, and edited; with publishing year if available)

Book (in chronological order):

The Historical Evidences of Christianity: 1885
The History of Anti-foreign Riots in China: 1892
The China Mission Handbook: 1896
A League of Princes (For private circulation): 1899
Hints to Rising Statesmen: 1905
Calendar of the gods: 1906
The Awakening of Faith in New Buddhism: 1907
Conversion by the Million in China, 2 Volumes: 1907
Guide to Buddhahood: Being a Standard Manual of Chinese Buddhism: 1907
The New Testament of Higher Buddhism: 1910
A Mission to Heaven: 1913
A Dictionary of Philosophical Terms (w/Donald MacGillivray): 1913
Contemporary Inspiration Through the Ages: 1914
Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences by Timothy Richard: 1916
Epistle to All Buddhists Throughout the World: 1916
The Awakening of Faith in Mahayana Doctrine, 2nd ed.: 1918

C.L.S. products (from 1891):

Newspaper of Wanguo Gongbao (Chief Editor)
50 Books on the Works of God in order to improve the material condition of China
(Chief Editor)
37 Books on the Laws of God to improve the social, national, and international
relationships (Chief Editor)
33 Books on the Providence of God to improve education (Chief Editor)
48 books on the grace of God to improve religion and character (Chief Editor)

III-2 Literary works in Chinese (translated in English)
(Including the authored, co-authored, edited, and translated; with publishing year
if available; in chronological order)

A Catechism on the Christian Religion: 1875 五洲教务问答
Holy Living, by Jeremy Taylor: 1875-1876 天道功课
Present Needs of China: 1881 新政策
Adaptation of Ricci's Tien Chu Shih Yih w/A.G. Jones: 1882 天主实意
Steam of Time (A Chart of the History of the Nations): 1883 大国次策
Hsiao Shih Pu: 1885 小诗谱
Modern Education in Seven Nations: 新学八章 (七国新学备要) 1889
Benefits of Christianity (Historical Evidence): 1890 基督教裨益之历史佐证
Four Great Questions of the Times: 1892/1898 中西四大政
Looking Backward by Edward Bellamy: 1893 《回头看》记略
History of Christian Civilization in the 19th Century by Mackenzie (w/Ts'ai Er-kang):
1894 泰西新史揽要
Productive and Non-Productive Labour: 1894 分利生利之别
The Parables, by Krummacher: 1894 喻道要旨
Outlines of History of Thirty-one Nation: 1894 三十一国之要 (又名五洲各国志要)
Protestant Missionary Pioneers: 1894/1896 教士列传
Reform Essays: 1895 时事新论
The Warning Bell from the West: 1895 西铎
Statement of Christianity Presented with Memorial on the Aims of Protestant Missions
in China: 1896 传教定律
Eight Great European Emperors from Alexander to Napoleon: 1898 欧洲八大帝王传
Essays on Reform (4 Volumes): 1898 新学汇编
Relative Strength of Nations: 1898 列国变通兴盛记
Thirty-one Essays in New Collection of Tracts for the Times: 1898 载 《皇朝经世文汇
编》
Physics: 1898 格物质学
Progress of China's Neighbors: 1899 列国变通兴盛
Right Principles of Universal Progress: 1899 社会的进化 (或大同学)
Childhood of the World by Clodd: 1899 古史探源
Elements of Practical Electricity: 1899 电学纪要
Agricultural Chemistry: 1899 农政新法
Old Testament Stories: 1901 旧约记略
Outline of the World's History: 1904 泰西近百年大事记

BIBLIOGRAPHY

B1 Primary Sources in English

B1-1 Manuscripts

There are a substantial number of documents in the form of manuscripts in six principal depositories in Great Britain and New Zealand, which are related to the life and work of Timothy Richard:

(1) BMS Library at London has a collection of letters from Richard to Alfred Henry Baynes, Secretary of the Society, during the years 1877-1903. Unfortunately, none of the correspondences emanating from Baynes or the Society has survived. There is also a manuscript entitled *Prospectus of a Society for Aiding China to Fall in with Right Principles of Universal Peace* in the Library.

(2) Margaret Richard Dixon, one of Richard's daughters, has a number of letters written by her father to her and her sisters during the years 1887-1914. She keeps them at home in Auckland, New Zealand.

(3) Thomas Evans of Kidwelly, Wales, holds the originals of 13 letters Richard wrote to his mother, Eleanor Lewis Richard, during the years 1866-1882. They were published in Wales in 1963.

(4) At the time of her death in London, the late Mary Celia Richard Napier held a large number of letters written by her father, Richard, to her mother, Mary Martin Richard, to her and her sisters over the period 1886-1901, among which there is one Richard's manuscript entitled *One Solution of What Remains of the China Problem*.

(5) The National Library at Aberystwyth, Wales, established a collection of Richard's writings, including 11 letters to his nephew, Timothy Richard Morgan, during the years 1905-1919; a manuscript dated 1 February 1921 by Evan Morgan, entitled *Timothy Richard and the Christian Literature Society*, prepared on the request of Thomas Lewis of BMS; a manuscript by Richard's private secretary, Hilda Bowser, entitled *Outline of Life and Work of Timothy Richard*, which she had prepared under Richard's supervision; manuscript essays entitled *The Modern Peace Problem*, *New Views of World Problems, Defense, and Tariffs* [dated London, 1 February 1906], and *Out of the Melting Pot: The Beginning of Permanent Peace* [dated London, 13 September 1917], and various manuscripts in connection with Richard's death or with the centenary observance of his birth in Wales in 1945.

(6) Library of the University of Wales in Cardiff has some records of the proceedings of a convocation honoring Richard on 15 July 1916.

B1-2 Books

B1-2-1 Annotated Books

- Ashvagoshā. *The Awakening of Faith* (tr. Timothy Richard and Yang Wen-hui), Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907.
- Barber, W. T. A. *Missionary and the Saint*. London: Charles H. Kelley, 1898.
- Hart, Robert. *These from the Land of Sinim*. London: Chapman & Hall, Ltd., 1903.
- Mackenzie, Robert. *The Nineteenth Century* (石印泰西新史), tr. by Timothy Richard, Shanghai, 1896.
- Wiseman, Nicholas: *Fabiola* (古圣徒殉难记), tr. by Timothy Richard, n.p., n.d.

B1-2-2 Non-annotated Books

- Bashford, J. W. *God's Missionary Plan for the World*. New York: Eaton and mains, 1907.
- Bekk, M. *China: Being a Military Report on the North-eastern Portions of the Provinces of Chih-li and Shang-tung: Nanking and its approaches; Canton and Its Approaches; etc.*, Simla: 1884
- Brow, J. Gumming. *The Awakening of China*, pref. Timothy Richard, Edinburgh, 1897
- China, Imperial Maritime Customs. *Treaties, Conventions etc. Between China and Foreign States*. Shanghai, 1887.
- Chinese Repository*. Macao and Canton, 1832-1851
- Ch'iu Ch'ang-ch'un. *A Mission to Heaven* tr. Timothy Richard Shanghai, 1913.
- Davidson, Robert J. and Isaac Mason. *Life in West China*, intro. Timothy Richard, London, 1905.
- Davis, (Sir) John Francis. *The Chinese: A General Description of the Empire of China and its Inhabitants*. New York: Harper, 2 Volumes, 1836; revised ed. 1857.
- Forrest, R. J. and W. C. Hillier. *China Famine Relief Fund*. Shanghai, 1879.
- Guinness, Geraldine. *The Story of the China Inland Mission*. Fourth Edition. London: Morgan & Scott, 1897.
- Hsuan Fo P'u. *Guide to Buddhahood* (tr. by Timothy Richard), Shanghai, 1907.
- MacGillivray, Donald. *A Century of Protestant Missions in China*. Shanghai, American Presbyterian Mission Press, 1907.
- Martin, W. A. P. *The Chinese: Their Education, Philosophy, and letters*. London: Trübner & Company, 1881.
- Morse, H.B. *The Trade and Administration of the Chinese Empire*. New York, Bombay, and Calcutta, Longmans, Green, and Co., 1908
- _____. *Gilds of China*. London and New York, Longmans, Green, and Co., 1909.
- _____. *The International Relations of the Chinese Empire*. 3 Vols. London and New York, Longmans, Green, and Co., 1910-1918
- Ricci, Mateo. *Tien Chu Shih Yih* (天主实义), tr. and ed. by Timothy Richard, 1882.
- _____. *China: Land of Fame*. New York, American Geographical Society, 1926.
- Richard, Timothy: *The China Problem, from a Missionary Point of View*, London, 1905.
- _____. *Fifteen Years of Missionary Work in China*, London, 1885.

- _____. *How Each Nation May Possess the Whole Earth*, n.d. [probably Shanghai, 1907].
- _____. *The Need and Scope of Our Literary Work*, Christian Literature Society Circular, n.p., 1891.
- _____. *Prospectus of a League of Princes for the Promotion of Universal Peace*, Christian Literature Society Circular, Shanghai, 1899.
- _____. *Reform Essays*, Christian Literature Society Circular, Shanghai, 1895. Some of the material from this work also appeared in Chinese.
- _____. *The Relation of Christian Missions to the Chinese Government*, Christian Literature Society Circular, Shanghai, n.d.
- _____. *A Scheme for Mission Work in China*, Christian Literature Society Circular, Shanghai, n.d.
- _____. *Some New Conditions of Missionary Work in Pacified China*, Christian Literature Society Circular, Shanghai, 1901.
- _____. *Universal Peace*, Christian Literature Society Circular No. 103, Shanghai, 1899.
- _____. *Wanted: Good Samaritans for China*, London 1885.
- Taylor, Jeremy: *Holy Livig* (天道功课), tr. by Timothy Richard, n.p., 1875-76.
- _____. *A Dictionary of Philosophical Terms*, Shanghai, 1913.
- _____. *An Epistle to All Buddhists*, London, 1916.
- _____. *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences*, London, 1916.
- _____. *Some Hints to Rising Statesmen*, London, 1905.
- _____. *Historical Evidences of Christianity*, Shanghai, 1885. He also used this title for a series of articles published in the Chinese Recorder during 1890-91.

B1-3 Pamphlets

B1-3-1 Annotated Pamphlets

- Timothy Richard. *Wanted: Good Samaritans for China* London 1885.
- _____. *Conversion by the Million in China*, Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907, Vol.1,2.

B1-3-2 Non-annotated Pamphlets

- Richard, Timothy. *The China Problem*, from a Missionary Point of View, London, 1905.
- _____. *Fifteen Years of Missionary Work in China*, London, 1885.
- _____. *How Each Nation May Possess the Whole Earth*, n.d.,n.d. [probably Shanghai, 1907].
- _____. *The Need and Scope of Our Literary Work*, Christian Literature Society Circular, n.p., 1891.
- _____. *Prospectus of a League of Princes for the Promotion of Universal Peace*, Christian Literature Society Circular, Shanghai, 1899.
- _____. *Reform Essays*, Christian Literature Society Circular, Shanghai, 1895. Some of the material from this work also appeared in Chinese.

- _____. The Relation of Christian Missions to the Chinese Government, Christian Literature Society Circular, Shanghai, n.d.
- _____. A Scheme for Mission Work in China, Christian Literature Society Circular, Shanghai, n.d.
- _____. Some New Conditions of Missionary Work in Pacified China, Christian Literature Society Circular, Shanghai, 1901.
- _____. Universal Peace, Christian Literature Society Circular No.103, Shanghai, 1899.

B1-4 Articles

- Foster, Arnold. Famine Relief as a Form of Mission Work. *Chinese Recorder* 23, no.2 (1912), pp.82-90.
- Mallory, Walter. The Serious Famine Situation in China. *China Weekly Review* 30. no.12 (1924), pp. 360-362.
- Richard, Timothy. Christian Literature. *Chinese Recorder* 21, no.12 (1900), pp. 597-603.
- _____. Christian Persecutions in China, Their Nature, Causes, and Remedies. *Chinese Recorder* 15, no.4 (1884), pp. 237-48.
- _____. Conversion by the Million. *Chinese Recorder* 38, no.10 (1907), pp. 540-42.
- _____. The Crisis in China and How to Meet It. *Chinese Recorder* 22, no.2 (1898), pp. 79-85.
- _____. Educational Work Indispensable. *Chinese Recorder* 32, no.2 (1901), pp. 91-93.
- _____. Essays on Reform (新学汇编). In: *Wan Guo Gong Bao*, ed. Young J. Allen, Shanghai, 1895.
- _____. The Future of the Church in China. *Chinese Recorder* XLIII, no.11 (1912), pp. 644-47.
- _____. The future of the Educational Association. *Chinese Recorder* XLIII, no.4 (1912), pp. 230-238.
- _____. The Future of Missions: A Prophet's Forecast. *The Christian World* no.1 (1906).
- _____. God's Various Methods of Blessing Mankind. *Chinese Recorder* 25, no.6 (1894), pp. 272-82.
- _____. Higher Buddhism. *Chinese Recorder* XLII, no.7 (1911), pp. 419-21.
- _____. The Historical Evidences of Christianity (a series including the following titles): "Spiritual Benerits," *Chinese Recorder* 22, no.4 (1891), pp. 172-177, and no.5 (1891), pp. 197-203, and no.6 (1891), pp. 245-252; "Maternal Benefits," *Chinese Recorder* 21, no.4 (1890), pp. 145-150; "Intellectual Benefits," *Chinese Recorder* 21, no.5 (1890), pp. 28-32; "Political Benefits," *Chinese Recorder* 21, no.10 (1890), pp. 435-438; "Social Benefits," *Chinese Recorder* 21, no.11 (1890), pp. 500-509; "Moral Benefits," *Chinese Recorder* 22, no.1 (1891), pp. 25-32; "Present Benefits of Christianity," *Chinese Recorder* 22, no.10 (1891), pp. 443-51, and no.11 (1891), pp. 491-98.
- _____. How A Few Men Can Make A Million Converts, *Chinese Recorder* 32, no.6 (1901), pp. 267-280.

- _____. How One Man Can Preach to a Million, *Chinese Recorder* 20, no.11 (1889), pp. 487-498.
- _____. The Influence of Buddhism in China. *Chinese Recorder* 21, no.2 (1890), pp. 49-64.
- _____. The Lambeth Conference from the Missionary Point of View. *Chinese Recorder* 39, no.11 (1908), pp. 622-628.
- _____. The Late Prince Ito. *Chinese Recorder* XL, no.11 (1901), pp. 640-641.
- _____. The Life and Work of Martin Luther (路德列传). *Wan Guo Gong Bao*, ed. Young J. Allen, XIV, no.3 (1902), p. 159.
- _____. Memorial to the Chinese Emperor on Christian Missions. *The Peking and Tientsin Times*, 7 March 1898.
- _____. New China and Its Leaders. *Chinese Recorder* 29, no.9 (1898), pp. 415-417.
- _____. Of More Value Than A Thousand Missionaries. *Chinese Recorder* 34, no.1 (1903), pp. 1-9.
- _____. One Great Missionary Secret. *Chinese Recorder* 32, no.3 (1901), pp. 124-125.
- _____. The Political Status of Missionaries and Native Christians in China. *Chinese Recorder* XVI, no.2, 1885, pp. 96-107.
- _____. A Practical Plan for Education. *Chinese Recorder* 25, no.6, 1894, pp. 295-296.
- _____. The Regeneration of China. *Chinese Recorder* 32, no.12 (1901), p. 614.
- _____. Review of R. F. Johnston. Buddhist China. *Journal of the North China Branch of the Royal Asiatic Society* XLV (1914), pp. 136-138.
- _____. Sacred memories of the Rev. J. S. Mc Ilvaine. *Chinese Recorder* 12, no.4 (1881), pp. 297-299.
- _____. A Scheme for the General Enlightenment of China. *Chinese Recorder* 23, no.3 (1892), pp. 131-132.
- _____. Shansi Imperial University. *Chinese Recorder* 24, no.9 (1903), pp. 460-461.
- _____. Some Forces in Modern China. *Contemporary Review* CXXI, no.12 (1916), pp. 749-754.
- _____. Some of the Greatest Needs of Christian Missions. *Chinese Recorder* 38, no.4 (1907), pp. 211-12.
- _____. Some Thoughts about Christian Missions—Examinations. *Chinese Recorder* 11, no.4 (1880), pp. 293-95.
- _____. Thirty-one Essays (时事新论). *New Collection of of Tracts for the Times* (皇朝经世文新编), ed. Mai Meng Hua, intro. Liang Qichao, published by The Reform Society of China, Shanghai, February, 1898.
- _____. Thoughts on Chinese Missions: Difficulties and Tactics. *Chinese Recorder* 11, no.6 (1880), pp. 430-431.
- _____. Timothy Richard's Relations with the Chinese Government and the Christian Church. *Chinese Recorder* 34, no.12 (1903), pp. 617-618.

B1-5 Reports and Proceedings

Christian Literature Society for China: *Annual Reports*, 1888-1932, Shanghai.
_____. *Report of the London Committee*, 31 March 1908.
Jones, A. G. *Baptist Mission Reports*, London, 1883.
Ecumenical Missionary Conference. 2 Volumes, New York, 1900.
Records of the General Conference of the Protestant Missionaries of China. 1877, 1890, 1907, Shanghai.
Report on the China Missions of the Baptist Missionary Society. London, 1908.
The China Mission Yearbook. 1910-15, 1919, 1923.

B1-6 Newspapers

The Awakening of China. *The Christian Commonwealth*, London, 8 November 1961.
The Future of Missions: A Prophet's Forecast. *The Christian World*, London, 1 February 1906.

A Great Chinese Missionary. *British Weekly*, London, 2 February 1905.

B2 Secondary Sources in English

B2-1 Books

B2-1-1 Annotated Books

Anderson, Perry. *The Origins of Postmodernity*. London: Verso, 1998.
Ashton, T. *The Industrial Revolution 1760-1830*. 4th ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1948.
Ashvagosha. *The Awakening of Faith* (tr. Timothy Richard and Yang Wen-hui), Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907.
Bailey, Paul J.. *Reform the people: Changing Attitudes towards Popular Education in Early 20th Century China*. (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1990.
Barnett, Suzanne Wilson and John King Fairbank. ed., *Christianity in China Early Protestant Missionary Writings*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1985.
Bastid, Marianne. *Educational Reform in Early 20th-Century China*. (Tr. P. Bailey. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan, 1988.
Beal, Samuel. *Buddhism in China*, (London: Society for promoting Christian knowledge, 1884.
Berger, P. L.. *The Sacred Canopy: Elements of a Sociological Theory of Religion*. Reprint: NY: Anchor Books Editions, 1969, 1990; Originally published: NY: Garden City: Doubleday, 1967.

- Bohr, Paul Richard. *Famine in China and the Missionary: Timothy Richard as Relief Administrator and Advocate of National Reform. 1876-1884*. Cambridge, MA: East Asia Research Center, 1972.
- Boulnois, Luce. Helen Loveday, and Bradley Mayhew, *Silk Road: Monks, Warriors & Merchants*. Hong Kong: Airphoto International Ltd., 2005.
- Bowen, Kurt. *Christians in a Secular World: The Canadian Experience*, McGill-Queen's Studies in the History of Religion Series. Montreal: McGill-Queen's Press-MQUP, 2005.
- Britton, Roswell. *The Chinese Periodical Press. 1800-1912*. Shanghai: Kelly & Walsh, Ltd., 1933.
- Broomhall, A.J.. *Hudson Taylor and China's Open Century*, 7 volumes (London: Hodder & Stoughton Religious. 1981.
- Brow, J. Gumming. *The Awakening of China*. pref. Timothy Richard, Edinburgh, 1897.
- Bullock, Alan and Olive Stallybrass, *The Harper Dictionary of Modern Thought*. New York: Harper & Row 1977.
- Burt, E. W.. *Fifty Years in China: The Story of the Baptist Mission in Shantung, Shansi, and Shensi, 1875-1925*. London: The Carey Press. 1925.
- Cameron, Meribeth E. *The Reform Movement in China. 1898-1912*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1931.
- Carlyle, G. ed. *The Collected Writings of Edward Irving*. London: A. Strahan & Co., 1864-1865.
- Carwardine, Richard. *Transatlantic Revivalism: Popular Evangelicalism in Britain and America, 1790-1865*. San Francisco: Greenwood Press, 1978.
- Chan, Wing-tsit. *Religious Trends in Modern China*. New York: Octagon Books, 1969.
- Charlton, B. and P. Andras, *The Modernization Imperative*, Exeter: Imprint Academic, 2003.
- Cohen, Paul A. *China and Christianity: The Missionary Movement and the Growth of Chinese Antiforeignism, 1860-1870*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1963.
- _____. *Christian Missions and their Impact to 1900*. In: The Cambridge History of China. Chapter 11, Volume 10: Late Ch'ing, 1800-1911, Part 1. Ed., John K. Fairbank, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1976.
- Collingwood, R.G.. *The idea of History*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1961.
- Craig, E. Routledge Encyclopedia of Philosophy, Volume 7. NY: Taylor & Francis 1998.
- Dalai Lama, Jeffrey Hopkins and Kalachakra Tantra, *Rite of Initiation*, Boston: Wisdom Publications, 1999.
- Dallimore, Arnold *Forerunner of the Charismatic Movement: The Life of Edward Irving*. Chicago: Moody Press, 1983.
- De Bary, William Theodore, Wing-tsit Chan, and Burton Watson. *Sources of Chinese Tradition*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1960.
- _____. and Donald Keene, *Sources of Japanese Tradition*. New York: Colombia University Press, 1958.
- _____.Stephen Hay, Royal Weiler, and Andrew Yarrow, *Sources of Indian Tradition* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1958.
- Dorling Kindersley Publishing, *The Visual Dictionary of Ancient Civilizations*. New York: Dorling Kindersley Publishing, Inc., 1994.
- Duncan, J. and D. Raymer, *Lives lived of Moir and Jessie Duncan*. Toronto, Canada:

- Windy Ridge Books, 2000.
- Eddy, Sherwood. *Pathfinders of the World Missionary Crusade*. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1945.
- Edwards, E. H. *Fire and Sword in Shansi*. New York: Arno Press, 1970 (reprinted from 1903).
- Einstein, Albert and Carl Seelig (Editor), Sonja Bargmann (Translator), *Ideas and Opinions*, 5th Printing, NY: Crown Publishers, Inc. 1960.
- Elliott, Jane. *Who Died for Civilization? Who Died for His Country? A Revised View of the Boxer War*. Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 2001.
- Esherick, Joseph W.. *The Origins of the Boxer Uprising*. Berkeley: University of California, 1987.
- Evans, D. Gareth. *A History of Wales 1815-1906*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 1989.
- Evans, E. W. Price. *Timothy Richard: A Narrative of Christian Enterprise and Statesmanship in China*. London: The Carey Press, 1945.
- Falkus, M. *Britain Transformed An Economic and Social History 1700-1914*. 4th ed. Ormskirk: Causeway Press Ltd., 1987.
- Fanon, Frantz. *A Dying Colonialism*, New York: Grove Press, 1967.
- Forsythe, S. A.. *An American Missionary Community in China, 1895-1905*, Cambridge, MA: Harvard East Asian Monographs, 1971.
- Gallaway, Helen. *Culture and Empire: European Women in Colonial Nigeria*. Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1987.
- Garnier, A. J.. *A Maker of Modern China*. London: The Carey Press, 1945.
- Gernet, Jacques, *A History of Chinese Civilization* (trans., Foster, J. H., and Charles Hartman (second edition) Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- Gillespie, Michael Allen. *The Theological Origins of Modernity*. Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 2008.
- Goossaert, Vincent and David A. Palmer, *The Religious Question in Modern China*. Chicago&London, University of Chicago Press, 2011.
- Gray, Jack. *Rebellions and Revolutions: China from the 1800s to 2000*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2002.
- Gray, Henry Blair *The Educational Reform in China*. Hongkong: Kelly & Walsh, Ltd., 1911.
- Hall, J. M.. *A history of the Archaic Greek world, ca. 1200–479 BCE*. MA: John Wiley & Sons, 2007.
- Hamm, B.. and R. C. Smandych, *Cultural Imperialism: Essays on the Political Economy of Cultural Domination* 3rd Edition. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2005.
- Haferkamp, Hans and Neil J. Smelser, *Social Change and Modernity*. Berkeley, Los Angeles, Oxford: University of California Press, 1992.
- Hocking, William Ernest. *Commission of Appraisal, Re-thinking Missions: A Layman's Inquiry after One Hundred Years*. Ehrsam Press, 2007.
- Hoefflerle, Caroline. *Essential Historiography Reader*. Boston: Pearson, 2011.
- Howe, Charles A.. *Thomas Jefferson Sawyer*, Dictionary of Unitarian & Universalist Biography, Unitarian Universalist History and Heritage Society (UUHHS) 1999-2013, [<http://www25.uua.org/uuhhs/duub/articles/thomasjeffersonsawyer.html>]

- Hsü, Immanuel C.Y.. *The Rise of Modern China*. New York: Oxford University Press, 4th ed., 2000.
- Hunter, Jane. *The Gospel of Gentility: American Women Missionaries in Turn-of-the-Century China*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1984.
- Hutchison, William R.. *Errand to the World: American Protestant Thought and Foreign Mission*. Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1987.
- Jackson, Samuel M.. *The New Schaff-Herzog Encyclopedia of Religious knowledge* (Michigan: Grand Rapids, 1907-14), Vol. X.
- Johnston, James. *Dr. Timothy Richard: A Missionary Statesman in China*. The Congregationalist & Christian World, May 19, 1906 (BMS MSS).
- Keswick, Maggie and Clara Weatherall, *The Thistle and the Jade: A Celebration of 175 Years of Jardine Matheson*. London: Francis Lincoln Publishing, 2008.
- Kwong, Luke S. K. *A Mosaic of the Hundred Days: Personalities, Politics, and Ideas 1898*. Cambridge, MA: Council on East Asian Studies, Harvard University Press, 1984.
- Larmore, C.. *The Morals of Modernity* (Modern Europe Philosophy), New York: Columbia University Press, 1996.
- Latourette, Kenneth Scott. *A History of Christian Missions in China*. London: SPCK, 1929.
- _____. *The Chinese: Their History and Culture*. 3rd ed (revised), New York: The Macmillan Company, 1947.
- _____. *A History of Modern China*. London: Penguin Books, 1954.
- Laughey, Dan. *Key Themes in Media Theory*. New York: Open University Press, 2007.
- La Valles Poussin, Louis, *Buddhism*. England: Catholic Truth Society, 1960.
- LeFevour, Edward. *Western Enterprise in Late Ch'ing China: A Selective Survey of Jardine, Matheson & Company's Operations 1824-1895*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University press, 1968.
- Lennox, James. "Darwinism", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Fall 2010 Ed.), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), [<http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2010/entries/darwinism/>].
- Lenin, V.I.. *Imperialism: The Highest Stage of Capitalism*. Australia: Resistance Books, 1999.
- Li, Anthony C. *The History of Privately Controlled Higher Education in the Republic of China*. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1954.
- Li, Chien-nung. *The Political History of China, 1840-1928*. tr., Ssu-yü Teng and J. Ingalls. Princeton, N.J.: Van Nostrand, 1956.
- Liu, Li. *The Chinese Neolithic: Trajectories to Early States*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- Liu, Kwang-ching. ed., *American Missionaries in China: Papers from Harvard Seminars*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1967.
- Lutz, Jessie G. ed., *Christian Missions in China: Evangelists of What?* Boston: HEATH, 1965.
- _____. *China and the Christian Colleges, 1850-1950*. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 1971.
- MacDonald, Gregory, *The Evangelical Universalist*. Eugene: Wipf & Stock, 2008.
- MacGillivray, D. *Timothy Richard of China: A Prince in Israel*. Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1920.

- Mackenzie, Robert. *The Nineteen Century: A History*. London: Thomas Nelson & Sons, 1909.
- Machen, J. Gresham. *Christianity and Liberalism*. Michigan: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2009.
- Masataka, B.. *China and the West, 1858-1861: The Origins of the Tsungli Yamen*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1964.
- Martin, W.A.P. _____. *The Chinese: Their Education, Philosophy, and letters*. London: Trübner & Company, 1881.
- Mazlish, Bruce. *Civilization And Its Contents*. CA: Stanford University Press, 2004.
- McBrien, R. P.. *The Church: The Evolution of Catholicism*. New York: HarperCollins, 2008.
- McGillivray, D. *The Historical Evidences of Christianity*. McIntyre, 1885 (also used this title for a series of articles published in the Chinese Recorder during 1890-91).
- _____. *Timothy Richard of China: A Prince in Israel* .pamphlet; Shanghai. 1920.
- Needham, N. R.. “Part One: The Age of the Early Church Fathers”, in *2,000 Years of Christ’s Power*. England: Grace Publications Trust, 1998.
- Mommsen, W. J.. *Theories of Imperialism*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1980.
- Mungello, D. E.. *The Great Encounter of China and the West, 1500-1800*. Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2005.
- Neill, Stephen. *Colonialism and Christian Mission*. New York: Lutterworth Press, 1966.
- Oldstone-Moore, Jennifer. *Confucianism: Origins, Beliefs, Practices, Holy Texts, Sacred Places*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002.
- Paley, William. *Natural Theology*. **Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008.**
- Palumbo-Liu, David. *Asian/American: Historical Crossings of a Racial Frontier*. California: Stanford University Press, 1999.
- Payne, Ernest A. *Timothy Richard of China, 1845-1919. The Great Succession: Leaders of the Baptist Missionary Society during the 19th Century*. London: Carey Press, 1938.
- Perry, M.. *Western Civilization: A Brief History*, 7th edition, MA: Cengage Learning, 2010.
- Percheron, Maurice. *Buddha and Buddhism*. (tr. Edmund Stapleton). London: harper, 1957.
- Pierard, Richard V.. *Baptists Together in Christ, 1905-2005*, Falls Church, VA: Baptist World Alliance, 2005.
- Possehl, Gregory L. *The Indus Civilization: A Contemporary Perspective*. MD: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc. 2002.
- Purcell, Victor. *The Boxer Uprising*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1963.
- Rabin, Sheila. “Nicolaus Copernicus”, *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Fall 2010 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), [<http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2010/entries/copernicus/>].
- Reeve, B. Rev.. *Timothy Richard D.D.: China Missionary, Statesman, and Reformer*. London: S. W. Partridge & Co. Ltd., 1911.
- Reynolds, Douglas R. *China, 1898-1912: The Xinzheng Revolution and Japan*. Cambridge, MA: Council on East Asian Studies, Harvard University, 1993.

- Ricci, Matteo. Douglas Lancashire, Peter Hu Kuo-chen, Edward J. Malatesta, *The true meaning of the Lord of heaven = T'ien-chu Shih-i* (天主实义), St. Louis: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1985.
- Richard, Timothy. *An Epistle to All Buddhists throughout the world*. [n.p.], 1916 (http://books.google.ca/books/about/An_Epistle_to_All_Buddhists_Throughout_t.html?id=u2owAQAAMAAJ&redir_esc=y).
- _____. *Forty-five Years in China: Reminiscences*, New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company, 1916.
- Richard, Timothy., and D. McGillivray. *A Dictionary of Philosophical Terms*. Shanghai: CLS, 1913.
- Schirokauer, Conrad and Miranda Brown, *A brief History of Chinese Civilization*, 4th edition. MA: Wadsworth Cengage Learning, 2011.
- Schiller, H. I. *Communication and cultural domination*. International Arts and Sciences Press, 1976.
- Schoppa, R. Keith. *Revolution and Its Past: Identities and Change in Modern Chinese History* (Mysearchlab Series for History). Pearson, 2010.
- Schwartz, S. B. *Implicit Understandings: Observing, Reporting and Reflecting on the Encounters Between Europeans and Other Peoples in the Early Modern Era*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994.
- Serway, Raymond A. and John W. Jewett. *Physics for Scientists and Engineers with Modern Physics*, 9th Edition, Belmont, CA: Brooks/Cole, 2008/2010/2014.
- Snyder, A. and S. West, *Readings in Global History* Vol. II, Revised 2nd Ed.; Dubuque: Kendall-Hunt, 1997.
- Soothill, William E. *Timothy Richard of China: Seer, Statesman, Missionary & the Most Disinterested Adviser the Chinese Ever Had*. London: Seeley, Service & Co. Limited, 1924.
- Spence, Jonathan D. *To Change China: Western Advisers in China, 1620-1960*. New York: Penguin Books, 1980.
- _____. *The Search for Modern China*. 2nd edition. New York, London: W · W · Norton & Company, 1999.
- _____. *The Memory Palace of Matteo Ricci*. NY: Penguin Books 1985.
- Stanley, B. *The History of the Baptist Missionary Society, 1792-1992*. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1992.
- Stewart, W. S. *Later Baptist Missionaries and Pioneers*. Judson Press, 1929.
- Stuchtey, Benedikt. *Colonialism and Imperialism, 1450–1950*, in: Europäische Geschichte Online (EGO), hg. vom Institut für Europäische Geschichte (IEG), Mainz European History Online (EGO), published by the Institute of European History (IEG), Mainz 2011-01-24.[<http://www.ieg-ego.eu/stuchteyb-2010-en>].
- Tan, Chester. *The Boxer Catastrophe*. New York: Octagon Books, 1955.
- Tang, S. and J. K. Fairbank, *China's Response to the West: A Documentary Survey, 1839-1923*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1979.
- Teng Ssu-yu and John K. Fairbank. *Research Guide to China's Response to the West: A Documentary Survey 1839-1923*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1979.
- Thiên, Khôi. *A Handbook for Buddhists: Buddhism 101 - Questions and Answers*. Florida: White Sands Buddhist Publications, 2009.

- Thompson, L. *Ta T'ung Shu: The One-World Philosophy of Kang Youwei*. London: Routledge, 1958.
- Toulmin, Stephen. *Cosmopolis: The Hidden Agenda of Modernity*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992.
- Toynbee, A.. D. C. Somervell. "Christianity and Civilization", in: *Civilization on Trial, and the World and the West*. Washington: World Publishing Company, 1964.
- Twitchett, Denis. and John K. Fairbank, *The Cambridge History of China* Vol. 10.. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1978.
- Wang Shu-hwai, *The Educational Association of China, 1890-1912: Its History and Meaning in the Missionary Education in China*, M.A. thesis, University of Hawaii, 1963.
- Walker, Williston. *A History of the Christian Church*. New York: Charles Scribner's Son, 1959.
- Weber, Max. *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*. Tr. Talcott Parson, New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1930.
- Whittemore, Thomas. *The plain guide to Universalism: designed to lead inquirers to the belief of that doctrine, and believers to the practice of it*. Boston : Whittemore 1840.
- Williams, William A.. *The Tragedy of American Diplomacy*. Cleveland, 1959.
- Williams, R.. *Keywords: A vocabulary of culture and society*. Revised ed. NY: Oxford University Press, 1988.
- Williamson, H. R.. *British Baptists in China, 1845-1952*. London: The Carey Kingsgate Press Limited, 1957.
- Wiseman: Nicholas. *Fabiola* (古圣徒殉难记). tr., Timothy Richard, n.p., n.d.
- Worden, R. L., A. M. Savada, and R. E. Dolan, *China: A Country Study*, Washington: GPO for the Library of Congress, 1987.
- Yang, Ch'ien Kun. *China's Religious Heritage*. Berkeley: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1961.
- _____. *Religion in Chinese Society: A Study of Contemporary Social Functions of Religion and Some of Their Historical Factors*. University of California Press, 1961.

B2-1-2 Non-annotated Books

- Adamson, John William. *English Education, 1789-1902*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1930.
- Altbach, Phillip, and Viswanathan Selvaratnam. eds., *From Dependence to Autonomy: The Development of Asian Universities*. Dordrecht, Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1989.
- Annual Report of the Society for the Diffusion of Christian and General Knowledge Among the Chinese* (S.D.K.). 6th, Shanghai, 1893.
- Annual Report of the Society for the Diffusion of Christian and General Knowledge Among the Chinese* (S.D.K.). 10th, Shanghai, 1897.
- Annual Report of the Society for the Diffusion of Christian and General Knowledge Among the Chinese* (S.D.K.). 17th, Shanghai, 1904.

- Annual Report of the Christian Literature Society for China* (C.L.S., formerly the S.D.K.). 18th, Shanghai, 1905.
- Annual Report of the Christian Literature Society for China* (C.L.S., formerly the S.D.K.). 19th, Shanghai, 1906.
- Annual Report of the Christian Literature Society for China* (C.L.S., formerly the S.D.K.). 20th, Shanghai, 1907.
- Annual Report of the Christian Literature Society for China* (C.L.S., formerly the S.D.K.). 21st, Shanghai, 1908.
- Annual Report of the Christian Literature Society for China* (C.L.S., formerly the S.D.K.). 22nd, Shanghai, 1909.
- Annual Report of the Christian Literature Society for China* (C.L.S., formerly the S.D.K.). 23rd, Shanghai, 1910.
- Annual Report of the Christian Literature Society for China* (C.L.S., formerly the S.D.K.). 24th, Shanghai, 1911.
- Annual Report of the Christian Literature Society for China* (C.L.S., formerly the S.D.K.). 25th, Shanghai, 1912.
- Annual Report of the Christian Literature Society for China* (C.L.S., formerly the S.D.K.). 26th, Shanghai, 1913.
- Annual Report of the Christian Literature Society for China* (C.L.S., formerly the S.D.K.). 27th, Shanghai, 1914.
- Annual Report of the Christian Literature Society for China* (C.L.S., formerly the S.D.K.). 28th, Shanghai, 1915.
- Annual Report of the Christian Literature Society for China* (C.L.S., formerly the S.D.K.). 29th, Shanghai, 1916.
- Annual Report of the Christian Literature Society for China* (C.L.S., formerly the S.D.K.). 30th, Shanghai, 1917.
- Annual Report of the Christian Literature Society for China* (C.L.S., formerly the S.D.K.). 31st, Shanghai, 1918.
- Annual Report of the Christian Literature Society for China* (C.L.S., formerly the S.D.K.). 32nd, Shanghai, 1919.
- Annual Report of the Christian Literature Society for China* (C.L.S., formerly the S.D.K.). 33rd, Shanghai, 1920.
- Annual Report of the Christian Literature Society for China* (C.L.S., formerly the S.D.K.). 34th, Shanghai, 1921.
- Annual Report of the Christian Literature Society for China* (C.L.S., formerly the S.D.K.). 35th, Shanghai, 1922.
- Armstrong, Alex. *English Baptist Mission: Shantung*. Shanghai: Shanghai Mercury Office, 1891.
- Ayers, William. *Chang Chih-tung and Educational Reform in China*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard East Asia Series 54, Harvard University Press, 1971.
- Barnett, Suzanne Wilson. *Practical Evangelism: Protestant Missions and the Introduction of Western Civilization into China, 1820-1850*. Harvard University, PhD. Thesis, 1973.
- Barr, Pat. *To China With Love: The Life and Times of Protestant Missionaries in China, 1860-1900*. London: Secker & Warburg, 1972.
- Bashford, James W. *China: An Interpretation*. New York: The Abingdon Press, 1916.

- Bays, Daniel. ed. *Christianity in China: From the Eighteenth Century to the Present*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1996.
- Beach, Harlan. *A Geography and Atlas of Protestant Missions*. Volume I: Geography. New York: Student Volunteer Movement for Foreign Missions, 1902.
- Bennett, Adrian A. *Missionary Journalist in China: Young J. Allen and His Magazines: 1860-1883*. Athens: The University of Georgia Press, 1983.
- . *John Fryer: The Introduction of Western Science and Technology into Nineteenth-century China*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1967
- Biggerstaff, Knight. *The Earliest Modern Government Schools in China*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1961.
- Bland, J.O.P., and E. Blackhouse. *China Under the Empress Dowager*. Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott Company, 1910.
- Bliss, Edwin Munsell. *The Missionary Enterprise: A Concise History of its Objects, Methods, and Extension*. New York: Fleming H. Revell Company, 1908.
- Bloomhall, A. J. *Hudson Taylor & China's Open Century*. London: Hodder & Sloughton and the Overseas Missionary Fellowship, 1981.
- BMS, MSS: *Taught by War...an Interview with the Rev. T. Richard*. The Daily News, August 30, 1897.
- BMS, MSS. *Chat with Dr. Timothy Richard*. The Baptist, February 23, 1905.
- BMS, MSS. *Calendar of the Imperial University of Shansi*. ed., Faculty and Staff of the Western Department, 1908.
- BMS, MSS. *Christian Literature and the Reform Movement*. Edinburgh: The Christian Literature Society for China, 1911.
- Board of Missionary Preparation. *The Presentation of Christianity in Confucian Lands*. New York, 1917.
- Boardman, E. P. *Christian Influence upon the Ideology of the Taiping Rebellion, 1851-1864*. New York: Octagon Books, 1972.
- Borst-Smith, F. *Mandarin and Missionary in Cathay*. London: Seeley, Service & Co. Limited, 1917.
- Borthwick, Sally. *Education and Social Change in China: The Beginnings of the Modern Era*. Stanford, CA: Hoover Institution Press, 1983.
- Boulger, Demetrius Charles. *China*. New York: Peter Fenelon Collier & Son, 1900.
- Bowser, Hilda. *Timothy Richard, D.D., Litt.D., LL.D.: An Outline of His Life and Work in China*. Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1914.
- Brockman, Fletcher S. *I Discover the Orient*. New York, London: Harper, 1935.
- Buckley, James M. *Theory and Practice of Foreign Missions*. New York: Eaton & Mains, 1911.
- Cary-Elwes, Columba. *China and the Cross: A Survey of Missionary History*. New York: P. J. Kenedy & Sons, 1957.
- Chang, Chungli. *The Chinese Gentry: Studies on their Role in Nineteenth Century Chinese Society*. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1955.
- Chang, Hao. *Liang Ch'i-ch'ao and Intellectual Transition in China, 1890-1907*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1971.
- Chen Chiyun. *Liang Ch'i Ch'ao's 'Missionary Education': A Case Study of Missionary Influence on the Reform*. In: Papers on China, No. 16, Cambridge: Harvard University Press. 1962.

- Chen, Jerome. *Yuan Shih-kai, 1859-1916: Brutus Assumes the Purple*. LLC: Literary Licensing, 2011.
- Chen, Wei Cheng. *The Educational Work of Missionaries in China*. Ph.D. thesis, University of Michigan, 1910.
- Cheng Yingwan. *Postal Communication in China and its Modernization, 1860-1896*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1971.
- Chesneaux, Jean. ed., *Popular Movements and Secret Societies in China, 1840-1950*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1972.
- Chesneaux, Jean, M. Bastid, and M.-C. Bergere. *China: From the Opium Wars to the 1911 Revolution*. tr. Anne Destenay, New York: Pantheon Books, 1976.
- Cheung, D. ***Christianity in Modern China: The Making of the First Native Protestant Church***. Leiden, Brill: Brill Academic Publishers, 2004.
- Chiu, D. P. K. *Timothy Richard's Contribution to the Christian Church in China*. M.A. thesis, Berkeley, California, 1957.
- Christian Literature Society for China. *The Rev. Timothy Richard, Litt.D., D.D., of Shanghai*. The 110th Annual Report, Missionary Herald, May 1902, p. 220.
- Christian Literature Society for China. *No Speedier Way: A Volume Commemorating the Golden Jubilee of the Christian Literature Society for China, 1887-1937*. Shanghai, 1938.
- Clayton, G. A. *A Classified Index to the Chinese Literature of the Protestant Churches in China*. Shanghai: China Continuation Committee, 1913.
- Cloyd, David E. *Modern Education in Europe and the Orient*. New York: The Macmillian Company, 1917.
- Clyde, Paul H. *The Far East: A History of the Impact of the West on Eastern Asia*. 3rd edition, N.J.: Englewood Cliffs, 1958.
- Coats, Olive Mary. *Mrs. Moir Duncan, One of the Pioneers*. Scottish Baptist Magazine, 3-4, January 1967.
- Cohen, Paul A. *History in Three Keys: The Boxers as Event, Experience, and Myth*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1998.
- Considine, John J. *World Christianity*. Milwaukee: Bruce Publishing, 1945.
- Costin, W.C. *Great Britain and China, 1833-1860*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1937.
- Couling, Samuel. *The Encyclopedia Sinica*. United States: Hardpress Publishing, 2012.
- Covell, Ralph. *W.A.P. Martin: Pioneer of Progress in China*. Washington, DC: Christian University Press, 1978.
- Cronin, Vincent. *The wise Man from the West*. London: Fount/harperCollins, 1984.
- Crowley, James B. ed., *Modern East Asia: Essays in interpretation*. New York: Harcourt, Brace & World, 1970.
- Davidson, Robert J. and Isaac Mason. *Life in West China described by two residents in the province of Sz-Chwa* (intro. Timothy Richard), London: Headley Brothers, 1905.
- Davin, Delia. *Imperialism and the Diffusion of Liberal Thought: British Influence on Chinese Education*. In: *China's Education and the Industrialized World: Studies in Cultural Transfer*. ed. Ruth Hayhoe and Marianne Bastid, Armonk, NY: M. E. Sharpe, Inc., 1987.

- D' Elia, Paschal M. *The Catholic Missions in China: A Short Sketch of the History of the Catholic Church from the Earliest Records to our Own Days*. Shanghai: Commerical Press, 1934.
- Dean, Britten. *China and Great Britain: The Diplomacy of Commercial Relations, 1860-1864*. Cambridge: Harvard University press, 1974.
- De Groot, J. J. M. *Sectarianism and Religious Persecution in China*. Amsterdam: J. Miller, 1903-04.
- Der Ling, Princess. *Old Buddha*. New York, Dodd Mead and Company, 1928.
- Dunne, A. *Generation of Giants: The Story of the Jesuits in China in the Last Decades of the Ming Dynasty*. Notre Dame: Notre Dame University Press, 1962.
- Dwight, Henry Otis, et al. *The Encyclopedia of Missions: Descriptive, historical, biographical, statistical* (1904). New York, London: Funk & Wagnalls Co., 1904.
- Ebisawa, Arimichi (comp.). *Christianity in Japan: A Bibliography of Japanese and Chinese Sources*. Tokyo. Committee on Asia Cultural Studies, International Christian University, 1960.
- Eddy, Sherwood. *I Have Seen God Work in China*. New York: Association Press, 1944.
- Edmunds, Charles K. *Modern Education in China*. Bulletin 1919, No. 44, Department of the Interior Bureau of Education, Washington: Government Printing Office, 1919.
- Elman, Benjamin A., and A. Woodside. eds., *Education and Society in Late Imperial China, 1600-1900*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1994.
- Fairbank, John K., E. Reischauer, and A. M. Craig. *East Asia: Tradition & Transformation. New Impression*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1978.
- Fairbank, J. K.: ed., *Chinese Thought and Institutions*. Chicago, 1957.
- _____. *The Chinese World Order. Traditional China's Foreign Relations*. Cambridge: Harvard University press, 1968.
- _____. *Trade and Diplomacy on the China Coast. The Opening of the Treaty Ports, 1842-1854*. Cambridge: Harvard University press, 2 Volumes, 1953 (reprint from Stanford University Press, 1966).
- _____. *The Missionary Enterprise in China and America*. Cambridge: Harvard University press, 1974.
- _____, E. Reischauer, and A. M. Craig. *East Asia: The Modern Transformation*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1965.
- _____, and S. Teng. *Ch'ing Administration: Three Studies*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1960.
- Fenn, W. Purviance. *Christian Higher Education in Changing China. 1880-1950*. MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1976.
- Feuerwerker, A. *China's Early Industrialization: Sheng Hsuan-huai (1844-1916) and Mandarin Enterprise*. New York: Antheneum, 1970.
- _____, M. Rhoads, and M. C. Wright. *Approaches to Modern Chinese History*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1967
- Fisher, D. *Calvin Wilson Mateer: Forty-five Years a missionary in Shantung*. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1911.
- Fitzgerald, C. P. *China: A short Cultural History*. (3rd rev. ed.). New York: F.A. Praeger, 1950.
- _____. *Revolution in China*. London: Cresset Press, 1952.

- Forsyth, R. C. *Shantung: The Sacred Province of China*. Shanghai: Christian Literature Society. 1912.
- _____. *The China Martyrs of 1900*. New York: Fleming Revell, n.d.
- Franke, W. *China and the West*. tr. R. A. Wilson. Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press, 1968.
- Fu, Lo-shan. *A Documentary Chronicle of Sino-Western Relations (1644-1820)*. Association for Asia Studies Monographs and Papers, no. 22, Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1966.
- Fullerton, W. Y., and C. E. Wilson. *Report on China Missions*. London: BMS, 1908.
- Fung, Yu-lan. *History of Chinese Philosophy*. 2 Volumes, tr. Derk Bodde, Princeton: 1953.
- Gascoyne-Cecil, L. W. *Changing China*. London: James Nisbet & Co., Ltd. 1910.
- Gasster, M. *China's Struggle to Modernize*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1972.
- Giles, H. A. *China and the Manchus*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1912.
- Goddard, D.: *A Chapter of Chinese History*. Cleveland, 1906.
- Goodall, Norman. *A History of the London Missionary Society, 1895-1945*. London: Oxford University Press, 1954.
- Goodrich, L. C. *A Short History of the Chinese People* (2nd ed.). New York: Harper & Brothers, 1951.
- Graham, Gael. *Gender, Culture, and Christianity: American Protestant Mission Schools in China, 1880-1930*. New York: Peter Tang Publishing, Inc., 1995.
- Graybill, H. B. *The Educational Reform in China*. Hong Kong: Kelly & Walsh, Ltd., 1911.
- Greenbern, M. *British Trade and the Opening of China, 1800-1842*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1951.
- Gregg, Alice H. *China and Educational Autonomy: The Changing Role of the Protestant Educational Missionary in China, 1807-1937*. Syracuse, New York: Syracuse University Press, 1946.
- Gregory, J. S. *Great Britain and the Taipings*. New York and Washington: Praeger, 1969.
- Guillaume, Daniel. *British Protestant Missionaries in Late Imperial China: The Perception of the China Inland Mission*. University of Ottawa, M.A. Memoir, 2005.
- Harrell, Paula. *Sowing the Seeds of Change: Chinese Students, Japanese Teachers, 1895-1905*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1992.
- Hart, Sir Robert. *These from the Land of Sinim*. London, Chapman & Hall, Ltd., 1903.
- Hayhoe, Ruth. *China's Universities. 1895-1995: A Century of Conflict*. New York: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1996.
- _____. ed., *Education and Modernization: The Chinese Experience*. Oxford: Pergamon Press, 1992.
- _____. and M. Bastid. eds., *China's Education and the Industrialized World: Studies in Cultural Transfer*. Armonk, NY: M. E. Sharpe, Inc., 1987.
- _____. and Lu Yongling. *Ma Xiangbo and the Mind of Modern China. 1840-1939*. Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe, 1996.
- Headland, Isaac Taylor. *China's New Day*. West Medford, MA: The Central Committee on the United Study of Missions, 1912.

- Hemmens. Harry L. *Timothy Richard, Our Standard Bearers*. London: The Baptist Missionary Society, n.d.
- Hintonm Harold C. *The Grain Tribute System of China, 1845-1911*. Cambridge: Harvard University press, 1956.
- Ho, Ping-ti. *The Ladder of Success in Imperial China*. New York: John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 1964.
- _____. *Studies on the Population of China, 1368-1953*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University press, 1959.
- Holloway, B. *Timothy Richard of China: A Pageant*. London: The Carey Press, 1945.
- Hsiao, Kung-chuan. *Rural China, Imperial Control in the Nineteenth Century*. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1960.
- Hsuan Fo Pu. *Guide to Buddhahood, Being a Standard Manual of Chinese Buddhism*. (tr. by Timothy Richard), Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907.
- Hughes, E. R. and K. Hughes. *The Invasion of China by the Western World*. London: Adam & Charles Black, 1937.
- _____. *Religion in China*. London: Hutchinson's University Library, 1950.
- Hurt. J. *Education in Evolution: Church, State, Society and Popular Education. 1800-1870*. London: Rupert Hart-Davis, 1971.
- Hyatt, Irwin T. (Jr.). *Our Ordered Lives Confess: Three Nineteenth-Century American Missionaries in East Shantung*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1976.
- Judge, Joan. *Print and Politics: Shibao and the Culture of Reform in Late Qing China*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1996.
- Kamachi, N., J. K. Fairbank, and C. Ichilo. *Janpanese Studies of Modern China since 1953. A Bibliographical Guide to Historical and Social-science Research on the 19th and 20th Centuries*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University press, 1975.
- Kang, Youwei. *T'a Tung shu: The One World Philosophy of Kang Yu-wei*. tr., Laurence G. Thompson, London: 1958.
- Ki, K. H. *Japanese Perspectives on China's Early Modernization: The Self-strengthening Movement, 1860-1895, a bibliographical survey*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan, Center for Chinese Studies, 1974.
- Kikuchi, B. H. *Timothy Richard's Influence on the Missionary Movement and Chinese Reform in Late Ch'ing China*. M.A. thesis, University of Oregon, 1969.
- King, Frank H. H. *Money and Monetary Policy in China, 1845-1895*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University press, 1965.
- Kuhn, Philip A. *Rebellion and its Enemies in Late Imperial China: Militarization and Social Structure, 1796-1864*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University press, 1970.
- Kuo, Pin-chia. *A critical Study of the First Anglo-Chinese War, With Documents*. Shanghai: Commercial Press, 1935.
- Kuo, Pingwen *The Chinese System of Public Education. Contributions to Education*. In: No. 64, New York City: Teachers College, Columbia University, 1915.
- Lang, Olga. *Chinese Family and Society*. New Haven: Yale University. Press, 1946.
- _____. "The Great Century in Northern Africa and Asia, A.D. 1800-A.D. 1914". *The Far Eastern Quarterly* 4, No.2 (1945), pp.195-197.
- Leclercq, J. *Thunder in the Distance: The Life of Père Lebbe*. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1958.

- Levenson, J. R. *Liang Ch'i-Ch'ao and the Mind of Modern China*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1953.
- _____. *Confucian China and its Modern Fate: The Problem of Monarchical Decay*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1958.
- Liang, Ch'i-ch'ao. *Intellectual Trends in the Ch'ing Period* (tr. and intro. I. C. H. Hsu), Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1959.
- Lin, Wen-ch'ing. *The Chinese Crisis from Within*. ed., C. M. Reith, London: Grant Richards, 1901.
- Lo, Huimin. *Foreign Office Confidential Papers Relating to China and her Neighboring Countries 1840-1914 with an additional list 1915-1937*. The Hague and Paris, Mouton, 1969.
- Lo, Jungpang. ed., *A Biography and Symposium*. trans., K'ang Yu-wei, Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1967.
- Lodwick, Kathleen. comp. *The Chinese Recorder Index: A Guide to Christian Missions in Asia, 1867-1941*. Volume L, Wilmington, DE: Scholarly Resources, Inc., 1986.
- _____. ed., *A Century of Protestant Missions in China (1807-1907)*. Shanghai: American Presbyterian Mission Press, 1907.
- _____. ed., *Descriptive and Classified Missionary Centenary Catalogue of Current Christian Literature*. Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907.
- MacNair, H. F. *China in Revolution: An Analysis of Politics and Militarism under the Republic*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1931.
- Majunder, R. C., R. Hamchandra, and D. Kalinkinkar. *An Advanced History of India*. London: Macmillan; New York: St. Martin's Press, 1961.
- Marchant, Leslie R. *A Guide to the Archives and Records of Protestant Christian Missions from the British Isles to China, 1796-1914*. Nedlands: University of Western Australia Press, 1966.
- Martin, W.A.P. *The Siege in Peking, China against the World: By an eye witness*. New York: Fleming H. Revell, 1900.
- Michael, Franz H. *The Origin of Manchu Rule in China*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 1942.
- _____ and George C. Taylor. *The Far East in the Modern World*. New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1964.
- Michie, Alexander. *The Englishman in China During the Victorian Era: As Illustrated in the Career of Sir Rutherford Alcock*. 2 vols. Edinburgh, London: W. Blackwood & sons, 1900.
- Miyazaki, Ichisada. *China's Examination Hell: The Civil Service Examinations of Imperial China*. tr., Conrad Schirokauer, New Haven: Yale University Press, 1981.
- _____. Timothy Richard, D.D., L.L.D., Litt.D. In: *The China Mission Year Book 1919* (10th Annual Issue), ed. E. C. Lobenstine and A. L. Warnshuis, Shanghai: Kwang Hsueh Publishing House, 1920.
- Murphey, Rhoads. *The Outsiders: The Western Experience in India and China*, Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1976.
- Nathan, Andrew J. *Modern China, 1840-1972: An Introduction to Sources and Research Aids*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1973.
- _____. *A History of the China International Famine Relief Commission*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1965.

- Nevius, John L. *China and the Chinese*. Revised Ed., Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, 1882.
- Nystrom, Erik T. *The Coal and Mineral Resources of Shansi Province, China*. Stockholm: P.A. Norstedt & Söner, 1912.
- O'Neill, F. W. S. *The Quest for God in China*. London: G. Allen & Unwin, 1925.
- Peake, Cyrus H. *Nationalism and Education in Modern China*. New York: Columbia University, 1932.
- Pepper, Suzanne. *Radicalism and Education Reform in 20th-Century China*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- Peterson, Glen, H. Ruth, and Yongling Lu. eds., *Education, Culture, and Identity in Twentieth-Century China*. Ann Arbor: MI, University of Michigan Press, 2001.
- Pfister, Lauren. "Rethinking Missions in China: James Hudson Taylor and Timothy Richard". in *Imperial Horizon of British Protestant Missions, 1880-1914*, Cambridge: Wm.B.Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2003
- Pong, David. *Modernization and Politics in China as Seen in the Career of Shen Pao-chen (1820-1879)*. PhD. Thesis, University of London, 1969.
- Potts, F. L. Hawks. *The Emergency in China*. New York: Missionary Education Movement of the United States and Canada, 1913.
- _____. *Problems of Chinese Education*. London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trubner & Co., 1936.
- Rawlinson, John L. *China's Struggle for Naval Development, 1839-1895*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1967.
- Reardon-Anderson, James. *The Study of Change: Chemistry in China, 1840-1949*. Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press, 1991.
- Records, General Conference of Protestant Missionaries of China*, held at Shanghai, May 10-24, 1877, Shanghai, 1878.
- Records, General Conference of Protestant Missionaries of China*, held at Shanghai, May 7-20, 1890, Shanghai, 1890.
- Records, Triennial Meeting of the Educational Association of China*, held at Shanghai, May 2-4, 1893, Shanghai, 1893.
- Records, Second Triennial Meeting of the Educational Association of China*, held at Shanghai, May 6-9, 1896, Shanghai, 1896.
- Records, Third Triennial Meeting of the Educational Association of China*, held at Shanghai, May 17-20, 1899, Shanghai, 1900.
- Records, Fourth Triennial Meeting of the Educational Association of China*, held at Shanghai, May 21-24, 1902, Shanghai, 1902.
- Records, Fifth Triennial Meeting of the Educational Association of China*, held at Shanghai, May 17-20, 1905, Shanghai, 1905.
- Records, Sixth Triennial Meeting of the Educational Association of China*, held at Shanghai, May 19-22, 1909, Shanghai, 1910.
- Reports, the Mission Among the Higher Classes in China*. The International Institute of China, the 27th and 28th, Shanghai, 1911.
- Reports, the Mission Among the Higher Classes in China*. The International Institute of China, the 56th and 57th, Shanghai and Peking, 1926.
- Richard, Timothy. *Some Hints for Rising Statesmen*. Shanghai and London: [s.n.], 1905 (BMS ROLL NO. 60, MISSIONARY JOURNALS AND CORRESPONDENCE,

- 1792 – 1914: China, Timothy Richard, 18~9 – 1914, Box CH4B, Diaries, 1899 – 1903; Scrapbook on life, letters, notes, clippings; unpublished book).
- Richardson, Don. *Eternity in Their Hearts*. Ventura, CA: Regal Books, 1981.
- Rowbotham, Arnold H. *Missionary and Mandarin: The Jesuits at the Court of China*. Berkeley, California: University of California Press, 1942.
- Scheiner, Irwin. *Christian Converts and Social Protest in Meiji Japan*. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1970.
- Schuttiann, F., and O. Schell. *Imperial China: The Decline of the Last Dynast, and the Origins of Modern China, the 18th and 19th Centuries*. New York: Vintage Books, 1967.
- Schwartz, Benjamin. *In Search of Wealth and Power: Yen Fu and the West*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1964.
- Shih, Vincent Y.C. *The Taiping Ideology: Its Sources, Interpretations, and Influences*. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1967.
- Sih, Paul K. T. *Chinese Culture and Christianity*. Taipei: China Culture Pub. Foundation, 1957.
- _____. *Communism or Christianity*. New York: St. John's University Press, 1959.
- Smith, Arthur H. *China in Convulsion*. New York: Ams Press Inc, 1971.
- _____. *The Uplift of China* [intr. by Griffith John]. New York: Young People's Missionary Movement, 1907.
- _____. *The Three Religions of China*. 2nd ed., London: London Oxford Univ. Press, 1923.
- _____. *China and the West: A sketch of their intercourse*. Oxford: Curzon Press, 1925.
- Spence, Jonathan D. *The Gate of Heavenly Peace: The Chinese and Their Revolution, 1895-1980*. New York: Penguin Books, 1981.
- Stauffer, Milton. ed., *The Christian Occupation of China*. Shanghai: China Continuation Committee, 1922.
- Steiger, G. Nye: *China and the Occident*. New Haven: Russell & Russell, 1927.
- Stephens, Margaret Anne: *The Impact of the West: Timothy Richard and Reform in China*. M.A. thesis, The George Washington University, 1979.
- Tang, Leang-li. *China in Revolt: How a Civilization Became a Nation*. London: N. Douglas, 1927.
- Tang, Xiaobing. *Global Space and the Nationalist Discourse of Modernity: The Historical Thinking of Liang Qichao*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1996.
- Taylor, Jeremy. *Holy Living* (天道功课). tr., Timothy Richard, n.p., 1875-1876.
- Teilhard de Chardin, Pierre. *The Divine Milieu*. New York: 1960.
- Teng Ssu-yu and John K. Fairbank. *The Taiping Rebellion and the Western Powers*. London: Oxford University Press, 1971.
- Tucker, L. *Notes on the Life and Work of Dr. Timothy Richard of China*. London: John F. Shaw & Co., 1908.
- Uhalley, Stephen Jr., and Xiaoxin Wu. eds., *China and Christianity: Burdened Past and Hopeful Future*. Armonk, NY: M. E. Sharpe, 2001.
- Vare, Daniels. *The Last of the Empresses*. London: Houghton Mifflin, 1936.

- Varg, Paul A. *Missionaries, Chinese, and Diplomats: The American Protestant Missionary Movement in China. 1890-1952*. New York: Octagon Books, 1977.
- Wakeman, Frederic Jr. and C. Grant. eds., *Conflict and Control in Late Imperial China*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1975.
- Walker, Richard L. *China and the West: Cultural Collision*. New Haven: Yale University, 1956.
- Wehrle, Edmund S. *Britain, China and the Antimissionary Riots, 1891-1900*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1966.
- Wei, Betty Peh-T'i. *Shanghai: Crucible of Modern China*. Hong Kong: Oxford University Press, 1987.
- Whyte, Bob. *Unfinished Encounter: China and Christianity*. London: Fount Paperbacks, 1988.
- _____. *Timothy Richard, 1845-1919*. In: *Baptists Who Made History: A Book about Great Baptists Written by Baptists*. London: The Carey Kingsgate Press Limited, 1955, pp. 96-107.
- _____. *China and Timothy Richard: Outline Studies for Group Discussion*. London: Carey Press, n.d.
- Wright, Mary C. *The Last Stand of Chinese Conservatism: The T'ung-chih Restoration, 1862-1874*. California: Stanford University Press, 1957.
- Wu, Chao-kwang. *The International Aspect of the Missionary Movement in China*. Baltimore: [The Johns Hopkins press](#); London, H. Milford, [Oxford university press](#), 1930.
- Xuanzang, *Prajnaparamita Heart Sutra*, tr. Venerable Yifa, M. C. Owens, P. M. Romaskiewicz, Kaohsiung: Buddha's Light Publishing, 2006. 玄奘:《般若波罗密多心经》，高雄：佛光出版社，2006年。

B2-2 Articles

B2-2-1 Annotated Articles

- Abe, Hiroshi. Borrowing From Japan: China's First Modern Educational System. In: *China's Education and the Industrialized World: Studies in Cultural Transfer*, ed., Ruth Hayhoe and Marianne Bastid, Armonk, NY, M. E. Sharpe, Inc., 1987.
- Abraham, Gary. "The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Utilitarianism: The Case of East," *Theory and Society* 12, no. 6 (1983), pp.739-773.
- Allen, Ken. *What is "Christian Universalism"?* [<http://www.auburn.edu/~allenkc/chr-univ.html>], Dec. 2013.
- Baxter, Alexander. "The Awakening of Faith," *Chinese Recorder*, LIV, no.10 (1923), pp.584-595; no.11.
- Bertrand, Claude-Jean. "American Cultural Imperialism- A Myth?" *American Studies International* 25, no.1 (1987).
- Bevan, L. R. O.. "The Imperial University at Taiyuenfu, Shansi. Taiyuenfu: Historical and Mythological," *East of Asia Magazine*, no.3 (1904-1905), pp.97-100.
- Bu, E.W.. "Timothy Richard: His Contribution to Modern China," *International Review of Missions* 34 (1945), p.295.

- Bohr, Paul Richard. "The Legacy of Timothy Richard," *International Bulletin of Missionary Research* 24, no.2 (2000).
- Burt, Ernest W.. "The Centenary Timothy Richard," *Baptist Quarterly*, (1945), pp.343-348.
- _____. "Timothy Richard: His Contribution to Modern China," *International Review of Missions* XXXIV (1945), pp.292-300.
- Chow, G. "The Chinese Economy, 1901-2000," *Perspectives*, 2, no. 6 (2001): [http://www.oycf.org/Perspectives2/12_063001/chinese_econ.htm], 16 August, 2011.
- Cohen, Paul A. "Missionary Approaches: Hudson Taylor and Timothy Richard," *Papers on China* XI (1957), pp.29-62.
- _____. "10. Christian Missions and Their Impact to 1900," In *The Cambridge History of China*, Vol.10, ed. J. K. Fairbank (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1978), p.612.
- _____. "10.Missionaries and the New Order," In *The Cambridge History of China*, Vol.10, ed. J. K. Fairbank (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1978), pp. 581-588.
- Dagnino, Evelina. "Cultural and Ideology Dependency: Building a Theoretical Framework," In *Transnational Enterprises: Their Impact on Third World Societies and Cultures*, ed. Krishmna Kumar, Boulder, Westview Press Inc. 1980.
- Dirlik, Arif. "Modernity as History: Post-revolutionary China, Globalization and the Question of Modernity," *Social History* 27, no. 1 (2002), p.p.16-39.
- Duncan, Moir. "Shansi Imperial University". *Chinese Recorder* 34 (1903): pp.460-463.
- _____. "Shansi Imperial University". *Missionary Herald*, (1903), pp.478-479.
- _____. "The Imperial University of Shansi," *East of Asia Magazine*, no.3 (1904-1905): pp.102-105.
- Elvin, Mark. "A Working Definition of 'Modernity'?" *Past & Present*, 113, 1986, pp. 209-213.
- Galtung, J.. "A Structural Theory of Imperialism," *Journal of Peace Research* 8, no.2 (1971), pp.81-117.
- Genow-Hecht, Jessica C. E. "Shame on US? Academics, Cultural Transfer, and the Cold War A Critical Review," *Diplomatic History* 24, no 3 (2000), p.472.
- Glover, T. R.. "A Man of Personality," *North China Daily News*, no.26 (1919).
- Harris, Paul William. "Cultural Imperialism and American Protestant Missions: Collaboration and Dependency in mid-Nineteenth Century China" *Pacific Historical Review*, 60 no.3, 1991.
- Harris, G. L.. "The mission of Matteo Ricci, S. J.: A Case Study of an Effort at Guided Culture Change in China in The Sixteenth Century", *Monumenta Serica*, 25, 1966, p.70.
- Hitchcock, Beatrice. *The Evolution of Unitarianism & Universalism: A Liberal Inheritance*, Sermon, High Plains Church Unitarian Universalist, 9 June 2013, pp.1-13.
- Kaufman, Alison A.. "The 'Century of Humiliation,' Then and Now: Chinese Perceptions of the International Order," *Pacific Focus* 25, no.1 (2010), pp.1-33.
- Klein, Thoralf. "Chapter 7. Christian Mission and the internationalization of China, 1830-1950", in: *Trans-Pacific Interactions: The United States and China 1880-*

- 1950, ed., Vanessa Kunnemann and Ruth Mayer, New York: Palgrave Macmillan 2009.
- Kranz, Paul. "List of Educational Articles from the 'Recorder' (1869-1894)," *Chinese Recorder* 26 (1895), pp.228-232.
- Kreis, Steven. "Lecture 2: Ancient Western Asia and the Civilization of Mesopotamia," in: *The History Guide (Lecture Notes)*, Florida Atlantic University, Broward Community College, Vance-Granville Community College, Meredith College, Wake Technical Community College, [<http://www.historyguide.org/ancient/lecture2b.html>]
- _____. "Lecture 3: Egyptian Civilization", [<http://www.historyguide.org/ancient/lecture3b.html>]
- _____. "Lecture 5: Homer and the Greek Renaissance, 900-600BC", in: *The History Guide (Lecture Notes)*, Florida Atlantic University, Broward Community College, Vance-Granville Community College, Meredith College, Wake Technical Community College, [<http://www.historyguide.org/ancient/lecture5b.html>]
- Kuo, Pinwen, *The Chinese system of Public Education*, Contributions to Education 64, New York City: Teachers College, Columbia University, 1915.
- Landow, G. P.. *The Industrial Revolution: A Timeline*. [<http://www.victorianweb.org/technology/ir/irchron.html>]
- Lancashire, D.. "Buddhist Reaction to Christianity in Late Ming China", *Journal of the Oriental Society of Australia*, 6(1-2), 1968, pp.82-103.
- Laliberté, André "Vincent Goossaert et David A. Palmer, The Religious Question in Modern China," *China Perspectives*, 2012/4 | 2011, pp.74-75.
- Lee, Erika. "The Chinese Exclusion Example: Race, Immigration, and American Gatekeeping, 1882-1924", *Journal of American Ethnic History*, Vol. 21, No. 3 (2002), pp. 36-62.
- Li, L. M.. "Introduction: Food, Famine, and the Chinese State," *Journal of Asian Studies*, no. 4 (1982), p.687.
- Liu Kwang-ching, "Nineteenth-Century China: The Disintegration of the Old Order and the Impact of the West," In *China in Crisis*, Vol.1, ed. Ho Ping-ti and Tang Tsou p.133. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1968.
- Lucas, J. R.. Wilberforce and Huxley: A Legendary Encounter, *The Historical Journal*, 1979, 22 (2): pp.313-330.
- MacGillivray, Donald. "The Story of Shansi University," In: *China Mission Year Book*. Shanghai (1911), pp.111-116.
- Mariani, Paul S. J., *The Jesuit China Mission: A Brief History, Part I (1552-1800)*, The New Jesuit Review Vol. 3., 2012.
- McIntosh, Gillbert: Rev.. "Timothy Richard: In Memoriam," *Chinese Recorder* L, no.5 (1919), pp.331-333.
- Medhurst, Spurgeon. "A Tribute to Dr. Richard," *North China Daily News*, 27 April 1919.
- Medieval Sourcebook: *John of Monte Corvino: Report from China 1305* [<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/source/corvino1.asp>]: Letter of John Monte Corvino, in *Cathay and the Way Thither*, translated and edited by Sir Henry Yule, second edition revised by Henri Cordier (London: Hakluyt Society, 1914), Vol. III, Second Series, Vol. 37, pp. 45-51, passim. Slightly abridged and reprinted in Leon Barnard

- and Theodore B. Hodges, *Readings in European History*. New York: Macmillan, 1958.
- Miller, Stuart C.. "Ends and Means: Missionary Justification of Force in Nineteen Century China," In *The Missionary Enterprise in China and America*, John K. Fairbank, Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1974.
- Miyazaki, Ichisada. "Obituary: Timothy Richard," *Journal of the North-China Branch of the Royal Asiatic Society*, no.50 (1919), pp.247-248.
- Momen, M.. Fundamentalism and Liberalism: Towards an Understanding of the Dichotomy. in: Vol. 13, *Studies in the Babi and Baha'i Religions*, (Los Angeles: Kalimat Press 2002), [http://bahailibrary.com/momen_fundamentalism_liberalism_dichotomy]
- Montgomery, John Warwick. "Luther, Libraries and Learning," reprinted in Montgomery's *In Defense of Martin Luther* (Milwaukee: Northwestern Publishing Co., 1970).
- Morgan, E.. "In Memoriam Rev. M. B. Duncan, M.A., L.L.D.," *Chinese Recorder*, no.37 (1906), pp.558-561.
- Moule, George E.. "About the Awakening of Faith by Timothy Richard," *Chinese Recorder* 42, no.6 (1911), pp.347-357.
- Ng, Peter Tze Ming "Timothy Richard: Christian Attitudes towards Other Religions and Cultures," *Studies in World Christianity* 40 (2008), pp.74-78.
- News Center, "China Commemorates Anti-opium Hero," [<http://news.cultural-china.com/20090604103010.html>], *Global Times*, 4 June 2009.
- Norman, C. H.. "Building the Protestant Church in Shandong, China," *International Bulletin of Missionary Research* 22, no. 2 (1998), pp.62-68.
- Origin: Silk Road Trade & Travel Encyclopedia*. [<http://www.silkroutes.net/orient/mapssilkroutrade.htm>].
- Osborne, Peter. "Modernity Is a Qualitative, Not a Chronological, Category: Notes on the Dialectics of Differential Historical Time." In *Postmodernism and the Re-reading of Modernity*, eds., Francis Barker, Peter Hulme, and Margaret Iversen. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1992.
- Owen, G. "The Recent Church Reform Movement in China," address given at the Central Presbyterian Church, New York City, 30 April 1900, and printed in *Ecumenical Missionary Conference*, Vol. I, pp.549-552.
- Peck, Myron H.. "Description of Buildings," *East of Asia Magazine* 3, 1904-1905, pp.105-110.
- Pratt, Mary Louise. Arts of the Contact Zone, *Profession*, 1991, pp. 33-40.
- Richard, Mary. "The Christian and the Chinese Idea of Womanhood and How Our Mission Schools May Help to Develop the Former Idea," *Chinese Recorder* 31 (1900), pp.10-16; pp.55-62.
- Schlesinger, J. R.. "Missionary Enterprise and Theories of Imperialism," In *The Missionary Enterprise in China and America*, John K. Fairbank, Harvard University Press, 1974.
- "Shansi University: A Tribute to Dr. Timothy Richard," *North China Daily News*. 15 December 1910. BMS, MSS.
- Shemo, Connie A.. "'So Thoroughly American': Gertrude Howe, Kang Cheng, and Cultural Imperialism in the Women's Foreign Missionary Society, 1872-1931". In:

- Competing Kingdoms: Women, Mission, Nation, and the American Protestant Empire, 1812-1960* (American Encounters/Global Interactions), eds., Barbara Reeves-Ellington, Kathryn Kish Sklar, and Connie A. Shemo. Durham & London: Duke University Press, 2010.
- Standaert, Nicolas. "Christianity Shaped by the Chinese," In *The Cambridge History of Christianity*, Vol. 6: *Reform and Expansion 1500-1660*, ed. R. Po-Chia Hsia, pp.559-561. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007.
- Twain, Mark. "To the person Sitting in Darkness" *North American Review*, February 1901.
- Van Der Veer, Peter. "The Global History of 'Modernity'," *Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient*, 41(3), 1998, pp. 285-294.
- Wany, Q. E. "Rise of the Great Powers=Rise of China? Challenges of the Advancement of Global History in the People's Republic of China," *Journal of Contemporary China* 19, no.64 (2010), pp.273-289.
- White, Livingston A. *Reconsidering Cultural Imperialism Theory* (Archives 6 Spring/Summer, Transnational Broadcasting Studies, 2001) [<http://www.tbsjournal.com/Archives/Spring01/white.html>]. 18 August, 2008.
- Yazdani, A.. The Relationship between Religion and Modernity, *Comparative Theology*, 2010, 1(3), pp.103-120.

B2-2-2 Non-annotated Articles

- Bashford, J. W.. "Buddhism," *China Mission Year Book*, (1914), pp.34-37.
- Burt, Ernest W.. "Timothy Richard's Influence on New China," *World Outlook*, no.160 (1945), pp.22-26.
- Buck, D. Educational Modernization in Tsinan 1899-1937. In: *The Chinese City Between Two Worlds*, ed., M. Elvin and W. Skinner, Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 171-212, 1974.
- Burr, E. W.. "Timothy Richard: His Contribution to Modern China," *International Review of Missions*, no.34 (1945), pp.293-300.
- Couling, Samuel. "A Portrait: The Rev. Timothy Richard". *New China Review* I, no.3 (1919), p.320.
- Cowell, H. J.. "Timothy Richard, Missionary and Mandarin: A Centenary Tribute". *The Asiatic Review* 41 (1945), pp.397-403
- "Editorial Comment," *Chinese Recorder* 33 (1902), p.427.
- "Editorial Comment—Congratulations to Dr. Moir Duncan," *Chinese Recorder*, no.35 (1906), p.281.
- "Editorial Notes," *Educational Review*, no.2 (1909), p.10.
- "Examination Scheme," *Chinese Recorder*, no. 29 (1900), pp.420-423.
- Fong, S.. "The Co-operation of Chinese and Foreign Educationists in the Work of the Association," *Educational Review*, no.2 (1909), pp.1-6.
- Fu, L.. "The Chi-nan-fu College," *Chinese Recorder*, no.33 (1902), pp.247-249.
- "Government Universities," *Chinese Recorder*, no.33 (1902), pp.463-464.
- Gracey, J. T.. "The Protestant Literary Movement in China," *Missionary Review of the World*, NS 27 (1904), pp.25-29.

- Hayes, W. M.. "Foreign Instructors and Intolerance," *Chinese Recorder*, no.33 (1903), p.234.
- Headland, Isaac Taylor. "Missionary Influence in Chinese Reform," *Missionary Review of the World*, NS 22 (1909), pp.26-27.
- "A Heathen Panegyric on the Shansi Martyrs," *Missionary Review of the World*, NS 25 (1902), pp.291-292.
- Keenan, Barry C.. "Imperial China's Last Classical Academies: Social Change in the Lower Yangzi, 1864-1911." *China Research Monography*, no.42. Berkeley: Institute of East Asian Studies, University of California-Berkeley (1994).
- _____. "Lungmen Academy in Shanghai and the Expansion of Kiangsu's Educated Elite (1865-1911)," In: *Education and Society in Late Imperial China, 1600-1900*. Edited by Benjamin A. Elman and Alexander Woodside, pp. 493-524. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press (1994).
- "New China and Its Leaders," *Chinese Recorder* 29 (1898), pp.418-419.
- "Notes," *Chinese Recorder* 32 (1901).
- "Notes," *Chinese Recorder* 33 (1902), pp.302-311.
- "Notes," *Tyndale Messenger* (1905).
- "A Noteworthy Document," *Missionary Review of the World* 25 (1902): n.p.
- "Officers and Committees," *Chinese Recorder* 33 (1902), p.302.
- "Program of Triennial Meeting," *Chinese Recorder* 33 (1902), pp.199-200.
- "Provincial Education in Shansi," *North China Herald* (1903), p.1296.
- Richard, Eleanor. "A Foster Father of the League of Nations," In: *The Peking and Tientsin Times*, Tientsin, 1919.
- Richard, Mary. "The Martyrs of 'Young China,'" *Sunday at Home* 46 (1899), pp.285-288.
- Sites, Lacey. "The Educational Edicts of 1901 in China," *Educational Review* 25 (1903), pp.67-75.
- Soothill, William E.. "The Educational Conquest of China," *Contemporary Review* 98 (1910), pp.403-408.
- Special Commissioner: The Fate of China: A Chat With Rev. Dr. Timothy Richard. *The Christian Commonwealth*. 23 March 1905.
- Swallow, R. W.. "Education and Reform in China," *The Imperial and Asiatic Quarterly Review and Oriental and Colonial Record* 20, no.1 (1905), pp.138-147.

B3 Primary Sources in Chinese

B3-1 Annotated Books

- 蒋廷黻 Jiang Tingfu: 《近代中国外交史资料辑要》 (*A source book of important documents in modern Chinese diplomatic history*). Shanghai: Commercial Press 1931.
- 康有为 Kang Youwei, 《大同书》, *Datong Shu* (Beijing: People's Publishing House, 2010).
- 李鸿章 Li Hongzhang: 《李文忠公全集》 (*Collections of Li Wenzhong*). Shanghai: Commercial Press, 1905.

- Richard, Timothy: 《灾宜设法早救》 (*Methods devised earlier for Famine relief*). Wan Guo Gong Bao (The Globe Magazine or Review of the Times), Shanghai, 1875-1883, 1889-1907, pp. 91b-92, 29 September 1877.
- _____: 《富晋新见》 (*New Policies of Bringing Wealth to Shansi*). Wan Guo Gong Bao, pp. 2-4b, December 1889.
- _____: 《中西四大政》 (*Four great policies for China and the West*). Shanghai, Society for the the Diffusion of Christian and General Knowledge in China, 1892.
- _____: 《泰西新史揽要》 (trans. Of Robert Mackenzie, *The Nineteenth Century—A History*). Shanghai, Society for the Diffusion of Christian and General Knowledge in China, 1895.
- _____: 《新政策》 (*New administration policies*). In: 麦仲华 ed., Huangchao Jinshi wen Xinbian (New compilation of essays on administrative statecraft under the reigning dynasty), 1898, 32 Volumes.
- _____: 《近事要务》 (*Present Needs*). Wan Guo Gong Bao, pp.118-21b, serialized 12 November 1881 – 28 January 1882.
- 王之春 Wang Zhichun: 《国朝柔远记》, *The Complete History of China's Trade* Beijing: Chinese Book Company, 1989.
- 翁同龢 Weng Tonghe: 《翁文恭公日记》 (*Weng Tonghe's diaries*). Shanghai: Commercial Press, 1925.
- 恽代英 Yun Daiying: 《恽代英文集》 (*Yun Daiying Corpus*), Beijing: People's Press, 1984
- 张之洞 Zhang Zhidong: 《张文襄公全集》 (*Complete papers of Zhang Zhidong*). 158 Volumes. Beijing, 1937.
- 中国国民党上海特别市党务指导委员会宣传部 Publicity Committee of Chinese Nationalist Party: , 《不平等条约研究集》 (*Study Set of Unequal Treaties*) Shanghai: Republic Daily, 1929.
- 郑观应 Zheng Guanying: 《盛世危言》 (*Warnings to a prosperous age*). Beijing: Zhonghua, 1893.

B3-2 Non-annotated Books

- 《大清会典事例》 (*Collected statutes of the Qing dynasty*). Vol.1220, Shanghai, 1908.
- 故宫博物院 China Palace Museum: 《清代筹办夷务始末》 (*Complete record of the management of Barbarian affairs*). 80 Volumes for the later Daoguang period 1836–1850, 80 Volumes for the Xianfeng period 1851–1861, and 100 volumes for the Tongzhi period 1862–1874, Beijing, 1930.
- 贺长龄 He Changling: 《皇朝经世文编》 (*Essays on administrative statecraft under the reigning dynasty*). Vol.120, Shanghai, 1886 & 1887.
- 胡思敬 Hu Sijing: 《戊戌履霜记》 (*Perilous Experiences during the 1898 Reform*). Vol.4, Nanchang, 1913.
- 李鸿章 Li Hongzhang: 《李文忠公奏稿》 (*Memorials of Li Wenzhong*). Vol.80, Nanjing, 1905.

- 梁启超 Liang Qichao: 《饮冰室合集》 (*Collected works from the Ice-Drinks' Studio*). Shanghai: Commercial Press, 1937.
- 南开大学历史系 History Department, Nankai University: 《清实录经济资料辑要列》 (*Selected economic materials from the Qing Veritable records*). Beijing: Zhonghua, 1959.
- 中央研究院 Academia Sinica: 《清代筹办夷务始末补遗》 (*Supplement to complete record of the management of Barbarian affairs*). Taobei: IMH, 1968.
- 徐世昌 Xu Shichang: 《清儒学案》 (*Records of the scholarship of Qing Confucianists*). Tianjin: Xū Family ed., 1938.
- 薛福成 Xū Fucheng: 《筹洋刍议》 (*Preliminary proposals on foreign affairs*). In: 庸盦全集 (*Collected writings of Xue Fu-cheng*), Shanghai: Tsui-liu-T'ang, 1897.
- 赵尔巽 Zhao Erxun: ed., 《清史稿》 (*Draft history of Qing Dynasty*), Beijing: Zhonghua, 1972.
- 左宗棠 Zuo Zongtang: 《左文襄公全集》 (*Complete collection of Zuo Zongtang's papers*). 1890.

B4 Secondary Sources in Chinese

Annotated Books and Articles

- 蔡中兴 Cai Zhongxin: 《帝国主义理论发展史》 (*A Developing History of Imperialism Theory*). Shanghai: Shanghai People's Press, 1987.
- 丁则良 Ding Zeliang: 《一个典型为帝国主义服务的传教士》 (*Timothy Richard: a Typical Missionary in the Service of Imperialism*). Beijing: Kaiming, 1951.
- 丁则良, Ding Zeliang, “马关议和前李提摩太策动李鸿章卖国阴谋的发现”, (“The conspiracy of the commit treason instigated by Timothy Richard to Li Hongzhang before the Treaty of Shimonoseki,”) *History Teaching*, no.3 (1951), pp.14-17.”, 《历史教学》, 1951 年第 3 期, 第 14-17 页。
- 邓云特 Deng Yunte: 《中国救荒史》 (*History of Famine Relief in China*). Shanghai: 1936.
- 冯友兰 Feng Youlan: 《中国近代思想史论文集》 (*Collected Articles on the History of Thoughts in Modern China*). Beijing, 1970.
- 顾长声 Gu Changsheng: 《传教士与近代中国》 (*Missionaries and Modern China*) Shanghai: Shanghai Bookstore Publishing House, 2005
- 顾长声 Gu Changsheng: 《从马礼逊到司徒雷登》 (*Robert Morrison to John Leighton Start*) Shanghai: Shanghai People Press, 2004
- 郭吾真, Guo Wuzhen, “李提摩太在山西的侵略活动”, (“Timothy Richard's Aggressive Activities in Shansi Province,”) *History Teaching*, no.4 (1964), pp.11-18. 《历史教学》, 1964 年第 4 期, 第 11-18 页。
- 海关总署研究室 Inspectorate General of Maritime Customs, Research Department: ed., 《帝国主义与中国海关》 (*Imperialism and Chinese Maritime Customs*). Beijing: Science Press, 1957-1959.
- 胡绳 Hu Sheng: 《帝国主义与中国政治》 (*Imperialism and China's Politics*). Beijing: People Publishing House, 1978.

- 胡维革、郑权, Hu Weige and Zheng Quan, “文化冲突与反洋教斗争”(“Cultural conflict and anti-Christian Struggle: Cultural perspective of Religious Case in Late Qing.”) *Journal of North East University* (Philosophy and Social Science version), no.1 (2001), p.25., 《东北师大学报》, 2001年第1期, 第25页。
- 金耀基, 范丽珠 Jin Yaoji & Fan Lizhu: “研究中国宗教的社会学范式: 杨庆堃眼中的中国社会宗教, 社会” *Sociological Paradigms for Studying Religion in China--Religion in Chinese Society to Ching Kun Yang*, Society (Bimonthly), 27(1), 2007, pp.1-13; 206.: , 2007年第27卷第1期, 第1-13, 206页。
- 李时岳 Li Shiyue: 《李提摩太》(*Timothy Richard*). Beijing: Zhong Hua Book Company, 1964.
- 林治平 Lin Zhi-pin: 《基督教与中国现代化》(*Christianity and China's Modernization*). Taipei: Taipei Yuzhouguang Publishing House, 1994.
- 刘大年 Liu Danian: 《美国侵华史》(*A History of American Aggressing China*). Beijing: People's Press, 1951.
- 罗荣渠 Luo Rongqu: 《从西化到现代化》(*From Westernization to Modernization*). Beijing: Peking University Press, 1990.
- 毛泽东 Mao Zedong, 《毛泽东选集》, 第二卷(*Mao Zedong Anthology Vol. 2*), Beijing: People's Press, 1991.
- 牟安世 Mou Anshi: 《洋务运动》(*The Self-Strengthening Movement*). Shanghai: People Press, 1956.
- 欧多恒, Ou Duoheng, “论西方基督教教士在中国传教的目的和方法”, (“Studies on the Aim and Means of Western Christian Mission Work in China,”) *Guizhou Social Science* no.4 (1993), p.78. 《贵州社会科学》, 1993年第4期, 第78页。
- 钱穆 Qian Mu: 《中国近三百年学术史》(*Chinese Academic History over the past 300 Years*). Shanghai: Commercial Press, 1937.
- 汤志君 Tang Zhijun: 《戊戌变法史论从》(*Collected Writings on the 1898 Reform Movement*). Hankou: Renming, 1957.
- 陶飞亚、梁元生 Tao Feiya and Liang Yuan-sheng: 《东亚基督教再诠释》(*Re-interpretation of Christianity in East Asia*). Hong Kong: Hong Kong Chinese University, 2004.
- 陶飞亚、杨卫华, Tao Feiya and Yang Weihua, “Studies of History of Chinese Christianity since Opening-up”, *Journal of Historical Science* 10 (2010), pp.5-18. “改革开放以来的中国基督教史研究”, 《史学月刊》, 2010年第10期, 第5-18页。
- 瞿秋白 Qu Qiubai: 《瞿秋白文集》第二卷(*Qu Qiu-bai Corpus Vol.2*). Beijing: People's Press, 1988.
- 王立新 Wang Lixin: 《美国传教士和晚清中国现代化》(*Ameircan Missionaries and the Modernization of China in the late Qing*). Tianjin: Tianjin People Press, 1997.
- 王树槐 Wang Shuhuai: 《外人与戊戌变法》(*Foreigners and the 1898 Reform Movement*). Taipei: 1965.
- 王之春 Wang Zhichun: 《国朝柔远记》(*The Complete History of China's Trade*). Beijing: Chinese Book Company, 1989).

- 吴盛德 Wu Shengde and 陈增辉 Chen Zenghui: 《教案史料编目》 (*A bibliography of Chinese Source Materials of the Local and International Cases in Christian Missions*). Beijing: Yanjing University, 1941.
- 恽代英 Yun Daiying: 《恽代英文集》 (*Yun Daiying Corpus*) Beijing: People's Press, 1984.
- 张贵永 Zhang Guiyong, 吕实强 Lü Shiqiang, et al. 《教务教案档》 (*Archives on Church Affairs and Disputes about Missionaries and Converts*). Taipei: IMH, Academia Siniaca, 9 Volumes, 1974-1975.
- 张钦士 Zhang Xinshi: 《国内近十年来之宗教思潮》 (*China's Religious Thoughts over the Past Decades*). Beijing: Yanjing Huawen School, 1927.
- 朱谦之 Zhu Qianzhi, 《中国景教》 (*Nestorian Christianity to China*). Beijing: People Publication Press, 1993.
- 朱维铮 Zhu Weizheng, 《利玛窦中文著译集》 (*Matteo Ricci's Chung-wen chu-i-chi, Matteo Ricci's Complete Corpus in Chinese*), (Shanghai: Fudan University Press), 2007.