'NEW EDUCATIONISTS' IN QUEBEC PROTESTANT MODEL AND INTERMEDIATE SCHOOLS, 1881 – 1926

by

Anne Drummond

Thesis submitted to the School of Graduate Studies and Research in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the Ph.D. degree in History

Université d’Ottawa/University of Ottawa

c 1994 Anne Drummond
The author has granted an irrevocable non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of his/her thesis by any means and in any form or format, making this thesis available to interested persons.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in his/her thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without his/her permission.

L’auteur a accordé une licence irrévocable et non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de sa thèse de quelque manière et sous quelque forme que ce soit pour mettre des exemplaires de cette thèse à la disposition des personnes intéressées.

L’auteur conserve la propriété du droit d’auteur qui protège sa thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

ABSTRACT

This study of Quebec Protestant superior and secondary education in the late-nineteenth, early-twentieth century focuses on the professionalization of the principalship of model schools which were subsidized from the Protestant share of the Quebec Superior Education Fund. The dissertation tries to make a conceptual and historical link between a regulation which prohibited principals from providing the official academy grade curriculum to pupils enrolled in model schools and a series of school consolidation campaigns which the Protestant Committee of the Council of Public Instruction planned and implemented between 1906 and 1926.

The dissertation proposes that the "educationists" of the Protestant Committee and the Provincial Association of Protestant Teachers of Quebec created the pre-conditions for the late nineteenth century Protestant rural school problem and subsequently conceptualized school consolidation and pupil transportation as solutions to this problem. The thesis argues that teacher professionalization regulations forced pupils at early ages out of one-room schools into graded, secondary, and graded, secondary, consolidated schools. Those school boards, principals, and pupils who were left out of the network of Protestant graded schools faced the loss of their Superior Education fund grants, their jobs, and their access to school leaving examinations respectively.
The nineteenth century model school— a relatively inexpensive and flexible provider of secondary education— was transformed by Protestant Committee initiatives to classify pupils by age-grade, consolidate rural schools, and obtain enabling pupil transportation legislation for the boards of Protestant school municipalities. Professionally certified men teachers developed a graded elementary and secondary system in the context of Protestant minority education rights obtained in 1867 with the British North America Act and the British Canadian nationalism and domestic ideology of Montreal’s elites. They used Protestant Committee regulation to reshape the right of the school commissioner to become a dissentient trustee into the right of the board of commissioners to create the separate Protestant school municipality. They did not believe that incumbent men and women principals of turn-of-the century model schools were qualified to defend a Protestant school system, and saw the depletion of Protestant school municipality tax revenues as a consequence of the growth of the Catholic school municipality tax base. However, with their devaluation of the model schools, they limited the possibilities of secondary school provision for principals, teachers, and pupils.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank the University of Ottawa Department of Graduate Studies and Research for providing me with a scholarship for the first two years of the History Department's doctoral program. Michael Behiels, Donald Davis, and Chad Gaffield, the supervisors of the fields, have respectively changed the way I think about Canadian and Quebec politics, the history of technology, and the strategies of public school provision. Michael Behiels and Ruby Heap have given freely from their knowledge of Quebec political, social, and educational history, and Chad Gaffield has been a patient supervisor from the dissertation's conception through its completion.

I am especially grateful for the assistance of Marion Phelps, Curator of the Brome County Historical Society; Pierre-Louis Lapointe, Recherche et documentation, Centre d'archives de Québec et de Chaudière-Appalaches, Archives Nationales du Québec; Jocelyn Saint-Pierre, Le responsable du Service de la reconstitution des débats, Direction générale de la bibliothèque, Assemblée Nationale; Edward Fisher, of Montreal, Quebec; and Clifford Moore, of Richmond, Quebec.

I am indebted also to the colleagues and friends who have given me hours of expertise and encouragement: Maureen Anderson, John Bland, Sue Brown, Wyn Dickson, Michael Fox, Robert Gidney and Wyn Millar, Lorne Hammond, Esther Healy, Thomas James, Rhona Kenneally, Evelyn J. Kerr, Peter Landry, Paula J.S. LaPierre, Lorna McLean, Jennifer Henderson, Lou Rider, Mary Ellen Riesner, Jonathan Rittenhouse, Frances Thompson, Susan Wagg, Kathleen Weiler, Anne Wood, and Donna Yavorsky-Ronish.

Margot Adair, Irene Simons, and Ann Sutherland have been sisters, and Louis, Rob, Gavin, and Colin, sons, in the struggle. Derek and his views of developers have been there from the beginning. The thesis is dedicated to the memory of John Alan Lafleur, 1945-1992.
INTRODUCTION

'NEW EDUCATIONISTS,' AGE-GRADING, AND

THE CONSOLIDATION-TRANSPORTATION OPTION
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION: 'NEW EDUCATIONISTS,' AGE-GRADING, AND THE CONSOLIDATION-TRANSPORTATION OPTION</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 1: DISSENT, PROTESTANT COMMITTEE REGULATION AND THE FUNDING OF PROTESTANT SUPERIOR SCHOOLS</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 2: CLOSING THE DOOR OF HOPE: THE DECERTIFICATION OF PRINCIPALS, 1881-1895</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 3: PROTESTANT MODEL SCHOOLS AND THE MARCHEAND EDUCATION ACTS, 1895-1905</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 4: THROWING AWAY THE KEY: THE DECERTIFICATION OF PRINCIPALS, 1905-1926</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSION: &quot;WELL UP IN THE MODEL GRADES&quot;</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX 1: PROTESTANT MODEL SCHOOLS: SCHOOL, TOWNSHIP, FOUNDING YEAR</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX 2: MODEL SCHOOL PRINCIPALS TEACHING THE ACADEMY GRADES, 1889-1915</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX 3: MODEL SCHOOLS AS A PERCENTAGE OF SUPERIOR SCHOOL PROVISION: 1889, 1905, 1917</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX 4: PROTESTANT BOARD AMALGAMATIONS AND CONSOLIDATIONS, 1902-1926</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX 5: EDUCATIONIST MEETINGS: A PRELIMINARY LIST, 1891-1926</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX 6: PROTESTANT COMMITTEE APPOINTMENTS: YEAR TITLE, 1881-1926</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Archival Sources</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Printed Primary Sources</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary Sources</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION

'NEW EDUCATIONISTS,' AGE-GRADING, AND

THE CONSOLIDATION-TRANSPORTATION OPTION

The unworthy condition of [Protestant] elementary education as arising from the existence of [our minority] relationship is not the question at issue, nor more than is any other feature of the British North America Act.1

In nineteenth- and twentieth-century North America, the graded secondary consolidated school has been at the centre of a repeating cycle of development and under-development of town, township and county public school systems.2 Conceptualized in the early nineteenth century to break down the barrier between the semi-private academy or grammar school and the tax-supported school, the graded school

1 John Murdoch Harper, Inspector of Protestant Superior Schools, 1886-1903, to the Montreal Witness, Quebec, April 28, 1906, Archives Nationales du Québec à Québec, hereafter cited as ANQQ, E 13, Scrapbook [of newspaper clippings 1883 to 1906 on Protestant education], possibly the collection of Elson Rexford and/or George Parmelee, English Secretary of the Department of Public Instruction, 1882-1891 and 1891-1930 respectively.

set in motion the transfer of secondary education subsidies from self-constituted to elected boards, the redistribution of quasi-private and common school pupils between private and graded elementary-secondary schools, and the competitive search for secondary enrolments between graded elementary-secondary schools.¹

Faced with the challenge from publicly elected commissioners to open their schools to a wider clientele, private trustees had four choices: maintain enrolments and try to survive on tuition fees and private contributions; release their assets to public boards; meet the criteria for alternate categories of government or private institution funding, if available; or close. With the loss of government support and of the human and financial capital of the semi-private school, the onus fell on the tax-supported graded school to attract and provide the resources for elementary and

secondary education. Graded high schools in their turn, however, relied on some form of private and/or government funding to generate secondary enrolments and maintain them. Those schools which could not maintain enrolments closed, restructured, or were consolidated.

In the 'search' for secure secondary enrolments, the grading examination process selected a small percentage of pupils for normal school and university entrance. However, the policy of enrolling pupils as revenue producers, while at the same time evaluating and ranking them in relation to the performance of the best pupil, ensured that enrolments in public high schools would be overwhelmingly in the elementary grades. Faced with diminished secondary enrolments, boards

---


5 A Quebec example is the support of the Women's Institute to Huntington Academy; *The Cleaner*, Huntington, Thursday, July 10, 1902.

turned to available transportation technologies and theories of school consolidation to attract pupils, and required educational psychology and 'new education' socialization techniques to fit pupils to age-grading's fine tuning.\(^7\)

Pupils aspiring to secondary education left ungraded one-room schools at earlier ages to travel to, or live near, graded secondary schools. The schools which these pupils left closed or were consolidated.

If 'radical revisionists' conceptualized this pattern of provision as social control, historians of rural education and the 'new education' saw the age-grading-consolidation synthesis as the misapplication of policy by metropolitan reformers in their hinterlands.\(^8\) Reformers fell short in their rural school regeneration schemes, failed to implement the Agricultural Sciences as compulsory subjects in secondary

---


grades, and implemented Nature Study for elementary grades as middle class gardening and landscaping. In the 1980s, 'radical revisionist' educational historians returned to their own hypotheses for a second look. The second time round, the 'irony' of seeking and securing graded secondary and graded secondary consolidated enrolments lay in the imperative to reduce the teaching process to a 'search for order' by the professionally qualified male career public school teacher.

---


age and grade, and the adoption of pupil transportation technologies, simplified and extended the graded elementary-secondary course over a greater number of ten month school years. As a result, 'career ladders' increased the salaries of men teachers, principals, and superintendents in each graded system and connected one system to another, giving them stability of profession but not of community. Grading and consolidation removed the secondary grades pedagogically and physically from all but a few pupils. The classification of pupils in eleven or twelve grades between five and sixteen years of age established peer cultures with syntheses of their own and eliminated all other permutations and combinations of ages and grades.

Second look radical revisionists also gave trustees,


pupils, parents, and teachers the agency denied by social control theory, and focused on the settlements negotiated between parents and trustees on the one hand and education bureaucrats on the other. State formationists, on the other hand, focused on the development of the institutional structure of the reformist state. Where state formation theorists focused on the reproduction of the individual pupil, teacher or inspector, family strategists emphasized the dynamic of the family unit and the school in the reproduction of the family and the school. Moreover, new concepts of 'rural' subordinated the role of the state to variables of class, gender, religion, ethnicity, or language.

---


New rural and family strategy historians, who shared a generational perspective, saw schooling and/or literacy as a substitute for inheritance, a bequest from parents to some or all of their children which took the place of land and/or capital, and focused on the use of public school systems for family reproduction.¹⁸ Their studies have revived the study of the politics of education, in which the issue of the extra investment in secondary school provision is not only the investment of parents in their children's fees but a community investment - a source of conflict between those ratepayers who uphold the social status quo and those whose children needed secondary schools to enter the liberal professions.¹⁹


However, family strategy historians had overlooked the role of gender in the social reproduction of public education systems - the central issue for historians of women's education and women teachers. Histories which combined the study of professionalization with the study of social reproduction focused on the 'spheres' of male and female professional teacher formation and practice, the


institutionalization of the examination process  
the institutional constraints upon women students and teachers when hard-won gains were taken from them,  
and the life course 'departure from teaching' of both men and women.  
The new question for educational historians was the dynamic of intra-professional practice. When did men and women normal school students work together like 'friendly
atoms in chemistry,' 25 force a debate over 'separate or mixed' in secondary and higher education agenda,26 define women teachers' work on the basis of professional peer pressure;27 and reproduce professional daughters and sons.28

For a number of educational historians, the nineteenth century principalship has served as a measure of the social reproduction of pupils and teachers. These historians have studied the point of intersection between the principalship as an occupation and the principalship as a step in the career


ladder for the principal or head teacher of the one-room school to the principal of the university. The gender relations of the principalship in a category of educational institution is the subject of this dissertation. The thesis tries to reconcile an apparent contradiction within the 'invention' of Quebec secondary education: to build a secondary graded consolidated system of Protestant schools, the Protestant Committee of the Council of Public Instruction regulated incumbent, qualified principals of model schools out of the teaching of the academy grades. Put another way, the Committee did not build its secondary school enrolments only from the ground up; it also reduced its model schools to fit the parameters of a graded elementary, intermediate, and academy grade system.


30 Gidney and Millar, Inventing Secondary Education.

The North American historiographical context for the system of the Quebec Protestant Committee is as yet barely established. In Quebec, the choice of the Protestant Committee of the Council of Public Instruction in 1875 to establish an English-language, non-denominational Protestant graded elementary and secondary school system set in motion a redistribution of English-speaking pupils among tax-supported common schools and private corporation, government-funded, grammar schools, academies, and model schools. By 1888, formally trained, English-speaking and Protestant men teachers obtained first refusal of graded secondary and secondary consolidated principalships and initiated the "steady abandonment of the profession by men." Protestant rural


33 See Quebec, Statutes, 1888, 51 Victoria; 1899, 62 Victoria c.28; 1904, 4 Edward VII, c. 18, s.2; 1905, 5 Edward VII, c. 19, s. 1; 1909, 9 Edward, c. 33. On the formative influence of the regulatory precedent on consolidation legislation, see David Tyack, Thomas James, and Aaron Benavot, Law and the Shaping of Public Education 1765-1954 (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1987).

school municipality ratepayers acquired the obligation to pay for them; and a consensus of federal and provincial deputies, Protestant Committee members, and teachers of the Provincial Association of Protestant Teachers of Quebec (P.A.P.T.) approved the professionalization policies which created them. \textsuperscript{35}

There was an "increased tendency for pupils to leave the elementary [ungraded one-room] schools at an earlier age than formerly for the purpose of attending the Model Schools and Academies."\textsuperscript{36} Furthermore, the

...cause of this movement [was] not the inefficiency of the Elementary schools so much as the inducements held out by Superior Schools to get as large an attendance as possible.\textsuperscript{37}

The imperative to increase enrolments not only emptied one-room schools, but imposed on academy and model school principals the choice of integrating pupils from ungraded schools or enforcing rigid grade distinctions and yearly


\textsuperscript{36} Quebec, Report of the Superintendent of Public Instruction, 1900-1901, 115-16. On the shift of one room school enrolments to academies or high schools in the United States and in Ontario, see Sizer, Secondary Schools; Gidney and Millar, Inventing Secondary Education, 214-30.

promotions. Boards either hired principals who stayed connected with one-room, feeder schools or those who were part of a network of graded, secondary school teachers. The consequent weakening and closing of Protestant district schools released school tax revenues to Catholic commissioners and dissentient trustees who, like their Protestant counterparts, had been encouraged to form separate school boards. Catholic commissioners then supported parish schools, and attracted the teaching orders to found government-funded and tax-exempt model schools, academies, convents, and colleges. 39

Campaigners for Protestant graded and graded consolidated schools argued, however, that Protestant rural school municipalities owed their depopulation problems to the minority status of English-speaking Protestants in Quebec and to the claims of Catholic parish and superior schools on the tax base of Protestant school municipalities. 40 Citing


statistics of empty or reduced enrolment one-room schools, the Committee obtained regulations by which it might cancel the grants of the model schools and academies which could no longer generate enrolments, and provincial legislation by which Protestant boards might consolidate one-room school districts and relocate district pupils in graded consolidated model schools and academies. These regulations punished the principals of model schools and demoted academies for teaching beyond the model school curriculum and providing their pupils with academy grade work. Despite the initiatives of 'new education' rural school regenerators to reverse the age-graded synthesis, schools outside of the graded-secondary-consolidated option then closed or were consolidated.

The groundwork for the thesis has been laid by the innovative studies of Quebec educational historians in the


last twenty years." Their research has made it possible to pose a problem in the history of Protestant superior and secondary school provision in the context of its Quebec Catholic counterpart and of North American graded systems. To argue that the Protestant Committee of Public Instruction shaped its own secondary school enrolments by establishing English-language, non-denominational Protestant, graded secondary schools, and that all variables of secondary school provision were subordinated to grading and male teacher professionalization, the thesis draws on the monographs which have hypothesized the origins of late nineteenth century Quebec secondary education as an accommodation based on language and religion on the Council of Public Instruction, in the Legislative Council, and within the leadership of the Conservative and the Liberal Party."


Tyack, One Best; Leloudis, "Means of Grace."

Although Wendie Nelson's Master's thesis might serve as a base for proposing that the work of certified women teachers was devalued as a consequence of the "guerre des éteignois," this dissertation focuses on the well-documented late nineteenth-early twentieth cycle of Quebec superior-secondary school provision. The most important monographs for the argument of the dissertation are those which address the question of superior school funding, girls' education, and the formation of women teachers in Catholic superior schools. Specifically, the doctoral dissertation of Ruby Heap on the late-nineteenth century origins of Quebec Catholic secondary education provides the connections for a study of its Protestant counterpart.

Heap's thesis begins its study of superior and secondary schooling in 1856, with the founding of normal schools, the establishment of the Council of Public Instruction and the Superior Education Fund, and when grant cutbacks check the impetus of model schools to offer course

---

45 Nelson, "'Guerre des Éteignois;" See also Drummond, "Autonomous Academy," ch.2.

requirements reserved for grammar schools and academies. ⁴⁷
Heap traces the legitimation of a corps of trained and self-
enhancing male lay teachers from the establishment of the
normal school share of the superior Education Fund, the
prerogative of the Cabinet to appoint normal school
principals, and the founding of the men teachers’ association
of the École Normale Jacques-Cartier and the École Normale de
Laval. ⁴⁸

In her analysis of the authorities of Quebec
governments and Catholic Committees between 1888 and 1920, the
revisions to Catholic teacher training and certification and
the structure of the Catholic école primaire were the essence
of superior and secondary school reform. ⁴⁹ As Heap has
pointed out, however, late-nineteenth and early-twentieth
century education reform proposals were on a continuum from
the abolition of the Council of Public Instruction to the
abolition of all state participation in Quebec education. ⁵⁰

⁴⁷ Drummond, "Academy," ch.2. For the long view of
women’s education and teaching, see Dumont, Girls’ Schooling;
Nadia Fahmy-Eid and Dumont, "Le rapport femme-famille-
education: bilan de la recherche," Fahmy-Eid and Dumont,
sds., 5-48; Maîtresses de maison, "Le pointe de l’iceberg."

⁴⁸ Heap, "L’enseignement primaire," 624.

⁴⁹ Heap, "L’enseignement primaire," especially ch. 1, 8-
10, Conclusion; Johnston, "L’école primaire supérieure."

⁵⁰ Heap, "L’enseignement primaire," 117-120, 984; see
also, Michael Behiels, "L’Association catholique de la
jeunesse canadienne française and the Quest for a Moral
She characterizes the resolution of this lengthy and highly-politicized debate as a 'double régime de certification des maîtres,' by which the Catholic Committee subordinated certified men teachers to the doctrines of Social Catholicism, and subordinated lay women teachers and women principals of the congregations to these men teachers.  

For Heap, the pre-conditions for this double régime were laid in 1895, when the Council of Public Instruction initiated a school reform project to legitimate two Quebec secondary school systems - the one Social Catholic and French-language, and the other, (Protestant) Social gospel and English-language. As she explains, this joint Catholic Committee-Protestant Committee project was virtually complete in May of 1897, when Félix-Gabriel Marchand and the Liberal Party came to power. In control of the Council's


52 Heap, "L'enseignement primaire," 136 n82.
institutional infrastructure as Marchand began the formulation of regulation and legislation, the Catholic Committee not only assisted in the defeat of Marchand's Education Act of 1898 but forced him to approve the opposite of the legislation's intent by Cabinet Order-in-Council.

By virtue of the Catholic Committee regulations of 1898 and the Education Act of 1899, the Catholic Central Board of Examiners devalued the teaching practices of incumbent female principals of convents, girls' academies, and model schools, and of male lay principals of boys' academies; established diocesan instituts pédagogiques to standardize elementary teaching; and strengthened the rigid separation of primary elementary, primary intermediate (formerly model), and primary superior grades and curricula established in 1888. By 1914, as Heap and other have explained, the threat to the 'moderate' compromise, found in the diversity of Quebec Catholic curricula and the pedagogies of the female teaching orders (where the categories "elementary, model, and academy," were flexible in their application to both curricula and teacher certification and where there was no set number of years for the completion of the three programs, especially the cours élémentaires) was in check.3

Heap has argued and Patrice Dutil has concurred that, although marginalized as a reform constituency in 1895, 'rouge' educational reformers retained a presence in the Legislative Assembly and on the Catholic Committee throughout the premierships of Simon-Napoléon Parent and Lomer Gouin.\textsuperscript{54} Heap concludes that Premier Gouin's education legislation was a 'moderate' compromise between his Government, the Catholic Committee, and Archbishop Bruchési which was primarily implemented in the schools under the Montreal Catholic Board of Commissioners while Dutil also locates reform initiatives in the City of Montreal.\textsuperscript{55} Heap documents the marginalization of the liberal progressives as educational reformers, links school reform with the progressive urban and business reform movement movements of the industrialization-urbanization model, and follows the implementation of these and earlier reforms in the schools outside of Montreal.\textsuperscript{56}


\textsuperscript{55} Heap, "La Ligue de l'enseignement."

This dissertation revises Heap's chronology and conclusions towards a conservative perspective on liberal progressive reform. It argues that by 1907, Quebec's two secondary school systems were complete, distinguished from each other solely by virtue of language of instruction, sectarian social Christianity, and stage of age-grading implementation. As Jean Hamelin and Nicole Gagnon have hypothesized, the 'double empire' ideologies of Britain and Rome produced a particularly strong combination of vestigial and new social conservatism in the latter decades of the nineteenth century. London and the Holy See extracted from the Quebec haute bourgeoisie a double allegiance, and the haute bourgeoisie extracted the same from its own petit


57 The date is considered a watershed in the history of Quebec education because, after 1907, the Protestant Committee and the Catholic Committee continued to meet separately in their regular quarterly and special sessions but found no necessity to meet together as the Council of Public Instruction. See Louis-Philippe Audet, Histoire du conseil de l'instruction publique de la province de Quebec, 1856-1964 (Montreal: Editions Lemeac, 1964); see also Heap, "L'enseignement primaire;" Johnston, "L'ecole primaire superieure."

bourgeois hinterland. Catholic independent subsidized schools and Protestant schools assisted by private endowments fuelled metropolis-hinterland configurations.\textsuperscript{59}

If social conservatism pervaded the Council of Public Instruction and the Legislative Council by 1895, the generational and electoral realignment of 1897 induced in the Legislative Assembly, regardless of language or religious affiliation, a climate of caution towards educational reform.\textsuperscript{60} Between 1895 and 1904, those Liberals who tried to take the Party's middle ground on teacher certification were caught in the position where insistence on professional training would exacerbate the one-room school teacher shortage.


\textsuperscript{60} See, for example, Marie-Paule Malouin, Ma sœur, à quelle école allez-vous? (Montréal: Fides, 1985); Huntingdon Gleaner, Huntingdon, Thursday, January 2, 1896, for the opening of the Gault Institute, the Valleyfield Protestant model school. The Institute was built and endowed on land owned by the Montreal Cotton Company and granted academy status in 1899; Report, 1899-1900, "Protestant Superior Education," 280-81.

(which grading had created but for which Liberals could be blamed), but support of their rural constituents would decertify trained women teachers.\textsuperscript{62} When they made the decision to implement the teacher permit, professional women teachers both Protestant and Catholic, were forced to define themselves by gender and class and lose their professional personae.\textsuperscript{63}

By 1905, when Lomer Gouin appropriated the premiership of Simon-Napoléon Parent, all that was lacking for a Social Catholic-social gospel agenda was the respective transformations of the Catholic and the Protestant Board of Examiners into permit-granting boards for untrained teachers, and Cabinet approval of a ten year Catholic, and a ten-year Protestant, curriculum for the two secondary school systems, rigidly divided between the elementary, the intermediate, and the academic grades.\textsuperscript{64} The Protestant Committee and the Catholic Committee obtained their teacher permits by virtue of the Statutes of 1909; the former obtained its ten-year

\textsuperscript{62} Heap, "L'enseignement primaire," 124-25, 414, 480-82, 551, 711.

\textsuperscript{63} Record 26(1906), 191-96; Heap, "L'enseignement primaire, 482; Thivierge, "La syndicalization." [P.A.P.T.] Teachers' Magazine, 1, 1(September 1919), 33.

\textsuperscript{64} Quebec, Statutes, 1909, 9 Edward VII, ch. 33.
curriculum in 1914, the latter, in 1923.\textsuperscript{65}

As a consequence of their open access throughout Gouin’s Ministries to the Cabinet Order-in-Council, their separate Social Christianity, their separate male teacher professionalism, their separate graded courses, and their separate colonial dependence, the Catholic Committee and the Protestant Committee appropriated teacher training and curriculum, and subsumed to them the rest of ‘new education’ theories.\textsuperscript{66} However, since teacher training and curricula were at the heart and soul of the ‘new education,’ spokesmen for the social catholic, the social gospel, and the ‘new education’ movements shared in the universal effort to name the culture shock and spiritual malaise which were a consequence of both the successes and failures of grading and

\textsuperscript{65} Flower, ”E.I. Rexford,” 148; Malouin and Dumont, ”L’évolution des programmes,” 95.

consolidation policies. Since they associated their feelings of disequilibrium with the closing of one-room schools, they agreed with the promoters of graded and consolidated schools on the regulation of women into domestic work and family roles, agreed to disagree on language, religion, and nationality; and disagreed on the basis of class and professional interests as to the degree of social mobility acceptable in secondary schooling.

The context for the dissertation's generational approach to the history of Quebec Protestant secondary

---


education is a "whiggish" biography of Elson Irving Rexford and the generational approaches to educational reform of Leloudis and LaPierre.70 Rexford was one of the small number of male teachers in the Protestant common or superior schools in the 1870s in Montreal. Born in the Eastern Townships in 1850, Rexford learned his British Canadian nationalism in the "Teachers Association [of] the McGill Normal School," in the federated and collegial Provincial Association of Protestant Teachers of Quebec (P.A.P.T.), and on the Protestant Committee.

Rexford's major contribution to Quebec education was the transformation, in the 1880s, of the bureaucratic post of English Secretary of the Department of Public Instruction into an organic link between the Department, the Committee, the PAPT Executive Committee, and the Lieutenant-Governor-in-Council. His 'career ladder' - his time to seek, attain, and retain, professional status - coincided with the formulation, implementation, and diffusion of grading and consolidation policies throughout the schools under the control of Protestant school boards and/or subsidized by the Superior

Education Fund.71 As his career path also overlapped with the older, 'loyal colonialism, of John William Dawson, Principal of McGill University, and the younger 'Pilgrim's Progress' professionalism of George Parmeleee, Principal of the Model School of the McGill Normal School, Rexford's professional formation included a class bias against those with greater economic and social advantages than himself.72

Rexford held that only men similar to himself were worthy of academy principalships.73 He did not believe that


73 For the British Canadian context of the principalship and the inspectorship, see Frederick H. Armstrong, "John Strachan, Schoolmaster, and the Evolution of the Elite in Upper Canada/Ontario," J. Donald Wilson, ed., An Imperfect
women principals or men principals without normal school training should serve as the first line of defence against the Catholic advance into Protestant school municipalities.74 Rexford's generational counterparts were the men principals of subsidized grammar schools and academies and an upper middle class 'first generation' of women students who led the academy diploma classes of the McGill Normal School or, as pupils of the Montreal High School for Girls, led the Associate in Arts Examinations of McGill University.75 A number of these women were McGill University's first women graduates in 1888, at the point when they, as qualified academy teachers were - along with the men principals and women assistants of rural


74 Record 9(1889), 316-19; 10(1890), 326-27.
academies — denied academy principalships, forbidden to teach
the academy grades in model schools and regulated into a
workplace of six ten-month school years. 76

When decertified, qualified men and women teachers
crowded model schools principalships, they increased the
number of model school which taught beyond the official six-
year curriculum. 77 Furthermore, when the Protestant Committee
failed to obtain legislation by which to force Protestant
dissentent trustees into Protestant boards, Committee
'educationists' adopted the consolidation and transportation
policies of township boards in New England, Indiana, and
Ohio. 78 These policies were fuelled by a continental takeoff

76 Gillian Burdett, "The High School for Girls, Montreal,
ch.2; Marta Danylewycz, "Sexes et classes sociales dans
l'enseignement: le cas de Montréal à la fin du 19e siècle,"
Fahmy-Eid and Dumont, eds., Maitresses de maison, 93–142;
Anne Drummond, "Gender, Profession, and Principals: The
Teachers of Quebec Protestant Academies, 1875–1900,"
Historical Studies in Education/Revue d'histoire de

77 Anne Drummond, "Rural Depopulation, Teacher
Certification, and the Course of Study in Quebec Protestant
Superior Schools, 1885–1915," a Paper presented to the
Canadian History of Education Association/Association
canadienne de l'histoire de l'éducation, Toronto, 1982;
"Gender, Profession, and Principals."

78 Porter, "Concord, Massachusetts, Public Schools;" O.
J. Kern, Among Country Schools (Boston: Ginn, c1906), 248;
A.C. Monahan, "Consolidation of Rural Schools and
Transportation of Pupils at Public Expense," United States
Bureau of Education, Bulletin No. 30 (Washington: Government
Printing Office, 1914).
of a number of pupil transportation technologies—mass communication, mechanized street railway systems, and the manufacture of mass assembly carriage parts—which had a minimal impact on consolidation policy in Quebec.⁷⁹

Officially, neither French- nor English-speaking consolidation promoters or "new educationists" had first hand experience with the consolidation-transportation process, or could imagine the human and financial cost of moving schools and pupils.⁸⁰ A popular model with consolidators, the May's Lick, Kentucky, school owed its success to the purchase of school vans from the Delphi Carriage Works, tires from the Firestone Rubber Company, and lobbying of the state legislature.⁸¹ In Quebec, however, the 'complete' rural consolidated school model—equipped with a professional male principal, secondary grade staff, experimental farm,


⁸⁰ Ruby Heap, "La ligue de l'enseignement;" Québec, Bibliothèque nationale, Débats de l'Assemblée législative du Québec, 1899, 80; "The Union of Districts and Some Objections to It," reprinted in The Gazette, Montreal, Thursday, July 31, 1902.

landscaped grounds, transportation vans, and teachers’ residences—could be understood in two ways. It might serve as the project of "a Carnegie, a Macdonald, or a Molson," where teacher professionalisation might be counteracted with sex-segregated manual labour classes and the return of men principals to rural schools, or as the project of professional teachers where rural regeneration might be contained by age-grading.

After 1900, the Protestant Committee misapplied American consolidation terminology and articulated an underdevelopment model: "when the [American] consolidated school remained of the same [elementary] rank as the schools of which it [was] composed, the consolidation was called

---


'partial;' when raised to higher rank it [was] called 'complete.' In Quebec, 'partial' consolidation was only an amalgamation of ungraded school districts, and the 'complete' consolidation was only a consolidated graded elementary or model school. The Committee extended its academy and model school courses to nine and seven graded years, respectively, adopted the elementary-intermediate-academy nomenclature, and certified teachers from extra-provincial or extra-state graded school networks. Since Catholic boards were expressly excluded from the consolidation legislation of 1899 and 1907,

---

84 Report, 35(1915), 126; circular re-published in same form 41(1921), 304. In 1906, the original terminology encompassed the 'complete' consolidation, the high school consolidation at the level of the county or the township. The 'partial' consolidation was a consolidation of a graded high school with feeder graded, elementary schools (the model of public elementary-secondary education of today). The union consolidation was a consolidation of ungraded one-room schools to form a single graded elementary school; an amalgamation was a union of ungraded schools. By 1923, there were almost three dozen official definitions for a consolidated school; J.F. Abel, "Consolidation and Transportation Problems," United States Bureau of Education, No. 39 (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1923), 1-22.

they were free to establish 'farm life' schools without incurring the problems of the consolidation-transportation option. In the 1920s, Protestant school municipalities experienced a disorder of ungraded, consolidated, and disconsolidated schools; of pupil abnormality classifications - such as 'retarded' or sub-normal (failed one or more grades), and 'eliminated' (dropped out); and of pupil transportation technologies and routes that distanced pupils and teachers from public schools. By this time, however, the ungraded model school and academy were memories and a new cycle of secondary school provision was underway.

Sources

American prescriptive teachers and agricultural


college texts on school consolidation provided the history of consolidation terminology from which Quebec reformers adapted their policies. These texts were essential to conceptualizing the consolidated school in several forms – as an idealized rural school of the past; as a promise of better rural education in the future; and as a failed technology of the present. The texts integrate the ideology of rural school reform into teacher professionalization, and also provide a starting point for any researcher interested in the study of the Country Life Movement at the international level, or in the development of public education sub-disciplines – elementary subject specialization, secondary subject specialization, administration, psychology. The texts also reveal the unevenness of the American rural school experience at the turn of the twentieth century. Textbook authors drew their images of rural-agricultural graded consolidated schools from a small number of successful examples – schools which they may have visited but about which they had probably only read. The Dominion Bureau of Statistics Annual Survey of Education for the 1920s confirms that the Canadian experience with grading and consolidation was but a thin layer of educational provision.

89 William Bowers, The Country Life Movement in America 1900-1920 (Port Washington, New York: 1974) also leads to the authors listed in the textbook section of the bibliography.
For the Quebec Protestant grading—rural consolidation context, the researcher relies heavily on three kinds of Quebec education primary sources— the "Protestant Superior Education" statistics in the Report of the Superintendent of Public Instruction, and in Quebec, Sessional Papers, the "Directory of Superior Schools" in the Educational Record of the Province of Quebec, and the "Minutes" of the quarterly and special sessions of the Protestant Committee of the Council of Public Instruction, found in each of the Report, the Record, and Sessional Papers.

In support of these records, it uses a variety of primary education sources, also found in the Report or Sessional Papers: Report of the McGill Normal School (and Model Schools); Report of the Protestant Inspector for Superior Schools; the Inspectors' Annual Reports; reports and circulars of the Superintendent of Public Instruction; the "General Statistics of the Cost of Education," in Protestant school municipalities. To ascertain the policy of the Department of Public Instruction regarding the ages and grades of the pupils attending model schools, and the names of the model schools which offered the academy grades into the twentieth century, the dissertation uses the Ledger for the
Enrolment of Protestant Academies and Model Schools. For newspapers sources, it favours the tone and coverage of the Sherbrooke Daily Record. The Record for the years 1896 to 1906 provided a useful mixture of impartial reporting and good coverage of the events and issues of education in the Eastern Townships. It also relies on a unique news source: two scrapbooks of newspaper clippings on issues and events in Quebec Protestant education between 1883 and 1926, probably clipped by Elson Rexford and/or George Parmeelee in their consecutive terms as English Secretary of the Department of Public Instruction—Secretary of the Protestant Committee, 1882-1890 and 1891-1930, respectively.

The researcher has also had the good fortune to have access to the letters of Sydney Arthur Fisher to his aunt and parents during his years as Minister of Agriculture in the Cabinets of Wilfrid Laurier, 1896-1911. They were especially useful in establishing a link between Fisher, Robertson, Macdonald, and William Peterson, Principal of McGill University, 1895-1919, as Quebec and Canadian participants in the international rural school reform movement.

Chapter One provides an analysis of the infrastructure of the Protestant Committee and the major changes in the scope

---

The privacy of individual pupils is maintained by using as evidence their ages and grades, not their names, gender, or examination results.
of Committee authority between 1881 and 1926. It focuses on the person and office of the English Secretary of the Department of Public Instruction - as Secretary of the Protestant Committee; as link between the P.A.P.T. Executive Committee, Committee sub-committees, and the Lieutenant-Governor-in-Council. The chapter also provides the definitions of model school and academy as grant categories in the annual distribution of the Superior Education Fund.

Chapter Two identifies experimental grading in English-language academies before 1880, innovative Protestant Committee grading and teacher certification between 1882 and 1886, and Committee attempts to achieve the formal right to legislate for Protestant and dissentient commissioners.

Chapter Three describes the Protestant Committee regulation revision project of 1895-1897, the failure of the Education Act of 1898, and the approval of the Protestant Committee regulations of 1898 and the Education Act of 1899. It goes on to describe the efforts of Sir William Macdonald and his spokesman, James Robertson, to establish a system of agricultural and teachers colleges and consolidated schools which would bypass the regulatory authority of both McGill University and the Protestant Committee.

Chapter Four analyses the politics of the Protestant teacher permit, the failure of the Macdonald-Robertson project, and the Protestant 'educationists' consolidation
campaigns from 1906 to 1926. It places the decertification of women teachers and the legacy of the Fisher Trust Fund for Protestant rural schools and agriculture in Brome County in the context of the permit, the Macdonald-Protestant Committee settlement, and the campaign consolidation initiatives.

The dissertation is not a demographic study of principals but a first run through late nineteenth-century official records for Quebec Protestant schools. It has, of necessity, omitted an analysis of several important topics in educational history: the implementation of the formal kindergarten; the various initiatives to obtain free and compulsory schooling; the place of French-language instruction in Protestant school municipalities. The first is a problem of documenting a change from one or two years of primary classes to Kindergarten as the year before Grade I Elementary; the second, of trying to understand what teachers wanted when they promoted compulsory attendance, and if they were in fact referring to secondary school enrolments; the third, of evidence at the level of the school board.

Conclusion

The thesis proposes a return to the original concept behind graded and consolidated schools - the selection and collection of secondary enrolments, not mass education. It suggests that secondary school systems have had a holding pattern of reform: experimentation, innovation, expansion,
rationalization, and recycling. Educational historians have approached this problem in a number of ways: they have used modernization theory, social and historical demography, feminist theory, elite theory, and theories of professionalization to document the origins of secondary school systems. This thesis focuses on the Quebec model school principal and academy grade teaching in first generation teacher professionalization, and how professional teachers linked grading and consolidation policies with the right to dissent.
CHAPTER ONE
DISSENT, PROTESTANT COMMITTEE REGULATION AND THE FUNDING OF SUPERIOR SCHOOLS
CHAPTER ONE

DISSENT, PROTESTANT COMMITTEE REGULATION AND THE FUNDING OF SUPERIOR SCHOOLS

It is not too much to say that the continued existence of the Protestant minority ...is closely bound up with the maintenance of efficient elementary schools, and it is time that those who have great interests at stake in this Province should have these facts pressed upon their attention.¹

The Protestant Committee achieved its regulatory authority over late-nineteenth century public schools by building an institutional infrastructure between the principalship and the right of the school commissioner or trustee to form Protestant or dissentient boards. On the promise of annual and special grants from the Protestant share of the Superior Education Fund, and in the name of Quebec Protestant minority education rights, the Committee advocated the formation of a separate Protestant school system. It advised commissioners to exercise the right to: leave Mixed (Common School) Boards; form Protestant boards to maintain academies and model schools; hire principals to classify pupils by age-grade; and established graded consolidated

¹ Educational Record of the Province of Quebec, hereafter cited as Record 10(1890), 328.
schools and pupil transportation services.²

The Protestant Committee met with the Catholic Committee as one policy-making body under the Education Act of 1869 but, as of 1875 and with the abolition of Quebec's first Ministry of Public Instruction, performed its day-to-day operations at the level of the two Committee sub-committees. Until 1875, there was no formal connection between Protestant commissioners who received Superior Education grants and the Protestant Committee of the Council of Public Instruction. The Council was a Life-member appointed body - a British colonial legacy somewhat like the Legislative Council but which included representation from the Catholic and Protestant Church hierarchies.³

When the Conservative Government of Charles-Eugène Boucher de Boucherville abolished the Ministry, it added a

² Report, 1880-1881, 310; see also George Trueman, Principal of Stanstead College, School Funds in the Province of Quebec (Teachers College, Columbia University, 1920), 35. In 1881, only Montreal, Quebec, and Sherbrooke held the right to create Protestant or Catholic school boards; Henry Hubbard, Protestant Schools in the City of Sherbrooke, Province of Quebec, Canada (Sherbrooke: "Examiner" Office, 1886).

complement of Associate members to each of the two Committees.

Chosen by Life Members in an advisory capacity for their professional teaching expertise, Associate members could not vote on Council. However, since they gave the educational issues raised by their respective Committees their full attention, and since the abolition of the Ministry did not solve the debate as to which schools held the right to Superior Education Fund grants, Associates soon played a role in policy-making out of proportion to their status.⁴ Provided in sub-committee meetings with regular opportunities between Committee quarterly sessions for the formation of strategic alliances, Catholic and Protestant Committee Associates held in common the goal of professional success and conservative family formation but separated on language and religion in pursuit of this shared ambition.⁵ While Life Members


represented the continuity of special interests - political partisanship, Protestant denominationalism, Catholic authoritarianism, and Catholic sectarianism - Associates represented the variables of language, non-denominational Protestantism, and non-sectarianism Catholicism.⁶

Continuously at issue between Life and Associate members was the establishment of criteria for the annual distribution to schools subsidized by the Superior Education Fund.⁷ Theoretically and practically, superior schools were the doors of opportunity for pupils but practically, they were also the route to promotion for career educators.⁸ From the establishment of the Provincial Association of Protestant Teachers of Quebec in 1864 through the British North America Act of 1867 to the Quebec Education Act of 1869, the English-speaking Protestant male teacher career path was shaped by men

---


for whom the Canadian and Quebec Cabinets, the Council of Public Instruction, and the P.A.P.T. Executive Committee formed an inter-connected network of influence and power the sum total of which transcended linguistic, religious, and political differences. In 1864, John William Dawson, Principal of McGill College and McGill Normal School, held the highest grant status and the largest share of the Protestant share of the Superior Education Fund.9 Between 1866 and 1874, Dawson successfully renegotiated the grants for his two schools. Inasmuch as the assets of the High School of Montreal were transferred from McGill to the Protestant Board of Commissioners of Montreal, and inasmuch as the High School of Quebec claimed the same right as the High School of Montreal to the Grammar School Fund of 1819, Dawson in effect renegotiated as well the grants of these two superior schools.10

It was as a result of Dawson's success in protecting the English Protestant school networks of Montreal that the


10 John Irwin Cooper, "When the High School of Montreal and McGill Were One, 1853-1870," McGill News, 25, 1(Autumn, 1943), 9-14, 55; "PC Minutes," Thursday, November 10, 1870, Memorandum of the Case of the High School of Quebec and Montreal, Quebec, January 1871, submitted to the Lieutenant-Governor-in-Council by Protestant Committee Secretary, Henry H. Miles.
private boards of Granby and Waterloo transferred their academy assets and grants to Protestant commissioners. However, despite the precedent established by the High School of Montreal and the Granby and Waterloo boards, the network within which the grant criteria had been established and renegotiated never fragmented into separate private and public superior school funding authorities. The P.A.P.T. convention membership continued to include a loose association of college, grammar school, academy, and model school principals funded directly from the Protestant share of the Superior Education Fund, as well as provincial and federal deputies, Protestant Committee members, Anglican clergy, Presbyterian ministers, the staff of the Department of Public Instruction, including the Superintendent, and the Montreal association of teachers which Dawson had cautiously named "The Teachers' Association in connection with the McGill Normal School."  

In 1875, when Premier Boucher de Boucherville abolished the Ministry of Public Instruction, separated the functions of the Catholic Committee and the Protestant Committee, and added complements of Associate members to the

---

two Committees, the criteria for Protestant-share grants remained the prerogative of Life Members but gave professionals an advisory capacity through Associate Membership. Since professional teachers were eligible for nomination to both Associate membership and P.A.P.T. Executive Committee membership, the Education Act of 1875 gave them the capacity to establish credentials for the principalships of academies and model schools. By serving on Protestant Committee and P.A.P.T. sub-committees, and using the P.A.P.T. annual convention as their platform, formally trained teachers monitored, at three levels of operation, the mechanism by which Life members awarded the grants to individual superior school boards, and the boards turned the grants over to their principals.

Principal Dawson and Elson Irving Rexford, Assistant Headmaster of the High School of Montreal, cast the superior school principalship in the image of the few English-speaking Protestant men in the overwhelmingly female academy diploma classes of the McGill Normal School. In the 1870s, Dawson

---

12 The details of Rexford's life and career may be found in George Flower, "A History of the Contributions of Dr. E.I. Rexford to Education in the Province of Quebec," M.A. Thesis, McGill University, 1949. For the 'first generation' male professional teacher as innovative prototype, see David B. Tyack, "'Pilgrim's Progress': Towards a Social History of the School Superintendent, 1860-1960," History of Education Quarterly, 17, 3 (Fall 1976): 264-74; David Labaree, "Career Ladders and the Early American High School Teachers," Donald
and Rexford participated in a "Teachers' Association" where the aspiration of middle class women to higher education and the professions had in part been satisfied through their academy diplomas from the McGill Normal School. Dawson, the comfortable Montreal bourgeois, believed that educated middle class women might work out of financial necessity, but was protective of those who competed in normal school and in the workplace with male students of lower social status.\textsuperscript{13} Rexford, on the other hand, was a farm boy from Brome County who had been introduced to the British colonial class cleavages of Montreal in the Panet Street (model, monitory) School of the Montreal Protestant Board of School Commissioners; in the P.A.P.T. where salaried teachers rubbed shoulders with the "friends of education;" in the Anglican Church hierarchy, under which he served for a year as pastor of St. Luke's Church.\textsuperscript{14}

When Dawson proposed the formalization of the link


\textsuperscript{13} LaPierre, "First Generation," 86, 115 n41.

between common and superior schools through normal school teacher training and standardized university entrance requirements, Rexford decided that he did not intend to spend the rest of his career as the social inferior of English-born Anglican clergymen or grammar school principals, or as one among the passive teachers in Dawson's "Teachers' Association." It was within this framework of loyal colonialism and angry dependence that Dawson revised the certification of rural elementary, model and academy diploma teachers on the lines of the diploma program in the McGill Normal School and implemented school leaving examinations for college, academy, and model school grant status schools on the lines of the Matriculation examinations for entrance to McGill College degree programs.

---


However, Rexford's approach was confrontational: he attacked the credentials and teacher certification practices of incumbent rural academy principals who were assembled at Bedford Academy for the annual P.A.P.T. convention of 1878 and, the following year, released the results of a self-appointed P.A.P.T. survey of seventy-five district schools in four counties of the Eastern Townships, in which he followed up his denunciation of male principals with a critique of the women teachers who taught in the district schools and had been trained in the academies.\textsuperscript{17} Here he struck a chord of recognition in William Warren Lynch - a former principal of Stanbridge Academy, a lawyer, the Member of the Legislative Assembly for Brome County, and a 'friend of education' in the P.A.P.T.\textsuperscript{18} When Lynch was appointed Solicitor-General in the Conservative Government of J. Adolphe Chapleau, he and Rexford looked to Chapleau's Education Act for a law for the regulation of the legal and medical professions and for the creation of separate Catholic and Protestant boards of school


commissioners by which the Protestant Committee might professionalize funded superior schools.¹⁹

When Premier Chapleau revoked this Act and resigned from office, J.-Alfred Mousseau formed a new government and appointed Lynch as Minister of Crown Lands. In 1881, Lynch encouraged Rexford to apply for the position of English Secretary of the Department of Public Instruction, so that the two men might devise through the Department, the Committee and the PAPT, a "legitimate means" of implicating Protestant and (Protestant) dissentient commissioners in secondary school provision.²⁰ They concentrated their strategy on Life Members, Principal Dawson and Richard William Heneker, Chancellor of Bishop’s College, who were anxious about the future of Protestant education in Quebec, and removed the business of the Committee and of the PAPT from the general meeting and the annual convention, and placed policy in the hands of coalitions and sub-committees.²¹

¹⁹ The legal profession has been a part of the culture of Quebec Protestant minority rights public education provision; Josée Legault, L’invention d’une minorité: Les Anglo-Ouëbécois (Montréal: Boréal Express, 1992).


In the summer of 1882, Rexford, as a Vice-President of the P.A.P.T., and Lynch, as Protestant Committee Life Member, requested Heneker, as President of the Sherbrooke convention, to present a motion in favour of uniform professional teacher training, and introduce the idea of a central board of examiners as a replacement for the local boards in the granting of academy and model diplomas. Heneker, as part of the Rexford-Lynch team, then announced the choice of Rexford as English Secretary of the Department.\textsuperscript{22}

By February, 1883, Dawson, Heneker, and Lynch had persuaded Mousseau that English Secretary Rexford should assume the place of Gédéon Ouimet, Superintendent of Public Instruction, at Protestant Committee quarterly sessions.\textsuperscript{23}

By the time of the next P.A.P.T. convention, it was the pro-professional training teachers, not Rexford or Lynch, who informed women teachers who already held academy diplomas of their ineligibility for the academy principalship, and who informed men principals who held Master’s degrees from England or New England and local model diplomas that they, like any other candidate principal, would have to pass the normal

---


\textsuperscript{22} \textbf{Record} 2(1882), 321-32.

\textsuperscript{23} Flower, "E.I. Rexford," 50.
school academy diploma course or apply to the Central Board for recertification. In a compromise with Rexford according to which women students might be admitted to the McGill University Bachelor's degree program, Dawson denied the academy principalship not only to future women teachers but to the women teachers who, unable to enter degree programs at McGill College, had graduated from the Montreal High School for Girls and from the McGill Normal School with academy diplomas which included passes in Latin and Greek.

Rexford changed the tone of the two year old Educational Record of the Province of Quebec from literary to professional. Editorials promoted graded elementary and secondary schools and encouraged Protestant commissioners to create graded (eight year) academies under separate Protestant boards as the exercise of their constitutional right of dissent. Activating the multi-functional Teacher's

24 Record, 3(1883), 314-15, 331; Samuel Robins to the Montreal Daily Witness, Montreal, December 7, 1907, typewritten letter, McGill University Archives, William Peterson Papers, RG2 C27.


26 Geneviève Jain, "Nationalism and Educational Politics in Ontario and Quebec, 1867-1914," Alf Chaiton and Neil McDonald, eds., Canadian Schools and Canadian Identity
Institute to spread this message in person in what he called the 'educational campaign,' he met directly with Protestant school commissioners to ask that they exercise their right to dissent and form separate boards of Protestant commissioners,\textsuperscript{27} and, at the same time, put together a team of selected inspectors and teachers to give instruction in age-graded classroom management techniques directly to one-room school teachers over the heads of private board principals.\textsuperscript{28}

In 1886, the Committee fired George Emberson, Inspector of Protestant Superior Schools, and hired John Murdoch Harper - Principal of the High School of Quebec - as replacement. Rexford turned the managing editorship of the \textit{Educational Record} over to Harper and took for himself the position of Committee Secretary also vacated by Emberson. The following year, Harper conducted the first set of written model school

\textsuperscript{27} \textit{Record}, 3(1883), 226.

and academy grade examinations for schools receiving grants from the Superior Education Fund. On the basis that six schools of sixty colleges, academies, and model schools were able to comply with the regulations approved by Order-in-Council between 1883 and 1887, Lynch and Heneker negotiated at the level of the Council the changes to Quebec School Law necessary for Protestant Committee regulation revisions. In the wider context of the Council meeting, the P.A.P.T. made enormous gains. The Jesuit Estates Act reduced the Protestant clergy to interdenominational wrangling; the failure of the Protestant attempt to redefine the corporation for tax purposes hurt the private board funded schools; and, like the Committee's regulations, the Professions Act was approved in the Consolidated Statutes of 1888.

The following year, in one of his last moves as English Secretary and only after his regulations were in place, Rexford recommended that the Committee appoint a member of the P.A.P.T. to serve a yearly term. Since the P.A.P.T. Executive


30 An exchange of favours put the Protestant clergy on the wrong side of the Jesuit Estates Act, but saw Committee regulations approved as law in the Consolidated Statutes of 1888. See Flower, "E.I. Rexford;" J.R. Miller, "Honoré Mercier, la minorité protestante du Québec et la Loi relative au règlement de la question des biens des Jésuites," Revue d'histoire de l'Amérique française, 27(Mars 1974).

31 Flower, "E.I. Rexford," 64-65; Beaulieu, Bonenfant, Hamelin, Répertoire, 201.
Committee and its sub-committees were already a part of the network of Committee sub-committees, Rexford did not intend this teacher to represent the interests of the membership at large as might the representative of a teachers' union.\textsuperscript{32} Instead the Committee appointee was to serve as a bell weather of Committee policy and neutralize resistance from the P.A.P.T. membership-at-large.

To cement the allegiance of male teachers and inspectors who promoted graded English-language, non-denominational Protestant secondary education, Rexford applied for and obtained the principalship of the High School of Montreal. At the same time, he was elected to a second term as vice-president of the P.A.P.T. Executive Committee, and to Associate member status on the Protestant Committee.\textsuperscript{33} He assumed the role of Eminence Grise to George Parmelee's English Secretary,\textsuperscript{34} and, taking advantage of Dawson's lame-duck principalship between 1893 and 1895, challenged the grants and curricula of the funded college-status grammar

\textsuperscript{32} See Wendy Johnston, "L'école primaire supérieure et le high school publique à Montréal de 1920 à 1945," Thèse de doctorat, Université de Montréal, 1991, 83.

\textsuperscript{33} Flower, "E.I. Rexford," passim.

\textsuperscript{34} Flower, "E.I. Rexford," 128; between December, 1893, and February, 1898, the two men shared a simultaneously official and private correspondence.
schools.\textsuperscript{35}

The distribution of college, high school, academy and model school grants by Committee vote on the report of Inspector for Protestant Schools Harper was replaced by a sub-committee of five members, with the Chairman and P.A.P.T. representative as ex-officio, to be appointed annually, to consult with the Harper and Parmelee, and to prepare the grant list between May and September for approval by the Committee.\textsuperscript{36} As of July, 1894, the grants would be distributed to those boards which hired teachers certified by the Normal School or the Central Board not only for principals but also for the heads of model and elementary departments.

By the time William Peterson replaced Dawson as Principal, Rexford had warned the P.A.P.T. of impending changes and chosen his sub-committee on legislation revision.\textsuperscript{37} Since Peterson was a career educator, had no previous attachment to Quebec rural colleges, academies, and model schools, and since he was unfamiliar with the Committee's institutional infrastructure, he supported the selection of Rexford,

\textsuperscript{35} William Warren Lynch to Elson Rexford, Knowlton, September 1, 1893, McGill University Archives, RG2 C27, Nos. 10 and 11; Frost, \textit{McGill University}, Volume 2, 1895-1971, 5.

\textsuperscript{36} \textit{Report}, 1893-1894, 272.

\textsuperscript{37} \textit{Record} 15(1895), 132, PAPT Convention, October 20, 1894; Louis-Philippe AuGat, "Le projet du Ministère," 77. For Dawson's last Committee meeting, see "PC Minutes," September 27, 1895, \textit{Sessional Papers}, 59 Vict., A.D. 1896, 299.

As soon as Edmund Flynn formed a new Government, the subcommittee tabled a set of regulations which would create a "professionalised" system of one-room and superior schools. Beginning at the top of a proposed secondary system, the changes would downgrad\textsuperscript{e} the Classics at the High School of Montreal, cancel the Honours Course at the Montreal Girls' High School, and force the private corporation of St. Francis College (and Grammar School) to transfer its assets to the Richmond Protestant Board of School Commissioners.\footnote{Quebec, Sessional Papers, "PC Minutes," special meeting, August 27, 1896; Gillian Burdett, "The High School for Girls. Montreal, 1875-1914," M.A. Thesis, McGill University, 1963, 22-23; Esther Healy, "St. Francis College: A Legacy of Private Initiative in the Formation, Development, and Decline of a Classical College, 1854-1898," M.A. Thesis, Bishop’s University, 1992, 110-18.} They would, furthermore: introduce the Protestant commissioner's option to consolidate district schools and transport pupils to graded secondary schools; make the funding of Protestant board one-room schools conditional on the division of pupils into age-graded classes; finance Teachers' Institutes; authorize
the Committee to audit the books of Protestant school boards; abolish the right to dissent and permit joint stock companies to allocate their taxes to Protestant school boards.\textsuperscript{40}

With the exception of the dissent and tax panel clauses, sub-committee recommendations went forward as the basis for the Protestant Committee's increase in regulatory authority over Protestant boards. Since the Catholic Committee was increasing its number of parish schools (rather than consolidating them into secondary schools), and since English Protestant businesses could not contribute to Protestant schools and remain unincorporated, the Council of Public Instruction would not agree to abolish the right to dissent or change the tax panels for corporations.\textsuperscript{41} Instead, the Protestant Committee proposed the abolition of all teachers' certificates which did not include normal school training or the approval of the Protestant Central Board of Examiners, a proposal within which the clergy would be unqualified to serve as superior school principals but with which the conservative-minded Catholic Committee sub-committee could not agree.\textsuperscript{42}


\textsuperscript{42} Flower, "E.I. Rexford," 140.
On January 7, 1897, Premier Flynn refused to approve both the Protestant and the Catholic Committee regulation revisions and legislation proposals but, with the approval of the Assembly, voted $100,000 for the improvement of public schools. On February 27, the Council demanded the division of the sum between its two Committees, but instead of making a decision, Flynn dissolved the Assembly and called an election. Flynn’s decision placed the responsibility for reform on Félix-Gabriel Marchand, leader of the Liberal Party in the Legislative Assembly since the defeat of the government of Honoré Mercier in 1892. Marchand, a practising Catholic, conciliator, and ‘Renaissance man,’ openly advocated major liberal progressive reform, specifically the creation of a system of Catholic primary schools accountable to the Assembly. However, he was caught between the polarized perspectives of Godfroi Langlois and the progressive Liberals who advocated secular schools, and Wilfrid Laurier, Prime Minister of Canada and leader of the Quebec Liberal Party, who had just won a federal election and wanted peaceful relations

43 Heap, "L’enseignement primaire publique catholique," 302-04.

between the Liberal Party and the Catholic Committee.45

In a move to control the extent of Liberal educational reform in Quebec, Laurier advised Marchand to campaign on a platform of moderate education reform. When Marchand was elected as Premier on May 24 with a solid majority, Laurier continued to impose on Marchand his federal Liberal and socially conservative vision of Quebec educational reform.46 However, Marchand’s victory was not only a Liberal Party victory but a swing election for the Legislative Assembly in which a large number of deputies were elected for the first time.47 Premier Marchand therefore governed with deputies who were uninitiated in the ways of the educational infrastructure


while this same infrastructure held out the possibility — as personified by the friendship between Laurier and J. Adolphe Chapleau, the Lieutenant-Governor — of a reconciliation between moderate Liberals and the Conservative Party.48

The conservative consensus on educational reform which pervaded the Legislative Council and the Catholic and Protestant Committees, was institutionalized in Committee sub-committees. Conservatives outnumbered radical reformers and, at the same time, implicated them in conservative reform initiatives. Yet it was not clear where the centre was in the new Liberal government or where Laurier should position himself vis a vis his Conservative colleagues and the Legislative Assembly.49 The possibility of radical reform placed in a tactical bind the Rexford faction also. The Protestant Committee could not give its official endorsement to a Bill designed by "the majority," whom it regularly scapegoated for the weaknesses of the schools of "the English Protestant minority." On the other hand, it could not officially reject a Bill that was in the vanguard of North


49 Audet, "Le projet," 77-78. Archambault, Cabinet member and Legislative Councillor, was swamped by a pro-Council Catholic Committee sub-committee of ten, including himself; Heneker could be outvoted three to one by Rexford, Shaw, and Hemming on the Protestant Committee sub-committee.
America public education reform.\textsuperscript{50}

Four days before the election, the Committees approved their respective and completed sub-committee revisions; three days before the election, the Protestant Committee retired Hemm\-\-ing as member and Counsel and replaced him with Lynch.\textsuperscript{51} Upon the Liberal Party victory and the choosing of the Cabinet, Marchand, in a fatal misunderstanding of the collective will of the sub-committees, abandoned the moderate proposals of his electoral campaign, read the sub-committees' submissions and returned them with his own education reform ideas.\textsuperscript{52} Satisfied by the end of June that both sets of revisions were complete and in anticipation of a Bill's success, he annulled Flynn's subsidies.\textsuperscript{53}

Having established Marchand's trust and with a full five months to prepare for the Speech from the Throne, the Protestant Committee used Lynch's political experience to create its public posture. Lynch officially connected the sub-committee on education legislation to H. Thomas Duffy,

\textsuperscript{50} See, for example, Record 9(1889); Record 10(1890); Heap, "Ligue d'enseignement."

\textsuperscript{51} "Catholic Committee Minutes," May 19, May 20, 1897, Sessional Papers, 61 Victoria, No. 5, A.D. 1897, 318-26, 326-332; Heap, "L'enseignement primaire," 302-04; Record, 17(1897), "PC Minutes," May 21, 1897, 229.

\textsuperscript{52} Audet, "Le projet," 78.

\textsuperscript{53} Heap, "L'enseignement primaire," 302-04.
Minister of Public Works and deputy for Brome County, and to his long time political associate, J.- Adolphe Chapleau, the Lieutenant-Governor of the Province.\textsuperscript{54} Since Chapleau had vowed to destroy the progressives "à coups de hache ou à coups de couteau dans le dos,"\textsuperscript{55} Lynch insisted on the necessity to include Protestant minority education rights as part of progressive reform in the Speech from the Throne, while Prime Minister Laurier held out to Chapleau the promise of a second term as Lieutenant-Governor.\textsuperscript{56}

At the end of July, Marchand placed the Provincial Secretary Joseph-Émery Robidoux in charge of drafting the Education Bill.\textsuperscript{57} Paul de Cazes, French Secretary of the Department of Public Instruction since 1888 and the initiator and coordinator of the conservative, Catholic Committee sub-committee proposals, hosted at his summer home a private meeting of Marchand, Robidoux, and Horace Archambeault, procureur général and member of the Catholic Committee sub-

\textsuperscript{54} For biographies of H. Thomas Duffy and William Warren Lynch, see Marie-Paule LaBrèque, Dictionary of Canadian Biography, Volume 14 (forthcoming).

\textsuperscript{55} Dutil, "Politics of Liberal Progressivism," 192, n25.

\textsuperscript{56} Dutil, "Politics of Liberal Progressivism," 188-91.

\textsuperscript{57} Heap, "L' enseignement primaire," 442.
committee for education legislation. In late September, Marchand added Duffy to his Cabinet Committee on education legislation, and the Protestant Committee sought official assurances from Duffy that the Marchand government would include protection of Protestant minority education rights in its forthcoming Bill.

On November 19, when the Premier communicated its contents to Pope Leo XIII, he received the Pope's blessing to proceed. On November 22, Chapleau delivered a Speech from the Throne which included brief reference to the creation of an inspector-general of schools, consolidation legislation, and mandatory teacher training for Protestant clergy, and Catholic priests, brothers, and nuns. At this point - not in May or September when the Committees had obtained possession of the (likely) contents of the Bill, but in November when Marchand had committed himself publicly - Archbishop Bruchési challenged Marchand and Chapleau to withdraw the Speech.

---

58 See de Cazes' numerous compilations in Beaulieu, Bonenfant, and Hamelin, Répertoire, 201; Audet, "Le projet," 78; Dutil, "Politics of Liberal Progressivism," 167 n98.
59 Heap, "L'enseignement primaire," 136, n82; "PC Minutes," Quebec, September 23, 1897, Record 18(1898), 22.
60 Débats de l'Assemblée législative du Québec, 9e législature, 1re Session, 1897-1898, texte établi par Jocelyn Saint-Pierre, xi. Official text of Bill is unavailable; Debats, vii.
61 Audet, "Le projet," 79-80.
This the Premier and the Lieutenant-Governor refused to do (except for the clause which created an inspector-general), partly on the premise that "the English Protestant minority" would not tolerate such a move.\textsuperscript{62}

Seizing the moment, Rexford drafted a regulation revision which would require Protestant ministers to hold teachers' diplomas (and would have the force of law). Approved by the Reverends Adams, Shaw, Norman, and Rexford, all of whom were from Montreal and all of whom favoured non-denominational Protestant graded, secondary education,\textsuperscript{63} this regulation required the principals of the funded Protestant denominational colleges of the Eastern Townships to hire formally trained teachers and hold teaching diplomas themselves, and Bishop's University to introduce courses in pedagogy based on the curriculum of the McGill Normal School.\textsuperscript{64}

With little time for deputies to familiarize themselves with its contents, Marchand scheduled the first reading of an Education Bill of 542 articles and one hundred

\begin{itemize}
  \item \textsuperscript{62} Audet, "Le projet," 84.
  \item \textsuperscript{63} "PC Minutes," November 26, 1897, \textit{Sessional Papers}, 62 Victoria No. 5 A.D. 1899, 360.
  \item \textsuperscript{64} "Pedagogy at Bishop's College," \textit{Sherbrooke Examiner}, May 17, 1899, ANQQ E13 No. 3014, \textit{Scrapbook}.
\end{itemize}
pages for December 13.65 The second reading took place between December 21, 1897, to January 3, 1898, in which period Chapleau announced his retirement.66 The Bill was heard in Committee of the Assembly from January 3 to January 5.67 The third reading and vote took place on January 5, and passed the Assembly by a majority of forty-eight to nineteen.68 On January 6, the rumour circulated that Chapleau would be made a Senator.69

On January 8, the Act went to the Legislative Council. Here Thomas Chapais, the leader of the Social Catholic offensive - appealed to Councillors, both Protestant and Catholic, to allow it to die.70 After Archambeault's reply to Chapais, the Act failed in a straight party vote of thirteen Conservatives to nine Liberals, with Legislative Councillors of "English Protestant minority" on both sides of the vote.71

65 Débats de l'Assemblée législative, 1897-1898, 258-59, 269; Sherbrooke Daily Record, December 17, 1897.


67 Débats de l'Assemblée législative, 1897-1898, 254, 256-59, 263-65, 267-68.

68 Débats de l'Assemblée législative, 1897, 268-70.

69 Sherbrooke Daily Record, Thursday, January 6, 1898.


Laurier chose this moment to announce the appointment as Lieutenant-Governor of Louis Jetté - member of the Catholic Committee since 1890 and member of the Catholic sub-committee for legislative reform.\textsuperscript{72} Two and one half months later, Premier Marchand was presented with the Regulations prepared since September of 1895 by the Protestant Committee sub-committee. He approved them by Order-in-Council on March 24. He approved the revisions to the Regulations of the Catholic Committee on May 13.\textsuperscript{73}

The Protestant Committee had made enormous gains with the failure of the Education Act. It had abolished the local elementary teaching diploma and the clergy diploma exemption, the last two official means by which men men with occupations other than teaching might also participate in local school provision. The Committee's most powerful sub-committee, the Protestant Central Board of Examiners, took on joint responsibility with the Normal School Committee for teaching diploma and university school leaving examinations.\textsuperscript{74}

As will be shown in the following chapter, the new regulations


\textsuperscript{73} Record 18(1898), 113-28.

\textsuperscript{74} Record 18(1898), 113; Sessional Papers, 62 Vict., A.D. 1899, 342-47. See also Beaulieu, Bonenfant and Hamelin, Répertoire, 202.
required normal school certificates for all teachers, gave no credit to model school pupils completing the academy grades, and destroyed the grants and/or autonomy in curriculum of the college grant-status grammar schools.\textsuperscript{75}

As a tangible measure of his defeat, Marchand appointed Lomer Gouin to the Catholic Committee and, three days later, approved its legislative revisions. The Catholic Committee took the opposite position of the Protestant Committee on the clergy teaching exemption, preserving it for the sake of the independent subsidized superior schools.\textsuperscript{76} Marchand obeyed Laurier's directive to forbid Robidoux to reintroduce the Education Bill and propose the abolition of the Legislative Council and appointed Thomas Duffy to the Protestant Committee.\textsuperscript{77}

Marchand's second Education Bill retained the Committee's school consolidation and pupil transportation clauses, even though the Government had few details as to how pupil


\textsuperscript{76} \textit{Sessional Papers,} 62 Victoria No. 5 A.D. 1899, 360.

transportation systems might work in Quebec.\textsuperscript{78} Having obtained the first consolidation legislation in Canada, and the fourth such Act in North America,\textsuperscript{79} the Committee asked the Superintendent of Public Instruction, Pierre Boucher de LaBruère, to circularize the legislation for the information of Protestant boards (only) and provide such information as he could obtain from the American and the New Zealand experience.\textsuperscript{80}

The new Law confirmed the joint control of Protestant teacher certification by the Protestant Central Board of Examiners and the McGill Normal School. At the request of the P.A.P.T. Executive Committee and to ease the academy principal's workload, the Protestant Committee added a year to the Official Course of Study and and passed a regulation which prevented pupils from entering model schools and academies except at the elementary grades. Having involved McGill University in overriding Bishop's University's right to hold school leaving (Academy III) examinations, it appropriated

\textsuperscript{78} Débats, 1899, Christopher Manning, "The Impact of Technology on the Eastern Townships of Quebec during the 1920s," M.A. Thesis, Bishop's University, 1990.


\textsuperscript{80} Report, 1899-1900, 400-07.
from the two universities this examination authority.\textsuperscript{11}

After both Marchand and Duffy died in office, Sydney Fisher, Laurier's Minister of Agriculture and Member for Brome County, stepped into the Committee's consolidation agenda as part of a pan-English Canadian initiative to revive dying rural school districts. Fisher had served as Member for Brome since 1882 (with the exception of the years 1892 to 1896), and was the independently wealthy owner of Alva Farm in Brome Township.\textsuperscript{12} He had attended P.A.P.T. conventions sporadically since 1883 and, as President of the Waterloo convention in 1887, had endorsed the changes in teacher certification with the remark that the "educated men in the House [of Commons]" were members of the professions.\textsuperscript{13}

By virtue of his Ministry, and his membership in the Montreal "plutocracy," and his connection with the Montreal

\textsuperscript{11} George Parmelee, \textit{School Law in the Province of Quebec: With Notes of Numerous Judicial Decisions Thereon and the Regulations of the Protestant Committee of the Council of Public Instruction} (Quebec: Daily Telegraph, 1899); \textit{Record} 20(1900), 241-42.


\textsuperscript{13} \textit{Record} 4(1884), 286-89; Drummond, "Autonomous Academy," ch. 4.
Herald Fisher was useful to Laurier. However, in his own back yard of Brome County, Fisher was an outsider. Federal political favours in the Eastern Townships were Laurier’s prerogative, while his constituency organization was regularly challenged by the Conservative Party ‘old boys’ network which had persisted from the pre-Confederation days of Christopher Dunkin. By 1900, he had developed a Canadian and British perspective on conditions in rural schools. Under the influence of James Robertson, Dominion Dairy Commissioner and former principal of the Ontario Agricultural College, he hoped to professionalize agriculture and teaching and, at the same time, preserve rural social institutions. As a result of his imperialist connection to an elitist network of farmers and gentlemen farmers, he hoped to replicate the conditions of

---

84 See Ramsay Cook, "Stephen Leacock and the Age of Plutocracy, 1903-1921," John S. Moir, ed., Character and Circumstance: Essays in Honour of Donald Grant Creighton (Toronto: Macmillan, 1970), 163-81; Gwynn, Private Capital, 269, 422. See also the letters in the possession of Mr. Edward Fisher, from Sydney Fisher to Mr. and Mrs. Arthur Fisher and Miss Suzanna Corse, which describe the Minister of Agriculture’s social life in Ottawa and trips abroad, especially in his early years as Minister of Agriculture.

85 Neatby, Laurier and a Liberal; Dutil, "Politics of Liberal Progressivism."

86 Sydney Fisher to "My dear Mother," July 15, 1898, letter in the possession of Mr. Edward Fisher.
English farms in the Eastern Townships.\textsuperscript{57}

Having helped Robertson to establish Macdonald manual training programs under way in selected Quebec Protestant schools and, after Robertson announced his pan-English Canadian rural school regeneration scheme,\textsuperscript{58} Fisher joined Parmelee in his rounds of Protestant school boards in the Eastern Townships at the summer’s end, accepted a place on the Protestant Committee on September 12, and attended his first meeting on October 4.\textsuperscript{59} For Fisher, as had been the case for Duffy, the invitation to Committee deliberations was an invitation to participate in deliberations the outcomes of which he was unable to control. When his first Committee motion, a request for unconditional government grants to one-room schools, was defeated, Principal Peterson asked Macdonald


\textsuperscript{59} Record 41(1921), 97; 21(1901), 298.
to sponsor a survey of Protestant school boards by a 'new
educationist' from Glasgow Normal School, John Adams, which
would identify suitable sites for Macdonald consolidated
schools. When Rexford and Parmelee failed to implement Adams's
recommendations, William Weir, provincial deputy for
Argenteuil County, tried for almost two years to obtain
sufficient evidence to discredit the Protestant Committee in
the Legislative Assembly. When Weir's initiatives resulted
in the firing of Inspector Harper, P.S.G. Mackenzie, Member
for Richmond County, tried to obtain unconditional funding for
one-room school districts, only to discover that he and Fisher
had supported a teaching permit regulation for teachers
without normal school training.  

With the teacher permit in hand and the Protestant
teaching profession devalued, Rexford and Parmelee prolonged
the negotiations of the Committee and the Corporation of
McGill University with Sir William Macdonald over the terms of
his benefaction to Quebec English-speaking Protestant
agriculture and schooling. By the time that James Robertson-

90 Robert Hill, "Robert Sellar and the Huntingdon
Gleaner: The Conscience of Rural Quebec, 1863–1919," Ph.D.
législative, 10e législature, 3e session, 1903, texte établi
par Richard Ouellet (Québec: Assemblée nationale, 1984), 166–
69, 202–03.

the animator of the Macdonald scheme of consolidated farm life schools - was invited to Committee membership, Committee subcommittees had appropriated his proposals for the teaching of agricultural science and the training of teachers, and had subordinated them to a nine grade elementary-secondary curriculum and its own entrance requirements and program for the School for Teachers.

Between 1908 and 1926, and as far as the Protestant Committee was concerned, there was no need for the Council of Public Instruction to meet. The Committee had recourse to all regulatory mechanisms to force the compliance of Protestant boards. While Fisher sponsored educational campaigns for the promotion of consolidation, the Committee not only encouraged Protestant boards to over-expand but implemented a ten grade course and the permanent Protestant pupil record and stopped the transformation of the P.A.P.T. into a collective bargaining union.

From the perspective of Protestant Committee regulation, the years of the governments of Lomer Gouin and Louis-Alexandre Taschereau were - with the exceptions of the boards of Montreal and its wealthy suburbs and those of English-language ownership company town - difficult years for
Protestant school commissioners and dissentient trustees.\textsuperscript{92} If the professionalization and formalization of the academy principalship made increasingly difficult the role of the private corporation,\textsuperscript{93} the separation of Quebec schools into Protestant and Catholic systems also played its part in the decline of English-speaking and Protestant political power.\textsuperscript{94}

For Dawson, Rexford, and Parmelee — men with direct access to provincial Cabinets — elected representatives were only Committee or sub-committee members to be recruited or outvoted, especially when they tried to represent diverse forms of superior and one-room school provision. The years between 1898 and 1907 engendered particularly harsh recourse to regulatory authority. Rexford and Parmelee were not the only first generation male professionals to promote, and

\textsuperscript{92} For the link between educational provision and economic development/exploitation in Canada East/Quebec, see J.I. Little, Crofters and Habitants: Settler Society, Economy, and Culture in a Quebec Township, 1848-1881 (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 1991), especially ch. 8 and Conclusion.

\textsuperscript{93} The principal of Stanstead College, George Trueman, obliged to graduate from professional school, took the obligation as an opportunity to study the problems which professionalization had created; Trueman, School Funds in the Province of Quebec (New York: Columbia Teachers’ College, 1920); Record, "Directory of Superior Schools," 28(1908), 314; 29(1909), 312; 33(1913), 344; 34(1914), 316; 36(1916), 325.

benefit from, graded and consolidated systems. However, the persistence of the Council of Public Instruction and the Legislative Council in combination with the British Canadian nationalism and paternalism of Montreal's haute bourgeoisie towards Protestant public schools may have exacerbated the difficulties of town and township municipalities in establishing and maintaining Protestant enrolments.

Tyack, "Pilgrim's Progress;" Leloudis, "Means of Grace;" "Schooling the New South."
CHAPTER TWO

CHAPTER TWO


...the time is not far distant when the Protestant Committee will require each academy receiving a grant to be organically connected with the common school system so as to consist of the most advanced classes of a graded school.1

The 'educationists' of the 1880s considered Quebec's education system inadequate, if not downright antique - a dangerously weak link in the chain of institutions that defended 'the English Protestant minority' against French Catholic incursion.2 They were convinced that they knew what was right for pupils, teachers, and school boards and made sure their ideas were engendered. Cultural poachers steeped in professionalization and British Canadian nationalism, they resented the grant privileges of academies and model schools

1 Educational Record of the Province of Quebec, hereafter referred to as Record, 4(1884), 272.

2 The history and ideology of a homogeneous Quebec English-speaking and Protestant population minority is explored in Nathan Mair, Protestant Education in Quebec: Notes on the History of Education in the Protestant Public Schools of Quebec (Quebec: Conseil superieure de l'éducation, 1981); Gary Caldwell and Eric Waddell, The English of Quebec: From Majority to Minority Status (Quebec: Institut quebecois de recherche sur la culture, 1982); Ron Rudin, The Forgotten Quebecers: A History of English-Speaking Quebec, 1759-1980 (Quebec: Institut quebecois de recherche sur la culture, 1985); Josee Legault, L'invention d'une minorite:Les Anglo-Quebecois (Montreal: Boreal, 1992)
and their duplication of common school services, and were not adverse to using underhanded tactics when they did not get their own way.  

In theory, grading pedagogies were written, rather than oral, methods of evaluating the individual pupil and promoting him to the next level of learning or 'book.' In practice and over several decades, grading slowly depleted the capacity of the common school commissioner to raise the school tax and his right to be a dissentient trustee. As "the 'so-called' American system," the classification of pupils by


ages and grades entered the schools of Quebec by fits and starts over a period of approximately seventy years. That pupils and classes could be organized on the basis of progressive learning in a fixed number of subjects within a ten month school year was probably familiar to principals in the Eastern Townships of Lower Canada as early as the late 1860s, but only came to be practised by individual schoolmasters in the late 1870s and early 1880s.7

In 1858, when the principals of funded colleges and academies founded the District of St. Francis Teachers' Association and the Bedford Teachers' Association in the Eastern Townships of Canada East,8 principals and teachers in the districts, towns, and townships of Massachusetts, New


7 Innovative classifications of pupils by grade was at least as early, maybe earlier, in Upper Canada and may have been articulated as anti-Americanism; see James Love, "Anti-American Ideology and Education Reform in Nineteenth-Century Canada," J. Donald Wilson, ed., An Imperfect Past: Education and Society in Canadian History (Vancouver: University of British Columbia, 1984). See also Bruce Curtis, True Government by Choice Men? Inspection and State Formation in Canada West (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1992), 44-47.

York, New Hampshire, Connecticut, and Vermont were engaged in the debate over the grading of secondary schools.\textsuperscript{9} Principals and teachers hired out of New England by Townships boards had already participated in the debates over grading and state funding of academies and high schools, and took advantage of Lower Canadian superior school grants.\textsuperscript{10} They charged by the term and/or course, hired assistant teachers as they thought necessary, and trained teachers for the tax-supported common schools.\textsuperscript{11} The model school grant category, designed primarily for women principals of Catholic écoles modèles was, in Townships usage, "any elementary school whose


teacher was willing and able to take the pupils further than custom demanded." Since the amount of the principal's grant depended on the political influence of the boards when they founded their schools rather than on the subjects taught, there was an overlap of course offerings between colleges, academies, and model schools.

To discourage this diversity of superior school provision and teacher training, the Corporation of McGill College hired as Principal, John William Dawson, Superintendent of Schools of Nova Scotia, and gave him a mandate to found a normal school. During Dawson's three years as Superintendent, this fundamentalist Presbyterian and self-taught geologist, zoologist, and teacher had embodied the tenets of the 'new education' in their pure and unadulterated form - scientific agriculture for public schools, non-elitist 'adult education' teachers' institutes, and object lessons. Before leaving for Montreal, he had compared the public school systems of Massachusetts and Connecticut with the schools of Nova Scotia, corresponded with Horace Mann, Henry Barnard, and Egerton Ryerson on matters related to public education and the training of teachers.  

---


13 B. Anne Wood has captured the essence of the Dawson's youth and early career in God, Science, and Schooling: John William Dawson's Pictou Years, 1820-1855 (Truro, Nova Scotia:
Upon Dawson’s arrival in Montreal, George-Étienne Cartier fired the Assistant Superintendent for Public Instruction in Lower Canada, Jean-Baptiste Meilleur. Cartier replaced Meilleur with Pierre-Olivier Chauveau, and replaced Meilleur’s expansionist superior school funding policies with the Superior Education Fund for Lower Canada.\(^{14}\) So as to reestablish rigid grant categories, Cartier and Chauveau devised an elitist and demographic formula for the Superior Education Fund. They set the Protestant share – according to the ratio of the Protestant to the Catholic population in Lower Canada – at one-seventh of the total fund, the universities and normal schools excepted. The Cartier government then created the Council of Public Instruction, the members of which were chosen for life according to the same formula, to look after the annual distribution of the Fund.\(^{15}\)

On the basis of this formula, McGill College, the McGill Normal School, and the Model School of the Normal School each had a degree of grant security unknown to the


English-language colleges, academies, and model schools.\textsuperscript{16}
In December of 1856, Dawson took over the management of the High School of Montreal as the preparatory school for McGill College and negotiated an arrangement with the Committee of the Colonial Church and School Society that its Model School would be annexed for practice teaching by the Normal School. From the Society's clientele, Dawson established his own Model School, and built his own model and normal enrolments.\textsuperscript{17} The students of the Normal School served without pay as the teaching assistants for the large Primary, Girls' and Boys' Departments of the Model School, while the pupils of the Model School were preferred enrolments from Montreal. The Model School pupils were taught according to monitorial methods and the pupil-teachers of the Normal School were taught a curriculum of subjects which included the Art of Teaching towards the elementary, the model, and the academy diploma.\textsuperscript{18} Thus while the Eastern Townships model school was on a continuum from an "exemplary" common school to a school which offered academy-status subjects, the Superior Education Fund


\textsuperscript{17} Orrin Rexford, "The History of Teaching Training in the McGill Normal School," M.A. Thesis, McGill University, 1936, 93-94.

\textsuperscript{18} \textit{Report}, 1861, 71-72.
built class and pedagogical distinctions between the common schools of the Montreal Protestant Board of School Commissioners, the McGill Model School, the McGill Normal School, and the High School of Montreal.

In 1864, in order to preserve the grant structure of his schools, Dawson and Chauveau arranged a meeting in Montreal of the principals of the District of St. Francis Teachers' Association, the Bedford Teachers' Association, the Quebec Teachers' Association, and the "Teachers' Association in connection with the McGill Normal School," each one of which maintained a network of teacher training and feeder schools. Although Dawson received a poor response from the Townships' Associations, he proposed, and won approval for, a federation of the four associations assembled in Montreal. The federation was named the "Provincial Association of Protestant Teachers of Lower Canada," (P.A.P.T.) and Dawson was voted in as president of the new federation. As President, Dawson spoke in the name of the educational rights and needs of the Protestant minority of Lower Canada, even though the principals of this "minority" represented diverse and competing interests.19

As chairman of the P.A.P.T. Executive Committee,

Dawson arranged for the PAPT convention of the following year to be held in Sherbrooke, the constituency of Confederation promoter, Alexander Galt. Following the arrival of Dawson and a contingent of Montreal teachers and 'friends of education' at the Sherbrooke convention, the demoralized principals and teachers of the District of St. Francis Teachers' Association met separately from the other teachers' associations. Here J.W. Graham, Principal of St. Francis College, challenged Galt to protect the rights of Eastern Townships schoolmasters in the clauses of the Confederation Bill. Graham also introduced for the first time in Lower Canada the proposal that "A Graded System of Schools for the Province" would serve as the means to establish a uniform Protestant, English-language, school system.²⁰

In order to placate the Townships headmasters and generate pro-Confederation momentum, Hector Langevin tabled in the Assembly of United Canada an Education Bill to guarantee the annual budgets of all categories of Protestant-funded superior schools. Since this Bill included the sum of $300,000 as a legacy for superior education in Lower Canada, and Upper Canadians were weary of petitions for Lower Canadian superior school funding in Lower Canada, they affixed the Bell Amendment to Langevin's Bill and it failed to pass. Dawson

then petitioned Queen Victoria for protection of the education rights of Lower Canada's "minority," and waited the results.  

After the Fathers of Confederation signed the British North America Act, Dawson and the Montreal Board of Protestant Commissioners continued their negotiations with Galt and Cartier and received their settlements in 1869 in the Quebec Education Act. The Act protected the grant of the McGill Normal School and Model School; McGill College was compensated for its grant cutback; the tax base of the Montreal Board was enhanced; and the Montreal Board took over the management of the High School of Montreal. By contrast, the Protestant-share grants of the schools outside of Montreal and Quebec City were reduced by forty to sixty per cent. As a result of the grant cutbacks, five Protestant superior schools in the Eastern Townships closed for lack of pupils, and three were transferred from private to public board management.

With the grant status of McGill College, McGill Normal School, and the McGill Model School, reinforced by the 1869

21 Journal of Education, 8 (November 1864), 151-52; 14 (June 1870), 104.


Act, McGill handed over the management of the High School of Montreal to the Board of Protestant Commissioners of Montreal, and the Board renegotiated the Grammar School (Scholarship) Act of 1819 to continue the funding of the High School of Montreal and the High School of Quebec. However, by 1872, at the P.A.P.T. Convention in Richmond, Henry Hubbard, Inspector for the Protestant common school municipalities of Sherbrooke and Stanstead County, raised the issue of grading as a way of developing common schools into secondary schools. He reported that the Principal of Sherbrooke Academy, had "a graded system in [its] most embryo form....[one not] sufficiently advanced to make...a high school, but an intermediate as well as a high school." In support, Mr. Shonyo, Principal of Coaticook Academy reported that "the officers of the municipality [were] ready to co-operate with him in [the introduction of] the graded system." Mr. Lee, Principal of Stanstead Academy said that he "believed that graded schools could not be called an experiment because in all parts of the neighbouring country [the United States] they had been introduced with success."

Mr. F. Hicks, Principal of the McGill Model School, said that he came to the convention to be instructed about graded schools, and that "in England they were about introducing them." Hicks, who was sympathetic to the

---

enrolment and timetable imperatives of "country" schools, suggested that graded schools gave an unfair advantage to the pupils in large towns and cities. For Hicks the central issue of grading, however, was not urbanization but the "healthy competition" between public and private schools for pupil enrolments. Mr. White, of the High School of Montreal, thought that "each [Montreal common] school was graded to [entrance to] the Elementary Department of the High School." Mr. Barwick, his colleague, added that the pupils passed from primary to higher grades "not in a given time."25

Dawson's response to the idea of graded Protestant schools was to preserve a formal separation between private and public education, as in Nova Scotia twenty years previously and on the paternalistic, pre-industrial, Scottish model of state elementary and secondary school provision.26 In 1873, he was appointed to the Protestant Committee by Premier Charles-Eugène Boucher de Boucherville and, after the abolition of the Ministry of Education, established a system of "payment by results" for Protestant academies and model schools, a system which tied the annual grant distribution from the Protestant share of the Superior Education Fund to the entrance examinations (Associate in Arts) of McGill


College, McGill Normal School, and Bishop's College, Lennoxville. As well, local Protestant boards of examiners were to implement a course on the "Art of Teaching" similar to the course in the Normal School as a requirement of local examining boards' elementary, model, and academy diplomas.27

However, by introducing a system of grant payments by examination results, Dawson had to face the problems which he had avoided by leaving Nova Scotia. These were the high success rate of women students in normal schools and as assistant teachers in academies and model schools, their entry into public school teaching, and the tension in the workplace between men and women teachers.28 When formally qualified women teachers, as assistants, took charge of both junior and preparatory classes in private board schools, they prevented their male counterparts from concentrating government funding in graded secondary schools and redefining the division of classroom labour. Dawson and the Committee therefore tried to stop academy and model school principals with only one assistant each from teaching the school leaving subjects.29

27 Record 2(1882), 45-47.


29 Record 1(1881), 6-7.
In 1878, when Elson Rexford, Assistant Headmaster of the High School of Montreal, offered "A Few Thoughts on Our District School System" at Bedford, at the P.A.P.T. annual convention, he attacked the funding of private boards which hired principals without professional teacher credentials, and the existence of boards of examiners where principals certified their own academy graduates as teachers for one-room schools or assistants in academies and model schools.\textsuperscript{30} Rexford himself was a graduate of this system. He was born in Brome County in 1850, and attended Rexford Corners district school and the private board, government-funded Mansonville Academy. He obtained an elementary diploma from the Bedford Board of Examiners on July 1, 1867, and taught in the Panet Street School, Montreal, between 1874 and 1876. He obtained a Bachelor of Arts and a Licentiate in Sacred Theology from McGill College in 1876, and held St. Luke's Anglican Church two years.\textsuperscript{31}

Since his own Headmaster was a Classical Grammar Scholar with the status of a private school principal, the security of its own government grant, and the largest tax base of Protestant schools, Rexford had instead targeted the

\textsuperscript{30} George Flower, "A Study of the Contributions of Dr. E.I. Rexford to Education in the Province of Quebec," M.A. Thesis, McGill University, 1949,

comparatively vulnerable academy principals of the Eastern Townships.\textsuperscript{32} Appointed English Secretary of the Department of Public Instruction in 1882, Rexford found a colleague in John Murdoch Harper, an applicant for the post of English Secretary who had settled for the principalship of the Boys’ High School of Quebec. Harper was a Scot who had graduated from the Glasgow Normal School, the school which had been founded by David Stow and the major influence on Dawson’s teacher training methods. Dawson had emigrated to Nova Scotia in 1866, and served as Principal of the Model School, Provincial Normal School, Truro, Nova Scotia. He had subsequently classified his pupils by age-grade as Headmaster of the Victoria School in Saint John, New Brunswick; and as Headmaster of the Kent School, Superintendent for the free schools of Charlottetown, and Principal of the Prince of Wales Normal School, Prince Edward Island.\textsuperscript{33}

When Rexford arrived in Quebec in September of 1882, Harper was not only Rector of the High School but Secretary-Treasurer of its Board of Directors and was trying to convince them to grade their School. Rexford therefore appointed

\textsuperscript{32} Elson I. Rexford, "The Provincial Association of Teachers, a Factor in Our Educational System," Teachers' Magazine, 8, 33(October, 1926): 11-12.

Harper as his unofficial second-in-command to make grading the official policy of the Department and of the Protestant Committee. He used Harper and George Parmelee, Hicks' replacement as Principal of the McGill Model School, as his first lecturers on graded instruction to the one-room school teachers who attended his Teachers' Institutes and to the commissioners and trustees who attended his 'educational campaigns.'

In under two years, Rexford took over the Superintendent of Public Instruction's place on the Protestant Committee and adopted what Dawson had described as the necessarily 'aggressive approach' to English-language, non-denominational Protestant school provision. In his dual capacity as English Secretary and member of the P.A.P.T. Executive Committee, Rexford used Teachers' Institutes to address the individual teacher of the ungraded district school; the Central Board to define the principalship; 'educationist' meetings to canvass the commissioner and the


36 Record, 2(1882), 331.
trustee; and the Executive Committee to define the P.A.P.T. membership.

Without waiting for formal approval by Cabinet of the abolition of local Protestant boards of examiners, Rexford linked grading to formal teacher training credentials and drove a wedge in the P.A.P.T. membership between the principals of private board funded academies and the teachers who were normal school graduates. By the end of the convention of 1882, the members were convinced that the problem of teacher certification and academy funding was a problem of minority education provision and one to be resolved among and between themselves.37

In June of 1883, Dawson, who had been wrestling with the question of women's education for thirty-four years and had concluded that coeducation for men and women of different social classes was "dangerous," took his sabbatical to study the provision of university education for women in England.38 In his absence, Rexford placed the issue of academy principal


credentials on the agenda of the P.A.P.T. Convention at Lachute, blaming McGill's Associate in Arts examinations and discrimination against women for academy diploma requirements. In this context, rural principals protested against the scheduling of these examinations in May instead of March (a crucial change for rural pupils), and defended women teachers' rights to academy diplomas.39

In June of 1884, when Dawson returned to Montreal, he was presented with Rexford's ultimatum: either men university graduates with academy diplomas had exclusive right to the academy principalship and women were to be admitted to the Bachelor's degree at McGill College, or male rural academy principals would remain uncertified and the women who had obtained their academy diplomas before they might enter McGill College would qualify for the academy principalship. At the P.A.P.T. convention in the fall in Cowansville, Dawson and Lynch announced that rural superior school teachers must make sacrifices for the sake of McGill University and the McGill Normal School by allowing their teacher training requirements to prevail.40 Dawson then wrote, for the University, his Report on the Higher Education of Women, and admitted to a separate degree program at the University the women who, since

40 Record 4(1884), 279-92.
1875, had graduated with high standing from the Girls' High School of Montreal, had obtained first class academy diplomas from the McGill Normal School, and who wanted to continue their education by enrolling in a Bachelor of Arts program.\(^4\) He made Greek an optional subject for women in the Bachelor's program, and a compulsory subject for the academy diploma, even though a pass in Greek did not authorize the women who already held academy diplomas to the first class academy principalship. For the women who aspired to teach and study the Classics, the study of Greek and Latin was transferred out of the Normal School to the University where they were less assessable.\(^2\)

In 1885, the Protestant Committee formally abolished local boards of examiners for teachers' diplomas, replaced them with a Protestant Central Board, and linked their authority to the right to create Protestant boards for academy and model school provision.\(^3\) The following year, and in


\(^2\) Donna Yavorsky-Ronish, "'Sweet Girl Graduates': The Admission of Women to English-speaking Universities in Canada in the Nineteenth Century," Thèse de doctorat, Université de Montréal, 1985, 324-25; Drummond, "Gender, Profession."

\(^3\) Flower, "E.I. Rexford," 69, cites Rexford, *Manual of School Law and Regulations....for the Use of Candidates for Teachers' Diplomas*, a first edition unavailable and of unknown publication date. See also, André Beaulieu, Jean-Charles
acknowledgement of his success in converting the High School of Quebec to grading, the Committee appointed John Murdoch Harper Inspector of Protestant Superior Schools. Harper graded the academies and model schools funded by the Protestant Committee, a process which required a ninety day minimum pupil attendance; extended the academy year to June; included the classification of model school pupils into Grades I-IV Elementary, Model I (repeat of E IV), Model II, and Model III; and academy pupils into Grades Elementary I-IV, Model II and III, and Academy I (repeat of Model III), Academy II, and Academy III; and written examinations for the model and academy grades. The Protestant Committee refused to recertify experienced principals who would not sit an examination in teaching methods based on Baldwin’s Art of School Management or fund academies for boards which would not

Bonenfant, Jean Hamelin, Répertoire des publications gouvernementales du Québec de 1867 à 1964 (Québec: Secrétariat de la Province, 1968), 201; Report, 1885-1886, xii; Record 3(1885), 226-30.

"Flower, "E.I. Rexford," 51; Protestant Board of School Commissioners of Quebec, Historical Sketch of the Protestant Board of School Commissioners of Quebec, 1846 to 1917, Quebec, August 1917, 7-8. For Harper’s experience in the Maritimes with age-grade pupil classifications, see Anne Drummond, "John Murdoch Harper," Dictionary of Canadian Biography, Volume 14 (forthcoming)

"Flower, "E.I. Rexford," 53; Record 4(1884), 21."
hire a minimum of two assistant teachers.\textsuperscript{46}

Since this official course of study also imposed on boards the obligation to hire for each academy diploma principal a minimum of two assistant teachers, private contributions played a greater rather than a lesser role in public academy provision.\textsuperscript{47} Principal Hobart Butler gave up his academy at Bedford, which forced the Protestant commissioners of Bedford to build a graded secondary school; the Anglican Church transferred its academy assets to the Knowlton (Protestant) Board of Commissioners, who then gave up their tax support to eleven Brome Township one-room schools; the Scots-origin directors of Huntingdon Academy - who had a contract with the common schools of the school municipality of Huntingdon - exchanged their "untrained" for "trained" teachers.\textsuperscript{48}

The Committee successfully negotiated its revisions on the Council of Public Instruction and saw them passed in the

\textsuperscript{46} \textit{Report}, 1883-1884, 374-75; 1884-1885, 419-20; 1887-1888, 262-67; "Minutes, September 21, 1887, \textit{Report}, 1887-1888, 259; \textit{Record} 7(1887): 189.

\textsuperscript{47} \textit{Report}, 1883-1884, 374-75; 1884-1885, 419-20; \textit{Record} 4(1884), 313.

\textsuperscript{48} Drummond, "Autonomous Academy," ch.4; \textit{Record} 4(1884), 272. See the comparative table of subsidized academy masters, and their degrees, diplomas, and the institutions which had certified them, \textit{Record}, 5(1885), 314-15;
Consolidated Statutes of 1888. As an indication that rural teachers and inspectors shared the faith in grading of their urban colleagues, the Committee welcomed, for the first time, a P.A.P.T. representative. However, the results of the examinations revealed that the top of the model school grant list had outperformed the bottom of the academy grant list and that at least two academies had cheated, and that, furthermore, the Montreal High School for Girls, which was not part of the Protestant Committee grant system, had led the province in the Associate in Arts examinations for the second time since 1886. The grading faction therefore introduced further regulation innovations which would bring the grammar and model grant-status schools into their system.

The implications of this agenda for both men and women principals were first revealed in Montreal. In the fall of 1890, symbolically, one gang of boys from the High School set a fire which almost totally destroyed the High School for Girls, and another gang set a fire which burned the High School to the ground. Taking advantage of the confusion which reconstruction entailed, Rexford challenged the right of the High School for Girls as an institution which prepared women in the Classical course, and challenged the principal of the

49 Beaulieu, Répertoire, 201.

High School of Montreal, Aspinall Howe, for teaching a Classical course which the High School for Girls had outperformed. In 1891, he replaced Howe as Rector of the High School and convinced the Protestant Board of School Commissioners to establish a High School Committee to manage the High School and the High School for Girls.\footnote{Flower, "E.I. Rexford," 83-84; Burdett, "High School for Girls," 22. The principalships of the High School of Montreal and the High School for Girls were not subject to the regulations of the Protestant Committee. The High School was maintained by the Board of Protestant Commissioners of Montreal, and the Girls' High School was maintained by fees and subscriptions. Both schools were classical grammar schools, the preparatory departments of which connected with Montreal's five-grade common schools, and the junior and senior departments of which prepared pupils for entrance to university and the professions.}

From that moment, qualified women principals who taught in both funded and tax-supported schools were subject to professional devaluation as part of the subordination of the Classical to the graded curriculum. \footnote{Joyce Pedersen, "Schoolmistresses and Headmistresses: Elites and Education in Nineteenth-Century England," Alison Prentice and Marjorie Theobald, eds., Women Who Taught, 37-70.} Through the chairmanship of the High School Committee, Rexford laid the groundwork for change of both schools. Mrs. Jane Fuller, a specialist in Botany and Mathematics, had served as Principal of the High School for Girls since 1880.\footnote{Burdett, "High School for Girls," 20, 78-83.} After two years on the High School Committee with Rexford, she retired from
teaching. Her successor, Maria Findlay, served two years as Principal before her return to England. In 1896, the Board appointed Rexford to the principalship, whereupon he cancelled its Honours Program, extended the regular course by one year, substituted prizes in general proficiency, conduct, and punctuality for subject prizes, and established a three-year sewing course in the Junior Department.\footnote{Burdett, "High School for Girls," 22-23.}

Well pleased with his work, he likened the School to

a family with

\small{\begin{quote}
the combined and properly adjusted influence of man and women \[my italics]\ldots an educational home for the daughters of the citizens of Montreal under the best possible conditions for their educational development.\footnote{Cited by Burdett, "Girls’ High," 23.}
\end{quote}}

One of these teachers was of Elizabeth Binmore — Academy Diploma, McGill Normal School, 1878, and Bachelor of Arts, McGill College, 1888 — who served as Principal of Clarenceville Academy (near the Vermont border in the District of Bedford) for one year. So that the Clarenceville commissioners would not lose their academy grant, Binmore returned to McGill University to study towards a Master of Arts degree under the botanist, Professor Edward Penhallow. She spent the remainder of her academic and teaching career in the common schools of Montreal and its suburbs.\(^{57}\) In a second example, Compton Ladies’ College, one of two girls’ secondary schools in the Eastern Townships, held a college-status grant.\(^{58}\) Its principal, Mrs. Amelia Brouse, had attracted both day-pupils and boarders who had led the Province in the Associate in Arts Examinations. When asked to comply with the Protestant Committee curriculum, the Board gave up its grant, and the school became an elitist boarding


\(^{58}\) *Report*, 1892-1893, 212.
school lost as a resource to the local community.  

If grading bisected women 'teachers' work' from the grammar to the common school, it also drove men principals with model diplomas from local boards out of teaching. In 1893 and by virtue of a highly interpretive legal opinion from Lynch and Hemming for the Committee, Parmelee, Rexford's replacement as English Secretary, and Rexford, Committee Associate Member, resolved that Superior Education Fund grants were not the perpetual right of individual private or public boards. They struck a five-member sub-committee for the annual distribution by which academies and model schools received their academic grants for providing ten month contracts for staffs of professional teachers rather than on the basis of principal credentials or pupil performance. Henceforth, in the words of Inspector Harper, Protestant secondary education was to be "'payments for results' in the hands of the commissioners," who were expected to fire - or


61 McGill University Archives, RG2 C27, Protestant Committee of the Council of Public Instruction, 1871-1908, Letter No 8, Dawson to Parmelee, Little Métis, September 1893; Letter No. 10, Lynch to Rexford, Knowlton, September 1, 1893; Letter No. 11, Hemming to Rexford, Montreal, September 1, 1893.
not to hire - men principals with model school diplomas.\textsuperscript{62}

The 1888 regulations had dramatically shifted academy grants from private boards to public commissioners and from local examining boards to the Protestant Central Board. However, when the 'educationists' of the Protestant Committee realized that their graded system would not diffuse automatically into model and one-room schools, they accelerated their campaigns, Institutes, and bonus grants for grading.\textsuperscript{63}

The Committee not only pushed the older academy and model school centres to form separate Protestant school municipalities, but distributed "special" model school grants and one-room school teacher bonuses to encourage grading in remote school municipalities. The Committee provided special subsidies for model schools in the Counties of Gaspé and Bonaventure,\textsuperscript{64} and proselytized in the counties of Ottawa, Pontiac, Argenteuil, and Megantic by holding Institutes at

\textsuperscript{62} Record 13(1893), 318.


\textsuperscript{64} Record 10(1890), 268-69; 12(1892), 269;"PC Minutes," Quebec, September 9, 1892, Report, 1892-1893, 263.
Shawville, Lachute and Inverness.\textsuperscript{65} In 1891, 'educationists' gave seventy-four one room and assistant teachers lessons "with a special view to aid in the use of the authorized textbooks."\textsuperscript{66}

Common school inspectors assumed increasing importance in the diffusion of grading into new territory. Lest a majority of inspectors continue to reflect the vestiges of pre-1888 associations - the District of Bedford, the District of Saint Francis, Huntingdon, Lachute, Quebec and Sherbrooke - the Committee encouraged its corps of elementary school inspectors to establish regional teachers' associations which would link the district one room schools with the graded academies of their, or the nearest, Protestant school municipality, and force comparisons between the principals and teachers who taught in graded schools and those who did not.\textsuperscript{67}

The Protestant schools of Brome County owed their protected,


\textsuperscript{66} \textit{Report}, 1890-1892, 294.

ungraded pupil-teacher networks to Inspector Ernest Taylor's service on behalf of local autonomy. In the Ottawa Valley, the Occidental Teachers' Association, united the principals of the Hull [Graded] Model School, Buckingham Academy, and Aylmer Academy, while the Oriental Teachers' Association represented the ungraded school tradition. The Frontier Teachers' Association, united the Protestant school teachers of the Counties of Beauharnois, Chateauguay, and Huntingdon to reduce the influence of Huntingdon Academy and its principal, C.S. Holiday.

The greatest obstacles to the Protestant Committee-P.A.P.T. agenda were the principal networks of the District of St. Francis Teachers' Association. The Consolidated Statutes and Committee regulations of 1888 did not apply to non-denominational and Protestant colleges and grammar schools subsidized from the Protestant share of the Superior Education

---


69 Gleaner, Huntingdon, October 10, 1895; September 3, 1896.

70 A.W. Lang, "Ormstown Academy," Teachers' Magazine, 10, 43(April 1928), 17-18; Gleaner, Huntingdon, October 10, 1895; January 2, August 20, September 3, 1896.
Fund. 71 St. Francis College was non-sectarian, maintained a College of Agriculture with a Women's Department, held subject specialization teacher institutes, trained teachers for the St. Francis District, and offered the academy grades and the first two years of the Bachelor of Arts. 72 Bishop's College had a university-status grant, offered Bachelor's and Divinity degrees, and had its own academy department in the non-subsidized, grammar school, Bishop's College School. 73 As well as the founding schools of the St. Francis Association, Morrin [Presbyterian] College, Compton Ladies College, Dunham Ladies College, and Stanstead Wesleyan College, had been funded from the Superior Education Fund. 74 Since the so-called affiliated colleges sent a free flow of pupils through Junior, Senior, College and University departments, into Protestant municipalities as teachers, they were, except for the Heneker connection, both independent of Committee regulation and protected by Committee clergy representation. The Protestant Committee—P.A.P.T. Executive network was closer to the Vermont

71 See the grant category "High Schools' and Special Schools," under "Protestant Superior Education," Report, 1892-1893, 212-13.

72 Healy, "St. Francis College."

73 Record 10(1890), 137-141; 174-177.

Teachers' Association, the Ontario Educational Association, the Dominion Educational Association (D.E.A.) in 1891, and the National [American] Education Association (N.E.A.) than the District of St. Francis Teachers' association.  

Within these wider networks, P.A.P.T. delegates were introduced to the ideas of school consolidation and pupil transportation as ways of concentrating pupils in graded secondary schools. While consolidation and transportation systems operated in parts of New England and the mid-western States, the Massachusetts Exhibit on consolidated schools at the Columbian Exposition, Chicago, was the catalyst for the diffusion of grading and consolidation policies, and pupil transportation technologies in Canada and the United States.  

There was enabling state legislation in Massachusetts in 1869 and 1879, in Vermont in 1885, and in Indiana in 1889.  

---  


76 Report, 1899-1900, 400-07; Ellsworth, "Ohio Valley;" Wayne Fuller, The Old Country School: The Story of Rural Education in the Middle West (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982).  

The Massachusetts laws were based upon the practice in Montague and Concord; the School Committee of Concord to collect and concentrate elementary and secondary pupils in the Emerson School, and thereby obtain a sufficient secondary enrolment to exclude the pupils of West Concord. Similar approaches followed in Quincy, Lexington, and Boxford with various degrees of failure and success.\textsuperscript{78} Few boards in Vermont took up the option;\textsuperscript{79} in Indiana, there was rapid progress through the use of the pre-assembled horse-drawn school van.\textsuperscript{80}

By 1895, the Protestant Committee was prepared to consider the formulation of enabling consolidation legislation.


\textsuperscript{80} Record 42(1922), 2; L. Burton Rogers, "A Comparative Study of the Township, District, Consolidated, Town, and District Schools of Indiana," Ph.D. Thesis, Columbia University, 1911.
for Quebec Protestant boards. Since 1890, it had halved its academy grant list, and the number of academies which failed to meet hiring and curriculum regulations had dropped from twenty-five schools to zero. In the five year period, the number of model schools had increased from thirty-six to fifty-three; however, eight of the latter refused to limit their curriculum to the elementary and model grades and classify and promote their pupils accordingly. Access to the school leaving examinations, both official and unofficial, was reduced from sixty-nine schools to twenty-six schools. The number of model school principals teaching Academy II and III had dropped from seventeen to eight.\[1\]

It was as if the Department of Public Instruction and the Protestant Committee were chasing out of teaching the men and women who were both experienced and qualified in the teaching of Latin, French, and Higher Mathematics, and capable of following the graded curriculum with the minimum assistant or assistants required, teacher each and of maintaining balanced elementary enrolments.\[2\] The five tables which appear


\[2\] Knowledge of Latin, French, and Mathematics was central to principal formation; Samuel Robins to the Editor of the *Witness*, typewritten letter, Montreal, December 7, 1907, McGill University Archives, William Peterson Papers, RG 2 C27.
in Appendix 3 offer some possible ways of looking at the
devaluation of model school work. There were, between the
approval of the Consolidated Statutes in 1888 and the
formalization of grading throughout Protestant secondary
schools by 1915-1917, approximately five hundred principal-
ships in model schools (renamed intermediate schools in 1904),
academies, high schools and special grant schools. The
tables focus on the principalships of the years 1889, 1905,
and 1917 to try to document the structural changes in
Protestant superior schools which accompanied the redirection
of the official teaching of Academy II and Academy III.

In Table 1, we examine the breakdown by school status
of special and high schools, academies, and model schools
subsidized from the Protestant share of the Superior Education
Fund. Between 1889 and 1905, and 1905 and 1917, there were
increases in the number of superior schools. Of valid cases,
model schools consistently made up over 60 per cent of

See, comparatively, Thomas Morain, "The Departure of Males
from the Teaching Profession in Nineteenth-Century Iowa," Civil War History, 26, 2 (June 1980): 161-170. After 1896,
Parmelee ceased to report the breakdown between elementary and
model grade enrolments in model schools; Quebec, Sessional
Papers, 59 Victoria A.D. 1896, 242-43; 61 Victoria A.D. 1897,
258-59.

For the British Columbia context, see Neil Sutherland,
"The Triumph of 'Formalism': Elementary Schooling in
Vancouver from the 1920s to the 1960s," Robert A. J. McDonald
and Jean Barman, eds., Vancouver Past: Essays in Social
History (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press,
Protestant superior schools. In theory, the door to further educational opportunity remained open. In practice, model school provision took less of the Fund per pupil than other forms of superior school provision except where the cancellation of grants left the entire high school/special school share for two schools (See Tables 2A, 2B, and 2C).

Tables 3A, 3B, and 3C indicate that, in 1889, male teachers participated almost as frequently as female teachers as heads of model schools. However, with the designation of the academy principalship as male, and of the model school principalship as female, the number of male model school principals decreased (in real numbers and in proportion to the number of schools) as that of female teachers increased. As male principals with the model school or no-teaching diploma left model schools, they were replaced, if they were replaced, with female principals with academy or model school diplomas, and male teachers with academy diplomas who were trying to upgrade new model schools to academy grant status.

At the same time, the process of upgrading model schools to academy status or demoting them to elementary school status annually changed the composition of the model school grant list. However, the number of model school principalships in which the principal, male or female, held a model diploma and was assisted by one teacher outpaced those in which the male principal held an academy diploma and was
assisted by two teachers. While enrolments in academy
departments declined, and elementary department enrolments
increased, in high schools, special schools, and academies
between 1889 and 1905 (See Tables 4A, 4B, and 4C), the
enrolment ledgers for Protestant model schools show an
increase every year between 1896 and 1905 in the number of
schools with at least one pupil enrolled in Academy II or III.
Furthermore, this persistence is documented through the
abolition in 1898 of the local elementary diploma and the
elimination in 1900 of the duplicated Model III/Academy I
curriculum.

Not surprisingly, when we look at Tables 5A, 5B, and 5C,
we see that academies overall had higher persistence rates
than model schools, rates which are higher between 1905 and
1917 than between 1889 and 1905. Model schools maintained
approximately the same persistency rate between 1889 and 1905
and between 1905 and 1917. 39.5 per cent of model schools
disappeared between 1889 and 1905, and 35.4 per cent, between
1905 and 1917. Female teachers, owing to their larger
numbers, were more affected than male teachers by the demotion
of model schools to elementary school status and their
replacement by other model schools (See Tables 5C1 and
5C2).

Conclusion

Beginning with the Protestant Committee regulations of
the 1880s, only a small minority of boards were able to comply with all the components of age-graded secondary schools—hiring minimums of three teachers for academies and two teachers for model schools; professional male principal for academies and high schools; professional female principal for model schools. On the basis of their elementary grade enrolments and with the goal of upgrading to academy grant status, boards hired male principals with first class academy diplomas and at least two teachers. Within one or two years and whether or not their elementary pupils persisted through the model and academy department grades, the Protestant Committee awarded them academy grants. That the so-called Quebec English Protestant minority tried to create a public school system on the scale of Ontario or England attests to the power of post-colonial British nationalism in the Committee-P.A.P.T. network. The men of this network appropriated the right to dissent and to the minority share of school municipality tax revenues as a mark of professional teacher formation. The regulations placed between the school board and the principal moved access to higher education away from semi-private colleges, academies, and model schools to graded elementary-model-academy department academies. In the process of restructuring and until the age-graded course of instruction was fully diffused, men and women with model diplomas were denied academy principalships but taught the
academy grades in model schools.
CHAPTER THREE

PROTESTANT MODEL SCHOOLS AND THE
MARCHAND EDUCATION ACTS, 1895-1905
CHAPTER THREE

PROTESTANT MODEL SCHOOLS AND THE MARCHAND EDUCATION ACTS, 1895-1905

...it is proposed to dump all the Model Schools, already harassed to death's door by regulation and perpetual changes, among the inefficiencies of the elementary schools and finally wreck them.¹

After the defeat of the Mercier Nationalists and the choice of Marchand as Leader of the Quebec Liberal Party in 1892, the reform of Quebec's elementary and primary schools was a distinct possibility.² However, on the issue of school reform, the separately nationalistic and professional teacher systems of the Protestant Committee and the Catholic Committee of the Council of Public Instruction did not distinguish between common and superior schools.³ The Council of Public

¹ Richmond Guardian, January 9, 1903, Archives Nationales du Quebec, hereafter referred to as ANQ, E 13 No. 3014, Scrapbook [of newspapers clippings on Protestant education, 1883-1906], Quebec, Department of Public Instruction, possibly the collection of Elson Rexford and/or George Parmelee.


³ For the political culture of the Council of Public Instruction, see Louis-Philippe Audet, Histoire du conseil de l'instruction publique (Montréal: Editions Leméac, 1964); Ruby Heap, "L'Église, L'État, et L'Éducation au Québec, 1875-
Instruction planned to redefine its schools on the basis of grading, language, religion, and the abolition of the right to dissent, and was ready in the autumn of 1895 to prepare its Catholic and Protestant Committee legislation drafts.⁴

Although the sub-committees of the Catholic and the Protestant Committee were not synchronized, they were on the same trajectory of principal decertification. The Protestant Committee proposed the reconstitution of its Central Board of Examiners as a discretionary certification mechanism for all categories of teacher diploma, and the abolition of the certification exemption for clergy.⁵ The Catholic Committee proposed the establishment of a Catholic Central Board of Examiners which would be a certification mechanism for all teachers, and the retention of the teaching exemption for

---


⁵ Flower, "E.I. Rexford," 140; "P.C. Minutes," February 24, 1897, Sessional Papers, Quebec, 61 Victoria A.D. 1897, 354.
religieux and religieuses.  

Between 1895 and 1899 and by means of the network of authority from its sub-committee to the Cabinet, the Committee decertified rural school principals from the college to the one-room school. From the top down, Protestantism was transformed from a religious belief into a 'social gospel, approved by Committee clergy and articulated as an official course of moral instruction for all grades.' To bring common and superior schools under this version of Protestantism, the sub-committee for legislation revision appropriated a share of the authority of the Normal School Committee of the Corporation of McGill University and transferred it to the Protestant Central Board of Examiners. The Central Board took a share of the administration of the Normal School authority for elementary and model diplomas and transferred the authority for academy diplomas to the Corporation. With the separation of the academy and model diploma authorities, the model diploma was no longer valid for the clergy of the various Protestant denominations teaching in

---


7 For the ideology of the Protestant Committee, see Geneviève Jain, "Nationalism and Educational Politics in Ontario and Quebec, 1867-1914," Alf Chaiton and Neil McDonald, eds., Canadian Schools and Canadian Identity (Toronto: Gage Educational Publishing, 1977), 38-56.
schools subsidized from the Superior Education Fund or in Protestant school 'unicipalities. The sub-committee therefore delegated to Bishop's University future responsibility for the formal training of Protestant teachers for the Eastern Townships.

The Council's appropriation of the "Catholic" and the "Protestant" moral authority was particularly well-suited to the Committee sub-committee format. This moral authority was not to be subsumed in either secular, liberal progressive, reform legislation or non-sectarian moral, rural school regeneration. Invited to Protestant Committee membership, reforers gave freely of their ideas, only to see them appropriated in the sub-committee division of labour as "Protestant" policy. Protestant Committee sub-committees coordinated their resolutions with those of the P.A.P.T. Executive Committee so that the debate over 'new education' policies unfolded in the context of proposed legislation.

One month after the appointment of Rexford, Richard Heneker, Archibald Love, and William Shaw as the sub-committee on legislation revision, the PAPT Executive Committee unveiled to the convention membership its strategy for 'new education' consolidation and teacher certification.¹ As chairman of the

P.A.P.T.'s sub-committee for professional training, Rexford recommended that decentralized Protestant teacher training centres be established in Protestant school municipalities should the McGill Normal School not meet the teacher shortage in Protestant rural schools. As there had been no indication at previous P.A.P.T. conventions that the professionalization of teaching and the improvement of rural schools were incompatible, the principals of the affiliated college grant-status schools offered to expand their role in teacher training, and Sydney Fisher and John Harper presented papers on the teaching of scientific agriculture in rural schools.9

With the support of the Committee and the P.A.P.T., Parmelee publicly announced that the Committee would introduce a policy for the "consolidation of weak schools."10 At a special Protestant Committee meeting held on August 27, the sub-committee on legislation revision presented its first set of recommendations to make its schools "Protestant." It proposed the abolition of dissentient schools and of the commissioner's right to change school municipality boundaries, conscience clauses for the corporate school tax panel, and

9 Record 16(1896): 168-169.

10 G.W. Parmelee to the Editor of the Observer, Quebec, March 24, 1896, ANQQ E 13 No. 3014, Scrapbook.
Committee authority to audit school board accounts. At the same time, the sub-committee on professional training proposed the abolition of local deputy-examiners the annual Academy III examinations, the creation of government funds for Teachers' Institutes, and of the Committee right to override the autonomy of the High School of Montreal and the High School of Quebec and modify their curricula. The sub-committee recommended the abolition of the local elementary diploma (which certified the "principals" of one-room schools), of the local model diploma (which the affiliated Protestant colleges awarded to teachers with two years of the Bachelor of Arts and ten years teaching experience), and of the clergy exemption (by which incumbent clergy also taught in grammar schools).

In conjunction with these major policy changes for boards and teachers, Parmelee proposed that the Committee might, for the third time since 1882, reinterpret the right to dissent. He recommended that the Committee extend the option to establish Protestant school boards for the maintenance of graded academies and model schools to include the option to


12 G.W. Parmelee to the Editor of The Observer, Quebec, March 24, 1896, ANQQ E 13 No.3014, Scrapbook; Quebec, Sessional Papers, 61 Victoria No. 5 A.D. 1897, 332-338.

13 Flower, "E.I. Rexford," 140.
create graded consolidated schools." He offered the opinion that

...if, at the same time, the system of school administration which is now in force in the cities and towns of the Province be extended to the rural districts, all trouble will be avoided. This last named system would do away with "Dissentient" schools, and would in lieu thereof provide for two Boards, the one Roman Catholic, the other Protestant, each administering the affairs of its respective schools.

Quoting the example of New England, and echoing the Rexford of a decade earlier, he proposed that:

Under such a system, the elementary and model schools in the rural districts could be placed at the most convenient centres, and, if provision be made for the conveyance of the children to and from the schools - a system successfully carried out in portions of New England, and even (as the Committee are [sic] informed) in part of this Province - the school buildings would not only be better, but there would be a better class of teachers, and consequently more successful results, than can be expected from the present system.\(^{15}\)

In January of 1897, Premier Edmund Flynn refused the legislative changes which the Committee had so far approved. Nonetheless the Committee initiated procedures to abolish the


model diploma of St. Francis College, Richmond, Morrin College, Quebec, and Stanstead College, Stanstead, and cancel their grants from the Superior Education Fund. The members of the Protestant Central Board of Examiners resigned in protest, and were replaced with a majority which supported the grading-consolidation agenda. On May 24, when Félix-Gabriel Marchand and the Liberal Party came to power, the Committee sub-committees were still meeting, and Lynch was back on the Committee as legal counsel.

With the Liberal victory, the Committee took the position that it welcomed progressive education legislation, as long as it fully protected Protestant minority education rights. Marchand abandoned the modest reform proposals of his campaign platform, read the legislation drafts of both the Catholic and the Protestant Committees and returned their drafts to them with the addition of major revisions of his own. Throughout the summer and early fall, the Committee maintained contact with H. Thomas Duffy, rouge Liberal deputy for Brome County (Lynch's former riding) and Commissioner of

---

16 Record 18(1898), 77.
17 Record 17(1897), 86.
18 Ruby Heap has noted the importance of recognizing the role of the "English Protestant minority" at the time of Marchand's Education Bill; see Heap, "L'Église, L'État," 512-13.
19 Audet, "Le projet," 78.
Public Works, as if Duffy were its representative in the Marchand Cabinet. 20

On November 19, Pope Leo XIII gave his blessing to Marchand's Education Bill and the Lieutenant-Governor's Speech from the Throne. When the Speech was in the public realm, Archbishop Bruchési challenged Marchand and J.-Adolphe Chapleau, the Lieutenant-Governor, to withdraw it. On the basis that a withdrawal would split the Cabinet and alarm the Protestant minority, the Premier and the Lieutenant-Governor refused to do so. 21 Using the excuse of "pending government legislation," and with the approval of the Corporation of McGill University, the Committee cancelled the grants of the St. Francis, Stanstead, and Morrin. 22

The Education Bill was read on December 13 and from December 21, 1897, to January 3, 1898; it was in comité général from January 3 to January 5. The third reading and

20 "PC Minutes," Quebec, September 23, 1897, Record, 18(1898): 22. For a historical sketch of Duffy, see Marie-Paule LaBrèque, Dictionary of Canadian Biography (forthcoming).

21 Audet, "Le projet," 84.

vote took place on January 5; the Bill passed in the Assembly by a vote of forty-eight to nineteen, went to the Legislative Council on January 8, failed in a straight party vote of thirteen Conservatives to nine Liberals, with the members of the English Protestant minority and French Catholic majority on both sides of the vote. Two and one half months later, Premier Marchand was forced to approve, by Cabinet Order-in-Council, the Regulations of the Protestant Committee which had been in the planning since September of 1895. The move pushed the Corporation of St. Francis College to give the College buildings and grounds to the Protestant Commissioners of Richmond. Led by School Commissioner, J.C. Sutherland, and Inspector R.H. Hewton, the Commissioners upgraded their model school to academy status, and consolidated one district school with the academy in a graded system. Morrin College closed, and Bishop's University was forced to offer lectures on

23 At least two deputies did not think that there was time to absorb all the clauses of the Bill; Quebec, Débats de l'Assemblée législative, 9e Législature, 1ère Session, 1897-1898, 258-69.

24 Heap, "L'Éducation au Québec," 480.

25 Record 18(1898), 120-121.

26 Healy, "St. Francis," 111-118; Record 18(1898), 11; "The Future of St. Francis College," Richmond Guardian, March 18, 1898, ANQQ E 13 No. 3014, Scrapbook [of newspaper clippings on educational topics, 1883-1906] probably the collection of Elson Rexford and/or George Parmelee.
pedagogy. Still not satisfied, Parmelee "expressed a regret that many important and useful amendments...should...have shared the fate of the parts which caused opposition." He singled out "the clause which empowered school boards to amalgamate weak schools and provide for the conveyance of the remoter pupils at the general expense," as in "many of the New England States, notably in Massachusetts, [where] this plan has passed through the experimental stage." Fortified by its new legislative powers and with its right to the Order-in-Council intact, the Committee prepared enabling legislation for the consolidation of school districts and the transportation of pupils to a distance of five miles by Protestant boards. The passage of Protestant board enabling consolidation legislation along with the major teacher certification changes intensified Committee 'educationist' campaigns and Teachers' Institutes (See Figure 1).

FIGURE 1 - Campaigns, Funded Superior Schools, Town or Township Consolidation Points, 1899.

Key: * Graded Secondary School

Campaign Superior School Point(s)

27 "Pedagogy at Bishop's College," Sherbrooke Examiner, May 18, 1899, ANQQ E13 No. 3014, Scrapbook.

28 Record, 18(1898), 10.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>School Name</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>School Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cleveland</td>
<td>St. Francis College*</td>
<td>Richmond</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Danville</td>
<td>Danville Academy</td>
<td>Shipton</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Durham</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Durham</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inverness/Leeds</td>
<td>Inverness Academy</td>
<td>Inverness</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lennoxbville</td>
<td>Lennoxbville Academy</td>
<td>Ascot</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stanstead</td>
<td>Stanstead College</td>
<td>Stanstead</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barnston Heights</td>
<td>Barnston Model School</td>
<td>Barnston</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sutton Village</td>
<td>Sutton Academy</td>
<td>Sutton</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shefford</td>
<td>Waterloo Academy*</td>
<td>Waterloo</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brome</td>
<td>Knowlton Academy</td>
<td>Brome</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa County</td>
<td>Aylmer; Buckingham</td>
<td>8 districts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Report of the Superintendent of Public Instruction, 1899-1900, 55-105.

As a foil for existing academies and model schools, 'educationists' sought alternate sites for consolidation points in the same townships. At the same time, the Committee regulated against the entry of one-room school pupils into model schools to write academy grade examinations. It implemented an entrance examination for one-room school pupils who wished to enter Model Grade I of model schools;\footnote{30 See "A Leaving Examination for the Elementary Schools," Sherbrooke Daily Record, Tuesday, October 11, 1901.} eliminated the overlap between Elementary Grade IV and Model Grade I;\footnote{31 For the link between the elementary school leaving examination and one-room school teacher stress, see David C. Jones, "Creating Rural-minded Teachers," Jones, Nancy M. Sheehan, and Robert M. Stamp, eds., Shaping the Schools of the West (Calgary: Detselig Enterprises, 1979), 163.} enforced the ninety day attendance regulation for pupils sitting the school leaving examinations and separated the Official Course of Study into three parts, elementary,
model, and academy;³² required teachers to report the average ages of each of their grades;³³ and redefined the veto against women principals of academies.³⁴

Despite a decade of campaigns, institutes, and regulations, model school principals managed to connect their pupils with the written examination, school leaving, process. Of the forty-seven schools with at least one pupil in Academy II and/or Academy III, seventeen employed principals with first class academy or model diplomas from the McGill Normal School, and twenty-five had hired principals with Protestant Central Board model diplomas. If we look at the average academy grade ages of these schools at a time when age-grading policy was partly diffused and aggressively enforced, we may suppose that the eight year graded curriculum did not connect with actual pupil enrolments. In 1899, while three of thirty-seven model schools had the staffs of three teachers which entitled them to provide Academy II and III, the remainder had staffs of two teachers which officially confined them to Model


³³ ANQQ E 13, Ledger of Enrolments for Protestant Academies and Model Schools, 1896-1926.

³⁴ Report, 1898-1899, 404.
III (the equivalent of Academy I). Yet all schools save one had Academy II enrolments, and nearly one fifth, Academy III enrolments. The average ages of Model III pupils added up to 585.8 years and Academy II, to 618.4 years, with a sizeable drop to 134.8 years for Academy III.  

A persistence of model school enrolments in Academy I and II suggests a persistence in the supply of candidates for the elementary and the model diploma, although extensive research should be undertaken in order to have a fuller understanding of the devaluation of model school status and the model school principalship. What regenerators saw when they described rural schools that worked was pupils who entered model schools at any level, and model school principals with model and academy diplomas, the majority of whom were women, who stimulated their pupils to go beyond the formal constraints of the curriculum. Unless the Normal School administration and Central Board were reconstituted, the number of women model school principals would increase,

35 ANQQ E 13 No. 17, Ledger of Enrolments of Protestant Academies and Model Schools, 1899-1900.

36 See, comparatively, Heap, "L'enseignement primaire," 482.

and any policy for one room and superior schools which stabilized regional pupil and teacher training networks would legitimate the model school status quo.

When Sir William Macdonald and James Robertson introduced such a plan on a Canadian national scale, the Protestant Committee-P.A.P.T. grading-consolidation faction treated Robertson's initiatives in Quebec with its usual containment strategy. Since Fisher's paper on the teaching of secondary school agriculture at the 1895 P.A.P.T. convention, Robertson and Fisher had travelled together to Britain as officials representatives of the federal Department of Agriculture, were connected through Fisher's social background to an international network of rural school reformers, and had observed the English version of the "New Education" for public schools - manual training courses segregated by gender, elementary courses in nature study and

school gardens.\textsuperscript{39} As former Principal of Ontario Agricultural College and as a man who had experienced personal farm bankruptcy,\textsuperscript{40} Robertson had been appointed Dominion Dairy Commissioner and Principal of the Experimental Farm, Ottawa. He lived at the Farm until 1896, when he moved to Theodore Street.\textsuperscript{41} Although he had little formal education, he was often addressed as Professor and performed well in front of his audience.

Robertson was disillusioned with the professionalization of agriculture and wanted to bring back the family farm and the open country school. He envisaged the establishment of "Local, Provincial, and Dominion Development Authorities" to intervene between the state and the citizen, and of "object lesson" teaching as the way to regenerate rural education.\textsuperscript{42} In discussions with William Macdonald, Canadian

\begin{footnotes}
\textsuperscript{39} Sydney Fisher to Mr. and Mrs. Arthur Fisher and Miss Suzanna Corse, London, England, July 15, 1898, letter in the possession of Mr. Edward Fisher and part of a collection recently deposited in the National Archives of Canada.


\textsuperscript{41} Ottawa City Directory, 1895-1896, 401; 1896-1897, 358.

\textsuperscript{42} I acknowledge with gratitude access to the notes of the late Douglas Lawr, through Robert Gidney and W.P.J. Millar, or the citation on "Development Authorities," handwritten notes, James Robertson, University of British Columbia Archives; Sutherland, English Canadian Society, Ontario Agricultural College, Report, 1904, 161.
\end{footnotes}
tobacco magnate and philanthropist, about Robertson's seed-growing contests for Canadian pupils, Fisher and Robertson learned of Macdonald's intent to create an independent pan-English Canadian system of agricultural schools and colleges. Although Macdonald and William Peterson, Principal of McGill University, were neighbours and friends, Macdonald supported Quebec Protestant school municipalities in the larger and rural regenerative context.  

When Robertson and Fisher chose, and Macdonald endowed, their sites for manual training schools in Quebec, their first choices were Protestant academies and model schools rather than elementary or one-room schools. Since Fisher had few chances for Liberal Party patronage in the Eastern Townships, he chose schools in the judicial district of Bedford, his home constituency, and schools in Montreal, his national political base. Knowlton Academy was within

---

See Snell, Macdonald College, 36, for the conversation between Macdonald and Robertson. Robertson and Fisher had travelled together on Department of Agriculture business; see Fisher, July 15, 1898.


For the context of Fisher's limited political influence in Quebec, see Blair Meatby, Laurier and a Liberal Quebec: A Study in Political Management (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1961); Ron Rudin, The Forgotten Quebecers:
several miles of Fisher's own Alva Farm in Brome Township, Waterloo Academy, in Shefford County, and Bedford Academy, in Missisquoi County. Westmount Academy and Aberdeen [Elementary] School were, respectively, in the Montreal suburbs of Westmount (Cote St. Antoine) and Coteau St. Pierre (Montreal West). The Boys' Model School and the Girls' Model School were the practice schools of the McGill Normal School.⁴⁶

No two schools were alike. Knowlton Academy maintained a department for French pupils along with its English elementary, model and academy departments, and its principal, Levi Moore, taught manual training and gymnastics, classes, and planted a school garden.⁴⁷ Waterloo Academy was a graded academy for the Protestant pupils of the town of Waterloo, where the Principal, James Mabon, had been implicated in an examination cheating scandal and had not implemented the Macdonald courses.⁴⁸ Bedford Academy was a public graded high school, no substitute for Hobart Butler's

---

⁴⁶ See the feature article on manual training in Protestant schools, Montreal Daily Star, Saturday, January 11, 1902.


private Academy of the pre-1888 regulations. Aberdeen Model School and Westmount Academy were located on the fine line between farmland and developing suburb.  

During the Dominion Educational Association (D.E.A.) meetings held in Ottawa from August 14-16, 1901, Robertson presented his English Canadian national scheme of school gardening, nature study, domestic science, consolidated schools, and alternative methods of teacher training. He, like Fisher before him, had no reason to believe that rural school reform and teacher professionalization were contradictory, since the meetings also heard proposals for the establishment of a Canadian Bureau of Education. He moved to fashionable Wilbrod Street, commuted between Ottawa and Charlottetown, Prince Edward Island, and left Fisher to implement his Quebec agenda. When Parmelee and Rexford learned of Robertson's speech to the D.E.A., Parmelee invited Fisher to join him in a round of 'educationist' meetings in


50 Dominion Educational Association, Proceedings, Ottawa, August 14-16, 1901, 19-23, 83-93; Sutherland, English Canadian Society, 183, 296n4.


the Eastern Townships. When Fisher publicly endorsed the Committee's consolidation policies, he was invited to join the Committee, attended his first meeting on October 4, and was immediately voted down on the question of direct subsidies to rural schools.  

Early in 1902, in Toronto, Macdonald announced the beginning of the school garden and rural teacher training phases of his pan-English Canadian rural regeneration scheme. As he explained in Quebec at the Aberdeen School, "the improvement of education [was] a matter of universal, national, and personal concern," and "men who [could] do things [were] wanted in Canada" to accomplish that end. Forced to acknowledge the presence of Robertson in Protestant schools, the Committee admitted officially that there was a Quebec Protestant "rural school problem," and announced "unofficially" that Macdonald would finance, and Robertson introduce to Quebec, "an object lesson based on the amalgamation [consolidation] plan" for the next school year.  

---

53 D.E.A., Proceedings, 1901, 397; Record 41(1921), 100; Record 21(1901), 298.

54 "PC Minutes," October 4, 1901, Record 21(1901), 298.

55 Montreal Daily Star, Saturday, February 1, 1902, ANQQ E 13 No. 3014, Scrapbook.

To help Robertson choose a site for the Quebec Macdonald consolidated school, Principal Peterson organized, and Macdonald financed, a survey of Protestant schools. Peterson engaged John Adams, Rector of the Free Church Training College, Glasgow, Scotland, to visit the schools and interview teachers, inspectors, and commissioners. Adams visited his first school on April 23 and, as his visits continued through the month of May, was favourably impressed with the women teachers of model schools and academies, less impressed with the men principals, and found that some schools would prefer to avoid all contact with the Protestant Committee. On May 30, partway through his schedule, Adams was invited to attend a regular Protestant Committee session. There he heard, for the first time, that the Committee had authorized an inquiry of its own, into the inspection procedures of John Harper, Inspector for Protestant Superior Schools. Adams completed his survey by the end of June; and William Shurtleff, chairman of the Committee's survey, visited

---


58 Adams, Protestant School System, 28-29, 66-70, 75-76; 80-84, 92.

59 Report, 1901-1902, 419.
his first school on August sixth.\textsuperscript{60} 

Despite the fact that "a conference of mothers would not have arrived at such a decision," a conference of Protestant elementary school inspectors endorsed a policy for the consolidation of Quebec Protestant rural schools.\textsuperscript{61} Robertson announced that the Pownal district in Prince Edward Island; Middleton, Nova Scotia; and Kingston, New Brunswick, were considering Macdonald consolidated schools.\textsuperscript{62} He also distributed school garden grants in Quebec to schools which Fisher chose - Knowlton Academy, West Brome (District No. 1) and Iron Hill (District No. 8), in Brome Township, and Georgeville School, in Magog Township, Stanstead County. Robertson hired former model school principal, George Fuller, as Macdonald nature study demonstrator.\textsuperscript{63} 

Between August 6 and September 19, Shurtleff conducted sixty interviews in Protestant school municipalities on the

\textsuperscript{60} Quebec, D\'{e}bats, 1903, 203.

\textsuperscript{61} Gleaner, Huntingdon, July 24, 1902.

\textsuperscript{62} Gazette, Montreal, Thursday, August 28, 1902; The Outlook, Middleton, Nova Scotia, Friday, September 4, 1902.

\textsuperscript{63} Brome County Historical Society, Fisher Trust Fund, Annual Report, 1933-34, 143. See also David C. Jones, "The Strategy of Rural Enlightenment: Consolidation in Chilliwack, B.C.," Jones, Nancy M. Sheehan, Robert M. Stamp, eds., Shaping the Schools of the Canadian West (Calgary: Detselig, 1979), 151.
inspectorate of John Harper.64 Although these interviews, with the exception of three, were favourable to Harper, Shurtleff's report recommended the abolition of the Office of Protestant Inspector of Superior Schools and the placing of the model schools under the supervision of the elementary school inspectors. The report was released to the press, tabled in Committee, and sent to Harper.65

Although Adams had noted several cases of the existence of tension between the Committee and the municipalities, the Committee read the report as a validation of the policies of age-grading and consolidation.66 Parmelee asked Robertson to join him at a second congress of inspectors, and asked the inspector to compile a list of schools which might serve as consolidation points.67 He placed the academy principals' letters which were critical of Harper inspection methods in the hands of a sub-committee on

64 "Educational Matters," Quebec Chronicle, September 30, 1902, ANQQ E 13 No. 3014.


66 Montreal Daily Star, October 2, 1902, ANQQ E 13 No. 3014, Scrapbook.

67 "PC Minutes," September 26, 1902," Report, 1902-1903, 379; James Robertson, "Consolidation of Schools," Extracts from an address on 'Education for the Improvement of Agriculture,' Record 23(1903), 205-211.
"office assistance" composed of Rexford, Shurtleff, and Shaw, and tabled the report of Committee member and McGill Normal School Professor of Mathematics, A. W. Kneeland, a report which showed that 113 teachers in model schools and academies had neither normal school nor Central Board diplomas. In the mean time, the entrance examination tested the survival skills of boards, principals, and pupils.

On December 17, Robertson visited Kingsville Consolidated School, Gustavus Township, the school which had set the precedent for state school consolidation-pupil transportation legislation and served as a model for American consolidation promoters. In January of 1903, Rexford

---


released the Shurtleff report to the press and moved the abolition of the office of Inspector of Protestant Superior Schools. He then argued that the dismissal of an inspector of the Department of Public Instruction was a Government responsibility and handed the dossier to William Weir, Liberal deputy for Argenteuil County and Minister without portfolio in the Government of Simon-Napoléon Parent.

While Weir defended the interests of Protestant "country" teachers and academies in the Legislative Assembly and held the Committee and the McGill Normal School responsible for the rural school teacher shortage, Robertson made a quick trip to Ormstown Academy, in the Chateauguay Valley, with a proposal for a Macdonald Consolidated School.¹

Unannounced in Quebec, he visited the Protestant schools in the village of Ormstown and the parish of Ste. Malachie and, a week later, offered the Academy board (formerly the board of District Number Two in the parish) and the parish municipality's twelve schools a Macdonald consolidation-pupil

---

transportation grant.\textsuperscript{72}

As Dominion Dairy Commissioner, Robertson was familiar with Ormstown, a centre of dairying and pomology close to Montreal markets.\textsuperscript{73} Ormstown Academy, promoted from model school status in 1896, had viable enrolments in the elementary, model, and academy departments, and a staff of a man principal with an academy diploma from the Central Board and three women teachers.\textsuperscript{74} As far as Robertson was concerned, the Ormstown consolidation would be one of "the informing anterooms to the wheat-field, the orchard, the wood-lot and the dairy....becoming national object lessons."\textsuperscript{75} The Committee learned of Robertson's plans for Ormstown when he announced them publicly in Ottawa. Called before the hearings of the Committee on Colonization and Agriculture on the "Macdonald

\textsuperscript{72} Kerr, "Proposed Macdonald."

\textsuperscript{73} Yves Otis, "La différenciation des producteurs laitiers et le marché de Montréal (1900–1930)," Revue d'histoire de l'Amérique française, 45, 1(été 1991): 56.

\textsuperscript{74} A.W. Lang, "Ormstown Academy," Teachers' Magazine, 10, 43(September 1928), 17–18; "Protestant Superior Education" Report, 1902–1903, 1902–1903, 276–77; "Directory of Superior Schools," Record 22(1902), 342.

funds for manual training and the improvement of rural schools," Robertson described his visit to Ohio and voiced his belief "as a private citizen" that "in ten years after the Macdonald object lessons have been given, [they would] have over 1,000 consolidated rural schools in Canada." He announced the locations of Brome County (sic) as well as Ormstown, Woodstock as well as Kingston, New Brunswick, the environs of Truro as well as Middleton, Nova Scotia, and Hazelbrook as well as the environs of Kensington, Prince Edward Island. With Robertson in Ottawa and his consolidation project gaining credibility, the Committee replied that "the people would not consent to the scheme [of consolidation] at all, local prejudices being too strong," and that Parmelee "had recently been told in Boston that it took quite a long time in Massachusetts before the scheme could be introduced."

At the same time, the Government obliged Parmelee by announcing that it would send a delegation to France to study French methods of manual and technical training, and that it

---

76 Robertson, Macdonald Funds, 35-37.

77 Robertson, Macdonald Funds, 35. See also Iles, "Farmers’ Children;" "The Most Direct Way to Build up a People," World's Work 6, 1 (May 1903), 3386-87.

78 Montreal Daily Star, Montreal, Friday, May 7, 1903.
would not renew the Macdonald manual training subsidies. To persuade Macdonald to place his proposed College of Agriculture under the control of McGill University and to invest in a new School for Teachers under the control of the Protestant Committee, Rexford enlisted Principal Peterson as an ally. With Peterson's support, Parmelee tabled Professor Kneeland's report on the diploma-granting record of McGill Normal School, and persuaded Kneeland to reverse his position and table a motion for the establishment of a Committee teacher permit. The Committee then asked for, and received, the resignation of Inspector of Protestant Superior Schools Harper and the firing of the principals who had complained about him.

By the fall of 1903, the Maritime Provinces and Ontario's Macdonald manual training centres were in place; one Macdonald Consolidated School had opened at Middleton, and another at Kingston. A Macdonald Consolidated School, in a suburb of Guelph near the Macdonald (Teacher Training) Institute and the Ontario Agricultural College, was all but

---


82 Sutherland, English Canadian Society, 187-193; Outlook.
officially opened, as was the Hillsborough Consolidated School outside Charlottetown. Teachers' and agricultural colleges which cut across the professions were projected for Quebec and these four provinces. However, in Fisher's backyard, the Townships of Brome and Bolton, Demonstrator Fuller's position as Macdonald's employee was regularly compromised by Committee 'educationists.' When Thomas Duffy died in office, Chairman Dr. Shaw snubbed Robertson by inviting Macdonald to join the Committee, which in turn placed Macdonald in the position of having to refuse the invitation. Principal Peterson invited Professor George H. Locke of the University of Chicago to make an assessment of the McGill Normal School buildings as an inducement to Macdonald to fund a new normal school facility for McGill.

Using the ultimate weapon, the Cabinet Order-in-

---


84 Montreal Star, Saturday, January 11, 1902, ANQQ E 13 No. 3014, Scrapbook; University of British Columbia Archives, James Robertson papers, included in the papers of the late Douglas Lawr.

85 Sherbrooke Daily Record, Thursday, October 3, 1903.


Council, Parmelee delayed the Ormstown project for five months. He asked Premier Parent for a modification in Quebec school law which would make of each and every model school and academy a school district. This change - passed by the Legislative Assembly as 4 Edward VII c.18 s.2 - meant that the proposed Ormstown consolidation waited from December, 1903, to May, 1904, until the pupils of Ormstown-Ste. Malachie were tested as ready to enter the Academy.88 E.S. Rivard, the new Principal of the Academy, James MacGregor, Inspector of Beauharnois and Huntingdon Counties, and his son, J.A. MacGregor, teacher at King's School, Westmount, included Ste. Malachie d'Ormstown in their Teachers' Institutes, and set an entrance examination for districts 1, 3, 4, 5, 7, 9, 10, 11.89

On May 20, 1904, the teacher permit motion was put to a vote. While Rexford, Fisher, and Peterson voted against the motion, and deprived the districts of an instant teacher supply,90 Robertson returned to Ormstown and districts with the specifics of the Macdonald Consolidated School offer. At

---

88 "PC Minutes," February 26, 1904, Report, 1903-1904, 395; A.W. Lang, "Ormstown Academy," Teachers' Magazine 18; Kerr, "Proposed Consolidation." At least one ratepayer blamed Robertson for the classroom reorganization; see Gleaner, Huntingdon, Thursday, August 18, 1904.


90 "PC Minutes," May 20, 1904, Report, 1903-1904, 401; Waterloo Advertiser, Friday, March 25, 1904.
a meeting on July 14 and with Parmelee in official attendance, Robertson presented the Macdonald gift to the village municipality. He announced that if the commissioners of the village of Ormstown would repair, at a cost of $1000, the foundation of Ormstown Academy, Macdonald would provide between $6000 and $7000 for a large addition to the building; three years of payment of the maintenance expenditures above annual school tax revenues; funds "to furnish vans, to haul scholars, and build suitable shed accommodations for the teams;" a fenced-in garden; and a staff of seven teachers.\footnote{Gleaner, Huntingdon, Thursday, July 14, 1904; Kerr, "Proposed Consolidation." See, comparatively, Lewis, "Macdonald Consolidated School."}

On July 28, the village and parish boards signed a contract for the consolidated school, and purchased two adjacent acres for the consolidated school playground.\footnote{Gleaner, Huntingdon, July 28, 1904.} Once Robertson and the Board had included every district in their plan, the Committee declared that Districts No.6, No.7 and No.11 were beyond the legal size permitted to school municipalities.\footnote{Quebec, Statutes, 1899, 62 V. ch.28 s.116, 118; Montreal Daily Witness, March 1, 1906, ANQO E 13 No. 3014, Scrapbook.} On August 27, a detailed tax plan, based upon the average annual evaluation over three years, was worked out for each district inside, and outside, of the
proposed consolidation. Seven districts were to maintain a truncated consolidation guaranteed by three years only of Macdonald money; Districts 6, 7, and 11 were left as isolated graded schools.\footnote{Gleaner, Huntingdon, Thursday, July 28, 1904.}  

Meanwhile, in the district of Saint Francis, J.C. Sutherland, Commissioner of the Richmond Board, and R.H. Hewton, Inspector for the Protestant schools of Sherbrooke, Richmond, and Wolfe, had encouraged Protestant Dissentient Trustees, Wilson Wadliegh and John Moore of the Mixed (Catholic and Protestant) Board of Kingsey Township, to separate from the Kingsey board.\footnote{Clifford J. Moore, "The evolution of Protestant education in Kingsey Township," Sherbrooke Record, June 10, 1988; Clifford Moore, Ormstown, to Anne Drummond, June 29, 1991, July 28, 1991, January 4, 1992.} To form a consolidation of the Protestant ratepayers of Kingsey Township and attract Macdonald funding, Moore and Wadliegh asked the "French" commissioners for the "English" share of annual school tax revenues. When they could not convince their fellow board members to release the "English" revenues, Wadliegh resigned and Moore led a group of Protestant ratepayers into a model school consolidation.\footnote{Sherbrooke Daily Record, Monday, May 1, 1905.}  

During the delay in the Ormstown negotiations, Macdonald bought up a number of properties as the site for his
School of Agriculture. These included the prize-winning farm of the Montreal businessman, Robert Reford in the parish of Ste Anne-du-Bout-de-l'Isle and other properties in the Town of Ste Anne-de-Bellevue. Although under pressure from Principal Peterson to affiliate his proposed college with McGill University, Macdonald maintained that "This college [was] a personal affair of [his] own" and that he could not "see of what earthly interest it [was] to the newspapers." Five weeks later, he announced that he would build his School on the Ste. Anne's lands, and that Robertson would leave the position of Dominion Dairy Commissioner to serve as its Principal.

At the end of January, the Ormstown and Ste. Malachie boards agreed on principle to unite for the purpose of forming a consolidation, and on February 13, obtained a vote of confidence from the ratepayers of 164 to 45 votes. On February 24, however, the Committee went into negotiations with Macdonald to persuade him to build a School for Teachers at Ste Anne instead of a Macdonald Consolidated School at

---

97 Snell, Macdonald College, 166; Sherbrooke Daily Record, Friday, September 30, 1904; Monday, November 21, 1904.

98 Montreal Daily Star, Saturday, November 26, 1904.

Ormstown. On March 13, at a Special Session of the Committee held at the McGill Normal School, two sub-committees were struck to meet separately with Macdonald "or his representatives" (i.e. Robertson) - a sub-committee of Reverend Shaw, Principal Peterson, Principal Robins, and Messrs Fisher, McCorkill, and Ames, to study the logistics of the proposed transfer of the McGill Normal School to the Ste. Anne property; and a sub-committee of Shaw, Peterson, Ames, Rexford, and Shurtleff, to study "teacher training and the Macdonald benefaction." Only Shaw, Peterson, Ames, and Rexford, were party to the business of both sub-committees. 

Invited to Committee membership, Robertson chaired a sub-committee which dealt specifically with consolidation policy and with the hiring of a "thoroughly trained and competent male teacher [for] the head of every consolidated school." The fourth section of the agenda, approved on the spot, regulated that model school principals required the permission of the Committee and the approval of the Inspector of Superior Schools to teach academy grade work, that such

100 "PC Minutes," February 24, 1905; March 13, 1905, Report, 1904-1905, 441-49; "Digest of Statements and Proceedings from February 24, 1905, to October 17, 1905, concerning proposals to merge the McGill Normal School with the Macdonald College at Ste Anne-de-Bellevue," William Peterson Papers, MUA RG2 C27. See also Montreal Daily Star, Monday, February 27, 1905; Flower, "E.I. Rexford," 141.

academy grade work would have no value "for [grant] ranking purposes."

On the day of the Special Session, Edwin Booker, a temperance advocate and Member of the Grange, and a parent and ratepayer of District Number Eleven of the Protestant school municipality of Ste. Malachie, initiated a lawsuit against the municipalities of Ormstown and Ste. Malachie. On March 16, Macdonald announced publicly that he would build a "Macdonald Teacher Training College" on the Ste. Anne farm site. At Kingsey, at the School Commissioners' meetings on April 15 and 22, the 'three French members' of the board refused to release the 'English' share of taxes to the English-speaking members. Wadliegh resigned as commissioner and Moore led a number of Protestant ratepayers into a Protestant consolidation. In September of 1905, the Kingsey Model Consolidated School opened; by mid-October, the families at the edge of the five mile transportation limit had served a lawsuit on the


104 Gleaner, Huntingdon, March 16, 1905.

105 Gleaner, Huntingdon, Thursday, March 16, 1905; Thursday, March 23, 1905; Sherbrooke Daily Record, Monday, April 28, 1905.
consolidated board. On May 6, the sub-committee "re the Macdonald benefactions" recommended that the Protestant Committee take administrative authority for the School for Teachers under a provincial charter if such a move were "satisfactory to the Government and to the members of the Legislature and if the Protestant minority approve." The Committee insisted that "negotiations with Dr. Robertson, as representing the benefactor, [were] being harmoniously conducted," even though Macdonald refused to affiliate his college project with McGill University or give in to its demands.

Conclusion

The failure of the first Marchand Education Act led to regressive legislation. The second Act decapitated the schools managed by Protestant commissioners and trustees and/or subsidized by the Superior Education Fund so that they would conform to the credentials of a small number of career

106 Sherbrooke Daily Record, Wednesday, October 18, 1905; Moore, "Evolution."

107 "PC Minutes," September 29, 1905, Record 25(1905), 267-68.


principals. The combination of men and women principals with model diplomas from the Protestant Central Board of Examiners and women graduates of academies from the McGill Normal School provided a qualified workforce for Protestant boards. These teachers were the base upon which Macdonald, Fisher and Robertson planned their rural school scheme.
CHAPTER FOUR

THROWING AWAY THE KEY: THE DECERTIFICATION
OF PRINCIPALS, 1905 - 1926.
CHAPTER FOUR
THROWING AWAY THE KEY: THE DECERTIFICATION
OF PRINCIPALS, PART TWO, 1906 - 1926.

An aimless conservatism directs construction of curricula and classroom methods.¹

Between 1906 and 1926, the Protestant Committee of the Council of Public Instruction brought the full force of its regulatory authority to bear on the parents, ratepayers, and teachers in Protestant municipalities. It asked the municipalities to unite as an identifiable ethnic group - English-speaking Protestants - behind the Committee's consolidation agenda while it reserved for itself - the professional education administration - the right to discipline those teachers and commissioners who questioned its own ethnic loyalties.²

Sir William Macdonald and James Robertson lost their war of nerves with the Committee in 1907. Since their first interventions in rural education, Macdonald had planned to build a School of Agriculture which was not subject to the

¹ Teachers' Magazine, 5, 5(September 1923): 8.

² See, for example, the headline, "Educationists at Inverness: Declare that Question is a National and not a Political One," Montreal Daily Witness, Saturday, August 18, 1906, McGill University Archives, George Parmelee Papers, MG 4111 C1, Box 1737.
Corporation of McGill University, and Robertson had conceptualized a teacher training scheme which was independent of Committee regulation. Yet the School for Teachers which opened on the campus of the Macdonald College of Agriculture had not materialized until after the Committee had obtained the regulations by which to control the supply of teachers for each rank of Protestant school. As a consequence, students of the School for Teachers learned domestic science and the nine year graded curriculum of Protestant elementary and intermediate schools in the rural setting of the Montreal suburb of Ste Anne-de-Bellevue, while in the "real" country, teachers and pupils experienced harsh and disorienting adjustments to graded and consolidated classes.

Between 1906 and 1926, the Committee promoted secondary education on the industrial development model of the

---

3 Stanley Frost, "Education at McGill," McGilliana, 10(March 1981), 4. I am indebted to Bob Gidney and Wyn Millar for access to the notes of the late Douglas Lawr; Lawr located Robertson's scheme for a rural district council level of government.

administrations of Lomer Gouin.\textsuperscript{5} Grants and bonus grants for consolidated schools reinforced the investments of corporations in new intermediate and high schools and those of the Catholic teaching orders in independent subsidized schools.\textsuperscript{6} Each grant and each bonus grant for graded secondary schools was a double blow to the academies and intermediate schools which sustained township networks of one-room schools.\textsuperscript{7} While new graded high and intermediate schools were


readily funded and constituted as separate school municipalities, township academy and intermediate school boards were required to restructure their connections with one-room schools and themselves pay the costs of restructuring.

As Committee member and in conjunction with his own election campaigns, Sydney Fisher, Minister of Agriculture in the Government of Wilfrid Laurier and Member for Brome County, sponsored Protestant Committee 'educationist' visits to Protestant school municipalities between 1906 and 1913. After 1913, Fisher lost hope in re-election and faith in Committee policies. The campaign leadership shifted to Victor Morrill, owner of the Sherbrooke Daily Record. Infused with post-World War One English Canadian "character education" ideology, the Committee's grading and consolidation agenda took on a second life. In the name of post-war, English-Canadian spiritual regeneration, campaigners asked the Protestant rural municipalities, the targets of their visits,

---

1 George Flower, "A Study of the Contributions of E.I. Rexford," M.A. Thesis, McGill University, 1949, 135-136, naming campaigns in 1906, 1912-1913, 1919, 1926 and citing Record, 41(1921): 100. As the Protestant Committee had no funds for full-fledged campaigns, one can only speculate at this stage of the research that Fisher absorbed campaign expenses. For the federal-provincial perspective, see H. Blair Neatby, Laurier and a Liberal Quebec: A Study in Political Management (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1961).
to mitigate grading's worst effects.  

Between 1922 and 1926, the Committee again restructured its teacher credentials, rural elementary school course, and inspectoral districts, but required the administration of Premier Louis-Alexandre Taschereau to cover board indebtedness and increase government subsidies to graded secondary and graded secondary consolidated schools by more than double the disbursements of 1919.  

A new generation of teachers barely remembered the one-room or the model school and embraced the automobile and the motorized bus as alternatives.  

In the contexts of consolidation and motorized transportation, Fisher's solution for the Protestant one-room

---

9 Kathleen Weiler "Women and Rural School: California 1900-1940," History of Education Quarterly, 34, 1(Spring 1994): 25-48. The texts of the American administrative progressive, Ellwood Patterson Cubberley, stated explicitly that, from the 1880s, consolidation, grading, and transportation policies should eliminate jobs in one-room schools; see Cubberley, The Certification of Teachers (1906); Rural Life and Education: A Study of the Rural-School Problem as a Phase of the Rural-Life Problem (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1914), 91.

10 Record 44(1924), 82.

11 Conversations, 1985-1994, with Marion Phelps, Curator of the Brome County Historical Society, former pupil in the 1920s of South Stukely district school and Waterloo Academy, and former teacher of Cowansville High School. See also, Christopher Manning, "The Impact of Technology on the Eastern Townships of Quebec during the 1920s," M.A. Thesis, Bishop's University, 1990; Yesterdays of Brome County, Volume 8 (Knowlton, Quebec, Canada: Brome County Historical Society, 1991), 59.
schools of Brome County was a trust fund which provided the financial and moral means to their preservation.\footnote{12}

The teacher permit

After 1895, the Committee expected intermediate school principals to relinquish the right to teach the academy grades if their boards failed to demonstrate their intent to upgrade and hire a minimum of three certificated teachers. However, despite the implementation of an entrance examination between Elementary Grade IV and Intermediate Grade I and rigid separations between elementary schools, intermediate schools, and academies, approximately one third of principals in 1904-1905 were teachers with model school diplomas who taught the academy grades.\footnote{13}

These certificated principals were the "tip of the iceberg" of trained teachers in rural schools.\footnote{14} There was a supply of teachers which Protestant boards could not tap


\footnote{13} Flower, "E.I. Rexford," 155.

because it represented the formerly credentialed who did not limit teaching to age-graded textbook instruction. Of fifty-two to fifty-six intermediate schools reporting in 1903-1904 and 1904-1905, twenty-one enrolled pupils in Academy Grade I, II, or III (See Figure 1). Nine principals were women teachers certified to teach the elementary and intermediate grades and two were men teachers who were formerly principals of academies. Three were women teachers with academy diplomas who were not officially allowed to teach the academy grades because they were women, and because they taught at intermediate schools where boards had each hired only one assistant teacher.

FIGURE 1—Model (Intermediate) Schools, County, Township, Diploma and Gender of Principal, 1903-1905

Key: A, M = Academy, Model Diploma; N = No Report

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model School</th>
<th>County</th>
<th>Township</th>
<th>Diploma</th>
<th>Gender</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Barnston</td>
<td>Stanstead</td>
<td>Barnston</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beebe Plain</td>
<td>Stanstead</td>
<td>Stanstead</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clarenceville</td>
<td>Missisquoi</td>
<td>St.George</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compton</td>
<td>Compton</td>
<td>Compton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cox</td>
<td>Bonaventure</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ulverton</td>
<td>Drummond</td>
<td>Durham</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dudswell</td>
<td>Wolfe</td>
<td>Dudswell</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preligshburg</td>
<td>Missisquoi</td>
<td>St.Armand</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaspé</td>
<td>Gaspé</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hemmingford</td>
<td>Huntingdon</td>
<td>Hemmingford</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kinnears Mills</td>
<td>Megantic</td>
<td>Leeds</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leeds South</td>
<td>Megantic</td>
<td>Lingwick</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gould</td>
<td>Compton</td>
<td>Potton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mansonville</td>
<td>Brome</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Carlisle</td>
<td>Bonaventure</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Richmond</td>
<td>Bonaventure</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rawdon</td>
<td>Montcalm</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
East
South Durham
Three Rivers
Waterville
Missisquoi
Drummond
St. Maurice
Compton
Stanbridge
Durham
-
Compton
A
M
N
N

Source: Ledger of Enrolments of Protestant Academies and Model Schools, 1903-1905, Archives Nationales du Quebec, E 13 No. 17; Educational Record of the Province of Quebec 24(1904); 25(1905); Report of the Superintendent of Public Instruction, 1903-1904, 1904-1905.

However, once the entrance examination obliged pupils to enter an intermediate school or academy at Intermediate (Model) Grade I, ungraded instruction would be stopped at its source and an approved permit would supply one-room schools with teachers whose competence was confined to the graded elementary text. Encouraged by the Kingsey Township school consolidation case award to the Protestant trustees of the Township of Kingsey, and the establishment of a consolidation under Committee regulations instead of a Macdonald Consolidated School, Rexford and Parmelee reintroduced the teacher permit motion. The textbook prototype of the failed consolidation, the Kingsey Intermediate Consolidated School stood at the crossroads outside French Village beside an


16 Sherbrooke Daily Record, Wednesday, January 17, 1906.
abandoned church. Unable to attract secondary enrolments or to sustain its transportation route, it was the millstone of its unreconciled commissioners.\footnote{The School generated a secondary enrolment of three pupils in Model I and eight pupils in Model II, and the median age in Model I was twelve, in Model II, fifteen years; \textit{Ledger of Enrolment of Protestant Academies and Model Schools, 1905-1906}, ANQQ E 13 No. 17. See also James Dickson, Trenholmville, Quebec, to the \textit{Montreal Witness}, April 11, 1906, Archives Nationales du Quebec, hereafter referred to as ANQQ E 13, No.3014, \textit{Scrapbook} [of newspaper clippings on educational topics, 1883-1906].}

Citing some evidence of board initiative in conveying one-room pupils to graded schools,\footnote{\textit{Report}, 1905-1906, 123-24, 152-54. The consolidation at Kingsley did not include all the school districts in the township but created a graded secondary school. The amalgamation of West Farnham and Abbotsford was a graded elementary school. The pupils of the Kirkdale School were conveyed to Ulverton Intermediate School, the pupils of Jamesville School, to St. Francis College.} Parmlee targeted the McGill Normal School as the culprit for the decrease of pupils and trained teachers in district schools.\footnote{Robert Hill, "Robert Sellar and the Huntingdon Gleaner: The Conscience of Rural Quebec, 1863-1919," Ph.D. Thesis, McGill University, 1970, 798 n21. According to Parmlee’s report: only 170 one-room schools of 900 observed the ten month school year; only fifty-seven rural elementary school teachers since 1898 had taken the four-month training course at the McGill Normal School; there were 200 district teacher vacancies, and "most [graduates had taken] city positions, left the province, or continued training. See also, "The Warnings by Drs. Robins and Parmlee," \textit{Montreal Witness}, Friday, May 4, 1906, ANQQ E13 No.3014, \textit{Scrapbook}.} Like deputy Weir before him, P.S.G. Mackenzie (Richmond) took Parmlee at his word, and attacked the Government in the Legislative Assembly
for the teacher training policies of the Committee, McGill
University, and the McGill Normal School.²⁰ Warning him that
the appointment in no way validated his speeches in the
Assembly, Premier Gouin appointed Mackenzie to the Committee;
whereupon Committee neophyte, Mackenzie, reactivated the
teacher permit motion to restore rural teacher supplies.²¹

Two weeks later, when the "Ormstown Consolidation
Case" was settled in favour of the Board of the Villag. of
Ormstown and the Parish of Ste. Malachie and the commissioners
sent off their "memorials to Robertson," Parmelee and Elson
Rexford, Principal of the Montreal Diocesan College, played
their last card with Macdonald and Robertson.²² Before tabling
the teacher permit motion, Parmelee read the minutes of
Committee's negotiations with Macdonald and Robertson as if
Macdonald had agreed to finance rural schools conditional on
their compliance with the official Committee graded
curriculum. The Committee accordingly carried a motion of
support for rural school grants conditional on age-grading,
and ignored Macdonald's protest that he had specified the

²⁰ Hill, "Robert Sellar," 679-81; Québec, Débats de
l'Assemblée Législative, 1906, 97, 104-06, 110-118.

²¹ Report, 1905-1906, 480-81.

²² "Ormstown Consolidation Case," Montreal Daily Witness,
March 1, 1906, Scrapbook, 1881-1906, ANQQ E13 No. 3014; Evelyn
Kerr, "The Proposed Macdonald Consolidated School," A Paper to
Commemorate the Centenary of the Incorporation of Ormstown,
June, 1979.
opposite intent. Mackenzie put forward a teacher permit motion which was more generous to unqualified teachers than the two previous permit motions and which recommended a two year, renewable, temporary permit which qualified the holder to sit the "examination in the Art of Teaching and School Law and if successful receive a Second-Class Elementary Diploma valid for elementary schools only." It placed the onus on Protestant school inspectors to ensure that permit teachers followed the age-graded course of instruction and also allowed Protestant clergy to resume teaching without formal certification. The Committee passed the Mackenzie motion by thirteen votes to three (with five absentees), Rexford and Fisher having reversed their 1904 stand and "deserted" William Peterson, Principal of McGill University.

With Principal Peterson stranded, Macdonald gave up

23 Flower, "E.I. Rexford," 155; "PC Minutes," November 28, 1902, Report, 387. Macdonald's recollection of the Committee Minutes of November 28, 1902, was his approval of rural school grants based on the school municipality census of pupils.

24 Record 26(1906), 191.


26 "PC Minutes," May 11, 1906, Record, 26(1906),191-96; Richmond Guardian, May 18, 1906, ANQO E 13 No.3014, Scrapbook; Sherbrooke Daily Record, Wednesday, November 23, 1904; Thursday, November 29, 1904.
his personal mission to create "rural-minded teachers,"27 and announced that he would transfer to the Board of Governors of McGill University the lands, buildings, and properties of Macdonald College, and endow the College with $2,000,000.28 John Dougall, Editor of the Montreal Daily Witness and Protestant rights activist, chose the moment to suggest to the Committee that "the English Protestant minority" might unite behind Macdonald's "munificence."29 As chairman of the Committee sub-committee on consolidation, Fisher chose to sponsor a series of "educational picnics" in the style of the political rally, where professional educators and deputies would "sell" rural ratepayers on school consolidation and pupil consolidation.30 He called a meeting at his Liberal Party headquarters in Montreal's Windsor Hotel, to which he drew rural deputies Mackenzie, Weir, and McCorkill, as well the member for Ward Number Five, Montreal, G.W. Stephens, Dougall, and educationists Rexford, Parmelee, J.C. Sutherland


29 Record 41(1921), 100.

30 Record 41(1921): 100.
and William Shurtleff.\textsuperscript{31}

As a rehearsal for the main campaign, Fisher made an especial effort in Brome Township—the location of his own 'Alva Farm' and the heart of his constituency—to place the consolidation option in the most favourable light.\textsuperscript{32} Brome County had not retained the political influence of its Conservative Party years, was the captive of the railroad boom of those years, and needed immigrants with capital to reverse its depopulation trends.\textsuperscript{33} Fisher belonged to an international, institutional, network of gentlemen farmers who advocated the regeneration of agriculture on the model of rural England, saw the restructuring of the County's Protestant municipalities as a question of manual training.

\textsuperscript{31} Records 41(1921): 100, 372. See also [Quebec] Journal of Agriculture and Horticulture for the Province of Quebec, for the years 1909 to 1925; Quebec, Department of Public Instruction, Scrapbook, ANQQ E13 No.3014.


domestic science, and elementary and secondary scientific agriculture.\textsuperscript{34}

The township boards of Bolton, Brome, Potton, and Sutton each supported ten or more one room schools,\textsuperscript{35} and the commissioners of Brome Township were receptive to teachers trained at the McGill Normal School and certified by local boards. The school year extended from August to June, with an extended break for the April mud season. In the Gilman School, A 'Specimen Timetable for an Ungraded Elementary School' co-existed peacefully with the 'Official Course of Study for Protestant Elementary Schools,' and the teacher provided the model school subjects.\textsuperscript{36} Since 1901, George D. Fuller, Demonstrator for the Macdonald school gardens and former model school principal, had worked in the gardens at Number One 'West Brome,' Number Seven 'Vernal's/Brome Centre,' and Number Eight 'Iron Hill.'\textsuperscript{37}


\textsuperscript{35} Quebec, Sessional Papers, 6 Edward VII, No. 8, A.D. 1905-1906, 123-24.

\textsuperscript{36} Brome County Historical Society, School Journals of Brome Township, 1886-1906; Sherbrooke Daily Record, Thursday, January 12, 1905.

As Fisher and Fuller's colleague and as newly appointed Principal of the Macdonald College of Agriculture, Robertson met with the Chairmen of the Brome Township and the Knowlton village Boards of Protestant Commissioners and their twenty-two teachers at Knowlton Academy.\textsuperscript{38} The major campaign then opened officially at Richmond, where the Board of Protestant Commissioners for St. Francis College (demoted to academy grant status in 1898) served as the flagship for graded secondary education.\textsuperscript{39} When the educationists moved on to Knowlton, Fisher found himself in trouble in his own backyard. As a result of the intrigues of the Conservative Party 'old boys' of Brome County, the campaign site was moved from the Academy to the lakeside property of 'old boy' George Foster.\textsuperscript{40} When Fisher tried to warn his audience that the English Protestant minority's schools were "falling behind in the [Canadian] race," 'old boy' William Lynch assured the assembled picnickers that the Protestant rural school problem was a professional teacher problem which had "nothing to do

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{38} \textit{Report}, 1905-1906, 173.


\textsuperscript{40} Brome County Historical Society, photograph of "The Reunion of Old Boys at Knowlton, Monday, September 4, 1905."\end{flushleft}
with their Roman Catholic neighbours' system.""41

The 'educationists' then spoke at Huntingdon, Inverness, and Ayer's Cliff. Fisher asked Protestant ratepayers to accept tax increases;42 Rexford informed them that they needed "strong men [not] young, untrained female minds in charge of the schools;"43 and Robertson "emphasized the obligation of the parent to give his boy fair educational advantages," proclaimed that the woman teacher "would go back from Ste. Anne's to their (sic) schools for three or four years... possibly might be married [and when she had] a home [would] become a leader in her centre."44 Weir reminded his audience


that "mothers who at one time were teachers, made teachers under the old local examination system [had a] power ... still felt in home and community" and advocated endowments by private individuals of the "schools which gave them their start in life and enabled them to achieve the success which had at last crowned their efforts."\textsuperscript{45}

In November, 1906, a Committee sub-committee appointed Professor George Locke, age-grading advocate from the University of Chicago, as Principal for the new School for Teachers, and the McGill Normal School building on Belmont Street was closed.\textsuperscript{46} Teachers-in-training for the elementary and intermediate diploma lived in residence on the Macdonald campus, learned domestic science and Grades One through Grade Nine of the elementary and the model school curriculum, and practice taught at the Macdonald Day (Intermediate) School and in the graded elementary schools of the Montreal Protestant Board of School Commissioners.\textsuperscript{47} The Day School served the children of the College and School for Teachers staff and

\textsuperscript{45} Sherbrooke Daily Record, Friday, August 17, 1906.

\textsuperscript{46} Report, 1906-1907, 449-50.

those of the suburb of Ste. Anne-de-Bellevue.  

Having acquired its teacher permit, devalued incumbent certified teachers, and embarrassed Fisher, the Committee drafted an amendment to the 1899 consolidation law which enhanced the teacher permit as a weapon against incumbent school commissioners and principals. This amendment proposed that boards might close one-room schools which did not maintain an average ten pupil attendance minimum over a ten month school year, and convey these pupils to graded secondary schools. The hiring of the permit teacher might then serve as a temporary measure until commissioners adopted the consolidation-transportation configuration.

Between 1907, when the legislation was proposed by sub-committee, and 1909, when it was approved by Cabinet Order-in-Council, Premier Gouin and Weir (brought into the Cabinet as Minister of Public Works) also "released" to the Committee the (Protestant) Normal School share of the Superior Education Fund which Macdonald's endowment had superseded.

---


49 "PC Minutes," November 29, 1907, Report, 1907-1908, 456-57; 9 Edward VII c. 33 s. 1, Parmelee, School Law, 1911, 32-33; Flower, "E.I. Rexford," 167; James Miller, Rural Schools in Canada (New York: Columbia Teachers' College, 1913), 100.

50 Report, 1907-1908, 448-56.
The Committee then constituted a Released Normal School Fund for rural schools conditional on age-grading which rewarded boards for the hiring of permit teachers and placed the onus on pupils to obey these teachers.\textsuperscript{31}

As the incarnation of the Protestant social gospel in Quebec, the Reverend Rexford preached the message of rural regeneration to teachers and Sunday School teachers.\textsuperscript{32} The network of Ormstown and Ste. Malachie school districts collapsed in the aftermath of its consolidation initiatives, as did the Kingsey Intermediate Consolidated School pupil transportation route.\textsuperscript{33} Nature Study was a compulsory subject


\textsuperscript{33} Evelyn Kerr, "The Proposed Macdonald Consolidated School," a paper written to commemorate the Centenary of the Incorporation of Ormstown, June, 1979, copy of the author; Clifford Moore, "From slate to paper and ink," The Gazette, Montreal, Sunday, September 2, 1990; after the school hacks failed, pupils travelled to school on horseback and by boat.
of the Committee official graded, elementary curriculum, but
the Macdonald school gardens withered and died, and both
Robertson and Locke resigned their principalships.54 As a
protest against the permit and the entrance examination, the
Montreal Protestant Women Teachers' Association broke with the
P.A.P.T. and affiliated with the local branch of the National
Council of Women.55 There, professional teachers accepted the
same British Canadian Protestant nationalism that overrode
P.A.P.T. professional militancy,56 while their colleagues in
rural academies and intermediate schools bore the burden of

54 Record 30(1910), 337-38; Edwin John Pavey, "James
Wilson Robertson: Public Servant and Educator," M.A. Thesis,
University of British Columbia,1971,103-104.

55 Teachers' Magazine, 1(September 1919): 53. They
officially followed a Manual of [Graded] Instruction for
Teachers, but even in the Montreal schools, the averages of
pupil ages did not match age-grade classifications in which
Grade One was supposed to include pupils between age five
years, nine months and six years, three months at the time of
September registration, and so forth, through Grade Eleven.
For a recent study of the Association of Protestant Women
Teachers, see Ruby Heap and Alison Prentice, "The Outlook for
Old Age is Not Hopeful": The Struggle of Female Teachers over
Pensions in Quebec, 1880-1914," Histoire sociale/Social

56 Record, 29(1909): 96-98. Marta Danylewycz, "Sexes et
classes sociales," Nadia Fahmy-Eid and Micheline Dumont, eds.,
Maitresses de maison, maitresses d'école: Femmes, famille et
education dans l'histoire du Québec (Montréal: Boréal Express,
1983), 93-118. The pervasive British Protestant nationalism of
Montreal's haute bourgeoisie is explored in Margaret Westley,
Remembrance of Grandeur: The Anglo-Protestant Elite of
Montreal, 1900-1950 (Montreal: Libre Expression, 1990); Cook,
"Stephen Leacock."
the teacher permit, and suffered the remaking of their image from competent professional to marginal labourer. The Protestant Central Board met its secondary school teacher shortage by granting model school and academy diplomas "for special reasons" to extra-provincial teachers and the Committee increased the number of its "special circumstance" grants to intermediate school boards. Its official history of Canada text, a 1911 publication by Isaac Gammell, a teacher at the High School of Montreal, depicted the swallowing up of Quebec and Canada by French-speaking Catholics. In a climate of blame and retribution, Fisher lost his seat in the free


58 See Joanne Preston, "Female Aspiration and Male Ideology: school-teaching in nineteenth-century New England," Anita Angerman, et al, eds., Current Issues in Women's History (London: Routledge, 1989); Weiler, "Women and Rural School Reform. In the American novel, The Corn Lady (1911), the heroine and her pupils win prizes for the corn they grew in their school garden. She marries a consolidated school principal and together they manage a farm life school. In A Real Country Teacher, The Corn Lady retitled and reissued in 1922, the heroine and her pupils receive no prizes. She is also denied her prize husband. Instead she lives out her life as a spinster, dedicated solely to her role as rural school supervisor.


trade election to Brome County favourite son, Harry Baker.\textsuperscript{61}

As a consequence of his political defeat, Fisher combined his sponsorship of a second major 'educationist' campaign with a search for a new riding.\textsuperscript{62} His schedule took on the atmosphere of a holy crusade, in which educationists spoke to each other of a not-so-distant past when relations in Quebec between Canada's two founding peoples had been more "courteous."\textsuperscript{63} 'Educationists' formed into teams, each of which visited a consolidation prospect, a graded secondary school, and a delinquent academy or intermediate school, and offered transportation subsidies to those commissioners who agreed to consolidate. Fisher represented the Protestant Committee membership; Parmelee, the Department of Public Instruction; Sinclair Laird, the Macdonald School for Teachers; John Parker, the graded superior school inspec-

\begin{itemize}
  \item \textsuperscript{62} "PC Minutes," February 23, 1912, \textit{Record} 32(1912): 233; 33(1913): 281ff; Flower, "E.I. Rexford," 156.
\end{itemize}
impetus.\footnote{ANQQ E 13, Ledger, No.18; Report, 1911-1912, 224; Record, 34(1914): 127.}

Tours included Compton County, where secondary school provision was divided between nine Protestant intermediate schools, Inverness, which maintained its academy and its network of one-room schools, and the graded schools at Ayer’s Cliff, Cowansville, and Richmond.\footnote{The commissioners of Ayer’s Cliff Intermediate School had separated from Stanstead Township, increased its staff from two to eight teachers, increased its salary expenses from $700 to over $7000, and needed more pupils to pay off its loan; see Report, 1912-1913, 186-87, 450-51; Report, 1909-1910, 243.} Educationists met with the officers of the Protestant boards, called their attention to a rural school exhibit at the Sherbrooke Fair which featured Manitoba’s school consolidation policy and pupil transportation technology, and distributed to them a pamphlet authored by Rexford called Protestant Rural Schools.\footnote{Flower, "E.I. Rexford," 134-35; [Quebec] Journal of Agriculture and Horticulture, Volume 16, August 1, 1912, 39.} The strategy of offering transportation grants to the officers of school boards paid off in Compton County.\footnote{See Michael Berger, The Devil in God’s Country: The Automobile and Social Change in Rural America, 1893-1929 (Hamden, Connecticut: Archon Books, 1979); Peter Ling, America and the Automobile: Technology, Reform, and Social Change (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press, 1990); A.C. Monahan, "The Consolidation of Schools and the Transportation of Pupils," United States Bureau of Education, Bulletin, 1914, No. 30 (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1914).}
a whirlwind tour of Eaton, East Clifton, Bury, Cookshire, East
Angus (Westbury), Hampden, Lingwick (Gould), Sawyerville and
Scotstown, by Parmelee and Fisher, Bulwer, in Eaton Township,
formed a separate intermediate school municipality. After
Fisher ran in Huntingdon County and lost a contested and
unresolved election, the Committee dropped Fisher as
chairman, sub-committee on consolidation. It transferred its
allegiance to Victor Morrill who, as editor and owner of the
Sherbrooke Daily Record, promoted the Eastern Townships as the
"Garden of Quebec," published a second pamphlet called
Protestant Schools in the Eastern Townships, and organized the
next campaign.

In Brome County, Fisher's personal consolidation project
was a weak model school consolidation at Brill's in the
municipality of West Bolton, where he paid the salary of a
second teacher. The Commissioners of Mansonville
Intermediate School and Knowlton Academy were harassed with

---

68 Report, 1911-1912, 224; Record 34(1914), 127.
69 "Minutes," September 27, 1912, Report, 1912-1913, 563;
Robert Hill, "Robert Sellar and the Huntingdon Gleaner: The
University, 1970, 813.
70 Flower, "E.I. Rexford," 134-35.
71 Report, 1914-1915, 269; Record 35(1915), 269, 346.
the letter of hiring regulations; the commissioners of Glen Sutton flaunted their twelve school pupil transportation system; and the Catholic school municipality of St. Édouard-de-Knowlton was formed from the Academy's tax base, taking the Academy's French-speaking pupils with it.

As the first appointment to the position of Inspector-General of Protestant Schools, Sutherland issued a circular to Protestant boards which outlined the 'points' of consolidation policy in Quebec. Articulating an underdevelopment consolidation model on the basis of the Quebec experience, he defined a 'partial' consolidation as an elementary graded school consolidation with transportation (instead of a secondary school consolidation within a township), and a 'complete' consolidation as a upgraded intermediate school consolidation (instead of a county or separate graded eleven

---

72 Yesterdays of Brome County (Knowlton, Quebec: Brome County Historical Society), Vol. 8, 59; Record 35(1915), 345.


or twelve year high school). The prescription at one and the same time described existing consolidations as established since 1905 and used practice as theory.

Weak and underdeveloped as they were, the Quebec consolidation models threatened the catchment areas of existing intermediate schools (See Figure 3).

FIGURE 3 - Incumbent Schools and Proposed Consolidations, by County, 1914

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>County</th>
<th>Township School</th>
<th>CONSOLIDATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Compton</td>
<td>Bury</td>
<td>Bulwer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brome</td>
<td>Sutton</td>
<td>Glen Sutton</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stanstead</td>
<td>Barnston</td>
<td>Heathon, Ways’ Mills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bonaventure</td>
<td>Paspebiac</td>
<td>Shigawake</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Megantic</td>
<td>Inverness</td>
<td>Thetford Mines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argenteuil</td>
<td>St. Andrew’s</td>
<td>St. Andrew’s East</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brome</td>
<td>Knowlton</td>
<td>West Bolton</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missisquoi</td>
<td>Hatley</td>
<td>North Hatley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compton</td>
<td>Compton</td>
<td>Compton</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


When Catholic independent subsidized schools filled the vacuum created by grading and consolidation policies, ‘educationists’ construed the gains of Catholic boards as at

---

75 Superintendent of the Department of Public Instruction, Circular No. 2630-12, Report, 1912-1913, 614; Record 32(1912): 250-51.

the expense of Protestant boards. However, the combination of pupil transportation bonuses with corporation taxes, endowments, and Committee bonuses to Protestant secondary schools is a more likely explanation for the incursion of Catholic superior schools into Protestant municipalities.77 Family/company funded schools (the Gault Institute, Valleyfield) and Granby Academy; the construction of new high school buildings (Lennoxville, Waterloo) in centres of industrialization; and Protestant intermediate schools in company towns (Drummondville, Kenogami, La Tuque, McMasterville, Ste. Hyacinthe, Three Rivers) — attested to the Committee's policy priorities.78 Catholic independent subsidized school provision followed upon the Committee's own dismantling of the regional pupil-teacher networks of Aylmer, Danville, Huntingdon, Kingsey, Lachute, and Richmond, and in the creation of the separate and isolated enrolments of Coaticook, Granby, Longueuil, Sherbrooke, and Waterloo (See Figure 4).

77 George Trueman, School Funds in the Province of Quebec (New York: Teachers College, Columbia University, 1920), Ch.2.

FIGURE 4 - Independent Subsidized Schools and Protestant Municipalities, 1912.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Municipality</th>
<th>County</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aylmer</td>
<td>Ottawa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coaticook</td>
<td>Stanstead</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Danville</td>
<td>Richmond</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Granby</td>
<td>Shefford</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Huntingdon</td>
<td>Huntingdon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kingsley</td>
<td>Drummond</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lachute</td>
<td>Argenteuil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Longueuil</td>
<td>Chambly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richmond</td>
<td>Richmond</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sherbrooke</td>
<td>Sherbrooke</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waterloo</td>
<td>Shefford</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The fragmentation of existing municipalities encouraged the Committee to proceed with its consolidation model. In 1914-1915, it approved an official ten grade course of study (eleven grades with Kindergarten included) for elementary, intermediate, and high schools (academies) for all of the Protestant school municipalities of Quebec. The culmination of thirty years of professional teachers' demands for the ten year, ten-month, school year, the curriculum was designed as an unofficial compulsory attendance mechanism, a sorter of Protestant pupils, and a stimulus to the relocation of district pupils in graded secondary schools.

---


80 Sherbrooke Daily Record, November 27, 1916; campaign sites were Cowansville, Lennoxville, Ormstown, Richmond, Lachute, and Leeds Village. See also W.O. Rothney, "Schools in
elementary schools were based on enrolment and attendance; the elimination of the overlap between Intermediate Grade III and Academy Grade I turned the intermediate schools into dead end schools; and the addition of a year to the curriculum distanced the pupil from the school leaving, teacher training and university entrance, examinations.

The ten year graded curriculum marked the low point of grading and consolidation policies for the original nineteenth century centres of superior education. In what was by now a typical campaign scenario, and despite the objections of commissioners and parents, the Committee refused to abolish the Summer School established in 1906 at Lachute Academy for the Training of Graded Elementary Teachers. Since 1906, the Summer School had granted thirty-five permanent rural school diplomas and sixty-four one year permits, and extended ten provisional diplomas beyond the two year maximum limit.¹¹

With the permanent closing of one-room schools and the transportation of their pupils to other municipalities, the P.A.P.T. Executive Committee called for a compulsory education

the Township of Leeds, County of Megantic, One Hundred Years Ago," Record, 12, 5(December 1941, 295-98.

and truancy law to boost Protestant school enrolments; the Committee introduced the Permanent Record, "for the purpose of preserving the scholastic record of every pupil, for future reference," kept statistics of the high rates of elementary and intermediate school dropouts, admitted to a minute percentage of examination candidates, introduced pupil normality/abnormality classifications in Protestant graded schools, and made the high school curriculum more accessible and less demanding.

---


53 Quebec, Department of Public Instruction, "To the Commissioners and Trustees of Protestant Schools," Report, 1918-1919, 460-62.

54 Record New Series, 1 (1927), 180-81; 28 (1955), 76; George Trueman, School Funds in the Province of Quebec (New York: Teachers College, Columbia University, 1920), 63.


56 See, for example, Robert M. Stamp, "Canadian High Schools in the 1920's and 1930's: The Social Challenge to the Academic Tradition," Canadian Historical Association, Société historique du Canada, Historical Papers, 1978; Wood, Idealism Transformed; Johnston, "L'École Primaire Supérieure et le 'high school.'"
The English-Canadian national, post-World War One 'Character Education' campaigns made a perfect fit with the ideology of grading and consolidation. In twenty-seven stops to twelve municipalities from the Ottawa Valley to the Gaspé Peninsula and, for the first time, including professional women teachers from Montreal, "educationists" began with the premise that "since the Protestant Committee [was] not an elective body but nonetheless [recognized] the principle of public responsibility, the time had come for it to "address the truer will of the community" and "partake of the nature of a direct consultation with the Protestant people of the Province in regard to public education."38

"Get every child to school ten months in the school year," character educationists urged, "it is his and her birthright in this twentieth century."39 "Proper vehicles," they explained, provided the way to the ten month school year and, adopted earlier, would have prevented the departure of

---


39 Record 41(1921), 303.
English-speaking children from rural districts. These vehicles were no longer as expensive or as unsafe as they had been in wartime, and their use "would at once hold all Protestant rural population on the land." Designed for dispersed pupil populations, pupil transportation was a success in Manitoba, Australia, New Zealand and thirty-two of the United States, and therefore the route to success in Protestant municipalities.\textsuperscript{90}

Since "the influence of the school [now outweighed] that of the Church or the Sunday School," and since only consolidated graded schools could attract teachers with "high ideals" to the country, educationists expected that formal training and higher salaries would win women back to teaching.\textsuperscript{91} Educationists explained that the scarcity of women teachers in Protestant rural school municipalities was due to the wartime effort, migration to Western Canada, and the entry of women into office work and nursing.\textsuperscript{92} "For the sake of the


\textsuperscript{91} W.O. Rothney, "Character Education in the Rural School Teacher," Teachers' Magazine 4, 4(September, 1922), 14-16; Character Education in the Elementary School (Toronto: Macmillan, c1922).

\textsuperscript{92} Record 40(1920), 5-6.
pupils," they insisted, Quebec Protestant teachers would never strike or support striking teachers' unions elsewhere in Canada.  

FIGURE 5—Counties, Superior Schools, Competing Consolidations 1918 - 1924

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>County</th>
<th>School(s)</th>
<th>Consolidations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brome</td>
<td>Knowlton</td>
<td>Foster</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sherbrooke</td>
<td>Lennoxville, Sherbrooke</td>
<td>Ascot, Capelton</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pontiac</td>
<td>Clarendon</td>
<td>Bristol</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rigaud</td>
<td>Como</td>
<td>Hudson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stanstead</td>
<td>Stanstead</td>
<td>Pitch Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compton</td>
<td>Bury</td>
<td>Brookbury</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compton</td>
<td>Bury</td>
<td>Canterbury</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Record 40(1920), 86; 42(1922), 197-98; Rapley, Century of Schools, 46; Record 44(1924), 192; 45(1925), 175.

In response to the character education campaigns and "special intermediate" grants, several boards embarked upon costly consolidation projects (See Figure 5). In Sherbrooke County, Ascot Consolidated Intermediate School was built and provided with a high school staff from a number of Protestant and dissentient school districts between Lennoxville and Sherbrooke. The Ascot commissioners also planned to collect 150 pupils from three one room schools to be taught at

Capelton." In Pontiac County, the Bristol commissioners formed a consolidation of one-room schools while the Committee was in the process of demoting to elementary rank the oldest superior school, Clarendon Intermediate School. The Canterbury, Brookbury, and Bulwer consolidations were in competition for secondary pupils, while the Fitch Bay consolidation was a challenge to Stanstead College to accept township one-room pupils.  

The separation of Foster from Brome Township challenged Fisher's view of consolidation because it established a base for a move to consolidate the comparatively well-off district schools of Brome with Knowlton Academy and exclude the weaker districts. For three years, Fisher had been unable to address the consolidation issue except in the patriotic context of moral education. In the 1916 campaigns, he had pleaded illness, and had appeared only at Cowansville and in the Ottawa Valley, had come out in favour of leaving one-room

---

54 Record 40(1920), 87; 44(1924), 192. For a present day analysis, see Michael J. Fox, "The Regional School Bus System and the Time-Distance Constraint for Students and Households in Quebec's Eastern Townships," Journal of Eastern Townships Studies/Revue d'études des Cantons de l'Est, 5(Fall/Automne 1994): 21-52.


56 Record 40(1920), 296.

schools where they were, and advocated the formation of an association of five large Protestant school boards for Brome County. 98

On April 2, 1919, he wrote a Will which reflected his concerns for elementary schooling and the regeneration of Brome County agricultural labour. A trust fund would:

...supplement the expenditure of the Province under the School Law and the Regulations of the Protestant Committee by... securing the services of a special Inspector for the County and choosing such Inspector for his qualifications...in Nature Study, Agriculture and all that tends to make the children...grow into good citizens for Rural Life. 99

Fisher also stipulated that "should there be sufficient money for further assistance," he would suggest that "it be applied to help in consolidating the small elementary rural schools rather than the schools for higher education." 100 Like Robertson and Macdonald before him, he proposed a level of administration of trustees and professionals which would intervene between government and classroom.

Appointed Committee Chairman of the "Propaganda Campaign," Fisher did not participate in the character

98 Report, 1916-1917, 236; campaign sites were Lachute, Ormstown, Cowansville, Lennoxville, Richmond, Shawville, and Leeds Village.


100 Fisher, Last Will.
education campaigns of the winter of 1919-1920.\textsuperscript{101} In the fall, he suffered a heart attack; he added codicils to his Will on March 18 and March 22, 1921, which reduced the number of school trustees from seven to four members.\textsuperscript{102} He died at his Ottawa residence on April 9, 1921, after a second heart attack, and was buried on April 13 at Christ Church in Montreal.\textsuperscript{103} Before Fisher’s appointed Trustees could hold their first meeting, the Duboyce school re-opened, breaking up Fisher’s consolidation at Brill’s School; whereupon Rexford encouraged the boards of Foster, Brome, West Bolton, and East Bolton to consolidate with Knowlton Academy.\textsuperscript{104} After Roswell Eric Fisher, trustee and nephew, had assured the chairmen of the three elementary school boards that they need not consolidate, he informed the three other trustees that the Fund would yield an annual revenue of approximately $4,000, and that the share designated for Protestant education would be used to create a strong network of Brome County one-room schools.\textsuperscript{105}

The Fisher trustees organized two annual inspections of

\textsuperscript{101} \textit{Report}, 1916-1917, 236.
\textsuperscript{102} Rexford, \textit{Fisher Trust}, 2, has the date of a codicil as April 2, 1919.
\textsuperscript{103} \textit{Montreal Daily Herald}, April 21, 1921. 
\textsuperscript{104} \textit{Record} 42(1922): 106.
\textsuperscript{105} \textit{Record}, 43(1923), 262.
the one room schools, annual Teachers' Institutes, and incentives for teachers in the form of teaching prizes, salary bonuses, and an annual essay contest also with prizes. So as not to give cause for Committee consolidation policy, inspections focused on the condition of schoolhouses and grounds, and the age and grade classification of pupils, with scholarships for pupils qualified to enter Knowlton or Cowansville Academy. Prizes and bonuses were incentives to commissioners to hire teachers for a full, ten month school year, and essay contests served to internalize teacher values. In the spirit of Canadian imperialism, each school was equipped with a portrait of King George V and Queen Mary and a portrait of Sydney Fisher.\footnote{\textsuperscript{106}}

In 1923, Roswell Fisher again diffused a consolidation proposal for West Bolton, Brome, Knowlton, and Foster,\footnote{\textsuperscript{107}} and brought the school to the standard of the North American inspected and supervised rural graded school.\footnote{\textsuperscript{108}} Between the professionalization of teaching and the professionalization of agriculture, and between the Protestant Committee and the

\begin{footnotes}
\item[106] See, for example, Brome County Historical Society, Fisher Trust Fund, \textit{Annual Report}, 1925-26.
\item[107] Brome County Historical Society, Fisher Trust Fund, \textit{Minutes}, June 2, 1923; August 30, 1923.
\end{footnotes}
Quebec Department of Agriculture, the teaching of scientific and practical agriculture did not reach the elementary schools of Brome.\textsuperscript{109}

As the final ironies of school reform, Rexford addressed the P.A.P.T. convention on the subject of "Rural Conditions and Child Development," revised the course of Study for elementary schools to seven, ten-month years, and wrote to Parmelee that "no child should be condemned to illiteracy just because he chanced to be born on a farm."\textsuperscript{110} Although the ten-month graded classroom was the "norm" against which ungraded classrooms were measured, and although Montreal pupils tested as "retarded" if they had failed a grade or "eliminated," if they had dropped out of school,\textsuperscript{111} a "number of [Quebec] pupils [were] still doing high school work in model schools" and observing the eight month school year.\textsuperscript{112} The Committee nevertheless identified twenty-eight possible future consolidations, announced Rexford and Morrill's success


\textsuperscript{110} \textit{Record} 42(1922), 229; 43(1923), 191; Rexford to Parmelee, quoted in Flower, "E.I. Rexford," 199.

\textsuperscript{111} Morphy and Tait, "Montreal Protestant Schools."

\textsuperscript{112} Canada, \textit{Dominion Bureau of Statistics}, "Annual Survey of Education," 1922, 30, 36, 50, 105, 114; 1923, 42-43. There was no Catholic/Protestant breakdown for academy grade teaching in Quebec model schools.
in achieving major consolidation grant increases from the Government of Premier Louis-Alexandre Taschereau, and placed Morrill in charge of the propaganda and schedule for the campaigns of 1926.\textsuperscript{113}

Conclusion

Protestant Committee policy between 1899 and 1906 established the pre-conditions for the underdeveloped graded and consolidated school system of 1906 to 1926. Educationists spoke the language of the social gospel, the new education, and Protestant minority education rights, in order to accelerate their moral regulatory authority. On a non-denominational Protestant, male professional teacher model, they transformed the right to dissent into an obligation to separate, devalued women's work from the academy to the one-room school, and made Protestant secondary schools less accessible to rural pupils.

Although the Catholic Committee was nine years behind the Protestant Committee in the adoption of a ten-year curriculum and although consolidation was not legal for Catholic boards, its implementation of the teacher permit coincided with the

\textsuperscript{113} "PC Minutes," October 16, 1925; September 24, 1926, Report, 1925-1926 (sic), 1926-1927, 425, 446; Flower, "E.I. Rexford," 137-38; Record, New Series 1(1927): 217; was not published in the second half of 1925 or in 1926; André Beaulieu, Jean-Charles Bonenfant, Jean Hamelin, comp., Répertoire des publications gouvernementales du Québec de 1861 à 1964 (Québec: Secrétariat de la Province, 1968), 201.
permit of its Protestant counterpart. If depleted Protestant municipalities made space for Catholic superior schools, a board by board comparison on the model of Gaffield's *Language, Schooling*, Little's *Crofters and Habitants*, or Johnston's "école primaire supérieure and high school," might elucidate the specifics of the transfer of revenues from Protestant to Catholic boards. There may have been Quebec Catholic rural school worlds of an order about which Macdonald, Robertson, and Fisher could only dream.
CONCLUSION

"WELL UP IN THE MODEL GRADES"
CONCLUSION

"WELL UP IN THE MODEL GRADES"¹

In Quebec, the pedagogical practice of a minority of academy principals set the precedents for twenty-seven revisions to law and regulation between 1881 and 1926. The Cabinet Order-in-Council, the Protestant Committee subcommittee, the Protestant Central Board of Examiners, the Educational Meeting, the Teachers' Institute, and the Executive Committee of the Provincial Association of Protestant Teachers of Quebec provided the networks by which principals formulated Protestant Committee regulations and created Quebec school law. The denial of the academy principalship to women with first class academy diplomas; the manipulation of precedent to disinherit the colleges; the defeat of Premier Félix-Gabriel Marchand's 1898 Education Act; the devaluation of the academy and the model school principalship and of "teachers' work;" the firing of Inspector Harper; the appropriation of the Ormstown and Kingsey consolidation projects; the implementation of the permit to

teach and the appropriation of the School for Teachers; the 'educationist' campaign - these were the education rights claimed in the name of the English Protestant minority by the Protestant Committee of the Council of Public Instruction.

At the outset of their careers, male academy principals were convinced that the classification of pupils by age-grade was the most efficient way to organize the public school. Over a period of forty years, they fit elementary, model, and academy grade pupils between the ages of five and twenty-five into an eight, a nine, and a ten year, course of study. They replaced the monitorial system of group oral recitation with a system of silent, individual memorization and written examinations, and ranked pupils against the performance of the top pupil. This system of learning and evaluation had the unintended consequences of comparing unfavourably the principalships of graded and ungraded schools and demonstrating that the highest-achieving students might be girls instead of boys. As a result, first generation career educators passed teacher certification and curriculum regulations which limited grammar schools as well as academies and model schools to the official graded curriculum and redefined the learning and teaching opportunities of girls and women from the elementary grades through university. Women teachers were denied the academy principalship, age-graded domestic science was introduced at the secondary and model
diploma level, and elementary pupils and teachers were supervised.

In early twentieth-century Quebec, the pedagogy of the male professional principal was not widely diffused. However, no boundary of time or space interfered with the diffusion of grading in parts of Quebec, Canada, and the United States. Inspector Harper's version of grading came to Quebec from the Glasgow Normal School via Truro, Saint John, and Charlottetown and, like Robertson's version of the object lesson, was off the mark of male teacher culture. Educational historians may have underestimated the shock of experimental and innovative age-grading on both teachers and pupils. Unprepared for the speed and precision of the new system and before the diffusion of educational psychology, teachers and pupils were placed in the age-grading strait jacket. As a result, the pupil was in the paradoxical and unenviable position where the teacher encouraged difference on the basis of individuality and rewarded performance on the basis of peer standards.

Historians of teachers' unions and professionalization may wish to focus on the intra-professional and inter-professional dynamics of school provision. If age-grading pedagogy divided a generation of Quebec Protestant clergymen, it also united men across the professions. Does the age-graded classroom create the conditions for the specialization of the workplace or was the age-graded classroom the servant of
professionalization? Were initiatives to promote the ten month school year, the ten month salary, and free and compulsory education professional initiatives to increase secondary pupil enrolments? The P.A.P.T. Executive Committee failed to represent the interests of qualified men and women teachers. While women teachers with academy diplomas were forced by regulation to take jobs as teachers in graded elementary and secondary schools, the teacher permit legitimated teachers who were familiar with the age-graded text. Combined with the location of elementary and intermediate grade training at the School for Teachers, the regulation against the female academy principalship and the permit constituted what we might today call 'backlash.'

At the point where and when age-grading policy was visible in the empty one-room school, rural school regenerators proposed a system of agricultural schools and colleges, elementary and secondary manual training and agricultural science, the return of men to rural school teaching and the return of women to the rural household. They believed that they could change rural schools for the future and did not realize that they themselves responded to changes which had already taken place. They fell far short of providing widespread teacher training and compulsory secondary programs in the agricultural sciences in regional systems of consolidated schools and colleges of agriculture.
William Macdonald, a self-made 'country boy,' idealized and institutionalized his own rural roots. Robertson tried to retreat from the professional-technological imperative of both education and agriculture. Fisher looked to the English gentry for his model for the Eastern Townships, and bequeathed it to the Townships of Bolton and Brome. 'Educationists' in North America, Western Europe, Australia, and New Zealand decided, at the same time, to fund colleges of agriculture, school gardens, manual training, and rural consolidated schools. Yet in Quebec's Council of Public Instruction, which implemented virtually indistinguishable teacher certification regulations, rural school regeneration divided on the basis of separate languages and separate social Christianities.

In the 1920s, 'educationists' restated the grading-consolidation theme that "no child should be denied a sound education because he chanced to be born on a farm." With the institutionalization of the grading-consolidation-transportation synthesis, career educators introduced less challenging high school graded curricula as the magnets for secondary enrolments, refined pupil normality-abnormality, elimination-retardation classifications, permitted the grouping of grades in rural schools, approved unsafe pupil

---

transportation systems, turned teaching principals into administrators and brought teachers into the curriculum revision process.

Under what conditions did families with school age children follow the graded and graded consolidated schools and when did they "stay behind"? The examples of St. Francis College and Knowiton Academy suggest that the aspiration to superior school provision overrode linguistic and sectarian differences and accommodated the right to dissent. However, 'educationists' aspired to the precedent of the 1890s of the graded secondary school under a Protestant board of commissioners. They tried to create a Protestant board and a graded curriculum for each school supported from the Protestant share of the Superior Education Fund. From their perspective, the establishment of Catholic superior schools in the major centres of the English-speaking and Protestant populations justified their policies. It was less important that grading-consolidation-transportation as an organizing principle of secondary school enrolments was

a disadvantage if [pupils] had more of it, and
...a disadvantage if they had none, and a disadvantage in the little they [had]; and it would be hard and perhaps impossible to say in which their disadvantage

---

It is important for educational historians to remember that the 'new education' cut both ways, that the graded curriculum was the point of divide in time and space, and that the sphere of influence of the graded curriculum went well beyond the public school classroom and the public school. It is also an important consideration for those who study high school drop out rates, those who look for ways to increase national productivity, and those who will participate in the restructuring of Quebec’s school boards.

The Quebec model school serves as a particularly interesting educational institution at which to study these problems of provision. Between the elementary school and the academy and on the edge of secondary school provision, the model school is richer in primary sources than the elementary schools and poorer in interpretation than the academies. It is a testament to the history of the model school teacher and the promise of the district school that commissioners wished their teachers to take their pupils "well up in the model grades."

---

James Agee, quoted in Andrew Gulliford, America's Country Schools (Washington, D.C., 1984), 44.
APPENDICES
APPENDIX 1

MODEL/INTERMEDIATE SCHOOLS - 1881-1926

Key: A = Academy; C = College; H = High School; M = Model School

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Start Year</th>
<th>End Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Arundel</td>
<td>M1899-1903</td>
<td>M1913..</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Athelstan</td>
<td>M1913..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aylmer</td>
<td>A1854</td>
<td>M1906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ayer's Cliff</td>
<td>A1849</td>
<td>M1897-1906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barnston</td>
<td>A1911..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beebe Plain</td>
<td>M1896..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Berthier</td>
<td>M1863-1901</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bolton Centre</td>
<td>M1892-1895</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brownsburg</td>
<td>M1899-1903</td>
<td>M1909..</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bryson</td>
<td>M1893</td>
<td>A1906..</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buckingham</td>
<td>A1854</td>
<td>M1862..</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulwer</td>
<td>A1855</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bury</td>
<td>M1889..</td>
<td>M1912..</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Campbell's Bay</td>
<td>A1829</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charleston</td>
<td>M1895-1902</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chateauguay</td>
<td>M1889..</td>
<td>M1913..</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chicoutimi</td>
<td>M1893..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clarenceville</td>
<td>A1843</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clarendon</td>
<td>A1855</td>
<td>M1889-1906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cono</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compton</td>
<td>A1852</td>
<td>M1896-1921</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cookshire</td>
<td>A1853</td>
<td>M1889</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cowansville</td>
<td>A1849..</td>
<td>A1917</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Danville</td>
<td>A1854</td>
<td>M1889</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denison's Mills</td>
<td>A1890</td>
<td>A1993..</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dixville</td>
<td>A1889</td>
<td>M1913</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dudswell</td>
<td>A1855-74</td>
<td>M1889-93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dunham</td>
<td>A1840</td>
<td>M1892-96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Durham</td>
<td>M1866</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fairmount</td>
<td></td>
<td>M1900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fort Coulonge</td>
<td>M1892</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farnham</td>
<td>A1854</td>
<td>M1889</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freilighsburg</td>
<td>A1857</td>
<td>M1889</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaspé</td>
<td>M1889</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gould</td>
<td>M1889</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greenfield Park</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haldimand</td>
<td>M1893</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hemmingford</td>
<td>M1889</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Howick</td>
<td></td>
<td>M1914..</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Code</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hull</td>
<td>M1889..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inverness</td>
<td>A1875..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joliette</td>
<td>M1917..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenogami</td>
<td>M1917..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kingsley</td>
<td>M1905..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kinnear’s Mills</td>
<td>M1893..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lachine</td>
<td>M1864..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lacolle</td>
<td>M1862..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LaTuque</td>
<td>M1893-1900</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leeds</td>
<td>M1889-1919</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lennoxville H1844</td>
<td>M1889-96 A1899..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lévis</td>
<td>M1893-1900</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Longueuil</td>
<td>M1901 A1915..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magog</td>
<td>A1913..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mansonville</td>
<td>A1856 M1889..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maple Grove</td>
<td>M1902-05</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marbleton</td>
<td>M1897..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McGill/Macdonald</td>
<td>M1856 M1907 A1909..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Megantic</td>
<td>M1899 A1925..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montreal West</td>
<td>M1894 A1918..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mystic</td>
<td>M1889-1901</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Carlisle</td>
<td>M1910 A1914..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Richmond</td>
<td>M1893..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Hatley</td>
<td>M1902 A1913..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ormstown</td>
<td>M1889 A1896..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paspébiac</td>
<td>M1889-1920</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philipsburg</td>
<td>A1855-75 M1911..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portage du Fort</td>
<td>M1889-1905</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Port Daniel</td>
<td>M1913-25</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portneuf</td>
<td>M1909-19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quoyon</td>
<td>M1906-09</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rawdon</td>
<td>M1889?..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Royal George</td>
<td>M1911-18</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ste. Agathe-des-Monts</td>
<td>M1916..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Andrews</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Francis/Richmond</td>
<td>C1856/ M1889 A1913..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Hyacinthe</td>
<td>M1896-1911</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Jean</td>
<td>A1889 M1904 A1909..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Lambert</td>
<td>M1889 A1904..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Sylvestre</td>
<td>M1892-1906</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sawyerville</td>
<td>M1894..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scotstown</td>
<td>M1892 A1926..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Shawinigan                       | M1913-A1923..
<p>| Shigawake Centre                 | M1914..|
| South Durham                     | M1897..|
| Sorel                            | A1855-77 M1889-99|
| Stanbridge                       | A1854 M1888..|
| Stanstead                        | A1829 C1878..|
| Strathcona/Outremont             | M1906-A1908..|</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sutton</td>
<td>A1862</td>
<td>M1889-A1894..</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thetford</td>
<td>M1909A1923..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three Rivers</td>
<td>A1881</td>
<td>M1907 A1926..</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ulverton</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valleyfield</td>
<td>M1893-A1899..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verdun</td>
<td>M1910</td>
<td>A1914..</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Warden</td>
<td>M1889-91</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waterville</td>
<td>M1889..</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Westbury/East Angus</td>
<td>M1896</td>
<td>A1914..</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weston</td>
<td>M1905-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Windsor Mills</td>
<td>M1892</td>
<td>A1914..</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## APPENDIX 2

MODEL SCHOOL PRINCIPALS TEACHING ACADEMY SUBJECTS: NAME, DIPLOMA, BOARD OF EXAMINERS 1896-1906

Key:  M = Model Diploma;  A = Academy Diploma;  McG = McGill Normal School;  CB = Protestant Central Board of Examiners;  Mont = Montreal Protestant Board of Examiners

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Diploma</th>
<th>Board of Examiners</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABERCROMBIE, Miss Ethel</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td>CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANDERSON, Miss May</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARMITAGE, Mr. William</td>
<td>A CB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARMSTRONG, Miss Jennie</td>
<td>M NR</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BANFIL, Mr. F.C.</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td>CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BARR, Miss Harriet</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BATELLER, Miss Maude</td>
<td>M CB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEDEE, Mr. Abner</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOWKER, Mr. C.E.</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOWN, Miss Florence</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRACKEN, Miss Jennie</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRYANT, Miss Flora</td>
<td>A CB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BUCK, Miss</td>
<td>M CB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BULMAN, Miss R.</td>
<td>M CB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BURWASH, Miss E.M.</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAMPBELL, Rev. J.L.</td>
<td>BA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CARBEE, Miss C.G.</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CARMICHAEL, Miss Lily</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAULFIELD, Miss M.R.</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLUNIE, Miss Eliz.</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COLE, Miss Kate E.</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DONNELLY, Mr. T.F.</td>
<td>A CB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOUGLAS, Mr. John</td>
<td>A CB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DUNCAN, Mr. A.E.</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECKHART, Miss Jessie</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td>McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAIR, Miss Ida</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FRASER, Miss Ella</td>
<td>M CB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FULLER, Mr. George</td>
<td>M CB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GARLAND, Mr. F.A.</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GILKER, Miss Edith</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GILMOUR, Mr. D.M.</td>
<td>A McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GRAHAM, Miss M. Robina</td>
<td>A McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEPBURN, Miss Eliz.</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HILL, Miss Effie</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HODGINS, Mr. Ernest W.</td>
<td>A CB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HOLIDAY, Miss Annie</td>
<td>M McG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Sex</td>
<td>Initials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HUMPHREY, Mr. Fred.</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HUNTING, Mr. H.D.</td>
<td></td>
<td>A CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JOHNSON, Miss May</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JORDAN, Mr. George</td>
<td></td>
<td>A CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KEMPFFER, Miss Ethel</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KIRKWOOD, Miss Mary</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LINDOP, Miss Primrose</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIPSEY, Mr. John</td>
<td></td>
<td>A McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOCKHART, Mr. A.R.</td>
<td></td>
<td>A CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MACKAY, Mr. James</td>
<td></td>
<td>A Mr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MACKIE, Miss Ellison</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MACNAUGHTON, Miss Barb.</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCBURNEY, Mr. Chas.</td>
<td></td>
<td>A Mr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCCASKILL, Miss L.A.</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCCLATCHIE, Miss J.E.</td>
<td></td>
<td>M CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCCLELLAN, Miss Grace</td>
<td></td>
<td>A Mr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCOY, Miss E.C.</td>
<td></td>
<td>A Mr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCCUAIG, Miss Mary</td>
<td></td>
<td>A Mr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCDONALD, Miss Annie</td>
<td></td>
<td>M Mr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCMILLAN, Mr. J.</td>
<td></td>
<td>A CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCMULLEN, Mr. John</td>
<td></td>
<td>A CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCNAB, Mr. G.G.</td>
<td></td>
<td>A CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCRAE, Mr. R.H./J.T.</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MELROSE, Miss Annie</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MESSENGER, Mr. W.J.</td>
<td></td>
<td>A CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MILLER, Miss Edith</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MILLER, Miss Louise</td>
<td></td>
<td>M CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOUNTAIN, Miss Bertha</td>
<td></td>
<td>M CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NUNNS, Miss J. Eliz.</td>
<td></td>
<td>M CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAINTIN, Mr. Alfred</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAINTIN, Miss Emma</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARK, Miss Julia</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PATCH, Miss Hattie</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POLLOCK, Mr. Thomas</td>
<td></td>
<td>A Mr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRICE, Miss Ethel</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PURDY, Miss Florence</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RICHARDS, Mr. S.M.C.</td>
<td></td>
<td>M CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RIVARD, Mr. A.E.</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RONDEAU, Miss Laura</td>
<td></td>
<td>A Mr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROSS, Miss M.E.</td>
<td></td>
<td>M CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RCGSS, Mr. Niles G.</td>
<td></td>
<td>M CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROTHNEY, Mr. William</td>
<td></td>
<td>M CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SADLER, Mr. Forrest</td>
<td></td>
<td>M CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAMPSON, Miss Edith</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAYWER, Mr. Lewis</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAVAGE, Miss Maude</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCOTT, Miss S.E.</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCROOGIE, Miss Jessie</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SHAW, Miss Lydia</td>
<td></td>
<td>M McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Initials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMITH, Mr. Ernest</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMITH, Miss Esther</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMITH, Mr. Warwick</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOLOMON, Miss Cora</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOLOMON, Miss Marion</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STEVENS, Miss Rachel</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STEVENSON, Miss Cath.</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STOBO, Miss K.E.</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUTHERLAND, Miss Mabel</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THOMPSON, Miss Annie</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THOMPSON, Mr. James</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOPP, Miss J.</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOWNSEND, Mr. Thomas</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRAVERS, Miss</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VAN VLIET, Miss Léonie</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VAUGHAN, Mr. A.E./F.W.</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VON IFFLAND, Mr. L.D.</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WARDROP, Mr. A.B.</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WESTMAN, Miss Annie R.</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WESTOVER, Mr. E.W.</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WILSON, Mr. W.G.A.</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WOODSIDE, Mr. James</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>CB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WOODWORTH, Miss Alice</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YOUNG, Miss Pansy</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>McG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YOUNG, Miss S.W.</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>McG</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Educational Record of the Province of Quebec. 1896-1906.
APPENDIX 3
MODEL SCHOOLS AS A PERCENTAGE OF SUPERIOR
SCHOOL PROVISION: 1889, 1905, 1917

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Status</th>
<th>1889</th>
<th>1905</th>
<th>1917</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(n)</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>(n)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special/High School</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>12.7</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academy</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>27.0</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>60.3</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TABLE 2A: Average School Grant and Average Grant Per Pupil, 1889**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Status</th>
<th>Number of Schools*</th>
<th>Total Grant</th>
<th>Average School Grant</th>
<th>Number of Pupils Enroled**</th>
<th>Average Grant per Pupil</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Special/High School</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3770</td>
<td>628</td>
<td>1166</td>
<td>3.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academy</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>4025</td>
<td>288</td>
<td>2392</td>
<td>1.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>2400</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>3000</td>
<td>0.80</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TABLE 2B: Average School Grant and Average Grant Per Pupil, 1905**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Status</th>
<th>Number of Schools*</th>
<th>Total Grant</th>
<th>Average School Grant</th>
<th>Number of Pupils Enroled**</th>
<th>Average Grant per Pupil</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Special/High School</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2783</td>
<td>928</td>
<td>933</td>
<td>2.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academy</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>6283</td>
<td>286</td>
<td>4094</td>
<td>1.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>5352</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>4143</td>
<td>1.29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TABLE 2C: Average School Grant and Average Grant Per Pupil, 1917**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Status</th>
<th>Number of Schools*</th>
<th>Total Grant</th>
<th>Average School Grant</th>
<th>Number of Pupils Enroled**</th>
<th>Average Grant per Pupil</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Special/High School</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1535</td>
<td>768</td>
<td>1130</td>
<td>1.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academy</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>17571</td>
<td>567</td>
<td>6071</td>
<td>2.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>11776</td>
<td>245</td>
<td>4566</td>
<td>2.58</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Number of schools having information on grants.
** Enrolment for the schools having information on grants.

TABLE 3A: School Status by Sex of Principal, 1889

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Status</th>
<th>Male (n)</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Female (n)</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Total* (n)</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Special/High School</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>57.1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>42.9</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academy</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>88.2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>11.8</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>63.0</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>37.0</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* 9 cases with sex of principal missing

TABLE 3B: School Status by Sex of Principal, 1905

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Status</th>
<th>Male (n)</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Female (n)</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Total* (n)</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Special/High School</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>80.0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academy</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>87.0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>13.0</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>23.4</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>76.6</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>46.7</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>53.3</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* 3 cases with sex of principal missing

TABLE 3C: School Status by Sex of Principal, 1917

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Status</th>
<th>Male (n)</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Female (n)</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Total* (n)</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Special/High School</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academy</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>72.7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>27.3</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>20.7</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>79.3</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>40.0</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>60.0</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* 5 cases with sex of principal missing

TABLE 4A: Department Enrolment as a Percent of Total Enrolment for Special/High Schools and Academies, 1889

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Status</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Academy Department Enrolment</th>
<th>Model Department Enrolment</th>
<th>Elementary Department Enrolment</th>
<th>Total Enrolment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(n)</td>
<td>(n)</td>
<td>(n)</td>
<td>(n)</td>
<td>(n)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special/High School</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>537</td>
<td>571</td>
<td>257</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academy</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>712</td>
<td>545</td>
<td>1257</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE 4B: Department Enrolment as a Percent of Total Enrolment for Special/High Schools and Academies, 1905

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Status</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Academy Department Enrolment</th>
<th>Model Department Enrolment</th>
<th>Elementary Department Enrolment</th>
<th>Total Enrolment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(n)</td>
<td>(n)</td>
<td>(n)</td>
<td>(n)</td>
<td>(n)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special/High School</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>670</td>
<td>396</td>
<td>510</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academy</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>572</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>2418</td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TABLE 4C: Department Enrolment as a Percent of Total Enrolment for Special/High Schools and Academies, 1917

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Status</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Academy Department Enrolment</th>
<th>Model Department Enrolment</th>
<th>Elementary Department Enrolment</th>
<th>Total Enrolment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(n)</td>
<td>(n)</td>
<td>(n)</td>
<td>(n)</td>
<td>(n)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special/High School</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>902</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>631</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academy</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>759</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>5331</td>
<td>789</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TABLE 4D: Mean Enrolment, all Departments, by School Status and Year

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Status</th>
<th>1889</th>
<th>1905</th>
<th>1917</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number of Schools</td>
<td>Average Enrolment*</td>
<td>Number of Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special/High School</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academy</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>161</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Number of schools having enrolment information

### TABLE 5A: Grant Turnover, Academies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Status</th>
<th>1889 (n)</th>
<th>1905 (n)</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>1917 (n)</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Still There</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>70.6</td>
<td>91.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Schools</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Academies</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>34</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disappeared</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>29.4</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To Model Status</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TABLE 5B: Grant Turnover, Model Schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Status</th>
<th>1889 (n)</th>
<th>1905 (n)</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>1917 (n)</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Still There</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>60.5</td>
<td>64.6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Schools</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Model Schools</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>60</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disappeared</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>39.5</td>
<td>35.4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To Academy Status</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To Elementary</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE 5C1: Of the Academies and Model Schools that Disappeared 1889-1905, 
a Breakdown by Sex of Principal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Status</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th></th>
<th>Female</th>
<th></th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th></th>
<th>Total</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(n)</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>(n)</td>
<td>%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(n)</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academy</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>60.0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>40.0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>53.3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>40.0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE 5C2: Of the Academies and Model Schools that Disappeared 1905-1917, 
a Breakdown by Sex of Principal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Status</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th></th>
<th>Female</th>
<th></th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th></th>
<th>Total</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(n)</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>(n)</td>
<td>%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(n)</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academy</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>29.4</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>64.7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

APPENDIX 4

PROTESTANT BOARD AMALGAMATIONS AND CONSOLIDATIONS 1902-1926

1902 - West Farnham-Abbotsford
1905 - Kingsey; Ulverton-Kirkdale; Richmond-Jamesville
1907 - Dunham
1912 - Bulwer; Glen Sutton
1914 - Way’s Mills; Shigawake; Thetford Mines
1915 - St. Andrew’s East; West Bolton (disconsolidated c1919)
1918 - Hudson; Ascot
1922 - Island Brook
1923 - Kinnear’s Mills; Escuminac
1925 - Morin Heights; Brookbury; Canterbury
1926 - Roxton Pond; Brownsburg; Bishop’s Crossing

Source: Educational Record of the Province of Quebec.
APPENDIX 5

'EDUCATIONIST' MEETINGS:

A PRELIMINARY LIST, 1891-1926

1891   Barnston

1899   South Durham; Richmond; Danville; Lennoxville;
       Counties of Brome, Missisquoi, Shefford, Stanstead,
       Ottawa - George Parmelee

1901   Knowlton - Rev. William I. Shaw

1906   Huntingdon, Ormstown, Hemmingford, Clarenceville -
       Inspector Luther Gilman

       Thurso, Kazabazua, Wakefield, Hull, Quyon,
       Shawville, Ladysmith, Campbell's Bay - Inspector
       Mason, Principal Reverend Thomas Adams

       Inverness, Leeds Village, Maplegrove, Gould,
       Valcartier - Inspector O. McCutcheon

       Knowlton - James Robertson; Macdonald Demonstrator,
       George Fuller

       RICHMOND - J.S. McCorkill, M.L.A., G.W. Stephens,
       M.L.A., George Parmelee, Principal N.T. Truell

       HUNTINGDON - Hon. Sydney Fisher, Elson Rexford,
       James Robertson, William Weir, M.L.A.

       KNOWLTON - Elson Rexford, C.A. Parmelee, M.P.,

       INVERNESS - Parmelee, Weir, Robertson

       LACHUTE - Weir, Rexford, Robertson, Fisher

       Ayer's Cliff (substitute for Coaticook) - William
       Shurtleff, McCorkill, Parmelee
Matapedia, New Richmond - Inspector Sutherland

New Carlisle - Inspector Kerr

1908
Barnston, Newport, Sutton - Hon. Sydney Fisher, George Parmelee

1912
Eaton, Bury, East Clifton, Compton, Cookshire, East Angus (Westbury), Hampden, Lingwick (Gould), Sawyerville, Scotstown

INVERNESS, RICHMOND, Melbourne, Ayer's Cliff, Cookshire, LACHUTE, Cowansville, KNOWLTON, Mansonville, Sutton

1914
Way's Mills, St. Andrew's, North Hatley, Farnham, Bedford, Stanstead, Compton Village

1916
Cowansville, Shawville, Lennoxville, Ormstown, RICHMOND, LACHUTE, Leeds Village

1919
Scotstown - Dean Laird, J.C. Sutherland, Inspector McCutcheon

Ayer's Cliff - Dean Laird, Dr. Shurtleff, J.C. Sutherland, Inspector Hunter

RICHMOND - Hon. W.G. Mitchell, J.C. Sutherland

Sutton - Professor Carrie M. Derick, George Parmelee, J.C. Sutherland, Inspector Taylor

Waterloo - Elson Rexford, W.S. Bullock, M.L.A., Professor Derick, George Parmelee, Principal Rivard

Clarenceville - Principal MacBurney, Montgomery Campbell, J.C. Sutherland, Inspector Gilman


Hemmingford - Dr. Rowat, Mr. W. Robb, M.P., Montgomery Campbell, George Parmelee, Inspector Gilman

Wakefield - Hon. Sydney Fisher, George Parmelee, Inspector Honeyman

Arundel - Principal McBurney, J.C. Sutherland, Inspector McQuat

Buckingham - Dean Laird, Principal McBurney

Inverness - Principal McBurney, J.C. Sutherland, Inspector O. McCutcheon

Kinnear's Mills - Principal McBurney, J.C. Sutherland, Inspector McCutcheon

1920

Bury, Foster, Magog - George Parmelee, Principal Reverend H.H. Bedford-Jones

Bedford, Sutton - Principal Percival, Isabel Brittain

Valleyfield - Dean Laird and Principal Lockhart

Mansonville - Professor A.W. Kneeland

Cowansville, Knowlton - Professor Kneeland, Principal Lockhart

Howick, Huntingdon - Professor Kneeland, Montgomery Campbell

North Hatley - Dean Laird, J.C. Sutherland

Shawville - Hon. Sydney Fisher, George Parmelee, Inspector Honeyman

1922

Island Brook, Hampden, East Bolton, Athelstan, Howick

1924

Godbmanchester, Hinchinbrook, Ormstown, Clarenceville, Dunham, Bolton East, Bolton West, Brome, Sutton, Chatham No.1, Chatham No.2, Shipton, Cleveland, Capelton, Stanstead (Township), Magog,
1924  Hatley, Lingwick, Gaspé, Matapedia, New Carlisle, New Richmond

1925  Bury, East Bolton, Escuminac, Cowansville, Namur

1926  Howick, Bardley, Bristol, RICHMOND, Ayer's Cliff, Cowansville, KNOWLTON, LACHUTE, HUNTINGDON, Sherbrooke, Bishop's Crossing, Roxton Pond, Brownsburg

APPENDIX 6

PROTESTANT COMMITTEE APPOINTMENTS:

YEAR, TITLE, 1881-1926

Key: PO = Politics  PR = Professions  OT = Other

AMES, Herbert B. - PO, 1895; Conservative M.P.

ARTHY, Edward Westhead - PR, 1898; Superintendent, Board of Protestant Commissioners, Montreal

BEDFORD-JONES, Reverend H.H. - PR, 1919; Principal of Bishop's University

BICKERDIKE, Robert - PO, Liberal; 1911, entrepreneur

BOND, Reverend William Bennett - PR, 1882; Lord Bishop of Montreal

BRITTAINE, Isabel E. - PR, 1914; teacher, High School of Montreal.

BRYSON, George - PO, Liberal, 1910; MLC, Inkerman

CAMERON, Dr. Alexander A. - PO, 1879; M.L.A., Huntingdon

CAMERON, A. Kirke - PR, 1920; Huntingdon

CAMPBELL, E. Montgomery - PR, 1912; Principal of the Commercial and Technical High School, Montreal

CHURCH, Levi Ruggles - PO, 1889

COTTON, Dr. Cédric Lemoine - PO, Liberal, 1899; MLA, Missisquoi County

CROMBIE, Marcus G. - ? 1916

CURRIE, Sir Arthur - PR, 1919; Principal of McGill University
DALE, J.A. - PR, 1910; Professor of Education, McGill University

DAWSON, John William - PR, 1874; Principal of McGill College

DERICK, Carrie - PR, 1918; Professor of Botany, McGill University

DUBOYCE, M. Percy C. - PR, 1922; Notary, Richmond

DUFFY, H. Thomas - PO, Liberal; MLA, Brome County

DUNN, Right Rev. A.H. - PR, 1891; Lord Bishop of Quebec

FERGUSON, Mary Laura - PR, 1909; Principal, Sarah Maxwell Elementary School, Montreal

FERRIER, James - PO, Conservative, 1882; MLC, Victoria

FINLEY, Samuel - OT, 1891; Governor, McGill College

FISHER, Sydney Arthur - PO, Liberal, 1901; MP, Brome County; Minister of Agriculture

FRASER, Mabel - PR, 1922; teacher, Commissioners' High School, Quebec

GAMMELL, Isaac - PR, 1924; Principal, High School of Montreal

GREENSHIELDS, Edward B. - OT, 1893

HENNEKER, Richard William, OT, 1877; Chancellor, Bishop's College

HEMMING, E.J. - PO, Conservative, 1881; Committee Counsel

HERSEY, Milton - PO, Liberal, 1919

HEWTON, R.J. - PR, 1889; Inspector, Counties of Sherbrooke and Richmond

HUNTER, Georgina - PR, 1907; Principal, High School for Girls, Montreal

IRVINE, George - PO, Liberal, 1882; MLA, Megantic County
IRWIN, Elizabeth A. (Hammond) - PR, 1917; teacher

KNEELAND, Abner Winslow - PR, 1887; Professor of English, McGill Normal School

LAFLEUR, M. Eugène - PR, 1924; Committee Counsel

LAIRD, Sinclair - PR, 1913; Principal, School for Teachers, Macdonald College

LAWLESS, L.E. - PR, 1910; teacher

LEACH, Reverend William Turnbull - PR, 1882; Vice-Chancellor, McGill College

LINDSAY, Venerable David - PR, 1882; Rector of St. Luke, Waterloo, Archdeacon of Bedford

LOVE, Archibald Thomas - OT, 1891; Gaspé County

LYNCH, William Warren - PO, Conservative, 1883; 1897, 1899; MLA, Brome County; Committee Counsel

MABON, James - PR, 1903; Principal, Waterloo Academy

MARLER, Herbert - PO, 1918; MP, Saint Antoine-Westmount

MARTIN, Mr. Justice John E. ? 1924

MASTEN, George - PR, 1883, Principal, Coaticook Academy & Graded School

MATHES, Reverend Dr. George D. - PR, 1881

Mackenzie, Peter Samuel George - PO, Liberal, 1906; MLA, Richmond County

MacLAREN, William Scott - PO, Liberal, 1897, Member of Parliament, Huntingdon County

MCDARLTHUR, Peter - ? 1888

McBURNEY, Charles - PR, 1910; Principal, Lachute Academy

McCORKILL, John Charles James Sarsfield - PO, Liberal, 1902; MLA, Brome County
McGREGOR, James - PR, 1882; Inspector for Protestant Schools, Counties of Argenteuil, Beauharnois, Chateauguay, Hochelaga (including Montreal), Huntingdon

McMASTER, Andrew Ross - PO, Liberal, 1924; MLA, Brome County

MITCHELL, Walter George - PO, Liberal, 1914; MLA, Richmond County

MORRILL, Victor E. - OT, 1920; Owner/Editor, Sherbrooke Record

MURRAY, Howard - PR, 1911; teacher

NICOL, Honourable Jacob - PO, Liberal, 1922; MLA, Richmond County

NICHOLSON, J.A. - PR, 1920; Registrar, McGill University

NORMAN, Very Reverend Richard Whitmore - PR, 1885; Rector, Saint Mathias Church, Cote Saint Antoine (Westmount)

NORRIS, Amy - PR, 1918; teacher, Montreal

PARROCK, Reverend - PR, 1910; Principal, Bishop's University

PETERSON, William - PR, 1895; Principal, McGill University

REXFORD, Elson Irving - PR, 1891; Rector, High School of Montreal

ROBERTSON, James Wilson - OT, 1904; adviser to Sir William Macdonald

ROBINS, Sampson P. - PR, 1891; Principal, McGill Normal School

ROWAT, William - PR, 1908, medical doctor

SHAW, Rev. William I. - PR, 1891

SHURTEFF, William Lewis - OT, 1900; Owner, Coaticook Observer

SILVER, H.J. - PR, 1900; Superintendent, Board of Protestant Commissioners, Montreal
SUTHERLAND, J.C. - OT, 1904; Pharmacist; Secretary-Treasurer, Board of Protestant Commissioners, Richmond

TAYLOR, Reverend Ernest Manly - PR, 1905; Inspector, Counties of Brome, Missisquoi, Shefford

TRUELL, Newton Theodore - PR, 1894; Principal, Lachute Academy

WALKER, William H. - PO, Liberal, 1898; MLA, Huntingdon County

WALSH, W. Allen - PR, 1920; Principal, Outremont Academy

WARD, James Kewley - PO, 1903; MLC, Victoria; Chairman, Board of Protestant Commissioners, St. Antoine

WATTS, William John - PO, Liberal, 1898; MLA, Drummond County

WEIR, William - PO, Liberal, 1906; MLA, Argenteuil County

WHYTE, John - PO, Liberal, 1896; MLA, Megantic County

WILLIAMS, Reverend Lennox - PR, 1914; Principal, Bishop’s University

BIBLIOGRAPHY
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Archival Sources

Archives Nationales du Québec à Québec (ANQQ)
Fonds Éducation (E 13)

Ledger [for Protestant Academies and Model Schools] 1885-1926

Scrapbook [Department of Public Instruction?] 1883-1906

Bishop’s University. Eastern Townships Collection.

Brome County Historical Society

The Fisher Trust Fund. Minutes. 1922-1972

Brome Township. School Journals. 1897-1906

School Municipality of Foster. Minute Book. 1919-1920

Concord Public Library, Concord, Massachusetts

Town of Concord. School Committee. Minutes. 1870-1890

McGill University Archives

McGill Normal School. Prospectus. 1856-1907

George Parmelee Papers, 1860-1941 MG 4111

William Peterson Papers, 1895-1919 RG 2 C 27

Missisquoi County Historical Society

Provincial Association of Protestant Teachers of Quebec.


Minutes of the Central Executive Committee,
Montreal, December, 1864 - November 1866.

P.A.P.T. Minutes of the Sub-committee for Textbooks and Curriculum. 1921-1926

Public Archives of Canada (PAC)

Lomer Gouin Papers

Wilfrid Laurier Papers

Private Correspondence of Sydney Arthur Fisher to Dr. and Mrs. Arthur Fisher. Collection of Mr. Edward Fisher. 1891-1908

Printed Primary Sources

GOVERNMENT DOCUMENTS

Canada

Dominion Bureau of Statistics. Annual Survey of Education. 1921-1926


Manitoba

Consolidation of Rural Schools in Manitoba. Winnipeg, December, 1910.

New Brunswick

Report of the School Trustees of the City of Saint John, 1873
Ontario

Annual Report of the Minister of Education. 1889-1929

Ottawa City Directory. 1895-1906

Québec

Department of Public Instruction. Memorandum of the Case of the High Schools of Quebec and Montreal. January, 1871.

Historical Sketch of the Protestant Board of Commissioners of Quebec. August, 1917.

Hubbard, Henry. Protestant Schools in the City of Sherbrooke, Province of Quebec, Canada Sherbrooke: "Examiner's" Office, 1886.

Bibliothèque de l'Assemblée nationale. Débats de L'assemblée législative du Québec 1893-1909

Journal of Agriculture and Horticulture. 1907-1913

Journals of the Legislative Assembly 1903-1906

Journals of the Legislative Council 1898

L'instruction publique du Québec à l'Exposition colombienne de Chicago. Rapport de l'Honorable Secrétaire provinciale


. School Law in the Province of Quebec. Quebec:
Canada Stamp Co., 1911.

School Law in the Province of Quebec. Quebec: Canada Supply Co., 1921.

Parmelee, G.W. and J.C. Sutherland. Education in the Province of Quebec Quebec: Department of Public Instruction, 1914.

Protestant Committee of the Council of Public Instruction. Educational Record of the Province of Quebec. 1881-1964

Minutes. 1875-1930

Public Instruction - Protestant Superior Education. 1883-1926

Protestant Board of School Commissioners of the City of Montreal. Annual Report. 1846-1871

Report of the Superintendent of Public Instruction. 1850-1926

"General Statistics of the Cost of Education" 1889-1918

"Inspectors’ Reports." 1875-1926

"Report of the McGill Normal School." 1856-1907

Sessional Papers. 1881-1926

"General Statistics of the Cost of Education" 1919-1926

Statutes. 1846-1921


United States


HISTORICAL SOCIETIES

Kerr, Evelyn J. "The Proposed Macdonald Consolidated School." A Paper to Commemorate the Centenary of the
Incorporation of Ormstown, June 1979.


Transactions of the Brome County Historical Society 1901-

Yesterdays of Brome County. Knowlton, Quebec: Brome County Historical Society. Volume 1 1983-

NEWSPAPERS


The Gazette (Montréal) 1980-1994

The Gleaner (Huntingdon) 1870-1906

The Montreal Daily Herald 1901-1906, April 10, 1921.

The Montreal Daily Star 1901-1906


The Observer (Cowansville). 1904-1908

The Outlook (Middleton, Nova Scotia) Friday, September 4, 1903

The Patriot (Charlottetown, Prince Edward Island). 1870-1881

The Quebec Chronicle May 22, 1906.

The Quyon Times & Pontiac County Advertiser February 5, 1899.

Richmond Guardian March 18, 1898- May 4, 1906.

Sherbrooke Daily Record 1890-1906

Sherbrooke Examiner February 20, 1883.

Sherbrooke Gazette April 2, 6, 1883.

Le Soleil (Québec) Saturday, March 1, 1919.

Stanstead Journal April 7, 1883.

The Watchman & Ottawa Valley Advocate April 1, 1898.

Waterloo Advertiser 1869-1901

PERIODICALS

Canadian Forum 1915-1925

Queen’s Quarterly (Kingston) 1900-1926

World’s Work, (New York) 1895-1910

PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATIONS, CALENDARS, JOURNALS, PAMPHLETS, PROSPECTUSES, SPEECHES AND SURVEYS


Canadian Educational Monthly. 1910-1910


Macdonald College. Announcement. 1907-1920


Rexford, Elson I.] Protestant Rural Schools. n.p., 1912
Rexford, Elson I. Provincial Association of Protestant Teachers of Quebec. Report of the Compulsory Attendance Committee, 1918.


Teachers' Magazine. [Quebec]. 1919-1964

SELECTED NORMAL SCHOOL AND TEACHERS' COLLEGE TEXTBOOKS


Arp, Julius. Rural Education and the Consolidated School Yonkers-on-Hudson: World, 1918.


Stokes, 1915.


Payne, William H. *Chapters on School Supervision: A Practical Treatise on Superintendence; Grading; Arranging Courses of Study; the Preparation and Use of Blanks, Records and Reports, Examinations for Promotions, etc.* New York: American Book, 1875 [1903].


**ARTICLES AND BOOKS**


James, Charles Canniff. *The Teaching of Agriculture in Our Public Schools.* sl: sn, 1900.


--------. "The Rural School Teacher." *University Magazine.* 11,(April 1912).

--------. "A National Purpose in Education." *Canadian Magazine.* (May 1913).


Westmount: a heritage to preserve. n.p. 1991?

RESEARCH AIDS


Secondary Sources

BOOKS


Caldwell, Gary and Éric Waddell. The English of Québec: From Majority to Minority Status (Québec: Institut québécois de recherche sur la culture, 1982)


---


---


—. The History of McGill in Relation to Montreal and Quebec n.p. 1978


Hilton, George W. and John F. Due. *The Electric Interurban


Lapointe, Pierre-Louis. Buckingham: In the heart of the Lower Lièvre District of the City of Buckingham from its


________, Jean Claude Robert and Réné Durocher. Quebec: A


Neilson, Helen P. Macdonald College of McGill University.


Paton, James. The Role of Teachers' Associations in Canadian Education. Toronto: Gage, 1962.


Reese, William. Power and the Promise of School Reform:


Sheehan, Nancy M., J. Donald Wilson, David C. Jones, eds. Schools in the West: Essays in Canadian Educational


________. *The Life and Times of Confederation 1864-1867:*


Westley, Margaret W. Remembrance of Grandeur: The Anglo-Protestant Elite of Montreal, 1800-1950. Montreal:


———, ed. Reliving the Past: The Worlds of Social History. Chapel Hill, University of North Carolina

JOURNAL ARTICLES


________. "Rediscovering the Majority: The New Rural History of the Nineteenth-Century North." Historical Methods, 19, 4(Fall 1986).

Behiels, Michael D. "Recent Contributions to the History of Twentieth-Century Quebec." Canadian Historical Review, 48, 3(September 1987).


1976.


________. "Dependent Motorization: Canada and the Automobile to the 1930s." Journal of Canadian Studies/Revue d'études canadiennes, 21, 3(Fall/automne 1986).


Ellsworth, Clayton S. "The Coming of Rural Consolidated Schools to the Ohio Valley, 1892–1912." *Agricultural History*, 30(July 1956).

Fahmy-Eid, Nadia. "Education et classes sociales: analyse de l'idéologie conservatrice-cléricale et petite bourgeoise au Québec au milieu du 19e siècle." *Revue d'histoire de*
l'Amérique française, 32, 2 (septembre 1978).


Jones, David C. "'There is Some Power About the Land'— The Western Agrarian Press and Country Life Ideology." Journal of Canadian Studies/Revue d'études canadiennes, 17, 3 (Automne 1982 Fall).


---


. "'Persécution et exil': la venue au Québec des congrégations française, 1900–1914." Revue d'histoire de l'Amérique française, 36, 3 (décembre 1982).


Malouin, Marie-Paule. "La Laïcisation de l’école publique


Miller, J.R. "Honoré Mercier, la minorité protestante du Québec et la Loi relative au règlement de la question des biens des Jésuites." Revue d'histoire de l'Amérique française, 27 (Mars 1974).


Morain, Thomas. "The Departure of Males From the Teaching Profession in Nineteenth-Century Iowa." Civil War History, 26, 2 (June 1980).


Otis, Yves. "La différenciation des producteurs laitiers et


Sutherland, Neil. "'We always had things to do': The Paid and Unpaid Work of Anglophone children Between the 1920s and the 1960s." Labour/Le Travail, 25 (Spring 1990 Printemps).


Taylor, Jeffrey. "Professionalism, Intellectual Practice, and


Thomas, John D. "Servants of the Church: Canadian Methodist Deaconess Work, 1890-1926." Canadian Historical Review, 45, 3(September 1984).


Vipond, Mary. "Blessed are the peacemakers: the labour question in Canadian social gospel fiction." Journal of Canadian Studies/Revue d'études canadiennes, 10(August 1975).


Wilson, Catherine Anne. "'Outstanding in the Field': Recent Rural History in Canada." Acadiensis, 20, 2(Spring/Printemps 1991).

Wilson, J. Donald and Paul J. Stortz. "'May the Lord Have
Mercy Upon You': The Rural School Problem in B.C. in the

——— and Marvin Lazerson. "Historical and Constitutional
Perspectives on Family Choice in Schooling: The Canadian
Case." Michael E. Manley-Casimir, ed. Family Choice in

Urban Culture: The Nineteenth Century Contributions."
Donald Fleming and Bernard Bailyn, eds. Perspectives in

Wood, B. Anne. "The Significance of Evangelical Presbyterian
Politics in the Construction of State Schooling: A Case
Study of the Pictou District, 1817-1866." Acadiensi,
20, 2(Spring/Printemps 1991).

Zinar, Ruth. "Educational Problems in Rural Vermont, 1875-
1900: A not so Distant Mirror." Vermont History,
51(1983).

UNPUBLISHED PAPERS AND THESISSES

Balcom, Karen. "From Recruitment to Retirement: Female
Teachers in the Public Schools of Late Nineteenth Century

———. 'As a rule men should be in charge of our large
schools': Female Spaces and Male Authority in the
Schools of Late-Nineteenth Century Halifax." Paper
presented to the Canadian Historical Association, Ottawa,
Ontario, June 8, 1993.

Booth, John Derek. "An Historical Geography of Brome County,

Bullen, John. "Child of the Industrial Age: Children, Work,
and Welfare in Late Nineteenth Century Ontario." Ph.D.

Burdett, Gillian Mary. "The High School for Girls, Montreal,


Fox, Michael J. "Time/Distance as a Factor in the Delivery of


McGill University, 1964.


Lewis, M. Colleen. "The Macdonald Consolidated School: An


University of British Columbia, 1970.


