NOTICE

The quality of this microform is heavily dependent upon the quality of the original thesis submitted for microfilming. Every effort has been made to ensure the highest quality of reproduction possible.

If pages are missing, contact the university which granted the degree.

Some pages may have indistinct print especially if the original pages were typed with a poor typewriter ribbon or if the university sent us an inferior photocopy.

Reproduction in full or in part of this microform is governed by the Canadian Copyright Act, R.S.C. 1970, c. C-30, and subsequent amendments.

AVIS

La qualité de cette microforme dépend grandement de la qualité de la thèse soumise au microfilmage. Nous avons tout fait pour assurer une qualité supérieure de reproduction.

S’il manque des pages, veuillez communiquer avec l’université qui a conféré le grade.

La qualité d’impression de certaines pages peut laisser à désirer, surtout si les pages originales ont été dactylographiées à l’aide d’un ruban usé ou si l’université nous a fait parvenir une photocopie de qualité inférieure.

La reproduction, même partielle, de cette microforme est soumise à la Loi canadienne sur le droit d’auteur, SRC 1970, c. C-30, et ses amendements subséquents.
From Punitive Attitudes to Ethical Sophistication of Mental Health Professionals in the Treatment of Pedophiles: The Theological and Ethical Significance of Robert Kegan’s Developmental Theory

by

Marguerite Emily Evans

A dissertation submitted to the Faculty of Theology, Saint Paul University, in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Theology)

© Marguerite Emily Evans
1996, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada
The author has granted an irrevocable non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of his/her thesis by any means and in any form or format, making this thesis available to interested persons.

L'auteur a accordé une licence irrévocable et non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de sa thèse de quelque manière et sous quelque forme que ce soit pour mettre des exemplaires de cette thèse à la disposition des personnes intéressées.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in his/her thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without his/her permission.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège sa thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

ISBN 0-612-11555-0
Marguerite EVANS

ABSTRACT

The issue of pedophilia is receiving increasing public attention and is presented today as one of grave concern. Pedophilia has been the topic of scientific study; the last few years have witnessed a profusion of literature on this subject from different perspectives. From the literature and from my clinical experience as a Registered Nurse within a psychiatric institution, two facts emerge.

Fact: (1) The scientific literature indicates an historical movement in the understanding of pedophilia--from an accepted institution, to criminal offence, to immorality, to, for some, an alternative lifestyle, to psychopathological disorder.

Fact: (2) Paradoxically, people working in health care institutions where pedophiles should especially be considered as needing treatment and care (a) generally lack "understanding" and (b) view pedophilia as immorality and criminal offence warranting punishment and death.

Thus there exists a problem which raises questions: (1) Why this paradoxical attitude? and (2) What can be done about it? My intent is to address these two questions. Therefore, to provide a clear understanding of the historical perception of pedophilia, I examine in chapter one the successive constructions of pedophilia and summarize the development of attitudes towards pedophilia and pedophiles in the course of Western civilization. I show how ancient Greek civilization for awhile kept its eye focused on 'paidophilia' as a "value." The ancient Jews, Egyptians, and later the Romans branded pederasty as a crime and instituted laws and punishments as a response. Christianity boldly set out the principles of a solution to adult-child sexual contact in its construct of "sin" and "immorality" but advanced little into the depth and darkness of the mystery of pedophilia. Today, medicine has begun to cultivate a complex field left fallow for centuries.

In chapter two I circumscribe the current problem in health care institutions by (1) reviewing literature on professional caregivers' attitudes toward the pedophilic client to establish which of the diverse
constructions of pedophilia analyzed in the historical research are assumed by such attitudes and (2) clarifying the notion of "attitude". Evidence in chapter two indicates that health care professionals working in institutions where pedophiles should especially be considered as needing treatment and care--generally lack understanding of the phenomenon, hold the view of pedophilia as immorality and criminal offence and have punitive attitudes toward pedophiles in their care. Theorists suggest that something more than punishment is required in order to yield the "good" of the pedophile and the community; "but," I ask: "are punitive attitudes all we can expect of professional caregivers?"

Next, in chapter three I present a framework, specifically the constructive-developmental theory of Robert Kegan, which (a) proffers a view of what it means to be a fully human being and (b) I believe is relevant to caregivers' reconception of attitudes toward pedophiles in their care. I argue that his theory describes a "natural ethic" which serves as a framework for analysing caregivers' punitive attitudes. In chapter four, I demonstrate this relevance by comparing and contrasting different views of human "being" as conceptualized by developmental theorists such as Kegan and as presumed from the empirical evidence of caregivers' attitudes. I sketch the ethical models used by health care professionals and show a correlation between levels of ethical sophistication and differences in attitudes toward pedophiles. To adopt a medical construction of pedophilia may require ethical sophistication: namely, an interindividual ethic by Kegan's standard. Kegan's framework reflects humankind's capacity to grow, to choose, to change, to work with paradox, conflict, and contradiction, to develop new evaluating criteria for ethical decision-making, self-reflection, and self-correction, to become caring and compassionate, and to assume responsibilities that go beyond the self to embrace the social good.

Finally, in chapter five, with the knowledge gained from the analysis of caregivers' ethical models and attitudes, I outline the role of theology, the ethical implications of theology, and how caregivers can be helped to
develop more-sophisticated moral attitudes toward pedophiles in their care. Thus the first four chapters of my dissertation constitute a "pre-text" for theological and ethical reflection and for illustrating how living-out a faith perspective, an ethic of care, and spirituality of compassion would mean that both the good of the person who is pedophilic and that of the community would be effected. For change to be wrought there is a need for challenge and support which can be accomplished through staff support groups and multidisciplinary dialogue.

The problem which I address in this dissertation project belongs to practical or applied ethics since it involves human action. My work is primarily a study presenting--from a particular angle--certain concerns and conclusions arising out of the scientific literature and my clinical experience in a psychiatric institution. It is a problem incident to a new realization of the role of theology and ethics.

In my survey of the psychological literature on profiles of caregivers I was unable to find ... studies done on the ethical models used by health care professionals vis-à-vis pedophiles. I found no investigation which had attempted to ascertain whether a correlation exists between levels of ethical sophistication, diverse "constructions of pedophilia," and different attitudes towards pedophiles. Hence, I was unable to locate any reported in-depth discussion of levels of ethical sophistication and their relative importance in the development of attitudes toward pedophiles, the capacity to adopt a "medical construction of pedophilia," and readiness to act compassionately. Therefore, within the literature, there is no evidence of attempts to seek a framework or to create a theory which (1) critiques a punitive response, (2) encourages ethical development of professional caregivers working in the area of treating pedophiles, and (3) guides more sophisticated moral attitudes and practices. Such a framework is the essence of my thesis. Thus my study is an original contribution to alleviating the problem of nontherapeutic attitudes.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Firstly, I want to remember my parents who were very important to making this thesis possible. My father, James Huchcroft, who died as I was beginning my research, is to be remembered for his compassion and unconditional love toward me which constituted the model for my relationship with a loving God. My mother, Ellathea Huchcroft, died two weeks after I defended my thesis. Were it not for the strength of spirit which she modelled for me throughout life, I might never have completed this project.

Many individuals, including the students and faculty of Saint Paul University, have influenced the preparation of this dissertation. In particular I wish to express my appreciation for the direction of my first thesis adviser, Dr. André Guindon. His wisdom, understanding, academic rigor, and challenging intellect encouraged me to be exacting in my research and presentation of my ideas. His unwavering belief in my project encouraged me; his vision of theology, ethics, and the human person enlarged my own.

I gratefully acknowledge the direction of Dr. Hubert Doucet who became my thesis adviser upon André’s untimely death and gave generously of his valuable time to read and critique my work.

I am especially indebted to three special people: my husband, James, for his sustained support and meticulous attention to the logistical details involved in completing the final draft of this thesis; and daughters, Heather and Nancy, for their love and patience even in the face of having to accommodate to changes in lifestyle and living environments. Without their forbearance, encouragement, love, and help this thesis would not have been completed.
Table of Contents

INTRODUCTION ................................................................. 1

HISTORICAL MOVEMENT IN UNDERSTANDING PEDOPHILIA ................. 4
  1.1 Pederasty as a Value ............................................. 5
  1.2 Pedophilia as Immorality ....................................... 12
  1.3 Pedophilia as Criminal Offence ................................ 22
  1.4 Pedophilia as "Sickness" or Psychopathological Disorder ....... 31
      Pedophilia Clinically Defined ................................. 31
      Treatment ...................................................... 33
      Factors Hindering Society's Ability to Deal with Pedophilia 43

PROFILE OF PROFESSIONAL CAREGIVERS AND THEIR ATTITUDES ......... 51
  2.1 Shape of the Problem ........................................... 51
  2.2 Attitude Defined ................................................ 56
  2.3 Attitudes Coming from Experience ................................ 58
  2.4 Observations Drawn from Academic Research .................. 61
  2.5 Empirical Research on Caregivers' Attitudes toward Pedophiles 67
  2.6 Why this Paradoxical Attitude? ................................ 75
  2.7 Societal Attitudes .............................................. 83
  2.8 Impact of Media on Attitudes .................................. 88
  2.9 Negative Effects of Punitive Attitudes ...................... 91
  2.10 What is the Source of Attitudes? ................................ 96

ROBERT KEGAN'S DEVELOPMENTAL THEORY AS RESOURCE TO CAREGIVERS .......... 101
  3.1 Overview of Developmental Theory ................................ 102
  3.2 Developmental Theory of Robert Kegan ........................ 107
  3.3 Culture of Embeddedness ...................................... 116
  3.4 Functions of Differing Cultures of Embeddedness ............ 117
  3.5 The Self-Transcending Principle ................................ 121
  3.6 Relevance of Kegan's Theory to Caregivers' Practice ....... 125

ETHICAL ANALYSIS OF EXISTING EMPIRICAL RESEARCH .................... 134
  4.1 The Incorporative Self ......................................... 136
      Adult Infantile Morality? .................................... 139
  4.2 The Impulsive Self ............................................. 147
      Adult Impulsive Morality? .................................. 152
  4.3 The Imperial Self ............................................... 156
      Adult Imperial Morality? .................................... 158
  4.4 The Interpersonal Self ......................................... 163
      Interpersonal Adult Morality? ............................... 165
  4.5 The Institutional Self ......................................... 171
      Adult Institutional Morality? ................................ 174
  4.6 The Interindividual Self ...................................... 180
      Interindividual Adult Morality? ............................. 182
  4.7 Summary .......................................................... 187

THEOLOGICAL AND ETHICAL CONTEXT ..................................... 190
  5.1 Theological Aspect .............................................. 191
  5.2 The Ethical Aspect .............................................. 227
  5.3 Conclusion: What Can Be Done? ................................ 242

SUMMARY ........................................................................... 249

SOURCES CONSULTED ...................................................... 251
INTRODUCTION

The issue of pedophilia is receiving increasing public attention and is presented today as one of grave concern. Pedophilia has been the topic of scientific study: the last few years have witnessed a profusion of literature on this subject from different perspectives. From the literature and from my clinical experience as a Registered Nurse within a psychiatric institution, two facts emerge.

Fact: (1) The scientific literature indicates an historical movement in the understanding of pedophilia—from an accepted institution, to criminal offence, to immorality, to, for some, an alternative lifestyle, to psychopathological disorder.

Fact: (2) Paradoxically, people working in health care institutions where pedophiles should especially be considered as needing treatment and care (a) generally lack "understanding" and (b) view pedophilia as immorality and criminal offence warranting punishment and death.

Thus there exists a problem which raises questions: (1) Why this paradoxical attitude? and (2) What can be done about it? My intent is to address these two questions. Therefore, to provide a clear understanding of the historical perception of pedophilia, I shall examine in chapter one the successive constructions of pedophilia and summarize the development of attitudes towards pedophilia and pedophiles in the course of Western civilization. In chapter two I shall circumscribe the current problem in health care institutions by (1) reviewing literature on professional caregivers' attitudes toward the pedophilic client to establish which of the diverse constructions of pedophilia analyzed in the historical research are assumed by such attitudes and (2) clarifying the notion of "attitude".

Next, in chapter three I shall present a framework, specifically the constructive-developmental theory of Robert Kegan, which (a) proffers a view of what it means to be a fully human being and (b) I believe is relevant to caregivers' reconception of attitudes toward pedophiles in their care. Although Kegan does not apply his theory to the care of pedophiles, in
chapter four I shall demonstrate this relevance by comparing and contrasting different views of human "being" as conceptualized by developmental theorists such as Kegan and as presumed from the empirical evidence of caregivers’ attitudes. I intend to sketch the ethical models used by health care professionals and to show a correlation between levels of ethical sophistication and differences in attitudes toward pedophiles.

Finally, in chapter five, with the knowledge gained from the analysis of caregivers’ ethical models, I shall outline the role of theology, the ethical implications of theology, and how caregivers can be helped to develop more sophisticated moral attitudes toward pedophiles in their care.

In my survey of the psychological literature on profiles of caregivers I was unable to find any studies done on the ethical models used by health care professionals vis-à-vis pedophiles. I found no investigation which has attempted to ascertain whether a correlation exists between levels of ethical sophistication, diverse "constructions of pedophilia," and different attitudes towards pedophiles. Hence, I was unable to locate any reported in-depth discussion of levels of ethical sophistication and their relative importance in the development of attitudes toward pedophiles, the capacity to adopt a "medical construction of pedophilia," and readiness to act compassionately. Therefore, within the literature, there is no evidence of attempts to seek a framework or to create a theory which (1) critiques a punitive response, (2) encourages ethical development of professional caregivers working in the area of treating pedophiles, and (3) guides more sophisticated moral attitudes and practices. Such a framework is the essence of my thesis. Thus my study will be an original contribution to the verification of the problem of nontherapeutic attitudes. It is important  

'I have created the term "medical construction" out of the heterogenous ways medical practitioners have recast pedophilia in terms of their theoretical models of pathology, i.e., pedophilia as anomaly, psychopathological, mental or sexual disorder, sickness, illness or disease warranting psychotherapeutic approaches rather than punishment.
for the reader to keep in mind that my main objective is not so much verification of, but what to do about, such attitudes.

I now turn to the first chapter and the historical overview of constructions of pedophilia.
CHAPTER ONE
HISTORICAL MOVEMENT IN UNDERSTANDING PEDOPHILIA

In this chapter based on the historical literature, I shall trace successive constructions of the concept of "pedophilia" and summarize development of attitudes towards pedophilia and pedophiles in the course of Western civilization. My objective is not to reconstruct the past but to show that different cultures in different times did not share our worldview (i.e., of pedophilia as sinful, criminal, or sick), perceive the same elements, nor respond as we do.

Although historically there have been many understandings of pedophilia, my thesis will focus on three constructions of how pedophilia is viewed: (1) immorality, (2) criminal offence, and (3) psychopathological disorder. It is important to be aware that the breadth of constructions of pedophilia has included pederasty as an educational system and pedophilia as an alternative sexual lifestyle. Constructs such as the latter two invite many questions; however, due to space constraints, such questions will not be addressed in this thesis.

In my view several factors or historical strands have coalesced within Western civilization to cause the problem of pedophilia to be more complex and vexing than many other human service problems with which health care professionals contend. These factors which have evolved as part of our complex mental apparatus, I shall show to be connected with and to be hindering our response to the pedophilic client. Because of this hindrance pedophiles are not always treated with care and compassion.
1.1 Pederasty as a Value

The phenomenon of pedophilia is delineated in a cultural context, is subject to socialization,¹ and often contains many ambiguities. For example, at different times since the beginning of Christianity, it has been equated with homosexuality.²

A significant part of Western tradition regarding sexual behaviour is traceable to Greek explanations. Historians such as Vern Bullough and Hans Licht show that within ancient Greek society many people valued pederasty³


³When speaking of the ancient Greek world I will use the term pederasty rather than the later latinized modern term pederasty. Throughout history neither the spelling nor the meaning of the concept pedophilia remained consistent. The modern word most commonly used, "pederasty" or "paederasty," has been anglicized from the Greek "paiderastia" which referred to "pair" (boy) and "eraStas" (a lover). The term indicated the spiritual and sensual affection felt by an adult male for a pubescent boy: see Vern L. Bullough, Sexual Variance in Society and History (New York: John Wiley & Sons, 1976), 102; Hans Licht, Sexual Life in Ancient Greece, ed. Lawrence H. Dawson, trans. J.H. Freese (London: G. Routledge, 1933), 413. The word "boy" did not allude to a child of tender age but to a sexually matured boy, one who had entered puberty. "Boy" may be retained since in Greece puberty began at an earlier age than that set by today’s standards: see Licht, Sexual Life in Ancient Greece, 416. Philippe Ariès contends that the concept of the ages of life did not date from ancient times but originated in the sixth century Byzantine Empire. As soon as young children no longer needed the constant solicitude of a prime caregiver, they belonged to the adult world. Ariès locates the discovery of the nature of childhood in the thirteenth century, although, until the eighteenth century the terms puer and adolescens were used indiscriminately, adolescence being confused with childhood: see Ariès, Centuries of Childhood: A Social History of Family Life, trans. Robert Baldick (Paris: Librairie Plon, 1960; New York: Random House, 1962), 18-19, 20-21, 25-29, 47. Lloyd deMause disagrees with Ariès, arguing that the concept of the
and institutionalized it. Until our society comes to terms with the Greek account of sexual behaviour, it denies the reality that, even in Western culture, attitudes toward pederasty other than those adopted by the dominant contemporary culture are possible.

Different perceptions of ancient pederasty exist.¹ Some authors suggest that pederasty² was part of the Greek educational system—a


¹It is difficult to attain an accurate picture of how ancient pederasty was practised. Historians of pedophilia are dealing with a subject whose very existence Western society has attempted to deny. They have had to be resourceful and frequently rely on unconventional sources: fiction, poetry, autobiographies, lyrics, graffiti, etc. Licht concentrates on poetic material and lacks psychological and sociological insight. Bullough has relied heavily on secondary authorities such as Symonds, Licht and Eagleton rather than drawing more heavily on primary sources. Kenneth James Dover situates the beginning of this practice from about 600 B.C. onwards: see Dover, *The Greeks*, from the British Broadcasting Corporation’s television series by Christopher Burstall and Kenneth Dover (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1981), 45; Kenneth James Dover, *Greek Popular Morality in the Time of Plato and Aristotle* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1974), 213. Thorkil Vanggaard contends that during the 7th century B.C. in the Dorian world, pederasty constituted a solemn sacred act—a ritual at a boy’s initiation into adulthood—which only later became part of an educational institution: see Vanggaard, *Phallos: A Symbol and Its History in the Male World*, translated from the Danish by the author (New York: International Universities Press, 1972), 65.

masculine institution established beyond the primary grades for the purpose of increasing virtues, most notably that of wisdom in a young man; inculcating specific values; and ensuring him a liberal education by having him befriend and emulate a suitable male elder. Serving as a mentor, the elder was responsible for the younger’s behaviour. Boys were potential defenders, their education requiring development of manly excellences and survival skills—the ability to cope with any situation which might arise. Out of this period’s desire for military prowess pederasty was believed to give rise to heroism and sacrifice: the lover would be ashamed to abandon his post in the presence of his beloved whilst the beloved, in the face of danger, would not desert his lover but help him. The Greeks did not

method employed by their authors. For example, Plato absorbed and presented the public’s mixed feelings on love by way of a dialectic method of argumentation. Dialectical reasoning was hypothetical, founded in premises admitted by disputants, and held all truth or doctrinal claims in a state of conversational suspension. Moreover, Plato’s literary publics were audiences of listeners not readers. Plato relied on narrators’ live voices to help impart the attitudes of his characters, their speeches and arguments. Hence his meaning today suffers from misunderstandings about and misrepresentations of the tone in which it was delivered: see Victorino Tejera, Plato's Dialogues One by One: A Structural Interpretation (New York: Irvington, 1984), 10-11, 46, 86-91, 93; Yvon Brès, La Psychologie de Platon (Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 1973).


Henry Teloh, Socratic Education in Plato's Early Dialogues (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1986), 69; Bullough, Sexual Variance, 108-109; Plutarch, "On Education," in Plutarch’s Morals: Ethical Essays, trans. with Notes and Index by Arthur Richard Shilleto (London: G. Bell, 1908), 5-6. According to Licht such import was accorded this manner of educating male youth that a boy was censured if he failed to find an elder companion: see Licht, Sexual Life in Ancient Greece, 415, 418-419, 441.

characterize children as asexual or innocent: it was assumed that children could both "enjoy" and "welcome" the lover's embrace.\^9

For Greeks such as Plato, the pederast was not a monster warranting dishonour but merely a libertine motivated by the omnipresent desire for pleasure.\^10 Writers, such as Plato suggest that negative sentiments existed. For example, in the Symposium\^11 Plato noted that a father, upon learning of a man being in love with his son, would immediately place his son in the care of an attendant to prevent contact between the lover and the boy. Plato recorded name-calling amongst young boys toward comrades who had accepted a lover.\^12 Pursuit of a boy for sensual purposes or seduction of a boy for monetary gain resulted in dishonour and loss of citizen-rights.\^13 Sexual intercourse with sexually immature boys was punished by death or banishment.\^14 By Plutarch's time, the practice of man-boy love had encoun-


\^11Plato, "Symposium," 182a-183d; Foucault, Use of Pleasure, 191; Dover, Greek Morality, 215.

\^12Aristophanes' Clouds reveals that the Greek pederast was the target of jest and recipient of droll nicknames see: Aristophanes, "Clouds," 905-910; Licht, Sexual Life in Ancient Greece, 493-495; Arno Karlen, Sexuality and Homosexuality: A New View (New York: W. W. Norton & Co., 1971), 35-36. Licht suggests that women, for the most part, objected to man-boy love and that hetairai (prostitutes) were jealous toward customers engaged in paidophilic intrigues. Orpheus was said to have been attacked, mutilated, and killed by girls and women who felt themselves spurned by his devotion to the love of boys: see Licht, Sexual Life in Ancient Greece, 447, 462.

\^13Dover, Greek Morality, 210, 215; Licht, Sexual Life in Ancient Greece, 460; Bullough, Sexual Variance, 112-113.

\^14Licht, Sexual Life in Ancient Greece, 417, 438, 453; Bullough, Sexual Variance, 101.
tered public protest and personal doubt. Other ancient cultures such as Islam also tolerated pederastic behaviour.

Such a society would be deemed permissive from our current Western viewpoint. However, awareness of ancient sexual practice can aid us in exposing the motivation of our contemporary discourse. For Michel Foucault, ancient Greek culture reveals:

There is no single, all-encompassing strategy, valid for all of society and uniformly bearing on all the manifestations of sex... the idea that there have been repeated attempts, by various means, to reduce all of sex to its reproductive function, its heterosexual and adult form, and its matrimonial legitimacy fails to take into account the manifold objectives aimed for, the manifold means employed in the different sexual politics concerned with the two sexes, the different age groups and social classes. What is significant is not whether the Greeks were mistaken, but rather, that they did not close their eyes to pederastic activity. Such activity was subjected to contemplation: they debated the issue, morally reflected upon it, and constructed sexuality in relation to their values and perception of truth.

Anthropologists also refute the belief that pederasty is a recent

---


16Karlen, Sexuality and Homosexuality, 232-233. In ancient Islam a man having sexual intercourse with a girl before her menarche was punished: see Bullough, Sexual Variance, 208, 214, 224-230, 238.


18Foucault, Use of Pleasure, 252.

19In general personal matters like sex escaped the investigative framework of classical cultural anthropologists. Some collected relevant data but fearful of damaging their reputations refrained from publishing it. Also problematic was the bias and gender of the investigator; aboriginal reticence about sex in general or about particular practices; failure to distinguish between homosexual behaviour and pederasty; previous encounters with the repressive attitudes and intolerance of missionaries, government officials and others; see Wayne R. Dyens and Stephen Donaldson, eds., "Introduction," in Ethnographic Studies of Homosexuality, Studies in Homosexuality, Vol. 2 (New York: Garland, 1992), vii-xi; Gisela Bleibtreu-Ehrenberg, "Pederasty among Primitives: Institutionalized Initiation and
occurrence; that it is unknown in parts of the world other than the West; and that it is universally abhorrent. 30 Historical and anthropological evidence, by revealing the plasticity of human sexual behaviour, helps us come to terms with sexual variance. It leads to the inference that pederastic behaviour can be understood only in terms of the specific social factors, beliefs and value systems that either promote or inhibit behaviour. 21 In different times and in different cultures, it was believed that sexuality was created to serve social aims and purposes other than procreation and sexual satisfaction. Within ancient Greek communities paiderasty took on a particular function just as it does in some primitive societies.


While a fuller analysis of pedophilia likely would reveal a more complex picture, it seems useful to mention a construct in which pedophilia is viewed as an alternative sexual orientation or lifestyle. From this perspective, some argue that pederastic behaviour can be as valid as adult heterosexual behaviour. Tom O'Carroll, a pedophile, believes it would be wrong to accept medical treatment aimed deliberately at destroying, or 'redirecting' as doctors would call it, those very deeply held affections for another person which in normal people are held to be amongst the finer manifestations of the human spirit. I cannot accept that anyone with any self-respect would consent to being 'treated', that they would buy this particular euphemism any more than they would consent to being 'doctored' like a tom cat, or 'put down' like an unwanted mongrel.\(^2\)

In contemporary Western societies this typology of pedophilia is accepted only by marginal groups.

The practical reality is that Western society does not accept this argument and views any overt or covert expression of pedophilia as sinful, criminal or sick. American sexologist and paediatric psychoendocrinologist John Money contends that part of the evolution of pederastic behaviour in our Western society needs to be understood as a repercussion of rejection. Condemnation is mirrored back. Those who castigate are held in contempt by the pedophile and chided for their intolerance of his expression of sexuality.\(^3\) This has led to formation of pedophile subcultures and/or

---


networks\textsuperscript{24} which serve as mutual support groups and to the promotion of adult-child sexual relationships which are unfettered by conventional constraints. Other constructs of pedophilia exist and to these we now turn.

1.2 Pedophilia as Immorality

I shall now examine the construct which emerged in ancient Roman culture—pedophilia as immorality.\textsuperscript{25} In Rome pederasty was not officially condoned and never really flourished as an idealized educational institution.\textsuperscript{26} However, houses of prostitution existed in which were kept both boys and girls, most of whom were slaves.\textsuperscript{27} Some of the very wealthy had harems of boys (paedagogia) who primarily served as diversions for their masters.\textsuperscript{28} Republican writers (e.g., Virgil, Horace, Cicero, Catullus, and Tibullus) and first-century imperial writers (e.g., Juvenal and Martial) wrote extensively of boy love.\textsuperscript{29}

Influenced by Stoicism and neo-Platonism, the Romans became increasingly more rigid in what they accepted as permissible sexual behaviour: for them participation in carnal love was immoral and constituted a sin. Roman

\begin{thebibliography}{99}
\bibitem{O'Carroll} O’Carroll, \textit{Paedophilia}, 9, 106-123; Cox, "Caregiver’s Dilemma," 76-77.
\bibitem{Greek terms} Greek terms were Latinized: the Romans coined the term paederactus or paedico from the Greek word paiderasty: see Bullough, \textit{Sexual Variance}, 142.
\end{thebibliography}
asceticism emerged, coming to dominate this essentially moralistic people and to permeate early Christianity.\textsuperscript{30} When Christianity became the official religion of the Roman Empire early in the fourth century, it joined the existing discourse on sex.\textsuperscript{31} Sexual activity was judged sinful. Sin involved penance: public confession and reconciliation became the means of disciplining parishioners and of maintaining ecclesial purity.\textsuperscript{32} In the late-fourth-century, penance for seduction of boys by monks included public beating, imprisonment in chains, six months of bread and water, and being spat upon.\textsuperscript{33} As public penance gave way to private penance, sexual activity became increasingly categorized.\textsuperscript{34} Sexuality was directed exclusively toward procreation; hence, pederasty was interpreted as wickedness or sin-against-nature. In general, penances pertaining to pederasty lacked consistency; acts were not equally culpable, depending on whether they were


\textsuperscript{33}Roswell, \textit{Social Tolerance}, 183, 188.

committed by boys, youths or adults. Penance could range from twenty to one hundred days and could include fasting or being beaten with rods.

Hostility toward and influential arguments opposing pederastic activity derived from concerns about eating certain animals and perceptions regarding animal sexual behaviour. Christians described pederasty as "unnatural" in spite of the fact that many recognized some animal behaviour to be incestous. Unwanted children were abandoned, sold into slavery, and used for sexual purposes. Justin the Martyr reacted to this practice

---

36Bullough, Sexual Variance, 360; Bailey, Homosexuality, 103-104, 106, 108.

37For example, the Mosaic prohibition against eating certain animals (Lev. 11:5) was equated to various sexual sins: see Barnabae Epistola, "Epistle of Barnabas," in Didache, Epistle of Barnabas, trans. Kleist, 51; Bailey, Homosexuality, 84.


39Ovid, Metamorphoses, Book X, quoted in Boswell, Social Tolerance, 152. For current research on adult/juvenile animal sexual behaviour see: Vangaard, Phallós, 73; Connie M. Anderson and Craig Biebert, "Adolescent/Adult Copulatory Behavior in Nonhuman Primates," in Biocommunications, ed. Feierman, 178-179; Frans B.M. de Waal, "Sociosexual Behavior Used for Tension Regulation in All Age and Sex Combinations among Bonobos," Ibid., 378-393.

primarily because of the possibility of a man unwittingly (a) breaking the
laws of Leviticus and Deuteronomy or (b) becoming impure by engaging in
incestuous relations with a son, brother, or other close relative.

At the close of the second century, Clement of Alexandria expected
Christians\(^6\) not to experience desire at all and warned them not to engage
in the licentiousness of the Sodomites who burn with frenzied passion for
boys.\(^4\) Concern was not with wronging one’s neighbour but with creating a
bad reputation for oneself and incurring God’s punishment. Clement also
expressed pity for the boys who were prostituted by slave-dealers, but his
apprehension centred on the possibility of committing incest. Further,
there was the overshadowing notion that the boy had denied his own sex and
that of all men by acting the part of a woman—in tolerable conduct within
a society organized in accordance with the belief that women are subordinate
to men.\(^5\)

---


\(^5\) Bailey, *Homosexuality*, 162.
In the twelfth century church and state shared jurisdiction over
punishing offences. If an offender, before charges had been laid, realized
the wrongdoing and became penitent, the offender would be turned over to the
Church to be dealt with according to ecclesial canons. However, an
individual who repeated an offence and again sought penance could be
admitted to penance but was then to be banished from the community.40 By
1140 the sin of stuprum puere merited capital punishment if the act had been
completed but only banishment if not completed." Increasingly Christianity
showed vengefulness and punitive fervour; the imagery of Sodom and Gomorrah
enhanced punitive response. From the sixteenth century onward, Catholic
moral theology’s endless, microscopic distinctions and casuistic minutiae;
the Church’s determination to eradicate disorder in the Papal States; and
its rigorous enforcement of justice by striking terror in wrongdoers -- often
led to atrocities. In 1586, for example, Pope Sixtus V condemned a priest
and a boy to be burned at the stake for sodomy.45

Unlike the Greeks, the early Christians viewed children as “innocent.”46 Viewing children as inherently sinful, Augustine debunked the myth
of childhood ‘innocence’ stating: “infants are harmless because of physical

40Bailey, Homosexuality, 80; Jacques Rossiaud, "Prostitution, Sex and
Society in French Towns," in Western Sexuality, ed. Ariès and Béjin, 92.
If the child called loudly for assistance, it was assumed he did not
acquiesce to the act, therefore, he would be exempt from legal penalty but
required to do penance according to the Church’s rule: see Bailey,
Homosexuality, 96-97.

41Bullough, Sexual Variance, 382.

42Ludwig Freiherr von Pastor, The History of the Popes from the Close
of the Middle Ages: Drawn from the Secret Archives of the Vatican and Other
Original Sources from the German, Vol. XXI (London: Paul Kegan, Trench &
Trübner, 1932), 92; Uta Ranke-Heineman, Runuchs for Heaven: The Catholic
Church and Sexuality, trans. John Brownjohn (Hamburg: Hoffmann und Campe
Verlag, 1988; London: André Deutsch, 1990), 221.

43Brown, Body and Society, 70-71. Third century Christian attitudes
toward the after-life were based on the belief that in the other world one
would recover the health and innocence of childhood: see Peter Robert
Lamont Brown, The Making of Late Antiquity (Cambridge, MA: Harvard
University, 1978), 77-78.
weakness, not because of any innocence of mind." 47 In the infant he identified jealousy; in the child, manipulation, vengeance, disobedience and avoidance of schoolwork. 48 However, the notion of childhood innocence resurfaced at various times throughout history and coalesced with the notion that children are asexual. 49

Jean Jacques Rousseau associated childhood with primitivism and prelogicism; the weakness of childhood with its innocence. 50 This interpretation characterizes the twentieth century's predominant concept of childhood. For many, Rousseau manufactured the 'innocent child'. In 1896, Sigmund Freud 51 emphasized the importance of infant sexuality and judged the popular belief that children are asexual to be a "common error." Since


48Augustinus, Confessions, 1.9.3, 10.12.1.


Freud, decades of research have revealed the existence of infant and childhood sexual responses and feelings. \(^{52}\)

In my view, the concept of children as 'innocent' and asexual takes us to the heart of the contemporary problem of pedophilia. The phrase "children are innocent" is problematic in that it can mean many things: that children are without knowledge; that children can do no wrong; that children are pure and untouched. Such is its ambiguity. This phrase poses problems not because children are guilty of sexual abuse, but because we fail to recognize the ambiguity and the implications of our use of such language and concepts. Conventional wisdom tends to view sexual relations as the line of demarcation between innocence and worldliness. The longer that children are considered to remain in this 'state of innocence', the longer their sexuality will be denied. This purifying of children makes them radically 'other'\(^{53}\) and situates them outside of the human race in a beautiful, tender, and far away world; for as human beings, we are constitutively sexual. Sexuality is an ontological reality; it speaks of our innermost being and our fundamental way of existing. It is not merely biological. As the essence of our being human, it enables us to be in relationship with others. Recognizing children as inherently sexual means recognizing the essence of their humanity. One can also assume that the


more firmly children are fixed in this particular category of being innocent and asexual, the easier it will be for society, in cases of pedophilia, to blame and to punish the adult for (1) allegedly destroying the child's innocence, and (2) supposedly rendering the child sexual. Pedophilia does not render children sexual beings; they already are sexual beings. Yet, we castigate pedophiles for allegedly causing children to become sexual.

The issue of childhood sexuality arose in the context of the Church's penitential system, to which was attached the element of secrecy. Following the Council of Trent (1561), questions posed to children in the confessional were to be obscure, yet leading. Contemporary psychology suggests that refusing to let sexual matters become part of public knowledge, and confining them within private thoughts to be aired only in secret places such as the confessional creates ambiguity and confusion in a child's mind. Children are left to script their own sexual worlds in secretive, dark nooks and crannies.

The mystery and secrecy with which our forebears and contemporary society cloak sex leaves children with many unanswered questions and may leave children more accepting of pedophilic relationships for here is an adult who is willing to discuss sexual issues and share sexual desires. In initiating the child into a new level of existence and in giving confidence, the pedophilic adult evokes confidence from the child.

In addition, the element of secrecy, which developed historically

---

54 Foucault, Introduction, 18-23; Ranke-Heineman, Sunuchs, 246-247.


within the ecclesial penitential and administrative systems, hampers contemporary society's ability to deal more effectively with pedophilia, reinforces the secrecy so characteristic of pedophilic practice, and gives rise to considerable controversy. Hurt surfaced and anger increased toward church and pedophile alike when knowledge arose of cases in which child sexual abuse had gone undetected, sometimes for years, because of confessional practice by the abuser and/or secrecy practised by the Church hierarchy.  

The construction of pedophilia as immorality acquired a twist as venereal disease increasingly threatened health. Society utilized this threat to reinforce the traditional moral message; but it was a mixed message. As medical science overstepped religion as the dominant influence on sexual precepts in the late eighteenth and nineteenth century, the two considerations of protecting the community and immorality merged. Fear of venereal disease and the threat to health were utilized to reinforce the need to employ undefiled children as outlets for adult sexual release in order to protect the community. It was deemed immoral to have sexual relations with frequented prostitutes because of the risk of spreading disease.


Bullough, Sexual Variance, 570.
The Victorian myth that sexual intercourse with a virgin could effect a cure for venereal disease created a growing demand within brothels for virgin prostitutes. In London even prepubescent children were sought for some customers—the assumption being that they would be clean. Thus a construct for adult-child sex was set up and became part of a social morality in which survival and its associated needs overrode all other considerations.

Within the construct of pedophilia as immorality, the pederast was denounced as one guilty of a very grave sin. The sinner was offered reconciliation with God through the Church's penitential system—the presupposition being that this human desire, this human failing, could be transformed and corrected through confession and penance. The construction of pedophilia as sin or immorality presupposes that a pedophile can be exhorted to mend his ways, to abstain from pedophilic behaviour, and to bring forth the fruits of repentance. The notion that a pedophile can change behaviour by an act of will has been debunked by medical science which, as we shall see, shows that change of such behaviour is not nearly so simple as "refraining from."  

6In England Uranian poets promoted Greek pederasty and took working-class boys under their tutelage with the goal of loving, helping and guiding them: see Tannahill, Sex in History, 367-373; Bullough, Sexual Variance, 570-572; Vern Bullough, "History in Adult Human Sexual Behavior with Children and Adolescents in Western Societies," in Biosocial Dimensions, ed. Feieman, 74-77.

1.3 Pedophilia as Criminal Offence

The construction of pedophilia as criminal offence took shape in antiquity. From the literary testimony to the love of boys found in an ancient Egyptian papyrus dating back more than 4,500 years, Hans Licht submits that pederasty was widespread in early Egypt.\(^{62}\) Bullough, however, suggests that pederasty was abominated by ancient Egyptian gods.\(^{63}\) He judges confessions found in mortuary texts compiled for the Book of the Dead\(^ {64}\) to be representative of crimes and shortcomings deemed unacceptable by Egyptian society.

The ancient Jews branded pederasty as a capital crime, punishable in most cases by stoning to death.\(^ {65}\) Child marriage was practised within

Feierman, 448.


\(^ {63}\) Bullough, *Sexual Variance*, 64.

\(^ {64}\) For example, "I have not done that which the gods abominate . . . I have not had sexual relations with a boy": see John A. Wilson, trans., "Egyptian Myths, Tales, and Mortuary Texts," in *Ancient Near Eastern Texts Relating to the Old Testament*, ed. James Bennett Pritchard (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1950), 34, 35.

\(^ {65}\) The Babylonian Talmud: Sanhedrin I, ed. Isidore Epstein, trans. Jacob Schacter and H. Freedman, Vol. 1 (London: Soncino Press, 1935-1952), 54a-56b; Talmud Sanhedrin, Tractate Sanhedrin, Chapters 1-11, trans. Jacob Neusner, Brown Judaic Studies, no. 84 (Chico, CA: Scholars Press, 1984-1985), 1C-1G. Chapter seven of the Sanhedrin tractate of the Babylonian Talmud records a debate about the age at which a male attains sexual maturity: see Babylonian Talmud, Sanhedrin 55b. It was decided that "pederasty with a child below nine years of age is not deemed as pederasty with a child above that:" see Babylonian Talmud, Sanhedrin 54b, 54bfn, 55afn. Since a child of a lesser age is unable to engage in sexual intercourse, no guilt can be incurred by the adult. The female child was deemed sexually immature if she was less than three years of age. She could be acquired in marriage "by coition" at three years and a day: see Babylonian Talmud, Sanhedrin 55b. Neusner’s translation of this passage in the Sanhedrin tractate uses the term "betrothed by intercourse:" see Neusner, *Tractate Sanhedrin, Chapters 1-11*, Bavli Sanhedrin 7.X.V. In the Jerusalem Talmud, however, clarification as to what felonies could be put to death by stoning for sexual transgressions makes no reference to the age of three years and a day as indicative of sexual maturity for girls: see Talmud, Yerushalmi. English, *The Talmud of the Land of Israel: A Preliminary Translation and Explanation*, trans. Jacob Neusner, Chicago Studies in the History of Judaism, no. 31 (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982-), 7:5. A boy of nine years and one day was considered mature enough to acquire his childless brother's widow through intercourse, yet was not viewed mature enough to divorce her: see Mishnah. English, *The
ancient Judaism; marriage for females took place usually at the age of twelve. Thus the ancient Jews judged sexual violation of young unbetrothed girls as punishable by death, yet sanctioned child marriage thereby setting up the condition for adult sexual relations with children.  

Within Old Testament society, children constituted property belonging to their father. A daughter's chastity reflected the father's financial interest--her economic value being bound up with her likelihood of marriage and his receipt of prospective gifts. If the girl were violated while unbetrothed, then the offender would have to compensate the father for economic loss sustained by the damage to his "property." Thus, cultural capital was invested in the concern about adult-child sexual contact.

By loudly insisting on the purity of the child and by ascribing to the child a central feature of desirability--purity--particularly the female child, ancient Jewish culture created a seditious echo: corruption and eroticism. By defining the child as desirable and in need of protection from desire, Jewish society, like the Greek, created the one who desires. Likewise, the Roman senate strove to protect the chastity of free-born Roman

---


"Ephraim Elimelech Urbach notes a Baraita dealing with an am ha-arez and laws of associateship which authorize taking from an am ha-arez (someone lacking culture and knowledge of the Torah) "daughters who are minors in marriage, but not those who are of age:" see Urbach, The Sages: Their Concepts and Beliefs, trans. Israel Abrahms (Jerusalem: Magnes Press, Hebrew University, 1975), 636. Ben-Zion Schereschewsky points out that by talmudic times some sages became opposed to child marriages and forbade a father giving his minor daughter in marriage unless she was mature enough to give consent. However, in later times parents became reluctant to delay their daughters' marriages until they had matured because of fear that they might be treated licentiously: see Cecil Roth and Geoffrey Wigoder, eds., Encyclopaedia Judaica (New York: Macmillan Co., 1971-1972), s.v. "Child Marriage," by Ben-Zion Schereschewsky; Jacob Neusner, Judaism: The Evidence of the Mishnah (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1981), 60-61, 92-95.

minors. Sexual issues were essentially proprietary. The legally sophisticated Romans worked out of a notion of rights and ensured that their rights over children were not violated.\textsuperscript{68} To the Romans we owe the beginning and development of positive law\textsuperscript{69}—a factor which later I shall show became an impediment to contemporary society's ability to deal with pedophilia.

Gradually a corpus of juridical literature came into being and was accepted as having legal authority. Indecent assault upon a woman, girl, or boy resulted in capital punishment. Raping underage virgins of lower rank was punished by condemnation to the mines—of higher rank, by exile.\textsuperscript{70} Stuprum, (corruption or defilement of a virgin, widow, or boy) was declared a punishable capital crime.\textsuperscript{71} About 305 A.D. the Spanish Council of Elvira issued a decree denying communion even in extremis to those who engaged in sexual activity with boys.\textsuperscript{72} Laws endeavoured to protect minors and


\textsuperscript{69}Hegel, Philosophy of History, 288-289. Ancient literature alluded to: (1) the Lex Scantinia reportedly passed in the year 226 B.C. in response to sexual overtures made to the son of M. Claudius Marcellus, and (2) legal measures being taken during the later Republic in a handful of cases related to sexual acts involving boys: see Bailey, Homosexuality, 64-81; Westermarck, Christianity and Morals, 370-372; Boswell, Social Tolerance, 62-71; William Gordon Holmes, The Age of Justinian and Theodora: A History of the Sixth Century A.D., 2d ed. (London: G. Bell, 1912), 120. However, nothing remains of the Lex Scantinia and there is no further mention of legal strictures taken against pederastic activity until the beginning of the third century A.D.


\textsuperscript{71}Digesta, Digest of Justinian, 48.5.6.1; 48.5.9 (8); Bailey, Homosexuality, 68, 80.

societal well-being; however, they had little effect before the fourth century. By 326 A.D. violation of the chastity of a girl by her tutor was punished by deportation—rape of a girl, consumption by fire. Theology informed the state regarding manner of punishment; even into the twelfth century punishment for sodomizing a child was consignment to flames. According to John Boswell, the Roman transition from tolerance of pederasty to hostility toward it resulted almost totally from the rise of corporate states and institutions (legal, civil, military and religious) with the increasing desire and power to regulate the private aspects of human life.

In medieval mainland Europe, rediscovery and revision of ancient political works such as Justinian’s Roman law renewed interest in lawmaking. Both canon and civil law derived from Roman law. Fortified by scholasticism, the Church claimed that matters of morals and sex fell within canon law’s purview. Western assumptions about sexuality, based upon early Christian theological presuppositions, were reset in legal and ecclesiastical thought and with little modification continued to govern Western thinking down to the twentieth century.

By the late twelfth, thirteenth, and fourteenth centuries widespread fear of disruptive soc’al elements; the rise of absolute government; institutional rigidity; plus a quest by secular and ecclesiastical authorities for intellectual, institutional, and corporate uniformity fuelled return to fourth century intolerance of sexual diversity. The Renaissance was a period of contradictions. Sexual activity occurred between men and boys at

---

7Boswell, Social Tolerance, 78.


7Boswell, Social Tolerance, 121.

7Bullough, Sexual Variance, 378-407; Boswell, Social Tolerance, 269-272.
various times and in different parts of the world. For using numerous children as sexual objects both before and after he killed them, Gilles de Rais ("Bluebeard") was hanged in 1440 at Nantes, France.

The Reformation effected increasing church intervention in sexual matters, more accusations and threats of exposure against many, and a craze for capital punishment for sexual crimes. The seventeenth and eighteenth centuries witnessed more-liberal sexual mores. New participants surfaced in the discourse. Stories exalted and admired the seducer of the child, revealed interest in variant sexual behaviour; marked a tendency toward sexual experimentation; and were interpreted as a microcosm of growing societal depravation. In the eighteenth century as disorder increased, court cases multiplied and punishments were made harsher. Reflecting a desire to articulate a discourse on sex that was derived from rationality, and not solely from morality, Enlightenment philosophers drafted their concepts in accord with reason and nature. Aware that ancient Greece and Rome had practised pederasty, Voltaire, for example, wrote a rationalization

---


of "amour nommé socratique" in his *Philosophical Dictionary.* While he did not wholeheartedly support the practice, he favoured some degree of understanding. His awareness of the resemblance of young boys to women and his capacity to reason enabled him to explain sexual variance in a very natural manner, indicative of a new level of toleration. Although he referred to pederastic behaviour as "vice," "sordid outrage against nature," "weakness," "disgusting abomination," "mistake of nature," and "nonsense," Voltaire coined more neutral language, calling pederasty "ordinary lot" and "disorder." For its time, the essay can be called revolutionary!

However, this newfound tolerance was short-lived; for with the emergence of medical thought on the dangers of sex, more restrictive views of sex reappeared. The Roman law tradition had influenced the legal codes of continental Europe. In England the hostility and harshly punitive attitude toward sex ran so deeply that Jeremy Bentham, out of fear, refused to publish his essay on pederasty in which he opposed capital punishment on utilitarian grounds and attacked ascetic sexual morality. Bentham made the plea: "Let us be unjust to no man: not even to a pederast".

---


8 Bentham asserted that the real reason pederastic behaviour was so severely punished derived from irrational "antipathy" to any form of pleasure particularly sexual pleasure: see Louis Crompton, ed., "Jeremy Bentham's Essay on 'Pederasty' Part 2," *Journal of Homosexuality* 4, no. 1 (Fall 1978): 95. Bentham opposed punishing pederasty because: (1) antipathy and its accompanying malevolence are grounded in prejudice; (2) one never knows where to stop; and (3) punishment opens the door to false prosecutions. Antipathy itself is a punishment. Bentham remarked that one was expected to deal calmly and coolly with other subjects: "but on this subject if you let it be seen that you have not sat down in a rage you have given judgment against yourself at once." see Louis Crompton, "Jeremy Bentham's Essay on 'Pederasty': An Introduction," *Journal of Homosexuality* 3, no. 4 (Summer 1978): 384-385.

added that the English condemned the Spaniards for burning Moors and the Portuguese for burning Jews; yet they themselves justified burning or hanging countrymen who were paederasts. Theological interpretation of the story of Sodom and Gomorrah informed the law; God was unmerciful in his wrath so why should humans be different? Meanwhile, Greek notions of friendship were taught and practised at every level in the English public school system. Moreover, the Puritan view had influenced the sexual outlook of colonial America, documents from which revealed harshness toward sexual activity with children.

In both Europe and America the eighteenth, nineteenth and twentieth centuries constituted a period of continual transformation of attitudes toward variant sexual practices depending on demographics and which current or countercurrent of intellectual, medical and political thought held sway--the Enlightenment, liberalism, conservatism, romanticism, medical fear-of-sex, or reform of French and English criminal laws. For example, the social welfare movement continued criminalization while the World League for Sexual Reform, founded in Copenhagen in 1928, regarded "disturbances and abnormalities of the sexual impulse . . . as more or less pathological

---

89 Bullough, Sexual Variance, 530-557; Eglinton, "Boy-Love in the Nineteenth Century," chap. in Greek Love, 364-405.
phenomena and not as crimes, vices or sins.\textsuperscript{9}\textsuperscript{9} However, with the triumph of Nazism, the sexual reform movement dissolved.

In nineteenth-century Britain some recommended castration or infibulation for sexual offenders; capital punishment was retained for intercourse with girls younger than ten.\textsuperscript{92} Only in 1877 in Canada was punishment for having sexual intercourse with a female under the age of ten reduced from death to life imprisonment with possible whipping. By 1972 corporal punishment was abolished for this offence.\textsuperscript{93}

Today, church and society continue to move in the direction of promulgating laws concerning adult-child sexual relations. Canon law and Canadian statute furnish ample guidance to church and society should legal recourse be necessary. However, debate has begun because emphasizing solely a legal approach to pedophilia is part of the current problem. In a speech given July 5, 1993, in Cambridge, England, to the Institute for Advanced Legal Studies, then Canadian Justice Minister Pierre Blais pointed out the following:

Too often, the response to crime is a call for more laws, in the belief that the law alone can resolve crimes. The law cannot. More laws and more prisons are not the answer. The law does have an essential place in responding to crime . . . but sometimes it can make matters worse by deflecting attention from other more effective measures. Ultimately, too much criminal law can become an instrument of oppression.\textsuperscript{94}

Our society has fallen into the Emperor's-New-Clothes Syndrome: because society has habitually taken a legal approach and incarcerated pedophiles, it has been difficult for individuals to insist on and to get other people to recognize the need/appropriateness of more-humane treatment.


\textsuperscript{92}Karlen, \textit{Sexuality and Homosexuality}, 162.


As Money points out: "a legally defined sex offense is not automatically . . . considered a syndrome needing treatment." Moreover, as Edward Brongersma muses: the history of sexuality shows that laws have failed to subdue the sexual impulse and to control sexual behaviour. Unfortunately, a legal response to pedophilia is intimately connected with politics and election votes.

Also fitting into the Emperor's New-Clothes Syndrome is the current "progressive exploitation of children" by advertising and the media. As Chris Bagley and Diane Schetky note, magazines and films routinely adultify infants and children by making them appear older than their age and dressing them in provocative outfits, thus holding up an image of children as sexually desirable. Such legitimizing of children as sex objects and satisfying of adult sexual fantasies is confusing enough for children, but what mixed message does it give to pedophilic readers and viewers?

---


5Brongersma, "Boy-Lovers," 163.


1.4 Pedophilia as "Sickness" or Psychopathological Disorder

The turn of the twentieth century marked the beginnings of the science of psychiatry and the medicalization of pedophilia. Continental--followed by American--medical practitioners began to discuss various "deviant" sexual practices and to foster understanding of the pedophile not as a mere criminal but as a mentally disturbed person.  

Pedophilia Clinically Defined

In 1886 Richard von Krafft-Ebing introduced the term paedophilia into medical literature and characterized the pedophile as a "sexually needy subject" having "a morbid disposition" rather than "degenerated morality or psychical or physical impotence." Today, various definitions of pedophilia exist. The American Psychiatric Association's Manual (DSM-III-R) classifies pedophilia as a paraphilia, a category of

---

99Schultz believes social work (1) continued medicalization of sexuality by inducing a shift from viewing certain sexual activity as immoral to clinically labelling the same activity as deviant, perverse, or abnormal and (2) from 1900-1930 shifted from punishment to rehabilitation of offenders: see Schultz, "Child Sexual Abuse in Historical Perspective," 27-28.

100Karlen, Sexuality and Homosexuality, 181-186; Bullough, Sexual Variance, 587-669. According to Foucault, medicine labelled and specified the disparate sexualities, yet, until Freud, it continued to hide the thing about which it was speaking, see: Foucault, Introduction, 41, 53.


103Paraphilia is a biomedical term derived from the Greek, para, meaning beyond, amiss or altered, and philia, meaning love. The nomenclature was introduced to American psychiatry in 1934 by psychiatrist Benjamin Karpman and replaced the earlier legal term, perversion: see John Money, "Forensic Sexology: Paraphilic Serial Rape (Blastophilia) and Lust
sexual disorder in which "over a period of at least six months", an individual experiences "recurrent intense sexual urges and sexually arousing fantasies involving sexual activity with a prepubescent child or children." Ron Langevin applies the term "sexual anomaly" to pedophilia because "the sexual behavior in question is not typical of the general population."

Based on the sex of the child relative to that of the adult, Mohr et al. speak of heterosexual, homosexual, and undifferentiated pedophilia where


American Psychiatric Association, Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders, 3d ed. rev. (Washington: American Psychiatric Association, 1987), 284. Not every perpetrator of child sexual abuse who is in need of intervention to limit his sexual behaviour with children, will meet all the criteria for Psychosexual Disorder set forth in the DSM-III-R. Philosopher Frederick Suppe argues for removing pedophilia from the DSM on the grounds that sexual paraphilias are not, per se, mental disorders and that psychiatric evaluations of specific patterns of variant sexual behaviour are "pseudo-scientific/medical masquerades of prevailing or reactionarily conservative social mores:" see Suppe, "Classifying Sexual Disorders: The Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of the American Psychiatric Association," Journal of Homosexuality 9, no. 4 (Summer 1984): 10, 26. Philosopher Bernard Gert emphasizes that in order for a paraphilia to count as a mental disorder, the crucial criteria of distress, disability, or a significant risk of suffering some harm must be included in each definition of a specific mental disorder: see Gert, "A Sex Caused Inconsistency in DSM-III-R: The Definition of Mental Disorder and the Definition of Paraphilias," The Journal of Medicine and Philosophy 17, no. 2 (April 1992): 155-171. Germund Hesslow argues that the concept of disease is misleading: it is not the presence of disease that is crucial, but the fact that treatment may be beneficial: see Hesslow, "Do We Need a Concept of Disease?" Theoretical Medicine 14, no. 1 (March 1993): 7, 8. See also Thomas Szasz, "Justice in the Therapeutic State," chap. in The Theology of Medicine (New York: Harper & Row, 1977; reprint, Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 1988), 118-133 (page references are to reprint edition).

children of both sexes are sought. According to the age of the pedophile, they further classify pedophilia as adolescent, middle-age, and senescent. A. Nicholas Groth categorizes pedophiles as fixated or regressed. Currently, clinicians such as Hall et al., Barbaree, Marshall and Bradford report that pedophiles do not constitute distinct discernable groups and have numerous associated paraphilias.

What Causes Pedophilic Behaviour?

Centuries ago in the Nicomachean Ethics, Aristotle observed that "morbid propensities" such as sexual perversion "result . . . from natural disposition, and . . . from habit, as with those who have been abused from childhood." More recently, numerous theories have been advanced concern-

106 Mohr, Turner, and Jerry, Pedophilia and Exhibitionism, 16, 20.

107 A fixed pedophile has primarily or exclusively been sexually attracted to significantly younger people throughout his life. A regressed pedophile originally exhibited sexual interest in age-mates, however, in situational psychosocial crises, the peer partner is replaced by a child: see A. Nicholas Groth, "Patterns of Sexual Assault against Children and Adolescents," in Sexual Assault of Children and Adolescents, Ann Wolbert Burgess et al. (Lexington, MA: D.C. Heath & Co., 1978; reprint, 1988), 6-9 (page references are to reprint edition); Groth, Hobson, and Gary, "Child Molester: Clinical Observations," 132-136.


ing the etiology of pedophilia. Calling pederasty "perverted lust," "sensual aberration," "vice contrary to nature," "abominable vice," and "crime," Paolo Mantegazza in 1885 located its origins variously in "the taste of the pleasure seeker" and "in the nervous centres." Krafft-Ebing attributed pedophilia variously to diseases of the nervous system, head injuries, degeneracy, a morbid disposition, and hereditary defects.

Denying a congenital basis, in 1905 Havelock Ellis associated pedophilia with "impotent senility," "an occasional luxurious specialty of a few over-refined persons, or, more commonly, as part of a general indiscriminating sexual tendency in the weak-minded." In general, reacting to conclusions of theorists such as Krafft-Ebing and Havelock Ellis, Freud judged perversions to be "a primitive and universal disposition of the human sexual instinct"--a by-product of dissociations from normal development, organic changes, unconscious forces, psychic inhibitions and an arrested

---

111Mantegazza, Sexual Relations, 89, 90.

112Krafft-Ebing, Psychopathia Sexualis, 500-503, 552-559, 586.

113Havelock Ellis regarded pedophilia as a form of erotic symbolism involving idealization; the play of fancy and imagination; concentration of attention on some object or process which is in the periphery or even outside of the natural path of instinct; and the capability to form new mental constructions and meaning around that focus: see Ellis, Psychology of Sex, 114; idem, Studies in Psychology of Sex, 1:1-3.

114Ellis, Psychology of Sex, 114fn, 156-157; idem, Studies in Psychology of Sex, 1:13.

Oedipus complex.\textsuperscript{116} Karpman, Mohr et al., Barnard et al., and Groth et al. also view psychosexual disturbances as developmental.\textsuperscript{117}

Money's distinctions\textsuperscript{118} regarding the paraphilias suggest that an altered, impaired, or failed sexuocerotic development may, in part, lead to pedophilia.\textsuperscript{119} According to Money pedophilia is a disturbance in the sexuocerotic orientation—a brain disease affecting brain centres and pathways responsible for sexual arousal, mating behaviour and reproduction\textsuperscript{120}—"no different than any other syndrome that, untreated, is likely to lead to

\textsuperscript{116}Sigmund Freud, "The Sexual Aberrations," in 	extit{Basic Writings}, 553, 572fn. Freud objected to the diagnostic term "degeneration," and deemed "the alternatives congenital and acquired" to be "incomplete" and inadequate to address all the circumstances present in sexual aberrations: see Freud, "The Sexual Aberrations," 555, 557.

\textsuperscript{117}Mohr, Turner, and Jerry, 	extit{Pedophilia and Exhibitionism}, 19; Barnard et al., 	extit{Child Molestex}, 126, 137. Karpman believed a childhood sexual trauma, such as incest, could detour a child onto a different road of sexual development: see Karpman, 	extit{Sexual Offender}, 345, 502; Groth, Hobson, and Gary, "Child Molestex: Clinical Observations," 135.

\textsuperscript{118}Money coined the term phyism or phylogenetic building block which is a unit of response or behavioural manifestation belonging to an individual by way of its phylogenetic heritage (evolution of behaviour through mutation and selection) as a member of a species: see Money, 	extit{Lovermaps}, 85; Jay R. Feierman, "A Biosocial Overview of Adult Human Sexual Behavior with Children and Adolescents," in 	extit{Biosocial Dimensions}, ed. Feierman, 8-68; Irenäüs Eibl-Eibesfeldt, "Dominance, Submission, and Love: Sexual Pathologies from the Perspective of Ethology," Ibid., 150-175; Wade C. Mackey, "Adult-Male/ Juvenile Association As a Species-Characteristic Human Trait: A Comparative Field Approach," Ibid., 299-323; Herman Dienkes, "The Concept of Function in the Behavioral Sciences with Specific Reference to Pedophilia and Pedosexual Behavior: A Biophilosophical Perspective," Ibid., 324-337. In the course of a pedophile's sexuocerotic development the phyism of parental/child bonding is diverted from its usual expression and merged or entwined with the sexuoceroticism of the phyism of lover/lover bonding. Such attachment represents failure to differentiate or separate the caretaking love for a child from the love of a sexual partner. Thus, pedo \_ilia represents an "impairment of ability to fall in love and pair-bond"—a sexuocerotic orientation or status: see Money, "Diffusion of Sexiological Knowledge," 251; John Money and J. D. Weinrich, "Juvenile, Pedophile, Heterophile: Hermeneutics of Science, Medicine and Law in Two Outcome Studies," 	extit{Medicine and Law} 2, no. 1 (1983): 39-40; Money, "New Phyism Theory," 448.

\textsuperscript{119}Money, 	extit{Lovermaps}, 150; John Money, "Sexology: Behavioral, Cultural, Hormonal, Neurological, Genetic etc.," 	extit{The Journal of Sex Research} 9, no. 1 (February 1973): 3-10.

\textsuperscript{120}Money, "Paraphilic Sexual Rape," 25-27.
entanglement with the law." In his colleague Fred Berlin’s view, pedophilia constitutes a diagnosable psychiatric condition: that is to say, an unconventional sexual orientation, a sexual deviation disorder, or syndrome. Langevin’s research suggests neuro-endocrine abnormalities. The course of pedophilia is chronic, its etiology multifactorial and poorly understood.

Freud denied that persons who interact sexually with children are insane, but he described such persons as "faint-hearted and impotent." Currently Groth, Bradford, and Mohr et al. find that pedophiles seldom suffer from psychotic mental illness; although personality deficiencies

---

12Money, Lovemaps, 150.
16Berlin, "Biomedical Perspective and Biomedical Treatment," 118.
may be associated with pedophilia. For Freud, Havelock Ellis, Karpman, and other current psychoanalysts, the potential for sexual perversions exists in all people. However, unlike the normal individual who has a broader, more versatile form of sexual expression open to him, the paraphiliac has a sexual urge that is closer to the origin of the instinctive urge and is therefore less susceptible to repression.

That pedophilia is not voluntarily chosen is stressed by pedophile Tom O’Carroll, and clinicians Karpman, Money, Berlin and Charles Socarides. Money suggests that excessive negation, constraint, and punishment of childhood-sexual-rehearsal-play may contribute to pedophilia. Berlin and others propose that certain biological and clinical abnormalities (i.e., chromosomes, hormones, or brain injury) may be involved; however, findings of these studies continue to be meagre and inconsistent.

---

12 Groth finds that the majority of offenders who come to his attention are included under a personality disorder classification: see Groth, "Patterns of Sexual Assault," 23. Bradford et al. view the paraphilias as distinct from personality disorders: see Bradford, Boulet, and Pawlak, "Multiplicity of Deviant Behaviours," 104.


13 Karpman, Sexual Offender, 501.


13 Money, Love & Love Sickness, 45, 47, 55, 84, 203.

Freud concluded that accidental stimulation of the sexual instinct through premature seduction of the infant by other children or adults as well as the infant's responsiveness and quality of heightened fixedness of these impressions of sexual life-participate in the etiology of sexual disturbances. Some theorists still endorse the abused-abuser hypothesis despite the fact that it is simplistic, misleading, and has little evidence to support it—as Finkelhor and others show.

Cognitive distortions may also play a significant role in the etiology of pedophilia or may be post hoc rationalizations. Studies show that pedophiles report specific sets of distorted cognitions regarding sexual involvement with children. For example, a pedophile may endorse cogni-


tions such as: "having sex with children is okay, it's educational for the child." Atypical cognitions result in biased perception and understanding of situations and may guide the individual's behavior.

Finally, theorists such as Patrick Carnes view child sexual abuse (he does not specify pedophilia) as a pathological system of addiction—a pathological relationship dependent upon a mood-altering experience and comprised of faulty beliefs, impaired thinking, unmanageability, and the addictive cycle.138 The addiction approach, however, has encountered considerable resistance from professionals,139 partly out of distrust of lay models and partly out of the belief that it is based on insufficient knowledge.

The extensive literature on pedophilia as a psychopathological disorder reasonably suggests a current shift to a medical construct of pedophilia. This construct begs the question: Is pedophilia treatable? To this question I now turn.

Treatment

I agree with the position of many clinicians that treatment is an important tool in dealing with pedophilia.140 I will not enter into the debate about whether pedophilia is treatable. The question is: what attitudes are more conducive to treatment? Believing that one ought not to punish those who are sick and also that "cure" is possible, Krafft-Ebing,

"Assessment and Treatment of the Male Sex Offender," 145.


139 Carnes, Contry to Love, 16-41.

140 Mohr, Turner, and Jerry, Pedophilia and Exhibitionism, 86.
followed by others such as Karpman, calls for clinical assessments by medico-legal experts, legal reform, understanding, and tolerance. He argues that "paedophile impulses can be mastered, unless a weakening or total loss of will power has been superinduced by pathological conditions." Moreover, the "powerful, natural instinct" which predisposes an individual to sexual crimes against children is "little influenced by punishment." More recently, clinicians such as Money, Lanyon, Barbaree, and Marshall point out that with treatment pedophilia might be subject to remission—although risk of recurrence is never totally eliminated. To date, there is no "cure". Newer biomedical treatment holds out a promising effect on long-term recidivism.

Treatment programs are multidisciplinary and multicomponent in that

---

14 Karpman judged the paraphiliac's deeply-buried psychic conflicts and long-standing emotional maladjustments to be approachable by psychotherapy: see Karpman, Sexual Offender, 287, 463-464.

15 Krafft-Ebing, Psychopathia Sexualis, 560.

16 Krafft-Ebing, Psychopathia Sexualis, 498-504, 551, 560. See also Karpman, Sexual Offender, 287.


18 Money, Lovemaps, 143.

they make use of various treatment strategies—e.g., pharmacotherapy; individual and group psychoanalytic therapy including insight-oriented therapy; behaviour based treatments including aversion therapy.


148 Adele Mayer, strongly endorses the group experience as a means of support for sex offenders and as an effective tool for breaking through their denial, however, she stresses the need for monitoring groups because they "can become a shelter, protecting participants from painful reality:" see Mayer, Sex Offenders: Approaches to Understanding and Management (Boca Raton, FL: Learning Pub., Inc., 1988), 121-139.

masturbatory satiation, self-management skills, and assertiveness training; family system approaches; sex education and therapy; victim awareness/empathy training; treatment based on cognitive-behavioral theory directed toward modification of distorted cognitions\(^{15}\) and deviant fantasy;\(^{13}\) alcohol and drug rehabilitation; and relapse prevention.\(^{13}\)

Surgical castration has been used in Europe but is not employed in the United States nor Canada. The procedure is irreversible and has not been reliably proven to reduce sex drive.\(^{14}\) Likewise psychosurgery such as stereotaxic hypothalatomy has been used in Europe, is highly questionable, and is not used in Canada nor the United States.\(^{15}\) The addiction approach utilizes anonymous support groups modeled on the Twelve Steps programs in


\(^{15}\)Hashmall, Iversen, and Jennings, "Typologies of Cognitive Distortions," 1, 8.


\(^{15}\)Lanyon, "Theory and Treatment in Child Molestation," 179; Travin et al., "Update on Theory and Practice," 99; Gerald Klerman, "Can Convicts Consent to Castration?" Hastings Center Report 5, no. 5 (October 1975): 17-19; Cooper and Cernovskiy, "Effects of Cyproterone Acetate," 38. Mayer judges surgical castration to be "a feasible alternative for sex offenders" although she recognizes it is effective only in some cases. She rejects it because it may increase their "rage" which might increase sexual assaults: see Mayer, Sex Offenders, 113-114, 117.

conjunction with therapeutic treatment with other appropriate professionals. 158

Factors Hindering Society's Ability to Deal with Pedophilia

Several factors have existed which have hindered contemporary society's ability to deal effectively with pedophilia. One factor has been society's reluctance to view sexology as a credible field of scientific inquiry. 157 Currently research into pedophilia and related issues is being restricted by the emotional reaction from both the public and health care professionals, unprecedented media hype and attention from government officials. 158 Researchers and human services professionals desiring to do research on or therapy with pedophiles who voluntarily seek therapy are bound by current reporting laws to report these individuals to police and/or child protection authorities. 159 Material which appeals to pedophiles is subject to confiscation. 160 Society's policy of zero tolerance and fiscal


157Haeberle, "Human Rights and Sexual Rights," 159-172; Money, "Diffusion of Sexological Knowledge," 253-255; Lanyon, "Theory and Treatment in Child Molestation," 176. For having written their books, both Krafft-Ebing and Havelock Ellis were professionally ostracized: see Money, Love & Love Sickness, 110.

158Research into sex has been suppressed for some time: after Hitler came to power, Nazis burned the Institute of Sexual Science founded by Magnus Hirschfeld and the archives of the Scientific-Humanitarian Committee, destroying thousands of volumes of research and most of the records of the first modern homosexual movement: see Bullough, Sexual Variance, 645; Dykes and Donaldson, History of Homosexuality, xiii. Alfred Kinsey was deprived of Rockefeller Foundation funding and monitored by the FBI on the grounds that his continued research would corrupt and endanger the nation's children: see Gerald P. Jones, "The Study of Intergenerational Intimacy in North America: Beyond Politics and Pedophilia," Journal of Homosexuality 20, no. 1/2 (1990): 285.

159Bullough, "History in Adult Human Sexual Behavior," 83; Feierman, "Human Erotic Age Orientation," 563.

160On two separate occasions police raided O'Carroll’s home and seized a large amount of research material garnered for his book on pedophilia: see O'Carroll, Paedophilia, 9.
priorities have resulted in a low level of funding for research into paraphilia.\textsuperscript{165}

Secondly, during the earliest periods of research into sexuality, it was difficult to obtain information. The introduction of a medical model for pedophilia facilitated acquisition of data from patients.\textsuperscript{162} Other researchers turned to prison populations; however, not all pedophiles are incarcerated, a fact which casts doubt on the generalizability of findings about pedophiles.\textsuperscript{163} Research has generally mirrored society's preconceived notions about child sexual abuse and has employed poorly defined, over-generalized, and value-laden terminology such as "molester," "assailant," "monster," "victim," and "innocents." Such notions polarize and prolong the debate.

Thirdly, labelling any type of sexual contact with children--from sexual intercourse to kissing--as "child sexual abuse" has resulted in a one-sided, simplistic picture. Collapsing all these areas into one catch-all term "sexual abuse" makes it impossible to make distinctions for research into issues such as pedophilia.\textsuperscript{164}

Fourthly, current literature on the subject of child sexual abuse reveals use of polemical devices which result in polarization, politicization and sideline ethical issues. With the advent of "new research" by


\textsuperscript{162}Krafft-Ebing also gleaned data from court cases: see Bullough, Sexual Variance, 649.

\textsuperscript{164}Finkelhor et al., Sourcebook, 138-142; Cox, "Caregiver's Dilemma," 78.

radical feminist writers in the 1970's, an angry, gender-biased tonality emerged in deliberations about child sexual abuse and adult sexual relations. Along the way, the issues of adult rape and sexual harassment merged with that of child sexual abuse as did male sexual abuse of women with that of children. Money argues that radical feminist militancy champions respectable female careers "devoid of sexuality and eroticism" and spawns "the bastard science of victimology," the philosophical premises of which reduce sex to male abuse of women and children. Vindication of women, victimology, and characterization of men as sexual abusers of women and children has turned many women away from men; attacked men and placed

---

166 Diane H. Schetky, "Treatment of the Sexually Abused Child," in Handbook for Health Care, Schetky and Green, 198. Early therapists such as Freud employed fairly gender-neutral language in their discussion of sexual aberrations. Stating that perversions were found in the "different sexes," Freud referred to "cases" and "individuals," both male and female, who chose children as sexual objects: see Freud, "Sexual Aberrations," 562-563; idem, "Transformation of Puberty," 624.

167 Diana E. H. Russell, for example, condemned male sexuality for its predisposition "to violence, to rape, to sexually harass, and to sexually abuse children." Despite evidence in her survey of female victims that 5% of incest perpetrators are female and her acknowledgment that had males been interviewed this percentage might have been higher, Russell characterized male sexuality as exploitive and utilized "pornography-related victimization" to illustrate the "predatory" nature of masculinity: see Russell, Sexual Exploitation: Rape, Child Sexual Abuse, and Workplace Harassment, Sage Library of Social Research, Vol. 155 (Beverly Hills, CA: Sage Pub. Inc., 1984), 173, 210, 217-218 290; Diana E. H. Russell, "The incidence and Prevalence of Intrafamilial and Extrafamilial Sexual Abuse of Female Children," in Handbook on Assessment and Treatment Issues, ed. Walker, 27, 29, 33.

168 See, for example, Russell, Sexual Exploitation, 23.


166 Money, Lovemap, 53.

170 Paul Okami and Gerald Schoenewolf, both critics of this view, note that feminists ascribing to this ideology depict male-female sexual activity as a "treacherous" area of activity; men as untrustworthy; and male sexuality, in particular, as menacing, dirty, and in need of control: see Okami,
them on the defensive; helped perpetuate the myth that sexual abusers are only male;\textsuperscript{171} polarized the sexes creating distrust between them; politicized the debate; and singularly focused attention on the sexual abuses of men rather than on child sexual abuse.\textsuperscript{172} The fact that child sexual abuse is perpetrated by females\textsuperscript{173} as well as men is largely ignored or dismissed.

\begin{quote}
"Sociopolitical Biases in the Contemporary Scientific Literature on Adult Human Sexual Behavior with Children and Adolescents," in \textit{Biopsychosocial Dimensions}, ed. Feierman, 91; Schoenewolf, "Feminist Myth about Sexual Abuse," 331, 338; Kerrie James and Laurie Mackinnon, "The 'Incestuous Family' Revisited: A Critical Analysis of Family Therapy Myths," \textit{Journal of Marital and Family Therapy} 16, no. 1 (1990): 73, 75; Bessel A. van der Kolk, "Trauma in Men: Effects on Family Life," in \textit{Abuse and Victimization across the Life Span}, ed. Martha B. Straus (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1988; reprint, 1990), 171 (page references are to reprint edition); Carolyn Holderread Heggew, \textit{Sexual Abuse in Christian Homes and Churches}, with a Foreword by Marie M. Fortune (Scottsdale, PA: Herald Press, 1993), 67; Marie M. Fortune, "Foreword," Ibid., 10. This attitude was verbalized concisely by Brownmiller who characterized rape "from prehistoric times to the present" as "a male prerogative ... man's basic weapon of force against woman, the principal agent of his will and her fear ... a conscious process of intimidation by which all men keep all women in a state of fear:" see Brownmiller, \textit{Against Our Will}, 5. Brownmiller's claim and others like it have become central to the radical feminist movement and suggest an unwillingness to view any sexual relations as involving affectional or tender elements at all.
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{171}The view that men are always the abusers has since been contradicted by research such as that of William Masters and Robert Kolodny that reveals men can be raped by other men: see William H. Masters, Virginia E. Johnson, and Robert C. Kolodny, \textit{Human Sexuality}, 4th ed. (New York: Harper Collins, 1992), 446, 449. Use of all male examples of perpetrators of child sexual abuse fails to recognize that early clinicians such as Freud, Krafft-Ebing, and Karpman recognized that females also can be pedophiliacs. Their observations have been supported by more recent theorists: see Sigmund Freud, "Heredity and the Aetiology of the Neuroses," in \textit{Standard Edition}, 3:152; Sigmund Freud, "The Aetiology of Hysteria," Ibid., 3:207, 208, 215; Sigmund Freud, "Further Remarks on the Neuro-PsychoSES of Defence," Ibid., 3:164-165, 172; Krafft-Ebing, \textit{Psychopathia Sexualis}, 557; Karpman, \textit{Sexual Offender}, 344.

\textsuperscript{172}As Schoenewolf succinctly expressed it: "the psychopathological feminist" searches for evidence of sexual abuse and wants "men to act out their feelings, wants them to be sexual abusers, in order to have all the more reasons for the rage at the root of her gender narcissism:" see Schoenewolf, "Feminist Myth about Sexual Abuse," 340.

by radical feminists like Russell as an attempt "to discount the predominance of male perpetrators of violence and sexual abuse." 174

Fifthly, juxta posed upon this political ideology is the view that sexual behaviour is a power struggle between the participants, children and women are deemed less powerful than men. 175 Inured to conceptualizing sexual relations in terms of power, Kincaid suggests we cite pedophilia as a clear example of distorting the power equilibrium that must obtain. 176 However, it is not only because adults (particularly male) are bigger and more powerful than smaller and younger persons that pedophilia is wrong.


176Kincaid, Child-Loving, 24. Physician Suzanne Sgroi, for example, adamantly contends that child sexual abuse is not a sexual problem but rather a power problem: clinicians treating perpetrators of sexual abuse are dealing with disorders of power; see Sgroi, Handbook of Clinical Intervention in Child Sexual Abuse (Lexington, MA: D. C. Heath & Co., 1982), 2-13. Psychologist Henry Giaretto puts it this way: adult-child sex is "like matching a high school boxer with Muhammad Ali:" see Giaretto quoted in By Silence Betrayed, 252. See also Foucault, Introduction, 48, 34, 37.
Pedophilia in our society is wrong because of such factors as the child's inability to give informed consent and to understand the consequences of the sexual interaction, and because of the harm to the child that may ensue.

To view pedophilia solely as an issue of male power is sexist and reductionist.\(^{17}\) This notion of power suggests that a complex issue such as pedophilia can be completely understood in terms of only one of its components. In my view, such an approach begs the question: If men learn to deal with power, will we no longer encounter sexual abuse of children? As a tool for understanding pedophilia, the power concept is inadequate. It is a quick response and serves to protect us from the complex realities of pedophilia: e.g., that pedophiles seldom use violence;\(^{18}\) and that children themselves may be furnished with power through awareness of the emotional vulnerability of the pedophile.\(^{19}\) Moreover, if we extend the power paradigm, we all too easily add the weight of law and declare this issue as controllable by power rather than resolvable by therapeutic intervention. Power needs to be deconstructed, its illogic de-centred.

Sixthly, there is the myth that only gay men seduce young boys. In fact, most pedophiles are heterosexual. Eventually as scientific knowledge

---


\(^{19}\) Kincaid, Child-Loving, 24-29. British criminologists J. Maldrum and D.J. West discovered that young boys sometimes bullied sexual abusers, extorted or stole money from them, and made false accusations against teachers "to get their own back" for various perceived injustices done them; see Maldrum and West, "Homosexual Offences As Reported by the Press," Medicine, Science, and the Law 23, no. 1 (1983), 45-47.
increases, such myths should break down. Yet another factor causing the problem to be more vexing than many other human issues is the prevalence of statistical analysis in many reports on pedophilia.100 To read in studies that 97 heterosexual pedophiles admitted sexual contact with 1,261 young children;101 that 73.8% of all dangerous sexual offenders in Canadian prisons were convicted of sexual offences against children;102 or to note that 28 police forces in 10 Canadian provinces and the Yukon surveyed 6203 cases of sexually abused children103 has a numbing effect on the mind and suggests that the matter is hopeless. In evaluating such statistics, we need to compare them with the real behaviour of pedophiles and not with some perception we imagine.

Furthermore, many of the problems present within society’s response to child sexual abuse are the result of territorial turf wars among the many professional disciplines concerned about this issue. With each discipline bringing a different perspective to bear on the matter, professional jealousies have contributed to a breakdown in communication between some groups and a refusal to work together to resolve the problem.104

100For example: Finkelhor et al., Sourcebook, 15-41; Mayer, Sex Offenders, 60, 92, 94; Russell, "Intrafamilial and Extrafamilial Sexual Abuse," 24-27; Krafft-Ebing, Psychopathia Sexualis, 499-499; Karlen, Sexuality and Homosexuality, 239, 241; Benjamin Schlesinger, "The Badgley Report on Sexual Offences against Children," in Sexual Abuse of Children in the 1980’s, Schlesinger, 84-86; Bagley and King, Search for Healing, 56-77.


102Canada, Offences against Children, 2:919.

103Canada, Offences against Children, 1:16-17, 467.

This chapter's historical consideration reveals that pedophilia has been variously constructed. Controversy continues as to whether pedophilia is some kind of biological failure, a manifestation of pathology, a nonpathological anomaly, a sin, a crime, or a variant sexual lifestyle. To each of these constructs society suggests a response—medical, sacramental, punitive, or lobbying.

The available literature leads me to pose two questions: (1) If pedophilia is judged to be treatable, although, not curable, and if such a vast range of treatment is considered to be of value, then why does the literature also reflect the deep seated repugnance for and rejection of pedophiles, to which I alluded earlier in this chapter? Even if pedophilia is deemed to be an unchangeable sexual orientation as has been suggested by O'Carroll and determined with regard to homosexuality and heterosexuality, I would argue that my thesis becomes even stronger—pedophiles as members of society still need to be approached and addressed with care and compassion. (2) Given that within society we have medical institutions mandated to help people with medical conditions, why do people working in such institutions (where pedophiles should especially be considered as in need of treatment and care) generally lack understanding and hold the view of pedophilia as immorality and criminal offence warranting punishment and death? To these questions and evidence of these attitudes I shall now turn.
CHAPTER TWO

PROFILE OF PROFESSIONAL CAREGIVERS AND THEIR ATTITUDES

In this chapter I shall shape the problem of punitive attitudes by reviewing the existing literature, profiling caregivers and their attitudes toward the pedophiliac client and establishing which of the diverse "constructions of pedophilia," analyzed in the historical research are assumed by such attitudes. To flesh out the problem I shall also develop the notion of attitude, provide an account of the source of attitudes, in particular those which are punitive, and outline their negative effects.

My study draws extensively upon both Canadian and American literature. In dealing with the problem of attitudes it is hard to separate the boundary between these two countries. However, it is important to keep in mind that differences exist with regard to values and in their political, legal, and health care systems.

2.1 Shape of the Problem

Increased acceptance of psychotherapy and development of advanced medical technology have given rise to reclassification of social deviance into medical illness. While still a new and experimental field, treatment of sex offenders is recognized as a crucial issue in the prevention of child sexual abuse. As some writers in both Canada and the United States have observed, our criminal justice systems have increasingly mandated that sex offenders be treated in specialized clinical settings.1 The 1958 Royal Commission on the Criminal Law relating to Sexual Psychopaths (McRuer Report) noted that while the present state of medical knowledge does not

---

permit us to speak with assurance about 'curing' the class of offenders we are considering, nevertheless

once a person has been sentenced to preventive detention by reason of the manifestation of sexual abnormalities he should be exposed to the best clinical treatment known rather than included in the ordinary prison population.2

The Report of the Committee on Sexual Offences against Children and Youth (Badgley Committee, 1984) chronicled the incidence and prevalence of child sexual abuse in Canada, and documented the inadequacy of the responses to the treatment needs of sex offenders such as pedophiles3 in spite of the clear and consistent recommendations of earlier commissions investigating the medical needs and conditions in penitentiaries.

Nurtured by humanism and the rehabilitative ideal, therapeutic processes are judged by some as a means of replacing penal values with humanizing health values. Medical diagnosis in some sense reflects the wish to do good. However, psychologist Russell Hollander charges that it is questionable how helpful institutional mental health care settings are to serve recipients given their propensity to depersonalize, to create dependency and powerlessness, the counter-therapeutic effects of ward culture, their failure to facilitate genuine dialogue, their continued reliance on a medical treatment model which imbibes the physician with unquestioned authority, and clinicians' inability to connect clinical concerns and reform with broader societal issues and reform.4 Psychoanalyst Leslie Farber denounces psychiatry by alleging that it is a construct unfit for human

---


habitation and psychiatrists create definitions of humanity out of fragments of psychopathology. Moreover, as Walter Reich, among others, points out, attributing to a pedophile an underlying diagnosable psychiatric condition and then treating that condition by pharmacological or surgical means is not necessarily humane, has not yet been proven effective, and may, in fact, be harmful to the individual. Every therapeutic intervention has potential ethical implications and is contingent upon the training and professional altruism of the caregivers involved.

Nevertheless, in recent years the state has come to rely heavily upon counselors, social workers, psychotherapists and nurses as primary professionals for dealing with sexual deviance such as pedophilia. Therapy is firmly rooted in and financially supported by modern society.

In 1886 Krafft-Ebing argued that the "proper place" for pedophiles was "a sanitarium, established for that purpose, not the prison." In 1964 Mohr et al. noted that regarding sex offenders there does seem to be a wider acceptance of the fact that there is an underlying psychological problem and there is therefore a greater

---


6Krafft-Ebing, Psychopathia Sexualis, 560.
readiness to gear dispositions to the exigencies of treatment and rehabilitation. ¹

These clinicians endorsed what they perceived in the current literature to be a general emphasis on provisions for treatment and the need for a therapeutic milieu in institutions. ⁹ Furthermore, a pedophile's expectations of help are reinforced by personal qualities of the caregiver; a positive attitude toward treatment is critical to therapeutic success. ¹⁰

However, upon disclosure of child sexual abuse the pedophile is likely to encounter a series of professionals from various disciplines and agencies, including police officers, social workers, judiciaries, nurses, physicians, chaplains and prison officials. A pedophile faces unpredictable and very differing responses from whatever professional personnel are enlisted to help.

Therapists¹¹ have much to offer in terms of treating many human as well as social problems; however, there are some inherent dangers. According to Van Hoose and Louis Paradise, counselors can employ knowledge which is subjective or open to misinterpretation; their recommendations may bear the imprints of value judgments and opinions; and the psychiatric labels they use are often confusing and misleading. Moreover, that therapy is not an exact science like mathematics and lacks scientific verification

---

¹Mohr, Turner, and Jerry, Pedophilia and Exhibitionism, 101.

⁹Mohr, Turner, and Jerry, Pedophilia and Exhibitionism, 106.


¹¹Van Hoose, and Kottler use the generic term therapist to refer to all psychological helpers such as social workers, clergy, psychiatrists, clinical psychologists, teachers, and other health personnel: Van Hoose and Kottler, Ethical and Legal Issues in Counseling, 2-3. Willi Seitz notes that prison officers can become "therapists" in that they can contribute to changing prisoners' attitudes and behaviour, given the intensity and frequency of their contact with inmates and the shortage of professional therapists in prisons: see Seitz, "Relations between General Attitudes and Personality Traits of Prison Officers and Some Specific Attitudes toward Prisoners," in Criminal Behavior and the Justice System: Psychological Perspectives, ed. Hermann Wegener, Friedrich Lösel, and Jochen Haisch (New York: Springer-Verlag, Inc., 1989), 399.
to support the claims and activities of its practitioners means that much of what happens in therapy depends upon "the self of the therapist" as both instrument and method of treatment.

Paradoxically, as clinicians such as Card, Feierman, Rogers and Dickey illustrate, the mental health professionals who work in those very institutions where pedophiles should be considered specifically as in need of treatment and care, generally lack compassion and hold the view of pedophilia as immorality and criminal offence warranting "punishment" of the offender.¹² Sex therapist John Bancroft notes that 'neutral' attitudes amongst therapists to the pedophile are rare.¹³ Rogers and Dickey point out that some health care professionals approach sex offenders with cynicism, with divided loyalties to the offender and the community, and outrightly disbelieve offenders' self-reports of the extent of their paraphilic behaviour.¹⁴ According to therapist Robert Card, "punishers" would have us believe that those persons who sexually abuse children are untreatable and will likely reoffend when released from prison.¹⁵

In contrast, persons such as Card, Feierman, Berlin, Conte, Cyril Greenland, Groth et al., and myself espouse a treatment perspective, believing that the well-being of child sexual abusers and the protection of the public would be equally well served by sensitive, humanistic attitudes

---


¹⁴Bancroft, "Ethical Aspects of Therapy," 170.

¹⁵Rogers and Dickey, "Denial and Minimization," 58-59.

and provision of assessment, management and treatment programs independent of punishment.  

2.2 Attitude Defined

In the past, little attention has been given to the attitudes of caregivers, their effect on therapeutic practice, attitude determinants and how attitudes might be changed. In 1967 Carolyn and Muzaffer Sherif judged "attitude problems of man's social development and his relations with his fellows" to be "central in social psychology." Yet social scientists to date have not been able to reach consensus on the meaning of the term. Derived from the Latin aptus, the term attitude signifies "fitness" or "adaptedness," and connotes a subjective or mental state of readiness for action. Hence, Allport describes attitude as

a mental and neural state of readiness, organized through experience, exerting a directive or dynamic influence upon the individual's response to all objects and situations with which it is related.

---


20Allport, Nature of Personality, 13, 40-41. For Allport, the term attitude partially overlaps the concept of trait. When a person specifies an object or value such as capital punishment against which he is rebelling
Attitude connotes a complex disposition or tendency of people to be bound to an object or value and to feel a definite attraction or repugnance toward a well-defined class of stimuli.

If, like the Sheriffs, we define attitude operationally as:

the individual’s set of categories for evaluating a stimulus domain, which he has established as he learns about that domain in interaction with other persons and which relate him to various subsets within the domain with varying degrees of positive or negative affect, they are led to view attitudes within the context of a judgment process and to view their development within the context of an individual’s reference groups—persons, institutions, communications, relevant objects, values, social issues and ideologies.

Attitudes are learned, enduring neuropsychic systems which can be subject to change. They are based on stereotypical and symbolic beliefs, emotions and past experiences. Sociologist Pitirim Sorokin explains that attitudes can appear in us quite suddenly of their own accord, sometimes contrary to our purposes, as a result of some characteristic trait such as

or intent on conserving, the term attitude is appropriate. If rebellion or conservatism is chronic in that it is expressed in almost every sphere of the individual’s behaviour, then the term trait is more applicable. A woman is fond of her cat: she has a kindly attitude toward it. If, in general, she is thoughtful of, and sensitive toward all persons and animals, she has a trait of kindness.

Sherif and Sherif, "Individual’s Categories," 115.

dirty finger nails or bad pronunciation. They have the capacity to initiate and guide forms of responses and behaviour toward social objects in a favourable or unfavourable manner. However, the assumption that specific behaviour can be correlated to specific attitudes often has been false.

2.3 Attitudes Coming from Experience

My initial thinking on the matter of mental health professionals' attitudes toward pedophiles emerged in the 1980's from my own clinical experience as a Registered Nurse working in a regional forensic psychiatric unit in which pedophiles are assessed and treated, my experience as a workshop leader, media coverage and first person accounts of clinicians working and writing in the field of sexual dysfunction. For example, during an entire eight-hour shift a forty-year-old student nurse avoided the pedophilic patient assigned to her care. Instead, she spent most of her duty time with a patient diagnosed as suffering from depression. In a heated debate concerning the topic of my dissertation project, a family member who is an epidemiologist working in the field of cancer research, vehemently argued that pedophiles ("that kind of people") should be incarcerated, castrated and hung! Similar words were uttered by an orthopedic specialist in the Emergency ward of a large urban hospital as he examined my arm which had been broken in a skiing mishap. To drive home his point, he forcefully flexed my wrist as he spoke.

In yet another setting a group of Christians attending a workshop I was giving on child sexual abuse by clergy, flatly stated: "We want

\[\text{Pitirim Aleksandrovich Sorokin, Society, Culture, and Personality: Their Structure and Dynamics; a System of General Sociology (New York: Cooper Square, 1962), 97.}\]

\[\text{Allport, Nature of Personality, 21-22; Sherif and Sherif, "Individual's Categories," 113.}\]

\[\text{Craig, "Message--Attitude," 273-275.}\]
justice. . . . Throw the book at them!" Further, during a meeting to establish a diocesan policy on child sexual abuse, a newly-ordained Anglican priest confessed that were he to learn of a parishioner being accused of sexually abusing a child, he would be unable to minister to or even be present to the individual. The wife of another clergyman sought retribution arguing that pedophiles should be thrown into jail where the law of the jungle, which she assumed to prevail in prison, would deal with them.

More recently, a young medical student—a self-avowed apostle of compassion—when asked how he would respond to a pedophilic patient, replied:

I hope I could be compassionate. . . . Pity . . . I don’t think I would pity him. . . . Yes, I would pity him for his lowly state and I’d thank God that I’m not him or like him.

The student’s initial sense of compassion was threatened and changed into pity and a prejudiced subordination of the pedophilic patient to a lower societal caste.

From local newspapers come other anecdotal examples of punitive attitudes which I shall show are confirmed by scientific research. One particular account of pedophile Bill Bradley, published in the Ottawa Citizen on Wednesday, January 19, 1994, is noteworthy for its ideological stance. The article was in response to a six-year prison sentence handed down to a 65-year-old pedophile who had abused 19 children over a period of 17 years. In her sentencing report the judge noted that Bradley was in failing health and had not abused anyone since 1983. Among the most significant claims made by the journalist was the assertion that "It is sickening to see the court turn itself inside out to give someone like Bradley a break." The article then led up to a rhetorical question: "There is a prevailing notion in the criminal-justice system that we need to be compassionate toward criminals, to work toward their rehabilitation.

---

Why do we owe them a thing?" The article's author viewed compassion and rehabilitation for the offender as problematic and remarked:

The people who write our laws and run our courts appear to be out of touch with the reality of ordinary Canadians. . . . society views people who prey on our children as deserving of punishment. Lots of it. Maybe just a little less than murderers get." The evening before, this same newspaper ran another article in which a journalist described Bradley's six year sentence as "pathetically inadequate" and made the claim that victims "see their pain trivialized in this lenient judgment." One year earlier this same writer hinted at hanging as an appropriate punishment for a 78-year-old man who had been convicted of sexually abusing his granddaughter. Such journalistic rhetoric has the effect of reinforcing punitive attitudes toward pedophiles.

Within the week letters to the editor appeared including one in which the sentencing of Bradley was judged to be "almost an invitation" to other child abusers and to "one-on-one vigilante-style justice." The argument for harsher sentencing was based on the belief that "part of the recovery process for victims is seeing the guilty party pay for their crime." "To balance the scales of justice," another letter writer recommended "indefinite incarceration."  

---

29Denley, "Only the Victims Are Really Punished," B1.
35Hazel Huneault, "Balancing the Scales," Ottawa Citizen, 22 January 1994, A9. Another letter to the editor won editorial acclaim as "Letter of the Day." In it the authors judged thirty-three years imprisonment as barely "a good start" toward reflecting "the magnitude of this most heinous crime" and public outrage: see Paul Yuck and Debbie Yuck, "Crime and Too
In yet another article, a journalist quoted the defence lawyer of an incest victim as stating in response to the death of the incestuous father: "There has been a loss of life here, but it hasn't been the loss of a human life as we understand it . . . This man was a monster without a conscience, humanity or morality." These stories reveal to me a remarkable concordance with the views propagated by radical feminists and many mental health professionals.

2.4 Observations Drawn from Academic Research

Jonas Rappeport notes what he terms "attitude-induced" personal bias, exaggerated responses, and counter-transference reactions on the part of therapists toward child sex offenders. Karlen observed the manner in which researchers and clinicians privately reveal "a vengeful hatred toward sexual deviants that they would never display in print or in public, and which makes their 'research' equally suspect." By contrast, psychiatric social worker, Herschel Prins, openly acknowledged in his writing that "filled with horror" at the behaviour of some patients who have committed serious sexual offences, he and his colleagues may choose not to listen to what these clients have to say. Mel Gill, Executive Director of the Ottawa-Carleton Children's Aid Society, wrote a letter to the editor of a newspaper.

---

Little Punishment," Ottawa Citizen, 26 November 1992, A10. In an editorial it was argued that light sentences inform offenders that they "have a valid excuse for their behavior" and declare that lack of protection, physical and mental health of defenceless children are of little import in our society: see "Bradley's Debt Unpaid," Ottawa Citizen, 15 January 1994, A10.


38Karlen, Sexuality and Homosexuality, ix.

advocating longer incarceration of child sexual abusers in order to protect children.46

In his criticism of the prison physician, Karpman stated:

Though he sees sexual irregularities fairly flaunted in his face daily, he does nothing about their amelioration and universally assumes a puritanical attitude, condemning the prisoner, which is as reasonable as to condemn a patient with a malignancy because of ill-smelling putrefying tissue.47

In a similar vein, Freud is said to have commented:

If the physician has to deal with a worthless character, he soon loses the interest which makes it possible for him to enter profoundly into the patient’s mental life. Deep-rooted malformations of character, traits of an actually degenerate constitution, show themselves during treatment as sources of a resistance that can scarcely be overcome.48

Likewise, the 1938 Royal Commission which investigated the Canadian penal system characterized sexual offenders as "the costly worthless dregs of society, for whom no adequate arrangements have been provided in Canadian prisons."49

Finkelhor remarks that workers in the area of child sexual abuse remain frustrated over the management of child sexual abuse and therapists do not "relish" working with child sex offenders.50 Barnard et al. note therapists’ feelings of revulsion toward the offender and their inability to empathize.51 While noting that the criminal justice system has turned toward the medical profession for help in the prevention and treatment of child sexual abuse, these authors note that mental health practitioners have been inordinately slow to recognize that sexual offenders need their care and have tended, in practice, to dismiss the perpetrator of child sexual


47Karpman, Sexual Offender, 405.


49Canada, Investigate the Penal System of Canada, 218.


51Barnard et al., Child Molester, 244.
abuse as "criminal, hopeless, or at best, unpleasant, unrewarding, and untreatable," warranting punishment or isolation from others. Barnard et al. emphasize the need for clinicians to transcend their prejudice if they are in some way to be effective as therapists. On the level of anecdote, these authors and MacFarlane and Bulkley comment on the criticism, hostility, and even ostracism received by therapists who work with sex offenders. Such therapists are viewed as sex offender advocates by their colleagues and the public who believe that sex offenders deserve punishment or isolation rather than treatment.

Criminal investigator Seth Goldstein reports that generally male police officers are repulsed by and strongly condemn child sexual abuse. While they believe in aggressive investigation and prosecution of such cases, on a personal level they don't want to be the ones to do this. Police officers involved in investigating child sexual abuse and exploitation are stigmatized by fellow officers, teased and joked about, labelled and ridiculed as department 'weirdos' or 'perverts'. They frequently experience isolation from co-workers, family and friends who do not wish to hear about child molesters or child pornography. Indeed, I was labelled a "pervert" by an Anglican priest when he learned of my doctoral project.

Reminiscent of the concerns about radical feminism which I expressed in chapter one, Greenland recalled being reproached by a female colleague for preparing a paper entitled "The Treatment and Maltreatment of Sexual Offenders: Ethical Issues." Greenland states his colleague tacitly presumed "that prompt and equally brutal retaliation would ease the victim's

---

46Barnard et al., Child Molester, xv, 241; Carnes, Contrary to Love, 37-39.

47Barnard et al., Child Molester, 241-251; MacFarlane and Bulkley, "Overview of Current Program Models," 87.


49chap. 1:45
pain and make the streets safer for women and children."\(^5\) Greenland concluded that many feminists view sex offenders as obstreperous children in need of severe punishment "in order to return them and the rest of mankind to some preexisting state of innocence and social harmony."\(^6\) From her research into child sexual abuse, child psychiatrist Diane Schetky also deduced that feminists demand harsh sentences for sex offenders.\(^7\)

Feminist scholar Nel Noddings, whose work has been utilized by nurse educators, acknowledges our innate ferocity and capacity for hate. In her book *Caring: A Feminine Approach to Ethics & Moral Education*, Noddings argues that her ethic built on caring demands that she oppose capital punishment. Ironically, in the same paragraph, she confesses that in some instances she could provide reasons for killing and "could not regret the demise of the condemned."\(^8\) She illustrates her conviction by stating that were she to catch someone molesting her children, in the heat of emotion she would tear him to shreds.

Nurse Janet Saines views child sexual abuse as an emotive subject surrounded by social taboos and likely to provoke strong feelings of revulsion.\(^4\) Common reactions of professionals working in the area of child sexual abuse, according to Saines, are extreme rage at the perpetrator, loathing and disgust. Nurse Joan Liaschenko and family therapists Patricia

---


\(^6\)Greenland, "Treatment and Maltreatment of Sexual Offenders," 377.


Reynolds-Mejia and Sylvia Levitan voice similar emotions.\textsuperscript{57} They find that reactions such as horror and revulsion are revealed in the caregiver's psychological isolation of the perpetrator, frequently with the caregiver functioning as if that person didn't exist. Gillies et al. note that responses may extend from bewilderment to feeling physically sick.\textsuperscript{58} Ross Dawson observes feelings of vengeance and ambivalence as to whether intervention should be therapeutic or punitive.\textsuperscript{59}

Mary de Chesnay, professor at the University of Alabama School of Nursing, and Laura Petro, an Alabama Deputy District Attorney, espouse a legalistic view in their presupposition that "The sexual use of children by adults is a crime, therefore offenders are criminals."\textsuperscript{60} Assuming a rights-based approach they argue that victim and offender both have rights but complain that those of the victim are prejudiced because those of the offender take precedence. A language of rights does not help in establishing a relationship of trust, so essential to the therapeutic milieu. Instead it sets up an atmosphere of mistrust and competing claims. While a rights approach is often a quick response given by professionals, the argumentation becomes circuitous in that there is no way to prioritize the rights of individuals or groups. As a result, one party's rights may take precedence over another simply because the former screams more loudly than the latter. De Chesnay and Petro argue that to institute programmes to treat and rehabilitate offenders is both humane and practical in terms of primary prevention but when community resources become scarce, the first

\begin{quote}
\end{quote}

\begin{quote}
\textsuperscript{58}Gillies et al., "Relapse Prevention in Pedophiles," 205.
\end{quote}

\begin{quote}
\end{quote}

\begin{quote}
\textsuperscript{60}Mary de Chesnay and Laura Petro, "The Accountability of Incest Offenders," \textit{Medicine and Law} 8, no. 3 (1989): 282.
\end{quote}
priority should be help programmes for victims. Advocating a juridical approach, De Chesnay and Petro chastised mental health professionals for undermining prosecution efforts by convincing parents that to avoid the court system is to help the child.\textsuperscript{59} Perceiving prosecution as a deterrent to sexual exploitation of children, they challenged communities to take a firm stand against such criminal behaviour.

Likewise, in Bangkok, Thailand, the International Summit on the Sexual Exploitation of Children, convened by the Pontifical Council for the Family, declared sexual exploitation of children to be "a crime against humanity"; because

It contributes to, rather than honestly confronts, the evil and sickness of pedophiles and other callous consumers, who need to change their despicable behavior.\textsuperscript{60}

In the foreword of a textbook for practitioners involved in criminal and forensic investigations of sexual exploitation of children physician Roland C. Summit endorses prosecution and conviction. He takes a "we-they" approach to child molesters with the words: "Until 'we' are smarter than 'they', we will all share the hazards and the backlash of hidden, no-fault crimes."\textsuperscript{61}

Others such as Schetky acknowledge that incarceration alone fails to treat the offender's underlying psychopathology. Nevertheless, Schetky's patience wears thin in the case of recidivism for she advocates "prolonged incarceration" for the repeat offender who does not respond to treatment.\textsuperscript{62}

Therapist Adele Mayer renders a glaring indictment against the therapeutic approach and argues that

\textsuperscript{59}De Chesnay and Petro, "Accountability of Incest Offenders," 286.


\textsuperscript{61}Roland C. Summit, "Foreword," in Sexual Exploitation of Children, Goldstein, xi.

\textsuperscript{62}Schetky, "Prevention of Child Sexual Abuse," 212.
It seems evident that in an area as damaging as sexual abuse/assault, every possible precaution is needed to ensure restitution in its various forms, including the criminal prosecution of perpetrators. . . . To err in these matters means the loss of credibility with the victims, their advocates and the tax-paying public.65

While in her book Sex Offenders: Approaches to Understanding and Management she presents a chapter on treatment of sex offenders and denies taking an "either-or" approach to sexually aggressive men, Mayer consistently appears to take a legalistic, punitive approach by, for example, emphasizing research that demonstrates no clear evidence that therapeutic programs are more effective than imprisonment.66 She contends that endorsement of the medical model "primarily serves as a rationale to protect male offenders under the guise of child-victim advocacy"67 and precludes or minimizes the importance of legal intervention; while acceptance of a humanistic approach fails to consider the severity of the crime of child sexual abuse. For Mayer "Eliminating prosecution altogether . . . is a self-defeating solution to this serious legal issue."68 Judging "treatability" to be a "mistaken assumption," she speculates that many therapeutic programs are rationalized out of treatment providers' persistent minimization of male crimes against the powerless, "need for titillation and vicarious enjoyment of deviant sexuality,"69 and unconscious identification with sexually deviant clients.

2.5 Empirical Research on Caregivers' Attitudes toward Pedophiles

Gradually a small but growing body of empirical research on the attitudes of health care professionals has validated some of the experiences and views of these clinicians. As Finkelhor and Lewis observe, research on sexual abuse in the last decade has shifted from an orientation that was

---

65Mayer, Sex Offenders, 57.
66Mayer, Sex Offenders, 78-81.
67Mayer, Sex Offenders, 81.
68Mayer, Sex Offenders, 82.
69Mayer, Sex Offenders, 82-84.
clinical and criminologic toward one that is more social, psychological and epidemiologic. Talk of pedophilia has given way to surveys about attitudes and beliefs.  

David Cox surveyed a group of pedophiles living in London, England, who reported that therapists consistently communicated their preference not to work with this particular clientele resulting in the pedophiles feeling they were receiving less than adequate treatment.

Susan Kelley, a nurse and assistant professor at Boston College School of Nursing, conducted a study of the attitudes of a group of police officers, child protective workers, and nurses. Half of the participants recommended punishment and incarceration. Recommendations for a prison sentence of one to twenty years were made by 12.5% of the nurses and 14.3% of the child protective workers. Life sentence, without parole, was advocated by 26.0% of the nurses and 16.7% of the child care workers. The death penalty was approved by 1.9% of nurses and by 4.8% of the child care protectors. Harsher punishments were sanctioned when the victim was female, when physical force was employed to sexually abuse the child or when the offender was of a lower social class.

Assuming that attitudes may constitute part of a causal chain to behaviour, Edward Saunders investigated the attitudes of five professional groups within an urban judicial system. From his research of attitudes, he discovered that while some mental health professionals advocate humane

---


67Cox, "Caregiver's Dilemma" 88.


treatment for sex offenders, others recommend punitive treatment or incarceration. In his survey of attitudes of child welfare social workers, police officers, district attorneys, judges, and public defenders, Saunders found significant differences among these groups. Public defenders followed by social workers are least likely to recommend punishment of child sex offenders, while police are the most punitive-oriented. Nonetheless, in contrast to the group norm, one social worker wrote:

"Prosecution is a definite deterrent. ... It is a 'joke' to think that perpetrators are rehabilitated. ... We are creating generations of abusers who have suffered absolutely no consequences for their illegal or immoral behavior."  

The 1984 Committee on Sexual Offences against Children and Youths reviewed numerous case studies of child sexual abuse and found that judicial attitudes differ, notably with regard to the perceived need for and efficiency of treatment for convicted child sexual abusers. Many judiciaries expressed the view that child sexual offenders suffer from illness warranting treatment rather than punishment. Still other court officials expressed reservations toward this view and opted for imprisonment in order to express society's detestation and denunciation of the behaviour and to deter the appellant and others from committing such offences. The committee also noted considerably different attitudes towards homosexual and heterosexual child sex abusers. Homosexual abusers with male children as victims were more severely sentenced than were heterosexual offenders having female children as their victims. The committee viewed these differing


78See also Conte, "Enduring Issues for Social Work," 15.


76Canada, Offences against Children, 2:873-878.

78Canada, Offences against Children, 2:906-907.
sentencing practices as reflective of prevailing public and judicial attitudes.

Realistically, in Canada and the United States child sexual abuse is designated a crime. Furthermore,

The degenerate is held responsible for his own degeneracy—by reading or viewing pornography... so his syndrome is legally defined not as an illness, a paraphilia, but as a crime.77

Yet a struggle appears to exist between the social work and legal professions about causation of and response to child sexual abuse. With respect to the attribution of ‘illness’ to child sexual abusers, Lucy Berliner, a social worker, and Mary Kay Barbieri, an attorney, write that many mental-health professionals believe that such offenders have psychological disorders that, in some sense, excuse their behavior and make them candidates for mental-health intervention. ... from this viewpoint, the criminal-justice system offers only a punitive outcome. ... But sexual offenders rarely seek mental-health treatment voluntarily. ... Often, the law can be used effectively as a leverage, even when the goal of all concerned is treatment rather than punishment.78

There is a perceived willingness to meld two social systems. Saunders notes two interdependent features of child sexual abuse: (1) it is a crime therefore a legalistic response is mandated from the criminal justice system; and (2) it is perpetrated within a family context and against a vulnerable child therefore a therapeutic response is mandated from the social service system.79 Sink also notes that where the mental health and legal systems intersect and overlap, the potential for conflicting methods and goals is greatest given that one approach is therapeutic, the other adversarial.80


Assuming the attitudes of prison officers to be vital to their successful and smooth participation in treatment-oriented imprisonment, Seitz studied male prison officers in three prisons of the German federal state of Hessen and applied concepts of attitude theories in his discussion of study results. He found that prison officers in their attitudes and corresponding behavior to prisoners, are not passive recipients of institutional influences. While liberal, reforming, and positive attitudes toward prisoners may exist, propitious conditions for their enactment may be lacking. Feedback regarding such benevolent attitudes can be negative or conflicting, or circumstances in the prison environment may positively reinforce restrictive, rejective and hostile behavior. On the other hand prison circumstances may endorse reforming behavior but individual officers may not be open to such endorsement.

Prison officers' attitudes towards prisoners are determined to a limited extent by individual personality traits which systematically interrelate with general social attitudes. In accord with his own personality, the prison officer actively forms part of the therapeutic environment either in an intolerant restrictive manner or with liberal and positive attitudes toward prisoners. 82

In her 1974 study of the ethical orientation of community college counselors in a large Midwestern state, Vafakas found that counselors reflected an institutional or societal orientation in their dealings with their clients. In the societal orientation, the counselor is concerned with societal laws, duty and societal welfare, not the individual. 83 She also found that the greater the years of counseling experience, the greater the

82Seitz, "Attitudes and Personality Traits of Prison Officers," 399-418. Schwartz and Cellini note that correction officials sometimes find sex offenders' behavior so repugnant that they are unable to be objective and choose not to provide treatment opportunities: see Schwartz and Cellini, Practitioner's Guide to Treating, 1.

8Seitz, "Attitudes and Personality Traits of Prison Officers," 411.

8Van Hoose and Paradise, Ethics in Counseling, 118.
tendency of counselors to function within the punishment and institutional orientation. Additional research suggested that the lesser the degree of contact with clients and the older the counselor, the greater the chance that counselors behaved within a punishment or institutional orientation. Counselors functioning at a punitive stage are dependent upon external rationale and are governed by sanctions, dogmatic beliefs and physical consequences of the particular behaviour. Right and wrong are defined by prevailing standards: bad behaviour is punished, good rewarded. A counselor at the institutional level is governed by the institution's rules and policies.

A series of attitude studies conducted by psychology professor Robert Altemeyer between 1971 and 1979 with introductory psychology students at the University of Manitoba revealed sentiments of submissiveness to authority, aggression, and conventionalism towards such issues as capital punishment. Results indicated highly punitive attitudes toward wrongdoers such as child sex molesters whom students "viewed as low status criminals who are relatively worthless." In her survey of outpatient psychotherapists' attitudes toward offender clients in general, Sally Graham found that knowledge of a client's offender status negatively effected therapists' attitudes regarding the client's appropriateness and selection for therapy. One can only speculate as to whether knowledge of a client's

---


88Altemeyer, *Right-Wing Authoritarianism*, 238.

offender status as a pedophile would have an even greater negative impact on the client's being selected for therapy.

A 1988 hospital study in Sydney, Australia, of the response of medico-legal agencies to child abuse revealed valuable information about patterns of response. Social workers within the Child at Risk Team demonstrated a definite preference for interviewing female perpetrators rather than male perpetrators. Moreover, counseling was more likely to be offered to female perpetrators and psychological assessments were made more regularly on female perpetrators than males. In their study of professionals' responses in the Boston area, Beverly Gomes-Schwartz and Jonathan Horowitz found that staff, largely comprised of social workers, from the Department of Social Services were the only group of professionals to give high priority to interviewing the child sex offender.

Danger lurks, however, in over-reliance on surveys. Professionals often verbalize patterns which are different from their on-site performance. As social scientist John Barnsley points out: "the relationship between attitudes and overt behaviour is not a simple one in logical terms, allowing direct inference from one to the other." The expressed attitudes of respondents are not always congruent with their observed behaviour. Degree of congruency is, in part, a function of variables such as age, sex, socio-economic status and type of issue involved. The problem of latent versus manifest attitudes can itself be subjected to empirical scrutiny through

---


9Barnsley, Social Reality of Ethics, 123, 139.
careful use of methods of both survey and observation. Robert Craig suggests that one approach to attitude-behaviour matching is to ask the respondent to connect verbally the attitudes and behaviours.

Some of the documented surveys were carried out at conferences while others were mailed to respondents. Surveys can bombard participants and many questions may be answered in a spirit of frivolity. There may be supplementary responses produced as the result of discussion with colleagues which often functions to bring people back to the group positions. Concerning methods of testing attitudes, Allport warns that attitude scales should be regarded only as crude approximations of the manner in which attitudes exist in the mental life of individuals. He observes that caught

---

4 From the perspective of sociology of ethics which studies groupings of attitudes, mores, norms and values, Barnsley argues that "research so far has tended to neglect the importance of taking into consideration the processes of reasoning and justification associated with particular moral attitudes resulting in an oversimplified model of the relationships to be expected between attitudes and actions." That ethical traditions of different cultures ascribe varying degrees of relative importance to actions and attitudes needs to be taken into account. Hinduism, for example, proffers a degree of choice between emphasis on attitudes and on actions. Perceived incongruities between attitudes and actions may be more apparent than real, more complicated than a simple model of them might imply: see Barnsley, Social Reality of Ethics, 140, 143.


off guard, respondents may choose to say one thing but think another. Some individuals possess two distinct sets of conflicting attitudes, one reserved for their inner private life, and the other for their outer public image. Likewise, James Rest et al. concluded that one’s score on a political attitude test says more about that person’s attempts at conveying a certain self-image to others than it says about how that person views the sociopolitical world. People are inclined to give safe, conventional answers in order to protect themselves.

Moreover, as Barnsley observes, in the analysis of attitudes in general, there exists little standardization between various surveys and often questions are omitted regarding background preconceptions (i.e., conceptions of ‘human nature’) which would enable the researcher to make sense of particular stances.

2.6 Why this Paradoxical Attitude?

In their study of the effects of social workers’ attributions of responsibility and complicity to different family members, Christopher Ringwalt and JoAnne Earp found that attributions of greater responsibility to the daughter than the father significantly affected social workers’ punitive feelings toward fathers who engage in father-daughter sexual abuse but paradoxically increased the likelihood of the social workers’ recommending the father’s incarceration. The extent of a punitive response towards the father was mitigated by the social workers’ perception

---

9Allport, Nature of Personality, 27, 35. See also: Lambert and Lambert, Social Psychology, 51-52.


11Barnsley, Social Reality of Ethics, 177.

of the mother as being significantly responsible for the incestuous relationship.\textsuperscript{103}

Gomes-Schwartz and Horowitz found that agencies and professional groups distrust one another and have little experience cooperating with each other.\textsuperscript{104} Roberta Hibbard and Terrell Zollinger report that knowledge and training about child sexual abuse among such professionals as physicians, nurses, social workers, child protective workers and psychologists is inadequate.\textsuperscript{105} Mayer reports that many professionals function out of uninformed opinions concerning sexually deviant behaviour and its effects.\textsuperscript{106} She claims that on occasion professionals know and understand less than the public, their interests being centred on self-aggrandizement and financial gain.\textsuperscript{107} One wonders about the extent to which worker burnout, disillusionment, frustration at being unable to help, lack of special training, lack of peer support and multidisciplinary cooperation, large caseloads and cutbacks in personnel, years of clinical experience, media coverage of particular pedophilic activity, as well as a pedophile's likeableness, cleanliness and personal characteristics are variables that negatively or positively impact on worker attitudes toward child sex abusers.\textsuperscript{108}

In their survey of attitudes of health visitors, medical students and nursing staff involved with rehabilitation of child sex offenders, Eisenberg, Owens, and Dewey found the degree of punitiveness varied with the

\textsuperscript{103}Ringwalt and Earp, "Attributing Responsibility," 277.

\textsuperscript{104}Gomes-Schwartz and Horowitz, "Professionals' Responses," 201; 'Abused by Adults,' \textit{Economist}, 9 July 1988, 51.

\textsuperscript{105}Hibbard and Zollinger, "Patterns of Child Sexual Abuse Knowledge," 347-355.

\textsuperscript{106}Mayer, \textit{Sex Offenders}, 30.

\textsuperscript{107}Mayer, \textit{Sex Offenders}, vi-vii.

type of sexual abuse. Respondents indicated that perpetrators of abuse which involved sexual intercourse rather than fondling should be dealt with more punitively.\textsuperscript{109} Similarly, Saunders found a positive and moderately strong correlation between a professional's perception of crime severity and a more punitive orientation. Consequently, Saunders suggests that "the greater the perception of crime severity, the more punitive-oriented are respondents."\textsuperscript{110} Yet, tests revealed contradiction and significant differences among the professional groups toward offender punishment. Police were the most punitive-oriented, public defenders least likely to advocate punishment while social workers were second to district attorneys in finding child sexual abuse to be a most serious crime.

Gomes-Schwartz and Horowitz noted that when child sexual abuse is perpetrated by someone from outside the family, agencies give preference to referring cases to criminal justice departments and to punishment. When the abuse is perpetrated by a parent, however, prosecution is avoided and child protective, mental health and/or social service agencies are contacted.\textsuperscript{111} The authors attributed preferential differences to workers' education, attitudes, knowledge, and predispositions regarding child sexual abuse.\textsuperscript{112}

For Card, the frustration and resentment generated by therapists become blockages inhibiting therapeutic insights and understandings which therapists could share with clients.\textsuperscript{113} Moreover, in my view, caregivers, benumbed by numbers, cannot concentrate on the needs of pedophiles in their care. Hopelessness, that is, having no expectation of solution or manage-


\textsuperscript{111}Gomes-Schwartz and Horowitz, "Professionals' Responses," 203-204.

\textsuperscript{112}Gomes-Schwartz and Horowitz, "Professionals' Responses," 207.

\textsuperscript{113}Card, "Case for Treatment," 16.
ment, may motivate hostile, aggressive behaviour, impair humanity's capacity to reason, to discover the truth about pedophilia, to inform political decisions and shape programs for social change. The distortion of reason will be most apparent in the craving for revenge on the part of caregivers, their punitive attitudes and diminishment of caregivers' sense of responsibility for serving the wellbeing of their pedophilic clients.

Addressing the problems which arise in prisons and court-mandated treatment centers, Greenland makes the point that maintenance of ethically sound therapeutic relationships is apt to be compromised in prisons and prison-like institutions because professionals absorb the prevailing ethos of the institution and its values. Unfortunately, the prevailing ethos in many prisons, rewards toughness on the part of the guards and servility of the inmates. . . . the worst abuses [sic] and terror is reserved for the sex offenders, who are the pariahs of the correctional system. In these circumstances, the application of humane treatment philosophies, which depend on mutual trust and respect, is extremely difficult to sustain. The difficulty is, of course, compounded by the remote locations of prisons and prison hospitals, and the reluctance of well-qualified professionals to practice in essentially hostile environments.14

He further argues that treatment of imprisoned sex offenders is fraught with difficulties such as the chronic shortage of well-qualified professionals. Card speculates that therapists "become a part of the punishment side of sex offender disposition" either to get or keep their jobs within the correctional system.15 Caregivers' sense of alienation and isolation from colleagues and society was also identified as problematic by Greenland and Prins in their work with sex offenders.16

Altemeyer attributed punitiveness to right-wing authoritarianism, a construct made up of three covariant attitudes, namely, submission to established authority, aggressiveness, and conventionalism.17 He found

14Greenland, "Treatment and Maltreatment of Sexual Offenders," 375.
17Altemeyer, Right-Wing Authoritarianism, 147-148.
that many of his introductory psychology students found expression of highly aggressive and punitive attitudes toward such criminals as child sex molesters to be personally satisfying or pleasurable and reinforcing.118

Therapists Reynolds-Mejia and Levitan remind us that

The professional in the child abuse field functions daily within the deepest layers of human disturbance, working with the traumas of others as well as coping with events that can traumatically alter the professional's own views of human life.119

Hence, all emotional responses of the therapist to the client will "weave a spell upon therapists' emotions"120 and thereby present a danger of destroying the therapeutic process. These authors contend that the loss of innocence faced by therapist and victim alike is manifested in the therapists' protecting themselves from experiencing fully the clients' trauma. The irretrievable damage to the therapists' innocence, their inability to grieve this loss, and their anger impact negatively on empathy toward clients and their pathological system--empathy necessary to rendering effective therapy.121

Many health professionals are not comfortable with their own sexuality nor with that of others.122 As a result they avoid the pedophile in their care and fail to respond dispassionately and to assess deviant behaviour objectively. In addition many professionals have experienced child sexual abuse in their own lives.123 Kelley found that 13% of her respondents had

118Altemeyer, Right-Wing Authoritarianism, 233-234.


120Reynolds-Mejia and Levitan, "Countertransference," 53.


123Saines, "Considered Response to Crisis," 148-149.
been sexually victimized as children and tended to attribute greater responsibility to the offender than did respondents who had not experienced childhood sexual abuse. Similarly, Ronald Nuttall and Helene Jackson found that their national survey of American social workers, pediatricians, psychiatrists and psychologists revealed that 13% of the males and 20% of the females reported a personal history of childhood sexual abuse.

Jerrold Pollak and Sheldon Levy suggest that mandated reporting can sometimes be interpreted by professionals "as an unacceptable violation of confidentiality and betrayal of trust" or represent a "test" of professional competence. Such interpretations give rise to feelings of fear, guilt and shame which can be expressed in the form of displaced anger and resentment toward clients. Likewise countertransference guilt can result when workers with exacting standards experience feelings of anger, disgust, and/or abandonment with this client population.

Professionals, in all likelihood, will justify punitive reaction to pedophilic clients on the grounds of the harm which ensues to the child. However, they have failed to do their homework. Existing literature on the effect of child sexual abuse is limited to anecdotal clinical material and studies, many of which are methodologically flawed in their sample size, for example, and lack of comparison or control groups. Some studies suggest


and some observers have proposed that pedophilic relationships are not always psychologically damaging. Nevertheless a degree of consensus exists concerning immediate negative impact as well as long-term sequelae. Immediate effects include physical trauma, venereal disease, fear, anxiety, dissociation and phobic reactions, sleep disturbances, guilt and self-blame, increased incidence of subsequent assault, as well as psychosomatic disorders. Physician, Roland Summit developed a model of an accommodation syndrome in which children are caught as they try to cope with child sexual abuse. The child’s coping behaviour is generally characterized by secrecy, helplessness and self- alienation, entrapment and accommodation; delayed, conflicted, and unconvincing disclosure; and retraction. Long-term sequelae include impaired ability to sustain

13 Schmidt, "Debate on Pedophilia," 3-4; Risin and Koss, "Sexual Abuse of Boys," 320; Theo Sandfort, Edward Brongersma, and Alex van Naerssen, "Man-Boy Relationships: Different Concepts for a Diversity of Phenomena," Journal of Homosexuality 20, no. 1/2 (1990): 5-12; Jones, "Intergenerational Intimacy," 276, 280. Finkelhor noted many children are not affected by childhood sexual experience. In his survey of sexually victimized children, a tiny minority of respondents indicated they had initiated the sexual activity with the adult; and some of the boys and girls (more often boys) reacted at times with interest and pleasure to the adult sexual contact. He stressed that feelings of pleasure were part of a confused deluge of feelings and sensations, pleasure often intensifying the guilt or helplessness by adding to the child’s confusion and leaving the child feeling out of control of his own emotions: see David Finkelhor, Sexually Victimized Children (New York: Free Press, a Division of Macmillan Pub. Co., Inc., 1979), 32, 65-66, 70. For examples of children experiencing pedophilic relationships as positive see: Money, Lovesaps, 21; Money and Weinrich, "Juvenile, Pedophile, Heterophile," 39-54; Risin and Koss, "Sexual Abuse of Boys," 318-320; Dienks, "Concept of Function," 328-332.


relationships, depression in adulthood, substance abuse, sexual issues, post sexual abuse trauma disorder, traumatic sexualization, chronic


anger, developmental psychopathology,\textsuperscript{136} and a negative impact on community.\textsuperscript{137}

2.7 Societal Attitudes

The punitive attitudes of mental health professionals, however, are not abstracted from those of the surrounding community. Health care workers are also societal members and the clinic or hospital setting constitutes a miniature representation of the greater society.\textsuperscript{138} Condemnatory and punitive attitudes toward pedophiles are, in part, a function of societal biases.\textsuperscript{139} Money notes that society does not tolerate a single relapse; recurrence of symptoms is punished rather than treated.\textsuperscript{140} Punishment and general deterrence not only reflect society's desire for public protection


\textsuperscript{140}Money, Lovemaps, 142. See also Dienske, "Concept of Function," 325, 334.
but also its need to express repudiation and abhorrence of a particular crime.

Saunders' research reveals citizens would punish child molesters more harshly than do the courts.\textsuperscript{14} Mohr et al. find that in Canada and elsewhere, studies indicate that a greater proportion of pedophilic offenders are imprisoned than are sexual offenders in general.\textsuperscript{15} Ringwalt and Earp record that the 1984 report of the U.S. Attorney General's Task Force on Family Violence endorsed a severely punitive stance to incestuous fathers.\textsuperscript{16}

Altemeyer's survey of adult males from Winnipeg's nonstudent population, introductory psychology students at the University of Manitoba as well as some of their parents show that a large segment of the Winnipeg population espouses longer jail terms and capital punishment for such offenders as child sex molesters.\textsuperscript{17} Most of these subjects justify their attitudes on the grounds of religious principles and severity of the crime; that such criminals were repulsive and disgusting; that punishment will help reform them.\textsuperscript{18}

By contrast, Finkelhor finds that probation and treatment are the most frequent choice of parents in his survey of parents in the Boston metropolitan area.\textsuperscript{19} Although the principal immediate reaction of parents to child sexual abuse is anger toward the perpetrator,\textsuperscript{20} less than half of the parents recommend a jail sentence. Of the 48% who recommend jail, only

\textsuperscript{14}Saunders, "Attitudes among Social Work and Judicial System Professionals," 86.

\textsuperscript{15}Mohr, Turner, and Jerry, Pedophilia and Exhibitionism, 106.

\textsuperscript{16}Ringwalt and Earp, "Attributing Responsibility," 278.

\textsuperscript{17}Altemeyer, Right-Wing Authoritarianism, 233-234, 245.

\textsuperscript{18}Altemeyer, Right-Wing Authoritarianism, 153-154, 234, 238, 240-241.

\textsuperscript{19}Finkelhor, New Theory & Research, 69, 97, 101.

\textsuperscript{20}Finkelhor, New Theory & Research, 75, 97.
a third advocate a severe sentence of more than five years. Interestingly, respondents of higher social rank choose leniency and treatment while Catholics, Protestants, and lower-status respondents opt for more punishment. The vignette employed by Finkelhor involves a father-daughter incestuous relationship; hence, he speculates that had the example been that of a stranger molesting a female child, the proportion recommending punishment rather than treatment might be greater. A 1985 Los Angeles survey reveals an even split between demands for "wider public education on the subject" and "heavier punishment for child sex abusers." 

Finkelhor attributes respondents' preference for treatment to the public's belief in the claim of mental health professionals that they are able to change various kinds of behavior. He also concludes that people opt for treatment, in part, to escape internal conflict. People appear to be averse to criminalize acts perpetrated by family members. Moreover the general public tends to label 'mentally ill' or 'sick' those deviants, including sex offenders, whose behavior seems unintelligible.

Nevertheless, Finkelhor notes that movements have arisen in some American states to lobby legislators for substantially stiffer penalties against child abusers. Schetky believes incarceration placates the enraged public while providing only an "aura" of safety to the citizenry.

---


15Finkelhor, New Theory & Research, 97.

Greenland posits that sexuality is a vehicle for society's displaced anxiety which has been exacerbated by a confluence of powerful social forces, including feminism, religious fundamentalism, victims'-rights organizations and the prevailing mood of neoconservatism. Together, these diverse movements have kindled the demand for retributive justice, harsher penal sanctions and even the return of capital punishment. Consequently, in Britain, Europe, and the United States, pedophiles have organized themselves into self-advocacy groups. Due, in part, to the Dutch people's ability to discuss pedophilia in an open, comparatively reasonable fashion and to seek understanding of the phenomenon, in The Netherlands there has been a marked decline in criminal prosecution of pedophiles and a stress on the need for medical treatment. In contrast, Mary de Young reports that when their organizational affiliation was discovered, members of pedophile organizations in the United States and in Europe sustained social stigma, some losing their jobs and others being ostracized by professional colleagues and social companions.

Brongersma attributes society's punitive attitudes toward pedophiles to (1) a low social status of the seducer; (2) the notion that children are asexual and innocent; and (3) repression of an individual's own, often

154Greenland, "Treatment and Maltreatment of Sexual Offenders," 373.

155Greenland, "Treatment and Maltreatment of Sexual Offenders," 373.


158de Young, "Indignant Page," 584.
unconscious, pedophilic impulses.\textsuperscript{159} Psychologist Albert Pepitone finds that the ostensible destruction of a child's innocence contributes to the perceived seriousness of the crime, the blame accorded the offender, the moral outrage produced by the rape of a child and the degree of retribution allowed the victims or victim-related sufferers.\textsuperscript{160} However, Pepitone also concludes that the extent of punishment sought can be mitigated by such factors as the presence of offender remorse and intensified by the existence of a previous criminal record.\textsuperscript{161}

Further, I believe that many people justify punitive attitudes by arguing that punishment of criminals is a traditional social norm in our society: so why change? In chapter one I showed that punishment of pedophiles has a lengthy, sordid history. One can see how society and its health care professionals would have difficulty transcending or breaking free of this punitive tradition.

\textsuperscript{159}Brongersma notes that (1) historically men of lower social status than their victim were punished or fined while men of equal or higher rank were left in peace; (2) when children are depicted as asexual, pure, and innocent, fierce hatred is reigned on pedophiles for destroying their innocence and soiling their purity; and (3) sexologists argue that a bit of pedophilia exists in everyone and that repression of one's innermost pedophilic feelings renders one violent in one's rejection of pedophiles and strongly committed to one's prejudices: see Edward Brongersma, "Aggression against Pedophiles," \textit{International Journal of Law and Psychiatry} 7, no. 1 (1984): 79-87. See also Sigmund Freud, "Taboo and the Ambivalence of Emotions," in \textit{Basic Writings}, trans. and ed. Brill, 833.


\textsuperscript{161}Pepitone, "Social Psychological Perspectives," 210-211.
2.8 Impact of Media on Attitudes

Professional and public consciousness about and attitudes toward child sexual abuse are also shaped by the media, which plays an integral role in the construction of child sexual abuse in general, pedophilia in particular and solutions to it. Indeed, James Halloran suggests that the media engages in a reward-punishment technique in the formation of attitudes. As I illustrated earlier in this chapter, media coverage is often the vehicle of accepted opinion in its tendency to endorse punishment of offenders and to maximize coverage when an offender receives a lenient sentence.

However, this is not a recent phenomenon. In Roman times writers used sexual peccadillos in attempts to discredit public figures. So too the nouvelles of eighteenth-century France entertained their readers with stories and ridicule of pederastic activity of members of the social hierarchy. Both the Mémoires secrets and the Correspondance secrète described the gruesome details of the crime and execution of the monk Jacques-François Pascal who had repeatedly stabbed a boy who resisted Pascal's sexual advances. Such media coverage exemplified and promoted the menacing image of sexually aggressive and predatory "monsters" and denied the reality that pedophiles are ordinary human beings like each of us.

---

164Harty, "Nightmares and Sexual Monsters," 261; Canada, Sentencing, Conditional Release and Related Aspects of Corrections, 11; Bullough, "History in Adult Human Sexual Behavior," 81-82. Speaking from the viewpoint of the Television Research Committee, Halloran notes that situations and statements on the mass media may facilitate implicit learning of attitudes, see: Halloran, Attitude, Formation and Change, 39, 44-45, 47.

165Halloran, Attitude, Formation and Change, 47.

166Van Hoose and Kottler, Ethical and Legal Issues in Counseling, 19.

167Bullough, Sexual Variance, 139, 150.

Similarly media coverage in our time has turned the issue of pedophilia into a morality melodrama of "depraved monsters" and "innocents." Doing so polarizes the public and prolongs debate. As Kincaid posits, the belief that pedophiles are evil monsters assures us that there are no complex issues and none that threaten. It allows us to overlook both contradictions and cruelties in our logic, in our family structure, and in our social system at large. It allows us unlimited and gratuitous talk on the subject.\textsuperscript{167}

Within contemporary Western society, the media along with the criminal justice and health care system assumes that the pedophile is a pervert, predator, and morally depraved "monster"\textsuperscript{168} and that pedophilia is a voluntary degenerate sexual preference that can only lead to sadistic assault, molestation, and lust murder. Krafft-Ebing wrote, "The finer feelings of man revolt at the thought of counting the monsters among the psychically normal members of human society."\textsuperscript{169} Likewise, in her title of a professional article on child abuse in Australia Suzanne E. Hatty's use of the highly emotive expression "sexual monsters"\textsuperscript{170} perpetuates the image of the child sexual abuser as some sort of Frankenstein, contributes to the hysteria, and reveals that myths live on even in the professional literature. Myths and fear breed a culture of vengeance.

By contrast, Schuijer reports that media coverage in The Netherlands has attempted to discuss pedophilia in a positive way with a neutral, not

\textsuperscript{167}Kincaid, Child-Loving, 27.

\textsuperscript{168}James Barron and Mary Tabor, "The Mind of a Monster: Police Probe Jeffrey Dahmer's Past for Clues to His Horrific Crimes," Ottawa Citizen, 7 August 1991, A1. One week later the same newspaper printed a letter to the editor in which the author, George Sutherland, argued that humans, like Dahmer fit the dictionary definition of monster as "an inhumantly cruel and wicked person": see Sutherland, "Humans Can Be Monsters," Ottawa Citizen, 22 August 1991, A14. The author of a 1993 opinion article on sexual predators argued that "we have but one choice: Call them monsters and isolate them:" see Andrew Vachss, "Sex Predators Can't Be Saved," New York Times, 5 January 1993, A15.

\textsuperscript{169}Krafft-Ebing, Psychopathia Sexualis, 554, 603. See also Groth, Hobson, and Gary, "Child Molester: Clinical Observations," 130.

\textsuperscript{170}Hatty, "Nightmares and Sexual Monsters," 255.
inimical, attitude. Although Canadian and American newspapers seem to delight in running photographs and caricatures of pedophiles looking unshaven, grotesque, and unkempt, most pedophiles bear no resemblance to these portrayals. Such assumptions, argue Money and others, are erroneous. They are based on a narrow perspective and rare cases in which an overlapping has occurred between pedophilia and another one of the paraphilias.

Pedophiles are not monsters. Novelist Sylvia Fraser, whose father began to sexually abuse her when she was an infant, states this in a manner which addresses the human qualities of the pedophile. Fraser writes:

my father was not a monster. His life was a bud that never opened, blighted by the first frost. His crime became his prison, his guilt his bars. He served his sentence as I have served mine, but his was for life, whereas I got off after forty-seven years for reasonably good behavior.

[References]


173 For examples see: Charles Lewis, "Sex Crimes," Ottawa Citizen, 8 August 1992, C3; Carolyn Abraham and Peter Hum, "Many Watched As Molester Marched to His Own Beat," Ottawa Citizen, 16 December 1993, A1. In an article entitled "Predator: The Horror That Was Joseph Fredericks," journalist Ian MacLeod described Fredericks as a "pedophile and one of the most evil characters Canada has produced:" see MacLeod, Ottawa Citizen, 14 February 1993, A4.


176 Money, Love & Love Sickness, 109; idem, Lovemaps, 73; idem, "New Phalism Theory," 456; idem, "Juvenile, Pedophile, Heterophile," 40; Bradford, Bloomer, and Bourget, "Heterogeneity/ Homogeneity," 218.


There is no psychosocial profile of the pedophile—pedophiles come from all social strata and professions. In therapist Richard I. Lanyon's view, sex offenders are "not remarkably different from other troubled people." Loneliness and unhappiness are often characteristic of the pedophile's life. Many are timid, unassertive, conservative and perhaps even prudish, with feelings of inadequacy and low self-esteem. Others are charming, intelligent, articulate and capable of engaging in interesting and enjoyable conversations.

2.9 Negative Effects of Punitive Attitudes

Society's condemnation is extended by correctional officials and other prisoners during incarceration where "being identified as a sex offender may be little short of a death sentence." Sex offenders are the pariahs of the correctional system, the object of the worst abuses and terror meted

---


181 Mayer, Sex Offenders, 9-10; John Francis Harvey, "Psychological and Pastoral Reflections on Pedophilia," chap. in The Homosexual Person: New Thinking in Pastoral Care, (San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1987), 220


184 Rogers and Dickey, "Denial and Minimization," 56; Card, "Case for Treatment," 12; Canada, Offences against Children, 2:808, 875.

out by guards and fellow prisoners. In his book Go-Boy!, writer and prison inmate, Roger Caron, chronicled with chilling clarity the stygian behaviour of inmates toward child sexual abusers during the 1971 riot at the Kingston Penitentiary.

Fourteen diddlers, rapos, and stool pigeons were tied with chains to chairs in a circle in the centre of the dome. Under ghostly illumination they were ritualistically tortured while hundreds of convicts lined the four circular galleries pounding rhythmically with steel clubs on the hollow railings like jungle drums. By daybreak twelve of the 'undesirables' were horribly mutilated and in critical condition; two others were dead. Dead, because according to the inmate code they deserved retributive 'justice:' one had viciously raped two little girls, while the other had 'disciplined' his children by burning them on a red hot stove. To these inmates, many of whom had lost their own childhoods, the child abuser forfeits his right to live. It was as if this court of retribution would put right all the years of abuse and despair in their own lives.

Among its central findings, the 1974 Standing Committee on Health, Welfare and Social Affairs of the House of Commons noted that public demand for punishment of child abuse offenders may cloud both the real issues of child abuse and neglect as well as the provision of services to high risk families. Moreover, society's punitive attitudes toward sexually deviant behaviour may be experienced by some sex offenders as ubiquitous. Thus, these offenders may perceive all settings as adversarial, be reluctant to discuss their pedophilic behaviour with therapists, and be uncooperative with treatment.

---


188 Canada, Offences against Children, 1:118.

Punishment is not a remedy.\textsuperscript{190} It merely demonstrates the public's revulsion for this type of behaviour. For Sorokin, a prison is essentially an antagonistic system of interaction; the greater the antagonism in the interaction of group members the greater the amount and severity of punishment used for maintenance and enforcement of law.\textsuperscript{191} Conviction and incarceration do not guarantee treatment programs, treatment participation or deterrence.\textsuperscript{192} The 1984 Committee on Sexual Offences against Children and Youths was informed that administrators of correctional services tend to assign a low priority to assisting incarcerated child sex offenders, viewing them as criminally deviant and deserving of severe punishment including that meted out by fellow inmates.\textsuperscript{193} Clinicians may select only those inmates they feel are "treatable." Moreover, a prison environment does not provide conditions conducive to treatment\textsuperscript{194} and may aggravate circumstances underlying the offending behaviour such as secrecy, inappropriate social interaction, low self-esteem, deviant sexual arousal.\textsuperscript{195}

D.J. West of the University of Cambridge's Criminal Science Department emphasizes that a focus of any realistic treatment program is readjustment to community living rather than adjustment to artificial institution life. A medical treatment model, therefore, calls for some flexibility with


\textsuperscript{191}Sorokin, \textit{Society, Culture, and Personality}, 94.

\textsuperscript{192}Borzechki and Wormith, "Treatment Programmes North America," 33.

\textsuperscript{193}Canada, \textit{Offences against Children}, 2:882, 884-885.


respect to release from custodial care according to the abuser's progress
towards reorientation and provision of supervision while still an active
participant in a treatment program. A prison environment constitutes a
barrier to assessment and open communication between inmate and therapist.
Large numbers of sex offenders within the prison system have resulted in
lengthy waiting lists for programs which are allocated an inadequate level
of resources. When forced to wait years for treatment, pedophiles can
lose their motivation to change; their hope and enthusiasm dissolves into
cynicism and despair. Punishment has failed to reduce the incidence of
child sexual abuse while the cost of punishing sex offenders is staggering.
Paradoxically, vengeance and incarceration supplies fresh victims. Having pedophiles live within the general prison population can result in
the gains they have made through therapy being lost. Following treatment
sessions, the pedophile returns to the general prison population where he
is subjected to the rationalizations of the pedophiles who refuse treatment.
Such an atmosphere is not conducive to effective therapy. Moreover, where
punishment is mixed into a treatment program, sexual problems may be

196D. J. West quoted in Canada, Offences against Children, 2:880-881.
197Canada, Sentencing, Conditional Release and Related Aspects of
Corrections, 208-209.
198Marshall and Barrett, Criminal Neglect, 149-150; Card, "Case for
Treatment," 7.
30Using terms such as "painful electric shock," "delivery of punish-
ment," "punishing the behaviors," and "conditioned punisher," Marshall
advocates aversion therapy. See Marshall, "Modification of Sexual
Fantasies," 557-564. Cox expresses concern that some of the aversive
stimuli used in behaviour modification could be used as punishment rather
than therapy and may reflect punitive attitudes of society or the therapist:
see Cox, "Caregiver's Dilemma," 86-87; Bancroft, "Ethical Aspects of
Therapy," 173-176; Robert F. Schopp, "Punishment As Treatment and the
Obligations of Treatment Providers," International Journal of Law and
Psychiatry 7, no. 2 (1984): 197-205; David J. Rothman, "An Historical
Overview: Behavior Modification in Total Institutions," Hastings Center
Report 5, no. 1 (February 1975): 17-24; Johnny L. Matson and Thomas M.
DiLorenzo, Punishment and Its Alternatives: A New Perspective for Behavior
driven underground, genuine personality change is not facilitated, victims remain undiscovered and unlikely to be helped.\textsuperscript{301} In the worst-case scenario, victims may have been exposed to sexually transmitted diseases such as AIDS, which undiscovered go untreated.

Further, in his comprehensive and masterful enquiry into \textit{Human Sexuality and Its Problems}, Bancroft, a sex therapist working with sex offenders, argues that in both couple and individual therapy "the quality of the relationship between therapist and patient is crucially important"\textsuperscript{302} and "requires special attention."\textsuperscript{303} In Card's view, such a personal commitment rarely occurs in a punitive environment. Through treatment, it is hoped that the pedophile will gain personal insights and adopt personal values in line with non-abusive sexual behaviour. As Bancroft observes:

> The onus for change lies with the patient, not with the therapist. The relationship is primarily an educational one between two adults, one providing expertise, the other making use of that expertise in an active way.\textsuperscript{304}

Change and the therapeutic relationship sustaining such change will be inhibited by mixing punishment with therapy. In response to a punitive approach, Card argues that offenders learn to comply superficially in order to get out of an oppressive system. Consequently, they will be released back into the community, angry, frustrated, partially or poorly treated, and still sexually attracted to children.\textsuperscript{305}

\textsuperscript{301}Card, "Case for Treatment," 7.


\textsuperscript{303}Bancroft, \textit{Human Sexuality and Its Problems}, 502.

\textsuperscript{304}Bancroft, \textit{Human Sexuality and Its Problems}, 502.

\textsuperscript{305}Card, "Case for Treatment," 18.
Moreover, incarceration may inflict greater stress on the offender's family through stigmatization, family disruption, and loss of income.\textsuperscript{26} In cases of incest, for example, a spouse or a child may blame him or herself for all of these consequences.

Having defined the term attitude and described and illustrated some of the consequences of punitive attitudes, I shall now explain their source.

2.10 What is the Source of Attitudes?

Concerning the source of attitudes, Altemeyer endorsed a "social learning model." In his view, people acquire their attitudes from other people such as parents and peers; from community and religious leaders; from their own experience with the object of these attitudes; and from the environment at large, which includes the media, movies and schoolwork.\textsuperscript{27} Social learning theory is based upon the concept that the individual gains reinforcement from learning the attitude or from interacting with the object of the attitude.

According to Seitz, attitudes and their function are determined by one's personality development. From his study of prison officers' attitudes toward prisoners Seitz concluded that an officer experiences innerpsychic imbalance of relations between personality traits, general social attitudes, and attitudes towards prisoners as unpleasant and full of tension. He, therefore, tends to develop mechanisms which balance the innerpsychic system. Mechanisms for reducing imbalance depend on the level of his personality development and on the conditions and processes which have caused that development. They depend on his professional socialization and the level of correspondence to his extraprofessional personality development.\textsuperscript{28}

\textsuperscript{26}Alfred Cohn and Roy Udolf, \textit{The Criminal Justice System and Its Psychology} (New York: Van Nostrand Reinhold Co., 1979), 281.

\textsuperscript{27}Altemeyer, \textit{Right-Wing Authoritarianism}, 254-259.

\textsuperscript{28}Seitz, "Attitudes and Personality Traits of Prison Officers," 414.
Van Hoose and Kottler situate attitudes within the realm of personality development and link them to ethics as follows:

Although many of the attitudes and feelings of what is right or wrong are inherited from parents, shaped by siblings and peers, modified by experience, taught by teachers and ministers, and imbibed from the media of television, radio, novels, and magazines, the development of the learnings matures within an individual to develop into a personal 'style' of ethics.\(^\text{20}\)

The Sheriffs, Rest et al. view attitudes as the outcome of a judgment process—the conclusion of a reasoning process.\(^\text{20}\) The Sheriffs base their outlook on the psychology of judgment\(^\text{21}\) while Rest et al. base their perspective on the psychology of morality.\(^\text{21}\) The Sheriffs stress the importance of development, social interactions, self concept, and self-system (varying degree of ego-involvement) and take into account the opportunity of the subject to provide or select his own personally meaningful dimensions.\(^\text{22}\) Allport regards attitudes as being "imbedded" in human personality.\(^\text{24}\) Similarly, Morris Rosenberg situates the self "squarely . . . in the realm of attitudes," and views the self as "an attitude or cluster of attitudes toward an object."\(^\text{25}\)

\(^{20}\)van Hoose and Kottler, Ethical and Legal Issues in Counseling, 19.


\(^{22}\)Sherif and Sherif, "Individual's Categories," 121.

\(^{23}\)Thoma, Rest, and Barnett, "Moral Judgment, Behavior, Decision Making, and Attitudes," 133.

\(^{24}\)Sherif and Sherif, "Individual's Categories," 113, 119, 126.

\(^{25}\)Allport, Nature of Personality, 38.

Developmental psychologist Robert Selman regards social attitudes as social-cognitive functions or processes. 26 Change and ambivalence in adult attitudes toward such social values and institutions as marriage and having children emerge, in part, from a person's ability to make choices about events which previously were viewed as givens. 27 Such changes in attitudes and associated beliefs may well give rise to alterations in the nature of personal relationships and social patterns. Moreover, as Selman sees it:

changing attitudes toward friendship, intimacy, parenting, and family, peer, and group social relations are complemented by changing values, individually directed inward toward the meaning of psychological development within the self. 28

The search for new values in adult life is manifested by concerns for self-actualization, understanding internal relations between conflicting emotions and a move toward greater self-reflection.

On the basis of a longitudinal study of American and Canadian subjects' attitudes toward capital punishment and his theory of moral development Lawrence Kohlberg concluded that "the nonfactual cognitive components of attitudes toward capital punishment are determined by developing moral standards" that prevail in society. 29 Kohlberg regarded attitudes toward capital punishment as "the product of an interaction between moral assumptions and assumptions of fact." 30

Differences in attitudes are moral and philosophical and are hierarchically related in that they develop ontogenetically. Kohlberg based his


27 Selman, Growth of Interpersonal Understanding, 73.

28 Selman, Growth of Interpersonal Understanding, 74.


30 Kohlberg, Philosophy of Moral Development, 251.
discussion on the belief that society's conception of punitive justice is morally evolving.\footnote{Kohlberg, Philosophy of Moral Development, 252-253.} In his view

If our society is in fact evolving toward higher moral stages, then we can assess the compatibility of any particular form of punishment with evolving standards simply by determining the attitude toward that punishment that is held by individuals who have attained those higher stages.\footnote{Kohlberg, Philosophy of Moral Development, 253-254.}

Kohlberg later presents data which suggests that attainment of higher stages of moral reasoning leads to rejection of capital punishment. However, only a minority of Americans have attained a high enough developmental stage for this rejection to occur.

The small amount of research which has been done on attitudes toward pedophiles is compelling and clearly indicates that people working in institutions where pedophiles should especially be considered as in need of treatment and care generally lack understanding of the phenomenon, hold the view of pedophilia as immorality and criminal offence and have punitive attitudes toward pedophiles in their care. Undoubtedly, more research is required to assess the role that attitudes play in clinical service delivery.\footnote{Seth C. Kalichman, Mary E. Craig, and Diane R. Follingstad, "Professionals' Adherence to Mandatory Child Abuse Reporting Laws: Effects of Responsibility Attribution, Confidence Ratings, and Situational Factors," Child Abuse & Neglect 14, no. 1 (1990): 69, 75.}
social good. Developmental theory provides evidence that people are the answer in light of their capacity to grow, to care for others, to enter into increasingly complex relations and to assume social responsibility. To this theory I now turn.
CHAPTER THREE
ROBERT KEGAN'S DEVELOPMENTAL THEORY AS RESOURCE TO CAREGIVERS

In chapter one by doing a historical survey, I demonstrated that a treatment approach has been identified as an alternative to punishment as a response to pedophilia. In chapter two I established that the "construction of pedophilia" assumed by specific professionals is that of medical condition but by professional caregivers in general is, in fact, that of immorality and criminal offense warranting punishment and death. I argued that significant questions can be raised about the punitive attitudes of mental health professionals toward pedophiles in their care.

Punitive attitudes, I believe, offer a truncated view of what it means to be a fully human being. This partial picture is accompanied by a loss of the sense of the whole person and can negate the possibility of caring. Therefore, in this chapter, I shall argue that there is a need to re-examine basic assumptions about what it means to be fully human. I shall do this from the perspective of developmental psychology because developmental psychology produces expectations about humanity and the future that are very different from the aforementioned punitive attitudes. I shall provide a quick tour of the field of developmental theory, particularly that of Robert Kegan. I shall situate Kegan's constructive-developmental approach within these differing paradigms of psychological development of moral behaviour to demonstrate how it is relevant to a reconception of attitudes toward pedophiles. My aim is to stimulate the reader to look beyond the immediate details of a particular theory to the underlying principle of self-transcendence. This quality assures us of our potential for development beyond punitive attitudes toward moral maturity.

---


Kegan presupposes that a successful organization or embeddedness culture functions as a holding environment analogous to amniotic conditions out of which the self continuously emerges. Hence, I shall

1. delineate Kegan’s notion of culture of embeddedness, and

2. illustrate how differing cultures of embeddedness perform functions of confirmation, contradiction, and continuity.

3.1 Overview of Developmental Theory

According to such therapists as Carl Rogers and John Pietrofesa et al., it is essential to therapeutic process that a facilitative relationship be founded in the caring and genuine interest which abides in the heart of the therapist.\(^3\) One of the ultimate goals of the therapeutic process and relationship is the client’s growth.\(^4\) Rapport is established and therapy is most effective to the extent that the therapist (a) accepts the client as a worthwhile person; (b) is positive, warm and caring in attitudes toward the client; and (c) can create conditions or a culture which make it possible for growth to occur.\(^5\) Hence, there is a need to focus on both the growth of the therapist as well as that of the client.\(^6\)

As Bagley and King point out: the humanistic approach to child sexual abuse manifests compassionate understanding of both the abuser and the survivor.\(^7\) "The humanistic approach to child sexual abuse assumes that both

---


\(^7\)Bagley and King, *Search for Healing*, 45.
men and women can learn new values and behaviours based on mutual support, new insights, and new understanding. Such an assumption applies equally to caregivers and to perpetrators of child sexual abuse. In their focus on growth, mental health professionals need to help the pedophilic client to address the very real differences and distinctions in the pedophile's sexual attractions, so that the client can live safely in the community and become a functionally productive member of society.

Human beings--like animals--can be extremely punitive in their behaviour toward other members of their species; but examples abound of human kindness, love, and willingness to sacrifice for the benefit of others. Moreover, prosocial or positive social behaviour, defined as behaviour that benefits other people, has been a major focus of research by psychologists. Social psychologist, Ervin Staub, for example, reports that a number of researchers have considered the possibility that prosocial behaviour has a genetic component.

The idea of the person and what constitutes personality has been an abiding and important issue of inquiry in ethics. There are profoundly different conceptions of the human person, but the most useful and reasonable approach has been to study the psychological development of moral behaviour. It is to this corpus of theory that I now turn. A quick tour of the field of developmental theory shows that developmental psychologists (some of whom are in dialogue with one another) consider the personal subject in its lengthy process of self-creating personal authenticity.

Jean Piaget believed that morality consists of a system of rules--the essence of morality being found in the respect which persons develop for these rules. He viewed the study of morality as a matter of cognitive

---


development. Based on his analysis of various aspects of cognitive development from infancy through the onset of adolescence, his theory describes cognitive development in terms of logic proceeding through a sequential series of stages. The stages arise initially from the child’s centring on its own body in an autism and cognitive egocentricity, toward mental structures or groups of operations. These operations yield a capacity for critical, realistic judgment and problem solving in the realm of justice revealed in the child’s relationships with the world around it. Piaget’s work is epistemological; it is about the balancing and rebalancing of self and other or of subject and object. However, it is also individualistic in nature and incomplete in that it fails to attend to the role of conscience and the non-cognitive side of mental development such as the emotions—an aspect of personality central to therapeutic practice.

Piaget spoke of the realm of justice. Even granting that he is correct in his assumption that there is no morality outside of society, morality is not reducible to a concept of justice among persons in society. If, instead, he had conceptualized morality as an attempt to create a society based on love and caring relationships, his questions would have been different. Moreover, Piaget’s studies were primarily of boys’ practice and consciousness of rules in the game of marbles. For his study of girls he made use of the less complex game of hide and seek. Thus, Piaget unconsciously bought into prevailing stereotypes.

Norman Bull reexamined much of Piaget’s work. He assumes morality to mean both the pursuit of the good life as well as the generally accepted code of conduct of a society or sub-group. He traces development in moral judgment in sample subjects, both male and female, from age seven to seven-


teen years. Employing interviews and tests including one on attitudes
toward punishment, he conceptualizes four intertwineable levels or stages
of moral behaviour.

Bull views growth (physical and mental) as the law of life. For Bull,
moral judgements involve the person, not just the intellect, and they stem
from often deeply-held-attitudes and motivations. In each moral judgment,
the situational factor is vital. Bull is open to other disciplines, such
as psychology and sociology, contributing to the study of moral development
and treats the concept of conscience. However, he remains traditional in
his theory of morality as justice and benevolence. I contend that morality
is more vast than these two concepts. Furthermore, he only points to the
role of the church, school, neighbourhood, and socioeconomic class. Surely,
more knowledge is needed about the place of these variables in development
of morality, values and ideals.

Lawrence Kohlberg\textsuperscript{12} extends Piaget's concept of cognitive moral devel-
opment into adulthood and defines six sequential stages or ways of thinking
about social and moral issues. The stages move from Stage 1 egocentric
hedonism through the very self-serving cooperation of Stage 2 and the mutual
sharing of Stage 3 toward Stage 4's prior-to-society perspective, Stage 5's
morality of contract and Stage 6's universal moral principles.

Kohlberg is interested in forms of reasoning but not content. He
acknowledges the need for the affective component in moral judgment but
avoids dealing with it. Identifying morality with justice, his descriptions
depict moral development as moving from an egoistic orientation towards

\textsuperscript{12}Lawrence Kohlberg, \textit{The Psychology of Moral Development: The Nature and
Validity of Moral Stages} (San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1984); Lawrence
Kohlberg, "From Is to Ought: How to Commit the Naturalistic Fallacy and Get
Away with It in the Study of Moral Development," chap. in \textit{Philosophy of
Moral Development}, 101-189; André Guindon, "Kohlberg's Postconventional
Development: Form, Content and Self: A Critique of Kohlberg's Sequence,"
\textit{Revue de University d'Ottawa} 48, no. 3: 232-263; Jürgen Habermas, "Justice
and Solidarity: On the Discussion Concerning 'Stage 6'," \textit{The Philosophical
Forum} XXI, nos. 1/2 (Fall/Winter 1989-90): 32-52; T. M. Reed, "Development-
orientation to social order. However, moral development is much more than what Kohlberg describes. He builds his just society on universal respect for rights; however, morality is not just concerned about rights. Moreover, his is a cold theory: these are your rights, these are mine. Kohlberg's argument for absolute and universal principles is questionable as is his assumption that men and women go through the same stages. Further, there are different ways of valuing at different stages but Kohlberg does not look at this.

Erik Erikson views the course of personal development as a life cycle of eight psychosocial ages or stages, each of which is marked by a definite crisis which, if resolved, produces a specific psychosocial strength or virtue such as hope and trust in an early stage and fidelity, love, and care in a later stage. Erikson explicitly reflects upon the development of an ethical orientation as the norm of a mature, fully human adult perspective. He differentiates the ethical from the moral orientation in that the moral sense develops in an earlier, more immature stage. The ethical orientation, developed from the moral sense, is an adult task that marks the difference between adolescence and adulthood. He contends that it is the development of cognitive, emotional, and social powers together which enables realization of the potentialities of each stage. Attending more to development of personality as a whole, his psychosocial approach is functional. It provides a clear explanation of the development from the "psycho" to the "social", of the development of caring for and loving others, and makes distinctions between men and women. However, his viewpoint of the moral is not clear. He seems to presuppose one, but what is the moral viewpoint? For him, morality seems to be in the parent's court.


James Fowler delineates a six-stage theory of development of the structures of faith. He distinguishes faith from belief and religion. Faith, he posits, is the core reality in every person and community, a person's way of discovering what bears the quality of ultimacy and of movement into the world field of life. Faith constitutes the way in which persons see themselves in relation to others within the shared process of finding life meaningful and purposeful. It includes cognition as well as affectivity and it is both social and interactive.

As one moves through the stages, one shows a growing self-awareness. There is movement from Stage 1's egocentrism and inability to coordinate one's perspective with that of the other towards Stage 6's sense of oneness with all persons, devotion to universalizing compassion, devotion to justice and love, and a vision of being that could be for all. Fowler's approach, however, is more intuitive than empirical; his definition of faith very broad. Moreover, faith is only one category within human experience. Fowler has not given enough attention to the way in which economic, environmental, and other factors influence one's faith development. Further, his theory focuses on faith as knowing. The question is: How is this faith related to that of doing and being?

3.2 Developmental Theory of Robert Kegan

Noticeably the question of what it means to be a person is a vast subject. Unlike the developmentalists who focus on specific dimensions of personal development, Robert Kegan directs his theoretical efforts toward establishing the fundamental unity of the self—cognitive, affective, moral, and religious. Because of this comprehensiveness, I wish to focus on Kegan's theory.

---

Building largely on Piaget, Kohlberg, and his own empirical work, Kegan—a research-theorist and practitioner-psychologist—proposes what he calls "natural therapy", a therapeutic approach which centres on how the self evolves and is transformed over time through personal interactions and the activity of constructing meaning or making sense out of one's experience of reality. Kegan credits Kohlberg's work with implying that one's "mental architecture" or level of development amounts to a certain coherence in one's meaning-constituting (at least within a given domain, such as moral construing), and by definition amounts to some systemic form of moral meaning-making. . . . this architectural 'plan' has implications for our understanding of long-time concepts in ego psychology (as well as for a clinician's treatment).

Relationships and institutions are human contexts—distinct organizations or cultures of embeddedness out of which the self continuously emerges. Kegan presupposes that development is "naturally" therapeutic in that development is the natural course of events and a successful embeddedness culture functions as a holding environment analogous to an amniotic environment.

For Kegan, the primary human motion is meaning—a simultaneously biological, philosophical, psychological, epistemological, ontological and theological activity about organizing reality, constructing systems of

---


meaning, relating to others, development of knowing and being. 20 "The activity of being a person is the activity of meaning-making," 21 "the process of the restless creative activity of personality." 22 Meaning is made in the ego, the self, the person; meaning is something we are, not something we have. 23 Persons persist through time; therefore, as persons we are unavoidably lifelong meaning-makers. 24

His constructive-developmental framework brings together the ideas that persons develop or evolve by meaning-making and construct reality through meaning rather than happen upon it. Evolution of subject-object relations and of meaning is the fundamental human motion and prior grounding phenomenon of personality. 25 In their meaning-making, people see themselves in new ways, develop in their levels of consciousness, 26 discover limitations in their ways of knowing 27 and recognize that they and others are originators of values. Although not a function of age-related psychosocial tasks as in Erikson's theory, 28 meaning-making is a universal, observable

---


21 Kegan, Evolving Self, 11.


24 Kegan, Evolving Self, 3, 265.


activity--a single fate "which we do not share . . . so much as it shares us."

Development is the process of outgrowing one meaning system by integrating it as a subsystem into a new meaning system. People respond to changing conditions of life and view themselves according to their meaning system. Meaning systems shape our experiences; largely give rise to our behaviour; and, except in periods of evolution from one system to another, principally organize our thinking, feeling, and range of functioning. One's feelings and attitudes come from how one knows or does not know--the way one understands what the other and the world is all about. Kegan noted that the "stuff" of Kohlberg's stages is a structure or underlying logic which gives forms to a person's experiences, motives, and attitudes.

He saw that human development had been studied by other developmental theorists as a series of stages, as well as a succession of subject-object/self-other separations or differentiations. For Kegan, "persons are not their stages of development," but rather a motion. This phenom-

29Kegan, Evolving Self, 265.


32Kegan, Over Our Heads, 17, 19.


35Kegan, "There the Dance," 407.

36Kegan, "There the Dance," 407; idem, Evolving Self, 277, 77, 219.
emon of motion is a life process that constructs or gives rise to developmental truces or self-other balances. The stages are merely markers or indicators of development in this ongoing process. To address the indicators of development is to risk losing the meaning-making organism, namely, the person developing. Each way of being in relation to and of knowing the world involves striking a subject-object balance or truce. Subject-object relations are not simply abstractions but become or take form in actual human relations within social arenas. Self-other distinctions are tenuous, fragile balances or truces. Each new evolutionary balance makes "what is" a window into "what might be."

Moreover, the self-other relating takes place in the prior context of knowing and being in the world—the context Kegan calls "meaning-constitutive evolutionary activity." The way in which the person resolves the issue of what is "self" and "what is other" essentially defines the person's system of meaning. The two greatest yearnings in human experience which give rise to a lifelong tension and to which the person attributes meaning are called "the yearning to be included" (to be close to, to be held) and "the yearning to be independent or autonomous" (to experience one's uniqueness).

Because this activity of constructing-meaning generates cognition and because it is a motion which is felt and gives rise to emotions, it is both cognitive and affective. It is the unifying context for thought and

---

37 Kegan, Evolving Self, 114.

38 Kegan, Evolving Self, 277.

39 Kegan, Evolving Self, 38.

40 In an earlier published article which contained material similar to the prologue of his later book Evolving Self, Kegan used the word "knowing" in place of the term "meaning:" cf. Kegan, Evolving Self, 18-19; Robert Kegan, "On the Hidden Treasure of Paid Attention: The Need to Know," The Andover Review (Fall 1978), 27-28.

41 Kegan, "There the Dance," 407-408.

42 Kegan, Evolving Self, 107, 209.
feeling. Thus neither cognition nor affect is the master of self-development. As Kegan explains: "when the structures are taken as the basic consideration, the framework is unavoidably cognitive." However, when the motion which gives rise to these constructions is the object of study, we discover that emotions arise out of this motion. Moreover, as Kegan views it, one's sense of right and wrong, the moral, comprises a part-meaning in the domain of personality. Thus, moral growth appears in this process of constituting the self as a consequence of the same basic motion. Moral development is a growth in the capacity for self-other relating, for caring, for wider and more complex social arrangements and for assuming social responsibilities. It is not exclusively logical. There are affective ("psycho") and social dimensions as well.

Further, at its heart, there is a religious, or spiritual, dimension or power to this framework which, in its spiritual reality, is the moving ground that unifies the self that is developing; roots and regenerates our self-other relations; partakes of the transcendent; and "goes beyond the quasi-religious status of stages of moral judgment or even stages of faith construction" as presented by theorists such as Fowler. That Kegan's framework is also theological allows for another perspective or dimension to one's understanding of what it means to be human.

Essentially, Kegan envisions the person as ever being "hatched out" or emerging from cultures of embeddedness, or one's life-surround, in order to create a qualitatively new form of self and to relate more to an

---

4Kegan, "There the Dance," 408.


4Kegan, Evolving Self, 50, 215.

4Kegan, Evolving Self, 115, 288.

4Kegan, "There the Dance," 409-410.
increasingly extensive world. "Though it is aimed at our vision, at helping us to see better what it is that people are doing"\textsuperscript{4} in the universal activity of making sense of their lives and of the surrounding world, the "secret devotion" of his lifespan approach to basic psychodynamic categories is to "increase the likelihood of our being moved... closer to those we live with" for in so moving "they come to matter more"\textsuperscript{5} and the heart feels more deeply. Kegan describes this vulnerability to being moved by and toward another as the risk upon which our lives depend.\textsuperscript{6} Kegan himself does not apply his theory to the care of pedophiles. In light of his theory, however, I believe that how a caregiver responds to a pedophilic patient has much to do with the different person that the caregiver has become in the organizing of the other.

For Kegan, the process of meaning-making evolves through six different levels of self-other relations and systems of meaning. Accordingly we begin in the Incorporative Stage 0 in which the infant, between roughly 6-9 and 21-24 months, differentiates its reflexes, sensing, and moving from the primary caretaker, i.e. the mother. In this stage the infant is embedded in its reflexes but also in the psychosocial environment/culture of the mothering one. From this stage, the infant moves beyond the primary caretaker into Impulsive Stage 1 and its embeddedness in the impulses of the 3-7 year old child within the culture of the family; into Imperial Stage 2 and embeddedness in one's own self-interest needs and wishes within the role-recognizing cultures of the peer gang, family, and school (i.e., institutions of authority); into the Interpersonal Stage 3 and its embeddedness in mutuality within the "culture of dyadic relations"\textsuperscript{7} amongst one's chums; into the Institutional Stage 4 in which there is embeddedness in a

\textsuperscript{4}Kegan, Evolving Self, 16.

\textsuperscript{5}Kegan, Evolving Self, 16.

\textsuperscript{6}Kegan, "Hidden Treasure," 36; idem, Evolving Self, 17.

\textsuperscript{7}Kegan, "There the Dance," 431-432.
sense of self as system, self-ownership and self-dependence going on in the "culture of social forms of ideology, tacit or explicit, personal or bureaucratic;" into the Interindividual Stage 5 with its embeddedness in the interpenetrability of self-systems which goes on within the context of intimate human relations.

For Kegan, each developmental "level" or system of meaning is an evolutionary activity of "preserving or renegotiating the balance between what is taken as subject or self and what is taken as object or other." Thus, human development involves a series of renegotiated dynamic balances that organize the experience of the individual in order to construct a qualitatively new form of self at each stage. This evolutionary process is one of limit and possibility and describes the activity of hope. How much better we might understand others if in their predicaments we could come to know the hopes and hoping that they in fact are.

Each new balance sees the person more whole, more fully person, more able to relate to the surrounding world and guarantees one, in a qualitatively new way, a distinct integrity. The stages represent movement from the embeddedness peculiar to that stage; from embeddedness in the self, from a relationship with a primary caregiver towards greater relatedness and ever more complex relations with others within society. They mark those periods of relative balance in the ongoing process of meaning-making. The balances are "tenuous, fragile, precarious states," temporary truces

---

Kegan, "There the Dance," 432.


Kegan, Evolving Self, 45.

In his theory Kegan provides empirical evidence for Karl Polanyi’s observation in The Great Transformation (Boston: Beacon Press, 1967; c1944), 258, that "Man becomes mature and able to exist as a human being in a complex society."

Kegan, Evolving Self, 114.
awaiting another period of chaos. They represent the person we are, the person we have been and the person we will be throughout our lifespan.

In each balance, the person looks "at a new sense of what is ultimate and what is ultimately at stake."\(^{37}\) Thus Kegan's model of development permits a view of what we can become as we develop into interindividuals with an increasing capacity for being open to self and others. Kegan shows that as we develop into full humanity,\(^{58}\) we are moved, indeed we are drawn, further into life, closer to those with whom we live. As we evolve in our process of making meaning, we simultaneously develop measures of increasing sensitivity which assist us in understanding the meaning-making system of others. As we begin "to see better what it is that people are doing,"\(^{59}\) people come to matter more. We become more vulnerable to being recruited to the welfare of others. It is our recruitability that renders us valuable in caring for another's development. Our survival and development depend upon this capacity to be drawn to another.

The study of the person as "meaning-constitutive evolutionary activity" does not describe the philosophy the self holds or the ethical and theological answers that the person has for the world, but rather the "answer" the person has become in the world.\(^{60}\) Kegan's theory examines the sequence of philosophies the person comprises throughout a lifetime.

Each qualitative change relative to each relation or balance of growth constitutes a response to the complexity of the world—a response which

---


\(^{58}\)Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 16. An interesting comparison can be made between Kegan's view of development into full humanity and Adam Smith's summation of the notion of human perfection in *The Theory of Moral Sentiments* (Indianapolis: Liberty Classic, 1976; c1759), 71: "to feel for others, and little for ourselves . . . to restrain our selfish, and to indulge our benevolent affections, constitutes the perfection of human nature; and can alone produce among mankind that harmony of sentiments and passions in which constitutes their whole grace and propriety."

\(^{59}\)Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 16.

\(^{60}\)Kegan, "There the Dance," 436.
increasingly creates a new appropriation of ultimacy, and "differentiates the self from its embeddedness in the world, guaranteeing, in a qualitatively new way, the world's distinct integrity...thereby creating a more integrated relationship to the world." This is accomplished by "the evolution of a reduced subject and a greater object for the subject to take... an evolution that is more 'truthful'." 

Thus, for Kegan, what is ultimate is not merely survival but personal development: "the bigger picture of the person as the process of evolution itself." The good or truth is the same activity as the emerging self or personality. Hence, the constructive-developmental framework generates justifiable goals for health care professionals and for society. An orientation to growth in terms of more truthful personal development must also become not only a therapeutic priority but its goal. Personality as a goal comes close to Pierre Teilhard de Chardin's vision of the task facing humanity: "The organization of... human energy... whatever its general methods may be, must culminate in forming... the greatest possible amount of personality."

3.3 Culture of Embeddedness

Kegan's constructive-developmental theory suggests a life history of successive "holding environments." He proposes that throughout our evolving lives we are "held" in qualitatively different ways by evolutionary human contexts or cultures of embeddedness, each with its own accumulating

---

*Kegan, Evolving Self, 294, 77.*

*Kegan, Evolving Self, 294.*

*Kegan, Evolving Self, 248.*

*Kegan, Evolving Self, 293-294.*


*Kegan, Evolving Self, 256-257.*
history and mythology. More than merely social or psychological supports, cultures of embeddedness are the psychosocial environments which hold us, to which we are fused, and which let go of us. For example, any caretaker, whether a mother in the home or a health care professional in a hospital is a holding environment—an "enveloping presence" which provides the context in which development does or does not take place. Likewise, the therapeutic context itself is a culture of embeddedness which can promote or thwart a troubled person's growth. Development involves emergence from a psychobiological evolutionary state but also emergence from embeddedness in a specific human context or culture. Development amounts to transcending my culture of embeddedness and creating distinctions "between my life and other life, between distress or comfort that has its origins in me and that which has its origins in others, or a world apart from me," between how the culture appears to define me and what is "really me."

3.4 Functions of Differing Cultures of Embeddedness

Kegan views the development of self as a sequence of naturally therapeutic human contexts: the mothering one; the role-recognizing one of family, peer group and school; mutual interpersonal relationships; the culture of ideology; and finally intimate adult relations. Each of these

---

67Kegan, Evolving Self, 115-116; cf., Gordon Willard Allport who defines culture as a "prearranged design for living" which renders life efficient and intelligible and shapes personality by providing available solutions to various life problems such as birth, death and meaning. Initially serving as a mechanism which trains and satisfies our needs, culture gradually becomes a "way of life:" see Allport, Pattern and Growth in Personality (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1951), 166-168.

68Kegan, Evolving Self, 262-263, 276.

69Kegan, Evolving Self, 262, 277, 288.

70Kegan, Evolving Self, 117.

71Kegan, Evolving Self, 257.

72Kegan, Evolving Self, 116, 124.
cultures of embeddedness performs at least three functions of confirmation, contradiction, and continuity. Each culture must hold on, let go, but also linger awhile so that it can be reintegrated as an object or subsystem of a new balance and culture of embeddedness. A holding environment holds not by keeping or confining but by supporting the activities of who the person is. To hold without oppressing may be the first condition of caring. People, however, do not grow by having their way of organizing reality only confirmed. They grow by having their realities challenged and by being supported as they listen to that challenge rather than merely defend against it.

The mothering culture of the Incorporative Stage 0 literally holds, protects, provides buoyancy and nourishes gestation (function 1); recognizes and helps the infant to differentiate from total embeddedness in the life force to create the object world, promotes emergence of "otherness" independent of its own sensing and moving (differentiation), reduces carrying, acknowledges displays of independence, and refuses to meet the infant’s every need (function 2); permits self to become part of the bigger culture such as the family, encourages separations from the infant and assists in delivering the infant to a new evolutionary balance (function 3); and bridges the transition from Stage 0 to Stage 1 while staying put for the infant to reintegrate into a new balance what was once a part of him, by continuing a nurturing presence and by providing soft, comforting objects such as a teddy bear, or favourite blanket.

The parenting or family culture of the Impulsive Stage 1 receives and nurtures the small child by acknowledging and culturing its activities of

---

75Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 162.
fantasy (i.e., bogeyman, monsters, superman), intense parental (oedipal) attachments and rivalries; confirms by communicating praise and by informing the child when it is correct (function 1). It recognizes and assists in the birth of a new personality which emerges from egocentric embeddedness in fantasy, impulses and idiosyncratic perceptions. It contradicts the child by setting limits on its behaviour, helping the child to discover that the world is not subject to the child, recognizing appropriate boundaries between the child and its parents (between itself and its own impulses), providing clearly distinct parental roles, holding the child responsible for its own feelings and its behaviour, recognizing the child’s self-sufficiency and allowing the child to assert same (function 2). The parenting culture permits itself to become part of the bigger culture of school and peer relationships by sharing the role of sponsoring the child with teachers and other people (function 3). At the same time, it bridges the self the child has been (i.e., subject to impulses and perceptions) and the self the child is becoming (i.e., able to coordinate or regulate its impulses).7

The role recognizing culture (family, school, friends) of the Imperial Stage 2 acknowledges, supports and confirms the preadolescent’s (or adolescent’s) displays and tests of self-sufficiency, competition, competency, rules and order as well as role differentiation i.e., construction of the role of the child in relation to parents (function 1). It recognizes and promotes emergence from embeddedness in self-centredness; denies the soundness of taking only one’s own interests, feelings, needs and perspectives into account; contradicts personal aggrandizement and overdifferentiation by demanding mutuality, that is, provision of a culturing environment for one another, and the giving as well as receiving of care; expects accountability, compromise and trustworthiness, the ability of the preadolescent to recognize the other as a unique person with her own purposes and role and to take the role of another (function 2). It allows itself to become

secondary to the preadolescent’s new self-concept and to relationships of shared internal experiences (function 3); and sticks around in such a way that allows the growing person to ignore and reject it, to find it anew and to redefine a relationship to it, to coordinate needs rather than be those needs, become mutual and empathic.

The culture of mutuality of the Interpersonal Stage 3 recognizes, confirms and cultivates the late adolescent’s (or adult’s) move to adulthood, self-authorship and personal autonomy as well as its capacity for collaborative self-sacrifice in mutually attuned interpersonal relationships; is interested in the young adult’s internal subjective states, innermost thoughts, feelings and moods (function 1). It promotes the other’s independence by (1) remaining helpful to the young adult but demanding the other person assume responsibility for the young adult’s initiatives, purposes and direction; and (2) resisting being fused with while recognizing the person as distinct and valuing closeness (function 2). It permits the relationship with the adolescent to be relativized or situated in the bigger context of its ideology, self-definition and emerging personal authority (function 3). It provides a bridging environment by acknowledging the young adult’s loss of home of origin and by refusing to cave in as the young adult becomes more reliable and self-decisive.

The culture (societal arena, workplace) of ideology, identity or self-authorship of the Institutional Stage 4 recognizes the adult as an independent person; acknowledges and promotes the adult’s capacity for independence, psychological self-definition, authority, and exercise of personal enhancement, ambition or achievements; and provides work which permits the adult to exercise influence and assume responsibility (function 1). It perceives the adult’s sense of loneliness and dissatisfaction with the workings of this balance; suggests the adult emerge from embeddedness

---

7 Kegan, Evolving Self, 161-183.

8 Kegan, Evolving Self, 184-220.
in autonomy, independency and overdifferentiation; and contradicts self-
possessiveness, over-subjectivity and mediated, nonintimate relationships
which are governed by generalized rules which ignore the particulars
(function 2). Ideological forms (i.e., general categories, formal construc-
tions of a situation) let themselves be unhinged and relativized on behalf
of the play between groups, standards or conventions, organizations, forms
and systems (function 3).\textsuperscript{81} The transition from Stage 4 is bridged as the
adult relaxes vigilance and frees up an internal life.

The culture of intimacy (intimate relations, wider and more complex
social arrangements) of the Interindividual Stage 5 recognizes and nurtures
the other's capacity for interdependence, self-surrender, openness to
reevaluation, contradiction and paradox, intimacy, and interdependent self-
definition; mutually preserves the other's distinctness while mutually
protecting the other's opportunity to experience and exercise life's funda-
mental tensions (function 1). It gives way to the larger context of the
person as the process of evolution itself and to the interdependent
fashioning of a bigger context in which separate identities interpen-
trate.\textsuperscript{82}

3.5 The Self-Transcending Principle

That Kegan's theory is theological is illustrated by Catholic
theologian Walter Conn. In several of his works Conn shows how these
developmental theories implicitly use the philosophical principle of self-
transcendence as a criterion of mature personal development.\textsuperscript{83} While this
term is used in different ways, some of which are vague and mysterious, Conn
specifies that self-transcendence is the moving beyond one's own self as,

\textsuperscript{81}Kegan, \textit{Evolving Self}, 221-254.

\textsuperscript{82}Kegan, \textit{Evolving Self}, 119, 247-254.

\textsuperscript{83}Walter E. Conn, \textit{Christian Conversion: A Developmental Interpretation
for example, when a person, understanding another's need and turning primary attention from one's own interests, reaches out and involves oneself in the needs of the other with a serious commitment of support. 84

With Piaget, this radical drive for self-transcendence lies within the perspective of cognition, in the individual's general decentering process from total egocentrism toward objectivity and the self-transcending capacities for realistic knowing. 85 The concrete operations which emerge in the child's thinking around the age of six or seven and which enable it to move beyond its own viewpoint to take other perspectives into account are the springboards for cognitional self-transcendence. With Kohlberg, the movement toward self-transcendence does not really begin to take hold until adolescence. The drive is within the development of moral consciousness, in the self-transcending capacities for moral judgments from the early orientation to the concrete interests of the self toward the principled conscience of a socially oriented morality.

By contrast, self-transcendence with Erikson is a critical issue from the very beginning of personal development and concerns psychosocial affectivity; the realization of strengths such as trusting hope, autonomous will, initiating purpose, care and love; and the development from immature superego toward identity and the mature ethical conscience. For Erikson, these strengths are "springboards pointed in the direction of self-transcendence." 86 In his work, Erikson clearly distinguishes between the moral and ethical orientations so that one becomes fully ethical only insofar as one reaches out beyond oneself to others.

According to Fowler, self-transcendence lies within the development of the structure of personal faith and constitutes the movement from an

84 Conn, Christian Conversion, 19.

85 Conn, Christian Conversion, 40-43.

early stage of undifferentiated faith through to being able to take the perspective of others. At a later stage one is able to reach out beyond the self, to be radically open to the 'other', until full self-transcendence in being for others.

With Kegan, self-transcendence is the constitutive and unifying reality of a life-long constructive-developmental meaning-making process, the decentering movement, 'hatching out', or emergence from incorporative embeddedness in the culture of the mothering one to greater relatedness to the world in the context of interindividual relations. For example, as indicated earlier in the discussion of the movement from Stage 2 to Stage 3, the achievement in this movement is the real transcendence of self towards 'team spirit'. Likewise, movement from Stage 4 to Stage 5 amounts to transcending the isolation of one's independence, polarity and identification with the product to an orientation to the process which creates the product.\(^7\) The springboards for self-transcendence are the universal tensions of differentiation and integration that are part of the reality of the motion of life itself and which point beyond themselves.

Accordingly Conn summarizes personal development as "the ever greater realization of the radical drive for self-transcendence, for reaching out beyond oneself affectively and cognitively through critical, principled judgment and responsible, loving action."\(^8\) Thus, human development is essentially self-transcendence, a moving beyond oneself in an effort to realize the good of others. Self-transcendence is a norm of maturity, a criterion of movement to higher, more complex stages of personal development, the personal dynamism which imposes a basic direction to one's life in the process of development. Given that the nature of the human person is a self-transcending one, a person's ultimate achievements are always beginnings.

\(^7\)Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 248, 253.

\(^8\)Conn, *Christian Conversion*, 69.
In contemporary theology an understanding of the human person as self-transcending is central to the interpretation of the religious dimension of human experience. The category of transcendence is fundamental, for example, to Catholic theologian Karl Rahner’s anthropology and refers to the element of openness which exists within all experiences. For Rahner, to experience ourselves as mystery, as a kind of question mark, and to be ever-reaching beyond the explanations of this universe, directed toward God as the Holy Mystery, is transcendent existence. Thus self-transcendence is a single, radical thrust of the human spirit, expressive of both authentic morality and genuine religion. It is the central dynamic reality of responsible care and of sustaining more complex social relationships. For Anglican theologian John Macquarrie, transcendence is an attribute of humanity which (a) "suggests the picture of climbing a mountain trail and overcoming the force of gravity that holds one back:" and (b) expresses the "fuller, truer humanizing of life" that occurs when we "push back the horizons of humanity itself," involve ourselves in the world around us, co-create ourselves and creatively mould the environment in which we live.

This is the basic point which I will use as a focus for an approach to the pedophile because it provides a perspective that immediately highlights the relationship between personal morality and the social good. Disparity exists between the personal and the social only in the early stages of human development. Sustained concern for the well-being of others lies beyond the capacity of the individual in the early stages.

---


3.6 Relevance of Kegan's Theory to Caregivers' Practice

At a glance one can trace the positive implications of the movement associated with stages on the overall character of one's participation in the response to pedophilia. For example, the movement from self-interest in Stage 2 to a concern for one's group of 'chums' in Stage 3 suggests implications for 'community spirit' in a 'team-based' approach. The traditional workplace is the most obvious form of the culture of ideology which holds the Stage 4 institutional balance. Kegan's Stage 4 institutional balance corresponds to Kohlberg’s "conventionality" and to Piaget’s "formalism." If one were to apply Kegan's theory to an institution like a hospital, one would readily see that the conventional organization is bureaucratic and the prevailing values are efficiency, viability of the product, quantitative results and the performance of predefined tasks. In contrast, the Stage 5, postbureaucratic or interindividual organization, although rare, would promote and value shared reflection on broader, more long-term organizational purposes, open evaluation of the organization's environmental effects, participatory decision-making, creative approaches to conflict resolution, protection of individual rights, encouragement of the individual's sense of responsibility, as well as intersystemic or interpersonal process. Such an environment clearly would support a qualitatively different evolution of meaning for its personnel than would a bureaucratic culture.  

Kegan's theory also offers a structure for the evaluation of support, whether the supporting system be a single individual (i.e. parent), a complex organization (i.e., workplace or school) or the therapeutic context as follows:

If the intrauterine environment is a model for the provision of a medium in which the growing organism can thrive, the framework suggests a basis for a kind of lifelong 'psychological amniocentesis', by which the quality of holding environments, their capacity to

---

nourish and keep buoyant the life project of their 'evolutionary
guests,' might be assessed.9

Thus, his theory is pregnant with implications for caregivers' punitive
attitudes toward pedophiles in their care. If the self is organized and re-
organized around the supports or naturally therapeutic processes available
to it from others or from social institutions like a hospital, then it is
imperative that caregivers evaluate these support systems in terms of their
function and the details of their interaction, meaning and makeup in order
to determine whether they thwart or promote growth, aid or do not aid a
person.44 One can inquire: Does the culture of mutuality require one to
take responsibility for one's own initiatives, preferences and sense of
direction? Are the goals of mental health workers 'nakedly political and
actually aimed at social control rather than the health of the person?"55

Kegan believes that

The constructive-developmental approach offers a way to think about
assessing the nature of a person's psychological supports that moves
beyond the quantity of caring others, even beyond the intensity of
their care, to consider, in a fairly discriminating way, the struc-
tural quality of those supports. Are there others who 'know' the
person, who can see, recognize, understand who the person is, and who
he or she is becoming? Support is not alone an affective matter, but
a matter of 'knowing'; a matter of shape, as well as intensity.66

Thus, he argues, his theory can serve as a natural wisdom to guide the
practice of professional therapy and counseling. It illustrates how, with
development, we revisit old issues at whole new levels of increasing
complexity77 and how a professional knows a client, 'holds' a client,
resonates with that client's experience according to the strictures of the
caregiver's current balance.88 Kegan's perspective can also support the

9Kegan, Evolving Self, 257.

4Kegan, Evolving Self, 212, 256-257.

5Kegan, Evolving Self, 291.

6Kegan, Evolving Self, 260.

7Kegan, Evolving Self, 109.

caregiver's ability to listen to the pain which the client brings to her or it may suggest a different place from which to listen. 99

Beyond the concerns about support and given moments of individual development, Kegan's framework also addresses the nature of community as a whole. The cultures of embeddedness serve as vehicles through which the community communicates, one of its most important communications being recognition of a person's growth and change.100 Each time a human context "holds" or supports a person securely, it ensures the integrity of the larger community of which the individual is a part and confirms the community's greater fidelity to the person-who-develops than to the self-the-person-had-composed.101

Moreover, unlike other theorists, Kegan pays attention to the social context, men as well as women,102 and examines attachment as well as independence and autonomy. He saw how this constructive-developmental process of making meaning could be applied to practitioners as well as to their patients.103 It has implications for how practitioners understand their patients, for their practice of therapy and for their educational training. For Kegan, these activities can be informed by a common theoretical framework, namely, the examination of the development of our construct-

99Kegan, Evolving Self, 267, 274.
100Kegan, Evolving Self, 260.
101Kegan, Evolving Self, 260-261.
103Kegan, Evolving Self, 273-274.
ing or meaning-making activity. Serving as a basis for integrating two professional stances: "the reaction to disturbance (the 'clinical' role) and the anticipation of disturbance (the 'preventive' role)," his framework offers health practitioners "a theoretical resource with considerable range and integrative capability." One's development in the process of meaning-making has a "naturally therapeutic" effect. The theory helps practitioners to comprehend the "naturally therapeutic" effect of healthy unselfconscious relationships with clients and to create such relationships. Practitioners can be most responsive to the person in their care by discovering more about, and engaging, the client's process of growth and meaning-making activity, rather than simply aligning with the person's "stages", "illness", or "problem", none of which is the person. Kegan views natural therapy as more a matter of approach and attitude than specific techniques. Constructive-developmental theory can help to determine whether some goals for psychological practice are justified or whether they are the unwitting exercise of the practitioner's power or the arbitrary favourites of the practitioner's social class.

For more than a decade Kohlberg's theory has been advocated by certain professions such as nursing. However, with its focus on justice and on cognitive development, it largely ignores both social experience and the emotional sides of experience, such as empathy. A moral theory emphasizing

---

107 Kegan, "Making Meaning," 374; idem, Evolving Self, 212, 267, 278, 291. Kegan recognizes that "illness" can readily become behaviour we dislike or with which we are uncomfortable.
108 Kegan, "Kohlberg and Psychology," 175.
justice only is inadequate to address concerns in health care professions which espouse the importance of caring and self-transcendence. Kegan's theory appears to meet this need.

Kohlberg argues that hard, structural stage theories, such as his own, focus upon forms of manifest reasoning; while soft, stage ego theories, such as that of Kegan, stress continual self-reflection and focus upon the ego's process of choosing and defining itself. In his view, because soft stages are not directly linked to action or empirical problem solving, they make no claim that a higher ego stage is more adequate than a lower one. Hence, development to higher stages is optional and soft stages cannot be formalized in a normative model of development. Nevertheless, Kohlberg commends soft stage models because they proffer a new way of researching adult development. "They can," he argues, "attempt to interpret the tasks of metaphysics and religion--essentially the task of integrating the ideals of justice, love, and truth with the ultimate nature of reality."

---


11Kegan, Evolving Self, 30, 274.


112Kohlberg and Armon, "Three Types," 393-394.
In their critique of Kegan's theory, Thomas Barrett and Vincent Harren liken his framework to a progression of "Aha!" insight experiences and find that while his framework is compelling and comprehensive and explains a great deal, it offers surprisingly few specifics and at times is difficult to understand.\textsuperscript{113} They remind us that the terms self and ego have been denigrated by critics as reifications—as though they were autonomously-functioning "little men"\textsuperscript{114} within the person. They seek clarification with respect to the role of emotion (which Kegan specifically claims his approach addresses\textsuperscript{115}), unconscious determinants, and regressive phenomena in the evolution of self.\textsuperscript{116}

What psychologist Jozef Denys finds noteworthy about Kegan's theory is its focus on the overall potential for self development more so than on the relative deficiency or 'error' of any of the cycles of the journey. Although each stage can be seen as wanting in some way in retrospect; nevertheless, it is viewed more appropriately as a stepping stone or readjustment rather than an error on the journey of growth.\textsuperscript{117}

Denys recommends Kegan's theory as a practical model for professionals for doing self care in order to join with those to whom they extend their care.

Similarly, Joann Wolski Conn endorses Kegan's approach as consistent and practical not only for therapists and counselors but also for those who teach religious development and spirituality.\textsuperscript{118} In chapter five I shall

\begin{itemize}
\item Barrett and Harren, "Perspectives on Self-Theory," 35.
\item Kegan, \textit{Evolving Self}, 4.
\item Barrett and Harren, "Perspectives on Self-Theory," 36.
develop the context in which Kegan is relevant to the religious and spiritual dimension. Jesuit theologian and canon lawyer, Ladislas Orsy judges that Kegan’s book is helpful to build for ourselves an image of the healthy person and healthy development and to shape the mind of canon lawyers to the point where they can make sound decisions about capacity or lack thereof. 119

Kegan points out that while his theory is still new, nevertheless, the constructive-developmental paradigm has deep roots and a long theoretical and empirical tradition. . . . it asks good questions, and in its freedom from investment in the established order, it challenges us to use ourselves in new ways. In its rigorous attention to meaning-making, it reminds us that caring is not an emotional matter alone, not alone a matter of intensity. Caring is also 'structural:' it knows and recognizes me, or it fails to know and recognize me. 120

Thus, his theory is already in tune with how some mental health professionals think about care and conceptualize the person in need of help. As long as the theory remains open to its own development, it can keep mental health professionals honest, impose a discipline upon caregivers and enable them to "bracket" particular prejudices which are not justifiable. 121

Kegan’s books are written for professionals who are concerned about their own growth and that of another. 122 His stages comprise generalized descriptions of a wide range of complicated and observed human phenomena of organizing reality. 123 He is concerned about practice and theory, the responsibility of our response-ability and recruitability, as well as the question of what we do once we respond and are recruited. If, as Kegan surmises, the capacity to be recruited is educable, then the exploration in


121 Kegan, Evolving Self, 295.

122 Kegan, Evolving Self, ix.

123 Kegan, Evolving Self, viii.
which he engages can enhance our recruitability. Thus, I believe his theory provides a framework (1) for discussion and further research; (2) for organization of the empirical data on the punitive attitudes of mental health professionals toward pedophiles in their care; and (3) for refinement by caregivers of their understanding of human complexities such as pedophilia. This I shall do in the next chapter.

While his theory has been utilized in the fields of learning and education, psychotherapeutic self-understanding, marital and family communication, sociopathy, conflict, leadership development, pastoral counseling and spiritual direction, I shall demonstrate how it can be an important resource for practitioners who care for pedophiles by analyzing the existing empirical research regarding the punitive attitudes of caregivers toward pedophiles in their care. This has been unexplored by Kegan himself.

Although his constructive-developmental framework is not an ethical theory as such, the quest for self which he describes implies natural ethics. Whether it might be an adequate and alternative path to ethical practice vis-à-vis pedophiles is answerable by walking the path he describes, a journey which I shall take in the next chapter. Kegan perceives Kohlberg’s framework to be "jointly philosophical and psychologi-

124Kegan, Evolving Self, 19-20.

cal and which can deal—in fact, insists upon dealing—with issues of the justifications of one's goals simultaneously with issues of psychological processes." 126 Thus, Kohlberg's framework amounts to "an empirically grounded way of 'doing philosophy', specifically 'ethics'." 127 A similar statement, Kegan argues, can be made of Piaget. Since Kegan's theory is both neo-Piagetian and Neo-Kohlbergian, one can make the same assertion of his framework, as we shall see in the chapters which lie ahead.


CHAPTER FOUR

ETHICAL ANALYSIS OF EXISTING EMPIRICAL RESEARCH

In the previous chapter I argued that there is a need to re-examine basic assumptions about what it means to be fully human and described the constructive-developmental theory of Robert Kegan with its underlying principle of self-transcendence which assures us of our potential for personal development. In this chapter I shall provide the reader with a means to compare and contrast different views of human being within a meaningful framework.

What must be established here is whether or not a correlation can be demonstrated for caregivers:

- on the one hand, between embeddedness in Kegan's Interpersonal level of consciousness and concomitant views of pedophilia as immoral and/or criminal along with punitive attitudes;

- on the other hand, between being embedded in Kegan's Interindividual level of consciousness and the concomitant medical view of pedophilia along with caring and compassionate attitudes.

If correlation can be demonstrated, I will have succeeded in providing an empirically driven illustration of my hypothesis: adoption of a medical construction of pedophilia may be a result of attaining an interindividual ethic (i.e., a more sophisticated level of ethical development). If insufficient data can be found to illustrate a correlation, we need not close the book on this issue: there remains a requirement for theory which will focus on the responsibility of professionals to develop ethical sophistication in order to care for anyone who offends their moral standards. Such a theory can be tested later through further empirical research that would involve (1) interviewing actual practitioners about their attitudes toward pedophiles; and (2) subjecting the forthcoming data to a more systematic and intersubjective analysis.

My method involves utilizing Kegan's theory to analyze the existing anecdotal evidence and empirical research regarding caregivers' attitudes
toward pedophiles in their care in order to establish any evidence of
Kegan's signposts of moral development. Kegan, along with his collabor-
ators, has developed tools which allow me to address the question. This
theorist can begin to help me answer questions in a manner that is more
pertinent than other resources. While I shall use Kegan's *The Evolving
Self: Problem and Process in Human Development* as a central text, I shall
also utilize articles which he has written as well as his most recent book
titled *In over Our Heads: The Mental Demands of Modern Life*. Moreover,
to attain a better understanding of his theory, at times I have found it
necessary to extend Kegan's work and to refer to the work of other theorists
such as Robert Selman, Lawrence Kohlberg, Jean Piaget, Erik Erikson, and
Sigmund Freud.

My goals are:

1. to sketch the ethical models and levels of personality develop-
ment/ethical sophistication used by health care professionals, and

2. to show whether or not there is a correlation between levels of
ethical sophistication and differences of attitudes towards pedophilia and
pedophiles.

As I indicated in chapter three,¹ Kegan's theory concerns development
of ways of "knowing" and "being", "growth" and "change" in levels of
consciousness. Morality is inherent within this growth process and pertains
to development of the capacity to relate to others, to care, to enter into
increasingly complex social arrangements and to assume social
responsibilities. Kegan contends that anxiety, defense mechanisms,
psychological maladjustment and psychotherapy are all efforts to maintain
and to experience the transforming of the "self-system."² Therefore, I
shall (1) begin with Kegan's description of the earliest and least complex
way of being in the world and proceed through his succeeding constructs of

¹chap. 3:113-121

being; (2) analyze the empirical data in light of these ways of being; and
(3) extrapolate from Kegan's descriptions of ways of being to sketch how
Kegan's meaning-making systems might look and work with respect to adult
forms of morality and professionals' encounters with pedophiles in their
care.

4.1 The Incorporative Self

According to Kegan's theory, the newborn lives in an objectless world
in which everything sensed is perceived to be an extension of the infant.
The infant is completely embedded in its reflexes, sensing and moving.
During the first 6-9 to 21-24 months the infant gradually emerges from an
attachment to itself (what Kegan terms "normal" or "healthy autism"). It
begins to differentiate itself from another; and becomes able to hold an
object or image in memory. By so doing the infant "brings into being"
another and subject-object relations. When the primary caretaker is
finally experienced as separate, the first self-boundary becomes estab-
lished.

In Erikson's view, the infant's general approach to life is
"incorporative"--the infant "takes in" whatever feels good or yields
pleasure. Likewise, Piaget views the infant as operating for its own

---

3Laurence Thomas is critical of many theorists who in their accounts of
moral behaviour and human interaction fail to give signification to the
existence of children. He argues that the parental role is absolutely
pivotal for development of moral behaviour in the offspring: see Thomas,

4Kegan, Evolving Self, 123.

5Kegan, Noam, and Rogers, "Psychologic of Emotion," 109; Erikson,
Childhood and Society, 247.

6Kegan, Evolving Self, 78-79.

7Kegan, Noam, and Rogers, "Psychologic of Emotion, 110.

8Erikson, Identity: Youth and Crisis, 98-100.
pleasure. However, as Piaget and Kegan point out, the infant's emotional world is still unable to differentiate between inner and outer sources of pleasure and discomfort.

Freud considered the primary "mental functioning" of the newborn to be under the sway of the "pleasure-unpleasure principle." The dominance of the pleasure principle ends when the young child achieves psychical detachment from its parents at which time the "reality principle" supersedes the pleasure principle. Repression, however, can bring back the pleasure principle's dominance over thought processes which have become rational. Freud believed that education contributes to the developmental process which in turn stimulates conquest of the pleasure principle by the reality principle. He noted that the sexual instinct is delayed in its physical development and tarry's longer under the command of the pleasure principle, some people never being able to withdraw from it.

Kegan also equates the evolutionary process of knowing, meaning and being with the activity of hope. Erikson interrelates the dynamic determinants of certain basic human qualities or virtues such as trust, hope, and faith with segments of human development. Erikson describes trust as the cornerstone of a vital personality. He defines it as an essential attitude toward oneself and the world -- trustfulness of others and a basic sense of one's own trustworthiness. Trust relies for its

---

12Freud, "Formulations on Two Principles," 223-224.
13Kegan, Evolving Self, 45.
14Erikson, Insight and Responsibility, 113, 115.
beginnings on the newborn's earliest encounter with trustworthy maternal persons who respond to the newborn's need for food and contact with warm, sensitive, and calming envelopment.

In turn, trust is the source of faith and hope. Ascribing the rudiments of hope to the healthy infant, Erikson deems hope to be the earliest and most indispensable virtue inherent in being alive and in sustaining life.\textsuperscript{16} Hope is then verified by the period of growth in which the infant "grasps" an object, namely a first love-object (i.e., the mother) and the world. These two kinds of objects are the first knowledge of, and the basis of, hope. The gradual widening of the infant's horizon of active experience of other and wider segments of reality verifies and inspires new hopefulness.\textsuperscript{17}

Deprivation or abandonment during infancy can radically impair basic trust and leave a residue of basic mistrust which is manifested in adults by severe estrangement from others or withdrawal into oneself when one's world is shaken to the core or when one is at odds with oneself or with others. Lack of trust has implications for how one responds to the complexity of the world and other people as will be shown in what follows.\textsuperscript{18}

\textsuperscript{16}Erikson, \textit{Insight and Responsibility}, 115.

\textsuperscript{17}Erikson, \textit{Insight and Responsibility}, 116-117.

\textsuperscript{18}Erikson, \textit{Identity: Youth and Crisis}, 97.
Adult Infantile Morality?

Although it is difficult to imagine mental health care professionals not having emerged from the Incorporative Self, it is possible for adults to exercise elements of the Incorporative Self, to generate meanings and to operate morally out of this subject-object balance. Therefore, I shall extrapolate from the preceding description of infancy and illustrate adult infantile morality by hypothetical vignettes. In its most fundamental activity of meaning-constitutive evolution, early infancy is not qualitatively different from other moments in the lifespan. Infancy marks the beginning of this activity and in so doing initiates themes and different ways in which individuals make sense of reality and of others that can be glimpsed throughout the lifespan. Hence, it can be argued that before some adults can give birth to other human beings—what Kegan terms "object relations"—they must emerge from their embeddedness in their own sensing, moving and reflexes. From this it appears that Kegan says more about the infant's caretaking person (it's embeddedness culture), than about the infant. Kegan refers to adults who themselves went without sufficient "intrauterine" nourishment and were "so poorly held" that they are unable to provide even the primary function of a culture of embeddedness, namely, that of "hosting" or "holding." Such adults are unable to protect or nourish another in their care and leave the other starved and vitally impaired.

The research of Kelley as well as Nuttall and Jackson to which I referred in chapter two reveals that a significant number of professionals working in the field of child sexual abuse have themselves experienced child sexual abuse. In their study of the prevalence and effects of a personal history of childhood sexual abuse among professionals, Nuttall and Jackson

---


20 Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 122-123.

21 chap. 2:80
found that individuals with such a history were reluctant to commit to major relational responsibilities. Women with an abuse-history were less willing than their nonabused colleagues to raise children and to commit to the emotional and physical responsibilities demanded by child-rearing.\textsuperscript{22} From the perspective of Kegan's developmental-constructivist framework, to be able to recognize that one's personal history inclines or directs one requires a third level/order of consciousness.\textsuperscript{23} The capacity to be aware of and in control of one's personal issues and to not punish a client because of one's personal history demands the fourth order of consciousness.\textsuperscript{24} Third and fourth levels are quite a leap for someone who experienced sexual abuse as a child.

Furthermore, as Freud points out:

psychanalysis has taught us that the individual's emotional attitudes to other people, which are of such extreme importance to his later behaviour, are already established at an unexpectedly early age. The nature and quality of the human child's relations to people of his own and the opposite sex have already been laid down in the first six years of his life. He may afterwards develop and transform them in certain directions, but he can no longer get rid of them. The people to whom he is in this way fixed are his parents and his brothers and sisters. All those whom he gets to know later become substitute figures for these first objects of his feelings. . . . His later acquaintances are thus obliged to take over a kind of emotional heritage; they encounter sympathies and antipathies to the production of which they themselves have contributed little.\textsuperscript{25}

In a similar vein Gardner Murphy finds that attitudes first appear in the form of infantile postural responses of acceptance and rejection.\textsuperscript{26} The Lamberts contend that one's "most basic attitudes are learned in infancy through interaction" with one's parents. The infant develops favourable attitudes towards parents in relation to their comforting it and meeting its

\textsuperscript{22}Nuttall and Jackson, "Personal History of Childhood Abuse," 467.

\textsuperscript{23}Kegan, \textit{Over Our Heads}, 130.

\textsuperscript{24}Kegan, \textit{Over Our Heads}, 132-133.


needs. The observations of the Lamberts, Freud, and Murphy very much apply to the mental health professional who has been sexually abused as a child and who as an adult is working with pedophilic clients.

Moreover, in his analysis of four broad levels of moral conduct, Bull describes the lowest level of moral behaviour as being sanctioned or controlled simply by pleasure and pain. For example, a man at this level of moral maturity would drive a car solely for the purpose of gaining pleasure and avoiding injury to himself.

An historical example of this form of ethic can be found among the ancient Greeks who, recognizing the pleasure of sensuous enjoyments and delighting in the use of the body, prohibited few aspects of sexual activity. The problem for the Greeks, however, lay in their tendency to excess pleasure—the danger of exceeding what was necessary. The widespread emphasis upon the pleasures of sexuality may have increased the pressure for acceptance of a range of sexual practices currently viewed as deviant. The Greeks, however, were sufficiently sophisticated to know that it was a question of determining the correct use of pleasures and of learning to maintain control over the appetites, passions and pleasures. A person could behave ethically only by taking a combative stance toward the pleasures. Such was the principal preoccupation of the Greeks. Pursued

28Bull, Moral Education, 3.
30Foucault, Use of Pleasure, 49-53.
31Foucault, Use of Pleasure, 31.
32Hegel, History of Philosophy, 242. The famous episode of Socrates' resisting seduction by Alcibiades did not deny his desire for boys: it revealed his ability not to give in to them: see Foucault, Use of Pleasure, 66-69.
in the correct order, pleasures were on the way to the final stage of idealistic love—beauty itself.\textsuperscript{33}

A version of this ethical model was espoused in more recent times by Tom O’Carroll, a pedophile, and André Gide, a self-declared pederast who was sexually attracted to young male adolescents. In his interpretation of childhood sexuality and his rationale for adult/child sexual involvement, O’Carroll displays the tenacity with which individuals hold on to sources of pleasure by arguing that adult/child sexual relations can be pleasurable for and sought after by the child.\textsuperscript{34}

In explaining his theory of love, Gide argues that "in the sexual act . . . pleasure attains to orgasm. . . . pleasure is pursued for itself."\textsuperscript{35} For Gide, "commands" of the "sexual instinct" are based solely on the pleasure principle.\textsuperscript{36} He garners support for his theory from the literature of the ancient Greeks. Gide’s ethic subjects individuals to the satisfactions, disappointments and frustrations of their met or unmet needs and wishes which are under the dominance and power of the pleasure-unpleasure principle.

Different levels of pleasure exist. More directly to caregivers, as documented in chapter two,\textsuperscript{57} Barnard, Fuller, Robbins, and Shaw note that mental health professionals tend to dismiss the perpetrator of child sexual abuse as unpleant and unrewarding, hence punishable and isolable in order for society to create a culture free of impure contaminants. Moreover, Altemeyer’s research into the attitudes of introductory psychology students revealed that many derived personal pleasure or satisfaction from expressing

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{33} Plato, \textit{Symposium}, 211c.
\item \textsuperscript{34} O’Carroll, \textit{Paedophilia}, 29, 35, 44, 47-48, 53.
\item \textsuperscript{35} Gide, \textit{Corydon}, 35-36.
\item \textsuperscript{36} Gide, \textit{Corydon}, 92-95, 99.
\item \textsuperscript{37} chap. 2:63
\end{itemize}
a highly punitive attitude toward such criminals as child sex molesters.\textsuperscript{38} Such evidence suggests that at least some health care professionals function according to the whims of what feels pleasurable versus what feels unpleasant.

Likewise, from the empirical research regarding attitudes of caregivers, the study of Stermac and Segal\textsuperscript{39} which compares child molesters' beliefs and cognitions about adult/child sexual contact with those of groups of clinicians (psychologists, psychiatrists, nurses and social workers), laypersons, lawyers, and police officers, as I see it, further implies that the reasoning of at least some clinicians may be under the command of the pleasure-unpleasure principle. Study results indicate that child molesters perceived more benefits resulting from sexual contact. However, the study also reveals that some clinicians ascribe partial benefits and enjoyment on the part of the child, especially in the case of genital contact with ejaculation when the child smiled or was passive. Adult-child sexual contact is perceived by the clinicians as less beneficial when the child cried.\textsuperscript{40} Stermac and Segal argue that such ratings can be explained by semantic ambiguity in the word "benefit" and in differing theoretical positions regarding the child's enjoyment of adult sexual contact. Nevertheless, utilizing Kegan's theory, such findings are somewhat disturbing to me and suggest that at least some clinicians share the beliefs and attitudes of child molesters and appeal to the pleasure/unpleasure principle. Clearly, more research is called for by this study to clarify the cognitions and beliefs of clinicians regarding the enjoyment of and benefit to children of adult/child sexual contact.

\textsuperscript{38}Chap. 2:78

\textsuperscript{39}Stermac and Segal, "Adult Sexual Contact with Children" 573-584; Lana E. Stermac and Zindel V. Segal, "Clinicians' Cognitions about Sexual Contact with Children: A Reply to Murphy,"Behavior Therapy 22, no. 1 (Winter 1991): 125-127.

\textsuperscript{40}Stermac and Segal, "Adult Sexual Contact with Children," 580.
Unable to postpone sexual gratification, pedophiles are under the
domination of the pleasure principle. They long to overthrow the trouble-
some moral and legal constraints maintained by society and to live fully
according to the pleasure principle. If pedophiles and clinicians who treat
them are both at the mercy of a despotic oral-demandingness, it will be
difficult, if not impossible, to pursue any integrated treatment goals.

Turning again to Kegan's theory, one notes the emphasis he places on
his contention that the primary human motion of meaning-making is a social
activity--it requires another. Meaning depends upon another who sees and
recognizes the meaning-maker. Our survival and development, whether in
infancy, childhood, adolescence, or adulthood, depends upon our ability "to
recruit the invested attention of others to us."\(^1\) The diagnosis of
"failure to thrive" is employed for infants who are normal organically but
manifest severe malnutrition, poor physical and emotional development and
who sometimes die due to the mother's failure to recognize her infant's
dependent needs and her own self-doubts about her nurturing capability.\(^2\)
Newborns and little children are endowed with a "cuteness" that draws people
to them;\(^3\) however, as people grow older, their ability to recruit another's
attention and interest becomes more varied.

Indeed, I have asked my colleagues in psychiatric nursing to observe
for a while (and I have myself observed) to which patients they find
themselves paying attention and in what manner. All too often we note that
we interact more frequently with patients who are admitted with depression
or other illnesses such as Parkinson's Disease which have been judged more
socially acceptable as an illness. Patients tend to be judged as to their
right to command attention according to a hierarchy of psychiatric

\(^{1}\) Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 17; idem, "Hidden Treasure," 25.


diagnoses. Less time is spent with patients who are diagnosed as having a Personality Disorder and even less with the pedophilic client.

In her critique in the nursing literature of promotion of an ethic of care, Hilde L. Nelson advocates an ethic of loving attention, the task of which is to see without illusion. Once learned, she argues, "attention becomes a habit of being, a continuous work that builds up moral directions for our lives and so defines our values." Judith Andre believes that seeing is a learned skill, that vision is one aspect of moral development, and that "the professional with moral understanding sees the patient as a person." Kegan points out that a client who feels recognized will find the therapist's limit-setting tolerable, perhaps a relief. The client who does not feel recognized, will resent limit-setting as a violation of who he or she is."

As I mentioned in chapter two, therapists Reynolds-Mejia and Levitan find that therapists frequently function as if the sex abuser in their care did not exist and psychologically isolate such perpetrators. These therapists along with Gillies et al., whom I also cited in chapter two, report that some professional caregivers find child sex abusers revolting to the point of feeling physically ill. Cox documents the feeling on the part of pedophiles that they receive less than adequate treatment from therapists who consistently convey their preference not to work with pedophiles. The pedophiles feel unhelped because therapists do not feel moved to treat them. This begs the question: Is the pedophilic patient unable to recruit or is the caregiver unable to be recruited?


"Kegan, Evolving Self, 181.

"chap. 2:65

"chap. 2:65
In psychiatric settings where ward meetings, group therapy, socialization with other patients, and participation in ward activities are the primary modes of treatment, it is my experience that pedophilic patients frequently experience a great deal of anxiety and have a difficult time. They can be seen, in group meetings or on a one-to-one basis with staff, struggling unsuccessfully to talk about themselves and their problems in a way that will elicit understanding from others--co-patients and staff alike. As suggested by Kegan, the greatest longings of human life are (1) to be welcomed in and held and (2) to be distinct and autonomous. Yet, other patients may refuse to attend the same group meeting, whilst some staff are less than welcoming.

As Kegan points out: "People are moved . . . by heroic and vulnerable expressions of dignity and integrity."49 The capacity to see, pay attention and be moved is what Kegan terms the "hidden treasure." Few, it would seem, are able to see any qualities in the pedophilic patient. Professional responsibilities may have enriched the life experience of these caregivers; however, their ethical model corresponds in many ways to Kegan's description of the culture of the incorporative level of consciousness.

Should not health care professionals be different? The risk they run is that in seeing the pedophilic patient as a person--anxious, possibly depressed or suicidal,50 struggling to make sense of a sexual attraction to children--they will be moved by that person. Before health care professionals can treat this particular group of patients, they must recognize them. The growth and development, indeed, the lives of pedophilic patients, depend on caregivers running this risk.

---

49Kegan, "Hidden Treasure," 34.

Moreover, Erikson argues that without hope, no person can live nor ego remain intact;\textsuperscript{51} but hope can only be verified in trustworthy, contemporary surroundings—"in the intimate meeting of partners in favorable social settings."\textsuperscript{52} Virtues such as hope depend most on the interplay of living together in organized settings, for verification and continued development. Living together means that the individual's life-stages are "cogwheeling" with the stages of others, and thus each moves along the other while being moved along by the other.\textsuperscript{53} Such is the psychosocial phenomenon of the life-cycle of the developing self which professional caregivers require if they are going to be able to develop the ethical sophistication which I believe is necessary to care for anyone who offends their social standards.

4.2 The Impulsive Self

In Kegan's terminology, the young child of 2-5 years, like the older child of 5-7 years, has organized its reflexes but is embedded in its own impulses (i.e., perceptions of one's "insides") and idiosyncratic perceptions (i.e., coordination of reflexes, sensations and actions) and misconstrues real others as these. Prone to "magical thinking" and fantasy, the impulsive child cannot reflect upon its fantasies and has a labile construction of reality based upon its wishes and impulses.\textsuperscript{54} The child cannot simultaneously hold two impulses or two perceptions (i.e., unable to integrate hero and villain in an individual), a consequence of which is the inability to take the role of another person. Similarly, the child is incapable of ambivalence and cannot mediate two different or competing feelings about the same thing. In addition the preschooler is unable to recognize that other people have a point of view, feelings and a mind of

\textsuperscript{51}Erikson, \textit{Insight and Responsibility}, 118.

\textsuperscript{52}Erikson, \textit{Insight and Responsibility}, 116.

\textsuperscript{53}Erikson, \textit{Insight and Responsibility}, 114.

\textsuperscript{54}Kegan, \textit{Evolving Self}, 156.
their own. This inability to contemplate the meaning of another's acts, independently of the child's own viewpoint, restricts the nature of the child's moral meaning-making as well. At that age social-relating is egocentric and activities which involve accommodation to others command a short attention span. Life is filled with fantasy (i.e., bogeyman, monsters, nightmares, phobias etc.) upon which the child is incapable of reflection.

Interested in particular aspects of social development and behaviour, developmental psychologist Robert Selman assigned children of ages 3 to 6 to a 0 level of perspective-taking. He described these children as being unable to (1) clearly differentiate physical and psychological attributes of individuals, and (2) recognize that someone else may interpret the same situation differently. At this stage of social reasoning, the child views people, including itself, as either all good or all bad.

Because childhood inferences are made through images, fantasies, and symbols which do not sustain logical relations with one another, Piaget labelled this age period prelogical or preoperational. The child is unable to differentiate between how something appears and how something actually is—the immediate appearance of things is taken as the sole and ultimate reality. Unable to dissociate ego from the external world and having no need to accommodate to reality, the child blends fantasies with accepted opinions. The child distorts objects in its environment in accord

55Kegan, "Child behind the Mask," 51.
56Kegan, Over Our Heads, 29.
58Selman, Growth of Interpersonal Understanding, 37.
59Selman, Growth of Interpersonal Understanding, 96.
60Flavell, Developmental Psychology of Piaget, 166-167.
with desires or fantasy and is shut up in his own viewpoint. So long as the child is unable to dissociate its ego from suggestions coming from the external world, it yields to every suggestion, unable to free itself from the thought and will of others. Not conscious of its own ego and unable to situate it in relation to thought in general, the child is unable to cooperate. In the matter of personal decisions, the child maintains its own fantasy. Decisions about right and wrong are based on obedience and on what an outside authority judges right or wrong, and the child aligns its thinking to the material consequences of an act.

An older child, in Kegan's view, is capable of greater physical patience and perseverance. Increasingly oriented to "reality" and not merely appearances, the child is able to take an interest in things as they actually are and fantasizes about things that, in fact, could exist. Recurrence of nightmares and particular monsters at this age may reflect the beginning of conq'ring one's impulses only to have them suddenly become ungovernable or a function of specific, unruly, unacceptable feelings. Decisions of right and wrong are made on the basis of self-benefit and thinking is adjusted to the intentions which underlie the consequences. The child of this age is in business for itself.

According to Piaget, the cooperating stage commences towards the age of eight years. Cooperation is the source of personality. It is

---

62Piaget, Moral Judgment of the Child, 92-93, 165. See also: Erikson, Childhood and Society, 256.


64Piaget, Moral Judgment of the Child, 34.


66Kegan, Evolving Self, 148.

67Kegan, Evolving Self, 139; Piaget, Moral Judgment of the Child, 37, 40-41, 78-79.

cooperation (i.e., methods of intellectual or moral interchange) rather than obedience, which leads the child to a morality of reciprocity, thence of moral universality and altruism in relations with playmates.\textsuperscript{39}

In Piaget and Kohlberg's view, action for most children under the age of nine is motivated by obedience and avoidance of punishment\textsuperscript{71}--bad acts or people warrant bad events such as punishment.\textsuperscript{72} Thus, Kohlberg's Preconventional Stage 1 perspective is that of moral realism in that moral judgments are assumed to be self-evident, requiring recitation of rules and designation of labels, and necessitating minimal if any justification.\textsuperscript{73} Faced with a moral impasse, there is failure to differentiate multiple perspectives.

The sense of justice at this stage is retributive, that of an "eye for an eye and a tooth for a tooth."\textsuperscript{74} Punishment is simple revenge. The social order is maintained by the weak obeying the strong (i.e., the police) and the strong punishing those who deviate.\textsuperscript{75} A particular action is judged by those in authority to be wrong; bad actions are identified with punishment. Actions and persons are categorized into types without regard for psychological perspectives or individual needs.

In Piaget's schemata, morality at this stage is heteronomous. Morality consists of a system of rules defined by those in authority and begins with respect for these rules and for those who established them.\textsuperscript{76}

\textsuperscript{39}Piaget, Moral Judgment of the Child, 96.

\textsuperscript{70}Piaget, Moral Judgment of the Child, 71, 73, 107, 138.

\textsuperscript{71}Kohlberg, Philosophy of Moral Development, 121, 128; idem, Psychology of Moral Development, 173-174; Piaget, Moral Judgment of the Child, 166-171.

\textsuperscript{72}Kohlberg, Philosophy of Moral Development, 148.

\textsuperscript{73}Kohlberg, Psychology of Moral Development, 624.

\textsuperscript{74}Kohlberg, Philosophy of Moral Development, 143.

\textsuperscript{75}Kohlberg, Philosophy of Moral Development, 148.

\textsuperscript{76}Piaget, Moral Judgment of the Child, 13, 14.
Rules give rise to obedience and disobedience, judgments of guilt and innocence, and the structure of vengeance and punishment. Enmeshed in moral realism, children ascribe a strictly literal character to these external rules so that the letter rather than the spirit of the law must be obeyed.\textsuperscript{77} Naughtiness is comprised of that which is forbidden and is the object of punishment by adults. Activity is almost exclusively limited to fear of external punishment or social ostracism. Furthermore, the child develops complex and ambivalent attitudes towards its parents according to how it associates punishment as well as pleasure with the parents.\textsuperscript{78}

Younger children, Piaget discovered, favour expiatory punishment, in particular, a painful punishment to bring home the gravity of the misdeed and to prevent regression.\textsuperscript{79} Punishment is vindictive. However, this impulsive vengeance is not solely instinctive.\textsuperscript{80} The child's belief in punishment also emanates from persons who encourage or censure, approve or disapprove conduct even before the infant can speak.\textsuperscript{81} Older children, observed Piaget, turn more towards punishment by reciprocity and do to the transgressor what the transgressor has done. This, they believe, will help the offender to realize that the bond of solidarity has been broken and that things must be put right.\textsuperscript{82} Punishments by reciprocity can range from temporary or permanent banishment from the social group to paying for or replacing the broken or stolen object.

Interestingly, Selman found that young children at Level 0 do not appear to see punishment as conscious retribution but as a reactive physical

\textsuperscript{77}Piaget, \textit{Moral Judgment of the Child}, 110-111.

\textsuperscript{78}Lambert and Lambert, \textit{Social Psychology}, 61.


\textsuperscript{80}Piaget, \textit{Moral Judgment of the Child}, 229.


enforcement of parental wishes. Older children coded as Level 1 and between the age of 5 and 9 years viewed punishment as a teaching device for instructing children as to what is good or bad and what is permissible or not. Punishment is deemed an appropriate way in which to pay back the child for disobedience or transgression.

Adult Impulsive Morality?

The belief that punishment is just and necessary; the harsher it is, the more just, survives at all ages and is apparent in many adults. Related to this punitiveness is a narrow, rather than an understanding approach, to pedophiles. In this vindictive approach no room exists for a more complex explanation, no way of considering pedophilia as illness rather than solely criminal activity.

Social worker, Herschel Prins expressed the feeling of horror experienced by him and his colleagues toward clients who have committed serious sexual offences. He stated that professionals may choose not to listen to what these clients have to say. The developmental theorists' way of making sense of human interactions suggests that these mental health professionals have arrested at the first stage of moral development and therefore, are incapable of taking into account someone else's point of view, especially that of the pedophile.

Speaking from a biosocial approach to understanding the origins of personality, Murphy argues that those who remain at the level of moral realism will cling blindly to absolutist standards of right and wrong. They will tend to combine this attitude with their love of and literal obedience to rules and become self-righteous and moralistic. Whoever deviates from the standards inculcated on the basis of moral realism is

Solman, Growth of Intercpersonal Understanding, 123-125.

Murphy, Personality, 861-862. Kegan’s Impulsive Stage 1 parallels Erikson’s Stage of Initiative versus Guilt, see also: Erikson, Childhood and Society, 257.
worthy of scorn and moral condemnation. Such moral immaturity, according to Murphy, is a dominant feature of the authoritarian personality and is also evident in Altemeyer's description of right-wing authoritarianism.\textsuperscript{85} Authoritarians seek one another and find safety in one another's company, building up a formidable class system of their own. This suggests that characteristically, caregivers who are at Stage 1 of moral development assign pedophiles to a less valued category of persons. Most often in the form of what Erikson terms "persistent moralistic surveillance,"\textsuperscript{86} they will self-righteously defend their impulsive balance and adopt a pietist/puritanical outlook as did the epidemiologist, the young medical student, and the prison physician described in chapter two.\textsuperscript{87} Behind this self-righteousness lurks "the inner powerhouse of rage" which Erikson argues "must be submerged at this stage, as some of the fondest hopes and the wildest phantasies are repressed and inhibited."\textsuperscript{88} In a similar fashion, Allport sees self-righteousness as a form of aggression, resentment, hate, and envy, each of which constitutes a self-restorative mechanism to be employed when the individual's sense of integrity and self-direction are disrupted.\textsuperscript{89}

Furthermore, at this level correctional justice is based on strict reciprocity: pedophiles harm children so they should be harmed as well. Rules admit of no exceptions. Society views pedophilia as wrong; therefore, pedophiles should be punished. Most of the research presented in chapter two suggests that many mental health professionals take a largely legalistic, punitive approach towards pedophillic patients.

\textsuperscript{85}Altemeyer, Right-Wing Authoritarianism, 250-251.

\textsuperscript{86}Erikson, Childhood and Society, 257.

\textsuperscript{87}chap. 2:58,59,62

\textsuperscript{88}Erikson, Childhood and Society, 257.

The more serious the crime, the more severe should be the punishment. As I noted in chapter two, the investigation of the attitudes of professional groups carried out by Saunders as well as that of Kelley, Eisenberg, Owens, and Dewey reveal a direct correspondence between the professionals' perception of crime-severity and their punitive-orientation.9 Caregivers lack mediating concepts, such as that of illness or distorted cognitions, through which the particular circumstances of a situation alter its moral significance. Further, the label of "pervert," "sexual predator," and "degenerate" is affixed to the pedophile. Such labelling serves to transform the person who is a pedophile into a worthless object which readily can be cast aside without justification.

In their socio-psychological explanation of punitiveness and moral condemnation, Theodor Adorno et al. marshalled evidence of a constellation of attitudes of prejudice, ethnocentrism, and conservatism organized around deep-rooted psychological tendencies such as submissiveness, repression, projection, and displacement of impulses toward authority and moral out-groups.91

Like young children whose lives are filled with fantasy, Stage 1 caregivers are unable to differentiate between how something appears to them and how something actually is. They attach the 'monster' image to this group of people upon whom they can visit the emotions (i.e., terror) raised in childhood by the fantasy. Thus, the immediate image of the pedophile as a 'monster' is taken as the sole and ultimate reality. It is this reified image or idiosyncratic perception that the caregiver consults. In making decisions, such professionals are unable to experience pedophiles as persons; and they regard pedophiles as distinctly different from themselves.

9Chap. 2: 68, 76

Allport shows that young children develop sweeping generalizations and frequently devaluing beliefs about groups of people. Adults do as well. Irving Sarnoff finds that attitudes tend to be embedded in a set of cognitions, articulated ideas and perceptions about, and tension-reducing responses toward the attitudinal objects. Albert Bandura, a social cognitive theorist, notes that many emotional propensities are learned not only from direct experience but also through observation of how other people respond fearfully toward threatening objects. Likewise, evaluating reactions towards persons frequently originate from exposure to modeled attitudes and emotional displays communicated by vocal, facial, and postural cues. Comments that arouse feelings of revulsion can create new fears, hatreds, and self-protective behaviours, while comments conjuring up positive reactions can foster likes and attractions. Events befall us daily; it's overwhelming to handle each occurrence in its own right. We strive to resolve problems easily. In the case of pedophiles, for example, it takes far less effort for caregivers to lump them rapidly into faulty or overgeneralized beliefs than to learn the real reasons for their behaviour. If the beliefs are negative and composed of disvaluing attitudes, caregivers simply and totally avoid pedophiles. Once established, protective avoidance prevents people from seeking accurate information and from learning that what they perceive to be threatening may not be. Moreover, as Staub points out, negative evaluation of persons makes harming them easier.

---

*Allport, Nature of Prejudice, 53.


*Bandura, Social Foundations of Thought and Action, 185-187, 189-190.

*Allport, Nature of Prejudice, 19-21.

Further, as I mentioned in chapter two, Gomes-Schwartz and Horowitz found that agencies and professional groups involved in child sexual abuse cases distrust one another and have little experience cooperating with each other. Kohlberg and his colleagues found that cultures have a specific moral stage orientation which is highly correlated with their degree of evolutionary advancement. Likewise, one can argue that the various professions constitute their own cultures and undergo moral stage evolutions.

Narrowly focused on their own field rather than the "big picture" and incapable of cooperating with one another, the different disciplines need to be called to grow up, to become less egocentric, and to enter into cooperative relationships with other professional cultures. Given the complexity of the issue of pedophilia, to fail to cooperate is to remain with a fragmentary and reductionist form of approach rather than to attain a conception of the whole.

4.3 The Imperial Self

The years following the age of seven and into the early teens comprise the Imperial Stage in Kegan's terminology. Although the child has gained self-sufficiency, independence and autonomy, increasingly it becomes interested in and identified with the family, groups, and class to which it belongs. The child develops a self-concept, a more enduring disposition and takes on the role of the child in relation to parents. Embedded in the child's needs, its emotional life reflects this underlying psychologic. The other is viewed instrumentally as a potential gratifier or frustrator--a

---

7chap. 2:76

8Kohlberg, Philosophy of Moral Development, 234-239.

9Kegan, Evolving Self, 89, 115, 161-162.

means to an end.\textsuperscript{101} Decisions are made based on one's perceived needs. Attitudes toward others are formed through association and needs satisfaction.\textsuperscript{102}

The hallmark of this stage is control—the Stage 2 individual must control, or at least predict, the behaviour of other people. That those who are the object of the imperial meaning-making logic feel controlled and manipulated is a corollary of the Imperial Self experiencing a threat of loss of control and attempting to free itself from the threat.\textsuperscript{103}

At this level the child has learned that egocentric behaviour is little tolerated and that other people have needs, interests, and wishes too. However, the child is unable to integrate into its own feeling or meaning-making\textsuperscript{104} how another person will feel. It is now able to take the role of another.\textsuperscript{105} Nevertheless, if one is still caught up in one's own needs, it will be impossible to fully understand the needs of the other. How one behaves at this stage is a matter of how external others will react.

At a minimal level, this order of consciousness marks the debut of the child's capacity to assume the function of culturing.\textsuperscript{106} Quick to ostracize a peer, the child's capacity to hold is unreliable and inconsistent. The second function of the culture of embeddedness (i.e., parents, institutions such as the school, peer group) continually needs to demand that the imperial child take into account the feelings, interests and expectations of others in order to move the child into the next stage, that of Interpersonalism.

\textsuperscript{101} Kegan, \textit{Evolving Self}, 100; Virginia Kelley, "Ego Development in Men and Women", 24.
\textsuperscript{102} Lambert and Lambert, \textit{Social Psychology}, 61; Murphy, \textit{Personality}, 281.
\textsuperscript{103} Kegan, \textit{Evolving Self}, 90-91; idem, "Child behind the Mask," 53.
\textsuperscript{104} Kegan, "Child behind the Mask," 53.
\textsuperscript{105} Kegan, \textit{Evolving Self}, 163.
\textsuperscript{106} Kegan, \textit{Evolving Self}, 166-168.
Kegan's Imperial Stage parallels Kohlberg's Individualistic, Stage 2 Instrumental Morality in which moral actions and decisions are determined by meeting one's own needs and interests, which to be met may also satisfy those of others. At Kohlberg's instrumental egoistic Stage 2, the person is prone to abuses of power. What is right is what is fair or what is an equal exchange;¹⁰⁷ people engage in mutual backscratching: "You scratch my back, and I'll scratch yours." Justice is not dictated by arrangement, but is a matter of concrete physical exchange of goods, needs, and actions--a life for a life.¹⁰⁸ Punishment is sought in order to prevent repetition of the crime.

Adult Imperial Morality?

Kegan found that negotiation of the imperial evolutionary balance can be problematic for patients on psychiatric wards and for inmates in prison or correctional institutions.¹⁰⁹ Subject to a mechanistic order that imposes a tyranny of needs and desires upon them, these individuals view others almost exclusively in terms of either facilitating or thwarting their own interests and goals. Kegan is highly critical of the behaviour modification programs commonly employed in such facilities for inviting and confirming rather than contradicting the imperial balance.¹¹⁰ In his view, which I share, the emphasis is on merely "shaping the superficial behaviors of good citizenship without any self-conscious attention to the organization of the person giving rise to these behaviors."¹¹¹

Appraised from a constructive-developmental perspective, behaviour modification treatment adds up to "a kind of polyester version of an

¹⁰⁷Kohlberg, Philosophy of Moral Development, 409.
¹⁰⁸Kohlberg, Philosophy of Moral Development, 260.
¹⁰⁹Kegan, Evolving Self, 171-173.
¹¹⁰Kegan, Evolving Self, 174-176.
¹¹¹Kegan, Over Our Heads, 45.
imperial culture of embeddedness." Enmeshed in the imperial balance, behaviour modification lacks the capacity to nurture the movement of the individual it cultures. Instead it reinforces behaviours which will lead to certain payoffs in the form of tokens, privileges, freedoms or responsibilities. It is utterly incapable of fostering the emerging capacities for internalized mutuality essential to the interpersonal level of evolution. If the individuals being treated through behaviour modification should happen to be beginning to emerge from the imperial balance, the behaviour modification setting will merely disconfirm their bids for growth. These treatments ensure that the individual will emerge from the program with no understanding of his behaviour but able to thrive on an underlying psychologic of "every man for himself."

Moreover, some behavioural treatment methods utilized in programs aimed at reducing deviant pedosexual behaviour involve "delivery of punishment" by such means as painful electric shocks. The aversive aspect of punishment is central to the behavioural treatment. It seems to me that there is something intrinsically contradictory about a particular technique being both treatment and punishment. When punishment is applied as part of an aversive treatment modality, it amounts to punishment in order to prevent repetition of the criminal behaviour, hence Stage 2's conception of justice.

Caregivers who are embedded in their own needs, interests and wishes project onto others this embeddedness. They will construct patients in terms of whether or not they meet the needs of the caregivers. Because caregivers who remain in this Imperial Stage cannot consider the other and the self simultaneously, they will proceed to anticipate their patient's actions and then adjust their own behaviour in accordance with the hoped for outcome. This will be experienced by others, including their patients, as controlling and manipulative. These caregivers will feel threatened by

---

112 Kegan, _Evolving Self_, 175.

pedophilic behaviour, be unable to understand how the pedophilic client is feeling or experiencing confinement, limit-setting, and treatment. If the pedophile in this setting does not feel understood, he will find the situation intolerable and resent it.

In Kohlberg’s schemata, at this level of moral development, deviation from norms is limited. Regarding pedophilia, a Stage 2 response would be as follows: "The judge should punish the pedophile, because otherwise others may try to get away with sexually abusing children." The perspective is that of criminal, victim, and others. However, Stage 2 is limited in that it fails to provide a means of resolving or prioritizing conflicting claims of various persons involved in a situation.\textsuperscript{114}

From their functional approach to the study of attitudes, Sarnoff and Daniel Katz assumed that attitudes serve particular needs.\textsuperscript{115} For example, prejudiced attitudes can meet an individual’s need to gain acceptance in one’s own group, to release unconscious hatred, to give structure to one’s external world, to protect oneself from acknowledging basic truths about oneself or the harsh realities of the world.

Further, the imperial level of consciousness marks the initial development of a self-concept. According to Kegan, throughout the lifespan we engage in a process of qualitatively differentiating ourselves from others and the world, of recognizing that people differ from ourselves, from one another and in the way in which they make sense of other people. Kegan emphasizes that among these differences none may be so important as the degree to which we distinguish another person from ourselves.\textsuperscript{116} The Sheriffs view formation of attitudes as "integral to the process of forming

\textsuperscript{114}Kohlberg, \textit{Psychology of Moral Development}, 626.


\textsuperscript{116}Kegan, \textit{Evolving Self}, 77.
a self-concept. Allport finds that most people have a strong need for personal status, that is, to be recognized as secure and successful and to have one's virtues acknowledged. For those who crave status, Stage 2 offers the formula of "class." As Elisha Babad et al. note: "having 'high status' implies that some others must have lower status." Out of a need to determine and to defend a particular self-image, to enhance their self-esteem or exploit their class identity and superiority, adults still in this stage will define recognizable "out-groups" and assign pedophiles to a lower class of people. To avoid admitting to themselves that they have deep feelings of inferiority and to round out their sense of superiority, they will construct negative, overgeneralized attitudes and project all sorts of defects onto members of the lower classes. These social attitudes, Allport, Babad et al. define as prejudice. Those minorities which attract strong hostilities, Allport terms "scapegoats." These psychological processes will serve as a major guide in their way of life, as justification of the hostility toward other groups and of the practice of discrimination.

Most will be unable to recognize their prejudices and will deny that they are prejudiced. Denial keeps unwelcome issues repressed. Moreover, in Allport's view: "To admit prejudice is to accuse oneself of being both irrational and unethical." No one wants to be at odds with the image one has created of oneself. From the viewpoint of Babad et al., scapegoating

---

121Babad, Birnbaum, and Benne, Social Self, 91.
122Allport, Nature of Prejudice, 236.
123Allport, Nature of Prejudice, 317.
generally emerges when groups are unable to cope effectively with their problems and when a distinct target for scapegoating is available. The object of the scapegoating is projected as the source of a particular problem and blamed for it. Scapegoating allows the group to feel cleansed and righteous and enables it to preserve its advantageous position effectively.\textsuperscript{124}

In a clinical setting, working out of a utilitarian attempt to attain recognition, the imperial caregiver will likely use the pedophilic group of patients for his own purposes or instrumental self-benefit, namely, as self-aggrandizement, financial gain or other rewards. Pedophiles in such care merely constitute a ready-made group of experimental subjects for drug or therapy trials or as a source for obtaining more psychological and/or biological data. Given the perks and benefits of drug testing and the flood of publishing on the subject of child sexual abuse and pedophilia in particular, it seems to me, that many health care professionals could be motivated by these considerations. That many practitioners in the field of child sexual abuse do work out of these needs was certainly the claim of Mayer as I noted in chapter two.\textsuperscript{125} In general, with respect to the instrumental or utilitarian function of attitudes, favourable attitudes will be cultivated toward objects which are associated with the satisfaction of the individual's needs while unfavourable attitudes will be built toward objects which thwart that individual. Alternatively, the caregiver may argue for punishment for pedophiles based on what he perceives will give the greatest pleasure to the greatest number of persons.

Similarly, in accord with the ego-defensive function a caregiver may obliterate the reality of pedophilia by avoiding the pedophile in her care. Such was the case of the student nurse which I mentioned in chapter two.\textsuperscript{126}

\textsuperscript{124}Babad, Birnbaum, and Benne, \textit{Social Self}, 103.

\textsuperscript{125}chap. 2:67

\textsuperscript{126}chap. 2:58
She avoided her pedophilic patient throughout an entire shift devoting her time instead to a patient who was depressed. Through the ego-defensive mechanism of complete avoidance she was able to reduce her anxieties created by such problems as pedophilia; to avoid facing the inner reality of the kind of person she is; and to obliterate through withdrawal the reality of pedophilia which confronted her.

4.4 The Interpersonal Self

During the teen years, the adolescent begins to emerge from embeddedness in needs into an interpersonal order of consciousness. This habit of mind establishes the individual as a citizen, a participating member of a community.\textsuperscript{127} The adolescent is capable of constructing values and ideals as well as of orienting to the well-being of a human relationship.\textsuperscript{128} Nevertheless, the person, though capable of socialization, is subject to socialization, vulnerable to romanticizing "the community" and incapable of critically reflecting on that into which the person is being socialized. In developmental-constructivist terms, society is now a part of the individual. A person of the third order of mind internalizes and identifies with the values and beliefs of her social "surround" as these are imparted by family, peers, religion, demographic regions, or social position.\textsuperscript{129} The third order of consciousness is the traditionalist mind that is uncritically and unknowingly faithful to external sources of ideas, namely, the family rules, values, religion, beliefs, myths, ideals, prejudices, fears and demons.\textsuperscript{130}

As yet having no self to share with another, the young person is incapable of intimacy. Lacking self-esteem, the Stage 3 person is very

\textsuperscript{127}Kegan, \textit{Over Our Heads}, 126, 288-289.

\textsuperscript{128}Kegan, \textit{Over Our Heads}, 77.

\textsuperscript{129}Kegan, \textit{Over Our Heads}, 76.

\textsuperscript{130}Kegan, \textit{Over Our Heads}, 104-105, 110, 267.
pliable; finds it difficult to own and to express anger due to fear of disrupting a relationship; 132 needs to learn genuine assertiveness; and wants to be liked by other people. Altruism is ultimate: an "other" is always implicated in the emotion or action. The essential question is: Do you still like me? 131 The person requires confirmation by the other's expectations, satisfactions, influences, approval, and affection in order to feel complete. 132 Meaning stems from how one is seen by others. Unable to establish one's own authority within oneself, one seeks to fuse with the authority of another. 134 The self resides within the interpersonal relationship and conflicts are located externally between oneself and the other. Oriented to nurturance and affiliation, the interpersonal individual is now capable of mutuality, reciprocal obligation, empathy, and of internally coordinating different points of view and needs-perspectives. 135

While arguing that individual situations should be taken into account, the Stage 3 person still defends the integrity of social laws. 136 Clearly, this individual is caught between two ways of meaning-making. From Kohlberg's perspective, at this stage of Interpersonal Concordance Morality, the person operates out of a conventional way of thinking. What is right is determined by the expectations of those close to the individual or by what people generally expect of persons in a particular role. The content of attitudes is ascertained by the individual's structure of reasoning and by the values, norms and roles of her culture. 137 Justice is a matter of

131 Kegan, Noam, and Rogers, "Psychologic of Emotion" 113.

132 Kegan, Evolving Self, 96-97.

133 Kegan, Evolving Self, 100, 192, 197, 201.

134 Kegan, Evolving Self, 202.

135 Kegan, Evolving Self, 95, 99, 211; idem, Over Our Heads, 258.

136 Kegan, Evolving Self, 194-195.

137 Kohlberg, Philosophy of Moral Development, 272-273. For a discussion of the role of values in attitude formation see: Babad, Birnbaum, and Benne, Social Self, 40-234.
golden-rule-balancing of perspectives, of doing unto others what one would have done by others.\textsuperscript{138} Reciprocity goes beyond Stage 2 concrete notions of equal exchange in that it is subject to negation or affirmation in relation to social expectations or conventional standards. Laws are necessary and represent a desire to limit any deviation which would constitute a threat to the social order. All points of view are taken into account and exceptions can be made in light of extenuating circumstances.\textsuperscript{139} Punishment is aimed at rehabilitation rather than prevention of recidivism. An ongoing vendetta is viewed as a threat to society and condemned.\textsuperscript{140}

Interpersonal Adult Morality?

From studies whose samples represent a range of socioeconomic classes, Kegan found that one-half to two-thirds of the adult American population is engaging in meaning-making less complex than the fourth order of consciousness.\textsuperscript{141} In separate studies of nearly five hundred professionals, one group of whom were nurses, Kegan discovered that the most frequent (58\%) consciousness stance was commensurate with one between the third and fourth order.\textsuperscript{142}

Therefore, let us consider the empirical data on attitudes from a third-order constructive-developmental perspective. Subject to internalizing the myths of one's life "surround," the interpersonal caregiver will be caught up in such societally shared constructions as the myth that only men sexually abuse children. This passionate assumption will be taken as true, the caregiver being unaware that such a "truth" is not the truth, but


\textsuperscript{139}Kohlberg, \textit{Philosophy of Moral Development}, 258.

\textsuperscript{140}Kohlberg, \textit{Philosophy of Moral Development}, 267.

\textsuperscript{141}Kegan, \textit{Over Our Heads}, 191, 196.

\textsuperscript{142}Kegan, \textit{Over Our Heads}, 196-197.
a truth among many.\footnote{Kegan, Over Our Heads, 86.} Unable to question or to weigh the validity of these "stories," to see critically through to the truncated or assumptive aspect of these myths, this individual is unconsciously subject to a dogma. Moreover, ever striving to gain others' approval, the Interpersonal Self runs the risk of ignoring and sacrificing integrity for the sake of popularity. What the professional at this order lacks is the ability to be assertive and to claim her own space.

Furthermore, as I noted in chapter one,\footnote{chap. 1:37} Freud, Karpman and Havelock Ellis observed that manifestations of sexual perversions such as pedophilia were seldom lacking in the so-called 'normal' individual. Infants and young children can elicit a strong emotional response from adults. There is a desire to pick them up, hold and cuddle them. As therapist Shirley Luthman notes, it is not uncommon for fathers to experience sexual feelings towards even a very young daughter.\footnote{Shirley Gehrke Luthman, Intimacy: The Essence of Male and Female (Los Angeles: Nash, 1972), 28-29.} Why? Luthman explains that it is difficult for one to separate human warmth and tenderness from one's sexuality. Imagine the significance of such an experience for a professional who is embedded in the interpersonal level of consciousness. "Here I have been living a life worthy of the approval and affection of others. I have also been what they expect me to be, hence, they think well of me. Suddenly, I now become aware of something within me which will render me unacceptable and dissatisfying to all these other people. What will others think?" This dark part of the individual is seen as an alien--an enemy. His or her life becomes chaos.

With the proper support from one's culture of embeddedness, this kind of experience of vulnerability can become one of growth. If the individual's environment can confirm (1) that these feelings are normal; (2)
that they reveal sensitivity and connectedness between one's sexuality and the capacity to feel warmth and tenderness; and (3) that one can take charge of and be responsible for one's own feelings and behaviour, then this caregiver will likely be better equipped to help the patient to come to terms with the reality of a pedophilic sexual expression. The caregiver will be sensitized to the angst of the pedophilic client and will be able to empathize when the pedophile discloses: "When I see a young boy I get aroused. I can't stop these sexual desires." The caregiver will be able to drop back to recognize that part of the problem is lack of control but this can be helped through treatment.

On the other hand, how devastating for the professional can be the impact of a lack of the support necessary for a person to grow. Fear of one's own pedophilic responses can be alleviated by condemning those of others, particularly out-groups such as pedophiles. Repression of one's own private sexual stirrings towards children makes one violent in one's spurning of pedophiles and more strongly committed to one's prejudicial attitudes. From Katz' and Sarnoff's perspective, the individual avoids facing this inner reality via the ego-defensive function of these attitudes.146 Thus, the caregiver is saved from complete disaster by projecting feelings of sexual arousal and associated guilt feelings onto some available minority. Through attitudes of superiority, denunciation of that minority, and proclamation of one's own goodness, purity, and concern for society's welfare, one's self-image can be restored. Altemeyer147 finds that his psychology students view child sex molesters as low status, relatively worthless criminals. He also observes that expression of aggression toward molesters was a source of personal satisfaction for the students. Thus, this research reveals a correlation for caregivers between embeddedness in


147chap. 2:72
the culture of tradition and psychosocial surround as reflected in interpersonal criteria for Kegan’s cognitive-developmental framework on the one hand, and criminal views of pedophilia with punitive, condemning attitudes on the other. Caregivers will simply turn to Western society’s tradition of punishing child sex abusers and ask: Why change?

As mentioned by Barnard, Fuller, Robbins, and Shaw and as noted in chapter two, it is apparent that therapists, generally, are unable to empathize with child sex abusers. In my survey of the literature concerning attitudes of professional caregivers, of the few clinicians able to show empathy, Fred Berlin stands out as exceptional. Berlin is able to hear and to enter into the tortured and conflicted feelings of the pedophile whose following testimony Berlin cites in several publications:

What starts a person like myself doing what I do? Why me? Why can’t I be normal like everybody else? You know, did God put this as a punishment or something towards me? I am ashamed. Why can’t I just go out and have a good time with girls? I feel empty when a female is present. An older ‘gay’ person would turn me off. I have thought about suicide. I think after this long period of time, I have actually seen where I have an illness. It is getting uncontrolable to the point where I can’t put up with it anymore. It is a sickness. I know it’s a sickness. But as far as society is concerned you are a criminal and should be punished. Even if I go to jail for twelve or fifteen years, or whatever, I am still going to be the same when I get out.

When a client speaks about how he constructs the world, what the practitioner actually hears will depend upon whether or not the caregiver can make personal sense of what the client is actually saying. This is why Kegan maintains that the filters, lenses and senses which we use in listening need regular inspection. The filters, etc. represent both a constraint and a mastery.

148chap. 2:52

149Berlin and Krout, “Diagnostic Concepts, Treatment, and Ethical Considerations,” 15; Berlin, “Biomedical Perspective and Biomedical Treatment,” 85. See also Feierman, “Biocultural Overview,” 58; Cox, “Caregiver’s Dilemma,” 79-84.

150Kegan, Evolving Self, 3.
Moreover, inability to experience empathy is common among pedophiles. Gillies et al. at Toronto's Clarke Institute of Psychiatry, believe that eliciting empathy for the victim is the key to genuine psychological change in pedophiles.\footnote{Gillies, Hashmali, Hilton, and Webster, "Relapse Prevention in Pedophiles," 203.} As noted in chapter one,\footnote{Chap. 1:42} group work to encourage empathy toward the victim is a significant part of many, if not most, relapse prevention programs. Group sessions involve sharing personal accounts of victimization and detailed disclosure of pedophilic acts. Such disclosure requires a marked degree of empathy among staff facilitators. If as a result of a lack of empathy on the part of caregivers, participants do not feel fully understood they will be unable to become engaged with the group process and will fail to take the perspective of others, especially that of their victims.

Empathy, however, can be biased. Developmental psychologist Martin Hoffman defines empathy "not as an exact match of another's feelings, but as an affective response that is more appropriate to the other's situation than to one's own."\footnote{Martin L. Hoffman, "The Contribution of Empathy to Justice and Moral Judgment," in Empathy and Its Development, ed. Nancy Eisenberg and Janet Strayer (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987; Paperback, 1990), 53.} He presents empathy as a significant motive base for moral, prosocial activism.\footnote{Martin L. Hoffman, "Empathy and Prosocial Activism," in Social and Moral Values: Individual and Societal Perspectives, ed. Nancy Eisenberg, Janusz Reykowski, and Ervin Staub (Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 1989), 65-85. Some authors point out that a moral aspect of empathy has not been clearly delineated as a separate component of the concept of empathy. They call for a critical analysis of empathy and question its appropriateness for nursing in such settings as acute care: see Morse et al., "Exploring Empathy," 273-280.} He further argues that empathy contributes to an individual being receptive to moral reasoning and to such ethical principles as those of caring and distributive justice.\footnote{Hoffman, "Contribution of Empathy," 60, 64, 66, 71.} Hoffman notes that one can be more empathic to victims who are known and like oneself than
to victims who are unknown or dissimilar. Biases lead to questions about situations involving conflicting moral claims. Both in his writings and in interviews Berlin serves as an example of one who has recognized and transcended such bias. He openly calls for empathy and articulates well the situation of meeting diverse and often conflicting needs as follows:

Surely the needs of those who are victims must also be met. But how does punishing an 'offender' help his victim? Restitution might make more sense. And, is punishment in such cases invariably just? ... When such men seek help, understanding, empathy and professional competence is required—not stigmatization or unenlightened scorn. Kegan judges empathy to be crucial at every phase in the lifespan because it is intrinsic to the process by which client and therapist develop.

Similarly, a Stage 3 level of consciousness and openness to minimizing punishment in extenuating circumstances is evident in the story of Bill Bradley, a pedophile, with which I introduced the subject matter of chapter two. In her sentencing of Bradley, the judge took into account both Bradley's state of failing health and the fact that he had not sexually abused any children for ten years. By contrast, the journalist who took a retributive position in her newspaper article about this case exemplified a lower, preconventional way of thinking and an inability to embrace such moral principles as equality which underlie our criminal justice system.

---


158 Kegan, Evolving Self, viii.

159 chap. 2:59
4.5 The Institutional Self

As the institutional balance emerges during late adolescence or early adulthood, conflicts become internalized.\textsuperscript{160} However, while emotional conflict is recognized, it is not tolerable. By authoring a self, the person achieves an identity; the notion of psychological independence and self-sufficiency becomes ultimate. This call to self-authorship and autonomy is what Kegan terms the claim of modernity.\textsuperscript{161} The self's defense mechanisms are aroused by threats to the experience of autonomy such as fears of closeness, of boundary loss or of losing one's control.\textsuperscript{162} Feelings are more controlled internally, relationships are regulated. The person is involved in the personal control of value-directed behaviour in the world: "It's what I want that not only makes me, but makes me distinct!" The individual experiences guilt and self-anger by violating his own standards, irrespective of another's expectations. Like other balances, the Institutional Self is limited. Embedded in autonomy\textsuperscript{163} and self-nourishment, the institutional balance brings into being the self as a system, however, the individual experiences a sense of loneliness and dissatisfaction—something is missing!\textsuperscript{164} People who are in contact with individuals in this stage feel that the real person is being withheld from them, that they are being filtered through some system rather than being in direct contact with the person.\textsuperscript{165} The Stage 4 self is consumed by the exercises of achievement and independent accomplishment; the self is a work role, a


\textsuperscript{161}Kegan, \textit{Over Our Heads}, 105, 236.

\textsuperscript{162}Kegan, \textit{Evolving Self}, 223.

\textsuperscript{163}Kegan, \textit{Evolving Self}, 222.

\textsuperscript{164}Kegan, \textit{Evolving Self}, 223, 225, 240.

\textsuperscript{165}Kegan, \textit{Evolving Self}, 242.
career, performances, and duties. The threat of failure looms overhead and negative performance reports give rise to humiliation and irritability.

The fourth order capacity to subordinate, regulate and create values and ideals is evident in the mental making of ideology which is understood by Kegan as "a system of explanation amounting to a theory of relationships."

Ideological participation—a truth for a group or class—is essential to the institutional balance, embedded as it is in the ideology of the culture. The calisthenics of ideology render the self an institution or organization. They provide a political discourse; a qualitative reconstruction of the self and the world; a system of explanation which undergirds interpersonal relations; a feeling of control over the present; a program for the future; and demarcation lines between groups (forms) of which one is a member and groups of which one is not a member.

Perhaps a function of the ideological balance, the emphasis at this stage is on the careful polarization of one's professional and personal life. The Stage 4 individual draws sharp distinctions between objects, variables and pairs of opposites such as good and bad. Ultimate loyalty is to the institution as it is. The world of work is ideally suited to culturing and encouraging the institutional balance.

A person of the fourth order of mind structures a situation in terms of formal rights and laws, both religious and civil. Protection against anarchy is paramount! It is in the very process of striving to succeed in a career that we exploit and even sanction killing others such as pedophiles in order to obtain our goals. We justify our actions by turning pedophiles

---

166 Kegan, Over Our Heads, 91, 173.


168 Kegan, Evolving Self, 243, 245-249.

169 Kegan, Evolving Self, 234, 237.
into inferior, unworthy heathens who can easily be discarded without great concern. Kegan's institutional balance with its reliance on the group, standards and convention is analogous to Piaget's formal operational system and Kohlberg's conventionality.

According to Kohlberg, for example, the Stage 4 individual takes the perspective of a member of society and moral judgments are made with respect to a societywide, legal order or institutionalized, religious laws, beliefs and practices. The Stage 4 person emphasizes that society must consider some rights inviolable. Paradoxically, Babad et al., who have been involved in human relations training, find that granting special rights to previously discriminated minorities actually intensifies prejudice and preexisting tensions within society. In my experience, pedophilia presents a clear example of this phenomenon. Pointing out to people that pedophiles also have rights within our constitution merely provokes aggressive prejudice and the retort: "Their rights should be taken away!"

Typically in our society, disputes are turned over to the courts. An offender is not regarded as being outside society and punishment, generally in the form of a fine or incarceration, is specified by the law. The aim is to (a) convey society's outrage at the crime; (b) protect society by deterrence and removal of the threat to society; and (c) oblige the offender to pay a debt to society. Exceptions are subordinated to societal considerations such as law enforcement, protection, smooth functioning of society, and maintenance of law and order. However, a legal approach is so absorbed in the battle of rights and the notion of winning or losing, that it rapidly loses sight of the persons involved. Interestingly, in his


cross-cultural studies Kohlberg found that the underlying structure of a society's legal, religious, and ethical systems could be analyzed in moral stage terms. He noted that a greater degree of evolutionary advancement corresponded to a higher institutional moral stage.\footnote{173}

Adult Institutional Morality?

As I noted in chapter two,\footnote{174} Vafakas' study of the ethical orientation of community college counselors in a large Midwestern American state reveals that counselors function out of an institutional or societal orientation in their dealings with their clients. In the societal orientation, counselors are concerned with societal laws, duty and societal welfare, not the individual. Vafakas also finds that the greater the years of counseling experience and the older the counselor, the greater the tendency of counselors to reflect a punishment and institutional orientation.

In the United States Finkelhor observes an increase in lobbying for harsher penalties for child abusers. Altemeyer's Winnipeg survey of nonstudent adult males and parents of university students shows they advocated longer jail terms and capital punishment for child sex molesters. Altemeyer's survey of psychology students reveals a reflection of society: sentiments of conventionalism and highly punitive attitudes toward child sex molesters. Similarly, Greenland observes that professionals readily absorb the prevailing ethos and values of penal institutions. This research supports Altemeyer's argument that such attitudes are learned through the process of socialization. It also indicates that a correlation exists for caregivers between embeddedness in the culture of institutions and their criminal views and punitive attitudes toward pedophiles.

\footnote{173}{Kohlberg, Philosophy of Moral Development, 234-237.}

\footnote{174}{chap. 2:71}
The Stage 4 caregiver is not, Kegan cautions, a "cowardly conformist". The caregiver is not so much controlled by what others might think as she "is the others who are thinking"-a difficult situation when it comes to understanding the nature of pedophilia and the nature of sexual attraction to children. Societally embedded caregivers are the society. They bring the full force of society to bear on their patients. Those who fall outside the caregiver's ideological or social group are written out of the human race.

Moreover, the writing of Berliner and Barbieri as well as Saunders' study reflect a merger of two social systems—the criminal justice system and the social service system. The former perceives child sexual abuse to be a crime warranting a legalistic response, while the latter views it within a family context, meriting a therapeutic response. Saunders finds that social workers view child sexual abuse as a serious crime and that punitive-oriented attitudes correlate to greater perception of crime severity. Gomes-Schwartz and Horowitz find a correlation between abuse perpetrated by someone outside the family and the agencies' response which was to take criminal action; abuse perpetrated by a parent resulted in social service agencies being contacted. Chesnay and Petro advocate a legalistic approach, deem prosecution to be a deterrent to child sexual exploitation, and consider the rights of victims to be inviolable.

Incapable of reflecting on the fundamental purposes of the self or of the social organization with which it is identified, the institutional individual in turn lacks a capacity for self-correction or modification. Unable to envision a wider context in which to root and justify laws, the institutional balance risks excesses of control. Nevertheless, a strength of the fourth order of mind is one's capacity to reflect on rather than be

135Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 64.
136Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 64.
177Kegan and Lahey, "Adult Leadership," 204.
driven by feelings which show up in oneself.\textsuperscript{178} This capacity is an essential attribute for dealing with issues of transference.

The unstated mission of a health care professional embedded in the institutional order of consciousness is that of protecting the interests of those in control and of preserving the social order. The system is judged more important than even the rights of its individual participants. Delivery of established programs serve the interests of organizational structures rather than those of pedophiles with needs. Caregivers serve as reflectors of society and agents of punishment\textsuperscript{179} rather than as advocates for compassion and understanding. They see pedophiles as society sees them, as clients inappropriately in the health care system, having little value, and unworthy of respect, rather than having value and worthy of respect by virtue of their human condition. Instead of listening to and accepting the pedophilic patient as a human being, these professionals merely look for the problem, monitor patient compliance, and demand evidence of meeting regulations. Desirous of 'fitting in', such professionals become part of the problem rather than of the solution.

Moreover, the social phenomenon of hopelessness with respect to the problem of pedophilia is also subject to institutionalization, becoming part of the very structure and fabric of organizations mandated to provide services to the pedophilic portion of the population. In my view, health care professionals at the institutional order of consciousness contribute to the sense of institutionalized hopelessness rather than to hope for new insights, greater research, growth, and concern for meeting the needs of all individual citizens.

Professional practitioners working at the level of institutional consciousness are concerned about practitioner/patient boundaries and professional as well as institutional standards. Policies and procedures,

\textsuperscript{178}Kegan, \textit{Over Our Heads}, 252.

\textsuperscript{179}Money, "Diffusion of Sexological Knowledge," 253.
practices and decisions are according to the book--step-by-step. There is no question that what the pedophile most needs may be limit-setting. Nevertheless, incapable of making independent judgments, mental health professionals would be unable, for example, to hold a sobbing, remorseful, perhaps suicidal, pedophilic patient in their arms out of fear of losing their own boundary lines, violating standards, and jeopardizing professional roles, careers, reputations and standings. It is critical that the professional caregiver be able to establish appropriate limits while simultaneously being able to assure the pedophilic patient that he is fundamentally a part of a human group that is committed to helping the patient. Moreover, given the relatively high level of self-disclosure and intimacy inherent in the relapse prevention programs for pedophiles, I think it is evident that a caregiver in the fourth order will encounter difficult boundary issues. As Kegan and his colleague Laura Rogers discovered, the experience of anger, for example, contains an element of boundary in that it implies that some construction of the self feels violated. Such a professional never lowers his guard; nobody gets in, especially the pedophilic patient.

The limit of this order of consciousness is that it makes self-preservation the goal of the organization. Moreover, there is a very real need to have a colleague and mentor in whom to confide and with whom to consult. The institutional caregiver with a false sense of confidence to "go it alone" and to "handle things by oneself" will be unable to reach out to a peer from whom to obtain essential feedback on practice.

The institutional balance is evident in the stance of those professionals who emphasize that society must consider the rights of the victim as inviolable. Loyal to the structures and needs of the institution, these individuals rebuff anyone who tries to appeal to their sense of guilt and argues for attitudes, responses, programs and organizations which more truly

---

meet the human needs of pedophiles as society’s expression of care and concern for all its members. These professionals will be brought on side only if it can be demonstrated that "if I help to create some social order in my community, it may lead to the kind of society in which I won’t have to worry about someone sexually abusing one of my children whom I love.”

Although espousing values, the institutional professional tends to identify with and stand up for a particular ideology. The individual’s ideological construction of the self and the world is a necessary characteristic of development toward maturity. The basic limitation, however, lies in the fact that the person cannot hold up the ideology for examination. This individual risks overtly or covertly, ideologically indoctrinating colleagues or making allegiance to the espoused ideology the tacit price of membership in the ‘inner circle’. As defined by Kohlberg, ideology, is a "recurring system of logically interrelated general assumptions" about "factual matters, about the nature of human beings, society, and the cosmos" that includes a set of general moral principles and defines evaluation and choice. With respect to sexual research, physician and researcher Fritz Freyhan contends that:

Ideology, dogma, and sometimes plain stupidity posing as scientific attitudes still impede the development of valid knowledge and its clinical and social application.

Moreover, the forces of unquestioned ideology account for glaring contradictions in both theory and clinical practice. As I argued in chapter one, whether one aligns oneself with ideologies such as those of power or victimology, the approach is still reductionist and inadequate as a mechanism for understanding pedophilia. Such a response serves only to protect one from

---


182Kohlberg, Philosophy of Moral Development, 231.


184Chap. 1:48
the complexity of pedophilia and fails to contribute to increased knowledge or a more humane response to pedophiles themselves.

Granting that the person in the fourth order of consciousness will preserve a sense of being radically different from the pedophile, there exist considerable new capacities at this level that could auger well for more compassionate treatment of the pedophile. Credit needs to be given to the fourth order's capacity, potentially, to resist and disengage from many of society's toxic perspectives toward pedophiles. The strength of the institutional balance is, after all, its capacity for autonomy. The institutional person strives to be distinct, to stand apart. She can be guided by her own vision of what is required of her as a professional, exercise critical thinking, and take responsibility for standing on her own feet emotionally, intellectually, and economically. She has the internal capacity, power, standards, and authority to be professional. She is capable of authoring her own work design in the face of challenges.

Cognitively sophisticated to construct complex systems, the institutional person is capable of wider and more complex social arrangements. Her evolution of meaning, in turn, is cultured by these social arrangements. As the person in the fourth order evolves or emerges from embeddedness in the overarching ideology or self as form, she is capable of providing identical medical treatment for the pedophilic patient and the non-pedophilic patient, not out of love but out of some kind of duty. While the individual formally constructs a situation in terms of rights and the formal regulative category of religious and/or civil law, a newer part of her is able to stand outside this formalism and look at things differently. A person struggling to develop beyond the institutional level, however, requires support for this process from within the work domain and/or in the construction of loving relations. No support renders the person vulnerable to cynicism, despair, depression or its equivalent--
workaholism. For this individual the questions are: What will be there to support me as I grow? Will it be necessary for me to make a choice between my job and my life-project? Might my workplace grant me a professional leave in order for me to find a new culture which will be supportive of my personal development?

4.6 The Interindividual Self

Kegan rejects the notion that psychological autonomy is the hallmark of personal maturity and views development as going beyond autonomy. The Interindividual Self is oriented to postideological construction, contradiction and paradox, and is open to reevaluation and dialectical process. There is a self-conscious self upon which to reflect. Loyalty is to evolution or development of the organization. Hence, the individual is able to listen to negative reports about her endeavours, to confront new opportunities and to seek out information that could result in her negatively judging that behaviour and changing it. Emotional conflict is recognized and tolerated and functions as an internal conversation. Feelings break free of the internal control of the too-constricting institutional balance. Now, there is a self which is available for human interpenetration, capable of sharing and intimacy with others. One's commonality or interdepen-

185Kegan, Evolving Self, 245.


187Kegan, Evolving Self, 228-254.


190Kegan, Evolving Self, 237-238.
dence with others is recognized; persons are members of one human community.\(^{10}\) We all share the human condition. The interindividual person is drawn not only to community but to what Kegan terms a "higher affection" that looks more like the community of all persons.\(^{12}\)

At this level of consciousness, the individual questions whether generalizable rules which ignore the particulars can solve moral problems. This open-minded individual encourages open communication. Opposites are viewed as poles of one concept; paradox can now be faced and the person can make his own decisions. The underlying psychologic is dialectical. Capable of transcending loyalty to one's particular faction and of placing oneself in a variety of different positions, the Interindividual Self is able to take into account differing outlooks on the same situation. Able to think about more than the formalism of the law, this person's scope is broader than the law so that things can be viewed in another way. Now cut from under the tyranny of formalism, the person is capable of moving between various systems and of altering and creating new systems. Wary of losing sight of the provisional, introductory and subjective quality of any particular standard or structure, the individual orients to the process which creates forms.

Kegan's Interindividual evolutionary balance parallels Piaget's post-formal thinking and Kohlberg's post-conventional principled social welfare morality. In Kohlberg's terminology, for example, the post-conventional person has adopted a "society-creating" rather than a "society-maintaining" stance.\(^{10}\) Emphasis is on the equal worth of all persons. Concern is for effecting social reform through precedent setting, deterrence and rehabilitation of offenders, restitution of victims and procedural justice which includes due process. Rehabilitation suggests a benevolent caregiver rather

---

\(^{10}\) Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 104, 230, 239.


\(^{10}\) Kohlberg, *Psychology of Moral Development*, 634.
than the heartless jailer. The soundness of rules, laws, and social institutions are subject to evaluation in terms of the extent to which they uphold, safeguard and promote the fundamental human rights, values, well-being and equal worth of all members of society. Every individual is obliged to make moral choices that maximize individual rights, values, worth and welfare, even if they conflict with society's rules or conventions. Decisions to punish or not to punish are made in terms of their positive or negative consequences for society as a whole and of maintaining individual citizens' rights. Moreover, a duty exists to defend the rights of the minority. In any given social situation, it is essential to take into account the perspective of each individual involved. Everyone is counted as valuable.

Interindividual Adult Morality?

The mental health care professional in this balance takes a transformational stance and engages in the art of inquiry: "What is the ethical significance of that system?" The response is in terms of those values which we, as Canadians, desire to maximize, for example, freedom. The caregiver is able to recognize the very real limitations of the professional therapeutic relationship at the institutional level and to identify institutional needs and structures which serve to impoverish and oppress the pedophilic patient. Having pointed out these weaknesses, Stage 5 individuals are open to committing the time, energy and resources to overcome them. They are willing to create informal support networks which invite professionals into healing relationships and which restore the meaning and mission of healthcare organizations and of community.

At the same time, there is commitment to shared reflection on the overall purposes of the organization; to calling into question institutional goals, norms, objectives, practices and basic policies; to facing and

---

resolving paradoxes; to confronting new opportunities; and to empowering people to engage in participatory decision making. In order for all of this to lead to growth, merely maintaining the status quo will not be adequate. All of these characteristics are rooted in a basic trust of people and are the constructive developmental aspects of leadership in the work setting.\(^{143}\\)

Having transcended embeddedness in the societal, the Stage 5 caregiver is capable of tolerance. Societal judgments are subject to critique and are found to be arbitrary. A philosophy of individual rights is found to be reductionist and wanting.

What it means to be a professional at this level has less to do with external social definition than with internal psychological equilibrium and capacity. A health care professional in the interindividual balance is able to view pedophilia as a human issue between persons: everyone counts. The basis for this capacity is a theory or philosophy of what renders persons valuable. The caregiver listens to and accepts the pedophilic patient as a person, not merely as a problem. Rather than simply giving directions, this caregiver walks along beside the person who is pedophilic. The professional seeks to discover the terms by which pedophiles shape meaning or make sense of the situations in which they find themselves including their experience of being who they are and of being in the context of a helping relationship. The caregiver offers clients a culture in which to grow\(^{196}\\) and is able to find the client’s process of meaning making very touching.\(^{197}\\) Loyalty is to persons in their own activities of meaning-making.\(^{198}\\) The caregiver will not reject or condemn the client but will recognize the client’s yearning to be safe.\(^{199}\\) Instead of grumbling about


\(^{196}\\)Kegan, Evolving Self, 276.

\(^{197}\\)Kegan, Evolving Self, 16.

\(^{198}\\)Kegan, Evolving Self, 274.

\(^{199}\\)Kegan, Evolving Self, 283.
having to administer mandated services, this mental health professional is able to recognize the worth of all societal members and their right to take part in and benefit from the opportunities and resources of society.

Accordingly, a humane institution, confronted with issues such as pedophilia and with health care professionals who are struggling to deal with it, seeks to provide supports to assist them in grappling with and in transcending the feelings of revulsion, anger, and inner conflict and the seemingly daunting set of demands placed upon them. The institution would also be interested in open-systems of seeking information, reflection upon and possible reconstruction of its goals, practices and policies, participatory decision-making, and conflict resolution. Given the widespread questioning which is occurring within the psychiatric community with respect to its categories and diagnoses, Kegan suspects that it may be caught in a transition beyond the institutional balance. Further research will be needed to assess this evaluation.

A health care professional in the interindividual balance is capable of post-ideological construction, of transcending polarities and the isolation of separateness, and of creating the bigger and highly complex context in which pedophilia exists and in which the pedophilic patient and the practitioner interpenetrate. A caregiver of the fifth order of mind can be counted upon to aid the pedophile in the accomplishment of the patient’s goal to live and to function safely within the community. An example of a response to pedophilia by a caregiver at this level of consciousness would be exemplified by some with the following stance: All persons should have an equal opportunity to make choices, to grow and to contribute to society, even if they have the disadvantage of being pedophilic. No one is excluded from the human community simply because they are different from the ‘norm’

---

30Kegan, Evolving Self, 244-245, 247.
31Kegan, Evolving Self, 295.
32Kegan, Evolving Self, 253.
in their sexual orientation. Exclusion as a solution to the problem of pedophilia places the burden for resolving the problem on those who are pedophilic. Differences in the ability to deal with sexual desires do not radically separate one person from another, because both share the movement of life itself, namely, meaning-constitutive evolutionary activity—the need to make sense of one's life.

From the empirical data on attitudes of professionals, Berlin, Money, and Feierman are caregivers who have adopted a medical view of pedophilia and reflect an attitude of caring. They teach us a lesson in compassion. Others such as social worker Claudia Konker call for "compassionate treatment of victims and humane rehabilitation of offenders." Katz stresses the importance of understanding pedophiles as persons rather than as criminals. Barnard, Fuller, Robbins and Shaw urge therapists to transcend their prejudices. Card passionately advocates moving away from a punitive model to a treatment model which reflects caring and trust. Rogers and Dickey are able to stand back and evaluate critically the models of treatment and assessment of sex offenders. They are able to recognize the limitations of the criminogenic model, arguing that it merely serves to create an adversarial setting which predisposes to defensiveness in sex offenders. They recommend inviting treated "admitters" to be cotherapists in treatment groups, and family and significant others to assist in a monitoring process to prevent recidivism. In the Netherlands clinical psychologist, Gertjan van Zessen contributed to the adoption of a new treatment program with a focus on understanding the meaning and the

---


Rogers and Dickey, "Denial and Minimization," 59-60.
psychological functions of pedophile attraction and behaviour. He finds that when emphasis is on interindividual issues, the problems discussed by participants in therapy change from an individual to a social and communal level.\(^\text{38}\)

Thus, there is evidence that a correlation exists between caregivers' being embedded in Kegan's culture of intimate adult relationships and medical views of pedophilia displaying caring and compassionate attitudes. The patient/practitioner relationship is a context in which, through sharing and interacting, both participants are helped to experience their own incompleteness or partiality, their own uniqueness, but also their own heterogeneous nature.

If Kegan is correct in his finding that 58% of his survey population is between a third and fourth order of consciousness with the majority not reaching the fourth order and a large proportion being less complex than the third order, then for many, the interindividual order of consciousness will, in his words, be over their heads. However, for me to argue that only the fifth organization of mind is adequate for caring compassionately for the pedophile is not to cast shame or aspersion on anyone who is operating at another level of consciousness. Rather, it is to suggest, just as Card\(^\text{39}\) speculates, that the latter are blocked in their ability to understand and to care and will require growth to meet the challenges and to bear the shocks of working with this particular population. What these professionals may be lacking is (a) consciousness of what it means to be fully human and how such awareness could enhance the therapeutic encounter; (b) an understanding of how demanding such professional work is; (c) an adequate comprehension of what changes they will need to make in order to become more compassionate in their work; and (d) an environment supportive of such changes. Psychoanalyst Murray Krim believes that if analysts were to become


\(^{39}\) Card, "Case for Treatment," 16.
more real, more interactive with their patients, "whole human beings, not part objects," their analytic work would be enhanced. To become more human, he argues, would inform analysts' judgment as to what to do, when to hug, when to laugh and when to be serious, when to confront and when and how to be kind.²⁰ Such a challenge demands a qualitatively different order of mind or more complex way of knowing than simply acquisition of a new set of skills.

4.7 Summary

In this chapter I utilized the descriptions and criteria of each of Kegan's levels or orders of consciousness to analyze the existing empirical research and professionals' anecdotes regarding caregivers' punitive attitudes toward pedophiles in their care. I established evidence of Kegan's signposts of personality and moral development. Thereby, I was able to reconfigure the empirical data and to sketch the ethical models used by health care professionals and to show that there is a correlation between levels of ethical sophistication and differences of attitudes towards pedophiles. Thus, my research demonstrates that to adopt a medical construction of pedophilia requires interindividual ethics (ethical sophistication). My research reveals regression or lack of ethical sophistication, at least in relation to caregivers' attitudes toward pedophiles. Moreover, mental health care professionals appear paralysed in their efforts to change.

I showed that Kegan's constructive-developmental framework, however speculative, contains a new and fuller view of what it means to be human and holds out considerable promise for mental health professionals who care for pedophiles. The framework illustrates how attitudes are generated by the manner in which we come to know and to not know and to make sense of the

situations we experience.\textsuperscript{211} It offers new clues to the sources of stress in treating pedophiles therapeutically and a new conception of what Kegan terms "consciousness thresholds"\textsuperscript{212} which professionals may have to reach in order to satisfy the expectations of a therapeutic milieu. Obviously, mental health professionals, like everyone else, develop at different rates. That some develop more slowly than others is not in itself cause for alarm, nor is it indicative of gross incompetence.

However, when the whole or a large proportion of a subculture appears to be comprised of developmentally-delayed citizen's, a meaning-evolutionary perspective provides a way to analyze the possibility that the cultural organization is itself unwholesome and detrimental.\textsuperscript{213} A good constructive-developmental framework guards against the privileged (i.e., mental health professionals) becoming self-serving and the least favoured constituents of a population having their rank perpetuated. Each order of consciousness has great significance.

Survey results, especially published extractions from them, are not a comprehensive source of information about caregivers' meaning-making. An open-ended interview format accompanied by a transcript would better illustrate how an individual frames real-life conflicts and how the person construes the world and constructs the "other."\textsuperscript{214} Moreover, none of the empirical data that I have used concerning attitudes of mental health professionals toward pedophiles in their care was obtained through actually utilizing Kegan's interview design. Hence, it is important to extend my

\textsuperscript{211} Kegan, \textit{Over Our Heads}, 87.

\textsuperscript{212} Kegan, \textit{Over Our Heads}, 11.

\textsuperscript{213} Kegan, \textit{Evolving Self}, 212.

\textsuperscript{214} In their research for their book \textit{Habits of the Heart} which reveals how Americans make sense of their public and private lives, Bellah et al. actively interviewed people as their primary method of research and secondarily resorted to survey questionnaires. They found that fixed questions in a questionnaire generated useful data but failed to create dialogue and argument, see: Bellah et al., \textit{Habits of the Heart}, 305.
research and confirm my hypothesis via the future administration, interpretation, and scoring of interview material as set out in the *Guide to the Subject-Object Interview: Its Administration and Interpretation* designed by Kegan and his associates.

Having sketched and analyzed the ethical models of professional caregivers, I shall now conduct in the next chapter an ethical and theological reflection on the knowledge gained from Kegan's theory and the above analysis.
CHAPTER FIVE

THEOLOGICAL AND ETHICAL CONTEXT

With the knowledge gained from the analysis of caregivers' ethical models, I now shall conduct a reflection (including a theological aspect and an ethical aspect) which will seek:

1. to develop and to illustrate the role of the theological strand of Kegan's theory;
2. to show the ethical implications of the theological dimension for caregivers who treat and assess pedophiles; and
3. to propose, in light of Kegan's "forms and functions of embeddedness cultures," how caregivers can be helped to develop more-sophisticated moral attitudes toward pedophiles in their care.

Kegan states that his hungers drew him to literature, philosophy, and theology. He maintains that his constructive-developmental framework is intrinsically theological and has the potential to reflect what Martin Buber terms the "divine spark" which hides in all things and beings until set free. Having lived for several months in the Lubavitcher Hasidic community in Brooklyn prior to publishing The Evolving Self, Kegan experienced the Hasidic testimony to a sacredness in everyday life and a spirituality found in the concrete world. He challenges "theologically-minded" constructive-developmentalists to see through the empirical basis of his theory to the religious dimension. I shall take up that challenge in what follows.

---

1 Kegan, Evolving Self, vii.


4 Kegan, "There the Dance," 426.
5.1 Theological Aspect

As a branch of learning in the human sciences, theology is the reflective and methodical interpretation by reason of religious faith, practice, and experience. It is a discourse about God and one's relationship with God. Striving for insight and attainment of knowledge that differs, for example, from philosophical and psychological knowledge, theology constitutes a distinct way of thinking, seeing, imagining, knowing, and being. It does this in a manner which at times can be critical and antagonistic toward other sciences and disciplines but at other times can be compatible, indeed, complementary toward these branches of learning. Christian theology asks and tries to answer such questions as: What is the purpose of life? What meaning is inherent in our everyday experiences? Theological questions can join those of psychology and ethics.

Theology proposes an anthropological which reflects Christian meaning. It portrays a vision of what "can," "ought" to, and "may" be in response to the Christian question: What must I do to live more fully the incarnation—life of God given in Christ? In so doing Christian theology holds up a number of fundamental principles, attitudes, and human values which, while providing no ready-made answers, provide us with a sense of direction and a way of living. Because it tends to the suffering of persons, including those who are marginalized, theology raises ultimate questions regarding the meaning of human suffering and can propose new ways of attending to others. It implores us to respond in kind to Christ's imperative to love.

Through questioning, listening, interpreting, and reflecting, theology expresses human phenomena in the language and context of theological knowledge and beliefs. Seeking human understanding of mysteries and of realities and striving to grasp the meaning, reason or cause of a thing, phenomenon, or truth, the theologian endeavours to (1) formulate a hypothesis about and trace the genesis of the object of study, (2) look for

---

and account for any turning points in the process of development, (3) develop a contemporary context, (4) critically engage other contemporary sciences and disciplines, (5) be open to the dialectical element and a reflective critical stance toward one’s work, (6) reconceptualize the evidence and knowledge one has attained in terms of contemporary theological knowledge, and (7) struggle to give enriched and more exact expression to one’s increased understanding. The objective is to find new light or aspects of the truth that have been overlooked or pushed to the periphery; fashion new concepts; clarify details; discover, develop, and express new insights; conceptualize and analyze opposed relations; determine where the mystery is; bring to light the riches of Christian faith, revelation, and Christ’s encounter with humanity; construct new images of God which satisfy the human quest for meaning; provide contrast models about humankind; and perceive some of the implications of one’s theological understanding of reality in regard to the human community. Thus the vision of theology has implications for the quality of the human world.

At work in ‘doing theology’ is a growth or developmental process. Kegan’s developmental psychology points to a view of the human as a being with exceptional potential for growth. Most of the latent possibilities of humankind are never realized; but until we understand them better, these will not even be called forth. The essence of the human person will not be found in a reductive conception of being—but only in a coherently detailed course of the evolving self. The essential characteristic of humankind is such that humanity strives toward greater interpenetration and unification. Kegan’s theory of constructive development provides a framework or illustration of how an individual’s motivations, attitudes, and worldview change and grow in the course of a lifetime. His whole psychology of the person, especially his notion of "evolving self," tallies with contemporary theological thinking on the human person "becoming."

Moreover, theology provides a lens through which one can see the world; to see an interconnectedness, interrelatedness or oneness of all
things is to see the universe theologically. As Kegan emphasizes, at the heart of his framework of meaning-making activity is a religious or spiritual dimension which "partakes of the numinous," grace, the holy, and the transcendent and offers a vision of "the oneness of all life." The spiritual reality or religious dimension is the locus of the human dance; the underlying motion; that moving ground which roots and holds the self, threatens to transform it, and regenerates our self-other relating. Consideration of the empirical phenomenon of a constructive-developmental perspective "describes an increasing involvement of the person with the ground of being." This ground or dance, suggests Kegan, "is the very exercise of hope itself . . . a hope which living things are, a hope which all living things do not share so much as it shares them." It is a meaning-constitutive evolutionary activity which is "intrinsically religious" and may itself be the Holy Other, "the ultimate mystery in which we live, of which we are." When a study of the changing person in time includes this fuller dimension, it becomes theological and shows in James Ashbrook's terms that humanity lives by religious faith as manifested in its meaning-making capacity, and "not by literal sight."

From Allport's perspective, personality is multi-faceted and requires many avenues of approach, each approach serving to correct the other.

---

6 Kegan, "There the Dance," 409, 415.
7 Kegan, "There the Dance," 426.
8 Kegan, "There the Dance," 414-415.
9 Kegan, "There the Dance," 426.
10 Kegan, "There the Dance," 423.
11 James B. Ashbrook, "The Cry for the Other: The Biocultural Womb of Human Development," Zygon 29, no. 3 (September 1994): 297. Ashbrook's assertion resonates with that of Teilhard: "Religion is not an option or a strictly individual intuition, but represents the long unfolding, the collective experience of all mankind, of the existence of God." see Teilhard de Chardin, Building the Earth, 63.
Allport suggests that it is here that reconciliation of psychology, philosophy, and theology can occur for the philosophy of the person is inseparable from the psychology of the person . . . no philosophy of the person can be correct if it flatly contradicts known facts about human motivation, cognition, stages of growth, pathology. . . . As psychology increasingly tells us how the personality system is patterned, we may call upon philosophy and theology to relate the findings as well as they can to cosmic order.\footnote{12}

In order to research and to understand human persons, many methods of inquiry need to be brought into play. For Allport, it is in the area of human welfare and "in the production of an improved human character without which all other human gains are tragic loss"\footnote{13}--that psychology and theology need to cooperate.\footnote{14} Failure to do so falls short of the measure of humankind.

Macquarrie agrees. In his view, psychology "describes the human condition as it is," while philosophical and theological anthropologies "criticize the actual human condition" and are concerned "with exploring the possibilities of the human condition."\footnote{15} The question of what it means to be a human person can be approached theologically in different ways. Like the developmentalists, Macquarrie views the human person as a "being-on-the-way"\footnote{16}--always unfinished and in a process of change and growth by which the self is created. This conviction is in accord with biblical anthropology and is implicit, for example, in the Johannine passage: "now we are God’s children, it does not yet appear what we shall be" (1 Jn. 3:2). One can recall other scriptural passages which speak of the human potential for

\footnote{12}{Allport, Pattern and Growth in Personality, 567, 571.}
\footnote{14}{See also John McDargh, "Theological Uses of Psychology: Retrospective and Prospective," Horizons 12, no. 2 (1985): 247-264.}
\footnote{15}{Macquarrie, Search of Humanity, 3.}
growth such as that of the letter to the Church at Corinth in which Paul states:

When I was a child, I used to talk like a child, and think like a child, and argue like a child, but now I am a man, all childish ways are put behind me. (1 Cor. 13:11)

Macquarrie links the idea of growth and change with that of transcendence. Fowler, who was himself influenced by Kegan’s doctoral dissertation, argues that faith is a powerful way of being which arises out of our way of seeing and of constructing reality. In fact, faith “is a core process in the total self-constitutive activity that is ego.” It provides orientation, hope, and courage; endows relationships, crises, and everyday life with meaning; and grounds sustaining strength, purpose, and experiences of shared loyalties to values which bind one another in community. As an expression of constructive knowing, faith involves both reason and feeling, constructions of the self and others, in perspective-taking, in moral analysis and judgment, and in the constitutions of self as related to others which we call ego. ... In both faith-knowing and the kind of moral-knowing which gives rise to choice and action, the constitution or modification of the self is always an issue.

Throughout the life-long developmental or growth process, the knower is extended, modified, or reconstituted in relation to the known. In the various forms of constitutive-knowing, the self constructs the "known," the self, and the neighbour and participates in communities in relation to what Fowler terms an "ultimate environment," that is, the

---


18 Fowler, "Faith and Structuring," 64.


20 Fowler, "Faith and Structuring," 59, 61.

21 According to Fowler, this pilgrimage occurs in stages and there are seven stages or styles of faith which underlie our values, beliefs, assumptions, attitudes and lifestyles: see Fowler, "Faith and Structuring," 52.
largest canvas of meaning--expressed in Judeo-Christian symbolism as the Kingdom of God." Fowler believes that:

To deal adequately with faith and with faith's dynamic role in the total self-constitutive activity of ego means trying to give theoretical attention to the transformation in consciousness--rapid and dramatic in sudden conversion, more gradual and incremental in faith growth--which results from the re-cognition of self-others-world in light of knowing the self as constituted by a center of value powerful enough to require or enable recentering one's ultimate environment.

To move in this direction necessitates taking account of ways of thinking that engage images, symbols, and fusions of sense and feeling. It requires coming to terms with "recessive" movements in which the psyche returns to primitive sources of imagery and prelinguistic memories--bringing them into consciousness with consequent reconstructions of the experienced world.

Theologian Francine Cardman sums up reorientation or change of this sort as "profoundly spiritual, reaching to the roots of the hope and meaning we have for ourselves and for our world." As theologian Regina Marie Bechtle points out, the language of change or conversion is spoken by theology and spirituality. One's commitment to change and the process of conversion, she argues, takes shape in decision-making, actions, and

---

23 Fowler, "Faith and Structuring," 63.
patterns of behaviour—all of which are the domain of Christian praxis. When faith searches for meaning and expression, Bechtle argues, the work of the rational intellect is insufficient; for theology is also an affair of the heart. Probing the heart brings us into the realm of spirituality.

Spirituality, maintains theologian Sandra Schneiders, is the experience of consciously striving to integrate one's life in terms not of isolation and self-absorption but of self-transcendence toward the ultimate value one perceives.

This definition echoes what is at the core of Kegan's theory. Spirituality as lived experience inquires into and seeks to understand the human being and religious experience and to realize the potential of the "extraordinary and paradoxical condition" of being human. Spirituality strives to embody, reveal, and empower love and freedom in history and carry them forward in the world.

This harkens back to the words of Kegan: namely, it is a concrete world pretending; but this in the literal, Latin sense, a 'holding forward' of the everyday. Behind, burst-ready, concealed: 'something wonderful' about to take place. This is artifice, but Whose?

Kegan quotes Martin Buber: "From of old Israel has proclaimed that the world is not God's place, but that God is 'the place of the world.'" Then Kegan responds, "The sacred is not by itself bodily forth. For this there

---


2Sandra M. Schneiders, "Spirituality in the Academy," Theological Studies 50 (1989): 684. Spirituality is defined in many ways, for example, Cardman makes clear that spirituality is about the ways in which our animating principle or life force "relates to body, world and history. It is the attentiveness which persons give to the reality of self, others, the natural world and whatever we name as holy, as source, depth and mystery (some would say, as the divine) in our lives. Spirituality is the direction, meaning and value we give to the totality of experience." see: Cardman, "Liberating Compassion," 6.


2Kegan, Sweeter Welcome, 136.

2Buber, Mamre, 105.
must be education ... a leading out. 32 This leading out is, in my view, the work of theology; the living out is the task of spirituality. Theologies differ; flowing from a particular theology is a particular spirituality. Having implications for one’s experience of the culture and world in which one lives, one’s basic attitudes, life-style, and activities, spirituality rests comfortably with Kegan’s framework but needs to be further developed.

Theology conceptualizes or describes what is ultimate in our everyday lives. Kegan joins Fowler in suggesting that every level of consciousness composes its own “ultimate environment” or “Ultimacy.” 33 In turn, with each stage of knowing, the person is embedded in a different, personal psychological structure or “ultimacy” which has spiritual functions and consequences for spiritual development. 34 For example, for children or adults who function out of the Impulsive Stage, their impulses and the threat of their nonexpression are “ultimate.” The Christian gospel, however, reveals unconditional love of the other to be ultimate. If God relates to us through unconditional love, it is the task of Christians to bring this relationship and this love to bear on pedophilic persons in our midst. This implies growth. Kegan, as a psychologist, promotes growth beyond needs satisfaction and mere socialization; it is growth into greater involvement in the world, relations with other people, and unconditional love that he describes. Buber, to whom Kegan refers, states:

He who truly goes out to meet the world goes out also to God. . . . Meeting with God does not come to man in order that he may concern himself with God, but in order that he may confirm that there is meaning in the world. 35

---

32 Kegan, Sweeter Welcome, 136.

33 Kegan, “There the Dance,” 427; Fowler and Keen, Life Maps, 24.

34 Kegan, “There the Dance,” 431.

Hence, I share the view of Joann and Walter Conn that Kegan's theory serves as a tool for interpreting and understanding patterns of spiritual growth and spirituality. Kegan acknowledges that the constructive-developmental viewpoint has not done justice to the motion of the ultimate reality of the universe. He extends Fowler by suggesting a religious power or dimension for the constructive-developmental perspective which goes beyond both the quasi-religious stages of moral judgment and the stages of faith construction.

Kegan recognizes that much prayer, liturgy, and scripture expresses either humanity's lifelong longing to be held, integrated, and accompanied; or the longing to be independent, differentiated, and able to choose one's own directions. Kegan hears these yearnings, for example, when the lonely Job speaks to--and even curses--God or in the ardent communalism of Hasidism. These hopes are in a lifelong relation of tension--each developmental level or order of consciousness being a new solution to this universal dialectic.

The tasks of religious traditions from Kegan's constructive perspective are to provide persons access to the religious nature and expression

---

36 Joann Wolski Conn and Walter E. Conn, "Christian Spiritual Growth and Developmental Psychology," *The Way Supplement* 67/72, no. 69 (Autumn 1990): 3-14. Ronald Barnes looked at the relationship between psychology and spirituality. Specifically, he noted that "spirituality is partly self-awareness and recognition, as well as search and yearning"--elements of common interest to developmental theorists such as Kegan. With the realization that human experience is the source of reflection, human development and psychological insights can be deemed part of authentic spirituality just as awareness of God's love and support can be viewed as assisting one to come to terms with personal dilemmas, to move outwards to promote justice for others, and to restructure social conditions according to values of the Kingdom of God: see Barnes, "Psychology and Spirituality: Meeting at the Boundaries," *The Way Supplement* 67/72, no. 69 (Autumn 1990): 30, 32, 37-38. See also Jean-François Catalan, *Expérience spirituelle et psychologie* (Paris: Desclée de Brouwer, 1991).

37 Kegan, "There the Dance," 410.

38 Kegan, "There the Dance," 412. For a description of how prayer, for example, is an expression of the desires of human life see: Allport, *The Individual and Religion*, 10-12.

39 Kegan, "There the Dance," 413.
of meaning-making activity through ceremony and symbol; to initiate people into the mystery of existence; to be a spiritual support for each developmental meaning-system; to make publicly shareable each system’s appropriation of ultimacy; to respond to each member’s new constructions of reality and re-composing of self; to understand how development challenges a person’s continued participation in the community; to fashion long-term relationships; and to celebrate and be the context for change rather than be terminated by it.\(^\text{6}\)

Kegan’s framework illustrates how such foundational aspects of spirituality as openness to others, compassion, and caring are the result of development; seeds for an adult spirituality of compassion are sown in infancy\(^\text{7}\) and can be nourished or destroyed. He helps us to understand better how concepts such as pleasure, empathy, conflict, mutuality, needs, impulses, desires, values, and the pursuit of meaning, conditioned by capacity, spin the strands or fibres that will gradually become woven into a subjective form of theology and spirituality.

For Philip Sheldrake, "spirituality incarnates, at least implicitly, a definite theology or set of beliefs about God, the world and humankind."\(^\text{7}\) One’s image of and relation to God, according to theorists such as Kegan and Ana-Maria Rizzuto, is subject to a complex, lifelong developmental


\(^\text{7}\)In Kegan’s framework, even the earliest mothering environment provides spiritual functions, the absence of which will have deleterious consequences for the infant’s spiritual development. Philosopher, psychologist, and theologian Antoine Vergote deems maternal affective availability and unconditional love to be foundational to realization of an adequate personal identity, an ethical disposition and development of benevolent attitudes toward others. When this love and affective availability are absent, Vergote argues that feelings of hate will supersede those of love and revenge will always be pondered: see Vergote, "The Dynamics of the Family and Its Significance for Moral and Religious Development," in Toward Moral and Religious Maturity, convener, Brusselmann, 94-99.

\(^\text{7}\)Sheldrake, Images of Holiness, 10, 2.
process. Each embeddedness culture is the context for the developing
human being to participate in this ground of being. Theologians need to
understand that God as a representation has endless potential for new
meanings throughout one's lifespan and that their theology can contribute
to caregivers experiencing God's loving relatedness.

With regard to pleasure—especially sexual pleasure which has been
considered with suspicion in the Christian past—Catholic moral theologian
André Guindon stresses the important role of theology and comments:
"pleasure accompanies the beat of life." Its absence "in any human activity
is the sign of some estrangement" from oneself. Theologian Dorothy A. Lee
argues that human pleasure with respect to sexuality reveals the divine
image; is part of both creation and the symbolic structures of redemption;

---

Kegan, "There the Dance," 431; Ana-Maria Rizzuto, The Birth of the
Living God: A Psychoanalytic Study (Chicago: University of Chicago Press,
1979), 179, 182; Fowler and Keen, Life Maps; Vergote, "Dynamics of the
Family," 89-114; James E. Loder, "Negation and Transformation: A Study in
Theology and Human Development," in Toward Moral and Religious Maturity,
convenor, Brusselms, 165-192; Fred J. Hanna, Rick A. Myer, and Allen J.
Otten, "The Effects of Early Religious Training: Implications for
Counseling and Development," Counseling and Values 39, no. 1 (October 1994):
32-41; Sigmund Freud, "The Economic Problem of Masochism," in Standard

Ana-Maria Rizzuto, "The Psychological Foundations of Belief in God," in
Toward Moral and Religious Maturity, convenor, Brusselms, 121. Early-
formed God representations often are not easily disposed by a given
individual nor are God's characteristics readily updated or transformed.
Repressed images may be called to the fore in later years under the
influence of various experiences ranging from an encounter with another
individual to an encounter with a life stress. A negative God represen-
tation affects an adult's sense of self; can obstruct later integration of
other kinder, gentler and more loving qualities from another source in the
course of life; can be employed as an organizer of an unintelligible and
chaotically perceived situation; and can serve as an object for displacement
of anger related to primary objects. Thus a mental health professional who,
as an infant, experienced the primary mothering culture as abusive, hostile,
vengeful and punitive, may have created a God representation with similar
traits, continued to construct and experience God in this manner even into
adulthood and to project this construction onto patients in her care: see
Rizzuto, "Psychological Foundations," 121, 124, 126, 129-130; idem, Birth
of the Living God, 179.

André Guindon, The Sexual Language: An Essay in Moral Theology
(Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1976), 71-73. See also Paul Ricoeur,
is implicitly God-bearing and God-revealing; and is linked to the joys of intimacy, bodily passion, and self-transcendence.  

Abuse, pain, and suffering do not comprise the whole story concerning our sexuality. Thus Lee takes the view that in their concern to stem sexual and other forms of abuse, Christians must guard against presenting the human body and sexual pleasures as evil or as barriers to God and Christian maturity. Rather, she stressesthe need to recapture the goodness of sexuality and the lost sense of God's presence within sexual passion and pleasure. To Lee's mind neglect and distortion of God's gifts--through fear, guilt, self-contempt, and a narrow definition of self-control--constitute their own form of abuse. Hence, she urges people to develop a positive, biblical attitude and a genuine theology and spirituality of pleasure which can challenge ethical neurosis and take seriously the divine giftedness and creative power of play and pleasure.  

Theologian and ethicist James B. Nelson asserts this perspective differently, holding that

the movement toward a more healed, wholistic spirituality and the movement toward a more healed, wholistic sexuality cannot be separated. It is not just that they ought not to be separated; quite literally they cannot be. One is necessary to the other. They are inseparable elements of full personhood.

For Nelson our spirituality has been one-sided in its emphasis on sin and redemption. Creation-centred spirituality; affirmation of the sexual dimension of our relationship with God; as well as the vision of the Garden of

---


Eden which gives rise to feeling, desire, communion, incarnation, and compassion—could well serve us, he argues, as a corrective to this bias.\textsuperscript{51}

Moreover, it is Nelson’s belief that compassion, defined as "an egalitarian and passionate caring about persons and institutions,"\textsuperscript{52} is integral to spirituality and intimately connected with sexuality. If compassion as social justice is a key element of Christian spirituality, Christians will need to attend more astutely to the ways in which the unhealed sexual dualisms, such as the mind-body or man-woman split, contribute so significantly to current social justice issues—child sexual abuse being but one example.\textsuperscript{53} To this end Nelson exhorts the community of faith, worship, and service to change, to understand itself as a sexual community, and to resexualize its liturgy through a more androgynous theology, language, spirituality, and sacramentality.\textsuperscript{54}

Allport noted that for some adults religion functions at an immature level of impulsive self-gratification, wish-fulfilling for self-interests, fantasy, or sentiment.\textsuperscript{55} This orientation is spasmodic, sometimes fanatic in intensity, unreflective and non-unifying in its effect on personality.\textsuperscript{56} Unable to face one’s own weaknesses, one will punish severely those which one sees in others. Further, the caregiver who relies on and is bound by a pious code of stilted reactions for every possible situation is addicted to her own idiosyncratic blueprint of rigid, precise behaviour. At the

\textsuperscript{51}Nelson, \textit{Between Two Gardens}, 8-13.

\textsuperscript{52}Nelson, \textit{Between Two Gardens}, 13.


\textsuperscript{54}Nelson, \textit{Between Two Gardens}, 13-14, 78-80.

\textsuperscript{55}Allport, \textit{The Individual and Religion}, 24, 60-61.

\textsuperscript{56}Adult religious infantilism is characterized by Jesuit Gerard W. Hughes as a narrow cocooning of one’s mind, protecting one from truth and against the risk of uncertainty. Unquestioningly subject to authority and the textual form of doctrine the infantile adult is rigid and intolerant of the weaknesses of others: see Hughes, "On Being an Adult in Today’s Church," \textit{The Way} 24/25 (October 1985): 262-264; Gerard W. Hughes, \textit{God of Surprises} (New York: Paulist Press, 1985), 19-20.
mercy of impulses, this caregiver is in danger of failing to respond in a
thoughtful manner but, instead, of reacting blindly in a stereotypical
fashion.

As Allport suggests, unquestioning regard of ritual and acceptance of
the system of beliefs tends to endorse conformity, egocentrism, and ethno-
centrism and to inhibit cultural diversity. In Sheldrake's view, only a
broadly conceived religion and notion of catholicity will lead beyond ego-
centricity; invite growth into an attitude of openness and inclusiveness;
accept and promote change; open the way to understanding, dialogue, coopera-
tion, and learning from one another; and undermine rigid rules of life,
condescension, arrogance, and smugness in assigning labels to itself and
others.\footnote{Allport, The Individual and Religion, viii, 34; Sheldrake, Images of
Holiness, 12-16.} Theology needs to affirm that our neighbour is each and every
other person; to deny the presence of God in the other is to dehumanize.

Because attitudes, thinking, and even acting can be influenced by
perceptions, theologians have a responsibility to challenge childlike-adult
belief systems, habits, and facets of cultural conditioning which portray
pedophiles as monsters and thereby obstruct perception of reality. Just as
Plato attempted to change radically our worldview and basic beliefs through
his Allegory of the Cave by illustrating how we are not seeing reality but
only shadows on the cave walls, so too, caregivers need to turn away from
the shadows in order to perceive reality. Inability to listen to who and
what others really are leads the caregiver to distort reality. It is of
paramount importance that professional caregivers make distinctions between
appearance and reality; look for a deeper interpretation or dimension; and
realize that every person, in spite of a debased characterization, is
created in the image of God. A questioning attitude throughout one's life-
span can only exist in someone who really trusts God's presence in all
beings. As a result of questioning and listening, one gains insight into
the pedophilic person and the meanings of the pedophile's situation and can
grow into responding in wisdom. Christianity imposed with threats of fire and brimstone for non-obedience produces tyrannical religious super-egos, stifles inner freedom in adulthood,⁵⁹ and results in a fanatical, self-righteous faith style.

Theology can do much to create a culture that seeks to maximize connectedness, caring, and cooperation.⁶⁰ Cooperation requires the ability to enter into a comradely communion with other human beings. Agreement as to ends presupposes acceptance of a criterion of values which are based on an adequate conception of the ultimate goal of humankind. For the Christian the answer to the question--To what end?--consists in the practice of a love that brings us into greater communion with one another and with God, the ground of our process of constructive-developmental meaning-making. Theologians of different faith traditions can help by inducing and strengthening these values, illustrating the shared humanity and goals of all people, and breaking down stereotypes.

Further, as I noted in chapter one,⁶¹ another factor which I believe theology needs to address is the interwoven notion of sexuality and innocence. In her experience of work in child abuse, Rita Brock finds that Western Christian attitudes that prize the notion of innocence merely reinforce the notion that punishing the wrongdoers is a divine mandate. They perpetuate the self-righteous, dichotomous dualisms of oppressor and oppressed--portrayals of oppressors as one-dimensionally evil and victims as helpless women and children to be pitied or helped rather than as active

⁵⁹Hughes, God of Surprises, 38.

⁶⁰See also: Ervin Staub who does not write in the context of Christian community but sees this as a function of schools: "Individual and Societal (Group) Values in a Motivational Perspective and Their Role in Benevolence and Harmsdoing," in Social and Moral Values: Individual and Societal Perspectives, ed. Eisenberg, Rejkowski, and Staub, 58-59.

⁶¹chap. 1:18
agents who can make conscious choices.61 Just as I discovered in my own work, Brock argues that her work forced her to understand that the idea of innocence serves to polarize and to isolate individuals into solitary worlds of suffering.62 She emphasizes that we live in complex relationships in which our vulnerability to be abused and our potential to be abusive are part of who we all are as human beings. We need to learn to be strong, dubious, caring, and wise, to tolerate ambiguity, to develop creative imagination, to be agents of our own lives, to take responsibility to alleviate pain, and to sustain the loving bonds that keep people alive.63 She argues that only if we give up the notion of innocence and accept our responsibility to lessen evil and to acknowledge that we do have some power can we attain hope.

Sheldrake also attacks the idea of innocence declaring that

spirituality should neither shield us from the darker side of human experience by protecting us in an artificial world nor preserve a kind of innocence that is, in effect, human and spiritual immaturity.64

Conventional wisdom along with theology has tended to view sexual relations as the line of demarcation between innocence and worldliness. However, the longer that children are considered to remain in a state of innocence—the longer their sexuality will be denied and the longer they will be situated

---

61Rita Nakashima Brock, "Losing Your Innocence but Not Your Hope," in Reconstructing the Christ Symbol: Essays in Feminist Christology, ed. Maryanne Stevens (New York: Paulist Press, 1993), 43, 46. Schultz argues that victim-offender dichotomies wrongly convey physical trauma which occurs in 5-10% of cases and fail to deal with consenting reciprocal sexual activities which may not be damaging: see Schultz, "Child Sexual Abuse in Historical Perspective," 28.


64Sheldrake, Images of Holiness, 32.
outside the human race in a paradisiacal world. For as psychology reminds us, sexuality is central to being human.  

Moreover, as psychotherapist Rollo May sees it, a "pseudoinnocence" capitalizes on naiveté and has a fixation on the past. It amounts to blinders which (1) render things seemingly simple and easy; (2) perpetuate earlier attitudes; (3) close one off from realities that confront humankind; (4) prevent one from coming to terms with one's own as well as another's destructiveness and capacity for evil; (5) deny one's history; (6) shield one from growth, taking responsibility and new awareness of human joys and suffering; and (7) fail to lead to spirituality.

Theologians have taken a mechanistic and act-oriented approach to sexuality. Consequently, they have failed woefully to address the richer notion of sexuality which acknowledges children as inherently sexual beings. Sexuality, to use Sheldrake's terms, "must be related to what it is to be holy." An adequate sex education should aim to humanize the sexual function by ennobling and refining it. It should enable the infant to make

6 Still, the notion that children are innocent and asexual persists. Recommendations published in July, 1991, by the American Bishops' Ad Hoc Committee on Sexual Abuse included the following aims: "to continue to assist victims and to lead molesters into recovery so that children can live innocent and trusting lives. . . . it is easy to forget that at the root of our struggle is to reclaim the innocence of a child. To protect that innocence . . . we must identify, monitor and care about the anxieties and fears that accompany all discussion on human sexuality." see Father Connors/Canice/Bishops' Meeting, "Subcommittee Head Introduces Think Tank Recommendations," Origins 23, no. 7 (1 July 1993): 106. Such a perspective presents childhood innocence as a vulnerability beset by so many adversaries that it necessitates protective custody. Within the gay movement, youth rejected the category of innocents in need of protection and fought to be recognized and treated as equal participants in the battle for integration into social and political structures; see Thorstad, "Man/Boy Love," 253, 255-256. "Innocence is . . . seen as being defiled, slipping away, not what it used to be:" see Kincaid, Child-Loving, 73.


6 Sheldrake, Images of Holiness, 30.
the transition from a state of complete dependency to one of responsible interrelationship with others. However, such refinement is only possible if society recognizes that children are sexual beings.

Areas of change are fraught with difficulty; the difficulty lies in the challenge which confronts us. What will happen? Once we start any ball of change rolling, we don't know where it will roll. Will it lead to enrichment and not be destructive? Recognizing children as sexual beings entails acknowledgement of one's own children as sexual, which in turn may draw one too close to incestuous musing. To concede that children are sexual is to threaten exposure of one's own sexual feelings. The reader, however, ought not to take the assertion that children are sexual too far and assume that it is a justification of pedophilia. A pedophile who acts out his sexual desires towards children is still culpable and needs to take responsibility for dealing with his behaviour.

A person in the interpersonal order of consciousness will have difficulty owning and expressing anger.69 Rather than creating guilt about strong feelings such as anger, theologians would better serve people at this level of consciousness by demonstrating how such feelings can be possible channels for growth and movement into higher levels of consciousness. As Sheldrake posits:

Passion, for all its dangers, needs uncaging if we are to move towards completeness as human beings and if our walking with Christ in faith is to pass beyond the cerebral and the emotionally anaemic. The trouble with the ambiguity of passion is that we sense that we cannot get it in order on our own and so run away not only from our humanity but in a sense from God as well.70

To dive into our darkest depths where passion dwells and to wrestle with its ambiguous nature is to confront the desert experience of faith and to meet God.

Nevertheless, as Joann Wolski Conn notes, danger lurks in that people in this balance who have experienced abuse, feel angry but do not always

69Kegan, Evolving Self, 97.
70Sheldrake, Images of Holiness, 37.
express it. This individual may be viewed by religious counselors or faith communities as "long-suffering," "patient," or "carrying the cross." Speaking from the perspective not only of feminist theology but also Kegan's constructive-developmental model, Conn points out that such interpretations serve to reinforce immaturity and to prevent the person from moving into self-ownership of feelings.\(^7\) The interpersonal individual may be afraid to question and to search for meaning lest he disrupt the approval and affection of others, undermine present comfort and social position, destroy pleasant associations accumulated in childhood or the security which had been enjoyed since the Incorporative Stage of infancy. Should this individual be a health care professional, there is a further danger that unresolved anger will be displaced onto persons in her care, especially onto those who have a history of being abusive such as the pedophile.

Further, with the emerging conception of oneself and others, the Interpersonal Self is also now capable of mutuality, empathy, and coordinating different points of view. The individual becomes aware that in continuity with oneself, people with separate histories and identities feel pleasure and pain. Consequently, one's empathic response not only becomes aroused and possibly intensified but also becomes combined with a mental representation of another's life condition and distress. Rollo May's definition of empathy parallels that of The Collins English Dictionary which defines empathy as "the power of understanding and imaginatively entering into another person's feelings."\(^2\) For May, understanding--as differentiated from ideal love--is a human possibility which involves understanding our enemies as well as our friends.\(^7\) In these days of global communications, argues May, we can no longer remain oblivious to needs, joys, and

\(^7\)Joann Conn, *Spirituality and Maturity*, 55-56.


\(^7\)May, *Power and Innocence*, 258.
woes of those bereft of power, whether these people be convicts or the poor. Furthermore, it is in understanding that one finds the beginnings of compassion and charity.

However, as Staub emphasizes: "Empathy does not arise out of nowhere in response to another person's emotional state." 

74 Here again, theologians can assist in arousing an empathic response by exposing people throughout life to the plight—the suffering and the vulnerability—of entire groups of people such as the poor, the oppressed, and the outcast. People can be helped to acquire the ability to form mental representations of biblical situations in which Jesus encountered those who had been marginalized or oppressed. A question needing to be posed is that of theologian Micheline Laguë: Quelle image de Dieu, de la créature humaine sont proposées aux disciples du Christ? 75 How did Jesus respond to those pushed to the community’s fringe? What are the characteristics of Jesus’ ministry among—and relationships with—those viewed as outcasts? Life-giving? Loving?

As I noted in chapter four, the content of the Interpersonal Self’s attitudes is determined by one’s structure of reasoning and by the values, norms and roles of one’s culture. The third order of consciousness is the traditionalist mind which is faithful to the family values, religion, myths, and prejudices. In chapter one I illustrated how the phenomenon of pedophilia has been fraught with a combination of myths, devaluing stereotypes, and a past history or tradition of punishment. The interpersonal caregiver is subject to internalizing all of this tradition if it is part of the "life-surround." Mere adoption of attitudes that already exist in one’s life-surround is not adequate. Caregiver-as-evolving means openness to growth into a truly Christian existence and to all manifestations of the presence of God in one’s life-surround. One discovers one’s true self and purpose in Christ. Furthermore, one is also capable of constructing values


75 Laguë, "Même souche," 351.
and ideals and orienting to nurture and affiliation. Christianity espouses particular values. The repeated acts of kindness and compassionate treatment by Jesus of societal subgroups can go a long way to instilling Christian values of caring and compassion and prosocial modes of behaviour in the hearts and minds of people. A truly incarnational spirituality involves an explicitly social dimension and draws us into confrontation with major contemporary issues. So too Sheldrake argues that "no contemporary spirituality can be effective without being rooted in social compassion." 

The Institutional Self is a career, a work role. Jewish theologian Carol Ochs argues that what it means to be created in the image of God holds out promise of an identity that is worth the journey, but cautions one not to reduce oneself to a mere collection of roles, traits or performances." One is far more than any or all of the many roles one plays in life.

Ideology is also essential to the institutional balance. As Staub observed, ideologies combine sets of value orientations and goals, beliefs, and justifications and usually identify an ideal social organization, which is perceived to represent an improved way of life or a better world for all humanity. If an ideology of hostility toward pedophiles has evolved, clear lines of demarcation will have been established and will determine who can or cannot be a member of the self as institution and of the religious institution with which the person is identified.

As George Soares-Prabhu and Babad et al. point out, religious institutions have highly prejudiced depictions which they continue to foster and to spread concerning their nonadherents or outgroups. Many believers embedded in the institutional balance feel they have no alternative but to conform with and to internalize these learned prejudices if they are to

\(^{7}\)Sheldrake, *Images of Holiness*, 16.


\(^{7}\)Staub, "Individual and Societal Values," 56-57.
remain within group ranks." However, unconditional love bears no prejudice. Therefore, theologians need to challenge caregivers to enter into the gospel stories, to see that Jesus was free of group prejudices toward outcasts, and to proclaim the freedom and love of Christ as the end of prejudice.

The institutional balance is able to recognize but not to tolerate emotional conflict. When there exist problems to be solved, that is when conflict chiefly occurs. Theologians have a responsibility to demonstrate that conflict is not necessarily negative. In fact it can enable one to explore ambiguity and inspire aspects of spiritual development. Indeed, writing on the place of conflict in the life of Paul, Carlos Mesters does not sanctify conflict; however, he emphasizes that it is impossible to have a spirituality without some conflict and conflict can be a source of fresh waters—of faith, hope, and love. Moreover, not only was conflict very much a part of Jesus' ministry, but he himself stated: "It is not peace I have come to bring, but a sword" (Mt. 10: 34; Lk 12: 51). The very experience of God is profoundly unsettling and conflict-provoking because of the radical demands it makes on persons and on society. That is why, explains Rahner,

the modern spirituality of the Christian involves courage for solitary decision contrary to public opinion ... such a solitary courage ... can exist only if it lives out of a wholly personal experience of God and his Spirit.

---

79George Soares-Prabhu, "The Unprejudiced Jesus and the Prejudiced Church," The Way 27, no. 1 (January 1987): 4-14; Babad, Birnbaum, and Benne, Social Self, 104-105.


83Rahner, Practice of Faith, 21-22.
To the extent that any religion, including Christianity, becomes institutionalized, "it inevitably develops a competitive and hostile attitude towards other rival groups which contest its claims" and tends towards in-group exclusivism. The history of pedophilia is marked with tragic manifestations of "Christian prejudice" against "out-groups". The results of such an attitude have been destructive and even deadly, revealing how easily Christian espousal of the love of Christ evaporates. We fear examining our prejudices and stereotypes too deeply lest we discover something within ourselves that undermines our cherished self-image. Meeting the stereotyped "other" face-to-face reveals that pedophiles are like each and every one of us—human. For Cardman, "The ability to embrace otherness while honouring difference is the beginning of compassion." She rejects the idea that difference is equated with otherness.

Rather, difference and particularity are understood as essential elements of reality and the basis of any authentic ... relationship. Real difference and real connection demand a multiplicity of viewpoints, of subjects, of experiences ... Reorienting oneself to pluralism is a spiritual as well as an epistemological and practical process. It requires a radical decentring on the part of the privileged whose reality has occupied the centre.

Awareness of this reality is the beginning of changing attitudes.

Kegan notes that the institutional individual begins to sense that something is missing. Ochs also sees something missing in the Western notion of autonomous self, namely, the influence of love. "Because of God's love," she argues, "the world comes to us organized through ... the song of our consciousness." Fear gives rise to the establishment of boundaries, divisions, and absolutes by the Institutional Self; but it is understanding and love which play critical roles in casting out fear. God's

---


9Cardman, "Liberating Compassion," 11.

10Cardman, "Liberating Compassion," 8.

Ochs, Song of the Self, 77.
love enables us to develop the freedom to compose from available sources and to be creative. Ochs holds that

love breaks down the otherness of the other and allows us to see the shared role we play in the whole. We have seen God's love but have not recognized our own. Our capacity to love and our need to be nourished by others' love suggests that 'autonomy' is not as central to our existence as interconnection. 88

While individuality is real at the institutional level of consciousness, it is not ultimate in the larger scheme of things. The self can no longer be defined narrowly and located in terms of an independent self but rather as the self in relatedness with God and with others.

Hence, the Institutional Self needs to be encouraged to explore the role of community. Rahner believes people need to find the

'God for us' who opens the doors on infinite space for the human deed and the adventure of living, who enjoins responsibility, and who encourages human beings to make their own decisions. 89

Moreover, in Rahner's view, a professional needs to develop "a positive relationship between one's profession, its ideals and realities, on the one hand, and a life lived in faith on the other." The person needs to be critical of the "partial blindness to human realities" characteristic of the methodology and "subject matter" of every profession. 90

Nevertheless, common at this level of consciousness is the doubt engendered by visible hypocrisy, encouraged grovelling, bigotry and failures on the part of leadership, as well as limits set on the free exercise of intelligence in institutional religion. 91 The history of punishment by the Church which I traced in chapter one may cause some to shudder and to question the excesses committed in the name of Christ. If the individual is going to be able to view religion with a positive attitude, theologians

88Ochs, Song of the Self, 77.
89Rahner, Practice of Faith, 126-127.
90Rahner, Practice of Faith, 127.
will need to work hard to assist the individual to revise imagery and theology while encountering day-to-day discrepancies between Christian ideals and actions—collisions between beliefs and increasing experience of participating in Christian community. If theology is to be vigorous and have any import at all in everyday life, it must be subjected to questioning and criticism. If the spiritual element and growth are not given special significance within the Christian community and if we are not open to encountering God within both ourselves and others, religion can degenerate into worship of an ideology or an idolatry of the institution.

Kegan remarks that social class as well as institutionalized religion can make growth difficult.\(^9\) The self needs to alter fundamentally its relationship to both.\(^9\) Christian theology views men and women as being responsible for the world in which they live and stresses the importance of the historical perspective for theological consideration. The Christian community, according to Rahner, needs to look to the past and to take responsibility for its actions, particularly those which are narrow, destructive, alienating and punitive and reveal the depths of malice. Rahner summons the Church to live out a spirituality that "learns over and over again positively and negatively from the Church's past."\(^9\) Accordingly, he asserts that the spirituality of the future will be a spirituality according to Matthew 25,

one related to the living God, who has revealed himself in the history of humanity, who has established himself in his most intimate reality—even as basic ground, as innermost dynamism and final end—at the very heart of the world and the humanity created by him\(^9\)

whether that be in his nakedness, hunger, or imprisonment—or in "the least of these brothers of mine" (Mt. 25: 40).


The danger inherent at the institutional level of consciousness is that of building the faith community into a fortress to keep "others" out--by naming pedophiles "outcasts." No awareness can exist of a veiled presence of God in this social issue. We try to contain God in our institution, but God is very much alive in those we cast out. An implied yardstick of acceptability or inclusivity stands at odds with a vision of faith community where all are welcome and persons are challenged to deal redemptively with differences. Moral exclusiveness denies the imperfections of real communities, abets further wrongdoing by creating the conditions necessary for justifying cruel punitive measures and thus proceeds along the continuum of destruction of community.

Christian caregivers would do better to examine their own experiences--corporately and individually--not only of abusive behaviour but also of being accepted, loved, and healed. Being in vital touch with our own pain and healing creates the possibility for compassion. Facing the destructive behaviour within ourselves breaks through the barriers that separate us. As the body of Christ, we are made up of many parts. One part cannot say to the other, "I have no need of you. . . . On the contrary, the parts of the body which seem to be weaker are indispensable" (1 Cor. 12: 21-22). We must continually ask ourselves: What is it like to be labelled a "sex offender," "pervert," or "scum of the earth," to be the brunt of societal venom, to feel excluded, left out. Is Jesus not someone who came that all might be healed and live life to the full?

The Interindividual Self is oriented to postideological construction, contradiction and paradox, open to reevaluation and dialectical process. Kegan illustrates the self's post-conventionality and "qualitatively more expanded form of connection" by drawing upon a significant Rabbinical legend recorded in the Passover Haggadah,* an ancient collection of Hebrew stories and prayers commemorating the Jewish people's exodus from Egyptian captivi-

*Kegan, Evolving Self, 68-69.
God was frequently deemed the possession of one group of people. Yet, at the moment in the Seder Liturgy of recounting the ten plagues:

God is represented as saying, reproachfully, to His angels, who joined in the song of jubilation chanted by the Israelites upon the overthrow of their enemies in the Red Sea: 'What! the works of My hands are sunk in the waters, yet ye can sing songs before Me.'

This powerful and very moving legend epitomizes the capacity of people to transcend the controlling context of one's group and to create a "wider community in which to participate, to which to be connected, for which to direct . . . concern." The Rabbis of the second century chose to magnify God's largesse and to diminish any sense of vengefulness and to qualify the festive feeling toward a day marked by a disaster to one part of the human race. Thus, they reveal what Kegan terms "a supervening affection toward something else, toward something that looks more like the human community, the community of all persons," toward which they feel even more strongly compelled.

Ochs argues that one can turn to the Bible to see that the process of breaking down dualisms transpires slowly throughout the Hebrew scriptures and the history of the Children of Israel. In a similar fashion the Talmud plays out the tension of opposites and emphasizes that both Jews and Egyptians are God's children--the work of God's hands. To my mind, this universal perspective challenges any one group's narrow interests and suggests that one can find God in and through the events of history which includes the reality of pedophilia. Ochs comments that

---


78 Kegan, Evolving Self, 71, 230.

79 Kegan, Evolving Self, 70.

80 Ochs refers to the same story but as noted in the Jewish Talmud: see Ochs, Song of the Self, 10-11; Babylonian Talmud. Megillah 10b.

we cannot become our authentic self—the person we are meant to be—by suppressing our identification with other people. . . . We do not achieve this self by slaying the Egyptians, cheating Esau, or casting out Hagar, nor do we achieve it in competition with others. God . . . does not play favorites. We achieve our authentic self by loving God. . . . The self that is constricted to mean 'me, not you' or 'we, not them' is always at risk and in need of defense. But the self that expands to include not only the Children of Israel but the Egyptians as well can stretch out, relax, and be loved by God.102

Initially, the Children of Israel were "held" by the victory Song at the Sea.103 Through it they were able to gain and to express a sense of community. The song provided comfort for an earlier form of self but also was foundational for reflection and future interpretation of their relationship to God. The future entailed further revelatory experiences throughout the continuous unfolding of their lives and the realization as expressed in the Talmud that all are children of God. Juxtaposing pairs of opposites upsets the usual way of constructing reality. If one were to dwell on this Talmudic interpretation one could ask: Are not pedophiles analogous to the Egyptians? Are they not also God's children?

Thus freed from being moored to social institutions and a collection of roles, the Interindividual Self becomes aware that meaning is "bound up with the larger Creation with which we were called into being and of which we are a part, and with the Creator who has called us forth."104 The person at this order of consciousness, thus freed, is keenly aware that at the heart of the self is inexhaustible mystery. The task of a theologian dealing with a mystery, as Charles Journet tells us, "is to do away with phrases which diminish the mystery."105 Unless, argues Bechtel, theology is rooted in a sense of mystery and seeks to grapple with a God through

102Ochs, Song of the Self, 13.
103Ochs, Song of the Self, 49-50.
104Ochs, Song of the Self, 6.
reflection and conversion, it remains inarticulate for itself and for others--vacuous and infertile. However, as Rahner cautions: mystery does not deny finding ourselves in confusing situations with no simple solutions. Rather, "mystery means confusion in hope." As we co-create and enter into uncharted ways of dealing with pedophiles, we are confronted with pedophilia as mystery; for as I noted in chapter one, science has failed to reveal its etiology.

The Interindividual Self is able to recognize that there is a deeper meaning to pedophilia than what can be explained by medical science and is yet to be discovered. The task which lies before theologians is to help caregivers to find that deeper meaning. Kegan views the human person as both question and answer. For Rahner, through the coming of God's kingdom and the resurrection Jesus

is now both the question and the answer present in human life. He is the ultimate answer . . . the word of God to us, the answer to the one question which we ourselves are, a question no longer about a particular detail, but the universal question, about God. From this position Rahner does not presuppose that Christians have "final" answers which can solve everything. Rather, he is concerned with the basic structure of who we are as questioners; for the experience of radical questioning is the means by which "we become conscious of ourselves as selves." That the subject never ceases to ask questions is an irreducible datum. To be Christian, however, is to allow oneself to "sink into the incomprehensible mystery" and not to "regard any experience, any understanding (however good and illuminating . . . ) as final, as intelligible in

---

107Rahner, Practice of Faith, 17.
108Rahner, Practice of Faith, 9-10.
109Rahner, Practice of Faith, 7.
themselves." Therefore, for Rahner, we are compelled to take the person seriously.

For Kegan "the reasons why we are drawn to others, especially to their welfare, are surely mysterious . . . but . . . harken back to . . . the activity of meaning." Theologically, it is the presence of God in ourself, in the other, in being, which attracts us and enables us to love. Concern, caring, trust, compassion, and love are just a few of the bonds that all of us are expected to share. Bechtle emphasizes that theological anthropology, to be complete, has to take with complete and utter seriousness the whole landscape of the human. To be human is to exist with others, not accidentally but radically. The degree and intensity and quality of our relating to one another is indeed a matter of our choice, but the fact of our being related, on interpersonal, societal and historical levels, is not.

That we are created in God’s image and in relationship can be reassuring but also challenging—maybe even frightening. Society views the pedophile as someone to be cast aside, to be annihilated perhaps. Yet, speaking of Jesus, Peter reminds us that "the stone rejected by the builders has proved to be the keystone, a stone to stumble over, a rock to bring men down" (1 Peter 2:7-8). Paul confirms for the Corinthian Church how illogical the language of the cross may seem by emphasizing:

It was to shame the wise that God chose what is foolish by human reckoning; those whom the world thinks common and contemptible are the ones that God has chosen—those who are nothing at all to show up those who are everything. The human race has nothing to boast about to God, but God has made you members of Christ Jesus and by God’s doing he has become our wisdom, and our virtue, and our holiness, and our freedom. (1 Cor. 1:27-30)

Indeed, pedophilia is scandal and folly for human reason. Pedophile Tom O’Carroll, in his presentation of the pedophile’s perspective, challenges and perhaps threatens our capacity to reason and to theologize, as follows:

---

111Rahner, Practice of Faith, 6-7. See also: Hughes, God of Surprises, 31.

112Kegan, Evolving Self, 19.

113Bechtle, "Convergences in Theology," 309.
I could not believe that it was right that the love inside me should be repressed, crushed, aborted. It had to be there for a purpose. It had to be there to do good with. I'm not a Christian. I don't believe in God, but at times I wish I did, because then at least I could appeal to the idea that I have been made as I am as part of His Great Purpose, and my love made accordingly.

O'Carroll's struggle with his sexual identity movingly expresses the taste of mystery that is so intimately interwoven into the fabric of people's lives and into social situations of impasse. In a time of financial cutbacks, many see priorities crying out for time, effort, and money other than this perplexing problem in our society, particularly in our health care system. Yet somehow for me, the pedophilic patient is prophetic. Like any one of us, the pedophile asks to be recognized as a human being, to be loved with a love that expresses care and understanding; but it is a risk to love someone whose very being has failed so radically to fit the norms of society. The cry of the marginalized is demanding. In some unspecified way, they teach us about the depths of human existence and the utter mystery of being human--about our own vulnerability but also about humility. Moreover, the pedophile deeply knows moments of Christ's experience, the anguish of abandonment in the garden, the agony and desolation of being driven outside of the walls of the city, and the utter forsakenness of the cross. To appropriate and articulate theologically such personal and social experiences of impasse, Bechtle asserts, "one has to speak the language of paradox, of conflict, of the cross." One must struggle with the ways in which God hears and is present to human experience.

11"O'Carroll, Paedophilia, 18. A similar sentiment on the part of Michael, a homosexual ephelophile, toward an 18 year-old male was also caught by novelist Iris Murdoch in The Bell as follows: "He was conscious of such a fund of love and goodwill for the young creature beside him. It could not be that God intended such a spring of love to be quenched utterly. There must, there must be a way in which it could be made a power for good. Michael did not in that instant feel that it would be difficult to make it so:" see Murdoch, The Bell (London, England: Chatto & Windus, 1958; London, England: Penguin Books, 1962), 157.

God is present to us in a complex way that no one theology can encompass. Unless there is an ultimate reality, a love and a compassion that transcends our world, we can never speak of a God who sent his son into human history to heal our world. God as unconditional love is crucial for human hope. Only if God is incarnate in all beings can we ultimately make any positive sense of the pedophile’s longing for meaning and purpose. The problem is one of balancing understanding and explanation with the sense of mystery.

In Kegan’s mind support for this struggle "is not alone an affective matter but a matter of knowing; a matter of shape, as well as intensity." In my view, it is the gift of knowing and growth which permits caregivers’ faith to be enlightened about the complexity of pedophilia and permits the health care milieu to be caring. Therefore, the task facing theologians is to help professional caregivers to obtain a knowledge of pedophilia; to come to know and to re-know the pedophile as person; and to become those into whose face the pedophile can look and see love reflected. For as Kegan confidently claims:

Long-term relations and life in a community of considerable duration may be essential . . . if we are to be able to recollect ourselves. They may be essential to the human coherence of our lives, a coherence which is not found from looking into the faces of those who relieve us because we can see they know nothing of us when we were less than ourselves, but from looking into the faces of those who relieve us because they reflect our history in their faces, faces which we can look into finally without anger or shame, and which look back at us with love.

Within such an environment and without fear of how it appears to others or the worry of negative scornful reactions from caregivers, the pedophilic person can attain a greater degree of freedom to be more honest, factual, and insightful about himself and begin to reshape life, thoughts, feelings,

---

116 Kegan, "There the Dance," 432.

117 Kegan, "There the Dance," 434; idem, Evolving Self, 218.
personal and social relations, and sexual interests.\textsuperscript{118} To the degree that pedophiles are enabled to do this, both their interests and those of society will be served.

Further, to live out the likeness of Jesus, we are called to be compassionate. Compassion, for Matthew Fox, is a spirituality of maturity and "a way of living and walking through life."\textsuperscript{119} To be compassionate presupposes growth over a period of time—movement beyond the "beginning stages of spiritual searching to a fuller stage of dialectical living"\textsuperscript{120} that "seeks to know and to understand the inter-connections of all things."\textsuperscript{121} In fact, Fox views compassion that is truly directed outward as the new word for transcendence!\textsuperscript{122} The Gospel message presents a realization of this growth process. Regarding compassion Cardman comments:

Acceptance of the reality and the otherness of our own pain allows us to be touched by the pain of others. Compassion does not confuse the reality of the other with our own, or seek to overcome the pain of separation by the imposition of sameness. It acknowledges distance and limitation, yet reaches beyond them in love. . . . Compassionate love moves us to action, impelling us to struggle against suffering and injustice. . . . in refusing to allow evil to break the bonds of relationship, a spirituality of compassion extends the possibilities of life for all of us. . . . Compassion is both the mother and the daughter of hope. . . . In its turn, such hope generates the energy that allows us to extend the reach of our compassion.\textsuperscript{123}

The link between compassion and hope\textsuperscript{124} brings us back to Kegan who describes the human evolutionary process of meaning-making as the activity


\textsuperscript{119}Matthew Fox, A Spirituality Named Compassion and the Healing of the Global Village, Humpty Dumpty and Us (San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1979), 17, 30, 83.

\textsuperscript{120}Fox, Spirituality Named Compassion, 17.

\textsuperscript{121}Fox, Spirituality Named Compassion, 23, 84.

\textsuperscript{122}Fox, Spirituality Named Compassion, 16.

\textsuperscript{123}Cardman, "Liberating Compassion," 11.

\textsuperscript{124}Fox, Spirituality Named Compassion, vi.
of hope." Here theologians have a responsibility to proclaim confidently Christ's call to a spirituality of compassion. For what mental health professionals working with pedophiles most need is an evolving spirituality of compassion that helps and supports them to recognize the presence of Christ in their work.

Kegan emphasizes that growth and change can be costly for both the individual growing and the faith community of which the person is a member. Fowler also recognizes that one who has experienced a structural change in faith "finds it difficult to relate to the members of one's previous network of sustaining relations in faith . . . due to one's new ways of seeing and being." Religious traditions in which people grew up may be deemed no longer adequate vessels for the fundamental character of their current representation of ultimacy. If the community is not to lose its member, it must function fruitfully at many evolutionary levels, committing itself less to any particular evolutionary level than to the very process itself.

In the view of Jacques Maritain,

it is by no means easy to achieve impartiality and justice when dealing with problems that are orchestrated to the multitudinous sensibilities of human anguish and passion.

In Kegan's framework it is people in the interindividual balance who are able to grapple with such tensions, who are able to exercise their authority on behalf of facilitating the development of those around them, and who thereby have the qualities of leadership.

---

12 Kegan, Evolving Self, 45.


17 Kegan, "There the Dance," 434-435; idem, Over Our Heads, 276.


Love of God and love of neighbour obtain to a relationship of mutual conditioning to such an extent that Rahner can claim that

All love of neighbor is, by Jesus' own statement, love for him... There is no love for God that is not, in itself, already a love for neighbor; and love for God only comes to its own identity through its fulfilment in a love for neighbor. Only one who loves his or her neighbor can know who God actually is. And only one who ultimately loves God . . . can manage unconditionally to abandon himself or herself to another person. 130

Love is an encounter with the God who makes each person capable of love. How one constructs what is self and what is other is, for Kegan, how one constructs truth. 131 However, for Rahner, "truth is the consciousness of the person who gives himself or herself to others in love." 132

Likewise, Macquarrie stresses that a human person is not an isolated being, but rather a "being-with-others." 133 A focus on the salvation of the individual at the expense of the rest of humankind is a distortion of Christian soteriology; for there is no development into a whole person without relationships to other persons--because we are bound one to another in this web of life. In light of the theological notion of humankind, the relationship between the individual person and the social ordering of human life is one of responsibility; for we are all capable of becoming fully human, loving beings.

In Christian terms, by becoming one with us, Christ summons each of us to wholeness and unites all of us in Him. "The belief of being bound to a personal God consists, to a very important degree, of an ethical conception of life." 134 As religious studies specialist Antonio Gualtieri argues, a religious tradition, through its myths, sets of values, rituals, explicit codes, world view, material culture, presuppositions about reality, personal

130Rahner, Practice of Faith, 8, 136.

131Kegan, Evolving Self, 114.

132Rahner, Practice of Faith, 12.

133Macquarrie, "Theology of Personal Being," 177.

paradigms, and participation in a community way of life, communicates ontological and normative attitudes towards the world that have decisive impact on morality and lifestyle.\textsuperscript{135}

The theological perspective which I have presented, I believe rests comfortably with French theologian Maurice Bellet's view of morality which follows:

La morale est d'abord l'art de vivre; elle partage de l'art le goût créatif, la liberté, le désir d'oeuvrer, communique, le sens de la maturation et de l'essai, la présence du corps et de la matière et selon ce qu'ils sont---la peinture ou la danse, c'est esprit et matière, et l'un par l'autre.\textsuperscript{136}

In short, concludes Bellet, "la morale est l'art d'aimer... paroles et actions--pas seulement comme actes mais comme réalisation." It is "dans le fruit, dans ce qui se donne de l'être humain et va vers l'autre."\textsuperscript{137} In addition, like spirituality, ethics presupposes a lived experience and a personal grasp of moral values.\textsuperscript{138} In my view, what humankind does about pedophilia will be determined largely by our values, attitudes, and beliefs; the manner in which we love; and the spirituality by which our lives are moved, and guided.

The principle of self-transcendence, integral to constructive-developmental theory, assures us (1) of our potential for human development; and (2) of our ability to change, to choose, and to create a health care environment based on a paradigm that permits the process of meaning-making


\textsuperscript{137}Bellet, "De la Morale Comme Art d'Aimer," 24-25.

and personal-development for all. As I demonstrated in chapter three, this principle is employed in theological, psychological and ethical projects. It explains why one can (a) anticipate escaping the powerful historical and psychological forces that bind us to a preoccupation with punishment; (b) point persistently to a change beyond vengeance; and (c) express hope of transcending each existing level of consciousness so that a more-mature way of being-in-the-world may emerge and better modes of discharging responsibilities can be created with regard to caring for pedophiles. Furthermore, in Kegan’s view, Piaget’s, Kohlberg’s, and Gilligan’s work suggests that people are natural ethicists. Since Kegan’s theory is Neo-Piagetian and Neo-Kohlbergian, it also implies “natural ethics” which I shall now demonstrate.

5.2 The Ethical Aspect

"Ethics" has become the buzzword of the nineties, particularly since all are touched in some way by the ethical issues raised by biomedical technology and health care. The issue of pedophilia occasions bitter disputes: (1) communities demand to be informed by police when convicted pedophiles are released from prison; (2) the public and the media demand longer prison terms or the death penalty, claiming that a short prison sentence for the pedophile offends the victim; (3) some bishops ban pedophilic members from church premises; and (4) major controversies exist about how to reconstruct the justice system and how to contain costs. Such controversies grab our attention almost on a daily basis, captivate the "monsterizing" aspect of our imagination, but fail to engage the creative and constructive aspects. Because of the emotive quality of this issue, it is fodder for newspaper headlines and television documentaries. There is scarcely an individual who has not read about, heard about and discussed.

139 chap. 3:121

140 Kegan, “There the Dance,” 406, 436; idem, “Kohlberg and Psychology,” 176.
in all probability, this major societal issue; yet few recognize that it also involves how we understand ourselves as human beings and that it is an issue in ethics. A better understanding of what it means to be fully human has implications for arguments in ethics, if in no other way than to undermine the punitive attitudes arising from a truncated notion of human development. It seems accurate to say that truly sophisticated ethical and humane behaviour derives from the most complex order of human consciousness. Kegan's levels of personality development have parallels in moral theology and in the quality of being ethical.

In society's view, pedophilia is wrong--therefore punishment is in order. There is a tendency to go back to what is familiar--historically we have severely punished pedophiles. Tugging relentlessly, ethics pulls us forward. The task of ethics is to challenge people's thinking by holding-up what ought to--and can--be. Already we have done this concerning persons with disabilities, women, and black people. Pedophilia represents a further test case. Accordingly, we need a view of ethics that is not simply juridical. This is where theology not only enters, as I have shown, but virtually explodes in our faces! This is also where Kegan's constructive-developmental framework proves helpful by revealing to mental health professionals the elements of, and barriers to, conditions that are necessary for development of an ethic of care and a spirituality of compassion.\textsuperscript{14} In describing the role of theological ethics, Guindon states:

Christian faith refers to an anthropology and to an ethics which are not of its own making. To acknowledge that much in honesty and humility is already a redeeming attitude.\textsuperscript{15}

\textsuperscript{14}Fox argues that while compassion includes ethics, it is not an ethical system. Being "the fullest experience of God that is humanly possible . . . it blossoms and balloons to something greater than ethics--to celebration of life and relief, where possible, of others' pain:" see Fox, \textit{Spirituality Named Compassion}, 30.

\textsuperscript{15}Guindon, \textit{Sexual Creatures}, 13.
To speak of a theological ethics does not imply the existence of two ethics. Rather, it suggests that ethics needs to reflect experiential evidence as well as the authentic proclamation of faith, namely, the way in which God relates to us in faith, and to bring this evidence and proclamation to fruition in our daily lives. Furthermore, theological ethics is not about God. ‘It is language about ourselves and about our action in the world.’ Thus informed by our faith in God, theological ethics indirectly speaks about God.

A handful of mental health care professionals have begun to recognize that existing punitive attitudes and criminogenic models have failed to solve problems and meet needs of pedophilic persons. They sense that current paradigms are out of touch with reality itself and what it means to be fully human. Central to the problem is the spectre of subordinating humanity to the despotic whims of the pleasure/unpleasure principle, idiosyncratic perceptions (i.e., monsterizing), or impulsive vengeance—rather than allowing the therapeutic process to become instrumental in developing and refining humankind to more-completely whole persons. By incorporating an alternative theory—that of constructive-development—into the notion of mental health care, one can recognize that punishment is an inadequate foundation for the well-being of patients. Ultimately, attitudes, responsible decision making, and actions need to be rooted in what it means to become fully human and to develop psychologically, physically, spiritually, and ethically.

Havelock Ellis was one of the earliest clinicians to become conscious of and concerned about physicians’ attitudes of horror toward patients who came for help regarding “psychic sexual anomalies.” Ellis found that patients repeatedly complained that their physicians had treated them as

---

14 Guindon, Sexual Creators, 14.

"vicious, wicked, perhaps disgusting persons."\textsuperscript{145} He noted that these same physicians were being trained with little or no instruction in sexuality, the psycho-physical processes of sex, or sexual dysfunctions. It had been assumed, Ellis argued, "that there is but one pattern"\textsuperscript{146} of sex-life. Ellis countered with a more-comprehensive viewpoint which considers the clinical experience of himself and others such as Freud and shows "that there are as many patterns as there are individuals."\textsuperscript{147} For him, the time had come to change basic assumptions about humanity and human possibility. He was convinced that "not only is it a hopeless task to deal with sexual varieties as immoralities or crimes, but the moral system is thereby discredited by its failures."\textsuperscript{148} Ellis urged the scientific and medical community to understand sexual anomalies, treat them if necessary, but not condemn them.\textsuperscript{149} He maintained that there is much still to be effected by the growth, which we are bound to expect, of a more enlightened attitude in society. . . . we should facilitate the medical, or even surgical, treatment of those who wish to escape from what they may find a burden, congenital or acquired, too heavy to be borne. We must aim not only to be just, but also to be sympathetic.\textsuperscript{150}

Because medicine, like society, had riveted its focus on a single ideal of sexual normality, the vision of what it means to be human was truncated. Ellis believed that we need to regard ourselves as sexual beings in the midst of a field of neither "seed alone or soil alone"\textsuperscript{151}--neither solely the constitutional nor solely the acquired. Hence, both discovery and

\textsuperscript{145}Ellis, Psychology of Sex, 12.
\textsuperscript{146}Ellis, Psychology of Sex, 112.
\textsuperscript{147}Ellis, Psychology of Sex, 112.
\textsuperscript{148}Ellis, Psychology of Sex, 150.
\textsuperscript{149}Ellis, Psychology of Sex, 113.
\textsuperscript{150}Ellis, Psychology of Sex, 159-160.
\textsuperscript{151}Ellis, Psychology of Sex, 13.
treatment of sexual variations require information about humanity and its sexual nature.

Moreover, Ellis was aware that "the moral situation," as he termed it, is not rigid and unchangeable but, rather, in perpetual transition. He therefore urged physicians to embrace a full sense of responsibility with respect to "the subject of sex in its psychic and social bearings." Always conscious of "the special situation of the individual patient," the physician, argued Ellis, must be alive to the large and splendid part he is entitled to play in working for the welfare of the community, and as medical adviser in the education of the whole people, takes part in this transformation of morals.

Implicit in Ellis' notion of responsibility is dialogue amongst history, science, medicine, religion, morality, and social convention. As I see it, Kegan's theory, which embraces both the individual and the societal, in conjunction with Kegan's image of the human person as both a question and an answer--represents a fuller alternative way to conceive Ellis' notion of responsibility.

Concerning sexual psychopathology, in the late-nineteenth century, Krafft-Ebing also recognized that there is a broader picture. There are other aspects concerning humanity that need to be integrated into law and jurisprudence; namely, psychopathology, anthropology, and clinical investigation. Failure to do so undermines the good of society. Krafft-Ebing believed:

A judge who considers only the crime, and not its perpetrator, is always in danger of injuring not only important interests of society (general morality and safety), but also those of the individual (honour).

\[12^{\text{Ellis, Psychology of Sex, 14.}}
\]

\[13^{\text{Ellis, "Preface," in Psychology of Sex, 6.}}
\]

\[14^{\text{Ellis, Psychology of Sex, 14.}}
\]

\[15^{\text{Krafft-Ebing, Psychopathia Sexualis, 501.}}
\]
Humanity has struggled and is struggling, he argued, to deal with "sexual delinquencies;" the greater number and variety of aspects of humankind that can be served, the greater the social good. Moreover, as Krafft-Ebing correctly points out, the interests of society cannot be sought at the expense of the interests of the individual. In order for overall human well-being to be achieved, individual members of society must have more than merely punitive motivations at heart. The key is not to allow the nature of the act to become equated with punishment. Such values as safety, public morality, and human respect can only be promoted as part of a wider notion of social good.

As Karpman later pointed out: in dealing with sex offenders, swift, harsh, punitive goals have long been considered paramount. Such goals remain important for the vacuum they fill in psychiatric service, sexological study, and research into criminal psychopathology.\(^{156}\) However, as Karpman reminds us:

"The witch-hunt is as old as the history of hate... Nowadays we do not believe in witches, but we still thoroughly enjoy hunting them in the person of whatever minority group can be made the subject of hysterical prejudice and mob psychology..."

"... New sets of circumstances are created, or disproportionately exaggerated, to bring into operation the same hysterical reaction that prevailed in past times and in communities which we now call 'ignorant'..."

"... Hostility is an emotion that is experienced by every human being... discharged on any situation that represents a danger or a threat... It is on this basis of free-floating hostility that one may explain the readiness with which human beings plunge into situations that provide opportunity for the discharge of their hostility, and... the reaction of social aggression against particular individuals who happen to incur the enmity of the group."\(^{157}\)

Nevertheless, suggests Karpman, conditions exist today that indicate a need for a shift from a preoccupation with hostile and punitive goals. For Karpman, what is at stake is "psychotherapy rather than brutalizing punishment."\(^{156}\)

\(^{156}\)Karpman, Sexual Offender, 285, 287, 289.

\(^{157}\)Karpman, Sexual Offender, 470-472.

\(^{158}\)Karpman, Sexual Offender, 289.
As part of the solution, Krafft-Ebing called for cooperation rather than opposition between law and medicine. Currently, insofar as offensive sexual behaviour and sexological knowledge and research is concerned, Money judges the law and the science of sexology to be hopelessly at odds. In his view:

the law is the repository of the sexual taboo of our society, and the institution of its enforcement.... Medicine, itself of venerable antiquity, allies itself conservatively with sexual taboo and the law, and only slowly assimilates the findings of sexological science in spearheading reform of the law.\footnote{Krafft-Ebing, Psychopathia Sexualis, 500-501.}

For Money, the time to change is now; for

benign medical intervention on behalf of sex offenders could be a wedge that opens the door to transforming social and legal policy in a humane way towards all of mankind's sexuality. This is no time for a cop-out, but a time for combined scientific, medical, and social action.\footnote{Money and Weinrich, "Juvenile, Pedophile, Heterophile," 52.}

For Money, what we are dealing with is human tragedy for which there is some explanation and a way to help.\footnote{Money, "Diffusion of Sexological Knowledge," 250.} What is at stake is transformation and humaneness as well as cooperation between societal systems of knowing and action.

Likewise, with regard to intervention, case management, and goals in child sexual abuse situations, Finkelhor, Gomes-Schwartz, and Horowitz note the high degree of institutional insularity, mistrust, and disagreement among community agencies such as those of child protection, youth services, schools, criminal justice, and mental health. These researchers express the concern that such factors can be countertherapeutic and can have unfortunate, community-wide implications.\footnote{John Money, "Pornography in the Home: A Topic in Medical Education," in Contemporary Sexual Behavior, ed. Zubin and Money, 435-436.} Lack of cooperation among agencies, for example, can result in child sexual abusers quitting or refusing to

\footnote{Finkelhor, New Theory & Research, 200-215.}
participate in treatment, whereas collaboration can improve treatment outcome.  

Hence, Finkelhor et al. call for greater collaboration among community agencies.

However, as social ethicist Kenneth Melchin points out, collaborative designs and structures of social living are conditioned by a recurrent sense of mutual trust and empathy in interpersonal discourse. Empathy bonds groups of people together in such a way that the suffering of others is felt, their joys shared, and their well-being is sought; and outrage is felt when injustice is done them. Moreover, argues Melchin:

for discourse to issue in cooperative living requires that all participants receive recurrent confirmation from each other that our lives will not be threatened when we turn our attention away from bodily self-defence to focus on our participation in the projects which promise to improve our collective living. When such confirmation is not recurrently forthcoming then social living becomes radically ambiguous. For the projects which have been built upon the foundations of this mutual trust begin to crumble as time, attention, resources, and human will are drawn away from them to focus more and more on self-defence and retribution in the subtly escalating war of all against all.  

Furthermore, all of our projects of daily living, whether of an economic, social, political, cultural, health care, or religious nature—are sustained by the fabric of common identity and good will. In turn, as I have shown, it is our experiences of trustworthiness which ground our subsequent disposition to cooperate and trust. By contrast, recurrent experiences of violation of trust result in fear and the suspicion that cooperative living is too perilous.

Developmental theory, such as that of Kegan, helps us to recognize that an adult caregiver who had been abused and/or not sufficiently

\[16\text{Finkelhor, New Theory 

& Research, 214.}\]


\[16\text{Melchin, "Structure of Cooperative Living," 511-512.}\]
nourished and held as an infant—will be unable to trust or to hope." Further, Kegan shows how an adult caregiver who is embedded in the impulsive order of consciousness is caught up in her own point of view; is narrowly focused on that individual's own field rather than the bigger, more-complex picture; and is unable to cooperate with another. Thus, cooperation is conditioned by one's development of an increasingly more sophisticated order of consciousness or way of knowing.

Moreover, Kegan's framework helps us to identify the dominant punitive paradigm operative within health care's response to pedophiles and to situate that model within the various levels of human development and knowing. Constructive-developmental theory provides empirical evidence (1) that a punitive model is inadequate to explain reality and (2) that within the moral realm people do grow. There is growth in the capacity to love and to care for others and in the ability to create and to nurture more and more complex social relationships. Thus, our notion of self is inextricably connected with our understanding of moral and ethical agency. The art of living together in social relationships isn't just self-sufficiency and autonomy, as the modernists claim, but rather something much broader which lies within the realm of ethics. Therefore, punitiveness is not all one can expect from people; and punitiveness is not what one requires regarding pedophiles in order to take care of the social good.

If, according to developmental theory, the person—the mental health professional—grows in the ethical realm into a caring, loving person with increasing capacities to live in complex social arrangements, and if constructive-developmental theory touches every aspect of living in groups and communities, then at its heart dare one say that it might be a theory of ethics? If this is so, then ethics and developmental theory need not be

---

Similarly, Erikson's developmental theory illustrates (1) how the infant's sense of trust reflects the parent's own sense of autonomy as well as the degree of autonomy which parents grant to their infants and children; and (2) how unreasonable shaming creates mistrust in the infant: see Erikson, Identity: Youth and Crisis, 110-113.
mutually exclusive. Instead they could be a powerful combination—the former prescribing what can and ought to be and the latter describing what is. Robert Fuller sees ethics

as the effort to reflect on how we might best go about caring for ourselves and others in the course of practical, day-to-day living. Viewed in this way, ethical reflection can and must build upon empirical information supplied by the natural and social sciences concerning those forms of conduct that will most likely contribute to the maximum satisfaction of the individual and the larger community of living organisms of which that individual is a part.\textsuperscript{168}

Fuller explains that "care is not simply a subjective sentiment. It is a developmental achievement that depends in part, upon a favorable environment" and "finding a deeper mutuality with others in friendship, love, and parenting."\textsuperscript{169}

In Guindon's view, "ethics is primarily a discourse on our humanity"\textsuperscript{170}—"a search for that which makes human beings human,"\textsuperscript{171} and an ongoing discernment of what humanizes. Therefore, Kegan's framework becomes an analytical tool for interpreting the process of development into full humanity; for as Guindon posits: the truth of ethics "lies in our becoming."\textsuperscript{172} Theologically, men and women are humanized through interpersonal communion and through carving in themselves the image of God.\textsuperscript{173} Moral-developmental theory, in particular that of Kegan, provides an internal structure which harmonizes with the quest for meaning which is also the quest of ethics and theology.\textsuperscript{174}

Moreover, as philosopher Thomas McCarthy reminds us:

\textsuperscript{166} Fuller, \textit{Ecology of Care}, 11.

\textsuperscript{169} Fuller, \textit{Ecology of Care}, 54.

\textsuperscript{170} Guindon, \textit{Sexual Creators}, viii.

\textsuperscript{171} Guindon, \textit{Sexual Creators}, 12.

\textsuperscript{172} Guindon, \textit{Sexual Creators}, 15.

\textsuperscript{173} Guindon, \textit{Sexual Creators}, 29.

inasmuch as individuation and socialization are two aspects of the same process, personal identity is interwoven with a fabric of relations of mutual recognition. This brings with it a reciprocal vulnerability that calls for guarantees of mutual consideration to preserve both the integrity of individuals and the web of interpersonal relations in which they form and stabilize their identities. Both of these concerns--with the dignity and inviolability of the person and with the good of the community as a whole--have been at the heart of traditional moralities.\textsuperscript{175}

It is our shared understanding of the structures of everyday life that informs the schemes of interpretation and normative expectations which we bring to social situations. At the level of everyday social interactions, we take ourselves to be--and assume others to be--"knowledgeable subjects confronted by real choices, for which we and they will be held accountable."\textsuperscript{176} This means that as individual actors we are accountable to the other, meet or fail to meet the other’s expectations, and answer either "yes" or "no" to the claims made by others.

McCarthy’s concern for the dignity of the person and the good of the whole community is reminiscent of Krafft-Ebing’s similar expression of regard for the individual and the social good which he argued is the task of both judge and medical practitioner. It also reflects the stance of Berlin who espouses values such as compassion, understanding, forgiveness, and reformation--all of which emerge from a sense of our shared humanity.\textsuperscript{177} However, of equal significance is McCarthy’s observation that personal identity is interwoven with the web of interpersonal relationships of mutual recognition. As Kegan himself states, his cognitive-developmental theory is aimed at this life-long activity of recognizing and being recognized; for this is irreducibly the primary human motion of meaning-knowing.\textsuperscript{178}


\textsuperscript{176}McCarthy, \textit{Ideals and Illusions}, 121.

\textsuperscript{177}Berlin and Krout, "Diagnostic Concepts, Treatment, and Ethical Considerations," 23.

\textsuperscript{178}Kegan, \textit{Evolving Self}, 16-19.
A constructive-developmental way of seeing others carries with it (1) an increased vulnerability to being recruited to the wellbeing of others, (2) greater responsibility in our response-ability, and (3) the risks of caring and of being a valuable factor in another's development. "In running these risks" argues Kegan, "we preserve the connections between us. We enhance the life we share, or perhaps better put, we enhance the life that shares us." Theologically, that which shares us, is God. Even in adversity, our ability to understand someone whom we were previously unable to understand renders us vulnerable to recruitment, increases the likelihood of our being moved and of our recognizing that the other's experience is meaningful.179 From Guindon's perspective, the role of the ethicist and ethics is to listen with attentiveness and empathy, to reflect the experience of persons such as O'Carroll who seek to make sense of their sexual being and lifestyle, and to articulate the meaning and sexual anthropology inherent in the experience.180

This is not to suggest that pedophilic behaviour should go unaddressed. Rather, it is to suggest that before someone deals with pedophilic behaviour, that person must see, must recognize, and be moved toward the pedophilic person. It is to suggest that pedophilic behaviour is the vulnerable exercise of that person's sexual being. It is to suggest that when the pedophilic patient feels recognized and has a sense that the caregiver understands the patient's experience (whether it is how the caregiver experiences it or not), the pedophile can find societal limit-setting tolerable and even a relief; if the pedophilic patient does not feel recognized, the patient will resent limits-setting as a violation of who he is and understandably so.

The risk the caregiver takes in understanding the pedophilic patient is not that of losing the sense of the harmful or destructive nature of

180Guindon, Sexual Creators, 12-13
pedophilic behaviour or of being paralysed in efforts to help to change the behaviour. The risk the professional runs is that in seeing the pedophilic patient as a person--frightened, self-loathing, self-harming, suicidal, confused about and struggling with why he is sexually attracted to children--the caregiver will be moved by and toward the patient. Our lives as members of society depend on mental health professionals and policy makers running this risk; for as the scientific evidence on pedophilia suggests, we are all vulnerable to pedophilic behaviour.

Today both developmental psychology and theology can account for our emergence into personhood and the fullness of humanity that goes far beyond the punitiveness revealed by the empirical data on the attitudes of mental health professionals toward pedophiles in their care. To apply Kegan's constructive-developmental theory to this evidence is not to judge or push away the punitive caregiver but rather to embrace the caregiver and present a fuller vision of what it means to be human. Punitiveness, by itself, is an inadequate attribute for the concept of person; certain characteristics of this attitude on the part of the caregiver are more representative of an early stage of personal development. Dependent upon the underlying philosophical notion of the self-transcending principle, developmental theories, such as that of Kegan, provide a new paradigm for professional behaviour, in that they are particular perceptions of reality with assumptions about the purpose of life and a value structure that is ultimate.

Indeed, Kegan's approach holds various disciplines in tension. He assumes that each perspective contributes to a fuller understanding of human phenomena, no one perspective being privileged or adequate by itself. His work, while not being ethics, per se, provides a pathway for mental health practitioners to follow and an opportunity to think through such fundamental issues as why one should strive to be ethical, by furnishing us with a notion of human wholeness and the final context of enhancing "the life that
In so doing, Kegan's psychological theory of personal development, abetted by well-integrated, philosophical, and theological insights, summons therapeutic theory and practice to a rebirth. Today and in the future a reasonable estimate of treatment process and outcomes must allow for the fact that, unless therapeutic treatment of pedophiles is to be paralysed by recurrent outbursts on the part of outraged humanity, it must satisfy criteria which are not purely clinical. Further, it must evaluate which professionals are able to provide relations and human contexts which support people through the often difficult process of growth and change and more accurately express the true nature and destiny of humankind.

Ethical problems in health care are not primarily the result of progress in medical technology but are inherent in the relationship of the practitioner and patient. Ethics is more than right and wrong actions; it is also concerned about attitudes, worldview, and one's fundamental stance to life. It involves the specific moral development of the practitioners or moral agents who must decide about and respond to clients.

Ethics is about (1) meaning and human understanding, (2) relationships and greater openness to others, and (3) one's own freedom and enhancing that of others. It is a reasoned approach to conditions and situations of life. Consequently, Kegan's theory of the evolving self becomes identifiable as a holistic, ethical perspective in which changes occur. It offers an alternative paradigm to the view of ethics as episodic occasions for ethical decision making. From the perspective of Kegan's theory, "the ethical situation" is the life of the person as a whole and attitudes are one expression of the moral fibre of the person. Accordingly, the ethical question is primarily: "What kind of person shall I become?" and secondarily: "How shall I become it?" Endeavouring to "become" is the problem of co-creating cultures of embeddedness that facilitate one's overcoming exte-

---

Kegan, Evolving Self, 20.
nal and internal obstacles or blockages to growth. This understanding undergirds Kegan's framework.

A primary focus of this section has been on the relation of constructive-developmental psychology to theology and ethics as a source of truth about humanity which can revitalize the aims and objectives of health care professionals. Having sketched this brief profile of self-creating personal development attained only in relationship with others, we can now see the latticework of causal interactions such as that of human values and environmental conditions which enable the person, in time, to care for others, enter into and nurture increasingly complex relationships, develop a concern for the well-being of others, and assume social responsibilities. We can also see how constructive-developmental theory reconfigures the empirical data and the ethical import.

In the human scheme, personhood is formed by interaction with others in the practices of daily living. The more fully one is able to organize one's environment in order to create meaning, and the more skillfully one participates in social groups, the more one emerges from society as a whole person. Meaning-making, the primary human motion, cannot be divorced from the experience of the caregiver nor that of the pedophilic patient. There is meaning in all we do; a world of meaning surrounds every event. A view of humanity, as such, provides some basis for critique of contemporary treatment of pedophiles. Increased self-knowledge, self-responsibility and autonomy, freedom of choice concerning the direction of one's life, and full development of the human person are the criteria of good therapy. We can now reconceptualize therapy as patterns of human relationships.

---


183 Freud emphasized that the aim of psychoanalysts is education of the patient "to liberate and fulfill his own nature, not to resemble ourselves:" see Sigmund Freud, "Lines of Advance in Psycho-Analytic Therapy," in *Standard Edition*, 17:165.
recurring within the context of meaning-constitutive evolutionary activity.\textsuperscript{184} In fact, psychoanalyst Thomas Szasz actually states that the problem the patient is attempting to solve is that of giving meaning to his life.\textsuperscript{185} The purpose of this description is ethical; it situates psychotherapy within a field of human activities and values which are distinctively moral. But what does this imply for mental health professionals and their practice?

5.3 Conclusion: What Can Be Done?

According to theorists such as Halloran, Allport, Murphy, the Sheriffs, and the Lamberts, attitudes can be changed, although not easily.\textsuperscript{186} Growth, emotional catharsis, self-insight, communication, social interaction (i.e., face-to-face contacts, group discussions), training, psychological process, and a period of emotional disorganization are necessary for change to occur. Similarly, Kegan believes, as I do, that people do grow and are educable. A combination of challenge and support facilitate the developmental process.\textsuperscript{187} Theology is not directly articulated but is implicit in what follows.

Caring for pedophiles within the health care system places upon mental health professionals a complex set of tasks, responsibilities, expectations, and what Kegan terms demands on "our minds, on how we know, on the complex-

\textsuperscript{184}In the 1965 preface to the first edition of his book on ethics and psychoanalysis, psychoanalyst Thomas Szasz described psychotherapy not as healing but as social action. In the preface to the 1988 edition of the same work Szasz labelled psychotherapy "mental healing" and described same as "a particular type of human relationship:" see Szasz, \textit{Ethics of Psychoanalysis}, xii, xvi.


\textsuperscript{187}Kegan, \textit{Over Our Heads}, 42, 293-294.
ity of our consciousness." The empirical evidence detailed in chapter two suggests that many caregivers are mismatched for such specialized work. The question is how to help them attain an order of consciousness which would enable them to care for the pedophilic patient.

In short, Card suggests asking therapists to examine their motives for offering their services to pedophilic clients. If punishment is an element of their motivation, they should be requested to resolve this problem or to offer their services to another client population. Secondly, Card recommends training for professionals working in this area of psychotherapy. In addition, he supports allowing pedophilic patients to have a choice of, and opportunity to change, therapists. Likewise, Cox argues that therapists who are unable to resolve their emotions toward, and their own position on, pedophilia should not become involved in forensic practice.

Harold Lief, an American medical educator, along with others such as John Money and Renée Fox, advocate programs of sex education for medical students and physicians: namely, a core curriculum to be followed by electives. Citing information and skills as important dimensions of such sex education, Lief viewed attitude training as the key to education in human sexuality, arguing that to teach facts alone is insufficient. I agree with him but also would press for sex education for all health care professionals, not just medical students.

Helping the clinician to be more comfortable with his own sexuality would lead to less anxiety or embarrassment on the part of the clinician, better counseling skills, and greater information being elicited from

---

188 Kegan, Over Our Heads, 5.
190 Cox, "Caregiver's Dilemma," 88-90.
192 Harold I. Lief, "Obstacles to the Ideal and Complete Sex Education of the Medical Student and Physician," in Contemporary Sexual Behavior, ed. Zubin and Money, 441-453, 446.
patients. Money suggests that medical students' exposure to pornography in medical school would lead to an increased awareness of their own sexual arousal, hence, to nonjudgmentalism, and to less alarm when this occurs in a clinical situation.

Lief et al. believe that increased awareness of the broad range of and the various influences (i.e., biologic, cultural, and so on) on sexual behaviour contributes to increased tolerance of deviant behaviour. Recognizing one's inability to escape one's own values but also the danger of imposing one's values on a patient, Lief recommends assisting clinicians to develop awareness of their own sets of values and beliefs. Diane Uustal, a nurse, also encourages the use of values clarification to enhance personal as well as professional growth; to contribute to giving optimal, sensitive care to any patient; to reduce pretentiousness and defensiveness; and to produce greater self-confidence and better motivated and action-oriented behaviour.

Kegan's framework shows that attitudes come from how one does, or does not, know. Attitude training, therefore, would involve desensitization, sensitization, and integration. Through the process of desensitization, inappropriate defence mechanisms such as avoidance, anger, or superior attitudes would be decreased. The process of sensitization could be employed to enable clinicians to become more sensitive to their patients' feelings and attitudes. Integration of factual information along with changed atti-

---


14Lief, "Obstacles to the Ideal," 444.

15Lief, "Obstacles to the Ideal," 441, 445.


17Kegan, Over Our Heads, 19.
tudes would result in more-effective therapy. Barnard et al. find that weekly support group sessions for therapists engaged in sex offender treatment programs contributes to high morale by drawing therapists into a caring group, helps staff become aware of each other's stresses, and allows problems to be addressed before they become serious. Similarly, Charles Taylor and Kevin R. Graham, coordinators of the sex offender treatment program at Westmorland Correctional Institution in New Brunswick, strongly endorse the role of counselor supervision as necessary to providing a therapeutic relationship with sex offenders, objectifying the therapeutic alliance, resolving countertransference issues, and sensitively approaching the sex offender with respect and care.

Hungarian psychoanalyst Michael Balint speaks of physicians' need for something more than the techniques which they learned in medical school. More than knowledge or facts, the something else "cannot be taught; only discovered." To enable general practitioners to focus on the atmosphere created by the physicians for their patients; to share experiences; to gain insight into the nature of their work; to identify misplacement of emotions; to rethink aspects of their physician-patient relationship, their ways of responding to, looking at, and listening to, patients; to tolerate uneasiness and incoherence more comfortably; and to harness their discomfort for the benefit of their patients, Balint and his wife set up and extensively

---


\(^{19}\) Barnard et al., Child Molester, 151.


researched the workings of Balint Groups. The fundamental assumption underlying Balint's work was that "the aim of all human striving is to establish—or, probably, re-establish—an all-embracing harmony with one's environment, to be able to live in peace."\textsuperscript{302}

The Balints' research revealed that object-relations based work in the group fosters moments of change in the context of relationship for both patients and physicians. Such moments as these can incorporate productive new attitudes and practices.\textsuperscript{303} It proved effective for the Balint group, consisting of eight to ten practitioners and a psychoanalyst-facilitator, to meet weekly for about an hour-and-a-half. In an atmosphere of exploration and in the spirit of honesty and openness, participants present patient situations from memory. Through encouragement of fresh observations from colleagues, the aim is to illuminate one another. What has been found to prevent practitioners from caring appropriately was failure to be emotionally present to patients.\textsuperscript{304} This was due to such factors as feelings generated in the practitioner, hidden ideologies, personal worldview, bias brought to every observation and decision, as well as previously unconsidered thoughts and actions.

Balint groups need not be restricted to physicians.\textsuperscript{305} Extending groups to other health care professionals and adopting an interdisciplinary format would more adequately reflect ethical discourse, a characteristic of which is multidisciplinarity. For several years I belonged to a multidisciplinary, informal, "bioethics discussion group" the goal of which was not unlike that of Balint groups. Mindful of being participants in a dialogue, members listened to the opinions of others, examined their own

\textsuperscript{302}Balint, \textit{Basic Fault}, 55.

\textsuperscript{303}Balint et al., \textit{Balint Revisited}, 31.

\textsuperscript{304}Balint et al., \textit{Balint Revisited}, 46-52.

ideologies, philosophy, biases, terms of reference, and alleged objectivity as decision makers. In the process assumptions were challenged and members were encouraged to clarify glaring inconsistencies and contradictions. By the end of the first year of meeting, members had discovered how important the process of interdisciplinary dialogue and the exchange of values is to ethical reasoning. Through interdisciplinary cooperation, all aspects of case studies were examined, causes and effects were identified, new insights were gained into problems, and creative alternatives for responsible action were put forth. As a result of the process, group members were able to experience a greater sense of solidarity with their clients: namely, the sick, the suffering, and the marginalized.

Members discovered that the meaning and task of ethics includes, but is not limited to: (1) respecting the autonomy of persons; (2) fashioning a common perspective within which the important issues are discussed; (3) engaging in critical discourse about what we see and say; and (4) allocating scarce resources. We noted that by listening only to the voice of the law other voices such as those of health care and ethics are not heard, the ethical questions are not raised, and alternatives are not created nor examined. Focus on the law as the sole approach to pedophilia can preclude ethics. For rehabilitation and therapeutic care to be effective, rather than focusing on further refinements in statutes, we need to focus, as I have done in this thesis, on the discourse that should and must occur among other disciplines such as psychiatry, medicine, social work, nursing, ethics, theology, anthropology, sexology, biology, sociology, and history.²⁶

The law informs members of a society as to what they can and cannot do. On the other hand, theology asks transcendental questions such as what is the purpose and meaning of life? A sociobiological perspective asks if

²⁶Bullough calls for "an open, interdisciplinary, and scholarly discussion and challenge to existing and perhaps prematurely arrived at views:" see Bullough, "History of Adult Human Sexual Behavior," 85.
some individuals have a proclivity towards pedophilic behaviour or is such behaviour adaptive? If so, how does pedophilic behaviour evolve? What factors determine it? Anthropology queries whether adult human sexual behaviour with children has a function. Ethics seeks the meaning and impact of decisions and actions, and concerns itself with the well-being and the needs of all parties involved. We need to look at the circumstances of the concrete situations of pedophiles and to examine the reality in which we live. Pedophilia is a human issue between people--everyone counts. Regardless of the specific clauses built into laws, if this ethical discourse fails, rehabilitation and therapeutic care fail.

Nevertheless, even if these suggestions prove useful, changing attitudes is more than programs. It is a process which takes the form of soul-searching, self-analysis, and collegial dialogue. Such work is not the flavour of the month. There is a tremendous need for organizational support for this work and for creating an environment and establishing a model conducive to such growth.
SUMMARY

The problem which I have addressed in this dissertation project belongs to practical or applied ethics since it involves human action. My work is primarily a study presenting—from a particular angle—certain concerns and conclusions arising out of the scientific literature and my clinical experience in a psychiatric institution. It is a problem incident to a new realization of the role of theology and ethics.

In chapter one I showed how ancient Greek civilization for awhile kept its eye focused on 'paidophilia' as a "value." The ancient Jews, Egyptians, and later the Romans branded pederasty as a crime and instituted laws and punishments as a response. Christianity boldly set out the principles of a solution to adult-child sexual contact in its construct of "sin" and "immorality" but advanced little into the depth and darkness of the mystery of pedophilia. Today, medicine has begun to cultivate a complex field left fallow for centuries.

Evidence in chapter two indicates that health care professionals working in institutions where pedophiles should especially be considered as needing treatment and care—generally lack understanding of the phenomenon, hold the view of pedophilia as immorality and criminal offence and have punitive attitudes toward pedophiles in their care. Theorists suggest that something more than punishment is required in order to yield the "good" of the pedophile and the community; "but," I asked: "are punitive attitudes all we can expect of professional caregivers?"

In chapter three I presented Robert Kegan's constructive-developmental theory which I argued describes a "natural ethic" and could serve as a framework for analysing caregivers' punitive attitudes. Hence, in chapter four using Kegan’s theory, I compared and contrasted different views of human being; sketched the ethical models used by health care professionals; and demonstrated a correlation between levels of ethical sophistication and differences of attitudes toward pedophiles. To adopt a medical construction of pedophilia requires ethical sophistication: namely, an interindividual
ethics by Kegan's standard. Kegan's framework reflects humankind's capacity to grow, to choose, to change, to work with paradox, conflict, and contradiction, to develop new evaluating criteria for ethical decision making, self-reflection, and self-correction, to become caring and compassionate, and to assume responsibilities that go beyond the self to embrace the social good.

Finally, in chapter five I conducted an ethical and theological reflection on the knowledge gained from Kegan's theory and analysis of caregivers' attitudes. Thus the first four chapters of my dissertation constituted a "pre-text" for theological and ethical reflection and for illustrating how living-out a faith perspective, an ethic of care, and spirituality of compassion would mean that both the good of the person who is pedophilic and that of the community would be effected. For change to be wrought there is a need for challenge and support which can be accomplished through staff support groups and multidisciplinary dialogue.
SOURCES CONSULTED


Connors, Father [Canice]/Bishops' Meeting. "Subcommittee Head Introduces Think Tank Recommendations." * Origins* 23, no. 7 (1 July 1993): 105-11.


Gualtieri, Antonio R. "Religious Cosmologies As Justifications of Morali-


_____. The Sexual Creators. An Ethical Proposal for Concerned Chris-


Halperin, David M. "One Hundred Years of Homosexuality." _Diacritics_ 16, no. 2 (Summer 1986): 34-45.


Huddleston, Mary Anne. "Sex, Sense and the Celibate Priesthood." America 163, no. 17 (1 December 1990): 422-25.


______. "Child Development and Health Education." *Principal* 57, no. 3: 91-95.


______. "Forensic Sexology: Paraphilic Serial Rape (Biastophilia) and Lust Murder (Erotophonophilia)." *American Journal of Psychotherapy* XLIV, no. 1 (January 1990): 26-36.


Monteleone, James A. "Where Has All the Magic Gone?" *Health Progress* 70, no. 2 (March 1989): 107-08.


---


Richards, Douglas G. "Dissociation and Transformation." Journal of Humanistic Psychology 30, no. 3 (Summer 1990): 54-83.


Stewart David S., Joe Driskill, and Margaret S. Steward. "Listening to Young Children Tell about Their Pain." *Religious Education* 86, no. 3 (Summer 1991): 441-54.


wilson, linda s., and victor a. ranft. "the state of ethical training for counseling psychology doctoral students." the counseling psychologist 21, no. 3 (july 1993): 445-56.


wormith, j. s., j. m. w. bradford, a. pawlak, m. borzecki, a. zohar, and m. crim. "the assessment of deviant sexual arousal as a function of intelligence, instructional set and alcohol ingestion." canadian journal of psychiatry 33, no. 9 (december 1988): 800-08.


